# Exxon Valdez Oil Spill <br> Federal Trial Transcript 

## Case Number A89-0095 civil

1994

## Volume 13 - Volume 22

## ARIIS

Alaska Resources

# Midnight Sun Court Reporters 

2550 Denali Street • Suite 1505 • Anchorage AK 99503 • (907) 258-7100 • Fax (907) 276-6727
100 Cushman • Suite 308 • Fairbanks AK 99701 • (907) 452-6727 • Fax (907) 456-2531


To: All Parties of Record - Federal Exxon Trial From: Marianne Lindley

Re: 1) Tapes Played in Court/Transcripts Read in Court Exhibits Offered/Recelved

1) The video tapes played thus far have been very difficult to interpret by the reporter (s), most likely due to the editing and modulation changes, as well as generational degradation. We will continue to do our
best in reporting them, but were encountering several problems:
-the scripts you give us don't match the video;
-sections included in the scripts have been deleted from the video;
-sections included in the videos are missing from the scripts;
-late transcript delivery because we're having to re-read portions of the scripts against the reporter's transcripts since the audio quality is difficult to report.

The read depositions:
-the scripts are sometimes massively paraphrased;
-the readers are paraphrasing while reading quickly (although their words are comprehensible, there is no time to absorb what they're saying, lacking the voice and body inflections of the original proceedings, for our shorthand purposes);
-the scripts contain material deleted from the live reading;
-late transcript delivery because we're forced to re-read portions of the scripts against the reporter's transcripts.

Our requests: Have the readers stay a consistent, reportable speed in their "testimony"
Have accurate scripts available for us of the videos
2) We're parenthetically noting exhibits as offered and/or received in court, as long as it's explicitly clear in the proceedings that this in fact has been done.

We understand that Tom Murtiashaw has asked all of you to clearly and formally offer exhibits. This would help the reporters out since the words are flying by ( 220 to 240 pages in six hours) and we have no time to go back a second time to re-review the transcripts before delivery.

Our request: Be sure the word "offered" is used immediately adjacent
to the exhibit numbers.
Read the exhibit numbers distinctly and clearly, remembering we can't see what you are referring to.
If the court is not completely clear that an exhibit has been "admitted" or "received", restate the exhibit numbers thus admitted.

Thank you in advance for your cooperation in these matters.


1
In THE UnITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE OISTRICI OF ALASKA

## Vol 131721

For defencunt dovilus $J$ serdanity Bogle a Gutes 1031 m 4th Avenue Suite 600 Anchorage AK 99501 Ph: 907/276 4557 miciacl chalos THOMAS M RUSSO Chelos 8 日rown 300 E 42 nd Street New rort hy 10011 Dn 212/661 5440 JANES I SAKDERS JNESS F NEAL Meal \& Harmell 2000 first union tower 150 4th Avenue Horth Mastrvile IM 37219 Ph 615/244 1713 pajaice lymen 0 Melveny \& Myen 400 s Hope street Los Angeles CA 90071 Ph 213/669 6000

Deputy Cler
tOM MURTIASHAM
US Diserict Court
222w 7thateres Anchorage ak 9951] on 901/271 4529 XARYH H CHALEM RPR Registered Professional Reporter manight Sun Court Aeporters 2550 Cenali Street Suite 1505 Anchorage ax 99503 Ph 901/258 1100
(1) PROCEEDINGS
(2) (Jury in at 8 00)
(3) THECLERK All rise
(4) (Call to Order of the Court)
(5) THE COURT Good morning ladies and gentiemen This
(6) is the continuation in case A89 0095 civil in re the Exxon
(7) Valdez
(8) MR JAMIN Let us start if we may by offering certann
(9) exhibits which have been agreed upon the first is 3793 37-
(10) catch up 379337943795379637993804380538073808
(11) and 3811
(12) (Exhibits 37933794379537963799380438053807
(13) 3808 and 3811 offered)
(14) MR SANDERS We have no objection
(15) THE COURT Thank you The exhibits announced by
(18) Mr Jamin are admitted
(17) (Exhibit 37933794379537963799380438053807
(18) 3808 and 3811 recelved)
(19) MR JAMIN At this tume with the Court s permission
(20) the plaintifts will call Michael A Peat to testify
(21) THE CLERK Would you rasse your right hand
(22) (The Witness is Sworn)
(23) THE WITNESS Ido
(24) THE CLERK Please be seated
(25) For the record would you state your full name your

## Vol 131723

address and spell your last name
(2) THE WITNESS Michael Alien Pete Peat I reside
at 8408 Sterling Bridge Road Chapel Hill North Carolina
(4) THE CLERK Thank you sir
(5) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL A PEAT

BYMR JAMIN
Q Doctor Peat good morning
A Good morning
(9) Q How are you currently employed?
(10) A I am presently empioyed as an individual consultant
(11) $Q \ln$ what field?
(12) A In the field of toxicology
(13) Q In March of 89 after the wreck of Exxon Valdez were you (14) employed to perform some tests on Joseph Hazelwoods blood?
(15) A Yes, they did
(16) Q All right Let me take a moment to review your education
(17) sir
(18) As background can you tell us about your undergraduate
(19) education?
(20) A Yes I have an undergraduate degree in chemiatry which was
(21) awarded from In England in 1969, and under graduate doctoral in
(22) pharmacology which was awarded from the University of Utah in
(23) 1982
(24) Q Can you give us a thumbnall sketch of your employment
(25) history?


A Yes from 1969 through 1972 I was employed at the metropolitan police forensic laboratory attached to New Scotland Yard in London From 1972 to 1978 I was with the Univeraity of London at ane of their medical schools where I held both faculty positions and a staff position directing a elinical forensic toxicology laboratory From 1976 through 1984 I was with the Center for Human Toxicology at the University of Utah Salt Lake Clty From 1984 through 1986, I was with Chemical Toxicology Institute in Foster City, Callornia And from 1986 through February of this year, I have been with CompuChem Laboratories
Q All right Now two words that you ve used forensic and toxicology Can you give the jury a brief description of what they are and how they work together?
A Yes is the study the adverse effects of chemicals and drugs on the human body Forensic toxicology deals with the (17) application of toxicology in the field of law, and in (18) particular with the analysis of blological specimens of drugs
(19) or toxic chemicals
(20) Q in March of 1989 where were you physically located in your (21) employment?
(22) A In Sacramento, California
(23) Q And what is the name of the outtit specifically you were (24) working for sir?
(25) A lt was known as ChemWest Analytical Laboratories

## Vol 131725

(1) Q We ve heard CompuChem and ChemWest before you testified
(2) Can you explain the difference or relation?
(3) A ChemWest is a - was a totally owned subsidiary of
(4) CompuChem Laboratorles
(5) Q And in March and April of 1989 were you employed as
(6) director of ChemWest?
(7) A 1 was employed as director of the drug testing division of
(8) ChemWest
(9) Q Now did ChemWest perform tests for the presence of alcohol
(10) and drugs in the blood of Joseph Hazelwood shortly atter the
(11) Exxon Valdez disaster?
(12) A Yes, they did
(13) Q And did they do that for Gregory Cousins?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q And do so for Maureen Jones?
(18) A Yes
(in) Q And did they do so for Robert Kagan?
(8) $A$ Yes

Q At the turne the tests were performed Doctor did ChemWest have any type of certitication to do chemical testing?
(1) A it was certiled by the National Institute on Drug Abuse to perform drug abuse testing in urine apecimens
(23) Q All night And are there rigorous standards sir to get (24) such certitication?
(25) A Yes, they are
(1) Q What are they?
(2) A The process by which you obtain certification is that you
(3) analyze a series of test specimens sent to you by the

National
(4) Institute Then you undergo an inspection for two days by
(5) three inspectors If you pass both those criteria you
become
(6) certified
(7) Q And are there continuing certification requrements once
(8) you get the original approval from NIDA?
(9) AYes
(10) Q What are they?
(11) A Every six montha you undergo another two day inspection by
(12) three man team and every two months you analyze test specimens
(13) tor the presence of drugs
(14) Q Now with respect to your own credentials and certification
(15) are you presently certified as a forensic toxicologist?
(16) A Yes, I'm board-certifled by the American Board of

American
(17) Toxicology
(18) Q And are there state certifications as well?
(19) A There are atate licenaures
(20) Q Licenses And where are you licensed sir?
(21) A In the state of California and the state of Now York
(22) $Q$ All right Do you serve a review function at all for the
(23) development of national standards in this field?
(24) A Yes, 1 served on the advieory board to the National
(25) Inathute for the certification of laboratories program

## Val 131727

(1) Q And in connection with that do you train inspectors who (2) actually certity labs?
(3) A Yes, I do
(4) Q All right Can you give us some estimate of how many blood
(5) and urine samples you ve been involved with the testing of over
(6) the years?
(7) A Ether myself or a laboratories that I have directed and (8) they number in the thousands
(9) Q And how about tests for the presence of alcohol or drugs?
(10) A Again, they would be in the thousands
(11) Q All right I want to take a moment to discuss the business
(12) practices at ChemWest just a bit Can you desenbe the general
(13) actuities of ChemWest?
(14) A Yes ChemWeat is aplit into two divialons One is the (15) environmental testing division, which deals with the analyale
(19) of water, sludge, solis, et cetera for environmental toxins
(17) The other was the drug testing division which analyze
(18) blological specimens including blood and urine for the presence
(19) of drugs
(20) All night Now this second part of the lab that dealt with
(21) the blood and alcohol issues what sorts of clients were yours
(22) during that period?
(23) A They were numerous They included law enforcement agency,
(24) Tederal agencies, state agencies, the state of California and (25) private companies that did drug testing
$\begin{array}{lll}\mathrm{Vol} & 13 & 1728\end{array}$
Q Did you work at all for the Alaska State Troopers? A We did some reterral work for the Alaska State Troopers Q All right Now when you do these the tests that you ve described how do you generally get the samples to start with? A Generally they re delivered by some overnight courier service such as Alrborne or Federal Express or UPS Occasionally they will be dellvered by hand, particularly local
(B) agency

Q And once received what s the general process by which the (10) samples are dealt with in the lab?
(11) A The specimens are first examined to insure the cells are (12) intact, there seen no obvious signs of tampering to the celle
(13) of the specimens They are then logged in on an internal chain
(id) of custody document by the receivers who document date and
(15) condition, general condition of the shipping containers

The
(16) receiver salso required to give a general description of the
(17) specimen container
(18) Q All right And how is the actual test for alcohol in
(19) blood?
(20) A The actual test is performed by a technique known as gas
(21) chromatography which anatyzed for ethanol and also
determines
(22) the amount of ethanol or in the -
(23) Q We ve had some discussion about test tubes Do you use
the
(24) enture sample from the test tube for one of these blood alcohol
(25) tests?

Voㅓ 131729
(1) A No only a very small portion of the specimen not in the
(2) test tube is used
(3) Q And can you give me some idea of how much is used for one
(4) of these alcohol blood tests?
(5) A It a less than one milliliter
(6) Q All right Now can you give me some idea of how much a millinter actually is?
(8) A if I can just demonstrate with my pen the pen could
(9) represent a test tube At the bottom of the teat tube this
(10) black portion would be approximately one mililiter
(11) Q All right
(12) A And the test tube would be filled to about where the top of
(13) the pen sits
(14) Q All right Good Now just for comparison purposes to
(15) check with something we all may know with the change to
(16) milliliters and things like that how many millitters are in a
(17) fluid ounce?
(18) A Approximately 30
(19) Q And with a 32 ounce quart about how many mililiters would
(20) be in a quart?
(21) A About a ltter
(22) $Q$ About a litar?
(23) A A thousand milliliters
(24) Q About a thousand of these milliliters that you ve described
(25) with your pen in a quart?

1) $A$ Yes
(2) Q All right Now if atter one alcohol test has been done in
(3) your lab and there s a request for another one do you go to a
(4) second tube do you use the first tube is there a partucular
(5) practice there?
(6) A We would normally uae the first tube the tube that we ve
2) opened, for that retest And if that will leave the second
(8) tube or third tube, whatever, sealed, for the donors to retest
(9) if requested
(10) Q All right Now as director of the lab that you ve
(11) described for us what were your general duties?
(12) A I was responsible for management of the taboratory,
(13) including the procedures and protocols used, Including staff
(14) and other adminiatration functions
(15) Q And did you have any duties with respect to maintenance of
(16) records str?
(17) A I served as the custodian of business recorde
(18) Q And what was the purpose within a forensic toxicology lab
(19) for maintenance of records?
(20) A Those recarde can obviously be requested by various
(21) agancies tor itigation purposes. Therefore they have to be
(22) maintained in the appropriate fashion for a period of time
(23) Q All right And who was ultimately responsible within
(24) ChemWest for the maintenance and preparation of records?
(25) Alwas

## Vol $13 \quad 1731$

Vol 131731
(1) Q All right Are you therafore familiar with the record
(2) retention system that was set up?
(3) A Yes l eatablished it when we opened the iaboratory in
(4) 1986
(5) Q All right Now when ChemWest gets a sample for testing
(6) for example a blood sample how is a file set up and what
(7) kinds of documents can we expect to find?
(8) A A file is set up for a particular individual, so in this
(9) particular case a file was establiahed for Joseph
Hazelwoad,
(10) and within that file will be documentation of chain of
custody,
(11) documentation on the analytical tests that were periormed
and
(12) generally and any other correspondence associated with
that
(13) particular situation
(14) Q And looking specifically now at the testing that was done
(15) in connection with the Exxon Vaidez grounding were samples
(16) received in the Sacramento ofice?
(17) A Yes they were
(18) Q And were files opened?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q And were tests done?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q And were you asked to make available some of those records
(23) for copying in this litigation?
(24) A Yes
(25) Q And did you do so?
(1) Q All right Are you therefore familiar with the record
(2) retention system that was set up?
3) A Yes I established it when we opened the laboratory in
(4) 1986
5) Q All right Now when ChemWest gets a sample for testing
6) for example a blood sample how is a file set up and what
7) kinds of documents can we expect to find?
(8) A A file is set up for a particular individual, so in this
(9) particular case a file was eatablished for Joseph

Hazelwood,
(10) and within that file will be documentation of chain of custody,
(11) documentation on the analytical tests that were performed
and
(12) generally and any other correspondence associated with
that
(13) particular situation
(14) Q And looking specifically now at the testing that was done
(15) in connection with the Exxon Vaidez grounding were samples
(16) received in the Sacramento office?
(17) AYes they were
(18) Q And were files opened?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q And were tests done?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q And were you asked to make avallable some of those records
(24) A Yes
(25) Q And did you do so?

A Yes, I did
Q All nght Were the records that you looked at for purposes of this litigation from the Sacramento office?
A Yes, they were
Q And did you find them there?
A No, I did not
Q All right Where did you find them sir?
A lfound them in CompuChem Laboratories in Research Triangle

Park, North Carolina
(10) Q And can you explain to the members of the jury why they
(11) Were in North Carolina and not Sacramento?
(12) A Yes In August of 1990 the drug testing division of
(13) ChemWest was closed by CompuChem and the records were
(14) transferred back to North Carolina for secure and safe keeping
(15) Q All right Now did you have an opportunity to compare the
(16) original file with the various documents we were going to
(17) discuss this morning?
(18) A Yes, I did
(19) Q All right Now I m going to show you sir if I may a
(20) senes of documents that we re going to talk about
(21) May I approach the witness Your Honor
(22) THE COURT You may
(23) BYMR JAMIN
(24) Q Ask if you could just first review those and indicate to us
(25) whether or not they are in fact copies from the file

## Vol 131733

(1) maintained by ChemWest?
(2) A Yes, they are
(3) Q All nght
(4) May I approach again Your Honor?
(5) What I m going to do Doctor is use the projector to
(6) display the documents
(7) A Okay
(8) Q 1 mirst going to refer Doctor to what s been marked as
(9) 3793
(10) May we have it on?
(11) Now let me ask you first 3793 is a three page document
(12) What is that sir?
(13) A it a what I would call a leatlet, which contsins some
(1a) information on a blood collection kit marketed by Beckton
and
(15) Dlckson VD (ph) for forensic purposes
(16) Q All right And did the document contain a consent form as
(17) well?
(18) A Yes, I believe page 3 of that document is a consent form
(19) Q All right Let $s$ take a look at the upper left hand corner
(20) of page 3 I hope I have that centered on the screen
(21) Can you see that there sir?
(22) A Yes, 1 can
(23) Q All right Now with respect to this document does it
(24) Indicate what sorts of tubes were present in the kit that it
(25) describes?
(1) A Yes, it indicates that it contains two ten milliliter
(2) Vacutainer blood tubes which contain fluoride and oxide
(3) fluoride and disodium
(4) Q All nght Now I m going to switch you over to the
(5) right hand side of that document and let me ask if you can to
(6) read the top part that appears to be called consent form
(7) A There is entry for a date which is 3/24/89 and a time which
(8) is 1035 a m, and below that there is a statement, 1 have
(9) granted permission for blood samples to be taken,
signature of
(10) subject, It reads Joseph J Hazelwood
(11) Q All right And looking farther down on the nght hand side
(12) of the form once again I will try and get that centered so we
(13) can see the whole thing is there a form that s indicated as
(14) blood collection report?
(15) A Yes
(16) Q And does it contain the name Joseph J Hazelwood?
(17) A Yes, it does
(18) Q And does it have date and time of incident 00047
(19) A It does
(20) Q And the date March $241989 ?$
(2i) A Yes
(22) Q And the place of blood collection listed as Exxon Vaidez
(23) $3 / 24 / 89 \quad 1035 \mathrm{am}$
(24) A Yes
(25) Q All right Now are you able to read any of the signatures

## Vol 131735

(1) farther down?
(2) A believe that one of the signatures, the one to the right (3) of the slash, M J Delozier
(4) Q And to the left are you able to make out any of that?
(5) A No I cannot make that signature out
(6) Q All right Now going back to the left hand side at the
(7) bottom of the form does it also have the name Joseph J
(8) Hazelwood?
(9) A Yes, it does
(10) Q And the same date and times?
(11) A The same information is inciuded
(12) Q All right And once again can we read the signature of (13) M J Delozier?
(14) A Yee, I can read that one
(15) Q And up above that we have the signature that 5 a littie bit
(18) tough to read but can you read after that USCG?
(17) Alcan
(18) Q All right Thank you
(19) Now did this document sir accompany the samples when
(20) they were received in the lab?

A Yes it did
Q All right Now let me show you next what s been marked
3794 and ask you - change the zoom on this a little bit Get
(24) a better feel for the whole document and then we ll come into
(25) the whole

Vol $13 \quad 1736$
All right Now I m going io scan in so that we can see the language more precisely but what is this sir?
A This is the requisition form from the American Institute
for Drug Detection, indicating a client name of Exxon U S A
O All right And did this too accompany the samples as they
were recelved in ChemWest?
A Yes, they did
Q Let me see if I can work the zoom buttons right And we II
focus in on the portion of the form that seems to be a block
called specimen change of cusiody?
A Correct
Q All right Can you read it looks as if with the xerox is - we may have lost the $S$ from specimens and came out pecimens but can you read that as best you can sir?
(15) A Yes it reads, specimen provided by Joseph J Hazelwood
(16) Q All right. And again to the extent that you re able to (17) can you read the rest of the writung on the form and the dates?
(18) A There are two sets of numbers both over the date 24
(19) March 89 The second set below the set is M J D, the first
(20) set appeare to be an $S$ followed by initial $I$ cannot read and
(21) then a C
(22) Q All right Now let $s$ take a look at a third document
23) Which has been marked 3795 Once again I m going to get a feel
(24) for the whole of the document Can you tell me sir whether
(25) this is a document that came along with the samples when they
that So this involved six people and did they include sir
Mr Kagan Mr Hazelwood Mr Cousins and Ms Jones?
A Yes, they did
Q All right Now does this indicate when Ms Metcalt
received this particular portion of the chain of custody form?
A Yes, it indicates she recelved it at 930 on March 28th, 1989
Q All right So between the two are we able to tell that apparently between 930 and 1014 in the morning of March 28th
(10) Ms Metcalf was processing this group of samples?
(11) A Yes
(12) Q All right Now let me ask you next to take a look at
(13) what s been marked 3811 and we II use the 200m agan get a
(14) feel for the whole
(15) What is this sir?
(16) A it's a copy of the internal chain of custody relating to
(17) Joseph Hazelwood, blood specimen
(18) Q All right Now we talked about the previous chain of
(19) custody Would you use the term external chain of custody for
(20) that?
(21) A That a how we would deacribe that chain of custody card
(22) yes
(23) Q All right And then the internal chain of custody how (24) does that differ?
(25) A it s an internal ChemWest document that documents transfer
Vol 13 1737
(1) were recesved at ChemWest?
(2) A Yes, it dld
(3) Q And what is this sir?
(4) A This is labeied a chain of custody card and I believe it
(5) originated with the Coast Guard oftice in Alaska
(6) Q All right And let s take a zoom on this focus on the top
(7) part at the beginning Does it indicate case title TN Exxon
(8) Valdez?
(9) A Yes, it does
(10) Q And does it indicate for the item description sealed blood
(11) samples for Joseph Hazelwood?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q And is there some indication as to the custody chain ending
(14) with Ms Metcalf apparently receiving them and can you
(15) indicate the date for that sir and the tume
(16) A Yes, this form indicates that Ms Metcalf received them
on
(17) March $28 t h, 1989$, at 10 i4
(18) Q All nght Now let me ask if we can take a iook at the
(19) second page of the same document using the zoom again get
a
(20) feel for the whole
(21) is this another chain of custody card that came along with
(22) the samples?
(23) A Yes This chain of custody card covered six sets of
(24) Epecimens which include J Hazelwood
(25) Q All right Let me zoom in so we can take a closer look at

Vol 131739
(1) of specimens between either individuals or between storage and
(2) individuala
(3) Q All right Now Doctor at the top of this form zooming
(4) there is a section that we ve already had some testumony about
(5) where it says specimen and do you see a three that s crossed
out atter ten milliliter red stoppered tubes of blood and then
a notation above then and one on next line below that and two
ten mililiter gray stoppered tubes?
A Yes, I do
(10) Q Now are you able to tell us explain to us what was going
(11) On with that portion of the form?
(12) AYes, I can
(13) Q Would you do so sir?
(14) A When the specimens were received, the initial blood
(15) specimena were received in March, the stoppers were covered
(16) extensively with red evidence tape And it was impossible to
(17) see the color of the stopper under that red evidence tape

Ms
(18) Metcalf Indicated that they were in tact three red stoppered
(19) tubes of blood because she could not ascertain the true color
(20) of the stopper
(21) Q All right And subsequent to the original receipt of the
(22) tubes was a clencal correction made sir?
(23) A A correction was made to the clerical error May 1 st, 1989
(24) Q And could you explain the circumstances for the correction?
(25) A Yes On the May 1st, 1989 Judy Peat my wife was
preparing the specimens for retesting at the center for toxicology in Salt Lake City She noticed there were in fact two gray-stoppered, one red-stoppered tubes of blood and asked

Karen and instructed Karen to correct the clerical error on the
internal chain of custody Karen performed that correction
by
(6) slashing through the three, indicating one and dating that and
(7) Initialing that She then added the statement iwo ten milliliter gray stoppered tubes of blood again initialed and dated
(10) That is the normal procedure for correction of clerical
(11) errors with our laboratory
(12) MR CHALOS I move to strike that testimony as being
(13) hearsay unless this gentleman can tell us personal knowledge of
(14) that
(15) THE COURT Ask the question
(16) BYMR JAMIN
(17) Q Do you have personal knowledge of the events you just
(18) described Doctor?
(19) A Yes
(20) $Q$ Thank you Let me ask you to take a look at 3796 ןust for
(21) a moment You mentioned that Ms Peat - I think it was Judy
(22) Peat sir7
(23) AYes
(24) Q All right Let me just ask you a question about her
(25) Did your wife work in the lab with you?

Vol 131741
AYes she did
Q And how was she employed?
A She was employed by ChemWest as a manager
(4) Q All right And had she training in the area?

AYes
(6) Q What was that sir?
(7) A She has a bachelors degree in medicat technology and is
(8) licensed as a medical technologtst and had worked in the field
(9) of toxicology for approximately eight years at that time
(10) Q All right Now let s take a look just for a moment at
(11) 3796 before we come back further to - the previous exhibit
(12) And what is 37967
(13) A 3796 la a copy of a chatn of custody which documents the
(14) shipment of the apecimen to Salt Lake City for retesting
(15) Q All nght And was it in connection with the transfer of
(16) another sample to Salt Lake City that the clerical error was
(17) discovered?
(18) AYes
(19) Q All right Now did you consider the error that was made a
(20) senious one sir?
(21) A No, I did not it is purely a clerical error and it did (22) not impact the testing resulta that were reported to the Coast
(23) Guard and to other agencies
(24) Q All right Do you know what color the tubes the stoppers
(25) were on the tubes actually as received as they were received?
(1) A 1 know that they contained two gray and one red stopper
(2) Q How do you know that Doctor?
(3) A I have personally examined those tubes and I have taken
(4) photographs or had photographs taken of the tubes
(5) Q All right And why did you have photographs taken of the tubes?
A We took - photographs were taken prior to transter of the specimens to the FBI
Q All right Now was there any attempt made to cover up the clerical error that Ms Metcalf made?
A There was no attempt made to cover up the clerlcal error
Q Now let s get back to the - to the issue of the samples
Just a bit and the testing
(14) Was testing done on Captain Hazeiwood s samples and the other samples that we ve described?
A Yes, it was
Q All right And sir can you tell me exactly what the results led to for Mr Cousins?
A No alcohol was detected in Mr Cousine' blood specimen
Q And for Ms Jones?
A The same result
Q All right And for Mr Kagan?
A The same result, no alcohol detected
Q And for Captain Hazelwood?
A Blood alcohol was detected in the blood specimen at a

## Vol 131743

) concentration of 08 one percent weight per volume
(2) MR JAMIN All right May I have ןust a moment Your

Honor?
Your Honor if you II excuse me I seem to have misplaced
what I was going to use 1 apologize for the delay Your
Honor
BYMR JAMIN
Q Now what I moing to do Doctor is show you Exhibrt
3797 Now is 3797 - and we II da the zoom again the report
(10) that was actually prepared by CompuChem laboratories dealing
(11) with Mr Hazelwood s blood sample?
(12) A Yes
(13) QAll right Let me do a zoom if I may Was this
(14) particular document on the tirst page prepared at the request
(15) Of the United States Coast Guard?

A Yes, it was
( ) All night And are the results indicated down at the
bottom portion of the page that you ve already described for us?
AYes
Q And what are those sir?
A That the blood contained 061 percent ethanol
Q All right The little $W$ to $V$ what does that refer $\mathrm{io}^{\text {? }}$
A lt's weight per volume
(25) Q And can you explain just a bit what that maans?

## Vol 131744

A It's the weight of athanol per certain volume of blood And that is the common unit that is used to report ethanol specimens
Q Very well Let me turn to the second page if I may of
3797 Now on this page was another report made to the
National Transportation Safety Board sir?
A Yes
Q And did that invoive separate testing at all of the captain $s$ blood?
A No, It was the same testing as reported to the U S Coast Guard
Q All right And down at the bottom of the page then the same reference is indicated to the 0617
A Yes
Q All right And if we were to look further at 3797 would
we see the similar reports for the other persons you ve
described?
A Yes, you would
Q All right Thank you
Now did there come a time sir where you took some
pictures of the samples that were received at ChemWest?
A Yes
(23) Q All night And what were those pictures that were taken?
(24) A They were a number of pictures taken of the shipping
(25) container and specimen tubes for Captain Hazelwood

## Vol 131745

Q All right I mgoing to see whether the Elmo works for some of these The first one to which I d like to refer is 3808 Let s see if this works I guess it gives us a little bit of a teel
Can you indicate to us what that picture represents?
A it is a picture of a blood tube l cannot see it clearly I have to look
Q May I approach the witness with the exhibit and what I II
be doing let the jurors look at them because the Elmo does not work particularly well
A This is a pleture of the blood tube, and if you look closely you can see a alit underneath the stopper You can see (13) the red evidence tape around the stopper with a break in it 14) showing the gray stopper underneath and at the bottom of the
(15) tube you can see the Initial CW 78
(16) Q All right May 1 approach Your Honor?
(17) And Your Honor may 1 show this to the jury?
(18) UNIDENTIFIED No objection
(19) THE COURT Objection 3708 is admitted
(20) (Exhibit 3708 received)
(21) BYMR JAMIN
(22) $Q$ The pictures that we re going to talk about and we ve
(23) already begun to talk about when were they taken sir?
(24) A In between Auguat and October af 1990 I do not remember
(25) the exact dates
(1) Q Okay And what was the reason they were taken?
(2) A They were taken to maintain evidence of the specimens
(3) Within Compuchem prior to shipment to the FBI
(4) Q All right Now had the FBI requested that the samples be
(5) transferred to them?
(6) A Yes, they had, In late August of 1990
(7) Q And prior to that tume had the state of Alaska asked that
(8) the samples be maintained in the lab?
(9) A Yes
(10) Q And how were they maintained?
(11) A They were stored in a long term freezer storage
(12) Q All right 1 m going to show you next two together which
(13) may have been pre admitted 3804 and 3805 - if I may
approach
(14) Your Honor
(15) And can you tell us what those are sir?
(16) A These are two photographs of the white poly styrene box in
(17) which the specimena were received 3804 is a front-on
(18) photograph showing the label on front of the box, labeled
(19) Joseph Hazelwood, dated Incidant 24 March,'89, date blood drawn
(20) 24 March, 89, 1050 a m, location Exxon Valdez, bload drawn
(21) by Scott M Conner And then below that there s two lines 018
(22) chain of possession, one of which reads received from Joseph
(23) Hazelwood, slash, and then there s the initiale J J H
(24) Next line is by Scott Conner initial S something C, 24
(25) March, 89

## Vol 131747

(1) And then below that there $s$ a recelved from Scott Conner
(2) Again with the initials, by Leutenant Gary Stock on the 25th
(3) of March, 89
(4) At either end of the white polystyrene box there la a red
(5) Integrity seal, as it sealled, and then on the left side of
(6) the box on the label is the CW 78-89 label with the initlals
(7) K.L.M on it
(8) Q All right
(9) A 3805 ls the same box but a side arm view showing an
(10) off-white seal that has been broken
(11) Q Very well I mgoing to see if we can display these on the
(12) Elmo and get an overview of what they took like
(13) All night So the one that I $m$ pointing to right now is
(14) sort of the front on view from which you read
(15) A Yes, it is
(16) Q And the second photograph describes the seal that you were
(17) talking about?
(18) AYes
(19) $Q$ Is there a bit of blood on the stryofoam box there sir?
(20) A Yes, there is
(21) Q And can you explain how that might have developed?
(22) A Over time, the blood tubes inside the box and blood tubes,
(23) collected for any purposes, will crack and they II be some (24) blood leakage out of those tubes because of the freezing and
(25) thawing that goes on for handling the specimens over a long

```
perlod of time
Q All nght
MR JAMIN Your Honor mayl approach the jury with
these two photographs as well?
THE COURT You may
BYMR JAMIN
Q All right Doctor I have a fourth photograph And this
one has been marked Did you check the back is it 3807?
A Yes, It is
Q Can you explain to us what this is?
A This la a plcture of two blood tubes that actually have
been stuck together because there s been leakage of blood
(13) one so they've stuck together The one that spointing up
(14) be seen as a gray stopper tube with evidence tape around
(15) tube Also wrapped around the top of the tube is a white
(18) which you can see the letters H-a-z e-l w from You can see
7) the initlals M J D and may count something that begins with
(18) S and ends with a C
(19) Q An S and a C
(20) A And then you can see the time 1050 The Jower end of
(21) tube you can see seven eight eight, and M
(22) Q All right And is the tube that you can see more readily
(23) have the top broken at all?
(24) A No, this seal is intact
(25) Q All night And to your recollection were both of those
```

from
can
that
label
an
that

## Vod 131749

1) test tubes intact as far as testing went in the lab?
(2) A Yes Both these test tubes, the seal is still intact
2) Q Very well
3) Sir may I publish this to the jury as weil?

Now Doctor finally as far as exhibits go I have 3799
which has been pre admitted and I d like to put that on the
screen with the zoom We ll get the whole and then we ll come
in and focus a little bit better. What is this document sir?
A lt s a copy of a memo for record prepared by Karen

## Metcalf

(10) on July 24th, 1990, that relates to CW 7889 and the chain of
(11) custody of Joseph Hazelwood
(12) Q All nght And was this a document that was prepared as
(13) part of the official records of the company?
(14) A Yes, It was
(15) Q All nght Now I m going to focus this in so that you can
(16) read it to us if you would
(17) Is that adequate for reading sir?
(18) AYes
(19) Q Please go ahead
(20) A $3 / 28 / 89$, we received three ten milliliter tubes af blood on
(21) Joseph Hazelwood as well as the other specimens collected
22) regarding the incident Upon initial inspection of Joaeph
(23) Hazelwood s specimens, reference CW 78 89, I found all tubes of
(24) blood had red evidence tape covering the stoppers as well as
(25) the Coast Guard Integrity seal which was - ran completely

Vol 131750
(1) around the tubes inciuding the sides of the atoppers
(2) Because of the red tape all three tubes appeared to be red
${ }^{\text {13) }}$ stoppers May 1 st, 1989 it was discovered that an error had
(4) been made on my part during the initial receipt, only one of
(5) the tubes was a red stoppered tube, the other tubes were gray
(6) Q Little anticipation go ahead
(7) A Gray stoppered This was found by cutting out a small section of the evidence tape on the top portion of the
(9) stopper On discovery of this error, the intial description
(10) of the stoppers on the chain of custody was changed to reflect
(11) the correct -
(12) O All right go over to page 2
(13) A - information, dated and initlaled Only one tube of
(14) blood was aliquotted from, it was a gray stoppered tube, the
(15) other two tubes remain sealed On May 2nd, 1989 an aliquot was
(16) sent to the Center for Human Toxicology in Salt Lake City,
(17) Usah This aliquot was removed from the eame tube we had
(18) tested
(19) Q All nght
(20) And then is Ms Metcalf certain that the statement she has
(21) given is true and accurate?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q And does she swear that statement in front of a notary?
(24) A She does
(25) Q Is Ms Metcalf s statement that you just read to us

## V어 $13 \quad 1751$

consistent with your own knowledge of the event?

## A Yes, It le

Q All right And is there any question in your mind regarding ChemWest receiving anything other than two gray and
(5) one red stoppered tubes?
(6) A There is no question in my mind that we recelved two gray
(7) and one red stoppered tubes
(8) Q Is there any question in your mind that procedures that
(9) ChemWest effected in any way affect the validity of the test?
(10) A No, the teating results were valid
(ii) $\mathbf{Q}$ if there was any question with your experience with the
(12) test would the testing have gone forward sir?
(13) A No, they would not Testing would not have been
initiated
(14) If there had been any question of the sealed - of the blood
(15) tubes
(16) Q Occasionally are there questions that may affect the
(17) integrity of a test presented by receipt of the samples?
(18) A Yes, they are
(19) Q And what is done in that situation sir?
(20) A Normally in that situation the client or the requeating
(21) agency is contacted with regard to the discrepancy
(22) Q All right And the testing that was done by or excuse me
(23) the sample that was taken that was tested by the lab did the
(24) documents indicate it was taken about 1030 in the morning of
(25) the 24th?
$\qquad$


FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-19-94
VOLUME 13 $\qquad$ XMaxi9) Vol 131752
A The first document that we looked at today indicated a collection time, i believe, of 1035 a m
Q All right And did it indicate sample - for which sample?
A For the sample Joseph Hazelwood
Q And did it indicate an incident time shortiy after midnight?
A Yes, it did
Q And coming up with the analysis 06 When ChemWest was doing the blood analysis is it performing an analysis of the blood as it existed at 1030 in the morning on the 24it? A Yes
(12) MR JAMIN I have nothing further thank you Oh I
(13) may not have offered 3797 and counsel points out probably that
(14) I should
(15) (Exhibit 3797 offered)
(16) THE COURT I was going to point that out
(17) Is there objactuon to 3797 ?
(18) MR CHALOS No objection Your Honor
(19) MR JAMIN Thank you Dr Peat
(20) THE COURT Admitted
(21) (Exhibit 3797 recelved)
(22) THE COURT You may cross examine
(23) MR CHALOS Good morning Your Honor
(24) THE COURT Good morning
(25) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL PEAT

|  | Vod 131753 |
| :---: | :---: |
| () BYMR CHALOS |  |
| (2) | Q If it may please the Court Dr Peat I m Michael Chalos |
| (3) A Good morning |  |
| (4) Q How are you? I represent Captain Joseph Hazelwood Dr |  |
| (5) Peat when you told us that your lab was certified by the NIDA |  |
| (6) do you rememb |  |
| (7) A Correct |  |
| (8) |  |
| (9)(10) | A No I indicated that was for urine sind drugs abuse |
|  | Q But not for blood alcohol? |
|  | A That is correct That program does not cover blood alcohol |
|  | Q Now you were in charge of ChemWest during March of 89 |
|  | right on through you said until August of 907 |
|  | A Yes |
|  | Q And at that time in March of 89 you had less than ten |
|  | people working for you? |
|  | A Yes |
|  | Q Now let me just go back to the time that you got the two |
|  | call from the Coast Guard That was on March 26 was it? |
|  | A l did not receive a call on that particular day To the |
|  | best of my recollection my first contact with the Coast |
| unrd |  |
|  | was on Monday the 27th |
|  | Q The 27th And you spoke to Lieutenant Stock? |
|  |  |

Vol 131755

1) these samples were handied before they came to your lab do 2) you?
(3) No, I do not
a) Q And if they had been tampered with prior to your receiving
(5) them you have no knowledge of that do you?
(5) A That \& correct
2) Q Now on Exhibit 3793 that you were shown do you remember
(3) where it said Mr Delozier signed below Captain
3) Hazelwood s-do you have that in front of you?
(10) A No Could you -
(11) MR CHALOS Your Honor may I approach the witness?
(12) THE COURT Yes
(13) BYMR CHALOS
(14) $\mathrm{Q} \mid \mathrm{m}$ going to do two things 1 m going to give you a set of
(15) my exhibits
(16) A Thank you
(17) Q Which now 3793 was this document do you remember this?
(18) A Yes, I did
(19) Q You told us about Mr Delozier s signature?
(20) AYes
(21) Q Okay Let me put this - what do you call this machine
(22) again?
(23) MR SANDERS Elmo
(24) MR CHALOS I ve been relegated to low tech Your
(25) Honor

## Vol 131756

1) Okay Here we are
(2) BYMR CHALOS
(3) Q This is the Delozier signature you re taiking about?
(4) A That s what it appears to be
(5) Q And there s also a Delozier signature over here?
(6) A Yes
(7) Q Okay Does that signature indicate to you that
(8) Mr Delozier witnessed the drawing of the blood from Captain
2) Hazelwood?
(10) A Certainly the signature is below I believe on the left
(11) side of this, it we can move it this way
(12) Q Okay Sorry let me try something now How do you like
(13) this? There you go
(14) Can you see it now?
(15) AYes
(16) Q All right It says here I hereby assert that I have
(17) witnessed the actual withdrawal of blood and collection of
(18) urine - wait a minute sorry I m reading - let me read it
3) agan
4) I hereby assert that I have witnessed the actual withdrawal
5) of blood from the above subject by the person whose signature
6) appears above Do you see that?
(3) Yes, I do see that
(24) Q Okay Were you here during Mr Delozier s testimony?
(25) A No, I was not

## Vod 131757

(1) Q Let me represent to you that on the trial transcript page
(2) 365 and 366 Mr Delozier said that he witnessed three
(3) red stoppered tubes of blood being taken from Captain
(4) Hazelwood 1 m going to represent that to you
(5) Can you explain to me then if that s what Mr Delozier
(6) said and he was right there witnessing it why you say today
(7) that you saw two gray stoppers?
8) A We recelved iwo gray stoppers and one red stopper tube
of
9) blood
(10) Q Let me ask you something sir When was the first time
(11) that you saw the samples?
(12) A I belleve in May of 1989
(13) Q That s after May 1st isn tit? Isn that correct?
(14) A l cannot recollect the exact day in May I anw the

## specimen

(15) Q So you don i know you don t know what was recelved by your
(16) lab until after your wife changed the records isn t that (in) correct?
(18) A My wife performed - asked Karen to perform a collection on
(19) the -
(20) $Q$ Is the answer yes or no sir you don t know what was
(21) received by your lab until after your wite changed the
(22) records? Is that a yes or a no?
(23) A lt sa yea orano
(24) Q Now you say - were you here for Ms Metcalt s testımony?
(25) A Yes, I was

Vol 131759
Mr Weidman before she did Captain Hazelwood s sample do you
(2) remember that?

A Yes
Q And do you remember that she was able to distingursh
between gray and red on Mr Weidman?
A I remember that she did that, yes
Q Now sir when you saw the samples after May ist were they all packed up the same way?
A They were in the white polyatyrene box, yea
(10) Q Did they all have this red tape that you re talking about?
(11) A They all had the red tape around the stopper together whth
(12) the white seal that was covering the red seal on the side of
(13) the stopper
(14) Q So Captain Hazelwood s looked no different than the other
(15) samples did they?
(16) A They were generally the same appearance
(17) Q Let s talk about your wite for a second if we may
(18) please
(19) MR CHALOS Can I have Your Honor while we re
(20) waiting I would like to offer into evidence - here I am
(21) Exhibits DX9102 and through DX91 12 so that would be 9102

3
(22) $4 \quad 5 \quad 6$ and so on untul we get to 9112
(23) (Exhibits 91029103910491059106910791089109
(24) 911091119112 offered)
(25) THE COURT Mr O Nell
(1) MR JAMIN No there is none
(2) THE COURT Exhibits DX9102 through 9112 both
(3) inclusive are admitted
(4) (Exhibit 91029103910491059106910791089109
(5) 911091119112 recelved)
(6) BYMR CHALOS
(7) Q Now can you see this?
(8) A Yes, I can
(9) Q All nght okay Up untl your wife changed the records
(10) or caused the records to be changed this is how the front
(i1) portion of the chain of custody read wasn it?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q it said three ten mililiter red stoppered tubes for
(14) Captain Joseph Hazelwood s isn that correct?
(15) AYes
(16) Q Now you said you ve looked at the records before you came
(17) here today?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q How many tumes was Captain Hazelwood s blood sample handled
(20) by your lab people before your wife handled it May 1 st?
(21) A I would have to retreeh my memory
(22) Q Well let me show you
(23) May I approach Your Honor
(24) THECOURT Yes
(25) BYMR CHALOS
(1) Q Exhibit 3468 which is already in evidence and I ask you
(2) to count on that sheet how many tumes that particular sample
(3) was handled before May 1st
(4) A There were four incidents five if you inciude the original
(5) receipt
(6) O Okay So at least - may I have that back sol can - let
(7) me take this - or let $\mathbf{s}$ move this back III put this down for
(8) a second All right
(9) So Ms Metcalf handled it on March 28th right?

A Yes
(11) Q All right The second one is a Matt Noedel handled it on (12) the same date?
(13) A Yes
(14) Q And then he handied it later in that day as well?
(15) A No, he had possession of the specimens from 1155 to three
(18) o clock
(17) Q So he had it for a penod of about three hours?
(18) A Approximately
(19) Q When he takes control he takes the specimen all right
(20) He s also got this chain of custody form with him doesn ine?
(21) A The chain of custody remains in the original receiving area
(22) and does not accompany the specimens He logs the specimens
(23) out of that chain of custody
(24) Q All right But Matt Noedel he logs the times that he $s$
(25) taking the specimens?
(1) A Correct
(2) And he logs the times he returns the speamens?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q On this chain of custody form?
(5) A Yes
(6) Q Okay Now we ll go to the - here we go the samples were
(7) handled again on March 30th by Ms Metcalf for a half hour
(8) nght?
(9) A Yes
(10) Q And again they were handled on April 17th by Ms Metcalf?
(11) A Yes
(12) Q And again -
(13) A Well, on April 17th, it s more than likely that only the (14) boxes were handied because there was a transter from

## temporary

(15) to long term storage
(16) Q Now let me ask you this
(17) It was during this period of time that we re talking about
(18) before May 1st that the samples were tested nght?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q When we say samples were tested not all the samples were
(21) tested just one tube was tested isn that correct?
(22) A That is correct
(23) Q You took a littie bit of aliquot from one tube and that was
(24) what was tested?
(25) A Yes
(1) Q You weren tinvolved in that test were you?
(2) A That's correct
(3) Q Now astde from these particular handlings there were
(4) other handlings weren there when you were using different
(5) batches?
(6) A Yes
(7) OOkay
(8) A Of the aliquots
(9) Q Okay And that s logged on some other sheet but these
(10) samples themselves were handied by Mr Noedel and Ms

Metcalf
(11) on other occasions besides the ones shown here am 1 correct?
(12) ANo
(13) Q This is the only time they were handled?
(14) AYes
(15) Q But the aliquots were handled?
(16) A The aliquots were handled the time of - the only teats
(17) that were performed on the blood apecimen was the alcohol test
(18) performed by Mr Noedel, and there was another further test
(19) pertormed on the 30th
(20) Q Now the first time your wife s name appears on this is May
(21) 1st 1989 am I correct?
(22) AYes
(23) Q And her name appears only once in all the time that you had
(24) Captain Hazelwood s blood samples am I correct on the chain
(25) of custody?
$\qquad$

Al believe so
Q That s that one day May 1st 1989 right?
A Correct
Q And according to this document she had the samples for a minute?
A She transferred the specimens from long term storage freezer storage, to short term refrigerator storage
Q She picked them up at 925 and she deposited them at 925 am I correct?
A Ye:
Q Incidentally you said that you had personal knowiedge of let me strike that and ask another question
It $s$ your understanding that at that point your wife went
to Karen Metcalf and told her to change the records so now
instead of reading - instead of reading three ten milliliter
red stoppered tubes now the records read one ten milliliter
red stopper tube and two ten milliliter gray stopper tubes
right?
A Yes
Q That s what your wife told Karen Metcalf to change?

## A Correct

Q You say you have some personal knowiedge of that? The fact
(23) of the matter is this you didn $t$ find out about this until
atter it was done isn that correct?
A That 8 correct

## Vol 131765

Q So you don t have any personal knowledge as to what your wife was looking at what Karen Metcalt was looking at what your wife told Karen Metcalf to do and how these records were changed?
A From how -
Q You don thave any personal knowledge?
A Well from conversatlons with both Karen and my wife I
did
(8) Q That was the point of the objection Let me ask you this
(9) When something is moved from long term is it-long term
()) storage to short term storage is that what your wife said she

1) did? Let me take this down so you can see again
2) Right your wife says she took it from long term storage
and put it in short term night?
AYes
Q Sir when you do that aren tyou just taking the box and
moving it from one place to the other?
A That E normally what you do
Q And that s the box that s covered - isn it that that white
box?
A it would be the white box Sometimes people would look at
(21) the specimens inside the box
(22) Q You don i know if your wife looked at all -
(23) A That E correct
(24) Q Now you were originally - your lab was orıgınally hired
(25) by the Coast Guard right?
(1) A Yes originally
(2) Q And you sent them what you say your lab sent them the
(3) results of what s purported to be Captain Hazelwood s blood
(4) sample is that correct?
(5) A That \& correct
(6) Q And at some point the National Transportation Safety Board
(7) got involved is that correct?
(8) A Yes

- And then you started dealing with them almost exclusively
(10) nght?
(11) AYes
(12) Q And you deali with the Dr Burkey (ph)?
(13) AYeE
(14) Q Okay Now on you also sent them a report of what $s$
(15) purported to be Captain Hazelwood s sample?
(16) A Yee, I did
(17) Q And in addition to that some time around April 30th you
(18) sent to the NTSB documents relating to Captain Hazelwood s
(19) chain of custody forms did you not?
(20) A I belleve it was on or about April 20th, yes
(21) Q Okay And then subsequently you sent them 36 pages of (22) everybody s chain of custody including Captain Hazelwood am I
(23) correct?
(24) A I believe that I sent one package which included Captain
(25) Hazelwood 8 and the others


## Vó 131767

(1) Q Okay I want to show you what $s$ been marked as DX 9042
(2) You have that in front of you?
(3) AYes, I do
(4) OOkay Good That sthe package you sent?
(5) A Yes, it is
(6) Q Okay And according to this you sent it on April 25th
(7) 1989 but it $s$ your recollection that you had sent them a
(8) smaller package container just Captain Hazelwood?
(9) A No that is not my recollection
(10) Q We re going to get to it in a second but let $s$ do something
(11) here Let me see if I can this is your signature?
(12) A Yes it is
(13) Q Okay You re telling the National Transportation Safety
(14) Board on April 25th 1989 that I hereby certify that the
(15) following 36 pages - which included Captain Hazelwood 5 chain
(16) of custody forms night?
(in) A Yes
(18) Q - are true and accurate copies of the chain of custody
(19) forms relating to the specimens received on March 28th 1989
(20) from Federal Express Right?
(21) A Yes True and accurate copies as of April 25th, 1989
(22) Q Right And then you have the fancy stamp and you re
(23) certitying it
(24) What you sent to them on April 25th and you represented to
(25) them was a true and accurate copy was this form wasn it?
(1) A Yes, it was
(2) Q That said three ten mililiter red stoppered tubes of (3) blood isn that right?
(4) A Yes
(5) Q Did you look at them betore you sent them?
(6) A No, I did not
(7) O Well how did you certify them that they were true and
(8) accurate if you didn t look at them?
(9) A 1 certiflcated it irue and accurate copies
(10) Q Did you look at the copies?
(11) A Did I look at the chain of custody copies? Yes
(i2) Q You did?
(13) A Yes
(14) Q And saw this didn tyou?
(15) AYes
(16) Q Now sir after this date but prior to May 1st 1989 you
(17) received a call from the NTSB didn $t$ you?
(18) A There was several calls through April of 1989
(19) O You received a call from Mr Birky didn tyou? Dr
(20) Burkey?
(2i) A As I sald, there was several calls from the NTSB, and my
(22) primary contact if not sole contact was Dr Bliky
(23) Q And Dr Birky toid you didn the that they had interviewed
(24) Scoft Conner and his description of what he sent - that is
(25) two gray stoppered tubes of blood and one red stoppered tubes

Vod 131769
of blood didn i match what you sent to them on the chain of
(2) Custody? Didn the tell you that?
(3) A I don trecollect that converation
(4) Q You don trecollect that it happened or you don thave a (5) recollection?
(6) A it could possibly have happened but I don $t$ recollect it
(7) Q Okay Now I want to you taking a look at Exhibit 91047
(8) A Is that a $D X$ exhibit?
(9) Q Yes sir DX exhibit
(10) Do you have it?
(11) AYes
(12) Q Incidentally did your wife speak to Dr Birky at all dunng
(13) this time?
(14) A I do not know
(15) Q Did you tell your wite that you had received a call from
(16) Dr Birky along the lines that we fust discussed?
(17) A I do not recollect that
(18) Q Coutd have happened inough?
(19) A Certainly
(20) Q You have 31 - sorry 9104 in front of you?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q Okay This is a letter dated May ist from the Natıonal
(23) Transportation Safety Board right?
(2a) A Yes
(25) Q And it s to you Dr Peat it says here as we discussed
(1) In a phone conversation previously the Safety Board may wish
(2) to have the alcohol measurements on the blood speamens taken
(3) from the captain of the Exxon Valdez confirmed by a second
(4) laboratory
(5) Do you see that?
(6) A Yes, I do
(7) Q Let me see if I can zoom in a little more all night?
(8) The decision has been made to go forward with this
(9) Confirmation even though thare is no reason whatsoever to
(10) question the findings
(11) You see that?
(12) AYes
(13) Q That s May 1st 1989 I suppose it sacoincidence that s
(14) the date your wife changed the records is that right?
(15) A That sthe date the correction was made to the records
(16) Q Now and of course the NTSB according to what they say
(17) had no reason to tell you to send it to another lab for
(18) confirmation is that what you understood?
(19) A That is certainly the inference from the letter
(20) Q Okay Now look here
(21) By the way this letter is from Mr Birky the fellow that
(22) you said you were speaking to So he says here let me-1 m
(23) getting good at this It says Subsequently I am requesting
(24) that you ship the gray stoppered tube of blood to the Center
(25) for Human Toxicology for confirmation of ethanol
measurements

Vol 131771
(1) Do you see that?
(2) AYes
(3) Q He told you take a gray stoppered tube and send it to
(4) Utah right?
(5) A That s the mesaage from the letter yes
(6) Q Did you do that?
(7) A No, we actually shipped an aliquot of the gray stoppered
(8) tube we had tested
(9) Q You didn tobey the NTSB orders?
(10) A if I remember correctly, I had some discussions with
(11) Dr Birky and it was decided that would be the course of action
(12) and leave the sealed gray stoppered tube for further testing if
(13) requested
(14) Q So what you did then was you took a little portion of the
(15) tube you had already tested right?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q And you sent it on to where Utah?
(18) A To the Center for Human Toxicology
(19) Q Now this place was a place that you used to work at
(20) wasn tit?
(21) A Yes it was
(22) Q And your wife used to work for these people in Utah right?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q And the person you sent it to was a guy named Crouch?
(25) A Mr Denns Crouch

1) Q And you used to work for him and your wife used to work for him?

## A We used to work with him

Q Now when you sent this little sample of what s purported
to be Captain Hazelwood s blood?
AYes
Q I m over here
When you sent the sample it didn thave any of the indicia
of whose blood it was or how it was sealed or anything like
that of the original tubes right?
A That s correct
Q It was just put into another tube and sent on?
A Yes
Q Before I move on to another topic I want to ask you something
You tested - in addition to Captain Hazelwood s blood you tested Gregory Cousins blood did you not?
AYes
Q And Gregory Cousins s blood indicated presence of acetone
and isopropanol is that right?
A There was some indications on the chromatographs to
the
2) beat of my recollection, of trace or small amounts of those
two
(23) materials

Q Well is acetone something that $s$ normally in people s
blood?

## Vot 131773

A No, it s not
Q How about isopropanol?
A Again, it is not normaliy in people s blood
Q So that particular sample to the extent it contained
acetones and isopropanol was contaminated wasn it?
A That a not necessarily the inference f would draw it s certalnly a possibility
Q And that what you tested for Gregory Cousins was a
gray stoppered tube isn that true?
A Yes, 1 believe so
Q Now what is isopropanol?
A lsopropanol is rubbing alcohol and is used as a cleaning
solution on akin
Q And sometimes it sused when you get a shot to sterilize
the area?
A Yes
Q Now that s not supposed to be done when you take blood is it
A For alcohol measurement
QYes?
ANo
Q it s not?

## A Correct

(2) Q Incidentally you found these what you call traces of 5) acetone and isopropanol but you didn $t$ report that did you?
(1) A No There was only very small amounts We did not report
(2) them
(3) Q But you didn t report it in any event?
(4) A That sorrect
(5) Q Did you ever tell the Coast Guard or the NTSB that your
(6) wife directed Ms Metcalf to change the form?
(7) A I believe that the first time those disecussions came up
(8) were in 1990
(9) Q And that would be around July of 19907
(10) A Yes
(11) Q Right around the time that Ms Meicalf wrote that memo that
(12) you talked about this morning?
(13) A Yes
(14) Q So that was the first time you told them?
(15) A Correct
(16) Q Is there a federal regulation that requires you to report
(17) any changes in the chain of custody forms?
(18) A No, there is not And again I woutd refer to this as a
(19) correction not a change
(20) Q Did you tell anyone besides - well strike that
(21) Did anyone besides you Ms Metcalf and your wite know
(22) that these records were changed pnor to July of 19907
(23) A To the best of my recollection, those three Indlviduals
(24) Including myself were aware of the correction
(25) Q Just those three?

## (1) A I belleve so

(2) Q You testified at a proceeding invoiving Captain Hazalwood
(3) in February of 1990 did you not?
(a) A Yee, I did
(5) Q And at that time you testified under oath didn tyou that
(6) there was no problem with the chain of custody on Captain
(7) Hazelwood 5 samples?
(8) A That s correct
(9) O You didn t tell anybody at that hearing you were under
(10) oath you didn $t$ tell anybody well what happened was we logged
(11) it in at three ten mililiter but really it was two gray- and
(12) one red you didn $t$ tell anybody that?
(13) A That s correct I could say correction was made in the
(14) normal course of businest
(15) Q Did you testify to that?
(18) A No, I didn $t$
(17) Q As a matter of fact let me read you what you testufied -
(18) this is on page 4319 And you know what I m going to give
(19) you a copy so you can follow along
(20) A Thank you
(21) Q Mr Chalos Question And were there any problems with the
(22) condition of the packages that you received on that date?
(23) Answer Can I consult?
(24) Question Sure
(25) Answer Each of the packages were received on that - on

| BSA | FE |
| :---: | :---: |
| Voi 131776 |  |
| (1) that day indicate - let me put it here so the jury can follow |  |
| (2) along as well |  |
| (3) Okay Your answer is Each of the packages were received |  |
| (4) on that day indicate that the shipment containers themselves |  |
| (5) were sealed and that the specimen containers were both sealed |  |
| (6) and labeled No problems were noted on the initual chain of |  |
| (7) custodies for any of those s |  |
| (8) Isn t that what you say |  |
| (9) A That's what i seld |  |
| (10) Q That wasn i a true statement in light of the change |  |
| (11) you knew about and nobody else did isn 1 that correct? |  |
| (12) A I etill believe that a true statement |  |
| (13) C |  |
| (14) before I go to July |  |
| (15) You had a chance |  |
| (16) 1st? |  |
| (17) A Yes |  |
| (18) | Q Okay When you looked at those samples did the tubes |
|  | (19) appear to you to be hernolyzed? |
| (20) A Well, yes The blood was ${ }^{\text {a }}$ dark red color |  |
| (21) O We re talking about Captain Hazelwood s blood? |  |
| (22) A Yes |  |
| (23) | Q Okay Could you tell all of us what hemolyzed means? |
| (24) | A Hemolysis is the breakdown of the red blood cells of the |
|  | blood and that adds a red color to blood over time | 0

## Vot $13 \quad 1777$

(1) O What happens in layman s terms is the red blood cells
(2) burst isn that what happens?
(3) AYes
(4) O Okay
(5) All right Let $s$ talk now about July 1990 What caused
(6) you in July of 1990 to ask Ms Metcalf to write a memo relating
(7) to this change of the records?
(8) A In July of 1990, there was some press coverage of a hearing
(9) In which the chain of custody documents were challenged
(10) Q Challenged by who?
(11) A By, I believe, yourselves
(12) Q And so what happened?
(13) A At that particular time ase we we ciosing the lab for
(14) economic reasons, we were closing the lab I requested that
(15) Karen document on a memo for record her recollection of the
(16) events of May and March 1989
(17) Q That s Exhibit 3799 Plaintifts Exhibit 3799
(18) What did you tell her to do just that?
(19) A That s exactly what I told her to do
(20) Q And what Ms Metcalf did was she wrote longhand what she
(21) said was the version of what happened right?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q And then she submitted that longhand memo that she wrote to
(24) you?
(25) A Correct and I made some grammatical changes to the

## Vol 131778

(1) longhand then it was typed up and signed by Karen
(2) Q You made grammatical changes and then gave it back to her?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q And then it was typed?
(5) A Correct
(6) Q And you reviewed it?
(7) A Yes I cannot remember if I reviewed it before or after
(8) Karen had aigned it
(9) Q Sir you have that document in front of you?
(10) A No, I do not
(11) Q You don thave it in front of you there Do you have a
(12) Copy? Okay why don tyou read the screen?
(13) This document was prepared - let me see one year and
(14) about three months one year and two months after the event
(15) right?
(16) A Approximately
(17) Q Okay And it was done at your request?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q Reading this document okay is there any mention at all of
(20) your wite $s$ involvement in the changing of the records?
(21) A No, there was not
(22) Q None whatsoever right?
(23) A No, there is no mention of my wife in that document
(24) Q Did you tell your wife since she was involved in the change
(25) to write a memo also?

(1) remarks -
(2) MR CHALOS Yes I m sorry I withdraw that remark
(3) BYMR CHALOS
(4) Q Mr - Dr Peat you mentioned by the way that my firm
(5) was involved in the in the publicity surrounding this change Remember that?
A I m not sure that your firm was invoived in the publicity but certainly you were involved, your firm was involved in several of the litigations
(10) Ol want to show you what we marked as Defendant s Exhibit
11) 9110 okay? This is a letter that we wrote to you on July
(12) 18th 1990 You see that?

AYes
(4) O Okay And in that letter we enclosed a subpoena Do you
(15) remember that?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q You see that?
(18) A Correct
(19) Q And what we wanted was all the records relating to Captain
(20) Hazelwood s blood tests we wanted the chain of custody we
(21) wanted the records relatung to the tests - you see all that?
(22) A Yes I do
(23) Q Okay You didn t respond to the subpoena did you?
(24) A No, I contacted Lleutenant - If I can refer to another
(25) document that you gave me

## Vod 131781

(1) Q Go anead
(2) A 1 contacted Lieutenant Campos of the U S Coast Guard who
(3) Indicated this could be ignored
(4) Q A subpoena could be ignored?
(5) A That what Lieutenant Campos told me
(6) O So you went ahead and you just ignored the subpoena?
(7) A Correct
(8) Q Even though it was issued by an administrative law judge?
(9) AYes
(10) Q And you didn $t$ provide anything to Captain Hazelwood for
(i1) his use in determining whether his blood alcohol tests were
(12) done properly whether the chain of custody was proper? You
(13) didn t give them any information at all?
(14) A We had previously supplied that intormation to the U S
(15) Coast Guard
(16) Q You didn $t$ respond to this subpoena?
(17) A That \& correct
(18) Q Now you told us eartier today that one of the samples that
(19) you kept was for the donor s use in case he wanted to retest
(20) it didntyou?
(21) AYes
(22) Q Well how is that - why don tyou tell me how the donor is
(23) supposed to get that if you won t answer a subpoena?
(24) A if the donor had subpoenaed or requested a retest of his
(25) own and then that would specimen would have been provided to
(1) him
(2) Q You didn $t$ supply the records that he was asking for is
(3) that correct pursuant to a subpoena?
(4) A That sorrect
(5) Q Now at some point sir you went to the west - to the
(6) East Coast nght?
(7) AYes
(8) Q And you had the sample sent to you on the East Coast?
9) A Yes
(10) Q And when you received those samples you wrote a memo on
(11) August 9th 19907
(12) A Correct
(13) Q That $s$ Exhibit 9108 ?
(14) A YeE
(15) Q Okay You see this Here you go
(16) This is a memo you wrote to file?
(17) AYes
(18) O Okay All nght Let me read the first paragraph
(19) On August 8th 1990 I received from Airborne a brown box (20) sealed with tape inside the brown box was a white box sealed
(21) with tape and containing dry ice You see that?

AYes
Q The dry ice was to keap the samples frozen isn t that
correct?
A Correct

## Vot 131783

(1) Q And that s the normal and customary way of sending samples
(2) through Federal Express blood samples?
(3) A Not necessarily But those specimens that had been

## frozen

(4) and stored certainly recommended to do it this way
(5) Q Okay Now look here You re describing Captain
(6) Hazelwood s samples right and you go ahead and you say two
(7) gray stoppered tubes one red stoppered tubes of blood-you
(8) see that?
(9) AYes
(10) Q But look down here at $C$ when you re describing
(11) Mr Kagan s you re describing it by size is there a
(12) particular reason why you didn t put any size on Captain
(13) Hazelwood s blood samples?
(14) A No, there s no partlcular reason
(15) Q An oversight or something?
(16) A There a no particular reason that I can recollect
(17) O I want to talk to you now about the pictures
(18) MR CHALOS Your Honor may lapproach the witness
(19) please?
(20) THE COURT Yes
(21) MR CHALOS Thank you
(22) BYMR CHALOS
(23) $Q$ I want to show you what s been marked as 3805 okay You
(24) See this?
(25) AYes

Vol 131784

1) $Q \mid m$ going to ask you some questions about it so go ahead
2) and study it for a second particularly this area
(3) A That silne
(4) Q Okay Now incidentally these pictures were taken you
3) said in August or - August through October of 1990 right?

AYes
Q That s about a year and a half after the samples were initally received?
AYes
Q Okay Now what I $m$ focusing in now is nght here this area here okay? Are you with me?
AYes
Q Okay Now there was a seal there before wasn it?
A Yes, there appears to have been an off white seal, as I
indicated earlier
Q That seal was ripped off7 Doesn tit appear it was ripped?
7) A Certainly appeare from that photograph to be ripped

Q is that standard lab practice when they receive a
(19) specimen to rip a seal like that?
(20) A No, it's to cut the seal
(21) Q What you do is you take a knife and you cut along the edge
(22) here is that right?
(23) A That a correct
(24) Q That $s$ not when what happened in this case?
(25) A it appears to have been ripped

$$
\psi
$$

## Vol 131785

[^0]|  |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |

[^1]_ 5-19-94
(1) Yes, It wa
(1) A Yes, it was
(2) Q And did erther you or an attorney for your company call the
(3) Coast Guard?
(4) AI- to the best of my recollection I belfeve I talked to
(5) Lleutenant Campos
(6) Q Okay And after talking with the Coast Guard authorities
(7) was it only then that you made the decision not to follow the
(8) Subpoena?
(9) AYes
(10) Q And if the Coast Guard had said follow the subpoena would
(11) you have done so?
(12) A Certainly
(13) Q Because it was a Coast Guard proceeding?
(14) A Correct
(15) Q With respect to this suggestion about the isopropanol and
(16) the acetone was that in Mr Cousins sample?
(17) A That was the only specimen that was present
(18) Q All night And is your report on Mr Cousins sample that
(19) It is negative for alcohol sir?
(20) AYes, it is
(21) Q All nght So there $s$ - there $s$ no alcohol in
(22) Mr Cousins sample?
(23) A Correct
(24) Q it s just Captann Hazelwood s sample?
(25) A That s correct
(1) Q And there was no suggestion about any isopropanol or
(2) acetone in Captain Hazelwood $s$ sample?
(3) A Correct
(4) Q All right
(5) Now with respect to the series of questions Mr Chalos has
(6) raised of you is there anything you have heard sir which
(7) suggested to you that the test results you did ware
compromised
(8) in any way with the samples that were in your custody?
(9) A No The test results that we reported to the Coast Guard
(10) and to the NTSB were accurate
(11) MR JAMIN Thank you sir I have nothing further
(12) Your Honor
(13) THE COURT Thank you sir you may step down
(14) (The Witness was Excused)
(15) THE COURT Will you call your next witness?
(16) MR MONTAGUE Your Honor Plaintifts call Dr David
(17) Smith as an expert witness
(18) (The Witness is Sworn)
(19) THE CLERK Please be seated
(20) For the record sir state your full name give your
(21) address and spell your last name please
(22) THE WITNESS David Smith Smith 409 Clayton
(23) street San Francisco 94117
(24) THE CLERK Thank you sir
(25) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DR DAVID SMITH

Vol 131792
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Good morning Dr Smith
A Morning
Q Could you please state for us your educational background?
A 1 graduated in 1960 with a bacheior of science in zoology
from the Univeraity of Callfornis at Berkeley
Between 1960 and '64, I attended University of California
San Francisco medieal schoof I was also enrolled in duate
school in pharmacology which is the study of the effects of
drugs
1964 to 65 I interned at San Francisco General Hospital
1985 to 76 I did a post doctoral fellowship in clinical toxicology
In 1967 I started the Halght Ashbury free cilnics in San Franciace and went on the faculty of UC San Francisco Q Okay So you are a medical doctor?
A Yes 1 m a physician licensed to practice in the state of Callfornia
Q Thank you And could you tell us now what your current present - your current professional positions are?
A lam the medical director of the Haight Ashbury free
clinics in San Francisco which is a community based health care
(23)
(24) I am
(25) an associate clinical processor of occupational medicine and

## Vol 131793

cfinical toxicology at UC San Francisco
Q Okay Do you currently hold any teaching positions?
A Yes As lindicated, 1 am associnte clinical professor at
UC San Francisco I mavisiting protessor of the behavioral
pharmacoiogy at the University of Nevada medical school
6) Q Do you do any consulting work have you done any
consultung
work?
A Yes, I ve consulted with a wide variety of government agencies, including the Veterans Adminiatration the National
(10) Institute on Drug Abuse I ve served as a consultant for the (11) Department of Transportation in the alcohol testing area and
(12) I ve testified in front of the Department of Trensportation
(13) alcohol testing committee relative to the alcohol testing
(14) regulations under the ombudsman transportation bill
(15) Q Are you a certified medical review officer?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q Could you tell us what that is?
(18) A A medical review officer was created by statute as a result
(19) of the Drug Free Workplace Act to review specimens, to evaluate
(20) their reliability and to make judgments I am certified in
(21) addiction medicine and certified as a medical review officer
(22) and practice in the medical review officer arena for three
(23) large utilitles in the San Francisco Bay area including PG\&E
(24) and the Bay Area Rapid Transit system
(25) Q Who certified you Doctor?

A There is a certification process through the American
Society of Addiction Medicine
Q Is that a national certitication?
A Yes
Q Have you held any posituons relating to government
governmental positions or agency governmental agency positions?
A 1 ve interacted and served in a variety of capacities with
government positions, including belng on the U S Olympic
drug
(10) teating team, 1976, 1984, and I ve served as a consultant on
(11) various health care reform substance abuse prescription
drug
(12) issue for a wide variety of government agencies, including
the
(13) Food and Drug Administration, where I served on the controlled
(14) aubstance advisory committee in which we evaluated the abuse
(15) potential of drugs
(16) Q Okay Have you wrtten any articles or books?
(17) A Yes, I have authored or co authored approximately 300
(18) Ecientific articles dealing with a wide variety of alcohol and
(19) drugs topics, including alcohol and the interaction with
(20) alcohol and other druge, including dependencies pain, drugs
(21) Ilke Librium and Valium, alcohol and cocaine, various types
of
(22) drug interactions in that capacity And then I ve aleo
(23) authored articies on alcohol and substance abuse disorders
in
(24) the various textbooks of psychiatry including the Lang
(25) textbook on paychiatry in the recent American Paychiatric

## V어 131795

Association textbook on substance abuse disorders
I ve also written an article entitied Identifying and
(3) Responding to Drug Abuse in the Workplace as part of a national
(4) conference that we had on therapeutic drugs and drugs of abuse
(5) In the area of the drug-iree workplace
(6) Now do you have experience and expertise as to the
studying of the results of blood alcohol concentration tests?
A Yee, I worked in this area for many years and as a medical
) review officer I ve served as a medical review officer for
(10) approximately 500 cases, some of whom inciude alcohol testing
(11) where I ve had to go into arbitration hearings and present my
(12) evaluation of the alcohol reault and use techniques of
(13) retrograde extrapolation to interpret the reaults under the
(14) guidelines established by that company
(15) Q Could you can you tell us basically uniess you already
(18) have covered it what you really do as a medical review
(17) officer when it comes to blood alcohol concentration tests?
(18) A The primary focus of a medical review officer is to an
(19) Individual who is tested in the workplace for whatever reason
(20) It might be for cost testing because there san accident, an (21) individual might have suspected of being involved with alcohol
(22) because they have alcohol on their breath There may be
(23) behaviors that the supervisor identifies as being associated
(24) With some form of substance abuse, alcohol or the elicit
(25) drugs
(1) The company has regulations by which testing can occur
(2) Those regulations are implemented the biological appropriate
(3) biological specimen is collected it is sent to a certilied lab
(4) where it is analyzed, and verified by the certifying
scientists The medical review officer must evaluate that drug
6) test, review all of the chain of custody documents in the laboratory procedure interact with the certifying scientists in the lab and then certify that specimen as a medical review officer
(0) Different specimens have different regulations For
(11) example the eifcit banned drugs such as cocaune marijuana,
(12) opiates, amphetamines PCP are much more strictly regulated
(13) until very recently than were the testing of alcohol
(14) spacimens
(15) So it is the medical review officer it is required to know
(16) the regulations that impact on that particular industry, the
(17) impact on that particular employee and what the company
(18) reguiations are
(19) Different companies have different regulations For
(20) example, some companies did alcohol testing and Involved the
(21) medical review officer wheress other companses only do testing
(22) for elicit drugs, not tessing for alcohol Some companies
(23) Involve the medical review officer in all aspects of testing,
(24) both alcohol and the elicit druge
(25) Once I judge the specimen as reliable I report that to the

[^2]$\qquad$
$\qquad$
(1) act
correct?
(5) A Yes
(6) Q Okay
(7) A Once the test is judged to be reliable, then we interpret
(8) It relative to the clinical meaning of the teat and different
9) tests might have different clinical meanings or ramificatlons
(10) Q Now when you make these determinations are you required
(11) as a medical review officer to support it support your
(12) conclusions in proceedings or is it just made for textbook
(13) reasons?
(14) A No, I m required to defend that reault in front of
(15) arbitration hearings The usual arbitration hearing that I
(16) participate is that the employee is on one side trying to
(17) invalidate the test, and the employer is on the other side
(18) trying to validate the test and implement whatever diseipllnary
(19) reasens
(20) The medical review officer is to be an objective arbitrator
(21) reaching independent judgments dictated by our own standards
(22) of practice of objectivity and appropriate clinical practica
(23) Q Now as a medical review otficer are you considered a (24) neutral expert or are you hired by either the employer or the
(25) employee?

## Vol $13 \quad 1799$

(1) the
(3) company and be paid by the company but our own standards of
(s) practlce require that we be neutral and have no conillet of interest
For example, under our code of ethics as a medical review officer we cannot refer our patiente to any treatment program
(日) that we may be afflilated with So for example in my (9) evaluation I might say inpatient treatment but there has to be
(10) completely separate evaluation relative to what inpatient
(11) program that go into or the patient the employee goes into

We
(12) have a code of ethics that require that we be neutral and
(13) objective
(14) OOkay
(15) Your Honor the plaintifts offer Dr Smith as an expert in
(16) substance abuse testing and medical review of substance abuse
(17) evidence including chain of custody documentation clinical
(18) toxicology and laboratory test results
(19) MR SANDERS Your Honor might I voir dire in the
(20) medical review officer area?
(21) THE COURT You may
(22) VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION OF DR DAVID SMITH
(23) BY MR SANDEAS
(24) Q Good morning my name is Mr Sanders I don I think we ve (25) ever met before

## (1) A Good morning

(2) Q The medical review officer function that you were just
(3) describing for the jury you started in that as the result of
(4) the enactment of the drug in the workplace act?
(5) A Correct
(6) Q When was that enacted?
(7) A 1989
(8) Q So how long have you been being a medical review officer
(9) since 90 or 1989 ?
(10) A About 1990
(11) Q And I take it from your description that some of the cases
(12) in which you have been involved in since 1990 perhaps 89 do
(13) involve blood alcohol tests?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q What percentage of the cases that you have heard or
(16) participated in as a medical review officer involve blood
(17) alcohol tests as compared with the other types of tests?
(18) A it would be somewhat hard for me to recall, because I ve
(19) been involved as a toxicologist, an addiction medicine
(20) specialist in blood alcohol for 25 years but I would say,
(21) strictly as a medical review officer in arbitration hearings, flve arten
(23) Q That would be a real small percentage then of these 500 (24) Cases?
(25) A As a medical review officer yes

## Vol 131801

(1) Q And I believe if I understood you correctly when you were
(2) talking about how you went about doing your function and you
(3) told about looking over chain of custody forms and other things
(4) that you did you included the fact that you interscted with a
(5) person that did the testing the drug - the chemical testing
(6) right?
(7) AYes
(8) Q Did you say that?
(9) A As part of our process, I will - I have questions or (10) issues i call the certifying scientists at the NIDA certified (11) lab that I use and interact with
(12) Q Now in the case here that you re getting ready to testify (13) about you didn $t$ interact with a man named Noedel did you?
(14) A No Who Ilnterscted with was Dr Michael Peat
(15) Q And you heard - you were sitting night over there when Dr
(16) Peat testified he didn ido the test?
(17) A No I interacted with Dr Michael Pete in the past, last
(18) week and I ve interacted with him betore
(19) O But the question was Doctor Dr Peat didn ido the test (20) on Captain Hazelwood sblood did he?
(21) A That's an incorrect characterization The certifying
(22) scientiat ls not the person that does the test The faboratory
(23) designated a certifying scientiat, it's usually the head of the
lab or some position - a person in the position of authority
(25) And a medical review officer is required to interact with the

Vol 131802
certifying scientist
I can, if I so choose - and I have on occasion done that, actually contacted the person that did the test but that is the person that did the test and the certifying scientist are not synonymous
Q All right in any event Doctor you didn t have any
interaction with Mr Matt Noedel did you?
A I did not have any interaction with Mr Matt Noedel
Q And then I believe you said you had an interaction with Or Peat but -
A Carrect
Q But that was last week?
A Correct
Q You had already formed your opinion in this case before you
ever talked to Dr Peat hadn tyou?
A I interacted with Dr Peat following my usual procedures of
(17) going through all the forms and chain of custody with Dr Peat
(18) as the certifying scientist
(19) O I beg your pardon Doctor The question was hadn tyou
(20) already formed your opinion and reported it to counsel and had
(21) your deposition taken and stated your opinion before you ever
(22) met Dr Peat?
(23) A My intersction with Dr Peat veritied my opinion, but I
(24) already presented my opinion in deposition
(25) $Q$ So the answer to my question is yes you had already formed

## Vot 131803

your opinion?
A Well, I stick by my answer
Q Yes or no Doctor?
A I had an opinion I would not characterize it that way I
had an opinion I presented it in deposition I went through the record with Dr Peat and verified that my opinion was rellable
Q That was atterwards?
A Correct
(10) MR SANDERS No further questions
(11) Just a minute Your Honor Your Honor I would request a
(12) briet side bar and maybe we could do it at the break on the
(13) question of expertise and how far -
(14) THE COURT We re nght at break time Let $s$ iake our
(15) recess ladies and gentiemen and I II hear counsel
(16) (Jury out at 1000 a m )
(17) THE COURT I assume due to the nature of this you
(18) probably wanted it on the record
(19) MR SANDERS I think that s a good idea
(20) THE COURT Go ahead
(21) MR SANDERS May It please the Court the problem I
(22) have with this is that I think that the plaintiffs are trying
(23) to have this man qualified as an expert on the question of
(24) evaluating the chain of custody And it strikes me as
(25) something not within the expertise certainly this person or
(1) anybody else to be an expert in the chain of custody I mean
(2) what one does with the chain of custody to determine whether
(3) It $\mathbf{s}$ valid or not is no different from what this jury is going
(4) to be asked to do with respect to that and I don think there
(5) is any qualification possible to be an expert in that And
(6) second if there is this foundation hasn t been laid with this
(7) man
(8) Moreover it is - from the voir dire it is clear that the
(9) function that he performs as a medical review officer is
(10) different from what he s been asked to do here and what he s
(11) going to be asked to do here
(12) Sol think there s serious questions about I think the man
(13) is an expert in his field My question is can there be and is
(14) he an expert as a medical review officer
(15) MR O NEILL In briet response Your Honor
(16) As a medical review officer he does review questions of
(17) chain of custody The fact that a pury in this case ultumately
(18) has to pass on chain of custody that line of argument we
(19) abolished years ago when we regularly started to use expert
(20) witnesses on questions that juries address - the purpose of
(21) his testimony is to ald the jury into coming to a conclusion
(22) about the chain of custody and as a medical reviow officer he
(23) has that experience for four or five years Indeed the
(24) experiences is unusual
(25) Now the fact that when he is a medical review officar he

## Vol 131805

(1) Juries these things as opposed to appearing here as an expert (2) witness doesn t strike me as germane one way or the other We
(3) do intend to offer him as an expert on the chain of custody in
(4) addition to retrograde extrapolation and some testumony on the
(5) physiological - the mechanical effects of alcohol on motor
(6) skills and the nerves in the nervous system But this is what
(7) we ve done for years on these kind of issues
(8) MR SANDERS I have no quarrel with the -
(9) MR O NEILL 1 might just add -
(10) THE COURT We re not going to double team this wing
(11) Mr O Neill took up the ball bat with him start and finish
(12) with him
(13) MR O NEILL I might add that he testified that he
(14) was trained to become a juror as a certified medical whatever
(15) the heck he is
(16) THE COURT Mr Sanders
(17) MR SANDERS I m getting some hetp too Your Honor
(18) MR NEAL I m not speaking though
(19) MR SANDERS May it please the Court I have no
(20) problem with this man testifying as to the retrograde
(21) extrapolation and some of these effects What concerns me is
(22) that - that he $s$ being put forward as an expert in making
(23) factual judgments and that s exactly what they re going to do
(24) I think and while he may be able to testify about what he
(25) thinks about the chain of custody 1 don $t$ think he $s$ an expert

## Vol 131806

(1) in it I don t think we have such things as experts in
(2) judgments
(3) THE COURT Gentiemen it s a rut that I think we all
(4) tend to fall into that experts have to deal with things
(5) scientific and I think that s just not necessarily so Ruie
(6) 702 speaks especially to the possibility of expert opinion
(7) testimony coming in on such things as the generalized category
(8) of quote specralized knowiedge I think what I have heard in
(9) the voir dire and before that suggests that this doctor has
(10) specialized knowiedge in an area that may be helptul and I so
(11) find to the jury in evaluating the evidence in this case and I
(12) will allow him to tesuty
(13) We ll be in recess for 15 minutes
(14) (Recess at 1005 am )
(15) (Jury in at 1020 am )
(16) THE CLERK All rise
(17) THE COURT Ladies and gentlemen I have ruled that
(18) Dr Smith has specialized knowledge about drug testing
(19) procedures and pharmacology matters as to which he may offer
(20) Opinions You may inquire
(21) BYMA MONTAGUE
(22) O Dr Smith I d like to ask you some questions about the
(23) handling of the blood samples of Captain Hazelwood in this
(24) case Okay Have you - have you studied any information
(25) concerning the handing of those samples?

## (1) AYes

(2) Q And could you tell the jury what it is that you looked at?
(3) A I studied the chaln of custody forms, the analytical
(4) procedures from both CompuChem and the Center for Human
(5) Toxicology I looked at the deposttions of Conner, Stock, and
(6) Metcall and discussed and reviewed the documents with the
(7) certilying scientists of CompuChem Laboratory Dr Peat and I
(B) also reviewed the material with a consultant certifying
(9) acientist who had the record for the State of Alaska Dick
(10) Prouty
(11) Q And did you hear Dr Peat testity this morning? Were you
(12) here for that?
(13) AYes
(14) Q And did you see the photographs that were used with
(15) Dr Peat -
(16) A Yee
(17) Q - this morning? And had you seen those before?
(18) ANo
(19) Q Okay
(20) A Pardon me I did see them this morning Today was the
(21) IIrat time I had actually seen the photographs
(22) O Okay And have you reviewed the actual test reports -
(23) A Yes
(24) Q - that came out of the CompuChem Laboratory?
(25) AYes
(1) MR MONTAGUE May I approach the witness Your
(2) Honor?
(3) THE COURT You may
(4) BYMR MONTAGUE
(5) Q l d like to show you a copy of Plainuff s Exhibit 3797
(6) which has already been admitted and ask you of that - that
(7) represents the test results of CompuChem that you previously
(B) seen?
(9) AYes
(10) Q Okay Now what does NIDA stand for?
(11) A The National Institute of Drug Abuse
(12) Q And what is a NIDA certified laboratory?
(13) A The Natlonal Institute of Drug Abuse, using epecific
(14) proficiency teating techniques, certifies a laboratory may
be a
(15) NIDA certifled lab A medical review officer is required to
(16) have the specimen analyzed by a NIDA certified laboratory
(17) Q Now are you finished?
(18) AYes
(19) Q Now does NIDA certify laboratones for blood alcohol
(20) testing?
(21) A Yea The NIDA certiflcation applies to the testing of
(22) illicit druge, but in general, forensic testing of illicit
(23) druge, they have a forenaic capability for doing alcohol blood
(24) testing Not all NIDA certified labs do aicohol biood teating
(25) but they do have the capability in terms of technique

## Vol 131809

(1) Q All right As a medical review officer and as someone
(2) expertenced in the area of toxicology for 25 years does - is
(3) there any significance to you when you recesved a blood alcohol
(4) concentration test from a NIDA certified laboratory?
(5) A Yes Receiving it from a NIDA certified laboratory is a
(6) stamp of approval that they have met certain standards and
(7) proflciency testing And as I indicated, we're only to have
(8) our specimens tested at a NIDA certified Iab, because it is a
(9) quality mssurance measure that is required when you re
working
(10) in this area
(11) Q Okay Now you have reviewed the chain of custody in
(12) approximately 500 cases involving alcohol and/or drug abuse
(13) Cases?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q And is there a difference in the chain of custody in
(16) those - those type of testings whether it $s$ for drugs or for
(17) alcohol?
(18) A The medical review officer process of reviewing the chain
(19) of custody is the same, but there are much stricter standards
(20) for chain of custody for ulicit banned druga They call them (21) the NIDA tlve I ve already reviewed them These would be (22) cocaine, marijuana, opiates, PCP, amphetamines The alcohol
(23) testing area was much less regulated, although that increase in
(24) regulation is occurring now with the recent passage of the
(25) Omnibus Transportation Act and the alcohol testing measures
that I ve previously alluded to
O Well in each of those cases the drug cases and I think
you said there were ten alcohol cases that you re invoived?
A Approximately, yes
Q In each of those cases were you?
THE COURT Excuse me I think he said five or ten
percent if I understood him
THE WITNESS That s correct Your Honor
BY MR MONTAGUE
QIm sorry five or ten percent In the cases that included
both alcohol testing and drug abuse testing were you required
as a medical review officer to reach a conclusion as to the
reliability of the chain of custody leading up to the actual
testing?
A Yes
Q And have you done that in this case?
A Yes
Q And what is your conclusion?
A In my opinion this chain of custody is intact All
procedures were properly followed There was no what we call
(21) a fatal flaw, which would be a reason to reject a specimen, and
(22) this is a reliable specimen that can be acted upon
(23) $Q$ Is the fact that the seals around the fube were intact on
(24) the Hazelwood tubes does that have a significance to you in
(25) reaching your result?

## Vol 13181

A Yes The most critical element is that the integrity of the specimen must be intac! There can be other issues, but these relative evaluations of chain of custody are considered
relatively minor in relationship to what we call fatal flaw If the integrity of the specimen is intact the evidence seal is intact, it s properly initialed, then this meets the chaln at custody standards and is a specimen that I not only do but must judge reliabie If I rejected this specimen I would be medically negligent and subject to legal action Q Have you ever heard of the term no test report?
AYes
Q What is that?
(13) A What happens is that the laboratory received a apecimen and
(14) determines that there has been a fatal flaw, the evidence seal
(15) has been vlolated, the integrity of the apecimen has been
(16) invaded, and agaln that $s$ the seal over the tube that has the
(17) blood in it That sthe critical one That, because the
(18) integrity of the specimen has been violated, there is the
(19) potential for tampering and they no test it and what is
(20) reported to the medical review officer, depending on the
(21) reporting procedures In the companies that I work with no
(22) test is reported to the medical review officer, and we take
(23) cilnical action For example, we may increase the
irequency of
(24) testing, have the individuals see the employee counselor,
(25) something of this nature because it asually the employee
that tampers with the specimen but $I$ cannot act on a no test by any procedure I can have a clinical response to a no test,
3) but not a legal or regulatory response

Q Okay And if there was any evidence of tampering at all
with the seal around the tube would you expect to recerve a no
test from the laboratory?
A Yes The lab is required to no test the apecimen, and then
(8) whatever reporting requirements are in effect, the regulations
vary depending on the different specimens being tested
They re much stricter, for example, with the Illicit drugs
Q Okay Now there s been talk about red stoppers and gray
stoppers and the difference between what is supposed to be
In those tubes
AYes
Q Am I correct one has serum and - the red stopper is supposed to have serum in it and the gray stopper blood whole
(17) blood?
(18) A What happens is that in the gray stoppered tubes they have
(19) a preservative and anticoagulant that prevents the blood
from
(20) clotting The red stoppered tube does not have the
preservative and anticoagulant, and therefore it can clot,
which is the red - the clot of the blood separates from the
serum and the serum is clear
In general the test is serum for the banned drugs, and they test the whole blood for alcohol And the standards that
are reported are whole blood standards For example if in
the
(2) state of Alaska your drunk driving leved is 08 or $\mathbf{1 0}$, then
() that is a whole blood standard
(4) The technician knows when they pick up the gray stoppered
) tube and look in it that it's whole blood and it hasn't
separated into the clot with serum The serum is e
straw colored liquid that s easily diacernible when you pick
up
the tube
Q And in fact the difference between the serum and the whole
blood is easily discernible is that another safeguard as far
as you re concerned that these tests were done?
A in a NIDA lab, skilled lab, they have done thousands of
(13) these specimens They know what is appropriate procedure And
(14) laboratory - If a technician picks up what s supposed to be -
(15) whole blood ample, they re going to see that te, In fact,
(16) serum and then whatever reporting procedures are implemented
(17) would be implemented
(18) Q Now I handed you earlier exhibit - was it 3797 I
believe?
AYes
Q And that is the CompuChem test results?
A Yes
Q Do you have - do you have an understanding of what tume
the blood samples were taken from Captain Hazelwood?
A Yes

Vol 131814
Q And on what date?
A 1050 a m, March 24th 1989 ?
(3) Q Now what does that - what does the iest repor from
(4) CompuChem show as to the blood alcohol concentration of Captain
(5) Hazelwoods and the blood sample taken 1050 a m on March 24

1989 ?
A 061 percent
Q May I borrow that please since we don 1 have a spare one
sol can put it on the machine?
(10) Dr Smith Im showing the first page of 3797 Is that the
(1) report that you were referring to?

AYea
(13) Q Okay And that is the report for Captain Hazelwood?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q All right Now I would like to call your attention to the
(16) part under - where it says ethanol parenthesis WV and then
(17) blood 061 percent Do you see that?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q Could you tell us what that represents - strike that Let
(20) me ask you another question
(21) Does that indicate that at the time the - this blood
(22) sample was drawn there was aicohol in the blood of Captain
(23) Hazelwood?
(24) A Yes \&
(25) Q Okay And what does that number at that point 061
(1) Captain Hazelwood $\mathbf{s}$ blood alcohol concentration was at or about
(2) the tume of the grounding of the Exxon Valdez on - around
(3) midnight? I don t know whether it s midnight the 23rd or
(4) midnight the 24 th the evening morning midnight between the
(5) 23rd and the 24th?
(6) AYes
(7) Q Okay And did you make any such calculation?
(8) AYes
(9) Q Could you just tell us the result of that calculation?
(10) A Using the method of retrograde extrapoiation and taking
(i1) into consideration the variables that we were trained to
(12) inctude, my professtonal opinion is that his blood alcohol at
(13) the time of the grounding was 226
(14) Q That s 226 percent?
(15) A Yes
(18) Q Okay
(17) A 226 percent weight by volume
(18) Q And did we ask you also to make a similar calculation
(19) for - for an earlier tıme?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q And what time - and actually you selected the tume?
(22) A One hour earlier
(23) Q Okay That would be 1100 pm ?
(24) AYes
(25) Q On the 23rd of Maren?
percent mean?
A 081 percent weight by volume is the standard way a laboratory reports a specimen to In thia case for purposes 01
(4) our discussion, to the clinician myaelf in this context, or whoever they report it to
Q Okay Now this blood was the blood sample was drawn at 1050 a m and were you asked to make a determination as to what Captain Hazelwood s blood alcohol concentration was at

Itme earlier than 1050 a m on March 24th 1989 ?
A Yes
Q And can you tell us what method or technique you use to do that?
A The method that I used is a technique called retragrade extrapolation which le a standard clinicat tectinique that is acceptable, for inatance, particularly in terma of calculating what the level of blood alcohol is at some time prior to when the specimen was analyzed The technique of retrograde extrapoiation is part of our training as a medical review officer and is generally accepted by laboratories and clinics to answer certain questions that might be posed whether it be
(21) In a company situation, which is where I work mostly or a
(22) drunk driving situation Things of that nature
(23) Q Okay And that $s$ an accepted method methodology?
(24) A Yes
[25) Q Okay Now were you asked to form an opinion as to what

Voㅓ 131817
(1) A Yes
(2) Q Okay And did you make such a calculation?
(3) AYes
(4) Q What was the result?
(5) A Using the same method, taking into consideration the same
(6) variables, my opinion my professional opinion is that the
(7) blood alcohol at the 1100 pm area was approximately

241
(8) O Okay Now could you tell us the significance of those numbers?
(10) A Again you have certain standards For example, in the (11) transportation industry for individuals that transport
(12) commercial veseels, other than recreational vehicles,
(13) recreational vessels, the acceptable level is 04, so thls
(14) would be approximately six times the acceptable 04 level
(15) Drunk driving in different states it might be either 08
(16) or 10 but this would be two and a halt times the drunk
(17) driving level
(18) O Okay To reach those numbers you used this retrograde
(19) extrapolation technique?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q And can that - you ve gone back approximately 11 or 12
(22) hours isn that correct?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q And is it possible - is it proper to use that retrograde
(25) extrapolation technique to go back so far?

## Vol 131818

A Yes You have to assume a number of variables which I will present the variables that we assume in using retrograde

## extrapolation

First of all, when alcohol gets into the body it $s$
absorbed into the gastrointestinal tract into the blood stream and then into atter an equilibrium throughout the body, it sabsorbed into the brain The brain is the target organ, because that s the organ that producea the ntoxication
and Impaurment
Blood is the closest approximation that we can have of the brain level So the focus is on blood and in this case for each ounce of alcohol that the individual drinks, we use an average of 03 up This absorptlon rate is influenced by a variety of factors For example, it there s no food in the stomach - the atomach empties in about an hour - if there is food in the stomach, it might take up to four hours So one of
(17) the key assumptions is that you have to select a time in which
(18) you belleve all the alcohol has been absorbed from the stomach
(19) Into the blood stream
(20) Retrograde extrapolation is a valid technique only when
(21) you re on the descending curve of the metabolism of alcohol
(22) Alcohol elimination and the way had alcohol is eliminated 18
(23) it passes through the liver and the liver enzymes break it down
(24) and then it is excreted And alcohol metabolism is a steady
(25) atate elimination with the average elimination rate

## Vol 131819

being 015
So In retrograde extrapolation we are trained and uae an ellimination of 015 on the descending curve Theretore if can have the screen I can show how I made the calculation MR MONTAGUE Okay Can we put the flag screen up and the stylus
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Before you do that I would like to ןust ask you one
question though You said you used the term in order to do the retrograde extrapolation you have to be on the down curve?
(11) AYes
(12) Q Does that mean that you can only go back up to the - up to
(13) the - you can only go back to the time where the alcohol level
(14) has already peaked?
(15) A Yes
(16) Q You can t go past the peak tıme? Is that what you re
(17) saying?
(18) A Correct You have to make an assumption and you can
(19) entertain different scenarios and assumptions, but when you re
(20) asked to render a protessional opinion you must select a
(21) particular assumption in order to give a reaponse And the
(22) assumption would be at the time you belleve that all of the
(23) alcohol is absorbed into - from the stomach into the blood
(24) stream and you re on the descending curve of the
elimination
(25) rate
(1)
5) do that on the screen?

A Yes Again what you do is you take the hours times the elimination rate You come up with a figure And then you add
(8) the known level that you have from the test resuit, In this
case 061 So if you have an 11 hour retrograde
extrapolation,
(10) which is the first question that I was asked, It would be 11
(11) times 015, equals 165 You add 061 and you come up
with 226
Q And that s the number for midnight?
A That s the 11 hour -
Q Okay That $s$ the midnight number?
A That ls correct
Q Okay Now could you do the same calculation for 11007
A In the 1100 it would be 12 times 015 equals 180 Add the
061 and you get a 241 at the 12 hour rate which is the 1100 pm time period
Q Okay And that s-those - that s the mathematıcal
calculations of how you reached those figures?
AYes
MR MONTAGUE Could we get a printout of that
please?

## Vol 131821

BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Now in picking the 1100 figure did you make any assumptions?
A Yes As I veindicated, you need to make a - an
assumption that best flts your perception of the information that you re provided And the key assumption here ia that you
must assume that all of the aicohol has been absorbed from
the
s) stomach and that you re on the descending limb of the
elimination curve I made the assumption that all of the
alcohol had been absorbed by 1100 pm and that he was on
descending timb of the elimination curve
Q Okay And are you - by the way is there any margin of error for those calculations?
A Yes There is subatantial biological variabllity in ellmination ratee producing a substantial range However
figure of 015 is accepted and is part of our tralning, and the
error rate would be plus or minus ten percent, so that with
great reliability I can say this figure plus or minua ten percent in the sense that a majority of Individuale will have an elimination rate, absorption rate, all the other variables that you have to consider, and that we're required to ansider
as part of our training and education in this area, so that a majority of individuals, the vast majority of individuale,
would be within plus or minus ten percent of this figure
There salew that will scatter out on either side, either
(1) be higher or lower, but given the assumptions and the
2) elimination rates and understanding of biological variables in
(3) absorption and metabolism, I believe this is a reliable figure 4) plus or minus ten percent
5) Q Okay Now let $s$ get back to the original figure of 061

Did you - excuse me
Did you see any other tests from any other labs that
confirm that number for you?
MR SANDERS Your Honor we re going to object to the
other tests No foundation
MR MONTAGUE This is something relied on as an
accurate penod of tume or I Il establish I minot offening it
into evidence
THE COURT I ll allow you to proceed
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Are there any other tests that you viewed?
A Other lab -
QYes
A Yes The atandard procedure, particularly if there :
appeal or some forensic issue
MR SANDERS I \| object to this as being
non responsive Your Honor
THE COURT Try the question again
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Was there any other test results trom another lab upon

## Vol 131823

(1) which you relied?
(2) AYes

Q And what was that lab report?
A Center for Human Toxicology
Q Do you recall what the result was inat they had from their blood test?
A 06
Q Okay And was that consistent with what the CompuChem
test
9) was?
(10) A Yes The veritying lab Center for Human Toxicology
(i1) verified the CompuChem inb
(12) O Okay Now Doctor I want to ask you some questions
(13) strictly from a - I hope I m using the right word -
(14) physiological point of view
(15) AYes
(16) Q A medical point of view?
(17) AYes
(18) Q if a person has a blood alcohol concentration of let $s$
(19) take the higher number the 1100241 do you have an
(20) opinion again from a physiological point of view as to
(21) whether that blood alcohol concentration would have impared
(22) that person s cognitive functions?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q Now that I ve asked the question can you tell the jury
(25) what cognitive functions are?

1) A Cognitive functions are the higher cerebral cortex
functions that involve judgment analysis, ability to react to new situations
Q Okay Now at that same level the blood alcohol
concentration of 0241 is it possible again from a
physiologic point of view that a person s motor controls would
not be affected?
A Yee An individual can have substantial tolerance to the motor effects of alcohol, but not the cognitlve effects, and I would like to diagram this to better explain my presentation
Q Okay Before that s removed has that been printed out?
Okay
A This is the blood which is the specimen that you re measuring with a blood ajcohol concentration As you have
) increasing blood alcohol, you will have increasing impairment
(16) because the brain is affected differently by an increasing
(17) blood alcohol We call this progressive CNS depression
(18) At the lower levels, the higher thinking levels of the
(19) brain, this is a schematic representation of the brain This
(20) is the cerebral cortex, which is the higher levels Then this
(21) is the mid brain which deals with more basle vegetatlve
(22) functions, and the epinal cord which deals with reflex action
(23) and the cerebellum that deals with coordination So the
(24) initial impact of alcohol is on the cerebral cortex, or the
(25) higher thinking centers

## Voㅓ 131825

As the blood alcohol level goes up, you then have
(2) progressive CNS depression of the mid brain, which can produce
3) a variety of different responses It can produce, for example,
(4) a sensation of the vomiting center in the mid brain, and the
5) individual will vomit This is actually a protective mechanism
6) of the brain to rid the body of the foxic alcohol You can
7) produce motor imparment so that you can have an individual
8) that has tolerance, impairment of cognitive function, which involves the judgment and the ability to analyze, without impairment of motor coordination
(11) There ss substantial tolerance to this motor impairment
(12) The tolerance is determined by genetic factors There are
(13) certain individuals that have a past or family history of
(14) alcoholism that have what we call an inborn tolerance They
(15) will take more of the drug without having impairment and that
(16) will be demonstrated with the first drink
(17) Then there is pharmacological tolerance, which the
(18) individual repeatedly administers higher doses of the drug
(19) There is a neuroadaptation that occurs in the brain and the
(20) body, and this is called pharmacological tolerance meaning that
(21) it requires more of a drug so achieve the same effect
(22) And finaily there is behavioral tolerance, which is the
(23) experienced drinker, who will learn to moderate their

## behavior

(24) in part to escape detection so that they may be able to walk
(25) and function in a motor fashion at a level that to the

BSA


5-19-94
$\qquad$ $X \operatorname{MAX}(28)$
(1) inexperienced drinker would produce great motor impairment
(2) However this tolerance does not occur to the cognitive or judgmental areas and of course if the blood alcohol goes high
(4) enough, you can actualiy die of acute alcohol poisoning This
(5) is why we call it progressive CNS depression, of which the ) effecte of the alcohol start at the higher centers As blood alcohol goes up, the CNS depression goes down through the
higher centers down through the mid brain and impairment gaes
(9) up
(10) Q Doctor during that discourse you used the word sometimes
(11) drug instead of alcohol Were you referring to the same are
(12) they interchangeable?
(13) A Alcohol is a drug
(14) Q Could we have a printout please?
(15) MR MONTAGUE Doctor thank you very much Your
(16) Honor I would like to offer these two created exhibits by the
(17) doctor The first being the caiculations which I understand
(18) will be Exhibit PX3812 and the sketch of the brain which would
(19) be PX3813 Id like to offer them into evidence
(20) (Exhibit PX3812 and PX3813 offered)
(21) MR SANDERS No objection Your Honor
(22) MR MONTAGUE I need stickers
(23) THE COURT Plaintifts 3812 and 3813 are admitted
(24) (Exhibit 3812 and 3813 received)
(25) THE COURT You may cross examine

## Vol 131827

(1) MR SANDERS Thank you Your Honor
(2) MR SANDERS May it please the Court?
(3) THE COURT Mr Sanders
(4) CROSS EXAMINATION OF DAVID E SMITH
(5) BYMR SANDERS
(6) Q Dr Smith you have done quite a bit of writing as you
testified earlier today correct?
A Yes
Q And did you have occasion to write a chapter in a book
called The Review of General Psychiatry?
(11) A Yes
(12) Q And was that chapter 187
(13) A Yes
(14) Q And you wrote that along with another doctor 1 assume?
(15) AYes
(16) Q Dr Landry?
(17) AYes
(18) Q And I believe the edition I have in front of you and this
(19) Is Defendant s Exhibit 9093 Your Honor if you would look at
(20) page 176 of Exhibit 9093 there $s$ a chart that appears in the
(21) bottom right hand corner May I have the Elmo please?
(22) That s a chart that you inciuded within the chapter that
(23) you co wrote is that right?
(24) A Yes
(25) Q Now that chart is a description I assume for a normal
(1) person -
(2) AYee
(3) Q - of the different stages of blood alcohol content and
(4) what kinds of signs of intoxication there are is that correct?
(5) A Yes
(6) Q That $s$ from your chapter from this book?
(7) AYes
(8) Q When did you publish this chapter? Was it about 1988 ?
(9) AYes
(10) Q And then it s been - there s been another edrtion since
(11) then in 19937
(12) A Yes
(13) Q And does this chart appear in that book?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q Now these numbers over here on the left hand side these
(16) that I mpointing to with the pen
(17) AYes
(18) Q For our purposes here we ve been talking about 061 and
(19) 10 This is a different measure but if we just considered
(20) this to be 020 to 099 and then 100 to 199 that would put
(21) us in the right framework for what we ve been taiking about
(22) correct?
(23) A That is correct
(24) Q Now from - you re going to have to help me with some of
(25) the reading here 1 m not familiar with these terms I can do

## Voㅓ 131829

(1) okay from 100 to 199
(2) A Yeah
(3) Q The signs are marked mental impairment?
(4) AYes
(5) Q And coordination?
(6) AYes
(7) OWhat s that?
(8) A That's impairment of groses motor performance with
(9) impairment of coordination
(10) Q Okay Those are the motor skills you were talking about?
(11) ACorrect
(12) Q And then there sproionged reaction time That spretty
(13) self explanatory
(14) A Yes
(15) Q And then there s a phrase here Ataxia?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q What s ataxia?
(18) A Ataxia would be, llke In balance staggering gatt
(19) Q Stumbling staggening?
(20) AYes
(21) Q And then from 200 to 299 there $s$ nausea and vomiting
(22) tirst?
(23) AYes
(24) Q What s this next one?
(25) A Diplopia would be blurred vision

1) Q Would be what? 1 m sorry 13
(2) A Blurred vision

Q And then the next one is marked ataxia?
A Yes
Q What is the difference between regular old ataxia and marked ataxia?
A You stumble more
Q It s a pronounced state of staggering stumbling?
A Right
Q In balance?
A Yes
Q And then when you get to 30 to 399 there are severe
symptoms correct?
A Yes
Q Hypotherma?
A Yes
Q What s the next one?
A Severe dysarthria
Q What $s$ that?
A That s slurred speech, very siurred speech
(21) Q Easily recognizable?

A Yes
Q Amnesia?
A Yes That would be the alcohol black out
Q And stage one anesthesia What s that?

## Vol 131831

A Comatose You pass out There sadifference between a (2) black out and a pass out
(3) Q Okay This is a pass out as opposed to a black out?
(4) A Yes
5) Q And then when you get from 400 above you can even have
(5) death can tyou?
7) AYes
8) Q if I might I think I II go to the retrograde extrapolation
9) first and 1 m going to - I m not gaing to compete with you on
drawing or figuring but 1 migoing to try to -1 thought -
) can I use these?
(12) MR O NEILL. That s my exhibit
(13) MR SANDERS I m just using the back of it
(14) MR O NEILL This is the Graves report
(15) MR SANDERS I just wanted the back of it
(16) MR O NEILL I object
(17) MR SANDERS Quit being so picky
(18) THE COURT Your objection is being cured I think
(19) BYMR SANDERS
(20) Q Now first I want to make sure Doctor that we all
(21) understand the assumptions that go into this extrapolation
(22) back And the first assumption is and you correctly
(23) identified this as a key assumption that you re assuming that
(24) the alcohol has been absorbed?
(25) AYes
(1) Q And that you are on the downward curve?
(2) AYes
(3) Q in other words remembering your little chart the blood
(4) alcohol not going up the elimination is starting and
(5) therefore the blood alcohol is going down?
(6) A Yes
(7) A And in fact when you made this analysis for counsel you
(8) were asked to assume then that there was no drinking by
(9) Captain Hazelwood certainly after 1100 pm correct?
(10) A Wasn tasked by counsel I made that assumption after
(11) analyzing all the facts and reviewing all the scenarios That
(12) was the assumption $I$ arrived at as the most rellable
assumption
(13) to start with
(14) Q So you re assuming - as the mosi reliable assumption
(15) you re assuming no drinking at least after 1100 ?
(16) A Yee
(17) Q Okay And as a matter of fact it goes back a little
(18) further than that doesn it it because you ve got at least an
(19) hour with an empty stomach it takes for alcohol to be absorbed
(20) after you drink it so the tume of no drinking moves on back
(21) some more doesn $t$ it?
(22) A Yee At least an hour, because an empty stomach, you II
(23) have all the alcohol absorbing in an hour Food in the
(24) stomach, it may be as long as four hours
(25) Q So your assumption of no drinking by Captain Hazelwood

## Vol 131833

(1) perhaps goes as tar back as before going to the security gate
(2) at 830 in the evening and boarding the ship?
(3) A My assumption is no drinking after 11, and then all alcohol
(4) absorbed by 11
(5) Q But the assumption of no drinking has to go back belore
(6) 1100 nght ?
(7) A That is correct
(8) Q At least an hour?
(9) A At least an hour
(10) Q All nght Now let start at the bottom There s no
(i1) telling how this is going to look Let s say if the time that
(12) the consent form was signed which is before you take the blood
(13) sample was 1035 and the time at which the blood sample was
(14) taken at about 1055 can we use 1045 as our time for the
(15) taking of the sample?
(16) A Depends on the question you re going to sak, but let me
(17) accept that depending on the question you re asking
(18) Q Well let s have a working hypothesis 1045 And we know
(19) from the test results that you say are reliable that the
(20) figure for 1045 is 0617
(21) A Yes
(22) Q And you using your standard elimination rate and your
(23) expertise you say that when you go back to approximately
(24) midnight is that correct?
(25) A Yes

Vol $13 \quad 1834$
Q - the blood alcohol content of Captain Hazelwoods blood
If this is reliable was 226 ?
AYes
Q And then at 1100 it was 2417
AYes
Q l put that down correctly?
A Yes
Q And you arrive at that that s not - that s a calculation
even I can do You just take the number of hours you use the basic elimination rate and you get a sum then you add it to
the 061 and there you have it?
A Yes l even demonstrated how I arrived at that calculation
Q Let s fill in another time here Let s fill in the time
that the United States Coast Guard came on board and just to
make it easy for me at least let s say it was 345
approximately And if you take that as seven hours seven
times 015 plus 061 comes up to 166 Does that sound right
to you?
A Yes
Q Now if we compare those readings using your method of retrograde extrapolation with what s on this chart Exhibit 9064 what we have at the time that the Coast Guard comes (24) on board according to this chart there is marked mental (25) impairment in coordination prolonged reaction time and ataxia

## Vol 131835

correct?
A No that s not correct As you veindicated, and as I indicated, this is a standard chart that relies and focuaes on the average clinical response in social drinkers This all has
to be modified when you re applying it to a specific case particularly if that specific individual has a history of alcohol problems because these figures, particularly the motor
impairment figures would not apply So you ve gone from the
general to the specific, and I wouldn t want to agree with that
(10) characterization

Q So are you assuming there is this alcohol history here or
are you fust saying I can t assume that so therefore I can t tell you?
MR MONTAGUE Your Honor the questions that were posed to Dr Smith were hypothetical and I think the cross exam shouid be kept in that way and not have him apply it to a specific person
MR SANDERS I m seeking a clarification what he is saying
THE COURT I think the question is proper and you may proceed
BYMR SANDERS
Q Do you have the question?
THE COURT Give it again
BYMR SANDERS
(1) Q Are you assuming this kind of alcohol history here for your (2) calculations and for your testımony or are you simply saying (3) I m not so therefore I can 1 compare?
(4) A That would be difficult, Your Honor I need your guidance
(5) on this I listened to Captain Hazelwood stestimony last week
(6) with the history of the alcohol problems, and i ve indicated in
7) my presentation if you have a history of alcohol problems, you
8) have increased tolerance and for me to respond to that
9) specific question, I have to take into account the information
(10) that I have heard in the testimony in the depostions sol-
(11) move from a general to a specific question So betore I can
(12) reapond, I need guidance
(13) THE COURT Well I think you re going to have to look
(14) for it from the examiner I think he s given a partial answer
(15) to the question and why don t you pose another question
(16) MR SANDERS Well let me go at it this way trst
(17) BYMR SANDERS
(18) Q it is true at least for a normal person and without regard
(19) to these other factors which may or may not be present that
(20) those conditions that I read to you would apply to a 166 ?

A Yes This chart which correlates with the 168 applies to 22) a normal person that has no evidence of tolerance, which would
(23) include no evidence of genetic solerance, pharmacological
(24) tolerance as indicated by past alcohol exposure or
behavioral
(25) tolerance But I do not belleve that you can take a general

## Vol $13 \quad 1837$

(1) chart for the average person that has no evidence of tolerance
(2) and apply it to specific signs and symptoms of a specific
3) individual and ask for an opinion on my part unless 1 am
a) allowed to take into consideration fact: that are known

## about

(5) that individual which is the fact that he does have a past
(6) history of alcohol problems and therefore would have
7) tolerance So if I can take that into conaideration I have
8) to say no opinion
(9) Q Let s just - so I understand doctor we re talking about
(10) what you heard in the court room the other day?
(11) A Correct
(12) O Or the other days when you were here?
(13) A Correct
(1a) Q That sit right?
(15) A I have listened to Captain Hazelwood's testimony last week,
(16) and l've reviewed his deposition and that Information
(17) Influences me relative to his tolerance to alcohol
(18) MR SANDERS Your Honor I think we need a minute
(19) please
(20) (At side bar off the Record)
(21) BYMR SANDERS
(22) Q Dr Smith we re going to leave it to the jury to determine
from the testimony of Captain Hazelwood and the other
) information exactly whether he falls within one of your
(25) exceptions or not but let me ask you specifically Let s just


## Vol 131839

## A Yes

Q And you also know that when they made the decision they made not to remove hum they also were putung their lives or safety on the line when they did that You understand that?
A l have no opinion on that
Q Well you do understand that they re more than casual observers there at $3 \mathbf{3 0}$ or $\mathbf{3 5}$ in the morning?
A My understanding, based on my review of the record is that
(9) they have the authority to remove him Why they didn t I have
(10) no opinion on that it s outside of my area of expertise
(11) Q Now you mentioned other factors Who is Dr Worlett (ph)?
(12) A Worlett? Dr Worlett is our medical review, offleer
(13) tralning, which 1 also teach in the same course He presents
(14) the alcohol teating and to keep the medical review officers
(15) updated on the latest science and teating in alcohol
(16) Q And as I understand you then as a matter of fact you ve (17) attended some of his training sessions?
(18) A On a regular basis, and I also ask him specific questions,
(19) Dr Worlett keeps us, all the people that participate in our
(20) American Society of addiction medical courses and the medical
(21) review officer up to date on alcohol teating So he presents
(22) the material that is in our syllabus, and we ask him questions
(23) Q And in the training you ve attended and the training
(24) materiais you ve gotten as being a part of this isn it a
(25) fact that Dr Worlett says that if you have a person who is a
(1) smoker that you should add another $\mathbf{4 0}$ percent to the
(2) elimination rate?
(3) A That would be an inaccurate characterization What - in
(4) the alcohol testing, what Dr Woriett did is present certain
(5) scientific factors that could produce alteration of
(6) metabolism Smoking increases metaboiiam in certain
(7) individuals, alcoholism does So that was information
(8) presented in the medical review officer manual by Dr Worlett
(9) Q Well isn 1 it a fact - well first you understand from
(10) Captain Hazelwood s testumony that he s a smoker?
(11) AYes
(12) Q And isn tit a fact that Dr Woriett said that for smokers
(13) you would increase this standard rate of zero - 015 by 40
(14) percent?
(15) A I believe that samischaracterization of the training In
(18) fact, at the end of the training manual, Dr Woriett Indicated
(17) that that - what you presented was in the scientific part of
(18) the training
(19) And at the end he presented the rate of 015 Is the one (20) used, and even has a case example We are given apecific cases
(21) of an employee by which we use the 015 So he presented
(22) evidence that smokers can have an increased metabolic rate, but
(23) the 015 figure was not altered, and in fact, in the case
(24) example that we were given in the alcohol testing schedule they
(25) used a 015

Vol 131841
(1) Q Would you look please at the exhibit I have in front of (2) you up there exhibit - detense Exhibit 90487
(3) A l'Il need some help from you They re alitie out of (4) order
(5) O If I can approach I might help This is a big volume of (6) materials that $s$ in that - there s the page Now III
(7) represent to you Dr Smith that that page comes from this big
(8) thing right here
(9) A That is correct Now all I have to have is my copy
(10) Q Now this page says alcohol metabolism does it not?
(11) A That is correct
(12) $Q$ And at the bottom there let me zoom in on it it says
(13) smokers have a 40 percent increased metabolism?
(14) A That is correct
(15) Q Now metabolism is the same thing as elimination?
(16) A That Is correct
(17) Q Now let s assume for just a minute with me Doctor that
(18) you do increase the rate of elimination of 015 by 40 percent
(19) and let s see what kind of numbers that gives us
(20) A l cannot accept that assumption based on the document that
(21) you presented and I have evidence in the same document that
(22) directly contradicts what you ve just said
(23) Q What is that evidence?
(24) A Under the alcohol elimination, which is the next page you 5) have referred to the page of alcohol metabolism smokers

Vol 131842
(1) percent increased metabolism But on the next page it says
(2) saturated kinetics, 015 grams per deciliter per hour
(3) Given all of that scientific information, Dr Worlett still
(4) saya 015, and in the final paragraph of that same manual page
(5) nine, it gives us the case example that we train on But it (6) says, in the employment setting there have been concerns regarding alcohol tests if one considers that the average rate of alcohol ellmination is about 015 percent 15 milligrams per decillter per hour, and then it goes on to give an example of retrograde extrapolation with the final case It
(19) is reasonable for an employer not to want an employee in a (12) safety sensitive task that day An employer could use a cutoff
(13) level above 04 percent when there $s$ documented evidence of
(14) current impairment So you have taken one scientfic fact that
(15) is used as the introduction to suggest that our elimination
(16) rate is to be changed for the purpose of retrograde
(17) extrapolation and that is inaccurate
(18) After you receive all of that scientific information the
(19) 015 still holds and the case example holds So as I ve said
20) here, I do not change the 015 even taking into consideration
(21) these other scientific facts
(22) Q All right And I understand You re saying that you don t
(23) accept that but assume hypothetically for a moment that it is (24) increased by 40 percent the numbers and you can check my math
(25) on this that would come from increasing 015 by 40 percent

## Vol 131843

(1) and I II fust round it it actually comes to 021 and I II
(2) Just use 02 You get a reading of 200 at 345 and a little
(3) 15 munutes beyond 1200 you would get 280 and if you went on
(4) back to 745 you would get 360
(5) Now if the assumption - you re forced to make this
(6) assumption 1 know you don $t$ want to but if you re forced to
(7) do those numbers look reasonable to you?
(8) A Based on your assumption you ve made the mathematical
(9) calculations correctly but I do not accept the asaumption and
(10) therefore cannot any that this is my opinion
(11) Q Doctor who is Dr Donna Smith?
(12) A Dr Donna Smith ls the individual at the Department of
(13) Transportation that teaches in our course and that we interact
(14) with relative to medical review officer guidelinea alcohol
(15) testing regulations, thinge of this nature
(16) MR SANDERS Your Honor might I put a number on this
(17) as we use this and then I can take it down can we put the
(18) number on later?
(19) Q Let me go to the - one of the other areas that you ve (20) testified about and that is your - the basis for your opinion
(21) concerning the chain of custody
(22) You ve testified that in making or giving this opinion to
(23) the ladies and gentlemen of the jury what you did was you
(24) reviewed the chain of custody documents?
(25) AYes

Vol 131844
Q And you reviewed certain deposition testimony?
A Yes
Q And then you ve talked to Dr Peat?
AYes
Q A week ago?
A Yes
Q And I belleve you talked to somebody else?
A Dr Richard Prouty
Q Dr Prouty?
AYes
Q When did you talk to him?
A Talked with him three times Ithink the first time was in
October and the last time was last week
Q I believe you ve also talked to Dr O Conner (ph)?
A Yes not about this matter but I have talked with
Dr $O$ Conner
Q You ve talked to him about this case and his testimony in this case haven tyou?
A Not in any great depth, because his area of testimony will be very different than this The individuals that I have talked to about this my specific portion of my testimony, relative to alcohol testing have been Drs Peat and Richard Prouty
Q Well did you have a conversation with Dr O Conner and
perhaps others in Mill Valley where you suggested that they

## Vol 131845

(1) could use an expanded definition of alcoholism that you had
(2) Kind of been involved in expanding that definition?
(3) A Yes
(4) $Q$ And I want to ask you a couple of questions about that
(5) The field in which you are involved in addictive medicine
(6) generally and alcohol definition diagnose-diagnoses and
(7) criteria is an area that has seen a great deal of evolution and
(8) change in the very recent past hasn tit?
(9) A That is correct The speciaity of addiction medicine has
(10) been recently, in the last several years recognlzed by the
(11) A M A in our American Society of Addiction section of which
(12) I mpresident elect, is one of the newer speciallites so that
(13) would be a correct characterization
(14) Q And as almost in any other field I think a science that
(15) grows like this has grown there are areas where there are lots
(16) of disputes among reasonable qualified professions as to what
(17) is the proper definition what is the proper diagnosis what is
(18) the proper elimination rate those kinds of things?
(19) A That is correct
(20) Q And there are legitumate differences then are there not (21) into all these areas?
(22) A That st the nature of science, is to have good falth debate
(23) and peer review
(24) Q Now science which is your major area of expertise being
(25) a doctor being in addictive medicine and having all of this

Vol 131846
experience science didn t play much of a role in your
(2) assessment of the chain of custody did it?
(3) A I followed the chain of custody procedures that I use in my
practice as a medical review officer and the guidelines as I
understood them from the training So I believe it is a
cilnical practice that's a valid clinical practice
Q I m not disparaging the ciinical practice I masking you
about your review of the chain of custody in this particular
case Your review of your the documents your review of the
deposition testumony that these ladies and gentiemen have
heard and talking to Dr Peat You didn $t$ do any tests did
(12) you scientific tests?
(13) ANo
(14) Q You didn t do any scientific measurements?
(15) A No
(16) Q And did you ever go to the lab?
(17) A That particular lab?
(19) Q ChemWest Sacramento?
(19) A Actually physically visited?
(20) Q Right
(21) ANo
(22) Q Did you ever see the testung facilities?
123) A That I can't recall We ve referred specimens there,
(24) sometime in the past totally unrelated to this matter I don $t$
(25) think I ve ever seen the lab in Sacramento ty

## V어 131847

(1) O it s closed now isn tit?
(2) A That s correct
(3) Q And you didn talk to the guy who actually did the
(4) testing physically did the testing Mr Noedel - or
(5) Dr Noedel?
(6) A In this case I didn $t$ Who I talked to was the certitying
(7) scientist Dr Michsel Pete of ChemWest
(8) Q Right And you heard him testity he had - he had never
(9) seen the samples until some tume after May 1st correct?
(10) That s your understanding?
(11) A That is my recoliection of his testimony
(12) Q All right And what you re telling us is that from your
(13) review of the chain of custody in your opinion there s no
(14) fatal flaw? Right?
(15) A Correct
(16) Q That $s$ your words?
(17) A Correct
(18) Q And second that you see no evidence of tampering?
(19) A That le correct
(20) Q All right And those two may be synonymous right?
(21) A The fatal fiaw is basicaliy if you have violation of the (22) actual integrity of the apecimen to demonstrate that there (23) might be adulteration of the specimen It doesn imean the (2a) bottle or anything of that nature You have to have the direct
(25) evidence of the violation of the integrity of the specimen

1) Q All right What you have is no testimony that you saw and
nothing in the records that say there was tampering right?
A That E correct
2) Q You fust don thave that you didn it see it anywhere?
(5) A That is correct
3) Q But you didn t physically examine these tubes to look at 7) those seals did you?
(8) A The only thing I have seen has been the photographs of
the
4) tubes
(10) Q Well those were taken a year and a half afterwards after
(11) the seals had been broken so that they could do the testing and
5) checking two or three different times right?

A 1 did not actually see the tubes
Q You don t know whether the seals were intact do you
except as it somebody said somewhere No they weren t
right? That s what you re relying on?
A ithink that mischaracterized my process My process is
(18) rellance on clinical intormation and certifled cuatodians
that
(19) document this, which ls the same procedure I use with any
(2) specimen
(21) Q Well but let me ask you about that Doctor What you re
(22) really saying is this lab was a certified lab and you would
(23) assume that a certified lab would act like a certified lab all
(24) the time partucularly with respect to this particular set of
(25) samples and tests and handing isn t that what you re saying?

## Vol 131849

(1) A NIDA certhied lab has certiln standards and ethics, and it (2) they don't conduct themselves based on these standards and
(3) ethice, they could you know, lose their license and
(4) certhication, and so when they put that - when the certhying
(5) scientiste puts his signature and verifies that, that is
(6) extremely important Now, I independently check it as I do all
7) the specimens, but I don t - I m not the one that does the
(8) test
9) Q But you didn tindependently check these specimens did
(10) you the ones in the Hazelwood case?
(11) A I used my standard procedure of the chain of custody,
(12) analyzing the results and talking to the certifying scientists
(13) $Q$ We re going to be here a long time Doctor My question is
(14) did you independently check these specimen in the Hazeiwood
(15) case That s the question
(16) A Well, if I -
(17) Q Would you answer that question?
(18) A You must I think I ve already answered it I did not in
(19) this case or any case actualiy see the tube and the teat
(20) That \& if this is what you re asking, of course, the answer is
(21) no, I m not the analyzing toxicologist
(22) Q You re saying since I know this is a NIDA certstied lab
(23) that I assume these guys did what they re supposed to do and
(24) there s no evidence that you see from any of these documents
(25) that they didn I but you re just assuming they did what they
were supposed to do?
A I have no evidence to the contrary but I $m$ assuming that they followed the procedures that they ve outlined
Q Right
A But I didn $t$ do the test myself
Q And you didn t see it done?
A No
Q And in part you re relying on the truthfulness of Dr Peat
that he stelling you the truth and he stelling these ladies
and gentiemen the truth?
A I belfeve Dr Peat is telling the truth and conforming to protesstonal standards and ethics
Q That s based on his talking to you and the fact that at one time he was running a NIDA certified lab?
(15) A That samischaracterization Dr Peat has an outatanding
(16) reputation in the field I ve heard him lecture He seen in
(17) this area for a long period of time it not just those
(18) particular issues it shis reputation and experience in the
(19) fleld I-a person wouldn $t$ risk their entire career to do (20) what you re suggeating
(21) Q I m not suggesting anything I masking you questions
(22) I masking you did you know what he did or didn t do or what
(23) his people did or didn ! do?
(24) A Based on the material that I ve reviewed which I ve
i25) 8

Vol 131851
(1) Consultation with Dick Prouty, I arrived at that decision But as I ve cand several times I did not do the test I am not the analytical toxicologitet
Q And in addition then looking at the records not knowing what you can $t$ know and don t know you resolved some disparities among witnesses and between witnesses and the records correct? A Yes O That s what you essentially did? A Yes Q And I want to talk to you about that a second Do you understand that this styrofoam container that contained the samples of Captain Hazelwood was according to Ms Metcalf sealed when she received it and logged it in that very first
(15) day March the 28th $1989 ?$
(16) A That is my recollection of her deposition, yes
(17) Q All right And well in - and her trial testimony her
(18) deposition was played in the trial so trial testimony?
(19) A it a my understanding that a deposition is like a trial (20) iestimony under the same onth
(21) Q And you further understand that Lieutenant Stock s (22) testimony was that he himself opened up that styrofoam
(23) container so he could look in and see what these vials looked
(24) like and he opened it up in Anchorage Alaska on the 25th of
(25) March 1989 and went through it looked at the vials Do you

5-19-94
VOLUME 13
XMAX $(34)$
Vol 131852
understand that?
A That is my recoliection of his deposition
Q But that doesn t affect your opinion that the chain of custody is that right?
A There was no violation of the integrity of the actual specimen itself That does not, in my opinion, represent a fatal flaw
Q Well if the chain of custody is broken and the boxitself
and containers does Dr Donna Smıth say you should reject that?
A Dr Donna Smith In her guidellnes was for drug testing, nat
(12) alcohol testing The standards are much stricter for drug
3) testing Those standards apply to drug teating, not alcohol
testing, and were not in appilication at this particular time
Q All right So what you re saying is that you would agree
with me that Dr Donna Smith says if this box was opened up by
Lleutenant Stock and this was for a drug test it should be
rejected?
A No, I would not I think you mischaracterize the Donna
Smith s presentation because Mr Stock was an authorized
custodian These guidelines are for unauthorized atodiana
The employee breaking in or an unauthorized individual, if
authorized individual opens to to check it this is not applicable in my opinion to the portion that you retalking
about for either drug testing or alcohal testing

## Vod 131853

(1) Q All right Let s go then to the next step Do you
(2) understand the chain of custody was broken when Mr Conner went
3) to the galley in Valdez and put this styrofoam box in an
4) unlocked refrigerator that nobody signed for And then the
(s) next morning comes back and gets it it sat there all night in
6) an open refrigerator in an open galley I don t mean open I
7) mean unlocked Unlocked relrıgerator and open galley and
8) there s a break there in the chain of custody Do you agree
9) with that? Do you understand that?
(10) A believe that you mischaracterized what happened The
(il) authorized custodian put it in a refrigerator The
refrigerator is supposed to be locked, but the actual tube
itself that had the appropriate Initlals and social security
number wasn t violated, and the integrity of the apecimen
was
(15) not violated
(16) Q And you know that from what?
(17) A Based on the testımony and depositions that I ve reviewed
(18) Q You didn t see it?
(19) A No
(20) Q Now you also understand that Scott Conner describes
(21) shipping - well strike that
(22) Do you und erstand from being here in court this morning and (23) perhaps from meeting Ms Metcalf that just before Ms Metcalf 4) was to log in these samples from the Valdez crew that she was (25) specifically told be extra special careful? Do you understand

## Vol 131854

## that was told that by Dr Peat?

A I don $t$ recall that specific statement, but in generat the technlcian ahould exercise appropriate care for forensic sample
Q Well of course they should My point is do you understand that at this particular instance she was given a speciric spectal instruction just before she logged in these to be extra careful Do you understand that?
A I m not disputing what you re soying What I m saying is that I did not recall that in my deposition review
Q And do you further understand that what she logged in that
day March the 28th 1989 was inree red stopper tubes? You understand that?
AYes
Q You further understand that Mr Delozier testified that
that 5 what was put in the styrofoam box in the first place
three red stoppered tubes?
A Yes
Q And you further understand that Mr Conner first tume he gave sworn testımony testified that those tubes were different sizes?
A Yes
Q And then after a visit from his Department of Justice he
changed his testimony and he said they were all the same size right?

## Vol 131855

A Well Ithink that mischaracterizes it In the deposition he indicated that his memory was that they were different sizes, but that was based on his past training He retreshed his memory again what happens in these situations is that you
(5) have many, many specimens, and then you re required to recall
(6) the size and this that and the other time and - and at a tater time so
O So you disagree with what I ve said is the testimony? We just disagree on that night?
(10) A I - my recallection of the testimony is that it had a very
(11) different fiavor than what you ve just described
(12) Q To you it had a different flavor?
(13) A Correct
(1a) $Q$ And these different flavors that you get they go into your
(15) judgments that you re making about how good this line of
(16) custody is?
(17) A Oh yes If ifelt - if I felt that the specimen had been
(18) tampered with my reputation and Ilcense is on the line and I
(19) would reject it So in reading the record I have to believe, (20) based on my professional analysis, that this specimen was not
(21) tampered with or otherwise I would not give such a
(22) professional opinion
(23) Q Well as I go through this any of these others if you get
(24) a different flavor you tell us about that we need to know
(25) about your different flavor
(1) Now do you also understand that when Ms Metcalf changed
(2) this chain of custody form she did so at the direction of the
(3) wife of the director of the lab?
(4) A That is correct But when the specimens were received
(5) they were wrapped in red evidence tape, and she
miscalculated
(6) that they were red stoppered tubes
(7) Q Do you also understand Dr Smith that all the other
(8) samples that she got that morning on March the 28th were
(9) likewnse wrapped with red evidence tape?
(10) A That would be my assumption The only epecimens that I
(11) have seen were the photographs of the Hazelwood, and in trying
(12) to valldate my own opinion when I called our own lab and just
(13) checked this out Many times what happens when they are first
(14) recelved, and they re covered with red evidence tape, they're
(15) logged In as red stoppered, but when they were opened up, they
(16) see it gray stoppered, and they change it So in my opinion
(17) it sa correction rather than any sort of fatal flaw in the
(18) chain of custody
(19) Q Doctor the question was do you understand that the other
(20) vials from the other crew members likewise were sealed with red
(21) evidence tape? Do you understand that? Yes or no
(22) A That is my recollection of the testimony
(23) Q And do you further understand that before logging in
(24) Captain Hazelwood s files and after logging in Captain
(25) Hazelwood sfiles that Ms Metcalf was able to distunguish

## Vol 131857

(1) between gray stoppered and red stoppered tubes for example
(2) before Mr Weidman and after Mr Kagan Mr Cousins Ms
(3) Jones? Do you understand that?
(4) A That would be my recollection, but none of the other
(5) specimens were sent off for ciear veriflcation to another lab
(6) because they weren i positive
(7) O Well let me ask you about that verification to the other
(8) lab Do you understand that what was done for this 60 called
(9) venfication was to take the vial that had been used in the
(10) very first instance out of refrigeration and - of a freezer
(11) and simply take another drop out of the very same vial an
(12) aliquot put it in another to be and send it off for
(13) Vertication?
(14) A Yes That s standard procedure
(15) Q Well wouldn it have been standard to send the sealed one
(16) that hadn i been broken yet that was also has the blood that
(17) was supposed to be in a gray stoppered tube?
(18) A That $s$ a decision made at the laboratory level, but
(19) aliquotting the same specimen there's support for doing that
(20) 100
(21) O Well let s get back to Ms Metcalf Do you understand
(22) from Ms Metcalf testimony and indeed affidavit that she
(23) didn $t$ individually go and say I better go look and make sure
(24) that what I m correctıng here is correct She didn t even go
(25) back and look at the vital? She just simply did what she was
$\qquad$ FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-19-94
VOLUME 13
$\begin{array}{lll}\text { Vol } & 13 & 1860\end{array}$
told?
A My recollection of the testımony was because Judy Peat was
(3) the one that pulled them out to send them to the verification
lab, and that $s$ when she saw that lt was two gray, one red
Checked the record and had it corrected So she was the one
that noticed the clerical error, and you are had it corrected
Q Do you understand Doctor that Ms Metcalf didn igo
confirm that she simply made the correction based on the word of Ms Peat?
A I don t recall anything in the record where Karen Metcalt actually went and looked at the tubes themselves
Q But none of all that effects your opinion anyway does it?
A I do not believe that the integrity of the apecimen was
violated, nor do i belleve these were fatal flaws in the chain of custody
Q What s a fatal flaw?
A Fatal tlaw is the documented evidence of tampering, the basis of which the specimen would be rejected
Q Okay So in other words your opinion in this case is that you find no evidence of tampening with the vials of Captain
Hazelwood That s what it really is isn tit?
A Correct
Q That sall it is?
A Well that s a very important protessional opinion
Q All right Well there s more to this gray stoppered red

## Vol 131859

stoppered tube than just colors isn there? You ve testilied
a little bit about this on direct There is a question with
any sample is there not whether or not the alcohol of the
blood - let me strike that start again
is there not a question that you haven $t$ reached in this
case that has to do with whether the blood has broken down
because of some processor contaminates that makes the result
unreliable even if it hadn t been tampered with?
A That has been raised, but $I$ don tind any scientific validity with that
Q Well there s no evidence in the chain of custody is there one way or the other?
A You Il need to rephrase the point that you re driving at
(14) Maybe I m not underatanding the queation
(15) Q I masking you - you say there is no evidence that this
(16) blood was contamınated?
17) A Correct
(18) Q And the chain of custody doesn $t$ tell you that one way or (19) the other does it?
(20) A No You have to have Intact chaln of custody and you have
(21) to have validation that the integrity of the specimen was not (22) violated
(23) Q And even if it s not there can be - there can be mistakes (24) made with respect to preservatives and anticoagulants putting
(25) it in the wrong tube where the blood will break down and
(1) therefore not be a reilable sample for a test isn that -
(2) can that happen?
(3) A I think what you're trying to any is when you separate the
(4) serum from the clot, there can be the hemolysis of the red
blood cells of the clot and the content of the red blood cells
leaked up into the serum
Q Maybe this would be a good time to break Your Honor
THE COURT Let s take our secondary recess ladies
and gentiemen We ll be in recess tor 15 minutes
(10) THE CLERK This court will be in recess for 15
(11) minutes
(12) (Jury out at 1200 noon)
(13) (Recess at 1200 noon)
(1a) (Jury in at 1215 pm )
(15) THE CLERK All rise
(16) MR SANDERS May it please the Court may I move in
(17) the admission of 9093 and if we could substitute that one page
(18) with the chart on it for the whole exhibit
(18) MR MONTAGUE No objection
(20) THE COURT It was 9093
(21) MR SANDERS Yes Your Honor it s page 176 of
(22) chapter 18
(23) THE COURT What is being admitted is the simply the
(2a) one page
(25) MR SANDERS Yes Your Honor with the chart

[^3]that a where the issue comes up the most it requires the
glucose in the biological fluid that usually comes about
because the person is a diabetic and then it requires
organiems like candidiasis to get in there and it -
Q Ferments?
A-terments, correct
Q So what you need is sugar glucose?
A Correct
Q Some sort of microorganism contaminant?
A Correet
Q And the process of those microorganisms working on the
sugar will produce or generate alcohol?
A Correct
O And if that occurs - can it occur in blood?
A It is my understanding in review of the literature, that
7) It cannot occur when the blood is in a sealed vacuumed
tube,
(18) because the reaction cannot oceur And there is much less
(19) evidence of this in the literature that we are presented
(20) relatlve to blood it is primarily an issue relative to
(21) hearing
(22) Q Are you familiar with the work of Dr Rosalki?
(23) A In general yes but you d have to show me the specitic
(24) citation
(25) O Let me ask you to turn to Exhibit 9074

## Vol 131863

|  | Vol 131863 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) | A it's about midway through that stack |
| (2) | O May I approach maybe I could speed it up a little bit |
| (3) | A Yes Cilnical Blochemistry of Alcoholiam |
| (a) | Q Yes |
| (5) | A Okay |
| (6) | O Would you turn over to page 52 |
| (7) | MR MONTAGUE What page? |
| (8) | MR SANDERS Page 52 |
| (9) | BY MR SANDERS |
| (10) | Q And at the bottom of the page just above the new |
| (11) | classification subheading methods for measuring alcohol |
| (12) | there s a paragraph concerning this process of problems with |
| (13) | neogenesis in the blood caused by strings of yeast or other |
| (14) | things? |
| (15) | A Are you referring to the paragraph that begins with |
| (16) | preservation of samples? |
| (17) | QYes |
| (18) | A Okay Thase sildes were studied by Corry in 91 Some |
| (19) | stringa of yeast however are capable of increasing the |
| (20) | concentration of ethanol even in the presence of |
| pres | ervatives |
| (21) | Q Correct |
| 1221 | A Yes |
| (23) | Q And the last two sentences of that paragraph7 |
| (24) | A The next paragraph or the paragraph - |
| (25) | O Bottom of that paragraph the last two sentences in the |

i) A k's about midway through that stack
(2) O May I approach maybe I could speed it up a litte bit
(3) A Yes Clinical Blochemistry of Alcoholiam
(4) QYos
(5) A Okay
(8) O Would you turn over to page 52

MR MONTAGUE What page?
BYMR SANDERS
(10) $Q$ And at the bottom of the page ןust above the new
(11) classitication subheading methods for measuring alcohol
(12) there $s$ a paragraph concerning this process of problems with
(14) things?
(15) A Are you referring to the paragraph that begins with
(16) preservation of samples?
(17) QYes
(18) A Okay Thase slldes were studied by Corry in 91 Some
(19) etringa of yeast however are capable of increasing the
(20) concentration of ethanol even in the presence of
preservatives
(21) O Correct
(22) A Yes
(23) $Q$ And the last two sentences of that paragraph?
(24) A The next paragraph or the paragraph -
(25) O Bottom of that paragraph the last two sentences in the

Vol 131866
this blood was not - these blood samples of Captain Hazelwood $\mid$ were not refngerated?
A My recollection of the record is that there were periods of time in which they were not refrigerated I know there was
O Well let s take them one at a time 1 m asking you do you realize that they weren $t$ refrigerated that first day?
A l took Into consideration periods of lack of refrigeration in my opinion yes
Q And part of the time they were walking around with Scott
Conner part of the time they were checking into the hotel and part of the tume they were on the windowsill in his room and part of the time they were walking back over to MSO and the galley correct?
A WIndowatl in March on a cold Arctic March afternoon
Q What was the temperature of that cold Arctic March
aftemoon?
A My aseumption
Q Do you know what it was?
ANo
Q How do you know it was a cold Arctic afternoon?
A That s my assumption
Q Right Well let s not - I m not asking you for what your assumption was now Do you know what the temperature of that
(24) blood was from $10 \mathbf{5 0}$ in the morning until it went into that refngerator?

## Vol 131867

## A No

Q When it was taken out of the refrigerator on the next morning on March the 25th it was then flown in Mr Conner s Iap to Anchorage?
A Correct
Q Do you know how long that flight was do you know how long it was not refrigerated in that period of time?
A There was a period of lack of refrigeration 1 don $t$ know exactly how long it was
Q Right And you don iknow the temperature that blood saw in that period do you?
ANo
(13) Q And I think there s testimony that he may have put it in
(14) the refrigerator in his house untul he went down to the office
(15) to meet with Lieutenant Siock?
(16) A Correct
(17) Q And during the time that it was out of the refngerator
(18) before it ends back up in the refngerator that evening on
(19) March the 25th you don $t$ know how long that was do you?
(20) A No, there was a period of lack of refrigeration
(21) Q You don $t$ know how long it was?
(22) ANo
(23) Q And you don $t$ know what temperature that blood vials saw (24) that atternoon?
(25) A No but itook all that information into consideration for

1) my opinion
(2) $O$ And then from the time that it was taken out of the
(3) refrigerator and taken to the ship and you are shipped down to
(4) Sacramento California it was not refrigerated is that your
(5) understanding?
(6) A Correct
(7) Q So there s about 24 hours right there where this blood was (8) not refrigerated correct?
(9) A There were periods of time that approximate that figure of (10) periods of tack of refrigeration
(11) Q You don i know what temperature that blood vial - those
(12) blood vials saw during that 24 hours without refngeration?
(13) A No
(14) Q And you don iknow as a matter of fact Doctor Smith
(15) whether that blood had any sugar in it or not do you when it
(16) was collected?
(i7) A There is no evidence of suger in the blood but -
(18) Q Well there s no evidence that there was not any sugar in
(19) the blood enther is there?
(20) A lsaw no medical report
(21) O Either way?
(22) A Correct
(23) Q So you don tknow?
(24) ANo
(25) C And you don itnow whether this lack of refrigeration -

## Vol 131869

(I) you don i know whether there was any kind of contarmination
(2) mieroorganism in mind because there s no report one way or the
(3) Other?
(4) A No I very much disegree it in some of the literature (5) Including some of the literature you gave me, ctearly states (B) red vacuum fube with sealed evidence tape you can have neuther
(7) contemination nor spontaneous generation
(8) O Well Cousıns had contamination in it do you understand 19) that if was in a vac tube?
(10) A 11 you have a tealed vac tube you cannot have orgeniama
(il) epontaneous generation glucose because they can illve The
(12) farmentation reaction cannot occur in a vecubrn
(13) Q You think Doctor Rosalkı and what was the other doctor s (14) name Corry they weren $t$ using vaceu tubas?
(15) A it is my opinion and it is atated in the Hterature
(18) including some of the literature that you have elted, that ti
(17) it sin is red sealed vac tubs the spontaneous generation
cannot
(18) oceur
(19) Q What literature is that?
(20) A it 8 on the literature that I was reading in my experience
(21) in this arena
(22) O Woll what is?
(23) A it's in my protesstonal opinion -
(24) Q Excuse me a minute Excuse me what Iterature what
(25) articte?

## Vol 131870 ,

A 1 can $t$ make $-i$ can $t$ recall the exact crtation without having to go back to my material But it is my protessional
opinion, based on my knowiedge of the field and the Ilterature
that I reviewed and I cannot give you the exact citation right
now, that epontaneous generation does not occur in a
vacuum, in
(6) a sealed vacutainer tube
7) O Do you concede Doctor that that might be another one of
8) these areas where there s a difference of opinion between some of you alcohol experts?
AYes
Q And isn it a fact Doctor that one of the reasons that refngeration ts absolutely required under certain regulations
and under certain procedures is because of this very problem
that 5 why you retrigerate blood?
A Yee, but reirigeration of blood alcohol epecimens is not
required in fact, the evidence is for example, one
experience by Dick Prouty is he put a tube of blood on his
bench for a month and did saline serum alcohol testing, and
it
(19) didn't change one bit So because a blood alcohol specimen is
(20) not refrigerated ls in no way a basis for rejection or even periode of isck of retrigeration
Q Doctor doesn i Ooctor Prouty refrigerate his blood samples?
A in general, we all try to refrigerate
25) Q And you do than in order that you can thave the kind of

## Vol 131871

(1) problems that I masking you about here that $\mathbf{s}$ a reason isn t
(2) it?
(3) A in good clinical practice we iry to retrigerate whenever (4) possible
(5) Q Other than your assumptions about the sealing you have
(6) about the sealing you have no idea about whether there was
(7) because of this long ume and the lack of refngeration
(8) whether this neogenesis this fermentation occurred or not do
9) you just can iknow inat?
(10) A l diaagree with that I think the possibility is so
(iv) unlikely as to be out of the realm of any medical probability
(12) Q And that $s$ your opinion and you admit other people could
(13) disagree with you on that?
(14) A Yes
(15) MR SANDERS Could I have just a moment? I have
(18) nothing further right now Your Honor
(17) MR MONTAGUE No redirect Your Honor
(18) THE COURT Thank you sir that concludes your
(19) examination
(20) MR O NEILL Plaintufts call Doctor Hunter Montgomery
(21) as an adverse witness for cross examination
(22) THE CLERK Rasse your night hand
(23) (The Witness is Sworn)
(24) THE WITNESS 1 do
(25) THE CLERK For the record state your name state
(1) your full name your address and spell your last name please
(2) THE WITNESS Charles Hunter Montgomery 6134 Doliver
(3) Houston Texas 77057
(4) THE CLERK Spell your last name please
(5) THEWITNESS M-antgomery
(6) THE CLERK Thank you sir
(7) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF CHARLES HUNTER

MONTGOMERY
(8) BYMR ONEILL
(9) Q Sir we ve never met My name is Brian O Neill and I
(10) represent the fisherman and the Natives who are plaintitis in
(11) this case Just so we know who you are you re the one that
(12) did the fitness determination for Captain Hazelwood in 1985
(13) Isn t that correct?
(14) A I was involved in that decision, yes
(15) Q From 60 to - 1960 to 1992 you were employed by Exxon
(16) Corporation?
(17) A That is correct
(18) Q And you were in the medical deparment of Exxon U S A
(19) A That E correct
(20) Q And would it be fair to say that Exxon Shipping Company
(21) didn t have its own medical department so Exxon Shipping
(22) Company had to use the medical department at Exxon U S A
(23) A t think that a basically correct
(24) And you worked with the Doctor Nealy and a Doctor Gould?
(25) A Yes Idid

|  | Vot 131873 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) | O In and around 19857 |
| (2) | A Yes |
| (3) | Q And Doctor Nealy reported to you and then you reported to |
| (4) | Doctor Gould? |
| (5) | A Yes at one time frame that strue |
| (6) | Q How about 85 tume frame is that a fair statement? |
| (7) | A No Ithink it was more 86 and later a litile later |
| (8) | than 85 |
| (9) | Q Were all three of you there in 85 that s ine important |
| (10) | thing? |
| (11) | A No, Doctor Nealy was still in Baton Rogue at that time |
| (12) | Q Was he working for Exxon Corporation? |
| (13) | A Yes |
| (14) | Q So we have three doctors that we re going to hear from |
| (15) | you Doctor Nealy Doctor Gould and all three of you are |
| (18) | medical doctors? |
| (17) | A That 8 correct |
| (18) | Q And you all worked for Exxon Corporatuon? |
| (19) | A That 8 correct |
| (20) | Q This is now - sir would it be fair to say that you had no |
| (21) | specialized training at all with regard to addiction medicine? |
| (22) | A No, that would not entirely be true I did get some |
| (23) | training in medical achool I got some dusing my internship |
|  | and I would say I got some on the job training during my |
| per | od |
|  | with Exxon |

Vod 131874
Q My question was do you have any specific training in alcohol and drug addiction?
A l guess the answer - could you re - could you define specific for me?
Q Let s go back to your transcript and let s go to page 18 of your transcript And at line $\mathbf{2 0}$ of your transcript are you there?
AYes
Q You were asked the question okay do you have any training in the area of alcohol and drug addiction and on line $\mathbf{2 2}$ you answered Not specifically
Was that the question asked and was that the answer given at your deposition?
A I did not take any specialized tratning in this area I think is what I meant at that time Q My question was were you asked that question and did you give that answer?
A Yes
Q Thank you Now there was at least one instance in your duties at Exxon in which in your own department you had a situation with someone who had an alcohol problem is that a correct statement?

## A Yes at least one

Q And at least one occasion you took it upon yourself to essentially monitor that problem isn t that a correct
statement?
A Yes I continued to meet with that employee on occasion
It was a case in Houston in the building where I was
working,
and I did do that
Q And when you met with him you talked with him about his alcohol problem that 5 a correct statement?
A That a correct
Q You talked with him directly about his alcohol problem?
A That s correct
Q And you checked into his aftercare and his AA isn it that a correct statement?
A I talked to him about them I didn't do any checking that I can recall with the institution
Q i know but at least you called the man in and you said
(15) how $s$ your aftercare coming how 8 your AA coming that kind of
(16) thing?
(17) A That sight
(18) Q And even despite the man had problems with a relapse isn t
(19) that a correct statement?
(20) A That a correct
(21) O Do you recall about when that was?
(22) A I have to eatimate but I would say it might have been
(23) midd-70s
(24) Q So at least by 1985 you had at least gone through the
(25) situation one time where in your opinion at least you thought
" you did it rignt?
2) A Well let me put it this way in this instance that you re 3) talking about I was requested by management to do this and we
4) did this for a period of time
5) Q And you deait with the individual honestly and openly and 6) directly?
7) A Right
8) Q And there was no sneaking around behind his back it was (9) call him in how are you doing?
(10) A Right
(1) Q Now with regard to Exxon Corporation would it be fair to
(12) say that in 1985 Exxon Corporation had no policy with regard to
(13) screening for medically unfit sea going personnel?
(14) A No that would not be correct If I underatoed the question
(16) Q Did Exxon Corporation in 1985 have any procedure or
(17) requirement with regard to the physical - medical physicals
(18) for masters on a regular basis or an irregular basis?
(19) A No
(20) $Q$ And at some point in tume in the 80s was there a
(21) significant problem on the West Coast with regard to depression
(22) and/or the mental fitness of Exxon seatarers?
(23) A I don t recall that particular problem I thirk you may be (24) referring to the problem that occurred on the Exxon New Orleans
(25) that $s$ in the deposition

## Vol 131877

(1) Q Yeah
(2) A That was not a depression problem That is as ibest can (3) recall it, wase problem of an individual who, it anything, had (4) the reverse but more of a manic behavior whe ts concerned a
(5) threat to the people on the ship, and they were concerned about
(6) how they could alely get that individual removed from the (7) ship
(8) O Would you go to page 273 of your transcript What s
(9) EHAP?
(10) A What excuse me
(11) Q EHAP?
(12) A Employee Health Advisory Program
(13) Q On page 273 in your transcmpt line nine the question
(14) reads were any of EHAP activities directed towards safoty
(15) issues such as whether vessels might be jeopardized if
(16) individuals had problems And your answer was No I don : -
(17) didn t really think don t think so I have to say no I
(18) don think that was the issue
(19) The question then becomes And that was not somathing that
(20) you were involved with in with EHAP Answar no
(21) And the question is what does the strike that -
(22) Why would there be concern about depression and the mentat
(23) fitness of seafarers And your answer is if my memory has
(24) It there had been a significant problem on the West Coast and
(25) I think this was wrtten for -1 think Harvey Morgan was out
$\begin{array}{lll}\text { Vol } & 13 & 1878\end{array}$
on the West Coast at the time he wrote this as the manager out there
My question was Was there a significant problem with
regard to depression and the mental fitness of seafarers on the West Coast?
A I would state at this time that I ve reflected more on that particular issue than I was in that letter, and my recollection at this point was that it was not a depression problem but more of a manic problem that was conaidered a concern to
ship rather than depression
Q Is your tesumony roday different than your testımony at
the tume of your deposiuon?
A On that particular isesue yes
Q Yes it is And at the time of your deposituon do you
recall raising your hand and taking the same oath that you took
here today in the courtroom?
A Yes, sir
Q Now would you agree with the assumpton that updated medical records are important it was important for Exxon
medical to have updated medical records?
A thad some relative importance yes We tried to keep records as up to date as we could
Q And in 1985 you had a problem with that didn tyou? A Not just 1985 It salways been a problem because you do (25) not know every time anyone goes to see a physician You don $t$

## Vol 131879

get a report on every instance that occurred We did have a program of doing prepiacement exams on all the seaman we did
(3) have a program of offering periodic exams throughout their (4) career in order to obtain some information but if a man got s) off sick uniess it was something of some magnitude we did not
(6) necessarily hear about it or had a blood pressure change, W©
(7) didn t necensarily change, so not everything was alwaye up $t 0$
(8) date

Q Are you finished sir?
(10) AYes
(11) Q In 1985 with regard to Captain Hazelwood 5 medical records
(12) let stake a specific example would it be lair to say that
(13) Captain Hazelwood s medical records in 1985 were 12 years out
(14) of date?
(15) Aldon t know whether they were - you could say they were (16) out of date There had been no entries into his medical record
(17) In 12 years
(18) $Q$ Thank you sir Now at the time someone let s take a
(19) hypothetical someone coming back from treatment from alcohol
(20) treatment was there a spectic written policy at Exxon
(21) Corporation or Exxon U S A or Exxon Shipping Company that
(22) required you to bring the individual in and talk to him about
(23) it7
(24) ANo
(25) O Was there a specific written policy that required you to

## Vol 131881

(1) A Yes, I have
(2) Q You saw it in 19857
(3) A Yes I did
(A) Q And you studied it before your deposition?
(5) A Yes
(6) Q And you studied it before coming in here today?
(7) A Yes
(8) Q I want to go over the iDR if we coutd Up on the top -
(9) this is an Exxon torm isn tit an Exxon Shipping Company
(10) form
(11) A Yea, sir
(12) Q And up on the top there s a check mark there that says Mr
(13) Hazeiwood was in a sea going position?
(14) A Yes it did
(15) Q is that what it indicates? And then your initiais are on
(16) the bottom of the iDR?
(17) A That is correct
(18) Q And you got this iDR in May of 1985?
(19) A That serrect
(20) Q And you read it?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q And you called or have a faint recoliection of calling a
(23) Doctor Vallury?
(24) A That is correct
(25) Q And you had or may have had a five minute telephone
(1) A Yea, I have

O You saw it in 19857
(3) AYes Idid

Q And you studied it betore your deposition?
(s) Aes
(5) Q And you studied it before coming in here today?
7) AYes
(3) Q want to go over the IDR if we coutd Up on the top -
this is an Exxon form isn tit an Exxon Shipping Company
(10) form
(11) A Yes, sir
(13) Hazelwood was in a sea going position?

A Yes it did
Q Is that what it indicates? And then your initiais are on
te botom of the JDR?
A That is correct
Q And you got this IDR in May of 19857
A That E correct
Q And you read it ${ }^{2}$
A Yes
Q And you called or have a faint recoliection of calling a
Vallury
(25) O And you had or may have had a ive minute telephone
conversation with Doctor Vallury -

## A That is correct

Q - in May of 1985 And your recollection with regard to the telephone conversation is faint?
A The detelle of the call are faint let $\sum$ put it that way I could not give any quotations from what I heard Q Now with regard to the Vallury conversation would it be fair to say that you didn $t$ document it?
A Well as you said, my initials are at the bottom of the sheet I did not make apecnic documentation 1 must admit
(11) Q in point of tact I think I m not arguing that you didn t
(12) call him or not his phone call is on the bottom?
(13) A Right
(14) Q My point is with regard to what you and he talked about
(15) there s no memo for the file?
(16) A That is correct We've been unable to find any memos
(17) Q And you ve looked?
(18) A And we ve looked
(19) O With regard to a specific written fitness for duty
(20) determination we can $t$ find a memo or a fitness for duty
(2i) determination either can we a written one?
(22) A Not within the medical department
(23) Q So we have in the medical department the IOR and a (24) conversation with Doctor Vallury and on the basis of the IDR
(25) and the one five minute phone call for Doctor Vallury you made

|  | V여 131883 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) a fitness determination? |  |
| (2) | A Let me rephrase that If I may Doctor Vallury made the |
| (3) | Iltness determination I tended 80 agree with it, accepted it |
| (4) | but lfelt it was his determination I had not geen |
| Hezelwood |  |
| (5) I had not talked to Captaln H |  |
| (6) individual physician who had been treating him for at |  |
| (7) month we |  |
| (8) O We ll talk about that |  |
| (9) A Okay |  |
| (10) Q But in point of fact you had one five |  |
| (11) and this piece of paper and at least with regard to |  |
| (12) concerned you made the fitness determ |  |
| (13) person in Exxon to clear the fitness |  |
| (14) A That would be true |  |
| (15) Q And you re a medical doctor? |  |
| (16) A That s right |  |
| (17) Q Now let s talk for a minute about what the IDR told you |  |
| (18) about Captain Hazelwood It told you that at |  |
| (19) time he had or was going to have individual psychotherapy |  |
| (20) treatment? |  |
| (21) | A Rlght |
| (22) | Q And he had or was going to have group therapy treatment? |
| (23) | A Uh huh |
| (24) | Q That s a correct statement? |
|  | A That eright |

(1) a fitness determination?
(2) A Let me rephrase that If I may Doctor Vallury made the
(3) Iitness determination I tended 80 agree with it, accepted it
(4) but ifelt ft was his determination i had not seen

Hazelwoad
(5) I had not talked to Capialn Hazelwood I had to rely on his
6) individual physician who had been treating him for at least a
month we know in the hospital
8) O We II talk about that
(9) A Okay
(10) O But in point of fact you had one five minute phone call
(12) concerned you pade the inness doterminaion You wore the
(13) person in Exxon to Clear the friness determination?
(4) A That would be true
(16) A That s right
(17) Q Now let s talk for a minute about what the IDR told you (18) about Captain Hazelwood It told you that at some point in
(19) time he had or was going to have individual psychotherapy
20) treatment?
(21) A Right
2) Q And he had or was going to have group therapy treatment?
(24) Q That s a correct statement?
(25) A That E right

Vol 131886
the file In 12 years
(2) Q Did you talk to Captain Hazelwood?

A No, Ididnt
Q Did you evaluate Captain Hazelwood?
A No, sir
Q Did you allow for or direct an examination of Captain Hazelwood?
A Say that again
Q Did you say to a bunch your colleagues or to an outside person let $s$ get an independent evaluation of Captain Hazelwood?
A No, I did not
Q And indeed up to the time of your deposition you $d$ never even met Captan Hazelwood?
(15) A Not to my knowledge I might have vieited with him in a (16) group meating when captains might have come so Houston and I
(in) might have been invited, but I do not recall having met him
(ig) Q Now at the same time that the individual disability report
(19) was in your office we have what we reter to as the Graves
(20) report over at Exxon Shipping Company and you re aware of that
(21) aren tyou?
(22) A I maware of lt now I was not aware of it at that time
(23) Q Okay I understand that and I m not trying to trick you
(24) My question was that is over in your otfice this is over at
(25) the shipping company?

## Vol 131887

## A Okay

Q That 5 a fair statement isn it you re aware of that?
A That would be true
Q And in the Graves report there is a report that Mr Hazelwood occasionally drank aboard ship and that he came back
(6) to the ship from port drunk on several occasions?

A That s what the exhibit says
O Would it be fair to say that in 1985 if you had known
(9) aboul the Graves report you would have had further misgivings
(10) with regard to Captain Hazelwood s titness for duty
(11) determination?
(12) MR NEAL Objection to the form of the question Your
(13) Honor further misgiving
(14) THE COURT Change the wording around a littie bit
(15) BYMR O NEILL
(16) Q Would you have - would it be farr to say you would have
(17) been concerned more concerned about Captain Hazelwood s
(18) fitness duty determination it was a relevant piece of
(19) information?
(20) A Yes
(21) O And putting the two together may very well have resuited in
(22) a different fitness determination?
(23) A l guess that s possible
(24) Q In 1985 if an employee at Exxon Corporation was caught as (25) opposed to self identitying with regard to alcohol that was

5-19-94 VOLUME 13
xHAX/4

1) grounds for termination wasn tit?
(2) A believe that $s$ correct $I$ think the wording of the
policy was that it was grounds for discipline up to and including termination
Q But the policy draws a distinction between those who self
identify that come in and say I have a problem and those
whom the company goes to and says either we re investıgatunc
you or you have a problem there s a distinction between the
two?
A Right the diatinction was there
Q Did I state the distinction fatriy?
A t thinkseo
Q Thank you Now let stalk a little bit about Alcoholics Anonymous in 1985 you knew that alcoholism was a disease a
) contunuing disease that like dysthymia may last a lifetume?
A Yeah, may
Q And you d read literature while you hadn thad any
specialized training you had read the literature you were a
medical doctor and you kept yourself up to date?
A Certainly tried to
Q And you were aware of Alcoholics Anonymous? A Yes
Q And its successes with regard to the treatment of
alcoholics?
AYes

## Vol 131889

(1) Q And that those who attended Alcoholics Anonymous had a
2) better chance of success than those who didn t?
3) A Yes
4) Q And that Alcoholics Anonymous believed that people who have
(5) the problem of alcoholism or the disease of alcoholism should
6) go to Alcoholics Anonymous for life?
(7) A By large that st the belief of the organization
8) Q And they shouldn idrink?
(9) A They shouidn itrink
(10) O And that family support was important to recovery?
(11) A That a correct
(12) $Q$ And at the tume you made the fitness for duty
(13) determination you knew it had recommended that Captain
(14) Hazelwood participate in Alcoholics Anonymous?
(15) A That s right
(16) Q And you did not discuss with anybody at Exxon Shipping
(17) Company the recommendation that he participate in Alcohoics
(18) Anonymous?
(19) A No that would not be correct I think I did
(20) Q Let me ask it this way You didn t think that if Captain
(21) Hazelwood stopped going to AA that would have any impact
(22) Whether or not he remained fit for duty?
(23) A I don t recall saying that but actually I supported
(24) trongly the recommendation that he be given the leave of
(25) absence to attend $A \mathcal{A}$ I thought was my testimony

V여 131890
Q Okay Let s go to page 447 of your deposition transcript Beginning at line 12 the question was I morry you dion t think that if Captain Hazelwood stopped going to AA that that would have an impact on whether or not he remained fit for duty
And your answer was At that point in 1985 I didn $t$ That was not really the custom that was taking place nor that was carried out Do you see that?
$A$ Yes I don think that I felt that his continued attending $A A$ was a criteria on which he would be judged as
whether he was fit for duty
Q it was even worse than that wasn tit In point of fact
you knew in 1985 that because Captain Hazelwood was being
reassigned to sea duty that he couldn t attend AA?
A That was the reason I was supporting the leave of ence
was to allow him to opportunity to get an enhancement to the
(7) program he had received while in the hotpital

Q So he could go to AA for 90 days and then return to sea and not go to AA?
A Well -
Q Is that a correct statement?
A He would have had - he has leaves ot absence, or leaves -
123) duty
(24) There might have been accasions when he arrived in port where
(25) he might have been able to attended AA I do not know for

sure It would have depended on the port perhaps
O Have you ever made the statement that the nature of the occupation does not allow for AA? You made that statement in
A linink that s in the deposition yes
Q That was a statement you made the nature of the occupation
does not allow for AA?
A If I may?
Q Did you make the statement?
A Yes I made the statement
$Q$ And you knew that AA was part of his treatment plan?
A That s right
Q And you knew that AA recommended that people go on a
lifetume basis?
A That sorrect
Q And you knew that AA was part of recovery?
A That is correct
(18) Q Did you make any provision with Exxon Shipping Company
to
(20) the 90 day leave of absence?
(21) A No, not other then the $\mathbf{9 0}$ day leave of absence
(22) Q Did you make any provision with Exxon Shipping Company
(23) meet with Captain Hazeiwood face to face and talk about his
(24) recovery his AA his aftercare?
A No sir
(1) Q That was what you did some vears earlier when you had an employee that had a drinking problem isn t th?
A That was done at that time at the request of management
that 1 do so 1 had no such request in this case
Q it wasn i your problem it wasn tyour watch?
MR NEAL Objection argumentative
THE COURT Sustained
MR O NEILL I will move on
BY MR O NEILL
(10) Q Now would it be fair to say that in 1985 there was no good
(1i) reason that you could think of not to give him a shoreside
(12) assignment so he d have the opportunity to go to AA isn t that
(13) right You could not think of a good reason not to give him a
(14) shore side assignment? You want me to re ask it so there
(15) aren t two negatuves?
(16) A Re-ask it so I don't get those nots in there
(17) O Let me re ask it
(18) Have you ever said quote there was no good reason not to
(19) give him a shoreside assignment
(20) MR NEAL What page
(21) THE WITNESS I would say he could have been given a
(22) shoreside assignment let s put it that way
(23) BYMR O NEILL
(24) Q Would you go to page 461 of your deposition transcript and
(25) we Il go to line 24 and I II read the question and answer and

Vol 131893
If you could follow me and make sure I read the question and
answer correctly
A Walt a minute
Q461 It s in volume two You got two volumes up here A Yeah
O Line 24 question by Mr Nolting As you sit here today
can you think of any good reason why Joe Hazelwood was not
given a shoreside assignment in 1985 when he returned to work?
(9) Your answer was I don iknow You see that?
(10) AYes
(11) Q Now after May of 1985 you had no discussions with anyone
(12) concerning drinking reports?
(i3) A You mean referrable to Capiain Hazeiwood?
(14) QYes sir
(15) A I dontrecall any
(18) The medical department in fact had the power to yank
(i7) somebody off of a ship didn $t$ they?
(18) A I m sure we had the authority, but whenever I had asked,
(19) you know literally, but whenever i had suggested or
${ }^{(20)}$ recommended that someone be taken of the shlp, they took
-
(21) they were oft the ship
(22) Q After you made the fitness determination in May of 1985
(23) did you take any other further action with respect to Captain
(24) Hazelwood or this particular claim or situation?
(25) A idon t recall that I did And shortly thereatter,

Vol 131894
probably eariy 86 actually I no longer had direct responsiblity for the shipping company, Doctor Nealy then took
(3) it on

Q Okay and would it be fair to say that other than the one
conversation with Doctor Vallury that we talked about you had
no further conversations with Doctor Vallury?
A it 8 possibie I only recall the one
Q And you were not aware of yourself with regard to Captain
Hazeiwood the installation of any montoring program no one
talked to you about it at that tume?
A You mean referable to Hazelwood
Q Hazalwood?
A No, I did not recall any
(14) $Q$ And you didn t have any conversations from May of 85
(15) thereon with regard to Exxon Shipping Company with regard to
(16) monitoring Hazelwood?
7) A I do not recall any

O And from May of 85 thereon until - was it Doctor Nealy rook over in 867
A think it was early 86 icould be off a little
Q Nobody from Exxon Shipping Company came to you with
any
(22) reports of or rumors of Captain Hazelwood drınking?

A l do not recall any at all no
(24) Q Now if there had been reports of drinking such as ordering
(25)
beer over a walkie talkie or that he was allegedly drunk or

## Vod 131895

(1) that he was loud or abusive and that had been reported to you
(2) at a minimum you would have brought him in and evaluated him
(3) is that a correct statement?
(4) MR NEAL II object to that Your Honor If hes
(5) asking a hypothetical I object to mischaracterizing the
(6) record Hes not -
(7) MR O NEILL If that resoives the objection I will
) ask the hypothetical
B) BY MR O NEILL
(10) Q Let s assume hypothetically that a port steward comes in
(11) and reports he s fallen oft the wagon he s drinking again the
(12) cure didn itake because of what the port steward says are
(13) drinking incidents At a minimum hypothetically you d bring
(1a) the man in and interview him and possibly evaluate him
(15) wouldn tyou?
(16) A That sa passibility Another posatbility under those (17) circumstances would be my judgment as to the nature of what 1
(10) had heard You made it sound fairly severe if that was the (19) case I think I would have gone back to someone in management
(20) who was aware of the problem and called it to their attention
(21) what I had heard
(22) O How about calling the man in and talking to him and just
(23) getting his side of the story?
(24) A That a possiblilty 1 could have done
(25) Q That $s$ a decent thing to do?
(1) A That sa decent thing to do One of those two would
(2) probably have happened But if I brought him in and it was as
(3) severe as you claim I think I stili would have wanted to talk
(4) to someone in managernent who was aware that this
problem
(5) occurred

Q The rumors may indicate a serious problem?
A That's correct
Q Let s assume we had a second hypotheucal situation in
) which a port steward comes in and says I was on a launch with
(10) him I was on a launch with him and he was loud and abusive
(11) and smelled of alcohol so now we have cumulative a second
(12) situation problem s more serious isn tit?
(13) A Yes, and I think the anawer would probably be pretty much
(14) the same as on the first instance
(15) Q And let $s$ throw a thurd instance on top of that to where
(16) you get a report that $A$ management knows he $s$ drinking again
(17) and B he orders beer over a walkie talkie from a company
(18) ship
(19) MR NEAL Objection untess it sa hypothencal
(20) MR O NEILL Hypothetical
(21) THE WITNESS I think in that instance we re talking
(22) about a violation of company policy and I would probably have
(23) called it to management s attention that I felt there had been
(24) a violation of company policy
(25) BYMR O NEILL

## Vot 131897

(1) Q Now with regard to somebody who s been through treatment
(2) and who has had a recommendation for Alcoholics Anonymous a
(3) recommendation to go inrough individual psychotherapy group
(4) therapy marital therapy all of these things his off duty
(5) drinking is a concern isn tit?
(6) A Well yes it might be of concern
(7) Q You need to know whether the cure takes don iyou?
(8) A Can you rephrase that?
(9) O You need to know whether the cure takes don tyou?
(10) A I d have to keep in mind here that this man, if we re
(:1) talking about Hazeiwood has really not been diagnosed as
(12) alcoholic diagnoses was alcohol abuse episodic
(13) Q Episodic?
(14) A Which means if periodically you know it might even be
(15) years between the periods I don $t$ know
(16) Q it skind of interesting that you pointed that out
(17) MR NEAL Let him tinish his answer Mr O Neill
(18) BYMR O NEILL
(19) Q Do you have any more to say Doctor?
(20) A No, I think that pretty well said it
(21) Q Let 5 talk about that for just a minute i was going to sit
(22) down but you raised a question and it - these questions are (23) your fault sir
(24) Let s see if I can find my notes on this topic You re
(25) talking about now his diagnosis as being episodic alconol abuse
or alcohol abuse episodic At the time that you reviewed these documents you interpreted this entire prece of paper here not quite so carefully But you thought in reading this that it was just one episode of alcohol abuse didn i you?
A There was one episode of treatment of which I was aware That s all the record had
Q So you certified the captain is fit for duty a sea going
master is fit for duty on the basis of this red flag and a
five minute phone conversation that you can tremember the detalls of?
MR NEAL Objection asked and answered
THE COURT I II allow it
BYMR O NEILL
Q And a minimization of the fact that you thought there was Iust one episodic instance of alcohol abuse Is that a fair statement?
A The fact that it was sald to be episodic I would have assumed there was more than one 1 don t think you would get
(19) that diagnosis with just one But I had evidence of only one treatment of anything and that even in that the primary diagnosis was dyathymia and the secondary diagnosis was
alcohol abuse episodic
MR O NEILL Thank you sir Thank you Judge
THE COURT You may cross
CROSS EXAMINATION OF CHARLES HUNTER
ONTGOMERY

## Vol 131899

(1) BYMR NEAL
(2) O Doctor I will be hopefully and mercifully brief but I do
3) want to know something about your background How old are you
() Sir?

A 66
Q And what we heard the other day once you reach 65 with
Exxon you are retired?
A That s correct
Q And so are you retured from Exxon now?
A Yes
(i1) O Quickly how long were you employed by Exxon
Corporation?
(12) A 32 years live monthe
(13) Q 32 years five months Let $s$ see when did you start your
(14) employment then? Will you count it up for me?
(15) A July 1st, 1960
(18) Q And retired this year or last year?
(17) A December the ist 1992
(18) 1992 Where did you recerve your - I don i want to go
(19) through all of it but you are a medical doctor?
(20) A That right
(21) Q Where did you recenve your medical training?
(22) A At the University of Virginia I graduated from the
(23) University of Virginia in 1953 MD Degree I did an
(24) Internship at the University of Virginta Hospital continued
(25) two edditional years in internal medicine at the University of
) Virginsa went into the United States Public Health Service
(2) where I stayed for two and a half yeare and during that

I time
(3) trame served a chief residency in internal medicine at the
4) Baylor University College
(5) Q In Waco?

I (6) ANo Houston
1 (7) Q The medical college of Baylor is in Houston?
(8) AYes
(9) $Q$ The regular college is in Waco?
(io) A The regular college is in Waco
(11) Q All right Now then I want to go nght to the
(12) conversation that Mr $O$ Nell brought up and he said that some
(13) time in 1985 you had a conversation with an Exxon Shipping
(14) Company official regarding Captain Hazelwood is that correct?
(15) A That a correct
(16) O And would you tell us approximately when that conversatıon
17) was and with whom you had the conversation if you remember?
(18) A Well let me cover that subject Within the Exxon Shlpping
(19) Company, there was a disability management aection -
(20) Q Okay
(21) $A$ - who tried to keep up with the disabilities of the
(22) seaman They were strayed all over the country They had no
(23) regular supervisor because they joined difterent ships at
(24) different times And we had close contect with them regarding
(25) disability management Reports such as the Individual

## Voㅓ 131901

(1) diaability report form which you saw a few moments ago comes
(2) Into that section from the physician and they look at it to
(3) determine what they need from it and then send it Into the
(4) medical department from this individual diaablity report
(5) Q We ll put that up so it will be easy to fix it up here and
(6) I II put it up here
(7) A Oh it sover here
(8) OOh okay Thank you Mr O Neill
(9) A 1 as best 1 can recall remind you nine yoars later and
(10) four years before this even came up, $t$ think an individual in
(ii) that section probably -
(12) Q Excuse me let me put this up on the screen because this is
(13) only part of it except for a littie card Would you flash
(14) that up here okay Now -
(15) A Thle form as I say came into shipping and then tis sent
(10) to medleal The medical department recelved the form on May
(17) the 14th 1985 and following that stamp it was sent to me for
(18) review
(19) After that I believe that a woman by the name of Gabby (20) Guerra as beat I can recall, was the one who called and asked
(2i) me if I would call and talk to Doctor Vallury I $m$ busy and (22) that wasn the prime thing one likes to have to do on the spur
(23) of the moment I aald fine, I will but I have some concern
(24) because actually this form has more detall completed on it then
(25) I generally got on thle type of form And she explained to me
(1) that there was a special reason they had that I needed to make
(2) this call to Doctor Vallury
(3) It you look at the form it says, the baginning date of
(4) Captain Hazelwood s disability was April the firat, which was
(5) the date he went in the hospital
(6) Q Okay
(7) A The form was completed on Aprif the 16th at a time when he
(8) was still in the hospital I was receiving the form a month
(9) later I do not know why it wale such a dalay, I cannot answer
(10) that The problem they had in that dieability section revoived
(11) around the fit for duty status The form indicates that
(12) Captain Hazelwood was not tit for duty Well, abviously on
(13) April the 16th he was not fit for duty, he was in the
(14) hospital Okay
(15) There is a benelit plan arrangement with regard to leaves
(18) of absence, that one really cannot grant a leave of absence
(17) Uniese one is not disabled, or in other worde is not - is fit
(18) for duty, so that this question needed to be resoived before
(19) they could grant the leave of absence
(20) Myaetf or anyone that I know of at least in the shipping
(21) company, took no exception to the leave of abeence because they
[22) needed to clarily this sese They also wanted to know how he
(23) was doing, if I could get the information So I placed a cali
(24) to Doctor Vallury
(25) Q While we were on that let me see if I can - you ve got

## Val 131903

(1) this form in front of you right?
(2) A Rlght
(3) $Q$ And it 5 recelved on May ine 14in?
(4) A Rlght
(5) Q The date of the form is May 17
(6) A The date of the form is May 1 Where do you see that?
(7) $O$ The date that he $s$ entering the hospital
(8) A April 1
(9) $\mathrm{O} / \mathrm{m}$ sorry And hes to be there you can tell by the
(10) writing for 28 days is that correct?
(111) A That E correct
(12) $Q$ The date that Doctor Vallury signed this form is April
(13) 16th?
(14) A That s correct
(15) Q So when he signs this form and presumably sends it to Exxon
(18) Shipping Company Captain Hazelwood is in the middle of his
(17) South Oak stay is that correct?
(18) A That would be correct
(19) Q However by the time you get it on May 14 presumably he
(20) has completed that stay of 28 days?
(21) A That sorrect
(22) Q All right Now you re asked to call Doctor Vallury You
(23) have this form in front of you What do you do?
(24) A 1 call Doctor Vallury and talk to him 1 can $t$ - you
(25) know it seen a long time but the giat of the conversation
(1) the best $t$ can recall it is that he indicates that Captain
(2) Hazelwood had done well in the program that he had entered it
(3) voiuntarily of his own free will, that he had participated wel
4) in the program, he fett his outlook or hus prognosis, if you
(5) want, was good but that because of the nature of hia job
(6) meaning that he could not get to AA meetinge, not attend the
(7) thinge that - the aftercare program that he wanted him to
(8) attend, that he had recommended that he take the teave of (9) absence
(10) Q Now at that tume did he say - did he tell you that he was
(11) fit for sea duty?
(12) A At that time we discusaed the fit for duty, and he
(13) Indicated to me that he was fit for duty And in turn then
(14) called back, I assume Gabby Guerra, as I m not sure which
(15) person it might have been, and advised them that on the basie
(16) of that, that I agreed whth that determination and that I
(17) recommended that he get the leave - they grant the leave 0
(18) absence And I remember this better than avarage, I guese
(19) because when I did get to them, and l'm not sure of the exact
(20) time, how long it took to do this but I think to was the
(21) latter part of May, when I got back to them
(22) Q To them you mean back to Exxon Shipping Ms Guerra?
(23) A Back to Exxon Shipping They d already granted the leave
(24) of absence which sort of hacked me little bit which is why 1
(25) remember this call as well as I do

Vot 131905
(1) O All right So then Doctor Vallury called you as I
(2) understand it he says Captain Hazelwood is fit for duty?
(3) A That sight
(4) Q But I recommend that he be given a leave of absence so tha:
(5) he can have the AA and attercare is that correct?
(6) A That s correct
(7) Q All right Did you understand that AA and aftercare was a (8) condition to be fit for duty or he was fit for duty but it was
(9) a recommendation that he contunue that?
(10) A ithought he was fit for duty and that it wase
(11) recommendation that he be given this leave of absence so that
(12) he could stay shoreside and get that $A A$ and other aftercare
(13) O Now Doctor Montgomery Mr O Neill kept saying you
(14) determined that he was fit for duty that $s$ that a fair
(15) statement or did Doctor Vallury determine - his physician
(16) determine that he was fit for duty?
(17) A His physician determined he wase fit for duty, and I
(18) accepted that as adequate for Exxon 8 purpases to allow him to
(19) be declared fit for duty
(20) Q All right And then you called Ms Guerra of Exxon
(21) Shipping Company and told her that you - in effect that his
(22) doctor says he s fit for duty his doctor recommends this leave
(23) of absence and you endorse that?
(24) A That $E$ right
(25) O Doctor Mr O Nell said that pulied up an Exhibit 160

1) IIf try it again here and said that this information was over at Exxon was over in the offices of Exxon Shipping Company Do you recollect that exhibit?

## A Yes

Q All nght Captain Hazelwood according to your testımony voluntarily entered South Oaks on April 11985 correct?

## A That s correct

Q Would you look at the date up here that 5 dated May 19 or
May 281985 Was that the date that the information was received by the Exxon Shipping Company to your knowledge or do
(i1) you know?
(i2) Aldon t know
(13) Q All nght If Exxon Shipping Company had received this (14) information after Captain Hazelwood went into or sought
(15) voluntarily sought treatment are you with me?
(16) A Uh-huh
(17) O Then he would be a voluntary declare or self identifier
(18) even though they later learned out - learned that he had
(19) violated the policy prior to seeking help is that correct?
(20) A ithink that is correct
21) Q Doctor Exxon Shipping Company employees I suppose like (22) all employees are entitied to have their own doctor correct?
(23) A Encouraged
124) Q Encouraged to have their own doctor And the medical
25) department is there for - to ald but not as a substitute for

## Voㅕ 131907

(1) their own doctors?
(2) A That is correct
(3) Q All right Is there anything - if a person - if an Exxon
(4) Shipping Company employee had some kind of medical problem and
(5) went to his doctor and then his doctor - you talked to his
(6) doctor and his personal doctor said he $s$ fit for duty would
(7) you be inctined to accept that?
(8) A Yes I would Unlese I saw some reason to realiy take
(9) exception to it That was generally the accepted program
(10) Q Now Mr O Nell asked you to assume certain things and he
iti) told you some things fike this Mr Shaw said and so forth
(12) Let 8 assume you know that you have this diagnosis of Captain
(13) Hazelwood correct?
(14) A Right
(15) Q And the primary diagnosis is dysthymia correct?
(18) A That Eright
(17) Q And only the secondary diagnosis is some sort of alconol
(18) abuse episodically?
(19) A That s right
(20) Q You ve testified that dysthymia is a mild form - mild form
(21) of depression?
(22) A That is correct
(23) Q All right if you go to - if you go to a doctor and you
(24) ask him what s wrong with you and the doctor makes a
(25) diagnosis do they - do they find out determine that - and
(1) give you an order of diagnoses that is the major probiem and
(2) the less major problem and they do it in that order?
(3) A Not always
14) Q Okay But did you understand that this was the primary
(5) diagnosis of dysthymia in this case and the secondery

## diagnosis

(6) of alcohol abuse episodically?
(7) AYes
(8) O Mr O Neill asked you to assume that you had - strike
(9) that
(10) I think I moing to have no further questions Doctor
(11) Montgomery
(12) THE COURT Redırect Mr O Neil
(13) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF CHARLES HUNTER

MONTGOMERY
(14) BYMR O NEILL
(15) Do you want me to, ask you questions or not ask you
(16) questions Doctor? ilí give you a choice
(17) MR SANDERS Can I vote?
(18) BYMR O NEILL
(19) O You have to answer the question
(20) A Excuse me Phrase that again
(21) Q Do you want me to ask you some more questions or not ask
(22) you any more questions?
(23) A I d juat as soon you not ask any more queestons
(24) MR O NEILL I have no further questions
(25) MR NEAL Man I hope we can do that for everybody

|  | Vol 131909 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) I d like to see everyone do that |  |
| (2) | THE COURT You may call your next witness |
| (3) | MR O NEfLL The planntif calls Kenneth G Gould as |
|  | an adverse witness for cross examination and on a videotape |
| (5) | DIRECT EXAMINATION OF KENNETH D GOULD |
| (6) | BY VIDEO EXAMINER |
| (7) | O You ve stated your full name for the record already it s |
| (8) | Doctor Kenneth G Gould Junior? |
| (9) | A Carrect |
| (10) | Q Could you tell us where you presently reside? |
| (11) | A l currently reside in Houston Texas |
| (12) | Q Are you currently employed by Exxon Corporation? |
|  | A No 1 m empioyed by Exxon Company USA, whieh is a |
|  | pany |
|  | of the Exxon Corporation |
| (15) | Q In what capacrty are you empioyed by Exxon Company USA? |
| (18) | A My current ifte is director of health services |
| (17) | Q How long have you held that position? |
| (18) | A Since December 1st, 1985 |
| (19) | O I d like to now turn to the matter of an employee who was |
| (20) | entering rehabilitation for alcohol dependency My question |
| (21) | is what are the different ways in which the medical department |
|  | might learn that an employee was in or about to begin |
| (23) | rehabilitation for alcohol dependency? Well let me refer you |
| (24) | to the tume period of 1985 |
| (25) | A We might learn if the employee tells us We might learn if |

Voi 131910
the employee through the individual disability report has his
(2) physician send us a report of his having been diasbied for a
(3) period of time, and that that may or may not be listed on that
(4) particular sheet Or we may be toid by management if they ve
(5) learned about it in some way
(8) We will not be toid about such a rehabilitation if the
) employee has instructed the folks in the rehabilitation not to
tell us
Q What was the medical department s routine procedure if
there was one with respect to an employee who it had learned
had been newly admitted to alconol rehabilitation and again
with regard to the tume period 19857
(13) A Perhaps it would be better to state in a generic fastion (14) when we learn that anyone is in a hospital situation, we would
(15) generally, untess requested to perform some service, merely
(16) make a note in the record if the time that we heard about thet,
(17) I would think at that time Probably not deal with the
(18) rehabilitation any difterently than we deall with the
(19) notification of any other sort of hospitalization unless there
(20) was some apecific restriction of duty which were indicated
in
(21) some way by the notufication that we got that it was necessary
(22) Q You had referred to a disability report What is an
(23) individual disability report?
(24) A They go by different names, and ti s sometimes called an (25) ER-5, sometimes referred to as an IDR or individual diaabillty

Vol 131911
(1) report When an employee is ebsent from work for five or more
2) days, the employee's supervisor will initiate a form in which he sends the form to the employee at the top stating that
bafore the employee should come back to work, that the mployee
should sign the middle part of the form which is essentially
release at Information and give that to his physician to provide two things
It's a form with, essentially iwo pages to it In the
first page, then, the physleian would Indicate that the
employee - he had firrt seen the employee on a certain date and may be the lant date that he eaw the employee And he would also indicate the duration at any disability which he expected to occur, that the peraon would not be able, tor instance, return to work, ift to return to work, not ift to return to work, and any ahort explanation in that form, then would wind up in the personnel recosds
This underneath form which is a carbon copy of the top material provides some additional room for the physician fill out data regarding history and physical examination and results and so on which the physician would then forward
the medical department
Now, much of the time we get the same information that the
(23) employee relations department gets with regard to the length of
(24) the disability and with regard to the generic tit to work or (25) not lit to work without any specific medical data and doctors
(1) have become more and more chary about giving us any
(2) intormation, even though they have a release on that form
(3) Q Let me step back for a moment What were the general ways
(4) that the medical department in 1985 may have learned about ar
(5) employee coming out of a rehabilitation program for alcohol?
(6) A I may have been confused eartier when I anawered with
(7) regard to the three days that I said I thought the department
(8) might have learned about it when they went in And
because 1 m
(9) not usually used to hearing about it at that point, but when
(10) they come out, and I may have misspoke in that regard - but 1
(11) think we said that the employee would tell us, we would get a
(12) note from the doctor or we might hear about it from management
(13) Q Are you referring now - you say - are you saying that
(14) that 5 the way you might learn about - are you saying that
(15) those are the three ways that the medical deparment might
(16) typically learn about an employee emerging from an alcohol
(17) rehabititation program?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q Are you saying that it s very possibie that the medical (20) department would not even learn about the fact that an employee
(21) had been admitted himself to a rehabilitation program unil
(22) after he completed the program?
(23) A Yes and l'm not excluding the fact that we might not have (24) learned about it at all
(25) Q Now assuming an employee has been admitted to an alconol

## Vod 131913

(1) rehabititation program and has now emerged from the
(2) rehabilitation program and has been absent trom work during
(3) that period of time and is returning to his place of
(A) employment what procedure would the medical department
(S) undertake at that time?
(6) A 1985?
(7) QYes
(8) A The procedure is as previously described when somebady is
(9) absent from work, his supervisor will send or give the absent
(10) employee the form for the absent employes to sign the relaase
(11) and for the doctor then to complete it and send it back I
(12) told you about the ways we would learn about it There s no
(13) other mysterious way I would know about it
(14) Q Would the medical department in the instance of an
(15) employee who had undergone rehabilitation for alcohol have
(18) conducted its own examination to ascenain whather that
(17) employee had successfully completed his alconol rehabilitation
(18) before allowing him to return to his job in 1985 ?
(19) A I think that the forms that we get are subseribed to by the (20) physician an M D Our general procese whether its related
(21) to alcohol or a hernia or something else is to take the word (22) of the physician and his description of fitneses to work The (23) one major exception to that is when we have someone who has
(24) seen a chiropractor we may in fact refer people who have been
(25) treated by chiropractors for another opinion by a physician

Vol 131914
with an estimate of potential disability
$0 \ln 1985 ?$
A Right
Q Was it necessary that - that there be a determination of
fitness for work before an employee who had undergone alcohol
(6) rehabilitation could return to his ןob?

A Not if the physician said he was fit to return to his
position You got to remember we have five doctors
essentially reviewing all the absences for the company of
20000 plus people And we cannot see everybody who comes back
(1) for something
(12) Now it management decides that they want to have that
(13) peraon further evaluated, they may contact the medical
14) department and say Please evaluate so and so for his fitnes:
(15) to work
(16) Q My question was literally was there no requirement that
in the medical department itself make a determination of fitness
18) before an employee who had been rehabilitated for alcohoism
(19) could return to his job?
20) A Not that I mawne of
21) Q One should look at that answer in the light of the fact 22) that where we found out about it through the process of an 231 individual disability report or ER 5 that we would have on (24) record a physician s signature which the physician said he was (25) fit to return to work or not fit to return to work And if the

## Vol 131915

(1) physician said that he was not tit to return to work and he
(2) shows up to work then we might get involved
(3) Is that a clanification which helps?
(4) Al Buppose
(5) Q My question is then -
(6) A But see management would know that at that time because
(7) they would have had their part of the form which the physician
(8) would say he git to work or not fit to work
(9) Q Where the medical department had received notice of an (10) employee s determination of his fitness to return to work in
(i1) the instance of his having completed alconol rehabilitation
(12) would the medical department ever speak to that employee s
(13) private physician about his determination?
(14) A Unlees there was some unuaval facet, probably not
(15) Q My question is simply did the medical department
(18) independently have a requirement about the level of detall that
(in) it would have wanted to receive or needed to recelve in terms
${ }^{(18)}$ of that determination of fitness for work by that employee $s$
(19) private physician?
(20) A I think practieing law or medicine or driving a bus or (21) whatever you're doing, there sa certain degree of judgment (22) which enters the picture And if one lays down restrictive (23) criteria or inatructive criteria one frequently misses the (24) essence of the problem
(25) We try to stay alent to unusual situmtions but there were
(1) no jot and tittle requirements on each and every person who
(2) comes back to work
(3) Again I reiterate that it there was some unugual facet
(4) mentioned in the diagnosis or in the information we were given
(5) we may or we may not choose to try to get in rouch with a
(6) physician or get in touch with the employee and to ciarify that
(7) depending on the fudgment of the individual reviowing health
(8) practitioner
(9) Q In 1985 did the medical department consider that it was
(10) important in terms of successful rehabilitation of alcoholism
(i) employees that they receive counseling atter their retum to
(12) employment?
(13) A t think as a general rule we would have felt that
(14) counseling would be wise after such a visit but then you have
(15) to describe what you mean by counseling in a certain
(16) celebrated case I recall that, you know what la uaunally -
(17) what was usually the recommendation of - of rehabilitation
(18) programs was that someone participate after that
rehabilitation
(19) In a 90-and 90, which is 90 visits to Alcoholies Anonymous
(20) chapter in the next 90 days in order to solidily the gains made
(21) with regard to the individual s thinking during the
(22) rehabilitation process
(23) I don think anybody conaidered even in 1985 the
(24) rehabilitation was complete complete when you stop the
(25) hospitallzation or the outpatient phase of the rehabilltation

## Vol 131917

(i) treatment, that this was an engoing life situation in which one
(2) needed to continue to atrengthen one sesolve not to return to
(3) the bottle or the plils
(4) Q Did the medical department in 1985 have any system in place
(5) to determine for itself that an employee who had undergone
(6) alcohol rehabilitation on an outpatient basis had followed his
(7) program betore returning to work?
(8) A No I don iknow how you can determine that today
(9) Q Doctor Gould after reassignment of an employee who had (10) completed alcohol rehabilitation did anyone within the medical
(i1) department have a responsibitity to monitor that employee to
(12) detect ralapse possible signs of relapse? And I m talking
(13) about the penod 1985 to 1988
(14) ANo
(15) Do you have an understanding about whather or not anyone
(is) eise within the Exxon organization other than the medical
(in) department had such a responsibility - and again I m
(18) referring to that period of time 1985 to $1988 ?$
(18) A it is the responsibility of the first-Ilne supervisor to
(20) determine the fitneas of his employees to do the job that
(21) they re supposed to be doing In the sense that he with them
(22) and he abserving them it he has a problem, he s supposed to
(23) get in touch with the medical department or with his
(24) supervisor in order to determine if any other procedure needs
(25) to be followed

[^4] the previously but
(1) efficiency within the corporate seting, that abstinence is to
12) be deaired
(3) Q Could you tell me what role if any the medical department
(4) played in the development of the alcohol and drug poincy that
(5) came into effect in 19857
(6) A We were asked our opinion on various parts of the

## proposed

(7) policy and provided that opinion Principaliy through the manager of the human resources department
Q Do you recall the opinions that you offered at that ume in terms of the deveiopment of the policy?
A Without having my notes in front of mei in really unable to
state with clarity the individual comments that I offered
Q Do you have any recollection about whether or not your
opinion was solicited with regard to institution of an
(15) aftercare or follow up program for rehabilitated alcoholics who (16) have been returned to the job?

A I don t belleve in $\mathbf{1 9 8 7}$ that our concept of aftercare
(18) within the medical department was well enough developed for us
(19) to have provided any particular input with that - with regard
(20) to that subject
(21) MR NEAL Can we cut him oft here sir?
(22) THE COURT Fine
(23) MR O NEILL Thank you
(24) THE COURT Please remember my instructions about not
(25) listening to your reading anything about this case? We will

## Voㅓ 131921

) adjourn at this time until 800 The fury is excused
If counsel would stay for just a moment sir
) (Jury out at 200 pm )
(4) THE COURT Just a couple of administrative things
5) I ve received notufication from the defendants or certificatuon
(6) from the defendants that they ve destroyed the copies of the
) jury questionnaires that they had
) MR SERDAHELY That s correct
(9) THE COURT Have the plaintiffs taken care of that?
(10) MR OESTING We delivered them to Mr Murtashaw
(11) bafore we got note that we destroyed them We were
previously
(12) told to deliver them all back here
(13) I II give them to the clerk
(14) THE COURT Thank you very much The second thing is
(15) that I think both sides have offered exhibits that run past the
(16) end of any exhibit list that I ve got from you
(17) MR O NEILL Well Mr Jamin will take care of
(18) getting exhibit lists for those exhibits by tomorrow moming
(19) MR LYNCH Every morning we gave Mr Murtashaw an
(20) Update we gave you this morning a new list that had all of our
(21) lists and I think what happened was that Mr Sanders created
(22) an exhibit that didn texist until he recreated it
(23) THE COURT More than fust one There s a hall dozen
(24) Of them I think that run past the end of the list I had it
(25) would be helpful to me if I had a complete set
$\qquad$ FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
Vol 131922
(1) That s all I have
12) MR O NEILL We have nothing else Judge
(3) THE COURT We will be in recess until tomorrow
(4) morning
(5) THE CLERK Court is in recess until 800 a m
(6) tomorrow
(7) (Proceedings recessed at 200 pm )

5-19-94
VOLUME 13
xmax(52)
Vol 131924
(1) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF CHARLES HUNTER MONTGOMERY 1872
(2) BYMR O NEILL 1872
(4) CROSS EXAMINATION OF CHARLES HUNTER MONTGOMERY 1898
(5) BYMR NEAL 1899
(7) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF CHARLES HUNTER MONTGOMERY 1908
(8) BYMR O NEILL 1908 (10) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF KENNETH G GOULD 1909
(11) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 1909

## Vol 131925

(2) EXHIBITS
(3) 379337943795379637993804380538073808 and
(4) 3811 offered 1722
(5) 3797 offered 1752
(5) 910291039104910591069107910891099110
(7) 91119112 offered

1759
(8) PX3812 and PX3813 offered

1826
(12) 379337943795379637993804380538073808 and
(13) 3811 recerved 1722
(14) 3708 recelved 1745
(15) 3797 received 1752
(16) 910291039104910591089107910891099110
(17) 91119112 recerved 1780
(18) 3812 and 3813 recelved

1828
(1) STATE OF ALASKA )
(2) Reporter s Certificate
(3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA)
(6) I Karyn H Chalem a Registered Professional
(7) Reporter and Notary Public
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
(9) That the foregoing transcript contains a true and
(io) accurate transcription of my shorthand notes of all requested
(ii) matters hald in the foregoing capuoned case
(12) Further that the transcript was prepared by me
(13) or under my direction
(14) DATED this day
(is) of 1994
(21) KARYNH CHALEM RPR Notary Public for Alaska
(22) My Commission Expires 4895

Beace Syzterns Appicxions Look-See Concordance Report

UNIQUE WORDS 2782
TOTAL OCCURRENCES 13,349
NOISE WORDS 385
TOTAL WORDS IN FILE 40,968

Single File Concordance
Case sensitive
NOISE WORD LST(S)
NOISE NOI
includes All Text
OCCURRENCES
IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES @ Bottom of Page

MAXIMUM TRACKED
OCCURRENCE THRESHOLD 50

NUMBER OF WORDS
SURPASSING OCCURRENCE
THRESHOLD 27
List of Threshold words
alcohol [171]
blood [174]
Captain [90]
chain [77]
COURT [55]
custody [78]
Doctor [72]
Dr (68)
employee [55]
Exxon [71]
form [53]
Hazelwood [124]
lab [56]
medical (115)
Okay [98]
opinion [52]
question (60)
received [61]
review [66]
right [193]
samples [67]
sir [63]
specimen [52]
test [59]
testing [71]
tube (60)
tubes [59]


FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-19-94 VOLUME 13

1035 (4) 173482317522 183313
1045 [3] 1833141820 1050 [10] 174620174820 18142518157918204 18651923186624
1055 [1] 183314
1100 [13] 18162318177
1820 3, 1718201821210 1823 19, 18329 15, 18336 18344
1155 [1] 176115
1200 [3] 1843 3, 18601213 1215 [1] 186014
14th [2] 1901 17, 19033
16th [3] 1902713190313
17th [2] 17621013
18th [1] 178012
1st [20] 1739232517503
17571317597176020
17613176218176321,
17642176816176922,
177013177616178521
184791861818991517 190918
-2-
20,000-plus [1] 191410
20th (1] 176620
23rd [4] 1787618163525
24th [9] 174910175125 1752101814218159 18164518382186519
25th (8) 174721767614
21241851241867319
27th [2] 17532324
28th [8] 173717173869
17619176719185115
18541218568
200 [2] 1921319227
2nd (1) 175015

| -3- |
| :---: |
| 3/24/89 [2] 1734723 |
| 3/28/89 [1] 174920 |
| 30th [3] 17627176319 |
| 176617 |
| 32-ounce [1] 172919 |
| 330 [1] 18397 |
| 345 [3] 18341618397 |
| 18432 |


| - 4 - |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| 4-8-95 (1] 192622 <br> 400 [1] 186524 |  |
| -7- |  |
| 70s (1) 187523 <br> 78-89 [3] 17476 <br> 745 [1] 18434 | $174910 \quad 23$ |


| $-8-$ |
| :--- |
| $80 s[1] 187620$ |
| 800 (3] 1722219211 |
| 19225 |
| 830 (1] 18332 |
| 8th (1] 178219 |

90-and-90 [1] 191679
90-day [1] 188515
925 [2] 17648
930 [2] 173869
9th [1] 178211

## - A -

a m [12] 17348 23, 174620 175221803 16, 18061415 181425,18157919225
A M A [1] 184511
A89-0095 [1] 17226
AA (23] 187510 15, 18844
1885101889 21, 2518903 ,
1014 18, 19 25, 189137
11, 13, 16, 24, 1892 12,
19046, 19055712
ability [2] 1824218259
able [14] $1734 \quad 2517354$
17361617388173910
17582217594180524
182524185625189025
19111319186191910
aboard [2] 18381918875
abolished [1] 180419
absence [18] 188591518
18892518901522
189120,211902161921
190491824190541123 absences [1] 19149
absent [5] 19111191329 10
absolutely [1] 187012
absorbed [9] 18185718
18192318217 10, 183124
18321918334
absorbing [1] 183223
absorption [3] 181813
1821 20, 18223
abstinence [1] 19201
abstınent [1] 191819
Abuse (5] 172521179310
1795318081113
abuse [22] 17252217539
1792231794111423
17951424179916
180912181011188420
189712251898141522
19071819086
abusive [2] 18951189610
academic [1] 191924
accept [5] 183317184120
1842231843919077
acceptable [3] 181515
18171314
accepted (6] 18151923
18211618833190518
19079
accident [1] 179520
accompany [3] 173519
17365176122
according [7] 1764417676
1770161787 15, 183424
18511319065
account [1] 18369
accurate [9] 175021
1767 18, 2125176889 1791101822 12, 192610
acetone [5] 17721924
17732517901617912
acetones [1] 17735
achieve [1] 182521
Act [2] 179319180925 act [5] 1797 2, 17981
1800418121184823
acted (1] 181022
action (6) 17711118119
231824 22, 1893 23, 19187
activities [2] 1727 13,
187714
actual [9] 17281820
17561720180722
1810 13, 1847 22, 18525
185312
acute [1] 18264
Add [1] 182018
add [6] 180591318207
11183410,18401
added (1] 17407
Addiction (2) 17942184511
addiction [7] 1793 21,
18001918392018459
18732118742,10
addıctive [2] 1845525
addition [4] 176617
1772161805418514
additional [2] 189925
191118
address [4] 17231179121
18042018721
addressed [1] 178723
adds [2] 177625179723
adequate [2] 174917
190518
adhered [1] 18653
adjourn [1] 19211
administers [1] 182518
Administration [2] 17939
179413
admınistration [1] 173014
administrative [2] 17818
19214
admission [1] 186017
admit [2] 187112188210
Admitted [1] 175220
admitted [9] 172216
1745191760318086
182623186023191011
19122125
adulteration [1] 184723
adverse [3] 1724 15, 187121 19094
advised [2] 188423190415
Advisory [1] 187712
advisory [2] 172624179414
affect [3] 175191618523
affected [2] 1824 7, 16
affidavit [1] 185722
affiliated [1] 17998
aftercare [11] 18751015
1885 10, 1891192419047
1905571219201517
afternoon [6] 1865 20, 24
1866141620186724
afterwards [2] 18038 ,
184810
agencies [6] 172724
1730211741 23, 17939
179412

Basc Symems Appications
agency [5] 17272317288 17512117946
agree [6] 18359185215
1853818618187818 18833
agreed [4] 17229178817 18190416
aground [1] 17545
ald [2] 180421190625
Aurbome [2] 17286178219 ALASKA [2] 192613
Alaska [8] 17281217375
174671807918132
185124192621
Alcohol [2] 181822182613 alcoholic [5] 18971219183 191931423
Alcoholics [11] 18844
1888 13, 21, 188914614 1718972191619191825 alcoholics [2] 188824
192015
Alcoholism [1] 18633
alcoholism [11] 182514
184071845118848
18881418895191418
19161019181325
alert [2] 191525191812
aliquot [5] 17501517
17622317717185712 aliquots [3] 176381516 aliquotted [1] 175014 aliquotting [1] 185719 allegedly [1] 189425 Allen (1) 17232
allow [8] 180612182214
18866189016189137
1898 12, 190518
allowed [1] 18374
allowing [1] 191318
alluded [1] 18101
atteration [1] 18405
alterations [1] 186115
altered [1] 184023
American [7] 172616
173631794125183920 184511
Amnesia [1] 183023
amongst [1] 179715
amount [3] 172822191919 21
amounts [2] 17722217741 amphotamines [2] 179612 180922
analysis \{10] 172418 17271517528917982 1824218327185520 18643
Analytical [1] 172425
analytical [5] 173111
1807318513186514 analyze [4] 1726312 17271718259
analyzed [4] 17282117964 180816181517
analyzing [3] 183211 18491221
Anchorage [2] 185124 18674
anesthesia [1] 183025
announced (1) 172215

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT

Anonymous [11] 18884 4
18881421188914614
1818972191619191825 Answer [3] 17752325 187720
answer [23] $175720 \quad 17763$ 17812318022518032
181520183614184917
20187431217187716
231890618922518932
918961318971719029
190819191421
answered [4] 184918
18741118981119126
anticıpatıon [1] 17506
anticoagulant [3] 181219 2118659
antıcoagulants [1] 185924
anybody [6] 177591012
180411889 16, 191623
anyway [1] 185812
anywhere [1] 18484
apologize [1] 17435
apparently [2] 173714
17389
appeal [1] 182220
appear [3] 177619178416
182813
appearance [1] 175916
appeared [1] 17502
appearing [1] 18051
appears [10] 17346173620
175642217632023
1784141725182720
applicable [1] 185224
application [2] 172417
185214
applies [2] 180821183621
apply [5] $1835816 \quad 183620$
18372185213
applying [1] 18355
appreciate [1] 178513
approach [12] 173221
173341745816174613
17483175511176023
1783181808118415
18632
appropriate [7] 173022
17542117962179822
18131318531318543
approval [2] 1726818096
approximate [1] 18689
Approximately [4] 172918
17611817781618104 approximately [11] 172910 17419179417179510 180912181771421 183323183417190016 approximation [1] 181810 April [16] 1725517621013 17661720176761421 2417681819024713 190381219066 arbitration [4] 179511
179815180021
arbitrator (1] 179820
Arctic [3] 1866141520
Area [1] 179324
area [23] 17414176121
1773151784211179311
23179558179920

180610180921023
18177182122183910
1844191845724185017 18741014
areas [5] 18263184319
1845152118708
aren't (3] 176515188621
189215
arena [2] 179322186921
arguing [1] 188211
argument (1) 180418 argumentative [1] 18926
arguments [1] 191917
$\operatorname{arm}$ (1] 17479
arrangement [1] 190215
arrive [1] 18348
arrived (4) 183212183412
18511189024
art [1] 18852
article [2] 17952186925
articles [3] 1794161823
ascertain [2] 173919
191316
Ashbury [2] 17921421
aside [1] 17633
asking [13] 1782217883
18331718467184920
1850212218591518665
221871118955
aspects [1] 179623
assert [2] 17561620
assessment [1] 18462
assignment (5] 18921214
19 22, 18938
assistance [2] 1797813
associate [2] 17922517933
associated (2) 173112
179523
Association [1] 17951
association [1] 179712
assume [19] 18031718181
21821718271425
1832818351218381
$\begin{array}{lll}1841 & 17 & 184223184823\end{array}$
18492318951018968
1904141907101219088
assumed [1] 189818
assuming [8] 183123
1832141518351118361
18492518502191225
assumption [25] 18191821
22182156918312223
183210121425183335
18412018435689
1856101866172123 187818
assumptions [6] 181817
1819191821318221
18312118715
assurance [1] 18099
Ataxia [2] 1829 15, 18
ataxia [6] 182917183035
6183425183814
attached [1] 17242
attempt [3] 1742911 19186
attend [6] 188471889 25, 189014190468191825 attended [7] 17927183917 231884718891189025 189119
attending [1] 189010
attention [4] 175422
181415189520189623
attomey [1] 17902
attorneys [1] 178818
August [9] 173212174524
17466175314177918
1782111917845
authored [2] 17941723
authorities [1] 17906
authority [3] 18012418399
189318
authorized (3) 18522023
185311
avallable [2] 173122
188523
average [6] 18181325
183541837118427
190418
avoid [1] 186416
awarded [2] 17232122
aware [14] 177424186518
231885118862022
1887218882118948
1895201896418985
191420
$-\quad-\bar{B}$
bachelor [1] 17925
bachelors [1] 17417
background (3) 172318
1792418993
balance [2] 182918183010
ball [1] 180511
banned [3] 179611180920 181224
bar [2] 180312183720
Based (3) 18438185024
185317
based [10] 18381818398
18412018492185013
18553201858818703
191810
basic [2] 182421183410
basically [3] 179515
184721187223
basis [11] 183918184320
185818187020187618
18822418911418988
19041519176
bat [1] 180511
batches [1] 17635
Baton [1] 187311
Bay (2) 17932324
Baylor [2] 190047
Beckton [1] 173314
becomes [1] 187719
bear [2] 189425189617
beg [1] 180219
begins [2] 1748 17, 186315
begun [1] 174523
behavior [2] 1825 23, 18774
behavioral [3] 17934
182522183624
behaviors [1] 179523
behind [2] 17972418768
belief [1] 18897
believe [43] 1733 18, 17352
1737417522175610
17571217581217641

1766202417731017747 17751177612,177711 177913 19, 17854,17904 1801 1, 18029,181319 181818,18192218223 182718183625,184015 184471418465185011 185310185519185813 1418882,190119191814
19198, 19192017
believed [1] 18894
bench [1] 187018
benefit [2] 17853190215
Berkeley [1] 17926
besides [3] $176311 \quad 177420$ 21
bill [1] 179314
Biochemistry [1] 18633
biological [8] 1724 18,
172718179623182114
1822.218612418623

Birky [7] 1768192223 17691216177021,177111 bit [16] 17271217351523
174213174325,17454
17471917498176223
182761859218632
187019188714188813
190424
black [4] 172910183024 183123
block [1] 17369
Blood [2] 174225181810
Blurred [2] 18302183811 blurred [2] 182925183810
Board [6] 17261617446
17666176714176923 17701
board [1] 172624
board-certified [1] 172616 boarding [1] 18332
body [5] 172416181847 1825620
book [4] 182791828613 18383
books [1] 179416
borrow [1] 18148
boss [2] 17871315
bottle [2] 18472419173
bought [1] 17885
box [21] $17461618 \quad 17474$ 69192217599176515 1819202117821920 17851185281618533 185416
boxes [1] 176214 brain [9] $1818711 \quad 182416$ 191825619182618 break [7] 174513180312 1418182318538185925 18607
breakdown [1] 177624 breaking [2] 18522218649
breath [1] 179522
Bran [1] 18729
Bridge [1] 17233
brtef [5] 172413178919 18031218041518992 broken [7] 174710174823 1848111852818532 18571618596

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
brown [2] 17821920
building [1] 18753
bunch [1] 18869
Burkey [2] 176612176820
burst [1] 17772
bus [1] 191520
business [7] 172711
173017177514178819 20188524
busy [1] 190121
buttons [1] 17368
$-\mathrm{C}-$
calculatıng [1] 181515
calculation [B] 18167918
18172181941820 17,
1834 8, 13
calculatıons [5] 1820 22,
1821 13, 1826 17, 18362 ,
18439
California [8] 1724 10, 22, 1726 21, 172724179267 1818684
Call [1] 17224
call [35] $172220 \quad 173313$
17532021175521
$17681719176915^{\text {th }}$
1773241790217911516
17975,180110180920
18102018114181415
18241718251418265
187120187691882512
$25 \quad 188310 \quad 1901$ 21, 19022 2319032224190425 19092
calling [2] 188122189522 calls [5] 1768182117795 819093
Campos [3] 17812517905 candidiasis [1] 18625
capability [2] 18082325 capable [2] 18631918645 capacties [1] 17948
capacty [2] 179422190915
captain [5] 1744917703
188011 13, 18987
captains [1] 188616
captioned [1] 192611
carbon [1] 191117
card [5] 173742123
173821190113
care [7] 17541421179222 179411185431921917 career [2] $185019 \quad 18794$ careful [4] 1754723
18532518548
carefully [3] 17585618983
Carolına [4] 1723317329
1114
carried [1] 18908
case [40] 1722617319 17377178119178424 178721180112180214 18041718061124 18101618153181811
182091835518402023 18425101918441718 $1846918476184910 \quad 15$ 1918581918596186518 1872111875318924

5-19-94 VOLUME 13

18951919085191616 192025192611
cases [12] 1795 10, 180011
15, 2418091213181023 510184020
casual [1] 18396
catch [1] 172210
category [1] 18067
caught [1] 188724
caused [3] 17601017775 186313
celebrated [1] 191616
cells (6] 17281112177624
1777118605
Center [7] 1724 7, 175016
17702417711818074
1823410
center [2] 1740118254
centered [2] 173320 ,
173412
centers [3] 1824 25, 182668
cerobellum [1] 182423
cerebral [3] 182412024
Certificate [1] 19262
certificated [1] 17689
certification [12] 17252024
1726271425179413
17972418082118494
19215
certifications [1] 172618
certifed [27] 17252117266 151753581793152021 25, 179631801 10, 180514 180812151624180945 8, 18481822231849122 18501418987
certifies [1] 180814
CERTIFY (1) 19268
certify [6] 17272176714
1768717968179723 180819
certifying [14] 176723
1796471801102123
18021418180778
184761849412
cetera [1] 172716
CHALEM [1] 192621
Chalem [1] 19266
Challenged [1] 177710
challenged (1] 17779
CHALOS [19] 174012
1752182317531175511 13, 2417562175919
1760625178023
178318212217851416 192311
Chalos [5] 17532177521 17792517892417915 chance [2] 17761518892 Change [1] 188714 change [18] 1729 15,
1735231736101764 14,
20, 1774 6, 19177610 1777717782417797 1780518422018458 185616187019187967 changed [11] 175010 175716 21, 1760910 17654177014177422 18421618542418561 changes [3] 177417

17772517782
changing [1] 177820
Chapel [1] 17233
chapter [8] 182791222
18286818383186022 191620
characteristics [1] 18382
characterization [4] 180121
18351018403184513
characterize [1] 18034
charge [2] 1753 13, 188013
CHARLES [6] 18727
1898251908131924147
Charles [1] 18722
chart [12] 1827202225
1828131832318342224
1835318362118371
18601825
chary [1] 19121
check [9] 1729 15, 17488
179721184224184969
14185223188112
Checked [1] 18585
checked [2] 185613187510
checking [3] 184812
186610187512
Chemical [2] 1724917885
chemical [3] 172520
1792 24, 18015
chemicals [2] 17241519
chemistry [1] 172320
ChemWest (26] 172425
17251368919172712
131417302417315
1732131733117366
1737117382517413
17442117514917528
17531317885184618
18477
chief [1] 19003
chıropractor (1) 191324
chiropractors [1] 191325
choice [1] 190816
choose [2] 1802219165
chromatographs [1] 177221
chromatography [1] 172821
circumstances [2] 173924
189517
ctation [3] 186224187074
cted [1] 186916
cites [1] 186413
crting [1] 18647
Crty [6] 17248917402
17411416175016
civil [1] 17226
claim [2] 18932418963
clarification [3] 183518
18801819153
clarity [2] 19022219166
clarity [1] 192012
Classification [1] 186418
classification [1] 186311
Clayton [1] 179122
claan [1] 188023
cleaning [1] 177312
clear [4] 18048181223
18575188313
clerical [9] 173922 23,
174041017411621
1742101118586
CLERK [14] 172232124

1723417911924180616 1860101518712225 18724619225
clerk [1] 192113
clisent [2] 17364175120
clients [1] 172721
Clinical [1] 18633
clınical [20] 17246179212
2517931317988922
17991718112318122
18151418354184667
184818186191418713
clinician [1] 18154
clinics [3] 17921422
181519
closed [4] 173213177920 2318471
closer [1] 173725
closest [1] 181810
closing [2] 17771314
clot [5] 1812212218136
186045
clotting [1] 181220
CNS [4] 18241718252
182657
co-authored [1] 179417
co-wrote [1] 182723
Coast [26] 17375174122
174315174410174925
1753202217652517745
1781215178268
1789241790361013
179191834 15, 23183819
187621187724187815
cocaine [3] 179421179611
180922
code [2] 1799612
Cognitive [1] 18241
cognitive [7] 18232225
182491825818262
1919410
coincidence [2] 177013
177922
cold [3] 1866141520
colleagues [1] 18869
collected [4] 1747 23,
17492117963186816 coliection [6] 173314
173414 22, 17522175617 175718
College [1] 19004
college [3] 19007910
color [6] 17391719
1741241758917762025
colors [1] 18591
Comatose [1] 18311 coming [8] 17528180421
18067187515187919
1881619125
command [1] 183824
comments [1] 192012
commercual [1] 181712
Commission [1] 192622
committee [2] 179313
179414
common [1] 17442
Community [1] 186515
community-based [1]
179222
companies [6] 172725
179619202122181121

Company [22] 18722022
18792118801718819
188620188917189118
221894152119001419
1903161905211906210
13211907419091315
company [25] 174913
17862417902179514
17961171797131114 2517993181521188625
188871894218961722
2419022119091319149
compare [3] 173215
18342118363
compared (1] 180017
comparison [1] 172914
compete [1] 18319
complate [6] 188423
191311191624191921 192125
completed [7] 190124
19027190320191222
191317191511191710
completely [2] 174925
179910
complied [2] 17881215
comport [1] 178520
compromised [1] 17917
CompuChem [14] 172411
1725141732813
17431018074724
1808718132118144
1823811
Compuchem [4] 17463
17876178834
concede [1] 18707
concentration [13] 17431
17957171809418144
181581816118231821
182451418632018645
concept [1] 192017
concem (5) 18772218789
189756190123
concerned [7] 179716
181311187745188312 188717
concerning [6] 180625
184321186312186416
189312191812
concerns [2] 18052118426
concludes [1] 187118
concluston (3) 180421
18101218
conclusions (1) 179812
condition [4] 172815
17752219058
conditions [1] 183620
conduct [1] 18492
conducted (1] 191316
conference [1] 17954
Confidence [1] 186425
confıdence [1] 186423
confidential [1] 178824
confidentiality [2] 178718
178825
confirm [2] 1822818588
confirmation [3] 1770918 25
confirmed [1] 17703
conflict [1] 17994
conforming [1] 185011
confused [1] 1912 -
connection [4] 17271
173115174115178924
Conner [11] 17462124
17471176824178523
180751853220185419
1866 10, 18673
Conners [1] 178525
consent [4] 17331618
17346183312
consider [4] 174119
18212119169
consideration [7] 181611
18175183747184220
18667186725
considered [5] 179823
1811318281918789
191623
considers [1] 18427
Consistent [1] 179710
consistent \{2] 1751118238
consult [1] 177523
consultant [4] 172310
17931017941018078
consultation [1] 18511
consulted (1] 17938
consulting [3] 178817
17936
consumes [1] 191915
contact [5] 175322176822
190024191413
contacted [4] 175121
1780241781 2, 18023
contain [3] 17331617342
16
contained [5] 17421
17432217734178620 185112
container [5] 172817
1744251767818511223
containers [4] 172815
17764518529
containing [1] 178221
contains [3] 17331317341 19269
contaminant [1] 186210
contaminated [2] 17735
185916
contamınates [1] 18597
contamination [3] 186917
8
content [3] 1828318341 18605
context [1] 18154
continuation [1] 17226
continue [2] 1905919172
continued [3] 1875218909
189924
continuing [2] 17267
188815
contracted [1] 17992
contradicts [1] 184122
contrary [1] 18502
control [1] 176119
controlled [1] 179413
controls [1] 18246
conversation [16] 17549
1769317701177915
184424188214724
189451898919001213
1617190325
conversations [3] 17657
1894614
convey [1] 175419
coordination [5] 182423
182510182959183425
coples [7] 173225176718
2117689101119216
copy [11] 173816174113
17499176725177519
177812178772318085
18419191117
copying [1] 173123
cord (1] 182422
comer [3] 17331917877
182721
corporate [1] 19201
Corporation [11] 187216
187312181876111216
187921188724189911
19091214
corrected [2] 185856
correcting [1] 185724
correction [14] 17392223
241740510,177015
17741924177513
1856171858818616717
correctly [6] 17711018011
1831221834618439
18932
correlates [1] 183621
correspondence [1] 173112
Corry [2] 1863 18, 186914
cortex (3) 182412024
cost [1] 179520
counsel (6] 175213180220
1803151832710,19212
counseling [3] 19161114
15
counselor [2] 179713
181124
count [3] 17481717612
189914
country [1] 190022
couple [2] 1845419214
courier [1] 17285
course [8] 177016177111
17751418263183913
18431318492018545
courses [1] 183920
Court [8] 172241917532
18032118051918272
18601619225
court [3] 183710185322
186010
courtroom [1] 187816
Cousins [12] 1725 13,
17382,1742 18, 19177217
1917738,1790 16, 18, 22,
1857218698
cover (4) 1742 9, 11, 175311
190018
coverage [1] 17778
covered [5] 1737 23,
1739151765 18, 1795 16,
185614
covering [3] 174924
1759 12, 186110
crack [1] 174723
cracked [2] 17862122
created [3] 179318182616
192121

Basce Syatern Applcinions
credentials [1] 172614
crew [4] 17542175819 185324185620
criteria [5] 17265,18457
189010191523
critical [2] 1811117
CROSS [6] 17522518274
1898 25, 192310 22, 19244
cross [6] 175222182625 1835 15, 1871 21, 189824 19094
crossed [1] 17395
Crouch [2] 17712425
cumulative [1] 189611
cure [3] 1895 12, 189779
cured [1] 183118
current [4] 17921920
184214190916
currently [4] 1723917932
19091112
curve [7] 1818211819310 24182191118321
custodian [4] 1730 17,
178819185221185311 custodians [2] 1848 18, 185221
custodies [1] 17767 custom (1] 18907 customary [1] 17831 cut [3] 17842021192021 cutoff [1] 184212 cutting [1] 17507 CW [4] 17451517476 17491023

- D -
data [2] 19111925
date [30] 1728141734718
20173510173618
1737151746 19, 176112
17681617701415
17752218141183921
187822187981416
188819190235190356 71219068919111011
DATED [1] 192614
dated [6] 17409174619 17501317692217876 19068
dates [2] $173617 \quad 174525$
datıng (1] 17406
DAVID [6] 179125179922
182741923161922
David \{2] 17911622
day [19] $175321 \quad 1757$ 14,
17611417642177614
178915183710184212 18511518541218666
188423188523189120 2118996192614
days [8] 17264183712
1890181903102019112 19127191620
deal [3] 1806418457 ,
191017
dealing [3] 17431017669 179418
deals [5] 172416172715 1824212223

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-19-94 VOLUME 13
dealt [5] $172720 \quad 172810$
17661218765191018
death [1] 18316
debate [1] 184522
December [2] 189917
190918
decent [2] 18952518961
decided (2) 177111191814 decides [1] 191412 deciliter (2] 184229
decision [9] 1770 8, 177924
179071839218511
18571818611516187214 decisions [1] 17895
declare [1] 190617
declared [1] 190519
defend [1] 179814
Defendant [2] 178010
182719
defendants [2] 192156
defense [1] 18412
define [1] 18743
definition [4] 1845 1, 2 6, 17
Degree [1] 189923
degree [3] $172320 \quad 17417$ 191521
delay [2] 1743519029
deliberations [1] 191924
deliver [1] 192112
delivered [3] 172857
192110
Delozier [11] 1735313
1755819175635824
17572 5, 185415
demonstrate [2] 17298 ,
184722
demonstrated [2] 182516
183412
Dennis (1] 177125
Department [5] 177910
17931112184312185423
department [38] 18721821
2218742018804188222
231893161901416
19062519092119109
191121231912471520
191341419141417
19159121519169
191741117231918811 172219203
818
depended [1] 18911
dependencies [1] 179420
dependency [3] 179224
19092023
depending (4) 181120
1812918331719167
Depends [1] 183316
depostted [1] 17648
deposition [22] 18022124
1803518371618441
1846101851161819,
1852218541018551
187413187625187812
14188141886 13, 18901
189145189224
depositions [3] 18075
1836 10, 185317
depression (13] 182417
18252182657187621
187722218784810

18841516190721
depth [1] 184419
descending [5] 181821
18193 24, 1821 8, 11
describe [3] 172712
173821191615
described [9] 17284
172924173011174018
1742 15, 174318174417
18551119138
describes [3] 1733 25,
174716185320
describing [4] 178351011 18003
description [8] 172413 17281617371017509 176824180011182725 191322
designated [2] 180123 191923
desired [1] 19202
desprte [1] 187518
destroyed [2] 1921 6, 11
detall (2) 190124191516
details [2] 18825189810
detect (1) 191712
detected [3] 1742192325
Datection [1] 17364
detection [1] 182524
determination [21] 18157
1872121882202118831
341213188522188711
1822188913189322
1904161914417191510
13, 18
determinations [1] 179810
determine [11] 17982
180421837 22, 19013
1905 15, 1619072519175 82024
determined [3] 182512
19051417
determines [2] 172821
181114
determining [2] 178111 179717
developed [2] 174721
192018
development [3] 172623
1920410
diabetic [2] 18612418624
diagnose [1] 18456
diagnosed [1] 189711
dragnoses [2] 1845 6, 19081 diagnosis [14] 184517
188410189712 25,
1898 19, 21, 1907121517 251908519164
diagram [1] 182410
Dick [3] 1807918511
187017
Dickson [1] 173315
dictated (1) 179821
die [1] 18264
differ [1] 173824
difference [7] 17252 ,
1809 15, 18121218139
183051831 1, 18708
differences [1] 184520
differently [2] 182416
191018
difficult [1] 18364
difficulties [1] 191910
Diplopia [1] 182925
diplopia [1] 18387
DIRE [2] 1799 22, 192319
dire [3] 17991918048
18069
DIRECT [8] 17235179125
187271909519237 16,
1924110
direct [4] 1847 24, 18592
1886618941
directed [3] 1727717746
187714
directing [1] 17245
direction [2] 18562192613 director [7] 172567 ,
173010179221 23, 18563
190916
disabilittes [1] 190021
disability [15] 1886 18,
190019251901 1, 4
19024 10, 1910 7, 22 23, 25
191112 24, 1914 1, 23
disabled [2] 19021719102
disagree [5] 185589
1869418711013
disaster [1] 172511
discemible (2) 1813710
discharge [1] 18859
disciplinary [1] 179818
discipline [1] 18883
discourse [1] 182610
discovered (2) 174117
17503
discovery [1] 17509
discrepancy (1) 175121
discuss [3] 172711173217
188916
discussed [4] 17691625
18076190412
discussion [3] 1728 23,
17881718154
discussions [3] 177110
17747189311
disease [3] 18881415
18895
disodium [1] 17343
disorders [2] 1794 23, 17951
disparaging [1] 18467
disparties [1] 18516
disparty [1] 18615
display [2] 17336174711
disputes [1] 184516
disputing [1] 18549
distinction [4] 18885810 11
distinguish [3] 175823
17594185625
DISTRICT [1] 19263
division [4] 17257172715
17, 173212
divisions [1] 172714
doctor [22] 17921618069
1826 17, 18271418379
184525186913188315
188819189919190522
1906 22, 241907562324
191212191311
doctoral [2] 172321179212
doctors [5] 18731416

Baste Systorms Applicetions
19071191125,19148 document [30] 172814 17331116182317345 173519241736222425 173719173825174314 174981217521175517 176441777151778913 1923,17802518412021 18481918828 documentation [4] 173110 11179917188210 documented [2] 184213 185817
documents [15] 17317
1732162017336173825 174113175124176618 177791796618076
18432418469184924 18982
Doesn't [1] 178416
doesn't [11] 176120
1786171805218321821
18472318523185918
187022188014188418
Doliver [1] 18722
dollar [1] 188014
dominant [1] 191911
Donna [6] 18431112
18529111619
donor [3] 1781192224
donors [1] 17308
door [1] 18653
doses [1] 182518
double [3] 180510183810 11
doubt [1] 17853
downward [1] 18321
dozen [1] 192123
DR [4] 179125179922
19231619
drank [1] 18875
draw [1] 17736
drawing [2] 17568183110
drawn [4] 17461920
18142218156
draws [1] 18885
drunk [4] 182516183220
188989
drinker [2] 18252318261 drinkers [1] 18354
drinking [14] 183281520 2518333518922
18931218942224
1895111318961618975 drinks [2] 181812191914 driving [6] 18132181522 18171517185913191520 drop [1] 185711
Drs [1] 184422
Drug [7] 17252117364 17931017941317953 18081113 drug [29] 1725722172717 2517321217922317949 11221796518004 18015180618180912 18102111825151821 18261113,1852111213 1725187421019204 Drug-Free [1] 179319 drug-free [1] 17955

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-19-94 VOLUME 13 Concordence by Look See(60)
drugs [24] 17241618
1725101726131727919 1753917921017941519 20179542517961122 241808222318091620 18121024
Drunk [1] 181715
drunk [6] 18132181522
18171618876189425
191922
dry [2] 17822123
DSM [1] 188410
due (1) 180317
duration [1] 191112
duttes [3] 17301115 187420
duty [33] 183824188219 2018852118871018 18891222189051114 2318974189878
190211121318,190411 12131905281014 16, 17192219076191020 DX [3] 17671176989 DX9102 [2] 17592117602 DX9112 [2] 175921178725 dysarthria [1] 183018 dysthymia [7] 18841315 188815189821190715 2019085
-E-
early [1] 18941
early'86 [1] 189420
Easily [1] 183021
easily [2] 1813710
East [2] 178268
easy [2] 18341619015
economic \{2] 177714
177923
edge [1] 178421
edition [2] 182718182810
education [3] 17231619
182122
educational [1] 17924
effect [4] 18128182521
19052119205
effected [1] 17519
effects [8] 17241517929
1805521182491826 6
185812
efficiency [2] 1919419201
EHAP [4] 18779111420
eight [3] 17419174821
elect [1] 184512
element [1] 18111
elien [4] 179524179611
2224
eliminated [1] 181822
elimination [21] 18182225
18193241820718219
1115201822218324
183322 1834 10, 18402
18411518 24, 1842815
184518
Elmo [5] 17451 9, 174712
175523182721
emerged [1] 19131
emerging [1] 191216
employed [13] 172391014

17241172557174123 187215189911190912 1315
Employee [1] 187712
employees [4] 19062122 191611191720
employer [4] 17981724
18421112
employment [6] 1723 24,
17242118426189914
19134191612
empties [1] 181815
empty [2] 18321922
enacted [1] 18006
enactment [1] 18004
enclosed [1] 178014
Encouraged [2] 19062324
end [6] 17474174820
1840161919211624
ending [1] 173713
endorse [1] 190523
ends [2] 174818186718
enforcement [1] 172723
England [1] 172321
enhancement [1] 189016 enrolled [1] 17928
entered [3] 17971019042
19066
entering (2) 19037190920
enters [1] 191522
entertain [1] 181919
entitied (2) 17952190622
entries [1] 187916
entry (2) 1734 7, 188525
environmental [2] 172715
16
enzymes [1] 181823
episode [2] 189845
Episodic [1] 189713
episodic [7] 188420
18971225189811517 22
episodically [2] 190718
19086
equals [2] 18201118
equilibrium [1] 18186
ER-5 [2] 191025191423
error [12] 1739 23, 17404
174116192117421011
1750391821131718586
errors [1] 174011
Erwin [1] 178724
escape [1] 182524
essence [1] 191524
essential [2] 1864318652
essentially [6] 18519
18742519115819149
191811
establish [1] 182212
established [4] 173139 ,
17951418651
estimate [3] 172741875 22,
19141
ot [1] 172716
ethanol [10] 1728 21, 22
17432217441,2177025 1814 16, 1863 20, 1864 3, 5
ethics [5] 179961218491 3185012
ovaluate [7] 17931917965 179771118864189514

191414
evaluated [3] 179414
18952191413
evaluatıng $\{3] 180324$
18061119188
evaluation [4] 179512
1799910188610
evaluations [2] 18113 ,
188522
evening [3] 1816418332
186718
event [5] 1751117743
17781417881518026
events [2] 174017177716
everybody [4] 175823,
176622190825191410
evidence [42] 17391617
17451317462174814
17492417508175920
17611179917180611
$18115,1418124,182213$
1826 19, 1836222318371
18402218412123
1842 13, 1847 18, 25,
18492418502185659
14
211858172018591115
186219186511186817
$\begin{array}{lllll}18 & 18696 & 1870 & 16 & 1898 \\ 19\end{array}$
evolution (1) 18457
exact [6] 174525175714
17873,187014190419
exactly [5] 1742 17, 177719
1805231837 24, 18679
exam [1] 183516
EXAMINATION [20] 17235
175225178921179125
1799221827418727.

18982519081319095
192371013161922
192414710
examination [6] 18711921
1886619094191119
191316
examine [4] 175222
1826251848618801
examined [2] 17281117423
EXAMINER [2] 1909 6,
192411
examiner [1] 183614
example [21] 17316 ,
17961120,179968 ,
18112318121018131
18171018181418253
18402024184251019
$\begin{array}{llll}1840 & 2024184251019 \\ 18571 & 186124 & 1870 & 16\end{array}$
18791218805
exams [2] 1879 2, 3
except [2] 184815190113
exception [3] 190221
1907 9, 191323
exceptions [1] 183725
oxchuding [1] 191223
exclusively [1] 17669
excreted [1] 181824
Excuse [6] 17881318106
186924190112190820
$\begin{array}{llll}186924190112 & 190820 \\ \text { excuse [4] } 17434 & 175122\end{array}$
18226187710
Excused (1) 179114
excused [1] 19211
excused


$\qquad$

$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

$\qquad$

$\qquad$
$\qquad$

$\qquad$

$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

$\qquad$

[^5][^6]教
exercise [1] 18543 Exhibat [27] 17221717438 1745201752152117557 17604,1761117697 177717178010178213 1785 6, 17871018085 18261820,2418271920 1834221841218612 1862 25, 188022190525 exhibit [16] 17411117458 $17581717698,9,181318$ 183112184112186018 188771906319195 192116 18, 22 exhibiting [2] 1838 2, 7
Exhibits [4] 172212175921 23, 17602
exhibits [7] 17229, 15 1749 5, 1755 15, 182616 1921 15, 18
exist [2] 1797 14, 192122
existed [1] 175210
expanded [1] 18451
expanding [1] 18452
expect [2] 1731718125
expected [1] 191113
expenses [1] 178911
experience [7] 175111
179561804 23, 18461
185018186920187017
experienced [2] 18092
182523
expertences [1] 180424 expert (14] 1791 17, 179824 179915180323180415 13 14, 191805132225 18066
expertise [6] 17956180313 25183323183910184524 experts [4] 18061418709 191919
Expires [1] 192622
explain [10] 17252173210
17391024174325
17472117481017575
18241019197
explained [1] 190125
explanation [1] 191115
exposure [1] 183624
Express [3] 17286176720 17832
extensively [1] 173916 extent (2) 17361617734 external (1) 173819 extra [2| 18532518547 extrapolation [18] 179513 180542118151418 1816101817192518183 20181921018209 1831821183422184210 17
extremely [1] 18496

| - |
| :---: |
| face-to-face [1] 189123 facet [2] 19151419163 facilities (1] 184622 facihty [1] 179223 fact [42] 173225173918 17402175423176422 |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-19-94
VOLUME 13
fill [3] 183414191119
filled [1] 172912
final [2] 1842410
find [11] 17317173257 ,
1764 23, 1806 11, 185820
18599,18821620189724
190725
findings [1] 177010
Fine [1] 192022
fine [2] 1784 3, 190123
finish [2] 1805 11, 189717
finished [2] 18081718799
firm [4] 1780478178924
First (1] 18184
first [41] 1722 9, 172811
17304617322417338
11, 1736191743 14, 17452 17521175322175710 1763201774 7, 14, 178218 17977180721181410 1820101825 16, 1826 17, 182922183192022
1836 16, 18409,184412 18511418541619 18561318571018666 18841318961419024 1911910
first-line [2] 19171919184 first-tıme [1] 17975
fisherman [1] 187210
fit [32] 1889221890411 189878190211121317 1904111213,19052810 14, 16, 1719 22, 19076 19111424 25, 1914725 191518
fitness [23] 187212187622 1877231878418821920 1883131213188521
1887101822188912
1893221913221914514
1719151018191720
fits [1] 18215
five [11] 17614179712
180022180423180921 181061018991213 1911119148
five-minute [4] 188125
18822518831018989 fix [1] 19015
flag [2] 1819518988
flash [1] 190113
flavor [4] 185511122425 flavors [1] 185514
flaw [10] 1810211811414
1847142118527185617
18581617186114
flaws [1] 185814
flight [1] 18676
flown [1] 18673
fluid [2] $172917 \quad 18623$ fluoride [3] 173423 186511
focus [6] 173691737 6, 17498,151795 18, 181811 focused (1) 186411 focuses [1] 18353 focusing [1] 178410 folks [2] 19107191919 follow $\{5$ ) 17751917761 179071018931
follow-up [1] 192015
followed (6] 173620
1810201846318503 1917625
following [5] 176715
18021618204190117 191915
Food [2] 179413183223
food [2] 1818 14, 16
forced [2] 184356
foregoing [2] 1926911
Forensic [1] 172416
forensic [10] 17242612
172615173018173315
180822231822 20, 18543
formed (3) 1802142025
forms [8] 1766191767 16,
1917741718013180217
18073191319
forth [1] 190711
forward [4] 1751 12, 17708
1805 22, 191120
Foster [1] 17249
found [5] 17328174923
17507177324191422
foundation (2) 18046
182210
four [5] 176141804 23,
181816183224190110
fourth [1] 17487
frame [3] 18735619003
framework [1] 182821
Francisco [9] 179123
17928,111522179314 23
free [3] 1792 14, 21, 19043
freezer [3] 17461117647
185710
freezing [1] 174724
frequency [1] 181123
frequently [1] 191523
front [16] $174618 \quad 175023$
1755917601017672
1769201778911179312
17981418271818411
1880221903123192011
front on [2] 174617174714
frozen (2) 17822317833
full [4] 172225179120
1872119097
function [6] 1726 22, 18002
18012180491825825
functions [7] 173014
17974182322 25, 18241 222
future [1] 18847

## - G -

Gabby [2] 190119190414 gains [1] 191620
gart [1] 182918
galley [4] 1853 3, 67 ,
186613
Gary [1] 17472
gas [1] 172820
gastrointestınal (1] 18185
gate [1] 18331
gave [6] 17782178025
1854201869519211920
generalized [1] 18067

Ause Sytorns Applicerions
generate [1] 186213
generation [5] 186123
18697111718705
generic [2] 191013191124
genetic [2] $182512 \quad 1836 \quad 23$
gentleman [1] 174013
Gentlemen [1] 18063
gentlemen [7] 17225
1803 15, 180617184323
18461018501018609
germane [1] 18052
gets [4] 1731518184
18535191123
gist [1] 190325
Give [1] 183524
give [26] 172324172413 17274172816172936 175514177518178113 1785215179120181921 1842918552118704 1874 17, 1882618921113 19, 190811619116 19139192113
Given [1] 18423
given [18] 17502117877
1822118361418402024
18546187412188589
15, 18892418922118938 190541119164191911 gives [3] 17453184119 18425
giving [2] 18432219121 glucose [4] $186125 \quad 18623$ 8, 186911
goes [15] 174725179911 182511826378183217 183311842918655 1878251884171818887 gotten [1] 183924
GOULD [2] 19095192410 Gould [6] 18722418734 1519093819179 government [4] 17938
17945912
govemmental [2] 17946 graduate [2] 17232117928 graduated [2] 17925 189922
grammatical [2] 177725
17782
grams [1] 18422
grant [3] $1902 \quad 16 \quad 19 \quad 190417$
granted [2] 17349190423
Graves [4] 183114188619 188749
Gray [1] 17507
gray [25] 17421174514 1748141750517514 17577817582317595 177024177511178510 181211161818134 185616185711718584 $\begin{array}{llll}25 & 18656 & 8 & 1214\end{array}$ gray-and [1] 17516
gray-stopper [1] 176417 gray-stoppered [11] 17398 $17403,8 \quad 175014176825$ 177137121773917837 17857
great [5] 18211818261 1844 19, 1845718643

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-19-94
VOLUME 13
greater [2] 19191415
Gregory [4] 172513
1772171917738
gross [2] 1829819195
grounding [5] 173115
17541018162 13, 183820 grounds [3] 18382518881 3
group [4] 1738101883 22, 18861618973
grown [1] 184515
grows [1] 184515
Guard [20] 17375174123
174315174411174925
1753202217652517745
178121517892417903
610131791918341523 183819
Guerra [4] 190120190414 22190520
guess [5] 1745318743
188723189023190418 guidance [2] 1836412 guidelines [7] 179514
1797111418431418464 18521121
guy [2] 17712418473
guys [1] 184923
——H-

H-a-z- $\theta$ - H w [1] 174816
hacked [1] 190424
hadn't [5] 18021519
1857 16, 18598188817
Haight (2) 17921421
half [3] 176271919 9,
192123
hand [6] 17222117287
$\begin{array}{lllllll}1785 & 12 & 17 & 1871 & 22 & 1878 & 15\end{array}$ handed (1) 181318
handled [16] 17541317551
175811760192017613
$\begin{array}{llllll}9 & 11 & 14 & 17627 & 10 & 14\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llll}1763 & 10 & 13 & 15 \\ 16\end{array}$
handing [4] 174725
18062325184825
handlings [2] 176334
happens [6] 177712
18111318121818554
185613
hard (1] 180018
Harvey [1] 187725
hasn't [3] 1804618135 18458
haven t [2] 18441818595
he'd [1] 189212
head [1] 180123
Health [2] 18771219001
heath [4] 179222179411
19091619167
hear [7] 1803 15, 180711
1861122018731418796 191212
heard [17] 1725 1, 17916 ,
18001518011518068
181110183610183710
$18461118478 \quad 1850$ 16,
1861181882618951821
18996191016
heaning [5] 1775917778

17981518622119129
hearings [3] 179511
179815180021
hearsay [1] 174013
heck [1] 180515
held [4] 1724517945
190917192611
help [5] 180517182824
1841 3, 5, 190619
helpful [2] 180610192125
helps [1] 19153
Hemolysis [1] 177624
hemolysis [1] 18604
hemolyzed [2] 17761923
HERBY [1] 19268
hereby [3] 17561620
176714
hernia [1] 191321
high [1] 18263
higher [9] 18221182319
$\begin{array}{llllll}18241 & 18 & 20 & 25 & 182518\end{array}$
182668
Hill [1] 17233
hired [2] 176524179824
history [9] 172325182513
18356111836167
18376191119
hold [1] 17932
hoids [2] 184219
honestly [1] 18765
Honor [46] 17322117334
1743346,17451617
$174614,17483,17521823$
17551125,175919
176023178318178514,
178710178920179112
16, 1799 15, 19, 180311
18041518051718082
181081822922182616
$21 \quad 1827119183514$
18364183718184316
18607212518711617
18871318954
hope [3] 173320182313
190825
hopefully [1] 18992
Hospital [3] 179211
1865 15, 189924
hospital [8] 17922418837
18901719025814
19037,191014
hospitalization [2] 191019
191625
hotel [1] 186610
hour [13] 17627181622
181815182091419
1832192223183389
184229
hours [9] 1761 17, 181722
1818 16, 1820 6, 183224
18349 17, 18687,12
house [1] 186714
Houston [6] 1872.3, 18753
1886 16, $19006,7,190911$
Human [7] 17247,175016
1770251771 18, 18074
1823410
human (2] 1724 16, 19208
HUNTER [6] 18727189825
1908131924147
Hunter [2] 1871 20, 18722

Hypothermia [1] 183015
hypothesis [1] 183318
Hypothetıcal [1] 189620 hypothetıcal [7] 183515
18386187919189558
18968,19
hypothetucally [3] 184223
18951013

## - 1-

Id [11] 1745217496
17851418062218085
182619186112189710
1908231909119
l've [31] 1755241793810
12179481022179529
11180018180118
1809211810118214
182324183661837 16,
184219184625184918
185016 24, 18512,185317
$18558 \quad 18786,188525$
1921516
ice (2] 17822123
idea [4] 172936180319
18716
identified [2] 17857183123
identifier [1] 190617
identifies [1] 179523
identify [1] 18886
Identifying [1] 17952
identifying [1] 188725
IDR [10] 188022 25, 18818
16, 18, 18822324188317
188511191025
Ignored [4] 1781346 ,
178823
Ilicit [4] 180822180920
181210
impact [6] 174122179616
1718242418892118904
impaired [1] 182321
imparment [16] 18189
182415,182578101115
1826181829389
18342518358184214
19195
implement [2] 17972
179818
implemented [3] 1796 2,
1813 16, 17
importance [1] 187821
important [10] 1754811
1849618582418739
187819188910191610
19181
umpossible [1] 173916
inabilties [1] 19199
inaccurate [2] 18403 ,
184217
inborn [1] 182514
incident [4] $173418 \quad 174619$
17492217525
Incidentally [3] 1764 11,
176912177324
inetdentally [1] 17844
incidents [2] 1761 4, 189513 inciuned [1] 19077
include [6] 17372417381
176141795 10, 1816 12,
$-\quad-1-$


## -

$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\square$




[^7]$\qquad$ 7

[^8]
$\qquad$

$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$


13


77


$\qquad$



$\qquad$

$\square$
$\square$





183623
included [7] 1727 23,
1735 11, 176624176715
1801 4, 181010182722
inclusive [1] 17603
incorrect (1] 180121
increase [4] 180923
1811 23, 184013184118
increased [5] 18368
1840221841131842124
increases [1] 18406
increasing [6] 18241516
18422518631918645 independent [2] 179821 188610
independently [4] 18496 9, 14, 191516
indicate [18] 173224
173324173771015
1738417455175124
17523517567177614
17851 181421, 18966
1911912
indicated [23] 173413
173918174317174413
1752 1, 175391772 19,
1779 23, 17813178415
179331797218097 1821418352 3, 1836624 18401618552188525 190413191020
indicates [8] 17341173716 1738617876188115 19021119041191920 indicating [2] 1736417406 indication [1] 173713
indications [1] 177221
indicia [1] 17728
individual [38] 172310
1731817951921179710 18181218248182557
1818356183735
1843121852222318765
187736187922188013
188361918861818973
190025,190141019101
23, 25191423
191672119191112
192012
individually [1] 185723 individuals [13] 173912
177423181124181711 1821192318251318407 184420187716191912 industry [2] 179616181711 inevitably [1] 18653 inexperienced [1] 18261 inference [2] 17701917736 influenced (1] 181813 influences [1] 183717 information \{28] 173314 173511175013178113 141787817887180624 182151836918371624 184071842318184818 18672518794188719 19022319061914 19116221912219164 19186
initial [9] 173620173914
174515174624174922

17504917766182424
initialed [3] 17408175013
18116
initialing [1] 17407
initially [1] 17848
initaals [7] 174623174726
174817185313188115
18829
initlate [1] 19112
inttated [1] 175113
impatient [2] 1799910
input [1] 192019
inquire [1] 180620
Inside [1] 178220
insıde [2] $174722 \quad 176521$
inspection [3] 1726411
174922
inspectors [2] 1726 5, 17271
installation [1] 18949
instance [13] 181515
18546185710187419
187621879118961415
211898151911 14,
191314191511
Instnute [8] 17249172521
1726 4, 251736 3, 179310
1808 11, 13
instrtution [2] 1875 13,
192014
instructed [2] 1740419107
instruction [1| 18547
instructions [1] 192024
instructive [1] 191523
insure [2] 172811189119
intact [11] 172812174824
17491218101923
1811256184814185920
integrity [14] 1747 5, 174925
1751171811151518
1847222518525185314
185813185921186425
intend (1] 18053
interact (5) 17967180111
1325184313
interacted (6) 1794818014 $\begin{array}{llll}14 & 17 & 18 & 180216\end{array}$
interaction [6] 179419
180278923185025
interactions [1] 179422
interchangeable [1] 182612 interest [1] 17995
interesting [1] 189716 internal [7] 172813173816 232517405189925
19003
intemed [1] 179211
internship [2] 187323
189924
interpret [2] 17951317987
interpreted [1] 18982
interview [1] 189514
interviewed (1] 176823
intoxication [2] 18188
18284
introduction [1] 184215
invaded [1] 181116
invalidate [1] 179817
investıgating [2] 183820 18887
investigation [2] 17791213
invited [1] 188617
invoive [5] 17448
18001316,18242
involved [21] 1727517381
1763 1, 1766 7, 177824
178057817894179521 1796201800121918103 184525187214187720 18851019152
involvement [1] 177820
invoives [1] 18259
involving [2] 1775 2, 180912
irregular [1] 187618
Isopropanol [1] 177312
isopropanol [7] 177220
1773 2, 5, 11, 25179015 17911
issue [13] 1742 12, 178810
1794 12, 1822 20, 186111
1862 2, 20, 18657,17
1877181878713190222
issued [1] 17818
issues [7] 172721180110
1805 7, 181121850 18,
186120187715
tem [1] 173710

-     - J -

J J H [1] 174623
JAMIN [18] 17228 19,
17236173223174016
17432,7174521174836
175212 19, 17601178919
221791111923814
Jamin [2] 172216192117
jeopardized [1] 187715
job [11] 175891885822
190451913181914619
1917201918919191
192016
Joe [1] 18937
joined [1] 190023
Jones (4) 1725 15, 17382
17422018573
Joseph [17] 172314
1725101731917341016
17357173615173711
17381717461922
174911212217524
17534176014
jot-and-tittle [1] 19161
Judge [2] 18982319222
judge [4] 17818179625
17972218118
judged [2] 17987189010
judgment (6] 1824218259 186113189517191521 19167
judgmental [1] 18263
judgments [5] 179320
17982118052318062
185515
Judy (3) 173925174021
18582
July [11] 1749101774922
177613141777568
177924178011189915
juncture [1] 178622
Junior [1] 19098
juries [2] 18042018051
juror [1] 180514
jurors [1] 17459
Jury [6] 172221803 16,
1806151860121419213
Jury [19] 172413173210
1745171748317494
177611785 15, 18003
180431721180611
1807218201182324 ,
1837221843 23, 192117
Justice [2] 177911185423

-     - K -

KLM (1] 17477
Kagan [5] 17251717382,
17422217831118572
Karen [14] 1740 4, 5, 17499
175718176414 20, 17652
37177715177818 185810
KARYN [1] 192621
Karyn [1] 19266
keep [5] 1782 23, 183914
187821189710190021
keeping [1] 173214
keeps [1] 183919
KENNETH [2] 19095
192410
Kenneth (2) 190938
kept [4] 178119183516
188819190513
key [3] 18181718216
183123
kinds [3] 1731718284
184518
kinetics [1] 18422
ktt [2] 1733 14, 24
knife [1] 178421
knowing [1] 18514
knowledge [18] 17401317
1751117542517555
17641122176516
178813180681018
18703188517188615
19061019182

| - L - |
| :---: |
| label [4] 17461817476 |
| labeled [3] 17374174618 |
| 17766 |
| Laboratories [4] 17241125 |
| 1725417328 |
| laboratories (5) 172625 |
| 17277174310180819 |
| 181519 |
| Laboratory [2] 1807724 |
| laboratory [19] 172426 |
| 17301217313174011 |
| 1770417967179918 |
| 1801221808121416 |
| 18094518111318126 |
| 18131418153185718 |
| Labs [1] 17885 |
| labs [3] 17272180824 |
| 18227 |
| lack [7] 186671867820 |
| 186810251870211871 |
| Ladies [1] 180617 |
| ladies [6] 17225180315 |
| 184323184610 |

18608
lard [1] 18046
Lake [5] 1724817402
17411416175016
Landry [1] 182716
Lang [1] 179424
language [1] 17362
lap [1] 18674
large [2] 17932318897
last [17] 17231179121
18011718021218365
183715184413184510
1863232518642218721
4188815189916191111
lasts [2] 18841819
late [2] 17466186524
latest [1] 183915
latter [1] 190421
launch (2) 1896910
law [4] 172417172723
17818191520
lawyer [1] 178721
lawyers [1] 178721
layman [1] 17771
lays [1] 191522
leading (1] 181013
leaflet [1] 173313
leakage [2] 174724174812 leaked (1] 18606
leam [9] 182523190922
251910141912141620
191312
leamed [7] 19061819105
1019124824
leave \{21] 17307177112
183722188591518
18892418901523
189120211902161921
190481723190541122
leaves [3] 189022190215
lecture [1] 185016
lectures [1] 18848
left-hand [3] 17331917356
182815
logal [2] 1811918123
legitimate [1] 184520
length [1] 191123
letter [14] 176922177019
211771517801114
1787345202317881
18787
letters [1] 174816
level [16] 18132181516
1817131417181811
1819131820818244
18251251838614
184213185718191516 levels [4] 1824182018644
Librium [1] 179421
license [3] 17972418493
185518
licensed [3] 17262017418
179217
Licenses [1] 172620 licensures [1] 172619
Lieutenant [11] 1747 2,
1753 24, 175479178024
1781 2, 5, 1790 5, 185121
1852 17, 186715
life [2] 1889619171
IIfetime [4] 18841819

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-19-94
VOLUME 13
Concordance by Look See(SA)
188815189114
light [2] 177610191421
likelihood [1] 191915
likes [1] 190122
likewise \{2] 1856920
limb [2] 1821811
Line [1] 18936
line [11] 17397174624
1804181839418551518
187461018771318902
189225
lines [2] 1746 21, 176916
Linsin (2) 17791115
liquid [1] 18137
list (3) 1921162024
IIsted [3] 17342218383
19103
listened \{2] 18365183715
listening (1] 192025
lists [2] 19211821
Inter [2] 17292122
Itterally [2] 189319191416
Interature (14] 18621619
186413186945151619
20241870318881718
191918
Ititgation [3] 173021
17312317323
Ittigations [1] 17809
live [1] 186911
liver [2] 181823
lives [1] 18393
local [1] 17287
located [1] 172420
location (1) 174620
locked [1] 185312
$\log [1] 185324$
$\log -\mathrm{I}$ [1] [1] 18616
logged [8] 172813175417
17639177510185114
1854711185615
logging [2] 18562324
logs [3] 1761222417622
London [2] 172434
long-term (7) 174611
176215176461765912 191924
longhand [3] 17772023
17781
looks [1] 173612
lose [1] 18493
loss [1] 19194
lost [1] 173613
lot [2] 178916188014
lots [1] 184515
loud (2] 18951189610
low [1] 175524
lower [3] 17482018221 182418
LYNCH [1] 192119

- M -

M-O-n-t-g-0-m-ө-r-y [1] 18725
MD (2) 189923191320
M J [2] 1735313
M J D [2] 1736 19, 174817
machine [2] 1755 21, 18149
magnitude [1] 18795
maintain [1] 17462
maintained [4] 173022
173311746810
maintenance [3] 17301519 24
major [4] 184524190812 191323
majority [3] 18211923
Man (1] 190825
man [11] 180113180323
1804712180520187514
181879418951422
189710
management [14] 173012
1876318923189519
18964162319001925
19104191212191412
19156191814
manager [3] 1741318781 19208
manuc \{2] 1877418789
manner [1] 17893
manual [3] 184081618424
March [34] 172313172420
17255173420173619
173717173869173915
174619202517473
175313162017619
17627176719177716
18142518159181625
1838218511525185412
1856818661415
1867319
margin [1] 182112
mariuuana (2] 179611
180922
martal [2] 1884118974
mark [1] 188112
marked [13] 17338173522
17362317381317488
17671178010178323
18293183036183424
183814
marketed [1] 173314
master [1] 18988
masters [1] 187618
match [1] 17691
material [5] 18078183922
18502418702191118
materials (3] 177223
18392418416
math [1] 184224
mathematıcal [2] 182021
18438
Matt [4] 1761112418027 8
matter (10] 1754811
176423177517183217
183916184415184624
186814190919
matters [2] 1806 19, 192611
Maureen [1] 172515
McCallion [1] 178722
mean [11] 1804118151
181912184723185367
1890231893 13, 189411
190422191615
meaning [4] 1798 3, 8
18252019046
meanings [1] 17989
means [5] 1743 25, 177623
1789817976189714
meant [1] 187415
measure [2] 18099182819 measurement [1] 177319
measurements [3] 17702
25184614
measures [1] 180925
measuring [3] 182414
186311186418
mechanical [1] 18055
mechanism [1] 18255
Medical [1] 178818
medically (2] 18119187613
Medicine [1] 17942
medicine [10] 179225
179321180019184559
2518732118992519003 191520
meet [3] 18671518752
189123
meeting (2) 185323188616
meetings [2] 1904619191
meats [1] 18116
member [1] 175819
members (2) 173210
185620
memo [13] 17499175817
177411177761523,
1778251779413178210
1618821520
memory [4] 17602118552
4187723
memos [1] 188216
mental [5] 18293183424
1876221877 22, 18784
mention [2] 17781923
mentroned [6] 174021
17761317804179715
18391119164
mercifully [1] 18992
Merrit-Peralta [1] 179224
message [1] 17715
metabolic [1] 184022
metabolism [10] 18182124
182231840618411013
152518421
Metcalf [37) 17371416
1738410173918174210 1749917502025175419 2017572417581,17619
1762710176310176414
2017652 3, 177461121
17776201779418076
1851131853231856 1, 25 1857 21,
221858710
method [6] 1815111323
18161018175183421
methodology [1] 181523
methods [2] 186311
186418
metropolitan (1) 17242
MICHAEL [6] 17235 ,
1752251789211923 7, 10 13
Michael (6] 1722 20, 17232 17532,1801141718477 microorganism [2] 186210 18692
microorganisms [1] 186212
mid [1] 187523
mid-brain (4) 1824 21,

18252 4, 18268
middle [2] 19031619115 midnight [9] 1752618163 418202 13, 15183324 midway [1] 18631
mild [3] 188416190720 Mill [1] 184425 milligrams [1] 18429 millifiter (5] 17295, 710 1740 8, 174920
miliuiters [5] 1729161923 24
million [1] 188014 mind [5] 175136818692 189710
minimization [1] 189814
minimum [2] 1895213
minor [1] 18114
mınus [4] 182117 18, 24
18224
minute [9] 1756 18, 1764 5,
1803111837 18, 1841 17,
1869241883 17, 1893 3, 189721
minutes [4] 18061318433
1860911
miscalculated [1] 18565
mischaracterization [2]
184015185015
mischaracterize [1] 185219
mischaracterized [2]
184817185310
mischaracterizes [1] 18551
mischaracterizing [1] 18955
misgiving [1] 188713
misgivings [1] 18879
misplaced (1] 17434
misses [1] 191523
misspoke [1] 191210
mistake [2] 17581318
mistakes [1] 185923
mix [1] 178625
moderate [1] 182523
modified [1] 18355
moment (10] 172316
172711174021174110
17432184223187115
1901231912319212
moments [1] 19011
Monday [1] 175323
monitor [3] 179712187425
191711
monntoring [4] 179714
189491619183
MONTAGUE [20] 179116
17921180621180814
1810 9, 181957182024
182111822111524
18261522183514
18601918637187117
192317
MONTGOMERY [6] 18727
1898251908131924147 Montgomery [4] 187120
18722190513190811 month [3] 18701818837
19028
months [6] 17261112
17781418991213
Morgan [1] 187725
Morming [i] 17923

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
morming [32] 1722517237
817321717389175124
175210232417533
17741217922179924
1800 1, 1807111720
181641820418381
18397185352218568
186519241866 24, 18673
192118192019224
mostly [2] 1815 21, 186411
motor [13] 18055182469
1825710112518261
182981018357191959
move [7] 174012175611
17617177214183611
18601618928
moved [1] 17659
moves [1] 183220
moving [1] 176516
MRO [2] 18611218
Ms [37] 173714 16, 17382
4 10, 1739171740 21,
17421020,17502025
1754192017572417581
176191762710176310
1774611211777620
17794185113185323
1856125185722122
185879190422
190520
MSO [1] 186612
Murtiashaw [2] 19211019
Myself [1] 190220
myself [4] 17277177424
1815418505
mysterious [1] 191313
-N -
name [20] 1722 25, 17231
17242317341617357
1736417632023177911
17912021179924
186914187125187214
919011919097
named [2] 177124180113 names [1] 191024
National [10] 172521
17263241744617666 17671317692217939 18081113
national (3) 17262317943
17953
Natives [1] 187210
nature [11] 180317181125
181522184315184522
18472418858189126
18951719045
nausea (2) 18292118387
NEAL [12] 180518188712
189262018954189619
18971718981118991
19082519202119245
Nealy [6] 1872241873311 151894218
needs [1] 191724
negative [1] 179019
negatives [1] 189215
negligent [1] 18119
Neogenesis [1] 186122
neogenesis [4] 186121

1862118631318718
nerves [1] 18056
nervous [1] 18056
neuroadaptation [1] 182519
neutral [4] 179824179924 12
Nevada [1] 17935
newer [1] 184512
newly [1] 191011
nicked [1] 17858
NIDA [18] 1726817535
180110180810121516
19212418094 5, 821
1813121849 1, 22185014
night [1] 18535
nine [3] 1842 5, 1877 13,
19019
Nobody [1] 189421
nobody (2] 1776 11, 18534
Noedel [9] 1761 11, 24
176310 18, 18011318027 ,
8, 184745
Nolting [1] 18936
nor-medical [1] 191811
non-responsive [1] 182222
noon (2) 18601213
normal [9] 174010177514
1783118272518361822
183816
Normally [1] 175120
normally [4] 17306176517 17722417733
North [4] 172331732911 14
Notary (2) 1926721
notary [1] 175023
notation [1] 17397
note [3] 191016191212 192111
noted [1] 17766
notes [3] 189724192011 192610
notice [1] 19159
notıced [2] 1740218586 notification [3] 19101921
19215
nots [1] 189216
NTSB [9] 176618176817
211770161771917745
177959179110
number [13] 17278174424
1814251818118201315
1822818231918349
18431618185314191914
numbers [8] 17361818179
1818202182815184119
18422418437
numerous [1] 172723
$\overline{-\quad \mathbf{O -}}$
o'clock [1] 176116
O'Conner (3) 1844141624 O'NEILL [28] 180415
180591318311214 16,
18712018728,188715
18928923189579
18962025189718
189813231908 14, 1824
190931920 23, 192117
19222192428

O'Neill [11] 175925180511
18729189717190012
1901819051325190710
1908812
Oak [1] 190317
Oaks [1] 19066
oath [5] 175841775510
185120187815
obey [1] 17719
object [5] 1822921
183116189545
Objection [5] 174519
18871218926189619
189811
objection (9) 1722 14,
174518175217 18, 17658
1826211831 18, 186019
18957
objective [2] 179820
179913
objectivity [1] 179822
observers [1] 18397
observing [1] 191722
obtain [2] 1726218794
obtained [1] 18651
obvious [1] 172812
obviously (2) 173020
190212
occasion [4] 1802218279
18742418752
Occasionally [2] 17287
175116
occasionally [1] 18875
occasions [3] 176311
18876189024
occupation [2] 1891 3, 6 occupatıonal [1] 179225
occur [10] 1796118262
18621517 18, 18643
1869121818705191113
occurred [4] 18718187624 1879118965
occurring (1] 180924
occurs [3] 182519186123
186215
October [3] 17452417845
184413
OESTING [1] 192110
off-white [2] 174710
178414
offender [1] 17975
offer [6] 175920179915
1805318061918261619
offered [12] 172213
17521315175924
1826201920912192115
19254578
offering [3] 17228182212 18793
office [6] 17311617323
1737518671418861924
officer [47] 179315 18, 21
221795917 18, 179659
15212317974161920
231798112023179917
20180028162125
18012518049141622
251808151809118
18101218112022
181519183912
211840818431418464

Basc Systems Applications
officers [1] 183914 offices [1] 19062 official [2] 174913190014 Oh [4] 175212185517 190178
okay [10] 17609177819 178011178323178411 178561829118749 1901814
old (2) 1830518993
Olympic [1] 17949 ombudsman [1] 179314 Omnibus [1] 180925 on-board [2] 18341524 on-the-job [1] 187324 ones [2] 176311184910 ongoing [1] 19171
open [5] 18536718653
opened [8] 1730717313
181785118512224
185216185615
openly [1] 18765
opens [1] 185223 operatıonal [1] 191925 opiates [2] 179612180922 opinions [2] 18062019209 opportunity [3] 173215 189016189212 opposed [3] 1805118313 188725
option [1] 17977
orange [1] 17861
Order [1] 17224
order [11] 181992118414 18641618702518794
190812191620191724 19186
ordering [1] 189424
orders [2] 17719189617
organ [2] 18188
organisms [3] 186125
18625186910
organization [2] 18897 191716
original [8] 17268173216
1739211761421177210 1822518616
originally [3] 17652417661
originated [1] 17375
Orleans [1] 187624
ounce [2] 172917181812
outcome [1] 191924
outfit [1] 172423
outlined [1] 18503
outlook (1) 19044
outpatient [2] 1916 25, 19176
outside [3] 178614183910 18869
outstanding [1] 185015
overnight [1] 17285
oversight [1] 178315
overt [1] 19195
overview [1] 174712
owned [1] 17253
oxide [1] 17342
$\frac{-P-}{\overline{P-\Theta-a-t ~[1] ~} 17232} 1$

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-19-94
VOLUME 13

1860141921319227
package [3] 17662417674

## 8

packages (3) 17752225
17763
packed [1] 17598
Page [1] 18638
page [33] 17331820
1737191743141817444
51217501217571
177518181410182720
18416710242518421
41860172124186367
10187451877813
189011892202419119
pages [3] 176621176715
19118
pard [6] 175422178979
17993188518189023
pain [1] 179420
paper [3] 188023188311 18982
paperwork [2] 18611520
paragraph [11] 178218
18424186312152324
25186411521
Pardon [1] 180720
pardon [1] 180219
parenthesis [1] 181416
Park [1] 17329
part [30) 17272017346
1737717491317504
175891795318019
181416181518182116
2218252418373183924
18401718508186557
1718669101112
18911116190113
1904211911519157
partial [1] 183614
participate [6] 17975
179816183919188914 17191618
participated [2] 180016 19043
parts [1] 19206
pass [5] 17265180418
1831123
passage [1] 180924
passes [1] 181823
patient [1] 179911
patients [1] 17997
PCP [2] 179612180922
peak [1] 181916
peaked [1] 181914
PEAT [6] 17235175225
$178921 \quad 192371013$
Peat [37] 17222017237
17392517402122
175219175325176925
17761317804178923
180114161918021015
16 17, 22231803618077
11151844322184611
1850811152518541
18582918617
186510
pecimens [1] 173614
peer [1] 184523
pen [5] 17298, 13 25,
people [16] 17381175317
176020176520177122
17722417733183919
18502318711218775
1885318894189113
191324191410
percent [26] 1743122
18107101814717
18151218161417
182023182117 19, 24
182241840114184113
$18 \quad 18421,8132425$
percentage [2] 18001523
perception [1] 18215
perform [5] 17231417259 22, 1757 18, 191015 performance [1] 18298 performed (8] 172519
17282017311117405
1757181763171819
performing [1] 17529
performs [1] 18049
period (22) 172722173022
17481176117176217
182020182212185017
1867781120187324
18764190924,1910312
1913319171318191816 22
periodic [1] 18793
penodically [2] 189714
191922
penods [6] 18663718689
10187021189715
permission [3] 172219
17349178514
person [29] 175621177124
180152224180234
180325182318221824 6,
182811835 17, 18361822
1837 1, 1838 1, 6183925
1850 19, 18624188313
1886101904 15, 1907 3,
19111319141319161
personal [7] 17401317
1764112217651619076
personally [1] 17423
personnel [2] 187613
191116
persons [1] 174416
pertaining [1] 18848
Pete [3] 17232180117
18477
PG [1] 179323
ph [7] 1733 15, 176612
1787 22, 24, 17885183911 184414
pharmacological (3)
18251720183623
pharmacology [4] 172322
179291793 5, 180619
phase (1] 191625
phonomenon [1] 186122
phone [5] 17701188212
251883 10, 18989
photograph [4] 174618
17471617487178417
photographs [11] 174245
71746 16, 1748 4, 1788 20,
1807 14, 21, 18488,185611

Phrase [1] 190820
phrase [1] 182915
physical [2] 187617191119
physically [4] 172420
1846191847418486
physicals [1] 187617
physician (22) 179217
1878251883619012
190515171910219116
918201913202225
191472419151,71319 19166
physiologic [1] 18246
physiological [3] 18055
18231420
pick [2] 181347
picked [1] 17648
picking [1] 18212
picks [1] 181314
picky [1] 183117
picture [5] 17455611
174811191522
pictures [6] 1744212324
17452217831717844
prece [3] 188311188718
18982
pills [1] 19173
punched [1] 17862
place [8] 173422176516
17711918541618907
1913319174
placed [1] 190223
PLAINTIFF (1] 19234
Plaintiff [1] 18085
plantiff [2] 17872119093
Plaintiffs [4] 177717
1791 16, 1826 23, 187120
plaintıffs (6) 1722 20, 17892
179915180322187210
19219
plan [2] 1891 11, 190215
play [2] 1846 1, 18804
played [2] 18511819204
players [1] 17894
Please [5] 1722 24, 174919
179119191414192024
please [18] 17532175918
17831917912117924
1803 21, 18051918148 ,
1820251826141827221
18371918411186016
18721419197
plus [5] 1821 17, 18, 24,
18224183418
point [22] 1752 16, 1764 13,
1765 8, 1766 6, 17825 5,
1814 25, 1823 14, 16, 20,
1824 6, 1854 5, 185913
187620,1878 8, 188021
18821114188310 18,
189061219129
pointed [1] 189716
pointing [3] 174713
1748 13, 182816
points [1] 175213
poisoning (1] 18264
pollce [1] 17242
policy [14] 17975187612
$187920,25,18804,18883$
5, 189622 24, 1906 19,
1918 17, 1920 4, 7, 10

Baere Syptemt Appleations
poly [1] 174616
polystyrene [2] 17474 17599
port [6] 1887 6, 189024
1891 1, 189510 12, 18969
portion [11] 1729110
173691738 5, 173911
1743 18, 1750 8, 176011
177114184421185224
pose [1] 183615
posed [2] 181520183515
position (12] 17245178716
178824180124188068
1118811319091719148 191820
positions [9] 17245
1792 20, 1793 2, 1794567
9, 18809,10
positive [2] 1797 6, 18576
possession [2] 174622
176115
possibility [6] 1773 7, 18066
18711018951624
post [1] 179212
potentral [3] 179415
18111919141
power [2] 183823189316
practice (15] 17305178418
179217179322179822
1799141846467
186191418713
practices [1] 172712
practicing [1] 191520
practitioner [1] 19168
pro-admitted [2] 174613
17496
precise [1] 186525
precisely [1] 17362
preparation [1] 173024
propared (6) 17431014
1749912177813192612
preparing [1] 17401
preplacement [1] 18792
prescription [2] 179411
18844
presence [7] 17259
1726131727918177219 18632018646
present [7] 173324179017
17922017951118182
18361918404
presentation [3] 182410
18367185220
presented [9] 175117
180224180351840817
1921184121186219 presently [3] 172310 172615190910
presents [2] 18391321
Preservation [1] 18642 preservation [2] 186316 18652
preservative [5] 18121921 186581114
preservatives [4] 185924
186320186468
preserved [1] 175414
president [1] 184512
press [1] 17778
pressure [2] 1865518796 presumably [2] 19031519

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
pretty (4] $1829 \overline{12} \quad 18 \overline{18419}$ 189613189720
prevents [1] 181219
previous [2] 1738 18, 174111 previously [7] 17701
1781141808718101 ,
19138191922192111
primarily [1] 186220
primary [5] 1768 22, 179518
18982019071519084
prime [1] 190122
Principally [1] 19207
printed [1] 182411
printout [2] 182024182614
prior (12] 174271746 3, 7
175541768161774 22,
17792417855181516
1864 2, 1906 19, 191816
privacy \{2] 17871817891
private [3] 1727 25, 191513 19
probability [1] 187111
problem [36] 17756
180321180520186417. 1870131874212518756 81876212324187723 2418783892324
18886818895189225
18952018964612
19021019074190812, 191524191722191812 problems [10] 177521
1776618357183667 1837618631218711
187518187716 procedure [13] 1740 10, 1796718122181313 1822191848 19, 184911 18571418761619109 191348191724
procedures [12] 173013 1751817972180216 18061918074181020 , 18112118131618463 18503187013
procead \{2] 182214183521 proceeding [3] 17752
178925179013
Proceedings [1] 19227
proceedings [1] 179812 process (13) 1726217289
1794118019180918 184817186212186312 18649191320191422 191622
processing [1] 173810
processor [2] 179225 18597
produce [7] 1825237
18261184051862113
produced [1] 186510 produces [1] 18188 producing [2] 1821 15, 18649
Professional [1] 19266 professional [10] 179220 18161218176181920, 18501218552022 18582418692318702 professions [1] 184516 professor [2] 179334
profictency (2) 180814
18097
prognosis [1] 19044
Program [1] 187712
program [28] 172625
1753 11, 1797 8, 9, 13,
179971118792 3,
1884241885236
18901718949,1904247
1907 9, 19125172122
1913 1, 2, 1917 7, 192015
programs [1] 191618
progressive [3] 182417
1825 2, 18265
projection [1] 178511
projector [1] 17335
prolonged [2] 182912
183425
pronounced [1] 18308
proper [6] 178112181724
1835 20, 1845 17, 18
property [4] 175417
17811218102018116
proposed [1] 19206
protect [2] 178717178825
protective [1] 18255
protocols [1] 173013
Prouty [7] 180710184489
231851118701722
provide [2] 1781 10, 19117
provided [5] 173615
17812518216,1920719
provides [1] 191118
provision (2) 18911822
Psychiatric [1] 179425
Psychiatry [1] 182710
psychiatry [2] 17942425
psychotherapy [2] 188319 18973
Public [3] 190011926721
publicity [2] 178057
publish [2] 1749418288
pulled [2] 18583190525
purely [1] 174121
purported [3] 1766315
17724
purpose [3] 173018
180420184216
purposes [8] 172914
17302117323173315
1747 23, 18153182818
190518
pursuant [1] 17823
puts [1] 18495
putting [3] 18393185924
188721
PX3812 [3] 18261820
19258
PX3813 [3] 18261920
19258

## - Q -

qualification [1] 18045
qualified [2] 1803 23, 184516
quality [1] 18099
quarrel [1] 18058
quart [3] 1729 19, 20, 25
Question [2] 1775 21, 24
questionnaires [1] 19217
questions [26] 175116

1779817841178917
1791518019180310
1804121620180622
181520182312183514
1839182218454185021
189722190810151621
222324
Quickly [1] 189911
Quit [1] 183117
quotations [1] 18826
quote [2] 1806 8, 189218

## - R -

Raise [1] 187122
raise [1] 172221
raised [3] 1791618599 9, 189722
raising [1] 187815
ramifications [1] 17989
ran [1] 174925
range [3] 1821 15, 1838 3,
186419
Rapid [1] 179324
rate [18] 18181325
18192518207 19, 182117
2018332218341018402
13192218411818428
16184518
rates [2] 18211518222
re (3) 1722618652118743
Re-ask [1] 189216
re-ask [2] 18921417
reach [4] 181012181718
1820118996
react [1] 18242
reaction [4] 182912
1834 25, 1862 18, 186912
read [30] 1734625173512
1416173612141720
174714174916175025
1756 18, 176011176416
177517177812178218
17871719183620
18641722188120
188817181892 25, 18931
readily [1] 174822
Reading [1] 177819
reading [11] 1749 17,
175618176415182825
184321855 19, 18641
18692018983192025
readings [1] 183421
reads [4] 173410173615
174622187714
real [1] 180023
realize (1] 18666
realm (1) 187111
reason [17] 1746117709
1717831214 16, 17898
179519181021,18711
189015189211 13, 18
189371902119078
reasonable [3] 184211
18437184516
reasons [5] 1777 14177923
1798 13, 19, 187011
reassigned [2] 18805
189014
reassignment [1] 19179
recall [27] $180018 \quad 18235$

184623185421018555 18581018652518701
1875132118762318773
187815188617188923
18931525189471317 23190192019041 19161619209
recalied [1] 178615
receipt [5] $173921 \quad 17504$
17511717615178622 receive [11] 175321 175420178418179720 1812518421818991821 191517191611
recelver [1] 172816
receivers [1] 172814
Receiving [1] 18095
receiving [5] 17371417514 1755 4, 17612119028 recent [3] 179425180924 18458
recently [2] 179613184510 Recess [2] 180614186013 recess [7] 180315180613 18608910192235 recessed [1] 19227
recognizable [1] 183021
recognized [1] 184510 recollect [11] 17549 175714175815176934 61717831617867 1787319063 recollection [24] 174825 175322251754317677 917695177222177423 17771517851917904 18471118511618522 18551018562218574 185821866318787 18812218823192013 recommend [1] 19054 recommendation [9] 1885101318891724 1897231905911191617 recommended [7] 17834 18858188913189113 1893201904817 recommends [1] 190522 Record [1] 183720 record [20] 17222517311 17499177715179120 18036181807918398 185519,185851018663 18712518791618956 1898619097191016 191424
records [36] 1730161719 20241731221732213 $174913175716 \quad 2217609$ 10161764141617653 $\begin{array}{llllll}177014 & 15 & 1774 & 22 & 17777\end{array}$ 1778201780192117822 178819,201848218514 71878192022187911 13,
191116
recovery [4] 179224
18891018911624
recreated [1] 192122
recreational (2] 18171213 red [45] 1739161717421

17451317474174924
17502517578175823
17595101112176417
1775121776202425
177711785717861416 $181211 \quad 152022185412$ 171856569141520 1857118584
251860451865618696 1718988
red-stoppered [11] 17396
181740317515717573 1760131764161768225 17837
REDIRECT [4] 178921
19081319231319247
Redirect [1] 190812
redirect [2] $178919 \quad 1871 \quad 17$
refer [10] 17338174323
17452177418178024
1799718854188619
190923191324
referable [1] 189411
reference [2] 174413
174923
references [1] 17874
referrable [1] 189313
referral [1] 17282
referred [5] 184125184623
18802119102225
referring [6] 181411
182611186315,187624
191213191718
reflect [1] 175010
reffected [1] 18786
reflex [1] 182422
reform [1] 179411
refrain [1] 191819
refresh [1] 176021
refreshed [1] 18553
refrigerate [4] 18701422 2418713
refrigerated (9) 18652021 18662461867718684 8187020
refrigeration [13] 185710 18652171866718678 $20 \quad 186810 \quad 12 \quad 25187012$ 15, 2118717
refrigerator [12] 17647
18534671112186625 $\begin{array}{lllll}18672 & 14 & 17 & 18 & 1868 \\ 18\end{array}$ regard [35] 1751 21, 183618 187321187611121721 18784187911188018 1882371419188311 188415188521188710 $\begin{array}{lllll}25 & 1888 & 23 & 18948 & 15\end{array}$ 18971190215191012 191123241912710 19162119181191918 19201419
regarding [6] 174922
175141842719001424 191119
Registered [1] 19266 regular [8] 1830 5, 183918 $187618 \quad 190091023$ regularty [1] 180419 regulated [2] 1796 12, 180923
regulation [2] 177416 180924
regulations [11] 179314
17961210161819
1797318128,184315
187012
regulatory [2] 18123
186110
rehabilitated [4] 191418
19183191914192015
rehabiitation [31] 188526
190920231910671118
19125172119131215
1719146191511191610
$\begin{array}{lllll}17 & 18 & 22 & 24 & 25 \\ 19176 & 10\end{array}$
19185101825191915 21
reimbursed [1] 178910
rerterate [1] 19163
reject [3] 18102118529
185519
rejected [3] 18118185218
185818
rejection [1] 187020
relapse [5] 187518191712
19191620
related [1] 191320
relates [2] $174910 \quad 186414$
relating [8] 173816,176618 1767191777617801921
1788717945
relation [1] 17252
relations [1] 191123
relationship [1] 18114
relative [10] 1793 13, 17988
17991018113183717
184314184422186220
187821
relatively [1] 18114
release [4] $178716 \quad 19116$
19122191310
relegated [1] 175524
relevant [1] 188718
reliability [4] 179320
179717181013182118
reltable [14] 17962517971
22, 251798718037
18102218118,18223
18321214183319,18342 18601
reliance [1] 184818
relied [2] $182211 \quad 18231$
relies [1] 18353
rely [1] 18835
relying [3] $1848 \quad 16 \quad 18508$ 191811
remain [1] 175015
remained [2] 18892218904
remains [1] 176121
remark [1] 17802
remarks (1] 17801
Remember [1] 17806
remember [31] 174524
175361755717175814 8121416212225 175924617711017787 1780151785251786215 $\begin{array}{llll}16 & 17872 & 1898 & 9 \\ 1900 & 17\end{array}$
1904182519148192024 remembering [1] 18323 remind [1] 19019
remove [3] $183824 \quad 183939$
removed [3] 175017
18241118776
render [1] 181920
repeatedly [1] 182518
rephrase [3] 1859 13, 18832 18978
report [37] 17341417439
174425176614177325
17741316179018
1796251811101814311
131815518233183114
1861111418682018692
187911886182018874
918961619011419101
22223
19111191423
reported [11] 174122
17441017919180220
1811 20, 2218131,18619
1873318951
Reporter [2] 192627
reporting [3] 181121,18128
181316
Reports [1] 190025
reports [7] 174416180722
1815318931218942224 189511
represent [7] 1729 9, 17534
1757141841718526
187210
representation [1] 182419
represented [1] 176724
represents [3] 1745 5,
18087, 181419
reputation [3] 18501618
185518
request [9] 17303,174314
177817178623,17871
1788151803 11, 189234
requested $\{9] 1730920$
17464177113177714
17812418763191015
192610
requesting [2] 175120
177023
require [2] 1799412
required (19] 1728 16,
$179615,179721,179810$
1417992180125,180815
1809918101118127 ,
18212118555186113
187012 16, 18792225.
18804
requirement [6] 186110
187617191416191516
1918 18, 24
requirements [3] 17267
1812 8, 19161
requires [4] 1774 16,
1825 21, 1862 2, 4
requistion [1] 17363
Research [1] 17328
research [1] 179223
restde [3] 1723219091011
residency [1] 19003
resolve [1] 19172
resolved (2] 18515,190218
resolves [1] 18957
resources [1] 19208
respect [13] 172614
$\qquad$

Bante Sytarme Applewions
173015173323178923
1790151791518044
184824185924186145
189323191010
respond [4] 178023 ,
1781161836812
Responding [1] 17953
response [6] 1787 4,
180415181223181921
18354
responses [1] 18253 responsibility [6] 179719
1880141894219171117 19
responsible [2] 17301223
rest [1] 173617
restriction [1] 191020
restrictive [1] 191522
result [12] 17422123
1793 18, 1795 12, 1798 14, 1800 3, 1810 25, 1816 9.
1817 4, 1820 8, 1823 5, 18597
resulted [1] 188721
results [18] 174122174218 17431717511017663
179179179571317983
17991818087181321
182225183319184912
18654191120
retention (1] 17312
retest [4] 173078178119 24
retesting [2] 17401174114
retured [3] 18997916
Retrograde [1] 181820
retrograde [16] 1795 13,
180542078151317
1816101817182418182
18192101820918318
18342218421016
return [14] 189018191114
151913181914671925 191511019161119172 returned [5] 1893819189 2019191192016
returning [2] 1913319177
returns [1] 17622
reverse [1] 18774
Review [1] 182710
reviewed (15] 177867
1807682218091121
18371618432418441
18502418531718704
18851318981
reviewing [4] 180918
1832111914919167
revolved [1] 190210
Richard [2] 1844822 rid [1] 18256
Aight [23] 176512176720
2217741117851018309 18462018478 14, 18504 1866221867101876710 188213188321,188439 188810190324190714 19143
right-hand [4] 1734 5, 11,
17877182721
rigorous [1] 172523
rip [1] 178419

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-19-94 VOLUME 13
Concordance by Look Ser(69)
ripped [4] 178416
rise [3] 17223180616
186015
risk [1] 185019
Road [1] 17233
Robert [1] 172517
Rocheby [2] 1788518
Rogue [1] 187311
role [3] 1846 1, 18804,
19203
room [3] $183710 \quad 186611$.
191118
Rosalkı [3] 18622218648
186913
roughly [1] 186519
round (1] 18431
routine [1] 19109
RPR [1] 192621
rubbing [1] 177312
Rule [1] 18065
rule [1] 191613
ruled [1] 180617
rumors [2] 18942218966 run [3] 1754419211524 running [1] 185014
rut [1] 18063
$-\quad-\quad-$

S-m-l-t-h [1] 179122
Sacramento (7) 172422
1731161732311184618 2518684
safe [1] 173214
safeguard [1] 181310
safely [1] 18776
Safety [5] 1744617666
17671317692317701
safety [7] 18394184212
1877141880581011
salıne [1] 187018
Saft [5] 1724817402
17411416175016
sample [34] $172824 \quad 17315$
6174116174311175123
17523417581817591
176019176121766415
1772481773417828
17901618222417912
181315181452218156
183313 15, 1854418593
18601
sampling [1] 179718
San (9) 1791231792811
14152217931423
SANDERS [38] 172214
17552317991923
18031019211805817
191822921182621
$\begin{array}{llllll}18271 & 2 & 5 & 1831 & 13 & 15 \\ 17\end{array}$
1918351822 25, 183616
1718371821184316 ,
1860162125,18613
186389187115,190817
19232023
Sanders [4] 1799 24,
18051618273192121
sat [1] 18535
saturated [1] 18422
save [1] 177925
saying [23] 1758181216

25-1785 $25 \quad 179725$
1819171835121918362
18422218482225
18492218521518549
188923190513191213
1419
scan [1] 17361
scatter [1] 182125
scenanos [2] 181919
183211
schedule [1] 184024
schematic [1] 182419
school [4] 17928917935
187323
schools [1] 17244
science [6] 17925183915
1845 14, 222418461
scientific [11] 1794 18,
18065184051718423
141821,18461214
18599
scientıat [7] 180122,23 ,
1802 1, 4, 18, 1807 9, 18477
scientists [6] 179657
180110180771849512
Scotland [1] 17243
Scott [6] 1746212417471
$176824185320 \quad 18669$
screen [7] 17332017497
17781218194518205
190112
screaning [1] 187613
sea [7] 187613188113
189014182318987
190411
seafarers [3] 1876 22,
18772318784
seal [20] 174751016
1748241749225175912
17841314161920
178611016181161416 18125
sealed [19] 17308173710
1750151751141771 12,
1772917765178220
178525185114185620
1857151862171869610 1718706
sealing [2] 187156
seals [4] 181023,1848711 14
seaman [2] 18792190022
seated [2] 172224179119
second [21] 17272017304
717361917371917444
174716175818175917
$\begin{array}{llllll}17618 & 11 & 176710 & 17703\end{array}$
1784218046184718
1851111865171896811 192114
secondary [4] 18608
18982119071719085
secrete [1] 186125
section [7] 1739417508
1845111900191901211
190210
secure [1] 173214
security [2] 18331185313
seeking (2) $183518 \quad 190619$
salect [3] 17979181817
181920
selected [1] 181621
self \{3] $188725 \quad 18885$
190617
self-explanatory [1] 182913
seminars [1] 18848
send [9] 1770 17, 17713
185712151858319013
191021913911
sending [2] 1754117831
sends [2] 19031519113
sensation [1] 18254
sense [3] 179724182119
191721
sensitive [5] 1842 12, 18806
81011
sentences [4] 1863 23, 25
18641622
separate [3] 17448179910
18603
separated [1] 18136
separates [1] 181222
separation [1] 18655
September [1] 17876
SERDAHELY [1] 19218
series [3] 17263173220 17915
sertous [4] 174120180412
1896612
serum [12] 1812151623
2418136916186046
187018
serve [1] 172622
served [8] $172624 \quad 1730 \quad 17$
1793101794810 13,
1795919003
Service [1] 19001
service [2] 17286191015
services [1] 190916
sessions [1] 183917
sets [2] 173618173723
setting [2] 1842619201
seven [3] 174821183417
Severe [1] 183018
severe [3] 183012189518 18963
Shaw [1] 190711
sheot [5] 1761217639
18802318821019104
ship [13] 1770 24, 18332
18382418683,187757
187810188756189317
2021189618
shipment [3] 174114
1746317764
shupped [2] 1771718683 Shipping [22] 18722021
18792118801718819
188620188916189118
221894152119001318
1903161904 22, 23,
19052119062101321
19074
shipping [7] 172815
174424185321188625
18942190115190220
ships (1] 190023
shore [1] 189214
shorestde [5] 1892111922
18938190512
short-ierm [2] 17647
176510

Basce Systorns Applications
shorthand [1] 192610 shot [1] 177314
show [17] 173219173522
17438174517174612
17602217671178010
1783231787518085
181441819418201
186223186420191910 showing [4] 174514 17461817479181410 shows [1] 19152
sick [1] 18795
sides [2] 17501192115
sign [2] 19115191310 signature [13] 1734917355 12151755191756357 102117671118495 191424
sıgnatures [2] 173425 17352
signed [6] 17558177818 18331218534190312 significance [3] 18093 18102418178
significant [3] 187621
18772418783
signs [7] 17281218284
1829318372190315
19171219195
Sir [4] 17494176515
1778918729
st [2] 18936189721
sits [1] 172913
sttting [2] 175425180115
situation [13] 173113
1751192018152122
187421187525189324
189681219101419171 19181
stuations [3] 1824318554 191525
sIX [4] 172611173723 17381181714
size [5] 1758817831112 18542418556
sizes [2] 18542118553
sketch (2) 172324182618
skilled [1] 181312
skills [2] 18056182910
skin [1] 177313
slash [2] 17353174623
slashing [1] 17406
slides [1] 186318
slit [1] 174512
sludge [1] 172716
slurred [2] 183020
smaller [1] 17678
smelled [1] 189611
SMITH [6] 1791 25, 179922
182741923161922
Smith [19] 17911722
1792217991518061822 18141018276183515 1837221841718431112 1852911162018567 186814
smoker [2] 1840110
smokers [4] 18401222
18411325
Smoking [1] 18406
sneaking [1] 18768

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-19-94 VOLUME 13

18721
spill [2] 19181723
spinal (1] 182422
split [1] 172714
spoke [1] 175324
spontaneous [6] 186123
186211869711,1718705 spur [1] 190122
stack [1] 18631
staff [2] 17245173013
stage [1] 183025
stages [1] 18283
staggering [4] 18291819
18308183816
stamp [3) 17672218096 190117
stand [1] 180810 standard [12] 178418
17991181331815214
18221918332218353
18401318491118571415
standards [15] 172523
17262317982117993
18096 19, 18117181225
18131181710184912
18501218521213
standpoint [1] 191925
start [8] 1722817284
18051118266183213
18331018594189913
started [4] 17669179214
18003180419
starting [1] 18324
Starts (1] 186423
starts [1] 186421
STATE [1] 19261
State [3] 17281218079
state [20] 172225172618
192117272417467
179120179241718132
18182518308187125
18786188811191013
192012
stated [4] 180221185025 18691519097
statement [34] 17348
174071750202325
1758152117761012
17892 3, 1854218736 ,
18742218751611 19,
188019188324188425
221885 16, 18872189021
1891236,91018953
189816190515
States [3] 174315183415 19001
states [2] 18171518695
stating [1] 19113
status [1] 190211
statute [1] 179318
stay [5] 190317 20, 190512
1915 25, 19212
stayed [1] 19002
steady [1] 181824
step (3) 17911318531
19123
sterilize [1] 177314
Stering [1] 17233
stoward [3] 18951012
18969
stick [1] 18032
stickers [1] 182622
Stock (10) 17472175324
17547917861018075
18512118521720186715
Stocks [1] 17868
stomach [9] 1818151618
1819231821818321922 24
stop [1] 191624
stopped [2] 18892118903
stopper [17] 17391720
174211745121314
1748141750917578
17591113176417
178510178611181215
16185412
stoppered (20) 175057
1770241812182018134
185417185661516
185711718582518591
1865681215
stoppers [12] 173915
174124174924175013
10175778175810
18121112186512
storage [9] 17391174611
176215176467176510
12
stored [3] 17461117834
18642
story [1] 189523
straw-colored [1] 18137
strayed [1] 190022
stream [3] 1818619
181924
streat [1] 179123
strengthen [1] 19172
stricter [3] 1809 19, 181210
185212
strictly [3] 179612180021
182313
strike [9] 174012176412
17742018052181419
18532118594187721
19088
strikes [1] 180324
strings [3] 18631319
18644
strongly [1] 188924
stryofoam [1] 174719
stuck [2] 1748 12, 13
studied [5] 18062418073
186318188146
study [5] 17241517842
1785181792918647
studying [1] 17957
stuff (1] 178824
stumble [1] 18307
Stumbling (2) 182919
183816
stumbling (1) 18308
stylus [1] 18196
styrene [1] 174616
styrofoam [4] 18511222
18533185416
subheading [1] 186311
subject [5] 173410175621
181191900 18, 192020
submitted [1] 177723
subpoena [12] 17801423
178146162317823

1788102317892317908 10
subpoenaed [1] 178124
subscribed [1] 191319
subsequent [1] 173921
Subsequently (1] 177023
subsequently [1] 176621
subsidrary [1] 17253
substance [7] 17941114 231795124179916
substantial [4] 18211415
18248182511
substrtute [2] 186017 190625
subtle [1] 188416
success [1] 18892
successes [1] 188823
successful [1] 191610 successfully [1] 191317 successor [1] 17884 suffer [2] 191949 sugar [6] $18628 \quad 13,186410$ 1868151718
suggest [1] 184215
suggested [3] 17917
184425189319
suggesting (2) 18502021
suggestion (2) 179015
17911
suggests [1] 18069
sum [1] 183410
summer [1] 177917
supertanker \{1] 188014
supervisor [8] 179523
1900231911219139
1917 19, 24191824
supervisors [1] 191812
supplied [1] 178114
supply [1] 17822
support [4] 179811185719 188910
supported [1] 188923
supporting (1) 189015
suppose [3] 177013
1906 21, 19154
supposed [11] 177317
17812318121216
18131418492318501
18531218571719172122
surrounding [1] 17805
suspected [1] 179521
Sustained [1] 18927
swear [1] 175023
switch [1] 17344
Sworn [3] 172222179118 187123
swom [1] 185420
syllabus [1] 183922
symptoms [2] 183013
18372
synonymous [2] 18025
184720
system [4] 17312179324 1805619174
-T -
tact [1] 191814
takes (5) 176119183219 189779
talk [21] 17322017452223

17591717775178317
18121118441118473
1851111879221883817
18852018862188813
18912318963189721
1901 21, 190324
Talked [1] 184412
talked [19] 1738181774 12,
17904180215184437
1415172118476,18755 8121882 14, 18835 ,
189451019075
talking [21] 1747171756 3,
175910176217177621
17906,180121828 18, 21
1829 10, 1837 9, 184611.
1849121850131852 24,
1876 3, 189522189621 ,
18971125191712
tampered [4] 17554
1855 18, 2118598
tampering [7] 1728 12,
18111918124184718
1848218581720
tampers [1] 18121
tanker [2] 18801113
tape [19] 17391617
174513174814174924
17502817591011
1782202117865 14, 17
185659142118696
target [1] 18187
task [1] 184212
teach [1] 183913
teaches [1] 184313
teaching (1) 17932
taam (3) 172612179410 180510
tech [1] 175524
technician [3] 1813414 18543
technique [9] 1728 20,
$180825 \quad 18151113,1417$ 18171925181820
techniques [2] 1795 12, 180814
technologist [1] 17418 technology [1] 17417
telephone [4] 177958
18812518824
telling [6] 176713183311
1847121850911
tells [1] 190925
temperature (5] 18661523 18671023186811
temporary [1] 176214
ten (11) 17407,174920,
175316180022181036 10182117182418224 ton-milliliter [9] 17341
173968176013176415 161717682177511 tend (1] 18064
tended (1) 18833
term [5] 1738191765 13, 18111018199,18852 termination [2] 1888 1, 4 terms [8] 17771180825 181515182825191517 19161019188192010 tested (15] 1750181751 23,

1762 18, 20, 212417718 15177216 17, 17738 , 1795 19, 18098 8, 18129 testified [14] 1725117752 5,171793 12, 1801 16, 1805131827718432022 185415201859 1, 190720 testify [9] 172220177515 17881817897180112 180524180612180711 18478
testifying [4] 175841422 180520
testumony [41] 17394
1740 12, 1756 24, 1757 24,
17852317868180421
1805 4, 1806 7, 18362510
1837 15, 23, 1838 18,
1840 10, 1844 1, 17, 19, 21,
18461018471118481
1851 17, 18, 20, 22185317
1854 20, 24, 1855810 ,
18562218572218582
$\begin{array}{lllll}1867 & 13 & 1878 & 11 & 1889 \\ 25\end{array}$
19065191810
Testing [1] 175113
testings [1] 180916
tests [27] 17231417259
19, 172791728325
1729417311120,176316
1780 20, 21, 1781 11, 17957
17, 17989,18001317
181311, 182271016
1842718461112184825
Texas [2] 1872 3, 190911
textbook [3] 17942517951 179812
textbooks [1] 179424
Thank [26] 1722 15, 17234
1735 18, 174020174419
1752191755 16, 177520
1783 21, 1789 18, 179111
1324,17921918271
1861118711818726 ,
1874 19, 187918,188813
18982319018192023
192114
thank [2] 1752 12, 182615
Thanks [1] 178519
thanks [1] 178916
thawing [1] 174725
therapeutic [1] 17954
therapy [4] 18832218841
18974
thereafter [1] 189325
thereon [2] 18941518
They'd [1] 190423
they'll [1] 174723
They're [2] 1812 10, 18413 they're [10] 1728517883
1805231813 15, 18396
1849 23, 185614191721
thay've [4] 1748 13, 18503
1910419216
thin [4] $178610 \quad 1617$
thinking [4] 18241825
1916 21, 191918
third [3] 17308173622
189615
thousand [2] 17292324
thousands [3] 1727810

181312
threat [1] 18775
three [26] 172651739518
1740617492017502
175721760 13, 17611517
1764151768217742325
177511177814179322
1844 12, 1848 12, 1854 12,
171873914 15, 1912715
three-man [1] 172612
threo-page [1] 173311
throw [1] 189615
thumbnall [1] 172324
times [16] 1735 10, 176019
1761 2, 24, 1762 2, 181714
16182061118183418
18441218481218512
185613190024
trtle [2] 1737 7, 190916
tolerance [17] 1824 8, 18258 1112141720 22, 18262 183682223242518371 717
tomorrow [3] 192118
192236
topic [2] 177214189724
topics [1] 179419
totally [3] 17253184624
191819
touch [3] 19165 6, 191723
tough [1] 173516
towards [1] 187714
toxic [2] 17241918256
toxicologist [4] 1726 15,
18001918492118513
Toxıcology [9] 172479 ,
172617175016177025
177118180751823410
toxicology [12] 172312
17246131617173018
174021741 9, 179213
1793117991818092
toxins [1] 172716
trace [1] 177222
traces [1] 177324
tract (1] 18185
train [2] 1727118425
trained [3] 180514181611 18192
training [23] 17414179720
18151818211622
18391317 23, 18401516
181846518553187321
232418741914188818 189921
transcript (10] 17571
187456187781318901
1892241926912
transeription [1] 192610
transfer (4] $1738 \quad 25 \quad 1741 \quad 15$
1742 7, 176214
transferred [3] 173214
1746517646
Transit [1] 179324
transport [1] 181711
Transportation [8] 17446
1766 6, 1767 13, 1769 23,
17931112180925184313
transportation [2] 179314
181711
treated [1] 191325

Basc Systome Applextons
treating [1] 18836
treatment [20] 179223
17977910111317997
918791920188019
18832022188823
189111189711898520
19061519171
trial [5] 1757118511718 19
Triangle [1] 17328
trick [1] 188623
Troopers [2] 172812
True [1] 176721
true [16] 173919175021
17671825176879
1773917761012183618
187352218831418873
1919919269
truth [3] 185091011
truthfuiness [1] 18508
two-and-a-half [2] 181716
19002
two-day [1] 172611
type [3] 172520180916 190125
typed (2) 177814
types [2] 179421180017 typically [1] 191216
$\frac{-U-}{U S[4] 1744101781214}$ 17949
U S A [4] 17364187218 22187921
UC [3] 179215179314
Uh-huh [4] 175816177915
188323190616
ultumately [2] 173023
180417
unable [2] 188216192011 unauthorized [2] 18522122
undergo [2] 1726411
undergone [6] 191315
1914519175191891824
undergraduate [2] 172318 20
underneath [3] 17451214 191117
understand [44] 17541013 1618261718312118379 183818202325183946 16, 18409184222185112 21185211853292022 2518545811131519 18561719212318573 8211858718698 188623
1905271908419186 understanding [10] 176413
1813 23, 1822218398
184710185119185914
18621618685191715
understood [5] 177018
180111810718465 187614
undertake [1] 19135
unft [1] 187613
UNIDENTIFIED [1] 174518
unit (1] 17442
United [3] 174315183415

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-19-94 VOLUME 13
19001
University (11) 172322
17244817926717935
18992223242519004
unlikely [1] 187111
Uniocked [1] 18537
unlocked [2] 185347
unrelated [1] 184624
unreliable [1] 18598
unusual [4] 180424191514 2519163
update [1] 192120
updated [4] 183915
18781820188524
uppar [1] 173319
UPS [1] 17286
urine [6] 1725221727518
17539175618186125
USA [2] 19091315
USCG [1] 173516
usoful [1] 19184
usual [2] 179815180216
Utah [6] 17232217248
175017177141722
utilities [1] 179323
-_
vac [3] 186991017
vaccu [1] 186914
vacutainer [2] 1734218706
vacuum [3] 1869612
18705
vacuumed [1] 186217
Valdez [17] 17227172313
172511173115173422
17378174620175424
10211770318162
185332418651215
valid (4] 17511018043
18182018466
validate [2] 179818185612
validation [1] 185921
validity [3] 17519185910 18654
Valsum (1] 179421
Valley [1] 184425
Vallury (16) 18812318821
7242518832189456
1901211902224190312
22241905115
values [1] 18651
variability [1] 182114
varables [6] 18161118176
18181218212018222
variation [1] 191912
vanations [1] 18643
vanety [6] 1793817948,12
18, 18181418253
vary [1] 18129
vast [1] 182123
VD [1] 173315
vegetative [1] 182421
vehiclos [1] 181712
verfication (5] 185757 9, 1318583
verfied [4| 17964180223
18036182311
verifies [1] 18495
verifying [1] 182310
version [1] 177721
vessels [3] 18171213
187715
Veterans [1] 17939
vial [3] 1857911186811
vials [6] 18512325185620
185820186723186812
VIDEO [2] 19096192411
videotape [1] 19094
v1ow [6] 1747914182314
1620,18246
viewed [1] 182216
violated [7] 18111518
18531415185814
185922190619
violation [5] 18472125
1852518962224
Virginia [4] 1899222324
19001
vision [3] 18292518302
183810
vist [2] 185423191614
visted (2] 1846 19, 188615
visiting [1] 17934
vists [1] 191619
vital [1] 185725
VOIR [2] 179922192319
voir (3] 17991918048 18069
volume [8] 1743124
1744118152181617
1841518802318934
volumes [1] 18934
voluntarily [5] 17887
178911904 3, 1906 6, 15 voluntary [1] 190617
vomit [1] 18255
vomting [3] 1825 4, 182921
18387
vote [1] 190817
-W -
Waco [3] 19005910
wagon [1] 189511
Wart [1] 18933
wart [1] 175618
wating [1] 175920
walk [1] 182524
walkı-talkie [2] 189425
189617
walking [2] 1866912
wanted [11] 1780192021
178119180318183115
1861418963190222
19047191517
watch [1] 18925
water [1] 172716
wave [1] 188416
ways [4] $190921 \quad 1912$ 3, 15
191312
We'll [5] 17497180613
1860 9, 1883 8, 19015
wo'll [7] 1735 24, 17368
1738 13, 1743 9, 1749 7,
17626189225
Wo're [5] 1767 10, 1776 21,
180314180510184913
we're [14] 1732 20, 174522
1758171759 19, 176217
1809718212118229
183792218731418887

189621189710
We ve [4] 17251172823
184623188216
we've [10] 1730617394
174215174522179924
18057182818 21, 18729
188218
weok [6] 1801 18, 180212
183651837 15, 1844513
weaks [1] 177924
Weidman [3] 175915
18572
weight [5] 174312417441
18152181617
weren t [7] 176314
18481518576186521
18666186914
West [4] 187621187724
187815
west [1] 17825
whatsoever [2] 17709 ,
177822
whenever [3] 18713
18931819
whereas [1] 179621
white [12] 17461617474
1748151759912176518 2017822017865 10, 16 17
whoever [1] 18155
wide [4] 1793817941218 186418
wife [28] 173925174025
1757 16, 18, 21, 175917. 1760920,176320176413 201765237101222 1769 12, 15, 1770 14,
177122177211774621
177820232418563
wind [1] 191116
Windowsill [1] 186614 windowsill [1] 186611
wing [1] 180510
wise [1] 191614
wish [2] 1770117893
withdraw [1] 17802
withdrawal [2] 17561720
WITNESS [10] 172223
17232,1789 18, 179122
181081871 24, 1872 2, 5
1892 21, 189621
Witness [4] 172222179114 18187123
witness [11] 1732 21, 17458
175511178318179115 171805 2, 18081187121 190924
witnessed [4] 1756 8, 1720
17572
WITNESSES [1] 19234
witnesses [3] 1804 20,
18516
witnessing [1] 17576
woman [1] 190119
won't [1] 178123
word [5] 182313182610
18588186116191321
wording [2] 1887 14, 18882
words [6] 17241218323
18471618581918647
190217
work [41] 172414172812
17368,174025174510
17711922177213
1793 6, 7, 1797 3, 181121
1815 21, 1862 22, 18647
18938191114141524
25191329221914515
251915128,1018
1916219177
worked [4] 1741817958
187224187318
working [7] 172424175317
18099183318186212
18731218753
Workplace [2] 179319
17953
workplace [4] 1795 5, 19
17976,18004
works [2] 174513
workshops [1] 18848
Worlett [10] 1839111219
25184048121618423
worse [1] 189012
worth [1] 178913
wouldn't [4] 18359185019 185715189515
wrapped [3] $174815 \quad 18565$ 9
wrapping [1] 178520
wreck [1] 172313
write [3] 17776177825
18279
writing (3) 17361718276 190310
written [8] 178713179416 1795218772518792025 18821921
wrong [2] 185925190724 wrote [9] 177411177720 2317794178011178210 16, 18271418781
WV [1] 181416

| - X - |
| :---: |
| xerox [1] 173612 |
| - Y - |
| yank [1] 189316 |
| Yard [1] 17243 |
| Yeah (6] 18292183813 |
| 18641118771188816 |
| 18935 |
| year [6] 17241017781314 |
| 178720189916 |
| year-and-a-half [2] 17847 |
| 184810 |
| years [21] 1727617419 |
| 17958179712180020 |
| 180419231805718092 |
| 1845101879131718861 |
| 1892118971518991213 |
| 25190021901910 |
| yeast [3] 1863131918644 |
| yestorday [1] 177911 |
| York [1] 172621 |
| you'd [4] 186223188613 |
| 188817189513 |
| You'll [1] 185913 |
| you'll [3) 17434177925 |
| 183222 |


| $\begin{aligned} & \text { (1) } \\ & 0 \end{aligned}$ | IN TE WITID STATE DISTRICT ©RIT RRR TE DISTRICT GF ALASA |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | In res | ) Caxe th. A890s CNV (HAP) |
| ©) |  | ) Ardrage, Alada |
|  | The EOON VLCE | ) Fricky, Mey $\mathrm{DD} \mathrm{FP}_{4}$ |
| (6) |  | ) 8:00 am |
|  |  | TRAESITT CF FRT\#DINS |
| $\begin{aligned} & \theta \\ & (\mathbb{I D} \end{aligned}$ |  | IRIA BY LRY KTH DAY |
|  | HTOE TH |  INE K Page 14216 |
|  | APPEARANC | Realtime Trasconptan ES |
| (4) | For Plarinffs. | BER S MEN |
|  |  | Chen, Milstein, Hasteld \& Tdl |
| (b) |  | KOl Men Yark Averse NW, 5ie 60 |
|  |  |  |
| (6) |  | Ph $72 / 68 \mathbf{3 4 7 3}$ |
| (17) |  | GRINT OREIL |
|  |  | Fagre \& Brism |
| (B) |  | 20010 Norest Onter |
|  |  | Mrrespolis M WKCP |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { (B) } \\ & \text { an } \end{aligned}$ |  | Ph 612/36-3500 |
|  |  | H. LADIE MNTACE, R. |
|  |  | Begr \& Mriage |
| (1) |  | 162 Loast Streat |
|  |  | Philacturia, PA P10 |
| (8) |  | Ph 25/85-3m |
|  |  | RIOFPD F CBRY |
|  |  | Bixty, Comen Caty |
| (6) |  | 80K Street Srte 72 |
|  |  | Antorage, $A$ Prill |
| B) |  | Ph. $907 / 67-470$ |

## PROCEEDINGS

(Juryinat 800 am )
THECLERK All rise
(Call to Order of the Court)
THE COURT Good morning ladies and gentlemen This
is the continuation of trial in case A89 0095 civil In re
The Exxon Valdez When we left off I don $t$ remember whether
we were in the middle of something or not
MS WAGNER Yıs we were Your Honor We II contınue
(10) with the deposition videotape of Kenneth Gould

## _(H) CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION OF KENNETH G GOUL

(Video)
(i-) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(13) QOkay
(14) A To the best of my remembrance
(15) Q Do you recall that topic coming up in discussion with you
(16) with the medical department at any tume between 1985 and
prior
(17) to the oul spill?
(18) A No - are you talking about between me and upper level
(19) management?
(0) Q Yes
(1) A As opposed to me aud between Dr Stockman or HAI or a
(-2) discussion 1 might have had an academic discussion
(23) Q Let s break it down I was ashing first between you and
( \&) managemunt in icrms ot anv such discussion
(2s) A I don't recall a discussion with management with regard
to

| (1) | For Deferdert |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| (1) |  |  - |
| (3) |  | Ph. 90/ $/ 2640$ |
| (4) |  | MOFE OKLTS TOASM. RESO |
| O) |  | Ohelos 8 sran |
|  |  | 30E cadstax |
| (6) |  | Nes Yark, NY 10017 Ph 212/661-540 |
|  |  | JAES F SALPB |
| (1) |  | PAES $F$ NEAL |
| $\theta$ |  | dmorst umon Toue |
| () |  | 50 4th Avele Noth |
| (b) |  | Natmile, TN ST29 |
|  |  | He $615 / 24173$ PATRICK LMOH |
| ( |  | onelvery mers |
|  |  | 4005.1 Hpe sreet |
| (B) |  | Los Ageles oa 9 m th 21340401 |
|  | incert |  |
| (b) | Depay Clark. | TOF MRTIASA |
|  |  | US. District Cart |
| (4) |  | T2 W Th Ame th |
|  |  |  |
| ( ${ }^{(1)}$ | rapued br | KFRN H OHLPM RPR |
|  |  | Registored Putexicre repriter |
| (B) |  | Mongit Pn Cart Peprites |
| (4) |  |  |
|  |  | Fh ¢ $0 / / 30-700$ |

Vol 141931

## QYes

A I think it's exceedingly important I thank that's one of the things we learned in the middie '80s We learned a lesson
and we brought it
Q Did you testifv earlier today about a conversation with
Mr larosst after the orl spill ${ }^{2}$
A That's correct
Q What did the discussion concern?
A I can't remember the details of the discussion but I can
remember that Captan Hazelwood entered into the discussion

Q Do you recall whether or not you discussed with
Mr Iarossi after the time of the spill whether or not the
alcohol and drug policy in effect at the tume of the spill had mandated that an emplovee who had undergone rehabiltation for
(15) alcoholism be returned to the exact position that employee had held before rehabilitation?
A I don't think I ever had that conversation
Q Did Mr larosst if you recall as part of these
discussions ever express concern to you that Exxon Shipping
Company had believed that the medical department was in some
( 1) fashion conducting continuous monitoring of employees who had
(-.) been returned to employment after undergoing alcohol
(3) rehabilitation?
(4) A No
(25) $Q$ Do you recall having any discussion with anvone in

Vol 141932
management in either Exxon Company USA or Exxon Shipping Company concerning that last topic?
A In the medical department? I thank there probably were some discussions around that issue with others
Q Do you recall what their reaction may have been after you shared information about the fact that the medical department does not undertake to perform continuous monitoring of employees that are returned to their positions after alcohol rehabilitation?
A Well I thank that the general appreciation was that ther knew that we were not but they were just venfying with us that we were not and in fact that was a monagement responsibilisty
Q Have you looked at any documents to prepare for this contınued deposition today?
AYes Q What have you looked at? A I looked at the IDR relating to Captan Hazelwood's hospitalization in 1985
Q Would you like to look at the IDR?
A Yeah
(ר) Q Let me show you a marked copy rather than have you pull
(3) your copy I think that will work better - actually I was
(7) going to get to this later but since we are on the topic I
(25) thought it would make sense to mark this now

Vol 141933
Are there references that you mentioned earlier under the column entited diagnosis and that then is indicated 30040 and
30502 DSM Roman three closed paren?
A That's correct
Q And do you recall what those diagnoses refer to?
A In general terms the $\mathbf{3 0 0} \mathbf{4 0}$ is dysthymia and the $\mathbf{3 0 5} \mathbf{0 2}$
substance abuse alcohol intermittent
Q is there another diagnosis in DSM III that involves
alcohol?
ATtink that there are a number of atems in the DSM-III
that relate to substance abuse to alcohol use and that one
would need to understand specifically what that question
referred to
Q Would you equate the diagnosis of 30502 in DSM Ill to alcoholism?
A It's not what it savs
Q You would not usc the term alcoholism and whatever the diagnosis is -
A It says alcohol abuse
Q That does not to you equate to alcoholism' You can answer
A The term alcoholism is an indefinite one It refers to different things for different people at different times and
even in various legal jurnsdictions it has a different meaning
(2) Q Okay

## Vol 141934

A It's an inaccurate term from the standpoint of saying that
genencally one would entitle something, I think, to be
alcoholism when in fact one can be more specific which is what
(4) the DSM Ill tends to do
(s) $Q$ Would in your view someone who was subject to a
diagnosis
(6) of 30502 be suffering trom alcohohsm?
7) You cananswer

81 A I thank it's possible that some people might consider that
(9) to be true
(io) Q Would a diagnosis of 30502 in DSM III mean that someone
II was an alcoholic?
2) A I thunk that some people might consider that to be so
(i3) Q Incidentally Doctor have you seeñ this document 64416
(14) at any time before you looked at it when your lawyer showed it
s) 10 you?
6) AYes
(17) Q When did you first see it?
(18) A I cannot give you an exact date, but it was several years
(19) ago, probably un 1989 that Dr Montgomery showed me a
copy of
("o) our fiche record We have our medical records on fiche and
he
(21) showed me the fact that he had put has imitals in one corner
(2) of this document
(23) Q Okay But this was after the onl spill?
(24) A After the oil spill
(25) $Q$ And in the normal day to day practice of the head services

## Vol 141935

department for the tume you have been there is the custom for physicians in the department to be in contact with hospitals or facilities who are treating Exxon employees? AYes
Q What would be the circumstances under which this contact would be made?
A To clanfy a medical matter return to work
Q Would that type of conversation normally be noted in a medical file?
A It's not always noted, but sometumes it is noted
Q Would it be good medical procedure to note it in a medical file?
A Yes, I would thank so
Q By noted in the medical file I mean a notation or a record of a conversation along the lines we discussed
A I would put it in terms it's preferred to have interactions which relate to an individual in some way entered into a medical file, so additional files from tume to tume can understand what went on
Q In the conversation or the discussion that you had with Dr Montgomery when you first saw 64416 after the grounding did you ask Dr Montgomery or did he indicatu to you that he being Dr Montgomery had ever followed up with anvone not just Dr
Vallury to ascertain whether the recommendations set torth in
64416 had been followed?

## Vol $14 \quad 1936$

A No
(1) Q Would it have been appropriate procedure tor the Exxon
medical departmınt or halith servicus dipartmınt to tonduct
that type of follow up?
A You mean to make a phone call to the doctor who was the
Q To take some action to insure that in a situation where
aftercare such as that described in 64416 was recommended that that recommendation was followed?
A I thusk he acted appropriately
Q Okay But you didn tanswer my question which is whether it would be appropriate procedure in vour department to do that follow up
A I would thank so
Q Okay Your icslimony that Exxun was ruvicwing posathic modifications of its alcuhol policy with ruspect lo dilcraar bufore the oil spill?

## A Yes

Q And were you directly involved in those discussions or review?
A Not directly involved but I was advising some of those who
( 1) were directly involved and I was - I was working back and
$1-1$ forth with the information vall we var as cunsultants and (23) things like that
(24) Q What - what was being consid crud to bu changed in the (L) pohicy with respect to altercart?
(1) A Well the addition of a company sponsored aftercare portion
() of the program a very formal one I would consider for
(3) instance that Captan Hazelwood had an aftercare program of a
(d) type where he was given tume off from duty to go to AA and that
( 1 ) in fact was an aftercare program as it was conceptualized in (6) the '80s
(7) There may have been others that would have held different (8) opinion at that tume that that was not the most advanced
(9) program but then on the other hand, there were a lot of places
(10) where there would have been no consideration for that as well
(II) So -
(19) Q Did the discussions that you have referred to culminate in
(13) any change of policy prior to the oil spill?
(14) A No
(1S) Q I assume though it was appropriate that the IDR and the $(161$ information provided in the IDR was submilted to your
(17) department?
(18) A At that point what you're talkung about is an interface
(19) which is then created to summarize to codify and to provide
( -0 ) subsequent direction $I$ think that is in an appropnate
(-I) interface and I would tell you that in all honesty it is
(22) unusual for us to get that much data from somebody who's been
(23) in the psychatnc mstutution We generally don't get
(ᄀ) diagnoses, we generally get recommendatious without diagnosis
( s) $Q$ So it s rually that that s the casc that Captain

Vol 141938
(1) Hacelwood - about morc than intormation about the capiain $s$ () condition in 1985 ?
(3) A I'm talhing about psychatric consultants in general (4) Q Well in the specific case of Captasn Hazulwood based on (5) what you ve now seen is it your view that Exxon medical had an (6) unusual amount of information about Captain Haselwood in this
(7) context in his medical situation in 1985?
(8) A I think it was appropriate for our ability to understand (9) and to -
(10) Q I m not asking whether it was appropriate I m trying to
(II) tollow up on your previous question Ithinh you said it was
(1) not that usual or rather infrequent -
(13) A I accept - I put myself mito and I agree that at as more
(14) than we generally get
(19) MS STEWART Your Honor dLfindants have no cross for
(16) Dr Gould
"17 THE COURT That completes Dr Gould stestumony
(18) MS WAGNER Plaintiffs call Dr Wrendell Nealy by
(19) deposition
(.) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WRENDELL NEALY (Video)
$(?)$ BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(22) Q Good morning Dr Nealy
(3) A Good morning
( 4 Q Can you stall your name tor the rucord and homb rusidencu
(.5) lor the record pleast?

## Vol 141939

A Wrendell Nealy Semior Home address is 795 Leeward Dnve

Baton Rogue Loussana 70808
Q Why don i we first review your educational background starting with college please Please tell me the college you attended the years that you attended and your major
A The first B S degree in 19 - well I began school at
LSU Loussana State University in 1951 through about the
middle of' 54 and came back to LSU in '58 through '60 and got
a B S degree
Then proceeded to LSU Medical School in New Orleans got
M D degree in 1963 And you want to go further than that '
Q Can you please deseribe briefly your educational history since UCSF?
A In 1980 - 1980, I joined Exxon Company USA as a plant physician at Baton Rogue refinery One to two years later was
16) promoted to medical director of that refinery

Q Did you in your family practice or in your practice prior to 1980 did you have any experience treating an alcoholic? A Well yes I did I was the medical director for a treatment center in Salem Oregon, rehabulitation center I forget the name of the center but I held that position as a part tume job probably I would guess three years Other than
(3) that, treatung alcoholics in my practice

Q Did you at Dammash and then at the rehabilitation center in
(rs) Oregon come to any concjusions with respect to the rate of

## Vol 141940

recidivism of alcoholics?
A Only that it was high
Q At that time what was your position with Exxon?
A When I went to Houston in 1986 I was associate -
assistant medical director of Fxxon Company USA and I nanned
that tutle through untal I resigned so that was my primars
tutle I was also medical director for Fxxon Shipping Company
at that time and that was more a contact for Fxxon Shipping
medical issues
Q In 1986 when you went to Houston did you take over Dr Montgomery s duties and responsibilities?
A With regard to?
Q To the role of contact for refining and shipping
A Yes and then I - and initally I reported to hum At some point in time that reporting relation changed where I reported directly to Dr Gould I don't remember exactly when
(17) that was Certanly by the tume I was - by the tume I was (18) full tume contact for Exxon Shippug Company my recollection
(19) is that that reporting relationshup changed to Dr Gould
(20) Q Upon discharge of your patients at Dallas and at the Salem
(21) center and J m talking about your patients who were inpatients
(22) with respect to alcoholism did you recommend or recommend that
(23) they remain abstinent thereafter?
(24) A Certanly
(25) $Q$ Why did you make that recommendation" As a preliminary
(I) question and I sav abstinent as opposed to would a be
sufficient that they just drank in moderation thereafter as
opposed to remaining abstinent?
A No
Q Why should they not drink in moderation?
A Even - well we say in general that an alcoholic or substance abuser is not ever cured that they're always in recovery, those words taken broadly to mean that one can be
cured of all the medical symptomatology, all the affects and
effecturof alcoholism but never escapes the susceptrbility
unique susceptibility to the addictive substance agann
(12) Is that clear enough?
(13) Q Why don t we be mure specific and talk about a -
(14) alcoholism
(15) A Okay
(16) Q From your time al Exxon which I guess is from - for the
(17) decade almost 1980 to 19 -
(1B) A 90
(19) Q 1990 a little beyond there were I understand a number
(30) of alcohol policies promulgated by Exxon USA Is that correct?
(21) A I thunk so
(22) Q Okay
(23) A I know there were more than -
(24) Q There was more than one?
(23) A I guess it's more or less a gradual evolution of a policy

[^9](1) themselves that they are
(2) $Q$ Without the admission of the individual that he or she is
(3) an alcoholic can you define or identify somebody as being
(4) addicted based on certain behaviors of that individual?
(s) A Well, we say it's more charactenstuc of them You know
(6) these behaviors are more characternstic of but they may not be
an alcoholic The person may not be an alcohohe Drinking,
heavy drinking is one of these heavy constant drinking, but
(9) then there are alcoholics who don't drink heavily only :
(10) episodically They may go for long periods of tume no
(II) drinking, and then binge be a binge druaker They begin to
(12) get into all kand of difficulties through behavioral acting out
(13) problems while under the unfluence and so they have social
(14) problems and family problems and tend to lose important
(IS) supportive structure
(16) I'm not going in any directive way with this, I'm just -
(17) any one of the things that you attribute - you know laver
(18) disease or any of the other things that you - that may be
(19) charactenstic of an alcoholic may be present and the person
(.0) not being an alcoholic
(T) $Q$ You use the phrase they would luse important supportive

1-1 structure What does the supportive structure provide to the
(-3) aicoholic and why is it important' It sa compound question
( 4) but if you could answer why is it important that he relain that
structure?

## Vol 141944

(1) A Some of the things that promote or make it more likely that
() an alcoholic in recovery will relapse ure being aloue boredom
13, being with people who are old buddies who were alcoholacs or
girl friends who were alcoholics and having nothing to do but
s) drink or having no stress reliever other than drinking so they
(b) go back to that activity

1 And so the opposite of that is the support structure that
(8) you want which promotes - a strong support from a wife who is
9) not an enabler and friends who aren't and chinge of finends and
no, change of activities and so that they re not easalv sucked back
(1) into the - go - you know going to a lot of AA meetings
(1) where you have the support group of other alcohohcs
(13) AA is not - the mann purpose of AA is not to - how should
(14) I say, to get you to quit draking, it's mostly to keep you
(1s) from gong back to it to betp you and support vou in
(16) recovening
(17) Q What is the medical department s routine procedure with
(18) respect to an employee newly emerged from alcohol
rehabilitation?
A You said what is'
QYus
A You mean currently now'
Q Well prior to the grounding All of thesc yucstions now
will rulate to the grounding
A Okay

## Q I 11 limit my questions to Exxon Shipping

A And it's due to the remoteness not of the job but of where
the people live from me as the doctor, so people going moto a
rehabilitation facility I might not even know about it it
was - in fact there are probably more people going into rehabilitation facilitues that I medical, would never know about than the opposite case And on occasion I would refer
someone to a therapist who recommended and they accepted
treatment but when upon returning from rehabilitation they didn't have to come through Exxon medical so I would not
them Usually if they presented agan if management had
problem with their - the fact of whether or not they were fit
for duty, they had the option to have them come see me for
assessment and for me to be involved in calling a doctor for
treatment and seeing whether they had completed a course
not But it was totally up to management
Q So ut was management soption to determine whether a
ruabiltated alcoholic should see medicai upon return from ruhabiltation?
A It was medical's option of whether they needed the medical
(-1) department 5 assistance in determining fit for duty
(ra) Q Were you aware of the criteria management used to determine
(23) Whether to refer the rehabbed alcoholic to medical?

A No
Q Did you have any discussions with Exxon Shipping Company

## Vol 141946

management on the types of rehabbcd alcoholics you would like

। to see upon return Irom rehab?
A No
Q Did you have an understanding as to which rehabbed
alcoholics what categories of rehabbed alcoholics were
referred to medical subsequent to rehab?
A No
Q Who at Exxon Shipping and I m referring Irom let s say
1984 to 1989 made this deturmination that is to reler the rehabbed alcoholic to medical for re evaluation?
A I don't know I mean I don't know that they did
Q Have you ever seen a rehabbed alcoholic reterred to you by
Exxon Shipping - again in the lume period 84 to the
brounding in 897

## A I don't belıeve

Q You don t belteve you -
A That I have ever seen an alcoholic who had been
rehabbed
(18) returning I don't belseve that I had seen him on their return
from rehabilitation, that's the context in which I view this
Q Earlier you testified that you were responsible for
dutermining fitness for duty?
A When asked by management
Q When you got to headquarturs that was approximately 19857
(24) A Nu that was August of 86
(-5) $Q 86$ Did you in lact mahe a strong recommendation to gut

## Vol 141947

an aftercare or follow up program so that you d give emplovees more heip in remaining abstinent in 1986 or thereafter?
A Tomy boss Dr Gould on the wav to the cafetena I
remember saying one of mv goals is to get an aftercare program
s) started And he sand what do you mean by this And I sand some kind of program so that people returaing from rebab
, centers would be followed up, there would be some structured
(8) follow up and suggested that probably the EHAP counselor would
be the people to do that
Q What if anything did Dr Gould say to you or suggest to you?
A My recollection then was he sand that's not our job we're not - that's not the medical department's job That's about as strongly as it was presented and as far as it went
Q Did he indicate to you why it was not medical department s job?
A I don't recall Ithink the brunt of that the gist of what his opposition was that medical department can the checking into everybody to find out what kind of therapy they're in and if they're going to their AA meetings or if they're going to groups, and you know relatuvely the policeman function That's a bne management function more or
(i) less
(9) Q Did you disagree with Dr Gould?
is A Yes I disagree and did disagree that but I don $I$ recall

## Vol $14 \quad 1948$

that I dasagreed with him verbally or certanaly wrote no memo
to the effect It was my feeling that there was a need to put
together a program to more closely follow and give added motuvation and support to people in recovery
Q Why did you fee! there was that need?
A Well almost - dll the treatment centers that I had been connected with very closely - here an Baton Rogue for example - have an aftercare policy and some range from
months to two years tn which they have reguiar groups that meet
(10) and people at discharge are required to sign up for that program and that helps them maintain their sobnety However there is no - there's no way to check to see and there's nobody checking to see that people comply with those
(14) programs And to mv-in my view siace the cost of the (19) inpatient therapy covers the cost of the outpatient follow up
(16) they get no more money whether the follow-up is completed or
(17) not, and so nobody has much of a motivation to go back
(18) It's left up - it's provided the employee can do it or
(19) not and I thought we needed somethag a lattle more structured
(r) so that -
(1) Q By something more structured do you mean that attendance
(22) would be required or mandated by the employer?
(23) A Raght
(4) Q And that thare would be some surt of 11 you want to call it police function to-

A Right
Q - understand that an employee did or did not attend?
A Yeah bring a note from the AA meeting that he did attend for example if he wac recommended to have 90 days and 90 visits he had to produce some kind of documentation that
he
could It's not very practical but I was trying to work with
some way to achueve some sort of order and structure to
that
(8) Q Have you ever met Joseph Hazelwood?

A-Notio my knowledge
(10) Q Pnor to the grounding had you ever heard of Joseph
(II) Hazelwood?
(12) A No, I don't think so
(13) Q Subsequent to the grounding did you have converations
(14) with other doctors at Exxon USA s medical unit with respect to
(15) Joseph Hazelwood?
(16) A Yes
(17) $Q$ Who did you speak to?
(18) A Spoke with Dr Montgomery and probably - I can't thunk of
(19) any of the doctors specifically excluded Surely Dr

Douglas
(20) and Dr Montgomery, and probably Dr Gould but I can't - I
(2i) don't remember the - it would have been infrequent but it
(22) would have been possible that Dr Gould was in the
(23) conversations
(24) Q Did Dr Douglas have knowledge of Joseph Hazeiwood :
(29) rehabilitation prior to the grounding?

$\qquad$

## A Yes

Q Are there schools of thought that sav that part ot any rehabilitation can be - making that particular person a social drinker rather than a person who drinks to excess?
A l've never heard of any rehabiltation program s goals that
would make them a social drinker
Q Maybe I phrased that wrong In the other schools of thought that you spoke about is there a view that you can take an alcoholic and they can drink again and they can do it in a moderate way where they become social drinkers and not necessarily alcoholics?
A I don't know that there's not some people that hold that niew I've never heard it I would disagree with it You know, you don't ever - having been an alcoholic you don't ever go back - we can cure pretty much the pathology and a
lot
(16) of the social ills and the financial problem we get that all (17) stranght and we can even get to the point an my view in my
8) beluef that the person never wants a drink any mure but I
don't belleve that you ever overcome the susceptability to of you do have a drink to the high risk of getting the full blown addiction back agan
Q You re not suggesting that somuont who has butn through
alcohol rehab cannot ever become a social drinher?
A I am suggesung that I don't beheve that's reallv solt
(25) Q Are you suggesting that someone who sbeen through

## Vol 141952

alcoholic rehab cannot stop and have one or two driniks?
A Excuse me
(3) Q That s what i m talking about social drinkcrs
(4) A That's not entarely true what I sand When you hmat it
(s) to people that have been through rehab in my view there are
(6) people who have been through rehab who are not alcoholics I
(7) belseve that a person who is a full blown alcoholic caunot go
(8) back to being a social drinker
(9) Q I see So you ru making a distinction -
(10) A Between rehab and alcohohisu
(11) Q If you had known that Captain Hactwood had bucn in
11) rehabilitation and heard subsuquent tu his ruturn dsa captain
(13) that he had been drinhing what would vou have done'
(14) A Nothing
(1s) Q Why do you say that?
(16) A I would have no responsibility to do anythang 1 would (17) base that on sımilar kinds of things that I had heard about
(18) other people and I don't have any respousibilaty to do
(19) anything in that - in that area

1201 Q So did you mean by I you pursonally or did you man your (21) department or did you mean both?
(22) A I mean in general that's not my jub It's not covered in
(r3) my job description at all When asked to evaluate sumeone I
(24) do that and otherwise we have no call in people for - or
(23) responsibility stated to do anything

II Q OLay and whose job would that have been at the tume? () A Whose responsibility would it have been' My - I'm not (3) sure but I would assume that my assumption has always been $1 t$
(4) was his supervisor's job
(s) Q Do you recall any written procedure that defined the (6) responsibility for either monitoring or reacting or responding
(7) in the event that someone back from rehabilitation began
(8) drinking again in the mid 80s while you were at Exxon from
(9) 1985 on?
(10) A The short answer is no There was some policy that we had
(11) in Baton Rogue at the Exxon refinery that described a
(12) supervisor's responsibility if he perceived someone at work
who
(13) seemed to be behaviorally impaired Other than that very
(14) narrow instance I don't recall
(15) Q Did you ever discuss Captain Hazelwood with Dr

Montgomery?
(16) AYes
(17) Q And could you tell me the nature of those discussions?
(18) A Dr Montgomery mentioned to me that - that Joe

Hazelwood
11s) had been into a treatment faculity
("0) Q Was there more than one conversation?
(1) A I'm sure there was more than one Surely two or three (-) tumes the subject came up
(23) The only thang that I recall Dr Montgomery's discussion or
$\sim 4$ ) comments about was the fact that he didn't see un the medical
(25) chart a release a fit for duty release That was a concern

## Vol 141954

(1) and he was somewhat concerned about that because he -
he
(2) recalled that and by - nut specifically but by general
3) process the would have gotten or assured humelf that there was
(4) a release for return to duty before Captan Hazelwood had
s) returned to duty and that's the gist and sum and substance
of
(6) $1 t$

Q Is therc a form that Exxon medical used that you would -
would bu the cquipment what you just referred to was fit for
duty release or determination)
(10) A Well there are many forms probably much more than Exxon
(II) - $\times x$ xou USA or Exxun Chipping would use 「here are many forms
(1) and releases to duty come in many shapes and forms from
the
(13) treating physician usually on their own forms rather than
(14) Exxon's all of which are usually acceptable, something to
wit
(15) sayung, that they are released fit for duty or they're not
(16) released fit for duty and if they're released with or without
(17) restrictions That's what I recall
(18) Q Now this is something that would be an Exxon generated
(19) document or form?
(0) A No These would almost always come to the medical
(21) departuent from outside the medical department and from outside
(2-) the company
(-3) Q Is Exhibit 66142 such a form?
(24) A I thank it is
(-s) Q Did this document - strike that

Vol 141955
This document was in the medical file kept on Captain
Hazelwood correct?
A Yes
Q This document has been referred to as an IDR Does that
term mean anvthing to vou?
AYes
Q Whal does it stand for?
A Individual Disability Report
Q If Dr Montgomery had already consulted the medical file
prior to this conversation with you could you then conclude
that he did not believe that Exhibit 66142 was a fitness for
duty release form?
A Well I belseve his concern was not over whether this
document was a release fit for duty but whether he had - he
had given something to Exxon Shapping Company or reviewing this
(16) document had been written something himself saving fit for
(17) duty
(18) Q Would it have been normal procedure in the medical
(19) department for an Exxon doctor to have done that in other
(20) words to have written something himself with respect to
(1) fitness for duty in the time frame we re talking about?
(2) COLLOQUY The question is -
(3) $Q$ In the time frame we re talking about
(4) A It carnes all kind of answers to that It would have been
( ${ }^{\text {i }}$ very normal for an Exxon doctor Sometnmes people return

Vol 141956
i) for - from lack of fitness for duty back to duty with no
() consultation at all with the medical department or any Exxon
(3) physician although it - a document like thas coming into the (4) medical department would usually flow to the doctor that's the
s) contact for that function, Dr Montgomery in this case It
(6) would be certannly normal for him to either communicate with
(7) shapping verbally depending on the nature of the question from
(8) the shipping company or to make some mark on the form itself
(9) If he had any question about the physicaan's - the treating
(10) physician's fitness for duty release
(II) If he had any question of that, it would be totally normal
(12) for hum to clanfy that question and make some note of it
(13) $Q$ And in that context to the best of your recollection what
(14) was Dr Montgomery sconcern with respect to Captain

Hazelwood?
(1s) A That he hadn't made a clearer note in saying I have called
(16) the treating physician and I release this patient fit for duty
(17) Q Did he express any concern that - as to whether or not
(18) there had been a determination of release for fitness for duty'
(19) A I don't believe that was his concern It was just the -
(20) the documentation of that
(21) MS WAGNER Nothing further Your Honor
(22) MS STEWART Your Honor defendants would like to
(23) present their examination by videotape
(24) CROSS EXAMINATION OF WRENDELL NEALY (Video)
(25) BY VIDEO EXAMINER

> Q Are you currentiv employed Dr Nealy?

A Yes
Q By whom are vou emploved?
A Ethyl Corporation
Q Could you spell that please?
AFthvi
Q When were you first employed by Ethyl Corporation?
A May 1 ' 91
Q What is your current tatie with Ethyl Corporation?
A I'm a corporate medical director
Q-tsthat the title that you ve held since May 1 1991?
AYes
Q Pre grounding were you employed in drug testing of Exxon
Shipping Company employees - I will be more explicit drug or
alcohol testing?
A Yes
Q Did vou have an ongoing concern about the mental and emotional fitness of the seagoing personnel?
A The way I take that question to mean dad I have some
( 0) knowledge that made me concerned about other than a general
(-1) concern that I would have for anyone's fitness emotional or (22) physical to do whatever job, but no, no more concerned about
(-3) the fleet or seagoing personnel than shore duty personned or
(7) refinery workers or anything else and nothing else that overall
( s) Fitness for duty unless asked specifically by management to

## Vol 141958

evaluate one individual employee on an undividual
case-by-case
(2) basis

Q Well you would agree that the seagoing personnel in
contrast to shore personnel were out of their let asy
day to day work home environment for substantial periods of (6) time Was this a concern of yours?
(7) A Well as at relates to - we tended to have - some people
shall - let's say that some employee who could work in a
refinery situation where we would have accessed medical care
"10) rapid access could do that job and could not do the job on a
(II) seagoing vessel where he may be at sea even though his
tour of
(1) duty may be to $\mathbf{2 0}$ to $\mathbf{4 5}$ days he was rarely away from port over
(13) two days, two and a half days Most trips were, you know from
(14) San Francisco to Valdez is about five hours, and so you're away
(is) from shore adequate medical care is not - you know usually
(16) over about two hours if the need is there
(17) Q You previously mentioned -
(18) A I think of the case of diabetics taken as a
(19) representative
(20) Go ahead
(21) $Q$ I was referting more to emotional and mental fitness of (22) seagoing personnel?
(23) A Never had any concern that it was leas or that it was there
(24) was any restriction - I don't recall any restriting anybody
(2S) from mental reasons for not sailing because of remoteness

## Vol 141959

(1) Q You did mention previously 1 thought you were going to
(-) say - and correct me if I m misinterpreting your testimony
3) that there was a concern tor substance abuse individuals and
(4) the remoteness issue?
(s) A I'd like to address that by saying in both mental and
(6) physician actual, physical mental and emotional stabihty
(7) requrements I never had any concern that there was any greater
(8) concern among seagoing fleet than refinen worker population
(9) for example
(10) Q What about for those individuals who had been an alcohol
(II) rehab program?
(12) A No, I didn't have any more than I would have had in a (3) refinery population, eather

Q Is remoteness an issuc?
A No
Q More central to a seagoing personnel rather than a refinery 7) personnel?
(18) A But remoteness is not central to alcoholism which a 9) rehabulated alcoholic who is in recovery I don't belseve Q Isn $t$ it environmental?
(-1) A Environmental is what I was going to respond to
(2) Environmental alwavs has a lot of other meaning to me so!
(73) need to be specific what you mean by environmental
(24) Q You earlier lestified that through boredom or perhaps even
i'si lack of stress an individual could turn bath towards drinking

[^10]( 5) one man to try to come see me you know once a month would be

Vol 141961
11) approprate to come check in more often if vou have problems
) Q Did vou conduct a full medical examination of these individuals?
(4) ANo
is) $Q$ When you say weicome them bach what did welcoming these
employees back entail -
A Encouragement and support thit they had gone through the
rehabilitation process and had achseved sobriety and were
the path and encourage them that they had every capability to
(10) overcome thas and continue to be sober and encourage them to do
that, and offering them any support that I could in that regard
Q You indicated that approximately five refinery rehabbed employees were referred to you
A No I said the total amount that I saw w's five Some of
those were not referred to me by management Two of them
least were people who I had referred anto rehab and they came
back to see meafter thev got out of rehab
It wasn't the best of mandgement
Q The ones that were referred to you at management did you have an understanding as to why management referred these post
(ר) rehab employees to you?
3) A This is agazn - you skip back to the pre
(4) Q Yes that s right
( s) A Okay At the refinery Ithink more of an administrative

$$
\text { Vol } 141962
$$

go by and you know would you see them and more of a
perfunctory thing on management's part saying go back through
, medical and make sure Dr Nealy thinks you re okay
Q Were you asked to perform a titness for duty on these individuals?
A Not specifically no Some of it was to document that I
agreed with their return to duty and that didn't require an examination It might have just required talking to them what
(9) they had done I recall a particular andividual who had been
in rebabilitation and when I asked him how manv - how long
(11) they had been in the rehab facinty, it was five days, and I
(12) asked why he was out in five days and be sasd the counselor
(13) sand he didn't need any more sntensive therapy than that and he
(I4) was okay to be released and I sand oh wat a manute let's (1) check that out who was the counselor
(16) I called hum and he sand well that's a totally different
in story than really transpired We told him we absolutely
(18) recommended that he not leave the facility, that he wasn't at
(19) all ready to go back to work and but that if he - it was his
( 0 ) choice and if he did leave the facility we would support him
(?) best as an outpatient
(2) I sand no you're not going back to work until you go back
(23) and satusfy the counselor that you you know jump through all
(24) the hoops and done all the requirements of the program And 30
(2s) days later he came back and expressed how - what a great

Vol $14 \quad 1963$
(1) impact that made on him that he was glad I done that
(6) Q You have that in front of you?
(3) AYes
(4) Q Specifically I m referring to the third full paragraph
(9) where it says employees - you see this?
(6) A Yes
17) Q That retterates the police in fact the confidentiality
(8) aspect of the policy?

AYes
(10) Q HAI is the human affairs Whre thev part of that sir?
(11) A-Nor
(12) Q Who were they?
(13) A They are the company contracted by Exxon to admunster and
(14) be the employee health advisory program Our employee
(1s) assistance program was run by them and thear counselors
(16) $Q$ What could an employee expect once he identified himself to
(17) you as having a problem?
(18) A He could if he - if he accepted the be supported in a
(19) rehabilitation program to not lose senuonty and not lose his
( 01 job and he returned to the job without a future career
( I) development being threatened by having gone in for
( ) rehabilitation
(3) Q And did that -
(.4) A And/or treatment
( 51 Q Could that employee also expect that whatever medical

would
(1) be kepl confidential?
(3) A Yes
(4) $Q$ Now is it true then that even the mere fact that someone
(s) was undergoing rehab would be kept confidential itself"
(6) A Yes As far as the medical department is concerned
(7) QYes
(8) A We had - our knowledge would not be divuiged He may
(9) his supervisor may know that from other places but not from
(10) us, and usually I mean obviously the goals in the treatment,

III in the $\mathbf{1 2}$ steps are to admit vou have a problem and to admit tt
in to anybody and that you need help including gods, et
cetera
(13) and to be not so confidential but that had to come from the
(14) employee but from the medical
(15) MS STEWART Your Honor due to the maracles of
(16) modern technology we ve managed to skip part of the diak If
(17) you ll bear with us for juat a moment we ll go back to the part
(18) of the disk that we skipped in this cross examination and take
(19) Just a moment to fast forward to the spot
(20) MR SANDERS And we didn iskip that much Your
(1) Honor
(22) MS STEWART Just moment orwo
(24) Just a page
('s) MR O NEILL Just read it Do you want me to be the

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT

Vol 14
196

(23) ever know that they went into a rehab facility So if that's

## Vol 141966

(1) what's covered under self identification aud if that $s$ what ( ) you're talking about -
(3) $Q$ Well in the conicxi of will idunifiting that I spuhe of
(4) nobody would know it - uxcusc $m_{\llcorner }$. That syour answir)
(5) A You're right In that context of self identifying that I
spoke of nobody would know it so there wouldn't be anything,
7) but even if prior to the grounding even if they had identufied to the company and sand I need help and/or the company referred
(9) them to EHAP and on snto a rehabilitation facility or if the
(10) company or supervisor or self or wife referred that person
(II) because they had quote self identafied referred them to
the
(12) medical department and the medical department referred them to
(13) a rehab facility in any of those instances would auybody
(14) receave any punishment for that uct aloue
(IS) MS STEWART Thanh you *
(16) MR SANDERS Thanks Your Honor
(17) MS WAGNER Is that the end?
(18) MS STEWART That concludes our crosa
(19) (The reader stepped down)
(20) THE COURT Thank you Next wincss
(-1) MR COHEN Next witness Your Hunor will be the
(22) deposition upon oral examination of Michat Emul
(23) THE COURT Last nami again was -
( 41 MR COHEN Emel Emıl
(s) THE CLERK Would you rasc your rizhi hand pleaw

5-20-94
VOLUME 14
גMAXII
Vol $14 \quad 1967$
(The Reader Is Sworn)
THE WITNESS I do
THE CLERK Please take the stand Would you state
your full name address and spell your last name please
THE READER Michael Woerner 1629 204th Avenue
Northeast Redmond Woerner
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL EMEL (read)
BY MR COHEN
Q Would vou state and spell your name tor the record?
A My name is Michael M Emel E me-l
$Q$ And where is your home?
A 3626211 th Place Northeast Redmond Washugton 98053
(13) Q Now what $s$ the first vessel you ever worked at?

A First vessel was the Gaiveston
Q So you never worked for any other vessels for any other companies other than Exxon?
A Before I got hured with Exxon I was a chief engineer on a private yacht
$Q \ln 1982$ then was the first tume you went to work for
Exxon is that right on the Galveston?
A Right That would be on the discharge sinp, would be the specific date
, Q Now did you ever sce anyone drinhing on an Exxon vessel ever'
AYes

## Vol 141968

i) Q And whan is the last timb you cversaw someonc drinking on I an Exxon vassel?
i) A A couple of veary ago
() Q And which vessil was that'

A Exxon San Francisco
Q And who did you see drinking on that vissel?
A Pumpman
$Q$ The pump man?
A Yes
Q You remember his name?
ANo
Q Was he ever discharged?
A For drinking '
QYes
$A$ No
Q And when did you sti him drinhing,
A In his room
Q Was there anyons cisc in his room with this pump man at the lime?
$\mathbf{A M e}$
, Q Were you drinking?
AYes
) Q Now were there ever any occasions on any Exxon vessels a) where in the evenings when all the work was all done you guys would gat on the fantal or something and you guys would have
$\qquad$

Vol 141971
couple of beers?
A No
Q Generally people if they did drink thev just drank in thetr rooms?
A. I can't state one way or the other I don't know who you're talling about there but not as a general thing
Q You re just not aware of that?
A I'm not aware of it
Q How ofien did you drink on vesseis?
A Occasionally
Q Occasionally on every vessel vou ve worked on?
A No, not every vessel
Q Most of them?
A Maybe half of them
Q Did a lot of other people do that?
A Not that I was aware of
Q Did you usuatly drink alone?
A Yes
Q Now other than this pump man on the San Francisco you don trecall ever having a drinh with anv nthurindividual on an Exxon vessel?
A No
, Q Now the last time we spoke here bulore the break we were a) talking about drinking on board and vou said that you have on occasions had a drink Now did that ever happen when you were

## Vol 141970

in Valdez?
AYes
Q On the vessels in Valdez?
A Yes
Q Did you ever bring any aicohol on board the vessel from the
Port of Valdez?
A Never
Q You know of anyone whocver has?

## ANo

(10) Q So when you brought something aboard it was in San
(II) Francisco say?
(1) A Yes
(13) Q Now I think we established previousiv that you started
(1a) sailing with Captain Hazeiwood on the Valdez let sust call
(is) it January of 1989 Do you recall an incident following that
(16) tume that you went to see Captain Hapulwood about a pay
(17) voucher?
(18) AYes
(19) Q And where did you see him?
(20) A In hes office
(21) Q Was there anyone else anybody else there?
(22) A No
(23) Q What was the question about the pay voucher?
(24) A I was asking to get a draw on a check to probably go to
(25) shore or something, an advancement

## Vol $14 \quad 1972$

(1) Mr Sherman You can answer the question?
(2) A He walked a little differeat not a lot of bounce in hus (3) steps so to speak
(4) Q Was your conclusion based in part on his speech?
(s) A No Just on the way he moved
(6) Q Now without wanting to put words in your mouth would it
(7) be fair to say that at the time you concluded that he just
(8) looked like he d been drinking?
(9) A Yes
(10) Q Has your conclusion changed since then?
(II) A No
(1) Q So you still think as we sit here today back then he
(1) looked like he d been drinking?
(14) A Yeah
(1s) Q Now what is the Westar Terminal?
(16) A That's a terminal down in San Francisco where the motor (17) launch comes out and fernes you from the shp to the shore
(18) Q Is the launch operated by Westar?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q it s not an Exxon operation then as far as you know?
(21) A As far as I know no
(22) Q Now when entering the Westar Terminal at any time prior to
(23) getting in the launch is there any security are there any
(24) security measures in effect in terms of searches or looking for
(25) contraband?
() A No

Q To your knowledge were there any such security measurcs
during the time that you sailed on the Valdez starting in
January of 19899
A No
Q Were there any seturity checks or searches in place at the
Valdez terminal that people had to pass through on returning to
the vessel?
AYes
Q Do you know why there was such a system in Valdez but not in San Francisco? ?
ANo
Q You know whether or not there is such a security system in
place in San Francisco now?

## A I have no idea

Q In regard to the Valdez run on which you served on those occasions in which you brought alcohol on board where did you
(18) bring it on board?
(19) A It would be San Francisco
(20) Q In all occasions?
(21) A Yes if I was in that port
(22) Q Sure You don ( recall bringing any alcohol anywhere else (23) in any other pon in other words?
( 4) A If the ship went to sdy maybe Long Beach or something
(25) like that or possibly there

## Vol 141974

(1) Q Would it be accurate to say that between the timb you signed on the Valdez in January of 1989 and the time of the grounding that you consumed roughly a gallon of alcohol?

## AYes

Q Would you at any time share any of that alcohol with
anybody?
A No
Q And in the same tume frame on how many suparatc oclastons did you bring alcohol on board the vassel'
A Maybe twice
Q Half a gallon at a tume?
A Yes
Q Now just a souple moru questions Mr Embl Thu alcohol that you drank on board the Exxon Valdu, was that vodha)
A Yes
Q Anything but vodha?
A No
MR COHEN Your witness
CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL EMEL (ruad) BY MR SANDERS
, Q Do you ever recall anylumi anvone cvir bclling fircd tor drinking that worhcd for Exxon'
AYes
Q Who?
(25) A I can trecollect any names but I know that there were

Vol 141975
(1) people that were fired
(1) Q Any vessels that you whre on?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q Can you think of the vessel?
(s) A Exxon Pnnceton
(6) Q Roughly when was that?
(7) A I would have to look at my discharge slips to see when I
(8) was on the vessel, but there was an individual on that shup
()) that was fired taken off in cuffs for drinking and manjuana
(10) Q Do you remember where this happened?
(w) A He was taken off in New York I beheve He was an oller
(12) $Q$ You say he was caught with marıjuana and with alcohol?

AYes
(1) Who took him off in cuffs?
(1s) A The authonties the Coast Guard, I believe Exxon - I
(16) don't know who I wasn't -
(17) Q Do you recall any other situation where someone was fired
(18) for drinking?
(19) A 1 heard of occasions of people being fired for drinking
(20) Q What did you hear of?
(-1) A I heard that a man got fired because of drniking
(2) Q Just once or more than once?
(23) A A couple of tumes different people maybe in the same
( 4) incident or other people, maybe three different occasions where
(rs) I've heard that people were - that was public knowledge

Vol 141976
(1) through the ESA and through Exxon
(2) Q Did you ever hear any of rumors of the Exxon Valdez of
(3) people drinking on the vessel?
(4) ANo
(5) Q Did you cver huar ot anv rumors of any captains or officers
(6) having drinks on any othur Exxon vussels?
(7) A Rumors of it no
(8) Q You ncver saw Captain Hacclwood have a drink on the vessul
(9) then Itake It?
(10) A No
(11) Q Nol counting yourselt during your employment with Exxon
(1) how many umes approximatuly do you estimate that you ve

1131 witnessed othur pursons drinhing on board vussels drinking
(14) alcohol?
(IS) A How many tumes un an eight year period did I witness
somebody else driuking'
Q Corrbl
A I can't - a few times
Q Does that mean morn than (Ln luss than lin'
A A few rwo three four mavbe
Q Did you cver witness an otficer drinking alcohol on board
an Exxan vasal)
$A \mathrm{No}$
(a) Q Did you cver sut any licunsed mumber of the crew drinking
( 11 on board an Exxon vossel?

Vol 141977
ANo
Q Did you ever receive either directlv or through the mail written copies of Exxon alcohol policies?
A I belıeve when I first started with Exxon we received information along those lines and I've received more than one
thing pertaining to those things, yes I think that I have another letter I can recall another letter at some point in time restating the drug and alcohol/substance-abuse-type things
on Exxon vessels
Q Restating? Did you say restating or reinstating?
"II A Restating, Just in case you forgot
(12) Q Let me back up a little bit Mr Emel I want to refer
(13) again to the time you went to Captain Hazeiwood s quarters in
(14) regard to the pay voucher question After reaching the
(15) conclusion about which you ve isstified already did vou ruport
(16) that to any other person employed by or associated with Exxon?
(17) ANo
(18) Q Did you ever subsequent to that time have any discussions with Exxon management about that issue?
(o) A No One thing when I observed the captann I'm no expect
II on the condation of a person you know I don't know one wav or
' , the other with just an observation I'm no expert in saying a
( ) man is one way or the other It may have been his natural
(74) habits I don't know It was an observation I made He may
(5) have been just fine, he may or mav not have been It was an

## Vol 141978

observation I can't conciude one way or the other on that if
he was or wasn't or if he had or had not been drinking
Q But you concluded at the time that he had heen drinking correct?
A Yeah
MR SANDERS That sall we have Your Honor
(The Reader stepped down)
MS WAGNER Your Honor plainuffs call William
Masciarelli by witness and the witness is coming to the
stand I m going to get Plaintiffs Exhibul 847 il sthe chan
of Prince William Sound
THE CLERK Will you raise your right hand?
(The Reader Is Sworn)
THE CLERK Please be seated
For the record state your full name address and apell your last name
THE READER Barry Klinkhardt 100 North Broadway
St Lous Missouri ItsKIinkhardt
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM MASCIARELLI (read)
BY MS WAGNER
Q Please state your name and your home address?
A Willam Masciarellı 1409 Northeast Boat B o a Street
(73) Seattle 98105
(24) Q What age are you?
(2) $\mathbf{A} 47$
(b) Q Can you describe the license vou have for the record?

1) A Well it's a third mate's hicense issued by the Coast

3, Guard It was issued in 1986 It is my first third mate's license
Q Can you start with your education and bring us up to-in other words could you start with high school? You graduated from high school?
A I graduated from high school attended a four-year college
graduated from college
Q-What college?
A Fordham University Fordham College in New York
Q Now from 1981 to the present can you run through your employment?
A Fxxon Shipping Company untal - I have to get the right
date I guess October 10th of 1990
Q Are vou employed bov Exxon today?
A No I'm not
Q Have you bcan imployed by Exxon since October 10 1990?
A No I haven't
Q Do you still hold your third mate s license?
A Yes I do
Q Did you pass celestial the second tume? What was the tume period there - I don I know whether you told us before when did you get your third mate s license?
A '86 I belteve
Vol 141980
Q You sailed with Captain Hazeiwood?
A I sailed with Captain Hazelwood
Q ls that the only tume you sailed with Hazelwood?
A No I was with him for I think about three days in San
Francisco We have to look at the discharges, but -
Q What year?
A Just a month before the Valdez went aground, so January
1989
Q You say vou wirl with him for threc days Was that in
port'
A It was in port I was the third mate on the Valdez for -
I think about a month and then was transferred from the
A I sailed with Captan Hazelwood
Q ls that the only tume you sailed with Hazelwood?
A No I was with him for I think about three days in San
Francisco We have to look at the discharges, but -
Q What year?
A Just a month before the Valdez went aground, so January
1989
Q You say vou wirl with him for threc days Was that in
port'
A It was in port I was the thard mate on the Valdez for -
(1) I thank about a month and then was transferred from the
Valdez
(13) to the Exxon Baton Rogue and Greg Cousuns came on board
to
(14) relieve me on the Valdez, and it was Captoin Hazelwood
came on
(15) the ship after the Valdez had arrived in San Francusco and I
(16) was with ham - it might have been only been two days It
(in) might have been three days before I was transferred also in
San
(18) Francisco to the Baton Rouge
(9) $Q$ Do vou remember what month that was?
A I can tell you the exact date if you want
(1) Q Mr Gerry January 20 to February 20?
2) A Well the date I got off the Valdez was February 20th
(23) Captan Hazelwood I don't know when Captan Hazelwood
joined
(24) It might have been February 18th or 19th So we had two
days
(25) together

## Vol 141981

```
    Q So ul was in February?
    A In San Francısco in February, yeah
    Q Did you have occasion to see has during that three day
    period?
    A I did I dad I saw hum every day
    Q More than one tume a day?
    A Yes
    Q Did you see him aboard the vessel or ashore or both?
    A Only aboard the vessel
    Q Did you see him in his cabin?
    A No, I didn't Well, not that I remember I remember'
    specifically seemg him at dinner on the bridge, in the
    officer's lounge I don't know if he was in his cabin
    Q Was there any ume during this period that you made a
    judgment that he was impaired Hazelwood?
    A Well, Captam Hazelwood was ashore for part of the tme
(17) had come back to the ship It seemed to me that he had
(18) dranking I don't know about impared I never saw him his
(19) work so -
(20) Q Maybe it s what -
(i) A Sol didn't have any stundard to sa) was leempalred to
(?2) walk down the corrndor or to drive a car or to pulot a ship
(-3) Q When you made the judgment you sa,d il seemed to you that
(4) he had been drinking What factors were involved that you
(25) reached that conclusion?
```

and
been

Vol 141982
A Gee I'm trying to picture ham Ile looked like soinebody who had been drinking
Q Did you ever during this three dav period sul any alcohol or beer aboard the vessel?
A Well I did And that was the only - that - and that was
the one tume I had alcohol myself on the ship Captan
Hazelwood offered me a glass of wine and I tooh it and drank a
glass of wine with hum
Q And what were the circumstante ul this otfering you a glass
of wine where did it take place?
A We were in the chart roum In the back of the bridge I should say the ship was at anchor there was nothing going
on the shup at that tume
Q You were at anchor outside San Franusco or in San
Francisco Bay?
A In San Francisco Bay
Q When you went in the chari room were you in there by yourself with Hazelwood?
AYes
Q Did Hazelwood have a botle of wine there in the chart room so that he could offer you a drink?
A I don't remember if he had two glasses of wine that he had
(23) brought up, say, to the bridge or whether he had two eupty glasses and a bottle I don't remember
Q Did you accepi?
i) AI did
(-) Q And did you have just the one drink with him?
(3) AI ded
4) Q How long did that session take place roughly a few minutes 5) or -

A It could have been a half hour We were just talking
7) and -
(8) Q Now did Hazelwood have more than one glass of wine during
(9) that half hour pertod?
(D) A He didn't
(II) Q Did you other than this wine during the three day period
(12) see any beer or any alcohol aboard the vesset?
(13) A I didn't
(14) $Q$ When Hazeiwood offered you this glass of wine did he (15) indicate to you what were the circumstances of why he was doing
(16) this just to be social or for what?
(17) A He didn't indicate, but Captan Hazelwood and I liked one
(18) another very much and from my point of view it might have just
(19) been a friendly gesture
( 01 Q Was ther any indication to you when he offured this to you
(1) that he had been drinking before this?
(.-) A Not at all
(-3) Q Let stall about Prince William Sound and Valdez Arm
(24) When you were standing the third mate watch in Vaidez was
(2s) it ever going into Valdez?

1984

## (1) A Yes

(1) Q And what about coming out?
(3) A Also
(4) Q Now how many umes in your career did you go into Valdez (5) and come out of Valdez with Exxon on any vessels?
(6) A As third made or able seaman also
(7) Q Let s just stay with third matc for a while then we 11 get ( 81 all the rest
(9) A Let me just take a look
(10) Q Just approximately
(II) A Somewhere between seven and ten umes
il 1 Q That would be trips there?
(13) A One way, etther in or out
(14) Q I sec That you actually stood a watch eithur in or out?
lls A That's ngitt So we could say 14 times an and out
(16) Q And now that $s$ as of third mate Whatever overall [sic]
(17) in your experience into Valdez not as a third mate? Had you
(18) been up there numerous tumes?
(19) A Many tumes Probably 20 or 30 times
(20) $Q$ When you were in Valdez and you came out and the pilot was
( 1) dropped at Rocky Point from that point while you were still in
(²) the traffic separation scheme - you would still be in the
(23) traffic separation scheme is that correct?
( 4 A Yeab there were a couple tames when we maght not have been
os, because of ice

Vol 141985
Q Just take in general from that point to past Bligh Reef down in this sector here Was the capiain alwavs on the bridge
while you were serving as third mate on watch?
A To the best of my recollectron he was
Q That is Watch Type C as far as Exxon is concerned? A Yes
Q So coming in and going out while vou whr in the tratfic
separation scheme in the area we re describing would you agree
that Exxon spolicy is there should be two officers on the bridge?
A Yes I would
, Q In addition to the pilot when the pilot comes aboard too is that correct it $s$ Watch Type C - let me rephrase it Watch type $C$ might embrace a period of time when the pilot is aboard and when he s not aboard isn that correct? You could still be coming into the port before you picked the pilot up?
A Yes it's true The Exxon manual as far as I remember
and
(19) as I see here doesa't mention whether or not the pilot's on board
Q But in your opinion as a third mate do you thinh it s proper for the captain to be on the bridge except for when hu has to go to the bathroom or get binoculars for a brief period of time for the period he $s$ coming in or going out of the
Valdez for the brief period when I ve been describing?

## AYes

Q Have you cuer as a third mate with Exxon on the Exxon
Valdez or any other vessel even when you were sailing A B
have you ever seen the captain leave the bridge for a
substantial period of time meaning for over an hour during this passage that we $v$ been describing with the pilot on the bridge?
A Not that I cin recall
Q Would you agree with me for that to happen that would be unusual?
A In my expernence it would have been unusual Q Well what it simply wanted to know is the situation of having a third mate up here by himself with no senior officer there number one required by Watch Condition $C$ which you agreed to and without the captain there would you agree that that a unusual?
A I would agree it's unusual although as I sand there might ) have been circumstances where a captan might have stepped off
(19) the bridge to go down to his office to get his binoculars or ( 0 ) something So if I were on the bridge and that circumstance (.I) had happened I might have been surprised but it wouldn't bave
, been unprecedented
( 31 However and I have to say given the conditions that ) might, I would have been very surprised
(25) $Q$ And then if we add the fact to it that you re not only left

1
1
1
(2) were instructed to maneuver while the captain was not on the
(4) bridge in that same area where Watch Condition $C$ is supposed

191 be inetfect)
A F veu in those circumstances if it was a clear aight and no
ice in the traffic lanes it would have been very, very
unusual and I would have scratched my head and say - and
sardfee what's going on But I wouldn't have been
shocked
(10) at the carcumstance
(II) Q Now if you re going to leave the entire scheme - you
(1) never did that is that correct?
(13) A Never did
(14) $Q$ Would it be your understanding you would have to report
(IS) that to the vessel traffic center?
(16) A Yeah Actually on the way in We did leave the enture
(17) scheme at one tume south of Bligh Reef because of ice that had
(18) drifts south and we were out of the scheme to the east instead
(19) of the separation scheme and we notified them about that
( 0 ) $Q$ Are vou familiar with the load up program of the engine?
(1) AYes
(22) Q And can you just describe briefly for the record what is the load up program?
A Well it's a computer driven speed increase on the diesel
designed to put least wear and tear on the diesel as it comes

## Vol 141988

to sea speed
Q And it s done automatically as soon as you set the vessel
|sic| in force?
A Yes
Q In your experience going into Valdez and coming out of Valdez - let s narrow it down Ever on your trips coming out of Valdez while you were on watch was the load up program put
(8) in place while you were still up in an area above Bligh Reef? A I don't remember
Q You don $t$ know whether that would be unusual or not?
A My sense is that it would not that on other ships that I
was on they would start to come up to sea speed as soon as they
(13)
couid as soon as the pilot was dropped
Q How about the ice conditions? Would that change it if I
asked you the same question with ice conditions putting the
vessel into load up program into place when the pilot is
dropped?
A I don't remember ever seeing that happened
(19) Q Do you remember whether you felt overworked?
(20) A I often felt tured
(21) Q is that because you had worked more than say an
( ) eight hour day?
(3) A Yes
(4) $Q$ And can you give me any idea within a 24 hour period of how (2s) many hours you might work?

## Vol 141989

A lt's difficult to say because it depended on upon - it depended on where $0 n$ my watch or where my watch fell and the
(3) tume the ship arnved in Valdez If I was on watch on the (4) bridge and the tymg up took place during a normal work peniod
(5) for me and the stran of being in port wouldn't be as great
(6) If I was asleep and was called out to go on watch and then sent
(7) back to sleep and then called to go on my cargo watch and then
(8) back to sleep and then called at a sleep break to help let the ) shop go, then it could get to be quite a strain
Q What about the chief mate the hours he worked as you observed when you were in Valdez when the vessel was in port? Can you give me an idea of the hours he worked? A Well I can't He was the man responsible for everything (1a) Ultumately he had to be on deck when cargo was started, when it
(15) ended, any problems that came up So he worked harder than I
(16) did I can't tell you exactly
(17) $Q$ Would you agree that of the officers on turn around the
(IB) chief mate was - probably works the longest hours?
(19) A Without question
(30) Q Do they juggle his watch at all his sea watch because of
(21) this knowledge that he s going to have to work long hours on the turn around in port?
A Well as I said on the way out the captain often stood his sea watch on the way out to make up for the fict that he had been exhausted in the port turn around Ab fir as on the way

## Vol 141990

in I don't recall any instances which he was given more sleep
, where they tried to prepare him
Q Whil we were on the subject of juggling watches in your
expcricnuc with Exxon on any of thuir vossels was thurlany
juggling of watches done other than what vou ve desiribud with
the chief mate because of overworhid conditions ol the ollicars involvad?
A Yeah It wasn't at all unusual for someone who had an easy
turn around - for example if I had been the one who had the easy turn around in Valdez - to stay on the bridge loager to allow my relief whether it was the chef mate or the second mate to get some more sleep if I knew he had [sic] had a lut of sleep, so I might hold over a couple of hours unto the departure
Q Was that a common practice would you say?
A Yeah It wasn't unusual
Q Was that individually donc so that the - or in othur
words what sort of arrangement is made on that just hutween the two officers themselvas the one who a to be relicved and the one who is relieved?
(21) A Yeah Often there's no drrangement at all just the , officer on the bridge doesn $t$ bother to call hiv releef because
( 31 he knows his relief has had a hard turn around
(74) Q Would the captain be advised of this to see if he arrived?
(as) A In all of my expenence the captain was on the bridge at

## the tume

Q Let me talk about fatigue a little bit In your opimion
was fatugue among dech crew a problem on Exxon onl tankers?
A What do you mean by "deck crew"?
$Q$ Let me first himit it to deck officers
A Yes
Q Was fatigue in your opinion a problem with regard to deck
officers?
AYes
(10) Q Just for clarity when we talk about deck and crew - when
we talk about deck crew and dech officurs the deck officers
would be who the first second and third mates?
A Chuef mate second mate third mate
Q The dach crew would be constituted as who?
A The sux A B's
Q In your opinion did deck officers experience fatigue from overwork?
A In some carcumstances yes In other carcumstances -
well
(19) always from overwork, yes
(20) $Q$ When you say that you feel fatigue among deck officer crew
(21) [sic] was a probiem in what way was it a problem?
(22) A Well, that led to lower - 1 don't know how to say it
(23) Lessened people's ability to work safely I guess is the thing
(4) to say
(s) $Q$ In your view was it primarily a safety issue?

AYes
Q You may have answurcd this Was it your icstimony that you
don 1 recall the autopilot ever being ulilized in Prince
William Sound when you whre on board)
A That's correct
Q But based on your expuriencu in transiting Prince Willam Sound the Exxon vessels involved in those transits utilized the vessul traffic center on the VTS?
A I don't know what you mean by "utilized"
Q Did thuy rely on them to get information?
A The only information we had relsed on them for was ice conditions
Q Was there ever any time that an Exxon vessel relied on the vessel traffic center for information about where they were in the Sound?
A Never
Q Let sfactor in your observation yesterday that Kagan needed supervision and your observation that in the normal course ol your changcover with Cousins you would have told Cousins that ban you still imaginc Cousins had he done things properly would not have piched up on the lact that Kagan talled to make a coursc thange in six minutes?
A I'll tell you that I can magine the circumstances Kagan and Greg hadn't been together very long at that ponat as far
_.s) as I can tell And let me say that I'm not sumply trying to

## Vol 141993

I) defend a fellow third mate, I can tmagine the fact that the concern with the ice was so overwhelming that he would not have
3) checked that rudder angle indicator

Now in my trips into and out of and I did a lot of trips in the two months prior to the grounding on both the Valdez and
(6) the Baton Rouge the captann was the guy who watched the ice
7) and I got to do evervthing else which included looking at that
8) rudder angle indicator The third mate's job is to do that
) when the captan is taking care of conaing the ship or making
los sure the ship isn't running into anything
When the captan or pulot is not on board and the third mate has to do everything else it's very concenvable to me that that is one of the things that the third mate wouldn't follow up on
Q Are you saying Cousins had too much to do on board the bridge that night?
A Yes yes
Q One of the reasons let $s$ assume that he did not realize -
let $s$ assume first of all that the course command that he gave was not carried out bv Kagan and let sassume he didn t pick
up - pick that up for six minutes What I asked him Ithink
was is one of the reasons he didn t pick it up because he was
too busy with other tasks?
A I believe that's the case
Q And is the reason that he was too busy with other tasks

[^11] had
Q When you were a crew man saling with Hazelwood did you
ever observe him to be impaired within four hours of leaving
port when he was standing watch?
A No I never did
Q Did you ever drink ashore with Hazelwood?
A Vever did
Q Did you cver see him drinhing ashore?
A No
Q And the oniy time you drank with him was the one you have
testified to the wine?
A-Yes
Q Did you ever hear from the other officers or crew members
any rumors or any statements concerning Hazelwood being
impaired?
A Never
Q Did you have any knowledge when you spent those three
with him that Hazelwood had been in a rehab program?
A No
Q What is Exxon s policy as you understand it concerning
drinking on board?
A That there is none
Q Would you mind reading that again I think the accent is on
the last word?
A That there is none
Q And it was Greg Cousins that replaced you on the 20th of

Vol 141996
February?
A That's correct
Q Where did that replacement take place?
A San Francisco Bay at anchor
Q Did you meet Mr Cousins at the tıme?
A Yes
Q Did you have any conversations with him?
$A$ Yes
Q What was the nature of the conversation?
A Oh what the assignment had been lake let's see let me
think a second There's a standard conversation that takes place between officers when they're relieving one another Anythag special in the equipment on the bring, anything not
functioning, anything I should know about in the cargo system (1s) anything special about the crew that I shonid know about, so
(16) Just basically turning over the job
(17) Q There sa standard conversation when one officer replaces
another on the vessel?
A When I say "standard conversation" there are areas that
you
( 0 ) could have been yeah
(21) $Q$ So we re not talking about just watch changes
( -) A No I'm talking about replacing
( 11 Q Do you remember any particular concerns that Mr Cousins
(4) passed on to you during the course of that conversation?
(r) A No

Vol 141997
Q Do you remember any particular spucilics about the conversation?
A No
Q Mr Cousins has testified on a couple of oucasions
previously that he let the second made Lloyd LeCain sleep
in Have you ever been in the umes that you have lult the
Port of Valdez has atever during the 8 to 12 watch?
A Oh, yes
Q So you were the watch officer on the bridge?
A Yes
Q Had you ever left your relief - had you ever let your 't rehef sieep in late?
AI have
Q Would you say that is uncommon or common?
A I would say that it's not uncommon
Q Why did you leave Exxon?
A I was termmated by Exxon Shipping Company
Q So your leaving was not voluntary'
A That's correct
Q Does that mean you wuru lirud?
A Yes
MR SANDERS No further questions
THE COURT You may call your next witness
(The Witness Stepped Down)
(25) MR MONTAGUE Your Honor plaıntiffs call as their $1+$

## Vol 141998

(I) nexi witness as an expert Mr Rick Van Hemmen
(2) THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand?
(3) (The Witness is Sworn)
(4) THE CLERK Please be seated
(s) For the record sir state your full name and your address
(6) THE WITNESS My name is Hendrih Van Hemmen My
(7) address is 50 Statestur ( ph ) Place Middletown Naw Jersey
(8) The up code is 07701 and my last namu is spullud $V$ a $n$, pact
(9) Hemmen
(10) THECLERK Thank you sir

いい DIRECT EXAMINATION OF HENDRIK VAN HEMMEN
(1) BY MR MONTAGUE
(13) Q Good morning Mr Van Hummin'
(14) A Good morning sar
(Is) $Q$ Could you tell the jury a litte bit about your emplovment?
(16) A I work for Martin Ottaway and Van Hemmen Iman engineer
(17) and our firm deals with marine transportation problems
(18) Q Could you be more explicit as to what your tirm does?
(19) A Yes we're a manne consulting firm We work for
('0) underwnters and for attorneys for ships owners and for
(-1) investors and we get engaged to analyze problems in manne
(22) transportation They could be collisions or they could be (23) groundangs They could be structural falures They could be
(14) problems relating to the operation of ships
(.s) $Q$ And how long has that tirm been in existunc?

Vol 142001
And forensic engineer investigates disasters investigates
problems that take place in engineernig systems
Q As part of that do you try to simultaneous problems or recreate problems or the movement of vessels?
A Yes sir
Q And have you done that as part of your duties in the past?
A Yes sir
Q Okay Have you testified as an expert before?
A Yes sir
Q And can vou tell us on what subject?
A Collisions sinkings capsizings structural failure
Q And in so testifying were you using thosc shills of a
forensic engineer as you just described them?
A Yes sir
Q Could you tell us some of the - some of the examples of the work that you do as it relates to specific incidents or specsfic vessels?
A We sit in our office and we get called by a chent and the
client says, well might have a ship that has hit an iceberg, I
would like you to go - this might be a ship owner - would
like you to go out and investigate the cause and if vou
( ) properly document the damage so we can make a
presentatuon to
(i) underwiters or we can deal with subsequent actions that might
$r a l$ be related to his problem
( 5) Or I maght be asked by an underwriter to go on board a shap

## Vol 142002

that has run aground to make sure the ship comes off the obstacle that it ran onto That would require engineering you know engineenig skills investigations as to how the ship
(4) was off ground what type of flotation a shap has what would be a proper route for geting the shap off the rocks
Q Have vou ever been a salvage master'
A Yes sir
Q Could you tell us what a salvage master is?
A A salvage master is a semi official term What happens ship is on the rocks and many peopie interested in getting
ship off the rocks, and quite often there's somebody will say,
(12) I want somebody to be in charge and then there's a general
agreement as to who will be the person in charge and that is called the salvage master
Q And that is somebody other than the master of the vessel? A Yes sir It as the person who directs the salvage effort Q By the way you re not a licensed mariner are you? A No, sir
Q Okay Have you ever heard the term discharge calculatıons?
A Yes sar
Q Do you do discharge calculations?
(3) A Not on a regular basis as like on board a shap, but we do (24) the discharge calculation when a ship has a problem
(25) Q Could you tell the jury what discharge calculations are?

Vol 142003
(1) A A ship is - onlv has limited strength When a ship is
( ) being loaded with cargo you cannot put the cargo all on one
(3) tank and ignore the rest of the ship The ship gets
(4) overstressed then It's important that the cargo gets brought
(9) in in the nght place at the nght tme so you don't overstress
(6) the ship And these calculations organizing this type of
(7) discharge or loading is called loading or discharge
(8) calculations
(9) Q Now Mr Van Hemmen do vou teach?
(101 A-Hestsir
(11) Q Could vou tell us where you teach and what you teach?
(I ' A I teach marine surveving at the College of Insurance in
New
(13) York City
(14) Q Okay And what is marine surveying?
(15) A Marine surveying marine surveyoring is the inspection of
(16) shups for - with regard to their condition or with regard to a
(17) certan amount of damage they have
(18) Q Okay At our request in this case have you undertaken a
(19) study of the use of the Exxon Valde7 sengine and its movements
(ro) afterif ran aground at Bligh Reef?
111 A Yen ur
1 Q And in doing so did you use the skills and the expertise
, that you ve described?
(1) A Yes sir
(s) MR MONTAGUE Your Honor I would offer Mr Van

## Vol 142004

i) Hemmen as an expert naval archatect and engineer as a forensic
() engineer for the purposes that I just described in the last
(j) quistion
(4) MR CHALOS Your Honor we have a serious doubt about
(gi) his expertise and qualifications but I would like to save that
(6) for cross I It let him on al that point
(7) VOIR DIRE EXAMINATION OF HENDRIK VAN HEMMEN
(8) BY THE COURT
(9) Q Mr Van Hemmen what is your degree?
(10) A It's a bachelor of scrence degree an aerospace and ocean (11) engineening
(1.) Q Do you have any advanced degrees?
(13) A No sir
(14) Q Tell me something about your experience in the area of
"lsi marine archuecture
(।A) A I presume you mean the term "naval architecture"
(17) Q If that sthe word yea
(18) A My experience is that I am - I in my aerospace and ocean

1191 engineerung traning, I dealt with naval archntecture on a
danly basis The course that I took is really a vehicle desagn
(21) course and it deals in the vehicle in the aur below, the
(22) ocean or the interface So the - so that's my traning and
(73) then working for MAR, Incorporated I dealt with naval
(24) architectural assues almost daily Woring for the Amencan
(23) Bureau of Shipping those two years I would say this wasn't
(1) necessarily the case daily Vaval architecture they were a
(2) Little more disconnected because it dealt with more machmery
(3) Items
(4) With Johan Valentuju, Incorporated I dealt with naval
(s) architecture issues on almost a dauly basıs In other words I
(6) desugned ships, I dealt with calculations, hydrostatic
7) calculations, discussions with classification societies
(8) construction supervision the welding of ships and things hike
9) that

Then I started working for Martin \& Ottaway and dgan I
deal with naval architecture almost daily
THECOURT Ohay 1 will atcopt the witness
qualifications as a naval architect
MR MONTAGUE Thank you Your Honor
5) RESUMED DIRECT EXAMINATION OF HENDRIK VAN HEMMEN
(16) BY MR MONTAGUE
(17) Q Now Mr Van Hemmen let s go back agan What is it that (18) the plaintiffs asked you to do in this case?
(19) A They asked me to take a look at the course recording deep
(.0) tape and the bell tape testumony general drrangement of the
(-1) vessel and to bell $\log$ and to anvestigate what type of actious
(-2) were taken by Captan Hazelwood while the ship was off ground
(23) Q Okay And did you do that?
(24) A Yes sir
(23) $Q$ And were you able to find all ot the materials that you

|  | Vol 142006 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) needed to do that? |  |
| $(\sim) A$ Yes to the extent they were avalable |  |
| (3) | Q Okay Was there anything missing that you tult you had to |
| (4) see? |  |
| (s) A Well, I would have liked to have seen some record of the |  |
| (6) rudder excursious of the vessel rudder movements on the (7) vessel but I understand there, no such record |  |
|  |  |
| (8) Q Now as a result of your studving thosc matcrals that vou |  |
| (s) Just identified were you able to ruruatc the movimunt of the |  |
| (10) Exxon Valdez once it was aground Bligh Rucl? |  |
| (1) A Yes sur within a reasonable extent |  |
| 121 Q And with the help of a videographer were you able to put |  |
| (13) that recreation on a videolape simulation? |  |
| (14) A Yes sar |  |
| (15) $Q$ And have you viewed thal simulation) |  |
| (16) A Yes sir |  |
| (17) Q And are you satisfied that il satcurate) |  |
| (18) A To an agann far and reasonable degree yes sir |  |
| (191 MR MONTAGUE May wi make the ruyucst put that |  |
| (20) videotape on butif you could put the controls so that Mr Van |  |
| (21) Hemmen can start and stop - you can I do that You have - |  |
| (2) I ll try to give you signals then or Mr Van Hemmen it you |  |
|  | want the video stopped at any point why what I would to do is when the picture first boes on stop it so wh can |
|  | have a still okay |

5-20-94
VOLUME 14
YMAXI 1
Vol $14 \quad 2007$
THE WITNESS Stopped on the tirst trame
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q It sa little trembly but could you explain what this depicts?
A This is a top view of the Exxon Valdez Just like the model
is over there If you look from the top, you would see about the same thing
$Q$ This would be looking down on the top?
AYes, sir
Q Okay
A And the deck of the ship is the dark red area, the deck
house the accommodation is the white area with the little
black squares Maybe I can stand over there and pount at
the
(14) vadeo That would be easier

THE COURT Pointer on there that he can use
THE WITNESS Does this worl?
THE COURT Give him a pointer That should work
MR MONTAGUE I don $t$ know what this is
THE COURT Isn there an electronic pointer?
MR MONTAGUE You can $\operatorname{t}$ put the - no he can t do that
THE COURT Somebody was doing it the other day
MR MONTAGUE Your Honor you reasking the wrong person
MR LYNCH Your Honor the - when the information is

## Vol 142008

(1) storid inside the computer you can do that When it s-this
() is a videotape it s just likl a videotape player and the
(3) sompulur can $t$ do that
(4) THE COURT Sorry
(s) MR MONTAGUE Wh have this the next bust thing Your (6) Honor
17) THE WITNESS Myhand has io be stady hore Let ma
|s) suc $11 /$ langut this linad upagain Can you sce the litide
(i) red dot? That sthu stack the duch that sthe back that s
(10) the stern that sthe bow the black area is what is basically
(II) the tunnel that - what $s$ forced into the ship when the ship
(12) ran aground when she ran aground there was a large area of
(13) damage It ended up to going to about that spol over there
(14) The whill lines the ones that look dashed and the ones that
(1s) are going across are the outlines of the various tanks in the
(16) ship the cargo tanks and then the yellow line which I think
(17) was yellow il looks a litte white over here is the

H81 centcrinc of the ship
(19) On the boltom over thure - don itwant to shine - that s
(20) the rpm which is the tachometer the revolution counter of the
(-1) ship the rugister the speed of the crgine Then that is the
1-1 time whith is 1230 at this stage and that $s$ compass rose
(23) north southeast and that says 270 that s 270 degrees
(4) BYMR MONTAGUE
(2s) $Q$ As the vessel grounded on thu reef it was facing

Vol 142009
approximately 270 degrees?
A No it was facing a bit further north than that It was facing about 290
Q Okay Now without - have you described what - does this mean anything?
A The hittle white dot is what we assume is the rotational point of the ship the ship that - the point of the ship is rotating about That point is the afterpoint of the damage about the middle of the damage and it also corresponds to Captann Hazelwood's testimony where he savs thev felt the ship
(11) was rotating about its normal rotation point
(1) Q Now could you tell us before we run this what is the (13) purpose of this videotape?
(14) A This videotape shows that once the Exxon Valdez was (19) aground the engines were started again and Captann Hazelwood
(16) undertook some maneuvers on the shap that made the shap move
"17) side to side made it swing back and forth around the obstruction
Q All right And was therl anv-and this dupicls that
movement is that what this simulation does)
A Yes sir from the top view of the movement
Q And was there anv cause of that ship moving as it s
depicted in this simulation as we li see than the enginc
running and the movement of the rudder?
A There might have been some tudal movement The ship might

## Vol 142010

have moved due to the tide It goes back and forth
Q Now does this videotape when we run it will that show
any actual rudder movement?
A No sir
Q And is that because you said you couldn iget an accurate
source for -
A Well there was no accurate source for a rudder ovement
In my opinion there was rudder movement but there was no
accurate source that depicted how far the rudder went to at each tume
Q And how did you determine the movement of the vessel?
A From the bell loader and from the course to course plot
Q And are you satisfied it was accurate?
A These two instruments and they just record what goes
They're not particularly subject to any type of mistake
QId like to run this and Id like Mr Van Hemmen anytime
(17) you want it stopped just signal over there and we II -
(18) A Before we start maybe we can run it just once The yellow
(19) line that goes down the centerine of the ship we use that to
kund of show the range that the ship rotated through So
you'll see the line swing up and it stays there and it comes down and it you end up with a wedge that - the angle ship rotated through
(5) Also at the stern of the ship you'll start to see a little white wedge that is a depiction of the weight coming off the
(1) propeller That wedge will get bigger when the rpm's nacrease
( ) on the ship In real hfe the wedge moves back and forth
(3) because you would use the rudder
(4) In this video it doesn't show In this particular
(s) viden - go abead At this stage the ship she's not moving
(6) She's still rotating probably prohably from the tide here
(7) The engine starts and she's going slow rpin nght now 25 rрш
(8) The speed goes up to 31 but now 1245 the tume This is sped -
(9) up of course This is an hour and a half process and we sped
(10) it up to slightly more than an hour We sped it up to a monute
(II) and a half
(12) Now you can see this ts the extreme port and the start of
(13) the vessel's swing at the tume the engine is being used

Right
(14) now 55 rpm This is full maneuvenng speed You see the
(I) vessel gnes hack and forth one ande the other side one sade
(16) the other side In real infe the swinging back and forth goes
(17) very slow of course
(18) $Q$ Now is that everv time there $s$ a swing back and forth does
(19) that mean there was a change in the rudder?

101 A Yes it would have had to be a change in the rudder
angle
(21) $Q$ And again is there any other explanation for that ship
(22) moving that far?
(23) A No sir
(24) Q How many degrees do you estimate that swing is?
(ns) A That is best measured from the actual voice recorded
tape

## Vol 142012

(I) and that comes to about 14 degrees
() Q Ohay Now it s shut off?
(3) A That's the end The engineer stopped and the shup has come
(4) to rest a latele bit further south than when she started with
(s) Q Can you tell what if it - if it s important I don $t$ know

101 that it is what degree it s facing what course it s facing?
(7) A I think it was something like $\mathbf{2 8 0}$ degrees
(8) Q Okay thank you Now you recall that when the - when
(9) Exxon when the Exxon Valdez first went aground that the
(10) engines ran for a litile while and then they were shut off"
ill A Yes sir
(1.) Q Al that point when the engines were shut off do you have
(13) an opinion from the materials that you studied as to whether
(1s) the Exxon Valdez at that point was solidly aground?
(14) A From what I studied I would conclude that she was solidly
(16) aground
(17) Q And why do you say that?
(18) A Because she was not moving any way by herself
(19) $Q$ And that s a pretty simple answer What does that mean?
(20) A Well, a ship's ether afloat or either aground And if
(21) she's afloat when the engane is stopped, she can float in
(?2) whatever direction she wants to float or whatever direction the
(23) wind and tide takes her When she's agronnd, she doesn't
move
(24) anywhere and that appeared to be the situation
( s ) Q Okay Now let s - the question I m going to ask you now
relates to the movement that we ve just scen on the simulation" A Sure
Q Was there a chance that if thc Exxon Valdez was nol steadily aground that that movement that we vi just seen would have - would have caused the vessel to come off the reef? A Well, that maneuvering would have taken her off if she wouldn't have been soludly off the ground
Q That confirms also solidly off the ground?
A Yes, sur
Q In your - now you weren ton the bridge that might?
A No sir
Q So all you ve been able to do is reconstruct?
A Yes, sir
Q And Captain Hazelwood was - aftur the grounding he was
the bridge?
A Yes sar
Q Okay In your opinion did Captain Hazelwood being on the bridge after the grounding did he know any more about the
condition of the Exxon Valdez as it rests - as it was on Bligh
Reef than you know by looking back at everything that was avalable?
MR CHALOS Your Honor I object He has no basis for answering that question THE COURT Well I will allow an expert witness to answer that question

Vol $14 \quad 2017$
(I) maneuvenng and when the maneuvening started the maneuvenng
() of the vessel basicallv caused it to grind on the reef and the
17) grinding on the reef caused additional damage to the ship and
(4) therefore additional pollution or it could have in an extreme
(5) case caused the ship to fracture and the fracturing could
(6) result in the ship breaking apart capsizing or whatever takes
7) place and also the ship could actually come free it could
8) work sts way free from the reef and the ship could actually
(9) sınk or capsize
(10) Q And is that a something that should - are those risks that
(i) should be considered at the time those maneuvers were tahen'

A Yes sir
i) Q And were those possibilities of things that could really happen?
fls) A They were all possibilities Fspecially because the damage
(1) situation was not all that clear at that stage so you start to take an actuon after that You don't have that much information Youtake an action basically shootiag in the dark
Q May I have Elmo ${ }^{\text { }}$ I d like to show you Mr Van Hemmen
some testimony given in this court room by Captain Hazelwood
And I d like you to - tan you suc that oiday'
A Yes sir
Q Can you see this is at page 633 of the trial transcript
Captain Hazelwood was asked the following questions and gives

[^12](i) It's like taking your car puting it in drive puting foot on the brake and the other foot hit the throttle If the you hit
the throttle engue speed up but never to full speed and
that's the same thing with the tanker you can't get to full
speed Full maneuver is about the max you can get without
getting overload or overheating conditions and you can push a
little bit beyond that but to get full speed is it's just not possible
Q So could you tell us in vour opinion based on whal you
sant trithe statement I could have pushed two buttons and
gone aca speed full astern in about two minutes is that a
correct or an incurrabl stalumant?
A That's incorrect techaically incorrect
Q Now vou have - hased on the simulation and the movement
of the versel at 59 rpm and side to side did that cause any stresses on the vessel?
A Yes str
Q And could you explain what they are?
A Thev're - well it's - if you just go ahead just push ahead agaunst the rock - say, this is a rock and the ship is around the rock and you just push you're just pushing, you can bring up as much propeller rpm as the ship can bring It doesn't bother it ton much It's a very long shup, as you can see over there and you see - take this reef it's like a wrench and that causes the grinding motion which can put d lot

## Vol 14-2020

of stress on the vessel
Q And what kind of stress on the frame of the vessel?
A On the atructure of the vessel stress on the steel The
ship's buit out of steel and the ateel could break away and
fracture and bend distort it
Q Now you heard - have you read the communications
bulwcen
Captain Hazelwnod and the VTS alter the grounding?
AYes sir
Q And you re familar with those communications where he referred to extracting the vessel from the rock?
AYes sur
Q Okay I want to ask you if the actions which Captain Hazelwood took as depicted on that simulator are they inconsistent with trying to get the vessel off the rock?

```
A They -
```

Q Do you understand that question?
A There's two sides to that question Maybe if you could
restate it maybe I can give a clearer answer to it
Q All right If Captain Hazelwood - the movementa that the
ship took as shown on the simulation is that inconsistent with
telling - with trying to get the vessel off of Bligh Reef?
A No If you look at what actually exists, that is the
course of quarter to VTS transcript where Captan
Hazelwood
says I'm trying to get it off That type of maneaverng could
be - somebody would make would try to get the vessel off

5-20-94 $\qquad$ YMAXIS
realizing what the actual risk of doing that is
Q Well could you explain how that would get the vessel off the reef?
A Well, it was pointing in the direction of the channel and the moving back and forth that sawing back and forth is not an
(6) uncommon way of getting shaps off obstructions
) MR CHALOS Your Honor i would like to move to
) strike his testimony I think this is going way beyond his
forensic engineering expertise he was qualified for Now he s
0) talking about maneuvering this ship This man doesn I hold any
licenses for that
THE COURT Sounds to me like at s passed naval
architecture
MR MONTAGUE It s not architecture Your Honor it s
engineering as to whether that movement could result in the
ahip going off the rock
MR CHALOS That sounds io me lihe that s navigation
and ship handling
THE COURT Sounds to me like ship handing
MR MONTAGUE Okay In that casl Your Honor Ihave
no further questions
THE COURT You may cross
MR CHALOS Thank you Your Honor CROSS EXAMINATION OF RIK F VAN HEMMEN
BYMR CHALOS

## Vol 142022

(I)

(a)
(4) A Good morning, Mr Chalos
(5) Q The Van Hemmen and the Francis - what in it Francis
(b) Martın Ottaway Van Hımmın'
7) A Today it's Martin Ottaway \& Vin Ilemmen
(s) Qhat Van Hummin is your dad richi'

A Yes sur
(101 Q Bythe way savhello for me when vouftl bach
(li) A I'll do that
(1), Q Thank you Just onc yuestion You said in your ollicu you
(13) sit around and people call you up and say my ship just hit an
(14) weberg will you tome down and tahe a looh do vou remembur
(IS) that?
(16) A Yes, sir
(17) Q You never got that kind of a call did you'
(18) A Yes Idid
(19) Q You did for an iceberg?
(20) A Yes, sir
(21) Q Where?
(22) A The Oversea Sohno last lanuary
(23) Q Uphere?
(4) A Yes in the Valdez terminal
(s) Q Did you go to that ship'

A Yes sir
Q You yourself?
A Yes, sar
Q Now let me ask you this The engineering license that you
hold right that sa stationary ingincur slicunse?
A No sir
Q What kind of an engineering license?
A It's a design engineenng license It's a license that
allows you to design structures that could cause harm to
people In other words, if I have to buld a building and I
put a steel structure in that an engmeer like me has to
approve that particular structure before at can be bult
Q That $s$ what I meant by stationary we ru talking about building?
A I thought you meant stationary operators hcense
Q I meant building design right?
A It's not stationary the Coast Guard now requires BE
licenses now for designang ships
Q Let me ask you this You do not hold a seagoing engineers
Itcense do you?
A Absolutely not
(22) Q As a matter of fact you ve never sailed as a crew member
(23) on any commercial vessel have you?

A That's right, sar
(.S) Q And you ve never salled on a tanker as a crew member have

## Vol 142025

I) Q Okay That was on one ship?

A As than official salvage master one ship yes sir
3) Q And you were on there when the ship ran aground or after?
4) A After the ship ran aground
() $Q$ The ship had already been aground when you got there?
6) A Yes it had been aground for two or three hours
(7) $Q$ And you don t know what maneuvers the captan made before
8) you got up there did you?
9) A Up to what stage"
(10) Q Before you got on the vessel you don t know what maneuvers
(tl) were made by the captain after you ran aground?
(1) A Afterit ran aground made no maneuvers whatsoever
(13) Q You weren t there though?
ris) A No Sufficient people around to make sure that nothing

## III happened

(16) Q Okay Now you went on board for a different reason you
(17) didn igo on board as a salvage master you went on board on
(18) behalf of the insurance company right?
(19) A That's right

Q And then while you were there thav said why don tyou
(21) become the salvage master?
(-) A No that's not the way it went
( ${ }^{\text {i) }} \mathrm{Q}$ Tell us how it went
(1) A The United States Coast Guard officer on board of the
hhip
(s) said no action gets taken until the salvage master gets

## Vol 142026

## II apponted then the owner sand who had made valvage

 master() and the underwriters said -
(3) I et me start from the bezmang Ran uground the Coast
(4) Guard came on board the vessel and the Coast Guard said
(s) nothugg gets done untul salvige master gets appointed Which
(A) is not alwavs the case 1 mean many groundings that salvage
(7) master never gets appointed Then the owner said well who
18) should we appoint as the salvage master, and they talked to the
(9) underwnters and the underwniter said well Mr Van Hemmen
(10) whose on board the ship, who has sufficient experience to
act
(II) as salvage master and that's how I became the salvage master
(1) Q Okay in that particuiar case the vessel had run aground
(13) in Rhode Island right?
(14) A Yes sir
(1) Q Okay And after you got on board the vessel was refloated
(16) within a couple hours?
(17) A Yeah I think it was maybe five sux hours or so
(18) Q Okay So you were on board the tide came up right you
(19) got a couple tugs alongside she came right off right?
(20) A No
( I) Q That s not what happened?
(r2) A No
(13) Q What happencd?
(24) A The ship was on the rocks she had run into a - part way
(2S) on the rocks part way on a jetty a stone jetty and we had to
(I) reballast the shap We had to move ballast from one side to () another side We had to do some pumping take some water up so
(3) when the tide came up we could tow her
(s) The ballast done by the crew?

A Under mv direction yes
Q And then the ship just floated off and was taken off?
A That's the best way to do it
Q And as a matter of fact you waited for the tide to come up
to high tide and then vou pulled har off
AYes sir
Q And the damage that that ship suffered was minor wasn t
$1117^{7}$
1131 A It was a gash in the side that was about I thunk abont
(14) 150 feet long and it was damaged to the bottom And the how I
(1s) wouldn't call it minor we had to make temporary repairs
before
(16) ship moved
(17) Q Then sailed on to the next port?
118) A We made a huge cement box
(19) Q Okay So that was the onlv time we were ever a salvage
( 0 ) masiler right?
1 11 A Officiall appointed as salvage master yes sir
1 : Q Now let stalh about the Exxon Valdez Could I have that
(3) tapı plavid You whnt over something real quick and I want to
(24) slow it down because I want to ask you some questions about
( 5 ) it Is that?

## Vol 142028

(1) A Maybe go ahead you have just a little bit It will stop
(i) Q Does it go back any further" Is that where it starts at
(1) $1230^{\circ}$

1 Now Mr Van Hamman you know from the lestimony do you
(s) not that the engine on this ship was shut down the first time
at 1220 you rumbmber that?
AYes
Q Ohav I noticud here that you don 1 show anything from
12 20 In 1230 In other words you didn I do an analysis of what the ship was doing between 1220 and 1230 right?
A Obviously at starts at 1230
Q Okay But the fact of the matter is you didn tanalyze whether the ship was moving at all due to tide?
A Oh, she hit the rocks and she kept swingang nght through there
Q So that lun minutes that we re talking about the ship was swinging'
A Yes
Q Let 8 start it up here because I want to ask you some questions
(1) Now before I ask you hold on a second At this point
(2) there $s$ no engine and there $s$ no rudder being used?
(23) A She's just stopped that nght
(.4) $Q$ Go ahead and start her up Let me get out of your way 1 m (2s) sorry Okay Stop Stop That ship is moving, wasn it?

Vol 142029
(1) A Yes sir
(2) Q And It was moving for about two minutes wasn it ${ }^{\text {? }}$ (3) A Yes
(4) $Q$ And the two minutes you were talking about before that you
(s) said she was swinging still?
(6) A Yes
(7) Q Now when you said she was hard aground and Caplain
(8) Hazelwood should have known it was hard aground what Capuan
(9) Hazelwood was seeing at that tume for about 15 minutes befor
(10) he started up his engine again was this ship moving wasn tit?
(11) A Yes it was the ship was stall moving but it was not
(1) moving across the ground it was hung up on something
(13) Q But the ship was moving I meanhe standing on the
(14) bridge?
(15) A It was rotatung, yeah
(16) Q But it was moving?
(17) AYes
(18) Q By the way you said that Captain Hazelwood new certain
(19) things that aught right?
(20) A Uh huh
(21) Q One of the things that you left out that he knew was that
(22) you weren t on the bridge that night right?
(23) A Yeah obviously
(24) Q All right Buthe was?
(s) A Yes he was

[^13]Vol 142031
(1) Hazelwood if he wanted to go full ahead maneuvering?
(-) A If he wanted to go full ahead maneuvenng
(3) Q Let me take that back How much horsepower would have
been
41 avatlable if he wanted to go full ahead emergency?
(5) A I would say that the engine -
(6) Q Well do you know Do you know?
(7) A Nobody knows
(8) Q What do you mean nobody knows' Isn this ship rated to go
(9) 33000 horsepower at full emergency?
(10) A No, sir Only when she's steaming She could be rated
\|।। anything you want to but she can't develop that
horsepower
(1) Q Develop something pretty close to it once full ahead
emergency?
A Once she's steaming on the way and running, you can drive
(15) past the normal full speed settung and you can go faster but also you end up in a condition, depending whether the ship Ls
(17) in ballast or fully loaded you get conditions overheat
(18) situations overheat exhaust gas temperature And it's just
(19) not the way to do it
(70) $Q$ The reason that engincs art rated to certain horsepowers
i it because that the max horsepower depends if you go to stluation

I you get in a stluation not even normal operating speed"

## A Anything can happen anything is possible

Q But what I masking you what is the rating of this ship at
full ahead emergency do you know?

## Vol 142032

(1) A Captain Hazelwood testufied 33000 hursepower
() Q Do you have any reason too dispute that?
, ANo
Q Do you have rated horsepower as full ahead maneuvering?
I A Captain Hazelwood testufied 8500 horsepower
Q This is a diesel ingine right?
A Yes ur
Q So the point is that Captain Hazclwood at no tume during
the time that he was using his engines right uxceeded 25
percen of what he believed was his available horsepower isn i
that correct?
(12) A No if you say what he belseves was hus avalable
(13) horsepower I have that's perfectly correct
(14) Q Now let me ash you this Youhcard Captain Hacelwood?
(1si Were you here for Captain Hazelwood sistimony?
(16) A Yes sir
(17) Q So you heard him say that when he was maneuvering the
(18) vassel at starting at 12 【think il was what did we say

12367
A Yes might have been 1240
Q When he staricd maneuvering the vessel at that point he
usud five dugreus and len dugrecs of ruddur is that right?
AYes sar
Q He had avatlable 10 him did he not 35 dugreen cither way if he wanted?

## Vol 142033

## A Yes sar

( ) Q Hard over 35 degrees to go to one side and 35 degrees to
(3) go to the other side right?

## AYes

Q So he used 15 percent 20 percent of his avallable nudder isn that right?
A I listened to Captan Hazelwond's testimons and that's what
he said that's what he sand ves
Q Do you have reason to doubi that?
A Yes I do
Q You do based on what?
A Well first of all there was also testimonv about a
helmsman who testified rudder all the way over The other thing is that if you put onlv five to ten degree rudder but at the same tume you go full ahead that doesn't seem to make T
(1) lot of sense Well that seems to be saving I use a blow torch
17) to light my stove or something like that
(18) Q Let s you and ! -
(19) MR MONTAGUE Excuse me Mr Chalos has heen cutting
(0) off Mr Van Hemmen
(।) MR CHALOS Iapologize
( ) BYMR CHALOS
(.3) Q Go ahead Mr Van Hemmen
(4) A The rudder is the device you use in conjunction with the
(s) propeller and the rudder is more sensituve than a propeller

## Vol 142034

To start the engane takes a while to get up to apeed takes a whale to slow down To say I first do $\mathbf{2 5}$ rpm and I only do ) five to ten degree rudder but then I don $I$ dn anvthing else but then I go to a higher speed and I only use five to ten degree rudder it doesn't make mv sense
MR CHALOS Did Icuthim off
MR MONTAGUE Restrain yourself
THE WITNESS I mot sure what completes my answer in vour question Iam nota mariner lama navalarchilect Im very experienced in grounded stiuations And I know what kind
of force it takes to move a vessel a certain way and what kind
type of rudder angle you use tor that Based on that it smy
opinion more rudder angle was used
(14) BYMR CHALOS
(1s) Q You don thave any evidence of that?
(16) A No just my opinion
(17) Q You didn t do any calculations did you?
(18) A It doesn't take calculations
(19) Q You say you re a naval architect but in fact you don 1
( ${ }^{\circ} 0$ ) have a degree in naval architecture do you?
( I) A If you add up all the numbers
l ) Q it setther a yes or no Do you have a degree?
(13) A No I don't have a naval architecture degree
( s) Q And the naval architectural experience that you had when
(s) you worked for Valentıne that you told us about?
(1) A Yes sar
(-) Q Do you remember that that was designing sailboats?
3) A And power boats
4) Q Small ones?
(5) A Well under 50 feet
(6) Q I want to corrcul two things that you said that s why I
7) got excited You said the heimsman put over hard right hard

81 left Do you remember what ume period?
AThat wisn tclear
Q If was prelly clear to me and it s pretly clear in the
testmony that it was between the time that the engines were
shuldown do you remember that?
A I don't remember that it wasn't clear to me
Q And you said that Captain Hazeiwood put the engine on full
ahead he didn $t$ put -?
A I stand corrected Captann Hazelwnod has always maneuvered
7 the engine within - stopped and full ahead maneuvering is 56
(18) rpms and full ahead sea speed is considerably higher I
think
(19) It's somewhere around 90 s
( 0$)$ Q Okay Now when we went through this videotape?
1 11 A Yes sir
1 ) Q We did it pretty fast we covered an hour and 40 minutes I
(-3) think in a minute and a half
(74) A Hour ten minutes Ithank hour and a half
(25) $Q$ In this maneuvers you were shown the ship awinging right

Vol 142036
i) werk rulativuly viow in rual hifu I think you said that?
() AYes
(3) Q luthat right?
(a) AYes sir
(5) Q Now you listened to Captain Hazelwood stestimony did
you
(f) not about what he perceivid to bc his concerns at that

71 particular moment immediately after running aground?
(1) A Yes sir
9) Q Okay And you remember his saying that he was concerned
(10) based on what he was seeing about a one degree list port
(II) right?
(12) A Yes sir
(13) Q Do you remember him saying that?
(14) A Yes sir
"19) Q He was concerned about his ship sliding off the reef"
(16) A Yes sir
(17) Q Right he was concerned about the tide coming up?
(18) A Yes sir
(19) Q Lifting him off the reef do you remember all that?
(") A That's what he sand
(21) Q And do you remember him saying that what he wanted to do
(72) was try use the ship sengines and use the ships rudder
(2) Iraditionally to try to get the ship to attein a starboard
(24) attitude that is come to the right side instead of leaning to
(25) the left do you remember that?

A Yes sar
Q And do you remember him also saying to the chicl mate gut
ready to ballast down do you remember that?
A Yes, sur
Q And do you remember him telling the chief mate get ready
to drop the anchors because we re staying right here?
A That's what he sad
Q It was right in the middle of all this maneuvering that was going on do you remember?
A I don't thunk that was enturely clear from the testumony
If you can help me out I mean check it but I don't remember
that
Q I appreciate the invite It was right in the middle ot all
that maneuvering?

## A If that's what it says that's what at sard

Q And do you remember Captain Hazelwood and the chiel
mate
(17) saying that at some point after they wure maneuvering the
vessel she settled down to starboard?
A Yes, sir
Q And came down on the reef
A Yes, sir
Q And then evcrything was shut down do you remember all that?
(4) A Yes sar
( 51 Q Now and Itahe il you diso rumumbur the hastimonv of Chict

[^14]
## Vol 142041

```
Is that a farr reading?
A That's perfect
Q Okav So you don t know it the use ol the engines and the
rudder caused anv additional damage'
A As to that question I agree yes
Q But Mr Blank told you did he not that he had hired
another expert by the name of Mr Harrison who went to see the
vessel when it was in dry dock in San Diego right?
A Yes sir
Q And he told vou that Mr Harrison told his expert told him
that there was no additional damagu donu as a result of the usc
of the engine and rudder do you remember that'
A Just a couple thmes be told -
QMr Blank - let me start again I don t wanl to lose
this Mr Blank told you that Mr Harrison his other expert
who had been on the ship in San Dlego when the ship was up in
dry dock after the damage?
A Uh huh
Q And who had looked at the ship?
A Uh huh
Q Had told Mr Blank that there was no additional damage
caused by the use of the rudder and the engine isn t that
correct?
A Well at's correct but at the tume Mr Harnson saw it
there was }100\mathrm{ tons of steel
```


Vol 142042
Q You didn isee the ship at San Diego'
A I didn't see the ship
QMr Harrison did see the ship?
A Mr Harnson did see the ship
Q He expressid an opinion?
A But it's from his anspection That's what I wat to make
sure He expressed an opinon that the damage was done
Q An inspection that you didn I make?
A Absolutely not
Q Now you said that one of the othur things that might have
(1) happened by the use of the rudder and the engine was that
there
(i2) would be additional stresses put on there I m talking about
(13) your testimony here
(14) A I see yes
(1s) Q Do you remamber that?
(16) AYes sir
(17) Q Did you do any calculations to determine where the stresses
(18) were put on?
(19) A lt's ampossible to do The obstruction the shape of the
20) obstruction is unknown You don't know where the force
(-1) actually hook up
(22) $Q$ So it follows then that you don (know without doing any
(3) calculations whetherin fact any stresses were put on al all?
(24) A That's exactly why I say it might have put additional
(.s) stresses

Q But vou don (hnow)
A I know for sure that it might have done it I don't know exactly what stresses were put on the vessel
Q Now vou mentioned that the American Bureau of Shipping is
like I think you said the Federal Aviation Agency in that
the $y$ supervise ship building design and things like that?
A Very simphified version that's correct It has absolutely
no requirement that a ship has to be inspected by American
Bureau of Shipping while you are required to have arplanes
inspected by the FAA but the functioning is sumular yes
Q-Po-you know who Mr larossi is?
AYes sir
Q Isn the the president now of American Bureau of Shipping?
A Yes after he stopped working for Exxon he became the president of ABS
Q He used to be the president of Exxon Shipping right?
A Yes sir
MR CHALOS Mr Van Hemmen thank you very much I
have no further questions
THE COURT Redirect?
MR MONTAGUE 1 have no further questions Your
Honor Thank you
THE COURT Thank you sir You may step down
Before we move on I didn t pick up an exhibit number for your simulation

## Vol 142044

1) MR JAMIN 122 That has been pre admitued, on I
a) believe that was on the original list on May 9th Your Honor
2) at this time we have three additional exhibits to offer into

41 evidence we believe without objection $154 \quad 155$ and 1793
(Exhibit 1541793 offered)
MR LYNCH 155 is for identification only
MR JAMIN That scorrect Your Honor I would like
to confirm that the courts s records indicate that number 3 was
admitted Thure was some ambigutly in the transcript
THE COURT I have a note in my registry of exhibits
that says the second section admitted
MR JAMIN Two sections yes sir
THE COURT Two sections admitted
MR JAMIN What happens the Court indicated we will
be publishing that next week through an agreement with the
defendants thank you Your Honor
THE COURT Lel s get straight where we are on these
three exhibits 154 is admitted without objection
MR LYNCH Yıs sir
THE COURT 1793 is admitted without objection
MR LYNCH Right
(Exhibits 154 \& 1793 received)
THE COURT 155 is merely identified
MR LYNCH Identification only The same arrangement
that Mr O Neill has to some of the other exhibits

Vol 142045
MR JAMIN Thank you Your Honor
MR O NEILL The plaintiffs call as an adverse
witness and for cross examine Mr Dan Paul
THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE WITNESS I do
THE CLERK Please be seated Would you for the
record sur suate your full name your address and spell vour
last name
THE WITNESS My name is Daniel John Paul Junior
Paul 5414 Windy Lake Drive Kingwood Texas
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DANIEL JOHN PAUL JR
BYMR O NEILL
Q Sir we ve never met before my name is Brian O Neill and
I represent fisherman and Natives who are the plaintiffs in
this case against Exxon Corporation You work for Exxon
Shipping Company?
A I worked for the shipping company in that penod yes
Q Do you work for Exxon now?
A Yes, I do
Q What do you do now?
A I'm with Sea River Mantime now
Q Sea River Maritime is what Exxon Shipping Company is now called?
A That's correct, yes sar
(1) tell me and we 11 go ahead and dig them out for you Okay?
() A All right
(3) Q The first thing I want to talk about are two exhibits that
(4) should be in that stack up there One of them is plaintiffs
(s) exhibit number 1024 and the next one is plaintiffs exhibit
(6) number 154 And they both have to do with the rating of
(7) masters and thev looh so you can pull them out of the stack
(8) like this You got them?
(9) A Yes I have them
(10) Q And what is Exhibit 1047

A 104 is a 1987 rank list for ocean fleet officers
(12) Q And that includes masters or ship captains?
(13) A Yes, it does
(14) $Q$ And what is exhibit 154?
(1s) A It's a seriatum rating summary of Joseph Hazelwood
(16) Q And would it be fair to say that using these two documents
(17) one could put together these two Exxon documents one could
(18) put together where Captain Haculwood ranked vis a vis other
(19) masters in the fleet from 1981 to 19887 Is that a fair
(30) statement?
(21) A Yes it is
(2_) Q And we ve attempted to put these two documents in a graphic
(3) form So wh have nowheru to put il on the chart Idiot lines
(-4) there
(s) THE COURT Sew it you can make it work

## Vol 142046



## Vol 142049

you re human resources director?
A I wouldn't characternze it that way no
Q Have you testified in court rooms on occasion on behalf of Exxon Shipping Company or Exxon Corporation?
A Yes, I have
Q Do you know how many times?
A Twnce I belıeve
Q How about in arbitrations?
A I don't recall ever testifying in an arbitration no
Q Okay At some point in time - would it be fair to say
that if someone in management gets a lip that a master of a vessel is drinking aboard a company vessel that that is something that management cannot afford to take lighty? A That's a fatr statement yes
Q And if a fleet manager gets a rumor or a tip that one of his masters is drinking that il would be a prudent thing to do to investigate that rumor?
A That's correct
Q That s just common sense and sound business practice? A It's prudent yes ub huh
( ) Q And would "t be farr to say that you can thinh of no
(-) circumstances in your judgment that would excuse a fleet
(3) manager who has received some sort of rumor regarding one of his masters drinking you can think of a circumstance that would excuse him from conducting an investigation tan vou'

## Vol 142050

A I think that s what mv deposition said yes that s correct
Q But the matter of a ship master because of his
responsthility using alcohol is a surious topic inn (it)
Alt certanaly 15 ves
Q Now at some point in tume you became aware of the Graves report and $I \mathrm{~m}$ going to put it up here 1 assume that when you became aware of it it wasn $t$ in this heavy torm But at
some point in time you became aware of the Graves report?
A Yes I did
Q And about when was that?
A It was some tume the late spnng early summer of 1985
Q And you had learned that Captan Hazelwood had consumed alcohoi prior to the date of the Graves reporn'
A Yes
Q And when vou became aware of the Graves report and the substance of the Graves report that was in about 1986 is that about nght?
MR LYNCH I think he just answered the summer of 85
BYMR O NEILL
Q The summer of ${ }^{85}{ }^{7}$
A Yes
(4) Q In the summer of 85 when you became aware of the Graves
(25) report the thought crossed your mind with regard to Captain

## Vol 142052

, your own mind that Captain Hazelwood had been less than
, truthful with you in the past about his drinking is that a
fair statement?
A I said that in my deposition Idid
Q Okay
A Upon further reflection the time period was not clear
Q So at the time of your deposition you told the examiner my
partner Mr Nolting that vou formed the conclusion that Captain
Hazelwood had lied to you about drinking in the past and today
you have a different version?
A I have a different reflection of that because the tume penod that we're talking about here was not clear Q Would it be fatr to ay that when you read Mr Graves report that you knew that Captain Hazelwood had alluded your particuiar personal efforts to monitor him?
A It was not clear to me when he reported that he was drinking
Q At your deposition?
A He might have been drinking after the time I was mitonng
him he may have been dnnking before It wasn't clear Q I m going to ask one more question and I maing to move on to a new subject Would it be fair to say that at your deposition you testafied that Captain Hazelwood in your view when you saw the Graves report you formed the conclusion that
(2) Captain Hazelwood had alluded your prior efforts to monitor

Vol 142053
(1) him?

AYes
3) Q Thank you And let stalk for a minute about what documents the company had at about this point in time We know
(5) we have the Graves report You re aware of the existence of
6) the Graves report bucause you reviewed it in the summer
7) of 857

A I was in a meeting when it was discussed
9) $Q$ And we have what everybody refers to as the IDR which is
(10) Exhibit 20 - this version of it is Exhibit 208 and the IDR is o
(II) Exhibit 10 And you re aware of the existence of the IDR in
(12) the company files?
(13) MR LYNCH This question is as ot today?

MR O NEILL Yes
THE WITNESS I m sorry repeat the question BY MR O NEILL
Q You re aware of that existence back in 1985 at some point in the company files You didn $t$ know in 85 but now you know
it was in the company files?
A That's correct yes
Q Third time is the charm
A Got you
Q And there s one other document I want to ash you about and
l have it up there And it in the lorm ot a document that s
got a scal on the froni of il NTSB sual and it , Exhibil 745 3*

[^15]Vol 142055

## Q Do vou know what LOA means'

A Leave of absence
Q How about marilax do you know what that is?
A I have no idea
Q Oh the marital marital therapy 1 m sorry What a dummy
Jusus Okav marital therapy So would il bu tair to say that
this entry $4 / 16 / 85$ hospital through $4 / 29$ then leave of
absence group whatever the next word is martal therapy that was in the Exxon Shipping Company tiles in the benefits -
A That is my understanding
Q Did you actually have somebody pull this file out of the benefits department so you can send it over to the national sa fety transportation board?
A Yes
Q At the time we now have three documents that we ve seen from the records of the company we have the Graves report we
(17) have Exhibit 10 which is the IDR and we have this document
(18) that we just talked about With regard to Captain Hazeiwood
(19) and his treatment are these the onlv three documents you know
(20) of that come out of the company files with regard to his

Iratment?
A That's all l'm aware of yes
Q And at some point in time you did some kind of a search so
that you could respond to the National Transportation Safety
Board)

## Vol 142056

## A Yes

, Q And would it be tair to say that in doing your search you
turned up no documents in the Exxon Shipping Company files
or
for that tabe in any Exxon Corporation files that formally
rulleched a dutermination that hi was fit for duty?
AI beheve I was responding to a specific request here from
Admiral - or from Mr Birky
Q Let me ask another question then Do you know of any
documents that tormally reflut a fitness for duty determination?
A I'm not - I don't recall any no
Q And do you know any documunts that formally rutlect any
montoring of Captain Hazelwood after 19857
A The documents ${ }^{\prime}$
Q Yes sir
A J'm not aware of duy
$Q$ And'
AC in ladd to that statement '
QSurb
A Other than the general performance evaluations of any of our emplovees
Q So wh have the purtormanc ivaluations in the file too?
AYes
(4) Q And in 1986 thu yoar aticr truatmunt Captain Hazelwood s
purformancu was such that he was ranhed 39 out of 37 masturs

5-20-94
VOLUME 14
$-V_{\text {ol }} 14 \quad 2059$
XMAX(34)

## Vol 142057

(t) isn that correct? You want to check?
() $A \ln$ 1986 $^{\text {? }}$
${ }^{3}$ Q Yes sir
(4) A 35 of 37 that's correct
(5) $Q$ So with regard to the issue of what we have in the files
(6) that concern Captain Hazelwood drinking alcoholism
(7) treatment that core set of facts we ve covered the universe
of documents?
(9) A We may have
(10) Q That you know of?
(II) A The ones I'm aware of
(I) Q Thank you sir
(13) A Could I add another -
(14) Q Sure
(15) A - to my statement Other than the underiving
evaluations
(16) of course on Captann Hazelwood

1171 Q And the performance evaluations don t talk one way or the
(18) other about alcoholism recovery AA treatment return to
(19) fitness fitness for duty do they what?
10) MR CHALOS Your Honor I move to strihe anv
(1) reference to alcoholism There sbeen no records and ther s
( ) been no testimonv of that
(3) THE COURT I m nol going to strike the reference
(4) We ve had testimony on that subject and the jury will have to
( 5 ) decide what the issues are and what the answers are I will

## Vol 142058

decide what the issues are the jury will decide what the facts
(9) are
(9) THE WITNESS Could you repeat the question please

BY MR O NEILL
Q Other than the document the performancl evaiuations don 1
address this subject do thev?
A They address the emplovee's performance on the job and
part of his performance on the job in being able to perform
the
(9) jobin a fit manner
(in) $Q$ is there anything on anv ol the performancl cualuations
I) that says I talked to the capiain about his recovery
treatment problems with alcohol Ifollowed up with them about
any of those things is there anything in any of those
documents in that tone or tenor that you re aware of
A Not that I'm aware of
Q As the human resources manager of Exxon Shipping and
now
(17) what is -

A Sea River Maritame
Q - you have a risponsibility for issues dealing with the subject of alcohohism don I you?
A I'm not currently the human resources manager
Q When you were?
A When I was yes I had that responsibility
Q Had you realizad that people who have a problem with
alcohol in the workplace don $t$ always fit the stereotype of a
il) shid row humb or talling down drunk that sa correct
, valement'

1) A I'm aware of that statement
(s) $Q$ And indeed such sterotypes really don thelp our solutions
(s) with those problems a heck of a lot do they?
(6) A No they don't
(7) Q And your understanding of the disease of alcoholism is that
(8) vou re always recovering and you must abstain from alcohol use?
(9) A That's my understanding of alcoholsm yes
(10) F-Now would it be fatr to say that Exxon medical department
(11) in your view was responsible for determining whether Captain
(1) Hazelwood successfully completed his alcoholism
rehabilitation?
(13) A Yes we rely when there's a question of - from the
(14) benefits group If there's a question ahout the individual ", dactor's concern or jou know diagnosis then we refer that to
(16) the medical department and rely ultimately on their judgment
(17) Q And al no lime aflur Captain Ha/clwood left alcohol (18) rehabilitation did you as the human resources manager ask him
(19) whether he completed any aftercare program?
(20) A That's correct
(21) Q And as the human resources manager of Exxon Shipping
(22) Company and prior to the grounding you re not aware of anyon
in from Exxon Shipping Company who spoke to the medical dupartment
(4) about what typc of aftercare Captain Hacelwood should have?
(.SI A I'm not aware of any no

## Vol 142060

Q And at no time in fact at no time prior to the grounding
did you know whether Captain Hazelwood was in any kind of
aftercare program at all?
AYes
Q But you had heard at some point in time a rumor about AA
that he might have attended AA?

## A Imight have

Q So that was something you had in your mind prior to this
grounding that thin captain might he going to AA?
A I believe that's correct seah
Q And would it he fair to say that you never discussed with
Caplain Haclwood whuthur hu was attending AA on a regular basıs?
A No I never discussed that with him
Q In fact you never discussed the subject of AA with Captain
Hazelwood at all did you?
A No I dedn't
Q At some point in time after leaving alcohol rehabilitation
Captain Hazelwood was assigned to the Exxon Yorktown is that
correct statement?
A Yes
(?) $Q$ Was it your understanding that the fleet manager that
Captasn Hazelwood worked for was responsible for monitoring
performance and abstinence?
A For his performance and he montors the abstanence of

Vol 142061
(1) everybody that's workang on board a ship while they're working
(2) on the shap
(3) Q While they were he working on the ship?
(4) A Yes
(s) Q That sa qualification to the answer you gave in vour (6) deposition isn $t$ it?
(7) A I don't recall exactly what I said in the deposition
(8) Q Would you go to page 164 of your deposition transcript $G$
(9) to page 163 I m sorry sir Line 16 to line 20 and I II read
(10) the question and answer and if you could follow along and make
(1) sure that I get it right
(12) And the question was referring to Captain Hazelwood and the
(13) question was Were you aware of his montoring while he was
on
(14) the job
(15) Answer I was aware that the fleet manager that hi worked
(16) for was responsible for monitoring his pertormance and
(17) abstınence Do you set that?
(18) A Yes, I do
(19) Q Did I read the question and answur lariv'
(30) A You did
( It Q Ithink I said the same thing And a recovering alcoholic
(-) is supposed to be abstinent in your view?
(3) A The question was aware of his monitoring while he was 0n
(-4) the job, and that's the way I answered the question
(.S) $Q$ Would at be fair to say that you assume that the medical

## Vol 142062

department evaluated Joc Harelwood after his ruhabilitation program?
A I assumed that 1 think yes
Q And in fact you assumed thal was the normal procidurb didn 1 you?
A Where it was requested by our people it was yes
Q Now you were the human rusourcis managhr from 86 to 877
(8) A Yes during that period of tume from fall of 86

Q And Dwight Koops was in what position during that puriod of ume?
A 86 to '87'
11) QYus sir
(ib) A Dwight would have been the gulf co ist fleet manager it that
(I4) time
(15) Q And that $s$ where Captain Hacclwood was)
(16) A Yes I believe - I believe he was in that for part of 87
(17) Q And at that point in ume you were the dirctior of human
(18) resources for Exxon Shipping Company?
(19) A Human resources manager
(20) Q I heep on getting that wrong don II? Is that a promotion
( 11 or a demotion?
(2) A I havenoidea
(3) $Q$ And would it be fair to gay that you don (ruall iver
(24) discussing Captain Hazelwood salcohol ruhabilitation with
(.s) Dwight Koops?

5-20-94

A True
(1) Q And vou never discussed monitoring Captain Hazelwood s
3) drinking with Dwight Koops?
(4) A That's correct
(s) Q Did you ever tell Dwight Koops about your concerns about
6) the problems in monitoring Captain Hazelwood at all?
7) A Vot that I recall
(8) Q Did the Exxon Shipping Company officers who reassigned
9) Captain Hazelwood to the Exxon Valdez in 1987 consult with
you
-
(11) A Not that I recall, no
(12) $Q$ Do you recall if they consulted the medical department
3) about that reassignment?

## A I don't know

s) Q Now there was one instance in which you did get invoived in monitoring Captain Hazelwood?
1 A Yes uh huh
Q And that was at the 1988 fleet conference?
A Fleet officer confereace yes I was asked to montor him
Q And that was by Mr larossi and he ashed you and Harvey
Borgen to monitor him just at the fleet conference?
A We were attending the fleet conference together, yes
Q And did you tell Mr Borgen that you had had reservations about your abiliv to suctesstullv monitor Captain Hazelwood al or about this 1988 flect conterınce tumu' Do you understand

[^16]Vol 142065
Q Nobody asked you to do "?
A No
Q It was common sense because we had a potential problem here?
A I just felt that it would be prudent for me to do it
Q Because a drinking ship captain is a dangerous thing isn t that right?
A Can be
Q Now let me ask a little bit as the human resources
manager you never told anyone that Captain Hazelwood - up
to
'Ill the time of the grounding you never told Captann Hazelwood you never told anyone that Captain Hazeiwood had alluded your
(13) attempts to monitor his use of alcohol did you?
(14) A Well, I wasn't sure that he alluded my attempts
(1s) Q You had concerns didn I you?
(|6) A I had concerns
(17) Q And a fier Captain Hazelwood returned from alcohol
(18) rehabilitation you never asked him if he had resumed drinking
(19) did you?
( 0) A No Just observed when I could
1 'I Q You didn I go in and say Joe how s your recovery doing
(ワ) how \& AA how 8 aftercare have you resumed drinking you
didn t do that did you?
(4) A No I sure didn't
(s) Q And indeed you re not aware ol anyone from Exxon who asked
$\begin{array}{lll}\text { Vol } & 14 & 2067\end{array}$

## describe to us all what the memo discusses?

A It discussev the proposal to enhance the professionalism of
3) our masters by allowing them to receive compensation for using
(4) pulotage in certain cases
(5) Q So that if a master had a pilotage endorsement for Prince
(6) William Sound he could use that pilotage endorsement it
(7) would - the policy would encourage him to go out and get the
(8) pilotage endorsement that kind of thing were the ones that
alteady trad the pilotage endorsement would use at this would
compensate them for that and encourage others to go out and
do
i) this same kind of professional thing?

## A Yes

Q And indeed the company hy using or qualifying tis captains
as pilots could not only enhanct their professionalism but
could save some moner?
A In that period of time that's correct
Q And how much?
A It depended on the port and how often it was used
Q Let stalk about Valdez
A I don't have any specific recollection nght now
Q Thousands of dollars?
A It was a farrly you know several hundred thousand a year
(3) Ithonk Ora few hundred thousand
(4) $Q$ Would it be fair lo say that two of the disadvantages or
( s) limitations on the utilization of employee pilots were that it

## Vol 142068

Captasn Hazelwood after he got out of rehabilitation whether he had resumed drinking?
A I'm not aware of anyone no
Q Was turn around time one of the criteria used in evaluating masters?
A It was a verv minor part of an overall performance
evaluation of all of our officers that were anvoived in running

## a ship

Q That shecausc turn around lime is related io prolit isn it (t)

A It's one of many factors yes
Q Now I want to go cxhibil 1793 It samemo of yours or
appears to be a memo of yours dated 3/27/1980 on the subject
of the employee pilot proposa! Do you have that?
A Whach exhibit agan please?
Q It : 1793"
A Yes, I see that
Q And what is 17937
A It's a memorandum I wrote to Jam Swartz on an employee
(0) pllot proposal in 1980
( 11 Q And did it deal with among other things the subjuct of
(2) pilotage in Prince Willam Sound?
(23) A Yes, it did
(4) Q Put the first page of the exhibat up on the screen iwice
(2s) Now basically what does the memo discuss if you could

## Vol 142069

```
A That's on Exhibit 173'
QYes sir
A Yes I see that uh huh
Q Is it your understanding that this press release was issued
to the press the worid and that in fact was a statement made
in the press release?
A I don't have an understanding about that All I see is
that thus says it was a press release from shipping company
Q This is in evidencl and I want to ruad the next paragraph
and I want to ask you whether you agree with the paragraph or
nol I m}going to read the last paragraph and I m going to
say do you agree or do you not
We are all extremely disappotnted and outraged that an
officer in such a critical position would have jeopardized his
ship crew and the environment through such actions Our
policies in this area are very clear larossi explamed do you
see the statement?
A I see the statement
Q Do you agree with the statement or disagree with the
gtatement?
A I don't except the predicate to the statement so l can't
agree with the statement
MR O NEILL Nothing turthur Judge thanh vou
THE COURT Cross
MR LYNCH Your Honor at your conveniunce I d like
                                    |
```


## Vol 142072

## THECOURT DXI70 is admillad

1) (Exhibil DXI 70 rutulved)
(1) BYMR LYNCH
2) Q Now in connethon with carrying out the Exxon Shipping
h) Company saluly brudo what stups did Exxun Shipping

## Company

6) tahe to promote consciousncss of safuly within its fleet and ) among it speople?
(3) A The credo was just the next step we took in a long, long, (9) history of trying to promote safety in our fleet but with the (10) credo we did announce it to all the employees put it in our (11) company newspaper we visited ships and had meetings with
11 ) employets and encouraged them to discuss it in their safety (13) meetungs when it was first announced And then un 1987 we had
(14) a vafety mitiative as another step in trving to remforce our (1s) commatment to safety aud keep it foremust in people's mands
(16) $Q$ What was the safuly iniluative)
(17) A Safety intuative was a program we had We sent our senior
(18) manne advisor Bill Duncan to each of the ships in the fleet
(19) with another group of people from our company We stopped the
(ro) operation of each vessel for about a day
1 " Q When you sdy you stopped the opuration dropped the anchor
1 | thad il up somuwhers?
1.31 A Well the vessels were in port at a dock typically maybe at

1 \& 1 anchor and we vhut down the operation the cargo
operations
(2S) left just a safety watch on the bridge and brought the rest of
(1) the crew in to a lengthy meeting to describe the reinforcement
() of the safety program we have to remforce the safety credo
(3) and to implement some new programs that we were sponsoring
(4) under this safety initiative

Q Did - was there an ongoing effort to promote consciousniss
(h) and awareness of safely?
7) A Yes there was

Q And what form did that take' How do you heep pcople alert to the concept of satety?
(10) A We use every means avalable to us basically to try to do

111 that Our supervisors enforce the safe acts concept As they
a : assign work to people we have job hazard analysis steps that we
(13) take in the begioning of each significant job to walk through
(14) the safety aspects of potential problems We have a lof of

IIs postures and bulletin boards and themes of the month and
things
(16) Ike that we put on the ships and just to try to keep safety

117, foremost in everybody's mind
(18) Q And do you give awards and recognize to people for safety
(14) performance?
(0) A Yes we do
i) Q And let me direct your attention to what I believe is

1 1 marked as DX9118 This is a Mr Murtiashaw tells me a montage
(3) of photos of awards issued to various ships and people Is
( 4) that correct sir?
(is) A That's correct yeah

[^17]shipping companv receives for participation in safety programs
( ) and for safety excellence
(3) Q And are those issued by outside agencies or by Exxon
(A) Shipping Company?
(s) A These are outside agencies Two of them are jointly issued
each year awarded each year by the Amencan Instatute of
Merchant Shspping and the National Safety Counsel
Q What award is that?
A-The-Jones Devlyn award which is on the left hand - top
left hand side
Q These awards here?
AYes
(13) Q What are those for?
(14) A Those are awarded to a vessel for having no dusabling
(Is) injuries for a penod of etther one two four or five years
(16) we have one ship there that shows I think didn't have a
(I7) disabling injury for a period of five years
(181 Q And how does Exxon Shipping performance for the Jones

(20) A Anv shipping company that wants to participate in that
( 11 program can nominate vessels for it and we typically bring
a
(2) large majonty of those awards back to our fleet, a lerge
(.3) percentage of the ones that are awarded
(74) MR LYNCH Offer 9117 Your Honor
(.S) (Exhibı 9117 offered)

## Vol 142076

MR O NEILL No objection
THECOURT Admuted
(Exhibil 9117 reculved)
MR LYNCH If this is a good time I could stop here
THE COURT We II be in recess for 15 minutes and
counsel standby for a minute take up the matter We II break
at this time
THE COURT Does this need to be on the record for
off
1101 MR LYNCH No Your Honor
\|ll THE COURT We re off the record

1. (Jury out at 1200 p m )
" ${ }^{1}$ (Recess at 1200 pm )
(14) (Jury in at 1217 pm )
usi MR LYNCH May I proceed Your Honor
(16) THE COURT You may
(17) BYMR LYNCH
(18) QMr Paul you said that when you were made I hope I get it
(19) right manager of human resources in 1986 was it?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q That your responsibility was for manning or seeing that
(22) Exxon Shipping ocean vessels had proper crews is that correct?
C31 A That's correct ves
(24) Q And how did Exxon Shipping go about doing that?
ras A We have uninke i lot of companies in our undustry who draw

## Vol $14 \quad 2077$

their employees out of umion hauls by senionty we bave the benefit of having the company employees running our ships owe
3) can really hand pick each one of them and tran them and put (4) them on the same vessels and have much better contanuty and
therefore we thonk a safer operation
Q So other U S flagships don thave permanent full tume employees on their crews?
A Most compones in the industry have contracts with , natuonal
umons that represent most of the employees When they when a
(0) company needs a seafarer they go to the umon hall and the umon assigns an employee to fill thear billet
Q What s the advantage of Exxon Shipping of having full tume
permanent employees as opposed to going to an union hall?
A I think we mantan better quality control over our people
that way we con hand pick them We can select mantume
academies We can license people in independent union they're
17) still company employees and we can pick them each one individually
We can train the people on uur programs and policies and
best in training them because we know that thev're here for a
| I/ career basically We're hingig the employes for a career and
1 we can assign them to the same vessels so thes c in fet to kbow
(.3) the vessel get to know each other is a team ind we thank that
(-4) provides us a better operation

policy to keep the same people on the same ships on a rugular basis?
A Yes particularly the officers and on few key people
Q To keep the same crews together generally speaking from trip to trip?
A Yes We don't have a blue teom and a gold team they all get off at once They stagger their rotations but the same people share the same assignment on a ship
Q Now for deck officers - first of all what is a debh
officer could you just char that up tor the reword'
A A deck officer is a master a chef mate vecoud mute or
third mate and they're responsible for the uavization of the
vessel and for cargo handling
Q What other kind of officer is there'
A There's an engineering officer and there are four of them or five of them on a shap, depending on the design Thev're
responsible for the propulsion system on the ship
Q The deck officers are they supposid to work in the propulsion area?
A No they can't by Coast Guard regulations
(1) Q The deck officurs may only bu invoivad in duch dutius)
( ) A Deck and cargu
(3) Q And the engincuring officurs may also have propulvon

1 is dullus?
i 31 A Propulsion and cargo Iher ( in I in ivigate the vhip
(") Q There s been good evidence that training - do you - let

1) me ash vou to look at Exhibil 3439 At my request did you pull
(3) together a hist of some training courses that Exxon provided to
(4) its people?
(s) A Yes I did
(6) Q And are these courses that werc provided by Exxon itself (7) inhouse?
(8) A Some of these were inhouse most of the ones on thes page,
(9) though, are from third party providers other companes that
provide these services
(11) Q Some school or some other agency to provide teaching?
(12) AYes
(13) MR LYNCH I will offer 3439
(14) (Exhibit 3439 offered)
(IS) MR O NEILL No objection
(16) THE COURT Defendants 3439 is admitted
(17) (Exhibul 3439 received)
(18) BY MR LYNCH
(19) Q Now with reference to the people you were talking about
( ${ }^{10}$ ) the full time employees who are aboard ships is there
(21) something called industrial due process in the human
resources
(?) field?
('3) A Yes there 25
( 4) Q Could you explain for the jury what you mean by that
(is) phrase?

## Vol 142080

A It provides a framework legal framework under which we must deal with our employees Deal with things hke respecting
(3) their rights of privacy certan labor laws that dictate how we ) must handle people's disputes or handicap laws there's a lot
of laws we have to abide by and under that framework
Q Spectically - is it manager of human resources or human resourcus managemunt'
A Whichever is easier for you to say
Q Did you have to tahe into actount the rehabilitation act in
your stalting ot Exxon Shipping Company ships?
AYes wedid
Q And how did that act aftect truatment of plople who had a
history of alcohol truatmunt?
A Well it required vou not to discriminate agoinst those
people and to keep their problems confidential
Q Were people in that category classificd as handicap peopie?
A They were classified as that handicap
Q Was Exxon Shipping Company ruquirud to make jobs availablu
us, to them of they were up to doing those jobs?
rol A Yes if thev were utherwise qualified
1 11 Q Wav that a ldulor that dlluclud the way you implemented as , human resourccs manager the operation of the manning of the
nubl overall"
A Yes it is
Q What wher restrictions or what other efficts did

Vol 14208
Industrial due process have on how Exxon Shipping could man and
operate its fleets?
A Well there were privacy rules that we had to abide bv that
basically limited how much information we could know about an
individual
Q And did those rules also affect what vou - what vou could use as a basis for joh action?
A Other rules not the privacy rules but nther rules did I thank yes
Q Mr O Neill for example asked you whether checking people
went to AA programs is that something that an employee is
typically entutled to take into account in a job related
arrangement?
A No
Q Now with reference to the deck complement what types of tankers did Exxon Shipping operate'
A We operate both crude and product tankers
Q Now could you explain the difference between those two'
A A product tanker is a tanker that c irmes refined products or intermediate feed stocks or chemicals like gasoline heating onl jet fuel from refinenes typically to marketing terminals where they're further distributed to the customer Q And a crude tanker carried only crude oll?
A Instead of having several grades of cargo on a ship you
would typically oniy have one grade Valdez

```
Vol 142082
Q And that is?
A That's crude oal
Q Exxon Valder was a srude oll antanker?
A That's correct yes
Q In connection with your West Coast fleet manager
```

cxperience
and your experience as manager of human resources did you
become acquainted with the way that companies other than Exxon
(4) Shipping staff those ships as tar as deck officurs whre
concerned?
A Yes I did
Q And what was the industry standard staff arrangement for a crude oll tanker?
A A master and three mates
Q And what did Exxon Shipping use?
A A master and three mates
Q Now were there statistics avalable to you published by
(17) the government relating to the shipments that call at Valdez
(18) Alaska?
(19) A Yes there are
(0) Q And at my request did you examine those statustics as they
( 1 ) relate to the year 1988?
( 1 ) A Yes, I did
(3) Q And did you determine from those government sources what
(4) the staffing was of the typical crude oif tanker calling at
(rs) Valdez Alaska?

AI did yes
MR LYNCH I belteve you have no objection but let
me know you Exhibit 343 1B as in baker
(Exhibit 3431B offered)
MR O NEILL Noobjection
MR LYNCH Ill offerit Your Honor
THE COURT 3431 B is admitted
(Exhibit 3431B received)
BYMR LYNCH
Q Could you just ixplain briefly what this char illusirates?
AHes it states in 1988 there were 55 tankers that were
called at Valdez and based on the govemment reports $\mathbf{5 0}$ of
those tankers were manned with master and three mates d five
41 of them were manned with a master and four mates
Q So the names of the various ships that had the three mate
and master complements are in the blue?
A That'scorrect
Q And the five ships that had four mates in addition to a
master in red is that correbt?
A That's correct
1 Q Wers you acquainted with both of the job capacities I
referenced with a Coast Guard regulation that is commonly
called the six hour rule?
A) Yes I am
(7s) $Q$ And that rule requires that there be six hours off duty

Vol 142084
lime for mates who are going to assume a watch at the time of leaving port?

## A That's correct six hours

Q To your knowledge did Exxon Shipping Company take any
steps to assure that its shipments and its crews were in
compliance with that regulation?
A Yes we did
Q What actions did Exxon Shipping take to assure compliance with that regulation?
A We had a number of discussions with our semor officers
the fleet at these officer conferences that I mentuoned
earlier $A$ number of those conferences we talled about sux hour rule and other ruies that the masters must comply with
(14) We told them that it was their responsibulity for assuring
that
(15) the six hour rule was complied with as any other law that
they're supposed to be operating under We also did an
analysis with regard to the ability of our company to meet
the
(18) six hour requirements at Valdez

Q Did you have any policy for should a case antse where for
some rasan the normal complement wasn table to comply
with
(21) the six hour rule?
(22) A There was a lot of nexibility in the master's discretion
(3) to rearrange the work schedule of the people or to stop the
ship at the dock or to do whatever he thanks is prudent to
comply with the law

Vol 142085
Q What was vour understanding ot how a - the otf duty lime was to be calculated? How did one determine whether you were
(3) on or off duty for purposes of that statute as you understood (4) $\mathbf{I t}^{7}$
(s) A If work was assigned to an individual to do during that period of tume, it was considered to be work
Q What if an individual had the discretion eithur to do it in
that ume or some other different ume and chose to do it that time?
A Then that would not be considered as duty thme
Q Beyond the question of application of the six hour rule did you as manager of human resources in Exxon Shipping
Company evaluate whether the - whether fatigue overworked
tiredness was a problem ruturning ships on the three mate -
one captain master three mate complement for crude oil traffic?
A Yes, I did
Q And what steps did you take to evaluate that question?
A We did a study in 1984 on work load redistribution within the officer group We also talked a goud bit through our operations managers as they visited vensels and talked to the
1 11 masters and other officers about fatague levels and work load
1-2) on the vessel for officers and unlicensed for that mater and
('3) made it clear that we expected the senior officers on the
(4) vessel by the master to insure that the people were not
(2s) fatugued when they were donng their job

## Vol 142086

Q Ithank you mantooned tlubl olficers cunicrancts Could you kll the jury what a lluct offler onfcrant was how it was done?
A Yes Heet officer conference is an - it's a conference that we typically held every year to invite all of all of our semor officers into the fleet into Houston and to meet for about a week wath our managemeat group and we covered d broad
range of topics in those neetings bime of thein were some
of the topics were to - to review with the officers the
overall state of the businesy other purposeb were to
introduce
, then to new policies and rules that we were mapiencintint. and to
describe to them what their roles were as supervivori on the
(13) ship We also provided traning of them on how to carry out those dutues and to provide an opportuaty for them to talk about professional topics that they were interested in as semor We asked for their mput on what that agenda would be
(17) Q Professional topics what are you talking about?
(8) A We talked about things ranging from fatigue ur how to run
19) an engine room to typically - we had our admiralty attornev
(20) come out and talk to them about navigation ind bring
-I) organization issues and law, and how thes should conuply with

1 | them
(23) Q Now you mentioned a study that vou did to balance the work
(4) load What did that study indicate to you?
is) A The study indicated to us that the work hours that our
(1) officers were working were not unreasonable and gave us no
( ) concern about fatugue It also indicated however that when
(3) our officers were ummediately removed from rested status in the
(4) early '80s that there was some imbalance in the work load
(s) between the engine department the deck department and between
(6) some of the semor officer responsibulities and the jumor officer responsiblinties
(8) Q And what was done about that imbalance?
(9) A We took steps to redistrict the work load as best we could
(10) given the Coast Guard restrictions on who can do what on a
(11) ship, and tried to balance out the work load more evenly to
(1) assist in the fatigue situation
(131 Q Now let s just tall about the working conditions aboard
(14) these tankers and particularly a tanhtr lihe the Exxon
(15) Valdez Obviously the people who worked there didn thave
any
(16) tommutc time
117) A Rıght
(18) Q What did they have to do about lood?
(19) A Theur food was prepared by the steward department on board
(20) the ship
(21) Q There was some suggestion by another witness that if you
(ㄱ) came off watch or at a curtain tume of the day you had to bc
(23) there at a certain time to eat meals is that a true statement?
(4) A Well the formai meals are served at certan tumes of the
( ${ }^{1}$ day but there, food available throughout the aight for

Vol 142088
II anybody that wants it
() Q And we say lood avaliable Suppose I camb off watch or
(3) didn I want to go to dinner at the prescribed time What kind
(d) ot an arrangement could 1 make to cat at whatever time suits
(5) me ?
6) A We have what we call a nught lunch and there's food
(7) prepared in the refngerator or i clull box and you can get
the
ri tood there We have mucruwaves to heat it up if you want
(9) It s very broad variety of food on board
(10) Q What aboul housecilaning?
(il) A Housecleaning is done by the steward department
(1) Q Now Irom the studies that you did did that indicate that
(13) the lypical mate or the typical maslur worksd in excess of
(14) wisht hours a day when on duly
(IS) A Typicallv they did yes
(16) Q What was the normal tour of duty?
(17) A About $\mathbf{6 0}$ days on the ship
(18) Q And how was that decided7 In other words if at went more
(19) than 60 or less than 60 what factors accounted for whether
(20) someone would stay on the ship less than or more than 60
days)
(1) A Well there are a number of factors Our sentor officers
( ) in particular since they were pared up and shared a job,
(-7) because of the contuguity that I uentioned earher we're
free
( i) to work with counterparts within reasonable limits Other
is) things that were affected work xhedule would be whether the

5-20-94
ship was in port or not Obviously you can tget off at sea even though 60 davs are up
Q There s been a suggestion in 1985 in the gulf coast when
Captain Hazeiwood returned to the Exxon Yorkiown that there was
a shortage of masturs and a shortage ol captains Have vou
looked into that question ${ }^{2}$
A Yes I have
Q And at that timu was there a shortag of captans avalablc to Exxon?
A From the study I did I a iw no reason to suspect that at all
Q And by that vou man that il vomehodv il nomuhody wants
cut their tour short or limit themselves to 60 davs that there
was a captain available to assign?
AYes
Q Now what would be you sard that you know people might espectally the two aiternating captains mught change their schedules what hinds of things would lead to that in your experience?
A Sometames they wanted to alternate holadays at home with
( I) therr family and they would rotate adjust therr schedule
One
' ) person could be home at Christmas morning or the next
vear
c is someone had a family event a birth or birthdav that they wanted to go to a number of thangs like that
s) Q Suppose somebody for whatuer stayed longer that 60

[^18], A That's correct

1) Q And then graduallv that changed?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q Ohay Was that done so you could figure out some way to
is: get overtime out of thesc people without paying for it?
a A Vo
74 Q What was the reavon tor going to a straight salary system?
A Provide d framework where the officers could feel they
1 could work more efficiently and he rewarded for their work
(10) Q Under the previouslv existing system how did the hourly
, rategetset?
I । A The houriv rate was set hased on our survey of competition
(13) and when they were represented then we guaranteed that rate
(14) with their umion
(1s) THE COURT Mr Lynch
(16) MR LYNCH Yes sir
un THE COURT There sanaturalization ceremony going on
(18) next door and I could see everybody $s$ wondering what they re
(is) hearing that and it was distracting a little bit It won I
${ }^{10}$, last the singing won $t$ last hut a few minutus and I think you
I' can probably tune il out now that you know what it is
MR LYNCH Ididn ilvenhearit Your Honor
THE COURT You were husy listening
MR LYNCH I saw vou smiling and I thought mavbe it
was my qucstion

## Vol 142092

[^19]the

Vol 142093
Q How did you differentate between people?
A Well we evaluated their performance and then we force rank the people on a particular classification like the masters list or the mate one of the mate list, and we put the
top performers, the guys that did the best job in our Judgment
at the top of the lust and we ranked them down to the person that made the least contribution or did the poorest job
Q When you say forced ranking thure could be no lles?
A We forced ourselves to put one person behnd another
Q Somebody had to be onl?
A Somebody had to be one
Q And somebody had to be ien'
A That's correct
Q So if you had Captain Cook and Captain Nclson and all the greateat mariners in the world somebody would have to end up as ten?
A Somebody would have to end up as ten
Q Even if Captain Hazelwood was in that group?
A Even if Hazelwood was there, that's right, no matter how good they were somebody had to be at the bottom of the
lest
(1) Q In making up that list what tactors did you tahe into
(r) account?
(23) A Well we took into account a broad range of factors but (24) uncluding their professional skills their ability to manage
(2S)

[^20]you from
lime to tume to give Captain Hazelwood a shore based job like port captain or something of that kind?
A Proposals were made yes
Q And what was the basis for making those proposals as you understand them?
A They were to try to give Joe a closer view of the shoreside
management challenges in the organization so that he could take
(8) those back to the shup and be a better overall manager
(9) Q You were hoping he d catch the corporate scent and follow that aroma off
A We helped make him a corporate guy, that's right
Q And what was - Captain Hazelwood worked directly for you
for a while is that right?
A Yes, he did
Q What was your impression of Captain Hazelwood s interest in
having that chance to come ashore and spend more of his tume
paperwork?
A I'd say it was pretty much shm to none from has point of view
Q Let s if I may Just try to verify what the arrangements
were with the port captain If Captain Hazelwood had come
ashore to be a port captain would he work 60 days off and then
60 days ón rather and then hav 60 days ofl 10 go home?
A No our shoreside organization is much like you know I'd
lake to sdy a nige to five job but it's a lot more than that

## Vol 142096

But it is typically a five six dav a week job We have our offices in Houston and Benicia Califorma just outside of San
(3) Francisco
(4) Q Or Baton Rozut or whatuvar zull boasi'
i9) A Were in Baytowit which is a suburb of Ilouston for somebudy
(6) to take that kind of a job they would bave to and they're
7) typically two to three vear jobs they would bave to eather
8) relocate their family to Houston or San Francisco area or
come
(9) by themselves without their family
(10) $Q$ By the way over the span of time that we re talking about
III) was that a continuing negative tactor in Captain Hazelwood s
(12) ranking under the forced ranking was il consistintily a question
(13) of his paperwork that was causing ranking to be pulled down?
(14) AYes
(is) QI noll there salairly figniticant jump in Captain
Ha/clwood a ranking holweun 1986 and 1987 as indicated on
this
(17) thart Whre you a part of the process that lad to the forced

81 ranking of the masters)
(9) A No At that tume I did not know the masters' performance well enough to contribute
(i) Q And ware you involvad in reviewing the torced ranking
(22) procuss at the - al the end of the day in selting up the
(7) salary systum?
(24) AYes
fsi Q And was il your understanding and improssion that Captan

Vol 142097

1) Hazelwood s job performance was improving as indicated by the

1 relativelv higher ranking in 19877
3) A It was improving but as I indicated earher that last ${ }^{4}$ ) Ine on the chart is an error It 5 really 24 out of 1 think (s) we said 29 So there was some amprovement but not as much
(s) indicated there
7) Q But he had gone from bastally being second to last on the
8) list he moved quite a way up the list in the meantime is that
(9) correct?

A That's correct
Q And that reflected that even his paperwork was gelting better is that right?
A Yes
Q Enough you indicated that you - since we re on this
topic that during that point in lume you had kept an eye on
Captain Hazelwood when vou had occasion to see him at fleet
officer conferences'
A Yes
Q When you kept an teve on him what wer vou looking tor'
A I was seeng if he showed any signs of having been drinking
Q And where - when he showed any signs of having been
drinking were there things going on at the ship officers
conference that gave you a chance to watch for that?
1 A Yes there were We had cocktall hour in the evening

## Vol 142098

(1) Occasionally after one of the sessions vou can watch for people

1) coming in late see how attentive they are in the morning ind
i) thangs like that
2) Q Okay So you were watching for any signs that indicated to
(s) you that Capiain Haselwood might be drinking period is that (6) correct?

AYes
Q And what did you observe'
A I dsdn't observe any signs at all
Q In the public ousasions when you had cochlails you did offer cocktals is that correct?
A Yes we did
Q As I understand it the people attending this conference
were the senior officers?
A Yes
Q So at least a high percintage of them were themselves
masters?
A Anywherefrom a half to a fourth of them yes
Q If you looked around you would see a number of drinking captains is that correct?
A We would
Q Were you harricd when you saw that?
A No
Q Did you think I meeing a drinking captain that sa
dangerous thing?

A No thev weren't working they weren't on the bridge of a ship
Q When Mr O Neill asked vou if Il was a dangerous thing do
you thinh it s dangurous to force a person who has the job of
tanhur captain to drink soctallv?
A V
Q Al thatc conterances Exxon sponsored serving drinks to
masters in that corrul)
$A$ Yes
Q is it unusual tor people in the seagoing trades to drink
soematly or al dinner?
A No it's not
Q At other times when the rest of us exercise that privilege? A No it's not
Q Now you didn tactually see the so called - could I see
PXIO please I mgoing to try this once I mgoing to try this then when I fall you can - you didn tactually see the IDR
which has been marked as PX10 You see these numbers? A Yes I do see them
10) Q Do thev mean anything to vou?
( \| A Not a thing
1 ) Q Does DSM Ill mananything to you'
(.3) A No
(4) Q You re not a doctor are you?
(rs) ANo

## Vol 142100

Q You gave some testimony I think about what a recovering
alcoholic can $t$ do Do you have any training on what a
recovering alcoholic can do?
A No 1 don't know
Q Would it be fair to say that you were repeating what you ve
heard whether it $s$ valid or invalid?
A That's true true
Q And you don thave any information to indicate that Captain
Hazelwood is an alcoholic do you?
A No I don't
Q Recovering or otherwise right?
A No that's true
Q Would you have any reason to dispute Dr Vallury a
diagnosis of Captain Hazelwood?
A No
(16) Q Now you indicated Ithink that you had - at your
(17) deposition you had some concern you felt some concern that
at
(18) a prior time when you werc monitoring Captain Hazelwood
he d
(19) evaded your monitoring do you remember that line of
(20) questioning from Mr O Neill?
(21) A Yes I remember that
(_) Q Now tirst of all the prior time would have been the 1980
(?) tume frame?
(4) A'81 and 82 yeq
( 1 Q That s when you were west coast feet manager?
(i) A That's correct
(1) Q At that ume Captain Hasclwood suilud undur your dirent
(3) supervision?
(4) A That's correct
(5) $Q$ And as his direct supervisor you whre rusponsitil tor
(6) monutoring his pertormance)
(7) AYes
(8) Q You monitored him as you would other employees to assure
(9) that he was not violating company policy about drinking?
(10) A That's nght
(11) Q Is that a true statement?
(12) A That's true
(13) Q And on one occasion you had - you specifically ashed
(14) Captain Hazelwood about a rumor that he might have been
(IS) drinking and he told you he had not been?
(16) A That's nght
(17) Q Now then at your deposition when you were shown the
(18) Graves report you saw that he had madu a statcmint to
(19) Mr Graves that at some unspecifitd prior lime hi had come
(-0) back to the ship drunh or he might have had a drinh aboard the
(21) ship is that right?
(22) A That's true
(23) Q Could you explain to the jury what you masint by saving you
(24) were concerned that he d evaded vour monitoring?
( $\mathrm{S}, \mathrm{l}$ A If the drinking that he had talked about to Graves

## Vol 142102

II occurred dunng the period of time that I was monitonng
hum,
(2) then you know clearly be would not have been truthful with
(3) me If at occurred after that time penod then he could have
(4) been truthful with me at the time and still have had a drink
(s) afterwards
(6) $Q$ So at the time of the deposition vou what assumed that
(7) Graves was referring to whilc he was worhing on the what coast
) under your supervision?
A I didn't thank about the taming well enough to aniwer that question accurately
Q But you answered that you wart concurnud in that correct?
A I would have been concerned yes
Q And your concern was that comment rufurrud to a tumL
working direcily for you?
AYes
Q And during that time you did exactly what you told Mr

1) O Neill you thoughi a purson supervising Capiain Harclwood
should do?
A That's correct
(L) Q You monitored him?
2) A Rıght
(9) Q You heard any indication that he was violating vour altohol
(3) rules you cheched into it"
(-4) A That's correct
(.S) Q And on one occasion you did?

A Yes
Q Could you looh at - this is going bach to this forced
ranking thing But could you looh at Plaintiff's Exhibit 154
tor a second
A Okay
Q Mr Chalos reminds me that has one further year on th than
I see on this chart I believe If I m reading this chart
This chart ends in 19877
A That's correct
Q Does PXIS4 have a column for 1988 ?
A Yes, it does
Q What does that show'
A It shows he was 23 of $\mathbf{3 8} \mathrm{m} 1988$
Q Okav So this was a larger number?
A Right
Q And this was a larger number so he had gone up another
notch in 1988?
A That's correct
Q Ona longer team?
A Two notches nght
Q Now just to be clear from your experience with the quality of people at Exxon Shipping Company what do you think
(23) ot the guy who s 37 of 37 is he a bad captain?
( 41 A No If he was bad he wouldn't be there
(25) $Q$ So everybodv on that chart is in vour judgminl a well
(1) qualified seaman?
(2) AYes
(3) Q Bui Captain Hazelwood over the period between 1986 and
(4) 1988 was making constant improvemunt in his job
performance?
(s) A Yes he was

Q Id like to ash vou if you would to take a look at a page
out of DX4471 I ll just put it on this so callud Elmo This
is the form that -1 apologict tor the lugibility of this -
you want a copy Mr Paul?
(10) A I'm going to need some help
(II) Q Well I m not sure I can?
(1) A This isn't a whole lot better
(13) Q I m not sure I wan offer you much help on that 1 wanted
(14) to ask you - this is the form that was used for ranking mates
(151 is that torrect?
(16) A Evaluating mates this was input to that process
(17) Q This was in faci the particular form that was used with
(18) Greg Cousins is that right?
(19) A Yes it is
(0) Q And I want to whil wh cantry to gut to the point where
(1) wh can - I m loohing tor - the ilcm I m loohing for I don $t$

1 : find hure Excuse mb ont stcond
(i) MR LYNCH Your Honor I m going to ash Mr Justice
(n+1 loget muadiffurent documint In the meantime I m on to
s) another subject I got Mr Justice s name in the record so he

## Vol 142105

1 can send a transcript home to his wife and tamily Flivn Justuce
BY MR LYNCH
Q Let sgo to the Exxon drug and alcohol policy You told Mr O Neill you were responsible for administering that policy is that correct?
A Yes when I was human resources manager
Q I d like to show you Exhibil 3619 I II bring you a copy
If I may Your Honor and put a copy on the -
MR LYNCH 111 offer 3619
(Exhibil 3619 offered)
MR O NEILL No objection
THE COURT That s defendant 3619?
MR LYNCH Yes Your Honor
(Exhibit 3619 received)
BYMR LYNCH
Q First of all Mr Paul could you tell the jury just basically what this document is and why as you undersiand it was written?
A It's a revision to our 1984 alcoholism pohcy
Q And why what was the occasion of making that revision?
A There were a couple reasons for it One was we wanted to

1) expand the scope of the Exxon policy to inctude drugs as a I treatment allness and under the policy we wanted to formally
1.51 introduce a search program unannounced search program that we
(1) concept"
, A That's correct
(3) $Q$ In other words you found someone in possession of alcohol
2) or drugs you told them they were fired demoted They said we
(G) disagree with you?

A That's correct
Q Basically you didn thave a right to search us?
A They were disputing at that tume on the basis that we had not notufied them that we were going to search and what the consequences would be
Qokar And so what happuned?
A Once the items finally got to arbitration which is the last step in the dispute process the arbitrator ruled in the favor of the employee and said in fact we had not given due notice
(15) Q Okay So this letter was designed to cure that so that
(16) from then on nobody could say they hadn $\mathbf{t}$ gotten notices is
(17) that correct?
(18) A That's true
(19) Q And otherwise in other respecis did it continue the policy
that it had as existed before?
() A Yes it did

Q I wonder if you would read the first paragraph for the
record down to the sub part two there
A The potential danger to employees and facilties resultung
from the use of drigs or alcohol in the workplace has become a

## Vol 142106

had in place on our vessels since 1982 but had not formally notufied employees that we were doang that
Q Now let me take that one step at a time You had an unannounced search program Could you tell the jury what that was?
A Yes We from time to time would show up unannounced to 9
ship in port and we would bring investigators with us and dog
team and we would search the vessel for drugs or alcohol and we
would search without touching anvbody we would search the
individuals as well and their procession
Q So this began in 19827
A Yes it did
Q And this was random 1 mean did you have -
A They were unannounced They would pick a shap for a vanety of reasons and go unannounced
Q As a result of this search program did you catch anybody in possession of items that were contrary to Exxon policy?
A We did on a few occasions yes
Q And did you taku action when you caught those individuals?
A Yes we did
Q Okay And what happened when you took those actuons?
(2) A The individuals if they were unlicensed employees would
(י3) typically dispute the action we took and carry it forward
(24) through their union
(.s) $Q$ And I mean this is part of the industrial due prociss

Vol 142108
(1) major concern of companes Exxon Corporation uncluding Fxxon
( ) Shuppinf Company is one of the many employers that have
(3) programs to deal with this potental problem Within the
(4) shipping company thus program has twa basic concepts One
(5) company sponsored medical support available on a confidentual
(6) basis for individuals who request help in combating drug or (7) alcohol dependency And two workplace gudelenes which permit
(8) on the job - prohibrt excuse me workplace guidelines which
(9) prohibit on the job possession or use of drugs or alcohol
(10) Q Maybe that s where your notuce problem came up You said
(III permit and you meant prohibit The prohibition that you had on
(1) the job possession of alcohol and drugs how fardid that go

113 back?
(14) A Oh it went back well before I ever jonned the shipping
(1s) company
(16) Q Was there any doubt about the fact that all the employees (17) had been notified of that fact?
(18) A No doubt at all
(19) Q Let me show you Exhibit 9113 ask you if you can identify
(20) that for the record?
(21) A Yes Ican
(22) $Q$ What is it?
(23) A It's a list of posted offenses that are on each of the (24) shaps
(25) MR LYNCH Offer 9113 Your Honor that s defendants

Vol $14 \quad 2109$
(Exhibil 9113 offered)
MR O NEILL No objetion
THE COURT Defendants 9113 is admutted
(Exhibit 9113 received)
BY MR LYNCH
Q And would you read item 14 of DX9113?
A Introduction, possession or use on the property of the
company of intoxicating hquors or habit forming drugs Q Is it prohibited?
A It is an offense for which members of the unicensed personnel may be discharged without further notuce
Q Did this prohibition also apply to olficurs and matcs)
A Yes it did
Q That prohibition that Exxon had was that something that was required by law by the Coast Guard
A No thus was a company policy
Q Was it something that was uniform in other U S flag
competitors of Exxon Shipping Company?
A No, we were the exceptuon
Q When you say that what do you mean?
A Most other companies allowed social dnaking on board
their

- ships
(23) Q How long had that bean Exxon Shipping companics policy'
(.4) A Again for as long ds I call reumember
(2s) Q 1 gather from somi of the lustimonv wh hiard this morning


## Vol 142110

that every once in a while someone musi have gollun away with
() sneaking a bottle or some buer aboard the ship When you were
13) rusponsible for supurvising Exxin Shipping Company ships what
(4) did you do to try to mahe that rulc slich)

A Well we as part of a supervisurn normal job responsibilitues be $s$ always alert to the fituebs of the people that he supervises to see if they reable to do the job and do it safely So we had that ongoing supervisory oversight We also visited the shaps and as 1 mentioned earlier we had this unannounced search program underway Q How often did those ships come into port' How often did the chance -
A It varied The Valdez traders di we called them call them go to Calsforaia or back al Califorma about every two weeks a round trip
Q And did you have other people who wunt out tor other
 $\operatorname{sig} n^{7}$
A Yes
QThat alcohol was aboard the ship'
A Yes
22] $Q$ What kind of contact would you have with a ship in that 23) connection?
(s) port engineer who were my seasor advisurs professional
(1) advisors on how to run the fleet, and they were on board the
( ) ship an awful lot as well talking to the officers about
(3) professional topics
(4) Q Was it a part of their responsibility to be on the watch
(s) for any sign that people had alcohol or were using alcohol aboard ships?
(7) A Yes
(8) Q And did you if you caught people what did you do?
(9) A We would discipline them
(10) Q Now the other aspect of the policy that is deseribed in
(H) this letter is company sponsored medical support available on a
(1_) confiduntial basis for individuals who request help in
(13) combating drug or alcohol dependency Was that new with the
(14) April 1985 letter?
(15) A No it wasn't
(16) Q And what was - how far back did that go to your
(17) knowiedge?
(18) A The alcohol support went back to 1977, and the drug support
(19) went back to I thunk the fall of 1984 when we had umplemented
(20) a priot employee assistance program
(-1) Q Now those - that program included a provision which I m
(ㄱ) pointing to let me highlight it no cmployet - woops no
(3) wonder you can 1 sue it there Suffuring Irom alcoholism or
(?s) drug dependuncy will jeopardizu his or her job securty if help
( i) is requestid or if an individual inrolls to rahabilitation

Vol 142112
(1) program prior to being involved in an incident which violates
(-) company policy
(a) Id hhe to ash you about that aspuct of the program

First of all trom the standpoint of the safety credo running
the salwit company in its industry?
A Uh huh
$Q$ - was il your vicw thal this provision contributed to the
sate opcration -
AYes
(10) Q - of Exxon Shipping Company?
(11) A Yes it did
(1.) Q And how did it do that?
(13) A Well it provided an employee help to solve a problem
(14) before it resulted in an tacident on board the ship safety
(19) incident

1161 Q By promising or at least giving assurance that an
(i7) individual could get his job back did you recognize that there
(18) would be people coming back to Exxon ships who if they took
(19) advantage of this provision had been through rehabilitation
( 0 . for analuohol problum?
(1) A Yes we dad
( -) Q And did vou considur that allowing those pcople back on the
(i) ship was nevcrtheless convistent with safety)
(4) A Yes we did
(2s) $Q$ How did vou draw that conclusion?

Vol $14 \quad 2113$
(1) A Assuming they successfully completed the program thev would
' ) come back as a better employee and not have the problem have
(3) it put behind them or under control and from that standpoint
d) they would be a safer employee than they been - had thev
5) continued to drink or have the abuse problem on board the (6) vessel
(7) Did you recognize however that there was some chance that (3) there might be a relapse?

A Some chance yes
Q And how did you - what about the risk of relapse how did
you reconcile that with your safety credo?
A Well the risk of relapse would be less after treatment
than the rask of an accident caused by dnaking if a person
never went to seek help to begin with
Q Let me ask you a few questions about how this process
worked Is that process what s been referred to as self
identification?
A The process of an emplovee going '
Q Employee seeking before - yes
Q Have you heard the term seif referral?
A Yes
Q Are those different or the same or'
A They're the same to me
) Q Okay What is the identification or what is the reterral
(5) that that stalking about?

## Vol 142114

A It's an employee recogazing that he needs help with a problem and going to medical assistants for help
Q Does this policy mean in order for an employec to take the benefit of this policy that he has to come to the company and say Dan or Mr larossi or somebody at Exxon Shipping Im identifying myself as a person who has problems with alcohol? A No they don't have to identufy themselves to us they can go to a pnvate provider of those services $Q$ To be a selfiduntificr vou don thave to identifv yourseif to the company?
A You have in identify the problem in yourself
Q Were there other kinds of refurrals or identification other than selfidentification?
A There were supervisory referrals yes
Q What is a supervisory referral?
A Well there is really two kinds One kind of supervisory referral would be a supervisor counseling with an andividual before he had a work performance problem to say that you know as a friend you looked at me like you may need some help
(0) with a personal problem of some kind and we have thus service
( I) avalable to you we'd like to remind you about and I think it
( -) would be a good idea if you go to it but still the employees
(23) choice to go
(24) Q So like a Dutch uncle?
(25) A Right
r
(3)
(4)
(9)
of
(7) ${ }^{(8)}$ play
(y) dactor the's just saving you know your performance usn't good
(10) and I suspect for whatever reason that it may be related to
(11) hım
(12) evaluate whether or not you have a problem

31 Q Okay Now in that case what rights does the employee
(A) have or what expectation does the employee have regerding his
ability to return to work and let $s$ assume he goes to the
medical department or wherever he $\bar{s}$ referred to and they say
yeah you should go gel some professional help and he does
go
181 to rchab?
119, A He goes to rehab and completer the program comes back to
ol work and the qupervisor judges that he's okay to come back Into
( ) that job then he comes back to the job
i' $Q$ So in that instance the employee would also be entitled to
(23) this provision of the policy?
(1) A Yes he would be
(.J) Q That assures him job - is he guaranieed that he goes back

## Vol 142116

in the very same job position?
A That's been our practice
Q Whin a person comes back how do you make the decision?
(4) A The-from a supervisory referral?
5) Q From any referral In other words a person comes back and
(6) you re faced with whether they are entited to get their job
(7) back what factors do you take into account or do you just
(8) automatically put him back in the job?
(91 A The supervisor would discuss with the employee has abslity
(10) to handie a job and when he was satasfied that the
employee
(11) could then he'd let hum back on the job
(1) Q Now Mr O Neill showed you the Graves report -
(1) AYes
(14) Q - eariser Ioday?
"1si A Uh huh
(16) Q And you understood that Captain Hazelwood went to a private
(17) hospital and received therapy You also saw some other
(181 documents about that How would you classify his case was he
(19) a self referral or a supervisory referral?
(\%) A He was a self referral
(21) Q Okay I want to go into one more sort of technicality
(22) here but to try to clear up this terminology Have you ever
(23) heard of EHAP?
(24) A Yes
is) Q What is EHAP?

Vol $14 \quad 2117$
A It's an employee assistance program
Q What is an employee assistance program'
A It's withm Exxon it's a contract service that we have hured to - that employees can go to a confidental basis to recerve help for a broad range of personal problems drug and
(6) alcohol financial planning concerns problems with kids thungs that would detract his attention from operating safely in his job
Q Let me show you Exhibil 9122
MR LYNCH Your Honor I will offer 9122
(Exhibit 9122 offered)
MR O NEILL No objecuon
THE COURT Admitted
(Exhibit 9122 received)
BYMR LYNCH
Q Is this a letter that announces in 1985 the availability of an employee health assistanct program?
A Yes, it is
Q The employee health assistance program as contemplated
the Exxon drug and alcohol policy does it have to be involved
in any way in the employees decision to go out and seek help?
A No
Q Can il be?
A Can be ye
Q Who makes that decision?

Vol 142119
alcohol on company vissels)
AYes
Q Do you remember that that was Exxon s policy but not everybody else s policy?
A Rught
Q For a period of time I gather you served wine once in a while to employees?
A Yes we called it a holiday mine policy
Q Could you just describe that policy quichly?
A Well three times a year Thanksiving Chnstmas and (10)
(II) Years we did provide wine on a limited basıs to our employees
2) to help them celebrate the holnday sunce away from famuly

Q I take it you tried to provide good wine on those
occasions?
A We did have a taste testing committee
Q You didn it intentionally get interior wine?
A Rught
Q I can always recommend Gallo myself but was that policy continued?
A It was contmued untul 1988
Q What was the last holidav on which winc was served?
A It was New Years of '88
Q New Year s Day 19889
A Yes
Q lt was discoñtınued al that tımı'

## A The employee

Q Okay Was uavailable as a rusource for the employee?
A Yes it as
Q Was it ever mandatory for the cmployce to go to EHAP'
A No it was strictly voluntarily
Q What about whan the cmployce rulurns is EHAP avalable to
the employee if he teeis that would bu hulptul to htm?
A Yes it is
Q is hu raquired to go to EHAP lor his allurtars
A No
Q is he required by - lo go to the modical care for his
aftercare?
A No
Q What s the theory behind that?
A Well, within our company we beheve that the employee
has
(16) responsibility for his own health care and our focus is how

1) well he performs his work on the job

Q Do you - apan from rusponsibility do you thinh that the
employee - that Exxon could constbtent with the restrictions
on an imployer gul invoived in prusuribing mudical care lor an employct who $s$ voluntarily gonc for medical truatment? A I thank that would be a matter of medical confidentially between the employet and has doctor
Q Now just somu side qucstions hart
Wh talked about the fact that thuru s prohibition dgainst

## Vol 142120

(1) A It wasn't discontinued officially at that time but there (?) were no holidays between then and when it was discontinued
(1) Q So athr January 11988 Exxon no longer offered holiday (4) wine is that correct?
(1) A That's correct
s) Q Now there salso been some lestimony about a mysterious
brow called Moussy which I happen to know from trying to find
it a boitic lor my upuning statemunt is very hard to find in the
marhet today What is Moussy?
(10) A It's a non alcoholic beer
(II) Q What does non alcoholic mean?
(1) A Federal government sets maxamum alcohol content Inmitations
(13) on it and I belneve it's no more than 5 or 05 I believe
(14) alcohol content
(Is) Q Meaning that it is a sofi drinh?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q Now I d lihc to jusi quichly move forward from
(18) Mr Iarosst s Lutlur 1985 letter up to March of 1989 Could
tivi you give bceause we ru running out of time and I d like to
10, git you out of hurb tould you give us just a quick survey of 11 what if anything iranspirid ovar that time in terms of hangutio Exxon - the polict that Mr larussi stated in his 3) April 24th letter'
( 4$)$ A In 1987 we expanded the policy to include for cause search
(2s) on the vessels and also to melude the coverage of contractors

Vol 14 2121

1) coming on the ship in the search provisions and the prohibition
provisions and in 1988 we -
Q Let me stop you for a second
MR LYNCH Your Honor could I offer DX3614 which is
the statement of the 1987 poiscy
(Exhibit DX3614 offered)
MR O NEILL Noobjection
THE COURT Defendant s DX3614 is admitted
(Exhibit DX3614 received)
BYMR LYNCH
Q I interrupled you
A We also in 1988 voluntarily ugned an agreement with the
U S Custom Service to enhance our searching capability on
vessels coming into the $U S$ from foreign ports
Q Was that called the Sca Carrier Intiative?
A Yes yes it was
Q And it had to do with the governments efforts to prevent importation of drugs since you had ships?
A Yes zero tolerance pohcy implemented we cooperated
MR LYNCH I offer DX3609 which is a coniract entered
pursuant to the Sea Carrier Intiative
(Exhibit DX3609 offered)
MR O NEILL No objection
THE COURT Exhibited 3609 is admitied
(Exhibit DX3609 receivid)

## BY MR LYNCH

Q Did there come a lime whon the Coast Guard issucs recommendations rilated alcohol ust aboard or around vesse!?

## A Yes it did

Q And what steps did Exxon take to comply with that regulation?
A We notified our emplovees on our ships about the new regulations and assigned the masters to enforce him them board the ships
Q And did you provide equipment and materials for testing aboard ship if there was a violation?
A We had the testing equipment requred at that tume on board
(13) the shap as a result of our 1987 for cause testing policy
(14) MR LYNCH And Your Honor Ioffer DX3618 as notice
(1s) to the fleet of the Coast Guard regulations
(Exhıbit DX3618 offered)
MR O NEILL Noobjection
THE COURT Defendants 3618 is admitted
(Exhibit DX3618 received)
BY MR LYNCH
Q Now let s go back to - to the 87 policy for a second
Exhibit DX3614 i m showing you a page from the written
guidelines for supervisors Can you see that I want to focus
(24) on paragraph D there
(5) A Okay
(1)
: 1
(7)
(4)
(5)
(6)
(7)
(8)
(9)
(10) s

1111

$$
111
$$

\| 1
\|?
|d| p about
(19) thur pursonal habits at home?
(16) A Yes There was - some of the limitations we had imposed
(17) on us we mentioned earher but our interest was trying to (i8) provide a safe workplace and that involved contacting the
(19) employee at work
(0) Q There were those guidelines developed?
(21) A In Exxon USA
(22) Q By whom?
(3) A By the employee relations department
(9) $Q$ And was that statf larger than your own staff"

1251 A Yes

## Vol 142124

Q And would with Mr O Neill spermission I Il lead into
this There were written guidelines prepared and given to supervisors?
A Yes
Q And those guidelines related in part to the supervisors
role in monitoring for alcohol?
A Yes
Q And could you just give in a summary what the guidelines that you gave to your managers were with regard to what the supervisors role was?
A-Fter were to look for unsatisfactory performance of the emplovees, ont the joh as an indication of non-compliance Q Did the policy have a ruason for focusing on job prformanças opposed to calling people and asking them

A Yes

Q And they engaged in a study to develop what the appropriate
(i) guidelines would be to implement this policy?
(i) A Yes
(A) Q Now under this policy what was the responsibility of Exxon
() Shippint Companv puoplu in the case of an tmployee who took
advantaf of the opportunity to return io his job after alcohol
rihabilitation what was thc company supposed to do in that
(s) Lase carry out the policy?
(y) A We were supposed to evaluate the employee's

## performance on

tlo, the job
(III $Q$ And what about relapse what about the risk that you know (12) you d have Mr O Neill talk to you about you know the peraon
(13) whose got an alcohol problem is not necessarily a falling down
(14) drunk Was there any step taken to watch out for that nak of
(ts) relapse?
(16) A Well we montor the employees performance
(17) $Q$ And in that monitoring did you juat monitor that look at
(18) that employee the same as any other employee"
(19) A If we knew he had come back from rehab we would look more
(20) carefully for signs of drugs and alcohol abuse
(21) Q Were your people trasned to do that?
(2) A Yes they were
(23) $Q$ Where did they get that training?
(24) A In 1984 in one of the fleet officer conferences that we
(25) had almost yearly we did offer a drug awareness traning
) program to better familianze our officers of what to look for drug and alcohol abuse in the workplace and we also had traning in 1987 with the implementation of this policy
Q Now I d like to go back to that subject that I started
with you on This is exhibit 4471 That sthe appraisal form that was used for mates is that correct?
A That's correct, yes
Q And can you read it - try your screen there Are you able to read that?
A Thes is real, that's good willing to assume additional
responsibilitues beyond normal job requirements
Q First of all were you involved in the development and use
of these forms?
AYes, I was
Q Were supervisors instructed as to what the form was suppose
to mean? Let me take this down I guess I m kind of defeating
my purpose
THE COURT Has 4471 been admutted
MR LYNCH Yes that s the one 1 had the wrong page
to show but Idid move its admission
MR O NEILL Offer ${ }^{\prime}$ ?
MR LYNCH Offer it
(Exhibs 447! offered)
MR O NEILL Noobjeclion
THE COURT It sadmiticd

## Vol 142126

(1) (Exhibat 4471 received)
(1) MR LYNCH Thank you Your Hunor
(3) BYMR LYNCH
(A) Q What was that - what was this tactor dusigned totahe accounl of
(6) It was intended to take into account the employee's
, mitnatuve and willingness to go beyond the narrow focus of hns
(3) job and lool for more creative wavs to get the job done to
basically amprove the quality of the job to look around ham what other things are going around on the ship
Q Was this a sneaky way to uncouragt people to work rtıme?
A No
Q Would you look at the lirst itm Whal is that'
A Manntans a high level of safety awarenes,
Q Was that - was that made lirst lor a rcason'
(10) A Yes it was That particular ane was made firvt to (17) re-emphasize the role of rafety
(18) $Q$ In the evaluation of a matio or ancmplovcl was il a
(i)) master $s$ duty to consider whether the emplovec was in good
(ro) shape and was getting proper rust and appropriatc rusl'
(-1) A Yes It was
( ) Q Was thure - was thcre specific facts for masuring the
( 31 mates purformancu in that rugard?
(4) A The third hine item is always in fit condition slert
(-5) vigilant on watch and at work

5-20-94

VOLUME 14
Vol $14 \quad 2127$
Q Would a mate who regularly worked to excess be entuled to
a high rating under this form?
A No
Q Did the captain have a responsibility to evaluate his
people for their compleung or their keeping proper rest
opportumities or managing their time to insure they got proper rest?

## A Yes, he was

Q Now I d like to refer you to Plaintiff's Exhibit 1793
Could you put that up Is that coming up? This is a real old
document yes or no it will take a long tame to dig it up
I think you may have that right there in front of you
Mr Paul This is your memo of March 271980 to Mr Shartz?
A Okay, yes I have that
Q Now this document was written by you in 1980 when you
were west coast fleet manager is that correct?
A Yes
Q And at that time there were certain pilotage federal
pilotage requirements in force in Prince Willam Sound
AYes
(21) Q Even at that tume it was Exxon s practice to have ats
(n) captains if possible obtain or some officer on the ship
( 3 ) obtain a pilotage endorscmant from the United States Coast
(4) Guard is that correct'
a) AYe,

## Vol 142128

Q Could you read the last paragraph of your recommendation well the ont we re felling indenied paragraphing beginning personnel and vessel safetv are the two most important items? A Which page are you on'
Q The lirst page advantages and disadvantages? A Okay Personnel and vessel sdfety are the two most important items considered while weighing the advantages and
(8) disadvantages in utilizing employee pulots Based on operating
expersence utilizing competence employee pilots will result
(10) to equal or greater safety for our vessels than the use of
(11) local pilots
") Q So your ricommundation for having cmployees obtain this
(13) Lurlification was driven by your vicw that that would be a
(14) haluiv promoling move'
"दा AYes
(16) Q And by the way the ductsion as to whether or not there
(17) should be pilotage in those water was not made by Exxon
(18) Shipping Company?
(19) A That scorrect
(70) Q lt was madu by the Unilud States Coast Guard
(-1) AYes
(.2) Q Were you aware that later in the 1980 s the United States
(73) Coast Guard recommendud elımination of the pilotage
(-4) requirements?
(?g) A I had heard that ves

Vol $14 \quad 2129$

1) Q And based on the conciusion and operating experience that 1 pilotage as far as down as Hinchinbrook was not required for (1) safety reasons?
(4) AYes
s) Q Now could you look at the second page sir and I d
(f) like - may I approach just for - let me direct your attention
(7) to this paragraph here Would you read the second paragraph
2) the paragraph beginning because of the unavailability?
(9) A Because of the unavalability of local federal pilots
(10) vessels have been forced to use state pilot service for
(II) Hanchanbrook to Rocky Point pilotage whenever employed pilots
(I) are not on board This is a three hour run which costs
(1) approximately $\$ 4500$ round trip ancluding a $\$ 3000$ launch fee
(141 During severe weather conditions y follow me approach should
(1s) be - has been utilized to minumize vessel delay However
(1s) recently the charter boat Blue Moon which was used by the
(17) local pilots to board vessels at Cape Hinchiabrook foundered
(18) and sank As a result the USCG has issued certann rules under
(19) which vessels may enter and transit Prince Willsam Sound to the
( 0) state pilot station without a pilot It savs without a
II pilot -
Q This is in 1980 correct?
A That's correct
Q And even at that tume the Coast Guard had issued rules
which permits ships to operate from Hinchinbrook up to the

## Vol $14 \quad 2130$

1) state pilot station without a federal pilot aboard is that

1 correct sir?
3 AYes
(4) Q If Ican just be one quick moment sir
s) MR LYNCH I have no turther questions
(6) MR O NEILL I may not finish

REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF DANIEL JOHN PAUL JR BY MR O NEILL
Q We ve talked hoth about satety and ahoul the Graves repor?
A Yes
Q And what does it say right above safely is for everyone every year in the Graves report? I asked Joe if he ever drank aboard the ship he commented that he occasionally drank aboard
(1s) the ship but not frequently He also indicated that he came
(16) back to the ship from port drunk on several occastons?
(17) A Uh huh
(18) Q That s right over safety is for everyone every year do you (9) see that?

AYes
Q That safiring offense isn 1 it?
A Whach is a firing? Offense
Q Coming back to ship from port drunk?
A Depending on what tume of year you talked - what tume
period you're talking about, it could be

## 5-20-94

VOLUME
Vol 14 2131
Q The captain did not self identify did he?
A Which captann?
Q Hazelwood?
A Yes he did
Q Let stalk about that You re aware that while the Graves
investigation was going on that a Mr Tompkins who is
Mr Sheehy s boss was directed to let the captan know he was
being investigated?
A l'm aware of that
Q The capiain didn t tome in and say I drank aboard the
shtroame bach from ship drunk There was an investigation
ongoing and Mr Tompkins wunt to Mr Sheehy and said tell
man we re investigating him You ruaware of that fact aren t
vou?
A I'm nat aware of how he - how he communcated to Joe

QMr Tompkins was told to tell the captain he was under
investigation that sacorrect statement isn $t t^{\prime}$ ?
A As far as I know yes
Q He was caught wasn the?
A No
Q And Captain Hazelwood has lestified that before he went into treatment indeed before he made the decision to go into treatment hi was contacted by Mr Sheehy and informed by Mr Sheehy that something was wrong?
(.5) MR NEAL Not Mr Sheehy Captain Pierce

## Vol 142132

BY MR O NEILL
Q That something was wrong that something was affecting his joh performance and that he bulter do something about it He was Laught wasn ihu'
A Vo he wasn t caught I wouldn't consider that beang caught Q Did he walk in the door and say 1 have an alcohol problem? A to he didn't
Q it is in Exxon sinterest as you sat here today to be able to pigeon hole him into self identification isn itif A I'm not trying to pigeon hole him nato anything
(1.) Q With regard to returning him from duty returning him to (13) duty there was no company requirement when he returned to duty
(1a) that he be reinstated immediately as a ship captain was there? A Our practice had been to return people to the job they came
(16)
(17) Q I want you to listen to the question I didn task you what your practice was I sad there was no company requirement to return him to the safety sensitive position as a ship captain when he returned from his treatment was there? A I thank there was, yes

## Q is it in any of the policies written?

A It's inferred in the policies
Q Is it written in any of the policies?
(25) A Not in direct words

Vol $14 \quad 2133$

```
Q It is in Exxon s interest as you sit here today for vou
to take that position isn (tt)
A Yes, it is
Q We talked about you started with the safety awards your
(s) statement that you made when you started with the safety
(6) was we have a reputation we have a reputation as the premiere
safety operator in the industry do you see that?
AYes
Q Exxon Shipping Company changed its name between the
(10) the Valdez and today to what?
(II) A Sea River Maritime
(12) Q You talk about industrial due process and the lugal
[13) framework of industrial due procuss Industrial due process
(14) does not keep you from firing a drinking alcoholic in a safety
|f) sensitive position does It?
(16) A If he's not performing his job duties it does not prohibut
7) you from firing them
(18) Q And indeed in the 85/ 86 time frame you fired people for
(19) violating the alcohol policy isn that a correct statement?
20) A That's true
1 Q And the Americans with Disabilites Act on a variety of
I? occasions didn ikeep you Irom firing him did it?
(.3) A That's true
14) Q The rehabilitation aul - I merry Thu rchabilitation it
5) aul doesn (keap you from tiring thum docs il'
```

awards
date of

## Vol 142134

```
A They were not handicapped
Q You talled for a minulu about the six on/six off rule Do
you recall that?
A Yes
Q That is an impurtani satcly ruquircmant inn (it)
A It \(s\) a Coast (, uard requiation that wav anplemented
presumably for safety ves
Q il gots into the carly pari of the wnturv inn ithat
Lorrecl"
A I don't know how far back it goes
Q And would it be fair to say that in Exxon Corporation
Exxon Shipping Company in 1988 1989 there was no way the
company could montor through recordkctping the work hours
(14) the deck mates?
(15) A That's correct yes We didn't see a need to do that
(10) Q You talked a hitile bil about fatiguc And fatiguc is a
(17) problem with regard to ocean going vessel isn 1 it?
us, A It is a potential cuacern I nouldn \(t\) call it a prablem
us) Q More than a polential conctrn what was the thumb of the
(.0) 1988 fleet officer conference?
( '1) A Future maning was one of the themes Safety was
(.-) There were a number of themes to that conference
(23) Q How about fatigue al sea was that a thamı?
A I don't recall that
(2S) Q Have you had a fleet officur conference where the theme
```

of
another
was - a theme was tatigue at sea?
A We had in 1988 we had a professional topic that dealt with fatugue That was not a theme of the conference trying
educate our supervisors about how to identify fatugue and how
to manage it
Q You talked a little bit aboul the straight salary system
and you talked a little bil about Captain Hazelwood and Captan
Hazelwood $s$ ratings And in both of these the subject of
management came up and that he was a poor manager Under
Mr larossi s vision of the Exxon Shipping Company Mr Iarossi
implemented a number of management initatives The purpose of
(1) which was to turn the captains trom driving the vessels into
the managers of the vessel $s$ business units isn that a
correct statement?
A I wouldn't characterize it that way no
Q Did he ever do that? Did you ever read his speech on that
topic' Do you recall that speech?
A Surrendening Memory
Q Do you recall that speech?
AIdo
Q That s one of the things he talked about in that speech
isnllt
A It is not turaing them from - be was turning - he was
adding to their professional responsibility
Q He was adding to thuir professional responsibilities so

## Vol $14 \quad 2136$

that they would assume responsibility for the management of the
, ship essuntially as a business entity?
A Right but not to the degradation of their professional respunsibilitues
Q It wava way to cnhancu their protessional cstcem so they
wure in usscncc a prolessional manager and a seagoing (aplaın'

A They were a supervisor of the unt
Q Did Mr larossi in Surrounding the Memories describe them
as a manager of this busincss unit? You whre there -
A I think he may have
Q He did didn the? You wure there for that speech?
A He may have I don't recall his exact words
Q Now you talked a litte bit about your monitoring of
Captain Hazelwood on your own We have two instances We have
(IS) the 88 new confersnce but when Mr Lynch was talking to you you talked a fittic bit about the incident where you walched him Do you ruball that?
A I also said I montored ham at the '87 conference
Q His drinhing was of such concern to you that you went out of your way to monitor him isn that a correct statement?
A His drinking was of no more a concern to me than any other
(22) rumor of a master that I would hear but I did monitor hm which I thought was prudent nght
Q And with regard to your concerns about the ability to
monitor him you never past them on to any other members of

management team did you?
A Not that I recall
Q Now in response to Mr Lvach s question vour answer was
something that purzles me You said I had notraining with
regard to recovering alcoholics or alcoholism Do you recall
saving that?
A Yes
Q You were the director of human resources for Exxon
Shipping
Company and that subject matter was within your
responsibilities wasn 1 it?
A That's right
Q I want to tall for a minute about the safetv credo the plaque
A Uh huh
Q The first tem in the safety crudo is accidents and injuries are preventable Do you see that)

## A Sure do

Q Accidents and injuries are preventable and one ot the ways
that we prevent accidents and injuries is through the caretul
selection and evaluation of seagoing masters is that a correct statement?
A One of many ways yes
Q That sa very verv important subject isn ( it?
A Certanaly is
MR O NEILL I have no further questions

## Vol $14 \quad 2138$

, THE COURT Thank you sar You may step down
MR LYNCH Your Honor could I-
(3) MR O NEILL I forgot to offer exhibits I will
(4) offer them for him The defendants offer 3487
(5) THE COURT This is defendants $\mathbf{3 4 8 7 9}$
(r) MR LYNCH Lut me take one sucond with Mr () Null I
17) want to make surt that hu understands
(8) MR O NEILL Wants to put more paplr in 1 don 1
(9) care

THE COURT Detendants exhibit -
MR O NEILL 3587 and 3509 and we have no
objection
(Exhibit 3587 \& 3509 offered)
THECOURT Defendants 3487 and 3589 - no 3509 are
admitted Thank you sir
(Exhibit 3587 \& 3509 received)
MR O NEILL Thank you sir
THE COURT Call your next witness
(19) MS WAGNER Your Honor plaıntıffs call Mary
(20) Williamson by deposition
( \| THE CLERK Raise your right hand
(1) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(r3) THE CLERK For the record would you state your name
(4) address and spell your last name please
(rs) THEREADER Sarah Armstrong Armstrong
(1) Minneapolis Minnusota
, THECLERK Thank vou
(3) DIRECT EYAMINATION OF MARY WILLIAMSON (Read)
(小) BYMS WAGNER
(f) Q Could you please state your name for the record
(k) A Mary Kobin Willamson
(7) Q Where do vou presentily reside Ms Willamson?
(8) A Houston Texas
(9) Q Bv whom are vou presently employed?
(10) A Exxon Shipping Company
(11) Qtrwhat capacitv?
(1) A Catering buver
(13 Q By whom were you emploved in 1980"
(14) A Fxxon Shipping Company
(19) Q In what tapacity?
(16) A 1980 I helieve I was on the utulity mess utulity lust
(17) Q How long have you bcen employed by Exxon Shipping?
(18) A Sunce 1978
(19) Q What job positions did you hold with Exxon Shipping from
(0) 1978 until 19907
( 11 A I held a job as mess man mess utility person ship's cook
(22) fleet chef those are the job titles
(2) Q In any of these assignments Miss Williamson were you on
( 7 (4) board a vessel?
(rs) AYes

## Vol 142140

(1) $Q$ Were you on board a vessel at any ume which was caplained () by Joseph Hazelwood?
(3) A I didn't sail on the vessel but I was aboard on temporary (4) vessel assignment
(s) QCan you please explain that please when that was and what (6) vessel?
(7) A The vewnel w'is on the went coast and it was one of the bug
s, ones I II sav the Valdez It may have been the Long Beach but I thonk the Valdez I'm not real sure But Captan Stalzer was the other captan so it was the Valdez I relieved in the west coast office for the port steward Q You relieved?
A Yes Temporary shore assignment temporary special assignment is what we call it
Q At any ume that you were fleet chef or on temporary special assignment as port steward did you receive any reporta of intoxication by any captains on board any Exxon veasel shipping vessel
A No ma'am the one incident that I perceived as alcobol being involved was on the launch in San Francisco
Q And could you explain that please in terms of when?
A You want a date' Comewhere there is a date on this Q Even jusi a year
A A year wkay It had to be-it was March I thunk, March
or April March of 89 and I was on board the Exxon

## Vol 142141

(1) Galveston And I took a launch ashore it was at anght and I
(2) had not heard any comments about the Exxon Valdez crew or

Captan Hazelwood up to that time
I came back on what is called a midnught launch It gets
back to the ship about madnight I think it leaves at about
1130 At that ponst I met Captan Hazelwood at the
Weststar
lauach
Q What happened?
A He came up and he spoke to me and they - d
conversation
(10) ensued 1-we were mside the building We later went
(at) outside I stepped back toward the door so it was fairly - by
(12) then there was a group of people but it's my perceptuon that I
(13) smelled alcohol on his breath
(14) Q On whose breath?
(15) A Captan Hazelwood's I don't know for sure but that's
(16) only my perception And we had a conversation and we stepped
(In outside and we got on the launch And that conversation
18, contunued briefly not long because he was out on the open
(19) deck area and I went in the cabin
(20) Q Of the launch?
(2) A Yes ma'am
(2) $Q$ And that was your only contact with Captain Hazclwood at (23) that tume?
(4) A That was my only contact with Captain Hazelwood Inside a
(s) building by the door of a building and the conversation was

## Vol 14 21+2


(") finished up on the deck of a launch
Q Now is Weststar launch the sami as Wisistar Icrininaln'
(1) A I know it as Weststar Marine bervices and Wentstar launch
is the same thing It is at Pier 46 in San trancisco $\mathbf{y o}$ is that what you're talkung about'
Q And at this time did you advisl Captain Hazulwood that vou thought that he was intoxicated?
A I didn't say to Joe Hazelwood I think you're drunk no
(9) ma'am I sasd something to the effect - he wanted be to relay
(10) a message to the captan of the Galveston and I sand well
(i) Captain 1 don't think I can do that I think marbe in the
(13) $Q$ What message did he want you to rulav to the captain of the
(14) Galveston?
(IS) A It wasn't enturely clear and I wasn't eatarely letting him
Consh his statements because be seemed to be upset with
(17) Captan Reeder and that was the master of the Galveston at
(18) that tume and wanted me to tell Captan Reeder that he was
( 0 ) that
I 11 Q Now at this tume that you smulled alcohol on the breath ol
12 Captan Hacelwood in Marsh or April of 19 -
(4) March
(5) Q Did you Icel that you had duty to rapori Caplain

Vol $14 \quad 2143$
(i) Hazelwood to other authonties in Exxon?
() A It was my mpression that I smelled alcohol It was my
(3) impression that I thought he had been drinking I got back $t 0$
the Galveston that nught and I'm aware of Exxon Shipping
Company policy I gave it a lot of thought that nught I didn't talk to anvone else on the vessel about it I was deciding what to do in the - and the next morning there was some A. B's talking about something that had happened duning the
(1) might which I slept through when the shup let go from the
(10) Valdez And I was wondening what I should do or if I should
do
(11) anything And I still didn't go to anybody But we were at
(19) anchor doing some repars and a gentleman by the name of

Steve
(13) Day, who worked in the west coast office whom I know
came on
(14) board and - well and I didn't want anybody violateng
company
(15) policy I couldn't prove the man had been drinking, but I (16) thought something should be sand So I took Steve Day aside
(17) alone in the officer's ruom on the Exxun Galveston in the
(18) afternoon I'm not sure of the date I think at was the
(Iy) second day of repars I sand when you get some tume I need
(20) to talk to you confidentrality about something And I went in
(_I) and said it is my impression I was ashore the other aight
and
1 -) this is what I think and I think that Joe Hazelwood was
('3) dranking Now I don't know any more about that and I didn't
( 4) pull anybody to see if he had been drinking but it's my
( $s$, unpression Aad steve if you thank anything should be done
Vol $14 \quad 2144$
about this would sou take at back aud talk to somebody

## And I

() didn't tell ham who to go talk to but I felt - whether
(3) anybody agrees with me I felt like I did what I had to do and
(4) I trusted Steve Day to address or at least see if the issue was
(s) checked out
(6) Q Was the issue checked out?
(7) A I did not talk to Steve Day after that I assumed it was
(8) Q And you said nothing to anyone that night?
(H) A No, ma'am I dad not
(10) Q Do you know anyone else who saw Caplain Hazelwood the night
(1t) hu Lift the launch in March 1989 from San Francisco and buardud
(1) the vessel?
(13) A There were crew members and some lacensed from the Exxou
(14) Valdez on that launch that went back on the ship with him and
(1s) there was another crew member from the Exxon Galveston on board
(16) that launch
(17) Q Did vou discuss your bcilufs rugarding Captain Hacclwood s
(18) possible stale of drunhennuss with any of the Exxon Valdel

191 members?
${ }_{1} 01$ A No I dadn't
in Q Did you board the Exxon Valdes that night"
1, A No ma'am
i 3 Q Alont with Captain Ha/clwood"
is A No ma am It went to the Exxua Galveston the launch went
is) to the Galveston prior to going to the Exxion Valdez I went
out
1: Q As a port steward would you have expected someone on board
s, a vessel to report someone else on board the vessel as a $\quad$ rew member being drunk'
A I would thank some people would and I would think some people wouldn't
Q Why wouldn $t$ some people do that and why would some people
do 11 ?
A This is my opinion
Q I know I masking for it please
A Okay Some people would do at because companv policy
you
( ) should follow And some would do at because they probably
thought there was another way and - you don't want to turn somehody in And if they were drinking and not drunk and there was no harm done even though it was a violation of company policy it's not - I didn't say anythang that first
night because I m not a hundred percent convinced Joe Hazelwood
181 was drunk I thought he was drinking Then I had to debate (19) company policy is a senous thing and to go to somebody and
say, hey by the wav I think your captann over there was
drukng I had to thank long and hard about that And I
thum there are other people that probably have to thank long and hard whether it is a captan or somebody else but in the
( 4 ) end we try to do the night thing in most cases and what I did
"I feel inke I was in the wrong place at the wrong ume and I

## Vol 142146

tned to do the right thing And maybe $I$ didn't do it in a tumely fashion but I thank I'must like most other people out
there Sometumeq you may take too long but you don't
dehberately violate company policy If I had seen the man
5) stumbling falling down drunk yes ma'am I would have made a
fuss over it But that's not what I suw
Q And you said Captain Reeder was the master of thl Exxon
Gaiveston at this :ime?
A Yes ma'am
Q Were you madk aware at any time as to whether or not Captain Hazelwood and Captain Rceder had a verbal altercation
(1) on the radio at about this time?
(13) A The morning after I came back on the launch ride that
(1a) might that next morning at breakfast I heard people talking
(15) about when the Galveston and the Valdez had let go And thes
(16) us talk because the chef didn't bave to get up for those
(17) things so I wasn't up for that that there had been profanity
(18) used on the radio
(19) Q Well when you bucams aware of this cursing between Captain
(20) Reeder who is the master of the vessel you were on -
( I) A Yes ma'am
(n) Q - and Caplain Hazelwood did you in any way feel any
(13) obligation to tell captain Reeder of your observations or (24) perceptions the might before?
(2) A I won't say the thought didn't cross my mind We were
"I underway Captan Reeder was on the bridge Captain Reeder
: was busv and I still hadn t made up my mind what to do about
i, it So I didn't tell Captan Reeder maybe I should have
handsight as alwavs better than foresight but no I did not tell Captann Reeder
Q If you can - and I appreciate the difficulty in doing so

- internally what was going through your mind when you
judged whether you shouldn t or you should tell Captain Reeder-
w) about vour perception with regard to Captain Hazelwood?
(10) $A$ It's perception I can $t$ tell vou the man was falling down
(ll) drunk He got on the launch just fine And if there was an
1: incident with profanitv or cursing over the radio then that as
(13) between Captann Reeder and Captann Hazelwood and that's up to
(14) them to settle I don't know if I was night or wrong in doung
(15) what I did I'm telling you what I did If I had thought the
(16) man was totally ncompetently drunk I would have handled

It
(17) different I thought he had been drunking And I had a hard
(18) time deciding what to do about it and, yes, ma'am I was
fully
1191 aware of the company s policies
Q Well the companv policy doasn i make a distinction between
drinking and falling down drunk do they?
A No ma am
1 3 Q liprohibits drinking am I correct?
A You're right
isi Q Well what was the company policy' Did it allow crew

## Vol $14 \quad 2148$

members to have one drink as you understood it?
A As I understood it you could not come back to a shap unebrated You could not have alcohol aboard a veasel You
could not drunk aboard a vessel If you went ashore and had dinner and ad a beer or a glass of wine and you didn't have to
(fi go on watch for several hours then you could do that That 7) was my interpretation of it
18) Q Yes At the point of the launch in March of 1989 was there
(y) any person representing Exxon Shipping who if they perceived
a
(10) crew member might be drunk could administer a test to
(11) determine whether or not that crew member was drunk or how
(12) drunk they were?
(13) A That night that I went to the Weststar launch, there was a
(141 Weststar lunch driver and there were people going back to
(1s) shaps And I don't know about any breathalyzer teat, but
(10) nobody said anythag about any breathalyzer test and only Fxxon
"1" people that were there were people that were A going to the
(18) Valdez, B gong to the Galveston I didn't see anybody else (19) who worked for Fxxon Shipping
( 0 ) $Q$ Were you aware of any company policy in effect at that tume (T) which would have stationed some Exxon Shipping

## representatuve

( - -) at the site of a launch to determine whether or not returning
(23) crew members were drunk and/or how drunk they may have been?
(24) A I don't know of one There might have been but I don't
(2S) know of one

Vol 14 2149
Q Was there anv Exxon Shipping rupresentative on board a
$\qquad$ vessel whose tunction was to delurmint whether or not returning
crew members were drunk or how drunk thev war?
A I assumed it was the mate on watch ur if you were on you know, if somebody saw you they would tell the mate or the
(6) captan or a chef if you were an oller or an engineer

Q And that a all you were aware of that sthe only procedure you were aware of?
A That's the only procedure I was aware of There might have
(10) been more but you're asking me what I knew

Q Miss Williamson let me ash it directly then At the tume you were on the launch with Captain Hazelwood in March of 1989
(13) and you perceived he had buen drinking did you also perculve
(14) that his drinking may have been in violation of company policy?
(15) A I know you want a clear-cut answer but I didn't think
(6) about at that way
) Why not?
A I don't know how to explann this I didn't percenve Joe Hazelwood was a danger to his vessel or anybody else And I
didn't discuss with him if he had been drinking I didn't see him take a drink Now in the back of my mind yeah I knew what company policy was and how precuse or how right I as or
how wrong I was and I gave it a lot of thought And unaybe if I hadn't of heard there had been an meident with profanity on
1 St the radio maybe I would have never sald a word to allybods I

Vol $14 \quad 2150$
don't know that That played a part in it and then I still didn't say it to the captain Then I wated for someone to come show up from the office that I trusted that I thought would just take this and pass it on and that's an assumption on my part that he passed it on
Q You said that the incidence of profanitv somehow connectud in your mind to -
A Our captains don't normallv use profanity on the radios
Q In vour mind did you assoctate the usc of protanity by
Captain Hazelwood with regard to vour perscptions the night before?
A Something was wrong I didn thow if he had beell druking
(13) or not But something - captains don't use profane - I m not
(14) saying a captan never used a dirty word on the radio I'm
(1s) saying our captains don't pick up radios and use - and curse
(10) other people out another captann or a liane handler or
(17) whatever They don't do that That is not nurmal
(18) Q I m just trying to find out honcstly what you whre thinhing
(iy) at the time and II I canask mayhe diructly then whun you
101 heard of the incidunt of Caplain Ha/ciwood using prolanity in

( ) he might be drunh'
131 A It rased a question of this is ond dud I wonder if I
( 4) know something that anpacts ally of this And I wonder what 1
(25) should do about it it rassed -
' Q Mr Thomas interjucls I believe she sfinished
, It raised it internally?
i, A It raised it unternally for me I didn't assume - I mean
you can get angry I don't say profanity is not used on Exxon
Shipping shups and I don't say that everybody didn't use at time and agan I'm saying on the radio that's just not routine That's not normal That doesn't mean somebody is drunk, that means somebody is annoyed or upset If I had really been concerned, I guess I would have gone to Captan Reeder and I didn't do that 1 just kept thinking about it, and that was strictly - I don't know how to explan to you what
(12) I felt or how I thought, and maybe you don't understand it but
(13) I didn't assume Joseph Hazelwood was drunk I assumed (14) something was wrong with him concerning - and I assumed that
(15) - well I knew what my perception was and maybe I had better
(16) say something And the best thing maybe to do would be to
say
(i7) something to somebody in the office if I could get off the ship
(18) and go to a telephone I didn't get off the shap We were at
(19) anchor And then Steve Day showed up and I thought well
( 0 ) Steve Day's here and I'll just tell hm
(r) MS WAGNER Thuru sabout two more pages left finish
( $1 / 11$ up?
( 1 THE COURT Finish it up
( 41 Q 1 m jusi trying to understand -
1 1 A la effect 1 passed the problem on whether 1 was night or

Vol 142152

| not And it was only my perception of the problem |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Q What was the problem you understood you were passing on? |
|  |  |
| yed mio prof |  |
| (s) radio or anything else but you know here Steve I don't |  |
| (6) know what it mens or if it means anything, and I did it |  |
|  |  |
| 181 would take it uut back and set if anybody in the office wants |  |
| (1) tocheck to out He told me he would take care of it He |  |
|  |  |
| (11) and I assumed he did |  |
| (la) Q Can you tell me to the bcst that you can rucall what you |  |
| (13) said to Mr Day and what Mr Day satd to you? |  |
| (14) A I told Steve Day that I had been ashore that I had come |  |
| (15) back It was the Weststar it was the launch, I had a |  |
| (10) conversation with Joe Hazelwood It was my umpression |  |
| that Joe |  |
|  |  |
| (18) |  |
|  |  |
| 01 radio and I didn't know if Steve knew dbout and that if he |  |
|  |  |
| mbervor |  |
| 'I go ash I Captam I wasn't a witness to that And that I |  |
| -3, would be more confortable if be would just pass it on to |  |
| somebody in the uffice and check it out or have somebody |  |
| check |  |
|  | ut I don't think I |

Q Check what out?
': A To check to see if the profanits or anything else if joe
i) Hazelwood had been dranking or if it was all linked together
or
what was going on I mean they could have - they could call
the ship up they could do something So he told me he would
take that back to the west coast office dad I don't - I don't
17) specifically remember him telling me who be would tell I just
(8) remember he said he would do at and I - I believed he would do it So I didn't - I didn't run after ham to see if he
ol really did it I just assumed he would take it back to whoever
ill he thought was appropnate in the west coast office It would
(1) be checked out
113) Q At the time you observed Captain Hazelwood on this launch
(1s) outside San Francisco did you lear anv rutaliation from Exxon
1s) Shipping if you - or Captain Hazelwood if vou actually
(18) officially reported the incident?

1171 A Official retahation an ma'am
18) Q Well svenunofficial rutaliation'

191 A If I had been wrong and reported him I thought they would
there would - thought there would probably be some unofficial
; ! and not from top down from the people you sali with Beang
( ) ostracized but that's human nature and I could be wrong about
( ) that Everybody wants to get along with who they sat with 4) Q Why did you feal there would be this pur pressurb if you ( s) reported -

## Vol 142154

A Joe Hazelwond was a nice - probably is a nice man and he
was liked by penple out there Inever satied with him but I always heard people liked loe Hazeiwood And I laked Joe Hazelwood He was always very nice when he dealt with me tn
(s) the office I had nothing against this man so why are you going to take this nice person and say well 1 think you dre but I'm not sure and I want to make a big mess of thas Maybe
somebodv else would have I didn t Maybe I should have

## didn't

MS WAGNER That sall Your Honor
MR SANDERS Fasi Eddic one page
THE COURT Lul sheep it logether
CROSS EXAMINATION OF MARY WILLIAMSON BYMR SANDERS
Q Ms Williamson just briefly Ithink you said you first encountered Joseph Hazelwood in the office where exactly did you encounter him?
A In the open warehouse building itself There is Isttle glassed in office und I had been in there It's warmer than the big open - I had come out of here and there were several people out there We were saying hello and I encountered hım
1 ) in the warehouse itself
Q Who all was thure that you presently recall in the open warehouse area at the limu and specifically - well nover mind Whoeverwas there?
(1) A Did vou skip somewhere,

1) Q Yeah Ruad line 19 the answer
(i) A Sever il people Okds I remember secund mate Nate

Cirr
(4) because I knew him I remember a Melanie Wright from the
(s) steward's department coming in I was introduced to an A B who
(6) was female 1 forget her name Chief mate Guy Kless was
(7) there There was a tall guy I bad never met I thinik be was
(8) in the engine department I mean they said hello and they
(9) sard thes rame but I don't remember I never sailed whth
ham
(10) There was several people, there was Betsy, there was someone
(II) else an engineer A female engineer I don't know her I (I) don't remember her name But people sand hello and people
(1) introduced each other
(14) Q Al the lime in March 1989 that you were on board the launch
(II) in San Francisco with Captain Haclwood did you perceive that
(16) Captain Hartlwood had had more than just a beer or glass of
(i7) wine at dinner? I mashing you only your perception
1181 A My perception was I smelled alcohol on this man's breath
(19) He could have had a beer five minutes before he showed up for
(ro) the launch He didn't slur his words be didn't stumble he rll wasn't as nice as he had always been on the phone with me, but
1 | I didn't take that directed at me that's what 1 perceived I
( ) didn't perceive this fumbling person going back to the ship
( 41 MR SANDERS That sall we have Your Honor
(s) THECOURT Ladissand gentlumen I have a note from

## Vol $14 \quad 2156$

(1) earlier telling me something about pictures having been taken
(r) out in front of the courthouse this morning I don t know what
(3) was going on this morning what was going on out there I don I
(4) have much control over what goes on
(s) I wish you would keep me posted though I think I have an
(6) understanding with the local press that your names - and we
(7) can taik about it specifically but I think I have an
(8) understanding with the press is not going to identify you in
(9) the paper So if that saconctrn thave some hope that
(II) that s not going to happen Buyond that 1 don 1 know what was
"ll zoing on cout thare this morning If you purceive any problem
" 1 lul me know about "
(13) We will bu adjourning for the day in jusi a second Please
(14) remembur my instructions aboul not listening to or not reading
(IS1 anything about this case Don igo off on your own
(101 investigating or reading up about anything
(17) We II see you at 800 Monday morning
(18) Counsel will stay for a minute
(19) (Jury out at 210 pm )
(20) THE COURT Somebody has left their notebook there
(9) Would you haul that back to the jury room It 5 in that first
(r) chair isn t It" I m seeing something
(73) MR O NEILL They all left them Judge Ithink Tom
+1 tahls carl of them
( i) THE COURT I will have Mr Murtiashaw take care of

Vol $14 \quad 2157$
(1) that I thought they were carrying them oul

Just a couple of administrative things We ve had some
paper exchange about the instruction I gave concerning the role
(4) and responsibility whatever of the Coast Guard in this
matter I ve been asked to give an additional instruction on
that subject I don $t$ intend to give any further instruction
on that subject at this time I will consider a request for
something specific on that in connection with the final
instructions
We have pending a Motion for Summary Judgment that has to do with certain landowners having what I ve referred to as quote unestablished end quote claims That s related to an
earlier motion that frankly I m still stting on because it s
4) a really tough nut to crack
(IS) I would like to see counsel who are involved in this motion
6) having to do with unestablished claims in chambers Tuesday at
(17) 200 I want to discuss that with the people that are directly
18) involved with it informally to see if we can figure oul somehow
(19) to break the problems down and dcal with them
(20) Third thing I guess is how are we doing timewish Mr
i) O Neill?
( ) MR O NEILL WL ra on mveshodule Ithink much io
3) Mr Lynch s surprist

THE COURT Are wo on inv nhoduls'


## Vol $14 \quad 2158$

(1) rest on Tuesday and that s within a couple hours of wherel
(2) thought we $d$ be And in addition wa ve allowed them to gut
(3) some witnesses in during our cas That ought to help the
(4) time
(s) MR NEAL I think thal wa will - wall wa \|l he dhle
(6) to start the conclusion of thuir case I gutss that I would
7. request if they - if they wonlude their cass at 1200 or
(8) something like that 1 might ash lor the rust of that day but
(y) start the nexi day But wi ll be ruadv if Your Honor savs you
(0) start immediately we ll startimmediately And Ithinh wh can
i) conclude our case in - certainly in inn trial davs
, THE COURT Thank you sur
(13) Anything else?
(14) MR LYNCH That sall Your Honor
(1s) MR O NEILL No sur
(161 THE COURT Have a good wachend
117) Wh rein rectas until Monday al 800 a in
(1) INDEX
(2) PLAINTIFF S WITNESSES
(3) CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION OF KENNETH G GOUL
(Video) 1929
(4) BY VIDEO EXAMINER

1929
(6) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WRENDELL NEALY
(Video)
1938
(7) BY VIDEO EXAMINER

1938
(9) CROSS EXAMINATION OF WRENDELL NEALY (Video) 1956
(1) BY VIDEO EXAMINER

1956
(12) CONTINUED CROSS EXAMINATION OF WRENDELL NEALY
(Read) 1965
(13) BY MS STEWART

1965
(15) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL EMEL (read)

1967
(16) BY MR COHEN

1967
(18) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL EMEL (read)

1974
(19) BY MR SANDERS 1974
(21) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM MASCIARELLI
(read) 1978
『, BYMS WAGNER
1978
( 4 ) CROSS EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM MASCIARELLI
(ruad)
1994
: 1 BY MR SANDERS

Vol 14216
(1) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MARY WILLIAMSON 2194

1) BYMR SANDERS 2154
? ${ }^{1}$ EXHIBITS
(4) 1541793 offered 2044
(s) DX170 offered

2071
(6) 9118 offered 2074
(7) 9117 offered 2075
(8) 3439 offered 2079
(9) 3431 B offered 2083
(10) 3619 offered 2109
(11) 9113 offered 2109

1) 9122 offered 2117

171 DX3614 offered 2121
(14) DX3609 offered 2121
(15) DX3618 offered 2122
(6) 4471 offered 2129

17, $3587 \& 3509$ offered 2138
11 154 \& 1793 received 2044
$\because$ DXI 70 received 2072
(3) 9118 received 2074
(4) 9117 received 2076
(5) 3439 received 2079
(1) STATE OF ALASKA)
(1) Reporter s Certificate
(3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA
(6) I Karyn H Chalem a Registered Professional
(7) Reporter and Notary Public
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
(9) That the foregoing transcript contains a true and
(10) accurate transcription of my shorthand notes of all requested
(11) matters held in the foregoing captioned case
11) Further that the transcript was prepared by me

131 or arnder mv direction
(14) DATED this day
(1s) of 1994
( 11 KARYN H CHALEM
Notary Public for Alaska
( $)$ My Commission Expires 4895

Look-See Concordance

## Report

UNIQUE WORDS $\mathbf{3 , 2 4 7}$
TOTAL OCCURRENCES 15,436
NOISE WORDS 385
Total Words in File 48,387

SINGLE FILE CONCORDANCE
CASE SENSITIVE
NOISE WORD LIST(S) NOISE NOI

Includes all TEXT OCCURRENCES

IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES © BOTTOM of Page

| -\$ - |
| :---: |
| \$3,000 [1] 212913 |
| \$4500 [1] 212913 |
| -1- |
| 101512120161415 |
| 1030 \|11 201616 |
| 10th \|11 197915 |
| $1130\|1\| 21416$ |
| 12001312076121321587 |
| 1217 \|11 2076 /4 |
| $1220\|3\| 20286910$ |
| $1230\|5\| 200822202839$ |
| 1011 |
| 1236 [2] 20321920396 |
| $1240\|1\| 203220$ |
| $1245\|1\| 20118$ |
| 18th (1) 198024 |
| 1980s (1) 212822 |
| 19th [1] 198024 |
| 141 [1] 20398 |


| -2- |
| :---: |
| 204th \|11 19675 |
| 20th $12 \mid 198022199525$ |
| 211th [1] 196712 |
| 24-hour (I) 198824 |
| 24th (1) 212023 |
| 200 [1] 215717 |
| $210\|1\| 215619$ |
| -3- |
| 3/27/1980 \|1] 2066 /3 |
| 3431B \|6| 20833478 |
| 2161921621 |


| $-4-$ |
| :---: |
| $4-8-95\|1\| 2 / 6322$ |
| $4 / 16 / 85\|2\| 20542220557$ |
| $4 / 29[2 \mid 20542320557$ |
| $-5-$ |

5th [1] 193014

- $8-$

8-to-12 [1] 19977
80s [5] 1931 319376
194241953820874
$800|3| 19292215617$ 215817
$\frac{-9-}{\text { 90s (1) } 203519}$
9 th [1] 20442
$-\mathbf{A -}$
A-B [5] 1960519863
1991152143821555
A-r-m-s-t-r-o-n-g [1] 213825
a m 151 1929220161415
16215817
A89-0095 [1] 19296
AA |15) 193741944 |l 13
19472019493205424
20571820605691215
206522208111
abide [2] 2080520813
abilty flol 19388197123
199123 206324208417
2093242521151521169 213624
able [15] 19846200021
2005252006912201312
2051 1720588208420
2110721258213210 21585
aboard 1251960$) 5197010$
19818919824198312
19851215204912
207920208713210120
21102202111621223
112130114213110
21403214834
ABS 111204315
absence [2] 205528
Absolutely [21 202321
20429
absolutely [2| 1962 I7
20437
abstain 11120598
abstunence |3| 20602425
206117
abstunent | 194023 1941 /
319472206122
abuse (8) 193371119
195932113521157
21242021252
abuser 1119417
academic $\mid$ 2| 192922
2000 23
academnes |l| 207716
Academy |1| 200020
acceleratung II 1942 /I
accent |1] 194522
accept $131 / 93813198225$ 2005 /2
acceptable III 195414 accepted [2] 19458196318 access [1] 195810
accessed |1| 19589 accident |1| 2 |13 13

Accidents [1] 213718 accidents (2] $213715 \quad 19$ accommodation 1112007 12 account (7] 20809208112 2093222321167212656 accounted (1) 208819 accurate [7] 1974 / 200617 201057913216310 dccurately (1) 210210 achueve [1] 19497 achieved [1] 19618 acquainted [3] 20827
208321209425
Act [1] 2133 21
act [6] $196614 \quad 202610$
208091221332425
acted [1] 19369
actung-out [1] 1943 12
action [9] 19366201519 $20171718 \quad 20252520305$
2081721061923
actions (6) 200123200521 20201220691520848
210621
activitues II 194410
activity [1] 19446
acts [11 2073 11
actual $[5] 19596 \quad 200022$
2010320112520211
ad (1) 21485
add 14| 198625203421
205618205713
added |ll 19483
addicted |1| 19434
addiction |2| 194225
1951 21
dddretive |4| /941 /|
$1942 / 3 / 4$
adding 1 I 121352425
addition $1411937 / 198512$
20831821582
additional (15) 193518
20173420391518
2040132120414 11 21
2042122420443212510 21575
address [13] 1939 । 19595
196741978152119985
72045820586720714
21382421444
adequate |l| 1958 /5
adjourning |1| 2156 /3
adjust |II 2089 21
administer [2] 1963 /3
214810
administering [1] 21055
Administration |1| 199916
administration |1| 209012
adminstratuve 13 1961 25
20461321572
adminstrator 111205417
Admural |l| 20567
admuralty |11 208619
admission $|2| 19432$
212520
admut [2| 1964 /]
ddmits [2] 19422425
Admatted (3) 20741620762 211713
admitted [15] 20449 /] J3 $18202072 / 207916$

20837210932121824
21221821257825213815
ddopted [1] 207113
advanced [2] $19378 \quad 200412$
advancement [1] 197025
advantage [4] 19608
20771221121921246
ddvantages [2] 212857
ddverse (1) 20452
ddvice [1] 2115 I
advise (1) 21426
advised 111199024
advising |1| 193620
advisor (2) 20681207218
advisors [2] 21102521111
advisory |I| 196314
aerospace [3] 19998
20041018
affars [1] 196310
affect [3] $208012 \quad 20816$ 20901
affected [2] 208021208825
affecting [1] 21322
dffects 11119419
afford [1] 204913
afloat $|3| 2012 \quad 2021$
201510
dftercare [17] 1930123
1936715251937135
19471419488205919
242060320652221189 12
afternoon [3] 197146
214318
afterpoint (1) 20098
afterwards |11 21025
dge |l| 197824
dgencies |2! 207535
Agency |1| 20435
dgency |2| 2074192079 /]
agenda [11 208616
dgree $|13| 1938 \quad 13195024$
19583198581986915
1719891720415206910
121922
agreed [2] 19627198615
agreement [3] 200213
204415212112
agrees |2| 20142121443 aground [41] 1980720021
200320200610200812
2009 15 20129141620
232013420158131823
20161220182324
2024472025345611
122026312202978
20303691020367
20392
and II 196423
ards 111195025
alir |l| 200421
Aurcraft [1] 199916
arplanes [11 20439
ALASKA 12 2 2163 / 3
Alaska |3| $208218 \quad 25$
216321
ALC |11 205419
alcohole [31| 1934 11

2224194337192023
1944219451823194610

12171951914195217 195919206121210023 9213314
alcoholics [131 19304
1939231940119439
19443412194615
1951 11 1952621375
alcoholism [24] 193023
193115193315172022
193436194022194110
14194225195210
$195918 \quad 2057618$ 2d
20582020597912
21052021112321375
alert $\{3 \mid 2073821106$
212624
allow [3] 1990 || 201324 214725
allowed [2] 2109 21 21582
allowng [2] 20673211222
allows [1] 20239
allude [1] 2051 2
alluded [4] 20521425 20651214
alone [5] 19442196614 19691721431721527
alongside 111202619
altercation [1] 2146 11
alternate [1] 208920
alternating [2] 199910
208917
ambuguty [1] 20449
America [1] 199924
American $19119991415 \quad 18$ 2220042420434813 20756
Americans [1] 213321 amount [31 19386 /961/5 200317
analysts [5] 1999 |/ 20289 203020207312208417 analytuc 111 200013 analyze [2] $199821 \quad 2028 / 2$ anchor 171 1982 $12 \quad 14$ $19964207221242 / 4312$ 215119
anchors|l| 20376
angets II 2092 /
angle [6] 199338201022
20112020341213
angry [1] 21514
announce [1] 207210
announced [1] 2072 /3
announces (1) 211716
annoyed (11 215) 8
Answer [3] 20401725 206115
answer [21] 19332119347
193610194324195310
1966419721201219
20132520182202018
20348204014205124
20615101921029
2137321491521552
answered [4] 19922
205019206124210211
answering [1] 201323
answers [3] 1955242018 I 205725
anybody [17] 195824
196412196613197021

1974620641620881
21069162143111424
2144321481821491925 21528
anytume [2] 197421201016
Anywhere [1] 209818
anywhere [2] 197322
201224
apart [2| $20176 \quad 2118$ 18
apologize 121203321 21048
apparent |2| $205113 \quad 14$
appeared |2| 20122420519
appears |1| 2066 /3
dpplication |1| 2085 //
apply III 2109 /2
appoint (11) 20268
appointed 14] 2026 / 57
202721
apprassal [2| 20941221255 appreciate [2] 2037 13
21476
appreciation |I| 193210
approach 3 ) 2071721296 14
appropriate |10| 19362 1]
193715201938810
1961 / 2124 / 212620
215311
appropriately |II 19369
approve 31 2023 12
20681516
Approximately [1] 20906
approximately [8] 194623
196113197612198410
2009 / 209027212913
Apral|ك12111/4 212023
21402521422223
arbitration 12120499
210712
arbitratmens |l| 20498
arbitrator $1112107 / 3$
architect |4| 2004 / 200513 2034919
architectural [2] 200424 203424
architecture $|10| 20041516$
$192005 / 51120211314$ 20342023
area (14) 19521919858
1987419888200414
$20071112 \quad 20081012$
$206916 \quad 20781920968$
214119215424
areas (1) 199619
aren't [2] 19449213113
arise [11 208419
Arm [1] 198323
Armstrong (1) 213825
aroma [1] 209510
arrangement $171199018 \quad 21$
200520204424208113
2082 II 20884
arrangements [1] 209520
arrived (3) 19801519893
199024
ascertain |1] 193524
ashore 1101 19818 16
19955720951622
$2141 / 21432121484$
215214
aside [1] 214316
dskıng $1151192923 \quad 193810$ 19702419711019944
200723203124207125
$209220 \quad 212314214510$
$214910 \quad 215517$
asleep (1) 19896
aspect [31 19638 211] 10 21123
aspects (1) 2073 /4
assess 11120384
assessment 111 /945 14
 2089 14
assıgned $|3| 206019 \quad 20855$ 21228
assignment [6] 199610
2078821404131416
assugnments [1] 213923
assugns [1] 2077 I]
assist [1] 208712
assistance [7] 194521
196315211120211712 1719
assistant II 19405
assistants |11 $21 / 42$
assocrate $\{111940421509$
associated III 197716
assume $1151193715 \quad 19533$
198711993181920
2009620507206125
20841211515212510
213612151313
assumed [111 196515
2062342102621447 $2149421511314 \quad 215211$ 215310
assumes [2| 19712425
Assuming 11121131
assuming |1| 209419
assumption (3) 19533
19651521504
assurance 111211216
assure [3] 20845821018
assured (1) 19543
assures 111211525
assuring [2] $201525 \quad 2084$ 14
astern (3) 20184232019 /I
attaching [1] 193015
attain [1] 203623
attempt [1] 20183
attempted (1) 204722
attempts $\left\{2 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lll}2065 & 13 & 14\end{array}\right.\right.$
attend 12194923
attendance 111194821
attended [5] 1939519798
20606206417
attending [3] 206012
206322209813
attentron $\{3120732121177$ 21296
attentive [1] 20982
attutude [2] 203624209419
attorney [2] 204012208619
attorneys [1] 199820
attribute 111194317
August (2) 19462420545
authorites $[2] 197515$
21431
automatically [2] 19882
21168
autopilot [1] 19923
avaulability 111211716
avaulable [20] 20062
20132120302520314
$20321012 \quad 2420335$
207310208018208216
208725208822089814
21085211111211421
211826
Avenue l11 19675
Aviatron III 20435
avord |11 20517
award $14 \mid 2074$ / 207589 19
awarded [3| 207561423
awards $|10| 207318 \quad 23$
$20743510 \quad 2520751122$
213345
aware 141| 194522195023
19697816205068916
2420515205351117
205522205616205711
$2058 / 415205932225$
$20611315 \quad 23206420$
20652520663212822
213159131521434
$214610 \quad 19 \quad 214719$
2148202149789
awareness [3] 20736
212425212614
awful |1] 21112

$$
-\mathrm{B}-
$$

B-a-a-t [1] 197822
B S $\{2 \mid 193969$
bachelor (1) 200410
background [2] 19393
200023
backwards $[2 \mid 201817$
baker III 20833
balance 12| 2086232087 11
ballast |4| 202714203117 20373
bar 131 19609204872070 /
Barry [11 197817
base $1211952 \quad 17 \quad 197116$
Based [3] 199415203412 21288
based [16] 1938419427
23194341972419926
1994 IS 2019914203311
203610208312209112
2094122095121291
basce [1] 21084
Basically [1] 21077
basically [13) 199616
2008102017218206625
$2071518 \quad 207310 \quad 207721$
2081420977210518
21269
bass [15] 19582200223
20042020055201322
2060132078220817
2094122095421078
2108621111221174
211911
bathroom [1] 198523
Baton [8] 193921519487
$19531119801318 \quad 19936$
20964
Bay $[3] 198215 \quad 16 \quad 19964$

Bux Syucar Appleaura
Baytown |11 20965
Beach [2] 19732421408
bear (11) 196417
beer [7] 19824198312
2110221201021485
21551619
beers [1] 19691
behalf [3) 202518204824 20493
behavioral [I] 194312
behavorally [1] 1953 /3
behaviors [2] 194346
behind (4) 2040120939
21133211814
behef [1] 195118
beliefs [1] 214417
believe [34] $1946 \quad 15 \quad 16 \quad 18$
19511924195271955 II
13195619195919
1975111519774197925
19932420442420497
20541720566206010
206216206410207110
232073212083221037
211815212013
21391621511
believed 13 | 193120
20321021538
beheves $11 \mid 2032$ 12
bell $16 \mid 20052021201012$
203881719
bend 11120205
benefit [5] 20546915
2077221144
benefits 17120152224
2046 II 2054172055912
205914
Benicra |1| 20962
bestows |11 20742
Betsy [1] 215510
bable [11 207121
bigger 11120111
Bill|l| 207218
billet 1112077 II
binge [2] 1943 /l
binoculars [2] 198523
198619
Birky [2] 2054520567
burth [1] 208923
birthday [1] 208923
bit [17] 19771219912
1998152009220124
2016132019720281
2048820659208519
209119213416213567
21361316
black 12| 200713200810
Blank |S| 2040122041614
15 21
Blugh 911985 / 198717
19888200320200610
2013192015423202021
blow [1] 203316
blown (1) 19527
blowup |1] 2038 /9
Blue (1) 212916
blue [2] 20786208316
Board 12120543205525
boarded |1| 2144 ||
boards |11 2073 15
Boat [1| 197822

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-20-94 VOLUME 14
boat |l| 2129 /6
boats |1| 20353
book |1| 203924
boredom [3] 19442195924
19604
Borgen [3] 20632123 20645
boring [1] 19605
boss [2] $19473 \quad 21317$
bother [2] 199022201923
bottle [4] $1982 \quad 20 \quad 24 \quad 21102$
21208
bounce |1| 19722
bow |2| $200810 \quad 2027$ 14
Bowen |11 $1930 / 4$
box [2] 20271820887
boy [1] 197916
brake [1] 20192
break [6] 192923196923
198982020420766
215719
breakfast [1] 214614
Breaking [l] 194224
breaking 11120176
$\begin{array}{lllllll}\text { breath } & \text { (4) } & 2141 & 13 & 14\end{array}$
214221215518
breathalyzer $1212148 \quad 15 \quad 16$
brew 11121207
Bran |1| 204514
bridge|321 $1981 / 219821 /$
23198521022198647
$\begin{array}{lllll}19 & 20 & 19874 & 19894\end{array}$
$19901022 \quad 25199316$
19941691119979
$201310 \quad 15 \quad 18 \quad 202420$
2029142220682207225
2099121471
brief |ㄴ| 19852325
brsefly 161193912198722
199423208310214118
215415
bringing 11 | 197322
broad 14| 2086720889
20432321175
Broader 11| 209421
broader 111209419
broadly [3] $194 / 8 \quad 1960 \quad 18$ 196522
Broadway 111197817
brunt |1] 1947 17
buddies |1] 19443
build |11 202310
building $1812023 \quad 10 \quad 14 \quad 16$
2043621411025215418
built [리 20204202312
bulletın 111207315
bumb ll| 2059 /
bunch 111196110

20042520434413
business |5| 204919
208610213513213629
busy [4] $199323 \quad 25$
2091 2321472
button |1| 2024 21
buttons [?] 20183201910
buyer [1| 213912
$-\mathrm{C}-$
cabin $|3| 198 / 1013$

2141 19
cafeteria [1] 19473
calculated [1] 20852
calculation [1] 200224
calculations [12] 200013
$20022022 \quad 25 \quad 200368$
20056720341718
20421723
Caluforna (3) 20962211014
Call $\{2 \mid 19294213818$
call [22] $193651938 \quad 18$
19423194824195224
$19701419788 \quad 1990 \quad 22$
1997232520221317
20271520452208217
20886209017211013
$213418 \quad 213819214014$ 21534
calling [3] 194514208224 212314
capability [2] $196192121 \quad 13$
capacities [1] 208321
capacity [2] 21391115
Cape [1] 212917
capsize ll| 20179
capsizing (1! 20176
Cdpsizings |1| 2001 /]
captained |l| 2140 I
captains $\mid 1511976519949$
$2047 / 2206713208958$
1720943209820212722
2135122140172150813 15
captioned |1| 2163 //
car [2] 1981 22 20191
 $199392070321181 / 16$ $20 \quad 2138921529215624$ 25
career [5| $196320 \quad 19844$ 20748207721
careful [1] 213719
carefully $[2] 206419 \quad 212420$
cargo ||5| 1989714
$1996 / 4200324200816$
201467201816207224
$20781322 \quad 25208124$
Carr [1] 21553
carried [2] $199320 \quad 208123$
Carrier [2] 2121 1521
carries [2] $195524 \quad 208119$
carry $131208613 \quad 210623$ 21248
carrying 1212072421571
case |30| $19296 \quad 193725$
193841945719565
$1958181977 / 1199324$
$200318 \quad 200511820175$
2021 202026612204516
204622051920564
208419211513211618
212458215615215836
7 /1 2163 /1
case-by-case [1] 1958 !
cases [5] $1960 \quad 14 \quad 19949$
20002220674214524
casualty [1] 20685
catch [2| 20959210616
categories |1| 19465
category |1| 208016
Cdtering II $2 / 39$ /2
caught [7] $1975 \quad 12 \quad 210619$
211182131192132456 caused 19120135201723
520391820402320414
$22 \quad 2113 / 3$
celebrate |l| 211912
celestual (1) 197922
cement |1] 202718
center [8] 1939202124
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}1940 & 21 & 1987 & 15 \quad 19928 \quad 14\end{array}$
centerlme [3] 200818
20101920148
centers [2] 1947719486
central [2] $195916 \quad 18$
century [1] 21348
ceremony [1] 209117
Certificate [1] 21632
certuficate [1] 20544
certification [1] 212813
CERTIFY [1] 21638
cetera [2] 196412205424
chair [1] 215622
CHALEM [1] 216321
Chalem |l] 21636
challenges $11 \mid 20957$
CHALOS [13] 20044
$201322 \quad 20217172325$
$203321 \quad 22 \quad 20346 \quad 14$
204318205720216012
Chalos $13 \mid 20224203319$ 21036
chambers [1] 215716
chance $\{6 \mid 20133209516$
209724211012211379
change |11| 19371319422
$19449101988 / 4199222$
2011192020401920465 208917
changed 181193624
1940151919421197210
204672091221339
changeover ! 1! 199219
changes [2] 199621212022
changing [1] 20164
channel $|3| 20181213$
2021 4
characterstuc [3] 194356 19
characterize [2] 20492
213515
charge [2| 20021213
charm |1] 205321
chart |l4| 195325197810
1982 /f $1720 \quad 204723$
20482208310209617
2097421037825
charter 111212916
Check |l| 2153 I check 111119481219611
1962151970242037 1/
2057121529242521532
checked [5] 19933210223
214456215312
checking |3| 194719
$194813 \quad 208110$
checks [1] 19736
chef [4] $213922 \quad 214015$
21461621496
chemicals (1] 208120
Chuef $|3| 199113 \quad 203725$
21556
chief 1111196717198910 18199061120372516 2038232078 II
chill [1] 20887
choce [2] $1962 \quad 20 \quad 211423$
chose [1] 20858
Christmas \{2] 208922 211910
chronic [2] 1942 || 16
circumstance [4| 19829
198620198710204924
circumstances $\mid 11119355$
19831519861819876
1991181992231994713
16204922
City |l] 200313
civil [11 19296
clams [2] 21571216
clarify [3] 19357195612
196521
clarity [1] 1991 10
classification $[2] 20057$ 20933
classıfied 12 2 $2080 \quad 16 \quad 17$
classify [1] 211618
clear (19) 1941 1219876
201716203591013
2037102039212052612
1620206916207810
208523210321211622
214215
clear-cut [1] 214915
clearer [2] $195615 \quad 202018$
CLERK 11511929319657

19982410201617
2045472138212321392
client $\begin{cases}12 & 2001 \\ 18 & 19\end{cases}$
closed [1] 19333
closer [1] 20956
co-op [1] 19999
Coast [22] 19751519792
202317202524202634
2070141821207820
20825208322208710
2109152122215212723
2128202321292421346 21574
coast (12] 20621320893
2096421002521027
2110242127162140711
2143132153611
cocktal (I) 209725
cocktails [2] 209810 /1
code [1] 19988
codify [1] 193719
COHEN [5] 19662124
19678197418215916
College [2] 1979 Il 200312
college [8] 19394197989
10199969
Collesions (1] 200111
colliswons (1) 199822
COLLOQUY [2] 195016
195522
column [2] 19332210310
combatung [1] 21086
combatting [1] 211113
comfortable [1] 215223
Coming [1] 213023
coming [20] $1929 \quad 1519563$

19789198421985716 24198856201025 201491020361720921
209822112182121114
21271021555
comma [1] 194210
command 111 /993 19
comment 1112102 /3
commented |1| 213014
comments [2] 195324
$2 / 412$
commercial |2] 201824
202323
Commisston |11 216322
commitment |1| 207215
committee (1) 211915
common (4) 199015
19971420491920653
commonly [1] 208322
communcate 11119566
communicated (1) 213115
communeations $|2| 20206$
9
commute |I| 208716
companies 191196716
20751920762520778
207992082721081
21092123
Company [48] 193120
193212193914194057
$18 \quad 19452519501421$
195515195714197914
19971720451723
2048252049420559
2056320592223206218
2063820681023207112
207252075430801018
20844208513210322
2108221091821103
21121021245212818
21339213412213510
$21379213910 \quad 1421435$
company-sponsored (1) 19371
comparable |f| 209015 compare |11 207519
compared (1) 209013
compass 111200822
compelling [1] 203823
compensate [1] 206710 compensation $|2| 2046 / 2$ 20673
comptence 11121289
competition |1| 209112
competative 111 209218
competitors [1] 210918
complement [3] 2081 is
208420208515
complements (1) 208316
completed (6) 194515
$194816 \quad 2059121921131$
213216
completes [3) 193817
20348211519
completing 11121275
complance 121208468 complied |II 208415
comply $1611948 \quad 13 \quad 208413$
$2025 \quad 20862121225$
complying [1] 196019
compound [1] 194323
computer [2] 200813
computer-driven (1) 198724
concervable [1] 199312
concept [3] 20739 I1
21071
concepts [1] 21084
conceptualized |1] 19375
concern [28] 19318 19
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}1953 & 25 & 1955 & 13 & 1956 & 14\end{array}$
17191957172119586
23195937819601
1993 2-20576 205915
20872210017210213
2108121341819213619 2121569
concerned [14] 1954 I
195720221964619855
201514203691517
2082921012421021112 21519
concerning [6] 19322
19951319206824
2151/4 21573
concerns |7| 199623
203662063520651516 21176213624
conclude 17119551019719
101978120121521587
11
concluded [3] 1971 11
1972719783
concludes [1] 196618
concluding [1] 19718
concluston (131 197116
1972410197715198125
2051 1516252052824 2112252129121586
conclusmons |11 193925
Condition (2) 19861419874
condition [7] 19382
19772119872200316
201319203116212624
conditions [9] 198623
1988141519906199212
20196203117208713
212914
conduct [2] 1936319612
conducting [2] 1931 21
204925
conference \{21) 20631819
21 222520646 /l 1417
18208624209724
$20981321342022 \quad 25$
2135321361518
conferences (6) 2084 /] 12
2086120971720997
212424
confidence [1] 196512
confidentual [8] 19642513
19651620801521085
21111221174
confidentualty [2] 19637
214320
confidentrally [2] 211822
21527
confirm |1| 20448
confirms [1] 20138
conjunction |1| 203324
connected [2] 1948721506
connectron [4] 20724
2082521102321578
conning [1] 19939
conscrousness [2] 20726 20735
consequences [1] 210710
consider 1811934812
19372201512211222
2126192132521577
considerably [1] 203518
consideration (1) 193710
considered [5] 193624
201711208561021287
consistent $[3 \mid 204816$
211223211819
consistently (1) 209612
consists III 20008
constant [2] 1943821044
constrtuted [1] 199114
construction (3) 199917
20001120058
consult [11 20639
consultant 111 203014
consultants [2] 193622
19383
consultation [1] 19562
consulted 141195013
1955920631220689
consulting [1] 199819
consumed [2] 19743
205013
contact 19119352519408
131819565211022
21412224
contacted (I) 213123
contactung [11 212318
contains 11121639
contemplated 111211719
content $12 \mid 2120 / 2 \quad 14$
context |6| 19387194619
19561319663520462
contuguty [1] 208823
continually [1] 19421
continuation [1] 19296
continue [3] 19299196110
210719
CONTINUED [4] 1929 /]
1965102159312
contunued (5) 193215
2113521191920214118
contunuing [2] 196024
2096 II
contınurty [1] 20774
contunuous [2] 1931 21
19327
contraband [1] 197225
contract [31 20901121173
212120
contracted [1] 196313
contractors [1] 212025
contracts [1] 20778
contrary [1] 210617
contrast [1] 19584
contribute [1] 209620
contributed [1] 21127
contribution [2] 2092 11
20937
control [3| 20771421133
21564
controlled [1] 196010
controlling [1] 209423
controls [1] 200620
conventence [2] 206925

Bence Syakme Appiculucrs
20701
conversation [19| 1931 517
19358152019509
19532019551019969 1/
171924199722141916
1725215216
conversations (3) 1949 /3
2319967
convinced [1] 214517
Cook [1] 209314
cook [1] 213921
cooperated [1] 212119
copies (1) 19773
copy [7] 19322223
19341920682121049
210589
core [1] 20577
corner [2] $193421 \quad 205418$
corporate |31 195710
2095911
Corporation [8] 1957479
2045162049420564
21081213411
corrected [1] 203516
correctly [1] 20142
corresponds 11120099
corridor |11 198122
cost [2] $1948 \quad 14 \quad 15$
costs |2| $209423 \quad 212912$
Counsel [2] 20757215618
counsel |2| $207662 / 5715$
counselang 111211417
counselor $14 \mid 19478$
$19621215 \quad 23$
counselors [1] 196315
counter [1] 200820
counterparts [1] 208824
countung [1] 1976 1]
couple [15] 196831969 I
197413197523198424
$19901319974 \quad 20261619$
20411320461207725 2105222157221581 course [20! 1945 15 19509
1971719921922199319
19962420042021
2005192010122011917
20126201820202023
20305204020205716
courses |2| 207936
Court [2] 19294204414
court (S) 20002223
20172120482420493
courthouse |1| 21562
courtroom |11 203013
courts |11 20448
Cousin (1) 199418
Cousins |l0| 198013
$199219 \quad 20199315$
$19952519965 \quad 2319974$
210418
cover 111207016
coverage |1| 212025
covered [5] 19522219661
2035222057720867
covers [1] 194815
crack |1| 215714
created 111193719
creatuve |l| 21268
credo 1 l0] $207112 \quad 13$
207258102073221124

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-20-94
VOLUME 14
Concordance by Look SecertSi
2113 /I 21371215
crew 1271 197624199134

1996152023222520242
2027420302206915
2073 / 21412 21441315
21453214725214810 II
2321493215221
crews [S] 20742207622
207772078420845
criteria [2] 19452220664 critical [1] 206914
criticism [1] 20684
CROSS |14| 195624
196510197419199424
20212420706215413
215991218242160 II
1721611
Cross |2] 199422206924
cross $16 \mid 193815196418$
19661820046202122
214625
cross-examine [1] 20453 crossed [1] 205025
crude 1812081172320822
31224208515
cuffs l2 $^{2} 19759$ /4
culminate 111 193712
Cup 12119992224
cure $12 \mid 195115210715$
cured |ㅇ| 194179
current |11 19579
currently |3| 1944221957 ! 205821
curse 111215015
cursing [2| $214619 \quad 214712$
curves [1] 203020
Custom (11)2121 13
custom |11 1935 /
customer 111208122
cut |31 $20346 \quad 2048$ /4
2089 /3
cutung |11 $2033 / 9$
—— D -
dad 1120228
dalv |6| 2004202420051 51120925
Dallas 111194020
damage (19) 200122
200317200813200989
2017315201815202711
203915182040132124
20414 II 172120427
damaged |I| 2027 /4
Dammash |11 193924
Dan [리 2045321145
danger 121210724214919
dangerous 14| 20656
209825209934
DANIHL $16 \mid 20451220706$
213072160141720
Dantel II 204510
dark (2) 2007 /1 201719
dashed (1! 200814
data |3| $193722 \quad 20395$ 20486
date 1101193418196722
19791519802022
20501421339214022

214318
DATED [1] 216314
dated [2] $193014 \quad 206613$
Day (10) 211923214313
1621444721511920
21521314
day (18] 19711198156
198822200722207220
2087222520881420902
32096122214319
215613215889216314 day to-day [2] 193425 19585
days [30] $19494195812 \quad 13$
19605111962111225
198049161724199516
208817202089213
2090134520952223 215811
Deal||| 20802
deal |8| 20001112200123
20051120662120802
21083215719
dealing (1) 205819
dealings |11 20516
deals [2] 199817200421
dealt |8| 1999 || 200419
23200524621352
21544
death 111194217
debate $1112145 / 8$
decade |1| 194117
decide 141196522205725 20581
decided (11 $2088 / 8$
deciding [2] 21437214718
decision $\mid 7120681023$
2116321172125212816
213122
decisions |11 2030 I/
Deck [1] 207822
deck [28) 198914199134
5710 II 141620
2007 1/ 2008920789 /1
182120811520828
$20875209025 \quad 213414$
2141 1921421
deep [3] 200519201819
defeating 111212516
defend [1] 1993 I
Defendant |l| 21218
defendant [1] 210513
Defendants |5| 207916
2109321221821381014 defendants 161193815
195622204416210825
213845
define [1] 19433
defined II 19535
defintion 12119425
degradation |11 21363
degree [23] 193969 J]
200491020061820126
201414201515111318
201645620331420343
5202223203610
degrees (111 200412
20082320091201124
2012172032222420332
delay (11) 2 2039 15
delaberately |l| 21464
demoted (1] 21074
demotron [1] 206221
denual (1) 194224
department [41] 192916
193120193236193512
1936311193717194417
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}1945 & 21 & 1947 & 13 & 15 & 18\end{array}$
$195019195221 \quad 195421$
195519195624196416
19661220468205512
205910162320621
2063122087519
208811211516212323
215558
departure [1] 199014
depended [3] 198912
206718
dependency [3] 21087 21111324
Depending [1] 213024
depending [3] 19567
203116207816
depends |1] 203121
depicted $|5| 20092320109$
201517201619202013
depiction $11 \mid 201025$
depicts [2] 20074200919
deposition [21] 192910
193215193819196622
203821203918204622
242050120512120524
718232061678
21001721011721026
213820
depression [1] 206421
describe (10) 193912
19791/198722 201425
2067 / 2073 / 207423
2086122119921368
described $|8| 19367$
19531119905200113
2003232004220094
211110
describing (3) 1985825
19866
description |1| 195223
desugn 1911999122122
20042020238916
20436207816
designed [4] 198725
2005621071521264
designing l-1 202318
20352
details [1] 19319
determunation l6] 19469
19549195618201419
2056510
determine |12] 194218 21
19451722201011
20421720822320852
2148112221492
determining [3] 194521
194621205911
detract |1| 21177
Develop 111 2031 12
develop |21 203111121241
developed [11 212320
development [2] 196321 212512
device |1| 203324
Deviyn |2| 2075919
dabetics 111195818
dagnoses [2] 19335
193724
diagnosis [11] 19332814
181934510193724
1964 / 205419205915
210014
dictate 11120803
Diego [3] 2041 8 I6 2042 I
diesel $[3$ ) $198724 \quad 25 \quad 20326$
difference [1] 2081 18 differentrate [11 2093 /
differentuated 111209212 difficult [2] 1942201989 I
difficultes (1) /943 /2
difficulty [1] 21476
dg [2] 2047121271$]$
dinner [5] 19811220883
20991121485215517
DIRE [2] 2004721605
DIRECT [16] 192911
19382019677197819
199811200515204512
$2139321593 \quad 6 \quad 15 \quad 21$
2160281423
direct [5| 207321210125 21296213225
directed [2] 21317215522
direction 161193720
2012222021420275
216313
directive |II 194316 director $1911939 / 619$ 19405719571020467 2049 / 20621721378 directs |1| 200216
drty [1] 215014
Disabiltites 111 213321
Disability [1] 19558 disability (1) 196019 disabling |2| $2075 \quad 14 \quad 17$ disadvantage $|2| 206823$ disadvantages [3| 206724 212858
disagree $16 \mid 19472425$ 19511320691921075 disagreed (1) 1948 I disappointed 111206913 dsasters (1) 20011 discharge [10] 194020 19481019672119757 $\begin{array}{llll}200219 & 22 & 24 & 25 \\ 2003 & 7\end{array}$ discharged [2] $1968 / 2$ 210911
discharges (1) 19805 discipline |11 21119 disconnected 11120052 discontunued [3] 211925 212012
discretion [2] 208422 20857
discrimanate [1| 208014 discuss [7] 195315206625
20721221169214417 214920215717
discussed 881 1931 11 1935152014520538 206011141520632 discusses [21 206712 discussing |l| 206224
discussion [11] 1929 IS 22

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
$2425 \quad 1931891025$
$193520 \quad 195323$
discussions 1101 1931 19
19324193618193712
$1945251950 \quad 20 \quad 195317$
19771820057208410
disease (4) 19429194318
20597
disk $12 \mid 196416 \quad 18$
dispute 14| 20322210013
210623210713
disputes 11120804
disputing $11 \mid 21078$
distunction $|2| 19529$
214720
distort [11 20205
distractung 111209119
distributed [1] 208122
DISTRICT 11121633
disturb [11 20168
dıvulged 11119648
dock [4| 2041817207223
208424
Doctor [11 193413
doctor 11111936519453
141955192519564
2059152099242115911
211823
doctors $1211949 / 4 \quad 19$
document |22| 19301318
1934132219541925
195514141619563
1962620012220532324
2054220551720585
21042421051821271115
documentation (2) 19495
195620
documents $1151 / 932 / 4$
2047161722204820 205342055151920563

211618
Doesn't 11119305
doesn't |15| 193012
19851919902220114
201223201923202110
203012033152034518
20701213325214720 21517
dog [1] 21067
dollars [1] 206721
door (4) $2091 \quad 18 \quad 21327$
21411125
dot $|2| 2008920096$
doubt $14 \mid 2004420339$ 21081618
Douglas [31 19491924 19505
Dr $136 \mid 1929$ 2/ 1934 /9
$\begin{array}{lllll}1935 & 20 & 22 & 23 & 1938 \\ 15 & 17\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llll}18 & 22 \quad 1940 \quad 10 \quad 16 \quad 19\end{array}$
$1947310 \quad 2419491819$
2022241950459
$19531518 \quad 2319559$
19565141957119623
19651220545210013
drank [8) 1941 219693
1974/4 19827 19959
21301314213110
draw |3| $197024 \quad 207625$
211225
drifts |11 198718
drink [24| 1941519439
19445 1951 91820
$1969391720 \quad 2519768$
1982211983219955
209951021012021024
21135212015214814
214921
drmker 15119431119514
62319528
drinkers [2] 195/ 1019523
Drinking +1F1943 7
drinks 14| 195141952 1
1976620997
Drive $\{2 \mid 1939$ | 2045 /1
drive [3] 19812220191
203114
driven [1] 212813
driver (1) 2148 /4
driving (1] 213512
drop [1] 20376
dropped 141198421
198813171207221
drug $11611930315 \quad 193113$

$\begin{array}{llllllllll}21086 & 211113 & 18 & 24\end{array}$
$2115721175 \quad 20 \quad 212425$ 21252
drugs |10| 21052321068
21074252108912
21098211511212118
212420
drunk 12512059 / 210120
21241421301623
2131 11 214282145414

21481011121231493
$215022 \quad 2151813215218$
drunkenness [1] $2 / 44 / 8$
dry [2] 2041817
DSM 1119333
DSM 111 |6| 193381014
1934410209922
due 111119452196415
20101202813207921
20811210625210714
$2133 \quad 12 \quad 13$
dummy [1] 20555
Duncan [1] 207218
Dutch [1] 211424
dutues [7] 19401120016
20461320782124
$2086 / 4213316$
dutv (39) $19374194513 \quad 21$
$194621 \quad 195325195445$

2119561101618
1957232519581219624
7205659205719
20832520851310
$20881416 \quad 212619$
21321213214225
Dwight [5] 206291325
206335
DXI70 (7) $207110 \quad 22 \quad 24$
2072122161522
DX3609 [5] 212l 202225
21611421626
DX3614 17121214689
21222221611321625
DX3618 $15 \mid 2122141619$

21611521627
DX4471 |11 21047
DX9113 |1| 21096
DX9118 [1] 207322
dysthymıa [1] 19336
$\frac{-\mathrm{E}^{2}}{\overline{\mathrm{~F} \text { mel } \mathrm{l}[2] 196624196710}}$
E thhy I |l| 19576
early 14119424205012
2087421348
earn III 20904
earned |1| 20902
easel |11 209019
easier [2] 20071420808
easty [1] 194410
east [I] 198718
easy [2] $19908 \quad 10$
eat $[2 \mid 20872320884$
Eddre 111215411
educate (1) 21354
education [2] 1979519995
educational [2] 1939312
effect [81 19311319482
1972241987520649
21429214820215125
effects $13 \mid 1941101942 \quad 16$
208025
efficiently [1] 20919
effort [2] 20021620735
efforts [3) 20521525
2121 17
EHAP $[811947819669$
211572116232521184
69
eught 12120881420925
eught hour (11) 198822
exght-year III 1976 /5
electronic |1| 200719
elamination [1] 212823
FImo |2| 20172021047
embrace 111198514
EMEL [4] 19677197419
21591518
Fmel 16119662224
196710197116197413
197712
emerged $[2] 194418$
196022
emergency [4] 20314913 25
emotional [4] 19571821
19582119596
employed |111 1957137
1319771619791618
2129 // 213991317
Fmployee (1) 211319
employees [39] 19303
1931211932819353
1947119571419601422
19616142219635
196512205621207210
1220771279131721
2079202080221018
2106222210724210816
211422211742121197
1121227212312212416 212812
employer [2] 194822
211820

Benc Syucan Applocuume
employers [1] 21082
employment [4] 193122
197611197913199815
empty [1] 198223
enabler (1) 19449
enclosing [1] 20546
encounter (1] 215417
encountered [ 2 ] 21541621
encourage [5] 1961910
20677102126 II
encouraged [2] 196023
207212
Encouragement [1] 19617 7 end l11] $1942 \quad 22 \quad 196617$ 20102220123203116 20702020931517
209622214524215712
ended [2] 198915200813
endorsement [5] 2067568 9212723
ends [1] 21038
enforce [2] 20731121228
engaged (2) 19982121241
engme [31| 198720200319
2008212009232011713
20122120193202421
2028522202910203017
203152032620341
203514172038320396
$\begin{array}{llll}9 & 121419 & 204014\end{array}$
204112222042 11
2086192087521558 engineer [22] 196717 199816199923200014 $15181925 \quad 2001113$
2004122012320146
201532023511211025 21496215511
engineering [15] 19998
20012200223200411
192015212021915
202347820781523
Engineers 111 200020
engineers 111202319
engines (111) 200915
$20121012 \quad 2024161718$
203120203292035 /I
20362220413
enhance [4] 20672 /4
21211321365
enrolls |l| 211125
ensued 111 2141 10
entall 11119616
enter |11 $2129 / 9$
entered $1311931 / 10 \quad 193517$ 212120
entering [2] 1965 /9 1972 22
enters $111 / 96518$
entutle |l| 19342
entutied 16119332208112
2090521152221166 21271
entuty 11121362
entry [3| $205418 \quad 22 \quad 20557$
environment $|4| 19585$
1960710206915
Environmental |-| 1959 2] 22
environmental $|2| 195920$ 23
episodically |I| 1943 /0

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-20-94 VOLUME 14
Concordance by Look-Sec(671,
equal [1] 212810
equate [2] 19331420
equipment (4) 19548
19961321221012
error [1] 20974
ESA [1] 1976 I
escapes [1] 194110
essence [1] 21366
essentually [2] 2094321362
established [1] 197013
esteem |1| 21365
estumate |2| 1976 12 $201 / 24$
et $|2| 196412205424$
Ethyl|31 1957479
evaded 121210019210124
evaluate [10] 195223
195812030121620384
2085131721151221249
21274
evaluated (2) 2062120932
Evaluatung [1] 210416
evaluating [1] 20664
evaluation |4| 2066721158
212618213720
evaluations 16120562022
205715172058510
evening |3| 197124
209725
evenings 111196824
evenly |11 2087 |/
event (3) 1953720685
208923
Everybody |II 215323
everybody 1111194719
2014212053920611
2073172091182092823
2103252119421515
evidence $16 \mid 20145203415$
2038182044420699
20791
evoluthon [21 19412519424
exact |S| $1931 / 515193418$
198020201510213612
exuctly $|x| 194016 \quad 198916$
2042242043320484
20617210216215416
EXAMINATION 1341192911
193820195624196510
19677197419197819
1994241998 /1 20047
200515202124204512
207062130721393
21541321593691215
182124216025811
$1417 \quad 202321611$
examinatron $|5| 195623$
$19612196281964 / 8$
196622
examine [1] 208220
EXAMINFR16| 192912
$193821 \quad 195625215947$ 10
exammer 1120527
examinang |1] 2040 I example 1711948819494
195991990920743
$2(811020908$
examples 111200115
exceeded 11120329
exceedingly $111 / 931$ ?
excellence 111 2075 ?
except [2] $198522 \quad 206921$
exceptron [1] 210919
excess [3] 19514208813 2127 I
exchange [1] 21573
excited [2] 20357203925
excluded [1] 194919
excursюons 11120066
Excuse [3] 19522203319 210422
excuse [4] 19664204922 25, 21088
exercise (11) 209913
exhaust (1) 203118
exhausted (1) 198925
Exhibut [49] 195423195511
19781020445204710
204862053101125
20551720691207124
20722207413141722
$207525 \quad 207632079214$
17208334820941
21033210581115
21081921091421179
1114 2121 692225
$212216 \quad 19 \quad 22212523$
$21261 \quad 21279 \quad 21381316$
exhibit |13| $203818 \quad 204324$
20475142048916
$2066 / 2152420947$
21255213810
Exhibited [1] 212124
Exhibits [1] 204422
exhibits 171204431018
252046222047321383
existed [1] 210720
existence |s| 199825
1999 / 205351117
existing 111209110
exists 111202022
expand 111210523
expanded 111212024
expect 1411963 16 25
$197720 \quad 205415$
expectation 111211514
expected $[2 \mid 208523 \quad 21452$
expects (II) 21156
experience [22] 193918
1984171986 /1 19885
199042519911619926
1994 15 2000920041418
20242320261020307
$\begin{array}{lllll}2034 & 24 & 2082 & 5 & 6 \\ 2089 & 19\end{array}$
2103212128921291
experienced 111203410
expert 1811977221998 ।
2001820041201324
204171015
expertise $\{3120032220045$ 20219
Expires |1| 216322
explain [11] 20073201918
20212207924208118
2083102101232140521
214918215111
explained III 206916
explanation 111201121
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}\text { explict } & 12 \mid & 1957 & 14 & 1998 & 18\end{array}$
express 131 1931 19195617
204011
expressed $131 / 96225$

204257
extensive [1] 202423
extent [4] 19712420062
II 202415
extra [2] 2068120904
extracting [1] 202010
extreme (2) 20111220174
extremely [1] 206913
Exxon-generated [1] 195418
eye $[3] \begin{array}{lllll}2097 & 15 & 19 & 211017\end{array}$

## - F -

FAA $121199916 \quad 204310$
faced (11) 21166
faciltues [3] 1935319456 210724
facilty (10) 19454195319
1960161962111820
$1965 \quad 23 \quad 251966913$
facing [5] 200825200923
20126
fact [35] 193261219343
$21 \quad 1937519421819455$
12194625195010
1953241960719637
19644198625198924
1992211993119945
20232220278202812
203419203911204223
20601152062420695
210417
21071421081617
211825213113
factor [5] $199217 \quad 199417$
20802120961121264
factors [7] 1981 242066 II
2088192120932123
21167
facts 141 19941620577
2058 I 212622
fall (1) 209917
farled III 199222
falls 11119654
fallure |1] $2001 / 1$
failures (11) 199823
fair (21) 19727200618
2041 120471619204817
$2049101421 \quad 2052313$
222055620562205910
206011206125206223
20672421005213411
farly $|5| 20482206119$
2067222096 15 2141 11
fall |3| 2022220628
211119
falling l6| 20591212413
2146521471021215217
familar [2] 19872020209
famiharize (11 2125 I
family [8] $193917 \quad 194314$
20892123209689
21051211912
fantall [1] 196825
fashon [2| 1931 21 21462
Fast (11 2154 11
fast 111203522
fast-forward [1] 196419
faster 111203115
father 111203815
fatugue 1171 1991 23716

Basc Systerna Appircationa
$20199417 \quad 20851321$ $208618 \quad 2087212213416$ 232135134
fatugued |11 208525
favor 111210713
fear (1) $2153 / 4$
February [6] 1980212224
19811219961
Federal [3] 19991620435 212012
federal [3] $212718 \quad 21299$ 21301
fee [1] 2129 /3
feed [I] 208120
feel [8] 19485 199] 20
2091821421225214525 214622215324
feeling [1] 19482
feels |1| 21187
feet [3] $2014 \quad 22 \quad 202714$
20355
fell [1] 19892
fellow [1] 19931
felt [11] $198819 \quad 201994$ II
20063200910201414
20655210017214423
215112
female [2] 21556 Il
ferries [1] 1972 17
fiche $\{2 \mid 193420$
field |l| 207922
figure 12120914215718
file flol 19359121418
195519205417205511
20562220947
files [9] $193518 \quad 20531218$
192055920205634 20575
fill [21 2070 |l 2077 ||
final [1] 21578
financtal [21 195] $16 \quad 21176$
find $191194719 \quad 200525$
201821202420204820
210422212078215018
fine l21 $197725 \quad 214711$
Finish (1) 2151 23
finish [3] 21306214216 215121
finushed (2) 2142121511
fired 191197421197519
17192119972021074 213318
firing $16 \mid 21302122$
213314172225

19991211202123
20007812
First [5] 196714203823
21051721124212512
first [37] $1929 \quad 23 \quad 193417$
19352119393619577
196713191977419793
1991512199319200624
2007120129201613
20181020285203312
203422047320543
206624207011207213
20789210022210722
212613151621285
213715214516215415 215621

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-20-94 VOLUME 14
Corsondance by Look-Seec 68 )
fisherman |11 204515
fit 113119451221195325
$1954815 \quad 1619551416$
195616205652058925
212624
fitness |151 1946 21 195511 $21 \quad 195611018195718$ 212519582119624 2056920571921106
 $\begin{array}{lllll}196211 & 1219947 & 202617\end{array}$
$203013203222 \quad 203314$
20343420406205122
20751517207816
20831318209034
20952520961215519
flag [2] 207519210917
llagships [1] 20776
flat [2| 2092510
Fleet [2] 20631920864
fleet [41] 19572319598
2046420471119204915 22206022206115
$\begin{array}{llllll}2062 & 13 & 2063 & 18 & 21 & 22 \\ 25\end{array}$
2064 11 1420701421
20711720726918
20752220802320825
2084112086126
209014209716210025
21111
212215212424212716
21342025213615
213922214015
fleets |11 20812
nexibility |11 208422
float 12120122122
floated (1) 20276
fotation |II 20024
flow III 19564
Flynn 11121051
focus $13121 / 816212223$ 21267
focusing 111212313
follow 151 19483206110
20959212914214512
follow-up 191193024
19364121938 II 19471
$8 \quad 1948 \quad 15 \quad 16 \quad 199314$
followed (5) 19352325
1936819477205812
following (3) 197015
20172520181
follows |3| 1942 13 203822 204222
food $171208718 \quad 1925$
20882689
foot |31 201422201912
force [5] 198832034 /l
2093220994212719
forced [11] 200811209017
20209389209415
$2096121721 \quad 21032$
212910
forces (11) 204220
Fordham [2] 1979 I1
foregoing |2] 21639 l|
foretgn (1) 212114
foremost 121207215
207317
Forensce (1] 200020
forensce[8] $200015 \quad 18 \quad 19$

200111320041201520
20219
foresight [1] 21474
forget [2] 19392121556
forgot [2] 19771121383
form (171 195471923
$19551219568 \quad 204723$
2050820511516205324
20738210481417
212551521272
formal [31 1937219995
2087 24-
formally |9| 20564912
21052421061
formed [3] 20512520528
24
forming [1] 21098
forms [5] $195410 \quad 11 \quad 12 \quad 13$
212513
forth 1101193524193622
200917201012011215
161820215
forward [2] 210623212017
found |11 21073
foundered |I| 2129 I7
four 16119762019952
20751520781520831418
four year III 19798
fourth [1] 209818
fracture ${ }^{2} 12017520205$
fracturing (11) 20175
frame (8) $195521 \quad 2319748$
200712020220644
210023213318
framework [5] 208015
20918213313
Francis [31 $199925 \quad 20225$
Francisco (23) 195814
1968 5 1969 /9 1970 //
1972 16 1973 // 1419
$198051518 \quad 19812$
$\begin{array}{llllll}1982 \quad 14 & 15 \quad 16 \quad 19964\end{array}$
20963821402021424
214411215314215515
Frank [31 20689 21 22
frankly (1) 215713
free [3] 201778208823
frequently [1] 213015
friend [1] 211419
friendly [1] 198319
friends $\{31194449$
front (6) 19632204621
20532521271221562
fuel 11 208121
Full [1] 20195
full 131119527 1961 2
196341965819674
19781519985201114
2018423252019347
$\begin{array}{lllllll}11 & 20311 & 4 & 9 & 12 & 15 & 25\end{array}$
2032420331520351417
18204582077612
207920
full-blown [1] 195120
full-tume [1] 194018
fully $[21203 / 17 \quad 214718$
fumbing (1) 215523
function (5) 194722
1948251956521492
functioning [2] 199614 204310
fuss |11 21466
Future 111 213421
future [1] 196320

- G-

Gallo [1] 211918
gallon [2] 19743 II
Galveston 114119671420
214112142101417
21434172144152425
$21468 \quad 15214818$
gas II 2031 18
gash (11 202713
gasoline [1] 208120
gather [2] 21092521196
gathered [1] 203011
gave [91 19931920615
2087120972421001
2123921435214923
21573
Gee [1] 1982 I
gee [1] 19879
generically [I] 19342
gentleman (1) 2143 I2
gentlemen $121 / 9295$
215525
Gerry 111198021
gesture |1| 198319
gets [11] 20033420158
202525202657204911
1521414
grill| 19444
gist (2) 19471719545
Give [1] 200717
give [16] 1934181947 I
19483198824198912
19994200622202018
207318209516212019
2021238215756
given 19119374 1955 15
19862319901201721
20222208710210714
21232
gives 111201725
giving [1] 211216
glad [1] 19631
glass $[71198278919838$
1421485215516
glassed-ın [1] 215419
glasses [2] 19822224
goals |3| 1947419515
196410
gods [1] 196412
goes [14| 20062420101
1419201181516
2090192115151925
213481021564
gold [1] 20786
gotten [3] 19543210716 21101
GOULD [2] 19291121593
Gould [10] 192910193816
17194016191947310
$24194920 \quad 22$
government [4] 20821723
208312212012
governments [1] 2121 17
grade |1| 208125
grades [1] 208124
gradual [2] 19412519424

Bate Syturna Applealioms
gradually [1| 2091 2
graduated 1411979689 199913
graphic [1] 204722
Graves $[2012050691416$
17242051420521324
205356205516210118
192521027211612
213091321315
great (3) 19622519895
204020
greater [2] 19597212810
greatest [1] 2093 /5
green [1] 20487
Greg [4] 198013199224
199525210418
grind [1] 20172
grinding (2) 20173201925
ground [6] 20024200522
20137820291220393
grounded (3) 200825
203410203825
grounding [23] 193521
19442324194614
$\begin{array}{llllll}1949 & 10 & 13 & 25 & 19507\end{array}$
1957131966719743
199352013141820151
20169202072039 II
$2040142059222060 / 9$
206511
groundings [2] 199823
20266
group |lo| 194412205423
20558205914207219
2085192086720928
209318214112
groups (2) 19472119489
guaranteed [2] 2091 13
211525
Guard (18) 19751519793
20231720252420264
207820208322208710
2109152122215212724
2128202321292421346 21574
guess [11] 193922194116 25197915199123
209022209220212516
2151921572021586
gurdelines $\{8 \mid 210878$
212223212325820 21242
gulf [3| 20621320893 20964
Guy |l| 21556
guy |S| 1993620648
20951121032321557
guys |3| 1968242520935


FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-20-94 VOLUME 14

242040120481820942
317209818
half-hour 11119839
hall $(2) 207710 \quad 13$
hand [12) 19379196625
1978121998220087
20454205418207110
207592077315213821
handscap [3] 208041617
handicapped (1] 2134 l
handle [2] 20804211610
handled (11) 214716
handler (1) 215016
handing (4) 2021 $18 \quad 19$
2078 13 209414
happens [2] 20029204414
harbormaster (1) 204821
Hard (11) 20332
hard (12) 19428199023
20152520297820357
2054252120821452123
214717
harder (I) 1989 IS
harm \{2\} 20239214515
harried |l| 209822
Harrison $|6| 204171015$
24204234
Harvey |2| 20632020648
haul |11 215621
hauls 1112077 /
haven't |21 197919202420
hazard |11 207312
he'd $17119728 \quad 1320959$
2100182101242116 /l
215210
head 12119342519878
heading $121201413 \quad 204019$
headquarters 111194623
health $|5| 19363196314$
21171719211816
hear 171197520197625
199512207725209122
213622
heard I291 19491019515

2520021920142520206
2024132032141720605
20901621006210222
210925211320211623
21282521412214614
214924215020215219
21543
hearing III 2091 19
heat 11120888
heatung 111 208121
heavily 111 / 9439
heavy 1311943820508
heck 11120595
heel |2| $20 / 41314$
height 111201415
held 18 | $1931 \quad 1619377$
1939211957 I1 2064 18
20865213921216311
hello (4) 202210215421
2155812
helmsman |2| 203313
20357
help 125119441519472
$1964121965 \quad 2319668$
1989820061220166
$20371 / 2059421041013$

2108621111224211213
21131421141219
2115172117521211912 21583
helped [1] 2095 1/
helpful (1] 21187
helps [1] 194811
HEMMEN [8] 1998 II
20047200515202124
216025811
Hemmen [25] 19981613
161999252003920041
92005172006 21 22
201016201619201720
20223567820269
2028420301020332023 204318
HENDRIK [6] 1998 II
200472005152160258
Hendrit [1] 19986
HERBY [1] 21638
hey II] 214520
high [10] 19402195120
19796782014 // 20279
20981621261421272
higher |s| 20141924
2034420351820972
highlight 111211122
Hinchunbrook 14| $2 / 292$ // 1725
hindsught |l| $2 / 474$
hured 131196717 2041 6
21174
hiring |l| 207721
history (4) $193912 \quad 2070 \quad 12$
20729208013
hit |5| 2001 1920192
202213202814
hold [10| 195020195112
197920199013202110
2023519202821213919
hole l2| 213210 ll
holiday $14121198 \quad 1221$ 21203
holidays [2] 20892021202
Home [1] 1939 I
home (101 19382419585
19607196711197821
2089202220952321051
212315
honestly [1] 2150 /8
honesty |l| 1937 21
hook II 204221
hoops 111196224
hope |2| $2076 / 8 \quad 21569$
hoping III 20959
horsepower llol 203025
20313 9 || 21 2032 / 45
1013
horsepowers |1| 203120
hos 111205422
hospital [2] 20557211617
hospitalization (1] 193219
hospitals [1] 19353
Hour III 203524
hour [16] 1983619865
201191020352224

2085 // 209246209725
$2129 / 2$
hourly (2) 2091 1012
hours [22| 19581416
$1988 \quad 25198910 \quad 121821$
1990131995220256
2026161720832520843
208625208814209012
132092621341321486 21581
house [1] 200712
Housecleaning (1] 208811
housecleaning [1] 208810
Houston $\{811940410$
206418208662096258 21398
huge (1) 202718
huh-uh |1] 206410
Human (2) 20469206219
human [21] 19631020467
102049120581621 205918212062717
20659207619207921
208062220826208512
2105721378215322
hundred (3) 20672223 $2 / 45 / 7$
hung I2) $2018 / 4202912$
hydrostatic |l| 20056

## - I-

I'd 118119595201016
20172022206925
207011207110209518
24210462105821123
212017192125421279 21295
l've [12] 195151319605
19752519775198525
20242172046 21 206820 2157511
Iarossi|l6| 193161218
2043 /1 2063202064613
206892220691621145
2120182221351021368
нсе |9| 1984251987717

619948
rceberg [3] 2001 192022 /4 19
Idea [8] 1973 IS 198824 1989122024101420554 206222211422
Identufication |1| 204424
identufication [7] 20446
20742221131724
$21141213 \quad 213210$
identified IS| 196316
1966720069204423
21155
identufier 11121149
identufy 191194332071 1/
21081921147911
$2131 / 2135421568$
Identafying [1] 21146
Idrot [1] 204723
IDR |10] $193218 \quad 20193715$
1619554205391011
205517209917
gnare |l| 20033
ullness (1) 210524
ills [11 195116
illustrates [1] 208310

Reace Syztems Applicatora
imagine [4] 19922023 19931199419
imbalance [2] 208748
ummediately [5] 20367
20873213214215810 impact [1] 1963 /
mpacts |l| 215024
impaired (7) 1953 /3
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}1971 & 23 & 1981 & 15 & 18 & 21\end{array}$
1995214
implement [2] 2073321242
implementation |1] 21253 implemented [5] 208021
2111 19 2121 1921346 213511
implementing [|] 2086 /] important [13] 193023
19312194314212324
200342012520747
21283721345213723
importation 111212118
mposed [1| 212316
impossible [21 201825
204219
tmpression 171209515
$209625 \quad 2143232125$
215216
improve [1] 21269 improvement [2| 20975 21044
mproving [2] 2097 / 3 in'89 [1] 194614
in people [1] 195224
inaccurate [1] 1934 /
incidence [1| 21506
incident |121 197015
197524211211415
213616214019214712
$214924215020 \quad 215219$ 215316
Incidentally [1] 1934/3 incidents [1] 2001 16 include [4] $2046 \quad 16 \quad 2105 \quad 23$ 21202425
included [21 19937 21/] 2]
includes 121200022204712
incompetently |1| 2/47 16
inconsistent [2] $2020 / 4 \quad 20$
Incorporated [5] 1999 /1 20 2120042320054
incorrect [3] $201912 \quad 13$ increase [2] 1987242011 ] incurred [1] 2040 /3 indefinite [1] 193322 indented [1] 21282 independent [1] 207716 indicate $9911935 \quad 22 \quad 194715$ 1983151720448208624 2088122094221008 indrcated [13] 19332 1961/3 $2044 / 4208625$ 208722096162097136 1420984210016213015 indication [3] 198320 210222212312
indicator [2] 199338
Individual [1] 19558 undividual [19] 193517 1942181943241958 I $195925 \quad 19629 \quad 1965 \quad 17$ $196920 \quad 19758 \quad 205914$

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-20-94 VOLUME 14
( meortance by Loot-Soel 701

20815 2085572092 11
2111 $2521 / 217211417$
undividually $\mid$ ? 199017 2077 /8
individuals |10| 193015
19593101961319625
$210610 \quad 19 \quad 22 \quad 21086$
2111/2
Industrial [|| 2133 /3
industrial [5] 207921
$2081 / 210625 \quad 21331213$
industry |6| 207421
207625207782082 /1
2112521337
mebriated |l| 21483
inferior |1| $21 / 9$ /6
inferred |l| 213223
influence | 1 ! /943 /3
informally |1| $2 / 5718$
information |19| 19326
$193622 \quad 193716 \quad 193816$
$195019 \quad 19775 \quad 199210 \quad 11$
$14200725 \quad 20141112$
$2017182030 / 11620814$
21008215210
informed |11 $213 / 23$
infrequent $|2| 193812$
194921
inhouse |2| 207978
intually ||| /940/4
inituals 111193421
Intuative $1212121 / 5 \quad 21$

2073421267
intuatives |1| 2135 1/
injuries |4| $207515 \quad 213716$
$18 \quad 19$
injury |l| 207517
inpatient [1] 1948 /5
inpatients $111 / 94021$
input |2| $2086 / 6210416$
Inside ||| 214124
inside l2| $2008 / 2 / 41 / 10$
inspected 1212043810
inspection |3| 200315
204268
instance 141 19373 1953 /4
2063 /5 21/5 22
unstances $\{3 \mid 196613$
1990 I $2136 / 4$
Institute [1] 20756
instutution [1] 193723
instructed [2] 19873
$2125 / 5$
instruction $\{3\} 2157356$
instructions | $21^{2} 2156 / 4$ 21579
instruments |1| 2010 /4
Insurance ||| 200312
insurance [1] 202518
insure \{3| 19366208524
21276
untend [1] 21576
intended [1] 21266
mtensive [1] 196213
intentronally [1] 211916
interactions [1] 193516
miterest [4] $209515 \quad 212317$
2132921331
interested [2] 200210
2086 15
interface 141 /937/8 21
$1960 / 6 \quad 200422$
interjects |1| 2151 1
intermediate $11 \mid 208120$
intermittent |1| 19337
internally [31 2147721512 3
interpretation [1] 21487
interrupted [1] 2121 /1
intervention (1) 194223
intoxicated [1] 21427
intoxieatang |1| 21098
intoxication |1| 214017
introduce [?] 208610
210525
introduced |2| $21555 \quad 13$
Introduction |1| 21097
invalid |1| 21006
investigate |3| 200121
2005212049 /7
investugated /1/ 21318
investigates $|2| 2001 / 1$
investigating $121213 / 13$ 215616
unvestugation $1512000 \quad 13$
204925213161117 investugations |1| 20023
investigators |1| 21067
investors |1| 1998 21
invite (2) $203713 \quad 20865$
involved I20| 1936 /8 2021
19451419812419907
$19927199922 \quad 206315$
206672078 21 2096 21
21121211720211820
$212318 \quad 212512214020$
21571518
involves [1] 19338
Island [3] $199919 \quad 202613$ 20308
Lssue [9] 193241959414
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllll}1960 & 3 & 1977 & 19 & 1991 & 25\end{array}$
$205752 / 4446$
Lssued |8| 19792320694
207323207535212918
24
Lssues [9] 19409200013
20042420055205725
205811920862121222
item [S] 21042121096
21261324213715
ttems [6] $193310 \quad 20053$
$2106 \quad 17 \quad 210712 \quad 212837$
$-$

J C $11 / 1930 / 4$
JAMIN $|\varsigma| 2044 / 71214$ 2045 I
January [7] 1970 I5 19734
1974219807 21 202222 21203
jeopardue [1] 211124
jeopardzed [1] 2069 /4
Jersey [1] 19987
Jesus [1] 20556
Jet [1] 208121
jetty [2] 202625
Jim [2] 19659206619
jobs $14 \mid 2046 / 2080 / 8 / 9$ 20967

Joe |16| $195318 \quad 20621$
20652120956213013
21311521428214322
$214517 \quad 214918 \quad 215216$
21532215413
Johan [3] 19992020054
JOHN $161204512 \quad 20706$
213072160141720
John (1] 204510
jom [1] 200021
joned [4] 193914198023
20006210814
jointly [1] 20755
lones |2| 2075918
Joseph |II| 194981015
$2419506 \quad 204715 \quad 20546$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}19 & 2140 & 2151 & 13 & 215416\end{array}$
JR 16120451220706
213072160141720
Judge l2| 206923215623
judge [1] 20305
judged |11 21478
judges |1| 211520
Judgment [1] 215710
judgment [6] 19811523
20492220591620935
210325
juggle |l| 198920
Juggling $121 / 99035$
jump |2| $1962 \quad 23 \quad 2096$ 15
Junsor |1| 204510
junior |I| 20876
Jurisdictions [1] 193324

20761214215619
jury [11] $199815 \quad 2000 \quad 17$
20022520572420581
20792420862210123
21051721064215621
Justice 13121042325
21052
$-\quad-\mathrm{K}-$
K-l-ı-n-k-h-a-r-d-t ||| 1978 18
Kagan 14| 1992172123
199320
KARYN 111216321
Karyn [1] 21636
keel [1] 201510
keep [15] 1944142016 1]
2062202072152073816
207814208015211017
2133142225215412
21565
keeping [1] 21275
KFNNETH 1211929 II
21593
Kenneth [I] 192910
kept [8] 1955 1 19642 5
202814209217209715
19215110
key [1] 20783
kuds [1] 21176
kands [5] 195217207425
20891821141216
Kingwood [1] 2045 11
Kless [1] 21556
Khakhardt [1] 197817
knowledge [151/949 924
1950619572019648

19732197525198921
199416199516206415 1920844209414211117
Koops [4] 206292520633 5
Kunkel [1] 2038 ]

- L-

Labor [2] $204612 \quad 20803$
lack [2] 19561195925
Ladies [1] 215525
ladies [1] 19295
Lake [1] 2045 I]
Lakesburg (H) 19997
landowners (1] 2157 11
lanes [1] 19877
large f3| 200812207522
larger [3] $2103 \quad 14 \quad 16$
212324
Last (1] 196623
last [20] 1932219674
19681196923197816
1995231998820042
20181620222220459
206911209120209737
21071221192121281
213824
Late [3] $199712 \quad 205012$ 20982
launch [27] 1972171823
212913214020214114
717202142123

214711214881322
214912215215215313
21551420
Law [3! $208415 \quad 25 \quad 210915$
Laws 14| 20803452086 21
lawyer |1| 193414
lead |3| $208918 \quad 21231$
leading 111194217
leaning |1| 203624
leans |1| 20159
learn (1) 19502
learaed (3) 19313205013
Leave (11) 20552
leave $1101 / 196013196218$ 201986419871116
$199716 \quad 20557209024$
leaves |11 21415
leaving |4| 19952199718
20601820842
Lecain (1) 19975
lectures (1) 205424
ledge [1] 20222
Leeward (1) 1939 ]
left-hand [1] 207510
legal |3| 1933242080 I
213312
legibility (1) 21048
legitumacy [2] 19601213
lengthy [2] 2018202073 ।
Lessened (1] 1991 23
lesson 11 1931 3
letter 111119777204015
2054521071521111114
$211716 \quad 21201823$
letting |11 214215
level [2] 1929 /8 $2126 / 4$
levels [1] 208521

Incense [14] 197912420
24202345781520
20302207716
licensed [4] 197624
$200217 \quad 20382214413$
licenses [2) 2021 |l 202318
lied (2) 2051 1720529
life (3) 20112162036 1
lift |l| 201424
Liftung |1| 203619
lught [1] 203317
lightly (1) 2049 13
liked (5) 19831720065
215423
Lumit [4] 1945 I 19524
19915208913
lumitations [3] 206725
212012212316
limited [3) 2003120814
211911
lemits ||| 208824
Linelll 20619
line |l4| 1942 /3 194722
$20 \times 11620101921$
20141320406820619
20974210019212624
21501621552
lined III 20088
Lines |5| 1935 I5 19775
200814204723205122
linked |11 21533
hquors |1| 21098
list [25| $2015 / 451113$
182016456203610
204422047 II 20793
209346202120941516
$18209782108232 / 3916$
Insted 111204015
listen 111213217
lustened 1212033720365
Listening 121209123215614
live 1119453
Inver (1) 194317
Lloyd (1) 19975
LOA [2] 20542320551
load $11011987 \quad 20 \quad 23 \quad 19887$
1620851821208624
20874911
loaded |2| 20032203117
loader 111201012
louding $12 \mid 2(0) 37$
hocal |6| /960) y 20684
2128 11 21294 1721560
$\log 111200521$
$\begin{array}{ll}\text { logger }|4| 2038 & 81719\end{array}$
20395
longest [1] 198918
looks [2] 200817215725

2041/4
loss 1112068 I
lot [22] 19379 1944 //
1951 $151959 \quad 22 \quad 196915$
1972219901219934
20192520306203316
20595207314207625
2(080 42018422 2(156) 16
20952521041221112
$214352 / 4923$
Louns |l| 197818
Loussana [2| 193927
lounge [1] 1981 13 lower [2] $199122 \quad 209417$ LSU [3] 19397810 lucky [1] 201512 lunch (2] 208861214814 Lynch [4] 209115213615 21373215723

-     - M -

M D [1] 1939 1]
ma'am |l2] 214019214121
21429214492224
2146592121471822
215317
machinery [1] 20052
mad (I) 203815
mall (I) 19772
man (1) 194413
manntan [2] 1948 // 207714
Mamtains [1] 212614
major (3) 1939519422
21081
majority (11) 207522
$\operatorname{man}|20| 196025196878$
$\begin{array}{lll}18 & 1969 & 19 \\ 1975 & 21\end{array}$
19772319891319951
20211020811213113
21392121431521464
21471016215415
215518
manage [4] 196015209324
2521355
managed [1] 196416 management |31| 192919
$\begin{array}{llll}24 & 25 & 19321 / 121945 \quad 11\end{array}$


19202119622197719
2049 /1 1320711920807
208672094192120957
21359 /1 2136 / 21371
manager $13311950 / 321$
1999320464910
2049 IS 2320581621
20591821206022
206115206271319
20651020701421
207619208062220825
620851220958210025
2105721271621359 213669
managerv 131208520
21239213513
managing 121209423
21276
mandated [2] 1931/4
194822
mandatory [1] 21184 maneuver [2] 1987320195
maneuvered |1| 203516
maneuvering [18] 201114
20136201516201621
20171202024202110
$2031 / 2203241721$
$203517 \quad 203781417$
maneuvers 161200916
201711202571012
203525
manned (2) 2083 1314
manner (2) 20152220589
mannerisms [2] 19711819 manning [4| 204611
207621208022213421
manual (1) 198518
MAR [2] 199911200423
March (14) 20716212018
21271321402425
2142222324214411
21488214912215514
marijuana (2] 1975912
marilax [2] $205423 \quad 20553$
Marine [2] $200315 \quad 21423$
marine [9] 1998171921
2003121415200415
20302207218
mariner (2] 20021720349
mariners |1] 209315
marital (4) 2055 568
Martume [4] 20452223
205818213311
maritume |11 207715
mark [2] 19322519568
marked (5) $193222 \quad 203818$ 207110207322209918
market |1| 21209
marketung |1| 208121
Martun [7] 199816199925
20007200510202267
MARY (4) 21393215413
21602321611
Mary [2] 21381921396
MASCIARELLI [4] 197819
19942421592124
Mascuarellh [2] 1978922 master [39] 2002681814 15202424202521721 $252026 / 578$ II 20272021203042049 II 205032067520681
20781120821315
$20831314 \quad 16 \quad 19 \quad 208422$
20851524208813
$212619213622 \quad 214217$ 2146720
masters 1221204771219
2049162420562520665 20673208413208521
208952090820924810
2093420961819209817 2099821228213720
Mate |l| 2038 /
mate |47| 1979232024
1980111983241984716
1719853211986213
1989101819906 II 12
1991 131993181213
199451520372516
$2038232078 / 112$
20831520851415
20881320934212618
21271214945215536 materıals [4] 20052520068 201213212210
mates $1161199112 \quad 208213$

20924151621041416
21091221256212623
213414
matter |12| 19357202322
2027820281220503
2076620852220929

Basce Systern Appictions
20931921182221379 21575
matters [2] $20482521631 /$
$\max _{[21} 20195$ 2031 21
maximum |1] $2120 / 2$
meaks [2] 20872324
mean 148193410193514
19365194181942610
19442219461119475
1948211952202122
19555195719195923
19601819641019653
1976191991419929
19972020041620095
20111920121920266
202913
20301320318203711
207924208912209920
2221061325210920
21143212011212516
21513721521921534
21558
Meaning [1] 2120 IS
meaning (5) 193324
19592219652219865 209421
means (5) 2039220551
2073102151821526
meant [5] $202313 \quad 15 \quad 16$
210123210811
meantume 12120978210424 measured 121201125
201413
measures (2) /972 24 /973 2
measuring [1] 212622
medır [1] 20684
Medical [11 193910
meet [4] 1948919965
20841720866
meeting (4) 1949319717
205382073 I
metungs [5] 1944 I]
1947202072 // 1320868
Melame (II) 21554
member 1111197624
2000192120232225
2024220302214415
2145421481011
members 19$] 199512$
$2109102136252 / 4413$
19214812321493
215221
memo (6) 1948 / 2066 12
132520671212713
memorandum [3] 193014
206619207019
Memories [1] 21368
Memory [1] 213518 mens [1] 21526
mental [6] $1942 \quad 16 \quad 1957 \quad 17$
19582125195956
mention (5) 19501019591
19851920687209016 mentroned [111 19331
195318195817120434 206862084112086123 20882321109212317 mentroning [1] 206416 Merchant (1] 20757 merchant [1] 20301
mere [1] 19644

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-20-94
VOLUME 14
Conowidence in (not-Seei7)
merit |1| 209223
$\begin{array}{llll}\text { mess 14| } 2139 & 16 & 21 & 21547\end{array}$
message [3] $214210 \quad 12 \quad 13$
MICHAEI $14 \mid 19677$
19741921591518
Michael [3] 19662219675 10
microwaves [1] 20888
mid [1] 19538
muddle $17119298 \quad 19313$
19398200992037813 206822
Middletown 111 19987
midnight |2| 2/4145
muld II 206421
mind |141/995 22205025
2051 162052120608
207317214625214727
21492121507921
215425
minds [1] 2072 15
minumize |l| 212915
Minneapois [11 2139 I
Minnesota |1] 2139 I
minor [3] 2027 || 1520666
minute |91 196214 201/ 10
2035232053320766
20902221342213712
215618
minutes |l| 19834199222
1993212016132018423
201911202816202924
92035222420765
209120215519
miracles (11) 1964 15
misinterpreting [1] 19592
Miss $\{212139232149$ /1
missing $|2| 2006320485$
Missourn 111197818
mistake [1] 201015
model 11120075
moderate (1) 1951 10
moderation [3| 194| 25
modern [1] /964 16
modifications III 1936 /5
moment [8| 1964171922
2030101420367207423 21304
Monday (2) $2156 \quad 17 \quad 2158 \quad 17$
money 12 1948 16206715
montor (I5) $205215 \quad 25$
206319212420645816
20651321241617
2134132136202225
montored (3) 21018
$2102202136 / 8$
montoring 126| 1931 21
1932719501419536
205127205219205613
2060232061131623
206326162064152122
210018192101624
2102121236212417
213613
montors [1] 206025
montage [1] 207322
MONTAGUE [22] 199725 199812200325200514 16200619200721820 23200852420141
2016101820211420

20331920347204321 216039
Montgomery |15) /934 /9
1935212223194011
19491820195049
195315182319559
1956514
month [5] 19602519807
$1219 \quad 207315$
months [3] 1948919935 19948
Moonth 2l29 16
morning [181/9295
$193822 \quad 23$ 1994 1314
20223420892220982
21092521421221437
214613142156231117
mostly 121 /944 141999 /2
Motion [1] 215710
motion (3) 201925215713 15
motivation [2] 1948417
motor [1] 197216
Moussy [2] 212079
mouth [1] 19726
move f111 200916201223
2021720271203411
204324205221205720
212017212520212814
moved $|5| 19725199919$
2010 / $2027 / 620978$ movement [17] 19712021 200142006920092021 2425201037811
201314201619201914 202115
movements [3] 200319
20066202019
moves 11120112
moving (15) 20092220115
2220121820148201522 202152028132520292 1011121316
MS $1221 / 1929919381518$
1956212219641522
19654 // 19661517 I8
$19788 \quad 20199421213819$ 21394215121215410 21591322216024
Ms [2] 21397215415
Murtashaw [2] 207322 215625
myself $\{5119381319826$
2092321146211918 mysterious |l| 21206
$-\quad-\mathbf{N}_{-}$
name $1301 / 938241939$ 21 196589196623196749

19985682041720458
9101421042521339
2138232421395214312
21556912
named [2] 19991120
names (3) $197425 \quad 208315$ 21566
narrow [3] 19531419886 21267
Nate [1] 21553

National 14| 20001920542 20552420757
national [2| $2055 / 2 \quad 20778$
Natives III 204515
natural [1] 197723
naturalization (I) 209117
nature 14| 19531719567
19969215322
Naval (1] 20051
naval $1312004111619 \quad 23$
$2005411132021 / 2$
2034919202324
navigate |11 207825
navigation |3| 202117
207812208620
Navy III 199912
NEAL [2] 21312521585
NEAI Y 161193820195624
19651021596912
Nealy |6| $193818 \quad 2219391$
19571196231965 I2
needs (2) 2077102114 I
negative [1] 2096 II
negotiation (1] 2090 II
Nelson [1] 209314
newly [2] $194418 \quad 1960 \quad 22$
Newport III 199919
newspaper III 2072 II
nev|s| 2154 | 46 2155 21
nught |22| 19862419876
199316199417101310
2029192220872520886
21411214345921
214481021214517
21461424214813215010
nune [1] 209525
Nobody [2] 2031720651
nobody [8] 19481317
19651419664620318
210716214816
Nolting [1] 20528
nominate [1] 207521
non-alcoholce $\{2 \mid 2120 \quad 10 \quad 11$
non-complaance (11) 212312
noon |3| 1971 3620704
normal |171 193425195518
25195661119894
199218200911203115
2220624208420208816
21105212511215017
21517
normally [2] 1935821508
North [1] 197817
north [2| 20082320092
Northeast [31 1967612
197822
Notary [2] 2163721
notation [1] 193514
notch 111210317
notches [1] 210320
note [7] 19351119493
19561215204410
209615215525
notebook [1] 215620
noted [6] $193018 \quad 1935810$ 14204019
notes [1] 216310
notice (4) 210714210810 210911212214
notuced [I] 20288
notices |11 210716

Hasce Sywert Applaction:
notufied $|5| 19871921062$ 2107921081721227 nowhere |1| 204723 NTSB [1] 205325 number [18] $193013 \quad 14$ 193310194119198614 20432420448204756 20841012208821 208924209819210314 16213422213511 numbers [2] 203421 209918
numerous |l| 198418 nut 111215714


FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-20-94 VOLUME 14
ocean 1712004101822
2046 // 2047 |/ 207622
213417
ocean-related [1] 199912
October (3) $193014 \quad 197915$ 18
odd (1) 215023
of87 (1) 206216
Offense [1] 213022
offense [2] $210910 \quad 213021$
offenses 111210823
Offer 14| 207524210825
21252122
offer |l8| 1982 21 200325
$2(1) 443207122207413$
20791320836209811
210413210510211710
2121420212214212425
213834
offered [32] 19827198314 2020445207124207414 20752520791420834
21051121091211711
212032121622212216
212523213813216145
 151617
otfering |2| $1961 / 1 / 19829$ otters 11120742
office |ls | 1970 20 198619
2001182022122140 /1
21431321503215117
21528242153611
$21545 \quad 16 \quad 19$
officer $1301197621 / 1981 / 3$
$1986 / 3199022199120$
199617199792024356
202524206319206417
206914207810111415
208411208519208624
2087672319717212424
$212722 \quad 21342025214317$
officers |3x| 1976519859
198917 1450 \% \% 1919915
81116199512199612
2047112063820667
20783918212320828
2084102085212223
$2086 / 69208713$
20882120902520918
209723209814
2109122111221251
offices |l| 2096 ?
Officual |11 215317
offictal |11 2025?
OTfictalh 111202721
offictally $\mid \leq 121201215316$
Oh |x| $1996 / 019978$
$2016 / 22038 / 420487$
20555207415210814
oh 111 /962 14
oll|161/929 17 19316
19342324193616
19371319913201469
208121232082231224
208515
oler |2| 1975 || $2 / 496$
okay |6| $19623142006 \quad 25$
201722211520214024
old 12! 19443212710
ones $191 / 4661202008 / 4$

2035420571120678 2075232079821408 ongoung [5] 1957171960 । 2073521108213112 open (5) $211017 \quad 214118$ $215418 \quad 20 \quad 23$
opening [1] 21208
$\begin{array}{lllll}\text { operate } & \text { [4] } & 2081 & 2 & 16 \quad 17\end{array}$ 212925
operated [1] 197218
operatung [7] 200010
203122208416209413 211772128821291 operation [111 197220
199824207017207220
21242077524208022
20942421128
operations [2] 207224
208520
operator [2] $207421 \quad 21337$
operators [2] 202315
209013
opinmon [23] 1930723
1937819427198521
1991271620108
201213201317201620
2420186920199
$203413162040 / 116$
20425721459
opportunitues |1| 21276
opportunty (3| 20388
20861421246
opposed (5) 192921 1941 J
$32077132123 / 4$
opposite [2] 1944719457
opposition (1) 194718
option [3| $19451317 \quad 20$
oral |1| 196622
Order [1] 19294
order [2] $1949721 / 43$
Oregon 121 19392025
organization $14 \mid 2000) 20$
2086212095724
organizing |I| 20036
oruginal |1| 20442
Orleans |l| 193910
ostracized (11) 215322
Ottaway [6] 199816
19992520007200510
202267
ought [2| 20481421583
ourselves |1| 20939 outlines (1) 2008 /5
outpatient [2] 1948 /5
196221
outraged |11 2069 /3
outside 1101195421
198214207419207535
20962 2/41 $1 / 17215314$ overall [7] 1957 24 1984 16
20666208023208610
20942420958
overcome 121 1951 19
196110
overheat $121203117 / 8$
overheating 11120196
overload |1| 20196
Oversea ||| 202222
oversight 11121109
overstress 11120035
overstressed III 20034
overtume 171 20915 20926 $\begin{array}{llll}10 & 15 \quad 16 \quad 17 \quad 2126 \quad 11\end{array}$ overwhelmed [1] 199412 overwhelming [1] 19932 overwork [2] 1991 1719 overworked 14] 198819 1990619945208513 owner 13! 2001 20202617 owners [11 199820
$-\mathbf{P}$
P-a-u-l |1| 2045 11
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { p m } & 14 & 2076 & 12 & 13 & 14\end{array}$
215619
package 111193016
page [21] 196424201724
204024817205122
205439206189206624
2079821046212222
21251921284521295
2154 II
pages 12120403215121
paid 161203013209024
2092456
paired |1] 208822
paper (3) 2138821569
21573
paperwork $15 \mid 20942123$
$2095172096 / 32097$ /1
paragraph $112 \mid 19634$
2040172068222069910
$1 / 2107222122242128$ । 212978
paragraphung |l| 21282
paren 11119333
part 1251 1931 1819512
1962219631019641617
19724198116200136
201582026242520588
20621620666209617
21062521072321105
211142123521348
215015
part tume ||| 193922
participate [1] 207520
participation [1] 2075 /
partner III 20528
party |11 20799
pass (4) 19737197922
21504215223
passage [1] 19866
passed [4] 199624202112
21505215125
passing 11121522
path |2| 19619203824
pathology |11 195115
patuent (2) 194225195616
patuents |2| 19402021
PAUL [6] 20451220706
213072160141720
Paul 181204531020708
20742420761821049
210517212713
pay (5) $1970 \quad 16 \quad 23 \quad 197714$
2074812
paying 11120915
peer 111215324
penalced (11 196519
pending 111215710
perceive | 9 | 2149 /3 18

21551523215611 percetred [6] 195312
2036621401921489
$2 / 4913215522$
percent [4] 20321020335
$2 / 4517$
percentage [2] 207523 209816
perception [8] 21411216
214791021511521521
$215517 / 8$
perceptions |2| $2 / 4624$ 215010
perfect [1] 20412
perfectly [1] 2032 /3
perform [3] 1932719624
20588
performance [29] 1994 /8
$20562022 \quad 25205717$
20585781020602425
20611620666207319
20751820932209619
209712101621044
211418211569212311 142124916212623 21323
performers |l| 20935
performing [1] 213316
performs 111211817
perfunctory |11 19622

197923198141419823
19839111985142324
251986519882419894
20358204518204819
2052612206289
2067162070162320711
52075151720856
20985210213
2104321196213025
pertods 12119431019585
permanent $12120776 \quad 13$
permissible |l| 19308
permission |i| $2 / 23$ /
permit 12121087 ll
permits 111212925
person [28] 1943719
1951341819527
196017196610197716
2120021316200724
203015208922209369
20994210217211313
21146211635212412
2139212148921546 215523
person-to-person |11 $21 / 52$
personal [4] 2052 15
21142021175212315
personally [1] 195220
Personnel [I] 21286
personnel [11] 19571823
1958342219591617
2094721091121283
persons [1] 197613
pertaming [1] 19776
ph [2] 1998719997
phone [2] 19365215521
photos 111207323
phrase [2] 1943 2/ 207925 phrased |1] 1951 7
physical [3] $1942 / 6$

19572219596
physician 171193915
1954131956391016 19596
physicians |11 19352
prek |91 1993202122
$2043242077315 \quad 17$
210614215015
picked |2| 198516199221
picture [2] 1982 ] 200624
puctures |11 2156 /
Pier |1| 21424
Pierce |11 2/31 25
pigeon [2] 213210 l
pilot [21| 198| 22198420
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}1985 & 12 & 14 & 16 & 19 & 1986\end{array}$
198813161993 II
$2066 / 4202068421 / 120$
212910202121301
pilotage |141 20662220674
$\begin{array}{llll}5 & 6 & 8 & 2070 \\ 20 & 212718\end{array}$
$1923212817 \quad 2321292$
11
pilots $|8| 2067 / 42521288$
9 |/ 21299 || 17

place [16] 1973614
198210198341988816
198941994171996312
200122003520177
2106 / $2142192 / 4525$
places [2| 1937919649
PLAINTIFF 11121592
Plantuff (3) 2094 / 21033 21279
Plamtuff 12 | 193818
197810
plaıntiffs |12| 19788
$199725 \quad 200518203818$
$22204012 \quad 2045215$
20474520946213819
planning 11121176
plant |4| 193914202410 $13 \quad 15$
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { plaque } 14 \mid 2071 & 15 & 16 & 18\end{array}$ $2137 / 3$
play 131 204622071 19 21158
played |31 202723 2/50 I
21524
player (11) 2008 2
Please [91 1939419657
 20161720457215613 please |171 19382519394 121957519662519674 199942040420583
206615209916213824
213952140521214510
plot 111201012
Pount [2] 1984212129 I/ point [501 $1937 / 8 \quad 1940$ /5 1942 I 2519511719777 19831819842119851 19922420001420046 200623200713200978 1120121214201521 $2016913 \quad 20282120328$ 2120371720401820465 20491020506
92051510152520534
$\begin{array}{llll}17 & 2055 & 23 & 2060518\end{array}$
2062172068920714
209024209518209715
2104202141621488
Pointer 1112007 15
pointer |2| 20071719
pointing |5| $2018 \quad 12 \quad 13$
20214211122
points |11 207725
police [1] 194825
policeman ||| 194722
polsciest9+1941 2019773
206916207719208611
$\begin{array}{llll}2132 & 22 & 23 & 24 \\ 214719\end{array}$
pollution 11120174
poor 11121359
poorest |2| 2092920937
population |2| 1959813
Port |2| 1970619977
port [341 195812197321
2319801011198516
19895 1/ 222519953
201112201414201514
20164202717203610
20671820722320842
20891209522122
210672110112425
2130162321401116
21452
portion 11119371
ports [1] 2121/4
position |16| 193115
1939 2/ 1940319992
20305122046520629 206816206914207119 $2116 / 2132192133215$ positions [3] 1930419328 213919
possession (5) 210617
21073210891221097
possibilitues $1212017 \quad 13 \quad 15$
post [1] 196121
post-rehabihtaton 111
195024
posted 131207116210823 21565
postures |1| 2073 /5
potentual 1712065320683
20731421072421083
21341819
power [3] 20302020353
204019
practical [1] 19496
practice (10) 193425
$193917 \quad 23199015$
20491921162212721
21321518
Pre (1) 195713
pre [1] 1961 23
pre-admitted |1| 2044 |
precise III 214922
predicate III 2069 21
preferred [1] 193516
prelıminary 111194025
premiere [2) 20742021336
prepare [2] 19321419902
prepared [5] 200022
2087192088721232 216312
prescribed |II 20883
prescribing [1] 211820
present [3] 194319195623
197912
presentation (1) 200122
presented [2] 1945 /1
194714
presently $1312 / 3979$
215423
president $|5| \begin{array}{lllll}2043 & 13 & 15 & 16\end{array}$
20681022
press 181206813171720694
568215668
pressure |11 215324
presumably [1] 21347
presume [1] 200416
pretty 1111194215195115
196061020121920169
$20311220351022 \quad 209518$
prevent |2| 212117213719
preventable [2| $213716 \quad 18$
previous [2] 1938 /1/ 20923
prevюously 161195817
1959119701319975
203818209110
primarily [1] 199125
primary [3] 1940619429
10
Prince [8] 1978 11 198323
19923620662220675
212719212919
Princeton 11119755
Prior 141 194910195016
17207013
prior 123 | 192916193713
193917194423194925
1950619551019667
1972221993519948
20162520501420516
205225205922206018
2100182221011921121
214425
privacy (3) 20803208138
private [3| 19671821148
211616
privilege ||| 2099 /3
problem 1351 1945 12
195/ 16196317196411
19913721200124
20022420489205824
20642020653208514
210831021121320

211561221241321327
213417182151252152 I
2215611
problems [23] 19431314
19602419611198915
1988172124199912
200123420581220595
2063620649207314
2080152114 C 211756
215719
procedure (9) 1935 /]
193621119441719535
19551820624214979
procedures [1] 196021
proceed [1] 207615
proceeded [1] 193910
process 117119302419543
1961820119207921
2081 / 20961722210416
210625210713211315
percenved to process


4 - Cancordenco by Look-See(75)
$16 \quad 18 \quad 2133 \quad 12 \quad 13$ processes [1] 194213
procession [1] 210610
produce [1] 19495
product [2] 2081 1719
products 111208119
profane |1| 215013
profanity 1111214617
214712214924215068
920215142152419
21532
Professional [2] 208617 21636
professional [15] 2000 I 4
24206711208615
20932421102521113
211517213522425
213635
professionalism [2] 20672 14
profit |!| 20669
program (50| 1930 //
193723591947146 194831119501019515
1959 /1 196013196224
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllll}1963 & 14 & 15 & 19 & 1965 & 18 & 20\end{array}$
198720231988716
19951719999205919
2060320622207217
20732207521210525
210641621084211010
21112021211213
21131211519211712 171921251
programs |6| $1948 / 4$
$207332075 / 2077 / 4$
$2081 / 121083$
prohibat [S] $193010 \quad 21088$
911213316
prohibited [2] 1930321094
prohibition (5) 210811
$21091214211825 \quad 21211$
prohibits [1] 214723
promise |1| $2090 / 8$
promsing (1] 211216
promote [4] /944 / 20726 920735
promoted |1] $1939 / 6$
promotes |l] 19448
promoting | $1 \mid 2 / 28 / 4$
promotion $11 \mid 206220$
promulgated |11 194/ 20
propeller |s| 201/ / 2018 25
201922203325
proper [6] $198522 \quad 20025$
207622212620212756
properiy [2] 199221200122
property ||| 21097
proposal [3] 2066 /4 20 20672
Proposals |I| 20953
proposals |1| 20954
Propulsion |1| 207825
propulsion $|3| 2078 / 719$ 23
prove |l| 2/43 15
Provide |l| 209] 8
provide llol 193719
$194322 \quad 195019 \quad 207910$ 1120861421191113 $212210 \quad 212318$
provided [6] 193716
194818207936208613 211213
provider [1] 21148
providers [1] 20799
provides [2] 20772420801
provision $141211 / 21$
2112719211523
provisions 121212112
prudent [s| 20491620
20655208424213623
psychiatric [2] 193723
19383
Public [2] 2163721
public [2] $197525 \quad 209810$
published (1] 208216
publushing [1] 204415
pull [6] 19322220477
2054 /3 2055 /1 20792
214324
pulled |3| 20279209417
$2096 / 3$
Pump |1| 19687
pump |3| $19688 \quad 18 \quad 1969 \quad 19$
pumping 111 20272
punctured 11] 20159
punshed [1] 196519
punshment [1] $1966 / 4$
purpose [4] 194413
2009 13 2125 17 2135 /1 purposes 14] 196017
2004220853208610
pursuant l2\} 20645 2121 21
push $1+1201961921$
202420
pushed [2] 2018 3201910
pushing 111201921
puts 111204020
putting 131 198815 20191
puzzles 11121374
PX10 [2| $209916 \quad 18$
PX154 111210310
$-\infty-$
qualification |1| 20615 qualifications 12120045
200513
qualified 1312021 y 208020 210141
qualifving 1112067 /3
qualaty 131207714210322
21269
quarter |1| 202023
quarters [2] $197713 \quad 199910$
Question (2) 20401623
questmoning (11 2100 20
questions (16] 194423
$1945 / 19652197413$
199722201725202121
202724202820204319 $212071421 / 31521 / 824$ 21305213725
qukk 141202723207725
21202021304
quickly 12 ] $2 / 19$ 9 2/20 17
quit |l| /944/4
quote |3| /966 /| 215712
$\frac{-\mathbf{R}-}{\text { radar II } 199410}$
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { radn } & 18] & 2146 & 12 & 18\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lllll}214712 & 2149 & 25 & 215014\end{array}$
215162152520
radios [2] $21508 \quad 15$
Raise [1] 213821
rase [5] $1966 \quad 25 \quad 1978 \quad 12$
1998220454215021
rased $(4) 21502325$
215123
Ran [1] 20263
ran [13] 20022200320
$-200812 \quad 201210201518$
23202462025341112
203010
random [1] 210613
range [7] 19488201020
20868209079209323
21175
ranging (11 208618
rank [3] 2047 /1 20933
209415
ranked [5] $204718 \quad 204817$
20562520936209415
ranking [16] 20482123
$209017 \quad 20 \quad 2320938$

212097221033210414
rankings |11 20482
rapid (1) 195810
rarely |1| $1958 / 2$
rate 17] /939 25 209/ /1 12
13209256
rated $14 \mid 2031810 \quad 20$
20324
rates $14 \mid 20921920 \quad 21 \quad 22$
ratuge 1512031242047615
2074821272
ratungs (11) 21358
rell] 19296
re-emphasize [1] 2126 17
re-evaluation [1] 194610
reacting 11119536
reaction (1) 19325
Read (5) $196510 \quad 21393$
$215522159 / 2216023$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}\text { read } 1311 & 19428 & 1964 & 23 & 25\end{array}$
1965219677197419
1978191994224120206
2038812203921205122
2052132054252061919 20699 /1 21072221096 2125892128121297 $\begin{array}{lllllll}2135 & 16 & 2159 & 15 & 18 & 21 & 24\end{array}$
READER 1411965919675
197817213825
Reader 131196711978713 reader [1] 196619
reading $16 \mid 19952220406$ 2041/210372156/4 16 reads $11 \mid 206822$
reall91/942 21 2011 216
20272320361212510
21271021409215210 realstic $|2| 20181021$
realuze [2] $199318 \quad 201610$
realized |1| 205824
realizing III 20211
rearrange [1] 208423
reason [16] $199325 \quad 1994$ '4
20151920162202516
2031202032220339

203824208420208910
20917210013211510
$2123 / 3212615$
reasonable [3] 20061118 208824
reasons [7] $1958 \quad 25 \quad 199318$
22210522210615
21101721293
reassigned [1] 20638
reassignment [2] $2063 \quad 10 \quad 13$
reballast [1] 2027 I
recall [48] $192915 \quad 25$
$193020 \quad 19311118 \quad 25$
193251933519471725
$195018 \quad 1953514123$
195417195824196024
19629196920197015
19717197322197421
1975171977719868
199011992320128
2039 /7
20499205111205611
206172062232063711
$\begin{array}{lllllll}12 & 2134 & 2 & 2135 & 17 & 19\end{array}$
21361217213725
215212215423
recalled |1| 19542
recenve [5] 19661419772
2067321175214016
recerved $|32| 197745$
20442220492320722
20741720763207917
2083821051521094
2116172117142121925
$2122192126 / 213816$
$21612122 \quad 232425$
2162123456789
recenves [1] 2075 I
receiving |1| 193020
recently [2] $2068 \quad 20 \quad 2129 \quad 16$
Recess [2] $201615 \quad 207613$
recess |4| 2016 13 20704
20765215817
recidivism [1] 19401
recipient [1] $1930 / 8$
recognition |1| 2074 //
recognize $|5| 207115$
$207318 \quad 207411211217$
21137
recognized |1| 207419
recognizing [1] 21141
recollect [1] 197425
recollection [7] 194018
$1947121950 / 1195613$
19854205123206720
recommend [3] 194022
211918
recommendation [5] 19368
$194025 \quad 194625 \quad 2128 / 12$
recommendations 131
19352419372421223
recommended [5] 19367
$\begin{array}{llll}19458 & 19494 & 196218\end{array}$ 212823
reconcile [1] 2113 1]
reconstruct |l| 201312
record [26] $193420 \quad 193514$
$\begin{array}{llllllll}1938 & 24 & 25 & 19679 & 1978 & 15\end{array}$
1979 / 19872219985
20065720101420458
20546915207111

He k Syaterni Applicatinne
20742320768 // 207810 210425210723210820
21382321395
recorded |11 201125
recorder [1] 204020
recording [1] 200519 recordkeeping [1] 213413 records [4] 19342020448 205516205721
Recovering [1] 2100 11
recovering $|6|$ /944 16
20598206121210013 21375
recovery [8] 193024 1941 8
1944219484195919
2057182058 I/ 206521
recreate [4| 2001420069
201434
recreation |1] 200613 red [3] 20071120089 208319
REDIRECT [2] 21307 216020
Redirect |ll 204320 redistribution (1) 208518 redistrict [1] 20879
Redmond [2] 1967612
Reeder (13) 21421718
21467112023214713
5813215110
Reef [9] 1985 । 198717
19888200320200610
2013202015423202021 reef [14] 20082520135 2017238201821318 1920192420213203615 19203720
refer 18119301319335
194572319469197712 20591521279
reference [4| 20572123 207919208115
referenced 111208322 references [11 1933 / referral [9] 21132024 $\begin{array}{llllll}211415 & 17 & 2116451920\end{array}$ referrals [2] 21141214 referred [21] 1933 /3 193712194661219548 1955419601419611416 $172021 \quad 19668101112$ 202010210213211316 211516215711
referring [7] $19468 \quad 1958$ 2] 19634201619206112 2094121027
refers [3] $193322 \quad 20539$ 21157
refined (1) 208119 refineries [1] 208121 refinery ( 10 1 19391516 19531119572419589
 refining [1] 194013 reflect [3] 204822056912 reflected [2] $205652097 \mathrm{I}^{\prime}$ reflection [2] 20526 1/
refloated [2] 202615
203824
refloatung (1) 203823
refresh [1] 205123

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-20-94 VOLUME 14 Comandiance by Loot Seech6
refrigerator |11 20887
regard 124119292519307
194012196112197316
19771419917200316
204616205025205518
$20 \quad 20575206415208417$
21239212623213212
21341721362421375
21479215010
regarding [4] 204923
206810211514214417
register [1| 200821
Registered [1] 21636
registered $|3| 2000 / 424$
registry III 204410
regular 141 19489200223
20601220781
regularlv |l| 2127 /
regulation |ك| 208322
2084692122621346
regulations 16120001112
2078202122815
rehab (22| 19462619476
195010195123195215
610195911196022
19611718221962 Il
$19645 \quad 1965 \quad 25 \quad 1966 \quad 13$
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}1995 & 17 & 2115 & 18 & 19 & 2124 & 19\end{array}$
rehabbed 181194523
1946145101217 196113
rehabilitated $|5| 19304$
19451819501422195919 rehabilitation (44) 19308 II 1931 14162319329 1939202419441919454 $\begin{array}{llll}6 & 9 & 19 & 1946 \\ 19 & 1949 & 25\end{array}$ 195061125195135
19521219537196013

1965182319669205912 18206018
206212420651820661
20809211125211219
21247213216213324
renforce 12120721420732 remforcement ||| 2073 /
remstated |l| 2132 /4
reinstating II / 197710
retterates (1) 19637
relapse 661944221138
101221241115
relate [4] 193311193517
194424208221
related [7] 20012420669
2081 1221151021223
21235215712
relates [3| 19587200116 2013 /
relating [3] $1932181998 \quad 24$ 208217
relation (11) 194015
relatons [2] 204612212323 relatronship |I] 194019 relatively [3] 1947 2] 20361 20972
relay [3] 214291213
relayed [1] 1964 I
release [14] 19532519544
91955121419561016
18206813172069468
released [4] 1954 I5 16 1962 /4
releases $111 / 954$ /2
relied [2] /992 |/ 13
rehef [S| 1990 II 2223
1997 |I 12
reheve [1] $1980 \quad 14$
reheved [4] 1990 $19 \quad 20$
21401112
rehever [1] 19445
rekeving [1] 199612
relocate-t| 20968
rely [3] $1992 \quad 10 \quad 205913 \quad 16$
remain |I! 194023
remaned [1] 19405
remaning $|3| 1941319472$ 196021
remembrance III 1929 /4
remand III 21/4 21
remands 11121036
remoteness [7] 19452
$195825 \quad 195941418$
196038
removed (1) 20873
repairs [3] $202715 \quad 214312$ 19
repeat [2] 20531520583
repeatung [2] 2092321005
rephrase |I| 198513
replaced 111199525
replacement III /996 3
replaces (11) 199617
replacing |l| 199622
Report [1] 19558
report $1271197715 \quad 198714$
20382220406205079
1416172520514
20521424205356
20546916205516
20702320711210118
21161221301013
21422521453
reported $16 \mid 1940 / 4 \quad 16$
2052162153161925
Reporter 121216327
reporting $121194015 \quad 19$
reports $12 \mid 208312 \quad 214016$
represent |4| 204515
2070820741020779
representative $[3] 195819$
21482121491
represented [1] 209113
representung [1] 21489
reputation [3] 207420
21336
request [11] 200318
200619205662064613
2079220822021086 2111122157721587
requested (5) 19651214
20626211125216310
requare [2| 1962720022
required [13] 19481022
19601819628198614
2043920801418210915
211891121221221292
requarement (4] 20438
2132131921345
requirements [8] 19597
19622420002123
208418212511212719

212824
requires (2) $202317 \quad 208325$
reservations |11 206323
reside |11 $2 / 397$
residence [1] 193824
restgned [1] 19406
resource |l| 21182
resources $\{21 \mid 20467910$
2049 / 20581621205918
2120627181920659
207619207921208067
222082620851221057
21378
respect |l11 1936 IS 25
$193925194022 \quad 194418$
19491419501320
195520195614196021
respectung |11 20802
respects [1] 210719
respond (2) 1959 2) 205524
responding 12119536
20566
response |11 21373
responsibilitues 1101940 II
20876720942021
21106212511213525
21364213710
responsibulty (21) 193213
$19521618 \quad 2519532612$
2046162050420581923
20762120841421114
211816182124421274
2135242136121574
responsible [12] 194620
198913204611205911
206023206116207812
1721015210552110317
rest|ll| 1984820033
20124207225209913
212620212757215818
restate [1] $2020 / 8$
Restating |2| 197710 II
restating 1211977810
reated (1) 20873
Restrain |II 20347
restricting III 195824
restriction |I] 195824
restrictions (4) 195417
208025208710211819
rests |1] 201319
result [12] $194210 \quad 20068$
20176202115204013
20411120681210616
2115621221321289
212918
resulted (3) 203915
204021211214
resulting [1] 210724
RESUMED ${ }^{2} \mid 200515$
21608
resumed [3] 20651822
20662
retam [1] 194324
retaluation (3) 2153141718
return [13] 19357194518
194621819521219544
195525196272057 18,
2115:15 2124 6, 21321519
returned [10] 19304
193115221932819545
19632020651720894

21321320
returning 19 ) $194591946 / 8$
1947619737208514
21321221482221492
returns [1] 21186
reverse [2] 2039912
review (5) 19361919393
2068132086920949
revewed [1] 20536
reviewing [4] $1936 / 4$
$195515196012 \quad 209621$
revision 1311930 IS 210520 21
revolution [1] 200820
revolutions (1) 201825
rewarded [1] 20919
Rhode [3] 199919202613 20308
Reck [1] 1998 /
ride [1] 2146 /3
Rught [16] 19482319491
196721201113203617
20398204421208717
209214210221210315
211425211532119517
21363
rughts |2| $2080321 / 5$ /3
RIK |2| 2021242160 /1 rise (1) 19293
risk 17119512020211 211310121321241114 raks |4| 2016202124 201710
River (4] 20452223
205818213311
Robin (1) 21396
rock 16120192021202010 14202116
rocks 161200251011
$202624252028 / 4$
Rocky |2| 1984212129 //
Rogue $16 \mid 19392$ IS 19487
1953 /I 19801320964
role 881194013196012
204622071192123610
21261721573
roles 111208612
Roman [1] 19333
room (10) 19505196817
$1819821117 \quad 20201721$
208619214317215621
rooms |3| 19694204824
20493
rose III 200822
rotate |l| 208921
rotated 12120102023
rotating l41 20098 /l
20116202915
rotation (11) 2009 11
rotational ||| 20096
rotations |1| 20787
Rouge 121 19801819936
Roughly [1] 19756
roughly [2) 1974319834
round (2) $211015 \quad 2129 / 3$
route [1] 20025
routune |21 19441721517 row (1) 2059 I
rpm 181 200820201117 142019152220342 rpms ||| $2035 / 8$
rudder [33] 19933820066 20092420103789
201131920202822
2030172032222033513
1424252034351213
2036222038320391419
204014 20414 1222
2042 II
rule (8) $208323 \quad 25 \quad 208413$
152120851121104
21342
ruled 111210713
rules 11012081368
2084132086 1/ 210223 21291824
rumor [6] $204915 \quad 17 \quad 23$ 20605210114213622
Rumors [1] 19767
rumors [3] 197625199513
run $|17| 196315 \quad 197316$
1979 /2 $200212009 / 2$
$201021618 \quad 20158$
202442026122420303
2086 /8 21/11 212912
21539
rundown $111 / 4994$
runaing $110 \mid 199310$
$2009242031 / 420367$
2066720712020772
21124212019
runs |11 201512
ruptured 11120147

- S -
safe|3| 2073 /| 21128 $2123 / 8$
safely 13119912321108 21177
safer 1212077521134
valest |l| 21125
Safety |S| 20543205524 20721720757213421 safety 1471199125200012 2054420551320711219 207256912141516 2520732469141618 $2075 / 2211241423$ $21 / 3$ /1 2126141721283 61014212932130912 18213219213345714 21345721371215 sual 1312140321532123
saulboats [2] 19992320352
sailed |I2| 1960519733
198012320232225
2024220271721012
2154221559
sailing $\{5 \mid 1958 \quad 25 \quad 197014$
198631995120382
salary $1912090712 \quad 25$
209172092 I/ 1323
20962321356
Salem $12 \mid 193920194020$ salvage |l8| 2002688914 16202423202521721 $252026 / 56811$ 202719 21
tan 126| 19581419685
196919197010197216
1973 // 141919804 /5

171981219821416 19964204181620421
20962821402021424
214411215314215515
SANDERS [15] 19642023
19652196616197420
1978619942325199722
21541114215524
2159192521612
Sanders [1] 19659
sank |1| 2129 I8
Sarah [1] 213825
satusfied (3) 200617
201013211610
satusfy [1] 196223
save [2] $20045 \quad 206715$
sawing [1] 20215
saying [24] 1934119474
195415195516195615
1959519622197722
1993152033162036913
2120372172038725
2101232115921376
2150141521516215421
scent 11120959
schedule [7] 201612
208423208825208921
20901021572224
schedules |1| 208918
scheme 17119842223
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}1985 & 8 & 1987 & 11 & 17 & 18 & 19\end{array}$
School II 193910
school |ك| 19396197967 82079 /l
schools $12 \mid 195127$
scrence |1| 200410
scope |l| 210523
scratched 1119878
screen |3| 205414206624 21258
Sea $16 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llll}2045 & 22 & 23 & 2058 \\ 18\end{array}\right.$ 21211521213311
sea |13| 1958 /1 1988112
198920242018422
20191120302203518
2089 / 21342321351
seafarer [11 207710
seagoing |12| 19571823
1958311221959816
19602202319209910
21366213720
seal [21 205325
seaman |2| 1984621041 seamanship |1| 209413
search |14| 20552320562
210525210648916
210779211010212024
21211
searches [2] 19722419736
searching |11 2121/3
seat 1119657
seated $141 / 978 / 419984$ 20161720457
Seattle |I| 197823
second [23| 197922
19901119911213
1996 /1 19975202821
2040172044 11 2078 11
209422097721034
21042221213212221
21295721386214319

21553215613
section |l| 2044 |1
sections [2] 20441213
sector (1) 19852
security 16119722324
19732613211124
seek [2] 211314211721
seeking [1] 211319
select [1] 207715
selection [1] 213720
self 19 ) $196610211316 \quad 20$
211491321161920
21311213210
Self-identufication (1]
196521
self-identufication [1] 19661
self-ıdentufied [1] 1966 11
self-identafies [1] 196518
self-identufying [2] 196635
semtofficual [1] 20029
seminars [1] 195020
send [3| 205S 1220946 21051
Sentor 111939 I
senwor 110 198613207217
2084102085232086616
20876208821209814
211025
senvority [2] 19631920771
sense |6| 1932251988 /l
20331620345204919
20653
sensituve 131203325
213219213315
separate 111 19748
separatron 14| 19842223
19858198719
sertatum |1| 204715
serous |4| 2004420504
20685214519
sernously III 20745
served [4] 197316208724
2119621
Service (1) 2121 13
service 13121142021173 $2 / 2910$
Services |1| 21423
services 15119342519363
$2046420791021 / 48$
serving l2| 1985320997
session 11119834
sess.ons (1) 20981
sets [1] 212012
setting $|2| 2031$ /5 209622
settle (1) 2147 I4
settled II| 203718
seven III 1984 11
severe [1] 212914
shape [2] $204219 \quad 212620$
shapes |1| $1954 / 2$
share | $2 \mid 1974520788$
shared |2| 19326208822
shareholders |1| 20708
Shartz |I| 2127 /3
Sheehy |5| 21317122324 25
Sherman [1] 1972 I
shine (1) 200819
shipments $12 \mid 208217$
20845
shipping [13] 194013

From returning to shupments

Batic Syaterie Applications
$195678199916 \quad 204518$ $204619 \quad 20 \quad 20698 \quad 20751$ $20 \quad 2108414 \quad 214018$ ships [42] 1988 /] 199820 $24199917 \quad 200010$ 20031620056820216 20231820309203622 2046112071202072 11 $18 \quad 207316 \quad 23 \quad 207428$ 2077220781207920 $208010 \quad 20828 \quad 20831518$ $2085 / 4 \quad 209414210824$ 21092221103911 21116211218 2121 18 212279212925214815 21515
shocked [1] 19879
shooting [1] $2017 / 8$
shore $\begin{array}{llllllll}99 & 1957 & 23 & 19584 & 15\end{array}$
$1970 \quad 25 \quad 197141972 \quad 17$
20001020951214013
shoreside [2] 2095624 shortage [3] 208958 shorthand (1) 216310 show [16] 19322220102 $20 \quad 20114201720 \quad 20288$ $203813 \quad 17 \quad 203924$
2103122105821066
$210819 \quad 21179212520$ 21503
showing [1] 212222 shows $\{31200914207516$ 210313
shut $16 \mid 201221012$ 20285203722207224 shutdown |1| $2035 / 2$ sic [4| $198416 \quad 19883$ $1990 / 2199121$
sickness [3] 20546916 sides [1] 202017
sun $131194810 \quad 211018$ 21115
shnallll 201017
stgnals 111200622
signed [2] 19742 2121 12
ugnificance |l| 20748
significant [31 2015 /]
2073 /3 2096 /5
signs [5] $20972022 \quad 20984$
9212420
silent [1] 19307
simple [1] 201219
simplified |l| 20437
simulation [11] 20061315
$200920232013 / 201523$
$201620 \quad 22 \quad 201914$
202020204325
simulator [1] 2020 /3
simultaneous [1] 2001 3
singing [1] 2091 20
sink [1] 20179
sinkings |1] $2001 / 1$
Sir [1] $2045 / 4$
sit [5] 197212 200/ 18
2022132132921331
site [1] 214822
sittung [1] 215713
situatron $|13| 19366 \quad 19387$
$19589 \quad 1975 \quad 17 \quad 1986 \quad 12$
$20122420168 \quad 25 \quad 201716$
2031 21 2220384208712

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-20-94 VOLUME 14

2040820513205315
2055520619213324
sort |l0| 19482419497
1990181999415200017
2046 l 204923206424 211621
sought |1| 1942 /2
Sound 1911978 // 198323
19924715206622
20676212719212919
sound |11 204919
Sounds $12+20211219$
sounds |11 2021 I7
source 1312010679
sources |1| 208223
south [3] $19871718 \quad 20124$
southeast |11 200823
space |II 19988
span |II 2096 IO
speak |3| $1930 \quad 12 \quad 1949 \quad 17$
19723
speaking |II 20784
special |4| $1996 \quad 13 \quad 15$
21401316
spectalties [1] 20009
specialty [1] 20007
specific [13| 1934319384
1941 13195923196722
1971192001161720566
206720212622215210
21578
Specifically [2] 19634
20806
specifically 121933 /2
19491919542195725
$196261965 / 4198112$
2051621011321537
21542421567
specifics |11 19971
sped [31 20118910
speech 16] 19724213516
171921213611
speed [18| 1987241988 /
122008212011814
2018422201935711
20311522203414
203518
spell |6| 19575196749
19781520458213824
spelled $111 / 9988$
spend [1] 209516
spent (11) 199516
spill f91 /929 17 1930 /
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}19316 & 12 & 13 & 1934 & 23 & 24\end{array}$
$1936 \quad 16 \quad 1937 \quad 13$
Spoke [1] 194918
spoke 17119518196513
196636196923205923
21419
sponsored [3| 20997
21085211111
sponsoring |11 20733
spot $|2| 196419 \quad 200813$
spring |1| 205012
squares |11 200713
St (1] $1978 / 8$
stabilty |II 19596
stable [1] 201625
stack 14120089204623
204747
staff [4] 20828 // 212324
staffing $1212080 \overline{10} 208224$ stage 19120082220115
2016825201716201811 1420259
stages |2| 19422223
stagger 11120787
Stalzer |1| 214010
stand |5| 1955719673
197810200713203516
standard 161198121

2082 II
standards (1) 199917
standby 11120766
standing [3] 19832419953
202913
standpoint [3] 19341
2112421133
starhoard $|3| 20165$
$203623 \quad 203718$
start |l8| 197956198812
20062120101824
2011 1220171620263
$20281924203412041 / 4$
20701721586910
started [17] 19475197013
$197741989 / 41999614$
1924200510200915
2012420171202910
20322121254213345
starting [3] 1939419733
$2032 / 8$
starts 1312011720282 I|
STATF ||1 2163 )
State III 19397
state 119119382419423
1965719673919695
1978 15 211998520004
20458207118208610
2129102021301213823
21395214418
stated $1311952 \quad 25 \quad 1960 \quad 16$
212022
statement [32] 195024
2018620191012203822
20472020491420523
205618205715205923
2060202068 II 2069517
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}18 & 19 & 20 & 21 & 22 & 2087 & 23\end{array}$
210111182120821215
2131172133519213514
213620213721
statements [2] 199513
214216
States [4] 202524212723
21282022
states [2] $2018 \quad 22 \quad 208311$
Statestur [1] 19987
statron [2] 21292021301
stathonary [4] $2023 \begin{array}{lllll}5 & 13 & 15\end{array}$ 17
stathoned |11 214821
statistics [2] 20821620
status |1| 20873
statute (1) 20853
stay [5] 19847199010
20167208820215618
stayed (1) 208925
staying |I| 20376
stays 111201021
steadily [1] 20134

Anuc Syzeran Applicatiom
steady [1] 20087
steaming [2] 2031 1014
steel [5] 202034202311 204125
step [7] $204323 \quad 2072814$ 21063210713212414 21381
Stepped (1) 199724 stepped (5) 19661919787
19861821411116 steps 18119641119723 2072520731220845
2085172087921225 stereotype (I] 205825 stern [2] 200810201024 sterotypes [1] 20594
Steve [11] $214312 \quad 16 \quad 25$ 21444721511920 21525142025
steward [6] 208719208811 214011162145221555 STEWART [9] 1938 IS 1956221964152219654 $111966 / 518215913$ stick 11121104
Stockman II 1929 21
stocks |1| 208120
stone |1| 202625
Stop $12 \mid 202825$
stop [7] 1952 / 2006 21 24
2028120764208423
21213
Stopped 111 20071
stopped 1111200623
2010172012321201812
20282320351720398
20431420721921
stored |11 2008 ।
story 111196217
stove [1] 203317
straught (5) 195) 17204417
2090242091721356
stran |3| 198959204020
Street \|11 197822
strength |1| 2003 /
stress [5] 19445195925
2020123
stresses 161201916
$2042121723 \quad 2520433$
strictiy (2) 21185 2151 11
strike [4] 19542520218
20572023
strong [2] 19448194625
strongly |11 $1947 / 4$
structural $13 \mid 199823$
200111204018
structure $111 \mid 19431522$
25194471949720159
2020320231112204020
structured [3] 19477
19481921
structures [1] 20239
studied 13। $19998 \quad 201213$ 15
studies |1| $2088 / 2$
study 18119999200319
2085182086232425
20891021241
studying 11120068
stumble 111215520
stumbling 11121465

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT "5-20-94 VOLUME 14
sub [11 210723
subject 119119345195322
19903200110201015
2052222057242058620
20601520661321
2104252125421358
2137923215767
submitted [1] 193716
Subsequent [1] 1949 13
subsequent [S| 193720
$194661952 / 2197718$
2001 23
substance |l0| 1933711
19417 |1 1942 /4 15
1954519593205017
206414
substance-abuse-type [1]
19778
substantual (2] 1958519865
suburb [1] 20965
successful [2] 193024
195025
successfully |3| 2059 /2
20632421131
sucked III 1944 10
vuffered 111 2027 I/
suffering |1! $21 / 1$ 23
suffering $111 / 9346$
Sufficient (1) $2025 / 4$
sufficient 12119412202610
suggest III 194710
suggested (1) 19478
suggesting |31 1951 2224 25
suggestron [2] 2087 2]
20893
suggestrons |11 209425
sutts II 20884
sum |21 195452064 /4
summarice |l| 1937 /9
Summary |1| 215710
summary 12120471521238
suminer (6) 2050121922
2420536207018
supervise [2] 1950 21 20436
supervises 11121107
supervising $1212102 / 7$
21103
supervision (6) 196015
1992182005821013
21028
supervisor 1111 1953 4 /2
1964 y 19661021015
21141721155820
2116921367
supervsors 110196513
2073 /1 2086 /2 21105
21222321233510
21251521354
supervisory 17121108
211414151621154
2116419
support |12| 19447812
15194841961711
1962202108521111118 supported |l| 1963 /8
supportive |3| $194315 \quad 21$ 22
Suppore $12 \mid$ 2 0882208925 suppose $|1| 2125 / 5$ supposed 171/9874

206122207818208416
20905212479
Surely [2] $194919 \quad 195321$
surest [1] 194220
surprise [1] 215723
surprised [2] 19862124
surprising (1] 20153
Surrendering [!| $2135 / 8$
Surrounding [1] 21368
survey [31 2091 12209218 212020

- surveying [31 2003121415 surveyoring [1| 200315 susceptiblity [3] 19411011 195119
suspect [2] 208910211510
Swartz [1] 206619
swing [5] 200917201021
2011131824
swinging 51201116
2028141720295203525
switch (1) 205412
Sworn (6) 1965519671
1978131998320455
213822
symptomatology 121 194/9 1942 //
synonymous |11 19603
system |151 19731013
199614207817209017
202325209171020924 132320962321356 systems |1| 20012
——T-
1 V |11 205414
tachometer 111200820
takes |71 1996 /| 201223
201762034 1 11215624
talk $12511941 / 3198323$
1991 21011202423
2027222047320533
$2057172067192086 / 4$
2020871321241221315
2133122137122143620
214412721461621567
talked [20] $20268 \quad 203017$
2055182058 /1 208412
20851920208618
2101252118252130924
213342134216213567
$212 / 361316$
talking |36| $192918 \quad 193718$
19383 1940) 2119523
195521231962819662
196962419836199621
22202110202313
$2024121415 \quad 202816$
2029420306204212
20521220644207919
20861720944209610
21112211325213025
2136152142521438
214614
tall |l| 21557
tank |3| 20033201816 204022
tanker |13| 20182420194
2023252024220811923
208231224208714

20901320995
tankers 16119913208116
1720831113208714
tanks (4) 2008151610147
tape [4] 200520201125
202723
tapes [1| 209412
tasks [2| 19932325
taste (I) 211915
teach 14120039 /l 12
teaching |11 2079 II
team |6| 20772320786
2103192106821371
tear [1] 198725
Tech [1] 19997
technical [1] 203823
technicality [1] 211621
technically [1] 201913
technology [2] 196416
19654
telephone (1) 215118
telling [8] 196024196522
20202120375203917
2147152153721561
tells [1] 207322
temperature |1] $2031 / 8$
Temporary [1] $2140 / 3$
temporary [4] 202715
214031315
ten 114119605197619
1984 // 202816203222
203314203434203524
20931216172158 II
tend [1] 1943 /4
tended 11119587
tends |l| 19344
tenor 111205814
term (9) 19331722 19341
195552002919200416
202413211320
Terminal [2] $197215 \quad 22$
terminal [3] $1972 \quad 16 \quad 19737$
202224
terminals $|2| 20812221422$
terminate [2] 2068 // 23
terminated 111199717
termination |11 2068 IS
terminology [1] 211622
terms 191192924193022
2419336193516197224
209415212021214021
terrible [1] 206821
test $131214810 \quad 1516$
testufied |l2| 194620
195924197715199510
1997420018203215
20331320493205223 213121
testufy [2] 1931 5204824
testifyong [2] 2001 1220499
testumony [27] 193614
1938171950419592
1992220002223200520
20091020145201721
20218202842032 IS
$20337122035 / 120365$
$203710 \quad 25 \quad 20382204213$
2057222421001210925
21206
testung liol 19303811
19502519571315

Basc Sviterm Appicencris
2119152122101213 Texas [21 2045 1/ 21398
Thank [19] 19661520 19981020051420141 202123202212204322 232045120533205712 20705212622138115 1721392215812 thank 141 20128204318 204416206923
Thanks [1] 196616
thanks [1] /965 3
Thanksgiving 111211910 theme |f| 2134192325 213513
themes 131207315213421 22
then latest [1] 193015
theory [1] 211814
therapist [1] 19458
therapy $[8] 1947191948$ IS
196213205424205556
8211617
thereafter [3] 194023
19412 19472
they'd [1] 20904
They're [4] $201015 \quad 201919$ 207816211323
they're |171 19417 194410
1947202119541516 $1996122061 / 20771620$ 207812208122208416 2091182096621107 they've $[212022$ / 2 thanking 121215018215110 Third [2] 205321215720 thard $\mid 261 / 9634197923$ 2024198011198324
19846716171985321 198621319911213
$1993 / 811131994515$ 20781220799212624
Thomas 121 1971242151 1
thousand $|2| 20672223$
Thousands [1] 206721
threatened [1] 1963 21
three [25] 19333193922
195321197524197620
19804917199516
202562044318204624
20551519207425
2082131520831315
$20851415 \quad 20967211910$ 212912
three-day (3) 1981 319823
198311
throttle [2] 201923
trdal [1] 200925
tude [15] 2010120116
201223201410111519
222026182027389
202813203617
tued (1) 207222
tues [1] 20938
tumely [1] 21462
times [20] 193323195322

$19844 \quad 111518 \quad 1924$
1994719976204113
20496208724209913 211910

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
tumewse |l| 215720
timing |1| 21029
$\operatorname{tip}$ [2] 2049 // /5
tired 111198820
tiredness |1| $2085 / 4$
title 14| 19406719579 1/
titles |1| 213922
tolerance [1] 2121 19
Tom |1| 215623
Tompkins 13| 2/31 61216
tone |l| $2058 / 4$
tons |1| 204125
tools [2] 20462125
topse 17] $1929 \quad 15 \quad 19322 \quad 24$
205042097152135217
topics $[5] 208681915 \quad 17$
21113
torch [1] 203316
total|l| /961 15
totally |4| $1945 \quad 16 \quad 1956 \quad / 1$
196216214716
touching ll| 21069
tough |11 215714
tour [3] 1958 /] 2088 /6
2089 /3
tow [1] 20273
towards 141195925201812 13209419
trade 12120462225
traders 111211013
trades |t| 209910
tradithnally |l| 203623
traffic [8] $198422 \quad 23 \quad 19857$
19877151992814
208515
train 121 2077319
trained $1112 / 2421$
training 112120041922
$2046122077202079 / 3$
2086132100221242325
2125321374
transcript 1101201724
2020232044920462324
2051212061821051
2163912
transcription |1| 216310
transferred [2] 1980 12 17
transit |l| 2/29 19
transiting (II 19926
transits [1] 19927
transpired 12$\rceil 196217$
2120 21
Transportation [2| 20543
205524
transportation |4| /998 /7
2220544205513
treating [6] $193531939 \quad 18$

treatment [27] 193022
$1939 \quad 20 \quad 1942 \quad 12 \quad 19459 \quad 15$ $\begin{array}{llllllllll}1948 & 6 & 1953 & 19 & 196016 \quad 18\end{array}$
$20 \quad 196324 \quad 196410$
$205420 \quad 20551921$
$20562420577 / 8 \quad 20.8 / 2$
$20801213 \quad 210524$
$211312 \quad 211821213122$
23213220
trembly [1] 20073
trual 13119296201724
215811
trick [1] 2038 /3
$\operatorname{trip}|4| 20785211015$
$2129 / 3$
trips $15 \mid / 958 / 3$ /984 /2
1988619934
I rue |l| 2063 /
true 11811934919524
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}19644 & 1985 & 18 & 2070 & 13 & 15\end{array}$
222087232100712
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}2101 & 11 & 22 & 210718\end{array}$
2133202321639
trusted [2] 2144421503
truthfut H 320522210224
Tuesday [2] 21571621581
tugs [1] 2026 /9
tune [1] 2091 21
tunnel |l| 2008 /]
turn-around [9] 19891722
$25 \quad 199091023 \quad 201819$ 206649
turning $131 / 996 / 6 \quad 213523$
Twice |1| 20497
twice |2| 197410206624
two-and-a-half |1| 1958 /3
tying |l| 19894
Type [2] $19855 \quad 13$
type [12] 1935819364
1937419851420024
20036200521201015
202024203412205924 2074 I
types [2] $1946 / 2081 / 15$
typical |3] 208224 2088 /3
Typically ||| 2088 /5
typically |10| 207233
207521 2081 122125
$20865192096 / 7210623$

- U-

U S $171199912 \quad 207519$
20776209013210917
21211314
UCSF (1) 193913
Uh-huh 1101 193017
202920203820204118
$\begin{array}{llllll}20 & 20718 & 21126 & 211615\end{array}$
213017213714
uh-huh [9] 204920206317
2064232068820693
Ultumately [1] 1989 /4
ultumately [2] 194217
205916
unable [1] 204820
unannounced [6] 210525
$210646 \quad 14 \quad 15 \quad 211010$
unavailability [2] 212989
unchecked (1) 194217
uncle [1] 211424
uncommon [3] 19971415
20216
undergoing [2] /93) 22
19645
undergone [11 193/ /4
underlying [1] 205715
understand [15] 1933 12
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}1935 & 19 & 19388 & 1941 & 19\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}1949 & 1994 & 13 & 199519\end{array}$
20067202016206325
20955209813210518
21511224
understandug [16] 19302
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}22 & 19464 & 1961 & 21 & 1965 & 17\end{array}$ 198714205510205979
20602220694720851
209625215668
understands |1| 21387
understood 15120853
21161621481221522
undertake [1] 19327
undertaken [1] 200318
undertook [1] 200916
underway [2] 21101021471
underwriter [2] 200125
20269
underwriters [4] 199820
200123202629
unestablushed 121215712
16
uniform 111210917
unson 18120771101113
16 2090 /1 $2091 / 4210624$
unsons |1| 20779
unique \{1] 194111
unit $131194914 \quad 2 / 3679$
United |41 202524212723
21282022
units [1] 213513
universe [1] 20577
University [2] 19397
1979 /I
unknown |l| 204220
unicensed (3) 208522
210622210910
undike [1] 207625
undffictal (2) $215318 \quad 20$
unprecedented [1] /986 22
unreasonable [1] 2087 1
unsatusfactory [1] 2123 /] unspecified [1] 2101 19 unusual |121 $193722 \quad 19386$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}1986 & 10 & 11 & 16 & 17 & 19878\end{array}$
$198810 \quad 1990816 \quad 201510$
209910
upper $121192918 \quad 205418$

upset | 3 | 2142 | 16 | 19 | 21518 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

USA [81 19321193914
19405194120194914
1950191954 // 212321
USCG|11 212918
usual |2| $193812 \quad 19607$
utulity 13 | $213916 \quad 21$
utulagation (1) 206725
utilzed [4] 1992379
2129 IS
utulizing [2] 212889

| - V - |
| :---: |
| V-a-n [1] 19988 |
| vacation [1] 20901 |
| Valentuu [3] 19992021 |
| 20054 |
| Valentane [11 203425 |
| Vallury [2] 193524210013 |
| VAN [8] 19981120047 |
| 200515202124216025 |
| 811 |
| Van [25] 1998 I 61316 |
| 199925200392520049 |
| 20051720062022 |
| 201016201619201720 |

$\qquad$

Bare Symera Apploalican
20223567820269
2028420301020332023
2043 /8
varied (1] 211013
variety (4) 20482520889
210615213321
rehucle [2] 20042021
venue (1) 20003
verbal (1) 2146 11
$\begin{array}{llll}\text { verbally }[2] & 1948 & 1 & 19567\end{array}$
verify [1] 209520
verifying [1] 1932 11
version [3] 20437205210 205310
vessels [29] 196715
1968231969919703
19752197661319779
198451990419927
2001417207116207223
2075212076222077422
2085202106121191
212025212114212810
$2129101719 \quad 213512$
vice-president (1) 19993
VIDEO [6] 1929121938 21
19562521594710
Video 161 192911193820
1956242159369
video (4) 2006232007 /4
201145
videographer (1) $2006 / 2$
videotape 111| 1929 10
1956232006132020082 2009131420102201517 203520
view 124119301019345
19385194619194814
19518131719525
198318199125200014
20075200921201521
20169204018205223
2059 /1 2061222095619 21127212813
viewed (1) 200615
vigilant ||| 212625
vюlate ||| 21464
volated ||| 206824
volates (11 2112 )
volating |4| 21019210222 $213319 \quad 2 / 43 / 4$
violation |3| 2122 /|
214515214914
Virginia |2| 199978
vis-a-vis [2| 1965 13204718 viswn [11 213510
visited (3) 2072 /| 208520 21109
visits (II) 19495
vodka [2] 19741416
voce [1] 201125
VOIR ${ }^{2} \mid 2004721605$
volumes 111 204624
voluntarily $|3| 21 / 8521$ 2121 12
voluntary [1] /997 /8
voucher 13 | 19701723 197714
VTS [3] 199282020723
$-\quad-\mathbf{W}_{-}$

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-20-94

W-o-er-n-せr 11119676
WAGNER [131 19299
193818195621196617
1978820199421213819
21394215121215410
215922216024
wat |II 1962 /4
wated [2] 2027821502
waik 141197123198122
2073 13 21327
walked [1] 19722
walking [1] 197125
wanted [17] 196015
198612201812203112
4203225203621208920
2421041321052224
2142918215221
wantung [1] 19726
Wants [11 21388
wants 171195118201222
2075202088 / 208912
21528215323
warehouse |3| 21541822 24
warmer (1) 215419
Washington 11196712
Watch 15 | 198551314
$1986 / 419874$
watch |27| 198324198414
19853198871989236
7202419953199621
19977920722520841
20872220882209724
2098 / 2/114 212414
$2 / 2625 \quad 2 / 4862 / 494$
watched [2] 1993 6 2/36 17
watches $[2 \mid 195() 35$
watching 11120984
water [4] $201818 \quad 19 \quad 20272$
212817
ways 14| 2074 1/ 21268
21371822
we'd 12| 21/4 2| 21582
We'll 15 ) 1929 y $2016 \quad 13$
207656215617
we'll |9| 19641719847
20092320101720471
2070321585 y 10
We're 1412076 || 2077 21
$215722215 \times 17$
we're |l|91 194712195521
2319858199621199819
$2023132028 / 620376$
2039 21 205212208823
20943209610209714
21201921282213113 215725
We've 141 1999 | 205724
2130921572
we've |lol 19641619866
20131 \& 204514204722
20551520577209016
21582
wear 111 198725
weather $1112129 / 4$
wedge |4| 20102225
201112
week (6) 204415206412
13182086720961
weekend [1] 215816
weeks 111211015
weighing |1| 21287
weught [1] 201025
Welcome |1| 196023
weicome [1] 19615
wekoming |I| 19615
welding [1] 20058
weren't 171 196019201310
202513202922206421
20991
West (4) $2070 \quad 1418 \quad 21$
20825
west 19121002521027
2110242127162140711
2143132153611
Westar (3) $1972 \quad 15 \quad 18 \quad 22$
Weststar (8) 2141621422
321481314215215
whatsoever (1) 2025 /2
whenever |1| 2129 ||
wherever 111211516
Whichever III 20808
white [5] 200712200814
1720096201025
Whoever (11) 215425
whoever [2] 19708215310 wife [3] $19448 \quad 196610$ 21051
WILLIAM $14 \mid 197819$
19942421592124
Willuam |lo 19788 1/ 22
198323199246206622
20676212719212919
WILLIAMSON 14121393
21541321602321611
Willaamson $16 \mid 213820$
21396723214911
215415
willing (1) 212510
willingness [1] 21267
wind |l| 201223
Windy |l| 2045 /I
wne |181 1982781020 $\begin{array}{lllllll}22 & 19838 & 11 & 14 & 199510\end{array}$
21196811131621
2120421485215517
wish [2] 2070921565
wit II 195414
WITNFSS 11319656
19672199862007116
200872014220348
204561020531520583
2092 I
Witness $\{5 \mid 19655199724$
1998320455213822
witness |181 19651196620
$21 \quad 197125197418$
$19761521 \quad 19789199723$
19981200512201324
2045320717208721
213818215222
witnessed 111197613
WITNF SSES 11121592
witnesses |11 21583
Woerner III 19675
won't |31 20911920
214625
wonder 14| 210722211123
21502324
wondering [2] 2091/8
214310
woops |1| 211122
word |s| 199523200417
20558214925215014
words [17] 19418195520
1972619732319796
19901820055202310
20289206439208818
2107321165213225 213612215520
worked [31] 19605196713
15 1969 11 197422
1988211989101215
1999101723201817
$2024101518 \quad 203425$
204518206023206115
20871520881320903
20927209512211316
21271214313214819
worker (111 19598
workers [1] 195724
Working [1] 200424
working [17] 193621
1999142024200423
200510202421204314
2061 I 3207472087113
209912102714
workplace |6| 205825
210725210878212318
21252
works 111198918
world [2] 20695209315
wouldn't |l71 196019
$19666198621 \quad 19879$
1989519931320137
20151920166202715
2049221032421325
213418213515214567
wrench [1] 201925
WRENDELL |6| 193820
195624196510215969 12
Wrendell [2) 1938 18 1939 ।
Wrught [1] 21554
write III 209018
written 110119535195516 $20 \quad 19773210519212222$ 2123221271521322224
wrong 114119517200723
206220212519213124
21322214525214714
21492321501215114
21531922
wrote [4] 1948120545
206619207019

## - Y -

yacht 111 /967 18
Yeah [15| $193221 \quad 19493$
1950819721419785
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllll}1984 & 24 & 1987 & 169908 & 16\end{array}$ 21 20261720292320397
20942321552
yeah [8] 1981 2199620
202915205425206010
207325211517214921
Year 111211923
year (17) 19806204823
20562420672220756
20822120865208922
2096721036211910
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}213013 & 18 & 24 & 2140 & 23 & 24\end{array}$
years $11111934 / 8 / 9395$
15221948919683
$200425 \quad 203013 \quad 207515$
1720943
yellow $1412008 \quad 16 \quad 17$
2010182094 /I
yesterday [1] 199217
York 141 197511197911
20005200313
Yorktown [2] 20601920894
you'd [2] 19471212412
you'll [31 $196417 \quad 2010$ 21
24
You've III 2024 16
you've |15] 1938 S 1957 /1
1969 II 1976121977 15
19905200323201312
20232225202438
2039320462521005
yours (4) 1958619601
$2066 / 213$
yourself ( 10 ) 1976 //
198218198712201512
2023220347205123
2114911
- Z -
reroll| 2121 19
分 111 1998 8



| () | For Defurdit. | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Vol } 152165 \\ & \text { mass J YRAt } \\ & \text { Boge \& cates } \end{aligned}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| ® |  | 1061 W 4t AcLe Mnte 60 Antrase AK Pron |
| (3) |  |  |
| (4) |  |  |
| $\bigcirc$ |  | thates 8 gron |
|  |  | 30 E 42d Somer |
| (4) |  | Men Yak, NH 20017 कh 212461540 |
|  |  | Jates $F$ Saloss |
| (4) |  | HEES F NEA anal 1 thell |
| $\theta$ |  | 200 Frist Uuan Taer |
|  |  | D0 4t Acre, Nort |
| (b) |  | Mestulle in 3829 |
|  |  | F. 61584173 |
|  |  | Patrex Lmo |
| ( $)^{\text {a }}$ |  | onelvery mpers |
|  |  | 40 s . Hpe strex |
| (3) |  | Los Argeles, oa 90 M h. $21548-50$ |
|  | incart |  |
| (b) | Depar Cler | TOM Mrilisara |
|  |  | U.S. Distret Cart |
| (4) |  | 20\% Th Ament |
|  |  |  |
| (in) |  |  |
|  | Aqpatior | Joy S. Braer <br> Registerel Professicel Repriter |
| (B) |  | mutgit qn cort Rppriers |
|  |  |  |
| (a) |  | Andorase, FK 9P18 Ph OTCBTM |

(1) PROCEEDINGS
(2) (Jury in at 800 am )
(3) THE CLERK All nise
(4) (Call to Order of the Court)
(s) THE COURT Good morning ladies and gentlemen This
(6) is the continuation of trial in case A89 0095 Civil in re the
7) Exxon Valdez
(8) Mr O Neill will you call your next witness?
9) MR O NEILL Thank you Judge The planatuffs call
(10) by videolape, Steve Day
th- DIRECT EXAMINATION OF STEVE DAY (Video)
(12) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(13) Q Mr Day for the record would you state your full name
(14) please?
(15) A Steven Morgan Day
(10) Q And where do you currently reside sir?
(17) A At 2920 Sombrosa Street un Carisbad, Califorma
(18) Q By whom are you currentiy employed?
(19) A Exxon Shupping Company
(20) Q What s your current position with Exxon Shipping Company?
(21) A I'm a first assistant engineer
(22) Q When you were initially hired in November of 84 by Exxon
(23) Shipping Company what position did you hold?
(.4) A Second assistant engineer
ist $Q$ And whre you assigned to any particular vessel at that
Vol 152167
(1) tume?
(2) A Just briefly, not to a permanent vessel, just to the Exxon
(3) Baytown
(4) Q Were you aubsequently assigned to a different veasel?
(s) A No I was sent - after that assignment I was moved
(6) ashore as machinery inspector for the construction of the

## Exxon

(7) Valdez and the Exxon Long Beach, spent four months in

## Houston

(8) in the headquarters office, and about, oh 18 months here in
(9) San Diego on-site, as on site inspector
(10) Q What was the next position you held then with Exxon
(II) Shipping Company?
(12) A When the ships were completed I sailed the Exxon Long
(13) Beach as first assustant enguneer for approximately one year
(14) Q Who was the master at that time?
(Is) A Marshal Price was one Bill Deppe and Tom Calle were
the
(16) three masters that I sailed with on that ship
(17) $Q$ And was the Exxon Long Beach involved in the Valdez run?
(18) AYes
(19) Q You did that for about a year?
(20) AYes
(21) Q So does that bring us up to sometime in late 85 ?
(22) A No, actually '88 shup was completed an April of '87 May
(23) of ' 88 I came ashore once again as a repair supenntendent
on a
(24) temporary shore assignment
(2s) $Q$ Where was that shore assignment?

## Vol $15 \quad 2168$

A Benicta Califorma, west coast fleet office
() Q And as a repair superintendent what were your duties?
(3) A To assist the vessel with voyage repairs in port to
(4) coordinate and essentially run the shipyard repairs when the
vessels enter the shipyard and then assist the chuef engineer
(6) and the captain as requred you know as far as getting parts
(7) or labor to accomplish different tasks on the vessel
(8) Q Was Harvey Borgen assigned to the west coast fleet office during the time you were there in 1988?
AYes
Q What was his position at that time?
A He was the west coast fleet manager
$Q$ Would you report to him?
A It was my recollection that I reported to the shap group coordinator for the individaal vessel that I was working on
(16) Q Okay And that would be etther Stuart McRobbie or Bill
(In Deppe?
(18) AYes
(19) Q Would they report to Harvey Borgen?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q How long were you the repair superintendent at Benecia
(22) Califorma?
(23) A From April of '88 untul approximately August of 1989
(24) Q And what position did you take in August of 897
(25) A At that tume I was assigned as repair supernitendent for

## Vol 152169

(1) the reparr of the Exxon Valdez here in San Dego
(2) Q From April - excuse me from November of 84 when you
(3) first were hired by Exxon Shipping Company until the present
(4) have you been informed of the existence of an alcohol poincy
(9) that the company had?
(6) A Yes
(7) Q Now has it been reminded you attended the fleet
(8) management conference in March of 1988 and there was a
discussion during that conference regarding the alcohol
policy?
A Yes, I beheve that was part of the presentation
Q Do you recall who gave the presentation in regards to the alcohol policy during that conference?
A No, I don't
Q Who attended - to your knowiedge, who was to attend the fleet management conference?
A Semor officers first assistants chef engueers chief mates and captains
Q Did captans attend this management conference as well? A Yes
Q Do you recall which captans were there?
A Some of them I don't remember everyone that was there
Q Okay Do you recall any names?
A Captan Hazelwood was there
Q What vessel was Captain Hazelwood sailing at that tume if
(1) you know?
(2)
(3)
(s) C who
6) was present in that room?

A Andy Dunn
Q Anyone else vou can recall'
A No
QIs there any particular reason over five years after the
(il) conference you can recall Captain Hazelwood and Andy Dunn
being
(12) present in the room?
(13) A I've been asked about this conference a lot by various (14) attorneys you know in the last five years
(IS) $Q$ Is that the only reason you recall Captain Hazelwood and
(16) Andy Dunn drinking Perrier?
(17) A No From my recollection they were the only ones not (18) drunking alcohol

Q After the management conference when was the next time you
(20) would have had occasion to see or hear of Captain Hazelwood?
(21) A May of '88
(22) Q Okay In May of 1988 you came across Captain

Hazelwood s
(23) name again or you heard about him again?
(24) A I worked with him
(20) Q Where was this?

|  | Vol 15 2171 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | A In West State Shipyard in Portland Oregon |
| (2) | Q You were the repatr superintendent at that time? |
| (3) | A I was an assustant to Jack King |
| (4) | Q And at that time was Captan Hazelwood the master of the |
| (5) | Exxon Valdez? |
| (6) | AYes |
| (7) | Q You say you worked with hem What exactly did you do with |
| (8) | Captain Hazelwood or how did your duties coincide with |
|  |  |
|  | Hazelwood s? |
| (10) | A Well it was - it was in both of our unterests to get the |
| (11) | vessel back into service, you know |
| (12) | Q Let me - the Exxon Valdez was in dry dock? |
| (13) | A Yes undergoing repaar |
| (14) | Q Do you recall specifically how long the Exxon Valdez |
| (1) | dry docking lasted in May of 19887 |
| (16) | A I believe it was about eaght weeks |
| (17) | Q Was there any reason it was longer than the general' |
| (18) | A Because there was this guarantee dry docking, as I |
| (19) | mentuoned, the scope of work was larger, a lot of guarantee |
| (20) | related items were repared or altered |
| (21) | Q Could you tell us what kind of contact you had with Captain |
| (22) | Hazelwood during this time? |
|  | A Primanly working the - my responsibility was to monitor the repars and then work with hum coordinate with hum to |
| be |  |
|  | sure that he was satusfied that repars were complete and |
| the |  |

Vol $15 \quad 2172$
get the vessel back minto service, you know
Q Did you see Captain Hazelwood on a dasly basis?
A Yes, I would - I would say that's how I remember it
Q Did you socialize with Capian Hazelwood at all during this tume?
A No
Q During the tume of the Exxon Valdez dry docking did
anything happen woncerning Caplain Hazelwood which you
subsequently reported to a supenor of yours?
AYes
Q Okay Could you tell us what occurred?
A I overheard on the wallie-talke radio someone call the
ship supenntendent for the vessel, yard person, indicatung
that we're out of Henry's up here " It was my umpression that
(IS) the voice calling was Captan Hazelwood
(16) Q You heard Capiain Hazelwood s voice before?
(17) AYes
(18) Q Okay You said that you heard this voice which you
(19) believed to be Captain Hazelwood saying we re out of Henry s
(20) uphere?
(21) AYes
(22) Q What does that phrase mean to you?
(23) A It sounded to me like be was referning to Henry

Wemhart's
(24) beer
(25) Q You identified the position before I think buito whom

```
Vol 15 2173
was Captain Hazelwood speaking at this time?
A The ship supenntendent
Q And who was that?
A Person named Bull Timmons
Q Do you recall what Mr Timmons response was?
A I believe it was something to the effect Roger - Roger
captan I'll see what I can do about that Something luke
```

that
Q How was it that you happened to overhear this conversation?
A I was in the shapyard office - the port engrneer's office
and it was my habit to leave the radio on to case the
shpyard
(12) needed me or people on the ship aeeded to ask me
somethang
(13) Q Did this exchange cause you any concern?
AYes
Q And why did it cause you concern?
A I was concerned that others might draw the conclusions I
had drawn
Q You had drawn some conclusions from this exchange?
A That Henry's meant Heary Wemhart's I was concerned
the
(30) way it sounded over the radio
( I) Q Why did that concern you the way il sounded?
(29) A Well we try to keep the radio conversation to
work related
(?) business and it didn't sound work related to me
(14) Q Did it concern you that an Exxon Shipping Company captain
(2s) was ordering beer over the radio?
(I) A I would have to say I was concerned that that might be the (2) case
(3) Q Did you do anything to follow up on your concerns?
(4) A Yes, I spoke to Herb Leyendecker
(s) Q Who is Herb Leyendecker?
(6) A At that tume, he was the repair manager I believe was hus
(7) tutle He was my boss, essentually, as reparr superntendent
(8) overseeng the repars of the vessel
(9) Q What did you tell Herb Leyendecker?
(10) A From my recollection, I told hm essentually what we've
(1) Just - what I've just told you
(12) Q Where was Herb Leyendecker?
(13) A He was in the office with me
(14) $Q$ So he overheard the conversation as well?
(1s) A It's very possible that he did
(16) Q Did he indicate to you that he'd over heard the
(17) converaation?
(18) A My recollection is that I dudn't have to do much
(19) explanng, so he was man office that was just a few feet
(20) away and probably could have heard the same radio that I heard,
(21) or even had one on in that adjacent office
(22) Q Was there anybody else in the office besides you and
(23) Mr Leyendecker?
(24) A Not that I recall no
(25) Q Can you tell us what it was you discussed with

Vol 152175
(1) Mr Leyendecker?
(2) A As I stated eariser, you know, we like to keep the radio
(3) for the business of the reparr And that there might bea
(d) possibility that what we heard was ordering beer
(s) Q What did Herb Leyendecker say in response to your (6) concerns?
(7) A My recollection is that be sard that he would speak to (8) Captam Hazelwood about what I had heard or we had heard And
(9) he didn't really want me to get unvolved I think being $a$
(10) Neet - fleet person
(II) QIdidn t understand what you meant being a fleet person
(1) A This - the job that I was dong in Portland and the enure
(13) two years I was ashore, stull essentially a first assustant
(14) engueer who was workang temporarily as a repar supenntendent
(IS) or new construction inspector but eventually as we've seen in
(16) my bio I do have to go back to sea and work with the rest of
(17) the fleet as a peer or as a junior officer to some of these
(18) people It was his desire to keep me out of any potential
(19) conflicts or discussions of that nature
(20) $Q$ Did he tell you that that was his desire?
(-1) A Yes that's my recollection that -
(22) QHesaid don tget - don $\mathbf{t}$ get involved you re going to be
(73) sailing with these people III handle it?
(4) A That's my recollection
(2) Q Okay As a result of the concerns that you told us about

## Vol $15 \quad 2176$

any action that you took in regards to this incident after you
() spoke with Herb Leyendecker using that understanding of follow
(1) up did you do anything to follow up on your concerns? A Well, I spoke to Herb about - as I said and I believe he ind speak with Captan Hazelwood at some point I can't recall
(6) whether it was that day or the following day
in Q Okay Let me ask you did you speak with Mr Leyendecker about his conversation with Captain Hazeiwood? A Yes
Q What did he tell you about that conversation?
A From what I recall he undicated he - he asiced Captonn Hazelwood if there was drnkang goung on on the ship, and Captan Hazelwood sand there wasn't This is from what I remember of hum debriefing me afterwards He asked Captan
(15) Hazelwood if he was drinking agann, and from what I recall his
(16) reply was no
(In And then I beheve Herb indicated that if there was any
(18) drining going on on the ship, that he wanted it stopped And
(19) if there was any booze on the ship, he wanted it off, you know
(v) kind of - kind of a warmigg or a - some gudance that if thas
(21) was some kind of indication of a problem that he expected
the
(22) captan to take care of it
(23) Q Anything else you can recall about what Herb Leyendecker
( 7 a) told you in regards to his conversation with Caplain
(25) Hazelwood?

## Vol 152177

A No that's - that's all I can -
Q You said that Herb Leyendecker asked Captain Hazelwood if he was drinking again?
A That's - that's my recollection yes
Q Did you have an understanding as to why Herb Leyendecker would ask ham if he was drinking again?
A My understandang was that you know possibly at some tume
(8) in the past Captan Hazelwood had an alcohol problem or been a
(9) heavy druker and as - you know as I stated earker the only (10) tume I had met hum, he was not drunking
(II) Q Prior to this incident had someone told you or had you (12) learned from ame source that Captain Hazelwood had had an
(13) alcohol problem or was a heavy dnaker?
(14) A Nothing specific
(1s) QMr Day did you want to clanfy that answer?
(10) A Yes I would say the impression that I had regarding you
(17) know what I sand previously, passably being a heavy drunker,
(18) probably came from Herb, you know m, you know discussing the
(19) ancident or in his decision to speak to Captan Hazelwood
(20) That's my recollection, that that's where I kund of became
(2i) aware that, you know, there mught be something in his past
(22) $Q$ Was this an indication that you d received from Herb prior
(23) to this incident?
(24) A No, I thmik kind of during Yeah Prior, I would have to (25) state, you know say the same as I did just a few minutes ago,

Vol 152178
(1) there was nothing specific to indicate that
(1) Q Okay
(3) A You know the only other thing I can add is you know I
(4) did attend this conference and with a group of sea going
(s) people and did notice that he wasn't drinking So maybe
(6) here s a guy who had realszed it was in his best interent not
(7) to Youknow that's probably the only other place I could have drawn that conclusion
(9) Q Do you recall thinking that at the time that maybe here s
(10) a guy who doesn t want to drink?
(11) ATes He and Andy, both you know They'd made a chosce of
(12) some-you know
(13) Q Do you know whether Herb Leyendecker spoke with anyone
else
(14) regarding this incident?
(15) A No I do not
(16) Q Do you want to clanfy?
(17) A Well there's a tume frame uvolved
(18) Q Okay And I had itmited my question to -
(19) A Right So it's wide open and in that tame frame you know
(20) no But -
(21) Q it s your undersuanding that sometime later Herb
(22) Leyendecker spoke with someone else about this incident?
(2) AYes
(9) Q Do you recall when that was that Herb would have had that
(25) conversation?

Vol 152179
(i) A I don't know exactly when he had the conversation I do
(2) know when he told me that he had had the conversation
(3) Q Okay And when was that?
(4) A After the grounding
(s) Q Okay But when he toid you about the converaation he
(6) dida tindicate when it was he had had - had discussed this
n incident with anyone?
(8) A Not specifically, no
(9) $Q$ Did he indicate to you that this subsequent conversation he
(10) had had was - occurred prior to the grounding?
(II) A Yes, that was my - that was my impression
(12) Q Did he tell you who he spoke with?
(13) AYes
(14) Q Who did he speak with?
(IS) A Harvey Borgen
(16) Q Did he tell you what he toid Harvey Borgen?
(17) A No, not specifically, just gave bun'a description of - of
(18) essentually what I've testufied here
(19) Q Okay And did he tell you what Harvey Borgen a reaponae
(20) was?
(21) A No, he didn't
(22) Q Now you ve told us that you spoke with Herb Leyendecker
(23) about this incident Have you spoken with anyone elae about
(14) this incident excluding the lawyers - well excluding your
(25) lawyer and Exxon Shipping Company counsel have you spoken with

Vol IS 2180
anyone else about this incident?
AYes
Q And who have you spoken to?
A Paul Myers
Q Let 8 go back to the conversation you can recall with Paul
Myers -
AYes
Q-regarding this incident When did that conversation occur?
A My best recollection is that when I - when I returned to
Benecia after the vessel saled from Portiand, I remember
discussing this meident with ham It's also very possible
prior to the shop saling from Portiand in speaking with Paul
regarding preparations to complete the repars and go to
sea
(1S) that I mentioned it as well
Q Okay You told us the ship was dry docked in Portiand for
approximately eight weeks?
AYes
(19) Q So in the May or June 1988 period you thank it s possible
you apoke to Paul Myers regarding this incident?
AYes
1 Q And then you say when vou went back to Benccia you had a
conversation with Paul Myers'
AYes
(2S) Q And when would that have been?

Vol $15 \quad 2182$
(i) ordering beer over the radio?

A I can't recall my specrific words Probably the best is to
say I relayed to hum what I've toid you today
Q Do you recall what Paul Myers response was to the information that you were telling him?
A No, I don't
Q Did Paul Myers indicate to you that he would take any
action based upon what you told him?
A No, he didn't
Q Was there something that specifically concerned you about that incident that led you to discuss this with Paul Myers?
A It was Paul's policy to request feedback on all of the people on the vessel from the repair superintendent, so I felt
(14) this was part of giving him that feedback, you know, regarding
(IS) events or people and their performance
(16) Q You menuoned before that Herb had told you to suay out of
(in) this because you're not - may have to sail with these people
(18) Was that a concern that you had when you were discussing this
(19) with Paul Myers on the telephone conversation?

A Yes
Q Did you discuss that with Paul Myers?
A I would say yes
Q What did you tell him in that regard?
A I would say discussion - I mean - my recollection is that
(25) Paul understood the position I was in and that - I kund of -

## Vol 152183

I got the umpression - or my feeling after tallong was that he (2) agreed with what Herb had done, to keep me out of it and take
(3) the ussue himself
(4) Q In May of 1988 were you aware of any instances where Exxon
(s) Shipping Company employees suffered consequences even
(6) informally from their fellow employees or from the company for
(7) reporting violations of company policy alcohol or otherwise?
(8) A In that - at that tume, no
(9) Q Subsequent to that time have you become aware of guch?
(10) A Nothing specific Our promotion system within the shipping
(II) company including the sea going employees is based upon (12) performance only and that performance is evaluated by your
(13) semior officers on the vessel, so at's easy to understand how
(14) crossing a certann group or - or sea officer could come back
(IS) to haunt you or prevent you from being promoted or geting,
you
(10) know salary increases or whatever It's something
everyone's
(17) pretty conscious of
(18) Q Whether or not you discussed it with Paul Myers was that a
(19) concern - was that a concern that you held that your
(20) reporting this incident could cause certain negative
(21) ramifications to you in future evaluations?
(1-) A Yes
(23) Q I may have asked you this already and I apologize Did
(26) Paul Myers indicate to you whether he was going to take any
(25) action as a result of your report during the tilephone

```
conversation?
A Not that I recall
Q You satd you had another conversation with Paul Myers on
May 23rd or 24th when you returned to Benecia?
AYes
Q Was that a conversation that you initiated?
A I can't recall whether he did or I did
Q What was the subject of that conversation? Was it this
Incident?
A No, actually most of it was updating him on the - how the
reparr finushed up, kind of nuts and bolts of how the reparr
was completed This was just part of that general
conversation
Q Now you say you recall this in person conversation better
than you do the telephonic conversation you d had with
Mr Myers What do you recall about your conversation with
Paul Myers on May 23 or 24 1988 as it relates to this
incident?
A What I recall is pretty much just restating the
circumstances and Herb's mavolvement and bis debnefing
(21) That's pretty much it
(22) Q I understand Other than this incident did you report
(73) anything else to Paul Myers during this conversation regarding
(54) Captain Hazelwood s performance during the dry docking of
(2S) Exxon Valdez?
(I) conversation?
(2) A Not that I recall
(3) Q You said you had another conversation with Paul Myers on
4) May 23rd or 24th when you returned to Benecia?
AYes
Q Was that a conversation that you initiated?
A I can't recall whether he did or I did
Q What was the subject of that conversation? Was it this incident?
A No, actually most of it was updating ham on the - how the reparr finushed up, kind of nuts and bolts of how the repair was completed This was just part of that general conversation
Q Now you say you recall this in person conversation better
than you do the telephonic conversation you d had with
Mr Myers What do you recall about your conversation with Paul Myers on May 23 or 241988 as it relates to this incident?
circumstances and Herb's movolvement and his debriefing
(21) That's pretty much it
(22) Q I understand Other than this incident did you report
(73) anything else to Paul Myers during this conversation regarding
(25) Exxon Valdez?
```

to me
the me
the

Vol 152185
Al reported bis performance generaliy was quite - we had quite a good relationshup, very cooperative seemed to work well together to get the reparr completed
Q Did you have any heightened concerns about this incident
because it was Captain Hazelwood involved as opposed to

## John

(6) Doe involved?

A I would say no You know the problem I had was using
the
8) radio for some purpose such as that where it could be heard
by
(9) all the shopyard employees as well as the shap's crew
(10) Q Did you have any further conversation with Paul Myers
regarding this incident?
A What tume frame?
Q Well since the May 23241988 conversation?
AYes
Q When did that conversation occur?
A It was in 1989 approxmately two months after the grounding
$Q$ Where did that conversation oceur?
A In my office in the west coast fleet office in Benecia
Q Who initated that conversation?
A Mr Myers
Q Was your report of this incident the subject of that
conversation?
A Not - not really
Q What was the subject?

A It was more the incident itself not my report of it
Q What was said at that tume with regards to the incident by Mr Myers?
A He indicated that he had passed on that mformation that I
had told hum to Harvey Borgen
Q During this conversation what else did he say?
A He said that there had been another incident in which that he did not remember
Q Now you have confused me He told you that there was
another incident? What type of incident?
A-We're going to get to it I'm sure It's in all the other depos
Q That sthe Mary Williamson incident?
A Yes He mentroned there was an meident reported
s) apparently reported to him that he did not remember He dedn't
(16) remember that occurring
(1) Q He didn irecall having received a report of that is that
(18) correct?
(19) A That's correct
(º) $Q$ Anything else that Paul Myery said during this conversation
(21) that you can recall?
(22) A No it was very short
(23) Q Whether Mr Myers told you or otherwise are you aware
(94) Whether Mr Myers took any steps other than reporting to
(25) Mr Borgen in response to your report of this incident?

Vol $15 \quad 2187$
(1) A No I'm not aware of any steps
(2) Q And do you have any knowledge as to what Mr Borgen did if
(3) anything in response to Paul Myers report of this incident to (A) him?
(s) A No I'm not
(6) Are you aware of any other Exxon Shipping Company employee
(7) having knowledge of this incident other than those that you ve
(B) told us about today?

A Just - just Herb and myself
Q And Harvey Borgen and Paul Myers?
AYes
Q Okay Your discussion with Herb Leyendecker -
Leyendecker excuse me did you discuss whether there had been
(1a) beer on board the vessel?
(1s) AYes
(16) $Q$ And what was discussed in that regard?
(17) A Herb asked of I had seen any beer on the vessel My reply (18) was that I had seen beer botties, empty beer bottles on board
(19) the ressel
(20) $Q$ Where were these empty beer botties that you had seen on (21) board the vessel?
(22) A In the dumpster or garbage can in the computer control
(23) room which was kind of public areas
(24) $Q$ What kind of beer bottles had you seen?
(25) A Henry Weanhart's

Vol 152188
Q When had you seen those beer bollles?
A My recollection is that it was - it was sometume between the tume I arnved there May 2nd or 3rd whenever that was and the time of the radio call, sometume in that first week, ten days
Q Okay Had you seen the beer botules on more than one occasion?
A I can't say I specifically recall I saw them in two different locations that I mentioned, which had to be a little bit apart, you know, it was - saw them in the dumpster, saw
il) them in the chart controller room, so I don't know \& pecifically
if it was, you know, successive days or every day or once
Q Do you recall how many beer boules you saw?
A Best recollection is possibly four to sux total in both
locations That's the best I can think or remember
UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER 1 m sorry Four to six in each
of the locations?
THE WITNESS No total Maybe two in one four in
the other or two and two
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Did you see any other aicohol containers aboard the
vessel?
A No
Q When you discussed this incident with Paul Myers did you
tell Paul Myers that you had seen beer bottles aboard the

## Vol 152189

(1) vessel?

A My recollection 25 that I would have - I would have told
hum that or 1 did tell hum that during that discussion
Q Was Captarn Hacelwood on board the Exxon Valdez on a
regular basis during the limb il was in dry dock and you were there?
AYes
Q When was the nexi lime that you would have come in contacl
with him or his namb would have come up?
A March of ' 89
Q Where were you at that lime?
A On the Exxon Galveston
Q Who was the captan of the Exxon Galveston at that ume?
A Captan Crang Reeder
Q And what type of vessel was the Exxon Galveston?
A It's a small 25000 dead weaght ton lightenng vessel
7) Stayed un San Francisco Bay
(18) Q Stayed in San Francisco Bay for the purpose of lightering
(19) other vessels?
(20) AYes
( ") Q What were your dullus at that timu'
1 I A 1 was stull repair superintendent working out of the west
( 3) coast fleet office
191 Q Could you tell us about the circumstanees surrounding your
1.S either contact or Captain Hacelwood coming out in March of
$1989 ?$
(2) A I didn't meet Captann Hazelwood at that tume I was
(3) involved in a conversation about hum
(4) Q When did this conversation occur?
(s) A I'm going to say it was approximately March 13 th or 14 th
(6) 1989
(7) Q What tume of day do you recall?
(8) A Oh, about 1100 m the morning, 11 a m
(9) Q Were you a direct participant in the conversation or did
(10) you overhear a convergation?

山L A I was a direct participant
(12) Q Who was the conversation with?
(13) A Mary Wilhamson
(14) Q This is a converation you iniliated or had Mary
(15) Wilhameon come to you?
(16) A Mary had come to me
(17) Q What did ahe say to you?
(18) A She sand she had something she needed to tall to me about
(19) Q Okay And what was your response?
(20) A We were both very busy at the tume I said, okay, when I
(21) get a chance I'Il stop by, or we'll get together and she could
(22) pass on thes information
(23) Q Did you make time during that initial contact to speak with
(24) Mary Williamson?
(25) A Actually, my recollection is the untual contact was - I'm

## Vol 152191

(1) going to say it was the - a Monday or the first day of my (2) involvement with the Galveston on that repar, and I - I (3) didn't really get a chance to speak with her that day I had (4) been on a ship all night, a different ship, and just came out (s) in the morning and then went home It was the followng day,
(0) so it was about say, a 24 hour tume period from the unitual -
(7) well, when she sand she had something she wanted to tell me and
(8) when we actually got together
(9) $Q$ And just so I m clear at that intial contact she didn $t$
(10) mention Captain Hazelwood 3 name?
(11) A No
(12) Q What was the next occasion when Captain Hazelwood s
name
(13) came up or you had contact with her?
(14) A After speaking with Mary'
(15) $Q$ Well let me ask you have you told us everything you can
(16) recall in regards to your conversation with Mary Williamson
(17) that intial contact?
(18) A Oh yes yes Initual contact was just Steve I need to (19) tell you something when you get a chance Okay She went her
('), way I went mıne We had lots to do
(21) Q You didn t speak with her again?
(22) A Untal about 24 hours later the followng day at lunch
(23) $Q$ What was the next occasion after that initial contact that
(24) you had with Mary Williamson where Captan Hazelwood was
(2S) discussed?

Vol 152192
A I belueve it would have been the 1100 conversation that
had That's my recollection I don't remember it coming up
all in the intenm
Q Could you tell us the circumstances around your subsequent conversation with Mary Williamson'
A I finally had the tume to - to break away went up to the - she was the fleet chef on the Galveston the cook and she pulled me aside into a private area one of the lounges adjacent to the galley and told me you know what she had
say
$Q$ What did she have to say ${ }^{2}$
A As best I can recall, she had been on a launch from estar
going out to the Galveston At the tume she was on that Iaunch, the Galveston was alongside the Exxon Valdez and the
(15) Valdez was discharging cargo to the Galveston And she sand
(16) she had met Captan Hazelwood on that launch and had a (17) conversation with him on the launch on the way back to the
(18) ship She sazd that in her opinion that he might have been
(19) dnaking and that he was being kind of loud and directing most
(ro) of hus comments toward her and so she you know contunued the
(i) conversation with him out on the deck of the launch to try and
(22) mmumize the number of people who would overhear what was being
(23) spoken about And she thought this might be a problem you

(23) circumstances that she hadgarnibed
(i) Qrgide - you said that Mary difliamson indicated that she believed Captain Hazelwood may have been drinking? AYes
Q Was she any more apecific than that? Did she give you any indication as to what it was what was said or appearance or demeanor that led her to believe that Captain Hazelwood may have been drinking?
A I'm trying to be sure I distangush between what I've read in designated documents and you know from what I was told at
(10) the tume Takes a little while to suft at through Certandy
(II) I think the loudness was - I thmik my umpression was that was
(12) an indication of something, being very vocal and I belseve
(13) that she also andicated that she smelled alcohol And I
(14) belseve the substance of the conversation was regarding Captan
(1s) Reeder who was Mary's captan on the Galveston, that's the
(I6) main reason she tned to you know move away from the rest of
(I) the group on the launch It wasn't very favorable That's -
(18) that's all I can remember night now
(19) Q Do you recall any - did Mary Williamson give you any of
(20) the specifics of what Captain Hazelwood was saying?
(21) A I - I don't recall very many specifics, just Captan
(22) Reeder's name and Dan Paul as two people who were objects of
(23) has anger or daspleasure, or whatever he was vocalizing, Just
(24) the individual stuff more than any description as to what the
(23) complant was I just seem to remember the - the names

Q Did you report what Mary Williamson had told you to
anyone?
A Yes
Q And who did you report it to?
A Paul Myers
Q When did you make that report?
A lt would have been the following dav one day after my conversation with Mary
Q What did you tell Paul Myers?
A From what I recall I - I initiated the coaversation went
into Pau's office in Benecia shut the door and related to
him
essentually what I've - what I've told you here what Mary
observed and thought he shouid know about it
Q Do you recall what if anything Paul Myers and in response to your report?
A He didn't - didn't say very much my recollection
anyway I vaguely remember some you know questions of when
(18) what dav and you know but that's about - that's about all It was very short actually
Q At the time that you were making this report to Paul Myers
did you have the same concerns that you had discussed
previousiy about reporting activity of a sentor officer and how
(73) that may impact upon your subsequent evaluations?

A Yes
(25) Q Do you know whether Paul Myers did anything in response to

Vol 152195
your report?
A No, I don't know
Q Al the time that you had had the conversation with Mary
Willamson on March 13 or 14 was the Exxon Valdez still in
port or had it departed?
A We were stall in port
Q At the tume that you had the conversation with Paul Myers was the Exxon Valdez still in port or had it departed?
A They were still in port
Q When you had the conversation with Mary Willamson had
been informed of any verhal altercation that Captain Reeder
and
2) Captain Hazelwood had had?

A At the tume that I spoke with Mary ${ }^{2}$
Q Right
A It's kind of tough to sort out you know, because as you
know there's a lot of testumony about that
Q Right
A My best recollection is that there was some andication
that
(19) some kind of altercation had taken place over the radio It
(20) kind of all runs together, you innow, it's - there's the
(21) grounding, it was all within a week's tume Very busy tume I
(22) would say in answer to the question, yes, I think
somewhere
(23) ether from Mary in our conversation by mference or somebody
(24) telling me on the launch or the launch driver telling me on the
(2S) way to or from the ship, you know somehow I got some kund of
I) feel that there was some kind of friction there between these
(2) two people

131 Q You said that Mary Williamson had reported to you that
(4) Captain Hazelwood had said luss than hind things aboul

Captain
(5) Reeder and Dan Paul?
6) A I beheve so, yes
7) Q What led you to report the information that Mary Williamson
(9) had told you to Paul Myers?
(9) A Well Paul was his supervisor
(10) Q Paul was not your immediate supervisor though is that
(1) right?
(12) A No
(13) $Q$ Who was your immediate supervisor at that time?
(14) A Depended which vessels I was responsible for At that
(IS) tume I beheve for most of the tume I was in that office it
(16) was Stuart McRobbie and Bill Deppe maybe three shufts with
(i7) one two with the other it kund of shifted around That's why
(18) I reported it to Paul
(19) Q Did you report it to Paul Myers because you had made the
(20) previous reports to Paul Myers as well about Captain
(21) Hazelwood?
(22) A Not really He was - he was Captan Hazelwood's
(23) supervisor at the tume of the shpyard repair also so I wh
(24) would - I would say that the reason for telling Mr Myers is
(2s) he was Mister - Captain Hazelwood's supervisor in both cases

## Vol 15 2197

(1) Q When you made the report to Paul Mvers did he indilate to 2) you that he would do anything with the report?
(3) A Not that I recall no
(4) Q Al this ume on March 13th or 14th of 1989 were vou
s) concerned that Captain Haceiwood had a drinking problem?
6) A I would say that my feehngs were that you know something
(7) was going on with this individual that his supervisor ought to
8) be made aware of if I can do that and as I said I chose to

9 do that I don't know that I m qualified to hear a secondhand
(10) report and determine if someone has a drinking problem or not
(11) So it's kand of hard to come out and say that
(12) Q Do you believe that you did all that you could to inform
(13) Paul Myers Captain Hazelwood a supervisor of the concerns
that
(Id) you have stated that you had about Caplain Hacclwood?
is AYes
Q And those concerns were that something was going on with this individual?
AYes
) Was that something in your mind a potcnital alcohol problem?
A Could have been - could have been a lot of things Could
, have been you know family probleius Cuald have beetl a umber
( 3, of things that were bothering this guy But I just felt that (24) what I was hearing from uthers be should be made aware of as
(25) his supervisor so if he needed to speak with ham or
(i) invesugate he could
() Q After your conversation with Paul Myers when was the next
13) tume that Captain Hazelwood s name came up or that you had
4) contact with him?
(5) A March 24th, the grounding was the next tume really I
heard
(6) his name
7) Q Was there any problem with the Exxon Valdez when it was in
8) portin San Francisco any mechanical problem?
(9) A We were having some problems with the turbo chargers on the
(10) mana engunes
(1I) Q Okay And what was that problem?
(12) A I beleve it was surging
(13) $Q$ What was your first thought when you heard the Exxon Valdez
(14) had gone aground?
(15) A Thought it was a mistake
(i6) Q Why did you think it was a mistake?
(17) A I Just didn't feel that with, you know one of the newest
(18) and most modern ships, well mantanned ship, that our company
(19) would have a problem like that You know, with the care that
(20) we took in our operation that we would be the ones to hit
(21) Bligh Reef Frankly Ithought it would be somebody else
you
(22) know, a fly by mght operation
(23) Q When you heard that the vessel had been grounded did it
(24) cross your mind that Captain Hazeiwood might have been
(23) drinking?

## Vol IS 2199

(1) A No Inually - to answer your question, mitually, no
(2) Q Okay
(3) A Could have been a mechanical problem you know
(4) Q You say initally no At some subsequent point in time
(s) did il cross your mind?
(6) A Heard an awful lot of media reports that ammediately
(7) brought that to the forefront you know News we got in the
(8) office
(9) Q So that morning -
(10) A Yes
(II) Q - when you gol to the office?
(12) A Yeah
(13) Q And that thought was as a result of the medie reports you
(i4) heard?
(1s) A I believeso yes
(16) $Q$ When those media reports started coming across did you
(17) discuss with anybody either the Mary Williamson report to you
(18) or the ordering of the beer in Portland shipyard?
(19) A That day"
(20) $Q$ We can begin with that day
(.1) A Any tume - yeah Not that I can specifically recall on
(-2) that day you know we were kind of busy with getting drawings
1.31 of the shup, getting people prepared to go up there
(94) Q Okay Subsequent to that day did you discuas either of
(2s) the ineidents the Mary Williamson report or the ordering beer

Vol $15 \quad 2200$
in the Portiand shipyard as it related to the media speculation
that alcohol had been involved in the grounding of the Exxon
Valdez?
A Every neighbor on my street that wanted to know the real
story There was an awful lot of hallway talk as you can
magne about every - all different theories on what
happened Then there were the media reports that may or may
(8) not have been correct, you know
(9) I do remember, you know talking to - it's kind of hazy but I do remember talking to Stuart McRobbie about it He was
(II) runnug the office after the grounding I also may have ) mentioned you know these ancidents to Tom Shearer who orked
in our office
Q Anyone eise you can recall?
A Those are the - the only people that I really have any recollection of Like I sand there was an awful lot of hallway talk and I heard about you know everything you can
(18) imagine

Q You satd that you had a conversation with Stuart McRobbie
but it was kind of fuzzy Do vou recall anything about vour conversation with Stuart McRobbie?
A Not - not too much Essentually as I sand be was runnung the office and he was I'm sure being asked for information by the company if there was any information out there So what I recall is just, you know meetung with him

## Vol 152201

## bnefly and relatiag to him what we've talked about here

 todayQ Do you recall any comments he made?
A No I beheve he was just a messenger He was a conduit to
pass information on to someone else
Q How about your conversation with Tom Shearer do you recall
n any specifics of that?
A Say it was pretty - pretty much the qame as the
conversation with Stuart maybe a little less formal Tom
was
(10) Just more of a peer than an individual in the office I would (II) say the same facts
(12) Q Did you express to either of these two individuals or to ) anyone other than your lawyera any concern you had that you had
(14) made reports to Paul Myers about Captain Hazelwood s
(is) activities and yel to your understanding nothing was done in
(16) regards to those reports?
(In A Well, first I'd like to say, you know something very well
(18) may have been done with the information that I passed along I
(19) Just was not aware of it I also, you know, after the (20) grounding, I thank there - yon've spoken to most of the (21) most of the people involved I think everyone had some
(22) feelings that gee what could I have done to have prevented
(23) this thing' And I was no different than anybody else in that
(24) regard And in hindsight I think I tried to do what - what I
(23) could, you know by informing Mr Myers of what I told him
(1) Q Paul Myers would he be considered Exxon Shipping Company
(2) management?
(3) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER By whom?
(4) VIDEO EXAMINER By this witness
(s) THE WITNESS Yes
(6) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(7) Q Do you believe that Paul Myers should have taken some
(8) measures to investugate the reports you gave hım?
(9) A Yeah As I said I think be very well could have that I 10, war ant aware of I think by virtue of the fact that I
III reported the information to him that I felt it was important
(a) enough to be looked uto
(13) $Q$ What did you - was there a message you were trying to get
(14) across to Mr Myers that perhaps was not expressed in what you
(15) were telling hum?
(16) A Sometimes, Mr Myers - I don't know if you've met hum -
(In tends to have a very flat affect And when you speak to hum,
(18) you can't determine whether it bounced off or sunk in
(19) sometimes you know Whether he's preaccupaed with something
( 0 ) else he just - as Mr Klunckhardt asked what was his
( 1 l) response and there really wasn't much of a response and
('-) that's why $I$ cand you know in thinking about it and trying to
(3) answer truthfully can I really be sure that he heard me or was
(4) he thanking so much about something else that was going on that
(2s) day that, you know he maybe didn't

Vol 152203
Q So then perhaps -
i A I was speaking that you know I'm farly certann he heard
in the spoken words the words that $I$ enunciated but they may not
(4) bave regustered or sunk in He may have been - as an example
(s) when - when I reported the Mary Wilhamson/Westar incident be
(6) was at that tume very involved with trying to get the turbo
(7) chargers repared satasfactorily on the ship so that the ship
(8) could saal We'd been delayed a couple days already and he
-
(9) so it's very possible that's one - I thank that's land of the (10) conversation that you know sparked me to make that statemeat
(II) to you is that I know on that particular day he was very busy
(12) and I was very busy as well And maybe in the - all the other
(13) things that were going on in his mind at that tume trying to
(14) get the shap out of port that didn't register
(1s) Q Why was he concerned about getting those turbo chargera (16) operational?
(17) A So that the ship could saul and psick up its next cargo
(18) Q Was ul costing you money for the vessel to be at the yard?
(19) A The shup was un service in - at the tume of the Westar
(20) uncident un March of '89, so every day that it sat in San
(21) Francisco without beading towards Valdez was a day off hire for
(22) the vessel which costs a lot of money
(23) Q You testified eariver that in your - one of your
(24) discussions with Mr Leyendecker - Leyendecker?
(23) A Leyendecker

Vol 152204
Q Leyendecker that there might be repercussions to your
career if you reported a concern about alcohol abuse of an
officer such as Captain Hazelwood do you recall that
iestumony?
AYes
Q Notwithstanding that concern you reported what you learned
on several occasions to Mr Myers correct?
(3) AYes

Q Why did you do that notwithstanding the fact that you knew
there might be repercussions on your career?
A I felt it was information that - that Paul should have
(2) you know, as his supervisor And I also feit that Paul would
3) be discreet enough not to reveal his sources, you know, having
(14) known hm for a whale
(15) Q Mr Day the Exxon Valdez when it lefi San Francisco Bay
(16) how many days behind schedule was il do you know?
(17) A My recollection 15 that they sauled on Saturday, whatever
(18) day that was, probably the 18th somewhere in there and that
(19) they were probably - had they not been experiencing these
(20) turbocharger problems probably could have left possibly I
( I) think the 14th so it was probably four days
(22) Q You believe they were four days behind schedule?
3) A Yeah four or five best I can recall

Q Were you aware of a telex that Captan Martineau had sent
down during the week prior to the grounding warning of the ice

Vol 15 220s
(1) conditions and advising only daylighi tranyit?

A I beheve I did hear that telex yes
3) Q You believe you huard about that telex?
( A Yes I can't - I'm not sure whether I heard about it when
s) it came in or after the grounding There was an awful lot of
(alk about that telex after the grounding, I m sure you can magme
Q And was there any discuysion as to why that - the
information in that telex had not been conveyed to the Exxon
Valdez prior to the grounding?
A I didn't - I wasn't aware that was the case I'm not sure what kind of distribution at received
Q You had no knowledge that that information was in fact conveyed to the Exxon Valdef prior to the grounding is that correct?
A That's correct
Q And as you sul her today do you have any son of
understanding at all as to what happened to that telex when it came in the week before the grounding?
A I don't have any specific knowledge of what happened to that specific telex 1 can tell you how the normal telex routing in that office worked, if that's helpful Q How does 16 typically work Mr Day? A There's a central kind of a telex file room where there's a copy machine a telex machine and files that are used by
(1) everyone in the office So the messages come in and they're
() printed out on a long sheet that the secretanes would tear
(3) off And then each individual had a box you know, all the
(4) ship group coordinators, such as Paul Myers myself, the repar
(s) people Harvey Borgen and then depending on the vessel that

161 the message came from or - or what the nature of the message
$\rightarrow 7)$ was, the message would then be put in the approprate person's
(8) box and they would - when they came in in the morning or a
(9) couple tumes a day wander through and pick up the

## messages that

(10) were in there
(11) Q Were there discussions any time the week before the
(i2) grounding regarding limiting transit in and out of Valdez to
(13) daylight tranat?
(14) A Not that I'm aware of, no
(1s) Q Typically would that be someching that you would be (16) involved in or not?
(17) A No I was prumarily mechanical type you know, takng
(18) after - looking after the repar of the vessels the
(19) navigation aspects would be handled probably by the agency
(20) group and the SGCs with maybe Harvey Wouldn't have nvolved
(21) the reparr group
(22) Q Would that typically involve Mr Borgen and people like
(23) Mr Myers?
(24) A Yes
(2s) $Q$ They d be involved in discussions like that?

## Vol $15 \quad 2207$

1) A Yes
(7) Q Now did Exxon Shipping Company management ever do anything
(3) to encourage reporting violations of the alcohol policy?
2) A Not that I'm aware of
(5) $Q$ You believe it s realistic to expect a jumior officer
(6) someone like yourself to report violations of the alcohol
(7) pohicy to superior officers? Are you aware of anyone else
(8) Mr Day other than you any jumor officer ever reporting
(9) violations of a senior officer?
(10) A No, not that I'm aware of
(II) Q Now you teatified eariter today that you had no knowledge
(IV) that Hazelwood was monitored regarding his use of alcohol

Do
(13) you remember that testımony?
(14) A Yes
(1s) QOkay
(16) A Up untal the tume of the grounding and everything became (17) public and there was a lot of public -
(18) Q Well are you aware of Captain Hazelwood being Ireated
(19) differently in any way by Exxon Shipping Company
management?
(20) A Up to the time of the grounding?
(1) QYes
(2.) A Not that I could discern
(23) Q The contention that Captain Hazelwood was the most closely
, monitored man in the neet do you have any information or any
evidence that would support that contention?

## Vol 152208

A The only thing I thunk I could add on that is that Mr Myers who is the SGC for the Exxon Valdez was very dingent in visiting the ressel He was - of the SGCs that I saw work in that office spent much more tume on the shaps tallang to the people What he was dong there I really couldn't, you know, couldn't say
Q How long was Hazelwood in Portland dunng April and May of

19887
A I really - I'm not aware of when he joined the vessel I know when I arrived on the second or thard day of May, he was
(II) there as captain
(12) Q Okay And how long did he remain before you went back?
(13) A He sailed with the vessel In the first voyage I
(14) believe
(15) Q So how long a period of tume would that have been that he
(16) was there and you were there before he sailed?
(in A Probably 20 days 18 days somewhere in there
(18) Q And during that 18 to 20 days you had datly contact with (19) Hazelwood did you?
(20) A Yes for the most part
(21) Q Okay And you re saying that no one ever told you to
(2) monitor or check on his drinking during that period of time is (23) that true?
(24) A That's correct
(25) Q Did Harvey Borgen ever come to the Portland shipyard during

[^21]Myers it was your hope or your belief that Mr Myers was going
, to act on your report and do something true?
A Yes he - you know, I passed the unformation to hum so
) that he could take that information into account in
supervising
) this individual however he chose to do it
Q Mr Myers Paul Myers in March of 1989 when you made that
report to him the Exxon Valdez was still stting there in San
Francisco Bay wasn It?
A That's correct
Qti hadn 1 tahen off?
A That's correct
Q How many days did it continue to sit there before it took off?
A I beleve I told him on Wednesday afternoon, stup sanled Saturday
Q So it sat there for what three or four days?
A At least two full days, yeah
Q Okay And had Mr Myers chosen to remove Hazelwood as
master he had at least two or three days to do that didn 1
he?
A Yes
MR O NEILL That concludes our examination

1) MS STEWART Your Honor defendants would like to
2) present Mr Day s cross-examination by videotape
(ר) CROSS EXAMINATION OF STEVEN DAY (Video)

## BY VIDEO EXAMINER <br> Q From November of 84 when you first were hired by Exxon

Shipping Company until the present have you been informed
of
(4) the existence of an alcohol policy that the company had?

## AYes

Q When did you first become aware of that alcohol policy?
A I beheve it - as best I can recall it was possibly
dunng the interview process for employment which took place
in August of '84 August September
Q So on those occasions that you were informed of the aicohol
policy as we previously discussed you also were informed that
if someone went through rehabilitation that would be kept confidential?
A Yes I beleeve that was my understanding of it
Q Do you recall specifically any names of people who told you that rehabilitation would be confidential?

## A No

Q You had mentioned previously that the policy was ported on
some of the vessels if not all of the vessels you were on
Was the confidenitiality of rehab an element that was also in this posting?
A As I recall at, yes, at was part of the policy
Q Do you recall specifically what was to be kept
confidential?
A My understanding was that the person's identity and any
detais of thear problem would be completely confidenual
Q Did anyone ever inform vou as to why that information was kepl confidental?
A I don't recall anyone specifically uforming me My understanding was that it was personal in nature and wasn't to
(6) be - wasn't company information to be distributed

Q So from the tume of your initai interview up to - we re
in March of 88 or 1988 period now - your understanding of
part of the Exxon Shipping Company alcohol policy was that
alcohol or drug use was considered an illness?
(II) A I thunk they used the word "problem
(12) Q Were you informed during that tume frame as to how Exxon
(13) Shipping Company would treat hat illness?
(14) A Yes I'm not sure where I was mformed or how My
(1s) understanding was that the person would be treated for thear
(16) Uness and with the adea that they could then return to thear
(17) normal position with the company after being treated -
(18) QOkay
(19) A - on the job
(20) $Q$ Was there any discussion as to how a person with an alcohol
(21) problem would be idenufied?
(22) A Not that I can recall You were encouraged to kund of (23) Identufy yourself You know that was one of the parts of the (14) program was to come forward we'll help you and we'll return
(25) you you know back to the work place in a better condition

## Vol $15 \quad 2213$

(1) MS STEWART The next part of this examination is
( ) going to deal with Mr Day s previous tesumony regarding the
(3) radio mesaage he heard in Portand shipyard
(4) QMr Day do you understand my - Mr Day do you
understand
my question -
A Just -
Q - that the ordering of the bucr for possussion aboard the vessel do you believe that that violated company policy subject to the objection?
A What type of policy² Drug and alcubul policy or -
Q Yea ar
A Just normal operatung policy
Q Let a start with drug and alcohol policy
A My opimion just ordening it, having it - having it not physucally be aboard or be brought aboard I would say no $1 t$
(16) wouldn't vioiate the drug and alcohol policy
(17) QOkay if the -
(1s) A As I understood it in uther words do I understood then
\|Y, $Q$ If the alcohol had in taul butn brouzhi abcoard pursuani to
roi Captain Hacelwood ordaring il ovar the radio would that have
( '1 violated tompany politr aluohol policy)
( ) A I'm not - l'm not sure that that would either because it
( 3) had not been coasumed you know on the vessel Maybe it was
(24) going to be taken back to an apartment or something after work
rsi or something So my opinion on that would also be no at least
(1) my opinion or my understanding of it
(1) Q Who else was aboard the vessel on a regular basis during
(3) that tume frame? And just so 1 m clear you first came onto
(4) the scene on May 2nd 1988 is that right?
(5) A Approximately, 2nd or 3rd
(6) $Q$ And you believe this incident happened within the firat
(7) seven days seven to ten days?
(8) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER What incident? His discovery
(9) of the empty beer bottles?
(10) VIDEO EXAMINER Correct
tht THE WITNESS It was sometime between the time I
(12) arrived and the walkie talkie incident which was probably the
(13) second weekend I was there
(14) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(15) Q Okay
(16) A So sometume in that tume period
(17) Q During that time frame do you recall who else was aboard
(18) the Exxon Valdez on a regular basis?
(19) A Assigned Exxon employees?
(20) Q Yes sir
(21) A The chief engueer was Chuck Kimtus, chef mate was George
(22) Dowdle There were other personnel on our repar team,
(23) shipping company employees and contract employees

Jack King
(24) was the reparr supenntendent Dave Ian was a contract coatung
(2) professional who was overseeing the - overseeng the paint

Vol 152215
application Bob Kaneely (ph) was a machunery contract
uspector also not a shipping company employee Nathan Carr
was the second mate I didn't see too much of hum, he was $0 \square$

## swing stuft

That's - that's about all I can remember at the moment
that - you know, crew that were assıgned and repar people UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER Excuse me did you mean to
exclude the yard workers themselves? I mean how many of the yard workers were on board?
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q No I didn I mean to
A Oh, okay At any tume durng the repair there were probably working at least two shifts, 50 to 100 yard workers both on day shift and evenings It might end up being, you
know $\mathbf{7 5}$ on days 50 on aughts They tend to slow down a
little bit at aight
MS STEWART Your Honor that concludes defendants
tross exammation of Mr Day
THE COURT Call your next witness
MR JAMIN Your Honor at this tume the plainuffs would call Ronald Lunt to testufy
THE CLERK Raise your night hand please air
( ${ }^{3}$ (The Witness Is Sworn)
(24) THE CLERK Please be seated for the record sir
(25) State your full name bive us your address and spell your last

```
name please
THE WITNESS Ronald Scott Lunt is5 Gulkana Street
Valdez Alaska L UNT
THECLERK Thank you
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF RONALD SCOTT LUNT
BYMR JAMIN
QMr Lunt when and where were you born sur?
A I was born in Topeka Kansas, October 22 1959
Q How old are you now?
A 34
Q And where did you live as a kid?
A We bounced around qute a bit My father was in the Aır
Force
Q How about high school where did you go?
A I attended Meade High School in Spokane Washnggton
Q When did you graduate s.r?
A 1978
Q And when did you move to Alaska?
A I belıeve it was in '82
Q All nght And where have you lived here in Alaska?
A Spent the whole tume in Valdez
Q Are you married sir?
A Yes,I am
Q Have chuldren?
A Three
```

(1) Q How old are they?
(2) A Ten sux and two
(1) $Q$ What sort of work have you been involved with since you ve
(4) been up here in Alaska and Valdez specifically'
(s) A Specifically either been a cook or shipping agent
(6) Q Okay And for whom have you cooked?
(7) A Valdez City Schools and Harborview Developmental Center
(8) Q All nght And are you currently at Harborview?

## A Yes I am

Q What is that sir?
A It's a state facility for people who are mentally
umparred
Q And you aerve as a cook there?
AYes
Q All night Now was there a period that you worked for an outfit called Alamar?
A Yes there was
(18) Q And is Alamar shorthand for something else?
(19) A It's short for Alaska Maritume Agencies
(20) Q And what was the period sur that you worked at Alamar?
(21) A It was - I can't remember the exace month but from '86
(22) tull - till the end of Aprl about of '89
(23) Q And what was Alamar s general purpose?
(24) A General purpose was to assust the shaps and the captans
(25) who came mito port that were hired by thear companies

## Vol $15 \quad 2218$

(I) Q All night And were these the ships and captains that were in the Valdez crude trade?
AYes
$Q$ And the vessels would come up with ballast and leave Vaidez with stude)
A Correct
Q Now within Alamar was there a particular person who was the boss?
A Yes Bob Arts was the manager of the officers
Q How many employees were there?
A-Sixtotal
Q And what was your - what was your job title if you had one?
A I was titled an operations agent
Q How many operations agents were there?
A There were four of us
Q So if Mr Arts is the boss and there s four agents what
were the other two people?

## A Secretarnes

Q All right Now as an agent what kind of workday would
you have? What kind of workweek would you have?
A Basscally depended on which type of ships we had coming
(3) in Normal day would be a couple three ships in port If
(-4) there weren't any requests from the captans or generally it
(25) was just maybe somebody to the doctor or securing stores
for

## Vol $15 \quad 2219$

the steward's department or basically like that would be a
basse day
Q All right So would it be fair lo say you were a support
person for the vessels as they came in?
A That would be a good description
Q All right Would you meet ships when they docked sir? A Yes
Q Was that part of the job?
A Yes Every tume one of our ships came in, we'd meet them
(10) as soon as they got gangway on board
(II) Q All right Were you there shortly prior to their departure
(1) as well?
(13) A Yes We'd come on board and get any last munte mall that
(14) had to come off and collect copies of oil reports from the
(15) gaugers
(16) Q I think we ve talked a little bit about ullage reports but
(17) that s how much room is left in the vessel after it s filled up
(18) with oil?
(19) A Well, how much is left and how much crude oil is actually
(20) in each particular tank
(21) Q All right Now was - was Exxon one of Alamar s citents?
(22) A Exxon was the largest prucipal Alomar had
(13) $Q$ So you would deal with the various Exxon vessels as they
(24) came into port?
( s) A Correct

Vol 152220
Q During the cource ol your work at Alamar did vou come to meel Joe Hazelwood?
AYes
Q All right And can you usumate for us how many limes you might have interacted with Mr Hazelwood during that period that you were at Alamar?
A I'd estumate 15 tumes maybe
Q All right Now this may seem a little strange but how do you know you were interacting with Joe Hazelwood? How do you
(10) know thas Joe?

A He was the captan of the ship That was who I dealt with
when I went on board, or he was the first person I'd go see
Q All nghs So as lasked you some questions about Joe
Hazelwood you re sure tt was Joe when you re talking about?
AYes
Q All right Now did you have an opportunity sir to go to
Mr Hazelwood a cabin al all?
A When you say exactly hus cuban has office was outside of his cabin and that's where we would cunduct busiuess
Q So you had an opportunity to go to the office part of his suite then?
AYes
Q All right And what brought you there sir?
A Oh, Exxon shipped all their mas to our office for the crew members and whatnot, and we'd always take that on board And

## Vol 15222

(1) then I'd sit down with the captain and discuss any requrements
(2) he had of myself or our office when the ship was in port
(3) Q So you actually got to know him a bit?
(4) AYes
(5) Q Let me talk just a bit about your responsibilitiex if any
(6) at Alamar for crew people Would you-and this is with
I) respect to the Valder yourtime in Valdus and ialking about
(8) ᄂrew members from the vessels
9) Would you on occasion tahb craw incmburs to bars?
(10) AYes
(il) Q And on occasion would you pish wrw members back up
from
\|) bars?
(13) A Yes
(14) Q And did you ever see crew membery Irom Exxon vessels
return
IIS to ships notseeably drunk?
(16) A Yes
117) Q And how could you lull sir?
(18) A Just - it was about a 1520 minute nde from town to
(19) Alyeska and just being toud boisterous having fun or
(30) whatever I mean just a different attitude than when I
brought
( ) them to town

1) Q All right And were those craw members that you found ( 3) noticeably drunk or dulermined wirn nolitably drunh whre they
(-4) able to get through the security gate at Alyesha?
(25) AYes

Q And were they able to walk back to the vessels?
A Yes
Q Now are you familar with how one had to go from shore
over some sort of apparatus to get to the vessel?
AYes
Q All nght Was there a name for that sir?
A Oh there's four berths there and each one had a walkway
(8) down to the ship And then there was a gangway once you got to
cl- the end of the - end of the berth onto the ship
(10) Q So gangway ts the right word then?
(11) AYes
(12) Q All night And were these men that you had seen as
(13) noticeably drunk able to make it over the gangway?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q Did you ever see anyone actually pass out once they had 6) gone through security?

A Yeah, one - one tume, but it was not a - an Exxon employee
Q Not an Exxon employee but that person had been able to
get
through security?
A Yes
(22) $Q$ Let s just talk about some of your contacts with Captain
(23) Hazelwood What sorts of contacts would you have with the
4) captain? What kinds of things would you do?
(2s) A Oh I'd go on board like I sand, and delsver the mall and

## Vol 152223

usually - or most of the ume, if it was stull busmess hours
2) un town, he'd ask for a ride to town And a couple of the crew
(3) members would come and I'd drop them off downtown and more
(4) tumes than not, we'd set up a range of time for me to pick them
(5) back up take them back to the shup after a few hours

Q All right Were there particular locations to which they
were dropped off when you would bring them downtown?
A Yeah I'd say most of the tume it was either in the
parking lot of the Pipeline Club or the parking lot of the grocery store directly across the street from there
Q All nght And were you also involved in picking up when
vessels would leave?
AYes
Q All right And from where if there was a normal place from where would you pick him up sir?
A Best I can recall, it was either at the Pipeline Club or
) there's another business in town called The Pizza Club where
(18) sometumes they'd pick up pizzas for the crew members and take
(19) them back
(30) Q All right And on such occasions when you were picking
( 1) Captain Hazelwood up to return him to the vessel did you ever
(27) go actually into the bar to pick him up?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q And can you explain how that would happen?
(25) A Well, hke I stated earher, we'd just arrange a tume for

## Vol 152224

me to prick ham up and I'd Just pull up go in and see if he was ready to go
Q All right And were there times when he would tell you that he wanted you to pick him up at a certain tume al a bar? A Yeah
Q All right Now did you ever actually see Joe Hazelwood drinking alcoholic beverages in Valdez?
A Yes
Q And can you explain the circumstances as to how you would see that?
A Well I'd just locate him inside the bar and walk up to hum whether he's sittung at a table or at the bar and ask him of he was ready to go
Q All night Now how do you know that it was alcohol that he was drinking sir?
A Well I don't know for a fact but just - like I say I've lived there for 12 years and frequented the Pipeline Club, seen
(18) what's called like a rocks glass in front of him and I just assumed that that's what was in the glass
Q How many umes do you think that you saw Joe Hazelwood drinking in these circumstances where you d pick him up before he went back to the vessel?
A Four or five maybe
24) $Q$ And can you estumate how many tumes that you pieked up
(9) Mr Hazelwood trom the Pipeline Club to bring him back to the

## Vol 152225

vessel during this period?
A 1 thought that was what you just asked, four or five tumes 1 mean
Q Okay Now would you also get other materials to bring
back to the vessel at Mr Hazelwood s request?
AYes
Q What sorts of things were they?
A Oh what sticks out most in my mind is dunng the summer months we would get fresh seafood that was available in town
101 and take that back on board
Q And were there other stores you d bring back as well?
A Occasionally they'd run out of bacon or something like that
Q Now during the period prior to the shipareck do you know whether it was possible to bring alcoholic beverages through the Alyeska security gate?
A Yes, it was possible
Q And how do you know that sir?
A I've seen it happen
Q What were the circumstances?
A Guys I'd take back they had arrived would have a bottle on them and they would just put it inside a - inside coat
3) pocket or put it in a boot or something and just hide at from (24) the security people
(25) Q Now other than the crews of the vessels - and I want to

Vol is 2226
focus exclusively on Exxon right now Exxon vessels other than the crews of the vessels by which I mean the masters and the mates and the seamen the engineers the radio people the crew did you ever see other Exxon people from shore side management in Valdez?
A There was only one occasion that I can remember where
a
7) couple of people came up that were interested in the steward's
department They stayed in town for two or three days and
boardedseveral ships to check out their facilities in the
kitchen
Q All nght Besides them did you see any other Exxon
management in Valdez?
A No
Q All right Were you ever aware that there was any program to montor or keep an eye on Joseph Hazelwood while he was in Valdez?
A Not to my knowledge, there wasn't
Q All right Now did you have contacts other than in person with Exxon people on a regular basis?
A Pardon"
Q Did you have contacts othcr than personal contacts where
you would actually interact with ameonc and other than crew
with shore side management?
A Strictly through telephone conversations yes
(2s) Q And what was the nature of those telephone conversations?

## Vol 152227

## A Generally it was due to a sick crew member who was

 unfit() for duty or if there was an emergency to get somebody off the
(3) shap or somebody that was meeting the shap in Valdez
(1) Q And how ofien would you - would you have these contacts
5) or perhapa how many coniacts did you have over the time that you were in Vaidez?
A Several hundred times maybe I'd talk to somebody in Benecia
Q In Benecia sur?
A Yeah
Q And did you understand that was near San Francisco and at was the west coast office?
A Rught west coast fleet office
Q During those conversations did anyone ever ask you to keep
an eye on Joseph Ha/clwood and/or his drinking?
A Never
Q Did Hazelwood have a reputation among Alamar people for being a sailor who liked to drink?
A Most of them
MR CHALOS Your Honor I object Hearaay
MR JAMIN Ithink Your Honor it s relevant as to
whether or not it would have been possible to monitor Joseph
(23) Hazelwood and if Exxon was interested what they would have
(24) found out if they explored it for drinking in Valdez
(2s) THE COURT I ll allow the testimony as to
(1) reputation
2) MR JAMIN Sir let me repeat the question as
(3) recognize that may be a listle bit disquieting
4) BYMR JAMIN
(s) Q Did Joseph Hazelwood have a reputation among Alamar people
(6) as a sailor who liked to drink?
7) AYes
8) MR JAMIN I have nothing further
(9) Thank you Your Honor
(10) CROSS EXAMINATION OF RONALD SCOTT LUNT
(11) BY MR NEAL
(1) QMr Lunt I m Jim Nual I don thinh we vecver mul
(13) A No we haven't
(14) $Q$ is that nght?
(1s) A That's correct
(16) Q Although I have asked somebody to interview you Do you
(17) know a Mr Brian Dougherty (ph)?
(18) A Yes, I spoke with hum, to hm on the phone two tumes
(19) Q And he talked to you about asking you about your proposed
(20) tesumony here?
(21) A Correct
(22) Q Was he polite to you?
(23) A Yes sir
(4) Q Did he try to intimidate you in any wav?
(-s) A No sir

## Vol 152229

(1)

Q He simply asked you to tell him what you knew about this
(-) matter เorrect?
(3) A Correct
d) Q Now than you said you inicracticd with Capiain Hacalwood
s) some 15 times am 1 currest about that'
6) A Yes
7) Q I would assumb thal when you - when you say interaction
is) you mean when he d comi in una trip you d inlurati with him
(9) is that one interaction)
(10) A Yes
(11) Q When did these interactions start?
(12) A I couldn't give you an exact date
(13) $Q$ Well to make it is trips it would have to start back in
(14) what 86 I guess would il not?
(15) A'80-I - I don't know When I say 15 tumes I'm saying
(16) maybe they were in port seven tumes then I nteracted with
(in) him when the ship came in and then I interacted with him
when
(18) the ship saried
(19) Q You call that - then that yiwu scparat obcasions?
(ro) A Two separate ones yes
(21) Q So it would be - when you say 15 interactions you re
(22) talking about that would be seven voyages?
(.3) AYes
(24) Q When did these voyages stant do you know'
(2S) A I have no idea

## Vol 152231

(i) A I beheve so
(2) $Q$ And that s the best you can tell us?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q All right And how long was it after that that you

SI inluracted as you say with Captan Haculwood?
6) A I couldn't even come close to telling you
7) Q Well was it a month?
(8) A I couldn't even come close to telling you
(9) Q Was it iwo months?
(10) A I couldn't even come close to telling you a date on the
(II) first tume I saw Captan Hazelwood
(12) MR JAMIN Your Honor I object to continuing
(13) questions Ithink they ve been asked and answered
(14) MR NEAL Your Honor this is cross examination
(15) THE COURT You may proceed Mr Neal
(16) BYMR NEAL
(17) Q Let s say you went there in sometume between January of 86
(18) and - and the tirsi of July of 87 okay?
(19) A That I met Captam Hazelwood'
(20) Q Well no I was going to say - I was going to say you ve
( 1) placed your time of going to work for Alamar as sometıme
( $\boldsymbol{r}_{2}$ ) between January I 86 and July 1 - July 186 am I
(?) correct?
(24) A Yeah
(25) Q Okay Now then would at have been six months before you
() met Captain Hazelwood?

A I have no idea
3) Q Would it have been a year before you met Captain Hazelwood?
(4) A I have no idea It's like asking me eight years from now
g) when I met you I couldn't remember

Q Well truth of the matter is you don t know whether you
met Captain Hazeiwood in the first half of 86 the first half
of 87 the second half of 87 is that correct?
A That's correct
Q Or the first half of 88 or the first half of 897
A Lake I said I could not give you an exact date of when I
met Captann Hazelwood for the first time
Q Isn tit a fact Mr Lunt that - let me - let sask this
right away Do you remember the trip that resulted in the
grounding?
A Do I remember the trip?
Q Yes str
A No Idon't I was on vacation at the tume of the grounding
Q Okay You do remember it was in 89 don 1 you?
AYes
Q You weren t in Valdez - you weren t in Valde7 around the grounding trip were you?
A No I was in Washington State
() Q So how long were you in Washington State)

```
Vol \(15 \quad 2233\)
(1) A It was maybe ten days, thereabouts Couple days either (r) way
(3) Q When did vou come back to Valdez?
(4) A I believe I got back two days after the spill bad
(S) occurred
(0) Q Okay All right So you had been - you were out of
(7) Valdez from eight days before the spill occurred and you didn 1
(8) get back until after the spill occurred is that correct?
(9) A That's correct
(10) Q Mr Lunt how many other companies did you work for as an agent during this period of time?
A There was only one other mantume outfit I worked for
(13) That was Valdez mantume, and that's - I believe I started in ) about November of ' 89 there
(15) QMr Lunt you would never take an Exxon captain or officer (16) back to the vessel just before saling time would you?
(17) A There was a couple of occasions where that occurred
(18) \(Q\) How often - how soon before asiling time did you take an (19) Exxon captain master or officer back to the vessel? (20) A It just depended on when the ship sauled If it sailed at (21) noon in the daytume sometumes they'd come anto port that 2) morning for an hour or two make some calls and go back
(23) QMy question was when prior to sailing When was the (24) latest prior to sailing that you ever took a master or an
(25) officer of Exxon back to the vessel?
```

A Maybe an hour before saling tume
Q You re sure of that?
AYes
Q All right Would you ever take Captain Hazelwood back that late?
A There could have been an occasion I did
Q Do vou rumember being interviewed by Mr Dougherty and being asked how lalc il was or how - how soon before sating you ever tooh an Exxon caplain or officer back to the vesael?

## AYes

Q-Letme say one that you say had been drinking?
A Pardon me?
Q One that had been drinking?
A No I couldn't - I don't think I could ever say I ever
took one back an hour before sailing that was dnniong
Q So when you re saying you took them back an hour - as much
(in) as or as late as an hour before sailing it would be one that
(18) hadn t been drinking is that correct?
(19) A That's correct
(20) Q All right Let s say you said that some of them would be
( 1 d drinking How soon betore sailing did you cver take one of
( ) those people back in an Exxon vessel?
( i) A Anv of the captains that I dever picked up on a bar that
( 4) were - had a beer or drank in front of them I don't think I
1 si ever took one back that was - well I know I never took one

## Vol 152235

back just prior to sanhag
Q How far - how soon prior to saling?
A Oh that's tough to say I'd say on the average from anywheres from eight to $\mathbf{1 2}$ hours
$Q$ in each wase if somebody d been drinking night?
A Yes
Q Now did you ever see Captain Hazelwood take any lıquor aboard a vessel?
A Never
Q Did you ever see any Exxon master or officer take any
liquor aboard a vessel?
A Never
Q As a matter of fact you were being paid by a compony that
(14) was being paid for efforts by Exxon weren i you?
(1s) A Correct
(10) Q All right And you were aware Mr Lunt that Exxon hed a
(17) very rigid alcohol policy weren 1 you?
(18) A On board yes
(19) $Q$ As a matter of fact you were aware at the tume that Exxon
(") absolutely prohibited the - the possession or drinking of
(21) alcoholic beverages aboard one of its vessels weren tyou?
( 21 A On board their ships yes
(23) Q Did you eversee then an officer master officer or a
(24) member of the crew of Exxon take any alcoholic beverages aboard
(23) vessel?
(1) A Not on board no
(1)Q Did you eversec ihum - wall now walla minule Did you
(3) ever aee them heading back towards the vissel and tahe anything
through security?
(s) A I've seen crew members do it before, yes

Q Exxon crew members?
A I can't exactly say that, but as many tumes as I've seen it
(8) happen, I'd have to say there was a tume when an Exxon crew
(y) member did, yes
(10) Q I see You ve seen others you re sure off but because
(1) you ve seen others employed by other companies you ve seen a
(12) lot of that, night?
(13) A Rught
(14) Q You re assuming because you ve scan so muth of that soms of
(15) it must have been Exxon crew members is that correct?
(16) A Seeng how those were most of the ships we handled were
(17) Exxan, yes
(18) Q So you re saying that you did see Exxon crew members take
(19) alcoholic beverages through security huaded to the vessel
(30) right?
(21) A Correct b
(2) $Q$ Did you ever - and you were aware of the alcohol policy
(2) right?

AYes
s) Q And you were buing padd by Exxun is that corrul?

## Vol 152237

(1) A Correct
(1 Q Did you ever ruport that to anybody al Exxon)
(3) A At Exxon, no
(4) Q Now as I understand your testimony then you would have
(s) seen Captain Hazelwood at the Pipeline Club on four or five
(6) occasions between whenever you started the work and March ol

89 is that torrtul)
A Correct
Q And in none of those - and you dun i hnow whuther that was
8687 or 88 ?
A Not a clue
Q But it was four or five umes duning all those years
correct?
A Correct
Q And in each and cvory obcasion whin you vi tosk him back
the vessel it was many hours before sailing time?
A Yes ane times out of ten definately
Q Pardon me?
A Nine tumes out of ten yes
(301 Q Wail a minute What do youmean ninc limas out of $\mathrm{L} \mathrm{n}^{\prime}$ ?
(-1) Was it nine times out of ten or luntimes out of thn)
1 A Well I can remember mite oct dion tikuig the captanis back
t_i, on board at saihng time gathering mail and getting the ullage
(Ta) report and leaving
(.S) Q Was that an occasion when you picked him up at the Pipeline

1) Club ${ }^{\text {? }}$
() A No, it wasn't
(1) Q Oh where did you pick him up?
(4) A I belueve on that occasion we were dealing with a sick or
si mjured crew member
2) Q A sick or an injured crew member?
3) A Rught
(B) Q As a matter of fact on that occasion he came in
4) delivered the sick - or came in with the sick or injured crew
) member and turned around went back to the vessel isn that
山L correct?
A Yeah 1 beheve what he did was come to the office and
spoke to somehody on the shore side about this matter, and
we
(14) returned to the ship
(15) Q And never went to the Pipeline Club or anything else? A No
Q All nght Let s leave that one alone At any other time when you picked up - that means there are three or four times then you picked him up at the Pipeline Club then right?
A No, there's four or five tumes, I'd say, at the Pipeline
Club
Q Okay Lut s say four or five tumes over these years
A Um hum
5) Q Any of those four or five tumes did you ever take him back
to the vessel shortly before sailing?

## Vol 152239

(1) A No

Q it was always a number of hours before sailing wasn $t$ it?
A Correct
THE COURT Are we at a good stopping point
Mr Neal?
MR NEAL Sure Your Honor and that ll heip me
THE COURT We Il take our first recuss ladies and
ghallemen
We ll be in recess for 15 minutes
(Jury oul at 1001 am )
(Jury in at 1017 am )
THECLERK All nise His Honor the Court this
Unted States District Court is again in session
Please be seated
MR NEAL May I proceed Your Honor?
BYMR NEAL
QMr Lunt you talk about how foggy your memory is and I
appreciate that Isn itt a fact - and you ve talked about the four or five times that you may have picked up - or picked
up Captain Hazelwood at the Pipeline Club and brought him back
(?) to the vessul long before sailing time and these occurred
(2) beiween January I 1986 and March of 89 is that a fair
(3) tatımıni)
(-4) AYes it is
(2S) Q All right Isn it a fact that on these occasions when
(I) you picked up a - an Exxon master or officer at the Pipeline
, Club and took them back to the vessel you don k know whether
this was before January 88 or after January of 88?
A That's correct
MR NEAL Thank vou Mr Lunt
MR JAMIN I have no redirect Your Honor
Thank you sir
THE COURT Thank you sur You may step down
Call your next witness
MR MONTAGUE Your Honor the plantiffs call
Dr Garrett O Connor as an expert witness
THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand please sir
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK Please be seated For the record sir
state your name give us your address and spell your last name please
THE WITNESS Garteti O Connor OC O N N OR 9100
South Sepulveda Boulevard Los Angeles Californa 90045
THE CLERK Thank you sir
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GARRETT O CONNOR M D (Live) BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Good morning Dr O Connor
A Good morning
Q Could you give us a litile background of your education

## Vol 152241 <br> please?

A Yes I-my medical school education was in Dublin Ireland at the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland where I received my medical degree in 1960 I then came to the United
(s) States from I reland and did an internship in the Uaina Memonal
(6) Hospital in Baltumore Marvland one vear And Ithen attended

John Hopkins University School of Medicine for a residency
traming in psychatry for three years from 1961 through '64
Q So is it correct that you re both a medical docior and a
psychastrist?
A That's correct
Q What is your current practuce?
A Well, my current practuce - I perhaps should add that prior to getting to my current practace chere's about $\mathbf{2 5}$ years
(15) intervenang in which I was first of all on the faculty of
(16) John Hoplans University from 1964 through 1972 as an
(in instructor and professor of psychutry in the department of
(18) psychatry and in the school of public health
(19) During that tume I directed the psychatric emergency (20) service at Johm Hopkins and also between 1969 and '72 the
(21) John Hopkins Drug Abuse Center in Baltumore I was also the
(22) chef of the Acute Treatment Clinic and taught communty
(23) psychatry in Baltumore
(24) I then moved to Los Angeles in 1972 where I joined the
(25) faculty of UCLA And I taught psychsatry on the facuity of
(11) UCI A from 1972 until 1976 And for a period of one year there
() was the medical director of the UCLA VA Drug Abuse Center at
the hospital in Los Angeles
Q Are you still affiltated with UCLA?
A Yes I am Not full tme anymore since 1976 but I am an
associate cinical professor at UCLA where I teach courses
regularly to medical students and resadents on alcohoinsm
and
drag-abuse
Q Does that bring us now up to vour current practice?
A 1 thank so
Q Ohay And could you tell the jury what you do today?
A Yes I am in the private practice of psvehatry and addiction medicine and in that role it see $-I$ am referred and
I evaluate patients for possible alcoholasm drug abuse or other forms of chemical dependence And I evaluate them make
(16) a diagnosus, if a dagnosis is to be made and then make (17) recommendations for treatment
(18) $Q$ And do vou have anything to do with these patients after (19) treatment?
(20) A Well I do Sometimes I participate in therr continuing
\& 11 evaluation and extended care over a two or three vear period as
; ) they are recovening from - they contunue to recover from ther
(23) alcoholism or their other forms of chemical dependence
(r4) $Q$ And sometimes are you consulted to evaluate persons who
(23) have been through - who have already been through alcoholic

Vol 152243
treatment?
i) A Yes The patients come to me at different tumes
(i) Sometimes they come before thev're gone to treatment

They mav
(a) be referred by a company by the fAA for example Idoa lot
of work with pilots and so the $\mathbf{I} \mathbf{A A}$ or the airlines will refer me patients about whom thev have a question employees about
(7) whom they have a question refer them to me to evaluate their
(B) status to see if there is a daagnosis of chemical dependence and if so what to do about it
(10) So then I will make a diagnosis, make a recommendation,
(1I) perhaps for inpatient treatment, for out patient treatment,
plus
(12) a program of on going care
(13) Then in the case of - most of the patients I see, I should
(14) say are people in safety sensitive posituons Pilots are
(1s) the - not the bulk of my practice but 50 percent of my
(16) practice I also see aur traffic controllers I also see
(17) physicians meluding surgeons and thoracic surgeons I
also
(18) see attorneys, and an occasional judge
(19) THECOURT Whon
(20) THE WITNESS It strue Your Honor
(21) Occasional judge I slso tee firefightera from the Los
(22) Angeles Fire Department consult members of the police
(23) officers most of the people - flight atuendants from all of
(24) the airlines
(23) So most of the people I see are in fact in safety

Vol is 2244
sensilive posilions I mvsull dmapilot so that also gives me a little bil of an edge with the arrine pilots paricularly
And so after they come - 11 they go for treatment then
they re sent back to me after their treatment to see if the
treatment took as it were if the vaccination took and they re
in recovery, and I make an assessment of their recovery status
and then make recommendations to the company or the FAA
the Board of Medical Quality of Califormia if il sadoctor
or the state bar association if it $s$ an attorney
I deal with these regulatory agencies a good deal around 1ssues of anfety and fitness
Q Is that your specialty doctor?
A That's the bulk of my practice is an that area and that's
what I thunk I'm -
Q And how long have you bund doing that that spusilic specialty?
A Sunce 19 - the eariy ' 80 s , sunce about 1982 '83
$Q$ Do you have any licenses?
A Yes, I do
Q Other than a pilot s license?
A Yes, 1 do
Q Could you tell us?
A I - I'm licensed by the Educational Council on Forengn
Medical Graduates anyone who goes to medical schoul at a

## Vol 152245

[^22]psvehiatric residents 1 think that's any of note that I published with respect to the field
Q Have you been involved at all in any educational - or preparing any educational or training materials?
A Yes Films I've been always interested in firms, and
I've prepared a number of traning films in the area of
alcoholism and aiso was fortunate enough to be able to
have
8) some influence on some network television shows where we were
(19) able to put matenal in about alcoholism, how to treat it, how
to recognize it And shows like Archie Bunker's Place, for i) example, which had milhons of peopte looknag at it and where
(12) we could, in a sense make some educational measage to people
(3) Oh, there was also a show on public television about
doctors and piots and lawyers and policemen in which I
participated and was the medical advisor for
Q In describing your specialty does that include evaluating
persons who have gone through treatment for return to their
jobs?
AYes
Q Do you do that?
AYes
Q Ona regular basis?
A On a very regular basis Most of my work is indeed
eather sendiag them for treatment or deciding if they should
for treatment and then after treatment seeing, as I said if

## Vol 152247

(1) the treatment took
(2) Sometumes people go for treatment and it doesn't take
(3) Sometimes people do - you want to be able to evaluate thear
(4) recovery status to see what they've learned, to see have
they
s) accepted the fact that there is a problem are they still in denal
Q How many of those have you done Doctor? How many of those'
A How many of those'
$Q$ The evaiuations for fitness?
A Oh at least 500, I should say Up to - I do about, oh, 50 or 75 a year Over a ten year period I would say a minumum

3 of 500
Q How do these people come to you?
A Well, they're referred to me Some of them come on thear own because they're worried about themselves There are very
(17) few Most of them come because they were referred by somebody
(18) else by management As I sand by the FAA by the Medical (iv) Board of Quality by the fire department by the unon, arrinne
(20) pilots association I conduct and mamtain relationships with
(21) all of those groups
(22) Q Doctor are you yourself an alcoholic?
(23) A Yes, I am
(24) Q Are you what you refer to in recovery ${ }^{\text { }}$
(23) A Yes I am a recovering alcoholic

```
    Q And from what period have you been in recoverv?
    A My sobriety date is March 6th }197
    Q And have you been sober since?
    A Yes I have been abstanent and sober from all alcohol and
    other mind altering drugs since that tume
    Q Are you a member of Alcoholics Anonymous?
    A Yes I am
    Q Do you still attend Alcoholics Anonymous meetıngs?
    A Yes,I do
    Q Approximately how many Alcoholics Anonymous AA
    etings
    have you attended in your lifetime?
    A I just - more than }300
    Q And have you ever spoken at AA conventions?
    A Yes I have
    MR MONTAGUE Your Honor ! -
    THE WITNESS I was just going to say I ve spoken at
    quite a number of AA conventions including the - several
    times at the annual convention of Birds of a Feather which is
    AA for pilots And this August I will be one off the speakers
    at International Doctors in AA in Atianta
    MR MONTAGUE Your Honor I would offer Dr O Connor
    as an expert in psychiatry and addiction medicine and
    specifically diagnosis and treatment of alcohol abuse problems
    evaluation for fitness for duty interventions and substance
    abuse education
```

            Vol 152249
    MR SANDERS We have no objection
THE COURT Thank you Court accepis Dr O Connor s
qualifications
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Let s get down to basics Doctor What is alcoholism?
A Oh well there are many defimitions for alcoholism and I
will try to make it clear to you what some of the most recent
ones are Alcohohsm first of all is a disease It's a
biological disease a psychological disease and a social
disease And that means that it is a disease which affects
your body, your mind your emotions and your
relationships
(12) wherever they - at home, or work or wherever they may be
(13) Now, because there are so many definitions of alcoholesm
(14) everybody in a sense has their own way of thming about it
(1s) Our society, the American Society of Addiction Medicine
and
(16) this is the defintion I'm soing to give you because I think
in it's a very good one spent two years assembling all of the
(18) unformation on defintions, and we came up with - I was a
(19) board member of the society at the tume We came up with a
(20) 1990, a definition which that was later published in the
(21) Journai of American Medical Association, very prestugious
(22) Journal
(23) That definutuon, I'll go through it with you, is as
(24) follows Alcoholasm is a primary disease of its own
(2) Biological psychological and social And its major
charactenzations are - or manifestations are episodic or
(-) impaired loss of control over dranking So the umpared
(3) control over your drinking can be episodic or continuous
(4) Preoccupation with alcohol is the next thing Alcoholics
(5) naturally think a lot about alcohol, and alcohol is a central
(6) part of their life experience The third thing is continuing
(7) to drink despite adverse consequences Continning to druik
(8) despite adverse consequences That means an alcohohc will no
(9) mater if he gets - say something happens at home or
(10) dasasters in his life or her life as there often are be
"II) continues to drink any wav even though they know the drinking
(1.) ss causing a problem
(13) And the fourth thing is distorted patterns of thinking In
(14) other words mental disease as well as everything else
(Is) Distorted patterns off thinking Most notably denal
(16) You heard Mr O'Neill talk about denial as not a niver in
(17) Egypt, that's a common phrase that came out of AA As a matter
(18) of fact it's a good one because denial is one of a central
(19) mental components off alcoholism The alcoholic as last to
(20) know he or she is an alcoholic Fverybody else knows
they're
rli an alcoholic first
1 , So episodic or impaired - episodic or continuing, impared
(23) control continuing to drink despite adverse consequences
(24) preoccupation with alcohol and mental patterns, distorted
(25) mental thmking, most notably denal

## Vol 152251

Q la it a progreasive disease?
() A Yes at's most often progressive In that it gets worse
(31 the longer it goes and the more vou drank basscally and very
(a) frequently fatal if not treated It's a very senous disorder
(s) $Q$ ls it chronic?
(6) A Yes chronic st that it tends in go on most tumes for a
(7) Lufetume, if not treated so yes at goes on over a long penod
(8) of time
(9) Q la there a way to stop it or arreat it?
(10) A Well, it's a closely guarded secret that alcoholnam us
(It) caused by alcohol That's the most umportant thing to
(12) remember Some people say it's caused by ninhappiness or bad
(13) childhood, in fact it's caused by alcohol So the way to
(14) arrest alcoholism - you can't cure alcohohsm Once an
(15) alcoholic always an alcobolic But youcan arrest it and in
(16) my opinion the best way to arrest alcoholism is to stop
(I7) drinking
(18) Q Total abatinence?
(19) A Total abstinence That's just the dranking part of the (20) disease And following that, of course, you'll have to (21) matutute treatment and support and so on, and perhaps we'll
(22) talk about that later for the other part of the disease the
(23) physical parts, the psychological parts and so on
(24) $Q$ Is there another school of thought other than total
(25) absunence?

Vol $15 \quad 2252$
A Yes, there is There's a controversy in the field There are a lot of people, mostly psychologists some physicians, but
(3) mostly psychologists who beheve that many alcoholics can return to social or controlled drinking, and that controversy has been ragug for, oh, some 20 years
The other side of the controversy is that with alcoholics,
(7) the proper treatment and the safest possible treatment and most
(8) conservative treatment and most successful treatment is abstunence, and that is the pusition that's taken by AA : The group of people in research who expose controlled drakugg would mantan that, as I said it's possible for alcoholics to go back to drinking, and the other side of the controversy says it isn't, and that abstinence is what you have
(14) to achieve and mantan
(15) $Q$ is that an accepted position?
(16) A Which one, Mr Montague?
(17) Q Social drinking for an alcoholic?
(18) A No it's not generally accepted in the man stream of (19) medicine, and certamily in the field of addaction medicine and
(20) generally in psychatry if's not widely accepted at all In fact, may we say this at the beganang Doctor -
MR SANDERS Your Honor I mgoing to object to the $a_{1}$ continuing narratives If Mr Montague could interrupt every now and then with a question
THE COURT I think we re doing all right

| You may continue Mr Montagul <br> MR MONTAGUE Thank you <br> THE WITNESS Well just to rullurate that the problum with the cuntrollud driniting issuc is that tven il you can show that somb very few maybl unc iwo thre four percent of alcoholics could go back to controlled drinking how do you know in advance which ones they re going to be? If 96 percent of them can 1 - and Dr Mark Shockerd (ph) one of the world s greateat authorities in alcoholism saya there is no data - although some alcoholics may be able to go back to controlled drinking there is no data that permits us to tell in advance which ones they will be so that a recommendation or prescription of an alcoholic to go back to controlled drinking can under certain circumatancts in my opinion be tantamount to a death sentence because you give the alcoholie the idea he or she can go back to controlled drinking they try the disease takes them over and continues on the inexorably fata! destructive procese of alcoholism So that s the prohlem with that <br> Q You used the figure of thrtc or four percent may - three or four percent of alcoholics in recovery may be able to go back to social drinking Where did that number come from? <br> A Well, there's a major study called the Rand report which came out in the 1970 s which has been actually widely critucized I do not subscribe to the findings of the Rand |
| :---: |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |

(1) You may conlinue Mr Monlagul
: MR MONTAGUE Thank you
(3) THE WITNESS Well just to rillurate that the
(d) problum with the cuntrollud drinking issuc is that cven il you
(5) can show that somb viry few maybu une iwo threc four

61 percent of alcoholics could go back to controlled drinking how
(7) do you know in advance which ones they re going to be? If 96
(8) percent of them can 1 - and Dr Mark Shockerd (ph) one of the
(9) world s greatest authorities in alcoholism saya there is no
(10) data - although some alcoholics may be able to go back to
ull controlled drinking there is no data that permits us to tell
(I-) in advance which ones they will be so that a recommendation or
131 prescription of an alcoholic 10 go back to controlled drinking
(14) can under certain circumatantas in my opinion be tantamount
(IS) to a death sentence because you give the alcoholie the idua he
(16) or she can go back to controllud drinking they try the
(17) disease takes them over and continues on the inexorably fatal
usi destructive procese of aloohulism So that sthe prohlem with
(1, $)_{1}$ that
(-0) Q You used the figure of thric or four percent may - three
(21) or four percent of alcoholics in recovery may be able to go
(22) back to social drinking Where did that number come from?
(23) A Well, there's a major study called the Rand report which
( 4) came out in the 1970s which has been actually widely
125) critucized I do not subscribe to the findings of the Rand
report, but I can tell you that when corrected down for errors
(2) of vanous tumes, the final distullation of their results was
(3) that about four percent of thear alcoholics could go back to
(4) some sort of controlled drinking
(s) A better study conducted in 1985 by a man called Helser
(6) (ph), and hus group showed that oniy 16 of thear alcoholics
could resume moderate, stable dronking And let me tell you
what moderate stable drining was by them They sard that
moderate stable drinking was sux draks a day plus three
0) episodes of intoxication per month That was what they called
(11) moderate stable drunking, the 16 percent of alcoholics who
(12) they said could return to dronking So that's where those
(13) figures come from
(14) Q is the social drinking concept an accepted premise for
(15) persons in sensitive - in safety sensituve positions?
(16) A Not anywhere that I know of Obviously, it's a rasky
(in) business and I don't know in any of the groups that I work
(18) with who would accept social dnaking as an outcome
(19) Q Now you treat people every day?
(20) A Yes
(-1) Q And what do you recommend?
(in) A I recommend total abstinence And if a person is not (23) wilung to commit to total abstunence and show that they can ( 7 +1 mantain it I will not recommend them for a return to a safety
(2s) sensitive position

## Vol 152255

(i) Q Are there symptoms - 1 guess that s the right word not
in being a medical person Are there sympioms of alcoholiam?
(3) A Yes there are
(4) Q And are they susucpuble to duscription?
(s) A I'll try I'll give a farly abbreviated version here as (6) they, I think apply to this particular case that we're in
(7) And, before I do let me say that the symptoms of alcohohsm
-
(8) alcoholics are just human beangs like me and everybody else so
(9) the behavioral symptoms that we'll describe everybody has had
(10) them to some degree or another But in an alcoholic, they are
(1) clustered and they're more severe, and they're severe enough
(i) their ordinary human conflicts and behaviors They're
(13) clustered in such a way as to cause pain and suffening and
(14) dysfunction so they're exaggerations of what everybody
here
(IS) has felt I'm sure, at one tume or another
(16) The first symptom of alcoholism is, of course drinking, (i) abnormal druking, heavy driaking, binge drinking, and there
(18) are different kinds of drinking Drinking that's enough to
(19) cause a problem in marriage, in family, in your own self,
(20) relationship with yourself or relationships at work That's
('I) the first as I said alcoholism cause of - alcohol is the (in) cause of alcoholism
(23) Then there is low self esteem depression Alcoholism is a
(24) depressing disease You lose things, not only your
memory but
(Sis sometımes your job and your dignity, and so people are
often
(1) depressed Resentment - Bill Wilson the founder of
(1) Alcoholics Anonymous sand resentment was the greatest enemy of
(7) all alcoholics Tolerance - tolerance is something that
(4) develops over tume in an alcoholic and that means that when a
(s) disease is progressing the alcoholic has to drink more over tume to get the same effect
Most alcoholics looking back in their hives would be able
to say I remember I used to be - I was the one that could
drink people under the table I could drive people home when
10, everybody else was drunk I could drink a lot hold my hquor
(11) whole syndrome
(1) What else - oh denial as I mentioned before which is a (13) whole range of psychological mechamams We'll talk about that
(4) for a minute because it's so important
(15) Denial helps the alcoholic to reduce awareness of the fact (16) that alcohol is the cause of his or her problems rather than (In) the solution An alcoholic, when they're dranking, thinks that
(18) alcohol is going to solve problems when in fact it really is
(1) the cause of them so denal keeps the alcoboic drakang by
${ }^{10}$ O) preventing him or her from knowng that alcohol is the canse
(21) And denial is an antegral part of the disease the mental (r) disease of alcohohsm and it becnmes inevitably an obstacle to
(23) recovery because the aicoholic isn't in touch with the fact (94) that I am an alcoholic That's what the whole treatment is
(25) about

## Vol 152257

(1) Explosive behavior impulsive behaviors of all kands
(2) Lying about drinking, about your drinking is part of the
3) denal Alcoholics like to decenve or not like to - they
(4) have to decerve people to order to cover up how much thev're
( $s$ ) draking So alcoholics hive a double life reaily, a life (6) that they kaow about and a life we let you know about as it (7) were
8) I remember my own if I may digress here because I think
(9) in trying to explain to the jury these symptoms, it's very
(10) important to be in a sense as specific as we can But an my (II) own alcoholasm, I used to be lake a spy I knew that I was an
(12) alcoholic and I knew that I had all of these problems, but I (13) wouldn't let you know about it, and I could pretend and I
couid
(14) create an image of function whether in my work or whth my
(Is) family but in order to do so I had to lie tell Les about my
( 10 ) drinking and pretend And eventually like any alcoholic I
in moved from telling a lie to hiving a lie when at becomes part
(18) of your whole system part of your whole character
(19) So they're the main things Of course I was also -
(20) alcoholics also are full of shame and gult because of the
if things they know they did and that they're hading from you
so
('2) that you don't know what it is we did, and that leads to (23) anxiety and a state of generally poor morale Agan, you cover
(2a) up with pseudo umage of function and good fellowship But
(25) beyond that there's an enormous amount of lonehness and

Vol 192258
() alienation an the sense of despar and feeling of not belonging
(2) to anything
(3) Q Once an alcoholic does drinking have any effect on your
(4) cognative functions or your thinking powers?
(5) A Yes
(6) Q And does one have to be drunk for that adverse reaction to (7) take place?
(8) A Cognitive functions, I think - thanks for bringing that
up, because I had - I didn't mention it in my list of symptoms
(11) Cognitave functions are when the alcohol affects your (12) brann, and the ones we would be most concerned with would be
(13) poor judgment, effects on judgment effects on memory, faulty
(14) memory blackouts, for example, that alcoholics get from
(1s) druking too much And there are many studies that show that
(16) these cogniave effects are not just assocuated with drioking
(17) or beang drunk or using intoxication, but because of the
(18) chromic effect of alcohol on the bran they persist even at
(19) umes when the alcoholic is sober
(30) And when we're evaluating - I'm evaluating pilots or
( I) doctors or police officers or uthers after treatment one of
1 : the things that I do is evaluate their cognative functions
(3) They may bave been sober for two or three months by this tume
(T) but they stall may have cognitive deficits from the chrons
s) effects of dnaking which have to be evaluated

## Vol 152259

i) Q le someone - in medical lerms is someone who is suffenng ( $)$ from alcoholism an alcoholic) Is there a difference between
(3) the disease of alcoholism and labeling somebody an alcoholic?
(4) A No People with alcoholism in my opinion and in medical
s) terms are alcoholics yes
of $Q$ And $I$ know we ve all seen various movies which depict
7. alcoholits dous one have lu be alcohol dependeni to he an alcuholis?
(y) A No nut momopion These days, the term alcohol (10) dependent alcohol abuse are used unterchangeably and we would
(11) call anybody with any of those problems an alcoholic
(12) Q Does one have to be a contınuous heavy drinker to suffer (13) from alcoholism?
(14) A No Most alcoholics - vast majority of alcoholics are aot
(1S) conuauous heavy drankers The puttern of draking is more
(16) usually episodic Alcoholics can stop driaking for periods
(17) give up for Lent Many people say lan't be an alcoholic I usi give up drinking every year for Lent 40 days
(is) Q Does being an alcoholic mian that you reach for the bottle (30) first thing in the mormng?
(2i) A No Only a very small - that's part of the stereotype of ( ) the surt of gamut alcuholic The Last Weekend Alcuholic
(.3) woaderful film with Ray Miland (ph) Dayv of Wiat and Roses
(n4) with Jack Lemon These are very senous films with end stage
(23) gamut alcoholics type of people just about to become skid row
) bums in an advanced stage where they have to because they're
2) shalang and want to take a drink early in the morning just to

## get going for the day

I had to do that Literally, sometumes I'd shake a Luttle in the morning, but I never had to take a dnak forit But that is the very severe kind of alcohohic that you're tolking about there
Q Now in your opinion can someone who is a - an episodic
alcohol abuser - by the way what does that term mean to you
(10)-episodic alcohol abuser?
(11) A Well, epesodic alcohol abuse, that means that a person (12) abuses alcohol on an episodic basis, which means that there
(13) would be periods of sobriety between pernods of abuse, and
it's
(14) a very - it's a term in the diagnostic manuals that in a sense
(15) has gone out of favor It was used more in the eariy '80s than
(16) it is now But you stall would see episodic alcohol abusers, (17) but now they would be called something else in the deagnoses
(18) $Q$ Well can a quote episodic alcohol abuser end quote be (19) an alcoholic?

A Yes I think Dr Gould as I sat here in the Court last week said that people with alcohol abuse, some people would
( 1 , call them alcoholics, some people with that diagnosis and
) alcohol abuse, some people would call it alcoholism, and I
happen to be one of those "some" people
(25) Q Which do you call it?
can determine whether someone who has gone through alcohol treatment has achieved a successful recovery at the time they re evaluated has achieved a successful recovery? A Yes Well maybe the best way to explan that would be to say what it is I look for when I'm evaluating say a palot or a police officer or air traffic controlier somebody lake that who's been through treatment and they will be sent back to
prior to - to get my recommendation to see if they're fit for duty in the safety sensative position That means are they in my terms in recovery
So m order to do that, what I - I have a procedure
First of all I will have a face-to face meeting with the individual, but not oniy with the individual but with his famuly, and I will have has or her permission to talk to their colleagues at work ther managers thear supervisors as well
(is) as talk to the people in the hospital the rehabilatation
center where they've been as well as have all of thear hospital records for me to look at Because you really need
make sure that a person is in fact clean and sober And not
(20) only that but enthusiastically and sincerely committed to a (a) program to stay that way
(2) So what I look forin a person I look for is he or she (3) number one sober Number two are they committed to (24) sobriety Number three, what are they doung to demonstrate
(2s) that commitment' Is their family behind them" Do thev have a

## Vol 152263

support group" Are they going to $A A^{\prime}$ ' Or, if they don't like
AA, are they going to another group, such as rationale recovery? If so what is the quality of their participation in those groups" And I know how to ask the questions to find

If they really are indeed participating actively in $A A$ and doing the 12 steps and if they have a sponsor I want to talk to the sponsor to see what the - it's a really thorough
evaluation here I want to see that they're if not happy in thear sobnety at least relieved and grateful for the opportunty to be sober and retura to work and not be fired
terminated or something like that
I want to see that they're willing to comply with whatever
company or government regulations may be facing them anse
often alcohohes feel that they're constricted and they have to
(15) do thus and they bave to go to meetings and they have to
(16) report they have to document thear attendance Well
(17) alcoholics are kind off free spints when they're dranking you
(18) know, and they don't like to be pmned sn And I aeed to
(19) evaluate the extent to which they're willing to comply and
(20) whether they're enthusiastic about complying because they know
(21) thus is the best treatment for their disease
(22) I want to know if they're being open and candid about their
(23) drinking, no longer lying about it Walling to talk about the
(24) shameful episodes openly willing to malke amends to

## people If

(25) not then sometime later be prepared to make amends to people
foes
I need to also inspect their cognituve functions And I
don't do that myself except in a cursory chnical evaluation
but I refer them to a psychologist for that who does an
extensive hatterv of tests to make sure the thinking
judgment
perception memory all of those things are back to normal
And I can tell you often we don't send people back to work
yet We have to wat If thear program isn't in good shape, I wilt detay my recommendation to send them back to work will
give them instructinns to tughten it up to increase it to
wat untal their brain functinns settle down come back in
three months six months communicate that to the agency or the
1141 work peuple and then send them back
1191 Q Doctor are those signs that you were talking about what
(16) you look tor?
in AYes
(18) Q Were those signs that were recognized by your profession
(19) back in 19857
(20) AYes
( 1) Q You mentioned - i think you used the word relapse?
(2) A Yes I dad
(23) Q What does that mean?
(9) A Well relapse really means a return to the previous pattern
( 1 i of abnormal drinking People - essentaally what it means -

## Vol 152265

Q Are there studies made or is it known in your profesaion
basically what the relapse rate is or the parameters of the relapse rate for an alcoholic?
A Well Mr Montague that question really can't be answered
very simply but 1 could answer it bnefly in the following way That untreated relapse rates for alcoholics tend to be very high up to 60 or 70 percent if you don't treat people However - and of course it depends on age and amount of dnaking and type of alcohnitsm and whether or not a person has
, 10 a social support group whether they're jobless, whether
(in) they - all of those things come into play an assessing relapse
(12) rates but in general they're very hugh However with proper
(13) treatment they can be reduced substantially
(14) Q Okay Now are there - just as there were signa for
(1s) successful recovery being successful in this recovery are
(16) there specific recognized signs for relapse?
(17) A Yes
(18) Q And could you tell us brefly what they are?
(19) A Well I don't seem to be able to tell anythang briefly, but
ro) I'll do my best Thev're in a way the opposite to the
(I) successful signs as you might imagine There is a
syndrome
(י2) called a protracted abstunence syndrome it's a technical term
(23) for negative thinking, irntability, sober alcoholic, an (24) alcohol who's dry rather as kund off uptught, doesn't like
(2) at, negative thankng, unwilling to deal with has or her

Vol 152266
drunking, really not in any sense of recovery, that sort of resentful, bitter angry atutude that vou sometumes see That
3) would be a major sign of impending relapse

Of course any kand of draking controlled or othermse as
s) the alcoholic might say, is a sugn of relapse Alcoholics
believe that they, you know have an obsession with the idea
71 that they can return - Can return to driaking luke a normal
person, we can't, so that any kund of goung back to draniong 15
9) a sugn of relapse

Fallure to follow ap with recommended prescriptions for
) aftercare, for treatment, for counseling, that kind of thing
Willingness, unwilhngness to deal with the aftermath of damage
3) in the family All of those things are signs of a person who (4) 45 not in recovery

Q Are all these signs things that you relied on in your evaluation of patients over the past - since the eariy 803?
A Yes And contmung denual of course is the princaple , one Person may be through treatment and stull says they're
(19) not alcoholic even though all the sigus and symptoms are avalable for inspection
Q Now the fact that a person suffering trom alcoholism self identifies rather than being involuniarily given treatment or introduced to treatment the fact that a person self
identifies does that thange the signs that you look for in
evaluating the success or failure of someone in recovery?

## Vol 152267

A No Huw a persongets to treaturent and subsequently is
not
(2) relevant to - that doesn't change how I would see or how 1
would look for the signs of recovery or what prescriptions
recommendations I might give for extended treatment
Q Now Doctor let $s$-we ve got a background and that $s$
what I was hoping we could get to give to the jury Lel sturn to this case now
A Yes sir
Q Have you ruvicwod any malcriala xpulific to this cas?
Alhave
Q And could you till us whal you ve reviewed?
A Summarize I read all I think of the Exxon policies with respect to alcohol alcohalic behavior and employees back

19771 thunk And I read a lot of - number of letters and other memoranda anternal to Exxan aud between Exxon and the
(16) governmeat after the oil spill
(17) I also read some documents of the NTSB National Tramng
(18) and Safety Board - Transport and Safety Board after the oul
(19) spill 1 then read a lot of tesumony I won't go through it
(20) all but it was testumony of vanous bxxon managers Captan
(21) Sheehy Captan Tompkins Captann Puerce Mr Iarossi,

17 , Mr Myers Mr Steve Dav and of course all of the $\mathbf{2 4 0 0}$ pages
1 " of Captan Hazelwood's testimong as well
(24) In addition I have been sitting in this cuurtroum since (-S) last Monday and have heard all of the testimony that you have
() heard So I won't go through all of the names You know , ourselves what else
(3) Q Have you ever been to Valdez?
(4) A Oh, yes, I did Last Sunday, I rented a plane and I flew
s) myself to Valdez because I was just curious it was a

## gorgeous

(6) day and I was curnous to see what it was like there
7) Naturally, having a particular miterest, I retraced Captan
8) Hazelwood's steps as I understood them from the testmony $0 n$
-191-March 23rd, 1989, and it was very helpful to me m
(10) understanding the circumstances of this case to walk around
(II) Valdex, see the various places, and then fly over the Alyeska
(12) terminal and see the walkways and gantries that Mr Lunt was
(13) talking about see the shups parked there, see the distances
(14) and then fly the course of the - of the Exxon Valdex that
(is) might and see Busby Island and the reef and Reef Island and
(16) Goose Island It was really very helpful to me in puttung it
(i7) altogether in my own mind
(18) $Q$ And from the maturials that you ve just described by the
way did they - have you seen the - what scalled the IDR?
A Oh yes the IDR
(21) Q Individual Disability Report have you seen that?
(22) A Yes l have seen that
(23) Q Have you seen the Sicikness Benefits Repori?
(24) A Yes, 1 have seen that, too
(25) $Q$ And have you seen what we ve been referring here as the

## Vol 152269

, Graves report or Graves memo?
I A Thank you Also the Graves report I've seen that
(i) Q From all of the materials you ve described have you been
() able to form certain opinions?

Alhave
Q Let a get them Do you have sufficient information to form an opinion as to whether Captain Hazelwood suffered from the disease of alcoholism as of 1985?

## AIdo

Q And have you formed such an opinion?
A I have
Q And can you tell us what that opinion is?
A Yes In my belief Captan Hazelwood suffered from the disease of alcoholusm since 1985
Q Could you tell the jury the basis for that opinion?
A Yes The basss of my opinion is largely hased on the materials that we just reviewed and perhaps the best way
talk about it is to divide it up into three tume periods,
really The signs and - that were appareat pnor to Captan
Hazelwood's entry anto South Oaks Hospital, and then
hospitalization itself, and the period after his
hospitalization and then, finally, the period towards the end
of his employment with Exxon prior to the oul spill
Prior to the hospitalization, what - what did he have?
Well he himself complaned that he and his wife had been

Vol 152270
talking about getting some help for eight months prior to his going snto the hospital He also complaned of moodiness and a
(3) mid life crisis There was an investigation going on into
(4) Captain Hazejwood's drinkung by Exxon in the eariv part of
(a) 1985 Captann Pierce called him sard there's an undercurrent
of some kind going on bere and maybe you better do something
about it
(8) The Graves report which indicated that Captan
(9) Hazelwood - of course Exxon didn't know about that untul a
(10) Inttle later but looking back on it Captan Hazelwood had
(i) come back drunk to the ship on $\mathbf{- 1}$ think intoxicated on
(12) several occasions and bad also been drinkiag on board So they
(13) were the man things I think prior to - in addition to of (14) course the proncipal thing Of course Captan Hazelwood's
(15) own account of as be said abusive dranking for four years
$(161$ once a week with his wife at home heavy driaking, we would
(17) say four to five doubles before dinner wine with dinner two
(18) to three doubles after that Which would make him as he sard
(19) in hus testumony and has deposition testamony giddy or jokey
(20) or a lattle clumsy So there was that and this obviousiy as
( 1 ) be indicated did not helphis relationship with his wife And
(2) led to subsequent treatment
(23) Q If I may divert for a minute Did you notice any change in (24) Captain Hazelwood stestimony with respect to the time of what
(25) he said in his deposition and what he said here in court?

## Vol 152271

(1) MR SANDERS Objection Your Honor as to relevance
(2) MR MONTAGUE Well Your Honor the witness just sasd
(3) that he relied in forming his opinion on his deposition
(4) teatimony
(5) THE COURT Mr Sanders anything else?
(6) MR SANDERS Your Honor 【question the relevance of (7) comparison
18) THE COURT Well illallow the witness to testify as
(9) to the comparison and you may cross examine as to whether
(10) there sany basis for it if it isn I brought out
(II) You may testify
(12) MR MONTAGUE Thank you Your Honor
(13) THE WITNESS Well yes there were - I think a
(14) couple or three different versions of Capiain Hazelwood
(15) account of his drinking with his wife In his first - in his
(16) deposition testimony he said in response to the questiona that
(17) it was once a week for three to four years Then I think in
(18) two different parts of his trial testimony he said on one
(19) occasion that it was sometimes weekly and sometimes kind of
(20) every three weeks Now a different patiern given And then
(21) on another occasion he said that the time interval between his
$\left({ }^{(2)}\right.$ heavy drinking at home was I think several months Several
(-3) weeks or several months Any way there was again a chird (24) version of the same account
(2) BY MR MONTAGUE

Q ls that - 1 m sorrv
A Yes go ahead
Q Does that have a significance to you the fact that that
story would change from his deposition in January of this year and at the trial?
A Yes it does It makes it difficult to rely upon Captan
Hazelwood for accounts of his drinking for me in trying to
think about the significance of Captan Hazelwood's dranking,
(9) what it means the vitality of it the centrality of it in this (10) case when you get a person giving three different versions (1) under oath in a two or three month pernod It makes it difficult to rely upon whatever be says about has dranking, especially is he - also basic to that opinion is hus own admission in his deposition testimony that he lied about his drinking several times and there was other information which
(16) perhaps we'll generate here that he hed about his drinking
on
(17) other occasions throughout this time
(18) MR SANDERS May it please the Court I renew my
(19) objection move to strike the comparison of testimony
(20) THE COURT I Il allow the testimony to stand
(i) MR MONTAGUE Thank you Your Honor

BYMR MONTAGUE
Q Let s get back from my diversion You were giving the , basis for vour opinion as to why you had conciuded that Captaın
( is Hareiwood was suffering from alcoholism or was an alcoholic as

## Vol 152273

) of 1985 and I believe you had finished his - the events - or had you finished the pre events before he entered South Oaks Hospital?
A Yes Oh one more I forgot about that he didn't tell his doctor about any of this Why is that arguificant?
MR SANDERS Your Honor mav we have a side bar?
(Al side bar off the Record)
THE COURT Ladies and genilemen you will please
ignore and disregard totally the last question and answer that
was given
Dr O Connor at this atage of your testimony we need to tighten things up a little bit and do it more in a specific question and a specific answer When you re giving the broad background material I ve allowed you to give narrative broad answers but we re into the case specific part of your teatimony now and we need to tughten it up some THE WITNESS Yes Your Honor BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Dr O Connor in reaching your opinion on whether Captain Hazelwood that he was an alcoholic and suffered from alcoholism in 1985 did you conaider the fact that he attended
a 28 day inpatient alcohol rehabilitation program?
A Yes 1 did
Q And what is the signaficance of that?
A Well it was in an alcoholism rehabilitation center and he

Vol 152274

1) was admitted to that for treatment
2) Q Okay Did you consider the information that was on the
(3) IDR which is Plantiff's Exhibit 10'
(4) A Yes,I did
3) Q And the statements on that made by Dr Vallury?
4) A I'm sorry The statements made on it by Dr Vallury, yes
5) MR MONTAGUE That $s$ not facing 100 good Thank
you Can you see that?
THEWITNESS Yes lcan
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q And what is it on that report which supporis your opinion
or from which you formed your opinion or contributed to your
opimion that Captain Hazelwood was an alcoholic in 1985?
A Well, the - do you want me to -
Q By the way -
A This IDR or this abbreviation of that
Q You look at Exhibit 10 if you want and if you could put
Exhibit 10 on the -1 guess we can 1 get - PX10
MR SANDERS Don $t$ we have a blow up of that
somewhere?
MR MONTAGUE Can everybody see the screen?
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q You want to tell us what wh re going to reter to and I II
try to make a more legible for ev crybodv
A Yes 1 was going to refer at some point to the code

## Vol 152275

I) numbers at the top of the diagnowis sectuon
? $Q$ ls that what you re referring to'
3) A Yes Where it says 30040 and 30542 They are typed
(4) $Q$ What is it about those that you ruliud upon in rusching
s) your -
6) A Well one of them is the code number for dysthymic

7, disorder and the other is the code number for alcohol abuse
(y) eplsodic

1) Q Yes And what is the sigmificance of that to you?
(10) A Well alcohol abuse episodic in a diagnosis which undicates
(II) a form of alcoholsm Furthermore the handwriten information
(12) below individual psychotherapy group therapy marital
(13) therapy, AA and lectures seminars and workshops pertaining to
(14) alcoholism is a classical descriptuun of the treatment in an
(1s) mpatient $\mathbf{2 8}$ day program for alcoholism following what is
(16) called a Minnesota model which was the traditional form of
(17) treatment for alcoholism at that time Audindeed today as
(18) well So that the $\boldsymbol{-}$ what is described for treatment is the
(19) treatment for alcoholsm
(20) And then further down Dr Vallury luoks like his writing, ( ) has said that Mr Hazelwood will complete our 28 day prugram
(22) that's the - the only thing - alcoholism is the only thing
(23) for which a 28 day program exists $1 t$ is recommended given
(24) the aature of his job that after discharge Mr Hazelwood will
t.S begiven a leave of absence to get invoived in AA and
(i) aftercare
(-) Again, that is an absolutely classical prescription for
(3) extended care and aftercare for somebody with a dagnosis of
(4) alcoholism We note in item five there that workshops
2) pertaning to alcoholism is what's used And goung back to the
(6) diagnosis part there it's typed, and that's probably Captan
(7) Hazelwood It indicates at the top, was admitted on the 1st of
(8) April, and this form is the 16 th of April, just 16 days, so
(9) this diagnosis is no doubt provisional And it's typed here
(10) MR SANDERS Objection Objection to the
(u) speculation
(12) THE COURT Sustain the objection
(13) The jury will disregard the comment about the nature of the
(14) diagnosis
(15) BYMR MONTAGUE
(16) Q Doctor in your opinion would any trained practicing
(i7) professional in your area know that Captain Hazelwood was
(18) treated for alcoholism by looking at that document?
(19) A Yes, in my opinion, would know
(20) Q Is there a treatment for dysthymia - dysthymia which is
(21) it? Dysthymia dysthymia which is it?
(22) A Dysthymia I think is how it's pronounced Yes, there is a
(23) treatment for dysthymia and that is individual
psychutherapy
(24) for 18 months to two years with what's called cognitively based
(2S) behavioral psychotherapy, which helps a person recognize the

## Vol 152277

(I) signs and symptoms of their depression and helps them do
(2) something about it to engage in behaviors that will prevent $1 t$
(3)

Q And from that exhibit the IDR can you determine whether
Dr Vallury pruscribed that type of treatment for dysthymia?
A There is no evidence to - no, there is no prescription for that type of treatment
(7) Q Are there any other bases for your conclusion that in 1985
(8) Caplain Hacelwood suffered from alcohohism?
(9) A Well Dr Vallury's deposition, we heard in the Court here
(10) where he indicated that the - wnth respect that he - he
(1) advocated, any cases of alcohohsm, he sand, that

## abstinence

(12) should be the recommended treatment, as he has andicated here
(13) by recommending AA and aftercare
(14) He also sad that the - in this instance the treatment

II! for dysthyma and alcohulism would be the same He
(16) recommended as did the hospital recommend a-as

Captan
(17) Hazelwood said in his testumony, too there was a general
(18) recommendation not to drink and he had committed humself
not to
(19) driok for a while
(20) Q Okay So your opimion is that in 1985 Caplain Hazelwood
(I) was an alcoholic?
(7) A That is my opinion
(23) Q Do you have any doubl about that conclusion?
(24) MR SANDERS Objection Your Honor
(2s) THE COURT Sustain the objection

MR MONTAGUE Okay
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Do you have - in the materials you ve reviewed and what you ve heard in this court have vou found that vou have sufficient information to form an opinion of Joe Captain Joe
Hazelwood s status in recovery from alcoholism after his
inpatient treatment and up to the time of the grounding of the Exxon Valdez in March of 19897
AYes Ido
Q And have you formed such an opinion?
A I have
Q And what is that opimion?
A It is my opinion that Captan Hazelwood never really got into a state of recovery and therefore that he did not achieve a state of stable recovery followng his discharge from
(16) South Oaks between that and the time of the oul spall

Q Okay And could you tell us - well let me ask vou some
specifics so maybe we can shorten things
The fact that Captain Hazelwood left his aftercare program after two months did that have any significance?
A Yes it does
Q And what is that significance?
A Well he was prescribed to attend extended and aftercare sessions and he told us that he had dropped out of those in late June or early July about six weeks after bis

Vol 152279
prescription and be didn't tell anybody about that Except dropping out of treatment dropping out of recommended treatment without telling anybody is often a sign of the beginning of the end of an alcoholic who will sometimes return
(s) to dranking because they have cut themselves off from professional contact and support
Q Does the fact that after finsahing treatment he had no
further contact with an alcohol abuse professional have a algnaficance?
A To my - to my knowledge that's the case
Q And why? Why does that have a significance'
A Well, agan the treatment had been prescribed by Dr Vallary, and one of the symptoms of a retura or an tual
return to dranking or poor recovery status is the alcoholic's beluef that they can do it on their own and that they have a (16) better way of goung about recovery than profeasionals or other
(17) people who know what they're doing
(18) Q What about Captain Hazeiwood attendance at AA meelings (19) and his description of participation al those meetings?
(20) A When Captann Hazelwood began he says be attended AA (1) meetings for - 90 meetings in 90 day, but his description of
(22) bis attendance in AA I bave found very difficult to
(23) understand For example he has said that he has never shared
(74) in an AA meeting in four years He has sand that despite the (2S) fact that he does not now or then ever thought of himself as an

Vol $15 \quad 2280$ and and , closed meetings of AA are for alcoholics only He says that he
hav had three temporar, vpunsors The concept of a temporar
sponsor that I m familsar with is one that you meet in a
hospital who heips you get extablished in AA and then you get
(6) a permanent sponsor I've never heard of somebody having three
(7) temporary sponsors for three years even though sponsors may
move you get another one but thev're permanent response
source And then finally the only requirement for membership
"or in AA is a desire to stop drinking Dnean't mean everybody who
(II) Jouns AA stops drinking but they have a desire to stop
(1) driaking dad when they go back to dranking, they generally
(13) talk about it in AA with thear sponsor bat as he didn't share
(14) ever in AA he apparently didn't talk about it in AA
usi So persons who contunue to drink in $A A$ and particularly who
(16) come to ciosed meetings and don't displav any deare to stop
(I7) drinking un AA are not generally well accepted because
(18) everybody to AA has a desare to stop drnkang and wants to
stay
(19) sober so people who don't demonstrate that in my expersence
(nol are frequently not ternbly welcome So that's why has
deqcription of his membershipin $A \mathbf{A}$ in puzzing to me
1 I Q Dols his description of his partilipation in AA meetings

meetings?
(t) Gatifor your opynon that he did not achieve recovery?

A Yes his resumed driaking He - he did resume dranking after a statement that he would remain abstinent and it was about a year later that he did so And the way he did so is very typical of how any alcohohes go back to drinking just sitting there at dinner suddenly it seems lake a good idea to have a drink Vo - nothing major going on in his life just had a drink and to me that means that the dental process had
(il) begun to set in again and the vigilance that he may have been
(12) taught at the treatment center about returning to dnniang, the
(13) consequences of dnnking the knowledge that he had about what
(14) would happen if he violated policy because of his meetings with
(1s) Captan Tompkins and others all of that anformatuon was not
(10) there as he just took up the first drink It just happened
(17) like that
(18) And from there on out his resumption of dranking over the
(19) next two and a half years between then and the onl spill it
(20) seems to me we can detect a pattern or a progression of Just
(i) baving one driak, which is a lapse or a ship, but then over
(22) tume relapse - just like recovery, relapse is a process not
(23) an event, it goes on over tume And he continued to drank, it
(24) was wne and beer and Bloody Mary's on planes and
dranking with
(.S) colleagues And then by September 1988 he had a pernod
of

## Vol $15 \quad 2282$

(1) beavy druiong in which he drank a lot of - I think ten dranks
(a) and then drove a car afterwards which might suggest agan a
(3) return - or the development of what I talked about tolerance,
(4) be able to drive a car after dranking ten drinks in a short (5) penod of tume
(6) Then the pattern contunued He began to violate alcohol (7) policy even knowing that that would result in termination of (8) his job, and at Portland where Mr Carr talked about having a-
9) drank on board with Captann Hazelwood We heard about the (10) wallae-tallae episode this morning for Mr Day We also then
(11) heard sbout the Captan Reeder epasode, Ms Willamson's (12) report, all of these things were contributing to my conviction
(13) that Captans Hazelwood had by that tume returned to an abnormal
(14) pattern of druang, under the circumstances, given his
(1s) treatment and given what was known In addition, he was
(16) leading a double life Heavy drnking after work for a while, (i7) but he concealed that from his wife who herself was in Al Anon
(18) and who had been in mantal therapy with him in the hospital,
(19) which most of these things were to be talked about which you do
(20) w mantal therapy, he didn't drink at home for all this penod
(21) of tume and yet he was drinking on the road on board, with
(22) colleagues and so on
(.3) And then finally, on March 23rd, 1989 there was hus (94) drinking in Valdez prior to the onl spill with the violation of TH-Che-Gome-Gumedrule-Vol 152283
(1) Q Okay Now have you formed an opinion Doctor as to
(2) whether Caplain Hazelwood s alcoholism was the cause of his
(3) leaving the bridge on the Exxon Valdez on March 231989 while
(4) the vessel was outside of the traffic lanes diverting ice and
(5) heading towards Bligh Reef?
(6) AI have
(7) MR SANDERS Objection Your Honor I think this is a
(8) hitle far outade the expertise that he $s$ stated here in this
(9) courtroom
(10) THECOURT Mr Montague it strikes me that it goes
(11) beyond
(1) MR MONTAGUE Let me ash ua different way if I
(13) might
(14) THE COURT All right
(is) BYMR MONTAGUE
(16) Q Doctor have you formed an opinion as to whether Captain
(17) Hazelwood 2 alcoholism impaired his judgment on the night of
(18) March $231989 ?$
(19) MR SANDERS it a closer Your Honor but -
(20) THE COURT I mgoing to let him try it
(?) BY MR MONTAGUE
(22) Q Have you formed an opinion first?
(23) A About whether alcoholism impared -
(24) Q No imparred his judgment?
(-9) Albave

-     - 

XMAX(32)
Vol 152284
(1) Q And what is your opinion?
(2) A I belseve it did
(3) Q And can you tell us in succinct terms how vou reached that opinion?
A Well it - obviously basic to that opinion is the fact
that I thunk that Captain Hazelwood had returned to an abnormal
(7) pattern of drinking by that tume and that he was actively
alcoholic and in full relapse of his drinking, for all the reasons that I've given On the afternoon - and was exercising poor judgment both with respect to his draiking and
(II) with respect to his actuvities
(12) On the afternoon of March $\mathbf{2 3}$ rd he drank an unknown amount
(13) of alcohol in Valdez in the company of his chief radio operator
(14) and his chief engineer and led them in a violation of the Coast
(is) Guard rule It seems to me that for -
(16) MR SANDERS Now we refarafield now it $s$ not his
(17) field of expertise as to whether there $s$ a violation of the
(18) four hour rule and those kind of things and I think he s
(19) answered the question
(20) MR MONTAGUE He s stating his basis
(?) THE COURT He s stating his basis
(22) Ladies and gentlemen you are the deciders of the facts in
(23) thia case and you all have a dispute in the evidence that
(24) you re going to have to deal with as to whether or not the
(25) Coast Guard rules were violated That sadecision vou re

## Vol 152285

(I) going to have to make at some point

1) This witness is going to offer some testimony about that
(3) but whether or not - he isn t the one who a going to decide
(4) whether those rules were violated You re the ones that are
(s) going to do that
(6) Go ahead Mr Montague
(7) THE WITNESS Perhaps I Lould say by drinking within
(8) four hours of going back on the ship And then coming back on
the ship Captain Hazelwood is - his hehavior in leaving the
(10) bridge that night was so uncharacterisicic he is knownas a -
(II) MR SANDERS Objection again Now he s
(i2) testufying over in the area of seamanship
(13) MR MONTAGUE Okay Okay
(14) BY MR MONTAGUE
(1s) Q Apart from - we ve heard all kinds of testumony about what
(16) happened on the ship that night and I masking you Doctor if
(7) you can as on the basis of his behavior ieading up to that
(18) night not what happened once he got on the bndge but his
(19) behavior leading up to the night he boarded the vessel if
(20) that a sufficient for you to form an opinion as to whether his
(21) judgment was impaired that evening?
(22) AYes
(23) Q Okay Can you do that and can you tell us?
(24) AIcantry yes
(2s) Q Thank you
(1) A Well I would be repeating myself to say that I think his ( ) judgment was impaired by the way that I have heard the accounts
(3) of - the variou, iccounts of his drinking that afternoon And
(A) so that in itself under the circumstances of his backgrounds
(s) treatment development of his disease progression of it would
(6) indicate to me that his judgment that afternoon was meneed
2) imparred

Q Now the fact that he was able to walk up the gangplank
when he boarded the ship does that have an effect on your judemunt?
(II) A No
(1) Q And the lact that poraunvon the volat will testify that
"IT, ther saw him and he loobed pericuilv line does that have an (141 effect on vour opinion?
(1s) A No
(16) Q Caplaın - Dr O Connor have you formed an opinion as to
(17) whether Exxon s - Exxon contributed in Captain Hazelwood s
(18) fallure in recovery?
(19) MR SANDERS I object to that question
(20) Contributed?
(21) THE COURT Try the question another way There may
(22) be a wav that you could get at this from a medical standpoint
(23) but that $s$ where your focus needs to be
(9a) MR MONTAGUE That scorrect
(s) BYMR MONTAGUE

## Vol 152287

## Q Dr O Connor have you reviewed Exxon s reactions to

Captenn Hazelwood from 1985 up to March 23 1989?
A Yes I have
Q And do you have an opinion as to how those actions affected
Captain Hazelwood in his alcoholism?
A Yes I do
Q Could you tell us that hric!lv?
A It goes back initially to the return to work of Captain
Hazelwond in Auguvt of 1985 when the critena for return to
work was successful completinn of treatment for his
alcoholism And Captann Hazelwood has hamself has sand that he
(12) dropped out of treatment after six weeks and therefore, in
my
(13) openion -
(14) MR SANDERS Object to this as the
(15) mischaracterization of the testimony Again I-maybe the (16) Jury should -
at THE COURT The jury will have to decide what the
(IB) facts are but I m going to allow the Doctor to testify as to
(19) his opinion buit if his recitation of the facts does not
(20) comport with yours you will have lo ignore the opinion
(1) You may go ahead

1, THE WITNESS Yıs sir That hi had dropped out of
in: ireatment at the end of June or the buginning of July and that
41 he had indicated to Captain Marh Picruc that his medical
(5) Ireatment had been curtailed over the summer And that

Vol 152288
indicates to me that he had not in fact suctusstully completed -
MR SANDERS Objection Your Honor That s not only a mischaracterization of the evidence it sa making up of evidence
Can we approach the bench Your Honor?
THE COURT No 1 m going to allow him to tustily
But I say again if his recollection or rubilation of the facts
does not comport with yours you will ignore his opinion on this subject
Why don tyou ask another question Mr Montague and help focus this
MR MONTAGUE Okay
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q Specifically let me ask you this question Based on your experience if Capian Haceiwood had been properly evaluated before being assigned to the Yorktown in 1985 could Exxon have
(18) discovered the signs of his tailure in recovery?
(9) A I belueve so

Q And do you have an opinion as to whether there were
) sufficient signs available to Exxon to delect Captain
1 Hazelwood stalure lorucovery whan Exvin radsulg nod the
captain to the Exxon Valdul in 1987'
I A I believe there were
, Q And had Exxun look ad properiy tould thov have luand those

[^23](1) THE COURT You may cross examine
(2) MR SANDERS Your Honor 1 II need a second to
(3) collect things
(4) THE COURT Sure
(5) MR SANDERS May I approach the witness Your Honor?
(6) THE COURT You may
(7) MR SANDERS I have here a copy of your deposition
(8) transcript You might need that I would also like
(9) to have handy a copy of Exhibs 10 to put up on the acreen at
(10) some point

山ـ CROSS EXAMINATION OF GARRETT O CONNOR MD (12) BY MR SANDERS
(13) Q Dr O Connor I was watching you while you testified and I
(14) remember your testimony about being involved in the
production
(IS) of some films and I was watching you look over talking to the
(16) Jury You re an actor aren $t$ you?
(17) A I have been an actor in the past, yes I'm not domg (18) acting these days
(19) $Q$ Well is there any treatment for getting over the disease
(20) of acting? Do you relapse into acting?
(21) A 1 am not familiar with actung as a disease That's a new

1 , concept to me
(13) Q As a matlur of facl you whre an actor in curtain
isl Lulevision shows?
(-s) A That's true

## Vol 152291

(II) Q You were an actor on the stage?
() A That's true
(3) Q You were an actor in the movies?
(4) A That's true
(s) $Q$ And as a matter of fact you rea member of the Actors

Equily?
A That's correct
Q Sull a member?
A That's correct
Q And the Actors Equity is what'
A The Actors Equity is an associate - professional
association of actors in the United States
(13) Q Does that include actors who have speaking rolea as well (14) as Just actors who don $t$ speah?

1s A Yes it does
(if) $Q$ is the Aclors Equity is that jusi for actors with speaking
(17) roles)

A I'm not sure of that but it certamily is for actors with speaking roles
Q Now you have - you have had - you are a paid expert here
for the - for the plaintiffs and these lawyers here right?
A That's correct
Q And in addition to that you have also attended other depositions of other people in the case correct?
(2s) A Yes I have
(1) $Q$ And at times you ve suggested questions for the lawvers to I ask at these deposition have you not?
3) A Well I've attended depositions and - of Dr Mendelsohn
4) an expert witness in the case and I have advised the lawyers
durng - as an expert durng those depositions about topic matenal that might be coming up
Q Did you suggest any questions that was my question
(B) Passed notes to my - the attorney taking the deposition
9) about areas that might be coming up topic areas and I thiak I
(10) did probably suggest a question from time to time about what
(t) maght lead to further clanfication of the facts
(12) Q From time to time right?
(13) A From tume to tume
(14) $Q$ And you also participated did you not in some - shall we
(1s) call them strategy sessions with the lawyers for the
(16) plaintıffs?
(17) A I did not
(18) Q You did not? Did you help select Dr Smith who testified
(19) here the other day?
(20) A The - yes I did
(-1) Q And did you help -
1 1 A Well I dad not help select Dr bmith
(3) Q Well you suggested his name?
(-4) A I recommended Dr Smith when I was asked if I knew experts
( $\boldsymbol{S}$ ) in the field Yes I recommended his name

Vol 152293

| Q And you also suggested Dr Masters who may lestify here tomorrow? |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | A The same reason knowing ham to be an expert in tha |
| (5) | particular area I suggested his name I also suggested the names of others |
| (6) Q And so you re - are you a - could we also call you a (7) consuliant in as well as an expert in this case? |  |
|  |  |
| (8) A Well I called myself a consultant at one point in ths |  |
| (9) case in a deposition when asked because I had made these (10) recommendations |  |
| Q Do you get paid differently for being a consultant than from an expert? |  |
| A No, sar |  |
| Q Now your practice that you were talking about your current practice and I m talking about your medical practice |  |
|  |  |
| now that s - that sa one man practice in Los Angeles right' |  |
|  | A Yes it is |
|  | Q And you ve been up here since what first of May? |
|  | A No I arnved bere on I thank the 9th of May |
|  | Q Been up here since then? |
|  | A Yes |
|  | Q Who 3 minding the store? |
|  | A Sorry? |
|  | Q Back in L A |
|  | have two people who are standing in for me two |

tomorrow'
A The same reason knowing ham to be an expert in that particular area I suggested his name I also suggeated the names of others
Q And so you re - are you a - could we also call you a consuliant in as well as an experi in this case?

Well called myself a consuitant at one point in this case in a deposition when asked because I had made these commendations
from an exper?
A No, sir
Q Now your practice that you were talking about your
 A Yes it is
Q And you ve been up here since what first of May?
A No I arnved bere on I thonk the 9th of May
$Q$ Been up here since then?
A Yes

A Sorry"
A I have two people who are standing in for me two

## colleagues for emergencies as my practice is essentially an

evaluation and referral practice I have no on-going treatment
(3) responsibilities and so these physicians are standing in for
(4) me to take care of anv emergencses that might arise That's
(s) routine practice when a phrsician is away from the office

MR SANDERS Could I have a piciure of Plaintiffs
Exhibit 10 please sir?
BY MR SANDERS
Q Doctor I m going to ask that they bring up on the sereen
Planteffs Exhibil Number 10 which we ve all started to refer
to as the IDR And if you could if someone with know how
would blow up the typed portion there in the middle of the
page
MR CHALOS You need my help?
MR SANDERS No thank you Mr Chalos Thank you I can operate this
BY MR SANDERS
Q This refers right after these code numbers that you talked
about in your dirut to DSM III?
(0) AYes
rl) Q You are familiar with what DSM Ill is are you not
19 Doctor'
(23) Alam
is Q And what is - what dous DSM stand tor'
(ヶ) A Diagnostic and Statistical Manual

## Vol 152295

Q And is that a publication that is put out for doctors for diagnosis and guidance and to put - well just tell us What s the purpose of DSM?
A The Diagnostic and Statustical Manuals, it's a senes of manuals that are put out by the Amencan Psychiatric Association for - as gundes to diagnosis of psychiatric disorders They are specifically for the use of doctors, chnicians therapists insurance companies and anybody else
(9) coscermed with these matters
(10)

Q And is one of the purposes of this so everybody knows what
doctors are talking about when they say that somebody is
1 diagnosed as this or that or someihing else?
(IV) A They are guides to diagnosis
(14) $Q$ And they re also guides to understanding what a diagnosis 1191 is onct the docior has made the diagnosis aren they?
(16) A They have a symptom - they set out sugns and symptoms and
(I7) set out parameters boundaries for making a diagnosis of
(18) behavior in patients yes
(19) Q But my queation to you is people like government and 20) insurance companies and maybe even lawyers every now and then
( 1 ) will - can use this to determine what a doctor meant when he
(22) said this patient is diagnosed as a so and so night?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q Have some uniformity of definition correct?
(s) A An atternpt to acheve uniformity of definition would be a

Vol IS 2296
better way to put it
Q And DSM III has - has undergone changes has it not?
A Yes, it has
Q And in 1985 DSM III was the - the bible correct?
A That is not the way any - I've ever heard it described
(6) before In fact, it $2 s$ specifically not described as the
7) bible It is an attempt to achieve and approximate some kund
(8) of way of understandmg these very complex assues which, as Dr
(9) Gould said in his testumony are indeed complex and r (10) undefinute
(II) Q The Diagnostic and Statusucal Manual the only one of
(12) these DSMs that was in existence in 1985 in the areas that
(13) we II dealing with was DSM III right?
(14) A Of the DSMs There were other diagnostuc manuals in
(15) existeace and used widely elsewhere yes
(16) Q The only one of the DSMs was DSM III right?
(1) At that tume in 1985
(18) Q Right And then later on in Ithink 1987 there was a
(19) revision to DSM III and that was DSM III R right?
(20) A That's correct
(21) Q Now under DSM III which was in existence in 1985 did
(22) DSM III refer to alcohol dependence and alcoholism as , synonymous terms?
(9) A As I recall from DSM III in 1985 what it said was that
( si alcohol dependence was sumetımes called alcobolism

## Vol 152297

(1) Q All right In other words as you ve testified in your
(2) deposilion those were used synonymously in DSM III?
(3) A Just sand what the DSM III said yes
(4) Q Did you testify Doctor at your deposition that they re
(5) used synonymously?
(6) A Ob I beg your pardon th my deposition vou'd have to show
17) me my deposition to -
(3) Q Well look at page 197 lines liku iwn and a halt in tirsi
, word in lina live'
A Page 1977
III Q Yes sir And I ll ask you if you didn isay in theru -
(2) well let me give you a chance to get there firat Are you at page $197^{\circ}$

AYes
Q And looking on about haliway down line iwo in DSM III the
term alcoholism it is noted that the term aicoholism and
alcohol dependence are often used synonymously right? Isn I
that what you satd?
A May I just look at the context here?
Q it was kind of a side comment you made in deseribing something else Didn i you ust those words that I just read? A Well I was talking ubout -
Q Wull Doctor I m not anhing vou what vou whritalhing about
A Well I need to put it in context Mr banders

MR SANDERS Well you can ask the Court s permission
(2) for that but I would like to stick this witness particularly
(3) Your Honor to what he actually sand
(4) MR MONTAGUE I think he s entutled to put his answer (s) in context
(6) THE COURT He a entutled to have the entire answer
(7) put in if there s more to the answer than just what was cited

Is there more to the answer?
MR SANDERS Well it $s$ - he can read it if you -
the Court wishes I will need to be careful about this in
(H) other areas But there s no problem with him reading - I II
(i) read the whole answer if the Count wishes

THE COURT All right
MR MONTAGUE Your Honor maybe we ought to have a
side bar because I see that this is one of those troubled
areas we were talking about
THE COURT Weil if it gets into an area that I ve
ruled out it s going to have to stay out
(19) Doctor review your enture answer and then tell us whether
(20) or not you -

THE WITNESS I could not anawer the question without
getting into one of those areas Your Honor It is
(23) specifically mentioned here in the answer

MR SANDERS I ll move on
(2s) THE COURT Thank you sir

## Vol 152299

BYMR SANDERS
Q Well you can $\mathbf{t}$ - you can t go into the context without
gelting into these other areas You could answer the question did you say those words?
A The context is in the same sentence Mr Sanders
Q Okay okay
A Not the same paragraph or page same sentence
Q Now isn itiafact Doctor that Captain Hazelwood did
not meet the definition of alcohol dependence alcoholism in the 1985 DSM III? Isn that a fact?
A I have no idea as to whether it's a fact or not
Q Well didn t you say that about three or four times in your
deposition that he did not meet that definition?
A You'd have to show me where I said that and let me
inspect
(S) the context

MR SANDERS Can we have a side bar?
(Al side bar off the Record)
THE COURT We re going to take our second break now ladies and genulemen 1 think we have this matter sorted out but we re going the take our breah now any way to make sure
Please don thave any discussions about the case during our ruclss and we 11 reconvene in 15 minutes
THE CLERK This court is in recess for 15 minutes
(Jury out at II 55 a m)
(3) (Jury in at 1212 pm )

Vol $15 \quad 2300$
THE CLERK All nse His Honor the Court this
United States District Court is again in session
Please be seated
BYMR SANDERS
Q Dr O Connor let me attempt to repeat my last question to
you Didn $t$ you in fact say at your deposition on the 22nd ol
April 1994 that Captain Hazelwood did not in my opinion meet
the criteria under alcohol dependencv DSM III at that tume
referring to 1985 ?
A Yes, I did as you showed me
Q Now I think it s obvious but I want to make sure
2) DSM III R was not in existence in 1985 when Captain Hazelwood
(3) sought treatment was diagnosed and treated by Dr Vallury? A That's correct
Q All right And then you also mentioned another definition
or basis for your definition of alcoholism and that was one
that your society worked two years on right?
A That's correct
Q And that wasn t published until 1992 was it?
A I think it was eariner than that but certannly in the '90s yes
Q Wasn 1 it published by the Journal of American Medicine in 1992ㄱ
A No it was published onginally by the Amencan Society of Addiction Medicine in 1990 and it was commented upon dnd

## Vol is 2301

(1) republished in the Jouraal of the American Medical

## Association

(2) in 1992
(3) Q In any event whether it was five or seven years it was
4) long after 1985 correct?
s) A It was 1990 yeah
(ด) Q And certasnly a fter the grounding?
7) AYes
(8) Q Now you mentioned duning your direct that you recognized
(9) that there were - on the queation of whether someone who has
(10) had an alcohol problem can return to social drinking or (II) controlled drinking there were two schools of thought nght)
(12) A Actually, I sand that alcoholics - I was talking about
(13) alcoholics being able to return to social or controlled
(14) dranking, yes
(1s) Q Be even more true for pcople that had a drinking problum
(16) that didn $t$ reach the level of alcoholism wouldn it I would
(17) assume?
(18) A What would be more true that they could return to social (19) drolang?
(20) Q Right
( I) A Well, in my behef there is no good evidence to suggest
(72) as I said that you can tell in advance who can retura to (23) social druilung and who can't
(24) Q I understand what your position is but I monly asking you
(25) If you recognize that there is a school of thought that is not
like yours?
A Well of course there is
Q Yeah
A But in response to your question -
Q Thal was mv question There is one isn there? And you
vald moul ot the people in it are porshologists hut there are
psychialrists in that school of thought aren they?
A I mentioned them too
Q And those psychiatrists in that school of thought are in
fact well respeclud well educated highly trained doctors?
A-Tbat's true
Q And you mentioned the Rand report Now the Rand report
was a study of only alcoholics primary diagnosis of
alcoholics nght that $s$ all they studied?
A The Rand report, the subjects were mostly alcoholics, that's true
Q Mostiv weren thev all alcoholics primary diagnosis of alcoholic?
A Of alcohol dependence
Q So the answer in mv question is ves?
AYes
Q All of them were correct?
A That's true
Q Now you have told us an awful lot about AA in connection with your various and sundry opinions and you talk about

## Val is 2303

membership in AA is ther, a membership right for AA' $^{\text {P }}$ Do you get a card?
A No
Q Membership in AA is going to AA meetings correct?
A And participating in the program
Q Right?
A The other aspects of AA yes
Q But there s no formal thing as a membership in $A A^{\text {? }}$
A There is no rule for membership no
$Q$ And the fact that -
A Fxcept the desure to stop drinking
Q And as a matter of fact peopic san go to AA for whatever purpose they wish do they not?
A That's true
Q Matter of fact there are people with problems which have
nothing to do with alcohol that regularly go to $A A$ ?
A I don't know that to be a fact
Q Do you know it to be a fact that there are people who do go to AA who do not have any alcohol problem whatsoever? A I don't - I don't know anybody of that sort
Q Well when someone goes to AA AA does not ask them why
(22) they are there does it?
(r3) A AA does not have the capacity to ask anybody AA is stmply
( 4) an organization of people it has no official position to ask
(25) anybody anything
31
4) there
A I do not know of such a principle
MR SANDERS If you dindulg me just a moment Your
Honor
BY MR SANDERS
Q Let me ask you to reler to your deposition page 1372?
A1372 ${ }^{\circ}$
Q 1372 The date - it is the last volume about a month
ago Are you having trouble locating it"
A I have it here I had the wrong package Yes
Q Let me ask you af the following question was asked and the
following answer given by you afier some discussion between
the
(16) lawyers
(17) Question What if a person goes to AA and has a desire to
(18) cut down drinking, that $s$ why he goes to cut down not to stop
(19) completely and as a result of going to AA does in fact cut
(30) down on drinking would he meet the criteria undur this
( I) diagnoatic criteria if that were the case
Answar Well the answurlo that quastion the bust I wan
do is that people go to AA tor their own purposus. One of the
things about AA it never asks why a person is there Bill
Wilson the foundur of $A A$ said that what dind of an in

## Vol 152305

organication do we have thal a pursun can bu a member just because they say they are
Was that question asked and did you give that answer on Apnil the 22nd 19947
A I did but I would - I did give that answer as you read it but in the context of what comes before and afterwards I thank there would be some illumanation of that answer, but that
8) is certanily what Bill Wilson said but it couldn't affect what

I've already sand 1 belleve
Q You said that didn 1 you?
AI did say that yes and Bill Wilson satd it too
Q Now you va also menuonad demal Weil lul me bach up
I gol unc more question on AA The lati that a persongocs to
AA or the lath that a pursun is rulerrad to AA is wriatnly not
the equivalent of a diagnosis of alcohol dependence is it? A Nu it as not
Q All nght Let me goto denal In fact Doctor denal is universal in the psychology of almost all individuals that you re familiar with?
A Yes it is
Q All of us have denial?
A That strue
Q All of us expuricncu dunal?
A That's true
Q It sadefens. mechanism inn it?
(1) A As I sand it was yes
(1) Q And it s by no means a condition specific to alcohol
(3) probiems is it?
(4) A No It exists in other problems as well
tsi Q Now let me understand let all of us understand what
(6) you re doing here What you ve testified to
(7) Captain Hazelwood went to treatment at a psychsatric
(8) hospital is that correct is that a fair characterization of
(9) South Oaks?
(10) A An alcoholism treatment unit in a psychatnc hospital
(山) It's a comprehensive psychological treatment center
(12) Q Comprehensive alcohol treatment center diagnoatic alcohol
(13) treatment center?
(14) A Correct
(1s) Q Did that in 1985 ?
(16) A That's correct
(17) Q And when he went in there he was seen treated for 28
(18) days?
(19) A In a 28 day aicoholisum rehabilitation program
(30) Q Stayed there for 28 days?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q And his treating physician Dr Vallury - can I have PX10
(23) again - made a diagnosis correct?
(7) A That's correct
(5) $Q$ And that doctor $s$ diagnosis was right up here on this IDR

## Vol 152307

[^24]still a provisional diagnosis
Q As far as that IDR s concerned?
A As far as the IDR's concerned yes
Q Now you have never had Captain Hazelwood as a patient have you?
A No I have not
Q And you have never seen him except in this courtroom or maybe out there in the hallway have you?

## A That's true

Q And moreover you re using a definition that wasn teven in
existence in the DSM III at the time the doctor made the diagnosis isn that a fact?
A In the DSM III the diagnosis of alcohol abuse episodic was
(14) in existence as also dependence And as I said earher on
(is) Dr Gould - the terms alcoholnsm alcohol abuse were in (16) generat use clinical use widely used unterchangeably, even
(17) though the parameters in the DSM III were as they - are as
(18) we're discussing but the terms alcoholssm alcoholic and so on
$(19)$ were even then very widely used interchangeably In fact the
(ro) reference here on the IDR is indeed to alcoholism on the IDR
( I) lectures for alcoholism
(2) Q Doctor let me try it again The definition that you gave
(23) this jury just this morning was a definition that you said came
(4) from your society that worked on it in 1990 isn that
(2s) correct?


Vol is 2310
buing general now 1 m not being speufic because $i$ don 1
recall Captain Hazelwood or his treatment or what I told him Do you remember that?
A Well he said he would say to anybody that they should have
(s) lifetume abstunence a day at a tume and he said be would say
that generally but he said it would indeed apply to Captan
Hazelwnod He didn't use him by name but be imphed that
Q You inicred it he didn icomply it
A No he complies it through his IDA His prescription here
is for-AA which is obviously for abstinence aftercare and
his
(") prescription for lectures on alcoholism and he
recommends
i) lifetime abstanence for people with that diagnosis

Q Are you finished Doctor?
AYes 1 am
Q Let me ask you about your testımony about Exxon Now do
you believe it is good for a company to have an alcohol
policy?
A Yes I do
Q And do you believe it s good for a company to prohibit the
use of alcohol on company properiv like a ship?
AYes Ido
' Q You agrel with that don 1 you' And do you believe that
1 31 il s good for a company to encourage peoplu who think they
may
(4) have a problem to come forward for treatment to get help?
(2s) A Yes I do

## Vol 19 2311

Q And do vou helieve it is gnod forithat company which has
) encouraged those people to come forward to treat the fact that
they camb forward the fact of whatever the problem is and whatevertreatment they get as a matter of confidentiality?
, That a gond isn 1 it?
(6) A When they come forward and are describing their problems in
(7) a medical sense and in the therapeutic sense of the employee
(8) assistance program confidentality should be mantained

Q And it also is good is it not for a company to say to a
(10) person who came forward that the fact that you re coming
(11) forward is not going to jeopardize your job secunty or your
(12) job future that mere fact that you came forward and sought
(13) help for a problem isn 1 that good?
114) A Well that depends
(1s) Q WLll did you say il depundud in your deposition or did
(16) you say that il was good for no employee - for no employee to
(17) have job security or future job opportunities jeopardized
(18) because of treatment?
(19) A Yes In general I think that's the case, but I say it
(20) depends because there are some small exceptions to that

But
(21) in general it is the case
(22) $Q$ It is the case?
(23) A Yes
(24) $Q$ And it s also good is it not for supervisors of employees
who have had problems and had Ireatment and had aftercare
for
8) performance in recovery when they know that an undividual
has
(9) been in rehabilitation and part of his responsibulity as a (0) professional is to comply with the recovery requirements,
well as the ordinary requirements of his job In that case, people who are workung with him ought to know of course about his rehabilitation and ought to be in a position not to make a diagnosis, because that's a medical fuaction, but certanly to oversee and supervise not only hus strict job (6) performance, part of his job performance after rehabilitation
(17) becomes responsible performance in recovery, which must be then
(18) supervised
(19) $Q \ln$ light of that and in light of your icsimmony that you
(-0) gave about what Exxon would have sucn - by the way did you
(I) ever talk to any Exxon people about what thev saw) is
( $\because$ ) A beg your pardon'
(-3) Q Did you cvertalh io any ul thas Exxun poupla?
A A No 1 didnut
(2s) Q But in light of what you ve said about those pcople that

## Vol $15 \quad 2313$

you never talked to or met and in light of what you just said let me ask you about your own experience Now you - you
diagnosed yourself as an alcoholic in 1977 that s your
testimony?
A 1976
Q 7677 whatcvar 76 now'
A Well I diagaoned minelf an au alcoholic and left my jub at
UCl A because of that dayguosis and in the perind between
November 1976 when I resigned my faculty position at UCLA
(10) because of the trouble in my life because of my alcoholism I
(1) then - It was two or three months before I joined AA but by
'1 ) that time I had diagaosed myself as an alcobolic My subnety
(13) date was 1977
(14) Q 77?
(1s) A Yeah
(16) Q That s what causcd inc to wondur dbout that
(17) A 1 understand
(18) Q You didn 1 go inio any treatmanl did you'
(ly) A No I did not I went straight to Alcobolics Anoaymous
(0) Q And -

1 11 A At that time 1 had treatmeat later on
(2י) Q And in 1980 I believe you applied for a mudical license
(-3) in California?
(24) A That's true
(25) $Q$ And at the time that you applied you didn t tell them you

5-23-94 VOLUME 15
(1) were an alcoholic did you?
2) A Nobody asked me
(3) Q But you didn t tell them did you?
(4) A There was no way to do so
(5) Q Just absolutely impossible for you to have communicated
(6) that fact to the authorities in Califorma?
(7) A I was a recovering alcoholic with three years of sobnety
(8) at the tume, and there was no partucular reason to tell anybody
(9) about that
(10) Q And I believe also in 1980 you appited for a palot s
(11) license?
(12) A That's true
(13) Q All right Now would you agree with me Doctor that a
(14) physician who has the authority the power the privilege to
(1s) preacribe medication to patients and to see patients who have
(6) trouble in their lives is a safety sensitive job?

1) A Yes, mdeed
2) Q And I ansume you would likewise agree with me that a pilot
of an airplane of whatever size, is in a safety sensitive job
correct?
A That's correct
(ר) $Q$ And when you applied for your FAA license you didn tell , them you were an alcoholic did you?
(74) A There was no requrement that 1 should do so 1 told them 5) later on in 1983 There was no requrement in 1980 that I

## Vol 152315

should do so
Q Doctor did you tell them? Did you tell them?
A There was no requrement that I should do so
Q Yes or no?
A I did not There was no way I could have told them
Q Now after you became a doctor - well at some point you
did itll the California authorilics that you were a recovering
alcoholic rught?
A That's correct
Q And that sthe medical authorities within a year or so when you - they were hiring you to do some of this work with treatment at that point you did tell them?
A They were not huring me I was doing voluntary work at that tame for the Cahformia State Diversion Program
Q All right You eveniually told the FAA too when they
hired you to be a consultant that you were a recovering alcoholic?
A That's not true I told the FAA that I was an alcohoinc when I was first asked to see pilots and I felt that because of the integrity of my position that I should not see any pilot for an evaluation in a safety sensitive position without divulging by alcoholism to the FAA At that tume there was
requirement that a self diagnosed alcoholic should report anything to the FAA The requrement was if you've bad a diagnosis of alcoholism in a medical chart And when I was
(i) asked to see the first alcoholic pulot who was paying his fees
() not hured by the FAA I first of all asked - went to the
(3) medical drrector of the FAA and sand I'm a recovering
(s) alcoholic with now five years of sobnety, what should I do?

Should I have a letter of authonty in order to confirm mv
professional integrity" And I was given a sanction by the FAA
7) to perform that particular evaluation And since then I have
worked closely with the FAA with full knowledge of my
recovery, and they asked me to demonstrate as a matter of
fact to them the reality of my successful recovery at that
tume before they said go ahead
$Q$ Isn $t$ it a fact Doctor that the FAA never monitored you?
A Monitonng was decided - it was decided that monitonng was not necessary because of my demonstrated five years of
(IS) successful recovery in Alcoholics Anonymous
Q And isn it a fact Doctor that the State of Califormia the medical authority never monitored you?
A Medical authonty hired me because I was a recovenng alcoholic and in other areas at least permitted me to work voluntanly for them because I was a recovering alcoholic who
( i) did not require monitoring because of demonstrated recovery in
( Alcohohes Anonymous
(23) Q They didn 1 monitor you did they?
(24) A There was no witness for them to do so and they didn't
(-s) MR SANDERS Can i have just a moment Your Honor?

```
BY MR SANDERS
Q There s one piece of confusion here Didn II understand
you to say that an alcoholic is never cured?
A Once an alcoholic always an alcoholic yes
MR SANDERS Nofurther questions
THE COURT Redirect?
MR MONTAGUE Noquestions Your Honor
THE COURT Thank you Dr O Connor You may step
down
MR O NEILL Your Honor we re going to play the
videotaped deposition of Ben Graves and jusi so that there s
no confusion or tumult in the courtroom the deposition goes on
for a while and then the witness looks different to an extent
to where you don I think il s the same guy It is the same
person Mr Graves was deposed in one setling and then three
weeks later he was deposed again and his phyamcal
pearance
(17) Is different so just so that when you see it you don tsay
(18) they goofed up on this tape I didn I goof up on the tape
(19) THECOURT Okay
(20) MR O NEILL I didn igoof up
(21) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF BENJAMIN GRAVES (VIdeo)
(22) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(23) Q Mr Graves, for the record would you atate your full name
) please?
A Benjamin Carter Graves Jr
```

Q Sir where do vou
Q where do vou currently reside?
A I reside in Kingwood Texas
Q Could you tell us by whom you re currently employed?
A Exxon Company USA
Q And in 1984 you were transferred to Exxon Shipping
Company
here in Houston?
AYes
Q Did you request that transfer?
ANo Itwas -
Q-Was that considered a promotion demotion any change in status at all?
A It wasn't a demotion It was either a lateral move or a promotion I don't remember
Q And what was the title you were to assume in 1984 with
Exxon Shipping Company?
A Administratuve manager
Q What were your duties as administrative manager with Exxon
Shipping Company in 1984 through 19867
A I was basically the human resource organization for
Fxxon
(3) Shipping Company
(1) Q Can you be a little more specific as tar as what your
(2) duties with human resource would entail at that time?
: 3) A Well it involved the labor relations activities
compensation benefit adminustration general personnel
activity manpower accounts let's see there was a personal

Vol 192319
staff I was involved in some rafetv and envirnamental issues
() I thuok that's about it

Q Within the parameters of your duties during that time
frame were vou concerned with the safety and prevention of oll
spills and safety of vessels and their crew?
A Oh well I guess everyone in the company is concerned
about
(7) those types of things It wasn't one of our prumary
functions
Q Not a primary function but certatnly something that you
were of course cognitive of and concerned about?
A I'm sure
"1) Q And then in July of 1986 you went back to Exxon US A?
A Yes
(14) Q Since 86 - you might have airuady told me this I
"15 apologi/n if you have Sincl 1986 have you held the same
(16) position?
(17) A Yes
(18) Q Have your duties changed al all?
(19) A Well, the organization's expanded quite a bit, but the
(20) essential dutses are the same
(21) $\mathbf{Q}$ Whale you were adminiatrative manager with Exxon Shipping
(22) Company did you work with the drug and alcohol policy in
(23) exastence for the company at that tume?
(24) A What do you mean work with?
(25) Q Well were you familiar with the policy?

AYes yes
QMr Graves let me hand you what we just had marked as
Exhibit 31876 and ask you if that s a copy of the drug and
alcohol policy in ixislunt for Exxon Shipping Company as of
September 28 1984？
A That＇s what it says yes
Q Do you recognize this exhibil to be that drug and alcohol policy？
A Yes
（10）Q Do you recall whether this particular policy Exhibit
（11） 31876 issued September $28 \quad 1986$ contantad any what you would
（12）consider material changes for the drug and alcohol policy
（13）exisung for Exxon Shipping Company prior to the issuance of （14）this document？
（1s）A I really don＇t know My recollection is that the policy （16）from 1979 through this duration was essentially the same kind
（17）of policy
（18）Q If you would for the record would you read the first （19）sentence on the complete policy underneath the heading number
（20）One policy？
（1）A The company recognazes alcoholism as a treatable allness，
（ A）charactenzed by an inability to control the repeated
（23）consumptron of alcohol causing ampairment of job performance
（24）$Q$ Is that the－is that your undersianding of the company s
（ 9 ）definition of alcoholism throughoul vour time as adminisirative

[^25]（H）it was generally understood through Exxon Shipping Company and
（）other Exxon organzations that the company operates on an opell
（3）door pohcy If you＇ve got a problem talk to somebody dbout
（4）it
（9）Q And are you aware of whether the licensed officera or crew
（6）people were informed of these opportunities to report masters
（7）who had violated the Exxon Shipping Company drug and alcohol
（8）policy？
（9）A I don＇t know that they were informed My－my
assumption
（10） 15 that they knew they could
（11）Q You don t base that assumption on any particular facte？
（12）A No
（13）Q During your time as adminstrative manager are you aware
（14）of any crew members or heensed officers reporting alcohol
（15）abuse by a master of a vessel to management？
（16）A Well，that was－I was aware of one case where there was
（17）an allegation
（18）Q Mr Graves let me hand you what s been marked as Exhibit
（19） 31880 and ask if you can identify that document？
（20）A Yes，I can
（21）Q And what is that sir？
（22）A It＇s a report that I sssued－
（23）Q This document Exhibit 31880 is a document you created？
（24）A Yes
（－s）$Q$ And the last paragraph in this memo does deal with Captain

## Vol 152323

（1）Hazelwood s use of alcohol on board a vessel？
（2）A That＇s right
（3）Q Would you read that last paragraph for the record please？
（4）A I asked Joe if he ever drank aboard the shop He commented
（5）that he occasionally drank aboard the ship but not frequently
（6）He also indicated that he came back to the ship from port drunk
（7）on several occasions
（8）Q Let me agk you Mr Graves did Captan Hazelwood say to
（9）you that he Captain Hazelwood had come back to the ship from
（10）port drunk on several occasions？
（II）AYes
（12）$Q$ Let me ank the question again then Do you recall whether
（13）Captain Hazelwood aaid anything to you regarding alcohol other
（14）than that he drank aboard the ship and that he came back to the
（IS）ship from port drunk on several occasions？
（16）A Nothing specific no
（17）Q Did you ask Captain Hazelwood what time frame it was that
（18）hu would have ether drank aboard the ship or come back to the
（191 ship from pori drunk？
（ข）A Trysig to thank And I can＇t be sure，but generally
（－1）speaking，my impression from Joe was that this was－when 1
（22）say historical I mean not necessanly current day situations，
（23）but back several years back in his earier career in the＇70s，
（24）early＇ 80 s kind of thing
（2s） Q Was he able to tell you which ports il was that he would
come back to the ship in an intoxicated condition?
A I didn't ask hum that
Q How is it determined that your report would be directed to these three individuals W J Davis law department Frank Iarossa and Paul Revere?
A Just seemed logical Iarossi is the president of the
company Revere is the vice-president of the company Bill
Davis was the attorney involved both our - some of our labor
(9) relation actuvities as well as any personnel type issues we had
(10) to deal with including harassment disability and et cetera

Q During the same time frame did you have any conversations
with Frank larossi regarding Captain Hazelwood s alcohol rehabilitation?
A Well I think - I think shortly after the May 28th letter I thunk Frank asked me to reconfirm again what the company policy was on employees completing rebabulitation And and
(17) I think as a result of that request of Frank's and the ordinary
(18) follow up, what you do in a situation like this I contacted
(19) the HR department and contacted the medical department to give
( 0) Frank back a complete story
(a) $Q$ And would vou just tell us generally what the aubstance ( 7 ) of the conversation was with Dr Montgomery?
(_3) A Well generally the substance was was the metical
(74) department aware that Hazelwood had been in rehabilatation and
(2s) the answer was yes to that and that he told me that
Hazelwood

## Vol 152325

(1) had completed has rehabilitation successfully And that Joe
() was attending AA meetings on a regular basis I don't remember,
(3) Ithak he said three times a week or something like that I (4) thank I said be'd successfully completed the program and that
(s) was about the sum and substance of the conversation
(6) Q Did Mr Iarossi ask you to do anything else in regards to
7) follow up on the issue of Capiain Hazelwood s alcohol rehabilitation?
A I don't know whether it was at that particular time or ) subsequent to that but Frank asked me to ensure that John Tompluns the gulf coast fleet manager connsel with Joe before
(12) he went back aboard a shup as a master
(13) Q Let me ask it again Was at your understanding that
(14) Captain Hazelwood attending the AA meetings was a part of his
(IS) alcohol rehabilatation program?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q For instance was there anyone at Exxon Shipping Company
(18) who was asagned to your knowledge asaigned the duty to make
(19) sure that Captain Hazelwood was attending his AA meetıngs?
(20) A Not to my knowledge
(21) Q Was there anyone within Exxon Shipping Company who was
(22) assigned the task of monitoring Captain Hazelwood during his
(23) leave of absence tume to determine whether he was drinking or
(24) not?
(25) A Not that I'm aware of

III Q Was there a concern?
(-) A Well agan it's hard to answer that question in today's
(3) environment Probably not
(4) Q After Exxon Shipping Company had learned through Captain
(9) Hazelwood s own admission that he had drank while aboard the

161 vessels and that he had gone through alcohol rehabilitation
(7) was it a concern at any time after that that Captain Hazelwood
(8) may be drinking whether it s on board the vessel or at home?
(9) A Oh I'm sure that some of Captan Hazelwood's

## supervisors

(10) were interested and concerned about that
111) Q Ohay
(1) A I certanaly would have assumed that they were any way
(13) Q Did you have anv conversations with Frank larossi regarding (14) that topic?
(15) A Oaly to the extent that Frank asked me to be sure that John
(16) Tompkins counseled with Hazelwood before he was reassigned to a
(17) vessel That his assignment travel plans routed hım through
(18) Houston so that he in fact could talk with John before being
(19) assigned to the vessel and John was to counsel with Captam
(20) Hazelwood about maintaning his non driaking status and to be a
' I) solid employee and manager of the ship
(2י) Q You say non drinking status Does that mean non drinking
i is status hoth on board the vessel and off the vissel?
(-4) A I presume from an alcoholic standpoint once you are
you
(25) can't pick up a drink thereafter I don't know That's just

Vol $15 \quad 2327$
what I hear But John wes to advise ham that any sofractions
that the companv became aware of would subject Captan
Hazelwood and subject ham to disciplane up to and including terminution
Q Did vour conversations with Frank larosai regarding this
topit intiude conversalions that onte vou re an alcoholic you
can I pisk up another drink -
A No
$Q$ - that ahstincnce was important?
ANo
Q Did you ever have any conversations like that with
Mr larossi?
A No
Q Did you take any steps to attempt to determine the extent of Captain Hazelwood a alcoholsam?
A No, that would have been the medical department, if they
I mean wouldn't be something I would be able to evaluate
Q Do you know whether they attempted to evaluate that?
A I have no idea what conversations took place between
our
201 medical department and his facility
Q Did you speak with anyone in an attempt to discover generally what $s$ involved with alcohol rehabilitation? A No Again, I don't consider myself an expert in that It's like whether I know whether the ship is being navigated properly or not It mean it's a doctor's prerogatuve as far
（1）as I＇m concerned
Q Did you speak with anyone in an attempt to determine （3）information regarding how from a human resources perspective a

4）company should deal with an alcoholic？
（s）A Not that I can recall
6）Q Did you speak with either Frank larosai or Paul Revere
regarding how the company should deal with Caplain Hazelwood
（3）having gone through alcohol rehabilitation and reporting bach to work？
A I don＇t recall speaking specifically to them about it I i）mean it＇s－alcoholism as $a$－as the company viewed it is a 2）treatable illneas，is kind of a job performance issue as much ）as anythung else and you know，how a person＇s llness affects
（14）therr ability to do thear job is part of the on going
（IS）supervisory responsubilities that any supervisor in the company
（16）would have，stay close，you know，close to observe the employee
（17）as possibly and determme what their performance levels
dre
1181
（1）｜
（20）
（21） （ニ） back
（23）aboard the vessel to let ban know that his performance was
24）goang to be watched and the company wished him well and
s）expected bum to have a full and total rehabilatation

## Vol is 2329

（1）Q Do you know what background if any John Tompkins has in 2）regard to problems associated with alcoholism？

A No I don＇t
Q Do you know whether John Tumpkins sought the advict of anyone to determine guncrally ihc problcms assuciated with alcoholism or how a company generally should deal with an alcoholic employee？
A I don＇t know You＇d have to ask Mr Tompkins that Q Was there any discusaion that you were a party to with either Mr larossi or Mr Revere where it was diacusaed whether Captain Hazelwood should have a shore side assignment at least
（1－1 inalially？
いい A No
（14）$Q$ is il your testimony that you believe a shore side
I，axsignment would have hetn punitive in nature？
A No I do not belave it would have beed puntive in nature
Q Do you believe a shore side assignment would have violaied
the alcohol poluy＂
A No
Q it s just a subject that nuvercamb up as far as you know＇
A As far as I know
Q After your May 191985 conversation with Joc Hasclwood did you have any further cunversations with him rugarding ethur his rehabilitation or his ubc of alcohol on vessels＇ A Not that I recall I guess it＇s pussable but the only
（1）significant conversation I remember with Joe was the interview
2）that I did with him on May 19th
（3）Q From the summer of 1985 untal you left Exxon Shipping
（4）Company did you have any involvement whatsoever regarding
（5）follow up on Captain Hazelwood and his alcohol rehabilitation？
（6）A Did I？No
（7）Q And did you ever ask Captain Hazelwood any questions about

8）his home life？
9）$A$ No
（10）Q And do you have any knowiedge of either Mr Tompkina or
（11）Mr Sheehy or anyone who was watching Captain Hazelwood
asking
（12）him questions about his home life？
（13）A No
（14）Q Do you have any knowledge of anyone ever from the tume
（15）Captain Hazelwood returned from his leave of absence up to
the
（16）time of the grounding，of anyone asking Captain Hazeiwood
（17）whether he had resumed drinking？
A I have no knowledge of that
Q Did Captain Hazelwood tell you that he had come back to the
ship drunh on several occasions？
1 A Yes
Q Did you ask him on how many occasions he was referring to
whether it was five umes ten umes 20 umes？
（74）A No，I did not
（25）Q And did you ask him when these occasions had occurred？

## Vol 15 2331

，AIdon＇t recall asking ham specifically，no
（2）$Q$ And did he tell you specifically when these occasions had occurred？
A Not that I recall
Q And did you－was il your understanding that attendance at
AA meetings was－by a recovering alcoholic was an important element in the rehabilitation program？
A Our presumption is that that would be a reasonable thing
for any substance abuse person to be anvolved in，some
contunueng support actavity
Q Between mid May and August did anyone monstor whether
was going to AA meetings three tumes a week？
AI don＇t know
Q As he had indicated？
AI don＇t know that they did or did not
Q Did you suggest to anyone that that might be a good idea？
Al personally did not no
Q Was that matter discussed by anyone to your knowledge？
A Not to my knowledge
Q Now did you understand that that outside doctor would be
making a decision as to whether or not Captain Hazelwood was
fil to return to duty as a master of an Exxon vessel？
）A Well，my memory＇s a luttle fuzzy on the disability
situations but I think the outside doctor may be able to take
a position that the person is fit for duty，but generally
speaking someone in our medical department mav have the authority to approve overrule or say yes or no to that
Q All nght Now no one at Exxon Shipping to your
knowledge had any contact with the - the outside doctor who
was treating Captain Hazelwood is that correct?

## A Not to my knowledge

Q To your knowiedge however someone in the medical staff
Exxon US A did have contact with this outside physician is that correct?
A That was my understandıng yea
Q And was it your understanding that that intermediate
from - that person from the Exxon US A medical staff was
Dr Montgomery or someone else?
A As I recall I was unclear as to whether that person was
Dr Montgomery or someone on the medical staff Dr Montgomery
was the person I talked to
Q And Dr Montgomery is the person who said to you that in my judgment Captain Hazelwood is fit to return to duty?
A I guess he told me that he had completed his program in the
$20)$ hospital he was continuing to go to the AA sessions and had
211 done what he should do relative to the rehabilitation effort
Q Did Dr Montgomerv indicate to you that anyone from Exxon
U S A s medical staff had interviewed Captain Hazelwood since he had undertaken this rehab course?
A No he did not

## Vol 152333

Q Were you ever laboring under the impression that anyone from Exxon US A s medical staff had any contact with Captain Hazelwood concerning his medical treatment after he entered the
rehab clinic?
A No
Q Do you know if any system was set up at that juncture to
advise othere what to do in the event Captain Hazetwood relapsed into drinking?
A No I'm not sure what system was or was not in place
Q What system was implemented to closely monitor Captain
Hazelwood while he - while he was out al sea?
A I do not know
Q Was any system of closely monitoring Captain Hazelwood at sea ever discussed with you?
A Not with me
Q Did you ever hear of any discussion that anyone had with regard to establishing a monitoring syatem for Capiain
Hazelwood while he was at sea?
(19) A No
(20) Q How about shore side was any monitoring system discussed (21) concerning Captain Hazelwood a behavior and performance while
(22) he was not at sea?
(23) A Not with me It may have been discussed in the operations
(24) group, but not - I don't recall anything about it
(25) MR SERDAHELY Your Honor we have no cross of this

## witness

THE COURT All right
MR O NEILL I get to do the videotapes today
Something I mable to handle The plantiffs call Willam
Deppe by videotape deposition
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM DEPPE (Video) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Captain Deppe what is your first recollection of hearing about the Exxon Valder on March 24th 1989?
A I got a phone call from Paul Mvers eariv that morning telhnf-rte that the vensel had gone aground near Bligh

## Reef

(I) Q And who s Paul Myers?
(13) A Paul Myers 15 a ship group coordinator and in the west (14) coast fleet office
(IS) $Q$ What happened after that?
(16) A I helped arrange for flaghts up to Alaska for fiarvey
(17) Borgen Paul Myers and myself We-we-I packed a bag and
(18) shortly after that drove to Oakland 'Aurport and met them at
(9) Oakland and we flew up to Alaska
(20) Q Okay And was il Harvey or Dave Borgen?
(21) A Harver

1-1 Q Harvev Borgen And what was his position at the time?
${ }^{1231}$ A He was the west coast fleet manager
(4) Q And what position did you have at that time with Exxon?
(2s) A I was a shap group conrdinator

## Vol 152335

Q Before we get to your conversation with the senior
officers what positions have vou heid with Exxon from the ime
you startid just to the best of your racoliection?
A I ve heen third mate through master on different veasels
that $f \times x$ on $s$ had I've been an analyst in the west coast
office I've also been a port captan and a ship group
coordinator in the west coast office
Q Now during 1982 and 1989 March what other duties did you
9) have ocher than being a master on a ship?
(10) A 1987 I was assigned as port captan in the west coast
(II) fleet office From 1988 -
(12) Q Was port captain what?
(13) A Port captan in the west coast fleet office
(1a) $Q$ Let me stop you there for a second What were your duties
(IS) as port - port capiain in the west coast office?
$(161$ A Port captan was somewhat as an advisor type position
(17) It's someone who would handle professional topics and
(18) operatuonal type topics for the fleet manager and deal with the
(19) deck operations on board the vessel, things that relate to (20) navigation the cargo operations with our vessels on the west
(21) coast
(22) $Q$ In thet job do you have to - or did you interact with
(23) other captans other masters?
(24) A Yes
(25) Q In what way did you interact with them?

Vul 152336
A I'd go aboard and talk to them about company policies mstruct them on what - what the latest directives might be from the company or information that they might want to disseminate throughout the fleet I would go on board and do
stewardship reviews with the - with the semor personnel on
board for end off the year reviews and mid year reviews If
there were any operational type problems or meadents that
might have occurred, I would - I would go do an inveatugation
on - or I might be asked to do an investigation on those types
(10) of things If there are any personnel type problems on board,
(II) I might be asked to get tnvolved in trying to find out what
(2) happened and settle these types of things

Q How long did you hold that pusition'
A Untll early 1988
Q And then what happened in 1988 ?
A The - the job was changed to a different concept and the
port captans became ship group coordinators
Q Ship group -
A Courdınators
Q And did you taki on the job thenas -
A Yes
Q - ship group coordinator'
AI did
Q To what extent did the dutics change with the job if at all?

## Vol $15 \quad 2337$

A As a shap group coordinator the - the captans and chief engueers reported to the shap group coordinator at that pront
(3) became more of a line position than a staff position so mstead of the sensor officers reporting to the leet manager they reported to the ship gruup coordinator for the ship 50 unstead as port captan I didn thave captaios reporting to me
17) directly as ship group courdinator I did I also got more unolved un engineering type operations Previously the chief
engineers reported to port engineer or at least dealt with the
(10) port engineer for engineering type problems and the ship group
II, coordinator handled buth deck and engine type problems on board
(1) the vessel
(13) Q You held that job for how long?
(1s) A Let me see Untul January 1991
(15) Q And what job did you take on in 91 ?
(16) A I weat back to sea was captain of the txxon I ong Beach
u71 Well actually I wus captain of the $\mathrm{F} \times \times \operatorname{lon}$ Mediterranean first
"18) and then I went to the Long Beach after that
(19) Q What was your alcohol polity in 1987 by your I mean
(20) Exxon?
(i) A Are you talksing about the corporate policy"
(22) Q Corporate policy yes
(23) A From what I understand, the policy the way it applied to
(_d) the shapping company was that anyone who was caught drunk or -
ist or with alcohol on board on board the versel would be
termanated from the vessel At that point it would - the
case would be referred to a - a review type board and they -
in I think Houston here and a decision would be made about disciplining that person
Q In doing the reviews that you referred to as a port
captain it was part of your job to keep an eye on the captains
and the masters to make sure they didn idrink on board or have
alcohol on board ship?
A Well, it - that was - that would be part of the job,
(10) yes

山) Q And would part of your job be to montor any captans or (12) masters who might be suspected of having a drinking problem?
(13) A Part of the job is to momitor all the masters and chef (14) enganeers to - if anyone is having a probiem with anything
to
(15) do something about it
(16) Q In any tume did anyone or anything make you aware that
(17) Captain Hazelwood might have a drinking problem?

A I knew that Captan Hazelwood had been through a rehabihtation program
Q Did you know what the rehabilitation program was for?
(21) A Yeah, it seemed to be pretty common knowledge in the
fleet
(') that Captan Hazelwood had been through a rehabihtation program for alcohol
(74) Q What was the basis for your knowiedge that Captain (2s) Hazelwood had been through an alcohol rehabilitation program?

## Vol 152339

A I don't know how I found out I just knew
Q That would be back - do you remember the tume that was?
A It was - it was before I got in the office as port captann
Q Now during the lime that you were either port captain or shipping group coordinator were you given any inatructions regarding the monitoring of Captain Hazelwood?
A Not that I can recall
Q I don I mean this in an argumentative way but when you say
not that I tan recall you ve had a long time to think of
this Can you - does any situation at all occur to you where somebody in Exxon Shipping or Exxon or Exxon U S A asked you
(13) or asked anyone else about whom you have knowledge to keep an
(14) bye on Captain Hazelwood in regard to his - regard to his (1S) drunking?
(16) A I knew that he had been through rehabilitation How I
(17) found out about it I'm not sure If a conversation took place (18) in the office with anyone about it I- it didn't stand out un (19) my mind because I knew already but I - I was aware of
(30) Hazelwood's problem and I would have been aware of hm (21) drinking if I was in a situation with him and he was drinking (.) I would have - that would have been something that would have
(23) stood out in my mend
(24) $Q$ At the tume that the alcohol policy was issued which you
(25) deseribed carlier was there any discussion on monitoring any
employees or officers who were thought to have an alcoholic problem?
A No
Q In the various meetings that you attended in 19 - in 1987
up to the time of the grounding do you recall any discussions
about monitoring persons that were thought or known to have alcoholic problems?
A No
Q Did any of your superiors ever ask you to keep - to
monitor or keep your eye on Captain Hazelwood in regard to any
(1) drinking problems?

A Not that I can recall
Q During the same period of time have you - did anyone ever
bring to your attention any complaint regarding Captain
Hazelwood?
A From 1987 -
Q To the ume of -
A - to the tume of the spill'
Q Yeah
A In a disciphnary nature?
Q Any nature
(2) A Well there was some complants about some of his
(73) management style but those were - those were in rankug
type
(24) sttuations But as far as any disciplanary type things there
(2s) was nothing brought to my attention dunig that penod

## Vol 152341

(1) Q If you know during the same period of time 87 through
(2) the spill was anyone Exxon Exxon Shipping or Exxon U S A
given an asaignment to keep an eye on Captain Hazelwood
relating io drinking problems?
A No I wasn't aware of anyone
Q Now you have - you have taken vessels through the Valder Narrows is that correct?
AYes
Q Have you ever taken vessels through the Valder Narrows when
(10) you weren t on deck at the time?
(II) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER On deck?
(12) THE WITNESS On the bridge
(13) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(1a) Q On the bridge I m sorry
(15) A No
(16) Q Did you consider it to be your obligation or your duty to
(i7) be on the bridge during the time that you - during the tumes
(18) that you trans - that you ve taken a ship through Valdez
(19) Narrows?
(20) A Yes
(21) $Q$ The question was when you were - you were in a
(22) supervisory capacity did - would not you expect any
(23) reasonably prudent captain to be on the bridge during such a (24) transit?
(25) A I would expect most captans would be on the bridge dunng
thosetransits ves
Q Since - 1 m going to read a question and answer and ask
you if this is atill vour opinion 1 m tooking at the
hearings page 1096 Question is could you tell me what Exxon
does 10 ensure that six hours of rest are given to ship $s$
personnel to the deck watch officer prior to getting underway
Answer we don thave any program to give six hours of rest to any dock - deck hand or officer before we get underway On the ships that I ve been on we mahe sure that - or I ve been made sure that once we have taken departure if no one has had
(19) rest then III stav up on the hridge and I II stand the watch
(13) until someone who has had enough rest to come and take the
(14) watch and meet the law
(ISi Still belteve that s a correct answer?
(16) A Yes
an Q You still stand by that answer right?
(18) A Yes I'll elaborate a little bit on that
(19) Q Sure
(20) A The master and the individual officer is responsible to
(21) make sure that he's getting that rest also
(22) Q Let me turn to our designation Number 32 which is a
(23) letter - no it s not it samemo dated July 15th 1986 and
(24) called west coast fleet letter $10 / 86$ vessel physical and
(25) operating condition report and it saddressed to masters of

## Vol 152343

(1) Exxon Shipping Company weat coast fleet owned vessels and
(2) it sagned by A P Martineau Have you seen this? That is
(3) now Exhihit 39606 I believe
(4) A Yes I've seen thas
(s) Q Do you have pilotage license?
(f) A No I don't
(7) Q For the Vaides Narrows?
(8) A No
(y) $Q$ Who on your ship had one when you were taking ships or (10) taking vessels up to -1 m sorry through the Valdez area
(II) Prince William Sound?
(I) A Before the accident?
(13) Q Yeah
(14) A The - there were several cases where the chief mate had
(is) pulotage and there were a couple of cases where no one had (16) plotage on board
(in $Q$ And when no one had pilotage what rules if any did you (18) follow?
(19) A When we made our precall or our check in there was an

1201 extended list of questions that was asked that we had to
answer
(21) compared to vessels that did have plotage Between Cape
( -) Huchinbrook and Montague Island we were required to check 10
(23) every ten minutes where a vessel with pilotage was not
(14) required to do that
(2s) We were also not allowed to enter I believe if the

Vol 152344
visibility was less than two mules and we had to pick up the pulot at Bligh Reef mstead of at Rocky Pount I think those were the differences
Q And what were the regulations leaving Valdez or without anyone on board with pilotage who met the pilotage requirements?
A The plot would - the Alaska state palot would stay on board tull Bligh Reef and we would make the check in every ten
minutes between Montague Island and Cape Hinchobrook and I
10, beheve those are the only two differences
Q Now you testified earice that il was common knowiedge in
the fleet that Hazelwood had been through alcohol
rehabilatation do you recall that?
AYes
Q When you made that statement when do you believe it was common knowledge?
A In 1986 and 1987
Q So it was well known within the fleet at least by the time
of the meeting in 1988 thal you were present al where he was
ranked?
A Yes
Q Was the subjucl of Ha/clwood s having bucn through alcohol

131 rehabilitation mentioncd in any way in the 1988 ranhing meeung?
A I don't thmik so

## Vol 152345

Q Captain Hazelwood had never told you that he had been through rehab had he?
A No
Q And you spokb aboul cominon dnowludgh arl you talling about
(9) yoursalf that you kncw about il'

AYes
Q And I take th you didn thave conversations with other
people about the fact that Captain Hazelwood had been
ihrough
rehab?
A No
Q You gave a presentation did you nos in November 1989
regarding the Exxon Valdu/ Incideni?
A Yes
Q And whal was the outasion ol that?
A There was a meeting of our - of some of our venour officers in New Jersey tu go over the - the facts that were known about the Exxon Valdez up to that point to just communicate with those people what we knew
Q In the courye of your preseniations did you express any opinions with respect to the cause of the grounding?
A No I kept away from expressing opinions
Q Wasn the subject of the bause of the grounding an area of concurn to the prople at that mueting?
A My job was just to present the facts that occurred that
anght and not - and keep away from expressing opinions

Q Were you instructed -
(2) A Yes
(3) Q - that you were to stay away from opinions?

A That's nght
Q Who instructed you to stay away from opinions?
A Legal counsel
Q Did you have any other relationship at all with Captain
Hazelwood either professionally or socially?
A In 1987, when I first became port captann, I took hum out
(10) to supper one night
(H) Q And where was that?
(12) A In Long Beach
(1) Q Any other social things that you did with Hazeiwood?

A No
Q I take it that Hazelwood did not have anything to drink at that dinner glass of wine or anything?
A He did not
Q Did you talk to him at all about has alcohol
rehabilitation?
A No It stood out mey mind that he didn't dronk, though, that night The other three people there were drinking and
dad not drink He drank Coca Cola
3) Q After you became port captain in 1987 at any time did you
) personally do anything to monstor Captain Hezeiwood to see
whether the alcohol ruhabilitation he d gone through was

|  | Vol 152347 |
| :---: | :---: |
| holding? |  |
| (2) | A I vasited the vessel I would have noticed if he had been |
| (3) drinking aboard the vessel If he was drinking aboard the |  |
| (s) vessel I would have seen that, but that's the extent of what I |  |
| (S) did to monitor him |  |
| (6) Q You were never instructed that you should do that? |  |
| (7) A Not that I can recall |  |
| (8) Q Now how many tomes did you actually board the vessel? |  |
| (9) A At least twice |  |
| (10) Q And that would be in the cour |  |
| (11) until March of 1989? |  |
| (12) A No, 1987 through early '88 |  |
| (13) Q Okay and what you resaying is that on those two occasiona |  |
| (14) you simply didn $t$ observe visible drinking? |  |
| (15) A That's right |  |
| ) Q And apart from that you have no other observations or |  |
| 17 reports to make with respect to montoring of Hazelwood after |  |
| 81 his alcohol rehabilitation correct? |  |
| (19) A That's correct |  |
| $(30)$ | MR SERDAHELY Your Honor agan no |
|  | (21) tross examunation |
| (22) THE COURT All right |  |
| (23) | MR O NEILL Great Planniffs call Gregory Cousina |
|  | by his duposition |
|  | DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GREGORY COUSINS (Video) |

```
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Please state your full name and home address?
A Gregory Thomas Cousins reside at 13966 Fletcher's Mill
Dnve Tampa Flonda
Q And you were with Exxon from 1980 up through 1990 is that
correct?
A Correct
Q When you were saling as a third mate which you ve
testified to on the four vessels with Exxon did you go do
Valdez?
A Yes
Q Now on the - these vessels the North Slope and the New
Orleans and the Exxon Vaidez what was the total number of
trips you made to the Port of Valdez approximately' I think
you previously have testified about a dozen would that be
about right?
A That would be yes farr I thma
Q About how many of the trips that you made to Valdez were
you a watch stander in Prince William Sound' Of say of the
approximate dozen?
A How many transats did I make on the bridge?
Q Yeah that you were actually watch standing going in or
coming out?
A Well I would sav a portion of all of the tımes but at
least - at least half
```

(1) have none loday?

ANo
Q For Prince William Sound?
A No
Q Are you familiar with the requirements for a piotage
endorsement on a license in Prince William Sound?
A No
Q What 1 m trying to do 18 really save time Mr Cousins
Instead of asking you take me through your day you have the
eight to twetve that morning is that correct?
AYer
Q This in on the 23rd of Marchn
A Right
Q In essence what I m concerned with is when you re working
when you re not working So you re on duty from 0800 to 1200
is that a correct statement?
A Correct
Q What did you do your recollection between 12 and 1300 do
you remember on March 23rd"
(20) A Well I had lunch then I did the salinity test and I
(21) returned to - I went to my room
(2) Q How long did you take for lunch do you recall about a
(23) half hour?
( 4) A No Well 1015 minutes
(5) Q All right
) Q How many trips did you make with - on the Exxon Valdez pror to the - not counting the grounding trip in or out?
Did you make a trip prior to that trip?
AYes
Q How many trips did you make prior to that trip do you recall?
A I belseve there were three or four total
Q How many trips prior to that trip the grounding trip we II
call tt the grounding trip in and out did you make with
Captain Hazelwood?
A One or two
Q Now in your experience in going into Vaidez and coming
out again the same parametera I gave you before and we re
always talking about Hinchinbrook to Valdez and from Valdez to
Hinchinbrook what type steening was used on the vessela you served on?
A Hand steening
Q Did you ever in any of your trips while you were a wateh
officer see the steering put in any type of auto mode in those waters?
A Well the - one time
Q When was that?
A That was the evening of - or the morning of the grounding
Q Now you had no pilotage endorsement on your license or

## Vol 15235

A Actually the - the twelve is the watch I'm reheved
actually at 10 minuted before
Q Youalso relicve 10 minulus hefort eight do you not?
A Correct
Q So you stand a lull lour hour walch?
AYes
Q So you do this salinity test a fier lunch?
AYes
Q And does that take you up to about 1300 would that be about right?
A Just a lattle bit - around 1300 Actually a little bit
(12) before 100
(13) $Q$ What is a salinity test?
(14) A Measurnig water density
(13) $Q$ And is that the density of the sea water around the
(16) vessel?

1171 A Yes sir
(18) Q And what sthe purpose of that)
(19) A That is used by the chsef mate to calculate what - what
(ro) drafts we'll be able to load to
(21) Q How do you get ses water to take the teat?
(ᄀ) A On the Valdez, we - we would go down into the engine room
(23) and take water from a small spigot that was fitted unto one of
(24) the sea suctions
(3) $Q$ So is that part of your normal - your normal operation of

## Vol 152352

```
the vessel?
A What taking a salmity?
Q Yes
A Yes, when you're loading um hum
Q it a needed information in order to put a proper load
aboard the vessel?
A Yes
Q This paperwork you did in your office?
A Yes
Q In your room?
A Yes
Q That paperwork was papurwork which you connected with
vessel right? You weren I writing love notes to your wife or
anything?
A Well actually, it may have been, but there was some
paperwork that was connected with the vessel's safety
Q All right and you were the safety officer aboard?
A Yes
Q Do you have a good estumate of how much tume you spent
(20) that paperwork?
('l) A It wasn't long I'd usually - well sit down work un it
1 _) }10\mathrm{ or }15\mathrm{ mmutes and set it aside and do something else
(3) Q So it may have becn 10 or 15 minules?
(24) AYes
(25) Q Solet spick it up from 1315 - ohay - 1315 on you slept
```

with

## Vol $15 \quad 2353$

(I) untsl about when? You can look at the testamony and notes?
(2) A Whenever they called me for supper rehef A few minutes
(3) before 1700
4) Q All right and you then did what?
s) A Relseved the chief mate for supper
(6) Q When you relieved the chic malu where did you go?
(7) A Cargo control
8) Q And then you had to observe gauges or whatever'
(9) A Yes monator the load
0) Q Okay do you agrec that 1730 was about the lims the chicf (1) mate reheved you in the cargo control room?
(12) A Approximately Jım - Jım was hike the rest of us pretty
(13) quick eater but generally
(14) Q That s about right?
(1s) A Well the normal normal the normal supper hour lasts 20
(16) miautes
(17) Q All right And then what did you do?
(18) A I went back do bed as far as I-I can remember I
(19) returaed to -
(20) Q Actording to Duloskre - I II lus you loosh at the

11 document - 1745 he savs targo cuntrol room Dow that
1 is refrush your -
(3) A You're referring to has report'
(4) Q His noles yes You suc 1749 ha has cargocontrol room?
(25) Does that refresh your recollection?
(1) A Probably yes I remember sticking my head in the control
() room and spoke to Jum Kunkel chef mate briefly about the
(3) topping off and that's when he told me that I would be (4) assistung hum
(5) Q And you stay in the cargo control room?
(6) A No, I went to my room
(7) Q Before you give me an answer let me asik you can you try
(8) and place times on these different events that you re giving
(9) us?
(Hol- A I will attempt to Can I - I'll begin with I reheved the
(11) chuef officer at approximately 1700
(12) Q Okay
(13) A He had supper I remaned in the cargo control room
(14) monitoring the load while he ate After he returned, I had my
(15) meal I returned brefly to the cargo control room and I guess
(16) this Delozaer has almost a log entry type thing here of 1745
(in) I don't know where he got that Maybe it's in the testimony,
(18) but I don't recall, but I don't thunk that it is
(19) I spoke brielly with the chuef officer and that's when he
(20) told me that he will use me to assist hum in the topping off
(21) I left I did not remam if the cargo control room from
(-?) that bnef conversation on, because the topping off didn't
(-3) begin untul sometume later
(24) Q What time?
(2s) A Much later Almost - well, I don't know

## Vol 152355

(1) Q Fimehed cargo was 1924 does that help you?
(a) A Correct So Mr Delozier has a 1900, chuef mate called
(3) cargo control room for topping off So at 1900, this - the
4) chief matecalled me in my room
(5) Q Let me juat go on and then IIf get back to that Your
6) lesumony is for a brief itme you had this conversation with
7) the chief mate and then you went to your room?

AYes
(9) And what did you do in your room?
(10) A I don't recall I normally don't sleep that tume of day
(II) I may have read a book sat down in the rechmer and digested
(1) my meal
(13) Q Up to this point of 1900 when you start working again
(14) does that - approximately 1900 did you agree with that?
(15) A Right
(16) Q Chief mate called you for cargo for topping off?
(17) A Yes
(18) $Q$ Was this period that we ve been going over up till 1900
"191 was this sort of typical for a turn around period in Valdez?
(20) A Yes Yes I would say that
(1) Q Now from 1900 which we took you up to up to the time of
(i) grounding you were doing work up on the bridge and/or on watch is that correct?
A From 1900 on, yes
(25) $Q$ When the vessel got underway and you ultumately returned

Vol 152356
, from your docking station to the bridge?
A Yes
Q When you returned to the bridge who was on the bridge?
A The pilot I belseve the captain I relseved the chisef
mate Jum Kunkel and I don't right of fhand recall who the helmsman was
Q Well without reading your testimony Radike you testified in the Hazelwood trial does that refresh your recollection?
AYes
Q You relieved Kunkel and he went below?
A Yes
(1) Q And you are now the watch officer?
(13) A Yes
(14) Q Now after you returned to the bridge did Captain
(1s) Hazelwood leave the bridge?
(16) A At - yes at some time later he did
rin Q When he left the bridge was it prior to the Narrows?
(18) A Yes
(191 Q And when he left the bridge did he say anything to you
( 0 ) about he was going to leave the bridge or why he was going to
(1) leave the bridge?
( ) A Yes he - he told me he was leaving the bridge and he told
(3) me why but I don't remember why
( 4) Q All right Now my question to you today thanking back on
(s) il are you saying he did give you a reason?

## Vol is 2357

(1) A The reason - the reason was he - was that he needed to
( $)$ discuss something that was bothening the chief engineer
(3) Q That s why he told you he was leaving the bridge?
(4) A Yes
(s) Q Did the captain tell - tell you or did you hear him
(6) announce when he was going to return?
(7) Aldon't recall
(8) Q Prior to the Narrows ultimatelvisn itt correct that vou
(9) were asked by the pilot to call the captain because the pilot
(10) was going to leave the vessel?
(11) A I called the captain on my own before we entered the (12) Narrows I said he was almost finished doing what he needed to
(13) do that he'd be up directly and later sometime later after
(14) we had transited the Narrows, and I can't say exactly when I
(1s) thank the pilot mentioned sand you ought to have the
captatn
(16) up here for debarking the pulot
(17) Q So it 3 correct that the pilot ultumately asked you to have
(18) the capiain come to the bridge isn that correct?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q So you re saying you had a conversation with Captain
(1) Hazelwood in the interm?
(.2) A Yes
(23) Q And that conversation tell me again what did you say and
(24) what did the captain say?
(23) A I informed the captain that we were approaching the Narrows

1 ind he asked if there was anv problems anv traffic and of course there wasn I and he said that he II be up as soon as he
finsher doing whatever he was doing and I don't recall what
isi he smid is far as what he was doing
(5) Q In any event as you recollect it back as you re sitting
(6) here right now the period of time Captain Hazelwood was off the bridge would you agree was not a short time?
A I would say it was longer than - than I was used to
Q in your experience on these other vessels in Valdez did you ever experience when you had that same watch let say coming through the Narrows as you re going out -
A Um hum
$Q$ - did vou ever experience a caplain walking off the bridge and ataying off the bridge through the Narrows?
Alcan't recall no
Q You say you can trecall you mean no you do not?
A I can't recall having been on the bridge with - wathout a master present through the Varrows
Q Now when you called Caplain Hazelwood to come back to
the
(70) bridge you remember what you said to him?
(21) A Yes
( 1 ) Q After the ptiot the pilot said to get the captain you
31 celuphonıd Captain Hazelwood?
AYes
Q And what did vou sav to him the pilot wants you back or -

## Vol $15 \quad 2359$

A I told him that we're geting close to the pilot station that we need hum on the bndge and he sand I'm on my way Q Okay From the tume you - of that telephone call about
what was the interval of time between that call and Captain
Hazelwood arriving on the bridge?
A I don't recall
Q Now vou tooh Cousins - you tooh LLCasn s watch that
cvening the mid wath at hast the heginning of it?
A Yeah
Q Alter you slood your walch'
A I was standing part of his watch ves
Q Why did you do that?
A Because he didn't get called when you normally call the the relieving watch
Q Maybe you didn $t$ understand my question Did LeCain ask you to take his watch for him because he was tired?
A No
Q Why did you lake LeCain s watch?
A Because when I returned to the bndge be wasn't there
So
I had no chnice I can't just leave the bridge without benng relıeved
Q Whan you relurned to the bridge you mean after dropping
the pilot off?
A Correct yes sir
Q But isn it normal for you to send someone down to wake
) the watch officer?
A No, the - the watch is called from the bridge
(3) Q Well who calls il from the bridge?
(4) A Normally 1 would
(5) Q You didn t though dad you that evening?
(6) A Well I dadn't have a telephone with me out on deck I was
(7) out on decic durng the tume that - the relieving watch would
(8) becalled The A Bs called ther rehef No one called my
()) rehef
(10) Q All right but then you got back do the bridge did you
(II) not?
(12) AYes
(13) Q And you could have called LeCain when you returned to the
(14) bridge could you not?
(1S) Alcould have yes
(16) Q But you didn $t^{\text {? }}$
(17) A I dsd not
(18) Q Why didn t you?
(19) A Because I was busy
(30) Q Now getting back to whurt we were on the document the
(21) next document I have which thty call it the bridge rough log
(22) and then in parentheses bull book Better name for it is the
(23) bell book?
(24) A Yes
(2s) $Q$ This is the dowument you were just reterring to is it not

## Vol $15 \quad 2361$

(1) that you said the chicf mate would have pul enirius in when he
2) Was on the bindge?

AYes
Q When you makt the entries in the bell bood her like the
pilot aboard and you ru up on the bridgb would you make it in
the bell book and then make it in the log al the same time?
A Not at the same time no Later
Q You make your untries in the log later?
A At the end of the watch
Q Okay so did you make all your untries for the 20 to 2400
waich that were in the bridge log atler the grounding'
A Yes
Q You copied them Irom the hall boold wi follooling al'
AYes str
Q Now from 2220 dow n through what eniry is your
handwriting'
(16) A 2253
(17) Q Potato Point abcam?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q Whose entry is the nuxt entry 2314 slow ahead symbol?
(30) A 1 don't know I assume it was the captan's

1 11 Q 2324 pilot off full ahead the eniry for pilot off would
( I normally bc made when the pilut guts into hin boal' is that
(3) when ils made?
('4) AYes
(.) Q And you were down there with him at thal lime were you
not?
AYes
Q And can you tell from the handwriting that s not your wriling?
A That's not my writing
Q What about the next entry indicating 2352 LPU?
A That is not mine
Q At that tume 2352 what officers were on the bridge jugt
you and Captain Hazelwood?
A Correct
Q So that would be Captain Hazeiwood as far as you know?
A Yes
Q Did you see ham put the entry in the book?
A No
Q And in fact you didn t know it had been put in Load Program
Up did you?
A No
(18) Q Tell us what Lond Program Up is?

A It's a computer controlled system bruging - bringing the
rpm engme rpms up gradually to prevent damage to the engine
(21) It's Just a - a program to - bringing the engue up to full
(22) sea speed
(23) Q So you were at that tume based on your recollection you
were full ahead maneuvering speed is that correct at 23527
A When 1 returned to the bridge, I had no idea where we -

## Vol 152363

what was goug on I didn't know what was going on with the
engunes
Q When you first returned to the bridge you didn 1 know it
was in Load Program Up but the captain told you it was in Load
Program Up is that whal you re saying?
A Yes yes
Q Now the next document I d like to show you in the sequence
of events here we want to refer to is this VHF radio
communication transfer Did you ever see this before?

## A Parts of it I have

Q This is predesignated Number 16 and I d like to have this marked as the next Exhibil Number
UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER That would be 48792 BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Okay now turning to the 2330 and 54 second transmasion
that s recorded there it $s$ on - it s on Page 4 Ithink
of - their numbered Page 4 do you see up there the entry on
the top of the page is 2326 They go in sequence
A 2326 is the top
Q The first yeah and if you look a lattle down from there
you see a 2330 547
AYes
Q And it s from the Exxon Valdel'
A Yes
Q And it says at the present time I mgoing to alter my

Vol $15 \quad 2364$
course to 200 and reduce speed to about 12 hnots in ah wind
my way through the ice ah Naked Island and ETA might be a
little out of whack but ah once we re clear of the ise out of
Columbia Gla - just has G I a with some dots - Bav we II
give you another shout over you see that transmission?
A Yes
Q Did you hear Captain Hazelwood make this transmission?
A No no I did not
Q In connection with his advising he s going to reduce speed
I want you to look at the previously - we looked at the bell
logger can you put that exhibit out there?

## A Yes

Q Do you see any speed reduction that Captain Hapelwood is
advising vessel traffic of in his 2330 and 54 second
transmission reflected on the bell logger?
A No
Q And in fact while we re on this subject isn it a fact
and we ve already covered this that al 2352 according to the
log entry Captain Hazelwood put the engine in Load Program
isn that correct?
A Correct
Q He did that on his own and then told you about it isn t
that correct?
A Yes
Q And vou ve already descrithed what Load Program Up is and

## Vol 152365

(1)

Load Program Up was increasing speed was it not? A Yes
Q When you returned do the bridge after dropping the pilot
off did you know what course the vessel was on once you made this 200 course change or not?
A When I first returned to the bndge no I did not know what the course was
Q Did you subsequently find out what the course was? A Yes Q What was 11 ?
A I don't recall $I$ can tell you that when I returned to the bridge and fixed the - took a fix off of -1 don't even recall the tume that as I was ploting that the vessel was beginning to turn to course whether it was the course of 200,
(1s) I don't recall
(18) Q Do you recall a course change to 180 that followed a fter (7) that after the 200 course change?

AYes 1 do
Q You were on the bridge then and you remember that coursh
change?
A Yes
Q Did the captain order that course change?
A Yes, he did
Q Now looking at the transcript again which we have marked
didn t we mark it" Did I mark that tranacript? Yeah 48792

Vol is 2366
do vou su anv Iransmission Irom Captain Hacelwond advising
Vessel Traffic Center that the vessel has thanged course after
the 2330 54 advisus ahout the 200 course change?
$\wedge$ No
Q Advising them about the 180 course change?
A I don't see it anywhere in here
Q And based on your knowledge of the regulations for Vessel
Traffic Center that course change should have been recorded is that correct?
A I assume that it already - that it had been
Q-Yes thut in answer to my question based on your understanding of the regulation which it rad in you before the course change to 180 ahould have heen repored?

## A Yes

Q Is that vour understanding' Now when Captain Hazelwood changed sourse to 180 up io that time had he said anything io you about his intention to give you the con turn the con over to you or was il after the course change to $180^{\circ}$ A First mention of that was after the course change
Q Okay And tell us what the captain said to you A When?
Q This first mention after the course change the first indication that you have that Captain Hazelwood intends to (24) leave the bridge and turn the con over to you What did he say (s) to you first that you remember?

A As far as turning the con over to me we had - we had discussed what - what he had intended asked me if I was comfortable with that I told ham what I thought and what I saw and how much room we had between the reef and the ice Th
ice had - I don't want to charactenze it as beng surpnsed but I had not veen the ice on radar up untal the time that I returned to the bridge from droppiag the pilot off So we had
some discussion about that He asked me again if $I$ was comfortable with that our attempt to get around the ice and that he wanted to leave the brigge for just a few minutes did I feel comfortable and I said yes
Q Okay would you be able to indicate on this chart -
MR O NEILL That a good piace to stop in the tape
sir
THE COURT Ladies and gentlemen please remember my
(16) of repeated instruction that you not read or listen to
|17) anything about the case We il be in recess now until 800
(18) tomorrow morning
(1v) MR LYNCH Your Honor -
(º) MR SANDERS Your Honor Mr Lynch is trying to
( 1 ) communicale
('2) MR LYNCH 1 just have a minor administrative matter
(23) one sentence matter
(24) THE COURT Jury is excused at this tume and I Il see
(25) counsel


5-23-94 VOLUME 15
(1) INDEX
$-$
(I) you just as you rt going oul' It spurt huuschcuping
(2) THE COURT Sure We re in rutess now
(3) THE CLERK This court is in recess until uighta $m$
(4) tomorrow morning
(5) (Recess at 202 pm )

Vol 152371
) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF STEVE DAY (Video) 2166
(I) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 2166

CROSS EXAMINATION OF STEVEN DAY (Video)
2210
( $s$ ) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 2211
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF RONALD SCOTT LUNT
2216
(8) BYMR JAMIN 2216
(10) CROSS EXAMINATION OF RONALD SCOTT LUNT

2228
(11) BY MR NEAL 2228

แ1) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GARRETT O CONNOR M D
(LivL) 2240
(14) BY MR MONTAGUE 2240
(16) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GARRETT O CONNOR

M D 2290
(17) BY MR SANDERS 2290
(19) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF BENJAMIN GRAVES (Video) 2317
(20) BY VIDEO EXAMINER

2317
(29) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM DEPPE (Video) 2334
(23) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(24) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GREGORY COUSINS (Video) 2347
(.s) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(1) STATE OF ALASKA)
(1) Reporter s Certificate
3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA)
(6) I Joy S Brauer a Registered Professional
(7) Reporter and Notary Public
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
(9) That the foregoing transcript contains a true and
(10) accurate transcription of my shorthand notes of all requested
(1) matters held in the foregoing captioned case
(12) Further that the transcript was prepared bv me
(13) or under my direction
(14) DATED this day
(19) of 1994
(?) JOY S BRAUER RPR Nolary Public for Alaska
(22) My Commission Expires 51097

Look See Concordance Report

UNIQUE WORDS $\mathbf{2 , 8 4 4}$ TOTAL OCCURRENCES 13,366
NOISE WORDS 385
Total WORDS IN FILE
42,791
Single file Concordance

CASE SENSITIVE
NOISE WORD LIST(S)
NOISE NOI
INCLUDES ALL TEXT
OCCURRENCES
IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES @ BOTTOM of Page

Maximum Tracked OCCURRENCE THRESHOLD 50

Number of Words
SURPASSING OCCURRENCE
THRESHOLD 22
LIST OF THRESHOLD WORDS
AA ${ }^{651}$
alcohol | $120 \mid$
alcoholic (77)
alcoholsm [84]
believe [61]
bridge [51]
Captain |197]
conversation [71]
drinking ||43|
Exxon |155|
fact $169 \mid$
Hazelwood [217]
Myers 165 |
Okay 1601
Paul 1611
people |86|
recall |91|
rught |9?|
shup |74]
treatment (77)
Valdez ${ }^{811}$
vessel [88)

| $-1-$ |
| :--- |
| $10186 \mid 11234224$ |
| 100111223910 |
| $11100\|2\| 2190821921$ |
| 115511229924 |
| 11 th 1121818 |
| 121211229925 |
| 13 th 1212190521974 |
| 14th 312190521974 |
| 2204 21 |
| 15th (1) 234223 |
| 16th 11122768 |

18th [1] 220418
1970s [1] 225324
19th |1| 23302
100 |1| $2351 / 2$
1st [2] 22301922767
-2-
20th $12 \mid 218139$
22ad 1312181423006
23054
2324 |11) $2 / 8513$
23rd [8] 2181 1521844
22689228223228412
23501219
24-hour (1) 21916
24th [3] 2184421985
23349
28th ||| 2324 /4
$200|1| 23681$
202 |1| 23695
2nd |3| $2188322 / 445$

| -3- |
| :---: |
| 30th \|1] 223021 |
| 31st [2\| 223019 2] |
| 3431B 111 23686 |
| 3451B [21 236867 |
| 3rd \|2| 2188322145 |
| - 5- |
| 5-10-97 111 237222 |
| -6- |

6th |1| 22482
$\frac{-7-}{70 \mathrm{l} \text { [21 } 224517232323}$

70s [21 224517232323
-8-
80s (5) 224418224522
2260 15 226616232324
8 (0) |2| 21662236717

$$
-9-
$$

90s 111230021
9th 111229319

- A-

A-Bs|l| 23608
a m 161216621908
2239101122992423693
AP |11 23432
A89-0095 (1) 21666
abbreviated 11122555
abbreviation |11 227416
abeam |1| 236117
ability ||| 2328 /4
able |21| 222 $24 \quad 2222113$
1922467922473
2253 10 2122567226519
226942282422868
230113232325232717
23312423344235120
236712
abnormal |4| 225517
22642522821322846
aboard !2ऽ| 21882125
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}2213 & 7 & 15 & 19 & 2214217 \\ 2235 & 11 & 21 & 24 & 2323 & 5\end{array}$
22358112124232345
$\begin{array}{lllll}14 & 18 & 232512 & 23265\end{array}$
2328232336123473
235261723615
absence [3] 227525
232523233015
absolutely [4] 223520
227622312323145 abstunence [14] 22511819 2522529,1322542223 226522227711230922 23105101223279
abstnent [2] 2248422815
Abuse [3] 2241 2122422
224516
abuse [19] 2204222428
1422482325225910 22601113212322757 1022798,23076230813 152309723221523319 abuser [3] 226091018
abusers [1] 226016
abuses [1] 226012
abusive [1] 227015
accept [1] 225418
accepted [7] $22475 \quad 225215$
1820225414228017
22893
accepts [1] 22492
accerdent [1] 234312
accomplsh [1] 21687
According (1) 235320
according (1) 236418
account [5] 221042270 15 22711524230911
accounts [4] 2272722862 3231825
accurate [1] 237210
achneve [5] 225214227815 2281122952522967 achieved [2] 226223
act (1) 22102
actung [4] $229018 \quad 2021$
action [4] 2176121828
218325232115
actions [1] 22874
actuvely [2] 2263522847
actuvitues (5) 220115
2261 |1 2284 /1 231823
23249
actuvity [31 $219422 \quad 231825$ 233110
actor (5) $229016 \quad 17 \quad 23$ $2291 / 3$
Actors [4] 22915101116
actors $[5] \begin{array}{lllllll}2291 & 12 & 13 & 14 & 16\end{array}$ 18
Acute (1) 224122
add [3] 2178322081
224113
Addiction $\{3$ ) 224510
224915230025
addsction [7] 2242 13
224591820224822
225219
addition |6| 22459226110
226724227013228215 229123
address [3] 221525224016 23482
addressed [1] 234225 adjacent [2] 21742121929
adminstration [1] 231824
Admustrative [1] 231816 admunstrative [5] 231817
231921232025232213 236722
admussion [4] 227214 2307242326523687 admitted [2] 2274122767 advance [3] 2253712 230122
advanced [1] 22601
adverse [4] 22507823 22586
advice (1] 23294
advise [2] 2327123337
advised [2] 2292423685
advises [1] 23663
Advising [1] 23665
advising [4] 2205123649 ,
1423661
advisor [2] $224615 \quad 233516$
advocated (1) 2277 11
affect [2] $220217 \quad 23058$
affected [1] 22874
affects [3] $224910 \quad 225811$
232813
affilated [1] 22424
afield [1] 228416
aftercare [8] 2266112276 I
322771322781923
231010231125
aftermath [1] 226612
afternoon [5] 221014
2284912228636
afterwards [3] 217614
2282223056
age [1] 22658
Agencies [1] 221719
agencies (1] 2244 11
agency (2] 220619226413
agent [4] $22175221814 \quad 20$
2233 /1
agents [1] $2218 \quad 15 \quad 17$
Aggressive [1] 2289 11
agree [6] 231022231413

agreed (1) 21832
aground [2] 219814233411
ah [3] 2364123
Aur |1| 221612
$\operatorname{arr}[2] 224316 \quad 22626$
arline [2] 22442224719
arrines [2] 2243524
arplane [1] 231419
Arport [1] 233418
A1-Anon [1] 228217
Alamar (14) 2217161820
232218722192122
22201622216222717
22285223025223121
Alaska [9] $2216318 \quad 20$
221741923341619
23447237221
Alcoholic (1) 225922
Alcoholics (11) 22486810
225042256222573
22591622665231319
23161522
alcoholics 132122523612

Bues Symarte Applaticme
22536102122543611
225582256372257520 2258142259571425 2260222263141722656 228022281723011213
$230213 \quad 14 \quad 15 \quad 17$
Alcoholsm [3] 2249824 225523
alienatron |1| 2258 ]
allegation [1] 2322 /7
allow [5] 22272522718
22722022871822887
allowed [3] 2273 /4 2289 I8 234325
alone [1] 223817
alongside [1] 219214 alter [1] 236325
altercation [2] 21951119
altered [1] 217120
altering (1] 22485
altogether [1] 226817
Alyeska [4] 22211924
2225162268 II
amends [2] 22632425
America [1] 2245 1
American [81 2245510
2249152122955230022
2423011
amount [3] $225725 \quad 22658$ 228412
analyst (1) 23355
Andy [4] 21707 |l 16 217811
Angeles [5] 224019
22412422423224322
229316
anger (1) 219323
angry (1) 22662
announce [1] 23576
annual (1) 224818
Anonymous [7] 22486810 2256223131923161522
Answer [2] 23042223428
answer [30] 217715
21952221991220223
226552273913229846

2302202304152223053
572324252326223422
151723432023547
236611
answered [3] 223113
22654228419
answers [1] 2273 15
anxiety [1] 225723
anybody [13] 217422
21991722012322372
22591122791322958
230320232523104
23148
anymore [1] 22425
anyway [1] 219417
anywhere [2] 22541623666
anywheres [1] 22354
Apart [1] 228515
apart [2] $218810 \quad 234716$
apartment [1] 221324
apologize [2] 218323
231915
apparatus [1] 22224
apparent [1] 226919

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-23-94 VOLUME 15
Cmoontance br 1 mot Secisol
apparently [2] 218615 228014
appearance $\{2\} 21935$ 231716
application [1] 22151
applied [5] $231322 \quad 25$
$23141022 \quad 233723$
apply [2] 2255623106
appreciate [1] 223918
approach [2] $22886 \quad 22905$
approaching [1] 235725
appropriate [1| 22067
approve [l] 23322
approximate \{2| 22967
234820
Approximately [4] 21811 $22145 \quad 224810 \quad 235312$ approximately [8] 216713 216823218017218516 21905234814235411 $2355 / 4$
April [9] 216722216823
2169222087221722
227682300723054
Archie [1] 224610
area [9] $21928 \quad 224414$

22934229817234310 234522
areas [9] 21872322929
$2296 / 22298$ /1 1622
22993231619
aren't [3] $229016 \quad 2295 \quad 15$ 23027
argumentative |l| 23399
arise [1] 22944
arrange $\begin{cases}21 & 2223 \\ 25 & 233416\end{cases}$

arrived $[5 \mid 2188 \quad 3 \quad 2208 \quad 10$
$221412 \quad 222521 \quad 229319$
arriving [1| 23595
Arts [2] 2218917
ashore $13 \mid 2167623$
$2175 / 3$
aside |2| 21928235222
asking $1912228 \quad 19 \quad 22324$
$228516 \quad 229723 \quad 230124$
233011162331123509
asks [1] 230424
aspects \{2) $220619 \quad 23037$
assembling (1] 224917
assessing [1] 2265 1]
assessment [1] 22447
Assigned [1] 221419
assigned [12] 216625
21674216882521702
$221562288172325 / 8 \quad 22$ $232619 \quad 233510$
assignment [8] 2167524
$25 \quad 2326 / 7 \quad 2329111517$ 23413
assist [4] 216835221724 235420
assistance [1] 23118
assistant (5] $216621 \quad 24$ $\begin{array}{lllllll}216713 & 21713 & 217513\end{array}$ assistants (1] 216917 ass 5 sting [1] 23544 assoctate [2] 224262291 /1 associated (3) 225816 232925

Assoctation 131 224921 $229562301 /$
association 131224410 224720229112
assume [7] 22297230117
$231418 \quad 231814 \quad 23219$
236120236610
assumed [2] 222419
232612
assuming [1] $2236 / 4$
assumption [2] 23229 /]
ate [1] 235414
Atlanta |l| 224820
attempt |8| $229525 \quad 22967$
230052327142123282
23541023679
attempted $1112327 / 8$
attend $151216915 \quad 19$
2178422488227823
attendance [4] 226316
$227918 \quad 22$ 23315
attendants [1] 224323
attended (10) 2169715
221615224162248 /l
227321227920229123
2292323404
attendees 11121703
attending $|5| 2280 / 23$
$23252 / 4 / 9$
attentm $|2| 234014 \quad 25$
attutude $\{2 \mid 222 / 2022662$
attorney |3| 22441022928
23248
attorneys $1212170 / 4$
$2243 / 8$
August 17121682324
2211922481922879
2331 /l
authored [1] 224513
authorities 14122539
231462315710
authority $|S| \begin{array}{llll}2314 & 14 & 23165\end{array}$
$17 \quad 18 \quad 23322$
auto |l| 2349 /9
avalable |4| 222592206
228821228917
4verage |1| 22353
aware [371 $217721 \quad 21834$
9218623218716
2192242197824220119
220210220424220511
2206142207471018
2208922091722116
$\begin{array}{lll}2226 & 14 & 2235 \\ 16 & 19\end{array}$
$223622 \quad 2321 / 318 \quad 23225$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}13 & 16 & 2324 & 2325 & 25\end{array}$
2327223381623391920
23415
awareness |1| 225615
awful (5) $21996 \quad 2200516$ 22055230224

| - B - |
| :---: |
| background 141 224025 |
| 2267522731423291 |
| backgrounds [1] 22864 |
| bacon [1] 222512 |
| bag [1] 233417 |
| Baker [1] 236814 |
| ballast 111 22184 |

Baltımore $|3| 224 \mid 621 \quad 23$
bar $111 \mid 2223222224411$
1222342322441022736

bars \{2| 2221 912
base [1] 2322 I]
Based (21 2288 15 2289 /5
based |81 218282183 I/
226916227624228917
2362232366711
bases [1] 22777
baskc [3] 22192227213
22845
Basically ||| $22 / 822$
bascally [5] 2219122513
$\begin{array}{llll}22618 & 22652 & 231819\end{array}$
basics |1| 22495
basts 12012172221895
$2214218 \quad 222619224622$

$227110 \quad 2272 \quad 24 \quad 22811$
2284202122851722895
23001623252233824
battery [1] 22646
Bay [5] $21891718 \quad 220415$ 2210823644
Baytown |!| 21673
Beach $16121677 \quad 13 \quad 17$
$2337 / 6 / 8 \quad 2346 / 2$
becomes $|3| 225622$
225717231217
bed |1] 235318
beer |20| 217224217325
217542182121871417
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}18 \quad 20 & 24 & 21881 & 6 & 13 & 25\end{array}$
219918252213722149
223424228124
beg [2] 22976231222
begun (1| 228111
behavior [7] 2257/2267 /3
$\begin{array}{llllllll}2285 & 9 & 17 & 19 & 2295 & 18\end{array}$
233321
behavoral |2| 22559 227625
hehavors $1312255 / 2$
2257 / 22772
behind $13 \mid 22041622$
226225
beings [1] 22558
belef [5] 2209622101
226913227915230121
beheved [2] 21721921932
Bell [1] 23688
bell [7] $236022 \quad 23 \quad 23614$
$\begin{array}{llll}6 & 13 & 236410 \quad 15\end{array}$
belonging [1] 2258 /
Ben |11 231711
bench |l| 22886
Benecis [9] 2168 2] 218011
22 21815 21844218519
2194 // 222789
benefit [1] 231824
Benefits [1] 226823
Benicıa [1] 21681
BENJAMIN [1] 231721
Beajamin [1] 231725
berth [1] 2222-9
berths [1] 22227
Besides [1] 2226 11
besides (1| 217422
heverages (5) 22247

22251522352124223619 bible [2] 229647
Bill [9] 216715216816
2173421961622561
230424230581123247
bunge [1] 225517
bro |1] 217516
Biological ||| 224925
brological [1] 22499
Birds [1] 224818
bit |13] $218810 \quad 22 / 516$
221612221916222135
2228322442227312
231919234218235111
bitter (1) 22662
blackouts [1] 225814 Bligh [5] 21982122835
2334 11 234428
Bloody [1] 228124
blow [1] 229412
blow-up [1] 227419
Board [5] 2244922455
224719226718
board 13812187141821
218942215922191013
22201225222225
2225102235182222361
22372322455224919
227012228292123214
2323 / 2326823233519
2336461023371125
2338278234316
23445823478
boarded $13 \mid 22269228519$ 22869
boat |1| 236122
Bob [2| 2215 / $22 / 89$
body |11 2249 ||
boisterous $111222 / 19$
bolts |11 218411
book |8| 2245232355 /1
2360222323614613 236213
boot |1| 222523
booze ||| 217619
Borgen |l|l| $21688 \quad 19$
21791516192186525
21872102206522
2208252334172022
born $12 \mid 221678$
boss 14121747218113
2218817
bothering [2| $219723 \quad 23572$
bottle |2| $222521 \quad 225919$
bottles 1912187182024
$2188 / 6132522149$
Boulevard (1) 224019
bounced $\{2 \mid 220218$

## 221612

boundaries |1| 229517
box |2| 220638
bram |3| 2258 /2 18226412
BRAUER [1] 237221
break (3) 219262299 /8 20
Bras |I| 222817
brief $|2| 23542223556$
briefly 191216722201 /
22655181922877
235421519
bringing |4| $22588 \quad 236219$ 21

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-23-94 VOLUME 15
broad [2] 22731314 bulk [2] $224315 \quad 224414$ bums [1] 2260 I
Bunker [1] 224610
Busby [1] 226815
business [7] 21732321753 $2220192223 / 17225417$ 23122
busy $161219020 \quad 219521$
21992222031112236019
$\longrightarrow-C-$
cabin $131222017 \quad 18 \quad 19$
calculate 111235119
Caluforna [12] 216617
216812222401922449
22457823132323146
2315714231616
Call [3] 21664221519
22409
call [24| $21668 \quad 9 \quad 217212$
21884221521222919
2240102259 /I 226022
23252261 | 229215
229362334410234319
2347232349923579
23593413236021
Calle lll 216715
calling (11) 217215
calls [2] 22332223603
candid [1] 226322
capacity (3) 218114
230323234122
Cape |2| 23432123449
captam 14512168621737
24217622218124
218913219315220811
$2220 / 12231 / 222224$
2233151922349223722
2288232335 б 101213
151623376161723386
23394523412323469
232356423575

22 23612023634236522
236620
captains $|14| \begin{array}{lllll}2169 & 18 & 19 & 21\end{array}$
2217242218124223423
233523233617233716
23386 |1 234125
cuptioned II| 2372 //
car 121228224
card 11123032
care $161217622 \quad 219819$
22422122431222763
22944
career [3] $2204210 \quad 232323$
careful 111229810
Cargo III 23537
cargo |l3| $219215 \quad 220317$
2335202353 /1 2124
23545131521235513
16
Carlsbad 111216617
Carr $12122 / 5222828$
Carter 111231725
case [291 $21666 \quad 2 / 73$ /1
$2174222051 / 22355$
22431322556226779
$226810227210 \quad 227315$

227910228423229124 22924229379229921 2304212311192122
23121123219232216 23382236717237211 cases [5] $219625 \quad 227711$ $23431415 \quad 236814$ caught [1] 233724
 231316
Center [5] 22177224121 22422236628
center [6] $2262 \quad 17 \quad 227325$
228112230611 12, 13
central [3] 22052422505 , 18
centrality [1] 22729
certified [2] 224559
CERTIFY [1] 23728
cetera [1] 232410
CHALOS [2] 222720
229414
Chalos [1] 229415
chance 14] 21902121913 19229712
change 119122662422672
22702322724231810
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2336 & 24 & 2365 & 5 & 16 & 17 & 20\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llllllll}22 & 2366 & 3 & 5 & 8 & 13 & 18 & 19\end{array}$
22236817
changed [4] 231918
2336162366216
changes [2] 22962232012
chapter [1] 224525
character [1] 225718
characterization [1] 23068
characterizations (1] 2250 I
characterize [1] 23675
characterized (1) 232022
chargers [3! 2198922037 15
chart |3| 2188 I| 231525 236712
check [3] 22082222269 234322
check-In [2] 23431923448 chef [1] 21927
chemical (3) 22421523
22438
Chief [1] 235516
chuef $\{25$ ) $21685 \quad 216917$
221421224122228413
14233718233813
234314235119235356
10235421119235524
7235642357223611
childhood [1] 225113
children (1) 221624
choce [2] 217811235920
chose [2] 2197822105
chosen [1] 221018
chronic (4) 225156
22581824
Chuck [1] 221421
circumstances [12] 218420
218924219242522249
21222520225314
22681022821422864
228912
cited [1] 22987
Caty |1| 22177

Civil [1] 21666
clarnication [1] 2292 11
clarify [2] $217715 \quad 2178 \quad 16$
classical [3] $227514 \quad 22762$
230921
clean [2] 22618226219
clear [4] 2191922143
2249723643
CLERK [11] 21663221522
2422164223912224012
$15 \quad 20 \quad 229923 \quad 23001$
23693
clients [1] 221921
Clinic (1] 224122
clunc [1] 23334
clinucal [4] 2242 6, 22644
230816230912
clinicians [1] 22958
closed (3) 22801216
closer [1] 228319
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { Club [12] } & 2223 & 9 & 16 & 17\end{array}$
222417252237522381 ,
15 192122392022402
clue [1] 2237 11
clumsy [1] 227020
clustered [2] $225511 \quad 13$
Coast (3) 228225228414
25
coast (18) 21681812
218519218923222712
1323251123341423
23355710131521
23422423431
coat [1] 222522
coating [1] 221424
Coca-Cola (1) 234622
code [4] 227425227567
229418
Cognitive [2] 22588 ll
cogntive (6| 225841622
2422643231910
cognituvely [1] 227624
conncide [1] 21718
colleagues [4] 226215
22812522822222941
cotlect (2) 22191422903
College [1] 2241 3
Columbia [1] 23644
comfortable [3] 23673911
coming [13] 21892521922
21991622182222858
229269230720231110
$2348 \quad 23 \quad 234912 \quad 235811$
236820
comment [2] 227613
229720
commented [2] 230025
23234
comments [2] 219220
22013
Commission [1] 237222
commat [11 225423
commitment (1] 226225
commutted [3] 22622023
227718
common [5] 225017
2338212344111623454
commonly (1) 226116
communicate [3] 226413
234518236721
communicated [1] 23145
communication [1] 23639
community [1] 224122
companies [5] 221725
$223310 \quad 223611 \quad 2295820$
Company [36] 21661920
2321671121693217324
21792521811021835
21876220212207219
220913221132212913
$23184515 \quad 18 \quad 20 \quad 231922$
$2320413 \quad 2321 \quad 1 \quad 6 \quad 1119$
23221723251721
2326423304
23431
company [42] 2169521836
711219818220024
$221142212617 \quad 22138$
2122142322152223513
2243422448226313

2311192319623
232021242322223247
152327223284
$\begin{array}{llllllll}7 & 11 & 15 & 24 & 2329 & 6336 & 1\end{array}$
3233724
compared [1] 234321
comparison (3) 227179
227219
compensatron [1] 231824
complaned [2] 226925 22702
complaint [2] 219325
234014
complaints [1] 234022
complete $\{51217125$
$218014 \quad 227521 \quad 232019$ 232420
completed 18121671222
2184122185322882
232514233219
completely [2] 22121
230419
completing [1] 232416
completion |1] 228710
complex [2] 229689
complies [1| 23109
comply (4) $2263 \quad 12 \quad 19$
23108231210
complying [1] 226320
components [1] 225019
comport [3] 228023
22872022889
Comprehensive [1] 2306 /2 comprehensive [1] 2306 1] computer [2] 218722 236219
$\begin{array}{lllll}\text { con [4] } & 2366 & 17 & 24 & 23671\end{array}$ concealed [1] 228217
concept [4] $225414 \quad 22803$ 229022233616 concern [13] $21731315 \quad 21$ $24218218 \quad 218319$ 220113 220426232617 234523
concerned (16] $217316 \quad 19$ 2174121821021975 $220315 \quad 225812 \quad 22959$ 23082323194610 $232610 \quad 23281235014$ conceraing (3) 21728 2333321
concerns [8] 2174321756
252176321854219421 21971316
concluded [1] 227224
concludes [2] 221022
221517
conclusion $|3| 2 / 788$
2277723
concluswns $|3| 2173 \quad 16 \quad 18$
220921
condition $\{5 \mid 221225$
230622321823241
234225
conditions [1] 22051
conduct [3] 222019
22472022893
conducted [1] 22545
conduit [1] 22014
conference 1101216989
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}13 & 16 & 19 & 2170 & 3 & 11 & 13 & 19\end{array}$ 21784
confidentıal[91221] 1316 242212 / 3
confidentiality $|3| 221 / 20$ 231148
confirm [1] 23165
conflucts (2] $2175 \quad 19 \quad 2255 \quad 12$ confused [2] $218692368 \quad 10$
confusion [2] 2317212
connected [3] 224520
$235212 \quad 16$
connectron [3] 230224
2309823649
conschus 111218317
consequences $|5| 21835$
$\begin{array}{llll}22507 & 83 & 2281 & 13\end{array}$
conservatuve 11122528
consider $16 \mid 220910$
22732122742232012
232723234116
considered [3] 22021
221210231810
consstent [1] 22303
constricted (1) 2263 /4
construction |21 21676
217515
consult ||| 224322
consultant |4| $2293781 /$ 231516
consulted (I) 224224
consumed [1] 221323
consumption (1) 232023
contact |17] 2171 2121898
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllll}25 & 2190 & 23 & 25 & 2191 & 9 & 13\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}17 & 18 & 23 & 21984 & 2208 & 18\end{array}$
$227968233248 \quad 23332$
contacted [2] $232418 \quad 19$
contacts [7] 22222223
$222618 \quad 21222745$
contained [1] 2320 1]
containers ||| 218821
contains [1] 23729
contention |ㅇ| 22072325 context [7] $229719 \quad 25$
229852299251523056
contunuation [1] 21666
contunue [4] 221012
22422222531228015
contınued [3] 219220
228/ 2322826
continues [2] 2250 /l

225317
Continuing |1| 22507
continuing 191223112
$2242202250622 \quad 23$
$225223 \quad 226617 \quad 233110$
233220
continuous $|3| 22503$
$2259 / 2 / 5$
contract $13 \mid 22 / 42324$
22151
Contributed [1] 228620
contribuked $\{2\} 227412$
2286 I7
contributing [1] 228212
control [15] 21872222502

$24 \quad 235415131521$
23553
controlied |121 2252 410
$2253461 / 131622544$
$226642301 / 1 / 3236219$
controller |2| $2188 / / 22626$
controllers [1] 224316
controversy [4| 2252146
13
convention [1] $2248 / 8$
conventrons $|2| 2248 \quad 13 \quad 17$
conversations $111 \mid 222624$
$25 \quad 2227$ /4 2324 /I
2326132327561119
23292323457
conveyed 1212205914
conviction |1| 228212
cook |3| 2/92 7 22/75 13
cooked [1] 22176
cooperative |1| 21852
coordinate [2] 21684
2171 24
coordinator [13| $2168 / 5$
2181/2 $15 \quad 233413 \quad 25$
233572336222337125
71123396
Coordinators [1] 233619
coordinators |2| 22064
233617
copsed |1| $2361 / 3$
copies |l| $2219 / 4$
copy $14 \mid 220525229079$
23203
Corporate [|| 233722
corporate [1] 2337 21
corrected [2] 2254 I 23687
costing |1| 220318
costs [1] 220322
Councal [l] 224424
counsel [5] $217925 \quad 232511$
23261923466236725
counseled [1] 232616
counseling [1] 2266 //
counting [1] 23492
country |l| 2245 I
Couple [1| 2233 |
couple [8] 2203822069
2218232223222267

course [40] $2220 / 225120$

226582266417226722
226814227091423022
$231212 \quad 231910233224$
23451923471023582

2364 I 2365457881416
$\begin{array}{llllllll}17 & 19 & 22 & 2366 & 2 & 3 & 5 & 8\end{array} 13$
$16 \quad 18$
1922
courses |1| 22426
COURT 145121665221519
222725223115223947
2240822431922492
225225227158227220
22738227612227725
$2283101420 \quad 228421$
22862122871722887
2290146229861317
2522991823176
81923342234722
236715242368291315
172423692
Court||21 21664223912
$1322492226020 \quad 2272$ 18
227792298 / 1012
$2300 / 2$
court |4| 22702522784
22992323693
courtroom [5] 226724
2283922891623087
231712
COUSINS [1] 234725
Cousins [41 23472323483
2350823597
cover [2] 2257423
covered |l| 236418
covers |11 224512
Cratg III 218914
create |11 225714
created ||| 232223
crew| 26 | 2185922156
2220242221689 II 14
$22 \quad 2223218 \quad 2226422$
222712235242236568
$15 \quad 18223856923195$
2322514
crews $\{2 \mid 22252522262$
criss (1) 22703
criteria |4| 2287923008
$230420 \quad 21$
critucized |1| 225325
CROSS [3| $221025 \quad 222810$ 2290 II
cross 13121982421995
233325
cross-examination [4]
$221024221518 \quad 223114$
234721
cross-examine [2] 22719
22901
crossing [1] 218314
crude [3] $221825 \quad 221919$
cure [1] 225114
cured (1) 23173
curnus [2] 226856
current [7] 216620224112
1314224292293 IS
232322
currently $[5] 2166 \quad 16 \quad 18$
22178231813
cursory [1] 22644
curtailed [1] 228725
cut [4] $22795 \quad 230418 \quad 19$

Banc Sysuant Applicetiona
daly [2] 21722220818
damage [2] $2266 \quad 12 \quad 236220$
Dan [2] 21932221965
data [2] 22531011
date 18| 22291222308
2231102232 II 22482
2289242304 /1 231313
DATED [11 237214
dated (1) 234223
dates [1] 22303
Dave [2] 221424233420
Davs [2] 232448
DAY [2] 216611221025
Day (14) 2166101315
217715220415220523 22078221024221324 221518226722228210 day 141 ] 21766218812
21907219113522
21947182199192022,
242202252203112021
22041822069220810
220912215 14, 221823
22192225491922603
2268622732222751521
23229219230619
2310523232223509
235510237214
dayiught [2] 22051220613
Days [1] 225923
days [30] 2181 $17 \quad 21885 \quad 12$
220382204162122
$22081718 \quad 2210121617$
192214722151522268
22331472259918
22768227921229018
23061820230724
daytume [1] 223321
dead (1) 218916
deal [13] 22132221923
224411226525226612
228424232225232410
23284723296233518
dealung [2] 22384229613
dealt [2] 2220 I/ 23379
death [1] 225315
debarking (1) 235716
debriering [2] 217614
218420
deceive [2] 225734
decide $\{2 \mid 22853228717$
decided [2] 231613
deciders [1] 228422
deciding |1] 224624
decison $|4| 217719$
228425 2331 21 23383
deck $\begin{array}{llllll}99 & 2192 & 21 & 2335 & 19\end{array}$
2337 11 2341 101123426
9236067
defendants [2] 221023
221517
defense $11 \mid 230525$
deficits 111225824
definttely [1] 223717
defintion [18] 22491620
23229524252299913
23001516230717
$230810 \quad 22 \quad 23 \quad 23092811$
15232025
defintions $|4| \begin{array}{llll}2249 & 6 & 13 & 18\end{array}$ 23099

FEDERAL TRIAL"TRANSCRIPT
5-23-94 VOLUME 15 Cancondenco by LookSeodS9)
degree [2] 2241 4225510
delay (1) 226410
delayed [I] 22038
dehiver (1) 222225
delivered [1] 22389
Detozier |3| 235320
23541623552
demeanor [1] 21936
demonstrate [3] 226224
22801923169
demonstrated [2] 23161421
demotron [2] $231810 \quad 12$
Denual [1] 225615
denal [16] 22476225015
$\begin{array}{llllll}16 & 18 & 25 & 2256 & 1219 & 21\end{array}$
22573226617228110
230512172123
denstry [2] $2351 \quad 1415$
departed [2] 219558
Department [1] 224322
department [11] 22191
2226 8, 2241 17224719
23244192423271620
2332 I
departure [2] 2219 11
234211
Depended (1) 219614
depended (3) 221822
223320231115
dependence (13) 224215
2322438224524229622
$\begin{array}{llllll}25 & 2297 & 17 & 2299 & 9 & 2302 \\ 19\end{array}$
23051523078230814
23096
dependency 11123008
dependent (2) 2259710
depending [1] 22065
depends [3] 22658 2311 14 20
depret (1) 22596
depos [1] 218612
deposed [2] $2317 \quad 15 \quad 16$
deposition [25] 22701925
22713162272414
2277922907229228
2293922972467
2299132300623049
23091823111523124
2317111223345234724
depositions $|3| 229 \mid 24$
22923 S
DEPPE |1| 23346
Deppe [5] 216715216817
$219616 \quad 233458$
depressed (1) 22561
depressing (1) 225524
depression [3| 225523
2277123075
describe |11 22559
described 181219225
$226818 \quad 22693227518$
229656233925236425
describing $|4| 224616$
2261222972023116
description 191217917
2193242219522554
22751422791921
22802122
designated [1] 21939
designation [1] 234222
designed [2] 2261 Hl 15
desure [8] $217518 \quad 20$
$228010111618 \quad 230311$

## 230417

despair [1] 22581
despite [4] 22507823
227924
destructave [1] 225318
detans [1] 22121
detect [2] $228120 \quad 228821$
determine [10] 219710
2202 18, 2262122773
$2295 \quad 21232523232714$
232821723295
determined [2] 222123
23243
development [2] 22823
22865
Developmental [1] 22177
develops [1] 22564
dragnose [1] 23122
diagnosed [6] 22951222
23001323133712
dragnosss [33] 224216
2243810224823226017
2222751102276369
$\begin{array}{lllll}14 & 2295 & 2 & 6 & 13,14 \\ 15 & 15\end{array}$
$23021317 \quad 230515$
2306232523072123
230811213231012,
23121423138231525
Duagnostre [3] 229425
22954229611
deagnostuc [4] 226014
229614230421230612
Diego [2] 2167921691
difference [2] 22592
230923
differences [2] 2344310
differently [2] 220719
229311
difficult [3] 2272612
227922
digested [1] 235511
dignity [1] 225525
digress [1] 22578
diligent (1) 22083
dinner [4] 2270 17, 22818
234616
DIRECT [6] 21661122165
22402123172123346
234725
drect (4] 2190911229419 23018
directed [2] 22411923243
directung [1] 219219
durectron (1) 237213
directuves (1] 23362
director [2] 2242223163
Disability [1] 226821
disabultty [2] 232410
233123
disagree [1] 230721
dsasters [1] 225010
discern [1] 220722
discharge 3 3] 227524
$227815 \quad 230725$
dischargung [1] 219215
disciphnary [2] 23402024
discipline [1] 23273
disciplining [1] 23384
discover [1] 232721
discovered [1] 228818
discovery [1] 22148
discreet [1] 220413
discuss [8] 21821121
2187132199172422211
23281823572
dscussed [14] 217425
21796218318218716
2188242191252194 21,
221111232910,233118
233314 20, 2323672
dscussing [4] 217718
218012218218230818
discussion [11] 21699
21822421871221893
22058221220230415
23299233316233925
23678
discussions [6] 217519
22032422061125
22992123405
disease [23] $22498 \quad 9 \quad 10 \quad 24$
2250142251 I 2022
2253172255242256521
2222593226113226321
226981422865229019
21
dssorder [4] 2251 422757
230745
disorders [1] 22957
dsplay [1] 228016
displeasure [1] 219323
dsppute [1] 228423
dsquieting [1] 22283
disregard [2] 22739227613
dissatisfaction (1) 230910
dissatisfied [1] 230915
disseminate [1] 23364
distances [1] 226813
distallation [1] 22542
destunction [2] 2309610
distanguish [1] 21938
Distorted [1] 225015
distorted [2] 22501324
distributed [1] 22126
distribution [1] 220512
District [2] 22391323002
Diversion [1] 231514
diversion [1] 227223
divert [1] 227023
divertung [1] 22834
divide (1) 226918
davulgng [1] 231522
dock [1] 23429
docked (1) 22196
docking [1] 2356 I
Doctor (28) 2247722
22495225221226124
226415226752276 16,
2283 I 16228516228718
228925229492222974
2322981922998230517
2308222309525231013
2314132315223161216
doctor [14] 22182522419
$2244-91322735229515$
2123062523081123156
2327252331202423324
Doctors [1] 224820
doctors [6] 224614225821
22951711230210
document [11] 226316
227618232014232219
232353212360202125 23637
documents [2] 21939
226717
Doe [1] 21856
Doesn't [1] 228010
doesn't [4] 21781022472
22652422672
door [2] 2194 11 23223
dots [1] 23644
double [2] $22575 \quad 2282 \quad 16$
doubles [2] 22701718
doubt [2] 22769227723
Dougherty [2] 222817
22347
Dowdle [1] 221422
downtown [2] 222337
dozen [2] $2348 \quad 15 \quad 20$
Dr [38] 22401123224821
2249222538226020
22731119227456
227520227749227913
22861622871229013
2292318222422931
229682300513230622
230711230815230914
182423178232422
233213151722
drafts [1] 235120
drank [8] 22821228412
$2323451418 \quad 23265$
234622
draw [2] $217316 \quad 220921$
drawngs [1] 219922
drawn (3) $217317 \quad 18 \quad 21788$
drink (30] $217810 \quad 222718$
222862234242250711
232251322565910
22602522771819
22801522819101621
232282920232625
232772338723461520 22
drinker 141217791317 225912
drinkers [1| 225915
Drinking [1] 225518
drinks [3] 22549228214
Drive (1) 23484
drive [2] 2256922824
driver [1] 219524
drop [1] 22233
dropped [4] 22237227824
22871222
dropping [5] 22792235922
2365323677
drove [2] 22822233418
Drug [4] $221310 \quad 224121$
22422224516
drug [16] $221210 \quad 221313$
16224281422451824 23192223203712
232137121723227
drugs [2] 2248522619
drunk [14] 22211523
2222132256102258617 22701123236101519 233020233724
dry [1] 226524
dry-dock [2] 2171 1221895 dry-docked [1] 218016
dry-docking [4] 2171 1518
21727218424
DSM [2] 22942422953
DSM-III (23) 229419 21
$\begin{array}{llllllll}2296 & 4 & 13 & 16 & 19 & 21 & 22\end{array}$
2422972315229910
23008230781015

DSM-III-R [3] 229619
23001223099
DSMs [3] $229612 \quad 14 \quad 16$
Dublin (1) 2241 2
due (11 2227 )
dumpster [2] 218722
218810
Dunn [3| 217071116
duration [1] 232016
duties (11) 2168221718
2189212318172223193
18202335814233624
duty [9] 22272224824
2262923251823312225
233218234116235015
dysfunction (1) 225514
Dysthymia [2] 2276 21 22
dysthymua $6 \mid 22762021$
232277415
Dysthymic [1] 23075
dysthymic [2] 2275623074
-
early $1121224418 \quad 224517$
222260215226616
22704227825232324
$233410233614 \quad 234712$
easy [1] 2183 l3
eater [1] 235313
economic (1) 224519
economy [1] 224519
edge [1] 22442
educated [1] 230210
educatron [3] 224025
22412224825
Educatronal (1) 224424
educational [3] 22463412
effect [6] 2173622566
22583182286914
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { effects } & {[4]} & 2258 & 13 & 16 & 25\end{array}$
effort [1] 233221
efforts [1] 223514
Egypt [1] 225017
eqght $191217116 \quad 218017$
223242233722354
2270123501023513
23693
elaborate (1] 234218
element (2) $221120 \quad 23317$
elsewhere [1] 229615
emergencies [2] 229414
emergency [2] 22272
224119
emotrons [1] 2249 11
emploged [3] 216618
22361123183
employee [10] 21876
221522222181923117 $\begin{array}{llllllllllll}16 & 2326 & 21 & 2328 & 16 & 23297\end{array}$ emplogees (18) 21835611
$\begin{array}{llll}21859 & 221419 & 23 & 221810\end{array}$
22436226713231124
 23241623401
employment [3| $221 / 8$
22306226923
empty $|3| 218718 \quad 2022149$
encourage [2] 22073
231023
encouraged |3| $22 / 222$
23112232111
encourages $\mathrm{H} \mid$ 2321 14
end (11) 221514221722
22229225924226018
22692222794228723
2336623619
endorsement $|2| 234925$ 23506
enemy \|1 22562
engage |l| 22772
engine 6 6| $233711 \quad 235122$
23622021236419
engineer [111 21662124
21671321685217310
217514221421228414
233791023572
enguneering [2] $23378 \quad 10$
engineers 151216917
$\begin{array}{lllll}22263 & 23372 & 9 & 233814\end{array}$
engmes $\{2121981023632$
enormous [11 225725
ensure $[$ [ 123251023425
ental [1] $23 / 822$
enter $|2| 21685234325$
entered $|3| 2273223333$
235711
enthustastec |1| 226320
enthustastically 111226220
entuled [2] 229846
entries [4] 2361 14810
entry (10) 226920235416

236317236419
enuncrated |I| 22033
environment \|l| 23263 environmental |1| 2319 |
episode [2] 228210 Il
epsodes [2] 225410
226324
epsodic [16] 22501322
22591622608101112
$16 \quad 18227581023076$
23081323097
Equity [4] 22916101116 equivalent (1] 230515
errors [1] 22541
essence [1] 235014
essentral (1) 231920
Essentually [il 220022
essentually $[10 \mid 21684$
2174710217513217918
218122219412226425
$2294 / 232016$
established (2) 22805
232122
establishing [1] 233317
esteen [1] 225523
estrmate (4) 222047
222424235219
et [1] 232410
ETA [1] 23642

2243722473225822
$226319 \quad 232717 \quad 18 \quad 232820$
evaluated 141218312
22582522623228816
evaluating [5] 224616
22582022625226625
evaluation |111 224221
2248242263822644
226616228941322942
23152123167
evaluations [3] 218321
219423224710
evening [4] 228521234923
2359823605
evenings $11 \mid 221514$
event |4| 2281 2323013
2333723585
events $191218215 \quad 22305$
2273 / 2354823638
eventual [1] 227913
eventually [3] 217515
225716231515
Everybody [1] 225020
everybody (10) 224914
22558914225610
2274212422801018
229510
evidence f61 22072522775
228423228845230121
exact 1412217 21 222912
223082232 II
exactly $\mid 912171721791$
22301822367235714
exaggeratrons |11 225514 exam [2| 22452
EXAMINATION 1912166 //
22102522165222810
224021229011231721
23346234725
examination [3] 221022
2213 / 2245 /1
FXAMINER 1131216612
21882022024622111
22141014221510
23172223347234113
$2348 / 236314$
example (5] 2203422434
2246 11 225814227923
Except [2] 227912303 11
except [2] 2264423087
exceptrons [1] 231120
exchange [2] $217313 \quad 18$
exclude [11 22158
excluding [2] 217924
exclusively (1) 22261
Excuse [1] 22157
excuse [3| 21692218713 226124
excused |11 236724
exercising |l| 228410
Fxhibit 1131227431718
22909229471023203
102322182323433
23631223686
exhibit [4] 2277323207
2364 II 23683
existence [12] 21694
$\begin{array}{llllll}22114 & 2296 & 1215 & 21\end{array}$
23001223081114123092
| 523192323204
feedback [2] 21821214
feel [4] $219612198 \quad 17$
226314236711
feeling (2) 2183 I 22581
feelings [2] 21976220122
fees (1) 23161
feet (1) 217419
fellow [1] 21836
fellowship [1] 225724
felt [9] $218213 \quad 219723$
2202 II 2204 11 12
22091623225515231519
field [6] 224622252119
22841722894229225
[igure [1] 225320
figures |1| 225413
file (1) 220524
files [1] 220525
filled (1] 221917
film [1] 225923
Films [1] 22465
films [4] 224656225924
229015
final |l| 22542
find [3) 226342336 // 23658
findings [1] 225325
fine [1] 228613
Finshed (1) 2355 I
finshed (5] 21841122731
2231013235712
finshes [1] 23583
finshing (1) 22797
Fire (1) 224322
fire |l| 224719
fired III 226310
firefighters |l| 224321
First |3| $2230 / 8 \quad 226212$
236619
first (50| 2166 21 216713
216931721751321884 $2191 / 219813220117$ 220813221126221436
22201222301617
22311118223271012
2239722411522498 22502122551621 225920 2271 IS 228116 $228322229318 \quad 22978 \quad 12$
231519231612232018
2334823371723469
2363320236562366 22 25
fit |4| 2262823312225 233218
fitness [3] 224412224710 224824
fitted [1] 235123

222423222522237512
2238202224223919
2270172276422979
$2301323164 / 4233023$
23681922
fix $1112365 / 2$
fixed $1112365 / 2$
flat (1) 2202 /7
flet [271 $2168 / 812$
$2169716 \quad 2175101117$
21851921892321927
220724222713232511

233414232335111318
2336423374233821
2342242343123441218
Fletcher [1] 23483
flew [2] 22684233419
flight (1] 224323
flughts [1] 233416
Florida [1] 23484
fly [2] 22681114
fly-by-night [1] 219822
focus [3] 22261228623
228812
focused [1] 226120
foes [1] 22642
foggy [2] 22301223917
follow [5] 21743217623
226610234318
follow-up [3] 232418
2325723305
followed [2] 218123236516 following [10] 2176621915 222194722512022655 22751522781523041415
follows [1] 224924
Force [1] 221613
forefront [1] 21997
foregoing [2] 2372911
Foreign [1] 224424
foregn [1] 22451
forgot [1] 22734
form [8] 2261182269 4, 6
227511162276822785 ,
228520
formal [3] 2201 9, 23038 232122
formainty [1] 232125
formed [7] 226910227412
2278102283 / 1622
228616
forming [1] 22713
forms [4] 22421523
224518226119
fortunate [1] 22467
forward [8] 221224231024
2311236101112
found [7] 222122222724
2278 4, 227922228825
2339117
founder [2] 22561230425
Four [2] 218816222423
four [31] 2167721881418
2204212223221016
221816172222722252
$2237512 \quad 223818 \quad 2022$
24223919225352021
22543227015,17227117
22792422858229912
234892349723515
four-hour [1] 228418
fourth [1] 225013
frame (10) 21781719
21819218512221212
221431723194232317
232411
Francisco [9] 21891718
21988220321220415
2210822271122892024
Frank [11] 23244121517 $20 \quad 23251023261315$
232752328621
Frankly [1] 219821

Consordence by Look-Seci011
free [1] 226317
frequented [1] 222417
frequently [3] 22514
22802023235
fresh [1] 22259
friction [1] 21961
friends [2] 22641
front [2] 222418223424
full [13] 216613221017
221525225720,22848
23168231723,232825
2348223515,236121 ,
23622124
full-tume [1] 22425
fun [1] 222119
function [4] 22571424
23121423199
functions [7] 22584811
22226431223198
future [3] 218321231112 17
fuzzy [2] 2200 20, 233123

- G -

G-1a [1] 23644
gailey (1) 21929
Galveston [9] $218912 \quad 13$
15, 2191221927131415
219315
gamut [2] 22592225
gangplank [1] 22868
gangway (4) 22191022228
1013
gantries [1] 226812
garbage [1] 218722
GARRETT [2] 224021
229011
Garrett [2] 22401118
gate [2] 222124222516
gathering [1] 223723
gaugers (1) 221915
gauges (1] 23538
gave [10] 216912217917
220282308222309811
20, 231220234511234913
gee [1] 220122
generate [1] 227216
gentleman [t] 23042
gentlemen [6] 21665
2239822738228422
229919236715
George [l] 221421
gets (5) 2250922512
22671229817236122 giddy [1] 227019

2229122230358 ,
22321122401625
22491622531522555
2259171822641122674 6, 22731422971223053 52324192342823547
23562523645236617
given [13] 226622227120
22731022752325
2282141522849230415 231662339623413
23425
gives (1] 2244 I
grving [5] 218214227210

2322731323548
Gla [1] 23644
glass [3] $222418 \quad 19$
234616
goes [12] 224425225137
22812322831022878
230321230411718
230513231712
goof [2] $231718 \quad 20$
goofed [1] 231718
Goose [1] 226816
gorgeous [1] 22685
Gould [3] 22602022969
230815
government (3] 226313
226716229519
gradually [1] 236220
graduate [1] 221616
Graduates [1] 224425
grateful [1] 22639
GRAVES [1] 2317 21
Graves [11] 226912
$\begin{array}{llllll}22708 & 231711 & 15 & 23 & 25\end{array}$
2320223221823238
Great [1] 234723
greatest [21 2253922562
GREGORY 111234725
Gregory [2] 23472323483
grocery [1] 222310
grounded [1] 219823 grounding [33] 2179410
2185 17, 21952121985
2200211220120220425
$220556101419 \quad 220612$ 2207162022099223215 19232278723016
2330162340523452022
234928924235522
236111
group [29] 21681421703
2178421811214218314
219317220642021
22521022546226312
226510227512233324
2334132523356233617
18222337125710 23396
groups [4] 224721225417 22611922634
guarantee [2] 2171 $18 \quad 19$
Guard [3] 228225228415 25
guarded [1] 225110
guess [7] 22291422551
22741823196232925
233219235415
gudance [2] $2176 \quad 20 \quad 22952$
guides [3] $22956 \quad 13 \quad 14$
gult (I) 225720
gulf [1] 232511
Gulkana [1] 22162
guy (4) 2178610219723
231714
Guys [1] 222521
$-\frac{-\mathrm{H}_{-}}{-}$
habrt [1] 217311
hadn't (2] $2210 \quad 10 \quad 223418$ half $[131223015 \quad 16 \quad 17 \quad 18$ 22327810228119

22978234825235023
halfway [1] 229715
hallway [3] 220051723088
Hand [1] 234917
hand [4] 22401223202
23221823429
handle [4] 21752323344
233517236824
handled [31 $2206 \quad 19 \quad 223616$ 233711
hamdwritung [2] 236115 23623
handwritten [1] 227511
handy [1] 22909
happens [1] 22509
happy [1] 22638
harassment [1] 232410
Harborview [2] 221778
hard [2] 2197 11 23262
harder (1) 226112
Harvey [14] 2168819
217915161921865
2187102206520220825
233416202122
haunt [1] 218315
haven't [1] 222813
hazy (1) 22009
he'd [7] 217416220910
222322229823254
234625235713
he'll [1] 23582
head [1] 23541
headed [1] 223619
heading (4) 22032122363
22835232019
headquarters 11121678
health (1) 224118
hear $771217020 \quad 21979$
2205223271233316
2357523647
Heard (1) 21996
heard (34) 217023217216
1821741620217548
218125218582198513
23219914220017
22022322032220534
22133225016226725
226812277922784
228062282911228515
2286222891622965
230924
hearing (2] 21972423348
hearings (1) 23424
Hearsay [1] 222720
Heavy [1] 228216
heavy $[9] 217791317$
22551722591215
2270162271222282 !
heightened (1] 21854
held [6] 216710218319
23191523352233713
2372 II
helmsman [1] 23566
help [14] 22122422396
226111192270121
2288112292182122
229414231024231113 23551
helped [1] 233416
helpful [3] 22052222689 16
helps [4| 225615227625
2277122805
Heker [1] 22545
Henry [6] 2172141923
217319218725
Herb [251 21744512
217552176241723
$21772518 \quad 22 \quad 21781321$
24217922 2181 23
21821621832218420
$2187912 \quad 17$
HERBY H 23728
heroin [1] 224517
hide (1) 222523
hiding [1] 225721
Hugh (1) 221615
high [3] 2216142265712
hughly [1] 230210
Huchunbrook [4] 234322
2344923491415
hindsight |11 220124
hure [1] 220321
hired 17121662221693
22112221725231516
23162 18
huring (2) $2315 / 1 / 3$
historical ||| 232322
hat [1] 219820
hold [3] $216623 \quad 225610$ 233613
holding (1) 23471
home (11) 21915224912
2250922569227016
22712222822023268
233081223482
Honor 1451221023221517
202227202122289
2231/2 14223961215
2240610224320224815
$212252222271 / 2612$
2272212273617227724
228371922883622902
522983142223001
23047
2316252317710233325
2347202367192023683
5
hope (1) 22101
hopefully |11 220919
hoping 11122676
Hopkins (4| 224I 71620 21
Hospital [3| 2241 6226920 22733
hospital [11] 22423226216
182270222771622805
$228218 \quad 2306810 \quad 230725$
233220
hospitalization [3] 226921
22, 24
hotel (I) 21704
hour $|8| 223322 \quad 2234115$
161723502323515
235315
hours [91 2191222223 / 5
2235422371622392
22858234258
housekeeping [1] 23691
Houston [4] 2167723186
23261823383
HR [1] 232419
human $15 \mid 22558 \quad 12$
2318192223283
hundred [1] 22277
hurt [1] 2264 I
————

1d|21| 2201172220712
2221/ 222225222338
2224 / || 22252122277
2234232235322368
2238202260423361
235221236371123686
I've 1291 $217013 \quad 217411$
21791821812221823
21938219412222416
222519223657224656
22481622692227314
228062284922923
2296522981723059
233545623421023434
Ian [1] 221424
Iarossi [11] 22672123245
61223256232613
23275122328618 232910

23642323674569
IDA [1] 23109
Idea [12] $221216 \quad 222925$
22322422531522666
22818229911230914
232719233116236225
identified $\{3 \mid 217225$
22122123685
identifies |2| 22662224
identufy $|2| 221223232219$
identity ||| 221125
IDR [11| 2268192022743
1622773229411230625
23082320
ugnore \{31 22739228720
22889
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { illness } & \text { (6) } & 2212 & 10 & 13 & 16\end{array}$
23202123281213
illumination (1) 23057
unage [2| 22571424
umagine [4] 2200618
22057226521
ummedrate [3] 218113
21961013
immediately [1] 21996
impact [1] 219423
impaired [11] 221712
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2250 & 2 & 2283 & 17 & 23 & 24\end{array}$
228521228627
umparment [1] 232023
impending [1] 22663
implemented [1] 233310
mpled [1] 23107
mportant [6] 220211
2251 11225614225710
2327923316
impossible [1] 23145
mpress.on 171217214
2177162179112183 I
2193 /1 2323212333 I
umpulsive [1] 22571
m-person (1) 218414
mability |11 232022
uncident 140121761217711

19232178142221797
$\begin{array}{lllllll}23 & 24 & 2180 & 1 & 8 & 12 & 20\end{array}$ 218120218211218320 $21849182221854 / 122$ 218612710131425 21873721882422035 202209822146812 234512
incidents [3] 219925
22001223367
melude [3] $2246 \quad 16 \quad 2291 \quad 13$ 23276
merease [1] 2264 1]
ucreases [1] 218316
mereasing [1] 23651
indefinite [1] 229610
undrate [10] $217416 \quad 2178$ I
21796921827218324
219712286 6, 233222 236712
undicated [13] 21761117
21864219311322708
2122771012228724
23092223236233114 indicates [3] $227510 \quad 22767$ 2288
indicating [2] $2172 / 3$ 23626
indscation [6] 217621 $2177222193512 \quad 219518$ 236623
Individual |1] 2268 2] individual [14] 216815 2193242197717 2201 10 2206322091922105 226213227512227623 23128234220 individuals [3] 220] 12 23051823244 indulge [1] 23046 Industry 11| 224516 unevitably [1] 225622 nexorably |1] 225317 mference [1] 219523 inferred |1| 23108 influence |l| 22468 inform |2| $2197 / 222122$ nformally |1| 21836 information [31] 21825 2186421902221967 2200242201518220211 2204 /1 2205913220724 $220916 \quad 171921221034$ 22122622491822696
22721522742227511
2278522811523283
2336323525
informed 111121694
2181162195112211310 $1 / 22121214232269$ 235725
informing |3| 218122
22012522124
infractions [1] 2327 I
Initual [1] 219118
initual [7] $219023 \quad 25 \quad 21916$
9172312127
Initully (1) 2199 |
untually [5] $216622 \quad 21991$
$4228782329 / 2$
inituated [4| $21846 \quad 218520$

219014219410
mjured [3] 2238565
mpatuent [4] 2243 II
$\begin{array}{lll}2273 & 22 & 2275 \\ 15 & 22787\end{array}$
unside [3] 2224 /I 222522
inspect [2] $22643 \quad 229914$
inspection [1] 226620
inspector [4] 216769
21751522152
unstance [2] $2277 \quad 14 \quad 2325 \quad 17$
unstances [1] 21834
instutute (1) 225121
instruct [1] 23362
ustructed \{3] 2346 l 5
23476
instruction (1] 2367 /6
instructions [2| 2264 11
23396
unstructor [1] 2241/7
unsurance (2] 2295820
untegral [1] 225621
untegrity [2] $231520 \quad 23166$
intended [1] 23672
mtends (l] 236623
intent [2] $23216 \quad 232821$
intention |l| 236617
interact [4] $222622 \quad 22298$
23352225
interacted $\{5] 2220522294$
$\begin{array}{lll}16 \quad 17 & 22315\end{array}$
interactung |l| 22209
interaction [? 222979
interactions [2] 2229 /] 21
interchangeably [3] 225910 23081619
unterest (2) 2178622687
unterested [4] 22267
22272322465232610
interests [1] 217110
unterm (2) 21923235721
intermedıate [1] 2332 J
unternal [1] 2267 15
International |l| 224820
interaship [1] 224) 5
interrupt |1| 225223
interval |2| 227| 2123594
intervening [1] 224] 15 interventions ||| 224824
interview |4| $22118 \quad 22127$
22281623301
unterviewed $\{2122347$
233223
intimidate [1] 222824
intoxicated [3] 2270 1]
2321823241
intoxication (2) 225410 225817
natroduced ||| 226623
investugate $\mid$ ? $\mid 2198 / 22028$
unvestugation |4| 22703
$2289 / / 233689$
involuntarily |1] 226622
involve |!| 220622
involved [27] 216717
2175922217817218117
232185562190322002
2201212203622061620
252217322231122463
$227525 \quad 229014231823$
2319123248232722
$233192336 / 123378$
mvolvement [3] 218420
2191223304
Ireland [3] 224135
rritability [1] 226523
Island [6] 22681516
2343222344923642
ssuance [1] 232013
ussue [4] 2183322534
23257232812
sssued [3] $232011 \quad 2322 \quad 22$
233924
issues [4] 22441222968
2319123249
Item [1] 22764
items [1] 217120

- J -

Jack (3) 21713221423
225924
JAMIN [8] 22152022166
2227212228 2, 4, 8
2231 12, 22406
January [11] 2230192224
2231172222392222403
22724233714
jeopardize [1] 231111
jeopardzed (1) 231117
Jersey [1] 234516
Jum [5] 2228 12, 235312
2354223565
job [34] 217512220922
22121922181222198
22552522752422828
231111121723121711
15162313723141619
23202323281214
2335222336162024
233713152338691113
234524
jobless [1] 226510
jobs [1] 224618
Joe [16] 220920222029
101314222462022785
23234212325111
23292223301
John |13| 218552241716
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}20 & 21 & 2325 & 10 & 232615 & 18\end{array}$
1923271232822232914 jouned [3] 22089224124
231311
jouns [1] 2280 11
jokey [1] 227019
Joseph (4) $222615 \quad 222715$ 2222285
Journal [3] 224921230022 23011
journal [1] 224922
JOY [1] 237221
Jr [1] 231725
Judge [1] 21669
judge [2] 22431821
judgment [11] 225813
$\begin{array}{llllll}22646 & 228317 & 24 & 228410\end{array}$
22852122862610
233218
July [9] $223022 \quad 24223118$
22227825228723
231912234223
juncture [1] 23336
June [4] 218019223021

227825228723
junsor [3] $217517 \quad 220758$
Jury [7] 2166222391011
2299242523672423681
Jury [10] $224211 \quad 22579$
22676226915227613
$228716 \quad 17 \quad 229016$
230823230924

## - K -

Kaneely [1] 22151
Kansas [1] 22168
keep [14] 2173 22, 21752
1821811621832222615
22271422611523386
2339132340910,23413
234525
keeps [1] 225619
kept [4] $221112 \quad 23 \quad 2212.3$
234521
kid [1] 221611
Kumtas [1] 221421
kinds [4] 222224225518
22571228515
King [2] 21713221423
Kingwood [1] 23182
kutchen [1] 222610
Klunckhardt [1] 220220
knots [1] 23641
know-how [1] 229411
knowing [3] 22562022827 22933
knowledge [27] 216915
21872722051320
2207112226 17, 227910
$\begin{array}{llllll}2281 & 13 & 23168 & 2325 & 18 & 20\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2330 & 10 & 14 & 18 & 2331 & 18 & 19\end{array}$
233246723382124
2339 13, 2344111623454 23667
Kunkel [3] 235422356510

- L -

L-U-N-T [1] 22163
L A [1] 229324
labeling (1) 22593
Labor (3) 21687231823
23248
Laboring [1] 23331
Ladies (3) 22738228422
236715
Ladues [3] 2166522397
229919
lanes [1] 22834
Lapse [1] 228121
largely [1] 226916
larger [1] 217119
largest (I) 221922
Last [2] 22592222684
Last [14] 217014221525
221913223015224016
225019226020226725
2273922891523005
23041123222523233
lasted (1] 217115
lasts [1] 235315
late [5] 216721223458
17227825
Gteral [1] 231812
letest [2] 22332423362
launch (8) 2192121416
1721219317219524
law [2] 23244234214
lawyer [1] 217925
lawyers [9] 217924220113
224614229121229214 15229520230416
lead (1] 229211
leading [3] $228216 \quad 228517$ 19
leads (1] 225722
learned [4] 21771222046
2247423264
leave [15] 21731122184
$\begin{array}{llll}2223 & 12 & 2238 & 17 \\ 2275 & 25\end{array}$
228923232523233015
2356152021235710
235920236624236710
leaving [6] 22372422833
2285923444235622 23573
LeСam [4] $2359715 \quad 18$ 236013
lectures [3] 227513230821 231011
Legal [1] $2346 \sigma$
legible [1] 227424
Lemon [1] 225924
Lent [2] 22591718
letter [4] $2316 \quad 5 \quad 232414$
23422324
letters [1] 226714
level [1] 230116
levels [1] 232817
Leyendecker [21] 217445
91223217515217627
2321772521781322
21792221871213
2203242522041
license (9) 22442122453
723132223141122
2343523492523506
Icensed [4] 224424
2321242322514
Icenses [2] $224419 \quad 2245 \quad 12$
lie [3] 22571517
lied (2) 22721416
Les (1] 225715
life [12] $2250610 \quad 225756$
2270322819228216
$231310 \quad 23308 \quad 12$
Ifetume [5] 2248 11 22517
2309222310512
light [4] 2312192523131
hightering [2] $218916 \quad 18$
lights [1] 236822
liked [2] 22271822286
Likewise [1] 231418
lumited [1] 217818
lumitang [1] 220612
lune (3) $2297915 \quad 23373$
lines [1] 22978
Luquor [3] 2235711225610
Lst [2] 22589234320
Listen [1] 236716
listening [1] 236810
Iterally [1] 22604
Live [1] 224021
live [2] 22161122575
Lived (2) 221620222417
Lives [2] 22567231416
living (1) 225717
Load [7] $23621518 \quad 23634$ $23641925 \quad 23651$
load [4] $2351 \quad 20 \quad 23525$
23539235414
loading [1] 23524
locate [1] 222411
locating [1] 230412
locations [4] $2188915 \quad 17$

## 22236

$\log [6] 235416 \quad 236021$
23616811236419
logger (2) $236411 \quad 15$
logreal [1] 23246
lonehness [1] 225725
looks [2] 227520231713
Los [5] 224019224124
22423224321229316
lose [1] 225524
loss (1) 22502
lot $\begin{array}{llll}22) & 2170 & 13 & 2171 \\ \text { la }\end{array}$
21951621972121996
220051622032222055
22071722091922239
2236122243422505
2252222561022671419
22821230224
lots [1] 219120
loud [2] 219219222119
loudness [1] 219311
lounges [1] 21928
hove [1] 235213
low [1] 225523
LPU [1] 23626
lunch [4] 2191 22235020
2223517
LUNT (2) 22165222810
Lunt (11) 221521221627
$\begin{array}{llll}2228 & 12 & 223213 & 223310\end{array}$
1522351622391722405
226812
Lyung [1] 22572
lying [1] 226323
LYNCH [6] 23671922
2368351214
Lyach [1] 236720


MD [2] 224021229011 machne [2] 220525 machunery [2] 216762215 ) man [4] 221913222024
222225223723
mam [5] 219316219810
225218225719227013
mantan (4) 224720
22521114225424
mantamed [1] 23118
mantaining [1] 232620
major [4] 224925225323
2266322819
majority [1] 225914
man [3] 22072422545
229316
management [14] 2169816
192170192202222072
1922091422265,1223 ,
224718232215234023
manager [13] 216812
217462218923181617

23192123211232213
232511232621233423
23351823374
managers [2] 226215 226720
maneuvering [1] 236224
manifestations [1] 2250 )
manpower (1) 231825
Manual (21 2294252296 /I
Manuals |I| 22954
manuals [3] 22601422955
2296 14 -
March [301 2169821704
218910252190521954 2197421985220320
220952210622128 ,
2230192122376223922
224822268922788
2282232283318228412
2287222892023349
23358234711235012 19
marital [3] $2275 \quad 12 \quad 228218$ 20
Martume |l| 221719
martume [2] 22331213
Mark [2] 22538228724
mark [2] 236525
marked [4] 23202232218
236312236524
marriage [I] 225519
married [1] 221622
Marshal (1) 216715
Martuneau [2) 220424
23432
Mary [261 $218613 \quad 219013$
 21925219311519
21941812219531013
2321963721991725
2203522098228124
Maryland [2] 2241622453 master $[17] 21671421714$, 22101922331924
2235102322401228919
24232215232512
233122233549234220
235818
Masters |11 22931
masters [8] 21671622262
$23226233523 \quad 2338712$
13234225
mate (16) 22142122153
2335423431423488
23511923535611
23542235524716
2356523611
material [4] 22469227314
22926232012
materials [7] 2225422464
226792268182269317 22783
mates [2] 21691822263
Matter (1) 230315
matter (19) 2229222301
223262235131922388 132250917229023
22915229919230312
2309182311423169
23311823672223
matters [2] 2295 9, 237211

McRobbse [5] 216816
2196162200101921
Meade [1] 2216 15
meal [2] $235415 \quad 235512$
mean [25] 217222218224
221578 II 222120
222532226222298
22372022591922609
22617226423228010
231924232322232622
23271725232811
23371923399235816 235922
means [14] $223818 \quad 224910$ 225082256422601112 226182322629226424 252272922811023062
meant [4] 217319217511
220922229521
measures |1| 22028
Measuring [1] 235114
mechanical [3| 21988
21993220617
mechanusm [3] 230S 25
232122
mechansms (1) 225613
medıa $\{512199613 \quad 16$
220017
Medrcal (6) 2244925
22471822492123011 231618
medical [32] 2241249.
224227224425224615
22552225914228622
$\begin{array}{llll}2287 & 24 & 2289 & 13 \\ 2293 & 15\end{array}$
23117231214231322
231510252316317
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}2324 & 19 & 23 & 2327 & 16 & 20\end{array}$

3
medrcation [1] 231415
Medicine [5] 22417224510 22491523002225
medxcine [7] $224213 \quad 22453$
79224822225219
Mediterranean |1| 233717
meet 110121902221969
22202228042299913
$23007230420 \quad 234214$
meeting [8] 22002522273
226212227924234419
2423451523
meetungs [20] 2248810
2263152279181921
228012162223228114
23034232521419
23316 12, 23404
member [11] 22271
22352422369223856
102248622491922915
823051
members [14] 222025
22218911142222233
182236561518224322
232214
Membership [1] 23034
membershp [6] 22809 2I
2303189
memo [3] 22691232225
234223
memoranda (1] 226715
launch to memoranda

Memorral [1] 22415
memory [6] 223917
2255242258131422647
233123
men [1] 222212
Mendelsohn [1] 22923 mental [5] $22501419 \quad 24$ 25225621
mentally [1] 2217 /1
mention [4] 21911022589 2366 19, 22
mentroned [19] 217119
218015218216218614
21889220012221118
22561222612226421
228025229823230015
230182302812230512
234423235715
mere [1] 231112
ment [1] 230920
message [6] $2202 / 322066$
722133224612
messages [2] 220619
messenger [1] 22014
mud (4) 227032331 11
2336623598
middle |1| 229412
Muland (1) 225923
mild (1) 23075
miles (I) 2344 1
Mill (1) 23483
mulhon |1| 226116
milloons (1) 2246 II
mend flll 219719219824
2199522031322258
224852249 /1 226817
23391923234620
mind-altering [1] 226] 9
minding [1] 229322
mine [3] 219120224523 23627
minumize [1] 219222
minumum (1] 224712
Munnesota [1] 227516 minor [2] $236722 \quad 236818$
manute $161 \begin{array}{llllll}2219 & 13 & 2221 & 18\end{array}$
22362223720225614 227023
minutes |16| 21772522399 2299222323432323449 235024235123235222 232353216236710 23681922
mischaracterization [2] 22871522884
misconduct [1] 2321 23 msidentufied [1] 23683 mistake [2] 2198 IS 16
Mister |l| 219625
mode (1) 234919
model (1) 227516
moderate |4| 2254789 //
modern ll| 2198 /8
moment [3| 2215523046 231625
Monday [2| 2191 | 226725 money (2] 22031822
montor [131 2171 23
220822222615222722 231623233111233310 23381113234010

2346242347523539 montored (4] 22071224 2316 12 17
Monitoring [1] 231613 monitoring [11] 23161321 $232522 \quad 23331317 \quad 20$ 233972523406234717 235414
MONTAGUE ${ }^{[33} \mathbf{3} 224010$
222248152122494
2253222712 12, 25,
2272212222731822747
102122227615227812
$2283121521 \quad 228420$
2285131422862425
2288131422892522984
1423177
Montague (9) 22521623
2253122654228310
228562288 /I 234322 23449
Montgomery 161232422
233213151722
month (5) 22172122317
225410227211230411
months [15] 216778
218516222592231925
22582322641322701
22712223227624
227820231311
moodiness [1] 22702
morale [1] 225723
Morgan 111216615
morning |18| 2166521908
219152199922068
22332222402324
225920226025228210
230823233410234923
23501023671823694
Mostly [1] 230217
mostly (3) 225223230215
move $161219316 \quad 221618$
22721922808229824
231812
moved [3] 21675 2241 24 225717
movies [2] 2259622913
MS |3| $22102322 / 3$ )
221517
Ms |11 2282 /]
myself 11312187922064
220923222122244 1
226442268522861
229382313712232723 233417
$-\mathbf{N}=$

Naked (1) 23642
name [20] 216613217023
2189921911012219322
21983622152522161
2222622401622922325
2293423107231723
23482236022
named (1) 21734
names |6| 21692321705
21932522111522681
22935
narrative [1] 2273 14
narratives (1) 225223

Narrows [12] 23417919 234372356172357812
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}14 & 25 & 2358 & 11 & 14 & 18\end{array}$
Nathan [1] 22152
nation (1) 224519
Natonal (1] 226717
Naturally [1] 22687
naturally [1] 22505
nature (10] 21751922066
22125222625227524
22761323291516,
23402021
navigated [1] 232724
navigation (2] 220619
233520
NEAL [8] 222811223114
1622396,151622405 236825
Neal [3] 222812223115 22395
needs [1] 228623
negatuve [3] 218320
2265 23, 25
neighbor (1) 22004
network [1] 22468
Neurology [1] 22456
newest [1] 219817
News [1] 21997
night [11] 21914221516
226815228317228510
$16 \quad 18 \quad 19,234525 \quad 234610$ 21
aughts [1] 221515
Nine (1] 223719
nune [4] 2237172021
230720
Nobody [1] 23142
non-drinking [3] 23262022
non-spiritual [1] 226118
noon (1] 223321
Normal [1] 221823
normal [15] 220521221217
22131222231422647
2266722891011232118
2351252353 15, 235925
Normally [1] 23604
normally [4] 218114
235510235913236122
North [1] 234812
notably [2] 22501525
Notary (1] 237221
note [2] 2246122764
noted (1] 229716
notes [5] 229282352 13,
2353124237210
notuce [2] 21785227023
noticeably [4] $222115 \quad 23$
222213
noticed [1] 23472
Notwithstanding [1] 22046
notwithstanding [1] 22049
November [6] 216622
2169222112223314
23139234511
NTSB [1] 226717
Number [6] 22622324
22941023422223631112
number [13] 219222
2197222239222466
224817225322226223
2267 14, 227567232019
$234813 \quad 236810$
numbered [1] 236317 numbers [3] 22751229418 236810
nuts [1] 218411

## - 0 -

O'CONNOR [2] 224021 229011
O'Connor [12] 22401118
2322482122492227311 1922861622871229013 2300523178
O'NEILL [9] 21669221022
$23171020,23343,234723$,
2367132368 16, 18
O'Neill [3] 2166 8, 225016
236825
O-C-O-N-N-O-R [1] 224018
Oakland (2] 2334 18, 19
Oaks [4] 2269 20, 2273 2,
22781623069
oath [1] 2272 11
Object [1] 228714
object (4] $2227 \quad 20 \quad 223112$
225222228619
Objection [7] 2271 I
2276102277 24, 22837
22851122883
objection (6] 2213922491
227219227612227725
236816
objects [1] 219322
obligated [1] 218116
oblugation [1] 234116
observable [1] 226124
observations [1] 234716
observe [4] 23281619
23471423538
observed [1] 219413
obsession [1] 22666
obstacle [1] 225622
obvious [1] 2300 11
Obviously [1] 225416
obviously [5] 227020
2284523071323092.

231010
occasion [177 217020
2188721911223220925
22219112226622346
22371522 25, 223848
22711921234514
Occaswonal (1) 224321
occasional [1] 224318
Occasmonally [1] 222512
occasionally [i] 23235 occasions [17] 22047
221110222320222919
22331722376223925 ,
2270122272172323710
15233020222523312 234713
occur [5] 2180921851518 21904233911
occurred [14] 2172.11
$21791021818,21,23$,
2233578,17223921
2330252331323368 ,
234524
occurring (1) 218616

October (1] 22168
offer [2] 22482122852
offered (1) 23687
ofthand [1] 23565
office (401 $21678 \quad 216818$
217310217413192122
2185 19, 218923219411
2196152199811220011 1323220110220522 220612208422201820
242221222271213
22381222945233414
23356711
1315233931823528
officer [26] 217517218314
219422220432207589
$2233151925 \quad 22349$
223510232240122626
23212423426920
234919235217235411
1923561223601
officers [131 216917
2183132207722189
2243232258212322514
233522337423401
23451623628
official [1] 230324
oft-repeated [1] 236716
Oh [18] 21908219118
2215122220242222725
222582235322383
22461322471122496
22684202273422976
2319623269
oh [4] $21678 \quad 224711$
22525225612
ol [11] $2219 \quad 14 \quad 18 \quad 19$
22671618226923
227816228119228224
23194236820
okay [8] $219020 \quad 221512$
2230182422311822996
235225236823
old [2] 2216922171
on-going [2] 22942232814
on-site [2] 21679
ones [8] 217017219820
222920224982253712
22581222854
open [3] 217819226322
23222
openly (I] 226324
operate [1] 229416
operates [1] 23222
operatung [2] 221312
234225
operation [4] 2181 18
21982022235125
operatronal [3] 220316
23351823367
operations [6] 22181415
2333232335192023378
operator [1] 228413
opmion (50] 219218
2213142522141225116
2253 14, 22594922608
226971012151622713
22721324227319
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}2274 & 11 & 12 & 13 & 2276 & 16 & 19\end{array}$
22772022227851012
1322811228311622

2284145228520
$\begin{array}{llllll}2286 & 14 & 16 & 22874 & 13 & 19\end{array}$
20228892022891822
2300723072323423
opunins [7] 22694230225
2345202125234635
opportunitues [2] 231117
23226
opportunity [3] 22201620
226310
opposed (1) 21855
opposite [1] 226520
Order (1] 21664
order [7] 224512257415
2262112316523525
236522
ordering [8] 21732521754
218212199182522137
1420
ordinary [3] 225512
231211232417
Oregon [1] 21711
organization [4] 230324
23051231819231919
organizatrons [1] 23222
orgmally [1] 230024
Orleans [11 2348 /3
ought [7] 21977226120
228912229814231212
13235715
ourselves (1] 22682
outcome (1) 225418
outfit [2] $221716 \quad 223312$
outpatuent [1] 2243 1]
outside [7] 22201822834
823312024233248
overhear [3] 21739219010
219222
overheard [2] 217212
2174 /4
overrule [1] 23322
oversee [2] 2312515
overseeng ( 3121748
221425
owned (11) 2343 I
$-\quad-\mathbf{P}$
pm [3] 2299252368 I
23695
package [1] 230413
packed (1) 233417
Page [3] 22971023631617
page lll $229413 \quad 22978 \quad 13$
229972304923424
236318
pages [1] 226722
pard [5] $22351314 \quad 223625$
229120229311
pain (1) 225513
paint [1] 221425
paperwork [5] $23528 \quad 12 \quad 16$ 20
paragraph [3] 22997
23222523233
parameters [5] 22652
22951723081723193
234913
Pardon [3] $222620 \quad 223412$ 223718
pardon [2| 22976231222
parentheses [1] 236022
parked [1] 2268 I3
parking [2] 22239
Part [1] 233813
part [30] 2169 || 218214
218412220820221122
221292213122198
2220202250622511922
225621225721718
22592122704227315
227662312916232124
2325 14 232814233869
11235125235911
participant [2] 21909 ll
participate [1] 224220
partacipated (2) 224615
229214
partucipating [3] 226110
2263523035
participation [3] 22633
227919228022
Parts [11 236310
parts [5] 21686221223
225123227118
party (11) 23299
pass |3| 21902222015
222215
Passed [11 22928
passed [31 21864 2201 18 22103
patuent [2] 22952223084
patuents (9) 22421418
22432613226616
229518231415
pattern [7] 225915226424
2271202281202282614 22847
patterns [3] 2250131524
paying ||| 2316 I
peer 121217517220110
People [2] 22594226425
perceived [11 232123
percent (8) 22431522536
82021225431122657
perception [1] 22647
perfectly (1) 2286 /3
perform (1) 23167
performance [18] 218215
21831221842421851
231215781617
 233321
period 134121801921916
2208 15 22220912
2212822141622171520
222052225114223012
2233112242121224712
2248 / 2251722692122
2272112281252282520
$23138234013 \quad 2523411$
234710
2355181923586
perrods [4] 225916226013
226918
permanent [3] 21672
228068
permission [3] 226214
2298 / 236821
permits |1| 2253 ||
permitted |2| 228923
231619

Perrier 111217016
persist |1| 225818
Person [2| $217342266 / 8$
person [46] 2172 13 217510
1122067221125221215
202218722194222012
222219222618225422
225522260112261819
$22 \quad 22621922 \quad 22659$
2266813212322671
2272102276252289712 23041724
2305 1 1314231110
231715232123232813
23319252332121416
1723384
personal [3] 2212522262$]$
231825
personally [2] 233117
234624
personnel [6] 221422
231824232492336510 23426
persons [6] 224224
224617225415228015
22861223406
perspective [1] 23283
pertaining [2] $2275 \quad 13$
22765
ph 5122151222817
2253822546225923
phone 121222818233410
phrase [2] 2172 22225017
physical (3) 225123
231716234224
physically [1] 221315
physictan (4] 22945
23062223141423328
physictans (3) 224317
2252222943
prek ||5| 22031722069
222111 22234151822
2224 / 42122383
232625232772344 I 235225
prcked (8] 222424223423
$223725 \quad 22381819$
22391922401
pxcking [2] 222: 1120
preture [1] 22946
prece [1] 23172
Pierce [31 22672122705
228724
pillar (11) 224519
pilot |271 2244 / 2122625
2314101823152023161 234427235642357915
$\begin{array}{llll}16 & 17 & 2358 & 22 \\ 25 & 23591\end{array}$
2323615212223653 23677
piotage [10] 234351516
17212323445234925 23505
Pilots [1] 224314
pilots [7] 2243522442
224614224720224819
225820231519
punned [11 226318
Pipeline |ll| 2223916
222417252237525
$22381519 \quad 20 \quad 223920$

22401
Puza [1] 222317
prazes [1] 222318
Place [1] 224610
place [11] 21787219519
22118221225222314
2258723271923339
$233917 \quad 23548236713$
placed [1] 223121
places [2] $224521 \quad 2268$ II
Plantuff [1] 22743
Plantufis [3] 2294610 234723
plantufis 16$\} 21669221520$
224010229121229216
23344
plane [l] 22684
planes [1] 228124
plans [1] 232617
play [2] $226511 \quad 231710$
Please [6] 221524223914
22401522992123003 23482
please [12] 216614221522 221612240121722411 $227218 \quad 22738 \quad 22947$
23172423233236715
plotting [1] 236513
plus |2| 2243 // 22549
pocket [1] 222523
Point |2] $234422361 / 7$ point [14] 2176521994 2239422742522851
22901022938230725
23156122337223381
234517235513
police [3] 224322225821 22626
policemen [1] 2246 /4 policies $|3| 22671223217$ 2336 I
policy [49] $21694 \quad 10 \quad 13$ $218212 \quad 21837220737$
$\begin{array}{lllllll}22114 & 6 & 11 & 18 & 22 & 22129\end{array}$ $\begin{array}{llllllll}2213 & 8 & 10 & 12 & 13 & 16 & 21\end{array}$ $2235172236 \quad 22 \quad 228114$ 2282723101723192225 $\begin{array}{lllllllllll}2320 & 4 & 8 & 10 & 12 & 15 & 17 & 19\end{array}$
 8232416
$232918 \quad 233719 \quad 21 \quad 22 \quad 23$ 233924
polite [1| 222822
poor 14] $225723 \quad 2258 \quad 13$ 227914228410
Port [3| $2335 \quad 13 \quad 16 \quad 2348 / 4$ port |33| $21683 \quad 217310$ 2195568921988 220314221725221823 22192422212222916 223042233212323610 $\begin{array}{lllllllllll}15 & 19 & 2335 & 6 & 10 & 12 \quad 15\end{array}$ 23361723376910 233852339352346923 portwon [2] 229412234824
Portland [121 2171 ]
2175122180111316 2181421991822001 $2208725 \quad 2213322828$ ports [1] 232325
position [28] 21662023

21671021681124
$217225 \quad 218110 \quad 218225$
$2212172252915 \quad 225425$
2262922898230124
23032423121323139
23152021231916
23312523342224
$233516 \quad 233613 \quad 23373$
positions [4] 224314
2244122541523352
possession [3] 22137
22352023214
possibility \{3] 21754
22091224
posted |1| 221118
postung [1] 221121
Potato [1] 236117
potental [2] 217518
219719
power [1] 231414
powers [l] 22584
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { practice } & {[18]} & 2241 & 12 & 13 & 14\end{array}$
$2242912 \quad 22431516$
2244142245137

practicing (1) 227616
pre |l| 2343 /9
pre-events ||| $22732^{n}$
precsely |1| 226120
predesignated |1| 2363 /l
premise (1) 225414
Preoccupation (1] 22504 preoccupatron (1] 225024 preoccupied [1] 220219 preparations [1] 218014 prepared [4] 21992322466 226325237212
preparing [l] 22464
prerogative [1] 232725
prescribe |1| 2314 15
prescribed $13 \mid 22774$
227823227912
prescription [7] 225313
227622277522791
2309202310911
prescriptions $\{2 \mid 226610$
22673
present [9] 2169321706
1222102422113234419
$234524 \quad 235818 \quad 236325$
presentation [3] 2169 // 12
234511
presentations |1| 2345 /9
president |1| 23246
prestignous |1| 224921
presume|l| 232624
presumption |1| $233 / 8$
pretend [2] 2257 13 16
pretty $181218317 \quad 218419$
212201822301233821
235312
prevent [4] $218315 \quad 226115$ 22772236220
prevented [1] 220122
preventung [1] 225620
prevention [1] 23194
previous $|3| 219620 \quad 22132$ 226424
Prevously |l| 23378
prevmusly [6] 217717
$219422221 / 1 / 18$

234815236410
Price [1] 216715
Prmarily [1] 217123
prumarily [1] 220617
prumary [5] $224924 \quad 230213$
17231979
Prince [4] $234311 \quad 234819$. 235036
principal [2] 221922
227014
principle [3] $226617 \quad 23041$
5-
printed [1] 22062
Prior [4] 21771124
22692423578
prior [26] $217722 \quad 217910$
218013220425220510
142219 11, 2225 14,
22332324223512
2241142262 8, 2269 19, 23
2270113228224232013
23426234923 5, 8,
235617
private [2] $21928 \quad 224212$
privilege [1] 231414
problem [35] 217621
217781321857219223
$2197510 \quad 20 \quad 21987811$
1921993221211121
22475225012,2253418

1523031923102423113
$13,2321 \quad 15 \quad 23223 \quad 233812$
1417233920
23402
problems [23] 219722
21989220420224823
225616 18, 225712
225911230315230634
231162523292523367
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllll}10 & 2337 & 10 & 11 & 2340711\end{array}$
2341423581
procedure [1] 226211
proceed [2] 2231 $15 \quad 223915$ process [5] $22118 \quad 225318$
22612122811022
production [1] 229014
profession [2] 226418
22651
professional [10] 221425
226125227617227968
22893229111231210
23166233517
professionally [1] 23468
professionals [1] 227916
professor [2] $224117 \quad 22426$
Program [8] 231514
23621518236345
2364192523651
program [25] 221224
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}222614 & 224312 & 2261 & 10\end{array}$
1422622122649227322
$\begin{array}{llllll}2275 & 15 & 21 & 23 & 2278 & 19\end{array}$
2303523061923118
2325415,23317233219
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2338 & 19 & 20 & 23 & 25 & 2342 & 8\end{array}$
236221
programs [1] 226117
progressing [1] 22565
progression [2] 228120
22865
progressive (2] 2251 12
prohibit [2] 23101923217
prohibited [2] 223520
23214
projector [1] 236821
promoted [1] 218315
promotion [3] 218310
$231810 \quad 13$
pronounced [1] 227622
proper [4] 2181922527
22651223525
properly [3] 22881625

## 232725

property [1] 231020
proposed [1] 222819
protracted [1] 226522
provide [1] 226122
provisional [2] 22769 23081
prudent [1] 234123
pseudo [1] 225724
Psychintric [1] 22955
psychatric [5] 2241 19
22461229562306710
psychiatrist [1] 2241 10
psychıatrists [3] 224525
230279
Psychustry [1] 22456
psychıatry [10] 2241817
$\begin{array}{llll}18 & 23 & 25 & 224212 \\ 224545\end{array}$
224822225220
psychological [5] 2249925
225123225613230611
psychologst [1] 22645
psychologests [3] 22522 3,
23026
psychology [1] 230518
psychotherap' [3] 227512
22762325
Public [1] 237221
public [5] 218723220717
224118224613
publication [1] 2295 I
publicatrons [1] 224513
published [9] $22451720 \quad 23$
2246222492023001922
24
pull (1) 22241
pulled [1] 21928
punituve [2] $2329 \quad 15 \quad 16$
pure [1] 23691
purpose [7] 21858218918
2217232422953230313
235118
purposes [3] 218117
$229510 \quad 230423$
pursuant [1] 221319
putting [1] 2268.16
puzzling [1] 228021
PX10 [2] 2274 $18 \quad 230622$

## - Q -

qualificatons [1] 22493
qualified [1] 21979
Quality [2] 22449224719
quality [1] 22633
Questron (2) 23041723424
quertion (41] 217818
2195222199122095
$22135 \quad 2228.2223323$

22436722522422654 227162273913228419
 2289152292710229519 2298212299323005 2301923024520 230414
$\begin{array}{lllll}22 & 2305 & 3 & 13 & 232312\end{array}$ 2326223412123422 $235624235915 \quad 236611$ questions [12] 219417 22201322311322634 227116229217231757 2330712234320
quick [1] 235313
quote [2] 226018
-R-
radar [1] 23676
radio [16] $217212 \quad 217311$ 20 22, 25, 21742021752 ,
218212185821884
219519221332022263
22841323638
Radtke [1] 23567
raging [1] 22525
Raise (1] 221522
rase [1] 224012
ramifications [1] 218321
Rand [5] 22532325
23021215
range [2] 22234225613
ranked [l] 234420
ranking [2] $234023 \quad 234423$
rate [2] 226523
rates [2] 2265612
ratronale [2] $2261 \quad 18 \quad 22632$
Ray [1] 225923
re [1] 21666
reach [2] 225919230116
reaction [1] 22586
reactions [1] 22871
read [15] $21938 \quad 2267 \quad 12 \quad 14$
$\begin{array}{lllll}17 & 19 & 2297 & 21 & 2298912\end{array}$
2305523201823233
23422235511236612 236716
reading [2] 22981123567 real [1] 22004
realustic [1] 22075
reality [1] 231610
realized [1] 21786
reason [10] $2170 \quad 10 \quad 15$
217117219316219624
2293323148235625
23571
reasonable [1] 23318
reasonably [1] 234123
reasons [1] 22849
reassugned [2] 228822
232616
recerved [6] 217722
21861722051222414
224568
recent [1] 22497
Recess [1] 23695
recess [7] 223979229922
23, 236717236923
recrtation \{2] 22871922888
recte [1] 23684
rechner [1] 235511
recognize [5] 22283
$224610 \quad 227625 \quad 230125$ 23207
recognized [3] 226418
22651623018
recognizes [1] 232021
recollect [1] 23585
recollection [28] 216814
$217017 \quad 21741018 \quad 21757$
$\begin{array}{llllll}21 & 24 & 21774 & 20 & 218010\end{array}$
218224218821421892
21902521922219416
$219518 \quad 220016 \quad 220417$
$22888232015 \quad 23348$
23353235018235325
23568236223
recommend [4] 22542122
24227716
recommendation [5]
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2243 & 10 & 2253 & 12 & 22628\end{array}$
$226410 \quad 227718$
recommendations [4]
2242172244822674 229310
recommended [7] 226610
2275231277121622792
22922425
recommending [1] 227713
recommends [1] 2310 II
reconfirm (1] 232415
reconvene [1] 229922
Record [2] 22737229917
record [8] 216613221524
$224015 \quad 231723 \quad 232018$
23233236826
recorded [2] $236316 \quad 23668$
records [1] 226218
recover (1] 224222
recovering [9] 224222
224725231472315716
$2316318 \quad 2023316$
Recovery [1] 226123
recovery [41] 2244722474
2422481225321225623
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2261 & 3 & 7 & 8 & 14 & 18 & 23\end{array}$
2262231022633

22673227861415
227914162281122
$\begin{array}{llll}228618 & 2288 & 18 & 22\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}2289 & 13 & 23128 & 10 \quad 17\end{array}$
2316910
1521
Redirect [1] 23176
redurect [1] 22406
reduce [3] $225615 \quad 236419$
reduced [1] 226513
reduction (1] 236413
Reeder [6] 218914219315
22, 21951121965228211
Reef [6] 219821226815
22835233411234428
reef [2] $2268 \quad 15 \quad 23674$
refer [10] 224357224724
2264522742325229410
2296222304923638
reference [1] 230820
referencing [l] 232121
referral [1] 22942
referred [8] 22421322434
$224715 \quad 17 \quad 23042230514$ 233825
referring [7] 217223
2268252275223009
$233022 \quad 235323 \quad 236025$
refers [1] 229418
reflect [1] 23687
reflected [1] 236415
refresh [3] $235322 \quad 25$ 23568
regard 181 $2182 \quad 23 \quad 2 / 8716$
22012423292233317
233914234010
regarding [25] 21699
2177162178142180814
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}20 & 2181 & 19 & 218214\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}2184 & 23 & 2185 & 11 & 2193 & 14\end{array}$
$220612 \quad 220712 \quad 22132$

23275232837232923
2330423397234014
234512
regards [7] 2169 /2 2176 /
2421862219116220116
23256
register [1] 2203 14
registered |1| 22034
regular [7] 2189522142
$\begin{array}{lllll}18 & 2226 & 19 & 2246 & 22 \\ 23\end{array}$
23252
regularly [2] 22427230316
regulation [1] 236612
regulations [3] 226313
2344423667
regulatory [1] 224411
rehab [S] 2211 20233224
23334234529
rehabilitation 133 | 221/ 12
1622621622732225
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}2306 & 19 & 23129 & 13 & 16\end{array}$

$23266232722 \quad 2328825$
2329242330523317
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllllllll}2332 & 21 & 2338 & 19 & 22 & 25\end{array}$
$233916 \quad 234413 \quad 23$
$2346 \quad 19 \quad 25 \quad 234718$
reterate [1] 22533
relapse [16] $2261 \quad 15 \quad 21$
22642124226523611
162266359228122
22848229020
relapsed (2] 22091023338
relapsing [1] 2261/3
relate [1] 233519
related (3] 2171 $20 \quad 219411$ 2200 I
relates [1] 218417
relating [2] 2201 123414
retation [1] 23249
relations (1] 231823
relatuonship [4] 21852
2255202270 21, 23467
relatronshıps [3] 224720
224911225520
relative [1] 233221
relayed [1] 21823
relevance $[212271$ 1 6
relevant [2] 22272122672
reled [3] $226615 \quad 22713$
22754
relief [3] 23532236089
relıeve [1] 23513
Reheved [1] 23535
relueved [8] 2263923511
235361123541023564
10235921
relreving [2] 23591423607
rely [2] $22726 \quad 12$
reman [3] $2208 \quad 12 \quad 22815$
2354 21
remamed [1] 235413
remember $142 \mid 216922$
21723217614218011
$21868 \quad 15 \quad 16 \quad 2188 \quad 15$
$21922219318 \quad 25 \quad 219417$
220091022071322155
2217212226612232514
162022347223722
$224512 \quad 22511222568$
2257822901423103
231813
232522330123392
$235019235318 \quad 23541$
$\begin{array}{llll}2356 & 23 & 2358 & 20 \\ 2365 & 19\end{array}$
$236615 \quad 236715$
reminded [1] 21697
remove [1] 221018
renew [1] 227218
rented [1] 22684
repair 127121672321682
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}21 & 25 & 21691 & 2171 & 13\end{array}$
2174672175314
$2181 \quad 15 \quad 18 \quad 2182 \quad 13$
21841121853218922
219122196232206418
$21221422 \quad 242215612$
repaured [2] $217120 \quad 22037$
repairs $\{6121683$ 4 2171 24
2521748218014
repeat |2| 2228223005
repeated [1] 232022
repeating [1] 22861
repercussons [2] 2204110
reply [2] $217616 \quad 218717$
Report [2] 22682123
report [47] $2168 \quad 13 \quad 19$
218325218422218522
21861172521873
2194146152021951
219671921971210
219917252207622099
2210272237224
22532322541226316
2269 / 2227082274 II
$\begin{array}{llllll}2282 & 12 & 2302 & 12 & 15\end{array}$
$3315232321 \quad 12 \quad 23 \quad 23226$
222324 3, 2342 25, 235323
reported [17] 216814
217292185121861415
219631822021122035
2204262209 13, 15,
233725 9, 236613
reporting [12] 2183720
218624219422220738
$2321716232214 \quad 23288$ 233746
reports [11] $219620 \quad 21996$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}13 & 16 & 22007 & 2201 & 14 & 16\end{array}$
22028221914 16, 234717
republished (1] 2301 1
reputation [3] 222717
2228 / 5
request [4] 21821222255
23188232417
requested [1] 237210
requests (1) 221824
require [2] 22894231621
required [3] 21686234322 24
requrement [6] 22809 $23142425 \quad 231532324$ requirements [5] 22211 231210112344623505
research [1] 225210
resentful [1] 22662
Resentment [1] 2256 /
resentment [1] 22562 reside [4] 216616231812 23483
residency [1] 22417 residents (2) 224272246 /
resigned [1] 23139
resource [2] 23181922
resources (1) 23283
respect [9] 2221722462
226713227024227710 $228410 \quad 11 \quad 234520 \quad 234717$ respected [1] 230210 response [14] 2173521755 21791921824218625 2187321901921941525 22022122711622808 23024
responsibilitues $13 \mid 222 / 5$ 22943232815
responsibility $[2 \mid 217] 23$ 23129
responsible [3] $2196 / 4$ 231217234220 rest $1812175 \quad 16 \quad 219316$
 restating [1] 218419 result |6| 217525218325 21991322827230419 232417
resulted |1| 2232 14
results |1| 22542
resume |2| 2254722814
resumed [4] $228025 \quad 22813$
$42330 / 7$
resumption |1] 228/ 18
retraced [1] 22687
return [25] 22121624
 22524225412124226310 226424226672279413 1422823228789
 $233218 \quad 23576$ returned [231 218010 $21815218442238 / 4$ $2282 / 3228462330 / 5$
 152355252356314 23591922236013 23622523633236536 1123677
returning [1] $2281 / 2$ reveal |l| 220413
Revere [5] 23245723286 18232910 review [2] 22981923382 reviewed [5] 22679 /1

226917227832287 1
reviews $|4| \begin{array}{llllll}2336 & 5 & 6 & 2338 & 5\end{array}$ revision (11 229619
ride [2] 2221 $18 \quad 22232$
Rught [11] 217819219514

$229618 \quad 23012023036$
$235013 \quad 235515$
rght-hand [1] 221522
rigid [1] 223517
rise [3] 21663223912
23001
risky [1] 225416
river [1] 225016
road [1] 228221
rock [1] 236819
rocks [1] 222418
Rocky ||| 23442
Roger (2) 21736
role [1] 224213
roles (3) 229113171719
RONALD [2] $22165 \quad 222810$
Ronald [2] 22152122162
room [24] 2170 46 12,
218723218811220524
221917235021235122
$\begin{array}{llllll}235210 & 23531121 & 24\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2354 & 2 & 5 & 6 & 13 & 15 & 21\end{array}$
2355347923674
Roses |11 225923
rough (1| 236021
routed III 232617
routine |l| 22945
routing (1) 220522
row [1] 225925
Royal [1] 22413
rpm [1] 236220
rpans |l| 236220
RPR [1] 237221
rule [4] $2282 \quad 25 \quad 228415 \quad 18$ 23039
ruled [1] 229818
rules 13| 22842522854
2343 /7
rumur |l| 22895
rumors |!| 2989 /]
run 13121671721684
2225 /2
running $\{212200 / / 23$
runs [1] 219520
$-\mathbf{S}$
safest [1] 22527
Safety [2] 226718
safety |l5] $2243 / 425$
$2244122254 / 52422629$
228971231416192315 21
231914523521617
sall|3| 2182172203817
saled |101 21671216
2180 // $2204172208 / 3$
$162210 / 4222918223320$ salling $1201216925 \quad 217523$


$2223716 \quad 23 \quad 223825$
223922123488
sailor [2] $222718 \quad 22286$
salary |l| 218316
salinity |4| $235020 \quad 23517$

1323522
San 1111 2167921691 2189171821988220320 22041522107222711 22891924
sanction [1] 23166
SANDERS [36] 22491
225222227116227218
22736227419227610
22772422837 19, 228416
228511228619228714 22883229025712
$\begin{array}{lllllll}22946 & 8 & 15 & 17 & 22981 & 9\end{array}$
24229911623004
23046823162523171
5236720
Sanders [3] 22715229725 22995
sat [4] 2203202210 16,
226020235511
satasfactorily [1] 22037
satusfied [1] 217125
Saturday [2] 220417
221015
save [1] 23508
saymg [ll] 217219219320
220821222915223416
223618230721234713
23562523572023635
scene (1] 22144
schedule [2] 22041622
School [2] 22161522417 school [8] 22161422412
18224425,225124
230125230279
Schools [1] 22177
schools [1] 230111
scope [1] 217119
SCOTT [2] 22165222810
Scott [I] 22162
screen [3] 22742122909
22949
sea [12] 217516218014

2337162351152124
236222
sea-going [2] 21784
218311
seafood [1] 22259
seamanship [1] 228512
seamen [1] 22263
season [1] 223012
seated [4] 221524223914
22401523003
Second [1] 216624
second [9] $2208 \quad 10 \quad 221413$
221532232822902
229918233514236315 236414
secondhand [1] 21979
secret [1] 225] 10
Secretartes [1] 221819
secretaries [1] 22062
section [1] 22751
securing [1] 221825
security [9] $222124 \quad 2222 \quad 16$
$20 \quad 222516 \quad 242236419$
23111117
select [2] $2292 \quad 18 \quad 22$
self (4) $225519 \quad 23 \quad 226621$ 23
self-dıagnosed [1] 231523
seminars [1] 227513
send [4] $2264810 \quad 14$ 235925
sending [1] 224624
Senior [1] 216917
senvor [7] 2183 13, 219422
220792335123365
23374234515
sense [8] 2246 12, 224914
22571022581,226014
2266123117
sensituve [10] 224314
224412254152522629
2289723141619231521
sentence [5] 22531522995
7232019236723
separate [2] 22291920
September [4] 22119,
2281252320 5, 11
Sepulveda [1] 224019
sequence [2] 23637,18
SERDAHELY [2] 233325
234720
series [1] 22954
serrous [2] 22514225924
serve [1] 221713
served [1] 234916
service [4] 2171 11, 2172 I
220319224120
session [2] 22391323002
sessions [3] 227824
229215233220
setting [1] 231715
settle [2] 226412,233612
seven [5] 22147222916
2223013
severe [3] 2255 1122606
SGC [1] 22082
SGCs [2] 22062022083
shake [1] 22604
shaking [1] 22602
shame [1] 225720
shameful [1] 226324
shape [1] 22649
share [1] 228013
shared [1] 227923
Shearer [2] 22001222016
Sheehy [2] $226721 \quad 233011$
sheet [1] 22062
shuft (2] 2215414
shufted [1] 219617
shufts (2) $219616 \quad 221513$
Shup [1] 233618
shupped [1] 222024
Shupping [38] 21661920
2321671121693217324
21792521811021835
21876220212207219
220913221132212913
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2318 & 5 & 15 & 18,20 & 2319 & 21\end{array}$

23221723251721
2326423303
2332323391223412 23431
shpping [6] 218310
2214232215222175
23372423396
shups [16] $216712 \quad 219818$
220842217242218122

5-23-94 VOLUME 15
$234822 \quad 235911$
Shope [1] $2348 \quad 12$
slow [2] $221515 \quad 236119$
smelled [1] 219313
Smith [3] 2292182224
sober (17) 224834225819
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}23 & 2261 & 9 & 11 & 12 & 13 & 15 & 20\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}22 & 226219 & 23 & 226310\end{array}$
226523228019
sobriety [7] 22482226013
22622422639231312
2314723164
Soctal [1] 225217
soctal [12] 2249925
2252422532222541418

234613
soctalize [1] 21724
socially [1] 23468
socreties [1] 230717
Society [3] 224510224915
230024
society [4] 22491519
230017230824
solely (1) 218116
solid [1] 232621
solution [1] 225617
solve [1] 225618
Sombrosa [1] 216617
somebody (16) 219523
219821221825222723
7222816223813224717
225932262622763
2280622951123223
233912
somebody'd (1) 22355
somehow [1] 219525
someone [25] 217212
217711217822219224
2197102201522076
22111222262222591
2260822621226625
2289422941123019
2303212332171315
233517234213235925
somewhat [1] 233516
somewhere [4] 219522
220418220817227420
Sorry (1) 229323
sorry (6) $218816 \quad 22721$
2274622812234114
234310
sort [9] $219515 \quad 220517$
221732222422544
22592222661230320
235519
sorted [1] 229919
sorts (2] $222223 \quad 22257$
sought [3] $230013 \quad 231112$ 23294
Sound [4] 234311234819
235036
sound (1) 217323
sounded [3] 217223
21732021
source [2] 21771222809
sources [1] 220413
South [5] 224019226920 2273222781623069
sparked [1] 220310
speak [14] 21757217657

217719217914219023
2191321219725220217
229114232721232826
SPEAKER 161218816
220232214822157
234111236313
speakers [1] 224819
speaking [10] 21731
21801321911422032
$2291131619 \quad 232321$
23281023321
special-1 $1+22452$
specialist [1] 22454
specialty [4] 2244 I3 17
224515224616
specific [19] 2177142178 1
2181221822218310
2193422052021224416
22571022651622679

23101231821232316
Specifically [2] 22175
228815
specifically [21] 217114
$2179817 \quad 21821021888$
11 21992122111523
2212422174224823
2261152295722966
22982323211421
232810233112
specifics (4) 21932021
22017227818
speculation [2] 22001
2276 11
speed [6] 23622224
2364191323651
spell [2] 221525224016
Spent [1] 221621
spent [4] 2167722084
224917235219
spugot |11 2351 23
spill [11] 2233478
22671619226923
227816228119228224
$234018 \quad 23412$
spills [1] 23195
spurits (1) 226317
Spokane (11 221615
spoke [15] 21744217624
2178132221791222
218020218124219513
22281822381323454
2354219
spoken [8] 21792325
21803219223220120
2203322481316
sponsor [5] 226367
22804613
sponsors [3] 228037
spring [11 22309
spy [1] 225711
stable [5] 225478111 227815
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { staff } & \text { 77] } 23191 & 2332712\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llll}15 & 23 & 23332 & 23373\end{array}$
stage [4] 22592422601
22731122911
stand [6] 227220229424

stander [1| 2348 /9
standing |4| 22932522943
standpoint [2] 228622 232624
start [f] $22 / 3$ 13 2229 // 13 24235513
started [9] $219916 \quad 220910$
$22301016 \quad 25 \quad 223313$
2237622941023353
State 16121711221525
22322425231514231616
state [111 216613217725
221711224016224410
$225723 \quad 22781415$
2317232344723482
stated $|S| 2175221779$
$219714 \quad 222325 \quad 22838$
statement (5) 220310
22392322815234415
235016
statements [2] 227456
States |4| 2239 /3 224| 5
2291 1223002
statung [2] $228420 \quad 21$
station [2] 2356 / 2359 I
Statistrical [3] 229425
229542296 II
status flof 2243822447
2247422786227914
2289142318 II 232620
2223
stay $11512182162261 / 1$
$\begin{array}{llll}12 & 1319 & 22 & 2262 \\ 21\end{array}$
$228018 \quad 229818232816$
23421223447234635
23545
Stayed (3) 21891718
230620
stayed [1] 22268
staying |II 2358 /4
steering [3] $234915 \quad 17 \quad 19$
step 12| 2240823178
steps [5] 21862421871
2263622688232714
stereotype (1) 2259 21
STEVE [1] 2166 I]
Steve $\{31216610 \quad 219118$
226722
STEVEN 111221025
Steven [1] 216615
steward [2] 2219122267
stewardship [1] 23365
STEWART [3] 221023
22131221517
strek [1] 22982
strckung 11] 23541
stacks |1| 22258
stop 1212190212251916

230311230418233514
236713
stopped [2] 2176 1822096
stopping [1] 22394
stops [1] 228011
store [2] $222310 \quad 229322$
stores [2] $221825 \quad 222511$
story [3] 2200 5 22724
232420
straught [11 231319
strange [1] 22208
strategy |1| 2292 IS
stream |1] 225218
Conarndenor by Look-Sac(71)

Street [2] 21661722162
street [2] 22004222310
strict [1] 231215
Strictly (1] 222624
strike [1] 227219
strikes [1] 228310
Stuart [6] 216816219616
220010192122019
students [1] 22427
studied [1] 230214
studies [2] 22581522651
study [3] 22532322545
230213
stuff [1] 219324
style [1] 234023
subject [11] 21848218522
252213922881023272
3232920234422234522 236417
subjects [1] 230215
subscribe [1] 225325
Subsequent [2] 21839
219924
subsequent [6] 21799
2192421942321994
227022232510
subsequently [4] 21674
217292267 1, 23658
substance [6] 219314
2248242324212323255 23319
substantally [1] 226513
substrate [1] 224520
success [1] 226625
successful (9) 22528
2262232651521
22871023161015
successfully [3] 2288 /
$2325 / 4$
successive [1] 218812
succinct (1) 22843
suctions (1) 235124
suffer [1] 225912
suffered [S] 2183522697
1322732022778
suffering [4] 22551322591 226621227225
sufficient (4) 2269622785 228520228821
suggest |5| 2282222927
10230121233116
suggested (5) 2292 / 23
229314
suite [1] 222021
sum [1] 23255
Summarize [1] 226712
summer [4] 22258223010
22872523303
Sunday |11 22684
sundry (1) 230225
sunk [2] 22021822034
supermintendent (13) 216723
21682212521712
2172132173221747
217514218115218213
218922221424
superior (2] 2172922077
supermors [1] 23409 supervise [1] 231215
supervised (1] 231218
supervising [1] 22104
supervisor [15] 218118
219691013232521977
$\begin{array}{llll}13 & 25 & 220412 & 2209 \\ 17 & 18\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lll}23 & 2321 & 17 \\ 2328 & 15\end{array}$
supervisors [6] 226215
231124231215623269
supervisory [2] 232815
234122
supper (5) 234610235325 $15 \quad 235413$
support [8] 22072522193
22512122611922631
22651022796233110
supports [1] 227411
suppose [1] 23212
Surgeons [1] 22413
surgeons [2] 224317
surging [1] 219812
surprised [1] 23675
surrounding (1) 218924
susceptable [1] 22554
suspect (1] 232115
suspected [1| 233812
Sustain [2] 227612227725
swing (1] 22154
Sworn [2] 221523224014
symbol (1] 236119
symptom [2] 225516
229516
symptoms [11] 225512,7
922579225810226619
22771227913229516
230912
syndrome |3| 2256 /1
22652122
synonymous |1| 229623
synonymously [3] 22972 S 17
system 19 ) $218310 \quad 225718$ 23336910131720 236219
-T -
table [2] 22241222569
Takes [1] 219310
takes [2] 2253172309 Il
talk [26] $219018 \quad 2200517$
2205622215222222
22277223917225016
2251 22 $2256 / 3226214$
162263623226918
$\begin{array}{llllll}228013 & 14 & 2302 & 25\end{array}$
2312212323223232618
$\begin{array}{llllllll}2328 & 22 & 23361234618\end{array}$
talked [11] 2170 3 2201 1
$221916 \quad 222819223918$
22823819229418
23131233216
talking (22) $2183 / 22009$
102208522201422217
22292222606226415
$2268 / 322701229015$
2293 14 15 2295 11
22972223229816
23011223372123454
234914
Tampa [1] 23484
tank (1) 221920
tantamount (1) 225314
tape [3] $231718 \quad 236713$
task [1] 232522
tasks [1] 21687
taught [3] 2241 2225
228112
teach [1] 22426
team [1] 221422
tear [1] 22062
technical [1] 226522
telephone [8] 2181720
218219218325222624
252359323606
telephoned [1] 235823
telephonic [1] 218415
television [3] 2246813
229024
telex [10] 2204242205 2, 3
6918212425
telling [11] 21825219524
2196 24, 220215223168 ,
1022571722793233411
temporarily [1] 217514
temporary [4] 216724
228037
Ten [1] 22172
ten [14] 2188522147
22331223717192021
22821 4, 2330232343 23,
23448
ten-year [1] 224712
tend [3] 2215 15, 226114
22656
tends [2] 22021722516
term [7] 225992260914
22617226522229716
termual [1] 226812
terminated [2] 2263 1]
2338 」
termination [2] 22827
23274
terms [8] 225915226210
228432296 23, 23081518
2321 25
terribly [1] 228020
test [4] $235020 \quad 2351713$ 21
testufied [11] 217918 ,
220323220711229013
2292182297123066
234411234891523567
testify $[8] 221521 \quad 22718$
11 22861222871822887
2293 I 22974
testifying [1] 228512
testumony [40] 219516
2204 4, 22071322132
22272522282022374
2267192023 25, 2268 8,
22701924227141618
227214192022731116
$\begin{array}{llllll}2277 & 17 & 2285 & 2 & 15 & 228715\end{array}$
22891622901422969
23073230924231015
23121923134232914
235312354 17, 2355 6,
23567
tests [1] 22646
Texas [1] 23182
Thank [18] 2166922164,
222892240 5, 7, 820 ,
224922253222692
22711222722122747

228525228925229415
22982523178
thank [2] $229415 \quad 236817$
thanks [1] 22588
that'll [1] 22396
theories [1] 22006
therapeutic [1] 23117
therapists [1] 22958
therapy [4] 227512 13,
22821820
thereabouts [1] 22331
thereafter [1] 232625
They'd [2] 2178 11, 220625
they'd [3] $222318 \quad 222512$ 223321
They're [2] 2255 12, 226520
they're [32] 2206122433 224456224715 16. 2250202253 7, 2255 11, 14 225617225741921
226012262 3 8, 2263 8, 12
$\begin{array}{llllll}14 & 17 & 19 & 20 & 22 & 226510\end{array}$
1222661822791722808 22951422974
they've [4] 22311322474
22621722641
thunking [12] 21789220222 242249142250131525 225842264622652325 235624
third (5] 2208 10, 22506
2271232335423488
Thomas [1] 23483
thoracic [1] 224317
thorough [1] 22637
Three [1] 221625
three [35] 216716219616
22101619221823,22268
2238182241 8, 224221
2253 ऽ 2022549,225823
226224226413226918
2270182271141720
227210112280367
22991223131123147
2317152324423253
23311223462123497
tughten [3] $226411 \quad 227312$ 16
tull [4] 22172223448
235518
tumes [43] 22069222047
22234222432024
2225222277222818 ,
22295151622301
$\begin{array}{lllll}22367 & 2237 & 121719 & 20\end{array}$
$21223818 \quad 20,22,24$
22391922432224818
2251622542225819
227215229212299 12,
23253
2330232331 12, 234117
234782348 24, 23548
Timmons [2] 217345 tured [1] 235916
tutle [3] 21747 2218.12, 231814
tutled [1] 221814
Tolerance [1] 2256.3
tolerance [2] 2256322823
Tom [4] 216715220012. 220169
tomorrow [4] 22932
23671823681923694
Tompkins [9] 226721
228115232511232616
2328222329148233010
ton [1] 218916
tools [1] 226122
Topeka [1] 22168
topic [4] 229259232614 23276
topics [2] 23351718
topping [5] 235432022
2355316
Total [2] 2251 1819
total (9) $2188 \quad 14 \quad 18 \quad 2218 \quad 11$
22512422542223
23282523481323497
totally [1] 22739
touch [1] 225623
tough [2] $219515 \quad 22353$
towards [4] 22032122363
22692222835
town [7] 2221182122232
172225922268
trade [1] 22182
traditional [1] 227516
Traffic [2] 236628
traffic [5] 22431622626
2283423581236414
tramed [4] 2261 25227616 230210
Tranng [1] 226717
training [6] 22418224524
25224646
trans [1] 234118
transcript (S] 22908
236524252372912
transcriptron (I] 237210
transfer (2) 2318823639
transferred [1] 23185
transtt [4] 2205 I 220612
13234124
transited (1] 235714
transits [2] 2342 l 234821
transmission (5] 236315
2364571523661
Transport [1] 226718
travel [1] 232617
treat (5] $221213 \quad 22469$
2254192265723112
treatable [2] 232021
232812
treated [8] $220718 \quad 221215$
17225147227618
230013230617
treatung [2] 23062223325
Treatment [1] 224122
trial [4] 21666227118
2272523568
trigger [1] 228913
trip [11] 2229822321416
2323492359
trips $\begin{array}{lllllllll}71 & 2229 & 13 & 2348 & 14 & 18\end{array}$ 234915818
trouble [3] $230412 \quad 231310$ 231416
troubled [1] 229815
true [22] 220823220914
22102224320229025
22912423011518
$23021116 \quad 23 \quad 230314$

2305222423071214
23089231324231412
23151823729
truth [1] 22326
truthfully [1] 220223
tumult [1] 231712
turbo [3] 219892203615
turbocharger [1] 220420
turning [2] $236315 \quad 23671$
twelve [1] $235010 \quad 23511$
twhes [1] 23479
type [23] $218610 \quad 218915$
220617221310221822
22592522659227746
$23249233516 \quad 1823367$
1023378101123382
2340232423491519
235416
typed [4] 22753227669 229412
types [3] 231972336912 typical (2) 22817235519
Typically (1) 220615
typically [2] 220523220622

- -U -

USA [8| 23184231912
23328122323332
$233912 \quad 23412$
UCLA [7] 224l 25224212 46231389
ullage [2] $221916 \quad 223723$
ultumately [3] 235525
2357817
Um-hum [2] $223823 \quad 235812$ um-hum [1] 23524
uncharacteristuc [1] 228510
unclear [1] 233214
undercurrent (1) 22705
undergoing [1] 2171 /3
undergone [1] 22962
underneath (1) 232019
understand [17] 217511
21831321842222134
22271122374226121
22792323012423065
23131723172233120
233723235915
understandable (1] 230913
understanding [23] 21762
217757217821220115
2205182211142522125
81522141226810
$229514 \quad 22968 \quad 232024$
2321323251323315
$233210 \quad 11 \quad 236612 \quad 15$
understood [5] 218225
2213182268823221
undertaken [1] 233224
underway [3] 234279
235525
unfit [1] 22271
unhappmess (1) 225112
UNIDENTIFIED [6] 218816
220232214822157
234111236313
unuformity [2] 22952425
Union [1] 22415
union [1] 224719
unit [1] 230610

United [4] 22391322414
22911223002
universal [1] 230518
University [21 2241716
university [1] 224524
unknown [1] 228412
unlicensed [I] 232122
unqualified [1] 23123
untreated [1] 22656
unwiling |l| 226525
unwillingness [1] 2266 /2
updates | +1 2309 11
updating |l| 218410
uptight (I) 226524

-     - V -

VA [1] 22422
vacation [1] 223218
vaccination [1] 22446
vaguely [1] 219417
Vallury [12] 227456
227520227749227913
$230013230622 \quad 2307$ II
2309141824
variety (1) 224521
vast [1] 225914
verbal [1| 2195 11
verson (2) 22555227124
versions $|2| \begin{array}{llllll}2271 & 14 & 2272 & 10\end{array}$
Vessel [2] 236627
vessels [32] 21685218919
219614220618221119
22184221942322218
1422221222312222525
22261222352123195
2321423266232924
233542023416923431
10212348912234915
23589
VHF |1| 23638
vice-president |1| 23247
VIDEO [13] $216612 \quad 218820$
22024622111221410 $14221510 \quad 231722 \quad 23347$ 23411323481236314
Video (5) 2166 Il 221025
23172123346234725
videotape [3] 216610
22102423345
videotaped [1] 231711
videotapes [1] 23343
view [2] 23092022
viewed ||| 2328 II
vgilance [1] 228111
volate [2] 2213 16 22826
volated [7] 2213821
22811422842522854
23227232917
volation (4) 228224
$22841417 \quad 232117$
violations [5] 2183722073
69232112
vurtue [1] 220210
visiblity [1] 23441
visible [1] 234714
visted [1] 23472
vistang ||| 22083
vitaluty [1] 22729
vividly (11 21818
rocal [1] 219312
vocalizıng [1] 219323
vorce $\left[\begin{array}{lllllll}31 & 2172 & 15 & 16 & 18\end{array}\right.$
volume [1] 2304 1]
voluntarily [1] 231620
voluntary [1] 231513
voyage [2] $21683 \quad 220813$
voyages [2] $222922 \quad 24$

- W -

W J 11123244
Watt |I| 223720
wait [3| 2236222649 I2
wake [1] 235925
walk |4| 2222 । 2224 1/
22681022868
walkie-talkie [3] 217212
221412228210
walking (1) $2358 \quad 13$
walkway [1] 22227
walkways (1] 226812
wander [1] 22069
wanted (7] 21761819
219172200422244
23671023684
wants [2| 2280 I8 235825
warning [2] 217620220425
Washington [3] 221615
22322425
watch |23| $23426 \quad 12 \quad 14$
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}2348 & 19 & 22 & 2349 & 18 & 2351 & 1\end{array}$
5235523235612235810

236012723619 11
watched [1] 232824
watching [3] 22901315 2330 II

waters (1) 234920
We'd [2] 22038221913
we'd |4| 22199222025
2223425
We'll [5] 223979225613
236717236817
we'll [11| 219021221224
2251 2122559227216
22961322992223498
23512023644
We're [3] 2186111229918
23692
we're [18] 21721419
2212722522522556
225820227315227423
$228416 \quad 2299 \quad 20 \quad 230818$
23171023491323591
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}2361 & 13 & 23643 & 17 & 2368 & 20\end{array}$
we've $\begin{array}{llll}121 & 2174 & 10 & 2175 \\ 15\end{array}$
22011221916222812
2259622675226825
228515229410235518
236418
Wednesday [1] 221014
week [11] 21884219521
220425220519220611
22099226021227016
$227117 \quad 23253233112$
Weekend [1] 225922
weekend [1] 221413
weekly [1] 227119
weeks [8] $2171 \quad 16 \quad 2180 \quad 17$
22712023227825

228712230725231716
weight [1] 218916
Wemhart [3] 217223
217319218725
welcome [1] 228020
well-known [1] 234418
well-mantaned [1] 219818
weren't (9) 221824223222
22351417121230217
234110235213
West (1) 21711
west [17] 21681812
218519218922222712
132334132323355710
13152023422423431
Westar [3] 21921222035
19
whack [1] 23643
whatnot [1] 222025
whatsoever [3] 230319
23091423304
Whenever [1] 23532
whenever [2] 2188322376
wherever (2] 224912
Whoa [1] 224319
wide [1] 217819
widely (5) 225220225324
22961523081619
wife [6] $226925 \quad 2270 \quad 16 \quad 21$
227115228217235213
WILLIAM||| 23346
Wullam [5] 233442343 II
234819235036
Wullamson [19] 218613
$21901315 \quad 2421911624$
21925219311921941
2195410219637
219917252203522099
2282 II
Willing [1] 226323
walling |4| $225423 \quad 226312$ 1924
Willugness [1] 226612
Wison [4] 2256 ! 230425 23058 11
wind (1) 2364 /
Wine (1) 225923
whe (3) $227017 \quad 228124$
234616
wnter (1) 22309
wish [1] 230313
wished [1] 232824
wishes $\{2 \mid 229810 \quad 12$
WITNESS |15| 218818
2202522141122162
224018224320224816
22533227113227317
2274922857228722
229821234112
Witness [2] $221523 \quad 224014$ witness |14| 2166822024 22151922409 // 22712 8228522290522924 22982231624231713 23341
won't [2] 2267192268 I wonder (1) 231316 wonderful [1] 225923 word (7) 221211222210 2255122642122979 230919236825
words [8] 2182222033
2213182250142297121 22994
work [38] 21711924
21751621852220523
22084221225221324
2217322201223010
22312122331022376
22435224623224912
225417225520225714
226215226310226418
10142282162287810
231511
1323161923192224
2321823289235221
235522
work-related [2] 21732223
workday [1] 221820
worked (10) 21702421717
220012220522221715
$20 \quad 223312 \quad 230017$
23082423168
workers [3| 22158913 working 1111216815
217123217514218922
22151322301625
$231212 \quad 23501415235513$
workshops [2] 227513
22764
workweek |1] 221821
world [1] 22539
worldwide 111 226117
worried (1) 224716
worse III 22512
Wouldn't (I) 220620
wouldn't [4] 221316
225713230116232717
writug 14 | $2275 \quad 20 \quad 2352 \quad 13$
236245
written [1] 232125
wrong (1) 230413
wrote [1] 224525

- Y -
yard (5) $217213 \quad 220318$
22158913
Yeah|19| 217724219912
22029220423222217
2223822245222710
$223124223812 \quad 22616$
23023231315233821
$234019234313 \quad 234822$
23599236525
yeah (4) $219921 \quad 2210 \quad 17$
23015236320
year [15] $21671319 \quad 22305$
13223232241622421
21 22471222591822724
2281623151023366
years [24] 21701014
21751322241722324

22491722525227015
2271 17227624227924
22807228119230017
2301323072123147
2316414232323
Yorktown (1) 228817
You'd [2] 22991423298
you'd [7] 217722218415

22242122251122298
2297623046
you'll [2] 2251 $20 \quad 230925$
You've [1] 223610
you've [30] 21792221877
22012022021622173
22312022361114
$223715223918 \quad 226711$
22681822693227834
22891622921229318
2297123051223066
23073231225231524
23223233910234118
23488
236425
yours [4] 21729228720
2288923021
yourself [8] 22076221223
2247222255202261225 2313323455

Vol $16 \quad 2373$
IN TEE WITED STATE DISTRICT ORRI
FRR THE DISTRICT OF ALAEA

In re:
) Case Na. AP-005 CN (ARS)
) Anchorre, Alaka
) Tuesdy Mey $34,19 \%$
) 8001 ar
TRAETRIT OF FCDEDNES

VIUE 16, Peges B73 उ' Realtire Trascoptan
(3) APPEARANCES.
(K) Fr Plantiffs RJOFD F CERT

Buty, men\& Cary
80 K Street, Snte $2 P$

Ah 9 $9 / B 7-8 \mathrm{Bl}$
GRIN ONEIL
LOR1 HOAR
Fagre \& Bren
200 Norest Cotre
Mrreand is, M OXCR
Fe 62/36 350
H. LDDIE MOTRCLE, R.

Berge \& Mrtage
162 Lonex Stest
Phlarelptia, PA 996
Ph. 25/85-300
HRTS SHEN
(6) Chen, Mistein, hasteld \& Toll KOI Nat York Avere NH ste 60 Heniom DC. Ph 20/62-300
(1) PROCEEDINGS
(-) (Jury in at 800 am )
(3) (Call to Order of the Court)
(4) THE COURT Good morning, ladies and genilemen This
(5) is the continuation of trial in case A89 0095 Civil in re The
(6) Exxon Valdez
(7) We re ready for another witness
(8) MS WAGNER Actually Your Honor we were in the
(9) middle of Greg Cousins deposition and the following question
(10) had been posed I believe
(u) Question Would you be able to indicate on this chart
(12) 16708 which we previously marked where you saw the ice on
the
(13) radar
(14) CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GREGORY COUSIN
(Video)
(1s) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(16) Q Would you be able to indicate on this chart 16708 which we
(17) previously marked where you saw the sce on the radar?
(18) A Approximately, not with any degree of accuracy, no I
(19) think it was - I drew the best picture that I could draw on
(20) the onginal chart that was produced in the NTSB hearings
(21) Q Can you give us an idea on this thart your recollection of
(-.) where that ce was)
(r) A Vague
(14) Q Can you take a pencil and draw where the leading edge of
(ـs) the ice was as you recollect it when Captan Hazelwood was up

## Vol 162376

(1) there and in the process of turning the con over to you?

A Wat a munte now As I saw it on the radar'
Q Well before you mark the chart what I minterested in
you have jusi leytified that in this digcussion with Caplain
Hasciword -

## A Yes

Q - your testumony was that you told him about the ice and
where you saw it?
A Yes, yes
Q And that $s$ what I want you to tell me now and to mark on
the chart if you can where you saw the ice as you were
describing uto Captain Hazelwood the leading edge
A I'm not measurng any distances here
Q No I understand you re doing this free hand on the chart
A Something like that
Q Could you make that line a little darker so we can see
where the leading edge of the ice was?
A Actually it kind of fell off more hike this
Q And the ice is so we all understand is south of that
line southurly of that hine? Is that the leading edge towards
your vessel - westerly? It s across the channel?
A Across
(23) Q So maybe you could draw some hash lines on that to indicate
(24) ice
(25) Thank you As you saw the sce then when Captain

## Voi 162377

(1) Hazelwood was about to turn the con over to vou - I m going to
hold this up so that the camera can pick up what was drawn -
is it correct then that you saw the ice extending out the
easterly limit of the traffic separation scheme as you ve drawn it and going all across the enture traffic separation scheme in the area you ve drawn it is that correct?
A It's approxımate I don't know that it was across the enture scheme but - today I didn't even measure what is
this distance here I thought I said it was less than -
approximately a male We had a mile clearance to get tween
Bligh Reef light or something like that
Q You had a mile clearance between the buoy?
A That's kund of what I recall now
Q Now when the captain was going to leave to go below he
just before leaving put it on load program up which you ve
told us about?
A Right
Q So in other words Captain Hazelwood left the bridge and
correct me if Im wrong two minutes before your vessel was
going to be abeam of the position that you re testifying to
that he told you to make the turn in?
A Yes
Q Is that correct?
A Yes
Q 120 seconds?

Vol $16 \quad 2379$
was a bit busv with navigating the vessel to concern mivself with whether it was unusual or not It was just that's the captann that s what he's domg
Q Now vour priortestimonv that you fust gave as you
reflect on it now you find it to have been unusual is that
what you re saving?
A Yes l'm sure he does too
Q I show you 32504 This is a photograph taken at night in the wheelhouse of the Exxon Valdez Do you recognize the photograph as being somewhat representative of what you had -
the evening of March 23 24?
A Somewhat The lights are a little bit too bright but
Q You like them dimmer than that?
A Yes it was quite a dark evening
Q Okay And this photograph shows this overhead rudder angle
(161 indicator is illuminated?
(17) A Yes
(18) $Q$ So you can readilv see that can you not?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q You already testıfied that Captam Hazelwood knew because
(21) you discussed it with him that you were outside the traffic
(22) separation scheme when he was turning the con over to you?
(23) A Yes
(24) $Q$ He further knew the vessel was on a course of $180^{7}$
(2) AYes

```
                    Vol 16 2378
A Right
Q What was the urgency as you understood it in what Captain
Hazelwood toid you why he left the bridge at this time two
munutes before the turn that you ve testified he told you to
make at Busby Island light?
A I don't know that I ever understood the urgency, but I
understood that be needed to gather figures to pass on to
Alyeska or whatever the name of our agent is up there
Q Did he use the word messages to you when he sard I got to
send some messages or do you recall the term he used?
A I don't recall specifically if he used that term
Q And you just testified justa minute ago you said you
weren tsure if you ever understood the urgency of it What
did you mean by that? Is it that you questioned the urgency'
A In companson to what we were dong Whocares about
(16) figures? I mean that's my opumon, but evidently he felt
(17) comfortable I indicated to hum that it's not a
(18) particularly - should not have beea a particularly tricky
(19) maneuver
(20) Q On that evening when you were thinking of your mind set
(21) right then did you question the necessity of Captain Hazelwood
(22) leaving the bridge for the reason that he gave to you in the
(23) circumstances the vessel was in which you ve testified to
(24) outside the traffic separation scheme?
(25) A I didn't really have tume to - I didn't really have - I
```

cargo

Vol 162380
Q He also knew that the vessel s course of 180 was heading if continued down toward the Bligh Reef area?
A Yes
Q He also knew that there was ice in the channel which you
previously discussed and have marked on the chart?
A Yes
Q Across the traffic separation scheme?
A Yes
Q He knew that you were a Navy third mate had come up from a
seaman up to a third mate about when vou had made your third
mate?
AYes
Q Got your third mate license?
AYes
(1s) Q He further knew that when he was turning the con over to
(16) you that it was Second Mate LeCain a watch?
(In A Yes, he did
(18) Q He further knew that the steering was on auto gyro because
(19) he had put it in auto gyro?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q And by the way did Captain Hazelwood before he left the
(22) bridge tell you it was auto gyro?
(23) A I only knew when the watch was changing out Mr Carr ( ph )
(24) informed we that it had been put on
(25) $Q$ Did you find it unusual that Captain Hazelwood had ordered

## Vol 16238

the engines to be put in load program up under the conditions
that existed that evening where the vessel was located outside
the traffic separation scheme and with icu in the tralfic
separation scheme ahead of you?
A Yeah Yes I did
Q After he departed can voutell us what you did next'
Al went to the steening cunsole and put the steening into
hand mode helm mode
Q Did you do that yourself'
AYes
Q And you ve already testified that you confirmed by looking
at the indicators on the SRP 2000 that that switch had been"
made?
AYes
Q Then what did you do nuxi?
A I - I beheve that's when I took the fix or shortly
thereafter, I was headed out to the port bradge wing, took a
visual bearing of Busby light
Q Okay And what did you use for the tume that you were
doing this? Did you use your wristwatch?
AYes
Q And had you previously synchronized your wristwatch with
the bridge watch?
AYes
Q You do that as a matter of routine when you come on watch?

## Vol 16 238?

(1) A Yes And also the gear test requires that

1) Q The first thing you did was take a bearing with an acimuth?
2) AYes
(4) QI mgoing to ask you prior to that and in your sailing
is experients have you ever ulilized any other muthod to
(6) dulurminc when a navigational aid was abcam whun you needud to
(7) do it rapidly?

181 A Yes
9) Q What method did vou use?
(10) A l've used radar for that purpose I ve also just an
(II) conjunction with the radar placed an azimuth circle set up
il , on - with the vanes set so $I$ could actuall, take a rough sight
113 of it from inside the wheelhouse
(14) $Q$ Why did you in this situation take the ume to tahe an
(IS) azimuth bearing to make il precise as opposed to doing it in a
(16) rougher manner like I described?
(17) A I can't give you a satasfactory answer for that It
(18) puzzies me also
(14) $Q$ Now after you took the samuth bearing you then waiked
( 0 ) into the wheclhousc from the pori wing?
11) AYes

1 , Q And what did you do naxi'
3, A I read the range ridar ringe off of liusby INand the
1 4) poant - the point
is) $Q$ And then what did you dudicer vou gol that dinanus'
(1)

A I plotted the fix
(2) Q So you walked back into the chart room and while you were
(3) in this position we mentioned yesterday that you couldn $t$ see
(4) anything up ahead?
(s) A Correct
(6) Q Okay Now you have plotted the fix and tell me from the
(7) tume you walked out on the port wing of the bridge to take the
(8) azimuth bearing that time at that time was 55 the time you
(9) statted this process?
(10) A Yes
(u) Q Can you teil us when did you receive a first report from (12) the lookout?
(13) A I had just finshed plotting position at the 2355 fix as (14) the lookout came unto the chart room and reported Bligh Reef
(IS) Light She gave the color and charactenstics of the light
(16) Q Did she tell you where the light was in beanng with
(17) reference to your heading?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q What did she say?
(30) A I beheve she sad it was a point on the port bow - a
(21) point on the starboard bow, excuse me
(22) $Q$ And the point in nautical terms for those that don $t$ know
(23) is how many degrees?
(24) A 11 and a quarter degrees
(25) Q Now when she made that report to you did you reach a

## Vol 162384

(1) conclusion as to what light she was reporting?
(2) A I - I knew what light it was I'd seen it before she had,
(3) actually
(4) Q Okay And did she make a subsequent report to you?
(s) A She - yes Some moments later and I can't say how much
(6) later she corrected her initial report and the characternstic
7) of the light
(8)
(9)
(10)
(11)
(1.)
(13) Q Where were you when she made that second report? Had
you
(ia) come out of the chart room or were you still in the chart room?
(IS) Al was in the wheelhouse
(16) Q You plotied the position she had made the first repor
(17) While you were in the chart room?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q You walked out of the chart room now what did you do
(20) nuxl?
(-1) A That's when I approached the radar It was giving the 1 , comanand - I was givang the command when she made her second
( 3 ) report as I recall
(24) Q Giving what command?
( ${ }^{\prime}$ ) $\mathbf{A}$ The rudder order the ten degree right rudder

Vol 162385
Q I see Okay So you gave that order then you went - you
went to the telephone?
A I went to a bulkhead
Q Got the light?
A Rught, flashinght went to the telephone It's on the
bulkhead separatung the chart room and the wheelhouse and
called the captan's office
Q Were you in the wheelhouse when you were making that call or were you in the chart room?
A I was in the wheelhouse
Q And then I think we talked about before you tumed around to make the telephone call to Captain Hazelwood and you didn t
(13) watch the - you didn t watch the helmsman?
(14) A I turned to take a flashinght from a holder that was on an
(15) opposite bulkhead and I called Captan Hazelwood as he
had
(16) mstructed me to do
(in Q Okay And again you agree you did not watch Ithink you
(18) testufied you did not watch Kagan to see if he executed the
(19) order?
(20) A No, I did not
(91) Q You got on the phone with Captain Hazelwood Can you tell

1 ) us to the best of your recollection what did you say and what
(13) did he say?
(9) A I told Captan Hazelwood that we had instiated our turn
(25) b

```
Vol 16 2386
may stall get into some of the ice And he said do you thank
that - are they real bug? Well I couldn't see them And he
sand do you thmok there's any problem? And I sad I - I
didn't know That was the gist of the conversation Thus is
not verbatım I don't recall
Q Okay Now you have testified you re having this
conversation with Captamn Hazelwood About how long would
estimate you were on the telephone with him?
A Qurte frankly, I think I lost track of tume
Q Mr Cousins just focusing on Kagan when you ordered
(11) to go right ten degrees rudder you then turned around and
(12) to the telephone?
(13) AYes
(14) Q You did not watch to see if he executed the order and
(1S) you -
(16) A Rught
(1) Q - you did not watch the rudder angle indicator Would you
(18) have done things differently in that respect just those few
(19) moments with respect to that order?
(20) A I would never make that mustake agan with any
helmsman,
(21) not just Mr Kagam But I -
(22) Q All right With any helmsman but if you had had that
(23) knowledge it would have motivated you to watch him is that
(24) correct?
(25) A I would not have bothered to turn my back on the - the
```

Kagan
went

Vol 162387
(1) whole process in paloting the vessel which is essentiaily what
() I did when I turned to make the telephone call

Q After you make the call to Captain Hazelwood then tell us what vou did?
A After the call?
Q Yes You hang up?
A I hang up and the sequence of my movements from then on are
8) not clear

Q Did-yeu?
A I - I approached - I recall going to the radar From
then on I can - I can tell you what I did I don't know that
the sequence is correct That's as I recall the first moment
of great concern that I had -
(14) $Q$ When you looked at the radar?
(IS) $\mathbf{A}$ - when I returned
(16) $Q$ What gave you great concern?
(17) A Well nothing had happened as far as a heading change
(18) Q How did you -
(19) A Or not much
(20) Q How did you make the judgment that nothing had happened
as
(21) far as a heading change?
(22) A Well, looking at the radar, the heading flasher the
(23) beaning of Bligh Reef lught in relation to the heading there's
a) a heading readout display from the radar
(5) Q All right Can you teil us what did vou do next?

## Vol 162388

A As I recall I told the helmsman to get the rudder over to ten right and ummedıately 1 turned and looked out went out to
3) the port bridge wing and looked back at Busby Island Light

Q And where did you see Busby Island light?
Alt was -
Q Do you want to look at this chart?
A - abaft the port beam
Q Abaft thu port beam?
A Abaft the port beam Perhaps broad on the port quarter,
(10) I recall
) Q Were you able to tell from looking at the light whether you
(12) were in the white sector or the red sector just from looking
(13) at it?
(14) A It observed a white light
(IS) Q You re out on the port wing and you looked back at Busby
(16) light what did you do next?
(1n A I entered the wheelhouse I'm not real clear on this I (18) approached the three centumeter radar I don't know whether
(19) when I went into the chart room I don't recall it For some
(20) reason at some point I thought that I had gone back to the -
(21) the chart just briefly, but I'm not sure about that at all
(22) There's the $\mathbf{2 0}$ degree rudder command also was given at about
(23) that tume when I re-entered the wheelbouse
(24) Q Okay You gave a 20 degree right rudder order to Kagan
(2nd can you tell me what did you do then? Did you - in
, connection with did you obsurve - what did vou observe right , after you gave him the order' Did vou watch him?
A I'm afraid that I - this is where I may have returned to the chart room
Q So is it correct that when you gave him the 20 degree right rudder order you did not observi whether he put the wheel over
further to starboard?
A Correct
Q And you did not obsurve the rudder angle indicator to see If it increased from its postion you last saw it at at six) A No I observed it moving from six towards ten and I didn't stand there and watch it 1 don't recall watching at until it stopped on ten I returned my attention to enther the rock or the radar or I would umagine the radar
Q And you may have gone in the chart room you said is that correct?
A It - to the best of my - my recollect - I actually don't remember going back into the chart room but 1 - I have a sense that I did and I just don't recall it because the circumstances that I found myself in 「hat I may have neglected observing the swing from tea to twenty also
Q On the ruducr dngle indiador in what you ra ading'

1) ACorrect yes
(4) Q All right Soatter the hard right did you then make a
2) kluphonc call to Captain Harclwood that you just muntioned)

## Vol $16 \quad 2390$

" AYes
(1) Q And what did you say to him?
(3) A 1 told the captan that we reinsernous trouble And he
(a) says what do you mean' I sadd we rein very sernous trouble
(s) that we are probably going to ground or something to that (6) effect
(7) Q What did he say?
(8) A And he sand well where's the rudder' And I said it's
( $)^{\prime}$ ) hard right rudder And then I looked at the rudder angle
(10) andicator and at was still at 20 and I told the helinsman to
(II) get the rudder over to hard hard nght 「bat's probably the
(1) only tame I watched him that evemang
"l। $Q$ And then you hung up or did you dolually focl or hear the
(14) grounding whil you sill had the iclephone in your hand'
(1s) A We were making - there are a senes of - of shocky to the
vessel It felt as I recull three - it wav-gave methe
II7) sensation on the bridge of having run over speed bumps
That s
(18) exactly what it felt lake and I-actually the captann was
(19) stall on the phone and I said we regong aground ind $I$ just
( 0 ) hung up and be was un the bridge -
(1) Q Okay

1 , A - immediately thereufter
(3) Q Did you give any further orders to Kagan attur the hard (d) righi?
(-s) A Yes I did The pacture I had in mv mand of where the -
(1) the posituon of the vessel was the - that the north -
-) northernmost point of the reef My fear was that as the vessel
3) contunued to swing, and we were still - seemed to be making
(4) way through over the reef My concern was that the vessel

If
5) it contunued to swing as it was was goug to hole the engine
(6) room and I ordered a hard left As I did that, the captan
was nght there, and after that he really took control of anything that went on
Q I m just asking do you have any explanation why the course recorder does not indicate any change off of 180 shortly after your 2356 or 2357 ten degree right rudder order? Based on your
(12) testumony those were the tumes that you would have given the
(13) order but it indicates the turn commencing at sometime by
(4) your estimate at 002 or 003 which is a gap of five to six
minutes?
AYes
Q Do you have any explanation for that?
A It appears that we were just - we were stull steenng 180
Q Now turning to the bell logger can you tell us what was
the first time that there was any reduction of speed ordered by
Captain Haectwood as shown on the bell logger at least reflected there after the grounding?
A That's half ahead at 18 mınutes after midnight 1854
Q 18 and 54 seconds is that correct?

## Vol 162392

, A Um hum

1) Q So the bell logger shows that it salmost at 19 is that
(1) correct?
(4) A Correct
2) Q And if the grounding occurred at 008 just based on your
(6) best estumate before that first bump on the course recorder
3) just assuming that to be the initial grounding there was an
4) interval of about nine minutes after the initial grounding that
5) the engine was put to half ahead?

AYes
Q Now who ordered the engines ultimately stopped which is
indicated on the bell logger at time 19 and 49 seconds which
is 19 minules after midnight and 45 seconds is that correct?
AYes
Q Who gave that order you or Captan Hazelwood do you rcall?
A I don't recall Somebody up there the captain or myself reganned some composure and realsed that we needed to do
(19) something to the engine I believe it was probably the
(20) captan Ife instructed me to call the engine room I may
have
(21) called the engine room before or I just - I don't remember
( ) I remember being on the phone with them twice
(73) The captan as I recall gave the commands for engine
) speed reduction
(rs) Q Did vou at any time after the grounding smell crude oll
(1) vapors?
(ग) A Yes They were verv strong
3) Q And what was the interval of time between the grounding and 4) your smelling this?
s) A Almost immediately
(6) Q And in your mind did you make a judgment that there was
7) danger of a fire?
(8) A Yes, that possibility crossed my mind
(9) Q Now were you on the bridge when Captain Hazelwood started
(10) maneuvering the vessel $s$ engines?
(II) A Yes
(12) Q After the grounding?
(13) A Yes
(14) $Q$ And on the bell logger it indicates that the first engine
(15) maneuver was at time 0935 and 57 seconds when the vessel $s$
(16) engine was put dead slow ahead Do you see that number towards
(17) the top of the second column? It $s$ about six entries down
(18) It $s$ this one right here
(19) A The dead -
(0) Q The dead slow ahead you see that?
( I) A Slow ahead that's at 093557
(2) QYes
( 31 A Yes
(4) Q And to bring that to local time that s 0935 and 57
( it seconds is that correct?

## Vol 162394

(1) A Yes
(2) Q Did Captain Hazelwood did you hear him say anything that
(3) indicated to you what he was trying to do while he put his
(4) engines ahead?
(s) A I heard part of a radio transmission And I assume it was
(6) with vessel traffic that he thought perbaps there was a chance
(7) to extricate the vessel from the reef
(8) $Q$ When you say extricate you mean free the vessel from your (9) strand?
(10) A Yes correct
(11) Q 1 m going to read you transmissions here that he gave and
(12) then ask you your interpretation It was your underatanding he
(13) was trying to get underway?
(14) A I really didn't know what he was trying to do
(19) Q But you did mention that you had heard part -
(16) A I mean the - the defintion of extricate is to pull
(17) something out right?
(18) Q Yeah I want you to turn over to page nine on this same
(19) exhibit
(20) A Um hum The transmissions '
(?) Q Yes And I want you to look at the transmission that was
(22) of 010729 when he stalking to the captain of the port?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q Were you on the bridge when Captain Hazelwood had this
(25) tranamission with the captain of the port?

## Vol 162396

A I see full ahead yes
Q Did you hear Captain Hazelwood during this hour and four or five minutes giving orders to the helmsman?
A Yes
Q And what orders did you hear that were given?
A I don't recall
Q During any of your studies did they ever teach you about proper maneuvers when your vessel goes aground if you re going
(9) to attempt to free your vessel from a strand?
(10) A Yes
ill) Q And whal were you laughl?
A Stay aground
Q And what - were you ever taught anything that if you were going to risk trying to free yourself from a strand did you ever receive any instruction as to what steps you should take to try and do that?
A I can't recall having read anything recommending puiling
a
(18) grounded vessel in the condition that we were in from a ground,
(19) but any - any text that I've read on those matters suggest
(20) extreme caution and number of safety precautions
(21) $Q$ And in connection with use of the engines if you go
(22) forward - if you go aground in the forward part of your vessel
(13) forward of your engine ronm an would it he more prudent to
(24) back your engines rather than try and go ahead to free your
( $\mathrm{g}_{1}$ vessel from a stern strand?

Vol 162397
(I) A If someone was trying to pull the ship off the reef'
(9) QYes
(3) A I remember - regardless of whether he thought that was a
(4) good thing to do or not you would back the engines
(s) Q And by going forward on the engines in the situation you
(6) were in if the vessel were able to have been freed from the
(7) strand might you not endanger tearing your engine room apart?
(8) A Yes
(9) Q Now just directing your attention a moment to the course
(0) recorder tape again Do you have a copy of that over there in
(II) front of you? It s on that same page we were looking at *
(12) before Just look and I want to direct your attention to time
(13) Greenwich time 936 approximatily which is local time 0036
(14) Do you see that?
(15) AYes
(16) Q And you see the heading of the vassel there at that tume
(17) the heading was about 2557 In the 180 to 170 quadrant?
(18) AYes
(19) Q Now taking that time and the lime that Captain Hacelwood
(20) was maneuvering the engine for the next hour and four minules
(21) approximately the heading of the vessel changed while he was
(22) maneuvering the vessel did it not?
(i) AYes
(4) Q And if we waich the swing of the vessel from the 255
( 51 postion she swings both port and starboard numurous limbs

## Vol $16 \quad 2398$

## does she not?

AYes
Q And the range of the swing the furthust il swings to starboard is over aboul 263 dugrees 264 dugreas do you sec that?
AYes
Q And the turthest she swingy lo port is ovcrabout up on
top Iguess il sabout 249 dubrus'
AYes
Q So during this period ol simu that Captain Ha/clwoud was mancuvcring the vesoul in ulle thal wavtahint placu and also using the helm was the vassal s hading was atually changing while she was on the ruel between those -
AYes
Q - degrees we just discussed?
A Yes
Q When the master turned the con over to you fust betore the grounding you said you wert - you said you were busy? A Certainly
(º) Q Okay You were still - you still had the dutv to navigatc
' " the vassul even though the mastur wavaboard right'
1 , ACorrect
( ) Q Imcan was on the hridgu'
(A) A Right
( s) Q And vou wer carrying oul thon dular)

## I A Yes

1 Q All right At the time that the master turned the con over
to you and told you to - what did he actually say about the
। next course other than the one you were on? You were on 180
is that right?
AYes
Q Did he give you a next course to steer?
A No
Q Isn t that somewhat unusual?
A Not in this circumstance no
tht $Q$ So he just told you when you came abeam of Busby Island what do what?
A Start bringing the ship back into the lanes
(14) Q And left it to your discretion as to what courses to steer and what helm orders to give?
AYes
Q Did he - had you ever been in that stuation before where
the master left you headed directly at a reef and left to your
discretion what courses to steer and how much helm to use?
A No
Q Do you have an opinion about whether or not that s good
martume practice?
A I wouldn't do it
Q Did you have in mind the time he turned the con over to you
and told you to make the turn at Busby Island what course you

## Vol 162400

would steer to bring it back into the lanes?
A Yes I had already formulated my approach to this - our passage between the reef and the ice back into the lanes Q What course did you in your mind - you didn i mark it on the chart?

## A No

Q And what course did you have in your mind that you would
steer to go from abeam of Busby Island between the ice and
the
ree?
A lt was not so much a course It was a senes of headings
Q And did you have those plotied out in your mind?
A ln my mind yes
Q What were they?
A I cannot recall My untent was because of the extent of the ice and how it appeared on radar that the reason for me not using more rudder angle more rudder initually was that I wanted a somewhat more gradual rate of change, heading change
(is) so I didn't end up in the midst of the ice
19) Q Okay Now where the we was did not encroach on the red stctor of Busby Island did it?
A No
Q So that there was room between the red sector and the front
cdge of the ice for the vessel to fo through?
A Yes there was plenty of room
Q Did the master tell you before leaving the bridge anything

| [ FEDERA |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Vol 16 2401 |  |  |
| out how you should - should steer the vessel or order |  |  |
| ) vessel steered to do that to avoid the ice? |  |  |
| A As far as courses or rudder orders no |  |  |
| Q He told you he was leaving for a few minutes did vou expect him to be back on the bridge during these maneuvers' |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| A Well I wasn't sure When he - when he first asked if |  |  |
| felt comfortable that he wanted to - would like to leave the |  |  |
| bridge for a few minutes said of I'm not back in a few |  |  |
| minutes give me a call So it was somewhat vague as to whether he was going to come up on his own or if he wanted |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| to give him a call when we were abeam Busby Which was |  |  |
| $y \mathrm{a}$ |  |  |
| couple of minutes, anyway |  |  |
| Q Why didn t you turn when you were abeam Busby? |  |  |
| A I thought I was That was the intent |  |  |
| Q Well my understanding - |  |  |
| A Oh okay |  |  |
| Q - was that some lume had passed from abeam Busby to your first helm order? |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| A I can't give you a good explanation That was just poor |  |  |
| seamanship on my part Lack of expenence perhaps, in |  |  |
| I dow but stuatuons where |  |  |
| tuation I don't know But in situations where I |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| a vessel before 1 had never done anything lake that |  |  |
| Q The master was aware of your expertence wasn the? |  |  |
| A I don't know |  |  |
| uated you on a number of occasions a |  |  |

$\frac{\text { SRIP }}{1}$
about how you should - should steer the vessel or order the vessel steered to do that to avoid the ice?
A As far as courses or rudder orders no
Q He told you he was leaving for a few minutes did vou expect him to be back on the bridge during these maneuvers)
A Well I wasn't sure When he - when he first asked if I
felt comfortable that he wanted to - would like to leave the bridge for a few minutes said if I'm not back in a few
minutes gave me a call So it was somewhat vague as to
whether he was going to come up on his own or if he wanted me only a
(1) couple of minutes, anyway
3) Q Why didn tyou turn when you were abeam Busby?
(14) A I thought I was That was the intent
(I) Q Weil my understanding -
(16) A Oh okay
(17) Q - was that some tume had passed from abeam Busby to your
(18) first helm order?
(19) A I can't give you a good explanation That was just poor
that
(21) situation I don't know But in situations where I maneuvered
( ) a vessel before 1 had never done anything like that
(1) Q The master was aware of your experience wasn the?
(4) A I don't know
( s) Q He had evaluated you on a number of occasions at least

.) AYes
(3) Q Now you mentioned I believe Mr Cousins itwas
(4) Tuesday You said looking back there a number of things you
(5) would have done differently and I think it was in response to
question aboul making sure that Kagan in facl followed your
7) order to turn Could you deseribe for me suthing here in
hindsight what things you would have done differently on the
0) A I would never have bothered to go out and take a visual
(11) beanig from a repeater I would not have left the three
(12) centumeter radar I would not even have bothered to go
(13) Into the chart room I already knew where I was I would not
(14) have left the helmsman unattended as I did I would bave taken
(Is) a visual beanng but I wouldn't have - would not have walked
(16) out to the repeater and sighted it It was not necessary
(17) Q Why did you do that evening?
(18) A I can't answer that
(19) Q You said you would have stayed at the radar?
(20) A I would have maintained the radar watch and nght there
where I can watch the helmsman the rudder angle
undicator I
(22) can watch - I had fairly decent visibility, as far as viewng
(24) that I saw that before the lookout did
(25) There was just no reason for me to do what I did that

5-24-94 VOLUME 16 $\qquad$ XMAX(8)
evening as far as ploting the fix going out and sighting it turning my back on the helmsman calling the captain If he
i) wasa't there whocares I mean obvinusiv he had
something
41 else to do I should ant have allowed mvself to become
(4) inattentive to more sernous -

61 QMr Cousins you were telling us a number of things that
7) weren I necessary on hindaight such as going out and taking a
8) visual bearing and going in the chart room'

A Correct
(10) Q Doryou belıeve as you sit here today that one of the
(11) reasons you may have been doing that is because you were nervous at the time?

A No
(14) Q Had you ever been in a situation that you were in at that
(1S) lime where you were conning a vessel by yourself outside of the Iraffic separation scheme'
A Vot to that particular sutuation Mavbe brieny headed towards an anchorage somewhere approaching Long Beach ar
(iv) approaching the dock down - or the port in Panama but those
(30) are fairly stranghtforward approaches but certanily nothing hil he this
(22) Q Did that concern you that you were put into a situation
(23) that you had never had any experience in before?

A I would have to say that I was - I was too busy with
trying to navigate the - the vessel to expenence concern If

[^26]Vol 162405
(1) everything right?

A I didn't have to - 1 did not have to do what I did Or in walking out taking visudl bearing it was not necessary It really was not necessary As a matter of fact it was considening the number of people on the bridge it was poor practuce
Q Al that limb though you had to do - you had to do what in your judgment was nelcosary righl'
A Obviously my judgment was flawed
Q Well 1 m not talking about looking at it today 1 m talking about at that tume when Hazelwood lefi the bridge you had to do what you thought was necessary right?
A Correct
Q And at that time you did what you thought was necessary right?
A Correct
Q And it wasn 1 Captain Hazelwood up there to question you or lell you that you were doing something wrong was 11 ?

## A Correct

Q And on no occasion did Ha/clwood call you lo sur how you
were doing did he?
A No he dadn't
3) How long does it tahe to get from the captain s quarters to the bridge?
A I don't know An estimate of - I would say if you were in

## Vol $16 \quad 2406$

## a burry you could do it in ten or 15 seconds

## Q In the circumstances in which Capiain Harclwood had

 placed3) auto gyro lthink I went over this with you and after going
d to 180 with the vessul heading out of the channel and indeed
5i still on auto gyro when the vessul was out of the channel and
4) he turned the con over to you -

A Yes
Q - in your judgment should the vasyol have hacn in auto gyro at that lime?
A In my opinion no
Q Now is one of the rasoons that volu sor not hatause you were
instrucied by him as you lastificd that you whre going to
make a course change in about two minulus aficr ho was alking
off the bridge and he walked off the bridge with the steering
isi still in auto gyro which would require il io have been pui in
helm is that one of the reasons?
A That's part of it As a matter of practice eventhough there's a - in some pertions of the round a lot of room to maneuver just as - as a normal practice I would aot ever put
(v) it in - put a vessel in auto - auto steering
(1) Q Mr Cousins you can lull nic bul in summarifing quablly
( -) what you testificd to on these diflercat points starting out
( 3) Captain Haselwood rulurned to the vonsel and voul didn itnow 1) whethar ha would rulurn hefore ar allur the pilat way aboard is that corract)
(1) A Correct
() Q And the pilot was on the bridge before Caplain Hazelwood
(3) and Captain Hacelwood came up latcr)
(4) A Correct
(s) Q is that correct?
(6) A Correct
(7) Q Okay Let s go to the next thing You testified that
(8) Caplain Hazelwood after getting underway at some period of
(9) tume before the Narrows left the bridge?
(10) AYes
(th) Q And you further testified that in your experience your
(12) experience in Valdez you have never seen a caplasn who had
not
(13) been on the bridge through the Narrows do you recall that?
(14) A Correct
(15) $Q$ You further testufied that you have never seen load program
(16) up used before when there was ice in the traffic separation
(17) stheme do you recall that?
(18) A Correct
(19) Q You further testified that the con was turned over to you
( -0 ) by Capisin Hazelwood at a tume in which the vessel was outande
(21) the traffic separation scheme in which the vessel sheading was
(22) in the general area of Bligh Reef that the vessel $s$ steering
(23) was in auto gyro the vessel $s$ engine was in load program up
(24) and that you had no pilotage?
(25) A Correct

## Vol 162408

(I) Q In violation of your vessel organization manual the (2) ruquirement for two officers to be on the bridge?
(3) A Assuming the Watch Condition C"
(4) QYes
(s) A Yes
(6) Q With which you said in your judgment existed?
(7) A In my judgment yes
(8) Q You further testified that the captain went below to his
(9) wabin and ramainud thero until about the limu of the grounding
(10) which was a period of - we had about 15 minutes I believe
(11) from 2353 to 0008 or thereabouts?
(1) A Correct
(13) Q Now du you have an explanation knowing Captain Hazulwood
(14) and knowing what you hnew of him before the grounding and
(15) reflecling back on this what caused this captain - you
(16) believed him to be a competent captain did you not I gather?
(17) AYes
(i8) $Q$ What caused this competent captain in a sequence of acts (19) over a period of few hours to be performing acts which you have
(20) given - the record speaks for itself - a description of? Do
( 1 ) you have any answer to that?
( $\rightarrow$ I I havenoidea
(9) Q Did you cvur su Captain Ha/ciwood drinhing ashore?
(24) A Onetume yes
(י) Q And when was that?

## Vol 162409

A I couldn't give you the date It was - the vessel was in
a shupyard and I'd stopped by his apartment briefly, he and
myself and one of the other officers and I think we had a beer
together
Q Do you recall what shipyard?
A Portland But I don't - WSI I thank was the contract
Q Do you recall what year that was?
A I guess it must have been sometime in 1988
Q Do you recall who the other officer was?
A No I don't
Q Did you have anything other than a beer as you described?
A No
MS WAGNER Nothing further Your Honor
MR SANDERS May it please the Court We have
cross examination or examination of Mr Cousins by video
With the Court $s$ permission and to save ume we can start
it up I have some charts to bring up and II do that while
it splaying
CROSS EXAMINATION OF GREGORY COUSINS
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Did you bring any documents with you?
A My ficense
(3) Q Couid I see that? This is a second mate s license of ocean
4) steam or motor vessels of any gross tons radar observer
unlimited and it s dated January 121992 is that correct?

## Vol 162410



A That's correct
Q When did you get this license)
A February of 1990 I betieve or '89
Q 89 that was your first issue of the second mate $s$
license?
A Yes
Q When did you take the exam for the second mate s license'
A In February
Q The year was what again?
A I belteve it was ' 89
Q Now just to put it in perspective was that a month
before the grounding of the Exxon Valdez -
ARight
Q-you took the exam What age are you sir?
A 42
Q So as of March of 89 you were 397
A 39
went
(19) to which we Il get to did you have any formai education?
( 0 ) A Through Latton Industries I attended
(1) QI m sorry strike that because you said college I meant (2) between college and Page Navigation I should say Did you (23) have any formal education
(24) A I attended courses that were offered by Litton Industry (2J)
with

## them

Q What did those courses relate to"
A Mechanical engineering
Q Okay Now Page Navigation school tell us about that
Where is the school located that vou went to?
A It s - when I attended he was located in the City of New
Orieans It has since moved
Q Ohav And how long did vou altend that school?
A I spent less than a month actually in the classrooms He
prepares videntaped lectures and home study packages
because - -
my home is in Tampa that surted my needs
Q And so you do the vidco studv at home?
A Yes
Q When did you start at that school' What month do you remember?
A I don't recall
(17) Q Well do you remember what is the length of the course
(i8) including this home session and the less than a month you had
(19) at Page?
(0) A Thev usualls recommend a minmum of a vear studs
( 11 Q Did you do that)
( ) A Oh ves I studsed on my own for sometime
( 31 Q Well il you slaricd Page in 86 is that correct did you?
(9) A Um hum yes
(25) $Q$ Do you remember the time of year spring fall summer?

## Vol 162412

A What I m sdying is that I can - my atudies began Ing
i) before I contacted Page Vavigation I had my own textbonks I
(3) pursued my studses on my own I attended Page so that the instructors there could help me focus on exactly what I needed
(5) for the third mate exam instead of studying everything that I
may need later on instead of nght now
Q So you didn I do the home study that Page recommended
after
(8) the Pagu?

A Yes I did
Q Well let me just finish my question that Page recommended be done through its tapls and ils studicy you did it on your own before you went to Page is that whal you re saying? A I really did it twice yes 1 did my own studies for probably more than a year I would estumate two years on my
(15) own before I even contacted Page When I went to Page I
(16) reviewed all of his material and at an accelerated rate
because
(17) I was already quite familiar with most of the maternal anyway
(18) because I had studied it
(19) Q The material that you studied before you contacted Page
(20) was it Page s material?
(1) A No it was standard maritime textbooks
(22) Q Geared for a third matu study and tor third mate license?
(23) A Well no it wasn't
(24) Q Well icll me what texthooks did you study then that you
si did this studying lor aboul two veara hefore any contact with

Vol 162413
5-24-94
VOLUME 16
XMAXIII

1) Page?
2) A Well standard marine text such ds Bowditch Dutton's many
(3) of the Cornell mantime naval pubheations
(4) QOkay Then when you - you went to Page do you remember
s) what tume of the year that was that you actually came to New
3) Orleans and went to the school?

A No I don't
Q Do you remember allur vou lult the schooling and they gave
you the videolapes and home study how long did vou do that
before you took your third mate scxam'
A Several months
Q Okay And then you took your third mate s exam?
AYes
Q Did you pass it?
A Yes
Q And that was sometime in 1986' is that correct?
A As I recall, yes, sur
Q And during that period you were a seaman what vcssels did
you sall on when you were a seaman a number of vessels?
A A number of them
Q And all tankers)
A All tankers
3) Q What was the ovcrall lungth'

1) A think they were close to 900 feet
s) Q About almost the same site as the Valde,'

## Vol $162+14$

" A Almost
1 Q And when you sailed just as an A B now holure you ware an 3) officur did you evar gu do Valdef the Port of Valduf' A Yes many times
Q When you wers issuud your licensc did you immediately
(b) start sailing with Exxon as a third mate or was theri some
(7) lapye in there where you were sailing as a staman?
is A I belleve there was oat assigument that I salled in an unlicensed capacity and then $\mid-$ av 1 recull it may have been
(10) the next assignment that I was stepped up
(II) Q Do you remember would that have bcun in aboul I $9 \times 77$ We II
(1) get to your servicu record laturand mayhs vou can rulrush your
(1) recollecuion This is just ginural right nuw thal might have
ild) been around 1987 would that be aboul riehi"
(15) A Perhaps the end of '86 beginang of 87
(10) Q Do you rememburany of the vasuls you surved un ay a thard
"7. mate'
॥si A Yes
( $\mid$ ( $)$ ) Q Do you remember all of them?
(.0) A Yes there weren't that many The Fxxon Galveston
(1) Exxon -
(-2) Q Tell me the stze of wach as you rugoing along
(3) Alcouldn't
(4) $Q$ What was the overall length of the Galvestun do vou
s) remembur?

A I have no idea It's probably - it was a converted tug
barge lighter vessel so it's relatuvely smail
Q Okay And then the next one?
A The Exxon Charleston
Q All right
A It was a private carner approximately 600 feet long
QOkay
A The Exxon New Orleans
Q All right
A Let's see
Q What was her size the New Orleans?
A 700 feet
Q Okay And the next one?
A The Exxon Valdez
Q Okay There satotal of four up through the grounding
would that be correct as an officer?

## A Right

Q All as a third mate?
A Yes, sir
Q When you sailed as an A B did you have occagion to go up
to Prince William Sound?
AYes
Q How many occasions'
A I think the estımate was perhaps 26 voyages or so, like
that

## Vol 162416

1) Q During the coursc of your service as an A B in Prince
, William Sound did you have occasion to steer up there?
2) A Yes
(1) Did you stand the lookout watch during those -

AYes
Q - those trips as well?
A Yes
Q You had a chance to observe the topography of the area?
AYes
Q You hnew where Bligh Reet was?
A Yes
Q You knew where the Bligh Reef buoy was?
AYes
Q You hnew wher Busby Island was?
A Yes
Q You hnew where Naked Island was?
AYes
Q How aboul Rocky Poınt?
A Yes
Q Potato Point?
AYes
Q The Narrows?
AYes
Q Litle Roch
A Yes

Vol $16 \quad 2417$
$Q$ Now can you recall who the captains were that you satled
() with into Valdez while you were an officer?
(1) AYes
(4) Q Tell me who they were
(5) A Captan Grove Captan Wallace Captain Hazelwood Captann
16) Stalzer Captan Hoye Captan Witty
(7) Q Now when you sailed as an officer where did you pick up and drop off the pilot?
A Rocky Point
Q Was that on every single trip that you were anvolved with
dropping off and picking up the pilot?
(12) Let me rephrase that That was a bad question
(13) When you were involved in the picking up or dropping off of
(14) the pilot did you always pick him up at Rocky Point and drop
(1s) him off at Rocky Point?
(16) A Yes
(in $Q$ When you - when you acted as a lookout when you were an
(18) A B in Prince William Sound did you report the various
(19) navigation aids that you spotied?
(0) A Yes
(1) Q Now I d like to focus on your servicu rucord for a
(י) second Can we have that put in front of the witness please)
(r3) A That's Exhibit 48786
(4) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER What sthe predesignation
(s) number?

## Vol 162418

## BY VIDEO EXAMINER

Q Number 11 I know you guys are trying to confuse me hut
(3) I m ready Could you turn to the service record covering the
(4) period February 13th 1987 to April 7th 1987 under Caplain
(s) Wallace

A Yes
Q You have it in front of you?
A Yes
Q is il correct that under the category maintains cooperative
working relationship - sorry sorry Strike that
(II) Under the category willingness to assume additional
(12) responsibilities beyond normal job requirements Caplain
(13) Wallace gave you what? A strong point performs very well?
(14) A Correct
(is) $Q$ Under the category carries out thoroughly the commitments
(16) and duties of position with attention to necesary detala
(in) what d Captain Wallace give you? What kind of rating?
(18) A Strong point performs very well
(19) $Q$ Is that the highest you could have gotten highest rating
(20) you could have gotten?
(21) A Onthis form yes
(3) Q Under the category is always fit - sorry is always in fit

131 condition alert and vigilant on watch what did Captain
(24) Wallace give you?
(25) A Same ratung
(I) Q The highest rating?
(1) A Yes
(1) Q Under the category acts quickly and effectively in
) emergencies or pressure situations what did Captain Wallace
s) say about that?
a A Vo opportunts to ohserve
7) Q Okav And under the bategory going down to deck officers
si only you scc that?
A Yes
Q Thu second calcyory under navigatusin an accurate
reliable mannur making optimum use ol all avalable navigation
equipment and aids what did Captain Wallace say?
A Moderately strong ponnt performs well
Q Okay Was this the first time you were rated as a third
mate?
AYes
Q Let s go to the next one which covers the period of June
19th 1987 to August 19th 1987 You have t" This is Captain
Wallace grading you again?
${ }^{1201} \wedge$ Yes

- QOkav Again he eave soli the highovi mark under the

Lalcgory willing nusstis assuma additional responsibililics
huvond nermal job requirements is that sorrect?

## AYes

Q And he also gave you the highest mark under carries out

## Vol 162420

thoroughly the commitmintsand dultu ol position with
attention to nulessary dutats?
A Yes
Q And under the callgory is always in fit condition alert
and vigulant on watch again he gave you the highest mark?
A Yes
Q And he gave you the highest mark on maintains a high level
of safely awareness te cargo work emergency drills?
A Yes
Q And now this tume he had an opporiunty to observe you with
respect to - or at least he rated you with reapect to the
Lategary of acts quichiv and cffictively in imerguncics or
pressure situations What did Captain Wallace grade you on that?
A Strong point
Q Okay And again with respect to navigates in an accurate
reliable manner making optimum use of all available navigation
equipment and atds Captain Wallace said that it 8 a moderately
strong points performs very well?
A Correct
Q Second highest category am I correct?
A Correct
Q All right Can we go to the performance evaluation that 4) Captain Hazelwood gave you during the period of December Ilth
(.5) 1987 and January 12th 19887

## Vol 16 2421

HAYes
(r) Q The form changed a little bit now did it not?
(3) AYes
(4) Q Okay With respect to the category is always in lit
(s) condition alert and vigilant on watch and on board what did
(6) Capran Hazelwood give you?
(7) A I don't know what line you're on
(8) Q lt s the third line down
(9) A Yes
(10) Q You have It $^{7}$ Captain Ha<eiwood gave you gencrally exceeds
(II) requirements am I correct' No sorry'
(12) A No, there's two Xs there majur - oh job profile
(13) major - and I can't read my copy
(14) Q Okay Well let me read you what I have here There are
(15) two different categories There sa check with respect to job
(16) profile and ays it a a major which Itake it as a major part
(17) of your - of your job am I correct?
(18) AYes
(19) Q And as far as the category as faras Captain Hazelwoods
(20) evaluation be says here generally exceeds requirements am I
(21) correct?
1..) AYes

123, Q Okay Going down you sucaboul this lar down lo the
1 4) bategory of setks advite or guidante al the appropriaic lime
1 S and intorms supurvinors when appripriale that , alno a major

## Vol 16 242?

part of your job?
AYes
Q And Captan Hacelwoud gave you an exclptional rating for (1)

A Yes
Q And with respeci to the navigalus portion that sthe duch
officer sportion a litlle bil turthur down'
A Yes
Q li says navigatcs in an accurate ruliable mannur mahing
opumum use of all avalable navigational cquipmunt and aids
that galso a major part ol your job?
A Yes
Q And Captain Hacliwood gave you an cxceplional on that as weil?
A Yes
(16) Q Did you have any discussiony with uthur Captain Wallact or
(17) Capiain Hacclwood about your navizalion ahililicx)
(18) A With Captain Wallace
(19) $Q$ What did Capiain Wallace Lull you about your ability (o) (20) navigatぃ)
( I) AIdun't recall the couversation specifically iquestooned (2) the captan on his evaluation of my abilataes as a uavigator
(23) asked him if he saw any major problems with my routane my ) abality to evaluate information Generally that wis the s) context of the coaversation

5-24-94


XMAX(13)

Vol $16 \quad \begin{array}{lll}16 & 2423\end{array}$
(I) Q Did you receive a generally tavorable reply'
() AAs I recall yes

Q As of March 23 rd 1989 were you confident in vour
abilities to navigate in an accurate reliable manner?
AYes
Q And in making optimum use of all available navigation
equipment and aids?
AYes
Q As an officer aboard the Exxon Valdez had you had occasion
U日) to observe the maneuvering characteristics of the vessel under
(1u) vanous speeds and loads?
(1) A By maneuvening characternstics you mean what?
(13) Q Well for instance -
(14) A Was I ever up there when we made a course change or -
(15) Q Yes right
(16) AYes
(17) Q So you had a chance to observe the - how the vessel
(18) handled when course change was made using a certain amount
of
(19) rudder"

A Correct
Q Have you had occasion to observe how the vessel handled
using ten degrees of rudder?
A Probably
Q Have vou had ollasion to observe how the vessel reacted
and
(2S) handled using ten degrees of rudder with almost a full load?
A Probably 162424
Q Did you ever see anyone from management come aboard?
A Frequently Yes
Q Who?
A I forget the fellow's name He was the ship group
coordinator, Paul something or other One of those guys
me office It's routune for them to come on board the
the vessels
(8) when we make a port call in the $L A$ or San francisco area
(9) Q You said in answer to Mr Noltings question that you were
(10) confused about the piotage regulations up there in March of
(11) 19897

II_ A Yes
(13) Q Had you ever seen a letter from Alamar agencies to -
(14) addressed to various steamship companies?
(1s) A Yes I recall
(16) Q Or addressud to whom it may concern dated September

19ih
1171 19867
A I recall having seen that letter yes
((y) Q Ohay Lut me pul the lellerin front of you i put before (30) you the letter dated September 19th 1986 from Alaska Maritime
(-1) Agencies to whom it may concern?
(2.) AYes
(23) Q Had you read this letter prior to March 23rd 19897
(4) A Yes
(3) Q Were you awar prior to that date that ther were

## Vol 162425

proposals made by the Coast Guard to change the pilotage regulations in Prince William Sound?

## A Yes

Q And did you understand that they wanted to waive pilotage from Rocky Point down to Cape Hinchinbrood?
A Well I probably did at the tıme ves
Q When you received this letter - when you read this letter
did you have any understanding as to whether this letter was
advising its recipients that the pilotage requirements had been waived?
A That was my understanding of the - the letter
Q When you took the con of the vessel after Captain
Hazelwood
left the bridge ןust north of Busby?
A Yes
Q And south of Rocky Point?
A Yes
Q Did you belteve that you were qualified to con the vessel
in those waters without a pilotage endorsement?
A Yes
Q On the night of the grounding when you had Kagan up there
(1) and we ll get to the details later but just on Kagan did it
(n) concern you at all that Kagan is not your regular helmaman when

Captain Hazelwood lefi you with the con?
( 4) A No it did not
( $\boldsymbol{\text { ( } ) ~ Q ~ L e t ~ s t a l k ~ a b o u t ~ y o u r ~ w o r k d a y ~ y o u r ~ n o r m a l ~ w o r k d a y ~ a s ~ y o u ~}$

```
                    Vol 16 2426
look back on It Asan officer when you were at sea can
you - can you take me through a workday what it was like?
A For the Valdez' I had different watches on different
ships so the - the watch schedule on the Valdez was a Litle
bit easier forme just because the - the enght to twelve is a
nice tume to be up and working
Q And the 20 to 24 in the evening?
A Yes
Q And on the other ships you have what watches?
A Twelve to four
Q You had the mid watch huh?
A It's a msserable watch, yeah
Q You were on - you were on a total of five ships I think
you gave us including the North Slope?
A Yes
Q So the other four ships you had the midnight to four in
the morning and - I m sorry let s see the noon to four in
the afternoon is that correct?
A Yes but I'm trying to recall what watches I had on the
Exxon Charleston I believe that was the - the eaght to
twelve
    Q On the Charleston?
    A On the Charleston It's - it had been a custom to sall
    third mates on the eight to twelve because those are what
(25) would call normal working hours the captann is up, the chief
```

we

Vol 162427
(1) mate is usually up and third mates usually are the ones with
') the least experience so if there are problems he needs the
iv) captain captain doesn't have to be woken up
(d) $Q$ And that a - that requirement vou just satd is not fust
(s) Exxon , is il as far as vou know' That spretty standard
throughnut the marilimi world in the United States that third
matware given the ught to twelve wath?
ANo
Q Thl other companies you sailed with you have had different
watches?
(1I) A Yes
(t) Q This is on the 23 rd of March?
(13) A Right
(14) Q If you add up these roughly four four and a half hours you
(1s) were off we re adding another half hour on for your nap
(16) period would you say that sabout right ten of eight in the
(17) morning up unti! 1900 I m talking about would that be
(18) approximately correct' Is it approximately correct four to
(19) four and a half hours?
(v) A Well you know I sat down and added up the times and I
( i) came up with a bit more rest so I - I don't - I wouldn't say
(-) that' just right no
(2) $Q$ Well do you want to add up the times sir take a sheet of (r) paper and show me how you re adding up the time up to - from (.S) ten of eight in the morning take a sheet of paper and you do

|  | Vol 16 2428 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | your nwn calculations with terything you have in front of |
|  | you? |
| (3) | A This is bow I do it |
| (a) | Q Now can voutell us what this means? |
| (s) | A From - from noontime iwelve 0 clock until 1700 I am off |
|  | duty off work That's my free tume From 1745 after I |
|  | finshed my meal untul I was called out that's my personal |
|  | thme that's my - my rest time I was not required or |
| 191 | requested to do anything else That's my rest penod How I |
| 101 | rest is how I rest |
|  | Q Okay Now Mr Cousins you-1 don twant to belabor |
|  | this whoie point I want io just ash you one other thing This |
|  | is your interpretation of your free time? |
| (14) | A Correct |
| (19) | Q It s correct that during this period of time is it not |
|  | that you ve testified that you had this 1200 to- |
|  | A 17 |
| (18) | Q - 1700 that you took a salinity test is that correct? |
| (19) | A That's correct |
| (20) | Q The first thing I would like to ask you about is you |
|  | remember the lattle yellow piece of paper that you wrote on |
|  | which is Exhibit 487877 |
|  | A Yes |
|  | Q That is your description of the lime that you were olf duty |
|  | on the day of the 23 rd correct? |

'1 you'
() A This is bow I do it
(s) A From - from noontume twelve o clock until 1700 I am off (6) duty off work That's my free tume From 1745 after I
(7) finushed my meal untul I was called out that's my personal
(8) time that's my - my rest thme I was not required or
(9) requested to do anything else That's my rest penod How I
(10) rest is how I rest

123 this whoic poin I want 10 just ast you one nther thing This
(1) is your interpretation of your free lime?
(14) A Correct
(19) Q It s correct that during this period of time is it not

1161 that you ve testified thal you had this 1200 to -
(18) $Q-1700$ that you took a salinity test is that correct?
(19) A That's correct
(20) Q The first thing I would like to ask you about is you
(21) remember the latile yellow piece of paper that you wrote on
(22) which is Exhibit 487877
(23) A Yes
(9) on the day of the 23 rd Lorrect?
(1) A Yes sar
(-) $Q$ And 1 beleve on there you satd you were olf duty trom 12
(3) to $1700^{\circ}$
(4) A Yes
(s) $Q$ Which is from noon to live o slock $p \mathrm{~m}$ ?
(6) A Right
(7) Q And in fact I belteve you testified at one point that you
(8) had gotten off probably about ten minutes till 12?
(9) A Yes
(10) MR SANDERS Now the next part of the testimony goes
(11) to the ume Mr Cousins is on the bridge butore gulung
(12) underway
(13) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(id) Q And I want to hnow al that point in time had you made any
(1s) arrangement with LeCain that you were going to let him sleep
(16) in?
(17) A No
(18) Q So as far as you re concerned th was going to be a normal
(19) watch change?
(20) A Yes
(2!) Q Did you see Chief Mate Kunkel come to the bridge?
(22) A Yes, he relreved me
(23) Q Did you hear Chief Mate Kunhcl and Caplain Hazelwood having
(-4) a discubsion controngy Caplain Haclwood agraing to take
is Chiel Malc Kunhul s morning walth'

Vol $16 \quad 2430$
A No I was not - party to that
QI was just tocusing on that point tahing il as a lact that
there s been testımony by Chici Matc Kunkul that Captain
Hacelwood told himhc would - that hu Captain Haselwood
would tahc Kunht, wath would that he normal'
A it would be kind I don $t$ know that it varmal no
Q Well bucausc of the long hourvithat Chicl Malc Kunhal works in port what I $m$ asking for some arrangemınt for this to have been made is that normal have you secn that done before?
(10) A Some captans would be kind enough to do that Most
(11) captans would not
(12) MR SANDERS Your Honor this next part is - goes to
(13) the subject of Caplain Ha<clwood $s$ condition un the bridge just
(14) before the Valdef got undurway the nisht of March 23 rd
(1s) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(10) Q Did you observe any staggering'
117. A No
(18) Q Did you beliuve Caplain Hactwood wa, impaired ur
(19) intoxicaled in anv way'
(b) A No

111 Q Now he lett belore vou want throuzh the Narrows and do you know whuther he said anything to the pilol about his ; 7 leaving the bridgb'
(24) A I recall some conversation with the - with the pilot yes
(-) Q Are you aware - pardon me arc you linishod?
(1) A I don't know what context of the conversation was but that
(r) he - there was mention that he was leaving When he announced
(3) that he was leaving, it was loud enough spoken loud enough
(4) where the plot as well as myself could hear
(5) Q Do you recall when you came bach you said that Captan
(6) Hazelwood was on the bridge the chief mate was there the
pulot was there and the heimsman was there as well?
A Correct
Q Okay Do you remember when Captain Hazelwood left after
21517
A I couldn't give you a specific tume Somewhere in the
transit of the arm before the Narrows, that's all I can -
specific as I can be
Q Okay In your testimony you - in your trial testimony
you said approximately 10 to 15 minutes thereafter Does
that -
A Okay
Q - jibe with what you just said?
A Probably, yes
Q Okay After Captain Hazelwood left what were you doing specifically?
( -) A Monitoring the vessel progress taking any engine orders
(_3) that may have been given and observing the acuons of the
-4) helmsman in regards to commands and steering
( s) Q Whri you standing in one particular spot while you were

## Vol 162432

doing this?
A Yes
Q Wherc were you standing?
A By the ten centumeter radar
Q And whr you facing forward at that point?
AYes
Q If someone were to come up into the chart room for
instance unless you knew he was there you wouldn t -
A No
Q - necessanly look back to see if they were there?
A No correct
Q Now do you remember what tume Captan Hazelwood came back
(13) to the bridge?
(14) A I do not recall a tame no
(15) Q You mentioned in your trial testimony that it was - that
(16) the pilut had told you to call him as you were approaching
(17) Potato Point?

1181 A Yes
(19) Q Do you recall that?
(n) AYev Ile didn't tell metocall him As I-as I recall
(?) at he - his words were to the effect that we ought to get the
( -) captam back up here pretty soon
(23) Q Was that as you wert approaching Potato Point?
(24) AYes
(2s) Q What lime according to the bull book did you-did you

> get to Potato Point?

A 2253 Potato Point abeam
Q Is it your recollection that the captain was back on the bridge by the time you - you got io Potato Point?
A I'm not sure It was shortly after I called him the second tume
Q You testified that you received - you made the call to the captain?
A Right
Q Sorry I stand corrected You called the captain and told
him that you were in the Narrows is that correct?
AYes
Q And what did the captan say to you?
A He - he asked me if there was any inbound traffic was I
having any problems everything look okay that he he'd be
up
(161 on the bridge shortly
(17) Q And the captain had previously told you he had in go down
(18) because of some problem or he indicated that the chief

## ingineer

(19) was having some problem?
(0) A Correct
( I) Q And how did vou answer the captain s questions?
( ) A The phone - on the phone -
(3) Q Yes
( 4 ) A-I told him that we had the escort tug everything was
(s) proceeding along pretty smoothly we'd reduced speed no

## Vol 162434

```
traffic that's it
    Q And no problems?
    A No problems
    Q Was the passage through the Narrows a routine passage?
    A Yes
    Q No problems at all?
    A No probiems
    UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER This is on what date'
    VIDEO EXAMINER This is on the 23rd going out
    UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER Outbound passage
    BY VIDEO EXAMINER
    Q The outbound passage yes that s the one I mreterring to
Mr Cousins
A Yes
Q You understood that?
AYes
Q I d like to focus now on the period of tume after you came
back to the bridge after you had dropped off the pilot Are
you with me?
A Um-hum
Q Okay When you came back to the bridge what did you do?
A Well, it was a better recollection that I could get at
reading my previous testımony I - you want me to just
generalize today?
(25) Q Well -
```

Vol $16 \quad 2435$
(1) A I approached the radar ohserved what I determined to be

1: ice There was a few words exchanged with the captan as I
recall Hewas standing over the console I don't know the
chronoings of this is -
Q Idon I want to make this a memory test I must trying to
put evervbody in the -
A I was familianzing myself with the position of the vessel
the targets that were on radar that sort of thing
Q Okay Do you have a recollection of about what time you
(10) got back do the bridge?
(ll) A Notreally I'd have to look at past testumony
(12) Q All right Let me see if I canhelp you While I m
(13) looking for that let me ask you this at which radar did you
(14) go to when you observed the radar?
(1s) A Ten centımeter
(16) Q That sover on the starhoard sidu)
(17) A Yes
(18) Q Whbru was the captain?
(19) A When I first re entered the wheelhouse -
ror QYcs
( I) A-from dropping the pilot off? I believe he was at the
(r-) console badge console I m not absolutely positive He may
(23) have been in front of the console
(24) Q Did there come a time when the caplain came over and stood (25) next to you?

|  | Vol 162436 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) | A Yes |
| (2) | Q Did that occur shortly after you got back to the bridge? |
| (3) | A Some minutes later yes |
| (4) | Q When you say some minutes later do you - |
| (9) | A I had plotted a position |
| (6) | Q You did? |
| (7) | A Yes |
| (x) | Q Which posilion did vou plot hiv then? |
| (4) | A I guess it - what was it the $\mathbf{2 3 3 9}$ or something like that |
| 1101 | Q Okay May we have the original chart Mr Blank? |
|  | Mr Cousins I mputing in front of you - what s the |
| 11 | Exhibil Number) |
| (19) | UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER On the back blue lag nght |
| (14) | there |
| (19) | BY VIDEO EXAMINER |
| (16) | Q Can you tell? |
| (17) | A 1614 |
| (18) | Q Now 1614 which is the original chart off the Exxon Valdez |
| (19) | and you mentioned that you land the 2339 fix which is on here? |
| (20) | A Yes |
| (21) | Q Okay So in terms of the time that we retalking does |
|  | this refresh your recollection that at least you were on the |
|  | bridge hefore 2339 ? |
| 141 | AYes |
| -91 | Q Okay And you told us yesterday how you obtained that fix |

you said you took a range and a bearing?
AYes
Q Was that off this buoy right here?
A It was a visual bearing I believe that I mav bave taken
a - a radar beanng and range
Q Also?
AYes
Q I m sorry and what did you use tor that?
A I don't - thas looks lake a range off of thas Rocky Point Inght here
Q Okay It also looks to me like you may have taken a . bearing off Bugby Island light?
AYes
Q Does that look to you -
A Yes sar
Q Okay So at thia point you knew the position of the
vesuel?
AYes
Q Okay After you took this 2339 bearing is that when
Captain Hazelwood tame over to the radar scope with you? AYes
Q Both of you were standing over at the len centimelur radar?
AYes
Q Close to each othur?
A Just about shoulder to shoulder ves
i) at the radar two separate meetings is that correct?

AYes
Q Was this the first meeting that you had?
A I beheve it was
Q Tell me what you and Captain Hazelwood discussed at that meeting the first meeting
A He explaned to me what he had intended as far as the deviation out of the traffic scheme to avord the sce That
was
9) the first that he spoke of coming abeam Busby Island and
then
(10) begu the turn back into the lanes

Q Okay He told you that was his intention?
A Yes
Q At this point were you able to sec any of the ice on the
radar?
A Yes
Q Did you see it in the form that you drew on Exhibit 48785 at that point?
A No, that was a bit later The targets that we had
identafied as ice, the radar was picking up the chunks of sce that were to the north and not all of the - not -
Q Ohay - don I get anything - can wh have a blue marker or red one red one seven better
Would you mind marking on Exhibit 48785 in red pen what you
observed during your first conterence at the radar -
A At -

## Vol 16 2438

Q Okay Now did you - vou disuusvud with Caplain Hazeiwood
) this ice condition was he in agreement with you as to where you saw the ice? You say you discussed with him when he was lurning the con over the situation with the ice?
Aldon't - I can't really answer that question Ile - he saw the ice The conversation as I recall it was that this 15 - if we're going to avoid the ice we're going to be out of the scheme altogether and he sand veuh we'll - we'll just start bnaging it back when we get down abeam Busby and swing
(10) It back into the lanes
 , wherc you whre to mahe the lurn' You vald vou dyoldown around
abcam ol Busby)
A Get abeam of Busby Abeam of Buaby alter course to get back to the traffic lanes
Q Yes What I masking you he said abeam ol Busby he used
that general term what was your guncral undurstanding that he
meant Busby is an istand?
A Yes Busby Island IIght
Q You say whan he lefi ha said ha was only going to go for a
fuw minutes he usud the word itwur minules'
AYes
Q You actually usid that ixprussion didn I you?
AYes
1 91 Q Now I bulicve your lustimun) in thal vou hadiwu inculings

## Vol 162440

I Q - with respect to the ILt?
(2) A Okay Fairly large targets like this standing down into
(3) here, down anto the southern lane, something like that Rught
(4) here
5) Q Okay Would you just - all right Would you initial in
6) the area that you made those?
7) A (Witness complies)

QOkay Good
UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER I think we should either hold
that up to the camera or let the record show that he put on
numerous red circles
, VIDEO EXAMINER Let the record show do you see that' Y ah that the witness put a series of red circles representing the ice -
MR SANDERS Your Honor we apologize We thought we
had a blowup of that over here with the red eircies and we
didn $t$ We 11 just have to show il a little bit later and I
apologize 1 know you can $t$ see $t$ on thu streen
VIDEO EXAMINER - that they observed the first time
that they stood at the radar okay
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Now you satd there was a second meeting at the radar
Whin did that occur in rulation to the first muting?
A Minutes later I returned to the chart room I don't know
if there was - if I actually put a fix down I had taken some
ranges to determine exactly how far the ice was across the lanes if it was in fact across all of the lanes or whether we really needed to go out of the lanes to give me a better idea as to what the captain was talking about I just - I hadn't been on the brndge that long So I returned to the chart room
briefly, picked off some distances that I had gotten from the
radar went back to the radar and II belneve that's when
Captan Hazelwood and I spoke agan He was standing on
forward side of the radar That's when I sand it looks like we're going to be - the ice is all across both of the lanes and that we're going all the way out of the lanes He sand yeah that's the point we have to go out of the lanes to get around the ice
Q Okay You had made a determination bv taking hearings and
(5) ranges?

A Ranges yeah
Q Oh sorry ranges that in fact the ice that you observed on the radar extended across both lanes inbound and the outbound?
A Yes Yes
Q And in terms of when Captain Hazelwood ieft can you place the time that the second meeting took place?
A Terms of when be left?
Q Yes
A It was shortly before he left

II sad he agreed ind be reiterated his instructions and he said
how do you feel about that and I sard that's the best that we
(3) can do nght now
(4) Q Okay Let s slow down here a second The instructions
(s) that he reiterated were that he wanted you to come to Busby and
(6) then start easing her back into the lanes?
(7) A He said come back to - when we get abeam Busby Island
you
(8) have to - you'll have to start briaging the vessel back
towards the lanes
(10) Q Ohay Did vou know he the sotind mating what course vou
"II, wLrestcuring'
11, A I did at the time I don t now But I - we were on 180
3) as I recall
(14) Q Did vou concur with the course of 180 to accomplish the
(15) maneuver that you wanted to alcomplish?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q As a matter of fact 180 is a tardinal course is it not?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q It s on the cardinal point?
(30) AYes
(I) $Q$ Which makis it wasice to figure out vour bearings?
(r) A Yes
( ) Q When you want to tahc a bcaring'
(i) A Certanaly beam beanngs yeah very easy
(25) $Q$ When Captain Harclwond told you the entire plan which is

## Vol 162444

(I) to come down abeam of Busby and then turn back into the
lanes
(2) in order to avoid the ice did you concur with that plan?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q Did vou in faci ful comiortahle with it?
(9) A Yes
(k) $Q$ When vou loonced at the radar you could aet - you could
(7) see Busby Island lughi)
(8) A Yes
(9) $Q$ Could you kc il visually al that point'
(10) A Yes
(III Q You could see Bligh Reef light on the radar?
(12) A On the radar, yes
(13) Q You could see the ice as you told us about?
(14) A I could - I observed targets of the ice I never visually
(IS) saw the ice untal after the grounding
(16) Q Okay You could - were you able to make out the land
(17) presentation of - of Rocky Point the Tatithik Narrows Bligh
(18) Island?
(19) AYes
(20) Q Did you understand the orders and the discuasion that you (') had with Captain Harclwood as to what he wanted you to do?
(22) A Yes
(23) $Q$ What I wanted to ask you was that when you onginally
(24) heard from Captain Hazelwood what his plan was for departing
(25) the lanes and skirting the ice he told - or he asked you or
(1) told you to take a fix is that correct?

A Correct
Q And in the course of preparing yourself though for the
plan itself you went and did some other things didn : you?
AYes
Q And he didn 1 tell you to do that did he?
A No
Q But one of the other things included attimpling a visual stghung of the ice?
AYes
Q You even tried to ust binoculars lo do that didn ( you); AYes
Q And you also looked at the radar to try to determint how much room there was to maneuver?

## AYes

Q Those kind of things?
A Yes
Q Got some ranges on how far the see was from the reef and
how far il was from you and those kinds of things?
A Correct
Q And the purpose of all that was what?
A To ascertan whether the maneuver was goung to be
successful or if there was ans dunger that we weren tgong
to
1 4) be able to safely pass between the reel and the ice
s) $Q$ When you had your sucund convcradion wall dilur vou had

## Vol 162446

(I) tompleted your work to prapari vou to - lo give input to the (1 caplam?
(3) AYes
(d) Q Youknew that the plan called lir the Valde/liguloutside (s) the Iraffic scparation stheme corrabl'
(o) A Yes after - well not - not until after I had completed
(7) my attempts at positioniag the ice in relation to the reef
(8) after the mitual mstructions by the captain You could be
(9) abeam you can be abeam Busby Island and still be in the
(10) lanes Once I went back anto the chart room with the
"II) mformation that I'd gathered that's - that's when I
(I-) recognized the - where the track line was going to take us in
1131 relation to everything else
(14) $Q$ And this is before you had your stoond conversation with
"Is, him though?
(10) A That's correct
(1) Q So at that point you Ancw you whre forng oulside the
(18) lanes?
(19) AYes
(30) $Q$ And indeed that s one thing you said to him when you had
(Pl) the second conversation wh re going to be outside the lanus)
(12) A Yes
(3) $Q$ And indeed when you tooh your tix at 2250-2355 that
(-4) was in tact outside the lancs wasn 1 Il?
(-1) A Yes

Vol $16 \quad 2447$

Q So you didn thave anv problem during this pe
knowing where you were in relation to the lanes,
A Correct
Q Now at the ume of the last two conversations with Captain
Hazelwood before he left the bridge did you know what the
speed of the vessel was? Approximately?
A I knew the approximate speed ves
Q All right At what point did you know that it was in load program up? Was it between the two conversations or before both of them or - the two that I m now talking about the last two before he left the bridge if you know?
A I knew at the ume I don't know now
Q Okay All right And load program up calls for the engine
to be increased gradually over a period of tume?

## A Correct

Q And that period of time is how much?
A Between 40, 42 to 48 minutes in that ume frame
Q And in that time range approximately what knots to what knots does that encompass approximately?
A I really don't recall what the maneuvenng speeds of the
Valdez were I beheve full maneuvering may have been 11 knots It could have been more Our top designed speed I believe was 16 I'm not real clear on that
Q Okay Well lets -using those numbers then your understanding as you now recall it was that the load program

## Vol 162448

would take the vessel from a speed of around II knots?
A Correct
Q To 16 knots in a period of 40 some minutes?
$\Lambda$ Yes
Q Does that do that on a straight line or is it more at the
buginning or more al the end or can you - can you recall
that? Where do you gel more of the increase in speed?
A I don't recall It is not a-a lnear increase as I
recall That there is a critical range where the rpm may be
slowed or advanced in rate but I-1 really don't recall the I) specifics
(12) Q Did you have when you - at what - at that time that you
(17) learned that the vissel was going to be in load program up and
(1a) knowing approximately what your speed was at that time did you
(19) think that the speed at which vou were going to do this
(is) maneuver was appropriat or imprudent or prudent?
(17) A If you asked me that question that evening, I would have
(18) responded that I took the - the increase in speed to
(19) facilitate maneuvenng
(20) Q And did you think that was a good idea that was an
(21) appropriate plan a prudent thing to do?
(22) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER Al that ume that night or -
(י) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(ra) $Q$ Al that - that night
t-s) A $I$ would have reserved that judgment to the captan He was

Vol $16 \quad 2449$
certanly a more skilled navigator and ship handler with the vessel knew the vessel charactenstics more - in more detal
3) than I did I did not question the increase in speed

Q Stated another way you didn think it was imprudent at
the time he told vou what you were going to do and knowing what
you were going to do?
A Um hum
Q Is that correct?
A Correct
Q ls one effect of increasing the speed to tighten the radius of the circle for the turn?
A Correct
Q I d like to ask you about Captain Hazelwood s management style How would vou describe it?
A Captaın Hazelwood was a very relaxed easy individual to work for I did not know him well We didn't have manv conversations The-in the professional vein I had met only
(1B) two other individuals that could explan and define situations
(19) and/or questions as thoroughly as - as be did I mean if ( 0 ) if encountered a problem or encountered something that was
' 11 unusual that we had not expernenced or that I had not
( -1 expenenced he is the type of individual that was willing to

1) share his knowledge and the manner in which he shared his
(14) knowledge was on a level that you don't often find
(.) Q When you stood at the radar with Captain Hazelwood those

## Vol 162450

both times did you feel that he was asking you for input as to the maneuver that was being proposed?
A I don't know if he was asking but I was giving it to hum Q You were?
A It's expected That's part of my job That's why I'm there
Q If you felt uncomfortable with the situation and toid
Captain Hazelwood vou were uncomfortable do vou helieve he would have stayed on the bridge?

## AYes

QId like to talk to you -
A He mumated that if I had not felt comfortable that be would undeed reman
Q He told you that?
A In a sense not those direct words but he said if I
minded In other words of I-IfI did mind that he left
the bridge, he would have stayed
(18) MR SANDERS Your Honor Ithink that sagood point

191 to have the break If that sall right
(20) THE COURT Thank you We Il take our firat receas
(1) ladies and gentlemen
( 1 ) We II reconvene in 15 minutes please
(3) THE CLERK This court is in recess for 15 minutes
(4) (Jury out at 1000 am )
(25) (Jury in at $10 \quad 17 \mathrm{am}$ )
THECLERK All rise
MR SANDERS Mavil plase the Courl before we start
anew I have-I haven I somehodv heller than I am has
rutrieved the exhibil that Iam responsible for having overhere and thm心 the sxhibul with the - the red dots or thered urblus that whre drawn on the chart
Lat me turn it a litilu hit so Your Honor can see it
THE COURT 1 don inced to sec il They need to see11MR SANDERS Thuse are the tirclus that Mr Cousins
drcwattie poini where Mr Chalos was asking him to draw in
red on the original chart and this is obviously a blowup of
that chart and these are the circles that were filled in in
red so they $d$ be easier to see representing the ice he saw at
IIS, the radar at that point
(101 Thank you Your Honor and again I apologize
[17, BY VIDEO E\AMINER
(18) Q Let stalk a little bit about the vessal being on autopilot (19) in this particular struation
(ro) AYes
( I) Q Do you hnow at what time the automatic pilot was put on?
( 21 ) A No 1 do not
(23) $Q$ Do you have a general knowledge of when it was put on?
(94) A When the ship was steadied up on 180
i si Q I think there was bome testimony that that was around 2345

## Vol 162452

(1) or 30?
(1) A Okay
(1) $Q$ When you took the vessel off the gyro when vou pushed the
(4) gyro button how soon after Captain Hazelwood left the bridge
(s) did you do that?
(6) A I don't thank that he was - he wasn't visible be was
(7) walking out As he was leaving I was approaching the steering
(8) console telling the helmsman that we were putting in hand
(9) steering
(10) Q Would you savit swithin five un seconds after he
"II started to walk awav'
(1.) AYes
(13) Q Okay Mr Cousina sutting here today did the fact that
(14) the vessel was on gyro for a period of time approximately
(1s) eight to ten minutes did that have anything to do with the
(10) grounding of this vessel?
(17) A No
(18) Q Okay Now you testified that you took your 2355 fix by
(19) doing the things that you aiready told us about Now is it
(20) your belief that had the maneuver the ten degrees right
(?) rudder been used at the time you gave the order which was
(r) about a minute or two after you tooh the fix is $1 t$ your belief
(3) that the vessel would have cleared Bligh Recf comfortably?
(i) A Yes
is) Q is - under the circumstances did you believe going around

Vol 16 2453

1) the ice was a prudent move to make? As opposed to going through the ice?
AYes
Q Is - based on your experience is a command to turn the
wheel ten degrees night is that a fairly simple command?
A Yes it is
Q Is it a farriy simple order to warry out'
A Yes it is
Q Now when you gave the order to the hulmsman did you lual comfortable with the situation al that point'
A Yes
Q Did you also feel at that tume that it -
A Perhaps rephrase that instead of comfortable, maybe confident
Q I Il accept that Did you fect confideni?
A I don't know that - the comfort thing, came out of - out
of Captan Hazelwood's, that's language he used I would have
(18) to say that I felt confident, not so - 1 don't know if I've (9) ever been comfortable
(8) Q All right Did you also feel that if you were unconfident
2) that you could call Captain Hazelwood and tell him you felt
3) unconfident?

A Sure
14) Q And vou hlit that he whuld ruturn to the bridet di that ( ${ }^{\prime}$ poin!)

## Vol $16 \quad 2454$

AYes
Q When Captain Harclwood lull the hridge dad volu - did you
have any doubt as to where the vassal was'
$A$ No
QOhay Id like lo ash vou now ahoul the lamous 38 fathom mark
AYes
Q Did Captain Hactlwood tull you to start your turn at the 38 fathom mark?
A No
Q Did you tell Delozier that you staried your turn at the 38
fathom mark?
A No
Q In your experience have you ever received an order to make
a course change at a - it a tathom marh'
A Nu
Q You muntioned that when vou cainc bach and laid down the
2355 lix as you ware walhing bach lo zive the ardur to the
holmsman Mauracn lonca tame in and ruportcda lightin you'
AYes
Q And at that time she reporied it with the wrong
characteristics am icorreut the first time?
A I doa't know what tune it was
(Q Bui you hncw whal lighi shi was rulcrring is)
AYes

_- _- maxi:
(1) Q Because vou had seen it before?
() A Yes, I expected it and I visually observed the Inght
(3) Q You saw it with your own eye?
(4) AYes
(s) Q And what light was that?
(6) A Bligh Reef Light
(7) Q So you knew where that light was in relation to your vessel
(8) at that time?
(9) AYes
(10) $Q$ So when she came back the second time and corrected it you
(11) knew what she was talking about again?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q Did you expect that light at that point in tume to be on
(14) your starboard bow?
(15) A Yes
(16) Q Was it where you expected it to be?
(17) AYes
(18) Q All right Now you mentioned that you got on the phone
(19) with Captain Hazelwood?
(20) A Yes
(1) Q And you told hum that - well strike that Can you tell
(22) me what he said to you and what you gatd to ham?
(73) A Whach tume'
( 4) Q This is the first time right after the 2355 fix and after
( 9 , you had given the order tor ten degrees right rudder?

## Vol 162456

(1) A l couldn't give you verbatum but the general context of i) the conversation, I informed him that him being Mister - or (ง) Captan Hazelwood that we were beginning our turn back towards
(4) the lane that I had seen more targets that I identinied as ice (5) further across actually out of the - the easternmost boundary
(6) of the northbound lane and that perhaps we might - we might
(7) audge a prece of ice or two, and he said - he queried me as to
(8) whether I thought that we were going to be okay I sand well,
(9) we're going to be okay I don't know how large these chunks of
(10) ice are You cannot tell by the return alone It's very
(II) unrelsable to try to judge the size of an object especially
(I) ice by the -
(13) Q This is what you were telling Captain Hazelwood or is this
(1d) what you re telling us?
(IS) A No this is what I'm telling you I'm explaning but he
(16) understood that
(17) Q Okay
(18) A But I explaned to him that there was more ice than I had
( 14 ) seen earher
(1) Q Okay
(21) A And that's the reason that - that I thought that we might
(י2) get into a little bit of ace
(23) Q Did he ask you at that point if you thought it would be any
(-4) problum?
(2s) A Yes
il Q And what did vou tell him?
A I sard that well we might nudge a prece of ice or two And he said okay do you think that's going to be a problem ' I
4) said well I don't know I don't think that it is But at that pont it didn't really make any difference whether the ice was going to be a problem If it was going to be a problem it just bad to be a problem
Q Were you still confident at that pornt that you would be able to carry out your maneuver?
A At that point I thought we were - we were carrying out the maneuver
Q Okay Were you confident that you would be abie to get around the ice and into the lanes with no problems?
A Other than what I Just stated that we - that I expressed
to Captain Hazelwood that we might - we might actually
encounter a chunk or two
Q When you were telling Captain Hazelwood what you just told him was there any anxiousness in your voice?
A No
Q You were calm about it?
AYes
Q I m not quite sure but at what point in time did you first become concerned that things weren t going as you - you had planned?
A Shortly after the telephone conversation

## Vol 16 2458

Q That s when you went over to the radar and you saw the the heading flasher and the heading weren t changing?
A Correct
Q Did you at that point consider calling Captain Hazelwood to come back to the bridge?
A I don't know that I thought about it I - as I recall I was concerned with trying to - to figure out the source of my
8) anxsety and that being where is - where are wein relation to the reef and I - the chronology is not correct it's - but at some tume in this - within this time after the conversation, I stepped out onto the bridge make another real
(12) quick check turned to the radar I believe that's when I
3) finally looked at the rudder angle indicator indicated a number of degrees less than - the ten nght Gave the ten nght, and after that I'm not sure of my movement I suspect - I really belseve that that is when I returned to the chart room
Q For a second tume? Or a third tume?
A I cannot - I cannot be absolutely beyond a doubt positive about that but I-I strongly suspect that I did
Q How much tume elapsed between that of the - I know you $r_{4}$ not going to be able to tell me but I have to ask the question between that - that event that you just described and the second call to Captain Hazelwood? A I don't know Probably a minute or two I really don't
know Mavbe perbaps less than two minutes no longer than
: that
(3) Ohav Did I understand you correctlv that when you were on
the phone with Captain Hactwood vou tett the first folt of the
running aground)
A In the second conversation )
Q Yしs
A While we were still on the phone"
QYes
A Yes
Q And did Caplain Hazelwood come up immediately?
A He didn't feel it It wasn't - I don't thank anyone else did feel it
Q But yourself?
A Well I think the people on the bridge did
Q Did voulcll him to come up right awav? Or did he jusi do that on his own'
A He just did that on has own I told ham that we're in
serious trouble and the question was what's - what's
wrong
(20) and I sand we're about to go aground And he saad well what
( 1 ) did you do with the rudder where's the rudder at" And I said
(12) it's at - it's hard nght, and I looked up, we skapped a
(23) rudder order in here and it was still at 20 degrees night
(24) Q You had previously given a 20 degrees right?
(1) AYes

## Vol $16 \quad 2460$



```
    A Yes
    Q Did you in fact taku the \ix?
    A Yes
    Q Do you remember him lclling the helmsman to put the rudder
amid ships?
    A No, I don't recall that
    Q Did he tell you to call the chief malc on the phone?
    A Hemay have I don't recall
    Q He did give you an order to lake Maureen Jones and go
(10) and wake up the crew?
A Yes
Q Were his orders clear?
A Yes
Q Were they concise?
A Yes
Q Were they given with authority?
A Yes
Q Now with respect to the - to the cngine and hulm
maneuvers that Captain Hacelwood was making allur the
grounding did he discuss those with you?
(21) A No
(22) Q Did he tell you what was in his mind at that point?
(3) A No
(4) Q Did he tell you what he wastrying to do)
| s| A No
```

down

## Vol 162462

(1) Q Did you believe the captain was after the grounding irying
(2) to ascertain how much damage was done and where the

## damage

(3) was?
(4) A He directed the chef officer to do a stability survey
(5) Q You heard him tell him that?

AYes
Q And you knew - and you undurslood that to mban he wanlud
to know how badly he was damagud'
AYes
(10) Q And wher.)
111) AYes
(1) Q Now you were ashcd somu quastoons both yuxterday and
"13, today I believe aboul a comment that you overticard Mr
Kagan
(14) gel from Caplain Hacelwood altur the grounding
(15) A Yes
(16) Q And I think al one point you mintioned you were kind of
[17) frustrated at the way the questions wur toming about that?
(18) AYes
(19) Q Is it correct that this comment by Captain Hacclwood came
(20) aflur a period in which Mr Kagan wavstanding at the helm)
(1) AYes
(-) Q And during that puriod of tions altur the erounding there

- 7 was nothing going on'
(4) A Correct
si Q Did you understand the sarcasin tuhe diruthed at that tact'
(1) AYes
() Q That he d been standing there when nothing was
happening?
AYes
Q Now going back to the - to the amount of tume you had off
duty and on duty or while you were resting or not resting at
the tume that you stood your watch the night of the grounding
starting sometime before 800 that night?
A Right
Q Did you feel like you were affected by any fatigue?
A No
Q At the time that you took over the con some eight or nine minutes before midnight did you feel fatigued?
A No
Q Did you feel like fatigue had anything to do with your
performance that evening? That night or that morning?
A No I don't think it did
Q Now at any time in the next three four or six or seven
hours did you ever have the opportunity to be able to at down and collect your thoughts and try to jot down what you had done
(20) and when you had done it?
(21) A No
(2) Q At some point farrly early on after the grounding people
started coming to the ship correct' Coast Guard
investıgators?
(.) A Yes

Vol $16 \quad 2464$
(1) Q And there were drug and alcohol tests and questions asked (2) correct)
(3) AYes
(4) Q And then the next day and thereafter there was a greal deal s) of pressure and publicily was there not?
(b) Yes

Q And within a litle over a month you were subjected to
lestimony before the NTSB?
AYes
(10) Q And at somi point in this time interval you were requested
(1)t or summoned to talk to the attorneys for the Department of
(1) Justice)
(13) A Correct
(14) Q And did you understand they were conducting a criminal
(IS) investigation?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q Did you also understand that there was a state criminal
(18) Investugation on going?
(19) AYes
(20) Q And did you ulumately insufy bulore a fideral grand jury?

1 II A Yes Idid
(-) Q Was that in Anchorage'
(י) AYes
(-4) Q Did vou also testify in front of a state grand jury if you (יs) rusall)

A I did not
Q And on the occasions - and you of course testified in the next year in - early in the next year in the Hazelwood trial?
A Correct
Q Which was a criminal trial?
A Yes
Q Now on all of these occasions vou vebeen asked many many
times about at what time certain things occurred?
A Yes
Q Just prior to the grounding and after the grounding correct?
A Um hum yes
Q You ve been asked how long it took to do a certain thing correct?
1191 A Yes
(16) $Q$ And how long it took to go from this thang to the nuxt
(17) thing?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q Have you not?
10) AYes
(1) Q And you ve also asked to try to put the things in order?
$1 \geqslant A$ Yes
13) Q What happened first second third fourth and fifth isn t
4) that correct?
(1) A Correct
(1) AYes

1) Q For example the time that vou took the fix at 2355 you
(3) Know that time don I vou)
(4) A Yes
(9) Q Why?
(8) A Because I logged it That $s$ a landmark time certan of -
(7) certain events in a time span would stand out more than others
2) Just because of their relative importance to me
(9) Q Well also didn i you look at vour wath?
(10) A Yes
(11) Q When you did that?
(1) A Yes put it on the chart
(13) $Q$ And as a matter of fact isn t that the only time from the
(14) time the caplain left the bridgu till sometime after the

1151 grounding that you cvirhad a chancu to look at your watch?
lla, Or vou cver loohcd al vour walch?
\|7 A Yes
(181 Q That night do vou recall what kind of watch you had?
(19) A It was a digital display lighted display
(20) Q Did it show hours and minutes or hours minutes and
(1) seconds?
(?) A Hours minutes and seconds
(3) Q Did you have to punch it to show seconds?
(24) A No
(S) Q When you arrived were out there on the wing when you

## Vol 162466

(1) Q And have you attempted to do that?
() A I have attempted
(11) Q Do you have as you sul here today having - you have 1
(4) assume had the opportunity over the past months to look at
(9) your NTSB testımeny?
(8) A l've had the opportunaty I haven't done it
(7) Q But at some point did you ever read your NTSB testimony?

AYes
Q And did vou cver read your Hazulwood trial lastimony or
parts of $1{ }^{\prime}$ ?
A Parts of it
(I) Q And do you realize there are differences between those?
(13) AYes
(14) $Q$ As to the sequence and the times and everything?
(1s) AYes
(16) Q Is it a fair statement that you ve had a great deal of
(17) difficulty under these particular circumatancea as we ve
(18) described them remembering the times at which things
(19) occurred?
(20) A Correct
(1) Q All right And that is in no small part due to what you
( ) had to go through that night the grounding and the aftermath?
(3) A Correct
(24) Q Now there are some times that are pretty clear in your
(25) mind though aren there?

## Vol 162468

(1) looked at your wath could you see how many seconds there were
(2) on it or did you remember how many seconds there were on it?
(3) A I would have been able to see it but with difficulty
(4) Q Do you remember seeing how many seconda it was after 23557
(5) A No
16) Q As vou vil hare today do you have an independent
(7) recolloblion that vou can sil here and rusall the order in
(8) which all thuse things whru donc?
(v) A Not an exact chronology no
(io) $Q$ And is it possible that certain things in the way you
(II) recite them here today or al the NTSB or at the Hazelwood trial
(1) were out of order from where they actually occurred?
113) A Yes
(14) $Q$ And is it also possible that your estimates of the inme it (IS) took to do things could be inaccurate?
(16) A Certanly I-I wish I'd made that more clear miny
(17) previous testumomes, that I really was not sure, that they
(18) were purely estumates
(19) Q When you were testifying before the NTSB?
(20) A Yes
(21) $Q$ Were you attempting to give them an estimate about how
long
(22) the tasks took or werc you actually giving them from
(23) recollection the ume il actually took you?
(4) A Those were my best estimates of - of time intervals other
(25) than - placed within times that I could venfy from - from


[^27] right almost

## Vol $16 \quad 2472$

) THE COURT Thank you Plaintıffs Exhibits 224 and
355 are admilted
MR O NEILL 1 m sorry ils 3551 I maspoke
(4) (Exhibits 224 and 3551 offered)
(s) MR SANDERS No objection to that one either Your
(6) Honor
(7) THE COURT 3551 and 224 are admilled
(8) (Exhibits 224 and 3551 rutelved)

MR O NEILL Your Honor we re calling - excuse me
(10) We re calling Mr Shechy for cross examination That means I
(II) get to ask leading questions And we ll use your depoaition
(I') Iranacripl
(I3, CROSS EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM SHEEHY (Live)
(14) BYMR O NEILL
(1s) Q Could you tell us where you work
(16) A Right now I work for Sea River Mantume
(17) QThat sthe old Exxon Shipping Company?
(18) A Exxou Shippiug correct
(19) $Q$ And when did you start with thum?
(20) A I started with them in I believe it was July of 1974
(21) Q And was that after graduation from some maritime academy?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q And what academy was that?
(24) A The Federal Maritıme Academy, Kings Point New York

1 is $Q$ And that sthe sort of top of the line maritimu academy
ll isn lit?
1 A Some people think that
(i) Q Do people who graduate from Kings Point wear their rings on
4) their lefi hand like they do at West Point?
si A I don't know I don't have one
6) Q I asked that I ma West Pointer and in the vears since

I ve graduated I ve put on so much weight that I can I gul mv ring on anymore
You were the port captain of the gulf coast flut at some point in time weren I you?
A Yes sir
$Q$ And about when was that?
A I started I believe in June of ' 85
Q And the primary job of the port capiain was to act as the liasson between ships masters and shore side management?
A That's correct when I started the job yes
Q At some point in time were the responsibilities enhanced?
A Yes, durng the tume that I was there I actually held three different jobs
Q Could you tell us what the three different johs were and when you held them?
A Well the first one when I started I was port captann for all 12 of the vessels there I'm going to say somewhere round
(-4) the first of ' 87 we changed the structure a lattle bit and
sl added a second port captatn so I had half as manv vessels

I after that time and the job description changed a little bit
) Not a lot And then in the - I think the first of '88 that
(3) structure was changed and we - I went from being port captan
4) to ship group coordinator and that was the biggest change 10
I) job descriptions was going from port captan to ship group (a) coordinator

Q Now at the same tume that these managtment changes were
taking place shore side would it be fair to say that
Mr Iarossi who was the president of Exxon Shipping Company
was implemenung management changes with regard to the responsibilties of tanker masters?
A I do not recall any real changes with regards to the masters on the ships
Q Have you ever heard hum or seen his speech surrendering
memories?
AYes
Q And in that speech doesn the talk about how he at least through the 1980s created a shipboard management team with regard to these vessels?
A Well what he discussed was adeas for the future and possibilities for changing 1 don't recall that he specifically changed anything in that time period Q Do you recall him when he made the speech saying - or when you read the spech - did you hear it or read il or hoth' A Both I think

Vol 162475
I Q The latest and perhaps most significant step in the
, evolution to the new fleet officer involved the development of
) the shipboard management team and the concept of business unil
( slcwardship do vou recall him saving that'
A Vot specific illy but -
Q Did vou attend the $198 x$ Mal management conferenč?
A Yes 1 probably did
Q Wasa topic ol dincusion at the l9x8 fleet management
conferenct fatigul at sca?

## Ai don't remember if that was or not

Q Do you recall a topic at fleet management - at a fleet
management conference prior to the grounding being fatigue at sea?
A No
Q Lel me show you 224 which has been admitted Have you
ever seen a handout like Exhibit 224 ?
You ve got a screen right there sir You got your own private screen
A Okay I doa't reallv remember this but I may have seen it and not -
Q Does this -
A And I generally remember I guess the subject but -
Q Does this at all rulresh vour recollebtion that in 1988 a
(9) topic at the fleet management conference may have been
fatigue
(rs) at sea?

## Val $16 \quad 2476$

A II mas have been ves
Q In August of 198 s when you wire the - you were then the
gulf coast fleet manager?
A No I was the port captan
Q Gulf coast - the port captain?
A Yes
Q Someone in personnel told you that Captain Hazelwood would
be returning to duty as the master of the Yorktown is that a
correct statement?
A That's correct
(11) Q And you were later told by your boss who was John
${ }^{1121}$ Tompkins to meet with Captain Hazelwood?
(13) A Yes

Q And Tompkins told you that Hazelwood had been
determined to
be fil for duty in a madical sunsc?
A Yes Tompkins told me that he was returning to sea Yes
I
(17) believe he said that

Q And he was going to be assigned to the Exxon Yorkiown?

## A Yes

Q And the sum and substance of this conversation was about
two minutes?
A Approximately
Q And Tompkins nuvcr told you the ruason for Captain
Ha7ciwood vleave ol abscnce)
A When - when rompkins and I had that conversation we were

Vol 162477
both going to the same meetung We were driving up north of
town I don't belseve that be told me any reason then
Q And you didn 1 ask him about the nature of Captain
Hazelwood s medical leave?
A No
Q And you learned later on that Mr Tompkins was in fact
aware of the reason for Captain Hazelwood $s$ medical leave?
AI-I assumed that he was aware of it, yes
Q Now after your discussion with Mr Tompkins and before
your meeting with Captain Hazelwood you called a Mark Pierce
to find out what the situation was with Captain Hacelwood you
were curious?
A Yes I called Mark Pierce because I had just reheved
Captan Pierce and so I decided to - before I left for the
meeting, to call Captan Pierce and just probe the issue a little bit
Q And Plerce told you that Captain Hacelwood had been in some
(18) kind of alcohol rehabilitation?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q And that he described Captain Hazelwood s problem as (21) drinking problems?
( ) A I can't recall for sure - I believe he said that yes
131 Q And Caplain Pierce was of the opinion that Captain
14) Hacelwood s drinking may have bucn intertering with Caplain
, Hackiwood s joh'

## Vol $16 \quad 2478$

[^28]5-24-94
how Joseph Hazelwood s drinking problem interfered with the performance of Hazelwood s job
BY MR O NEILL
Q Sir Mr Sheehy Captain Shechy when I asked you the question I want you to know I read it out of the transeript A Oh, I'm sure you did
Q That s how I do it Idon thave the confidence to ask questions I don $t$ know the answer to
A Well, the thing that's relevant as he asks up on line 5
about problems interfering with Joe's job, and I said no, I
don't think there were any problems interfening with Joe's
job
and I believe this - this is down -
Q Let a read the questions and answers out loud 111 read the question an answer out loud
A Okay
Q And you tell me whether I read il out loud right or not A Okay
Q Question, did Mark Pierce at any time after 1985 tell you how Joseph Hazelwood s drinking problems interfered with the performance of Hazelwood ejob?
Answer I believe that a subsequent tume he did tell me something about it
Question what did he tell you?
Answer seems to me lite he told me something about some problemy on one ut the vessels Joe was on and that was what

## Vol 162480

actually precipitated his involvement with Joe and
encouragement to go to a program
Were those questions asked and were those anawers given? AYes
Q And indeed Captain Pierce told you that he was instrumental in gelting Captain Hazelwood to seek help for his drinking problem?
A Captan Pierce sand that he had some involvement with Captan Hazelwood going into a program I don't beheve he said be was instrumeatal but he did say that he had some unvolvement with that due to some problems that he had seen
(12) that I don't think were job related
(13) Q Are you al all aware of the Graves report?
(14) A First tume I saw that was when it was one of the (IS) predesignated documents
(16) Q It would appear from the Graves report that Caplain
(17) Harclwood s drinking was job rulated wouldn $t$ al
(18) A Maybe at sume point I don't know
(19) Q Would you go to pase 113 of your deposition transcript
(\%) line 19 and with regard to the word instrumental was the
( i) qucstion ashed - let s start on line 20 There are a variety
1, ol quastoons and you eventually answer
( "1 The quistion is yus but the answur is I bulteve that Mark
( 41 said that he - he was involved in Joe y drinking problem and
(25) that he had told or that he had been instrumental in loe

Vol 162481
II seeking help and that it was a good thing that he did and that you know he needed to seek this help and successfully
complete this program in order to remain employed with the
company something along those lines that in the context of
this last chance thing came in
Did you say that?
A Yes I belseve so
Q And the word instrumental was vour word wasn $1 t^{\text {? }}$ A Yes
Q Did Mr Plerce or Captain Pierce tell you that he hoped that Captain Hazelwood had been rehabilitated?
A I beheve he made a comment something like that
Q And did he tell you that it was a good thing that Captain
Hazelwood had stopped drinking because that Captain azelwood
wouldn I remain an employee if he continued the way that he was?
A Captain Pierce may have been speculating that there was potential for problems if - if Captain Hazetwond was not rebabilitated I recall something like that
Q And did he tell you that Captain Hazelwood needed to seek
this help and successfully complete the alcohol rehabilitation program in order to remain employed?
A He told me that if he didn't seek some sort of rehabilutation that - that there was a potential for him to do something that may jeopardize his employment

## Vol $16 \quad 2482$

Q Indeed Captain Pierce told you that this wnuld prohably hu Captain Hazelwood s last chance?
3) A He made some comment like that
(4) Q And this was in 1985 this last chance commint was in 1985?
A Yes
I Q So you had - at this point in lime in 1985 prior to your
) meeting with Captain Hazelwood you had had a telephone
(9) conversation with or a conversation with Tompkins may have no been in the car?

## (II) A No it was in my office

(12) Q It was in your office and then you had this follow up
(13) conversation with Captain Pierce?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q And then you met with Captain Hazelwood at a - at the
(16) Windham Hotel in where?

A That's the Windham Hotel near the airport Houston Q In Houston?
A Intercontinental yes sir
Q And Captain Hazelwood was going to come in for this meeting
(21) and then the next day he was going to be reassigned to the
(י) Exxon Yorktown?
(3) A That's correct
(24) Q And the meeting has been described as having taken place in
(S) a variety of differunt environments Would you - would it bs
(1) fair to say that it was in the open lobby of the Windham Hotel?
i) A The way I recall that meeting was I met Captan

## Hazelwood

in right by the entrance and we sat down at the closest
is d dvailable - I belseve it was a couch and a table in the lobby
, there
(s) $Q$ And that - - vou could devirite it as the lobby bar an

171 open lobbv bar would that he farr?
(s) A Yeah You could get beverages sittmg there yes
(4) Q Captain Haselwood slestified that vou had a beer there?
(10) A i mayor may not have had a beer I don't really recall (II) what I had
(1) Q But it s one of those places that we all know in hotel
(13) lobbies where the table sout there and there $s$ a ber set up
(14) and it sout in the atrium?

A It's in the atnum
1161 Q ls that a fatr statement?
(17) A Yes that's correct
(18) Q Now Captain Hayelwond has lustificd that in his
(19) conversatton with vou the subject of drinking did not come
(o) up Ohay' Your recollection of that is different isn itt?
(I) A Yes
(?) Q So we have (wo versions as to what took place We have
(3) whatever he lestified to hert in the courtroom and your
( 4) recollection is that Captain Harelwood told you that he was no
(.5) longer drinking?

## Vol 162484

## A That'v correct

1) Q And you told Captain Hazelwood that this was your last (1) chance?
(4) A When we were sitting there at the table and I can't recall (s) for sure what precipitated the comment but I believe

## Captain

(6) Hazelwond proffered that to me that he was not drinking and I
171 said good I understand that - that this - that you
shouldn't be or this is your last chance or something along those lines
101 Q So that in 1985 at least as you and I are talking and your
"ll recollection of the conversation goes Captain Hazelwood was
I, told that this was his last chance?
i3ı A I don't thank I ever soid Captann Hazelwood was told it was
(14) his last chance
(15) $Q$ Did you say I understand that this is your lant chance this 1101 ume?
(17) A I may have sand that yes sar
(18) Q You re careful in your speech and if I overstate feel free
(19) to come back and -
(20) A Okay
( 11 Q All right?
(? A Okay
131 Q You did not ask Captain Haclwond anything about his
( si aftercarl AA muntal or cmotional hulp family support
i in struclur those kinds of things did you?

## Vol 162485

(1) A No My understanding was that Mr Tompkins had already met
(2) with hum As a matter of fact that was the agreement that 1
(3) had with John Tompkins was that I was really only to meet with
(4) Captain Hazelwood if he did not make it to the Windham
(s) I did know that Mr Tomplans did meet with Joe so in
(6) actuality, my meeting with Captan Hazelwood was
redundent at
(7) that point
(8) Q Would it be fair to say that in the summer of 1985 you
(9) were on notice of a potentsal problem that is Captain ,
(10) Hazelwood alcohol rehabilitation and what Captain Pierce had
(II) told you?
(12) A Captan Pierce - yes Captan Pierce had - when - I
(13) beheve that perhaps also when I relaeved Captan Pierce in
(14) June, several months before the Windham meeting I beheve that
(1s) Captan Pierce suid something to me about Captain Hazelwood
(lo। being on medical leave We didn't get down to the details of (17) any of at nor ded we discuss when be would be back
(18) $Q$ And you understood during the period of ume that you
(19) worked with Captain Hacelwood on thu gult coast that there wab

301 a farly high likwhhood that somtone with an alcohol problem
(2i) would start drinkıng again?
(. ) A I don't know of I was aware of what that likelihood was
( 3) I'm not sure if I could assign a percentage to it but I
(4) certanaly recognized that it was sumething to be concerned
( 5 ) about

|  | Vol 162486 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Q The term lairly high the ruason that ! used that is that |
|  | was the phrase that you used in your deposition Would you |
|  | rake issue with that now' |
|  | A l'd have to read that |
|  | Q Lets find it |
| 161 | A Okay |
| 71 | Q Leis go to pagt 285 line 16 The quastion wax and what |
|  | was your understanding as to the rate of rucidivism' And your |
| (9) | answer was that it was lairly high Do vou yuc that' |
|  | A Yes That refreshes my memory the discussion about recidivisma little bit |
|  | Q Wh san take - wh can ahe our timb Wh tanqu hach herc |
|  | and tahe a look at what vou nocdlolouh al hwaunc thore |
|  | art - thure s hihe 400 or 500 pazts ill transuript thare |
|  | A Yeah |
|  | Q And you knew that a foilow up probram was a nubussary part |
|  | of Captain Hazelwood salcohol rehabilitation? |
|  | A The detask to my knowledge about Captann Hazelwood's |
|  | program were very hmited because it was a confidentual |
|  |  |
|  | that really only a supervisor would be privy to no the details |
|  | of his program and of his aftercare nituation I was not privy |
|  | to |
|  | Q You knew as a suncral proposition that a lollow up program |
|  | was a nuclssary pari ol an alcohol ruhabilidioun prozram' |
|  | A I know in - yes in movt casts it is yer |

$Q$ And that was vour bellef at the ume that Caplain Hazelwood was under your watch?
3) A Yes, I belleve that he was in some sort of program, yes
(4) Q And you made no attempt to determine if Captain Hazelwood
(1) would attend AA or aftercare meetings during his tours at sea
(6) did you?
7) A The details of Captan Hazelwood's aftercare program as I
(8) said, were not - not matters that I was privy to I was stall
(9) on the peer level with Captan Hazelwood What his pragram
(10) was, how frequently, what - I didn't even know what group
(II) was going to, whether it was AA or rapid recovery or any of those
Q That 8 - that 8 fine In fact let stake that one step lurther Would it be fair to say that no one ever told you to monitor Captain Hazelwood regarding his use of alcohol?
A Well, the fact of the matter is is that I don't recall
specifically being told and I think it's probably because I
recognize that such monitonng of like that that you speak was
(19) part of my job in the base case I did not recall of
specifically being told to do anything other than what I felt
like I was duing already
Q Well my statement is correct you were never told by
anyone at Exxon to monitor Joseph Hazelwood regarding the
use
(14) o「alcohol?

A I - I may or may not have been told that I don't recall

## Vol 162488

beng told that I may have been
Q Okay Would you go to page 218 of your duposition
transcript and I $m$ going to read from lint 2 to line 5 and you tan follow along whe me
Ohay were you evur told by anyone at Exxon to monitor
Joseph Hazelwood regarding use of alcohol and your answer was
, กo
Do you sce that?
A Yes But then on the same page I specifically say that I
wouldn't necessandy be told that because it was part of my Jub
(11) to montor that

Q Well you wert concurncd about this man weren 1 you just
on your own? Your own investigation without being told to monitor him puts you on notice of a polcntial problem didn it 117
A I felt like it was my job to - to monitor hum yes
Q And would it be fair to say that you don i know whether
anybody ulse specifically monitored Joseph Haculwood garding
his usc of alcohol?
A I don't know specifically what other monitoring plans or prograns were
Q Now at some point in time a Mr Jim Shaw comes to you with rugard to Captain Ha/rlwood?
A Yeab
Q Is that a correct stalumant?

1) AYes

1 Q And he was a port steward while vou were the port captain
i, of the gulf coast Ileet?
(4) A That's correct
5) Q And you view Mr Shaw as being an honest man?

A I believe my testimony was that he $s$ - he's honest and
well intentioned but he also is prone to gossip to exaggerate
8) things rather - he lacks in credibility sometimes simply because of his gossiping and exaggeration
Q He had never - are you finished?
A Yes
Q He had never before or after reported any out of school drinking problems that he had This is the only drinking report that Mr Shaw ever brought to you isn $t$ it? A I had had a lot of contact with Jim Shaw over the years and I think he - he taiked abont all aspects of people's private lives over the years I think I may have - I don't think I, while port captan, ever heard any other rumors from Jım, but I think perhaps when I sailed with him I had Q When you were port captain Mr Shaw didn $t$ come in and tell you any other out of school drinking stories did he? A I can't positively say that he didn't but I don't recall that he did
Q And Mr Shaw told vou that Captain Haflutood was acting funny?

## A Yes

Q And you had to press him to get the story up didn tyou? A Yes
Q And you did pross hım?
A Yes
Q And Mr Shaw told you that Captain Hazelwood was drunh over
7) In Baton Rouge when Mr Shaw was on the ship? A I believe that he alluded to that fact that my discussion with Mr Shaw - he was being so cryptic and so ambiguous
what be was saying I can't recall that he specifically sand he was drunk 1 think he sadd that he thought Captan
Hazeiwood had fallen off the wagon or something like that
contanued to question ham about what he meant by that
Q Did Mr Shaw tell you that Captain Hazelwood was drunk?
A Like I say as - as near as I can recall right now he
said that be had fallen off the wagon or that be was acting
funny
Q The cure didn t work?
A May have said that
Q And did he tell you that he was concerned about Captain
Hazelwood being drunk on board ship?
A I don't know if he said that be was concerned
Q Would you go to page 156 of your deposition transcript
line 16 and 1 mgoing to read the 157 line 2 and why don 1
you follow aiong

Vol 162491
Jim Shaw uxpressed concern that a lot of people saw Joseph
Hazelwood drunk question And vour answer was I helieve he
said something like hey this man-this isn Itoo cool I
mean we have all the people storing the vessel and Joe was he
said misbehaving or I can 1 remember exactly whal mınology
he used but something like that Like i say it was somewhat
crvpit and I mav have sard what do vou mban vou mean he
was
drunh dnd hc add vis or I can 1 rumumber how it went hul that unded up hung the hotom line wo lo speak Jimalleging that
Is that a - does that tairly state what happened?
A I thank so yes
Q li s a louchy thing for a port steward to report a master being drunk isn ill?
A I don't think it's so touchy for Jım Shaw because he regularly gossips about people's personal lives and things like
(17) that I don't think that he felt uncomfortable about doing that at all
(19) Q Al the time that Mr Shaw hrought this information to you vou had - vou kntw that Captain Hazclwond had been through
the
(1) program and vou according to sour icstimony had told him
this
( ) washis last chancu)
(3) A I told him that I understood it was his last chance yes
( 4) Q Now let stalk about the things that you didn to after
(2S) the Shaw ruport You didn I go and interview anybody else on

## Vol 16 2492

(1) the ship did you'
i) A By the tume i got the shaw report the shap had left
(i) Q At no time after that did you go and did you talk to the
(4) people thal wure on the ship and ash them about the Shaw
(s) allegations did you?
(6) A Subsequent to the Shaw allegations I did go over to the
17) vessel talked to Captann Hazelwood and I made myself avaılable
(8) to other crew members
(9) Q You made yourself avalable Did you go and ask any of the
(10) other crew members anything specifically aboul the Shaw
(II) allegations?
(12) A I did not specıfically ask anybody if they had seen

Captans
(13) Hazelwond druak or anything like that

114, Q And anvihing to the potcnual wilncyses crew members
(1s) there whre a variety ol other potential witnesses the
(IB) stevedorus isn I that right'
(17) A Well there were somestevedores on there but my feelungs
(18) about that whole report due to Mr Shaw's lack of credibulity
(19) I thought that it would be mappropriate to launch into an (20) investugation that could possibly undermine Captan Hazelwood's
(21) authonty based on such a scurrilous report from basically a
(22) non-credible source So I felt that it was prudent to take
(.3) other avenues before I did anything that I thought might
have
( 4) been an overreaction
(rs) Q Would it be fair to say that with regard to the potential

## Vol 162493

witnesses with regard to the Shaw event that is the other
crew members and the stevedores you didn $t$ go and interview them?
A I did not interview the stevedores, no
Q Now Captain Hazelwood - you took this seriously enough
the situation seriously enough to call Mark Pierce didn I you?
A Yes I called Captan Pierce Probably immediately after Jum Shaw told me the - the story
Q And Pierce told you that if Captain Hacelwood was drinking again he was going to be in big trouble?
A He sand something like that $Y$ es $I m$ not sure what the
trouble was referming to if at was a professional or a
personal sense
Q Well let s lalk about that because during that same phone
call didn t Captain Pierce tell you that Captain Harelwoods
drinking problems had interfered with his job performance at
another lume?
MR SANDERS Your Honor this has been asked and
answered We ve spent quite a bit of time on it
MR O NEILL It sanother tume
THE COURT My sense of it is this is another ume
but the jury will have to make that cull for themselves based on the testumony
s) BYMR O NEILL

## Vol 162494

Q Did he inform you of that in that telephone conversation ${ }^{2}$
A I beleve that in that telephone conversation here again there was the one at this tume and the one in August of '85 I
don't believe that be ever said that there were any
professional probleus that - that has at vet affected Captain
(6) Hazelwood'v job perforinance lle mav have alluded to persunal
problems or problems un general but I don I believe that he ever specifically told me that - he may have sand there were
some problems maybe even problems on the ship but - but
(10) nothing that had really negatively impacted performance at
that
(111) point
(12) Q Did he tell you that there had been drinking problems that

1131
1141
(1s) Q Let s go to page 116 of your deposition transcript
1161 MR SANDERS Your Honor this is cxacily whal wi did
17, bulor wacl same pabt wa isainc linc
(is) THE COURT Is that the sumb pagt'
(19) MR O NEILL It is the saine page but the manハー
(º) MR SANDERS Sami question there whriwo
(1) conversations The answurto the lirst ont is on line 9 and
in) this one is where he s referring to again it s the very same
1.31 thing
1.41 THE COURT II we ve been over 11 Mr O Neill his
( 5 ) don I do Itagan

```
MR O NEILL I ll move on Judge I ll move on
BY MR O NEILL
Q At some tume you also talked to an Ivan Mihajlovic?
A Correct
Q And he is a friend of Captain Hazelwood s?
A Yes, I think I thmik they live near each other I'm not
sure how close they are
Q And it crossed your mind that Captain Hazelwood would
Iip - that Captain Mihajlovic would tip off Caplain Hazelwood
about your investigation wouldn t it?
A Captain Mihajlovic was a classmate of mine through all
(1) years of school and I belneve that I could trust Capton
Mihajlovic to discuss an issue with him if I wanted to I may
have had some concern about that, but I beheve that I felt
that over all, it would be better to - to discuss thes with
Captann Mrhajlovic
Q But it did cross your mind didn it?
A It may have crossed my mund, yes
Q Then you testified that you went to see Captain Hazelwood
isn that night about the Shaw incident?
A Thus was the same tume, that you were talkung about, wnth
the stevedores
Q About the same tume?
A It was exactly the same tume
(9) Q Now Caplain Hazelwood doesn t recall this conversation?
```

four

## Vol 162496

A Well, about enght years ago
Q And you can t really remember who said what to whom can you in the conversalion?
A I can't really remember what was sand I can remember ufter I called Pierce after I called Mihajlovic I can remember 1 got a great deal of satisfaction from Mihajlovic un
(7) a very personal level that Captain Hazelwood was not dranking
and that was my chef reason for calling Mihajlovic because 1
knew they lived close to each other and that - that Captan Mhajlovic would certomly know that
I - with that bacigground, I did go over to the vessel I
think I spent about sux or eight hours on the ship First place I went was Captana Hazelwood's office What I sand to
Captan Hazelwood as near as I can recollect was I informed
hım
"Is, that I had heard these ullegations I don't belneve I told him
"|o, who made them regarding his last port call
(17) My recullection is that we did not have a leogthy
us, conversation about it but I told him that this had come up
(19) don't know if I talked to him or not about any of the other
(30) things I did but I was comfortable at the end of my
(21) Conversation with Captain Hazelwood that the allegations were
(.2) untrue based on - on everything else
(23) Q Did you know that Captain Hazelwood had resumed drinking
in
(24) 1986 ?
(3) A No

Vol 162497
Q And vou repored all of this to the gulf coast fleet manager Dwight Koops?
A That's correct
Q And vou had never talked to Mr Koops before about Hazelwood salcohol rehabilitation?
A I'm a little unclear about the temporal sequence of all this I - I don't recall specifically talking to Dwight about
Captann Hazelwood's rehabilitation but as I had said this -
this was a confidential matter that I would have made the
assumption that whatever arrangements that Captain
zelwood
had would have been with Mr Koops and it would have been
10 a
(1) confidential status
Q Would it be fair to say that you had never talked to
Mr Koops before about Hazelwood saicohol rehabilitation?
A Before?
Q This report
A Before this report, I - I may have talked to Dwight about
it I - I don't specifically recall discussung anything about
Joe's aftercare or his rehabilitation program with Dwight
Q And you made this report that s-10 Mr Koops?
A Yes
Q And after you told Mr Koops about the Shaw report vou
assumed that the hall was in Mr Koops court?
A I assumed that as far as further action on this specific
allegation that the ball was then in Mr Koops' court yes

```
Vol 16 2498
Q And he was the gulf coast fleet manager?
A Yes
Q And he reponted directlv to the company president?
A Yes
Q And after Mr Shaw s repori about Captain Hazelwood you
can trecall doing anything different yourself in terms of
watching Captain Hazelwood can you?
A Well I think from the very beginning when you know
subsequent to my first conversation with Captain Pierce
```

you
(10) know I probably had a heightened awareness or recognized
the
(11) need to be more alert Ithink it would be far to say that
(12) with Captan Hazelwood's incident with Jim Shaw if that
would
(13) have maybe been some other person that Jım Shaw was -
was
(14) saying that about I may not have - have even reacted as
(is) strongly as I did with that
(s) So I don't think it's a fair characterizatuon to say that I
(in) never did anything different with Captan Hazelwood,
because I
always subconsciously knew of his background
Q You knew that he was an accident watling to happen didn $t$
you?
A No
Q Let s go to Page 323 of your deposition transcript line 8
and III read from line 8 to line 13
A Which page was that sir?
Q 323 sir

MR SANDERS Give us a second counsel
BY MR O NEILL
Q Question did you do anything different - did you do anything differently after the Shaw report in terms of monitoring or watching Hazelwood?
Answer here again I may have but I don $t$ recall of
anvthing that significant that itan pecifically tell you that
I did do something diffurunt
Do you ubl hat?
AYer
Q And would it be tair to say that Mr Koops you re unaware
as to whether Mr Koops did anvthing differently? After the
Shaw report?
A I'm not sure what Mr Koops dad no
Q And you don t recall ever discussing with Mr Koops about whether you and he should watch Captain Hazelwood more ely?
7) A The - typically when I would vistt the ships, Dwight or 8) Mr Koops required us to make a report back to him That was a
(19) one page written form that covered a number of issues I know
( o) that I-they were called vessel visitation reports and I'm
' 1 sure I wrote those when i visited the Yorktown Dwight and I

i 1 remember
(4) Q Ohay Lul sgotothe samb page 323 of your deposition
transcript and II read from line 17 to line 21 and you see

Vol 162500
ifl gut uright
() Question I take it you never discussed with Koops gat
(1) down and said mavhe we ought in watch hima little more closely
(4) or something like that?
(s) And your answer was I can t remember having a conversation
(0) like that
(7) Did I get il right?
(8) A Yes
(9) Q And indeed this was the only discusaion that you had with
(10) Mr Koops about Hazelwood and alcohol this one discuasion?
(11) A Well, as I say, I know that I discussed a lot of issues
(12) with Dwight especially each tume I - I visited the vessel
(17) I'm sure I dıscussed Captan Hazelwood with Dwight I'm sure
Usi Dwight avked me how Captatn Hazelwood was doing and I reported
IIS) on that I think that Mr Koops and I had an understanding
(10) between the two of us what that meant but specifically, I
(I7) can't remember a date and a tume when I discussed that specific
(18) issue with bim
(19) Q Now sometime in 1987 the issue of Captain Hazelwood being
(20) reassigned to the west coast fleet comes up do you recall
(21) that?

AYes
(23) Q And you had a conversation with a Mr Andy Martineau?
(24) A Yes
(s) Q And Mr Maritneau was in the course of this conversation

85A
FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
Vol 162501
, at least concerned enough about Captain Hacelwood to ash the
, question whether Jon was drinhing'
3) A Yes He - he inituated this conversation with tue
4) regarding Captain Hazelwood's transfer to the $F \times x$ on

Valdez We
discussed some of the - as well as some other reassignments
(6)
(8) problem
9) with Captan Hazelwood drunking

118, and I beheve Captan Martıneau was satisfied with - with what
(19) I had told hum

Q Did vou know that by 1987 Captasn Ha7elwood had in fact resumed drinking?
2) A No I had no reason to suspect that at all as I satd his jub performance was above averake Ifelt
4i Q His ratings weren : wurl they'
s $A$ No

Vol 162502
Q In tact in 1986 the year prior to this 1987 conversation his ratungs were the worat that they had ever been weren t they 35 out of 37 ?
A I was not privy to the list exactly $I$-I understand that he was in the final outcome of the senatim be was quite
(6) low on it

Q So now would a bc fair lo sey that Captain Marineau was on nolice that there was this inciden!'
A No I don't think that would be fair to say I-I sand that I may or mav nut have meationed the Jan thaw incideut

Captan Martuneau As matter of fact Imay have said well,
(12) we had one uncident which we investigated we found it not to
(13) be factual and so m my upinion everything with Captan
(14) Hazelwood was fine and that there would be no problems s) transferning ham

Q In point of fabl over the one year puriod prior to that
conversation you had never ashbd Capiain Ha clwoud art you
drinking are you in AA how s vour rahabilitation zoing how s
vour family going is that a lair valumunt'
A During that time period Ihid numeroun converiations with

Captan Hazelwood I mot sure th it - I thank we may have discussed his family we mav have discussed hor he was doing in
(23) general
(4) I do not specifically remember talking about his aftercare
) or his rehabilatation program I-Ifelt that I had somewhat

Vol 162503
of a rapport with Joe but I also felt that that was a confidentsal matter and that in my opinion his performance was
(3) such that it didn't warrant delving into his personal life
(4) Q It was a confidential matter Youkncwabout it isn t
(s) that right?
(6) AYes
(7) Q Pierce knew about at?

A Yes
Q Koops knew about it?
A Well, Koops knew about it because he was hus supervisor
I
(II) knew about it
(12) Q Did Koops know?
(13) A I knew about it on a more personal level
(14) Q You found out about it from Pierce Andy Martinenu knew
(19) about it didn the?
(16) A I think he may have, yes
(17) Q Are you aware that it was a rumor in the feet?
(18) A I'm aware that there's not a lot of secrets an the fleet,
(19) so -
(20) $Q$ So it wasn $t$ as confidential as one mught think by juast
(21) saying it was a confidential matter isn ithat right?
(22) A Well you know I think you know most individuals (73) especially Captan Hazelwood's peers has colleagues would take
(24) the rumors for what they were worth I always felt that that (L) was a personal matter If Captain Hazelwood wanted to despel

## Vol 162504

|  | Vol 162504 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | or discuss these - these rumors, that was his busuess I |
|  | I felt that from my pount of view, Captan Hazelwood was g |
|  | an excellent job and that there were no signs of any blems |
|  | associated with anything |
|  | Q I want to - so then Captain Hazelwood gets tranaferred to |
|  | the west coast that sacorrect statemunt? |
|  | A Eventually, yes |
|  | Q And you didn $t$ tell Andy Martinesu that he needed to |
|  | monitor Captain Haculwood did you? |
|  | A Well - |
| (11) | Q Did you? |
| (12) | A I made the assumption that Captan Martinegu knew what |
| his |  |
|  | job was and it's very explicit in the written job description |
|  | that we montor activities of the vessels and the masters |
|  | we also ensure that they comply with all the company and |
| 1161 | statutory type reguiations so I assumed that be knew that |
|  | $Q$ You assume that bul vou didn $t$ say hi had been through |
|  | rehabilitation we d had a drinking report you better keepan |
|  | cyc on him did you? |
|  | A I told him that we had one report |
|  | Q I want togo to a conlurcnuc that you dilundud in 1989 |
|  | after the grounding of the Valdes |
|  | A Okay |
|  | Q At which Mr Frank larossi spohe and Franh larossi was at |
|  | that point in time the president of Exxon Shipping Company is |

$\qquad$
inat a correct atatement?
A That's correct
$Q$ And who was at the conference?
A Probably about half the - the masters in the fleet a
bunch of the managers more senior managers There were
couple of - kind of ex Coast Guard captans that were going
7) be on contract for Exxon That's about it

Q Those are the guys essentially?
A That's the guys
Q The guys who were running the companv?
AI guess yeah
Q And at this meeting of the guys who were running the
company would it be fair to say that Mr larossi said that
Captain Hazeiwood - Mr Iarossi couldn t believe that Captain
Hazelwood went ashore so soon after the vessel tied up?
A I belseve that Mr Iarossi sand something like that I
know he discussed a lot of the events surrounding or ading up
) to the grounding
Q Okay I want to focus on three of them Mr larossi said
(1) that he couldn t believe that Hazelwood left the ship as soon
as it tied up?
A A belueve he said that yes
Q Mr Jarossi said that they had beln ashore in Valdez all
day and at several different bars during the day ol March 23rd
to 24th and that he couldn $t$ believe he did this?

Vol 162506
A Mr larossi was - was giving a speech about that I-I can't recall now what all he sad, but eventually it was something along those lines
Q And he couldn t believe Mr larosst the president of Exxon Shipping Company couldn thelicve that thcy came hach
close to sating tume?
A I believe he saud somethang like that
MR O NEILL Thank you sir
You got to stay there and he agoing to ask you some questıons
THE WITNESS I was just about ready to run off here THE COURT Don $t$ do that yet
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM SHEEHY
BY MR SANDERS
Q Good morning Captain Sheehy
A Good moraing counselor
Q Let mestart if I may with the summir of 1985 You werc transferred and I II lead a ittle here with the Court sand counsel s indulgence
You were transferred from being a ship caplain with Exxon
Shipping Company to a port captain in the summer of $1985^{7}$
A Correct
Q You took over for Captain Mark Pıercı who had been the port captain before that?
A That's correct

Q What waq vour ship betore that?
A My ship was -
Q Or shıps?
A My most immediate prior ship was the Exxon Lexington
Q Was the assignment to the port captain s pob considered a
good thing by you or a bad thing by vou or was it a mixed bag?
A Really the job was a mixed bag The - it was not an increase in my level within the company You did have to upront your family and move them somewhere temporanly
for a
II couple vears hut set it was a change It was something
different in I think it would depend on the andividual how it
suited his particular stage in life whether it was a plus or a minus
Q You considırıd it a plus didn i vou?
A Yes
Q At the time?
A At the tume
(19) Q All right Now when you took over that job there was some transition period in which you spoke with Captain Pierce about the job and the people that you would be haison with and what your responsibilities would be is that right?

## AYes

Q And al the lime vou whre - was there one port captain for
the gull (watl'

## Vol 162508

A At that tume there was just one port captan and I beheve that lasted for a year maybe a little longer Q All right And when that stopped what was the change? A When - when that stopped we actually got another port captain and another port engineer and divided up the ghips that
(s) we had so one pervon didn $t$ have all of the ships that , responsabilaty
Q Did this other group the port engineer and the port
taplaingo to the west cuast fleet is that what happened or did you divide up a fleel that was in the gulf coast? A Well at that time we had about 12 ships in the gulf coast and only about half as many on the west coast, so-so there were two of each in Baytown and one of each on the west coast,
(14) which would have been in the west coast fleet

QI m not doing a vary good job of drawing the distinctions
here When you tirst started in the gulf coast there wasa
west coast fleet offica)
A Yes
Q With a port captain and a port engineer?
AYes
Q And then the gulf coast had a port captain and port
engineer?
A Correct
Q And then a year or so later you divided that gulf coast
port captain s job and created another section the river fleet
or something like that? What was it called?
A Well, the nver fleet was a different section No
actually it was because we had twice as many shaps on the gulf
coast as we did on the west coast the decision was made to add
a port captan and port engineer just for the ocean goung
shups So myself and the port engineer were - pror to that
change, we'd each had a dozen ships, now we only had six
but
we didn't add any Stull the inland and the river fleet was a separate -
Q Okay I don I know whether I clarified il or not
A I'm not sure if you diderther
Q Captain when you - when you were in the office on a
summer day in August in Baytown Texas you menioned that
you
(14) had this conversation with John Tompkins?

A Correct
$Q$ And he was what?
A At that tume, John Tompkins was my boss and also the ummediate supervisor of the captains on the ships He was the
(9) gulf coast fleet manager

Q Hu was the thul managurthcre'
!ll AYes
1 -1 $Q$ And you had a bricl cunvarsation with himabout mbaling (3) with Capiain Hacelwood'
(4) A Yes my - my understanding when we separated that (25) conversation was basically what Mr Tompkins told me was that

## Vol 162510

Captan Hazelwood was rejoining the fleet he's goiag to be
' I joinang the Yorktowa the uext day that he was going to try to
il talk to Captain Hazelwood and be had every intention of talking
(4) to Captand Hazelwood but be would eather like met to go ulong ur
(5) be a back up in case he didn't make it We were buth going up
(6) to the Woodlands (pb) and that was the way we left at was
(7) that I would meet with Captain Hazelwood at the Windbam Hotel
(8) Q All right Before - that was the day you were going to
(9) meel with him you and Mr Tompkins or jusi Mr Tompkins

1101 correat?
(11) ACorrect

1) Q But during that dal wa madk that all to Caplam Picr (13) Lorrect?
(14) A Immediately after the discussion with Mr 1 intupkins yes
ilf $Q$ And baycd on your ball with Caplain Pisrat whal did vou
1(1) know about Capiain Hacliwoud and whal did you hnow vour
[17, rasponsibilues ware guing to be ifany'
(Is) A Well based on that conversation and here agann 1 did
(19) talk to Captan Pierce when I reheved him a lattle bit about
(20) the situation with the masters but after that conversation I
( I) became aware of the fact that Captan Hazelwood bad been to
( a some sort of alcohol rehabilitation program so in effect
inl Captann Pierce was informing me of another issue on my plate
(24) that I should be awure of and I should take responsibility for
(-S) watching this potentad assut or whatever vo - vol Captain

Pierce basically told me in a little bit more detal where

## Captam Hazelwood had been

Q Did you believe it was your responsibility to watch Captain
Hazelwood in regard to the alcohol issue?
A Yes
Q Did you do that?
AYes
Q All right Now let s find out what you were looking for
What did you believe right or wrong was the disease or the
condition that Captain Hazelwood had based on this brief
conversation with Captasa Pierce?
(1) A Based on thus conversation with Captain Pierce I-I
(13) believed that Captan Hazelwood was just, I gueas, the classic
(14) alcohohe in that he had to abstan from drankug
(15) Q All nght That was the assumption that you made about
(16) Captain Hazelwood?
(17) A Right, based on what I had got from Captan Pierce, yes
(18) Q All nght Did you have any assumption about what would
(19) happen in the event that Captain Hazelwood started to drink?
(20) A Well, here agan, we had - we had some traming on that,
(21) but basically, I felt that Captan Hazelwood had to be
(27) absunent
(3) Q All right But I masking you -
(A) $\boldsymbol{A} \ln$ other words I felt that perhaps if he started drinkeng
(?s) dt all that it might become uncontrolled

## Vol 162512

Q All right now and what was your - as port caplain now what was your thought about that situation?
A Well my thought about that was that at could cause a lot of problems for me that - you know as far as my management
of the operations of the vessel I had to make sure that they operated safely and efficiently, and that I didn't want anything to interfere with that
Q All right So what you were looking for was any sign of drinking by Captain Hazelwood?
(10) A Yes
(II) Q And did you do that?
(1) A As mucb as I looked in those years there was only one (13) merdent and that was -
(la) $Q$ Well now wall a minute Slay with me hurl Did you do
(19, that" Did you do that job)
(16) A I belseveso yes
(17) Q AI luast you did to the bust ot your ability)
(1x) $A Y_{\text {es }}$
(|c) Q And did you do it throughout the time that Captain
(ro) Hacelwood sailed as a captain in the gulf coast fleet for Exxon
(1) Shipping Company?
(22) A Right from 1985 through 1980 - middle of '87
(23) Q All right Now after you talked to Captain Pierce is (24) that when you went to meet with Captain Hazelwood?
(25) A I talked to Captan Pierce pretty early in the morning,

## Vol $16 \quad 2513$

maybe $8 \mathbf{0 0}$ in the morming even 730 then I left to go to the
meeting and it was early evening before I talked to Captann
Hazelwood
Q Okay But it is that day that you went out there?
A Same day yes Just later on the same day
Q Now my friend Mr O Neill has said in his opening
statement that the first meeting he has with the representative
of Exxon Shipping Company is where? It sinabar The first
meeting he has on return from his disability leave is in a
bar Let me ask you ask you I have a couple pictures here
Start with this one Your Honor this is Defendants
Exhibit 9127
Captain Sheehy do you recognize what is portrayed in
(14) Defendants 9127 ?
(19) A Yes that's the lobby of the Windham Hotel
(1/) Q Is that the lobby where you met Captain Hazelwood?
:17) AI belleve so Yes
(18) $Q$ With the Court s permission would you come down here and
(4) point to various things on here so you can show thl Ladies and
(20) Gentlemen of the Jury where you had this meeting?
11) MR SANDERS Is that all right Your Honor? Give you
(22) my handy dandy pointer
(.7) BYMR SANDERS
(9) $Q$ Would you first point out where the front entrance is? $^{\text {? }}$
( s) A Oh kind of nght in between these two pillars here As

## Vol $16 \quad 2514$

you can see it sort of goes on out of the picture but this is the man entrance nght in here and when I came in that evenug -
Q Watt just a minute Let me get you to tell a few more
things Above that on the picture as we re looking at it
where is the registration desk?
A All in here is the registration
Q All right And you ve pointed out the front entrance
Would you point out please sir where was Captain Hazelwood standing when you first came in' Did you meet him there in the lobby"
AYes
Q Where was he standing?
A I believe when I came in through these doors here where I
(1s) first saw him was right in here And as soon as I scanned
the
(16) lobby I saw him standing right here
(17) Q Okay And where did you go and sut down and talk with
(18) Captain Hazelwood?
(19) A Well we may have talked a minute or two standing right
( 0 ) there and then he just walked nght around the corner and sat
(21) down right here
(29) QThere?
(23) A At that table Actually, where the people are here at that (24) table I can't remember which of us were in which seats but (25) it was at that table It was actually the closest table to

## Vol 16 2515

where we were standing
Q There s something kind of yellowish or goldish there is that a railing?
A This thing here' Yeah it's a brass railing
Q Are there stairs there?
AYes
Q And is that where you sat with Captain Hazelwood?
A Yes
Q And that s where you mut him?
A Yes
MR SANDERS Move the admission of this exhibit Your
Honor
(Exhibil 9127 offered)
MR O NEILL Noobjection
THE COURT Defendants Exhibit 9127 is admitted
(Exhibit 9127 received)
7) MR SANDERS Just a couple more questions Your Honor
and it will be break tume of that sall right
THE COURT Sure
BY MR SANDERS
Q Captain Sheehy in fact also when you got there did you understand - well did you understand whether or not Captain Hazelwood had met with Mr Tompkins siready?
(4) A I understood that Captann Hazeiwood had met with

1 si Mr Tompkins just as Mr Tompkins had told me he would

## Vol 162516

(I) probably do
(2) Q Who told you that?
(3) A Captain Hazelwond did
(4) Q Did hi illl you where he mel him?
(s) A I don't thank he told me that no
(6) MR SANDERS Your Honor this is a good lime for a
(7) break
8) THE COURT We If tahl our accond raclss ladies and
(9) gentlemen
(i0) We II reconvene in $i 5$ minutes please
(11) THE CLERK Court is in recess for 15 minutes
(I?) (Jury out al 1200 pm )
(13) (Jury in at 1216 pm )
(14) THE COURT Mr Sanders
(is) MR SANDERS May I proceed Your Honor?
(16) BY MR SANDERS
(17) Q Captain Shechy hefore we leave this subject do you
(18) recognize this picture which is Defendants Exhibit 9126 as a
(19) closer up view of the area we were talking about in your
(0) testimony?
(ri) Althink so yes
(r) Q All right Now this area right here this is a place
(23) where one could order a drink correct?
(24) A Yes
(2s) Q And has a piano there?

Vol 162517
A Well actually a waitres, goes up there so you don't really go up there but -
Q Okay Butalcoholic beverages and other beverages are obtanable right here?
A Yes
MR SANDERS 1 move the admission of Defendants
Exhibit 9126
(Exhibil 9126 offered)
MR O NEILL I wish I would have moved its
admission No objection
THE COURT Defendants 9126 is admitted
(Exhibit 9126 received)
BY MR SANDERS
Q Now Captan Sheehy when you mel with Captain Hazelwood
there seated in the lobby of the hotel did you ash him if he was drinking or not'
A I beheve the way it came up was Captan Hazelwood
volunteered that to me I didn't ask hum Matter of fact
we - he may have ordered a coke or a seltzer water or
something, and that may have precipitated hum telling me
that
(21) I con't recall for sure
(n) Q Now between the tume that you had this meeting with the
(23) captain - weil let $s$ put it in purspective Let me strike that and go back
(.S) Is it your understanding that after these meetings that he

## Vol 162518

had with you and Mr Tomphins that hu was then going to get on his ship al some other port?
A I beheve he was going to Tampa the next day
Q All right And do you know how long it was from the timb you had this meeling io the lume vou had this conversation about which you ve luslificd with Mr Jim Shaw'
A I would say at wav prubabls a vear at leuvi
Q Ohay How good is vour racolltclion on that' Withat an "slimalu'
A That's purely an estomate
Q You don 1 know the dale or the lime?
A No
Q And of course you didn twrite this down?
A No
Q All right Let me go into that business juat a tiny bit
because it salready been covered but you had this conversation with Mr Shaw?
AYes
Q And he was very cryplic corrch)
A Correct
Q All right Whan vougolt anto it and prossed him what was your conccrn?
A My concern first of all was that if in fact what he was saying was true ins conceril in in il - th it loe inds have fallen off the wagon or muy - mav have started drinking agan
i so my concern was how that would affect the operation of the
() vessel
(3) All right Did you think you had any duty or obligation to do something about that?
A Well, yeah, obviously I did because I did And I felt
that that was squarely within my job responsibilities to
investugate that
Q All right And did you investigate it?
A Yes
Q All right And as part of this investigation you called
(II) Captan Pierce and Captain Mihajlovic?
(1-) AYes
(13) Q Now let me ask you Mr O Neill asiked you a question about
(14) calling Captain Mihajlovic and knowing that he was a friend of
is, Captain Hacelwood $s$ and that it cntercd your mind that he would
(161 up - he might tup Captain Hazelwood off Is that why you
(17) called Captain Mihajlovic so he would up off Captain
(18) Hazelwood?
(19) A No, that's not it at all The reason I called Captan (20) Mihajlovic was because l, too, know Mihajlovic very well Like
(21) I say, I weat to school with hum I felt that Captan
(29) Mihajlovic would tell me the truth Part of it was on a
(23) personal level and I felt that on that personal level Captan
(24) Mihajlovic would not do anything that would jeopardize a
shap
(35) or jeopardize any of the operations and I felt like Captan


Mihgjlovic would - would level with me
Q All right What did he tell you specifically as beat you tan recall?
A He told me that he was good friends with Joe, spent a lot of time with him at home and that he was definitely not
drinking and that - that there was no question in his mind
that he was in some sort of aftercare or that he was stull dry
Q All right Now we ll get to Captain Mihajlovic again in a
ininute After talking with Captain Mihajlovic and Captain
(il) Pierce you ve teatified that you went to Baton Rouge?
(12) AYes
(13) Q Why did you go the Baton Rouge?
(14)
run
(15) it went down to Chinquu Grande and back and I knew that would
(16) be the next $\mathrm{U} S$ port that it would be an $I$ went there
(17) because of what I heard and I wanted to ask Captan

Hazelwood
(ly) about these allegations and make him -
(19) QAll right Now -
(ro) A-make him aware that these had been presented to me
(1) Q When you mul with Captain Haculwood did you ask him if hu
(--) had been drinking or if these allegations from Shaw were true?
(23) A I told Captain Hazelwood what the allegations were, Just
as
(24) Mr Shaw had told me and Captan Hazelwood sand that that
(23) basically it was all fabricated, it was not true

1) $Q$ What did he say? Don tiell us basically If you cancall any spectfics
A I can't really recall what he sand but I know I was verv comfortable with the fact that he was telling me the truth and
(s) that what Jım Shaw had told me was basically not true I felt comfortable with that as I left the vessel some six or seven hours later
Q Did you spend six or seven hours on the vessel?
A Yes
Q And you ve already testified as to what you didn 1 ask
What was the purpose of staying on the vessel for six or seven hours?
A Well I probably talked to the chief engineer chief mate Probably ate lunch on the ship Probably talked to some of unlicensed crew members I can't recall specifically what any
(16) of the sssues were but I probably saw most of the people on the ship dunging that tume
Q Captain Sheehy is it realistic your view in 1985 or 86 whenever this happened is it realistic or was it realisitic in your view to expect that if there had been a drinking problem with Captain Hazelwood on board that ship that somebody on board the ship would have told you?
A I thunk that rumors hke that always fly pretty fast yes Q All right Now you came back after this and I believe you testufied you met with Mr Dwight Koops?

Vol 162522
A Yes
Q Let me ask you first before you get into that Mr Koops was at that time the gulf coast fleet manager he had by that lime taken over Mr Tompkıns job?
A Yes
Q Matter of fact he had stepped in about a month after you gol in as port caplain? Two months?
A Little longer than that yeah couple months
Q Did you tell Mr Koops whal you whre invasilgating and what your conclusion was?
A Yes I pretty much discussed everything with him I
beheve that Jim Shaw came in and sat in with us when I had
that discussion with Koops I can't remember for sure, but I think that Jım Shaw came m, $\mathbf{t 0 0}$, and added whatever he rett
) appropriate
(16) Q What was that?
(I7) A He basically, when we got done, he sand that he was
(18) comfortable with what - you know what we bad done
(19) Q All right Did you later hear on this issue? Did you
(20) later hear again from Captain Mihajlovic?
(21) A Yes, somewhere along the way, and I can't remember exactly
(22) what point in tume it was if it might have been before I went
23) over to Baton Rouge - as a matter of fact I thank it was
4) captann -
(25) Q But it was after the Shaw - after you called Mihajlovic?
(") A After the Shaw report after 1 called Mihajlovic but
( ) think prior to me going over to the vessel Captan Mihajlovic
is called me back and I beleve that Captann Mihajlovic was on the

Fxxon San Francisco at the time and that they were anchored
(s) together when they left the dock in Baton Rouge and they went
(6) down they were both anchored in Chinqua Grande wantung
to -
(7) Q Excuse me just a minute Could you tell the ladies and Eunilemen of the fury what Chiriqui Grande is?
A That's the port they loaded down in Panama It's about a
five dav trip five and a half day trip and the shaps wait in
this lagoon to go and load from a pipeline down there
Q Sorry for the interruption They were together there near
the lagoon in Panama Goahlad
A They were probably - might have been withn a half a mile
of each other actually But Captan Mihajlovic told me he
(16) went over to Captan Hazelwood's ship and searched through has
(I7) room and that he felt that everything be had told me over the
(18) phone still held and that there was - that he found no alcohol
(19) in Captann Hazelwood 8 room
(20) Q All right Did vou pass that along that information
(a) along?

1-1 A Yes Mr Kuops and I discussed every aspect of all this
(23) Q All right Now and I believe you ve testufied and made it
clear but let me ask you so that it is cluar After this ume
that you got this report and did this investigation did you

## Vol 162524

receive any report concerming Capiain Hazelwond drinking?
A I did not ever receive any more reports about Captan
Hazelwnod
Q Did you receive any sort of an indication or a sign that
Caplain Hazelwood was drinking? -
A No
Q - while on the gull soasi?
A Vo Avamatter of fact it was just the contrary
Q All right What dos volu intan by that
A I felt that Captain Hazelwood dad an above average job in
the profescional and techmical aspects of being a ship master
(12) You know, over the years he had - he maybe had some problems
(13) with being too outspoken with management or perhaps being
(14) critical of some of the policies or something hike that, but he
(15) was always as far as the professional and technical
aspects of
(16) running a ship, I felt that he was above average - matter of
(17) fact considerably above average and that was always what
my
(II) input was an the rating process and Mr Koops and I
discussed
(19) that before when we did the ratuggs, and it was - it was told
(20) to me that most of managemeat recognized Joe's
professional
(21) abulity but - but be needed to polish his image a little bit
22) so to speak
(23) Q And that image was his corporate image?
(24) A Or lack of
(25) Q Right And is that your undersianding of why he was ranked

## Vol $16 \quad 2525$

() 35th out of 37 in 1986?

A Yeah I - I didn't really recall that tull I saw this
sheet they gave me here but I knew it was down there
somewhere '86 and then it went up - well by '88 quite a
bit, but yes, that was - that was my understanding
Q As a matter of faci Captain Sheehy did you recommend in your suggested ranking that he be ranked higher than that in 19867
A The - my recollection of when Mr Koops asked me to rank
(10) the masters he asked meto give ham a peaciled last of the -
in that year, I thunk there were 29 and I gave hum that list
and he says well, we're going to the ranking session where
would typucally meet with the other managers at his level and
(14) also the president, Mr Larossa, and that be would take my lust
(15) into consuderation, and that they would have to work out a (6) senatum that was agreeable to all partues there

A few days passed, four or five, maybe, and Mr Koops then came back to me with my penciled list and told me that it was
(19) exactly as I had given to him other than that he had taken

Captain Hazelwood's aame he had a circle aruund it and it was
(?) put from maybe the - oh the top 25 percent or top $30^{*}$ percent
( - ) down to - I can't remember how far down there and he said that where I had him would not fly with the other managers
Q You had rankid him withoul rugard to his percuplion by
other managers right?

Vul 162536
A I suppose that would be furr to aus
Q Now Captain did you try to pul somu surt ol while wash on
this rupurt that you zol trom Jion Shau in your investigation ol
11)

A Whate wash'
Q Yeah Sweep il under the rug?
A No I-mitally I felt because of my personal knowiedge with Jim both th the office and on the ships that you know
was prone to grossly exaggerating thags, whether it be operationally on a vessel or personal matters that once he had
(ll) given me enough information about what be was trying to do and
") that did take sume conxiag I vaid well Jom let bietake the
(13) lead on this assue I Il investogate at as I see fit and I
it don iteally thank that - that yua should be aivolved with it is, anymore because this is a touchy and a confidential matter and
(10) that I certanaly didn't want Captan Hazelwood's authority
(17) undermined by these rumors beang spread further by somebody in
rly the office mithout snvestigation
(iv) But I never - I actually encouraged Jim to tell me all he (30) knew about it and I never discouraged him from going directly
" to Mr Koups but I told ham be shouldn't be telling the
1 , secretaries or ever listen to them in the hall
(-3) Q Why did you not ash quastions ol Caplain Hasclwood during
(4) the puriod of - from 1985 summer ol 85 to late apring or ( ' summur ol 1987 why didn 1 you go up and ash hun about whether
() he was drinking?
(2) A Well the knowledge that I had of Captain Hazelwood's
rehabilitation was that - that number one that he self
identified and it was voluntary, that there were no performance
(s) problems that dictated he go to it so it was strictly
() voluntary And number two that it was - like any other
medical records that it should have been confidentual, that
situation
Q Let me stop you there for a second Did you know what his
wi diagnosis was in fact?
(II) A In fact, I dud not know what his diagnosis was I had an
(12) Idea I made an assumption When Captan Pierce told me he
(13) had been in alcohol rehab, I assumed that he was dragnosed as
(14) an alcoholec
(15) So you know, getting back to your question, I felt that
(16) because Captan Hazelwood had self identufied before and It was
(17) a confidential matter, that the operation of the ship would (18) best be served by me doing my job of watching for operational
(1) problems or operational concerns or anything that would affect
(z) or compromise that but I saw no need to breach this
(21) confidentaglaty, to query Captan Hazelwood about
something
(22) that could have been a touchy matter that should have been
(23) reserved for fewer high level people and physicians I saw -
(.4) there were $n o$ incidents that would have prompted me to
launch
(nsi into anythung like that other than Mr Shaw's ancudent

Vol 162528
(1) QAll right And when Mr O Nell ashed you did you do () anything any different other than the Shaw inveatigation, was (i) thuru cvar a time when you were called upon to do anything?
(4) A No There - I never had any reason to do anything (5) dufferent with Captain Hazelwood 1 believe that in my mind 1
(0) was aware of his situation
(7) Q Did you watch hım?
(8) A Yes I had that awareness in my mind I tred my best to
(9) visit him as much as I could I thunk it might have been a
(10) little bit more than other shaps I'm not sure I couldn't
(II) say that specifically, but I think it might have been a little
(12) bit more I had seen Captasn Hazelwood on quite a number
of
(1) occasiuns both on the ships and in other functions
(14) I know one tume I drove hum to the airport from Texas
"19 City All this tame I never saw any signs of - of any
(10) recidivism
(17) Q All right I have - 1 have one other hitle area of
(18) questions and then I m through
(19) When Caplain Hazelwood was transferred to the - to the
(30) Exxon Valdez let me just ask you straight out did you want to
(21) get rid of him?
(?) A No 1 - and to me I had no desire to move Captain
(23) Hazelwood The issue of transfernigg him was - was initiated
( 4) hv Captan Martineau He called and told me that Captan Deppe
is) was cuming into the office I beheve from the Exxon Valdez

Vol 162529
i) and that he needed somebody that would be qualified for that
2) ship or that would fit in well and Captain Hazeiwood had y00
(1) know experience on the North Slope with his big ship Prance
(4) William Sound pilotage lot of experience runnang in the heavy
(5) Gulf of Alaska weather so it was a very natural thing for (6) Captan Hazelwond to go to the Exxon Valdez Matter of fact
7) Captan Martineau really wanted hum

Q All nght Now when you - when you - excuse me when
Captain Hazelwood was in fact transferred to the Exxon Valde,
in 1987 under whose jurisdiction did he come as far as fleet
offices port captains et ceters?
A Well typically with the captans myself and Martineau would work the details of the assignments but they would be
(14) fully discussed and it would be under the auspices of the
fleet
(1s) manager
QI m sorry let me interrupt you because that s not the question lintended to ask
As far as watching Captain Hazelwood or as people have used the word monitoring under whose jurisdiction would Captain
Hazelwood come when he transferred to the Exxon Valdez?
A When he was transferred to the Fxxon Valdez he would
have
( 2) come under Harvey Borgen's jurisdiction
Q And where was Harvey Borgen?
A Harvey Borgen was the west coast fleet manager
Q That was in Benecia?

Vol 162530
A Benecia
Q And when that occurred you were in the gulf coast in
Baytown Texas weren $t$ you?
A Yes
Q You stayed in Baytown Texas from that time to the tima
you went back to sea?
A Yes
Q And when you went back to sea was when?
A The winter of 88
Q And what ship did you sail on?
A The Exxon Baytown
Q All right Did you have any occasion or any opportunity to
ask or learn about any monitoning that was done after Captain
Hazelwood left you?
A After Captan Hazelwood left me, I really had no occasion
to learn of any monitoring I made the assumption that
Captan
Martineau and Mr Borgen knew the issues
Q Why did you think - why did you make the assumption that
Captain Martineau knew?
A Well I made the assumption that Captan Martineau knew because he asked me if Joe was drinking anymore
MR SANDERS Could I have just a moment Your Honor?
No further questions Your Honor
THE COURT Redirect Mr O Neill?
MR O NEILL Thank you Judge

Vol 16 2931
RECROSS EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM SHEEHY
BY MR O NEILL
Q With regard to all of this taik about Captain Hazeiwood
would it be fair to say that you re not aware of one piece of
paper in the entire world that reflects any monitoring of
Captain Hazelwood?
A Any monitonng regarding -
Q Alcohol?
A Alcohol? As far as the paperwork on that I would not have
(10) the opportuaty to see that I would not be privy to that
(1)

111
1121
(14)
(15)

161
(17)
(18)
(19)
(20)
(21)

221
(23) ( 941
151

A Well reallv one step removed

## Vol $16 \quad 2532$

Q One step removed And you were on notice of the fact il was your opinion that the man suffered from the disease of alcoholism" At that point in time that was your opinion?
That sa correct statement isn $t t^{\text {p }}$
A Oh I assume that he had been diagnosed as an alcohohc because he had been to a rehahilitation program
$Q$ And you knew that alcoholics could cause a lot of problems
tor you? You testified to that a couple minutes ago?
AI knew that do alcoholic could cause a problem of he resumed dranking yes
Q That he could cause a problem for the vessel that he was in charge of?
A He could, yes
$Q$ And the environment surrounding the vessel?
A Whatever associated with it, yes
Q Now let s talk for a minute about - is this the picture of the joint? I never -
MR SANDERS Now it sajoint?
MR O NEILL I have a real good question about it I want to ask - I don I like It when peopie take potshots at me
BYMR O NEILL
Q is this area right here like - you see what I mpointing to ${ }^{7}$ Is this like where you pick up your macaront and cheese?
Itisn $t$ is at?

Vol $16 \quad 2533$
A That's a waitress station there
Qlt sabar 18n lit?
A Yeah
Q And there is a cocktall lounge isn $t$ it?
A I don't know The people conduct all kinds OF business in
that area
Q I understand that and you did too and you had a beer
when you were conducting businuss with Caplain Hazelwood didn $t$ you?
A I don't beleve I had a beer
Q So he swrong and you ru right?
AYes
Q And you - right here is where you xat where these people are stling?
A Yes
Q Right next to this bar?
AYes
Q And you were careful when you referred to the watress as a
wattress When I go to a place likc this I refer to her as a
cockial watress Have you ever heard that expression?
A Jeez I don't know I might have
(.a) Q You knew did you not sir when you sat down right nexito
(`3) this bar right here with Captain Hactiwood that he had uas
(-4) come out ol alcohol rahabilitation didn ( you)
(s) AYes

## Vol 162534

(1) $\mathbf{Q}$ Would you agree with me that that is a rulatively
(?) insensitive thing lor you to do?
(3) A Not at all Not at ull
(d) Q Okay That sfinc
(s) A You have to remember Captan Hazelwoud was beang dssigned
(6) as master of a merchant vessel the next day I would have had
7. a lot of alarm if he would becomeskitush over siting in a bar He was going to take command of the vessel be on has own At that point he - I felt that if he had any problem
(10) with that it might just as well come out un the open now I
(II) don't think be ded
(I-) Q So your approach to stansitivity with regard to this man who
113) had just goltun out ot an alcohol rehabibitation program was to

IIs bring him into a bar and lust him'
"lsi A I didn't bring ham unte the bar
1161 Q Could have mil ham in a confurcnuc room or hotcl room'
(17) A Well I could bave but the fact of the mutter was as soon
isi as 1 talked to Captan liazelwood he informed me that the
||y) meeting was nut necessary because John Tompkins had already
( 0 ) covered the - the subject matter that he wanted to cover with
( 1 ) him and that we had no reason to meet
(2) Q Okay I have a litile problem with that because Captan
(a) Hazelwood when he testified here under oath testilied that he
(-4) met with you first and with Tompkins second Now who s
(25) rught? Or is anybody right?

## A Well one of us has to be right

Q That s right Now you talk about this being confidental
and when I was talking with you we - we ran over a list of
names who knew about it Pierce Koops and Martineau and you
and then in hastening to your testimony and response to the
Exxon lawyers we add Mihajlovic to that he knows about it right?
A He probably knew about it more on a human or personal sense
tol-because they were neighbors
(10) Q You knew about it on a professional basis?
(II) A I knew about it more on a personal bass because I was
( 19 ) friends with Captain Pierce
(13) $Q$ And the other person who had nouce of this that you know
(14) about it - now I ve got it up to five we know that Jim Shaw
(IS) had notuce of it too don twe?
(16) A I don't think Jum Shaw had any real notice of it I thunk
(17) he was just speculating like he so often did
(18) Q Didn I Jum Shaw tell you that Joe had quote fallen off
(19) the wagon?
(20) A He may have sard that but I don't thmik that he had any (-I) detals regarding Captain Hazelwood's rehab or bow the company
(.2) had dealt with that

131 Q And we tall about Andy Martineau you ve now said that Andy
(14) Martıneau - you assume that Andy Martineau s bosa Borgen
(2S) Lnew about it?

## Vol 162536

## A Yes

Q So everybody we - have you Mihajlovic Koops Martineau
Shaw Borgin all knew about this problem is that a correct stalcment?
A They all knew about it at different levels I would say the level that Martineau and Shaw knew about at was purely based on rumor or sketchy information that they may have picked
up at the water cooler or something I don't know
Q You mentioned in response to the Exxon lawyer's questiona
(10) that you had received some training by the tompany with
regard
(II) to alcoholism?

## A Yes

Q Did you see a movie?
A No it was I think almost every year the senior officers took a - a day long course on adentufication of substance abuse alcohol abuse
Q Yeah bul did you ever see a movic on it?
A I may have - a movie moy have been part of one of those courses
Q Do you recall what the name of the movie was?
A Yes
Q What is the name of the movie?
A Everything Looks So Normal
(24) Q I m sorry I didn i hear you
(25) A Everything Laoks So Normal
$\qquad$

Q And vou saw this movic Everything Looks So Normal and vou
| knew that alcoholics hide their drinking didn : you? At the time you talked with Captan Hazelwood vou knew that alcoholics hide their problems didn $t$ you?
A Some alcoholics do
Q And at the time you met with Captain Hazelwood knowing that alcoholics hide their problems and having seen the movie Everything Looks So Normal you disregarded Mr Shaw who had
(a) no reason to he and you took Captain Hazelwood s version of the story?
A I didn't I dadn't
MR SANDERS Object to that
THE WITNESS I didn
THE COURT Mr Sheehy
MR SANDERS Object to that Mischaracteri/ss the
testimony evidence and his tesumony with regard to Mr Shaw
MR O NEILL I don think it does
THE COURT I think it was pretty close to the line
Try the question again
BY MR O NEILL
Q At the time you met with Captain Hazelwood you d seen the movie Everything Looks So Normal you knew that alcoholics hide their problems you d gotten a report from Mr Shaw about drinking that sall correct isn itt?
A That movie probably spent just as much time talking
about

Vol $16 \quad 2530$
"ll THE WITNESS Well mv testimonvabout being told to
' ' monitor was that I undcritood that to he a hasic part of my
12, joh I cannot rucall spccilsally ol discussing that with

1) Mr Koups hul Ifal lihe he prohahlv didicll me hut Ifusi
(s) don I remember
(6) BYMR O NEILL
(7) Q You don (know)
(8) A I don't recall ham telling me that
(9) Q And indeed as you st here today you d sort of like to
(10) have it both ways wouldn : you? You d like to have it so that
(11) you mentored him but vou d like to have it so that you didn I
(12) monitor him so he wouldn $t$ be an alcoholic you $d$ like to have
(13) it both ways?
(14) MR SANDERS Objection
(IS) MR CHALOS Objection
(16) THE WITNESS I don $t$ understand that at all
(17) MR O NEILL I have onc more question
(18) THE COURT I If allow the question and the answer

BY MR O NEILL
Q lan that right?
A No that's not night
(י) MR O NEILL Well I won I even askanymore
(23) questions
(14) THE COURT Thank you Captain you may step down
(5) Call your next witness

```
                Vol 16 2538
alcoholics crying out for help as it did talking about
alcobolics hiding it I don't thunk that - that alcoholics
hidung it was any more specific to Captann Hazelwood than -
than the normal averages And that's not correct that I
ignored the Shaw report
Q At the end of your testimony I wrole down what you said
but you said in response to your activities a fter the Shaw
report you said I never had any rwason to do anvihing
different with regard to Captain Hazelwood That was in
response to Mr Sanders questions
A I sand that I never had any reasuns to - for macreased
alarm or increased - I never saw any problems was what !
Mr Sanders I saw no -
    Q I wrote it down says I never had any reason to do anything
    different with Captain Hazelwood?
    A I think I said I didn't ever have any problems with Captann
    Hazelwood
    Q And you were never told to montor Captan Hazelwood
    weren : you - you were never told to monitor him?
    MR SANDERS Objection This has been asked and
    answered
    MR O NEILL HL rased the question again I mabout
    done I II-
    THE COURT Oncl more and then we re through with it
    MR O NEILL Well Ican-
```


## Vol 162540

(1) MR O NEILL Plainiffs call Paul Myers as an adverse
(2) Witness
(3) THECLERK Would you raise your right hand sir
(4) (The Winness Is Sworn)
(s) THECLERK Please be seated For the record sir
state your full name your address and spell your last name
THE WITNESS My name is Paul Myers M YERS l
live at 219 Roy Sircet in Houston Tuxas
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF PAUL MYERS (Live)
BYMR O NEILL
Q How art you sir'
A Fine Thank you
Q Tell us who you are if you would?
A My name 45 Paul Myers
Q And where do you work?
A I live - work for Sea River Mantame formerly Fxxon
(I7) Shupping Company
(18) Q And when did you first go to work for any member of the
(19) Exxon family of companies?

A May 25th 1970
Q And from 1970 to today have you worked for one Exxon
entuty or another ${ }^{7}$
A Yes sir
Q Luts - to put it in contuxt why you re here what was
your job in 19877

## Vol 162541

A I finushed ap a job in San Diego Caluforma as
(2) supernatendent engineer durng the construction of the

## Exxon

(3) Long Beach and Exxon Valdez And about mid year I was
(4) assigned to the west coast fleet office in Benecid

## Calforma,

(5) as port engineer
(6) Q Did you supervise the construclion of the Exxon Valdez?
(7) A I was in charge of the mspection team
(8) Q And were there captains that were involved in the
construction of - what is it - the Valdez and the Long
Beach? Were there captams assigned to the construction of
(II) those vesaels?
(12) A There came a period of tume, about May 1986 when you got to
(13) the point in construction where you were doing significant
(14) amount of operational testing At that point in tume officers
(1s) and some of them were captans were brought down to the
(16) shipyard number one, to get - to - I guess you'd call it
(17) on the-job trannig to famila
as
(18) well as to participate in the work intensive effort of
(I), operational testing
(ro) $Q$ When you finished working with regard to the building of
( 1 these ships then you were assigned to where?
(2) A The west coast fleet office in Benecia Califorma *
(23) Q And you were the - the what?
(-4) A Port enganeer
(.5) Q Port enganeer?

## Vol 16 2942

A Yes sir
Q And then you cvantually husamb ship group toordinator?
A Yes sur
Q And your boss was Harvey Borgın'
A Yes, sir
Q And Caplain Hastlwood was the masicr of the Exxon Valduz
when you became the ship group coordinator?
A That is currect
Q And you became Capiain Harclwond s supervisor did vou not?
A That is correct
Q You kept notebooks with regard to your dultes?
AYes sar
Q is that a correct slatumunt? And at some porntaflurith
grounding of the Exxon Valduf you inirusicd thosu notebooks
your personal lawyur?
A Yes sir
Q And after some litigation the nolebooks were produced in discovery that sa correct statement?
A I belseve it is
1 Q And you had a notebook that you kept generally up to about the ume of the groundint?
A Yes sar
Q And you had a wocond nothhosh that vou cyscnisally startiod
al or about a day or two after the frounding?

A Yes sir
Q And immediately after the grounding you received a call
from Captain Hazelwood?
ANosir
Q Okay What was the first - did you call Caplain
Hazelwood?
A Yes, sir
Q So you called Captain Hazelwood on the vessel and you
talked to him?
A Yes, sir
Q And did you keep notes of that conversation?
A Yes, sir
Q And you kept the notes in your notebook?
A Yes, sur
Q And would it be fart to say and I ve got it up on the
montor you ve got a montor there if you want to - can you
see that?
A Yes, sir
Q That this is the copy of your notes of that telephone
converation?
A That's correct
Q And in taking these notes you tried to be accurate?
(23) A Is that a question or a statement?
(24) Q Yes sar it is
(25) A When I was on the telephone with Captan Hazelwood I kept

## Vol $16 \quad 2544$

notes on a - what you might call these sucky things post it notes and by the tume the conversation was over they were
all
over the katchen table
Q So -
A And this is transcribed from them not necessarily in the order that it was actuaily spoken
Q Bul these subjects were discussed?
A Yes
Q And at least with regard to the entries for each of these
(10) subjects you tried to be accurate?
(il) A Yes sir
(1-) Q And Captain Hazelwood reported to you - well you spoke to
(13) ham pursonally?
(14) A Yes sir
(15) Q And let s just take a section of this if we can We Il do
(16) it in parts
(17) A Ob, now I can see it
(18) Q Just stich with me and III help you out a latte bil it
(19) says here right here where the arrow is spoke to Joe
(20) Hazelwood do you see that?
(-1) A Yes sir
(92) Q And hu told you that he was hung up aground?
(23) A Yes sir
(4) Q On Blıgh Ruc
(.s) AYes
$\qquad$

Q And it savs here zig forice third mate Joe just went below do you see that? AYes
Q Is that what he told you?
A Yes sur
Q And savs Joe just went below to do paperwork Is that what he told you?

## A That's correct

Q And Joe my fault I $m$ the blame and then I can 1 read that
A Nenther can I
Q With regard to Joe my fault I m the blame is that what Captan Hazelwood told you?
A Yes sir He indicated that he'd just gone down below to do paperwork when this happened and my ampression was the
(is) third mate made an error and he said he should have been n the
bndge
Q Thank you And there is a comment right here concerned
about stability?
AYes sir

1) Q Is that a comment he made to you?
) A Yes sar
Q And what is the should keep yap shut?
A At one point in time he indicated that he perhaps had said
(2S) too much and perhaps needs a lawyer

## Vol 162546

Q Okay And did he tell you that he thanks he can get it off?
A That was really the last thing that was said and certanily
an retrospect that was a - from where I'm standing a
pleasant way of ending the conversation There was nothat
6) was the last thing be said it was don't worry we'll get it off it's not the end of the world type that was the last thing he sand before we hung up
Q Have you ever heard the expression you can lchange the written word?
A No I haven't
Q Your notes at least reflect the fact that he sand thinks
he can get it off do you see that?
AYes
Q And then he also said right below that after departure
programming up to full speed do you see that?

## AYes

$Q$ Is that what he told you?
A I had asked how fast were you going and his response
were - was that we were programming up so I knew the shap
had
(21) to be going more than 55 rpm

Q And you transeribed these notes at some later point to
start your second notebook?
AYes sar
Q And with regard in your transcription the second time is

It fair to sav that the transuriplion of vour notes the second
lime is ussunialliv - vou had lime lo rullucl and the entries
arc chucntially the same'
$\therefore$ A With one exception I think I wrote down twice that
Captann
Hazelwood mentioned the - the third mate twice something
about I can't let the third mate take all this by humself I'm partially to blame something to that effect
Q Doesn isay at least in your notes I mpartally to blame
does he?
A No-
Q He savs my fault I m the blame?
A Yeah there's another entry lower somewhere as well Q Okay My fault
A My fault can't pin on - let 5 see can't pin on thard
mate normal operation
Q Says mv fault can ipin on third mate normal operation
should heep yap shut?
A Um hum
Q Okay And on both of those eniries there is an indication
that he was - think he can get 11 off"
A Those were the words that I wrote down and I just transcribed as I said
Q Now you talked to him over the phone?
A That's correct
Q And how did he sound?

Vol 162948
A Just as we're talking now
Q Okay
A Calm
Q I want to play another conversation that he had at about

Q I want to play another conversation that he had at about
the same time and ask you whether the tone intonation pacing
speech style is the same as when he talked to you okay?
A Yes sir
MR O NEILL Can you play that?
(Audiotape Played)
BY MR O NEILL
Q Can you compart his tone intonation pace diction and the phone call with you and what we just heard there?
A They sound completely different
Q Thank you You were of the view that the grounding
wouldn t have happened if Captain Hazelwood would have
been on
(6) the bridge aren tyou?

A Yes sir
Q You became Captain Hazelwood s supervisor in early 1988?
A Took effect March lst 1988 but I was prepanng for it in
lanuary and February
Q And would it bc lair to say that you got bad vibes from
Captain Hazelwond?
A Yes sir
Q And you thought that there might be a problem down the road
(ר9) with regard to Captain Harelwond because of these bad vibes?

Vol 162549
(1) A Once the - as I met Captan Hazelwood sometume in the (?) summer or fall of 1988 in my capacity as port engineer on the
(3) Exxon Valdez, and dunig the period of time from then up untul
(4) I think my February vasit I found hum to be very iaterested in
s) the shup and very knowledgeable And at that point in time
(6) which is after the anoouncement of the new organzation I felt
7) that he was somewhat put off by the fact that Number one 1
(8) have an engneering background number two 1 am from outside
(9) of then Exxon Shuppang Company, I'm an outsider, and number
(i0) three, I was in a peer position and now I'm going to be in a (II) supervisory position
(12) Q But all of that being taken into consideration you ve got
(13) these bad vibes and they were sufficient enough to where you
(14) went to Mr Borgen your boss to discuss the subject the bad
(IS) vibes subject with him?
(16) A That is correct

1171 Q As Clint Eastwood would say vou wanicd to discuss an I attilude problem"
1191 A Oh this was a concern that was dascussed with the other
or ship group coordinators av well as Mr Borgen and though
I this was the highest level if you will there was some of
thes - I could feel some of this from some of the other masters but it wasn't as extreme
4) Q And Mr Borgen told vou that Captain Ha/clwood had gone

I through alcohol rehabilitation?

## Vol 162550

I A Dunng the conversation when I related what I just related
, to you he indicated that - or told me that Captan Hazelwood
(7) had undergone sume sort of rehabintation relative to ulcohol

41 as well as some emotunal concerns
Si Q Okay Now I mintereat in the way you just put that
it Because you used the words indicated and told
A Um hum
Q He whispered it to you didn ithe?
A Well the door - actually when I went into his office and started speaking to hum the door was open and when he got
the point where he discussed thas he looked at the door
because it is a confidentual matter and spoke in a low voice
Q He whispered it didn the?
A Spoke sa a low virce
Q Whose in im is whispurad?
AI-I ve used that term
Q So we have iwo lull grown Exxun 九xatulives whispuring aboul
( (8) alcohol rehabilitation?
A I wasn't whispenng
QHc was?
; A He spoke in a low voice
$1^{1}$ ) Q And you may have had one othur discussion with Mr Borgen
(23) about Hazelwood and drinking is that right?
(4) A About actual drinking'
(-S) Q Yeah
i) A I don't think the discussion had to do with actual () drunking
(3) $Q$ In the whole tume between the tume vou became member of the
(4) management team and the time of the grounding how many
(5) discussions did you have with Harvey Borgen aboul Joe Hazelwood
(6) and alcohol drinking?
(7) A I would montor Captain Hazelwood and I would come back to
$\rightarrow$ Hr Morgen each tume I visited the shup, and in essence report
(9) to him my observations so that he was aware of them If that's
(10) what you're referring to
(11) Q My - did you come back repeatedly and aay to Harvey
(12) Borgen I checked on Joe and he asn I drinking? You didn $t$ do
(13) that did you?
(14) A Not in those words, no, sir
(15) Q You - your underatanding was that Captain Hazelwood was
(16) alcohol dependent?
(17) A That is correct
(18) Q And he couldn idrink?
(|y) A Or if he did he would be - he would be addicted to it
$1^{1201}$ yes
(I) Q And he had emotional problems?
(22) A Yes
(7) $Q$ And he was supposed to abstain from drinking whether on or
(24) off duty? That a a correct statement?
(2) A Well if you - yeab if you're an alcoholic in essence

## Vol 162552

(I) you have to abstand
(1 Q Okay And you - let s - do you know of anybody clse who
(7) was montoring him other than you or Harvey Borgen? You don 1
(4) do you?
(5) $A$ No, sir
16) Q And you didn idocument any of the monitoning did you?
(7) A There wasn't really anything to document
(8) Q Okay We il come to that in just a minute But there is
(9) no document is there?
(10) A Not to my knowledge
(II) Q Not onl plece of paper that you re aware of in the Exxon
(12) Corporation that reflects any monitoring?
(17) ANo sir
(14) Q Okay And you never visited the Exxon Valdez in the Port (ls) of Valder did you?
(16) A Not in the port no
(17) Q And did you ever ask of the Alamar people we had a fellow
(18) from Alamar hure yusterday did you evcrask anybody at Alamar
(19) whether Hazelwood had a reputation for drinking or was
(30) drınking?
(1) A No sir
(1) Q How about anybody at Alyeska did you ash anybody at
(23) Alycska?
(14) A No sar
(25) Q And there wert never any random searches of Hazelwood s
(1) quarters?
(י) A Not when he was master of the Exxon Valdez that I'm aware
(7) of
(4) Q And you never asked anyone at Exxon about past incidents)
(5) A No sir

161 Q And you never asked any other supervisors of the west coast
(7) office about Hazelwood and alcohol did you' Other than

8 . Borgen?
9) A That is correct My understanding of this whole rehab
(10) situation is that the procedures that I have read undicated

III that there'll be no discussion on rehab or the details of it or
(12) any such thing and such as that unless the employee
chooses to
(13) do so humself
(14) Q So it stop secret is that nght?
(1s) A That's my ampression
(16) Q You never told Captain Hazelwood or you never asked Captain
an Hazelwood if he was in treatment Alcoholics Anonvmous how his
(18) recovery was did you?
(19) A No But I did - not in those words but I dad ask Captain
(no) Hazelwood of he had any personal problems and he said no 1
' 1 ) asked him if he had any problems at all and he sand no And I
(22) beheve that Captan Hazeiwood knew that I was talling about
(23) alcohol
4) Q So it s sort of kind of a thing that you d understand or whisper?

## Vol 162554

1) A Well as I saad there's this confidentiality issue about rehab and I didn't feel it appropriate to go down and say well Joe, how's rehab going, how was the last AAA |sic| Meeting I chose not to be a bull in a chana shop but to handle it a little bit differently
Q And in May of 1988 you got a call from Steve Day who told
you that he heard Hazelwood order beer over the ship walkie talkie?
A I did not receive to my recollection a call from Steve Day that addressed that issue There was however a conversation in late May of 1988 where Steve did tell me that
(12) Q There was a call in May of 1988 where Steve Day told you hu
heard Hazeiwood order beer over a ship walkie talkie?
A Not a telephone call no sur, there was a conversation Q Conversation?
A In Mr Day's office where he related that to me
Q Did he tell you he found empty Henry Weinhards bottles on the vessel?
A No sir
Q Did he tell you that the walkie talkie incident had to do
with Henry Weinhards beer?
A No sir
Q Mr Day testilied that he came in and reported this to you did he?
A He - he reported to me that he heard Captann Hazelwood
over the walkie-talkie asking for heer And at that posint in
time I said did you go over and investigate? He said no I
asked him a series of other questions and I can't remember
specificall, what was said but the last question I said is
did you see anybody drinking and he said no
Q So for - does that allow you to wash your hands?
A No I went in to Mr Borgen after this this conversation
and - and spoke to him about the possibility that Captan
Hazelwood maght be dranking
Q And Mr Borgen already knew about $\mathfrak{n}$ didn t he?
A That is correct
Q And you were shocked weren tyou'
A I was sort of surprised that I didn't know about it
Q Everybody knew about It?
MR NEAL Objection
THE COURT Sustaned Jury will disregard that
BYMR O NEILL
Q The word shouked is vour word isn itt?
A Yeah I was surprised Herel am three months on the
job
(0) I find this saformation out go to my boss and he is already
( I) aware of it so veah I was a little surprised
1 Q So woutd it be fair to say that at this point in time you
(23) knew that captain - you were of the view that Captain
(4) Hazelwood was an alcoholic he had to abstain he ordered beer
(25) over a walkie talkie in the Portland shipyard and that you and

| your boss both knew about it? |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  |  |
| A Well when I left the conversation with Mr Borgen my understanding was that he had done - or some sort of investugation was done and there was nothing to tue Captann |  |
| Hazelwood with drinking durnag that incident |  |
| Q So you - |  |
| ptain |  |
| Hazelwood closely |  |
|  | Q And than at some point in time you talhed to Messrs |
| Kimisa and Glowachi ivn 1 that risht? |  |
| A teparately, yev |  |
| Q And did youknow that Mr Kimis was the one that Captain |  |
| Hazelwood was drinking beer with in Portand? |  |
| A No I did not know that |  |
| Q Did you know that Mr Glowacki - at that point in time you wouldn I know that Glowacki was in Valdez drinking before the grounding Did you know that Hazelwood and Glowacki drank |  |
| occasson? |  |
| A Not until the - after the incident |  |
| Q Now Captain Hazelwood said in his testimony we talked at great length about his conversation with you? |  |
| A Whach conversation? |  |
| Q The onc in May or June of 1988) |  |
|  | A I talked to Captan Hazelwond Ithnk in May he called me from the shapyard and in June I was on board the shap for |

## Vol 162556

(I) your boss both knew about il?
i A Well when I left the conversation whth Mr Borgen my understanding was that he had done - or some sort of investigation was done and there was nothing to tue Captan Hazelwood with drinking during that incident
Q So you -
A And one other thing that I would continue to watch

## Captann

(8) Hazelwond closely

Q And thun al some point in time you lalhed to Messrs
101 Kimlis and Glowachi inn 1 that rishi?
"II' A teparately, yev
(1) Q And did you know that Mr Kimtis was the one that Capiain
(13) Hazeiwood was drinking beer with in Portand?
(4) A No I did not know that
(IS) Q Did you know that Mr Glowacki - at that point in time you (16) wouldn I know that Glowackı was in Valdez drinking before the (17) grounding Did you know that Hazelwood and Glowacki drank on
(18) occasion?
(19) A Not untal the - after the incident
(20) Q Now Captain Hazelwood said in his testimony we talked at (21) great length about his conversation with you?
(27) A Which conversation?
(3) Q The onc in May or June of 1988)

A I talked to Captan Hazelwood 1 think in May be called me he

## Vol $16 \quad 2557$

stewardship review and to give hum performance feedback
Q Okay And he says that you and he talked at least at one
point in time in his testimony he said that you and he talked
and he told you that he was drinking beer with Chuck Kimis
back at his apariment?
A That -
MR NEAL Objection to that uniess Mr O Neill
brings out the fact that makes that migleading really
Mr O Neill knows what that story is I Il get to it never
mind I withdraw my objection
THE COURT Thank you sir
MR O NEILL So we can get it clearly in mind
(Portion of video of Caplain Hazelwood played as follows)
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Did Mr Myers discuss this event with you?
A I think it was the subsequent voyage We left Portland loaded, dropped a bunch of people off that had ndden with us
(18) in Long Beach Went to Panama and returned Ithalk it was our last run to Panama
Q And where did the discussion lake place?
A As I recall, Anchorage and San $I$ rancisco
Q And what did he say to you and what did you say to him?
(23) A He was - it was part of a general commentary on how did
('4) thengs go to the yard and, you know it basically was a
i $s$, shakedown voyage for all thas repar work that had been dune

## Vol 162558

[^29]Vol 162559
(1) of the walicie talkie during the - during the conversation?
() A Smmons Tmmons something like that I've forgotten
(3) Q Who was be agan remind me?
(4) A I think he was a ngger foreman He was un charge of the
(5) nggers for the day shift at that tume

Q Did you tell Mr Myers how much beer you drank duning the hockey game?
A I don't thmik specifically I think it was a six pack of
beer and I think we andicated to ham that we finushed at or
drank it
(Portion of video of Captain Hazelwood concluded)
BYMR O NEILL
Q Have you ever seen that before?
A No, sur
Q In the conversation would it be fair to say that he does
say that he related to you the fact that he drank beer with
Kimis back in his apartment?
A Well, that's what he sand, but-
Q That s what he says?
A That's what he said, but -
( i) Q I mgoing to let you-IIl give you a chance Go
(22) A Number one, I never had a conversation with Mr

Leyendecker
(23) in relationship to this and I think Captain Hazelwood is
(34) mistaken because that discussion never took place With
(25) Captan Hazelwood It just didn't take place
$\qquad$
(1) California or I ong Beach I was in there for extended penods
() of tume and I know what to look for and I ensured that evern tume I came on board the ship I got close enough to him to
smell hus breath I talked to him I made myself available to
other members of the crew And I got a number of
unsolicated
6) posituve comments more than I had for anyone else And it
(7) dıdn't -

81 Q Let me ask the question a different way
(9) A Okay
0) Q If we assume Captain Hazelwood s version of the facts
(1) which we all just looked at
(2) MR NEAL Your Honor this is too much Canwe
approach the - approach the side bar?
THE COURT Not at this point Let s see what the
next question is
MR NEAL Then I Il havc to set up the video again
where Mr Hazelwood comes bach and corrects this
parently
Mr O Neill is not going to do that
THE COURT You Il have your chance
MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
BYMR O NEILL
Q If we assume Captain Hazelwood s - That version of Captain
Hazelwood stestimony and I mhappy to admit that there are at
least four versions okay there are four versions two in
which he says that two in which he says the conversation

## Vol 162963

'/) fleet so there was a meeting and Captain Deppe said that be
needed somebodv for the - I think it s the Yorktown that was
working for I think PRI which is a customer of ours and he indicated that - or said that he needed a good ship handler and evervbody's told me that Captan Hazelwood is the best
probably the best ship handler Fxxon Shipping Company had sol
(7) said do you want to take him on that ship It wasn't - it was
(8) moretike looking at the general interest of the company rather
than saying get this guy off my ship
(10) $Q$ Did you suggest that he go to another vessel?
(II) A Other than that conversation no
(1) Q That conversation did you discues that he go to another
vasscl?
A I suggexted that if Mr Deppe wanted him for the

## Yorktown

1s, that would be okay Because of the requirements he had
Q And Captain Deppe didn twant Captain Hazetwood did he?
(17) A No Because he's not politic
(18) Q He sa wise guy?
(19) A Not a wise guy
(ro) Q Now at some point in time you get a report do you not
( 1 ) with regard to a second incident concerning Captain
Hazelwood
( -) in San Francisco Bay concerning Captain Reeder and Mary
(23) Willamson?
(4) A Captain Reeder I - I had a conversation in March of 1989
isi where Steve Day said officers busting Reeder's chops To my

## Vol 162564

knowledge and recollection there was nothing said about
Captain Hazelwood
Q So il s your testimony as you sit here today - well
let 3 see what Steve Day said and then you can deny il not
deny il okay?
A Um hum
(Porion of video of Steve Day plaved as follows)
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q What did you lcll Paul Mycrs?
A from what I recall I-I initiated the conversation went
into Paul's office in Benecia shut the donr and related to
ham
I I essentıally what I've - what I've told you bere what Mary
observed and thought be as - he should know about it
Q Do you recall what if anything Paul Myers waid in response to your report?
A He didn't say very much, from my recollection Vaguely remember some, you know, questions of when, what dey and you
(18) know, but that's about - yeah, that's about all It was very (19) short actually
(70) (Portion of Video of Steve Day concluded)
(1) BYMR O NEILL
( ) Q The Mary Willamson incident is the incident Mr Day had ( 1 ) previously talked about concerning whether Captain
Hazelwood
(24) had been drinking aboard a launch that evening, and here he
(25) reports that he reported it to you or testifies that E reported

## Vol 162565

(I) it to you My question is simply did he?
(2) is
(3) that during that tume frame we had a turbocharger problem and
(4) I'm sure you're aware that the Exxon Valdez was delayed from
(5) the Monday I guess that would be the 13 th through Saturday
(6) the 18 th because of a turbocharger problem and I was dealing
(7) with thas, which I normally wouldn't have done and Steve is 2
8) hot shot engmeer, diesel engmeer and I went into Steve's
room and asked hum some questions about if te could help
me
(10) with the turbocharger or if he had any ideas because 1 had
(11) three different firms, one Sulzer, one our own people and
one
(1-) the turbocharger manufacturer all saying that they were
3) different things, trying to find out which one it was so things were a little tense for me
And Steve was busv and be really didn't have anvthing to
offer and there was a lull in the coaversation and I member
hum saying after that officer's busting Reeder's chops, and someone else came uto the room and I left and got back on the
(19) turbocharger case

Q So just so the record is clear you duny that Mr Day told
you about what we - about Mary Williamson observing Caplain
) Hacelwood in a possibiy incbriaicd stak?
MR NEAL Objection Your Hunor tototal
misquotation of the record

MR NEAL Possibly incbriated state she said she couldn $t$ say that-
THE COURT Mr O Ncill-Mr Nual-I hnew I d do
that sooner or lalur - just late ill a litlic bil wasy
please The jury will dubide for themsclvas what the isstimony
of these various witnesses were
You may continue Mr O Neill
MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
BY MR O NEILL
Q Mary Williamson describes an incident aboard a launch
with - right before the Valdec leaves north to go on the
fateful voyage And she repors it to Mr Day whatever the
characlerization of it is Mr Day hay lusilfied that he
reported both the Williamson incident to you and a heated
conversation between Captain Ha/clwoud and Captein Recdur
which profanily was used Mr Day stestified that he reportud
that to you My quesion for you sir is did he?
A You said Just before the ship left I was on board the ship the 17th overaight to the 18th
Q My question is did Mr Day repor that to you?
A Not that - not that I'm aware of no sir
Q Why would Mr Day lic aboul that if you hnow?
(3) A Certainly on the surface 1 have - I have no explanation on why he would
(25) Q Now knowing what your staic of mind then was with rugard
(1) to Captain Hazelwood and his treatment and his alcoholism and
() the fact that he wouldn t be drinking if indeed Mr Day made
(3) this report to you and you didn $t$ act on it that would be
(4) reckless wouldn $t$ it?
(s) A Well yeah, I think if he sand that to me and I didn't,
(6) yeah, I would be a bad boy, so to speak
(7) Q Reckless?
(8) A No question
(4) Q No question?
(1) A It would have been - it would have been wrong But I do (II) not remember hum saying anything about Captan

Hazelwood 1
(12) don't remember anything about profanty All I remember sayugg
(131 is officer's busting Reeder's chops, and this was old news
(14) MR O NEILL Sir I m not going to argue with you
(15) about it
(16) THE WITNESS Fine
(17) MR O NEILL Okay thank you
(18) THE COURT You may cross examine
(19) MR NEAL Mr Myers I m Jım Neal I represent Exxon
(roi dufendants Let me starn with one of the latter things that
rl Mr O Neill asked you about
(12) CROSS EXAMINATION OF PAUL MYERS
(23) BY MR NEAL
(24) $Q$ He said that you recommended a transfer of Captain
(2s) Hazelwood from the Valdez do you remember that?

## Vol 162568

[^30]$\qquad$
at one time about telling you about the Henry $s$ and that he and
, Mr - chief mate somebody had consumed that six pack back 3) six pack back at the apartment while watching a hockey game do
you remember that?
A Yes sir
Q All nght Did he tell you that shortly within a few
minutes after that Captain Hazelwood conlinued in his
deposition to come back in and sav you know I think I better
correct something I don I belicve I had that conversation or
told Mr Myers that I consumed those beers He didn I show
you
(11) that did he?

A No sir
Q We II try to show that before we conclude this case Now
you said that you understood that Captain Hazelwood was an
alcoholic or alcohol dependent or something like that Where did you get that information?
A That's the impression that I got from the discussion I had with Mr Harvey Borgen I'd say it was in February of 1988 when Harvey bad told me that Joe had undergone some sort of

## rehabilutation for aicohol

Q So you assumed that he had been diagnosed as an aicoholic or alcohol dependent because you were told by Mr Borgen that , he had gone through some sort of alcohol rehabilitation is that correct?
A That is correct

| Vol 162570 |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Q Pardon me? |
|  | A Yes, that is correct |
| (3) | Q And that is all you knew at the lime correct? |
| (4) | A Yes sir |
| (9)(6) | Q All right Have you seen plaintiffs Exhibit Number 10 in |
|  | this case which is a diagnosis of Captain Hazelwood? |
| $\begin{aligned} & (6) \\ & (7) \end{aligned}$ | A No sir |
|  | Q You were not aware that his physician after attending him |
|  | for 28 days diagnosed ham as suffering or having a case of |
|  | dysthymia which is a mild depression we talked about and |
| (11) secondary alcohol abuse episodic you were not aware of that? |  |
| 11) A No s |  |
|  | Q Now you also testified under questioning by Mr O Neill |
|  | that the captain says he thinks he can get it off is that |
| (15) correct? |  |
|  | A That's correct that's correct |
| $177$ | Q That was a conversation that was a part of a converastion |
| (18) you had with Captain Hazelwood somelime after the grounding |  |
| 19 |  |
| (19) that correct? |  |
| (20) A Yes sir |  |
|  | MR NEAL Could you bring that back up that portion |
|  | of Mr Myers notebook Exhibit Number - well Ill give you |
|  | this It doesn t have an exhibit number on tt Matter of |
|  | fact I don t think they were ever introduced into evidence |
|  | but I will give you what I ve got |

## Vol 16 2972

the end of the world but -
Q You didn itake that to mean that he was going to alone try to gul the boat off the roch) A No he had - he had already told me in so many words that
(5) he's concerned about stability He's telling me that half the bottom of the ship is torn away and you got waterin the forepeak of the ballast tanks and if at wasn't supported it would have sank
Q Thank you I II take that off Ithink Thank you
Mr O Neill also - oh 1 m sorry I mgotng to get to that
Mr O Neill also asked you to listin to a conversation that
(1 ) Capiain Hacelwood had with the VTC immediately after the
(13) grounding you remember that?

1141 A Yes sir
(1s) Q And then he asked you to compare that with what you (16) remember of the conversation when you had a conversation with
(17) Captain Hazelwood?
(18) A That's correct
(19) Q All right now let a assume that Captain Hazelwood had that (20) conversation immediately after the grounding something a few (21) minutes 1517 minutes as I remember after madnight on March
(22) 24 When was your conversation with Captain Hazelwood?

31 A Roughly an hour and a half later
( 4) Q An hour and a halflater?
( s) AYeh sar

Vol 162573
Q Would you - would you think that the breumstances under which Captain Hazelwood was talking to the VCR - VCT (sic) and
(3) the eircumstances under which he was talking to you would be considerably different?
A. Yeah, he had to be very upset right after that happened, I would thunk
Q Now you said there were difference in the various things in
the converation Would you believe that the difference in circumstances at the time could account for those differences? A I would think so It's possible
Q Now Mr Myers you ve been employed for - by Exxon for some almoat 24 years now is that correct?
A Yes, sir
Q Would you just because you didn 1 go over this jusi briefly tell us the jobs you had up to 19877
A From 1970 to 1973, I was technical assistant, which was really a traming position From '73 to '77, I was repar superntendent From '77 to '80, I was an operatuons
(19) superntendent From '80 to '82, I was a reparr planner From
(20) '82 to '84, I was superntendent engineer during the
(-1) construction of three vessels in Avondale shipyard for Exxon
(י) Shpping Company and from 84 to '87 I was supernatendent
1.31 engineer in San Diego Califurain during the coastruction of
1 41 the Exxon Valdez and $f \times x$ in $I$ ing Beach
t-S1 Q Now to pass over this quichly and gut to the puint you

## Vol $16 \quad 2574$

joined the weat coast fleet sometime in 1987 as port engineer?
A About mid year yes sir
Q And then you nexi took over the position of ship group coordinator?
AYes sir
Q What vessela did you have - oh by the way did you have
supervisory authorily then ovar curiain vasselg?
A Yes sir
Q What vesyels?
(10) A The Exxon Benecia the Exxon Loug Beach the Exxon North
(II) Slope, and the Exxon Valdez
(12) Q Limit ourselves to the Valdec for a moment what trade was
(13) It in when you beceme ship group coordinator?
(14) A li would take cargo from Valdez Alaska and go to

## Panama

(1s) and come back to Valdez with a stop in I ong Beach where they
116, pack up fuel provisions and upare parts
117) Q Did that type of trade thangt anv during the lime vou wirt
(ly) ship group coordinator'
(191 A Yes sir Toward the end of 1988 the trade changed where
(30) the ship was no longer going to Panama It would come into $\operatorname{San}$
(7) Francisco Bay where the cargo was discharged into a smaller
(2) shup
: 11 Q Ohay Let mu go back for a moment to the - to Captain
(24) Hazelwood You had occasion to meet Captain Hazelwood of (-9) coursc?

A Yes, sir
Q When did you first meet him?
3) A Late summer, early fall of 1987
(4) Q All nght Now from that tume untul February of 1988 when
5) you satd you had occasion to have a conversation with
(6) Mr Borgen did you work with Captain Hazelwood?
(7) A Yes As port engueer, I was uvolved and responsible for
(8) the guaranty admunstration and although the chef engueer was
(9) the person on board coordinating this it had been my practice

## (10) in the past to bning in the captain in these duscussions

(II) because he's responsable for the ship, and I found Captan
(12) Hazelwood more than cooperatuve and more than wilhng to
(13) participate
(14) Q In February, Mr O Neull asked you if you became upset with
(15) Captain Hazelwood or Captain Hazelwood became upset with you
(16) Tell us about that
(I7) A I don't even remember the situation, all I can say is that (18) it was my feelng that he'd found out or it had been

## announced

(19) of the umpending organizational change and he sort of resented,
(20) as I said before, the fact I'm an engineer I'm an outsider and
PII I was a peer and now I'm going to be a supervisor
に $1 \quad Q$ And following your belief that he had some irtitation with
(?) you as you describud you had a conversation with Mr Harvey
(24) Borgen the man you reported to?
(2s) A That's currect

## Vol 162576

Q He told you that Captain Hazelwood had gone through some
2) sort of aicohol rehabilitation from which you assumed that he
(3) was some sort of alcoholic or alcohol dependent?

A That's correct
s) Q From that point on from the time you had the conversation
with Mr Borgen did you consider yourself a monitor of Captain l Hazelwood?
A Yeah when 1 left the - the conversation with Harvey I felt it was my responstbality to watch Captain Hazelwood very
(10) closely
(II) Q Did you all discuss that?
(12) A Yes, but I can't remember the detanls of the conversation
(13) Q Now then did you monitor him?
(14) A Yes, sir
(IS) Q Tell me how you went about thal
(16) A Well I went down to the ship every tume it came to the (17) west coast And I would talk with Captan Hazelwood I would
(is) notice his behavior or I would see how he interacted with other
(19) people I would manage to get close enough to hum where I
(ro) could smeil has breath each time I'd make myself available (21) for you know to other crew members ask them how they were
(22) doing, and by the way, I did get a number of unsolicited
(23) positive comments about him
(24) I asked both chief engueers of he was drinking and they (25) had said no, and I'd also monitor the performance of the ship

```
                        Vol 16 2577
and as we - as is a matter of record that ship with him on
It won the fleet manager's award in 1987 as well as 1988
    QIIl get to that Let s - let s flesh that out a litte
    bst The vessel - where would you board the - where was your
    office during this period of time" Let s statt early }8
    now when you were Captain Hapelwoods supervisor whera
    your office?
    A ln Benecia Califormia
    Q Where would the vessel come t0' You said you d board it
    every tume tt came into port?
    A Rught
    Q You re talking about a Califormia port?
    A Yes sur either be -
    Q Where would it - where would it come to and let s talk
    about the early part of }88\mathrm{ when he wastrading in Panama
    where would tt come to?
    A Long Beach California to pick up fuel and supplies and
    spare parts
    Q And you were in Benecia where is Benecia' In San
    Francisco?
    A Yes Sir
    Q How far is it from Benecia to Long Beach?
    A About what }500\mathrm{ mules
    Q Would you get on a plane and ny down to Long Beach?
    A Yes sar
```

|  | Vol 162578 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) | Q Every time the vessel came in? |
| (2) | A To the best of my recollection yes sir |
| (3) | Q All right and you d board the vessel? |
| (4) | A Yes sar |
| (s) | Q How much time would you spend with Captain Hazelwood? |
| (6) | A I'd say anywhere from two hours to the whoie day |
| (7) | Q Did you ever spend the night with him I don t mean - I |
| (8) | mean on the vessel with him |
| (9) | MR CHALOS I m going to object to that Your Honor |
|  | MR NEAL Iam too I withdraw it |
|  | MR O NEILL That is not what this triel is about |
| (12) | BY MR NEAL |
| (13) | Q Somewhere on this big ship at might were you al one placi |
|  | and Captain Hazelwood another place over the night? |
| (15) | A Yes sir |
|  | MR NEAL Did that straghten tiout all right |
|  | Mr O Neill |
|  | MR O NEILL Yes sir |
|  | MR NEAL Thank you |
| (20) | BY MR NEAL |
|  | Q Did you do this in these ways we talked about now from |
|  | the tume of early 88 untul the grounding? |
|  | A Yes, sir |
|  | Q Captain Hazelwood testified in this case that you mother |
|  | henned him shadowed him I believe he used the name |
|  | ont |

## Vol $16 \quad 2980$

II was going on and he said no and I kanw I asked him a number
i) of other questions and the last thing I can remember asking him
(3) was did you see anybody drinking and his answer was no
(4) Q Now he testified at this trial that he also told you that
(5) Mr Leyendecker had told him that he had investigated had gone
(6) aboard the vessel asked Captain Hazelwood if he was drinking
(7) Caplain Hazelwood said no and thal hu - he Leyendecker told

Mr Day and Mr Day allugedly told you that he saw no sign of
(9) drinhing although hu did sec wome umply heer cans
somewhere on
(10) the vessel
(lll Did Mr Day tell you about Mr Leyendecker sinvestigation
(1) to your recollection?
(13) A No, sir
(14) Q But he did tell you about ordening the beer?
(Is) A Yes sir
(16) Q All right Did you do anything thereafter with respect to
(17) this incident?
(18) A Yes sir
(19) Q What?

A I went down to speak to Mr Borgen
Q You and Mr Borgen have a conversation about this ordering
of bcer?
A Yes alr
Q In substancl what was that conversation?
A Well in substance Harvey related that this had been
$\qquad$

Vol $16 \quad 2581$
(1) looked at and nothing had been found to - to connect Captan
() Hazelwood with drunking any beer and that I would contunue a
(3) close eye on him, meaning Captann Hazelwood

Q So you concluded from this investigation that the matter -
from this conversation that the matter had been investigated?
A Yes, sur
Q And it turned up not to be justified?
A Right
Q Or not to involve drinking by Captain Hazelwood?
A That's correct
Q Now then following this incidunt did you have a
conversation to get with Captain Hazelwood on board the vessel?
(13) A Several conversatsons, yes
(14) Q When was the next tume after - by the way when was -
(15) when did you hear about this Henry s incident we ve referred
(16) to?
(17) A It was the latter part of May 1988
(18) Q When was the next tume you saw Captain Hazelwood?
(19) A It was roughly a month later
(20) Q And where did you see him and under what circumstances?
(r!) A It was un Long Beach and it was the thme of the - what you
inl might call the mid year stewardship review and tume that I
was
('3) going to give some feedback to buth Captain Hazelwood and Chief
(4) Engineer Kimus on the performance of the -
' is Q Was il aboard the Valde,'

## Vol 162582

[^31]॥ INDEX
(2) CONTINUED DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GREGORY COUSINS (Video) 2375
(3) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 2375
(5) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GREGORY COUSINS 2409
(6) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 2409

CROSS EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM SHEEHY (Live)
2472
(9) BY MR O NEILL 2472
(山) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM SHEEHY
2506
(I) BY MR SANDERS 2506
(14) RECROSS EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM SHEEHY 2531
(IS) BY MR O NEILL
(17) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF PAUL MYERS (Live)

2540
(18) BY MR O NEILL 2540
(20) CROSS EXAMINATION OF PAUL MYERS

2567
(21) BY MR NEAL

2567

Vol 162584

| (1) EXHIBIT S |  |
| :--- | :---: |
| (2) 224 and 3551 offered | 2472 |
| (3) 9127 offered | 2515 |
| (A) 9126 offered | 2517 |
| (6) 224 and 3551 recuived | 2472 |
| (7) 9127 received | 2515 |
| (8) 9126 ruclived | 2517 |

(1) STATE OF ALASKA)
() Reporter s Certificate
(3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA)
(6) I Joy S Brauer a Registered Professional
(7) Reporter and Notary Public

DO HERBY CERTIFY
That the foregoing transcript contains a true and
accurate transcription of my shorthand notes of all requested
(II) matters held in the foregoing captioned case
(12) Further that the transcript was prepared by me
(13) or under my direction
(14) DATED this day
(19) of 1994
(1) JOY S BRAUER RPR Notary Public for Alaska
( ) My Commission Expıres 51097

Bene Syatem: Applicaisona
Look-See Concordance Report

UNIQUE WORDS 2,457
Total OcCurrences 12,180
NOISE WORDS 385
TOTAL WORDS IN FILE 42,957

SINGLE FILE CONCORDANCE

## Case sensitive

NOISE WORD LIST(S) NOISE NOI
includes all Text
OCCURRENCES
IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD Ranges @ Bottom of Page

MAXIMUM TRACKED
OCCURRENCE THRESHOLD 50

NUMBER OF WORDS SURPASSING OCCURRENCE THRESHOLD 20

List of Threshold Words
belueve |92]
bridge |61|
Captan 14511
captain [72]
conversation [88]
drinking [74]
Exxon 1651
Hazelwood [384|
ces [63|
Okay 11001
point |79|
port 1611
radar |s||
recall [99|
remember | 471
rught |153|
Shaw (57)
ship (67)
sur (99]
veasel [108]

| -1- |
| :---: |
| 1000111245024 |
| 1017111245025 |
| 11th \|I| 242024 |
| 1200111251612 |
| 1216111251613 |
| 12th \|1| 2420 2S |
| 13th $12 \mid 2418425655$ |
| 17th \|1| 256619 |
| 18th 12\| 25656256619 |
| 1980s \|1| 247418 |
| 19th 14\| 24191824241620 |
| Ist \|11 254819 |

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-24-94 VOLUME 16
Canoorderace by Look-Seerssi
$\frac{-2-}{23 \text { rd }|8| 2402924233}$
$242423 \quad 242712 \quad 242825$
24301424349250524
2dth |3| 24029246910
250525
25th (1) 254020
202 [2] $258223 \quad 25$
$-3-$

35th |11 2525 d
$\frac{-5-}{5-10-97[1] 258522}$
$\frac{-7-}{730[1125131}$
7 th 11124184

- 8-
$800|4| 2375224637$
2513 / 258221

$$
-\mathbf{A}-
$$

A-B 14| 24142241520
$2416 / 241718$
a m 13| 2375224502425
A89-0095 |11 23755
AA |4| 24842424875 // 2502 /8
AAA 11125543
Abaft [2| 238889
abaft |1| 23887
Abeam [1| 2438 /4
abeam \{17) $237720 \quad 23826$
2399 11 2400824011113
172433224389131416
24399244372444 I
24469
dbilities 31 1 24221722
24234
dbilty |4| 24221924
251217252421
able ||2| 2375 || 16
$2388 / 11239762439 / 3$
2444162445242457912
24582224631824683
aboard 191239821240624
2423924242256424
25661025806258125
25827
absence [1] 247624
absolutely ( 3 | 243522
245819
abstam |4| 251| 14255123
2552 I 255524
dhstment ||| $251 / 22$
abuse |3| 2536 16 2570 /l
Academy 11| 247224
academy |3| 2472212325
accelerated 111241216
accept 111245315
accident [1] 249819
accomplish [2] 2443 /4 15
according [2| 243225
249121
account |l| 25739
accuracy 111 237518
accurate [7] 241910
2420 ( 24229 2420162422924234 254322254410258510 accustomed [1] 240410 act [2] 24731425673 acted [1] 2417 I7
actung [2] 248924249016 action [2] 249724256020 actoons [1] 243] 23
activitues (2] 25041425387 acts [4] $240818 \quad 19 \quad 24193$ 242012
actual [2] 25502425511
actuality [1] 24856
add [5] 2427142325094 825356
added [3| 242720247325
$2522 / 4$
addicted [1] 255119
adding [2] 24271524
addition (1] 247021
additronal [2] 241811
241922
address [2] 24711725406
addressed [3] 24241416 255410
admunistration (1) 25758
admission [3] 251511
2517610
admit |2| 256/ 232562 /
admitted |5| 247227
247515251515251711
advanced III 244810
adverse [1] 2540 )
advice [1] 2421 24
advising [1] 24259
affect [2] 2519 I 252719
affected [2] 2463924945
afrad [1] 23893
aft |l| 239623
aftercare [7] 248424
2486 21 248757249719
25022425207
aftermath |1| 246622
afternown |1] 242618
age 11| 241014
Agencies ||| 242421
agencies [1] 242413
agent [1] 23788
agree [2] 2385172534 I
agreeable [1] 252516
agreed |11 2443 I
agreetng [1] 242924
agreement [2] 2438224852 aground 18123901923968 12222459520246016 254422
and 11123826
ands |与| 241719241912
24201824221024237
arport [2] $248217 \quad 2528 \quad 14$
Alamar $1412424 / 32552 / 7$ 18
alarm 16] $24608 \quad 15 \quad 247019$
2125347253812
Alaska [4] 24242025295
257414258521
Alcohol [2] 253189
alcohol [36] 2464 / 247718
24812124851020

2486172424871524
24886192497514
25001025102225114
252318252713253324
253413253616254925
25503182551616
2553723255811256915 20
2223257011257623
alcohole [15] 251114
25173252714253259 253912255125255524
2560262425691521
2576325797
Alcoholics [1] 255317
alcoholics [9] 2532725372
45722253812
alcoholism [4] 25323
25361125601725671
alert (4) 241823,24204
242152498 II
allegation [1] 249725
allegations [8] 2492 S 611
249615212520182223
allegedly [2] $257913 \quad 25808$
alleging |11 24919
allow (2) $253918 \quad 25556$
allowed [1] 24034
alluded [2] 2490824946
alone [2] $245610 \quad 25722$
alter (1] 2438 /4
altogether [1] 24388
Alyeska [3] 23788255222 23
ambiguous [1] 24909
amid (1] 24615
amount (3) 24231824634
2541 14
Anchorage [2] 246422
255721
anchorage [1] 240318
anchored [2] 252346
Andy [6] $250023 \quad 250314$
2504825352324
anew (1) 24513
angle $1101237915 \quad 238617$
238992223909240016
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2402 & 21 & 2458 & 13 & 2469 & 14 & 20\end{array}$
announced [2] 24312
257518
announcement [1] 25496
Anonymous [1] 255317
Answer 1612469192325
2479212424996
answer [18] 238217
24021824082124249
2433212438524706
247981424802223
248692488624912
24942125005253918
25803
answered [2] 249320 , 253821
answers [3] 24701247913 24803
anxiety [1] 24588
anxiousness [1] 245718
Anybody |1] 25799
anybody (111 248818
249125249212253425
25522182225555

Hasc Syskers Applications
2579625803
anymore [4] 24738252615 253021253922
anyway (3) $240112 \quad 241217$ 247025
dnywhere [11 25786
apart (2) 23977258215
apartment |4) 2409225575 25591725693
apologize [3] $2440 \quad 15 \quad 18$ 245116
Apparently 111256117 appear [2] $248016 \quad 2568 \quad 16$ appeared [2] 238525 240015
appears [1] 239118
approach 14124002
253412256113 approached [4] 238421 2387102388182435 I approaches $\{11240320$ approaching 15124031819 2432162324527 appropriate [6] 24212425 $24481621 \quad 25221525542$ approximate [2] 23777 24477
Approximately [3] 237518
24476247622
approximately [12] 237710
2397132124156242718
24311524471819
244814245214246910
approximation |1| 2469 /1
April (I) 24184
area |11| 2377623802
2407222416824248
2440625161922252817
25322325336
areas [2| 246015247016
aren't [3] $2466 \quad 25 \quad 2548 \quad 16$
25625
argue [1] 256714
arm [1] 243112
arrangement [2] 242915 24308
arrangements [1] 249710
arrived [1] 246725
arrow (1) 254419
ascertan [2] $244522 \quad 24622$
ashore [3] 240823250515 23
asking [10] 2391 924308
243816245013245111
25112325551256014
25802
asks [1] 24799
aspect [1] 252322
aspects [4] $248916 \quad 25017$
25241115
assugn [1] 248523
assugned [5] $247618 \quad 25345$
254141021
assugning (1) 25017
assignment [3] 2414810
25075
assignments [1] 252913
assistance [1] 247022
asssstant [1] 257316
associated [2] 25044
253215

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5 24-94 VOLUME 16 (mandence bo 1 mot Seet 561
assume |ISI 239452418 I]
24192224664250417
$2532525352425601 / 14$
25611022256223
257219
assumed 17124778249723
$24 \quad 250416 \quad 252713$
25692125762
Assuming ||| 24083
assuming [1] 23927
assumptron (8) 249710
25041225111518
2527122530161820
ate (11 2521 14
atrium |2| $248314 \quad 15$
attempt [2] 2396924874
attempted [3] $2466 / 2$
25627
attempting [2] 24458
2468 21
attempts |1| 24467
attend [31 2411824756
24875
attended [5] 24102024
2411624123250421
attending (II 25708
attention [7] $2389 / 323979$
1224041119241816 24202
attutude |11 2549 /8
attorneys [1] 2464 1]
Audrotape (1) 25489
August [5] 24191824762
24943250913256215
auspices |1| 252914
authority (4) 246116
$249221 \quad 25261625747$
auto |l0| $238018 \quad 19 \quad 22$
24063581520240723
automatic (1) 2451 21
autopilot |1| $2451 / 8$
available (9) 2419 /I
$242017 \quad 24221024236$
2483424927925614
257620
avenues ||| 249223
average |4| $250115 \quad 23$
$252410 \quad 16 \quad 17$
averages 11125384
avold (4) 2401224387
2439824442
Avondale [1] 257321
award [1] 25772
aware [22| 2401 23242425
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}2430 & 25 & 247778 & 248013\end{array}$
24852225031718
2510212425202025286
2531425519255211
2553225552125654
2566212570811
awareness [3] 24208
24981025288
azumuth [5] 23822 II 15
1923838

- B -
background [3] 2496 II
24981825498
badly (1) 24628
bag (2) 250778
ball 12124972325
ballast |11 25727
bar 11212483671325138
102533216232534814
15256113
barge [1] 24152
bars [1] 250524
base [1] 248719
Based [2] 2391 11 2511 12
based [10 2392524534
249221249323249622
251015 HR-2511 1017
25367
bask |11 2539 ?
basically 191249221
2509252511121252025
252115252217255724
basis [2] 25351011
Baton [6] 249072520 I/
$13142522 \quad 23 \quad 25235$
Bay [2] 2563222574 2/
Baytown [5) 250813
25091325303511
Beach 112 | 2403 /8 25413
1025571825611257324
257410152577172224
2581 21
heam (4| 2388789
244324
bearing [17] 2381/8 23822
$\begin{array}{llll}15 & 19 & 23838 & 16 \\ 2387 & 23\end{array}$
240211152403824053
24371451219244323
bearings [3| 2441 14
24432124
beer [26| 24093 // 24839
102533710255471321
255512425561325574
25584142025596916
25791214258091422
25812 25823
beers 111256910
behavir $1112576 / 8$
behind |11 24422
belabor II 2428 //
behef [4] $245220 \quad 2224871$ 257522
belleved [2] $2408 \quad 16 \quad 251113$ bell (6) 2391 $2022 \quad 23922$
$\begin{array}{lll}12 & 239314 & 243225\end{array}$
Benecta (11] 25292525301
2541422256411257410
$\begin{array}{ll}25778 & 19 \\ 22 & 257919\end{array}$
bent (11 244210
Berging ||| 247119
besides 11125588
beverages (4) 24838
2517325797
biggest |1| 24744
binoculars |1] 2445 II
bit [30] 2379112239523
242122422724265
242721243918244017
2451718245622247324
24741247716248611
24932025101925111
25181525242125255
25281012253116
2544182554525664
256810
25774
blame |5| $2545912 \quad 25477$


## 811

Blank |11 2436 10
Bligh |15| 2377 I| 23802
238314238723240223
$240722 \quad 241610 \quad 12$
24421524441117
24522324556254424
blowup (2) $244016 \quad 245112$
blue I2| 2436 /3 243921
board 11512421524247
245() 21 2521 2122
25562525613256618
25715625759257749
25783258112
boat $121257115 \quad 25723$
book 111243225
Borgen [26] 2529222324
25301725352425363
254242549142024
25502225515812
$2552325538 \quad 2555710$
255622569182225756
242576625802021
boss 1812476 II 250917
25311525352425424
25491425552025561
bothered [31 238625
24021012
bottles |11 255417
boundary |11 24565
bow (3) 23832021245514
Bowditch [1] 24132
boy 11125676
brass III 25154
BRAUER [1] 258521
breach |1| 252720
break $31245019 \quad 251518$
25167
breath I21 25614257620
brief |2| $250922 \quad 251110$
briefly |c| $238821 \quad 240317$
2409224416257315
bright |11 $2379 / 2$
bringing |3| 23991324389
24438
brings [1] 25578
broad |l| 23889
Bruins [1] 255816
building (1] 254120
bulkhead [3] 23853615
bull |l| 25544
bump |l| 23926
bumps 111239017
bunch [2] 25055255717
buoy 14) $237712 \quad 241612$
24373244216
buried (11 2404 I
Busby [29] 23785238118
23822323883415
2399 II 252400820
2401111317241614
2425132437122438913
$\begin{array}{llllll}14 & 16 & 18 & 19 & 2439 & 24435\end{array}$
724441724469
business [5] 2475325041
251815253358
busting [3] $256325 \quad 256517$
$2567 / 3$
busy (5) 2379 / 239818
24032424044256515


.

[^32]$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

$\qquad$




$\qquad$
$\qquad$



$\square$12

\author{

}


[^33]\author{[^34]}


[^35]$\qquad$


$\qquad$


\author{
\author{

}
}


#### Abstract

正



button |1| 24524

- C -
cabin [1] 24089
calculations [1] 2428 I
California [8] 2541 1422
256112573232577812 17
Call (2) 23753253925 call (40) $23858 \quad 12 \quad 238723$ 523892523922024019
1124041624052024248 2426252432162024337
245321245824246020
24617247113247715
249361623249616
251012152521125401 25411625432
525441254812255469 1214258122
calling [6] 2403224584 247291024968251914 calls |1| 2447 13
Calm |i) 25483
calm ||| 245720
calmest |11 2571 21
camera |2| 23772244010
cans |l| 25809
capacity (2) 2414925492
Cape [1] 24255
captains (10) 24171
2430101125056250918
25291112254181015
captioned III 2585 II
car |11 248210
cardunal [2| $244317 \quad 19$
careful $\{2$ ) $248418 \quad 253318$
cares [2] 23781524033
cargo (4) $2378 / 524208$
2574 /4 21
Carr |1| 238023
carrier 11124156
carries [2] 2418 15 24/9 25
carry [2] 2453724579
carrying [2] 239825245710
case [10] 23755248719
25105256519256913 257069257824258220 2585 II
cases 111 248625
categories 111242115
category |14| 24189 /1 15
22241937102224204
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}12 & 21 & 24214 & 19 & 24\end{array}$
caused 12124081518
cautron |1| 239620
center |l| $2395 / 8$
centumeter 151238818
$240212243242435 / 5$ 243722
CERTIFY $11 \mid 25858$
cetera |1| 2529 |]
chain |1| $2531 / 4$
CHALOS |2| $253915 \quad 25789$ Chatos 111 2451 11 chance ||6| 2394624168 24231724671524815 2482242484381214 1524912223255921 256119

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-24-94 VOLUME 16 Conoxdemer by Look-Socish
change [181 23871721 239110240017240613 2423141824251242919 24541524744250711 250832509725469 257417257519
changed [8] 23972124212
24732424741322 2531 16257419
changes $13 \mid 247471012$
changing |6| 238023
2398 13 2458224691417 2474 21
channel \{4| 2376 2! 23804 240645
characterstic [1] 23846 characteristics [5] 238315 2423101224492245422 characterization [2] 2498 16, 256613
charge [3] 25321225417 25594
Charleston (4) 24154
$2426 \quad 20 \quad 22 \quad 23$
chart |42| 2375 /| 162021
23763111423805
23832142384111417
19238569238861921
23894151824005
240213240382404915
2432724361018244024
244152446102451612
13245817
246712247135
charts (1) 240917
check (2) 2421 IS 245812
checked |11 2551 12
cheese |1| 253224
Chuef $161242921 \quad 23 \quad 25$
243037258123
chief |12 $242625243 / 6$
2433182461724624
2496825211325692
25758257624258213
chm (11) 257125
chuna (1) 25544
Churıquil3) 25201525236 8
chooses 111255312
chops $1312563 \quad 25 \quad 256517$ $2567 / 3$
chose [1] 25544
chronology [3] 24354
2458924689
Chuck |2| 255742558 /5
chunk 1112457 /6
chunks [2] 24391924569 curcle |31 2382 || 2449 /] 252520
circles |6| 2440 I/ 1316
245161013
circumstance [1] 239910
curcumstances |9) 237823
23892024062245225
2466172573139258120

Civil|l| 23755
clarified |1| 250910
classic [11 251] 13
classmate ||| 2495 ||
classrooms ||| 2411 9
clear [9] 23878238817
244723246112246624
246816252324256520
clearance [2] $237710 \quad 12$
cleared [1] 245223
CLERK [8] 24502324511
2471141621251611
254035
Clont (1] 254917
closer [1] 251619
closest [2] 24833251425
Goast [3] 2425 1246323
2571 17
coast [33| 24739247635
2485192489324971
2498125002025046
2507252508910 11, 12
131416,17212425094
192512202522 3, 25247
252924253022541422
2553625741,257617
coaxing [1] 252612
cocktall [2] 2533420
coke |11 251719
colleagues |1| 250323
collect |11 246319
college 12 2410 2 ! 22
color [1] 2383 /S
column [3] $2393 \quad 17 \quad 2395 \quad 17$ 24
comfort [1] 245316
comfortable [11] 2378 17.
24017244442450 12,
$2453101319 \quad 249620$,
252146252218
comfortably [1] 245223
coming |4| 24399246217
246323252825
command (10) 23842224
238822245345246020
$247015 \quad 25311425348$
commands (3) 239223
243/ 24244214
commencement [1] 239510
commencing [1] $2391 / 3$
comment [8] 24621319
24811224823424845
25451821
commentary [1] 255723
comments [2] 25616
257623
Commission [1] 258522
commitments [2] 2418 15
24201
compantes [3] 2424 14
$242792540 / 9$
Company [111 247217
247492504252506521
25122125138254017
25499, 25636257322
company [9] 2481424983
$250415 \quad 2505101325079$
25352125361025638
compare $\{2\} 254811$
257215
comparison (1) 237815
competent [2] $2408 / 618$
complete [3] 247817
2481321
completed |2| $2446 / 6$
completely |1| $2548 / 3$
comples (1) 24407
comply (1] 250415
composure [1] 239218
compromse [1] 252720
con [14] 2376123771
$237922 \quad 2380$ 15, 239817
239922424066240719
242512172324384
2463 II
concept [1] 24753
concern (17] 23791238713
1623914240322 25,
2404124241621242522
2491124951425182223
242519 l 254919
concerned [11] 2429 18,
2457232458724601
248524248812249020
222501125451825725
concernung [5] 242924
2524125632122,256423
concerns [3] 2527 19.
2550425583
concise (1) 246114
conclude (1] 256913
concluded (3) 2559 11
25642025814
concludes [1] 247110
conclusion [2] 23841
252210
concur [2] 24431424442
Condition [1] 24083
condition [7] 239618
2418232420424215
24301324382251110
conditions [1] 23811
conduct [2] 25335256021
conductang [2] 246414
25338
conference [8] 243924
2475691224250421
25053253416
confídence [1] 24797
confident (6) 24233
24531415182457812
confidentral (12) 248619
24979122503242021
252615252771725352
255012
confidentrality [2] 2527 2]
25541
confirmed [1] 238111
confuse [1] 24182
confused (1) 242410
conjunction [1] 2382 11
connect [1] 25811
connectron [2] 23891
239621
connung [2] 240315240416
consider [2] 2458425766
considerably [2] 252417
25734
consideration [2] 252515
254912
considered [2] 2507515
considering [1] 24055
console [7] 2381724353
22232442224528
construction [7] 25412 69
$10 \quad 13 \quad 25732123$
consumed [3] 255814

2569210
contact [2] $241225 \quad 248915$ contacted [31 241221519 contans [1] 25859
context $171241025 \quad 242225$
243112456124814
254024256016
contunuation [1] 23755 continue [31 2556725667 25812
CONTINUED [2] 237514 25832
continued [8] 2380223913
523951520248115 24901325697
contract [2] 2409625057
contrary (1) 25248
control (1] 23917
Conversation [1] 255415 conversatmons [7] 244749
24491724712249421
250220258113
converted [1] 2415 I
cool (1) 24913
cooler [1] 25368
cooperative [2] 24189 257512
coordinatung [1] 25759
coordinator [8] 24246 24744625422725744 1318
coordinators (2) 254920 256218
copy [3] $239710 \quad 242113$ 254319
Cornell [11 24133
corner (1) 251420
corporate |1| 252423
Corporation (1) 255212 corrected [4] 2384610
243310245510
correctron [1] 23848
correctly |1] 24593
corrects || 256117
couch (1) 24834
counsel 312499 / 250619 258222
counselor |11 250616 couple [7] 24011225056 250711251310251517 2522825328
course (27) 2379242380 I 239192392623979 2399472524004710 24061324111724161 24231418243814 $2443101417 \quad 24453$ 24541524652250025 251813253615257425 courses [6] 23991419
2401324102424112 253619
COURT [30] 23754245020 24518247112247217 247820249322249418 $24250612 \quad 25151519$ 2516814251711253024 25371418253824
25391824255516
2557112561141925663
25671825821824

Court 171 2375324091416 24512250618251318 251611
court [3] 24502324972325
courtroom [1] 248323
COUSINS [3] 237514
24091925832
Cousins [141 2375 و
2386102402324036
2406 21 2409152428 I/
2429 // 2434 /3 2436 /I
2451 10245213246912
247111
cover (1) 253420
covered (3) 249919
251816253420
covering [1] 24183
covers [1] 241917
Cranston [1] 2579 ]
created $(2) 247418 \quad 2508 \quad 25$
credibility [2] 24898
249218
crew [8] 2461102492810
142493225211525615 257621
criminal (3) 24641417 24655
critucal [2] 244892524 /4
CROSS [31 $240919 \quad 247213$
256722
cross [2] $249517 \quad 256718$ cross-examination [2]
240915247210
crossed [3] 2393824958 18
crude |l| 239225
crying [11 2538 I
cryptic |3| 2490 924917
251819
Cup [1] 255817
cure 111249018
currous |1| 247712
custom |1| 242623
customer |11 25633

- D-
damage [2| 24622
damaged (1) 24628
dandy [1] 251322
danger [2] 23937244523
dark [1] 237914
darker (1) 237616
date [5] 2409 / 242425
243482500172518 /1
DATED (1) 258514
dated (3) 240925242416 20
Day [23] 25546101216 232563252564472022
 $22 \quad 256722579131721$ 2580811
day [26] 24282524644 248221250524250913
25102812251345
2518325231025311719
2325346253615254225 2559525641725786
258218258514
days $[2] 252517 \quad 25709$
dead [3| $239316 \quad 19 \quad 20$ deal (4) 24644246616 249662568 /I
dealing [1] 25656
deals [1] 247823
dealt [1] 253522
December (1) 242024
decent (1) 240222
decide |11 25665
decided II 2477 /4
decision 11125094
deck | $2 \mid 2419724226$
deep [2] $2460 / 314$
deeply 1112404 /
Defendants 1612513 I/ 14
2515152516182517611
defendants 111256720
define 111244918
defintely [1] 25205
definiton [1] 239416
degree [8] 237518238425 $238822 \quad 2423895239111$
246913247015
degrees $\mid 17123832324$
2386 II 239848 IS
2423222524522024535
245525245814245923
2424691624705
delayed [1] 25654
Delozuer |II 2454 |/
delving [1] 25033
deny [3] 256445256520
departed (1) 23816
departing (1) 244424
Department [1] 2464 11
departure (11 254615
depend III 250712
dependent [4| 255/ 16
2569152225763
deposition $112 \mid 23759$
2472 |/ 2478 // 12
2480192486224882
249023249415249822
24992425698
Deppe 181252824256219
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}256314 & 25683 & 716\end{array}$
depression 111257010
depth 11124718
depths (1) 247025
describe [5] 24027240421
24491424836256021
described [7] 238216
$\begin{array}{lllllll}240911 & 2458 & 23 & 246618\end{array}$
247720248224257523
describes [1| 256610
describing (11) 2376 /2
description [4] 240820
242824247412504 /3
descriptions [1] 24745
designed (1) 244722
destre [1] 252822
desk [1] 25146
detall [2] 2449225111
details [11] 24181624202
2425 21 248516248618
2024877252913253521
255311257612
determination [1] 2441 14
determine 14| 23826 2441 |
24451324874
determined [2] 2435 I
2024877252913253521
descriptions [1] 24745
$2476 / 4$
development 11124752
deviation [11 24398
dagnosed [4| 252713
2532525692125709
daagnosss [3] $252710 \quad 11$ 25706
dictated |1| 25275
dicton |I| 2548 II
Diego |2| 2541 / 257323
diesel|l| 25658
difference |3| 2457525737
8
differences [2] 246612
25739
differently $16 \mid 238618$
240258249941225545
difficult (1) 256015
difficulty $12 \mid 24661724683$
digital [1] 246719
dimmer [|| 2379 13
daplomatic [11 256810

DIRFCT [4] 237514250613
2540925832
direct |2| $239712 \quad 2450 \quad 15$
directed |2| 2462425
directing ||| 23979
directron |1| 258513
directions |1] 2438 I]
disability |l| 25139
dsscharged III 257421
discouraged (1) 252620
dscovery (1) 254219
discretion [2] 23991419
discuss [11] 244221
$246120 \quad 248517249513$
152504125491417
2557 I5 2563 12 2576 II
discussed [24| 2379 2|
2380 S 2398 lS 243813
24395244213247420
$25002111317 \quad 250157$ 2502222505172522 11
252322252418252914
254472549192550 II
discussing [3] 249718
24991525393
dscussion [18] 23764
24292424442024758
2477924861024908
2500910251014252213
25502225511255311
25572025582255924 256917
discussions [3] 242216
25515257510
disease [2] 2511925322
dispel [1] 250325
display [3] 238724246719
disregard [1] 255516
disregarded [1] 25378
$\begin{array}{lllll}\text { distance [2] } 2377 & 2382 & 25 \\ \text { distances [2] } & 2376 & 13 & 2441 & 6\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}\text { distance [2] } & 2377 & 9 & 2382 & 25 \\ \text { distances [2] } & 2376 & 13 & 24416\end{array}$
distunctrons [1] 250815
divide [1] 250810
divided [2] 2508524 dock [2] 24031925235
document [3] 2552679 documents $\{21240921$ 248015
Doesn't |11 25478
7

\author{

}
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$





.

$\qquad$



$\qquad$
$\qquad$





$\qquad$
,
59
7





\end{abstract}

$\qquad$

\author{

}



$\qquad$
$\qquad$


Berve Syzicm: Appicaukir
doesn't |4| 24273247417
249525257023
door 141 2550910 ll
2564 1/
doors |11 251414
dots [1] 24515
doubt $[2] 245431245819$
dozen (1] 25097
drank 15 l 255617255820
255961016
draw [4] 23751924
237623245111
drawng [1] 2508 15
drawn (4) 2377250624516
drew [3] 237519243916
245111
drils (1) 24208
drank [31 251119251623
255118
driving [1] 24771
drop [2] 2417814
dropped (3] 243418
25571725685
dropping !31 $241711 \quad 13$
243521
drove ||| $2528 / 4$
drug (I) 2464 /
drunk [8] 24906 |/ 14 2]
24912814249213
dry |l| 25208

$2492 / 8$
duties 14] $2398 \quad 25 \quad 2418 / 6$
24201254212
Dutton (1) 24132
duty [10] $2398 \quad 20 \quad 2428$ 6, 24
24292246352476815
25193255124
Dwght |l0| 2497271719 $24991721 \quad 2500121314$ 2521 25
dysthymıa |1| 2570 10

- E -
early |ll| 24029246322
2465325122525132
$254818 \quad 257532577515$
25782225795
easter (3) 24265244321
2451 14
easing III 24436
easterly 11123774
easternmost [1] 24565
Eastwood II] 254917
easy [3] 2443242449 15
25664
edge |5| 237524237612
1720240023
educaton 12124101923
effect [7] $23906 \quad 2398$ /1
243221244910251022
25477254819
effectively [2] 24193
242012
efficiently 11125126
effort 111254118
erght 1101242652024
242771625245215
2463 /1 $2496 / 12$
elapsed [1] 2458 21

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-24-94 VOLUME 16
Conochimence by Laot-See(59)

242012
emergency |11 24208
emotional [3] 248424
25504255121
employed [3] 2481 322
257311
employee [2] 248115
255312
employment [2] 241025
248125
empty $[2] 25541725809$
encompass |1| 244719
encounter |l| 245716
encountered [2| 244920
encouraged |1| 252619
encouragement |1| 24802
encroach (1) 240019
end $1101240018 \quad 241415$
2448624962025386
25467255812525721
257419
endanger (1) 23977
ended (1) 24919
ending |l| 25465
endorsement 111242518
engine 11712391523929

2395102523962323977
20240723243122
244713 246/18
Fngineer 111258124
engineer $122 \mid 243318$
2508581922250956
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllllll}2521 & 13 & 2541 & 5 & 24 & 25\end{array}$
254922565825732023
2574125757820258213
enguneering (2) 24113
25498
Engineers |1| 241025
engineers ||| 257624
engines |8| $2381 / 2392$ //
2393102394423962124
239745
enhanced |II 247317
ensure 111250415
ensured |11 2561 2
enter |11 24717
entered [2] $238817 \quad 251915$
entity (1) 254022
entrance 14| $2483325 / 324$
251428
entries $|5| 239317239524$
254492547219
entrusted III 2542 IS
entry $1112547 / 2$
environiment 12 253214
25607
environments 111248225
episodic 1112570 II
equipment |4| 241912
$242018 \quad 242210 \quad 24237$
error 111254516
escort [1] 243324
essence $12 \mid 2551825$
essentually $|6| 2387 /$
25058254224254723
256412
estumate | $10 \mid 23868$
239/14 23926240525
241214241524246821

e (II) 2529 II
evaluate [1] 242224
evaluated [1] 240125
evaluation [3] 242023
$242120 \quad 242222$
evening [14] 237820
2379111423812239012
24029172403124267
24481724631525132
25143256424
event [4] $2458 \quad 232493$ I
251119255715
events [3| 246772469 ।
250517
Eventually [1] 25047
eventually [3] 248022
2506225422
Everybody [1] 255514
everybody [3] 24356
2536225635
evidence [2] 2537 16,
257024
evidently (1) 237816
evolution (1) 24752
ex-Coast (1) 25056
exact (3) 24689249417
exactly |lo| 23901824124
2441124915249416
24952425024252221
25251925792
exaggerate [1] 24897
exaggerating [1] 25269
exaggeration (1) 24899
exam [5] 2410 7, 14, 24125
24131012
EXAMINATION [8] 237514
$240919247213 \quad 250613$
$2531 / 25409256722$
25832
examination |3| 240915
$2471 / 12478 / 8$
examine |1] $2567 / 8$
EXAMINER 151237515
$2409202418 / 242913$
2430152434911243615
$\begin{array}{llllll}2440 & 12 & 19 & 21 & 2448 \\ 23\end{array}$
$245117 \quad 25571425648$
example [2] $24048 \quad 24672$
exceeds [2] 2421 1020
excellent (1) 25043
exceptron [1] 25474
exceptronal [2] 2422313
exchanged 11124352
Excuse [1] 25237
excuse 13123832124729
25298
executed [2] 238518
$2386 / 4$
executaves |11 255017
Exhibit [16| 241723242822
24361224391623
$247516251312 \quad 251513$
$\begin{array}{llllll}15 & 16 & 251618 & 25177 & 812\end{array}$
2570522
exhibit [5| 239419245145

## 251511257023

Exhibits (4) 2471232472 I
48
existed $[2] 2381224086$
expect [3) 24015245513 252120
expected [4] 2450524552
16247010
experience [12] 23825
$240120 \quad 23 \quad 24032325$
240711122427224534
245414252934
experienced [2] 24492122
Expures [1] 258522
explan [1] 244918
explamed (4] 24397
$245618 \quad 25581719$
explanning [1] 245615
explanation [5] 2391 9, 17
240119240813256623
explscit [1] 250413
expressed [2] 245714
24911
expression [3] 243823
25332025469
extended (2) 24411825611
extending [1] 23773
extent [1] 240014
extraordinarly [1] 256817
extreme [2] $2396 \quad 20 \quad 254923$
extremes (1) 246014
extricate [3] 23947816
eye [3] 24553250419
25813

## - F -

fabricated [1] 252025
facultate |11 244819
facing [2] 2432524425
fact [49] 2402624043
240542429724302
244121724431724444
24462424521324612
24622524671324698
247762485224871316
249082501202502111
16251021251521
25171825182325214
25226
23252481725256
2527101125296,9 ,
25321253417254612,
25497255782558 19.
25591625672256824
257024257520
facts [2] $256010 \quad 256110$
factual [1] 250213
fair (28) $246616 \quad 24748$
2483171624858
248714248817249225
24971324981116
24991125027919
2505132526125314
25431525471254821
255522255915256018
21 256215
Faurly [1] 24402
farly [9] 240222240320
245357246322248520
248619249111
fall $[312411 \quad 25 \quad 25492$
25753
fallen [4] 24901216
251825253518
familar [1] 2412 17 familiarize 11 2541 17 famularizing [1] 24357 family [5] 248424250219 22250710254019
famous [1] 24545 fast [2] 252123254619 fateful [1] 256612
fathom [5] $245450912 \quad 15$ 24719
fathometer [2] 24607
247019
fathoms [3] $24701 / \quad 17$
24718
fatrgue [5] 246391424759
1224
fatugued [1] 246312
fault [6] $2545912 \quad 254711$
131416
favorable [1] 2423 I
fear |11 23912
February [8] 241038
2418425482025494
2569182575414
Federal [1] 247224
federal [1] 246420
feedback [2] 25571258123
feel [17] 23901324432
24444245012453912
$\begin{array}{lllll}15 & 20 & 24591213 & 24639\end{array}$
121424841825394 25492225542
feeling [2] $2558 \quad 2 \quad 2575 \quad 18$
feelings [1] 249217
feet [3] 2413242415612
fell [1] 237618
fellow [2] $24245 \quad 255217$
felt (38) $2378 \quad 16 \quad 239016 \quad 18$
240172442222450712
245318212424594 24601248720248816
249117 249222249514
2501232502252503124
250422511212425195
21232525215252214 252317252410
162526725271525349 2549625769
fewer [2] 243821252723
fifth (1] 246523
figure [2] 24432124587
figures [2] 2378716
filled (1] 245113
final [1] 25025
finals [1] 255817
find [9] 23795238025
24046244924247711
2486525118255520
256513
Fine [2] 254012256716
fine [4] $248713 \quad 250214$
2534425601
finish [1] 241210
finished [7] 23831324287
2430252489102541120 25599
fire [1] 23937
firms [1] 2565 1]
First (2) $248014 \quad 249612$
first |46| 238222383 /1
238416238712239121

239262393142401618
24104241914242820
243519243936924 24401923245020
245422245524245722
2459424652324713
2473222424742247823
24942124989250816
$\begin{array}{lllll}251378 & 24 & 25141015\end{array}$
25182325222253424
25401825435256013 2575225829
fit 17124182224204
24214247615252613 25292
five |12| $238410 \quad 2391 / 4$ 23952123963242613 24295245210252310 25251725351425583
fix $11812381 \quad 16 \quad 2383$ / 613 2403 / 24361925244025 2445 / 24462324521822 245418245524246025 2461 22467224692
fixed (1) 24716
fixes |11 2469 I
flasher [21 $238722 \quad 24582$
flashinght 1212385514
flawed (1] 24059
fleet |35| 247392475268
11242476324893
$249712498 / 250020$ $25031718 \quad 2505425089$ 1014172525092819 202510125122025223
25291014242541422
2563 / 2574 / 25772
flesh (11) 25773
fly (3) 252l 23252523 257724
focus 14124124241721
243417250519
focusing $121238610 \quad 24302$
follow |이 24884249025
follow up [3] 2482 /2
24861623
followed 11124026
following |3| 23759257522 258111
follows [2] 25571325647
football [1] 255820
foregoung [2] 2585911
foreman [1] 25594
forepeak (1) 25727
forget [2] 24245255825
forgotten (1) 25592
form 14124182124212
243916249919
formal [2] $241019 \quad 23$
formerly [1] 254016
formulated (1) 24002
forward 16123962223
239752432524419
found [10] $238920 \quad 250117$
250212250314252318
254942554172575 11 18 25811
four (18) 23952123962 239720241515242610 $\begin{array}{llllllllll}16 & 17 & 2427 & 14 & 18\end{array}$ $2463172495 / 1252517$

25612425621
fourth |1| 246523
frame |2| 24471725653
Franclsco |6| 2424825234
255721256322257421 257720
Frank [3] 250424 2531 14
frankly (1) 23869
free [8] $237614 \quad 23948$
2396914242428613
248418
freed [1] 39976
Frequently |l| 24243
frequently 111248710
friend |3| 2495525136 251914
friends [2] 25204253512
front |15| 2397 || 240022
24172224187242419
242812435232436 II
244228924642424698
25132425148
frustrated (1) 246217
fuel $121257416 \quad 2577 \quad 17$
full (8) 2395242396 । 242325244721247116 25406254616255017 fully 12 | $247010 \quad 252914$ functions |1| 252813
funny (2) $248925 \quad 245017$ furthest [2| 239837 future III 247420

- G -

Galveston [2] $241420 \quad 24$ game [5] 2558212223 2559725693
gap [1] 2391 /4
gather 12123787240816
gathered |1] 2446 /1
Gave III 2458 /4
gave [28] $2378 \quad 2223794$
$2383152385 / 238716$
238824238925239016
2392 /5 232394 /I 24138
2418132419212524205
7242421102422313
24261424522124539
252531125588
gear (11 2382 I
Geared [1] 241222
generalize [1] 243424
Gentlemen [1] 251320 gentlemen [S] 23754
2450212516925238 258219
gets [2] 25045256019 gst [1] 23864
Give $\{2 \mid 2499$ | 251321
give $\left[\begin{array}{llllll}26 \mid & 2375 & 21 & 2382 & 17\end{array}\right.$ 239023239971524019 $\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}11 & 19 & 24091 & 241817 & 24\end{array}$ 2421624311124413 2446124541824561 24619246821252510 25571255921256020 25702225258123 given [121 $238822 \quad 239112$ 2396524082024277 243123245525245924
$246116 \quad 24803 \quad 252519$ 2526 /1
Giving |l| 238424
giving |9| 23842122
239632450324602325
2468222470 IS 2506 I
 17
goes |6| 23968242910
24301224841125141
25171
goldsh 11125152
gossip |l| 24897
gossiping 11124899
gossips ||| 249116
gotten $16 \mid 24181920$
2429824416253413
253723
grade |1] 242013
grading |II 241919
gradual (11 240017
gradually |I| 244714
graduate |11 24733
graduated [1] 24737
graduation [1] 2472 2]
grand |2| 24642024
Grande 131252015252368
(rraves 12| 24801316
great 171 2387131624608
2464424661624966
2556 21
Greenwich [1] 2397 I3
Greg |l| 23759
GREGORY [3] 237514
24091925832
gross |11 240924
grossily |II 25269
ground (2) $23905 \quad 239618$
grounded [2] 239618
246017
grounding 1421 2390 14
239123239257825
$2393312 \quad 23981824089$
14241012241515
$242520 \quad 244415 \quad 245216$
246120246211422
2463622246510246622
24671524699247512
250422250518254215 22
252543225481425514
255617257018257213
2025782225796
group [12] 24245247445
24871025088254227
2549202562182574313 18
Grove |11 24175
grown |1] 255017
guaranty 11125758
Guard [4| 24251246323
25056257117
guess (9) 2398824098
24369247522250511
25111325411625655
2579 I2
guidance (1) 242124
Gulf $\{2 \mid 2476525295$
gulf [18] 2473924763
2485192489324971
$2498 / 250725250810$ II

1621242509319
2512202522325247
25302
guy [3] 256391819
guys [6] 2418224246
2505891012
gyro [11) $238018 \quad 1922$
240635915240723
24523414

## - -

half [13] 23912423929
2427141519247325
2505425081225231014
257252324
hall [1] 252622
hand [7] 23761423818
23901424528247114
2473425403
handle [1] 25545
handled [3] 242318 2] 25
handler [3| 2449 / 256346
handout |II 2475 /6
hands |11 25556
handy (1) 251322
hang [2] 238767
happening [1] 24632
happy [2] 2561232562 I
hard [7] 23892423909 1]
23 2391 6245922
Harvey [12] 2529222324
25424255151125523
2569181925752325768
258025
hash |I| 237623
Hestings ||| 2471 19
haven't |3| 245| 324666 2546 /1
he'd (5) $243315 \quad 24632$ 254514257518257925 headed [3| $238117 \quad 239918$ 240317
heading [16| $2380 / 238317$
23871721222324
2397161721239812
24001724064240721
24582
headings (1) 240010
hear $112 \mid 23901323942$
23962524292324314
24742425221920
$2536242579122581 / 5$
heard $|17| 2394515$
24442424625247414
$248918 \quad 249615 \quad 252017$
25332025469254812
25547132525791325
hearings |I] 237520
heated [1] 256614
heavy |II 25294
herghtened [1] 249810
held 141 $247318 \quad 21 \quad 252318$ 258511
hello (2) 258210 /S
helm |8| $23818 \quad 239812$
$23991519 \quad 2401 / 8$
240616246118246220
helmsman |16| 238513
$238620222388 / 239010$
$\begin{array}{lllll}23963 & 24021421 & 24032\end{array}$
242522243172424528
2453924541924614
help [10] $241242435 \quad 12$
$248062481 / 221$
24842425381254418
25659
henned (1) 257825
Henry [7] 2554 17 21
2569 / 2579 // /3 258/ 15
258216
Herb [1] 25584
HERBY (1) 25858
hey [1] 24913
hide [4] 253724723
hiding [2] 253823
hyg [6] 24101824207
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}2485 & 20 & 2486 & 1 & 2527 & 23\end{array}$
higher (1] 25257
highest [9] 24181924191
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}21 & 25 & 2420 & 5 & 7 & 2549 & 21\end{array}$
Hunchinbrook [1] 24255
hudsught [2] 2402824037
Hockey [2] 25582223
hockey l긔 2559725693
hold $\{2\} 2377224409$
holder |1| 238514
hole [1] 23915

241272413925205
honest [2] 248956
Honor [27] 23758240913
243012244015245018
24517162471102225
$\begin{array}{llllllll}2472 & 6 & 9 & 2478 & 16 & 2493 & 19\end{array}$
24941625131121
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}251512 & 17 & 2516615\end{array}$
$253022 \quad 23 \quad 256112$
2565232578925825
hoped 111248110
hot |l| 25658
Hotel |5| $248216 \quad 17 \quad 24831$
25107251315
hotel $1312483 \quad 12 \quad 251715$
253416
hour 16123952123962
$\begin{array}{llllll}2397 & 20 & 242715 & 2572 & 23 & 24\end{array}$
Hours |1| 246722
hours ||4| 240819242625
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}2427 & 14 & 19 & 24307 & 2463 & 18\end{array}$
246720249612252178
122558325786
Houston $1312482 \quad 17 \quad 18$
2540.8

Hoye [1] 24176
huh |1| 2426 /I
human (1) 25358
hung $15 \mid 2390132024604$ 25442225468
hurry ||| 2406 /
$-\mathrm{I}-$

I'd ||8| 2384224092
2417 21 2434172435 11
2446 // 2449 /3 2450 //
2454524606246816
2478162486425663
$256918 \quad 2576 \quad 20 \quad 25 \quad 25786$
I've [15| $238210 \quad 239619$
2453182466624737

253514254315255016
2558625592256412 257025
1e [1] 24208
Iarossi [13] 24749250424
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}2505 & 13 & 14 & 16 \quad 19 & 23\end{array}$
250614252514253114
19
Idea [7] 237521240822
2415124413244214
244820252712
udeas [2] 247420256510
identification (1] 253615
identufied [4] 243919
245642527416
ggnored [1] 25385
llummated [1] 237916
umage [3] 25242123
mague \{1] 238914
mmedrate [2] 25074
250918
Immediately (1) 251014
immedrately [10] 23882
2390222393524145
2459 // 2460324938
2543225721220
umpacted [1] 249410
umpared (1] 243018
mpeading [1] 257519
mplementung [1] 247410
importance [1] 24678
mportant [1] 2469 I
mpression [3] 254515
255315256917
mprudent [2] 244816
24494
maccurate [1] $2468 / 5$
inappropriate |l| 249219
inattentive |l| 24035
inbound $[2] 24331412441 / 8$ meident $\{24 \mid 249520$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}249812 & 2501 & 17 & 2502810\end{array}$
$12 \quad 251213252725$
2531171924255420
2556519256321256422
$25661014257911 \quad 12$
$2580172581 / 115$
incidents [2] 2527 24, 25534 included [1] 24458
increase $[5] 24487818$
2449325079
increased [4] 238910
$2447 / 42538 / 112$
increases [1] 24046
increasing (I) 244910
independent [1] 24686
indicate (5) $237511 \quad 16$
23762323911023957
indicated [12] 237817
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}2392 & 12 & 2394 & 2433 & 18\end{array}$
$245813 \quad 2545 / 42425502$
$6 \quad 255310 \quad 2559925634$
indicates |2| $2391 / 3$
239314
indrcating ||| 239516
indication [2] 25244
254719
indicator [10| $2379 / 6$
$2386172389922 \quad 239010$
$240221 \quad 245813 \quad 246914$
17, 21
indicators (1) 238112
individual (3) 24491522

## 250712

undividuals [2] 244918
250322
indulgence [1] 250619
Industries [1] 241020
Industry [1] 241024
mebriated [2] 256522
25661
mflection [1] 257123
unform [1] 24941
mformation [8] 2422 24,
244611249119252320,
2526112536 7, 255520,
256916
unformed [4] 23802424562
$249614 \quad 253418$
informing [1] 251023
unforms (1) 242125
untral [5] 2384 6, 239278
2440524468
imitally [2] 240016,25267
mituated (4) 23852425013
252823256410
unland (1] 25098
mput [3] 2446124501
252418
msensituve [1] 25342
inside [1] 238213
inspection |1| 25417
mstance (2) 24231324328
instructed [3] 2385 16,
239220240612
instruction [1] 239615
instructions (4) 244314 ,
24468258219
mastructors [1] 24124
unstrumental [5] 2480610
$20 \quad 2524818$
untended [2] 24397252917
intensive (1] 254118
mtent [2] 240014240114
untention [2] 24391125103
interacted (1) 257618
Intercontinental [1] 248219
interest $\{2] 25505,25638$
interested [2] 2376325494 interfere [1] 25127
interfered [6] 247836
2479119249317249413
interfering (3) 247724
24791011
interpretation [2] 239412
242813
interrupt [1] 252916
interruption [1] 252312
unterval (3) 2392823933
246410
intervals [1] 246824
unterview [3] 2491 2524932
4
intumated |11 245012
intonation (2] 2548511
untoxicated [1] 243019
untroduced (1) 257024
unvestugate [4] 251978
25261325552
investugated [4] 250117
2502122580525815
investigating |1] 25229

Raske Systemm Applicatikna
investigation |13| 246415 $18 \quad 248813 \quad 249220$
$249510 \quad 251910 \quad 252325$ 25263182528225564 25801125814
investigators [l] 246324
involve [1] 25819
involved [7] $241710 \quad 13$
24752248024252614
2541825757
invoivement (3] 2480181]
irritation [l] 257522
Island [17] 23785238223
23883423991125
$24008 \quad 20 \quad 24161416$
24371224381924399 24437244471824469 sland [1] 243818
ssue [14] 24104247715 2486324951325001819 $25102325 \quad 251 / 4252219$ 2526132528232554110 ssued [1] 24145
sssues [4] 249919250011 2521 16253017
Ivan |1| 24953

## - J -

jagged [1] 246012
January [3] 240925242025 254820
Jeez [1] 253321
jeopardize [3] 248125
25192425
jube |1| 2431 18
Jum [22] $2488 \quad 22 \quad 2489 \quad 15 \quad 19$ 2491191524939
$2498 \quad 12 \quad 13 \quad 25021025186$
252152522121425263
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllll}8 & 12 & 19 & 2535 & 14 & 16 & 18\end{array}$
256719
job 149] $24042 \quad 2418 / 2$
$241923 \quad 2421 \quad 12 \quad 15 \quad 17$
$24221 / 1245052473 / 4$
1624741 S 247725
2478472479210 11 20
$248012 \quad 17 \quad 248719$
2488101624931724946
132501232504313
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}2507 & 5 & 8 & 19 & 21 & 2508 & 15\end{array}$
252512152519625224
25241025271825393
25402525411255519
257923
jobs [3] $247319 \quad 20 \quad 257315$
Joe [26] $2479 \quad 10 \quad 11 \quad 25$
24801242524855
249142497192501210
2503125182425204 252420253021253518 254419254516912 255151225543256919 John [5] 2476 11 24853 25091417253419 jomed [1] 25741
joining [1] 25102
jount [2] $2532 \quad 17 \quad 18$
jolt [1] 24594
Jones [2] 24541924619
Joseph [7] 247852479 ।

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5 24-94 VOLUME 16
192487232488618 24911
jot |1| $2463 / 9$
JOY |I 258521
Judge [5] $247818 \quad 24951$
25302525612025668
judge [1] 245611
judgment [8] 238720
2393624058924068
240867244825
July $11 \mid 247220$
June l6| $241917 \quad 247313$
$2485 / 4 \quad 255623 \quad 25 \quad 256223$
jurisdiction $131252910 \quad 19$ 22
Jury 18 ( 2375224502425
$251320 \quad 251612 \quad 13$
255516258223
jury [5] $246420 \quad 24 \quad 2493 \quad 23$
2523825665
Justice |1| 2464 /2
justified (11 25817

## - K -

Kagan |12| $238518 \quad 238610$ $21238824239023 \quad 24026$ 242520212224621320 keep |S| $250418 \quad 254311$ 254523254717257124 kept 14] $2542 \quad 12 \quad 21 \quad 254313$ 25
Kimtis $1612556 \quad 10 \quad 12$
$25574255815 \quad 255917$
258124
kinds 131244519248425
25335
Kings [2| 24722424733
kutchen [1| 25443
knots $151244718 \quad 19 \quad 22$ $2448 / 3$
knowing $181240813 \quad 14$
2447224481424495
25191425376256625
knowledge |12| 238623
24492324245123
2486 I8 2526725272
$255210 \quad 256017 \quad 18 \quad 25641$
knowledgeable [1] 25495
Koops (32) $24972411 \quad 14$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllll}20 & 22 & 23 & 25 & 2499 & 11\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llllllll}14 & 15 & 18 & 2500 & 2 & 10 & 15\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}2503 & 9 & 10 \quad 12 & 2521 & 25\end{array}$
25222913252322
$252418 \quad 2525917 \quad 252621$
2531202535425362
25394
Kunkel $16 \mid 2429212325$ 2430357

| -L- |
| :---: |
| L A [1] 24248 |
| Lack [1] 240120 |
| Lack [2] $249218 \quad 252424$ lacks [1] 24898 |
| Ladies [1] 251319 |
| Ladies [5] 23754245021 |
| 2516825237258218 |
| lagoon 2125231113 |
| land [2] 243619245417 |
| Lamont [1] 257825 |

land 111244416
landmark |31 2467624693 6
lane $\{3 \mid 24403245646$
lanes [27] $2385 \quad 25 \quad 2399 \quad 13$
240013240223243810

$\begin{array}{llllllllll}12 & 18 & 2442 & 24 & 25 & 2443 & 6 & 9\end{array}$
24441252446101821
2424472245713
language |11 245317
lapse | 1124147
large |2| 2440 224569
Last 111247119
last $|25| 238910 \quad 2447410$
24711724815248224

$23 \quad 249616 \quad 2540625463$
672554325554255719
2571232425802
lasted (1] 25082
Late (1] 25753
late [2] 252624255411
latest |l| 2475 I
latter [? $31256720 \quad 258117$
launch [4| 249219252724
256424256610
lawyer 13125369254216
254525
lawyers |1| 25356
lead $12 \mid 250618 \quad 252613$
leading $1612375 \quad 24 \quad 2376 \quad 12$
1720247211250517
learn $[21253013 \quad 16$
learned [2] $244813 \quad 24776$
leave $1812377 / 4 \quad 24017$
247624247747248516
25139251617
leaves |11 2566 /|
leaving $191237715 \quad 237822$
$240025 \quad 24014243023$
24312324527257124
LeCam |21 $238016 \quad 242915$
lectures (1) $241 / 10$
left hand 111239517
length |4| $2411 / 17241323$
241424255621
lengthy |1| $2496 / 7$
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { letter } & {[9]} & 2424 & 13 & 18 & 19\end{array} 20$
2324257811
level [13] 24207244924
2487924967250313
2507925192325201
25251325272325366
2549 21
levels [1] 25365
Lexington (1) 25074
Leyendecker [5] 25584
255922258057 II
luason $\{2] \begin{array}{lllll}2473 & 15 & 2507 & 21\end{array}$
license $\begin{array}{llllllll}81 & 2380 & 13 & 2409 & 22\end{array}$
232410257241222
24145
lue [2] 25379256622
life [2] $25033 \quad 250713$
light [31] 2377 II 23785

2791023854238723
238834111416240223
$243710 \quad 12 \quad 243819 \quad 24447$
11245419242455256
$7 / 3$
lughted II| 2467 /9
Inghter 1112415 ?
lights |2| 2379 I2 240223
likelihood [2] $248520 \quad 22$
Limit [1] 257412
lumit ||1 23774
limited |1| 248619
Line [1] 247815
line 132| $2376 \quad 16 \quad 20 \quad 24217$
82446122448524703

247992480202124867
2488324902424919
2494172124982223
249925253718
linear |I| 24488
lines [5] $237623 \quad 24782$
248142484925063
list I6| $25024252510 \quad 11$
$14 \quad 18 \quad 25353$
listen $1312526 \quad 22 \quad 2572$ I/
258219
listening [1] 25355
litugation |11 254218
Itton [2| 24102024
I lve l2 | $247213 \quad 25409$
live l4| $2471 / 8 \quad 24956$
2540816
lived |I| 24969
lives |2| 248917249116
load |11| 23771523811
2407152324232524478
132524481324691
252311
loaded [2] 252392557 I7
loads |l| 2423 I]
lobbies (11) 2483 13
lobhy 1912483 / 467
$251315162514 / 116$
251715
local (2) 239324239713
located $|3| 23812241156$
logged [1] 24676
logger 15123912022
$23922 / 22393 / 4$
lookout 15| 2383 /2 14
24022424164241717
Looks [5] 25362325
25371822
books [3] 243791124419
lost [1] 23869
lot [12] 24061824742
2489 15 24911 250011
25031825051725123
252042529425327
25347
houd 151 2431 $3 \quad 2479$ /3 14
16
lounge (11) 25334
low [4] $25026 \quad 25501214$
21
lower (1) 254712
lull [1| 256516
lunch [1] 252114

## - M-

M-Y-E-R-S [1] 25407
macaroni [1] 253224
$\operatorname{man}|1| 25142$


| $-\mathbf{M}-$ |
| :--- |
| M-Y-E-R-S [1] 25407 |
| macarons [11 253224 |
| mann III 25142 |

Beave Syuran Applicaison
mantamed [1] 240220 maintans $12 \mid 2418924207$ major [7] $2421 \quad 12 \quad 13 \quad 16 \quad 25$ 24221123
man [7] 24881224895 2491324941925322
253412257524
manage [1] 257619 management [16] 24242
2449132473152474710 182475368111224
251242524132025514
manager 1912476324972
2498 / 2509192025223
2529152425772
managers [5] 25055
$252513 \quad 2325$
maneuver [13] 237819
239315240418240619
2443152445 14, 22
24481624502245220
2457911247010
maneuvered [1] 2401 2 ]
maneuvering 191239310
239720222398 11 2423101224472021 $2448 / 9$
maneuvers 171 239510 I/
15202396824015
246119
manner (6) 2382162419 I/
2420172422924234 244923
manual |l| 2408 /
manufacturer (1) 256512
March [12] 2379 11 241016
2423324241023242712
243014246910250524
254819256324257221
marine |11 2413?
mariner |1| 24715
Maritume 14| 242420
24721624254016
maritume [6] 239922
2412212413324276
24722125
Mark [8] 247710131324788 2524791824802324936 250623
mark |l2| 237631024004 2419212524205 7゙
245469121524719 marked |31 23751217 23805
marker ||| 243921
marking |I| 243923
Martuneau |22| 25002325
25011314182502711
2503142504812252824
25297122530171920
253542324253626 Mary (S) 256322256412
22256521256610
master [131 23981721
$2399218 \quad 240025240123$
247682491132524 /I 253462542625532 25606
masters 191 $247315 \quad 2474$ I/ 1325041425054251020 252510253120254923

FEDERAL TRIAL"TRANSCRIPT "5-24-94 VOLUME 16 Cancordaca by LookSecec 031

Mate $16 \mid 238016242921$
$23 \quad 25 \quad 243037$
mate [27] $2380910 \quad 11 \quad 13$
24092324104724125
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}22 & 2413 & 10 & 12 & 24146 & 17\end{array}$
24151824191524271
2431624617252113
25451162547561516 25692
$\begin{array}{lllllll}\text { material } & {[4]} & 2412 & 16 & 17 & 19\end{array}$ 20
mates $|3| 242624 \quad 2427 \mid 7$
Matter 141 $2517 / 825226$
25296257023
matter (28) 2381 $25 \quad 24054$
240617244317246713
24698248522486 19,
24871624979250211
25032421252522 23,
$2524816 \quad 25256252615$
$25271722 \quad 25341720$
$2550122577 / 25814,5$
matters |5| 23961924878
252610256221258511
Maureen I? 245419 2461 9
McRobbie |l| 2562 19
meal |l| 24287
mean ll91 $2378 / 416$
$239042394816 \quad 239823$
24033242312243811
24491924627247024
2491472524925722
257878
meaning |기 2395825813 means |21 24284247210
meant $14 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llllll}2410 & 21 & 243818\end{array}\right.$
249013250016
measure |1] 23778
measuring |l| 2376 /3
Mechanical $111241 / 3$
medical |s| $2476 / 524774$ 724851625277
mex |11| 247612248535
251079251224251410
$252513 \quad 253421257424$
25752
Meeting [1] 25544
mexting [271 243936
24402223244122
244310247711015
24828202424832
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllll}2485 & 6 & 14 & 2505 & 12 & 2509 & 22\end{array}$
251327920251722
25185253419256215 2563 /
metungs 1412438252439 / 24875251725
member [2] $2540 \quad 18 \quad 25513$
members [7] 249281014
24932 2521 1525615
257621
memo [2] 2531 |1] 13
memories [1] 2474 /5
memory [3] 24355248610 25822
mental ||| 248424
mentwon |3| 23941524312
25652
mentroned [13| 23833
$23892524023 \quad 243215$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}2436 & 19 & 2454 & 17 & 245518\end{array}$

24607246216250210
2509132536925475
merchant [1] 25346
messages [2] 2378910
Messrs [1] 25569
method [2] 238259
mid [4] 242611125413
25742258122
middle [3] 23759251222
25582
midnight [5] 239124
$239213 \quad 242616 \quad 246312$
2572 21
midst [1] 240018
midway [1] 239518
Mihajlovic [27] 24953911
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}13 & 16 & 2496510 & 6 & 10\end{array}$
$25191114172022 \quad 24$
25201 9, 1025222025
252312,31525356
25362
muld [1] 257010
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}\text { mile } & 4 & 2377 & 10 & 12 & 2523 & 14\end{array}$
miles |1| 257723
mind [24] $237820 \quad 239025$
239368239924240047
1112243923245016
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}2461 & 22 & 2466 & 25 & 24958 & 17\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}18 & 2519 & 15 & 25206 & 25285\end{array}$
$8 \quad 255710 \quad 12 \quad 256625$
258216
minded [1] 245016
mue [1] 2495 /1
munmum [1] 241] 20
muns [1] 250714
munute [12] $237622378 \quad 12$
245222245825251214
251441925201025237
$253216 \quad 25528 \quad 257921$
Minutes |1] 244024
minutes $139 \mid 237719 \quad 23784$
239/ 15 242392813
23952123963239720
$240148 \quad 9 \quad 12 \quad 2406 / 3$
24081024298243115 ,
243634243821244717
2448324502223245215
$24591246312 \quad 24672022$
24706247621
$25161011 \quad 2532815697$
257221
misbehaving [1] 249) 5
Mescharacterizes (1) 253715
miserable [1] 242612
misleading |l| 25578
misquotation |1| 256524
missed [1] 256822
Mississippi \{l] 24048
misspoke [!] 24723
mistake [1] 238620
mistaken [1] 255924
Mister [1] 24562
moxed [2] 250768
mode [2] 23818
Moderately [1] 241913
moderately [1| 242018
moment [6] 23871223979
$253022 \quad 2574 / 2 \quad 23258222$
moments l? 23845238619
Monday |1| 25655
monitor 1 (18) 24871523
$24885111416 \quad 2504914$ $253818 \quad 19 \quad 2539212$
254316255172576613
25
montored [2] 248818
2539 11
Monitoring [1] 2431 22
monitoring [11] 2487 18,
24882024995252919
25301316253157
25523612
month [7] 24101124119
14182464725226
258119
months [6] 24131124664
248514252278255519
morning [11] 23754
242617242717 25,
242925246315250615
1625122525131,258221
mother [1] 257824
motwated [1] 238623
motor (1) 240924
Move [1] 251511
move [6] 2453124951
25071025176252822
moved [2] 24117 25179
movement [1] 245815
movements (1) 23877
movie $[9] \begin{array}{lllll}2536 & 13 & 17 & 18 & 20\end{array}$
222537172225
moving [1] 2389 11
MS [2] 23758240913
MYERS [2] 25409256722
Myers (11) 25401714
25571525596,2564914
256719256910257022
2573 11
myself [131 2379 / 238920
2392172403424093
243142435724927
25096252912253120
25614257620
$-\mathrm{N}-$

Naked [1] 241616
name [14] 2378824245
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}2471 & 16 & 17 & 18 & 19 & 2525 & 20\end{array}$
2536202225406714,
257825
names [1] 25354
nap [1] 242715
Narrows [8] 24079 13,
241622243021243112
2433 II 24344244417
nasty [1] 244216
natural [1] 25295
nature (1) 24773
nautucal |1) 238322
naval [1] 24133
navigate [4] 239820
240325,24222024234
navigates [4] 241910
242016242269
navigatung [1] 23791
Navigation 14] 24101822
2411424122
navigation [6] 240223
241719241911242017
24221724236
navigational [2] 23826
242210
navıgator [2] 2422222449 I
Navy (1) 23809
NEAL [18] $255515 \quad 25577$
25611216256212
2565232566125671923
2570212571325781012
161920258256
Neal [21 25663256719
Nebraska |11 2471 19
necessity (1) 237821
needs [31 2411 1/ 24272
254525
negatuvely (1) 249410
neglected (1) 238921
neighbors (1) 25359
nervous [1] 2403 /2
news [1] 256713
nice [2] 24266244216 nught [13] 23798242520
2430142448222424636
715246622246718
257871314
nune [3] 23928239418 2463 II
Noltungs [1] 24249
non-credible [1] 249222
noon [2] $242617 \quad 24295$
noontume [1] 24285
Normal (5) 25362325
25371822
normal [12] $24061924 / 812$
241923242525242625
242918243056925384 25471516
normally |1] 25657
North [3] 24261425293 257410
north [5] 2391 1242513
243920247712566 11
northbound [1] 24566
Northern (i) 256025
northernmost [1] 23912
Notary (1) 2585 21
notehook [5) 25422124
254313254623257022
notebooks [3] 2542 l2 15
18
notes [11] 2543111319
2225441225461222
254718258510
notice $[8124859248814$
250282532125351315
16257618
NTSB [8] 23752024648
2466572468 II 19
2469912
nudge [2] 2456724572
Number [6] 24182243612
254972559222570522
number [21] 239316
23962024012524024
240362405524131920
241725245814249919
252736252812254116
25498925615257023
25762225801
numbers [1] 244724
numerous [3] 239725
244011250220
o'clock [21 $24285 \quad 2429$
O'NFILL |48| $247113 \quad 22$
$247239142478 / 8 \quad 23$
2479324932125249419
2495122499225068
25151425179253025
$\begin{array}{lll}25312 & 253219 & 22 \\ 253717\end{array}$
$20253822 \quad 252539617$
192225401102548810
255517255712
25591225612021
25621314256421
256525256689256714
1725781118
O'Nell [20| 24942425136
$2519132528 / 253024$
255779256118256212
256637256721256814
$2125257013 \quad 25721011$
257514257817
oath 11 ! 253423
Object [2] $253712 \quad 15$
object [3] 2456 l| 256225
25789
Objection |6| 253820
$253914 \quad 15 \quad 255515 \quad 25577$
256523
objection 16124712325
24725251514251710
255710
obligation |1| 25193 observations |11 25519
observe [13| 2389 1 69
2416824196242010
242310172124243016
246918
observed $11212388 \quad 14$
2389 /l 2404 /8 2435 / 14
243924244019244117
2444 /4 24552246915
256413
observer |l| 240924
observing |3| 238921
243123256521
obtamable 111 25174
obtained |1| 243625
Obvюusly (1) 24059
obvюusly [3] 24033
2451 1225195
occasion [11] 240520
241520241622423921
$24253012 \quad 15 \quad 255618$
25742425755
occasюnally |1| 256812
occasюons [6] 239524
240125241523246527
252813
occur (2) 24362244023
occurred 161 2392524658
24661924681225302 257916
ocean [2] 24092325095
offer [2] $247122 \quad 2565 \quad 16$
offered [4] 24102424724 25151325178
office (18) 2385724247
24821112249613
$\begin{array}{llllll}2508 & 17 & 250912 & 2526818\end{array}$
252825254142225509

255372554162564 ।1

257757
officer 11312404424099
24143241516241727
242272423924261
2462424752256517
256713
officers 1612408224093
24197253614254114
256325
offices |1] 2529 1]
Oh [9] 2401 16241122
$2441 / 72442 / 224796$
25132525325254417
254919
oh 14| 242/ 12 2525 21
25721025746
oll 111239225
okay $1141240116 \quad 243315$
244020244212245689
2457325486255878
25608256124256315
25645
old [2] $2472 \quad 17 \quad 256713$
on-thejob (11) 254117
ones [1] 2427 ]
open 1412483 」 7253410 255010
opening |II 25136
operated |II 25126
operation $|4| 2519$ |
$252717 \quad 25471516$
operational 1412527 I8 19
25411419
operationally |l| 252610
operations [3] 25125
251925257318
opinion (9) $2378 \quad 16 \quad 239921$
240610247723250115
25021325032253223
opportunty $\{9] 24196$
242010246318246646 2530122531101125794 opposed [2| 2382 /5 2453 /
opposite $1112385 / 5$
optumum |4| 2419 |/
24201724221024236
Order |l| 23753
order (33| 2384252385 ।
$\begin{array}{lll}19 & 2386 / 4 \quad 19 & 2388 \\ 24\end{array}$
23892623911113
239215240111824027
24442245221245379
24541418245525
24592324602524619
246521246871224813
222516232544625547
13
ordered 191238025238610 23916 21 2392 // 2469 /3 25171925552425585
ordering |4| 257914
2580142125823
orders [91 239023239635
23991524013243122
244420246023246112
organization [2] 2408 1
25496
organizational 111257519
original [4] $2375 \quad 20 \quad 243610$
$182451 / 2$
orıgnally |l| 244423
Orleans |41 2411724136
$241581 /$
ought $12 \mid 243221 \quad 25003$
ours |11 25633
ourselves 111257412
Outbound [1] 243410
outbound (2) 243412
244119
outcome |l| 25025
outside |10| 237824
$237921 \quad 23812240315$
24072024464172124 25498
outsider [2] 25499257520
outspoken [2] 252413 25689
overall [2] $24 / 3 \quad 23 \quad 241424$
overhead |11 2379 IS
overheard [1] 2462 13
overnight [I] 256619
overreaction 111249224
overstate [1] 248418
————
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { p m } & \text { |S| } 24295125161213\end{array}$
25822325
pace |11 2548 II
pacing II 25485
packages 111241110
Page 119124101822
24114192324122378
1012151920241314
249822256212
$\begin{array}{lllll}\text { page |22| } & 2394 & 18 & 2395 & 17\end{array}$
$23971 / 24691624703$
247811121312348019
24867248829249023
$\begin{array}{lllllll}2494 & 15 & 17 & 18 & 19 & 2498 & 24\end{array}$
24991924
pages II 248614
Panama [8] 24031925239 $\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}13 & 2557 & 18 & 19 & 2574 & 14 & 20\end{array}$ 257715
paper $|5| 24272425$
242821 25315 2552 I/
paperwork (3) 25319
2545615
Pardon [2] 2570125718
pardon [1] 243025
Part [1] 251922
part [24] $2394515 \quad 239622$
240120240617242116
2422 / 11242910243012
24505246621247821
24861624248719
248810251910253618
$25392 \quad 255723 \quad 2570 \quad 17$
257715258117
partually [3] 25477825624
participate 121254118
257513
partues [1] 252516
Parts [1] 2466 11
parts [4] 246610254416
257416257718
party [2] 243012568 I1
pass [5) 23787241314
244524252320257325
passage 16| 2400324344

Sunc Syatems Applowico
1012244214
passed [3] 240117247016 252517
PAUL [2] 25409256722
Paul [7] $242462540 / 714$
256491114
peer [3] 24879254910
257521
peers [1] 250323
pen [1] 243923
pencil [1] 237524
penculed [2] 25251018
people [24] 24055245915
246322247323248916
2491141624924
250721251423 2521 16
252723252918253220
2533513255217255717
25622124256511257619
percent [2] 252521
percentage (1] 248523
perception [1] 252524
performance (18) 242023
24631524784610
247922024931724946
10132501142325032
2527425571257625
258124
performing [1] 240819
performs (4) $2418 \quad 1318$ 241913242019
pernod $\{29 \mid 23981024078$
2408101924131824184 241917242024242716 242891524341724471 141624483245214 24622022247422 24851825021620 250720252624254112 254932577525795 perrods |1| 25611 peripheral |1] 24606 permission [2] 240916 $2513 / 8$
person $\{71240425249813$ 2508625351325759 257917
personal |16| 24287
24911624931424946
24967250331325
251923252671025358
11254216255320 personally [I] 254413 personnel [3] 24767
25622125
perspective [3] 2410 II
247024251723
ph $\{2 \mid 23802325106$ phone |14| 238521239019 239222243322245518 2459482460424617 249315252318254723 254812
photograph $|3| 2379810$ 15
phrase |11 24862
physician |l| 25708
physicians [1] 252723
plano |l| 251625
prek [7] 237722417714 247821253224257416

257717
pricked [2] 2441 625367
picking [3] 24171113
243919
preture $|6| \begin{array}{llll}2375 & 19 & 2390 & 25\end{array}$
$2514 / 5251618253216$
pretures [1] 251310
piece [5] 24282124567
24572253142552 11

$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}15 & 17 & 23 & 24781 & 24\end{array}$
247918248058248110
17248211324851012
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}13 & 15 & 2493 & 6 & 8 & 10 & 16\end{array}$
24965249892503714
250623250720251012
 25122325
251911252011252712
2535412
pillars ||| 25/3 25
pilot |l5| 240478240624
2407224178 /1 14,
24302224243147
$243216 \quad 2434 / 8 \quad 243521$
245121
pilotage [7] 240724
242410242514918
25294
plotung [3| 2387 I 240420
pin $13 \mid 25471416$
papeline |1| 2523 /]
place |16| 2398 /| 244| 21
$22 \quad 24748248224248322$
249613251622253319
2557202559242525621
425781314
placed [3] 2382 /| 24062
2468 25
places (1] 248312
Plontuffs (3) 24712224721 25401
plantuffs [2] $247 / 1325705$
plan 1612443252444224
2445424464244821
plane ||| 257724
planned | || 245724
planner |1| 2573 /9
plans |1| 248820
plate |l| 251023
play $1312548482558 / 6$
Played |I| 25489
played [3| $2557 / 325647$
256825
playing [2] $240918 \quad 255816$
pleasant [1] 25465
Please [2] 25405258219
please 19| 240914241722
245022 245/2 $2471 / 417$
2514925161025665
plenty |l| 240024
plot |2| $24368 \quad 247014$
plotted |5| $2383 / 6$
$2384 / 62400 / 124365$ plotting |3| 2383 /3 2403 /
$2404 / 2$
plus $12 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llll}2507 & 13 & 15\end{array}\right.$
Point |171 24161820
2417914152425515
243217232433124
24379244417247224

247334
pointblank [1] 258216
pomted [2] $244217 \quad 25148$
Pointer [1] 24736
pointer [1] 251322
pointing [1] 253223
points [2] 240622242019
polucies [1] 252414
policy [1] 2558 11
polesh [1] 252421
polutic [1] 256317
poor [2] 24011924055
Port [4] 2414325412425
255214
Portion [4] 2557 13, 2559 11
2564720
portion [3] 242267257021
portions [l] 240618
Portiand [4] 24096255525
$2556 / 3255716$
portrayed [1] 251313
posed [1] 237510
position [17] 2377 20, 23833
$13 \quad 238416 \quad 23891023911$
23972524181624201
24357243658243716
2549101125731725743
posithoning [1] 24467
posituve [4] $243522 \quad 245819$
25616257623
posituvely [1] 248922
possibilitues | || 2474 21
posstbility [2] 2393825558
post-it [1] 2544 1
Potato |6| 241620243217
$232433 / 24$
potentual 19124789248118
$24 \quad 24859248814149214$
$15 \quad 25 \quad 251025$
potshots [1] 253220
practice [6] 23992224056
2406171924692425759
precautions [1] 239620
precipitated [3] 2480 I
24845251720
prectse |l| 2382 /5
predesignated [1] 248015
predesignation [1] 241724
prepare [1| 2446 |
prepared |l| 2585 /2
prepares [1] 2411 10
preparing $12 \mid 24453254819$
presentation [2| 2442 1]
244417
presented [2] 252020
25607
president [6] 2474924983
25042525064252514
2531 15
press (21 249024
pressed (1) 251821
pressure [3] $241942420 / 3$ 24645
pretty [8] 24275243222
243325246624251225
2521232522 /1 $2537 / 8$
previous [2] 243423246817
previously [7] 2375 12 17.
2380 S, 238122243317
245924256423
PRI |1] 25633
prumarily [1] 25688
primary [1] 247314
Prunce [7] 24152124161
24171824252,2460811 25293
prior (12) 2379423824
2424 23, 25246510
$24751224827,25021,16$
2507425096,25232
private [3] 2415 6, 247518 248917
privy [5] 248620 21, 24878
25024253110
probe [1] 247715
problem [27] 23863
2433 18, 19, 2447 1, 244920
2456242457367
247720247912480724
2485920248814,252120
2532911 2534•9, 22,
253632548 24, 254918
256536
problems [41] 2422 23,
2427224331524342,36
724571324772124786

248011248118248913
249317249457912
2501825021425043
25124252412,2527519
2532725374,723
25381216155121
25532021
procedures (1] 255310
proceed [I] 251615
proceeding [1] 243325
process [4] 2376 1, 23839
23871252418
processes [1] 24042
produced [2] 2375 20, 254218
profanity [2] 256616
256712
professwonal [7] 244917
249313249452524 11 15 20253510
proffered [1] 24846
profile [3] $240420 \quad 242112$
16
program [28] 237715
2381 1, 2407 1S, 23, 24479 $\begin{array}{lllll}13 & 25 & 2448 & 13 & 24692\end{array}$
247832480292481322

248737 9, 2491 21
249719250225251022
25326253413
programming [2] 25461620
programs [1] 248821
progress [3] 2404 I] 12
243122
promoted [?] 25622225
prompted [1] 252724
prone [2] 2489725269
proper [1] 23968
proposals [I] 24251
proposed [1] 24502
proposition [1] 248623
provisions [1] 257416
prudent [S] 239623244816
2124531249222

Public [1] 258521
publications [1] 24133
publicity (1) 24645
pull [2] 2394 I6 2397 I
puling [1] 239617
punch [1] 246723
purely (3) $2468 \quad 18 \quad 2518 \quad 10$ 25366
purpose [3] 238210
244521252111
pursued |1| 24123
pushed [1] 24523
puts [1] $2488 / 4$
putting [2] 2436 // 24528
puzzies [1] 238218
$-\mathbf{- Q}$
quadrant [1] 239717
qualified [2] $242517 \quad 2529$ /
quarter [2] 23832423889
quarters [2] 24052325531
queried [1] 24567
query [1] 252721
Questron [7] 2375 /1
$24692224247918 \quad 23$
2499325002
question 146123759
23782124026240517
24121024171224249
2438524481724493
245823245919246916
247042478151624
247951424802123
2486724901324912
2494202501210251913
25206
252715252917253219
253719253822253917
182543232555425618
152565125661720
256789256822
questroned (2) 237814
2422 2I
questroning (1) 257013
questions [26] 243321
244919246067246212
172464 | 2470 I 2472 Il
24798132480322
250610251517252623
25281825302325369
25381025392325553
2564172565925802
25825
quick [1] 245812
quickly [4] 24062124193
$242012 \quad 257325$
quote [1] 253518

- R -
radio (1) 23945
radius [1] 244910
railing [2] 251534
Rase [1] 247114
rase [1] 25403
rased [1] 253822
ran [1] 25353
random [1] 255225
range [8] $238223 \quad 23983$
243715924471824489
Ranges [1] 244116

$2445 / 8$
rank 11125259
ranked |3| 25242525257 24
ranking |4| 2525712
25622324
rapid |11 2487 11
rapidly [1] 23827
rapport [1] 2503 /
rate 14] $240017 \quad 241216$
24481024868
rated [21 2419142420 II
rating [8] 2418 $1719 \quad 25$
2419 I 24223252418
25622324
ratings 13125012425022
252419
relll 23755
re-entered $|2| 238823$
243519
reach |11 238325
reacted (2) 242324249814
read [25) 238223239411
$23961719 \quad 24211314$
24242324257246679

162486424883249024
24982324992525459
255310258220
readily |II 2379 /8
reading 131 243423246915 24715
readout (1) 238724
real [7] 23862238817
2447232458 // 247412
253219253516
reatistic [3] $2521 \quad 18 \quad 19$
realize |l| 246612
realized [1] 2392 I8
reason [171 237822238820
$240015 \quad 240225 \quad 245621$
24762324772724861
24968250122251919
2528425342125379
2538 8 14
reasons |5| 2403 I/ 24043
24061116253811
reassigned [2] 248221
250020
reassignments [1] 25015
receve [7] 238311239615
24231252412425549
received 1812425724337
24541424728251516
25171225361025432
Recess [1] 258225
recess [S] 24502023
25168 // 258218
recidivism $|3| 24868$ /l
252816
recipients (1) 24259
recite [1] 2468 II
Reckless [1] 25677
reckiess (3) 256012 2) 25674
recognize [4] 23799
$248718 \quad 251313251618$
recognized [4] 244612
248524249810252420
recollect [3] 237525
recollection |23| 2375 2/
$238522 \quad 241413 \quad 24333$
24342224359243622
2468723247523248320
2424841124961725188
25259255492564 / 16
2565225782258012
25823
recommend |2| 241120
25256
recommended [31 24127
10256724
recommending ||| 2396 I7
reconvene [2] 245022
251610
record 1 I2 1240820241412
2417212418324401012
2471162540525652024
25771258224
recorder [31 239] 1023926
239710
records ||| 25277
recovery [2] 2487 II
255318
RECROSS [1] 25311

243922232440 I/ 1316
2451561214
Redirect |11 253024
redirect |1| 2478 /9
reduced III 243325
reduction $|2| 239121$
239224
redundant [1] 24856
Reeder [6] $256322 \quad 2425$
256517256615256713
Reef [14] 2377 II 23802
238314238723240223
24072224161012
244215244411245223
24556254424
reef|l|c| 23912423947
239535823971239813
$239918 \quad 2400392445 / 8$
242446724589
refer 121253319255825
reference [1| 238317
referred $[3] 253318 \quad 25585$
258115
referring [S] 243412
245424249313249422
255110
reflect [3] 23795254612 25472
reflected [1] 239] 23
reflectung [1] 240815
reflects [2] $253152552 \quad 12$
refresh $13 \mid 241412 \quad 243622$
247523
refreshes (1) 248610
regained [1] 239218
regard [24] $247410 \quad 19$
248020248823249225
2493125114252524
2531312253412253610
25371625389254120
25421225449254512
$\begin{array}{lllll}2546 & 25 & 2548 & 25 & 2560 \\ 18\end{array}$
256321256625
regarding $19 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lll}2487 & 15 & 23\end{array}\right.$

248861824961625014
2531713253521
regardiess |11 23973
regards $12 \mid 2431242474$ I2
registration [2] 251467
regular (1) 242522
regulariy (1] 249116
regulations [3] 242410
24252250416
rehab [6] $252713 \quad 253521$
2553911255423
rehabilitated $\left[\begin{array}{llllll}2481 & 2481 & 11 & 19\end{array}\right.$
rehabilitation [25] 247718
2478324812124248510
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}2486 & 17 & 24 & 2497 & 5 & 8 & 14 & 19\end{array}$
$25021825 \quad 250418$
2510222527325326
253324253413254925
255031825692023
25762
reterated [3] 244214
2443 / 5
rejected |1| 256816
rejoining (1) 25101
relate [1] 24112
related [8] $248012 \quad 17$
25501255416255916
2564 // 258025
relatmon |7| 238723244023
24467132447224557
24588
relationship [2] 241810
255923
relatuve [2] 2467825503
relatively $[3] 24152246013$ 25341
relaxed |11 244915
relevant (3) 24782122

## 24799

relable [4] 2419 I| 242017
2422924234
relieved $141242922 \quad 247713$
248513251019
remaln |4| $245013 \quad 24813$
1522
remained (1) 24089
remembering [1] $2466 / 8$
remind |1] 25593
removed [3] 2531 2325
2532 I
reparr [3] $255725 \quad 2573 \quad 17$ 19
repeatedly [1] 255111
repeater [2] 24021116
rephrase [2] 241712
245313
reply [1] 24231
report [43] 2383 // 25
$\begin{array}{lllllll}23844 & 613 & 16 & 23 & 241718\end{array}$
$24801316 \quad 248914$

$249716 \quad 17 \quad 20 \quad 22 \quad 24985$
$249941318 \quad 250418 \quad 20$
25231252524125263
2531 13253723253858
2551825584
25601920256320
25641525662025673
25796
reported [16] 238314
$2384924541921 \quad 248912$
2384924541921248912
-

Smen Symens Apphatuc:
$24971249832500 / 4$
25441225542325
$256425 \quad 25661416 \quad 257524$ reporting [1] 23841
reports [4] 24992025242
256425256612
represent [1] 256719
representative [2] 237910
25137
representing $\{2$ ) $2440 / 4$
2451 14
reputation [1] 255219
requested [3] 24289
246410258510
requrre [1] 240615
required [2] 242882499 /8
requirement [2] 24082
24274
requirements [6] 241812 ,
2419232421112024259
256315
requres [1] 2382 I
resented [1] 257519
reserved [2] 244825
252723
respect |ll| 2386 /8 19
242011162421415
$242262440 / 246 / 18$
258016
respects |1] 2501 15
responded (1] 244818
response [7] 2402525355
253692538710254619
256415
responsibiluties [8] 240414
$241812241922 \quad 2473 / 7$
2474 // 2507222510 /7
25196
responsibility 14125087
$251024251 / 325769$
responsible 141 245/4
2562425757 II
rest $151242721 \quad 24288910$
restung (2) 24635
result [1] 256224
resume |1] 258220
resumed |3| 249623
2501 21 253210
retrieved [1] 24514
retrospect [1] 25464
return (5) 240624245324
2456102471325139
returned [8] 23871523893
1324062324402424415
$2458 / 6255718$
returning $|2| 2476816$
review [? 2557 | 2581 22
reviewed |1| 241216
rud [1] 2528 21
ridden [1] 255717
rigger |l| 25594
rugers |1| 25595
Rught [23] 2377172378 / 23855238616239824
$2410132415172427 / 3$
242962433924403
2463824719247216
251117251222252425 $253316256223257 / 13$ 202577 // 258/ 8
ring |l| 24738

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-24-94 VOLUME 16
rings (1) 24733
rise (1) 24511
risk [2| $239614 \quad 25607$
risks [1] 256019
River [3] 24048247216 254016
river [3] $250825 \quad 250928$
Road [1] 2471 19
road III 254824
Rock |1| 241624
ruck |3| 238913 2571 15
25723
Rocky |8| 24161824179
1415242551524379
244417
rocky [1] 2460 l2
room [36] 2383214
23841417192385 6,9
2388192389415 18,
2391623922021239623
2397724002224240213
2403824049 IS 240618
2432724402424415
$2445 / 4244610245817$
2523171925341625659
18
Rouge 16] 249072520 /I 131425222325235
rough |11 238212
rougher (1) 238216
Roughly |l| 257223
roughly [2] $24271412581 \quad 19$
routine [4] 2381 25242223
2424724344
Roy 11125408
rpm |2| 24489254621
RPR || 2585 21
rudder 136| 2379 /S 238425
2386 // $172388 / 2224$
23896922239089 /l
2391 || 24MO 1624013
2402212423192225
245221245525245813
2459212324614246913
141720247015
rug |l| 25266
rule|l| 247820
rumor [2] $250317 \quad 25367$
rumors (S) 248918250324
2504 | 252123252617
run |5| 2390172506 /1
25201425571925688
runaing 15124595250510
1225241625294
$\frac{-\mathbf{S ~ -}}{\frac{1}{3}}$

S-H-E-E-H-Y ||1 247120
safely [2| $2445 \quad 2425126$
safety |2| $239620 \quad 24208$
sall |3| 241319242623 253010
sauled 181241428241520 24171724279248919 251220
sailong |4| 23824241467 25066
salinity |I| $2428 / 8$
salutations |1] 258212
San |81 2424825234
$2541 / 255721256322$

257323257420257719 SANDERS [32] 240914
242910243012244015
2450182451210247110
2524725247816249319
2494162024991250614
251321232515111720
2516615162517613
$253022 \quad 253218253712$
15253820253914
Sanders [3] 251614
25381013
sank [1] 25728
sarcasm [1] 246225
sat [8] 242720,2483 3,
25002251420,25157
25221225331322
satusfaction [1] 24966
satusfactory [1] 238217
satusfied [1] 250118
Saturday [1] 25655
save [1] 240916
saying [15] 23796238922
241211224742324754
249010249814250321
2518242563925651217 2567 II 12
scanned [1] 251415
scenario (2) 2558 18, 19
schedule [1] 24264
scheme $[14] 2377468$
$237824237922 \quad 23807$
238134240316240717
21243882439824465
school |101 2410 18, 24114
58142413624891221 249512251921
schoolung [1] 24138
scope |2] 24372024426
screen |3| $244018 \quad 247517$ 18
scurrious (1) 249221
Sea (2) 247216254016
 24761624875253068
seaman [4] 238010241318 1924147
seamanship (1) 240120
searched [1] 252316
searches [I] 255225
seated [2] $251715 \quad 25405$
seats [1] 251424
Second [2] $238016 \quad 242021$
second 1351238491013
2223931724092324104
724172224191024335
2440222441222443410
24452524461421
2455102458182424596
24652324713247325
249912516825279
253424254224254623
2525471256321258211
secondary |1] 2570 II
seconds [15] 237725
23912523921213
2393152523951624061
2452102467212223
$2468 / 24$
secret III 255314
secretaries [1| 252622
secrets [1] 250318 section [3] 25082525092 254415
sector [4] 238812240020 22
seek [4] 248062481220
23
seeking [1] 24811
seeks [1] 242124
self [2] 2527316
seltzer (1) 251719
send [1] 237810
senwor [2] 2505 5253614
sensation [1] 239017
sense [6] 238919245015
2476152493142225358
senstavity [1] 253412
separate [2] 2439 1, 25099
separated (1] 250924
Separately [1] 255611
separatung [1] 23856
separation [11] 237745
23782423792223807
238134240316240716
2124465
September [2] 24241620
sequence (5) 2387712
24081824661424976
sernatum [2] 25025252516
series [4] 239015240010
24401325553
serrous [4] 23903424035 245919
sernously [4] 249356 ,
25793
served [2] 241416252718
service (4) 24141224161
24172124183
session (2) 241] $18 \quad 252512$
seven (Sl 23849246317
252168 II
Shadow [1] 2579 I
shadowed [1] 257825
shakedown (1) 255725
share [1] 244923
shared [1] 244923
she'd [1] 23849
SHEEHY [3] 247213
25061325311
Sheehy [14| 24711318
24721024794250615
251313251521251617
25171425211825256
253714256219
sheet 131242723 25, 25253
shuft [1] 25595
shiphoard [2] 247418
24753
Shipping [12] 24721718 247492504252506521
25122125138254017
2549925636257322
ships $\{21 \mid 2426491316$
24615247315247413
24991725073250856
11250936718,252310

shupyard 161240925
254116255525255625
257321
shocked [2] $255512 \quad 18$
shocks [1] 239015
shop [1] 25544
shore [2] 24731524748
shorthand [1] 258510
shot [1] 25658
shoulder [2] 243725
show [11] 23798242724
$244010 \quad 12 \quad 17 \quad 246720 \quad 23$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}2475 & 15 & 2513 & 19 & 25691013\end{array}$
shows [2] 23791523922
shut [3] $254523 \quad 254717$ 2564 /1
Sıc [2] $25543 \quad 25732$
sight |ll 238212
sughted [1] 240216
sughting [2] 2403124459
sugn [3] 2512825244 25808
sugnificant [3] 2475 I
24997254113
slgns [3] 25011625043 252815
Summons [1] 25592
sumple [2] 245357
single [1] 241710
Sir f2] 24794256714
sut 191240310246318
24663246867251417
253992560125643
situng [6] 24027245213
2483824844253314 25347
sttuation [23] 238214 23975239917240121 240314172224047 2438424507245119
245310247711248621
2493625102025122
2527825286255310
$256022 \quad 257125 \quad 257517$ situations [4] 2401 21
24194242013244918
sux [12| 2384923891011
239114239317246317
24961225097252168 1125583
six pack [3] $25598 \quad 256923$ size |4| 241325241422
241511245611
sketchy (1) 25367
skulled [1] 2449 1
skıpped [1] 245922
skurtung [1] 244425
skıttush (1) 25347
sleep (1] 2429 15
Slope [3] 24261425293
257411
Slow [1] 239321
slow (3) $23931620 \quad 24434$
slowed [1] 244810
smaller [1] 257421
smell [3] 23922525614 257620
smelhng [1] 23934
smoothly (1) 243325
Somebody [1] 239217 somebody [7] 24513
25212125261725291 2560162563225692 Someone |l| 24767 someone [51 $2397 / 24327$
$248520 \quad 2565 \quad 18 \quad 256810$
Somewhat [1] 237912
somewhat 181237910
2399924001724019
2404624916250225 25497
Somewhere [2] 2431 l] $2578 / 3$
somewhere [7] $2403 / 8$
247323250710252221 2525425471225809 sooner (1) 25664
Sorry [2] $243310 \quad 2523 \quad 12$
sorry |l3| $241021 \quad 241810$
$22 \quad 24211124261724378$
2441172442424723
$252916 \quad 253624 \quad 257210$
sort [20] $24358 \quad 247225$
24812324873251022
$2514 / 2520725244$
252622539925503
$2553242555 / 325563$
25601525691923
257519257623
Sound $181240618 \quad 241521$
2416224171824252
24608 /1 25294
sound [3] $246015 \quad 254725$ 254813
source [2] 24587249222
south [3] $2376 \quad 19 \quad 2425 \quad 15$ 24716
southerly [1] 237620 southern |1| 24403
span |11 24677
spare $\{2 \mid 257416 \quad 257718$
speak $15 \mid 2487 / 8 \quad 24919$
$252422 \quad 25676258020$
SPEAKER [6] 241724
$24348 \quad 10 \quad 243613 \quad 24409$ 244822
speaking [!] 255010
speaks [1] 240820
specufic [5] 24311113
24972425001725383
specifically [27] 2378 11
242221 2431 21246919
2474222475524871720
$2488918 \quad 20 \quad 249010$
$24921012 \quad 24948124977$
182499722250016
25022425202252115
2528112539325554 25598
specification |1| 257924
specifics [2] $24481 / 125212$
speculating [2] 248117
253517
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { speech [7] } 2474 & 14 & 17 & 23\end{array}$
$24 \quad 248418 \quad 2506125486$ speed [15] 239017239121
239224243325244767
 2449310254616
speeds [2| 2423 /| 244720
spell [2] $2471 \quad 17 \quad 25406$
spend [3] 252181257857
spent [5] $241 / 9249320$
24961225204253725
Spoke [1] 255014
spoke [9] 2439924418
$250424250720 \quad 254412$
192550122125558
spoken $12 \mid 2431325446$
spot |31 $243125 \quad 244216$ 24716
spotted |1| $2417 / 9$
spread |2| $240414 \quad 2526 / 7$
spring |2| 241/ 25252624
squarely 11125196
SRP |1| $2381 / 2$
stability [3| 24624254519
25725 -
stage [1] 250713
staggering [1] 243016
stairs [1] 25155
Stalzer [1] 24176
stand [4] $238912 \quad 24164$
24331024677
standard 13124122124132 24275
standing $|18| 243 \mid 25$
2432324353243722
24402244182442125
824622024632251410
$13 \quad 16 \quad 19 \quad 2515125464$
Stanley |1| 255817
starboard 161238321
2389723972523984
$243516 \quad 245514$
Start [2] $239913 \quad 251311$
start |16| 240916 2411/4
2414624389244368
2451224548246023
247219248021248521
250617254623256720
25775
started 11612383923939
$241 / 232452$ I/ 2454 H
$246323 \quad 2472 \quad 20 \quad 247313$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}16 & 22 & 2508 & 16 & 2511 & 19\end{array}$
251825254224255010
Starting |l| 2478 /4
starting [2] $240622 \quad 24637$
state [8] $246417 \quad 24$
$2471 / 62491 / 125406$
$2565222566 / 25$
Stated |1| 24494
stated |I| $2457 / 4$
statement |IS| 246616
24769248316248722
$248825 \quad 25021925046$
250512513725324
$2536425421419 \quad 254323$
255124
statements [1] 25604
States [1] 24276
station [2] $240416 \quad 25331$
status [1] 249712
statutory [1] 250416
Stay [2] $239612 \quad 251214$
stay [21 25069258222
stayed 14| 24021924509
1725305
staying |1| 2521 11
steadied |1| 245124
steam [1] 240924
steamship (1] 242414
steep $\{212460 / 8$
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { steer } & 171 & 2399 & 7 & 14 & 19\end{array}$
$2400 / 82401 / 24162$
steered [1] 24012
steering [11] $238018 \quad 23817$
23911824061420
2407222431242443 II
245279
step|s| 2475 / 248713
$253 / 25 \quad 2532 / 253924$
stepped 131241410
2458 II 25226
steps $12 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llll}2396 & 15 & 2531 & 23\end{array}\right.$
stern 111 239625
Steve 11112554691112
25632525644720
25657815
stevedores $1512492 \quad 16 \quad 17$
249324249522
steward [2] 24892249113
stewardship [3] 24754
25571258122
strek 1112544 /8
sticky |II 2544 /
stop |41 $2395 \quad 16 \quad 246915 \quad 18$
25279257415
stopped [7] 238913
2392 II 23951024092
248114250834
stories (1) 248921
storing [1] 24914
story [4] 2490224939
25371025579
straight [3] 2448 S 252820
253119
strashhten |11 257816
straightforward [1] 240320
strand [9| 239492396914
2523977
Street III 25408
strictly |11 25275
Strike [1] 241810
strike 31241021245521
251723
Strong $12 \mid 241818 \quad 242015$
strong |4| 23932241813
241913242019
strongly $[2] \begin{array}{llll}2458 & 20 \quad 2498 & 15\end{array}$
structure [4] 24732424743 248425253124
studied $131241 / 222412 / 8$ 19
studies $|5| 239672412$ l 3
1113
study [7] 241110 1220
24127222424139
studying [2] 2412525
style [2] 24491425486
subconscrously [1] 249818
subject [7] $243013 \quad 247522$
248319251617253420
25491415
subjected [1] 24647
subjects [2] 2544710
Subsequent [1] 24926
subsequent [S] 23844
2478524792124989
255716
subsequently (1) 255820
substance [7] 247620
25011725361525586
25792225802425
successful (1) 244523
successfully [2] 2481221
suffered [I] 25322
shocks to suffered $\qquad$
$\qquad$


Benc Syurwe Apporations
suffering [1] 25709
sufficient [1] 254913
suggest [2] 239619256310 suggested [2] 25257
256314
suited [2] 2411 11250713
Sulzer [1] 256511
sum [2] 24762025585
summarizugg [1] 2406 21
summer $[9] 24112524858$
25061721250913
252624252549225753
summoned (1] 2464 11
superintendent [5] 254] 2
2573181920,22
supervise (1] 2541 6
supervisor [7] 248620
2503102509 18, 25429 25481825752125776
supervisors [2] 242125
25536
supervisory [2] 2549 11 25747
supphes [1] 257717
support |1] 248424
supported [1] 25727
suppose (I) 2526 I
supposed |1| 255123
surface |1| 256623
surprised $13 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lllll}2555 & 13 & 19 & 21\end{array}\right.$
surrendering [1] 247414
surrounding 12 ] 250517
$2532 / 4$
survey [1] 24624
suspect [3] 24581620.
250122
Sustanned [1] 255516
Sweep III 25266
swing 161238921239135
2397242398324389
swings [3] 239725239837 switch |1| 238112
Sworn [2] 2471 1525404 synchronized (1) 2381 22 system |1| $2460 / 4$
-T -
table [8] 248341324844 251423242525443 tag 111243613
talle |19] 2425252450 /1
2451 182464 11 247417
2491 24, 2492 3, 2493 1S,
$2510319 \quad 251417$ 25313
172532162535223
2576172577142579 /1 talked 13012385 // 24709 2489162492724953 249619249741317 2499222512232525132 25141925211314 2534182537325439 254723254862556920 2425572325614 256423257010257821 talking [25) 239422240510 1124271724362124414 244710245511248410 24952124977250224 25103251619252010

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-24-94 VOLUME 16 Councracese by Look-San(69)

2535325372525381
2548 / 255322256017
256221257323257712
Tampa [2] 2411 11 25183
tanker (2) 2474111256019
tankers [2] 24132122
tanks [1] 25727
tape III 239710
tapes |II 2412 II
target [1] 244216
targets [S] 24358243918
2440224441424564
tasks (1) 246822
Tatutikik (1) 244417
taught [2] $2396 / 1 / 13$
teach ||| 23967
team (4) $247418 \quad 24753$
2541725514
tearing [II 23977
technical (3) 25241115 257316
telephone [15] 2385 2, 512
238681223872238925
23901424572524828
2494 / 225431925
255414
telling [14| 2403624528
2456131415245717
2461425172025214
2526212539825691
25711725725
temporal |l| 24976
temporarily 111250710
Ten (1) 243515
ten [23] $238425 \quad 2386$ 11
238822389 I1 1321
2391112406124232225
242716252429824324
2437222452101520
24535245525245814
247015
tense |l| 2565 /4
term |6| 23781011243817
$2486 / 25501516$
terminology |l| 24915
Terms |l| 244123
terms |5| 238322243621
2441 21 2498624994
test (4) 2382 / 242818
24355253414
testufied 14012376423784 $12232379202381 / 1$ 2385182386624061222
2407711151924088
2428162429724337
2452182465224698
248391823249519
$25 / 8$ б 2520 /| 25211025 25232325328253423 2554232558625661316 25701325782425804
testufies |II 256425
testify (3) 2464202425687
testufying [3] 237720
246819246912
testmonies [1] 246817
testumony [30| 23767
23794239112242910
24303243114243215
2434232435 /l 243825
245/25 246482466579

24896249121249324
25162025355253716
2538625391255620
2557325612325643
25665
testing [2] 2541 1419
tests [1] 24641
Texas [5] 2509 13252814
25303525408
text $[2] \begin{array}{llll}2396 & 19 & 2413 & 2\end{array}$
textbooks [3] 241222124
Thank [18] 237625245020
2451162471122124721
25068253025253924
254012254518254814
25571125612025668
25729257819
thank [1] 256717
there'll [1] 255311
thereabouts [1] 240811
thereafter [ 5 ] 2381 17,
23902224311524644
258016
they'd [1] 245114
they're |1| 25716
thinking [2] $2378 \quad 20 \quad 2558 \quad 12$
third $[26] 238091013$
241252224131012
2414616241518241914
24218,242624242716
2458182465232545116
2547561416256811
thoroughly [3] 241815
24201244919
thoughts [1] 246319
three (13) $2388 \quad 18 \quad 239016$
239524240211246317
24731920250519
253123254910255519
2565 |l 257321
the [1] 25564
tued 12 ) 25051521
tughten (I) 244910
till [3] 24298246714
25252
tumes 113] 239112239725
241442427202324501
246582466141824
246825246936
Timmons [2] $255825 \quad 25592$
tuny (1) 251815
up [5] $24959251916 \quad 17$
tomorrow [1] 258220
Tompkins [24| 24761214
16232524776924829
24851352509141725
251091425152325
251812522425341924
tone [2] 25485 ll
tons |l| 240924
topse [3] 24758 11 24
topography |I! 24168
torn [1] 25726
total (3) $241515 \quad 242613$
256523
touchy [4] 2491 1315
252615252722
tours |11 24875
towards |6| 237620 2389-1I 23931624031824439 24563
town (11) 24772
track [2] $238692446 \quad 12$
trade [3] 2574121719
trading [1] 257715
traffic [18] 2377415237824
2379212380723813
23852523946240316
2407162124331424341
2438152439824465 246014
traming [4] 251120253610 $254117 \quad 257317$
transcribed [3] 25445
254622254722
transcript [13] 247212
24781224795248019
24861424883,249023
249415249822249925
2585912
transeription [3] 254625
25471258510
transfer [2] 25014256724
transferred [8] 25045
$250618 \quad 20 \quad 25281925299$
202125628
transferring [2] 250215 252823
transtt [3] 2431 12246013 16
transition [1] 250720
transmission [4] 2394521
2523952
transmissions [2] 2394 11
20
traveling [1] 2470 /1
traverse (11] 247025
treatment [2] 2553172567 ।
trial (9] 23755243114
24321524653524669
24681125781125804
tricky (1) 237818
trip (3) 2417 10, 252310
trips [1] 24166
trouble [5] 239034
24591924931113
true [7] 2470121414251824
252022252521525859
trust (1) 249512
truth [2] 25192225214
Tuesday [1] 24024
Tug [2] 2571 10 /]
tug [2] 24151243324
Tugs [2] 2571 79
tugs [1] 257118
turbocharger [5] 256536
101219
turning [6] 23761237922
23801523912024032
24384
Twelve [1] 242610
twelve (S) 242652124
2427724285
twenty [1] 238921
twice (6) 23922223952
2412132509 3, 254745
type [7] 24047244922
25041625467257125
257417258215
typically (3) 249917
252513252912

From suffering to typically
$-\mathbf{U}$

U S [1] 252016
ultumately [3] 2392 11
23959246420
Um-hum [10] 23921
239420241124243420
24421824497246512
2547182550725646
unattended [1] 2402 /4
unaware [1| 2499 /1
unclear [1] 24976
uncomfortable [3] 245078 249117
unconfident [2] 24532022
uncontrolled [1] 251125
undergone [2] 25503 256919
undermine [1] 249220
undermined [1] 252617
understand [17] 23761419
2425424442024593
24622524641417
247123248471525024
25152225337253916
255324
understanding [16] 239412
2401152425811243817
2447252485124868
250015250924251725
25242525255255115
2553925563
understood [12] 2378267
1324341524561624627
248518249123251524
25392256914
underway [4] 239413
240782429 /2 $2430 / 4$
UNIDENTIFIED $|6| 241724$
243481024361324409
244822
unit [1] 24753
United [1] 24276
unicensed [2] 24149
252115
unimited [1] 240925
uarelable [1] 2456 11
unsolicited \{2) 25615
257622
untrue [1] 249622
unusual [5] 237925
23802523999244921
uproot [1] 250710
upset [3] $25735 \quad 25751415$ urgency [4] $23782 \begin{array}{llll}2378 & 13 & 14\end{array}$ USCC [1] 25714
USCG [2] 257145
utilized [1] 23825

| - V - |
| :---: |
| Vague [1] 237523 vague [1] 24019 |
| Vaguely [2] 24702256416 |
| Valdez [46] 2375623799 |
| 240712241012241325 |
| 2414324151424172 |
| 24239242634243014 |
| 243618244642447 21 |
| 250148250422250523 |
| 252820252529692021 |

25413692542615
2549325521415
2553225561625625
25654256611256725
257324257411121415
258125
vanes |1| 238212
vapors || 2393 I
variety 131248021248225
249215
VCR [1] 25732
VCT |11 25732
ven [1] 244917
verbatum [3] 2386524561
257120
verify [1] 246825
version [6] 25379256010
25611022256223
versions |4| 248322
25612425622
vessels [15] 240924
2413181924141624247
$247323 \quad 25 \quad 247419$
$247925 \quad 250414254111$
2573212574679
vibes 14125482125
25491315
VIDEO [15] 237515240920
24181242913243015
2434911243615244012
1921244823245117
25571425648
Video [3] $2375 / 4256420$
25832
video 16 | 2409 /5 $2411 / 2$
255713255911256116
25647
videotaped (11) 241110
videotapes (1) 24139
view [7] 2489525042
25161925211820
254814255523
viewing [1] 240222
vgilant [3] 24182324205
24215
vnolation [2| 2408 / 2558 /I
visibility ||| 240222
visible [1] 24526
visit |3| 24991725289
25494
visitation |1| 249920
visted $|4| 249921250012$
25518255214
visual (7) 2381 18240210
15240382405324374 24458
visually [31 244491424552
vore [4] $245718 \quad 255012$
1421
voluntarily (1) 24783
voluntary [2] 252746
volunteered (1) 251718
voyage 3125571625
256612
voyages [1] 241524
VTC [1] 257212

| - W - |
| :---: |
| WAGNER [2] 23758240913 wagon (4) 24901216 |

251825253519
Wart [3] 2376225144
257921
watt |2| $251214 \quad 252310$
watting 12124981925236
watress|4| 2517 / 2533 /
$\begin{array}{ll}18 \quad 19 & 20\end{array}$
waive |l| 24254
waived III 2425 10
wake II 246110
walk [2] 240492452 II
waiked $18+238219 \quad 23832$
7238419240215240415
240614251420
walkie-talkie [7] $25548 \quad 13$
202555 / 25255852559 ।
walking 14] 24053240613
$245272454 / 8$
Wallace 11312417524185
131724241941219
$24201318 \quad 242216 \quad 18 \quad 19$
wanted ||8| 2400 1724017
102404222425424435
152444212324627
249513250325252017
$25297253420 \quad 254917$
255810256314
wants (1) 247819
warrant 11125033
wash [31 25262525556
Watch 11124083
watch $14|\mid 23801623$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllll}2381 & 23 & 25 & 2385 & 13 & 17 & 18\end{array}$
$2386 / 417 \quad 23 \quad 2389212$
2397242402202122
2416424182324205
2421524264 II 12
242772429192524305
$\begin{array}{llll}24636 & 24679 & 15 & 16 \\ 18\end{array}$
2468 / 24872249916
250032511325287
2556725769
watched [2] $239012 \quad 255816$ watches 1412426319 242710
watching |8| $2389 / 224987$
24995251025252718
25291825582025693
water (8) 24601315
2470112524717251719 2536825726
waters [1] 242518
ways (3) $253910 \quad 13 \quad 257821$
we'd (3) $243325 \quad 250418$
25097
We'll [10] 2414 II 244017
245020222516810
25441525528256913
258218
we'll [8] 241019242521
$243882472 / 125209$
25466258220
We're 131 23757247210 258224
we're $122 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llll}2390 & 3 & 4 & 19\end{array}\right.$
2395416242715243621 2438724411011244621 245692459182024729 25145252512253824
25481256017257124
We've [2] 2493202562 ]
we've 131 246617249424
2581 15
wear III 24733
weather (1) 25295
weight 11124737
Wemhards [2] 25541721
well-Intentroned [1] 24897
weren't |131 23781324037
241420244523245723
24582247310248812
2501242502225303
253819255512
West [2] 247346
west [14] 25002025046
2508912131417125094
252924254142225536
25741257617
westerly |1| 237621
what'd |11 241817
whatnot |11 258212
wheel [2| 2389624535
wheelhouse [11| 23799
$238213 \quad 20 \quad 23841523856$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}8 & 10 & 2388 & 17 & 23 & 2404 & 18\end{array}$
243519
whenever [1] 252119
whisper [1] 255325
whispered [3] $25508 \quad 13 \quad 15$
whispering [2] 25501719
Whrte [1] 25265
white [3] $2388 / 214 \quad 25262$
whoever 1112558 /6
WILLIAM 13 ] 2472 /3
25061325311
William [9] 24152124162
241718242522460811
2471131825294
Willuamson [5] 256323
$256422 \quad 256521 \quad 256610 \quad 14$
willing $\{21244922 \quad 2575 \quad 12$
willungness [2] 2418 I]
241922
Windham [7] $248216 \quad 17$
$2483 / 248541425107$
251315
windows ||| 24429
wing 16| 238117238220
238372388315246725
winter (1) 25309
wise [2] $256318 \quad 19$
wish [2] 24681625179
withdraw [2] 255710
257810
WITNESS [7] 247118
2506112537132539116
25407256716
Witness [3] 24407247115
25404
witness [5] 23757241722
24401325392525402
witnessed [2] 24691417
witnesses [4] 24921415
2493125666
Witty [1] 24176
woken [1] 24273
won [1] 25772
won't |11 253922
Woodlands [1] 25106
word [10] 23789243821
24802024818252919
254610255518257912
words \{14] $237718 \quad 2432$ 21 2435224501516251124 25472125506255114 25531925712025724 25792
work [15] 2420824286 , 244612449 16, 24721516 2490182525152529 13 $2540151618 \quad 254118$ 25572525756
workday [3] 24252524262
worked [2] $248519 \quad 254021$
workung 16123953241810
242662525412025633
workload [11 24046
works [1] 24308
workd [5] 2427625315
2546725712225721
worry (1) 25466
worst [1] 25022
worth [1] 250324
wouldn't [19] 239923
24021524272124328
248017248115248810
24951025391012
2548152556162560321
2565725672425683
25792
wristwatch $12 \mid 23812022$ write [3] 251813 2531 1113
writing III 257923 written [3| 249919250413 254610
wrong [8] 237719240518 24542124591925119 253311256710256818 wrote 171 2428 21 2499 21 25386142547421 2571 21
WSI 11124096

$$
-X-
$$

Xs 111242112

yap 12| 254523254717 yard |2| 25572425583
Yeah |17] 2381 5238412
23941824401324838
24861524882425154
252522526625333
253617254712255025
2555192573525768
yeah |15| $2384 / 2242612$
24j8 8 244112 16244324
2505112519525228
255125255521255824
256418256756
year [18] 2409724109
24653250212162513
2425187252511253614
2541325742258122
years |11| 2412 14 25
24901250711 2512 12
252412257312
yellow |11 242821
yellowish 11125152
yesterday |4| 23833

243625246212255218 York (II) 247224
Yorktown (7) 2476818 24822224992125102
2563214
You'd (1] 253910
you'd [11] $243812 \quad 246016$
2537212325399 II 12
25411625532425779
25783
You'll |ll 256119
you'll|1| 24438
You've 121 $246513 \quad 247517$
you've |l91 23774615
2378423 2381/11 242816
246572124661625148
25186252011252110
252323253523254316
$254912 \quad 257311$
yourself [9] 2381 9239614
2403152404624453
2459142492924986 25766

- Z -
zug 111 2545 /
coom 11| 2571 /


Vol 172590
and the Court and the Members of the Jury what is a stewardship review?
(3) A it s really the way we take care of business and we look at
(4) various things that are under control of the ship compare
them
(5) to what they had forecast, and the same criteria that is used
(6) during the stewardship review is also a criteria for the ship
(7) manager s award
(8) Q All right How long did this stewardship review take
9) place? How long did it take to have this?
(0) Aldsay at least all morning Might have gone into the
(11) afternoon I know I was on the shlp all day
(12) Q Some several hours then?
(13) A Yes, sir
(14) Q Thereafter - who was present by the way during this
(15) stewardship review?
(16) A To my recollection, it was Captain Hazeiwood Chuck Kimtls
(17) and myself
(18) Q All right Thereafter did you have an occasion to speak
(19) with Captain Hazelwood alone?
(20) A Yes, sir
(21) Q All right Did you - what did you say to - let me - 1
(22) know you said a lot of things but did you ask Captain
(23) Hazelwood if he d been drinking?
(24) A Not in those words sir
(25) Q What did you ask him?

(1) confused Make sure you tell Mr Kende exactly what it is
(2) you re referring to that you re correcting
(3) A In the sense that Mr Leyendecker in Portland the day atter
(4) asking me I believe I told him that I d consumed the beer with
(5) Chlef Engineer Kımtis and Mr Myers, when he questioned me
(6) about it a month or six weeks later, whenever that was in later
(7) June $-d$ mot sure if I got that specific with my recounting of
the Henry s alleged event And I m not sure how lanswered
it
(10) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS (Indiscernible)
(11) A Well it wasn ta specific question and answer about that
(12) specific event as it was with Mr Leyendecker
(13) Q Well did you - did you indicate to him that you had
(14) consumed alcohol whether or not you were specific in your
(15) discussion?
(i6) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER Objection insofar as the word
(17) indicate It is vague and ambiguous Did he tell him did he
(18) tell him if he consumed alcohol?
(19) $8 Y$ VIDEO EXAMINER
(20) Q You understand what the word indicate means?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q Okay Thank you
(23) A I don trecall specifically telling him that Itold him
(24) that the beerl d gotten was in at Mr - Chlet Engineer
(25) Kimtis behest, basically and there was no violation of the
Vol 172593
alcohol policy that I was aware of
Q What - did anything spark your recollection of that
discussion over the lunch hour to change it from what it was
this morning?
A Nothing sparked it except In the sense that thinking
ut
It It was more that he was golng down I think he had a
checklist or something ot all the repairs that were made in
yard, and this was on his checklist somewhere
(Portion of Video Testimony of Captain Hazelwood concluded)
BY MR NEAL
Q Now that testimony was not played for you yesterday?
A No, sir
Q When you had your separate conversatıon with Captain
Hazelwood and you asked him if he had any personal problem
any problem at all as you phrase it did he tell you that he
had consumed any of these Henry s beers?
A No sir I dike to add that the Henry s beer Incident
was not dlscussed at all
Q Now by the way later on you had another conversation with
another - sometime later on not that day but several weeks
later or some weeks later you had another conversation in
which you asked another crew member if Captain Hazelwood
drinking didn i you?
A Yes, sir
Q Let me - II get to that Let me ask you back when you

Vol 172594
(1) asked Chief Engineer Kımtis if Hazelwood had been drinking why
(2) did you go to the chief engineer? Is there a reason you d go
(3) to him?
(4) A Llke the captain, he in essence is what you might call a
(5) management representative on board He s head of the engine
(6) department In addition to that, Chuck Kimtis was with me In
(7) San Dlego three or four months from out of six or seven from
(8) May 1986 through December when the shıp was delivered and Id
(9) developed somewhat of a rapport with him having worked with
(10) him, and I felt I could speak to him in confidence
(ii) Q You re both engineers?
(12) A Yes, sir
(13) Q Now let $s$ go to the meeting with Mr Day in March of
(14) 1989 Do you remember being examined about that?
(15) A Yeg, sir
(16) OMr O Neill asked you yesterday a question - just so the
(17) record is clear you deny that Mr Day told you about what
(18) we - about Mary Willamson observing Captain Hazelwood in a
(19) possibly inebriated state Do you remember that question?
(20) A Yes sir
(21) OAll right I m going to read you the testimony of -1 (ky
(22) hope it s basically a summary of her testimony on this subject
(23) that $s$ presented to this jury
(24) My perception - this is - I m reading Mary Willamson s
(25) testimony My perception was I smelled alcohol on this man s

## Vol 172595

[^36]5-25-94 VOLUME 17
Vol 172596
(1) Q Okay What I m interested in is what you meant by heard
(2) I take it you didn it mean there was noise in the room and he
(3) didn thear the words?
(4) A RIght, no
(5) Q What did you - was there a message you were trying to get
(6) across to Mr Myers that perhaps was not expressed in what you
(7) were telling him?

A Well, sometimes Mr Myers, I don t know if you ve met him,
(9) tends to have a very flat affect, and when you speak to him (م) you can $t$ determine whether it bounced off or sunk in
(11) sometimes, you know Whether he s preoccupied with
something
(12) else you Just - as Mr Klinckhardt asked, what was his
(13) response and there really wasn $t$ much of a response and that E
(14) why I sald, you know, in thinking about it and trying to anawer
(15) truthfully, can I really be sure that he heard me or was he (16) thinking so much about something else that was golng on that
(17) day that you know he maybe (Indicating) passed through
(18) (Portion of Video Testımony of Steve Day concluded)
(19) BYMR O NEILL
(20) Q Mr Myers what was what was - did you have problems on
(21) that day and surrounding that day?
(22) A Yes, sir
(23) Q Explain to the pury what you were working on?
(24) A As I mentloned yesterday, the Exxon Valdez, I belleve,
(25) tried to leave San Francisco on the Monday - I think it was

## Vol 172597

Monday the 13th of March and I got a call at 730 at night and the chief engineer told me that they d had some vibration
(3) and we - the ship came back and we spent all week trying to determine what the problem was and having to do with the turbocharger and it surging and vibration
(6) Q Were you working on that?
(7) AYes sir
(8) Q Now I belıeve in answer to Mr O Neill s question
yesterday you said you didn thear Mr Day say anything about
(10) Captain Hazelwood is that correct?
(11) A That \& correct
(12) Q You heard something would you explain what you heard?
(13) A I heard the words offlcer $s$ busting Reeder s chops
(14) Q Officer s busting Reeder s chops What did that mean to
(15) you?
(16) A in the context of what was going on at that time, it meant
(17) relatively Ilttle and it referred to what ls old business I
(ia) don t know whether it $\mathbf{s}$ healihy competition between ships but
(19)
or
(20)
as
(21) Well
(22) Q What had been going on?
(23) A A friction between the lightering vessel and, not only the
(24) Valdez, but the other vessels that I dealt with ihat IIghtered
(25) to the Galveston

Vol 172598
(1) Q Some of us and I guess up till a few months ago I was one
(2) of them didn i understand what lightering a vessel meant
(3) means What does that mean?
(4) A Well the - the larger ships that I dealt with were too
(5) big to go to a berth in the San Francisco Bay area so they
(6) would come in and anchor and then they would bring a smaller
(7) ship alongside and then they would attach hoses and they would
(8) fill that ahip up That ship would go away and discharge
(9) cargo, and then it would come back and they would do the same
(10) operation again That s called lightering smaller ship taking
(11) cargo trom a bigger one
(12) Q Unlike the Port of Valdez where you can move your big ship
(13) right up to the berth and put it right beside the berth you
(14) can t do that in the port of San Francisco?
(15) A That 8 correct
(16) Q You have to anchor out in the bay and have smaller ships
(17) come out unioad your cargo into smaller ships and they take it
(18) Into the berth?
(19) A That s correct
(20) Q All right And Captain Reeder you referred to was the
(21) master of one of those smaller Inghtering vessels is that
(22) correct?
(23) A The Exxon Galveston that is correct
(24) Q And the other officers or masters you talk about were the
(25) officers or people who had to leave San Francisco go various

## Vol 172599

(1) places and come back?
(2) A That is correct
(3) Q The Galveston never left San Francisco Bay?
(4) A Not in her role as llghtering vessel Occasionally, she
(5) would make specific cargo moves to other locations
(6) Q Now Mr Myers let me ask you this question had you -
(7) what would you have done - I have played you or read to you
(8) what Mrs Willamson said about smelling alcohol on Captain
(9) Hazelwood s breath not slurring his words or anything like
(10) that but smelling alcohol and Mr Day has testified that
(1i) basically he had said to you whether you heard it or not what
(12) Mrs Williamson had said to him
(13) What would you have done had you heard - assuming Mr Day
(14) said it had you heard it what would you have done?
(15) A I would have asked Mr Day to accompany me to Mr Borgen 8
(16) offlce and we would have got to the bottom of what he knew we
(17) would have, I m sure, brought in Mary WItllamson to find out
(18) exactly what she did know and what her story was And
(19) depending upon what came out of that, I can see bringing
(20) Captain Hazelwood Into the offlce and discussing to determine
(21) What exactly his side of the issue was
(22) Q Let me move on to another subject Mr Myers You
(23) became - I guess you started working on the job in January
(24) February of 1988 and you became on March 11988 the ship
(25) group - effective March 1 the ship group coordinator is that
(1) right?
(2) A Yes sir
(3) Q And you had certain vessels under you Were there other
(4) ship group coordinators in the west coast fleet?

A Yes sir
(6) Q And they had certain vessels under their jurisdiction?

A Yes sir
(8) Q Up until 1988 had you had anything to do with the ranking
(9) of masters of the Exxon west coast fleet or the gulf coast
(10) fleet?
(11) A No-sir
(12) Q Did you have anything to do with the ranking of masters for
(13) 19887
(14) A Yes sir
(15) Q Let me show you Defense Exhibit 9123 and ask if you
(16) recognize that Could we put that up? I II try to bring this
(17) in but maybe I Il not be able to
(18) A I can read it
(19) Q Huh?
(20) A l can read it That s a-a ranking list of wesi coast
(21) fleet masters
(22) Q For what year?
(23) A 1988
(24) Q All right Do you see Captain Hazelwood on that?
(25) A Yes sir

|  | Vol 172601 |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | MR NEAL Your Honor if this trial lasts long |
|  | enough I might even get to be adequate on this |
| (3) | BYMR NEAL |
| (4) | Q That s Captaın Hazelwood? |
| (S) | A Yes sir |
| (6) | Q Where is he-if I ve counted that correct there are |
|  | what 21 masters? |
| (8) | A l belleve theres 21 there, yes sir |
| (9) | Q And Captain Hazelwood is ranked 13 on this? |
| (10) | A Yes, sir |
| (11) | Q ls that the way you ranked him? |
| (12) | A Theres one difference here Captain Deppe, who is on |
| the |  |
|  | Ilat, was part of making up the list and I belleve his |
|  | placement was later given by Mr Borgen, so with the |
|  | eption |
|  | of that, it would be like, I belleve 12 out of 20 |
| (16) | Q Okay If you leave out Captain Deppe who was shoreside |
| (17) | as far as you were concerned you didn t put him on the list? |
| (18) | A That sight |
| (18) | Q If you leave him out it s 12 out of 207 |
| (20) | A That s right |
| (21) | Q Mr Myers following this ranking did you make any |
| (22) | memorandum regarding the ranking as it pertained to Captain |
| (23) | Hazelwood? |
| (24) | A Yes, sir |
| (25) | Q And did you send a copy to Captain Hazelwood? |

AYes sir
Q Let me show you what is Defense Exhibit 9128 and ask if you recognize that
A Yes Ido
Q What is that?
A it $s$ a memo that I wrote to Captain Hazeiwood that summed
(7) up the discussion that I had with him, the teedback discussion
(8) I had with him with his performance and the ranking that had
(9) Just taken place
(10) Q Joe was complimented on his professional expertise
(11) leadership and interdeparmental cooperation?
(12) A Yes sir
(13) Q What did you mean interdepartmental cooperation?
(14) A Traditlonally, you ve got a deck department and an engine
(15) department on board the ship, and also a steward department and
(16) in - on many ships, these departments really didn t work well
(17) together It was like a them and us the deckies against the
(18) engine guys My observation on board the Exxon Valdez is
they
(19) worked as a team and there was very good cooperation and (20) communication between the departments
(21) Q I believe you say here if I m correct that I indicated
(22) that Joe ranked in the lower half of the third quarter of the
(23) WCFM is that west coast fleet -
(24) A Yes sir
(25) Q - masters? And had the potential to be ranked higher?
Vol 172603
(1) A That is correct
(2) Q This is what you communicated to Captain Hazelwood?
(3) A Yes sir
(4) Q Now bring it back up one more tume and ask you about the
(5) last paragraph here
(6) Joe can improve his pertormance by directing his energy
(7) towards constructive activities within the framework of the
(8) organization as Joe has much to contribute what did you
mean
(9) by that?
(10) A Well Joe s not politic He s a good seaman and a very
(11) good ship handler but he s got a little trouble or had a
(12) little trouble with shoreside management
(13) Q If you had been - if you had thought that - never mind
(14) Let me go to one last thing and I think we can - maybe two
(15) last things and we can wind this up
(16) During the tume 1988 that you were ship group coordinator
(17) for certain vessels of the west coast fleet was there any
(18) Company pressure for rapid turn around in the Port of Valdez?
(19) A No, sir
(20) Q You know what I mean by rapid turn around?
(21) A Yes sir
(22) Q What do I mean?
(23) A From the time the ship gets there to when it leaves to
(24) hurry up and let s go by a certain time or within a certain
(25) number of hours or -
(1) Q All right 1 m going to show you - and I ask the Court s (2) permission to approach the witness and hand them to you because
(3) they re a little more bulky than the others
(4) I m going to show you what is in evidence as Defendants
(5) Exhibit 3509 and 3487
(6) Do you recognize those?
(7) AYes, sir
(8) Q All right Tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury what
(9) this one shows
(1) A Well this is a Valdez position report which lists the
(11) vessels in various times and arriving at Hinchinbrook,
berthing
(12) and unberthing, and this one says that the Exxon Valdez did
(13) leave berth 5 at 20 - at 900 in the evening on the 23 rd , and
(14) what it says here is the next ship was due at that berth at
(15) 1400 the next day, and that means to me that the Exxon

Valdez
(16) could have stayed at least 12 to 15 more hours at berth
(17) number 5
(i8) Q What I m circling here on the monitor is the Exxon Baton
(19) Rouge and it says arrives Hinchinbrook - arrive Hinch?
(20) A Yes that s correct
(21) Q And that s 240800 What does that mean?
(22) A That $8 \mathbf{8} 00$ in the morning on the 24th
(23) Q And arrive berth at 2400 that means 200 in the afternoon
(24) On the 24th?
(25) A Yes that scorrect

## Vol 172605

(1) Q And you re telling the jury that berth five - 1 think
(2) we ve already established this was the berth that had the
(3) Valdez right?
(4) A That is correct
(5) $O$ And so there was no vessel that would be needing that berth
(6) untul two pm on the 14 th ?
(7) A That is correct
(8) Q The Exxon Valdez however left at approximately 920 on
(9) the 23rd 920 pm ?
(10) A Yes, sir
(11) Q Now let s go to the next vessel the next document Can (12) you tell me what this is?
(13) A This shows all the ships on the west coast basically where
(14) they are, arrival date arrival time, eatimated time at the
(15) next port and when it would depart the next port it s
(16) basically a position sheet on all ships in the west coast
(17) fleet
(18) Q Okay When was the -1 m not sure I ve got this right
(19) Take it off and you II put it up there? Okay You taka care
(20) of it Would you go ahead and do the rest? I can isee this
(21) Tell me the Valdez could have remained at the berth until
(22) two pmon March 24 you say?
(23) A That is correct
(24) Q Some - oh gosh how many hours is that after nine $p \mathrm{~m}$
(25) the previous day?
(1) A At least 15
(2) Q Now my question to you is when was the Valdez due to
(3) arrive at its destination that is Long Beach California?
(4) A it says on this sheet the 31 st of March
(5) Q If it had waited overnight and left the next day would it
(6) have plenty of time to reach tis destination by March 31
(7) 1989 ?
(8) A if it had gone full speed it woutd have arrived the 30th
(9) a day earller than that
(10) Q Even earier?
(11) A The answer to your - that s right
(12) Q Leaving on the 24th?
(13) A That s correct
(14) Q What happens if a vessel like the Valdez with North Slope
(15) crude arrives at its destination in this case Long Beach
(16) before its scheduled date?
(17) A At Long Beach it would go to an anchorage and anchor
and
(18) Walt for the avallablity of a berth
(19) Q And fust simply be out of operation?
(20) A That ls correct
(21) MR NEAL Would Your Honor indulge me a moment?
(22) BY MR NEAL
(23) Q Just briefly did you - Mr Myers did you ever receive
(24) any information you yourself that you heard that Captain
(25) Hazelwood was drinking?

## Vot 172607

(1) A No, sir
(2) Q Whether on duty off duty whether you could have done
(3) anything about it or not?
(4) A No sir
(5) Q Had you tried your best to find out whether he was
(6) drinking?
(7) A Yes, sif
(8) Q Asking crew members?
(9) A Not specifically it he was drinking other than the two
(10) chlef engineers but I certalnly -
(11) Q But you did ask two chief engineers?
(12) A That's right and lasked other crew members how things
(13) were going
(14) Q March of 89 was approxımately four years atter Captain
(15) Hazelwood went through rehabilitation as has been discussed
(16) here is that correct?
(17) A Yes, sir
(18) Q Did you think even four years later that Captain
(19) Hazelwood was drınking or had started drinkıng?
(20) A No, sir
(21) Q As a matter of fact - as a matter of fact lat me close by
(22) asking this you went to fleet officers conferences with
(23) Captain Hazelwood in 1988 did you not?
(24) A Yes, sir
(25) Q Several days?
(1) A Yeah it was a whole week
(2) Q Whole week And I assume you got to see him every day?
(3) A Yes sir
(4) Q Did you go to places where alcohol was being served?
(5) A Yes sir
(6) Q Did you have a drink?
(7) A Yes sir
(8) Q Did Captain Hazelwood have a drink?
(9) A Not alcohol
(10) Q What did he have?
(11) A I think bubbling water or sparkling water
(12) Q And as a matter of fact sometime in 1988 you had occasion
(13) to have a luncheon to celebrate some event with Captain
(14) Hazelwood did you not?
(15) A That is correct
(16) Q What was that event?
(17) A It was the event of his 20 years with the company
(18) Q And you all were celebrating his 20th year at this
(19) luncheon was there anything alcoholic served?
(20) A Yes, sir
(21) Q Did Captain Hazelwood drink alcohol?
(22) A No sir
(23) MR NEAL Thank you Thank you Mr Myers
(24) THE COURT Redirect?
(25) MR O NEILL Thank you Judge

## Vol 172609

(1) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF PAUL MYERS
(2) BYMR ONEILL
(3) Q We started yesterday and the Exxon Corporation counsel
(4) came back to the phone call that you had with Captain

Hazelwood
(5) after the vessel was aground and I played you an audio tape of
(6) a VTC conversation that was at about midnight Alaska time
(7) which would make it about 100 west coast time do you recall
(8) that?
(9) A Yes sir
(10) Q And the question and answer was well this isn iclose to
(11) the tume this VTC tape is not close to the tume that you had (12) your conversation with Captain Hazelwood do you recall that?
(13) A it sabout an hour and a half difference, I belleve
(14) Q Let s see if we can find the VTC tape Your notes Indicate
(15) that the call took place at 2 30?
(16) A I beileve that s when I woke up I think it was a little (17) later than that but it slose enough
(18) Q Close enough Let s see if we can - there is a VTC
(19) transmission at 107 Alaska time which would make it 207 your
${ }^{(20)}$ time within a half an hour of the phone call that s a fair -
(21) the times are latr Let s listen to the transmission
(22) Can you play the transmission?
(23) MR NEAL Your Honor we re back to the problem area
(24) here I don thave a chance to get back up I don $t$ recollect
(25) going into that in my - my examination I covered the - just

Vol 172610
(1) asked him the same questions that he $d$ asked on direct
(2) MR O NEILL He went into the topic of his voice the
(3) voice on the tape being different than the voice in the phone
4) call to explain It away So he went into the subject matter
5) Now I have a tape at 207 within 23 minutes
(6) MR NEAL I thought he d gone into this is the
7) reason I asked it
(8) MR O NEILL It s a separate transmission
9) MR NEAL Oh I m sorry I m sorry
(10) MR O NEILL Can you play the transmission?
(ii) (Audio played oft record)
(12) BYMR O NEILL
(13) Q Now that $s$ within about a half hour of your conversation
(14) with him Was the quality of his voice timber spacing
(15) speech mannerisms at that time about the same as when you
(16) talked to him?
(i7) A I d say no, that sounded stlll different than certainly the
(18) telephone Ilne Certainly the telephone line was also clearer,
(19) but the - the pacing of our conversation was much seemed to
(20) be much smoother than that Idask a question he would
(21) answer it
(22) Q So would it be fair to say that when you talked to him at
(23) 230 his voice his voice mannerisms his pacing were
(24) distunctly different than when you talked to him the first time
(25) and the second time?
*

## Vol 172611

(1) A l only talked to him once
(2) Q I mean from the firsi VTC transmission and the second VTC
(3) transmission we ve listened to?
(4) A I certalnly sounded different the pace was different and (5) of course it was on a telephone line
6) MR O NEILL Could we have the Elmo please? I would
7) like to offer exhibits 1805 page 180 and 1806 page 2 which
) are the two pages that we ve talked about from his notebook
9) Is there any objection?
(10) (Exhibits 1805 and 1806 offered)
(11) MR NEAL The pages that you - that you showed
(12) yesterday?
(13) MR O NEILL Yes sir
(14) MR NEAL Were there two of them? I only remember
(15) one But we have no objection to the pages that were published
(16) yesterday
(17) THE COURT I understand those were exhibit (18) plaintiffs exhibit or defendants exhibit?
(19) MR O NEILL Plaintifts Exhibit 1805 page 180 and
(20) 1806 page 2
(21) THE COURT All right I understand there are no
(22) objections to those two pages and they are admitted
(23) MR NEAL That is correct
(24) (Exhibits 1805 and 1806 received)
(25) BYMR O NEILL
(1) Q Do you know when Mr Glowackı was assigned to the Exxon
(2) Valdez?
(J) A He, I believe, left with the ship when it went on its
(4) maiden voyage That would be December ithink 11th, 1986
(5) Q And his first tour with Captain Hazelwood was in February (6) of 1989 ?
(7) A lf you say 80
8) Q And I think that s what he indicated in his deposition
that his first tour with Captain Hazelwood was in February
0) of 89 and that causes me to ask something about your testımony yesterday
2) You testified yesterday that as a follow up to the Henrys
(13) Incıdent you talked to Kımtıs and Glowackı do you recall
(14) that?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q But Mr Glowackı wasn t serving with Captain Hazelwood
7) untul February of 1989 ?

A That E correct
19) Q Now you testified that when you talked to Mr Kımis and
(20) Captain Hazelwood about this review that you talked to them
) because they were quote the management representatives on board do you recall saying that this morning?
A We re talking about captain - I mean Chlef Engineer
) Kimtis
(25) Q And Hazelwood?

## Vol 172613

## A Yes

Q And they were the management representatives on board?
A Yes, sir
Q Would you explain that so us?
A The captain and chlef engineer are certalnly reaponstble for their - their various departments and In relationshlp to thls, if you will the stewardship or the management of the vessel the stewardshlp activity Ibelieve started roughly ten years - no - yes - let see About late 70 s early B0s when it was determined that the folks that ran the respective departments would be management on board the shlp

## (12) and the stewardship process started

(13) Q To some extent that s what Mr larossi talks about in his (14) talk surrounding the memories have you ever heard that or (15) read that?
(16) A I ve read it, but I don t remember the detalle
(17) Q But in any event the concepi was to change the role the
(18) traditional role of the captain from someone who drove the boat
(19) to someone who managed the vessel and its activities as
(20) essentially an economic unit?
(21) A I think that $s$ what I was getting at when I mentioned that
(22) each individual fleet office for - since the late 70 s or
(23) early 80s this is my understanding I wasn there had
(24) specific stewardship activitles I think the thing that
(25) changed in the time frame that I came into the organization
is

Vol 172614
) that the stewardship requirements were going to be the same for
both fleets of ships, rather than a little different for one
fleet than the other, and the other aspect that was cranked
into this is the safety aspect that wasn t actually part of the
stewardship before It was IIke a separate entity
Q So at least by the time by 19881989 the captain and the
chief engineer were the management of the company on board the
ship?
A 1 wouldn $t$ - management of Exxon Shipping Company, is that
(10) what you re saying?
(1i) Q The management representative on board the ship?
(12) A Yeah I would say so
(13) Q Now I want to talk to you for a minute about this Mr Day
(14) coming in to talk to you about the Mary Williamson incident and
(15) the possibility that you may have been less than attentive
(16) during the conversation if in fact the conversation took
(17) place Does that make sense?
(18) A Yes, with the exception I was - I went to him on another
(19) tople
(20) Q Okay
(21) A There s a little disagreement there
(22) Q The issue of Captain Hazelwood and drinking was an
(23) important issue in your mind wasn itt?
(24) A I would say so
(25) $Q$ And the issue of a drinking captain who had gone through

## Vol 172615

(1) alcohol treatment was one that you knew could present dangers
(2) to the vessel to the safety of the vessel to the environment
(3) surrounding the vessel You were aware of the risks?

A l was aware of the pollcy
Q You were aware of the risks too weren tyou?
A I was also aware of the pollcy
Q Were you aware of the risks?
A What riske are we talking about?
Q That a captain who had an alcohol problem who suffered
(10) from alcoholism of a supertanker presented a clear and present
(1i) danger to the vessel if he was drinking again to the vessel (12) and the environment -
(13) A it he was drinking if anybody was drinking, actually
(14) Q Now the rankings that you looked at today where you had
(15) him in the middle those were not the final rankings were
(16) they? Those were your recommendations?
(17) A That was the - I belleve the final ranking for the west
(18) coast fleet
(19) Q Was that the final Exxon Shipping Company ranking for that (20) year?
(21) A belleve they were melded with the gult coast masters (22) Q Would it be fair to say from your testimony today that on
(23) the evening of the 23rd there was no need for the Valdez to go
(24) out at night and there was no need for the Valdez to have run
(25) the risk of that ice at night that it could have waited for
(I) another day?
(2) A If there was a spectic reason the ship could have stayed
(3) Q Are you aware at all of the ice telex?
(4) A Which ice telex?
(5) Q Captain Martineau sending an ice telex on or about
(6) March 161989 to some part of the west coast fleet
(7) recommending that Exxon Shipping Company vessels only take
(8) passage because of ice conditions during the day?
(9) A I ve heard about that but I don t remember seeing it
(10) O You ve heard about it though?
(11) A Yee, from counsel
(12) Q You testified that you monitored Captain Hazelwood and I m
(13) Just going to ask a series of questions that all have to do
(14) with monitoring whether you did or didn t do it okay? Did
(15) you ever talk to anybody in the medical department about
(16) Captain Hazelwood?
(17) A No sir
(19) Q Did you ever talk to anybody in the - what is it human
(19) resources section or department that Dan Paul heads up about
(20) Captain Hazelwood and drınkıng?
(21) A No, sir
(22) Q Did you document any of the so called monitoring of Captain
(23) Hazelwood?
(24) A Theres nothing to document
(25) Q Okay Did you ever inquire of the Exxon Shipping Company

## Vol 172617

(I) agent Alamar in Valdez about Captain Hazelwood and drinkıng?
(2) ANo sir
(3) Q Did you ever do a random search of Captain Hazelwoods
(4) quarters?
(5) ANo sir
(6) Q Did you ever search the ship?
(7) A No sir However the - all of the ships in the west
(8) coast fleet in the - I believe in 1989, were golng to be (9) randomly searched and one had been scheduled for the Exxon
(10) Long Beach and then canceled just prior to the Incident because
(1i) they couldn t get the dogs, but this was - thla was planned
(12) Q Would it be fair to say that during your tenure there were
(i3) no searches of the Exxon Valdez with regard to alcohol?
(14) A That I am aware of that s correct
(15) Q And you never asked anyone at Exxon Corporation other than
(16) the conversation you related with regard to Mr Borgen about
(17) Captaın Hazelwood and drınkıng on dury did you about his
(18) history?
(19) A About his history?
(20) Q Yes sir
(21) A No, sir
(22) Q And you never discussed Captain Hazelwood $s$ - the issue of
(23) Captain Hazelwood s alcohol problems with other supervisors
in
(24) the west coast fleet office other than Mr Borgen did you?
(25) A My understanding was that Mr Borgen told me that In

Vol 172618
confidence and the policy is clear that the whole issue of rehab is nat to be discussed unless the employee brings it up
(3) Q And you never discussed the issue of rehabilitation with
(4) Captain Hazelwood did you?
(5) MR NEAL Your Honor this is getting repettive now
) from his examination yesterday Maybe I waste more time making
the objection than letting him go ahead but l object on
repetition covering the same ground
THE COURT IIl allow it
MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
(11) I msorry Could you read back that question?
(12) (Requested testimony read)
(13) THE WITNESS No sir I think I explained that
(14) yesterday
(15) BYMR O NEILL
(16) Q And you were provided with no professional training
(17) regarding how to monitor a recovering alcoholic were you?
(18) A Well, the thing is that during the 87 and 88 time trame
(19) the Exxon Shipping Company organization was Inundated with
(20) documentation, much of it sent at home, about alcohol, alcohol
(21) poilcy actually what to look for what the criteria is it
(22) was covered in fleet conferences it was covered in seminars

4
(23) and IInally, it was covered on board the ships with
(24) discussions with the ships They were requested as well to
(25) diacuss the whole issue during their safety - safety meetings

## Vol 172619

(1) so that everybody would be aware of the issuea
(2) Q Sir would you go to page 144 of your deposition
(3) transcript? It s right over there to the left it sin the
(a) big volumes

A Hundred and what?
Q 144
A Yes sir
Q And 1 m going to read the question at line 18 and your
answer The question at line -
MR NEAL Excuse mejust one moment May I have that page again?
THE WITNESS 144
BY MR O NEILL
(14) Q Why don tyou read the question and answer from line 18 to (15) line 21
(16) A Dld you ever recelve any kind of professional training by
(17) Exxon regarding how to monltor a recovering alcohollc $I$
sald
(18) no sir
(19) You want me to continue?
(20) Q No Well you can read - I mean if you want to
(21) A Asked if I went to an AA meeting
(22) Q It s another topic Have you ever been to an AA meeting?
(23) A No I think the point I m getting at is I was looking at
(24) this -
(25) Q My point is were you asked the question and did you give
(I) the answer?
(2) Almean a doctor did not discuss this with me but there
(3) was a tremendous amount of information that was
disseminated,
(4) the issues were covered In fleet conferences, there were also
(5) seminars And as I also explained in and relevant to myselt
(6) my father was as close to an alcoholic as you can get, and I
(7) have seen people that have had the problems that have actually
(8) been retired because of it in the early 708 where 1 worked
(9) So I ve got a lot of information and, prior to this, I did not
(10) study the alcohol policy I was given certaln things to study
(11) that were - that were called for and for this presentation I
(12) have this - I have gone back and looked at some of the
(13) documentation that I had eeen, and that I certalnly didn t
(14) remember at the time of the deposition
(15) Q What did you just call this?
(16) A The alcohol policy -
(17) Q No Didn tyou fust refer to your appearance here today as
(18) this presentation?
(19) Albeg your pardon?
(20) Q Did you just refer to your appearance here today as this (21) presentation?
(22) A I was thinking of the presentations about alcohol I may (23) have misspoke
(24) MR O NEILL I have nothing further
(25) MR NEAL I guess Your Honor wouldn ! want me to ask

## Vol 172621

(1) One more - one question? I m not pushing it Your Honor
(2) THE COURT Then let s go to another witness
(3) MR NEAL All right What would you say if I d said
(4) I was pushing it let s go to another witness?
(5) THE COURT Right
(6) MR NEAL Okay Your Honor could I just move over
(7) here ןust one minute?
(8) THE COURT 1 m sorry What do you want to do?
(9) MR NEAL Could I move over with Mr O Nelll to the
(10) side bar just one second while he s getung ready?
(11) (At side bar off the Record)
(12) THE WITNESS I can leave?
(13) MR SANDERS You can step down
(14) THE WITNESS Thank you
(15) THE COURT You re through sir Thank you
(16) Mr Montague?
(17) MR MONTAGUE Your Honor Plaintiffs call as their
(18) next witness Dr Richard Masters as an expert witness
(19) THE CLERK Raise your right hand please sir
(20) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(21) THE CLERK Please be seated For the record sir
(22) state your full name give us your address and spell your last
(23) name please
(24) THE WITNESS My name is Richard L Masters My
(25) address is 5299 DTC Boulevard Englewood Colorado And my
(1) name is speiled M A S TERS
(2) THECLERK Thank you sir
(3) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF RICHARD L MASTERS (Live)
(4) BYMR MONTAGUE
(5) Q Dr Masters could you please tell the jury your
(6) educational background?
(7) A I went to college at Wayne University in Detroit, Michigan,
(8) where I received a bachelor's degree in psychology I then
(9) started work on a master 8 degree and had a teaching fellowship
(10) In psychology I did not complete the master s degree because
(11) I had an opportunity, somewhat unexpected opportunity to enter
(12) medical school and I went to the Unlversity of Michigan for
(13) four years and graduated from there
(14) Q Doctor could you keep your voice up a little bit? I think
(15) we re having trouble hearing you
(16) THE COURT Doctor that silver microphone will
(17) amplity if you get it over in front of you and speak into it
(18) It II broadcast your vorce
(19) THE WITNESS Thank you
(20) MR MONTAGUE Thank you very much
(21) THE WITNESS I graduated from the University of
(22) Michigan in 1957 with an M D degree took an internship then
(23) entered the United States Air Force
(24) I was in the Alr Force for a total of nearly ien years
(25) During my work in the Air Force I took a master s degree in

## Vol 172623

(1) public health preventive medicine and occupational medicine at
(2) Harvard University and completed my residency training for my
(3) board certification
(4) BYMR MONTAGUE
(5) Q What is occupational medicine Doctor?
(6) A That s the study of the diseases of work environments as
(7) they affect humans and the - and the effect of humans in their
(8) work environment
(9) Q Okay And today do you have a specialty?
(10) AYes
(1i) Q Could you tell us what it is?
(12) A m a special - I mboard certitied by the American Board
(13) of Preventive Medicine in aviation medicine, and my
epecialty
(i4) la preventlve medicine, aviatlon and occupationai medicine
(15) Q Do you have any special expertise in alcohol abuse
(16) programs?
(17) A Yes
(18) Q And does that include the monitoring of employees in safety
(19) sensitive positions?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q Could you tell us how you developed that expertise?
(22) A Well, skipping anything that I might have had contact with
(23) In the Alr Force 1 start with my assignment or my work after 1
(24) left the Alr Force at the Lovelace Foundation for Medical
(25) Education and Research At that organization I became the
chairman of the department of preventive medicine and as a
(2) part of that work there I was responsible for a number of
(3) consulting contracts with various organizations probably
the
4) most significant being the - what we called then the atomic energy commission
Q And what did you do with respect to the atomic energy commission?
A Well I had a number of roles there, but -
Q I mean relating to an alcohol abuse program?
A Yes sir relating to that I was a consultant to the
commission in drawing up and enhancing the standards for
the
(12) selection for the continued duty and for special evaluations of
(13) the persons who had hands on contact with nuclear weapons, the
(14) couriers who transported those weapons and the methods
of
(15) transportation by land, sea and air
(16) Q Have you recelved any grants from the National Institute of
(17) Alcohol Abuse and Alcoholism?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q What is that what is that institute?
(20) A That s one of the national institutes of health that deals
(21) with, as the name says alcoholism and alcohol abuse
(22) Q And could you tell us if that grant included within it the
(23) area of monitoring of safety sensitive positions?

A Yes it did
Q And when did you get that grant?

## Vof 172625

(1) A The grant - the grant began on September 11 th, 1974
(2) Q And when did you finish your work officially under that
(3) grant?
(4) A The officlal cessation of the grant was December 31st, 1982
(6) Q So that was approximately an eight year project?

AYes sir
(8) Q Okay Now can you tell us what you just - very briefly
what you did under that grant?
(10) A Basically, we developed a program for the dealing of
(11) alcoholism in the safety sensitive positions In the alrife
(12) Industry
(13) Q And does that - the study that came out of that grant (14) does that have a name?
(15) A Yee We called it the Human Intervention and Motlvation
(16) Study, and the acronym for that is juet HIMS, HIMS
(17) Q Okay And as a result of HIMS-Doctor have you had
(18) occasion to familiarize yourself with alcohol programs
(19) including monitoring programs in industries other than (20) aviation?
(21) A Oh yes Before you get a grant for example you have to (22) provide a very detailed written request detalling precisely (23) what you re going to do and we did a great deal of study of (24) programs that were in effect before the onset of the grant, and
(25) then as a consequence of having the grant, we did a wide study,

Vol 172626
(1) collected hundreds of programs from major industries around the
(2) country
(3) Q Now with respect to your study of - which we ll call
4) HIMS have you had requests from other industries for copies of
(5) that?
(6) AYes

Q I mean when I say other industries I mean industries
(8) outside of the airline industry?
(9) AYes
(10) Q And can you estimate how many?
(ii) A In a rough way, yes
(12) Q Could you tell us?
(13) A Well the National Institute of Alcohol Abuse and
(14) Alcoholism provided our name to a number of industries who were
(is) Inquiring about these types of programs, so we really got some
(16) Inquirles before the completion of the program, but once we
(17) completed the program we printed a thousand coples of the
(18) report
(19) And then I recall that we had to go back and do a second
(20) printing of another 500 copies I would estimate that maybe
(21) $\mathbf{5 0 0}$ copies went to the aviation industry in general so there
(22) were probably about a thousand coples that got distributed one
(23) way or the other including these numerous requests we have
(24) vartous groups
(25) Q Okay Now are you yourself involved in actual

## Vol 172627

(1) monitoring of employees in safety sensitive positions where
(2) employees have returned from some form of alcohol treatment
3) program?
4) A You mean right now?
(5) QYes

A Yes
Q And have you been doing that for a while?
A Yes a long time
Q For how long?
(10) A For about 27 years - or 17 years, 1 m sorry
(11) Q 17 years? Okay And do the principles of monitoring that
(12) you apply do they also apply to other industries involving
(13) safety sensitive positions?
(14) A Yes
(15) MR MONTAGUE Your Honor I would offer Dr Masters
(16) as an experi in occupational and preventive medicine and
(17) specifically in monitoring procedures for employees in satety
(18) sensitive positions with alcohol abuse problems and other
(19) substance abuse problems
(20) MR LYNCH Your Honor III reserve any questions I
(21) have on that subject for cross
(22) THE COURT Thank you The Court will accept Dr
(23) Masters qualifications
(24) MR MONTAGUE Thank you
(25) BY MA MONTAGUE
(1) Q Doctor I d like to now turn to monitoning We ve heard a
(2) lot about that the last couple of days and the questions -
(3) I d like you to understand that the questions I ask you are
(4) going to not just relate to monitoring generally but to
(5) monitoring of employees who return to a safety sensitive
(6) position after having completed some form of alcohol treatment
(7) program Okay?
(8) AYes
(9) Q Can you keep that in mind? Okay By the way is the
(10) captain of a large oil tanker considered a safety sensituve
(山) position?
(12) A I would consider him so yes
(13) Q Okay Now in the context that I ve placed this for
(14) employees who return to satety sensitive positions after
(15) completing some form of alcohol treatment in that context
(16) could you tell us what the word monitoring means to you?
(17) A Yes it has a rather specialized meaning because
(18) monitoring really is the overall technique that you use to
(19) prevent and deal with anything that might lead to a relapse
(20) Q Okay And can you tell us does monitoring require some
(21) Kind of formal program to be effective?
(22) A Ye: We certalnly believe that
(23) Q And going back I want to go back now to 1985 and even
(24) before then was monitoring for people returning to these
(25) positions after treatment was that a recognized concept?

## Vol 172629

(1) A Yes I belleve so
(2) Q And in 1985 were there widely known methods for monitoring
(3) that were employed by corporations and other organizations?
(4) AYes
(5) Q And if a corporation or an organization in 1985 wanted to
(6) find out what those methods are were there sources that were
(7) readily avallable?
(8) A Yes
(9) Q And could you tell us what some of those sources were?
(10) A Well, I think the first place you would consider looking
(11) would be to the National Instltute of Alcohol Abuse and
(12) Alcoholism, which had a very large occupational programe
(13) division and an established clearinghouse for Information that
(14) was available to any corporation or even the general public
(15) Q Are there any other organizations that would have
(16) information available as to methods of monitoring by
(17) corporations or other organizations back in 1985?
(18) A The Natlonal Council on Alcoholism would have some
(19) Information on that or would have had Information on that at
(20) that time
(21) Q Anything else that comes to mind?
(22) A Yes. There $s$ an organlzation called the Assoctation of
(23) Labor Management Consultants and Advisors in

Alcoholism an
(24) acronym for that is ALMCAA and they would have had information
(25) avallable at that time In tact, actually, publications

Vol 172630
Q So back in 85 or before if a corporation wanted to have a monitoring program especially for persons in safety sensitive positions and especially where they ve returned from some form of alcohol treatment that information was readily available is that a fair statement?
A Yes From those organizations, as well as interchange of information between corporations or organizations
Q is that the sort of information alcohol abuse programs and ways to do it and monitoring is that the type of information in your experience that large corporations are willing to share amongst themselves?
A I ve rarely seen anyone refuse to share that information Q Okay Now can you describe for us as you understand it and based on your experience the major features of a monitoring program? And I d like you to do that if you can based on what was avallable in the early 80 s or at least 1985 And again relating to employees in safety sensitive posittons who have returned from some form of alcohol treatment
A Well monitoring is a concept that needs to be formalized in a plan, and it needs to Involve a relatlonship between the operational supervisors and the medical department and
the
(23) individual or indlviduals being monitored
(24) Q And can you tell us - can you sort of tell us the roles
(25) that each of those - well first of all when you say a

## Vol 172631

(1) formalızed plan what s that supposed to set forth?
(2) A Well, it should be a written plan and th should be
(3) explained very carefully the relationship between supervisory
(4) personnel and the medical department personnel and what their
(5) specific roles are
(6) Q Okay Could you tell us for example what the - what the
(7) role of the supervisor is and what - and its relation - and
(8) the supervisor s relationship to the medical department?
(9) A Well, the supervisor is responsible for looking at the (10) overall behavior of an employee who has returned to work and
(11) for keeping in mind that you have to have a broad concept In (12) dealing with this He has to understand the employee as well
(13) as he can, he has to be concerned about the employee, and he
(14) has to be alert to any observations that he might make about
(15) changes In that employee a behavlor, the way he approaches his
(16) Job, that type of thing
(17) Q Okay And does the supervisor get any - should there be
(18) interaction between the medical department and the supervisor
(19) before the supervisor begins to watch that particular employee
(20) or keep an eye on him?
(21) A Yes The medical department would play a very key role in
(22) this, assuming for example that they would have made a return
(23) to work or itness for duty determination after the person
(24) comes out of the inpatient treatment program The medical
(25) department would Interact with the supervisor of a given
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

Individual and together they would talk about what the (2) monitoring program should be The medical department should
(3) meet with the individual before he $s$ returned to duty, and then
(4) should have periodic meetings with him throughout the time of
his monitoring, as should supervisors
(6) Q Okay Now would it be fair to characterize the supervisor
(7) as the eyes and ears of the medical department?

A That sa
Q Is that a fair -
A Yeah, that s a good term yeah
Q Now when the supervisor sees something that is unusual or
nolices something in behavior or hears a report about behavior
(13) or drinking or whatever what - how does he then interact with
(14) the medical department?
(15) A I think the medical officer should be consulted by the
(16) supervisor They should have a conference discuss the the
(17) findings or observations of the supervisor We re certainly
(18) assuming that the supervisor will have done some preliminary
(19) investigation of the problem and can give a fairly good
(20) description to the medical officer of what the problem might (21) be
(22) Q Okay Now is it monitoring - is it monitoring if the
(23) supervisor never reports anything to the medical department?
(24) A No not under the plan that I ve described
(25) Q And why not?

## Vol 172633

(1) A Well, the - the whole monitoring program is aimed toward
(2) prevention What you re looking at is making sure that the
(3) person has continued in his progress and his aftercare program
(4) is in continuing care and is being observed very closely in
(5) every way Medical department may have Information pertaining
(6) to this particular case which might cause them to have reason
(7) to periorm a formal protessional evaluation for example
(8) Q And might that be information that is not avalable outside
(9) of the medical department?
(10) A Yes, they had - would have the records from the treatment
(11) center They would have the frequent reports from the (12) aftercare program all of those types of things
(13) Q And what if they didn thave those records?
(14) A Well I think they would have to have them I don think
(15) It would be an adequate monitoring program if they didn t
(16) Q Does a - in a responsible monitoring program is the - is
(17) 11 proper for the medical department to require the employee
(18) who has been in treatment to make his records available? As a
(19) condition of returning to his safety sensitive position?
(20) A I believe it is I believe that it would be quite
(21) important I can $t$ concelve of how the medical department
(22) could make judgments without having that information aviilable
(23) to them
(24) Q Would it at least be appropriate to ask for them?
(25) A More than appropriate
(1) Q Okay Now let s get back on the beat here Once the
(2) supervisor spots something and reports it to the medical
(3) department someone in the medical department - and I take it
(4) that s a doctor?
(5) A Yes
(6) Q Okay Then what sthe next step?
(7) A Well -
(8) $Q$ In this -
(9) A Let me Interrupt you, if I may That could be the
(10) physician or he might have assigned a particular employee
(山) assistance person program person to accept the Inltial
(12) reports Ilke that, but generally it would be the physician
(13) himselt, especially in the role of great responsiblity
(14) Q Would it be fair to say it would be a physician or someone
(15) especially trained?
(16) A In all cases, yes
(17) Q Now let s assume that the report is made then to that -
(18) to the medical department and the person within it who should
(19) receive it What happens next in the medical department?
(20) A The medical officer should review the report carefully,
(21) discuss it carefully with the supervisor, make any
(22) determination that he feels able to make at that point in
time,
(23) but most likely shouid see the employee face to face
(24) Q And that s the person in the medical department?
(25) AYes

## Vol 172635

(1) Q And after that then is it the person in the medical (2) department that determines what steps should be taken with (3) respect to the employee in that safery sensitive position?
(4) A Well it always has -
(5) Q Do you understand that?
(6) A lthink I do It would always have - it would always have (7) to be done in conjunction with the supervisor Medical
(8) department interactions invoive the responsibllity of making
(9) recommendations
(10) Q Okay And then that s-the medical department would make
(i1) its recommendation after it s interviewed the employee?
(12) A Well, it may do more than that You know the medlcal
(13) department would have to perform a protessional
evaluation of
(14) this individual in their meeting with this Individual, and
(15) there $s$ a whole gamut of things that, you know, the medical
-
(16) you know the medlcal department might need to do The outcome
(17) of this meeting in the medical department could be anything
(18) from go back to work, calling the supervisor saying look I
(19) don think this is important I see no evidence of a problem
(20) here, or they might say well, look, he s having some
problems
(21) with - with one of his children, we re going to get some
(22) family counseling Introduced Or he s got financial problems,
(23) we re going to get one of our financial people, all of those (24)
a
(25) more specialized protessional evaluation on the individual and

Vol $17 \quad 2636$
may call in other people or send the Individual to - to
another type of specialist maybe a psychlatrist, whatever
call the aftercare monitoring counselor see it he s got any
input what he thinks He might want to you know, increase
the monttoring program He might want to enhance it so to
speak He might say look let $s$, in conjunctlon, say with the
counselor at the aftercare program he might say, well, let s
go ahead
Q Might he pull him off the job say wait until we get the evaluation?
A I was talking about a gamut, and that s sort of the end of the road, but if he has to go that far yes, he would pull him off the Job, do whatever is necessary have other valuatlons
and so forth, sure
Q Okay Now have you reviewed Exxon s alcohol policies and their supervisors guidelines with respect to those policies?
A Yes, I have
Q And have you heard the testimonies in this courtroom of
Drs Montgomery Gould and Nealy?
A Yes, I have
Q And have you looked at their depositions?
AYes
Q And have you heard the testımony of Mary Williamson last Friday and Steve Day?
$A$ That was read

Vol $17 \quad 2638$
Q Is that what a protessional in the medical department would
(2) do if he were interviewing Hazelwood Captain Hazelwood after
that type of report?
A No It s not even what a supervisor should do
(5) Q Okay And I also - Mr Myers was asked by Mr Neal what
would you have done had you heard Steve Day when he - when
he
mentioned the San Francisco Bay Mary Williamson story and he
) said I would have asked Day to accompany me to Mr Borgen s
office-we would have brought in Mary Williamson we would have
(10) brought Captain Hazelwood in Captain Hazelwood to hear his
(11) side of the story is that what a medical department would do
(12) if it were reported that incident?
(13) A No I don t-Idont-I wouldn t-I wouldn take
(14) that type of action
(15) Q Well is that what you would expect?
(16) A No, it 8 not what I would expect
(17) Q ls it correct that people in the medical department are
(18) trained to know how to determine if a person who has been
(19) through alcohol treatment and who is in a safety sensitive
(20) position that they re trained to be able to ferret out if
(21) someone is in denial or whether they re actually - they re
(22) more apt to be able to ferret out what $s$ really going on?
(23) A They should be if they re going to make montoring work
(24) effectively
(25) Q And is that normally the case?

## Vol 172639

A That, In my experience, yes
(1) QYes

Q And the video deposition of Steve Day on Monday?
A Yes, yes
Q And were you here to hear the testimony of Captain Sheehy
(6) and Paul Myers?
(7) A Yes for both gentlemen

Q And on that based on that information in your opinion
(9) did Exxon - did Exxon s alcohol policy and program whatever (10) It was provide for monitoring?

A ifound nothing in the paperwork that I didn tind - 1
(12) didn $t$ find the word monitoring In any of the provisions so
(13) I would have to say no
(14) Q All nght
(15) In your opinion what captain Hazel - I m sorry what
(18) Exxon did as to Captain Hazelwood as described by Captain
(18) Exxon did as to Captain Hazelwood as described by Captain
(17) Sheehy and Paul Myers does that constitute monitoring?
(18) A No, It does not
(19) Q I d like to - I d like to take some notes this morning and (20) you recall Mr Myers testifying that with respect to the
(21) Portland Shipyard incident he said I spoke to Hazelwood alone
(22) I asked Hazelwood it he had any personal problems or any
(23) problems at all and he said no
(24) Do you recall that testimony?
(25) A Yes, sir

Vot 172637
(2) AYes
(4) A Yea, yes

A Yes,

Q And monitoring as you ve described it is it effective?
A ithink lt quise effectlve, yes
Q Okay Now I want to turn for a minute to job performance
and you ve heard testimony that Exxon in their alcohol policy
their supervisors were looking to job performance as the main
criteria as to whether someone was okay and is that a proper
criteria on which to base a monitoring program?
A No it s not It s-I would characterize it as even
dangerous to base everything on that

- Dangerous?

A Yes
(13) Q Why would you say it $s$ dangerous?
(14) A Well flrst of all, it a not preventively oriented You
(15) need to take In all elements of the person a conduct and (16) behavior and the way he approaches his work 1 feel that both
(17) performance and skill in professionals ls one of the last
(18) things to go, and $i$ really wouldn't want to have that happen
(19) when a alety senaitive person is driving a train controlling
(20) a ship, flying an airplane
(21) $Q$ In other words the first - the first mistake that
(22) manifests itself could be the big one is that what you mean?
(23) A Yes I don twant to see that happen, you know, on
(24) approach to Kennedy airport with a load of passengers, for
(25) example

## Vol 172640

(1) Q Okay Now I want to turn for a second to monitoring -
(2) monitoring program and paperwork and if a monitoring
program
(3) is in effect would you expect - you testified that there
(4) would be a written plan?
(5) A Yes, sir
(6) Q And would that include written guidelınes as to what the
(7) medical department should do and what the supervisors should do
and how they interact?
A Yes, sir
Q That would be explicit?
A Yes
Q And did you find that in Exxon?
A No
Q And would you expect also to find paperwork documenting
the
(15) activities of the supervisors if they found anything or
(16) reported anything to the medical department?
(17) AYes
(18) Q And would you expect to find anything when the - in the
(19) files of the employee in the safety sensitive position when the (20) medical department made its evaluation of that report?
(21) A Yes the flle would start with you know a
(22) fitness for duty and then make any further reports of any
(23) special evaluation conducted which were brought to their
(24) attention or that they found out in their interviews ${ }^{\text {Ls }}$ with the
(25) person But those reports would have to be handled In a very

## Vol 172641

confldentlal manner and the report itself merely would be a
(2) record of what was done That sall that would get to the
(3) personnel flle I ve examined this person and Ifind him fit
(4) for duty, or this person was removed for duty for a period and
soforth
Q And when there are no such records elther a written plan
) or guidelines telling employees how to act both the medical
department and the supervisor s department and where there s
(9) nothing in the files of the employee either the personnel
(10) files or the medical records or anything like that does that
suggest to you that there s no effective monitoring program in place?
(i3) AYes
(14) MR MONTAGUE Thank you very much Dr Masters
(15) THE COURT You want to cross examıne?
(16) MA LYNCH Let me have just a moment
(17) THE COURT Certainly
(18) MR LYNCH Maylapproach the witness Your Honor?
(19) Your Honor if I may I II offer Defendants Exhibit 9147
(20) (Exhibit 9147 offered)
(21) MR MONTAGUE No objection
(22) THE COURT Defendants 9147 is admitted
(23) (Exhibit 9147 received)
(24) BYMR LYNCH
(25) Qihanded you Dr Masters a document marked as Exhibit
(1) 9147 now in evidence entitled An Employee Assistance Program
(2) for Professional Pilots an Eight Year Review See that
(3) document sir?
(4) A I have that
(5) Q And is this the document that you referred to in your
(6) direct testimony as having printed first a thousand and then
(7) another 500 copies?
(8) A Yes, sir
(9) Q And this is the outcome of your grant from the National
(1)) Institute of Alcohol Abuse and Alcoholism is that correct?
(11) A it a final report There were a number of other reports
(12) submitted as interim reports that were required over the
eight
(13) years
(14) Q And -
(15) A More detalled
(16) Q This report relates does it not sir to a program that
(17) you developed as aeromedical consuitant to the Airline Pilot s
(18) Association and would you say that when you spoke about your
(19) view of monitoring and what would make a good monitoring aspect
(20) of an alcohol policy for safety sensitive positions that this
(21) program as spelled out in this report reflects your views on
(22) that subject?
(23) A Well as lsaid, this is a general report There $s$ not a (24) great deal of detail in this report on the program of - for (25) monitoring That was developed in the years from 1974 to 1975

## Vol 172643

(1) and 76 and those were years that were covered by the interim
(2) reports detailed reporta to the National Institute of Alcohol
(3) Abuse and Alcoholism The monitoring materlal would be -
(4) would be found more in those interim reports
(5) Q So is it your testimony that this 1982 document does not
(6) contain disclosure of your views on monitoring?
(7) A It has - it has comments on monitoring, yes, sir
(8) Q And is it fair when you talked about this document having
(9) been disseminated to other industnes and so forth that you
(10) were referring to this document as a document which would
(ii) disclose your views on the conduct of monitoring?
(12) A Yes It - it would do that and this is a document that
(13) was produced and then any special or specific questlons
that
(14) may come up, we would handle as inquirles came In
(15) Q Okay now your own direct involvement in monitoring the 17
(18) or so years that you spoke about is that monitoning involved
(17) in the field of airiine pilots and airline fight attendants?
(18) A Certainly for the first - no, I- did you say fllght
(19) attendants?
(20) Oldid sir
(21) A Then the answer would be no
(22) $Q$ The answer would be no it s not involving that fieid?
(23) A I have never monitored ilight attendants
(24) Q Okay if llimit the question to airline pilots -
(25) A Yes, we - we certalnly help the ilight attendants develop
their monitoring programs but yes, my monitoring would be of
airline pilots
Q So when you spoke of 17 years of experience in monitonng
people in safety sensitive position in the airine industry
you were talking about air monitoring airline pilots?
A No, I d have to go back to my work with the Atomic Energy
Commlssion because we monitored there with possible problems of
alcohol and drug abuse
Q And you were directly involved in that?
A Yes, sir
(11) Q So your experience involves airline pilots and couriers of
(12) nuclear weapons?
(13) A Yes, and then in my work with the National Aeronautics and
(14) Space Administration, it involves monitoring of persons in
(15) safety sensitlve positions at NASA, at the filght research
(16) facillity
(17) Q Was that work before you joined ALPA or was that during the
(18) time you were area medical advisor for ALPA?
(19) A Well both I guess I d have to explain to you that, when I
(20) came to Lovelace out of the Air Force, I was then responsible
(21) for monitoring and other types of programs to assure

## fitness

(22) for duty in sensitive - saiety sensitive positions for the
(23) entire operations surrounding the test pllot work for NASA
(24) development of new alrcraft, modifications, development of
(25) varlous systems and so on, and I was the supervisor of the

## Vod 172645

clinic at the Dryden Flight Research Center for a number of years while all the time i was at Lovelace and for two years thereafter, and then I ceased Interacting with that, because the new chalrman of the department after I left Lovelace took
(5) over that role gradually

Then I got back Into that work in, I belleve 1986 I wouldn $t$ be quite positlve on that without looking, but I got Into that role then in 1986 as the flight surgeon for the NASA Ames Research Center and the facility at Dryden
(10) Q Do you recall testifying at your deposition that the only
(11) time you ve been employed in the development of alcohol
(12) monitoring policies is for airline pilots?
(13) A I very well may have, not thinking in terms of anything (14) elae but my alrilne pllot saseoclation work
(15) Q is it fair to say the bulk of your experience and views
(18) that you formed were formed with your work through the aurline
(17) pilot s assoctation?
(18) A Within monitoring, sir or -
(19) Q 1 include monitoring in the broad topic of alcohol policy
(20) but I don ilmit it to that certainly
(21) Al developed a lot of my ideas about monitoring in my work
(22) with the Atomic Energy Commlaclon, carried that over to the
(23) alrline pilot sassociation and bulk of the work is with
(24) alrline pilot $s$, yes
(25) Q Now you would agree don $t$ you that it s a good thing for
(1) a corporation to have a policy for dealing with employees who
(2) have an alcohol problem?
(3) AYes sir
(4) Q You generally agree that it s a bad thing to deal with the (5) problem of alcoholism or alcohol problems by simply I think
(6) you called it the knee jerk reaction of firing people?
(7) AYes
(8) Q And in fact that $s$ what you ve devoted your career to
(9) isn tit sir-irying to save the career of pilots in
(10) particular who otherwise would have a problem with alcohol?
(i1) A WeH I ve-alcohol has not been my entire career, sir
(12) You know I deal with all types of occupational problems
(13) related to aviation I would say the alcohol cases would
(14) involve about 10 percent of all of the medical cases that I ve
(15) had over the years involving pilots and associated people
(16) Q Well do you really disagree with the premise that one of
(17) the things you sought to achieve as aeromedical advisor of the
(18) airline pilot s association was to save the job and careers of
(19) pilots who otherwise would not have a license?
(20) A That 8 correct
(21) Q And you ve never been employed to develop an alcohol policy
(22) Outside government or the airline industry is that correct?
(23) A Employed, no
(24) Q Now you re being paid today for your testimony is that
(25) correct?

## Vol 172647

(1) AYes sir
(2) Q And your agreement to make yourself avaliable to the
(3) plaintiffs to testity is something that you did reluctantly is
(4) that correct?
(5) A Yes In fact there is no written agreement at all
(6) Q Well but - but you were approached by Dr O Connor and
(7) asked to testify or to -
(8) A Yes, sir
(9) Q - to cooperate with the plaintiffs in this case?
(10) A Yes, sir
(11) Q And your first reaction was that s something you didn t
(12) want to do?
(13) A Yes, sir
(14) Q Did your prior association with air Captain - Captain
(15) Hazelwood Captain Hazelwood of Pan Amencan have anything
to
(16) do with your decision to -
(17) A Absolutely not
(18) Q You did have a previous professional experience with
(19) Captain Hazelwood s father did you not?
(20) A Not exactly a professional experience, I was involved in (21) the Interchange of some communicatlons He was never a patient
(22) of mine I didn thave any direct medical Involvement with
(23) him
(24) Q As a member of the airline pilots association he asked you
(25) to support an application to change a FAA rule that related to


## Vol 172649

Q An adamant supporter of the dissolution - why don tyou read it?
A You read better than I do, but I II be glad to Captain Hazelwood Pan Am Captaln Hazelwood was an adamant supporter at
the diasolution of the FAA age 60 rule Captain Hazelwood, to
(6) my recollection provided me with certaln information pertaining to his good health and then asked that I petition the Federal Aviation Administration for an exemption from the
(9) age $\mathbf{6 0}$ rule that would apply to him
(10) Q Question And what was the result of his request to you?
(11) A i refused to do that to comply with his request
(12) Q So you did refuse?
(13) A That was my recollection at the time Subsequent to that,
(14) I was able to find the record on the original Captain
(15) Hazelwood - and I would have to elaborate on that a blt
(16) Q I guess my question is do you now say you didn it refuse (17) the request?
(18) A No, I m not saying that I maying there salot of (19) Involved reasons for -
(20) Qim sure Mr Montague can bring it out if he wishes to but (21) you did refuse that request is that correct?
(22) A No, the president of the alrilne pllots assoclatlon refused (23) the request
(24) Q Is that after Captain Hazelwood complained about your (25) relusal?

5-25-94
VOLUME 17
xMax 117
${ }^{-}$
(1) Vol 172650
(1) Al did not respond to Captain Hazelwood The legal
(2) department of the airline pilots association responded to
(3) Captain Hazeiwood
(4) Q Well did your altercation with Captain Hazelwood -
(5) A I didn thave an altercation with Captain Hazelwood
(6) Q - have anything to do with your ultimate choice to -
(7) A Well, that s a mischaracterization I did not have an
(8) altercation Thls was not a face to face thing at all it was
(9) all correspondence
(10) Q You recall that or you ve now looked at correspondence
(1i) which changed your memory?
(12) A Yes, it shanged my memory because I- now I m not
(13) saying I never met Captain Hazelwood I probably did I
had
(14) no ldea who he was I made no connection, but in - In the
(15) Exxon Captain Hazelwood s deposition, he said that his father
(16) had made some disparaging remarks about me that caused me to
(17) think back and I said my goodness there was a Hazelwood
in
(18) the airline pilots association
(19) Q At your deposition did you testify that you told him he
(20) didn $t$ have a right to demand that I do this so he took it to
(21) the president of the association wrote some derogatory
(22) comments about me to the president? Did that come from you
or
(23) from the Exxon lawyer?
(24) A No that came from the legal department of the airline
(25) pilots association

## Vol 172651

(1) Q Could you look at page 669 and if you will will you look
(2) at lines 20 through 247
(3) A Yes sir That was my recollection at the time betorel
(4) consulted the records
(5) Q All right and was that your recollection when the
(6) plaintitfs approached you in this case?
(7) A I had nothing - I had no recollection at all I knew of
(8) no connection between the man who was -
(9) Q Captain Hazelwood at Pan Am had no involvement in your
(10) decision to take on this matter?
(11) A Oh, absolutely not
(12) Q Okay
(13) A I didn t even remember about it
(14) O With reference to follow up on employees who have been
(15) treated for alcohol problems is it the case Dr Masters that
(16) you do not favor alcohol testıng?
(17) A Yes sir that ls the case
(18) Q ls it -
(19) A Bur that 8 related to alcohol testing of whole
(20) populations It would not necessarily be the case with
(21) satety sensitive positions if it were felt to be indicated by
(22) the medical officer at the time of a reported problem
(23) Q Okay let me - let me just go into that for a second
(24) Your view is that you re opposed to periodic or unannounced or (25) random testing is that correct?

A That has been my view for years especially of alcohol testing
Q Of alcohol testing in particular correct?
A Yes, sir
Q And you re also opposed to random testing for other drugs of abuse?
A Yes I d say my view may have moderated a bit on that but
yes
Q Your former view was it could be called medical
McCarthyism?
A That wasn t my - I wish I could have claimed that term
It was a term I adopted from an article I read
Q You did embrace it is that correct?
A Yes sir
Q As to testing for drugs other than alcohol?
A Yes, sir
Q In your view about testing for alcohol is that you didn t
support it because testing for alcohol really measures an
alcohol state at a moment in time isn that correct?
A Measures an - it measures an alcohol concentration at a point in time and most importantly, though, alcohol testing, 1
(22) have not felt was sustainable for large groups of people In (23) other words, random alcohol testing, just going out and (24) randomly alcohol testing I didn t think it was sustainable (25) for a large group of people as a type of screening evaluation
(1) A Not specifically I don t deny it was asked
(2) Q Could you please turn to page 6127 You have that sir?
(3) A612 yes
(4) Q Yes sir And the question to you was on page 612 at line
(5) 16 just before we broke you answered a question I asked you
(6) with respect to whether you had criticisms of Exxon $s$ approach
(7) to drug testing during the 1980s In the course of your answer
(8) you said that one of the aspects that you might comment on was
(9) using alcohol tests What did you mean by that?
(10) Then there s some interjection and your answer is at page
(11) 613 beginning at line 15 The criticisms that I was referring
(12) to were generic in nature even as related to the Exxon
(13) program They re ןust philosophical problems that I have with
(14) doing testing and which especially ! think that would be that
(15) I believe that the levels of what is termed a positive test
(16) probably should have been brought into line with federal
(17) standards With regard to alcohol testing I am not a
(18) proponent of alcohol testing under any standard that would
(19) cause random testing or periodic testing The reason for that
(20) is that a positive alcohol test is a very nebulous thing that
(21) alcohol testing is not as standardized as the extremely
(22) accurate laboratory testing of drugs which are - where you use
(23) qualified laboratones approved by the department of health
(24) education and welfare and so on Breathalyzers are there are
(25) a lot of pro and con arguments about the quality and

## Vol 172655

(1) standardization of breathalyzers Alcohol blood test s
(2) Interesting but as opposed to blood testing alcohol testing
(3) is something that measures something at the instant you take
(4) that test it doesn $t$ have any capability of being extrapolated
(5) back if your test comes off - comes out below a given level
(6) that is agreed to as a cutoff It comes out to a level above
(7) the cutoff then you maybe able to do some extrapolating back
(8) but that s more guesswork than science
(9) Isn that what you testified sir?
(10) A Yes And that was all related to the context of
(11) breathalyzers
(12) Q Did the question ask you about breathalyzers only?
(13) A No But the way I answered it, there's a -
(14) Q Your testımony -
(15) A There 8 comment that breathalyzers, Is what I was
thlnking
(18) about
(17) Q So the testimony now say is you now think extrapolation
(18) back is something other than guesswork?
(19) A I still have a problem with breathalyzers, sir
(20) Q You don thave a problem with other kinds of alcohol tests
(21) is that your testimony today?
(22) A Blood alcohol tests are more accurate, far more accurate
(23) in my mind at least
(24) Q it s true in the airline program that you supervised the
(25) only type of alcohol testing that was pursued was for cause

|  |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| Vol 172656(1) tesung by whatever means Breathalyzer blood alcohol or(2) anything else?(3) A Try that again?(4) Q In the airline pilot monitoring program that you(5) supervised isn tit true that you absolutely did not test(6) pilots with alcohol problems except for cause?(7) A Yes, that s true(8) THE COURT Stopping place Mr Lynch?(9) MR LYNCH That would be fine Your Honor(10) THE COURT We li take our first recess ladies and(11) gentlemen We ll be in recess for 15 minutes(12) (Jury out at 10 00)(13) (Recess )(14) (Jury in at 10 16)(15) THE COURT Mr Lynch(16) BYMR LYNCH(17) Q Dr Masters directing your attention to your tesumony(18) about what you would consider to be appropriate monitoring(19) procedures for a company employing people who have(20) safety sensitive jobs first of all is it your testımony that(21) you know that the standards that you described are tollowed in(22) Industry generally?(23) A it is my testimony that I know of the wide disseminatlon of(24) the information It is my testimony that I knoworganizations(25) that use this technique and I don t - I don i know what you |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |

急

|  | Vol 172657 mean by "widely disseminated" |
| :---: | :---: |
| (2) | Q I said used in the industry generally |
| (3) A Generally |  |
| (4) Q Used in industry generally? |  |
| (5) Al couldn tanswer that beca |  |
| (6) Industry |  |
| (7) Q You did a lot of work with United Airlines is that |  |
| (8) correct? |  |
| (9) A Yes |  |
| (10) Q And isn tit a fact that you don i know for sure that these |  |
| (11) procedures are followed for people for example who maintan |  |
| (12) 747s? |  |
| (13) A I have only the assurance of that from the me |  |
| (14) department |  |
| (15) Q But you haven i seen any written program applicable |  |
| (16) United Airlines employees other than pilots? |  |
| (17) A l ve seen their illght attendant program |  |
| (18) Q And their flight attendant program both of |  |
| (19) Covered by special FAA regulations are they not? |  |
| (20) A There are no FAA regulations that apply to flight |  |
| (21) attendants having to do with this particular area, and there |  |
| Is |  |
| (22) no FAA regulation requiring monitoring of airline pilots by <br> (23) companies |  |
|  |  |
|  | 8 |
|  | who has ever been diagnosed to have - with alcoholism to - to |

(1) resume flying without monitoring provisions isn that
(2) correct sir?
(3) A No, that s not correct
(4) Q isn the FAA - well we ll get into that is it your
(s) testumony that these procedures that you described should be
(6) followed for any alcohol related problem of any kind?
(7) A In safety sensitive positions?
(8) Q Yes sir
(9) AYes
(10) Q Does it make a difference to you whether the diagnosis is
(11) alcohoıism or alcohol abuse?
(12) A No not if the - not if the condition ls serious enough to
(13) have required treatment
(14) Q So in your view even if the alcohol problem was secondary
(15) to some other matter you would - you believe that these
(16) monitoring procedures should be followed?
(17) AYes EIr
(18) Q Okay is it your viaw - strike that
(19) Isn I it true that in the middle to late 80s there was a
(20) general school of thought that employers should be limited to
(21) evaluation of job pertormance of employees in determining
(22) whether an employee who had returned to work from alcohol
(23) treatment was subject to any pob action by the employer
(24) including reassignment?
(25) A That concept predated the late $B 0$ by a long time

## Vol 172659

(1) Q And it continued into the late 80s isn that true sir?
(2) A In satety sensitive positions, I belleve that that concept
(3) was gradually replaced
(4) Q Gradually replaced but in the mid to late 80s that was a
(5) concept that was broadly accepted in the industry isn that
(6) true sir?
(7) A For saiety sensitive positions?
(8) QYes sir
(9) A No, I don't think so
(10) Q What s the basis for your statement?
(i1) A Because most safety sensitive industries by that time were
(12) developing concepts of monitoring
(13) Q Well isn $t$ it true Dr Masters that you just told us
(14) that you don thave personal knowledge about what industries
(is) other than those with which you ve been directly involved with
(16) were doing in the middle to late 80s?
(17) A No, I d have to modify that to the degree that I mentioned (18) very early on in response to a question from Mr Montague that
(19) we developed first of all had on hand at the Lovelace
(20) Foundation It sa research Institution had a large llbrary
(21) and we developed a program to collect programe from all types
(22) of industry and it is my testimony that many types of Industry
(23) Involving saiety sensitive positions had monitoring programs of
(24) one sort or another in effect by the mid 80s
(25) Q Would you look at page 588 of your deposition?

Vol 172660
(1) Were you asked this question Would you agree that during
(2) the mid to late 80s 1980 s there was a substantial school of
(3) thought in the employee assistance program field that job
(4) performance was a key component of the approach to prevention
(5) and treatment of alcohol problems in the workplace? And
(6) there s a comment by counsel and this answer is given I would
(7) agree that is the case and also qualify the answer with my
(8) feeling that that is an extremely limited point of view and was
(9) rather narrow - was a rather narrow concept which I think has
(10) become outmoded
(11) Was that question asked and that answer given?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q Did you say anything at that time to the examıner about
(14) your view that that didn tapply to safety sensitive
(15) positions?
(16) A Not in this testimony no
(17) Q Now you understood - let me - your direct involvement
(18) full time involvement at that time was with airine pilots (19) Correct?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q And the federal aviation regulations in effect specified
(22) that If an airline pilot had a diagnosis of alcoholism - key
(23) word alcoholism - that pilot could no longer hold his
(24) license isn that correct?
(25) A An established clinical history - dlagnosis or history
(1) Q Of alcoholism? Vol 172661
(2) A Aicoholism
(3) Q Correct?
(4) A Correct
(5) Q As opposed to alcohol abuse?
(6) A The term was alcoholism because that was the definition
(7) that they were using based on DSM If
(8) Q And in the federal -
(9) And the Federal Aviation Administration distinguished
(10) alcohol abuse from alcoholism did they not?
(11) A No, they didn t
(12) Q Could you turn -
(13) A They dldn t distinguish it because they had a definition in
(14) DSM II that didn t distingulsh it
(15) Q Could you turn to the appendix to your eight year report
(16) sir and specifically if you would to appendix page $G$ 1
(17) A Yes
(18) Q Can you read that on than? Is that clear? See the
(19) language under diagnosis?
(20) A I have it right here on the screen, ls that -
(21) Q Yes And would you look at the second paragraph some of
(22) which is highlighted there?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q It says Alcoholism is usually characterized by an
(25) evolutionary development preceded by a long period of
(1) Q Of alcoholism?
(2) A Alcohollem
(3) Q Correct?
(4) A Correct
(6) A The term was alcoholiam because that was the definltion
(7) that they were using based on DSM If
(8) Q And in the federal -
(9) And the Federal Aviation Administration distinguished
(10) alcohol abuse from alcoholism did they not?
(1t) A No, they didn t
(12) Q Could you turn -
(13) A They didn $t$ distinguish it because they had a definition in
(14) DSM II that didn t distingulsh it
(15) Q Could you turn to the appendix to your eight year report
(16) sir and specifically if you would to appendix page G 1
(17) A Yes
(18) Q Can you read that on that? Is that clear? See the
anguage under diagnosis?
(20) A I have it right here on the screen, Is that -
(21) Q Yes And would you look at the second paragraph some of which is highlighted there?

Yes
(25) evolutionary development preceded by a long period of
(1) increasing abuse There may not be a precisely identifiable
(2) point in time beyond which an individual is clearly an quote
(3) alcoholic end quote As a consequence there is often some
(4) justifiable confusion in distinguishing between alcohol abuse
(5) and alcoholism
(6) That s an FAA document isn it sir?
(7) A Yes
(8) Q By the way when I asked you earlier about the FAA
requiring monitoring for a pilot who wanted to return to duty
(10) in this memorandum the FAA set up standards in which it would
(11) grant exemptions to pilots who had a diagnosis of alcoholism
(12) did it not?
(13) A That s the general purpose of this document
(14) Q And that document specified that in order for a pilot to
(15) recerve that exemption he would have to be subjected to (16) monthly monitoring meetings of the type you described in your
(17) direct testimony isn that true sir?
(18) A That s true
(19) $Q$ By the way this document evolved from a grant you recerved (20) from the National Institute for Alcohol Abuse and Alcoholism?
(21) AYes
(22) Q Now with reference to the diagnosis of alcohol abuse
(23) If - if a pllot in 1982 had been diagnosed as having - as
(24) having a case of secondary alcohol abuse secondary to
(25) dysthymia that would not require his license to be revoked by

## Vol 172663

(1) the FAA isn that correct?
(2) A No that s not correct He would have to report his
(3) Inpatlent treatment and the FAA would have probably required
(4) the documentation and would have reviewed the medical records
(5) In great detall and would have made an individual
determination
(6) on that case
(7) $Q$ is it true that if the FAA determined that the diagnosis
(8) was alcohol abuse secondary to dysthymia that that would not
(9) require the pilot s license to be suspended or revoked?
(10) A if they determined that that was the exact diagnosis that
(11) could be the case But they would make an Individual
(12) determination based on their review of all of the medical
(13) records
(14) Q So if they made the determination that a pilot was
(15) suffering from dysthymia primary problem alcohol abuse
(16) episodic secondary problem then that pilot could continue to
(17) fly isn that correct?
(18) A That requires a lot of assumptlons that you haven i glven
(19) me
(20) Q it is true is it not Dr Masters that that is - that if
(21) the FAA concurred in a diagnosis of dysthymia and alcohol abuse
(22) episodic that the FAA regulations would not call for the
(23) cancellation of that pilot s license?
(24) A If the FAA concurred In that, yes
(25) Q And in this case you have no - you re offening no opinion

Vol 172664
(1) about the accuracy of the diagnosis of Captain Joseph
(2) Hazelwood are you?
(3) ANo sir
(4) Q Now talking about sea Captain Joseph Hazelwood
(5) A I understood th that way
(6) Q By the way from the fact that captain - air Captain
(7) Hazelwood was flying at or near age 60 under these regulations
(8) we can assume he didn t have a alcohol problem or history of
(9) diagnosis of alcoholism isn ithat correct sir?
(10) A No you can t
(11) Q You can i?

4
(12) ANo
(13) $Q$ isn it true that it s required by law that a pilot report
(14) If he has any cinical history of alcohol history?
(15) A It \& required He may not have reported it i have no
(16) Idea $I$ don $t$ want to get into that captain situation at all
(17) But I m saying it is possible
(18) Q So you would have to assume -
(19) A I would have to asaume thas he didn $t$ report it
(20) Q For a period of 60 years?
(21) A That there was no dlagnosis that there would be no problem
(22) Q That he had flown for a career running to mandatory
(23) returement age correct?
(24) A Yes that s the mandatory
(25) $Q$ And that under - that throughout that tume he had not

## Vol 172665

(1) reported a clinical history of alcoholism is that what you re (2) surmising?
(3) A I have absolutely no evidence that he did or didn 1 l
(4) mean, he might have reported it and -
(5) Q From the fact that he was flying?
(6) A He might have been reporting it and had a-an exemption
(7) I don t know that
(8) Q You don t know that one way or the other your problems
(9) with him had nothing to do with that?
(10) A Absolutely nothing, no
(i1) Q Now you know of South Oaks Hospital don tyou?
(12) A Yes, sis
(13) Q And indeed you have a high opinion of South Oaks Hospital
(14) is that correct?
(15) A In my experience during the time that we referred pllote
(16) there, we got good reports
(17) Q In a - in tact that s where you sent your tough cases?
(18) A There and a couple of other places
(19) Q And you knew Dr Vallury?
(20) A Yes, I met Dr Vallury I would not say that he was a
(21) personal friend of mine or anything like that I knew better
(22) the medical director and the executive director Dra Corrone
(23) (ph) and Crinsky (ph)
(24) Q And you had reports - in the course of your monitoring
(25) you received reports from Dr Vallury?
(1) A Oh not now no, not at all
(2) Q But in the past?
(3) A I don thave any direct recollection of that, no No
(4) Q Give me a second here
(5) A it \& possible I did when I was - when I was with the
(6) airilne pllots assoclation as their aeromedical advisor, it s
(7) possible I did, but I don thave a direct specific
(8) recollection
(9) Q Let me see if I can refresh your recollection Could you
(10) turn to page 268 of your deposition? Were you asked the
(u) question Did you have - have you had any dealings whether it
(12) was reviewing reports or otherwise with Dr Vallury in the
(13) same sense that you had dealings with Dr Persh (ph) and
(14) Dr O Connor that we went over yesterday
(1s) Answer I can itecall any instance in which I received a
(16) report from Dr Vallury that wasn t complete enough that I
(17) didn t need to call him [sic] I don t recall ever having had
(18) to raise questions with him His reports were well written
(19) Does that refresh your recollection?
(20) A Yes I don't belleve I teatifled that I didn thave
(21) respect for Dr Vallury I |ust cannot tell you - I cannot
(22) bring up in my mind a speciflc case
(23) Q But generally you remember reviewing reports that he
(24) wrote?
(25) AOh yes sir Yes sir

## Vol 172667

(1) Q And you remember that they were well written?
(2) AOh, yes
(3) Q And that they were complete?
(4) AYes
(5) Q And that you relied on them?
(6) A And they were reviewed, too, by people at South Oaks,
(7) generally
(8) Q At least that s your understanding from your knowledge of
) South Oaks?
(10) A Yes, sir
(II) Q But you relied on those reports correct?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q As a medical -
(14) A With regard to the treatment program, a report of the (15) treatment program, they were always accurate and complete
(i6) Q And you didn t need to call Dr Vallury the reports were
(17) adequate for you to rely on them?
(18) A Because of the very long association we had with that
(19) Institution, he knew precisely what kinds of reports we
(20) required
(21) Q And by the way when did you give the deposition where you
(22) gave that answer?
(23) A January 28th
(24) Q Of what year?
(25) A Of thls year 1994
(1) Q Now you re acquainted with the fact are you not Dr
(2) Masters that for employers not subject to the federal air
(3) regulations the rehabilitation act forbids an employer from
(4) discriminating against an employee solely on the basis of a
(5) history for treatment of alcohol problems?
(6) A Yes, but I wouldn t say it doesn tapply to the airline ) industry

Q I didn i say it didn tapply to the airlines industry 1
said for employees that don $t$ have this federal air regulation
they have to - they are not allowed to act on the basis of a
mere clinical history of alcoholism isn that true?
A You mean an employment application?
(13) Q I mean in job assignments I mean in - in the treatment of
(14) that employee on the job?
(15) A That s correct
(16) Q But in the federal in the pilot area there is a
(17) regulation that says a pilot can thold a license to fly with
(18) that unless he gets an exemption if he has a elinical history (19) of alcoholism?
(20) A I would merely state that they no longer give exemptions
(21) It 8 called special lssuance Comes under paragraph 6719

01
(22) the federal aviation regulations
(23) Q l appreciate the -
(24) A It s just a term of art
(25) Q Terminology correction?

## Vol 172669

AYes
Q appreciate that Dr Masters With that clarification
(3) there is a tederal air regulation that says to the airlines
) that the mere fact of a clinical history of alcoholism
) disqualifies a pilot from holding a license isn that
correct?
A Yes there - there are federal restrictions in the - in
the alr regulations and medical section alr regulations for ten
or 11 very serious disqualifying conditions
Q And that s one of them?
A Yes sir
Q So in the case of an airline the mere history for
alcoholism disqualifies the pilot as a matter of federal law from having a license unless he gets a special issuance isn t that correct?
A Not quite
(17) Q What s quite? What did I miss?
(18) A Regulation itself allowa for two contlngencles First (19) contingency is that the individual can present Information (20) satisfactory to the federal alr surgeon, which allows the (21) federal alr surgeon to make a determination and provide for (22) this thing that you have called an exemption which proper (23) terminology years ago, special issuance we call it now (24) Q Right And Ithought I put -
(25) A Or he can wait for two years and provide evidence that he
(1) has two years of sobriety and does not need a special issuance
(2) or exemption
(3) Q Let s take the first My question - my question included
(4) special issuances
(5) Unless there s a special issuance an airline has to report
any - any employee it knows who has a history clinical
history of alcoholism correct?
A No
Q Alrine doesn thave to -
(10) A Airline has no requirement under federal law to report that
(11) person
(12) Q it is not required to advise the FAA Federal Aviation
(13) Administration if it becomes aware of information that the
(14) pilot?
(15) A No sir absolutely not
(16) Q Okay The pilot has that duty?
(17) A Yes sir
(18) Q it s a crime if he falls to do it?
(19) A if he exercises his certiflcate and falls to do it under
(20) the provisions of the questionnaire he has to fill out (21) every - - oh periodically at different alrilnes then that
(22) would be a - a crime
(23) Q Do you know of any similar regulation that applies to
(24) holders of masters licenses?
(25) A No, I don't

## Vod 172671

(1) Q Okay Now you said at the end of two years if a pilot
(2) can show that he s remained sober - is that correct is that
(3) what you said?
(4) A Yes the - the language pertains to documented evidence
(5) satisfactory to the federal alr surgeon of a perlod of
(6) sobriety I think the word sobriety is Important there of two
(7) years And we have a pllot going through that process right
(8) now
(9) Q And the regulations specify that sobriety means total
(10) abstention don they?
(i1) A No they don $t$
(12) Q Could you look at -
(13) A That s not the regulation, Mr Kerry [sic], that a the
(14) problem I mialking about the regulation And on the
(15) regulation, I know the regulation very well
(18) Q Okay so is it your position just so we re not -
(17) A lf you re referring to 1976 letter
(18) Q - we re not playing games -
(19) A That s not the regulation
(20) Q Let s not play games with each other
(21) Is it the fact that in interpreting the regulation and
(22) deciding whether evidence sufficient to satisty the agency has
(23) been presented the agency takes the position that only total
(24) abstention will satisfy?
(25) A That is a decision that reats solely with the federal air

Vol 172672
(1) surgeon and it s decided individually And ican tell you what
(2) the current practice is if you d like to know that
(3) Q Could you turn to page $G 4$ of appendix $G$ of your eight year
(4) report' Referring to the very last - this is a memorandum
(5) from the Federal Aviation Administration describing how it is
(6) going to interpret the regulations isn that correct?
(7) A in general, yes That s a good explanation
(8) Q And it says with regard to the person who wants a special
(9) issuance the sine qua non for continued exemption -
(10) old fashioned word - is total abstinence is that correct
(II) sir?
(12) AYes it does
(13) Q is it your testimony that that position has changed?
(14) A it is the alne qua non tor a special lssuance it is not
(15) the sine qua non if the person has a demonstrated period of
(16) sobriety of two years because he doesn then get a special
(17) Issuance
(18) Q So just so -
(19) A He meets the standards
(20) Q So just so 1 understand an airman who had had - a pilot
(21) who had had his license to fly suspended or revoked because of
(22) a clinical history of alcoholism and remained sober for two
(23) years could get his license reissued even if he told the
(24) agency that he occasionally had wine with dinner is that
(25) accurate?

4

## Vol 172673

(1) A Yes Since he wouldn t get a special issuance, I believe (2) that would be accurate
(3) Q Now going to the subject of how you would monitor you
(4) assume in your program the plan that you ve set up you assume
(5) that the medical department would get access to the treatment
(6) records of the individual?
(7) A Yes,ldo
(8) Q Now you re aware are you not Dr Myers [sic] that there
(9) are federal statutes that protect the confidenttality of those
(10) records?
(11) Almaware of those
(12) Q And are you aware that under those statutes the agency
(13) the treating entity that holds those records may not release
(14) them to an employer without the written and free consent of the
(15) employee?
(16) A I would agree with that
(17) Q Okay And as of 1985 those regulations put a burden on
(18) the entity to estabish that the consent was freely given
(19) ISn that correct?
(20) Aldon trecall that at this moment but I wouldn it doubt
(21) that
(22) Q And one of the things that would vithate the consent was if
(23) the employer exacted consent to release of the records over
(24) against the employee s free will as a condition of giving the
(25) employee his job back Isn that true?
(1) A All I can say about that is that you re getting Into a
(2) legal area that I don think I m qualified in Iknow in the
(3) airllne pilots association that the department would not view
(4) It that way
(5) Q in case of the airline pilots association the insiances of
(6) consent that you were familiar with involved pilots who were
(7) seeking a special issuance isn that true?
(8) AYes
(9) Q And in order to get their license back from the federal
(1) government they had to meet - they had to give that consent
(11) or they d do without their license isn that correct sir?
(12) A That la correct
(13) Q Now you also assume that the medical department of the
(14) corporation would take over get involved in the aftercare of
(15) the employee?
(16) A That the medical department would be involved directly,
(17) yes
(18) $Q$ There is a school of thought isn ithere Dr Masters
(19) that it is not the place of the employer to get invoived in the
(20) doctor patient or clinician patient relattonship of the
(21) employee and his aftercare provider?
(22) A Yes A falify outmoded school of thought, yes
(23) Q And there was a substantial body of medical opposition to
(24) any employer involvement in aftercare through the mid to late
(25) 80s that you now think is outmoded?

## Vol 172675

A I would have no reason to say that were so
(2) Q You think it was outmoded even then?
(3) AOh, yes
(4) Q You d agree don tyou wouldn tyou that medical records
(5) should not be provided to supervisors?
(6) A Absolutely
(7) Q Okay And you d agree would you not that supervisors
(8) should not be expected to act as diagnosticians?

A Absolutely
(10) Q Would you also agree that they should not be expected to
(i1) act as clinicians?
(12) A That E correct
(13) Q Or therapists?
(14) A Ot course not
(15) O You talked about supervisors being the eyes and ears of the
(16) medical department as a part of monitoring?
(i7) A That was Mr Montague s characterlzation and, In a
sense
(18) they can fill that role
(19) Q In a sense they can fill that role?
(20) AYes
(21) Q Okay now does that mean that you think that a good
(22) monitoring program obligates a supervisor to pass on to the
(23) medical department every rumor that they hear?
(24) ANo
(25) Q You think it is fair to the employee who has been treated

Vol 172676
for an alcohol problem to post his name on the bulletin board
and ask people to call a 1800 Exxon or 1800 pilot or
something?
A Did I say that was proper?
Q No 1 m asking you a question
A Ot course not
Q That wouldn t be a very sensible way to try to help a
person return to work would it?
A No that would be a terrible abuse of people s rights, and I would never agree to that
Q And with reference to rumors do you recognize and did you
recognize in your experience that one of the problems with peer
identification is the possibility that charges or allegations
of improper conduct would be made because of recrimination
personal animositues or things of that kind?
A Yes sir That s why you have professional evaluatlons to take care of that problem
Q Let me see if I understand this If a supervisor received
a rumor from a notorious gossip and the supervisor didn $t$
believe the rumor is it your testimony that that supervisor
should call the medical department and drag this employee in for a medical evaluation?
A No, it s not my testimony
Q Okay
A And drag in I think that a rather strident

## Vol 172677

(1) Q Oh I m sorry I didn t mean to be sirident Invite the
(2) employee in for a medical evaluation?
(3) AYes
(4) Q Now is it your view that the supervisor should do that?
(5) A Under the circumstance you suggested?
(6) QYes sir
(7) A A rumor? No I suggest the supervisor investigate the
(8) rumor, if he doesn think there sanything to it that s
(9) fine
(10) Q I take it that one of the drawbacks you think of relying
(i1) on supervisors is that to judge whether there is a recurrence
(12) of an alcohol problem is the difficulty of the supervisor
(13) detecting medical signs of reuse or relapse to using alcohol?
(14) A Yes That s why they have to be extensively trained
(15) Q And in particular you d consider relying on the smell of (16) alcohol on the breath to be unreliable isn that true?
(17) A if the supervisor experienced li directly or if somebody (18) reported it to him?
(19) Q Either Don $t$ you consider it to be an unreliabie (20) indicator of alcohol use?
(21) A Well, a lot of people put a lot of stock In it $I$ think it (22) would certalnly raise some question
(23) Q But it is capable of being misused isn that true sir? (24) You don t advocate that?
(25) A Capable of being misused Yes, it s capable of being
misused yes
Q Excuse me a second Going to one of my folders for this
one 636 Would you turn to 636 of your deposition? I migoing
to refer you to your testimony question begins at line 2 where
) you re referring about criticisms of supervisor - supervisor
monitoring and you say - the question is any additional
criticisms
Answer Well the crying need for educational supervisory
personnel is obvious because they put in here some very
(10) misleading and easily misunderstood information on how
you re
(11) supposed to detect alcohol and drugs
(12) Question What are you referring to specifically?
(13) Answer Well specifically it talks about judgments that
(14) the supervisory personnel are and masters for example are
(15) supposed to make on persons to indicate that they might have
(16) alcohol or drug involvement and you know there could be other
(17) reasons for some of those symptoms that they point out There
(18) could be another reason for maintaining - inability to
(19) maintain your normal balance or poor coordination slurred
(20) speech inability to understand and connect thoughts smell of
(21) alcohol on breath is even debatable and fairly easily covered
(22) these days by some mouth sprays that you can buy in almost any
(23) bar and there s low alcohol beers -
(24) Question And there s low alcohol beer as well isn t
(25) there Doctor?

Voㅓ 172679
(1) Answer Oh yes theres low alcohol beer That sagood
(2) example
(3) You believe that reliance on those kinds of tests for
(4) monitoring by supervisors are ill advised do you not?
(5) A This was in the context of the intensive and very careful
(6) training program that I was advocating for supervisors and
(7) those were examples of what s-of what Exxon put in their
(8) policy as advice to supervisors and I think that you can t
just
(9) lay that sort of thing on a policy and then not provide (10) extensive training in order to expect them to understand the
(11) condition they re supposed to be observing
(12) Q All right let $s$ deal with that
(13) You were referring in that testimony to some written Exxon
(14) documentation that you had reviewed isn that correct sir?
(15) A Yes
(16) Q Those were the guidelines those were the guidelines that (17) supervisors were to use
(18) I can t see the doctor through my framework Your Honor
(18) Those were the guidelines that the supervisors were to use
(20) in implementing their part of the alcohol poilcy isn that
(21) correct?
(22) A l belleve that $s$ the case, yes
(23) And those guidelines said that the supervisor s job was to (24) judge by job performance isn that correct sir?
(25) AYe:

Vol 172680
Q And that part of job performance was to look for signs
(2) that - of on the job in the workplace signs of possible
(3) misuse of alcohol such as slurred speech lack of balance
(4) uncoordinated speech and the like correct?

A Yes
Q And you were saying that you thought those could be misleading correct?
A In the hands of a layman, yes
Q And were you assuming that the only information that the
Exxon supervisors had was in what was in that written set of guidelines?
A No, I wouldn t assume that necessarily I m just saying that the guidellnes seemed to be, you know not extensive enough
Q Well I understood your earlier statement to say that it wasn t so much that you disagreed with using those tests as that you thought the supervisor needed training on how to use those tests? Did I misunderstand you?
A Well, no, I just - I don $t$ - tests? Yau know, they re not - you re not giving them an exam This isn $t$, this isn $t$ a paper and-pencil written thing These are observatlons that
(22) supervisors can be trained to make and all that leads to is a consuttation with the medical department by the supervisor Do
(24) you think there is anything, Doc - should we do something
(25) about it? Well let s talk about It back and forth well,

## Vol 172681

(1) AYes
(2) $Q$ And rather than trying to diagnose it they should reter it
(3) to the medical department?
(4) A By all means
(5) Q And the writings that you saw in Exxon recommended that
(6) Exxon supervisors do exactly the - follow exactly those
(7) standards isn that true sir?
(8) A Yes
(9) MR LYNCH I have no further questıons Your Honor
(10) THE COURT Redirect?
(山) MR MONTAGUE I have just a few questions Your
(12) Honor
(13) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF RICHARD L MASTERS
(14) BY MR MONTAGUE
(15) Q Dr Masters you reviewed the guidelines for masters
(16) captains and managers and supervisors is that one of the
(17) things -
(18) A Yes, sir
(19) Q - for Exxon and their policy statement on employee alcohol
(20) and drug abuse?
(21) A Yes, sir
(22) Q And those - there was nothing in those that related to
(23) satety sensitive positions was there?
(24) A Nothing
(25) Q And there was nothing in there that related to monitoring

Vol 172683
(1) was there?
(2) A Nothing
(3) Q And isn it what Mr Lynch is referring to in his last series
(4) of questions didn $t$ they relate to the general policy of
(5) alcohol of when a supervisor sees something in the workplace
(6) with respect to a person that then they should go to see the
(7) medical department if they have a question about it?
(8) A Yes
(9) Q As an initial - as an initial matter?
(10) A Yes, sir
(i1) Q Has nothing to do with monitoring?
(12) ANo
(13) Q There were no guidelines in those papers with respect to (14) monitoring is that correct?
(15) A The word - I could not find the word
(16) Q Now with respect to - this will fust be quick
(17) The impression that I got from Mr Lynch s questions was an
(18) implication that you never performed monitoring on a pilot who
(19) had gone through a rehabilitation once he got his license back
(20) is that a correct - is that a correct impression that we
(21) should have?
(22) A No, not at all
(23) Q How long do you monitor pilots? Do you monitor pilots
(24) atter they get their license back?
(25) A Oh yes 1 ve got about 20 Im monitoring right at the
$\qquad$

## (1) moment

(2) Q And is that under the system that you ve described to us?
(3) AYes sir
(4) Q One last question - one last series of questions
(5) You were asked about Or Vallury and getting reports from him?
A Yes
(8) Q What kind of reports - do you recall the type of reports (9) that you d get from Dr Vallury?
(10) A Oh yes complete medical records with diacharge summary
(11) and it s one of the characteristics of a good record It -
(12) there asychiatric reports, reports of psychoiogical testing,
(13) Irequently, if required, and In a case where that would be (14) Indicated we d expect to get that Even down to the progress
(15) notes and sometimes the nursing notes
(16) Q Okay And is that a report you received from Dr Vallury
(17) after the inpatient treatment is finished?
(18) A Well you couldn't produce it before then, no
(19) MR MONTAGUE Thank you very much
(20) THE COURT Thank you Doctor you may step down
(21) (The Witness Stepped Down)
(22) THE COURT Call your next witness?
(23) MR O NEILL Your Honor I have some documents to
(24) offer all by agreement Redacted copies of Plaintitfs
(25) Exhibits $16 \quad 18$ and 19 which are responses for request to

## Vol 172685

) admission Exhibit 795A 795 Alpha which is Surrendering the Memories Exhibit 1705 Exhibits 827828 and 829 Exhibit
103 Exhibit 6000 for identufication only - and one matter of
() record clanfication in our review of the transcript it
appears that an Exhibit 292 Alpha may have been admitted That
(6) should be 92 Alpha
(7) (Exhibit $1618 \quad 19$ 795A 1705827828829103
(8) 92A offered)
(9) MR SANDERS Your Honor I have no objection to those
(10) that Mr O Neill listed and I agree to the clarification as to
(11) Exhibit 92 Alpha
(12) I too have a clarification that I have discussed with Mr
(13) O Neill That clarification is that the - in Dr Smith s
(14) cross examination I intended to offer the page from the
(15) chapter that he wrote in the book and the chart that - a copy
(18) of the chart that I wrote up as two independent exhibits and I
(17) think the record probably through my fumbling around reflects
(18) that they came in as one exhibut and I would like the record to
(19) reflect that they are two separate exhibits
(20) The numbers that I wrote up there on the backwards
(21) extrapolation is Exhibit 9000 and the exhibit which was the
(22) page from chapter 18 was Defendants Exhibit 9093
(23) (Exhibit DX9093 offered)
(24) MR O NEILL We have no objection and assume that
25) there s been bedtıme reading
(1) THE COURT Let me play this back and see if we have
(2) everyone on the same track
(3) The plaintifts are offering and defendants do not object to
(4) redacted Plaintiffs 1618 and 1619
(5) MR SANDERS No I think that s 1618 and 19 isn 1
(5) that right?
(7) MR O NEILL Yes sir 16 comma 18 comma and 19
(8) THE COURT When you ve got so many exhibits -
(9) MR O NEILL I goofed up and I should have put the
(10) commas in
(i1) THE GOURT it salittle hard Okay 16 comma 18
(12) comma and 19 all redacted?
(13) MR O NEILL Yes sir
(14) THE COURT Are admitted okay
(15) (Exhibit 1618 and 19 received)
(16) THE COURT Going on Plaintiffs 795 A 1705827
(17) 828829103 are all admitted by agreement
(18) (Exhibit 795A $1705827828 \quad 829 \quad 103$ received)
(19) MR SANDERS Correct
(20) THE COURT Exhibit 6000 has been identified but is
(21) not being offered and is not being admitted
(22) MR SANDERS Correct Your Honor
(23) THE COURT As to Exhibit 292 Alpha 1 do not show
(24) that as having been admitted
(25) MR O NEILL Good

## Vol 172687

(1) THE COURT But I understand that 92 Alpha has been
(2) admitted
(3) (Exhibit 92A received)
(4) MR SANDERS That s our understanding Your Honor
(5) THE COURT As to the defendants exhibits
(6) defendants 9000 and 9093 are admitted
(7) (Exhibit 9000 and 9093 received)
(8) MR SANDERS Thank you Your Honor
(9) MR O NEILL Your Honor the plaintifts would like to
(10) offer pursuant to Rule 103 (a)(2) what has been marked as
(i1) Court Exhibit 1
(12) (Exhibit Court 1 offered)
(13) THE COURT That s the material that s being submitted
(14) under seal?
(15) MR O NEILL Yes sir
(16) THE COURT That $s$ being offered under seal it $s$
(i7) being received and will be held by the Court for possible use
(18) as a part of the record in the case
(19) MR O NEILL That s correct
(20) THE COURT But it is not admitted
(21) MR O NEILL it is not admitted It is being offered
(22) pursuant to 103 (a)(2) which deals with offers of proof
(23) MR LYNCH Those are federal rules of evidence
(24) MR O NEILL Of the federal rules of evidence
(25) MR LYNCH As opposed to the federal alr regulations

Vol 172688

1) MR O NEILL Which we ve heard enough about in one (2) day
(3) THE COURT Court will receive Plaintiffs Exhibit 1
(4) for part of the record
(Exhibit Plaintifts Exhibit 1 received)
(s) MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
2) Your Honor Plaintifts Exhibit 3 has previously been
) admitted without objection Pursuant to an agreement reached
3) with the defendants the plaintiffs would like your authority
(10) to publish portions of the exhibit to the jury in conjunction
(11) with Defendants Exhibit 3902A May we publish the exhibits to
(12) the jury?
(13) THE COURT it s agreed?
(14) MR LYNCH So agreed Your Honor
(15) THE COURT Do it
(16) MR O NEILL Ladıes and gentlemen Plaintiffs
(17) Exhibit 3 is a part of the oll spill contingency plan for
(18) Prince Wiliam Sound that was in effect at the time of the
(19) spill It had been promulgated by Alyeska Pipeline Service
(20) Company of which Exxon Pipeline Company a division of Exxon
(21) is an approximate 20 percent owner The plan was approved by
(22) the State of Alaska Department of Environmental Conservatıon
(23) and the federal government as required by law There are two
(24) portions in addition to the cover page which have been
(25) admitted The first two portions are pages 3 through $7^{4}$ - are

## Vol 172689

(1) pages 37 through 38 and 324 through 343 It describes the
(2) concept exclusion action under the contingency plan
(3) It contains a map of exclusion sites a map of Prince
(4) William Sound and the dots are sensitive areas listed and
(5) describes 136 exclusion sites listed on the map
(6) The second part of the plan is the 200000 barrel spill
(7) scenario and contains paragraphs relating to assumptions
(8) conditions and immediate response actions And environmental
(9) Considerations
(10) Defendants Exhibit 3901A is a May 11986 letter from Paul
(i1) O Brien manager for oll pollution control of the State of
(12) Alaska Department of Environmental Conservation to Alyeska in
(13) the letter Mr O Brien asked Alyeska to develop three
(14) scenarios for its Prince William Sound contingency plan
(15) including that for a 200000 barrel spill
(16) MR O NEILL Ladies and gentlemen you will have boin
(17) exhibits with you in the jury room in their entirety This
(18) brief display has allowed us to introduce them to you Thank
(19) you
(20) Your Honor again with the agreement of the defendants we
(21) would like permission to publish Exhibit 268 to the jury it
(22) is a videotape if there s no objection Your Honor we d like
(23) to play seven and a halt minutes of 268 and the seven and a
(24) half minutes have been agreed to with the defendants
(25) MR SANDERS That is correct No objection Your
(1) Honor
(2) THE COURT Fine proceed
(3) THE COURT Do you want it reported2 Or - well it s
(4) an admitted exhibit it doesn t need to be reported
(5) MR O NEILL I don t think we need it reported do
you?
MR SANDERS I do not
(8) THE COURT It will not be reported
(9) (Videotape Played Exhibit 268)
(10) MR O NEILL Thank you Your Honor We have one last
(11) witness to call and she II take about five minutes If we
(12) could take a stretch so we could set up the silde projector?
(13) Thank you Judge
(14) THE COURT We ll just stand in place but we ll be off
(15) the record for a moment
(18) THE CLERK Raise your right hand please
(17) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(18) THE CLERK Please be seated
(19) For the record state your full name give us your address
(20) and spell your last name please
(21) THE WITNESS My name is Natalie Fobes Fobes
(22) I m from Seattle Washington
(23) THE CLERK Thank you
(24) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF NATALIE FOBES
(25) BYMR O NEILL

Vol 172691
(1) Q And ma am what do you do for a living?
(2) A Imaireelance photographer
(3) Q And who do you sell your pictures to?
(4) A l work for a number of magazines including National
(5) Geographic Geo Newsweek U S News, Tlme, and a number of
(6) Other smaller magazines in addition to some companies
(7) Q At or about the time of the spill of the Exxon Valdez did
(8) you have occasion to take some photographs of the vessel?
(9) A Yes Idid
(10) Q And when was that?
(ii) A larrived in Valdez on the - the day after the splli,
(12) Which was the 25th of March 1989, and I left about a month
(13) later, the first time And then I came back after about a
week
(14) break for about another month
(15) Q Exhibit 228 which have been admıtted are your slıdes
(16) And rather than ask you a bunch of questions we d just like
(17) you to run the slide projector and tell us what the slides are
(18) and then that II be the end of your testimony
(19) A Oh great I malittle nervous
(20) Q How can you cross examine a slide projector?
(21) A I been worrying about it
(22) MR O NEILL Tom could we get the lights down?
(23) THE WITNESS I guess we should probably turn it on
(24) sorry
(25) MR SANDERS Well I object to that Your Honor

## Vol 172692

(1) THE WITNESS This photograph was taken on the 26th
(2) which was Easter Sunday It shows of the Alyeska Terminal
(3) where my understanding is that they load the tankers with the
(4) oll
(5) This was taken the day after the spill which was the 25 th
(6) and was taken in the afternoon I had chartered an aircraft
(7) fixed wing aircraft for a couple hours in the afternoon

Let me focus that
The larger tanker is the Exxon Valdez and there satanker next to it which is off loading or where the oll is being off loaded onto that tanker
You also might want to take a look at the boat that is
leaving a clean water wake through the oll and the
discoloration on top of the water is all oil
(15) You Il notice quite a bit of photographs from just flying
(16) around and that s part of my job is to get as many different
(17) angles and as many different aspects of it so again looking
(18) back the first island there that kind of the long skinny one
(19) is Reef Island and then behind that is Bligh Isiand and
(20) again you can see that same boat leaving that wake through the
(21) ofl And the thick - thickness of oil varies depending on
(22) where it is at that point Again this is the day after the
(23) spill
(24) The edge of Reef Island is that land over there and again (25) that same boat going through the oll The oll one of the

Vol 172693
(1) reasons that I take a lot of different photographs from
(2) different angles is so that I can really get an idea of what s
(3) going on where and in this photograph in particular you can
(4) see that the oll has hit the beach on Reef Island All of
(5) these photographs were taken above 1500 feet because Coast

Guard had asked that - or I guess it wasn t-they weren t
asking us the pilots they were actually telling the pilots
not to go below 1500 feet and our pilot of course complied
with that regulation But even at that altitude the fumes
(10) were nauseating and after a while I developed a headache
(11) MR SANDERS Your Honor can we just restrict this to
(12) her explaining what $s$ in the picture?
(13) THE COURT I think probably that would be a good
(14) Idea
(15) A (Continuing) Here again you can see the Reef Island with (16) the oil coming off of the beach there and the various
(17) thlcknesses of the oll, and again, that same boat going through
(18) the oil leaving the clean water wake behind
(19) Agaln, looking back toward Reef Ialand and Bligh Island and
(20) In this photograph, you can see that the oil is In between
(21) the - the lalands at that point
(22) A little blt further back shot These were all taken, (23) again, at 1500 teet, and using a wide angle lens trying to show
(24) as much of the spill as possible, but that wasn t possible for
(25) me to do I couldn t see the end of the spill

And again, a little bit different angle looking back toward the ship the two tankers there and the clean water wake the
boat is now out of the photograph
The oll, the thickness of the oll varied on the top of the
water and that gives the discotoration of it
The clean water wakes kind of form a irlangle and you can
see that In the darker shade, which - right there that you
can actually see the wake going through that dark spot indicating that it is oil
And again, a little bit further back taking a little bit
more of a look at it the oil continues on throughout the bottom of the frame and as I said before I could not see the end of the oll slick at that point
This shows - this is taken with a more of a telephoto
lens, like an 85 millimeter, and it shows the boom that was
place at that point around the two shlps And you can see the
(17) oll at the - the down current end of the boom, but obviously
(18) the boom is not holding the oll in in place within itself
(19) A little bit further back showing the oll tendrila coming (20) out from the boom and the oll continuing out throughout the
(21) irame, throughout the photograph
(22) This shows a little bit more of the way the off loading was (23) happening and the thickness of the oil right around the (24) tankers
(25) Agaln, a littie bit further back

## Vol 172695

) There sthat same clean water wake through the oll These
(2) tankers, I have no Idea how big they are, but they are very
(3) very big, and In these photographs they may look a little small
(4) but again, that was because I was trying to show the scope of
(5) the oll
(6) This was taken on the next day It was a beautiful Easter
(7) Sunday, and I went out early In the morning, just cryatal clear
(8) conditions, and you can see the difference in the coloration of
(9) the water and the thick, thick ail that going from the
(10) tankers the ame two tankers that were there Also the
(ii) discoloration on top of the water is all oll at this point
(12) The white things there are pleces of lce and we re again
(13) looking back toward Bligh Reef - or, I m sorry, toward Bligh
(14) Island and Reef Island
(15) Sorry about the shakiness
(16) This shows a littie bit more of the booming, the boom and
(i7) how the oil has down stuck in the boom a little bit but alsa is
(18) traveling out throughout the boom The boam wasn t
hoidlng,
(19) waen $t$ containing the oll at this point
(20) And again, a ilttle bit further vlew showing a IItile bit
(21) more of the scope of the oll with the tankers on the reef
(22) there And the dark oll leading from the tankers off into the
(23) dark blue, the bottom of the frame
(24) That 8 It
(25) MR SANDERS I have one question if you through

| BSA | FEDERAL TRIAL TRANS |
| :---: | :---: |
| Vol 172696 |  |
| (1) MR ONEILL. I m done go ahead |  |
| (2) CROSS EXAMINATION OF NATALIE FOBES |  |
| (3) BYMR SANDERS |  |
| (4) Q Do you happen to remember the name of the vessel the (5) smaller vessel that was off loading the oll from the Valdez? |  |
|  |  |
| (6) A 1 can t recall it right now I can look In my notes and |  |
| (7) see If it sin my notes |  |
| (8) Q What about the Exxon Baton Rouge? |  |
| (9) | A Sounds famillar but again I d want to check my notes |
| (10) MR SANDERS I have nothing further | MR SANDERS I have nothing further |
| (11) MR O NEILL 1 didn terther |  |
| (12) Thank you ma am |  |
| (13) THE COURT Thank you you may st |  |
| (14) (The Witness Stepped Down) |  |
| (15) THE COURT Mr O Nelll just before we started up |  |
| (16) Mr Murtashaw asked me a question about Exhbit - 1 think |  |
| (17) It s 3902 A We aren $t$ clear as to whether that one has been |  |
| (18) admitted or not |  |
| (19) MR ONEILL 3902 A? |  |
| (20) MR LYNCH Yes it is |  |
| (21) THE COURT I m assuming that that s a plaintits |  |
| (22) exhibit number |  |
| (23) | MR ONEILL Itis 3902A |
| (24) | MR LYNCH Such as they are Your Honor our records |
|  | do not indicate that it has not been admitted |

4

## Vol $17 \quad 2697$

(1) THE CLERK This is the one in conjunction with
(2) Plaintifts Exhibit 3 Didn $t$ you indicate it was 39902 A
(3) Defendants Exhibit
(4) THE COURT No no No I understood it was a
(5) Plantuffs exhibit
(6) MR JAMIN I think - 1 know what it is Your Honor
(7) MR O NEILL Oh the letter is Defendants Exhibit
(8) 3902 A
(9) MR JAMIN And that is admined by agreement
(10) MR O NEILL That is admitted by agreement
(11) MR LYNCH Yes sir
(12) THE COURT If not before then now Defendants 3902 A
(13) is admitted
(14) (Exhibit Defendants 3902A received)
(15) MR O NEILL The Plantiffs rest Your Honor
(16) MR LYNCH And we II deter any motion and I think
(17) we re ready to call our first witness
(18) MR CHALOS It s nice to be back Your Honor
(19) THE COURT Mr Chalos nice to have you here
(20) MR CHALOS Defendants call for their first witness
(21) Jerzy Glowack!
(22) THE CLERK Raise your right hand sir
(23) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(24) THE CLERK Please be seated
(25) For the record state your full name your address and

Vol 172698
) spell your last name please
THE WITNESS My name is Jerzy Glowackı I reside in
Raleigh North Carolina and the spelling is Jerzy
GlowackI
THE CLERK Thank you sir
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JERZY GLOWACKI
BY MR CHALOS
Q Hello Mr Glowackı
A Good morning
Q What is your present occupation?
A I mpresently selt employed and I malso on the faculty of
an engineering department at State University of New York Maritime College
Q What is your present employment?
A As self employed?
QYes
A Yes I do consulting work in the maritime engineering
fleld
Q How long have you been doing that?
A Since 1990
Q And how long have you been in an instructor at Maritime
College?
A Since about two years ago
Q Can you give us just briefly your educational background?
A I graduated from State University of New York maritime

## Vol 172699

(1) college in 1970 with a bachelor of engineering degree
(2) Q That s Fort Schuyler is it not?
(3) A Yes, it is
(4) Q As opposed to Kings Point?
(5) A That s correct

Q Mir O Neill said the other day that Kings Point was the top
shelf - is that what you called it?
MR ONEILL I hope so
MR CHALOS Something like that
BYMR CHALOS
Q How do you feel about Fort Schuyler as a maritime college?
A Well Fort Schuyler is the only academy both tederal and
state that gives accredited degrees
Q College degrees?
A College degrees
Q So we re smarter than the Kings Pointers right?

## Alhope so

Q Can you tell us a little bit about your employment
background starting with after you graduated college?
A I was given employment by Exxon in 1970 following
graduation and I joined Exxon the day after graduation Q And you worked with Exxon until when December of 1990 you
(23) said?
(24) A That s correct
(25) Q What did you do for Exxon in that period of 20 years?

## Vol 172700

（1）A Most of the time I was involved in the fleet I sailed in （2）engineering positlons and out of the 20 years 1 spent perhaps
（3）five or more years in special office and shoreside assignments
（4）Q Let s start with your seagoing career I take it you
（5）started out as a third assistant engineer？
（6）A That s correct
（7）Q is that a license that you received from the Coast Guard （8）upon graduation from－
（9）A Upon graduation from any academy，graduates receive a third
（10）engineer s or third mate s license that s correct
（i1）Q And in your case you received a third engineer s license？
（12）A That 8 correct
（13）Q Did there come a time when you advanced that license to a
（14）second engineer s license？
（15）A Perhaps two years later
（16）Q That would be 19727
（17）A Correct
（18）Q You sailed for two years as a third assistant engineer？
（19）A That is correct
（20）Q And did there come a time when you advanced to the second
（21）engineer s license to a first engineer s license？
（22）A That s correct That took approximately three years
（23）Q That would be 19757
（24）A In that ballpark，yes
（25）Q Did you sall for those three years？

| Vol 172701 |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| （1） | A Yes，I did |
| （2） | Q As a second assistant？ |
| （3） | A Both second and third |
| （4） | Q Okay And did there come a time when you advanced that |
| （5） | first assistant s license to a chief engineers？ |
| （6） | A Yes I did I received my chlef engineers license in the |
| （7） | latter part of 77 |
| （8） | Q What is the－what is that license that you hold |
| （9） | presently－strike that Let me back up |
| （10） | Do you still hoid that license？ |
| （11） | A Yes，I do |
| （12） | Q Same license since 19777 |
| （13） | A That 8 correct |
| （14） | Q And what is that license？ |
| （15） | A lt s a chlef engineer of motor vessels and steam vessels |
| （16） | unlimited horsepower |
| （17） | Q Is there a difference between steam and diesel？ |
| （18） | A Yes，Coast Guard differentlates between the two different |
|  | types of propulsion and different tests are given to |
|  | lfcants |
|  | for the licenses，that s correct |
| （21） | Q And you hold both a chief engineer s license for steam |
| （22） | vessels and chief engineer s license－ |
| （23） | A That s correct |
| （24） | Q－for motor or diesel vesseis？ |
| （25） | A That a correct |

## A Yes，I did

Q As a second assistant？
A Both second and third
Qokay And did there come a time when you advanced that

A Yes I did I received my chlef engineer slicense in the latter part of 77
Q What is the－what is that license that you hold
enly－Strke that Letme

A Yes，I do
Q Same license since 19777
A That s correct
Q And what is that license？
A lt s a chlef engineer of motor vessels and steam vessels unlimited horsepower
Q Is there a difference between steam and diesel？
（18）A Yes，Coast Guard differentlates between the two different （9）types of propulsion and different tests are given to applicants
（20）for the licenses，that s correct
（21）Q And you hold both a chief engineer s license for steam
（22）vessels and chief engineer s license－
（23）A That s correct
（25）A That a correct
（1）Q The Exxon Valdez was a diesel vessel was it not？
（2）A lt was a diesel vessel yes
（3）Q Now you stated that you did－in addition to sailing for
（4）Exxon you did some special projects for them？
（5）A That s correct
（6）O What kind of special projects？
（7）A l worked for six months in the shipping company s marine
（8）department at the time office in Baton Rouge as a so called
（9）transportation allocator That was in 1972 Then I was
（10）transferred for one year 81 through 82 to our offlice in
（1i）Benicta as an engineering analyst I spent roughly a year in
（12） 8283 In Louisiana and New Orleans when we were building
（13）three motor tankers there at the time
（14）Then I was Involved In for about six months in a design－
（15）latter design stages of the Exxon Valdez，and then I was a
（16）machinery superintendent during construction of the Exxon
（17）Valdez and the sister ship，the Exxon Long Beach
（18）Q Let me ask you about the construction projects that you
（19）were involved with That s three different construction
（20）projects？
（21）A That scorrect
（22）$Q$ The first one involved the Exxon Benicia is that what you
（23）sald？
（24）A Yes that was in 1979
（25）Q And the other one involved you said three diesel

[^37]（1）vessels Which vessels were those？
（2）A These were the Exxon Charleaton Exxon Wilmington and
（3）Exxon Baytown
（4）Q And how much tume did you spend during their construction （5）working on the construction project？
（6）A In 1979 with the Exxon Benicia was only In the shipyard
for
（7）maybe two three months prior to dellvery of the vessel I was

8）there In the position of the chief engineer
（9）In 8283 I was also assigned as a－in a position of
（10）chlef engineer to the Wilmington I was there approximately a

I）year
（12）Q And you said you also worked in the construction of the
（13）Exxon Long Beach and Exxon Valdez？
（14）A That s correct
（15）Q How long were you in－what did you do in regards to
（16）that？
（17）A As I said I was in Houston late 84 for approximately six
（18）months I was involved in the latter stages of the machinery
（19）design，planning and then we moved to San Dlego where the
（20）vessels were built when the construction started
（21）Q isee With respect to the machinery design you had a
（22）hand in designing the engine of this vessel？
（23）A No
（24）Q This auxiliary machinery？
（25）Almsorry？

Vol 172704
(1) Q The auxiliary machinery is that what you re talking about?
(2) A Some, yes
(3) Q Now were you present during the construction of the
(4) vessel?
(5) Alwas
(6) Q The enture imme?
(7) A That a correct
(8) Q Let me ask you this in the years that you worked for
(9) Exxon did they ever send you to any courses?
(10) A lattended many courses, yes
(11) Q What type of courses were you sent to?
(12) A I attended several courses in Kings Point
(13) Q The other school?
(14) A That 8 correct
(15) Q That s right okay
(16) A lalso attended many courses given by difterent
(17) manufacturers of marine type equipment, engine manufacturers,
(18) that type of thing
(19) $Q$ And this was - these were courses that Exxon sent you to
(20) at their expense?
(21) A That s correct
(22) Q These were intended to increase your knowledge of - of new
(23) products and how new products worked?
(24) A I wouldn t say new products These are courses to further
(25) our professionalism basically


## Vol 172705

(1) Q Did Exxon do that for other chief engineers besides
(2) yourself?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q And first engineers as well?
(s) A Yes I believe so
(6) O Now once the Exxon Valdez was constructed did you sall on (7) her as a chief engineer?
(8) A Yes, 1 salled on her from the maiden voyage on that $s$
(9) correct
(10) Q When did the vessel come out of the yard?
(11) A Mid December 86 I don trecall the exact date
(12) Q And you were the permanent chief engineer on that vessel
(13) from 1986 until the grounding?
(14) A One of the two that s correct
(15) Q Who was the other chief engineer?
(16) A Chuck Kimtls
(17) Q Now when was the first time that you sailed with Captain
(18) Hazelwood?
(19) A About a month after I joined the vesse! in 1989
(20) O Well when did you join the vessel in 1989 ?
(21) A Sometime in January 1989
(22) Q So would mid February sound about right?
(23) A It s very possible yes
(24) O Was that the first ume you salled with Captain Hazelwood
(25) in your 20 year career?
(1) A That is correct
(2) O You were already on board when Captain Hazelwood arrived?
(3) A That s correct
(4) Q Now between mid February when you first encountered
(5) Captain Hazelwood and the day of the grounding - let s say
(6) March 22nd so we re clear - from mid February to March 22nd
(7) did you have occasion to interact with Captain Hazelwood on a
(8) dally basis?
(9) A ContInuousily
(10) Q Did you see him more than once a day?
(11) A Yes
(12) Q Did you ever drink with Captain Hazelwood during that
(13) period that we just talked about?
(14) A No, I did not
(15) Q Did you ever see Captain Hazelwood drink aboard the ship
(16) during that period of time?
(17) A I did not
(18) Q Did you ever see Captain Hazelwood impaired or intoxicated
(19) at all during that tume?
(20) Aldid not
(21) Q Did you have occasion during that period of time to go
(22) into his office?
(23) A Many times
(24) O Did you ever see any evidence of alcohol use by Captain
(25) Hazelwood while you were in his office?

## Vol $17 \quad 2707$

(1) A No, I did not
(2) O Did you see any containers or - or liquor bottles or
(3) anything like that?
(4) A No, excuse me I don trecall anything of that nature no
(5) Q Now you were in charge during that period of time of the
(6) engine department were you not?

A That s correct
(3) Q And under you was the first assistant What was his name?

A At that ilme, It was Ray Jones
(10) Q And who was the second assistant?
(11) A Graeme Oldham
(12) Q And who was the third assistant?
(13) A Katherine Haven
(14) Q There s been some testımony here by Ms Haven that there
(15) were parties on board the Exxon Valdez during that period of
(16) time Did you ever see any parties on the Exxon Valdez in the
(17) engineering department?
(18) Aldid not
(19) Q Did you ever see any parties at all?
(20) A No I didnt
(21) Q Did you ever see Mr Oldham Mr Jones or Ms Haven
(22) drinking on board the vessel?
(23) ANo
(24) Q Did you ever see Captain Hazelwood socializing with those
(25) three in a drinking party?
ESA FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRI
(1) A No
(2) Q Did you ever hear of anything like that?
(3) A No
(4) Q You have a chance to interact as the head of the
(5) engineering department with Mr Oldham Mr Jones and Ms
(6) Haven on a dally basis?
(7) A Contlnuously, yes
(8) Q Did you ever see any of them under the influence of
(9) alcohol?
(10) A Not that I could determine no
(11) Q You worked pretty closely with them in the engine room
(12) didn t you?
(13) A Worked very closely
(14) Q Okay I dlike to go - Mr Glowacki I dike to direct
(15) your attention to say mid March of 1989 when the vessel was
(16) In San Francisco Do you remember that period?
(17) A Yes
(18) Q Okay you had some problems with the engine did you not?
(19) A I had a - we had problems with the main engine
(20) turbochargers, yes
(21) Q Tell us a little bit about that You re the chief
(22) engineer so you re in a position to tell us What happened?
(23) A Well, the sister vessel the Exxon Long Beach, had severe
(24) problems with the turbochargers prior, let s say couple
months
(25) prior to that period and manufacturer of the turbochargers

## Vol 172709

(1) came back - as a result of these problems on the sister ship
(2) came back to Exxon with a proposed modification to the
(3) turbochargers and however the Exxon Valdez really had not had
(4) any of the same problems that the Long Beach had had
(5) After the modifications were made on the Exxon Long Beach,
(6) It was decided to perform the same modificatlons on Exxon
(7) Valdez whether we needed them or not, they were
pertorming
(8) One turbocharger was completely overhauled and
(9) modifications were made I d asy early February or something of
(10) that sort, so at that time we had - one turbocharger was (11) overhauled and one as originally bullt, and then the perlod of
(12) tlme I assume you re talking about In San Francisco again was
(13) when the second turbocharger was modifled And -
(14) QMr Glowacki?
(15) A Yes
(16) Q Sorry I know I went to that smart school but I don t
(17) know what turbochargers are Can you tell us?
(18) A Okay
(19) Q What do they do?
(20) A It 8 a exhaust -
(21) Q Do you know?
(22) A I m sorry?
(23) Q Do you know?
(24) A l hopeso
(25) Qlhope so too
(1) A It $s$ an exhaust gas driven turbine which also has a
(2) compressor or another turbine wheel attached on the other end
(3) of the shaft which compresses air which ls used in a
combustion
(4) process in the engine
(5) Q Sounds good to me
(6) So you fixed - you overhauled the turbochargers and then
(7) what happened?
(8) A After we finished discharging cargo, we were going to go
to
Valdez to - another voyage, pick up another load We left
(10) anchorage and after we got out the gate Golden Gate -
(11) Q Anchorage you re talking about the anchorage in San
(12) Francisco?
(13) A In San Francisco, that a right
(14) Q Not the Anchorage in Alaska?
(15) A Right
(16) Q Go ahead
(17) A Dlscharged the cargo in San Francisco all of the cargo was
(18) Ilghtered we were proceeded to start our voyage to Valdez
(19) And after we dropped the pilot oft in San Francisco, Instead of
(20) speeding up to sea speed we started experlencing severe
(21) turbocharger vibrations
(22) Q Were you in the engine room at the time?
(23) A That's correct
(24) Q What did you do?
(25) A Well we Investigated the situation and perhaps after -

## Vot 172711

Initially ithought couid be a translent a different ppm of the turbocharger or different conditions they might go away,
(3) and after a short period of time seeing that it wasn t going
(A) away I called the captain and told him that we re having
problems and we have to go back in
Q That s Captain Hazelwood?
A That 8 correct
Q What did Captain Hazelwood say to you?
A Okay
(10) Q And did you in fact go in?
(i1) A We turned the ship around we called the company and sold
(12) them we re golng back to anchorage
(13) Q You called the company?
(14) A We made contact I don i remember exactly whether It was
(15) Captain Hazelwood or both of us but we did notify the company
(16) that we were turning the ship around, we re golng back to
(17) Anchorage and that we will require representatives of the
(is) turbocharger and manufacturers to meet us in anchorage
when we
(19) landed
(20) Q Did that happen? Did the representatives come down?
(21) A That ls correct
(22) Q Okay Did there come a tume when the problem was
(23) corrected?
(24) A Well, they performed some repalrs, changed some parts

You
(25) want me to go Into specitics?

## Vol $17 \quad 2712$

(1) Q No no no it s okay I just want to move along I want to
(2) get on this voyage
(3) AYes
(4) Yes, they changed some parts There was evidence of severe
(5) wear on the bearings, and put new bearings in and after $I$
(6) don $\mathbf{t}$ know, perhaps 24 hours we decided to start our voyage
(7) again
(8) Q Okay What happened then?
(9) A We left anchorage again, and this time we didn t get past
(10) Alcatraz lsland untll same thing, same thing occurred, so
(11) again we turned the ship back around, back to anchorage Same
(12) scenarlo
(13) Q Okay And ultumately that problem was corrected?
(14) A Well, the second time we didn t lust look at the bearings, (15) we disaseembled the entire turbochargers and the rotor to shore
(16) up the balancing, and it was much lengthler a process
(17) O How long did the entire process take of repairing whatever
(18) the problem was?
(19) A From the first - from the first attempt of trying to
(20) leave? From the first attempt of trying to leave San

## Francisco

(21) to the time we finally did leave was approximately six days
(22) $Q$ There s been some suggestion here that when yourivessel
(23) sailed when the vessel satied finally after the problems were
(24) corrected that she was running behind schedule is that
(25) correct?

## Vol 172713

(1) A Not that I maware of It no
(2) Q Why do you say that?
(3) A I don t follow you 1 m eorry
(4) Q in other words was the vessel five days or six days behind
(5) schedule at that point or had there been other arrangements
(6) made to send another vessel in your place?
(7) A There probably would have been yes because we were out of
(8) service for six days, and if there was cargo consigned to us
(9) It was Exxon abligation to provide the tonnage to lift it
(10) yes So some other arrangements would have to be made
that :
(11) true
(12) Q Is it your understanding that your vessel was taken out of
(13) rotation at that point and another ship was substituted for the
(14) Vaidez?
(15) A it wasn t my understanding at the time, but that was the
(16) procedure one would have to follow if there was cargo
(17) avallable, that 8 correct
(18) Q So based on your understanding then when you left San
(19) Francisco you were in a different rotation for another load
(20) not the load that you were originally destıned for?
(21) A That $s$ a realistic assumption, yes
(22) Q Okay Mr Glowackı I d like to go now to March 22nd
(23) 1989 The vessel arrived on the - in Valdez on the evening of
(24) March 22nd am I correct?
(25) A That $s$ correct
(1) Q Okay And I take it once the vessel was tied up you went
(2) to bed?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q All right You woke up the next day I take it March
(5) 23 rd?
(6) A That 8 correct
(7) Q Did you have any discussions with Captain Hazelwood about going ashore?
A Yes, we discussed going ashore to the agent a office We
(10) had some business to take care of, communlcate -
telephone
(11) calle - telephone calls to the office yes
(12) Q Did you have that discussion with Captain Hazelwood?
(13) A That s correct
(14) Q Did he indicate to you that he needed to go ashore to take
(15) care of some business?
(16) A That's correct
(17) Q And did you tell him that you had some business to take
(18) care of as well?
(19) A That 8 correct
(20) O What was your plan at this point after you had this
(21) discussion?
(22) A We planned to leave the vessel somewhere between 10 1100
(23) and go to the agent s office In Valdez
(24) Q Did that in fact happen?
(25) A That 8 correct

## Vol 172715

(1) Q Tell me what tume did you physically leave the vessel?
(2) A We left the vessel somewhere around 1030 in the morning
(3) Q What we re talking about now is you stepping on the
(4) gangway the gantry?
(5) A Yes leaving the vessel yeah
(6) Q All right Was - before you lett the vessel belore you
(7) started going up the gangway did you happen to notice
whather
(8) there was a sailing board?
(9) A Yes there was
(10) Q There was a salling board posted?
(11) A That s correct
(12) a Could you tell please the ladies and gentlemen of the
(13) Jury what a sailing board is?
(14) A A salling board is a physical board on which there are
(15) certain legends, such as the name of the vessel, the date the
(16) vessel will sail, the destination of the vessel, and what time
(17) the crew is to be back on board, and that s usually posted
by
(18) the gangway where one either comes on or off the vessel
(19) Q On the morning of March 23rd as you were about to depart
(20) the vessel did you happen to look at the saling board?
(21) AYes
(22) $Q$ What was the salling tume that was shown on there?
(23) A lt was 900 pm 2100
(24) Q Now after you got off the vessel you went up the gantry
(25) right came down on the other side? You walked down the long

Vol 172716
(1) ${ }^{2} \mathrm{etty} \mathrm{y}^{2}$
(2) A That s correct
(3) Q Okay What happened when you got to the end of the jetty?
(4) A Captain Hazelwood made arrangements with one of the plots
(5) to give us a ride into town and I believe we walted for him
(6) for a little bit
(7) Q At the end of the jetty?
8) A That s correct
(9) Q Did anyone besides yourself and Captain Hazelwood decide to
(10) go to town?
(11) A Yes the officer radio operator
(12) Q That was Mr Roberson?
(13) A That 8 correct
(14) Q What was he going to do in town?
(15) A He just came along with us and had opportunity to get a
(16) free ride lnto town
(17) Q Now you say you were picked up by a pilot?
(18) A That 8 correct
(19) Q Do you remember his name?
(20) A Bradiord I never met him prior to that time
(21) Q Let me suggest a name Bradley?
(22) A Fine
(23) Q That sound correct?
(24) A Fine
(25) Q Where did Mr Bradley take you atter he picked you up in

```
Vol 172717
1) his car?
(2) A He took us to - obvlously out of the terminal Into
3) downtown Valdez to our agent s office Alaska Maritime
(4) Services
(5) Q Before we get to the Alaska Maritime Office you checked
out through the gate I take it?
A That s right
Q When you got to the gate did you have to log out?
A ldon trecall physically signing out no Or individually
signing out
Q Do you remember what imme you left the gate?
A it had to be shortly before 1100
Q We have evidence here and we put it up before that you left
(14) at 1059 Does that comport with your recollection?
(15) A lt ls with the sign out sheets, yes
(16) Q Now you said you went to the Alamar office Did you go to
(17) the Alamar office directly?
(18) A That 8 correct
(19) Q You were driven by Pilot Bradley directly to the Alamar
(20) oflice?
1) A That ls right
(22) Q All three of you?
A That s right
(24) Q What did you - what did you do when you got to the Alamar office?
```

(1) A Their office on the second story, so we all went to their (2) office and they provided us with a couple desks where we could
(3) use the phones and Captain Hazelwood proceeded to make his
(4) phone calls and I proceeded to make my phone calls, plus I had
(5) some lubricating oil samples from the turbochargers that I
had
(6) to have Fed Ex d to San Francisco for analysis and that was
(7) basically the nature of the business what I had to do there
(8) Q Did Pilot Bradley go up to the Alamar offices with you?
(9) A I don trecall He didn t stay with us if that s what you
(10) mean
(11) Q Yes that s what I was driving at
(12) A No, I don trecall that
(13) Q So the three of you got out of his car and walked upstairs
(14) to the Alamar office?
(15) A That 8 correct
(16) Q What time did you get to the Alamar office?
(17) A Have to be about 1130
(18) Q And how long did you remain in the Alamar office?
(19) A Approximately an hour
20) Q Till about 12307
(21) A Correct
(22) Q During that period of one hour did any of you leave the
(23) other site or to say it a different way did you all stay
(24) together?
(25) A That s correct

## Vol 172719

(1) Q You all stayed at the Alamar office?
(2) A That a my recollection yes sir
(3) Q Now you said you had to make some phone calls as well?
(4) A That scorrect
(5) Q Who did you call?
(6) A l called our repair superintendent out of the Benlela
(7) afflce, all regarded the turbochargera and I also called
(8) iurbocharger manufacturer 8 representative And there might
(9) have been a couple others, I don trecall
(10) Q And plus you made arrangements to send the samples by
(ii) Federal Express?
(12) A That a correct
(13) Q So that whole thing took a period of time I take it and
(14) then you were waiting you said for Captain Hazelwood at this
(15) point to finish what he was doing?
(16) A I was done with whatever I had to do earller than Captain
(17) Hazelwood was yes
(18) MR CHALOS Your Honor this may be a good time
(19) THE COURT Take our second recess ladies and
20) gentlemen We ll be in recess for 15 minutes
(21) THE CLERK This court is in recess for 15 minutes
(22) (Jury out at 1202 pm )
(23) (Recess)
(24) (Jury in at 12 17)
(25) THE COURT Mr Chalos

## Vol 172720

MR CHALOS Thank you Your Honor
BYMR CHALOS
Q Mr Glowackı before we go back to the Alamar office I
notice you speak with a slight brogue is that a Bronx accent?
A No, it s not a Bronx accents
Q Where were you born?
A I was born In Poland
Q You immigrated to the United States?
Alm sorry
Q Did you immigrate to the United States?
A That s correct I did
Q Just one more question When you left Exxon - in 1990 you said?
A Yes I did
Q - was that a retirement on your part?
A I had the opportunity of taking $\mathbf{2 0}$ year retirement and I took lt, yes
Q Okay back to the Alamar office when you were there for the
one - one hour from 1130 to 1230 you said?
AYes
Q Did there come a tıme when you overheard a radıo
transmission from the vessel regarding the salling time?
A Yes, the vessel did get in touch with the agent and did notity the agent of a change in sailing time Q From what to what?

Vol 172721
(1) A It was moved back one hour to 1000
(2) Q So when you left the Alamar otfice at 1230 in the
(3) afternoon was it your understanding and Captain Hazelwoods
(4) understanding that the vessel s sading time had been pushed
(5) back one hour to 1000 from 9007
(6) A Yes it was
(7) Q Incidentally we spoke a little bit about the sailing
(B) board Is the salling board the time that slisted on the
(9) salling board for sailing is that something that people who
(10) are going ashore can rely on?
(1i) A lt has been my experience that s correct
(12) Q Okay So what happens that 12 30?
(13) A Captaln Hazelwood and Pilot Murphy made arrangements to
(14) have lunch together and myaelf and Mr Raberson were also
(15) Invited to lunch
(16) Q Did - Captain Murphy was a pilot up in Valdez was he not?
(17) A Yes hewas
(is) Q Did there come a tume when Captain Murphy picked you up (19) the inree of you up?
(20) A After we got done with whatever we had to do at the agent $s$
(21) office, we went downstairs and we watted for Pilot Murphy to
(22) plek us up, that scorrect
(23) Q Where did you go downstars?
(24) Alm sorry
(25) O Where at the Alamar office?

A At the Alamar office
(2) Q And did you wait in the parking lot?
(3) A We waited In front of the office
(4) Q Did you go anywhere else during that period of time while
(5) you were walting for Pilot Murphy?
(6) A No, we just stood outside the office downstairs

Q And did the three of you stay together?
A Yes, we did
Q And did Pilot Murphy come directly to pick you up at that point?
(山) A I belleve we waited a few minutes something of that order
(12) but yes, he did, did actually come and pick us up
(13) Q And did he - did he drive you somewhere?
(14) A We all - yes He drove us to the place where we was going
(15) to lunch
(16) Q What was the name of that place?
(17) A Plzza Palace
(18) Q And did you in fact have lunch at the Pizza Palace?
(19) A Yes we did
(20) Q Did you drink anything at the Pizza Palace?
(21) A Yes, I did
(22) O What did you drınk?
(23) A I had beer
(24) Q How many beers?
(25) A I believe two

Vol 172723
(1) O How about Mr Roberson did he drink?
(2) A lbelleve he also drank beer

Q How many beers?
Aldon t know
Q Did Captaın Hazelwood drınk?
A Yes, he did
OWhat did he drink?
A He had lce tea
Q Did he drink anything of an alcoholic nature?
A At the Pizza Palace?
(11) Q Yes
(12) A No he did not
(13) Q How about Captain Murphy? Did he have any alcohol at the
(14) Pizza Palace?
(15) A No hedid not
(16) Q How long did the lunch take?
(17) A I would say slightly over an hour
(18) Q Let me ask you this
(19) During this lunch that you said took slightly over an hour
(20) did any of the three of you get up and leave to go any place?
(21) ANo
(22) Q You remained together?
(23) A Yes, that $s$ correct
(24) Q All right After lunch was finished where did you go?
(25) A Pllot Murphy took us back In his car to - back to the
(1) center of fown
(2) Q And all three of you?
(3) A That 8 correct
(4) Q Did he drop you off somewhere?
(5) A l believe there was a supermarket there in front of the
(6) supermarket, which ls - to me is the center of town, Valdez
(7) Q To the best of your recollection about what ime would
(8) that have been?
(9) A Around $2 \mathbf{0 0}$ or shortly after
(10) Q Now what did you do - did Pilot Murphy get out with you
(11) there or did he just drop the three of you?
(12) A I belleve he just dropped us off
(13) Q What did the three of you do after you were dropped off?
(14) And I m talking now initially I don t want you to give me a
(15) long recitation We ll get into that
(16) A Seems I recall that we sort of hung loose there for a (17) whlle, not knowing what to do, or to decide, and then Captaln
(18) sald - Captain Hazelwood said he had something else to take
(19) care of, and I wanted to get some papers for the - I was asked
(20) prior to leaving the ship to get the newspapers for some of the
(21) other crew members, some of the engineers, and I don $t$ recall
(22) Mr Roberson saying anything that he had to do
(23) Q Okay How long did this discussion take?
(24) A Perhaps a few minutes
(25) Q Okay And did there come a time when you split up?

## V어 172725

i) A Then we decided to part, and we parted
(2) Q Did you have a general plan as to where you were going to (3) meat up again?

A Yeah prior to parting, we did say we d-we II meet in the Plpeline Club
Q Did you say about what time you would meet in the Pipeline Club?
A Within a couple hours
Q Was there any plan to meet there at any specific tume?
Aldont -
Q Or around a specific time?
Almsorry?
Q Or around a specific time?
(14) A i don t recall any specifics belng talked about, no
(15) Q Now did you walk away from the other two at that point?
(18) A Yes, I did
(17) Q Where did you go?
(18) A i belleve I went to the drugstore, which also sells
(19) newspapers They didn thave any Sol baught some news
(20) magazines, and then I was told that the only place you can buy
(21) papers in Valdez is irom an automatic dispensers, so at the
(22) drugstore, I belleve they told me where a couple of them could
(23) be located, and I proceeded to look for papers
(24) $Q$ How long did that walk take you from the drugstore to
(25) wherever the papers -
(1) A Well I also went to - there sa hotel in Valdez
(2) Westmark, I believe or something of that sort
(3) $Q$ The one down by the small boat harbor?
(4) A By the yacht basin in the small harbor yes
(5) Q Why did you go there?
(6) A l couldn $t$ find newspapers anywhere else all the machines
(7) were empty, so I went over there and I hung around the harbor
(8) for a little while, just taking in the sights
(9) Q Anything else?
(10) A That 8 about it
(11) Q Okay did you eventually make your way to the Pipeline
(12) Club?
(13) A Yes, I did
(14) Q What time did you arrive there?
(15) A Approximately four in the afternoon
(16) Q So you walked around town? is it your testimony you walked
(17) around town for about two hours?
(1a) A About an hour and a half plus yes
(19) O When you arrived at the Pipeline Club - you said about
(20) 4007
(21) A Yes
(22) Q Was that the first time you were in the Pipeline Club that
(23) day?
(24) A That day, yes
(25) Q Was there - was Captain Hazelwood or Mr Roberson in the

Vol 172727
(1) Pipeline Club when you arrived?
(2) A No, they were not
(3) at
(4) the Pipeline Club?

A Yes He joined me about 20 minutes to half an hour after I
showed up, after I went to the Pipelline
Q What time would you say he came in?
A Approximately 430
Q Had you already ordered a drink by the time Captain
Hazelwood arrived?
Aldid yes
Q What did you order?
A Gin and tonic
Q Did you get a gin and tonic?
A Yes, I did
Q When Captain Hazelwood camein did he come over to speak
(17) to you?
(18) A Yes, he came toward me, that s correct
(19) Q Okay What did he say to you and what did you say to him?
(20) A I don t belleve we said anything other than How you doing,
(21) something llke
(22) D Did he ask you if you wanted a drink?
(23) A l'm sorry
(24) Q Did he ask you if you wanted a drink?
(25) A No, I stIII had the drink I ordered

| BSA | FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCR |
| :---: | :---: |
| Vol 172728 |  |
| (1) | Q So he didn t buy you a drink at this point? |
| (2) | A No I don t recall anything of that sort no |
| (3) | Q Did Captain Hazelwood go up and order a drink for humselt? |
| (4) | A Yes, 1 belleve so |
| (5) | Q Did you hear what he ordered? |
| (6) | A l belleve he ordered vodka yes |
| (7) | Q And did he come back with the vodka? |
| (3) | A That sight |
| (9) | Q Now you said about 20 minutes later Mr Roberson arrived? |
| (10) | A He did, yes About 20 minutes atter Captaln Hazelwood |
| (11) | Q At that point did Mr Roberson come over and ask you if |
| (12) | you wanted a drink? |
| (13) | A He might have, yes |
| (14) | Q Do you remember what you said to him? |
| (15) | A l don \% belleve we got around for it because we still had |
| (16) | our drinks |
| (17) | Q You were still working on your first drink at that point? |
| (18) | A I might have been working on the second one, I don t |
| kno |  |
| (19) | Q How about Captain Hazelwood? |
| (20) | Aldon trecall |
| (21) | Q Now when Mr Roberson arrived did he go up and order |
| (22) | something to drink? |
| (23) | A Yes, he dld |
| (24) | Q What did he order? |
| 25) | A He ordered a beer |

5-25-94 VOLUME 17
$x \max (37)$

## Vol 172730

(1) Q The glass that Captain Hazelwood was drınking from was
(2) that a single glass as besi you recall?
(3) A it was the same size mine was, yes
(4) Q And you were drinking singles?
(5) A Yes, that s correct
(6) Q Now did any of you during that period of time that you
(7) were together in the Pipeline Club - that is you and Captain
(8) Hazelwood were together you said from about 430 to
(9) approximately 7007 Do you remember that?
(10) A Yes
(1) Q Okay Did either one of you ever leave the other s sight?
(12) A No
(13) Q Did anybody leave that place and go somewhere else during
(14) that period of time?
(15) ANo
(16) Q How about when Mr Roberson arrived did any of you leave
(17) any of the three of you leave?
(18) A No, we dld not
(19) Q Okay what did you do at 700 ?
(20) A We left the Plpellne Club and we were golng to go back to
(21) the ship
(22) Q Your plan was to go back to the ship at that point?
(23) A That s correct However I asked Captain Hazelwood and Mr
(24) Roberson if they wouldn $t$ mind if we stopped over at the Plzza
(25) Palace solcould buy a couple pizzas and bring them back to

## V어 172731

(1) the ship for the other engineers
(2) Q That was your suggestion?
(3) A That 8 correct
(4) O The other two were ready to go back?
(5) A Well we were all ready to go back
(6) Q When you left the Pipeline Club - at approximately 700
(7) you said - what did you believe at that point was the sailing
(8) time of this vessel?
(9) A 1000
(10) Q All right
(11) Now how long did it take you to go from the Plpeline Club
(12) to the Pizza Palace?
(13) A About 20 minutes
(14) Q What was the condition of the road do you remember?
(15) A It was winter It was icy and packed snow
(16) Q You guys were walking I take it carefully?
(17) A As one does on uneven icy slippery surface, yes
(18) Q Did any of the three of you have any problem negotiating
(19) the icy road to walk from the Pipeline Club to the Pizza
(20) Palace?
(21) Aldon tbelleve so no
(22) Q Anybody stumble?
(23) ANo
(24) Q Anybody fall?
(25) A No I don t recall anything like that

Vol 172732

1) QWhen you lett the Pipeline Club did you feel impaired? A No
Q Did Captain Hazelwood appear impaired to you?
ANo
Q Did Mr Roberson appear impaired?
ANo
Q in addition to three drinks that you had at the Pipeline
Club you also had two beers earlier in the atternoon right?
A That s correct
Q Now what happened when you got to the Pizza Palace?
A Well, we were going to go inside so l could order the
pizza, and I seem to remember the - lot of people standing
around in the cashier sarea where I was going to order the
pizza so Captaln Hazelwood and Mr Raberson did not go In,
(15) they decided not to go in, they stayed outside, and I went in (16) to order the pizza
(17) Q How long did that process take?
(18) A Few minutes
(19) Q Okay Then what happened?
(20) A Well, I - I guess the - prior to them leaving, It was -
(21) I believe lt was starting to drizzle, drizzle outside so they
(22) decided that I II meet them next door, which was a bar, while
(23) we were wailing for the pizza
(24) Q Let me see if I understand this right You went in to
) order the pizza they were standing outside?

## Vor 172733

(1) A Right
(2) Q And some point they went into the Club Bar?
(3) A That s correct
(4) Q And then you went in and joined them?
(5) A That 8 correct
(6) Q What happened in the Club Bar?
(7) A After I walked back in there?
(8) QYes

A Captaln Hazelwood and Mr Roberson was sitting there at the
(10) bar, and I jolned them there
(1i) Q Did the three of you order drinks?
(12) A lordered a drink, and they had already ordered a drink
(13) prior to me arriving, that Ecorrect
(14) Q And three drinks were served to the three of you?
(15) AYes
(16) Q What dld you order?
(17) A Another gin and tonlc
(18) Q What did Captain Hazelwood order?
(19) A I wasn there when he ordered
(20) Q How about Mr Roberson do you know what he ordered?
(21) A I belleve he had a beer in iront of him, so -
(22) Q Now did you finish your drink?
(23) A Not that one, no
(26) Q What was the answer?
(25) A Not that one, no
(1) Q What do you mean not that one?
(2) A The one we just ordered
(3) Q You only ordered one drink is that right?
(4) A That s correct
(5) Q And you didn t finish the drink?
(6) A That s correct
(7) Q Why did you not finish the drink?
(B) A Well by the time we got the drinks that took - by the
(9) tlme I got the drink, that took a few minutea and by that time
(10) was about 15 minutes or 80 after I ordered the pizza, I went
(1i) back to the - next door to the Plzza Palace to find out
(12) Whether the pizza was ready and also I wanted to call a cab
(13) for us to go back to the ship to take ua back to the ship
(14) Q And did you do that?
(15) A Yes, I did
(16) Q What happened?
(17) A When I went back to the Plzza Palace yes Indeed the pizza
(18) was ready and I asked the cashier to also call us a cab which
(19) she did and I have to assume that cabs were in radio contact
(20) and she told me there was a cab waiting outside, there happened
(21) to be a cab outside where we were
(22) Q So the pizza and the cab were all there at the same time?
(23) A Almost happened simultaneously, that s correct
(24) Q Okay What did you do then?
(25) A l went got the pizzas and went, paid for the pizzas and

## Vol 172735

(1) went next door and told Captain Hazelwood and the radio otficer
(2) that Cab is here let s go
(3) Q Do you know whether or not either one of them finished
(4) their drink?
(5) A I don't belleve so I have no way of knowing
(6) Q Do you know whether ether one of them even started their
(7) drink?
(8) A Again, I have no way of knowing
(9) Q But you know you didn t finish your drink?
(10) A Yes Yes I do know I did not finish my drink
(11) Q What happened when the taxi picked you up? Where dyou

90
(12) next?
(13) A He had to pick up another passenger
(14) Q Where was that?
(15) A I belleve it was Pipeline Club, but I wasen $t$ sure at the (15) time
(17) Q When you arrived the three of you were in the taxi - and
(18) you drove over to the Pipeline Club is that what you re
(19) saying?
(20) A That s correct
(21) Q And did you in fact pick up another passenger?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q Did any one of the three of you get out of the taxt at the
(24) Pipeline Club and go into the Pipeline Club?
(25) A No we did not

Vol 172736
(1) Q Did you remain in the taxi the enture time that you were (2) there?
(3) A That scorrect
(4) Q Did there come a time when the taxi took you back to the
(5) termınal?
(6) AYes
(7) Q How long was the taxi ride?
(8) A Approximately hall an hour
(9) Q According to the gate log at Alyeska you and the other
(10) two - three gentlemen arrived there around 824 does that
(11) comport with your recollection?
(12) A it 8 in the ballpark yes
(13) Q Now when you arrived at the Alyeska gate check tell us
(14) what happened What s the procedure there?
(15) A The general procedure le that the cab -
(16) Q Excuse me don tell us the general procedure tell me
(17) what happened on that particular night if you recall
(18) A Okay Well, the general procedure was followed which
(19) happens to be -
(20) Q You re - you re not only a good engineer but a better (21) lawyer
(22) A Well, the cab driver generally collects everyone's I D s (23) and passes them to security guard who takes them and checks
(24) them off at the list of names that when people lett and then
(25) you re asked to get out of the car or the cab and go through

## Vol 172737

[^38](1) pizza
(2) $Q \ln$ boxes?
(3) AYes
(4) Q Like we know pizzas okay
(5) What did Captain Hazelwood have? Did he have any packages?
(6) A I belleve he had some sort of attache case that he brought
(7) with him, with his papers
(8) Q After you came out of - now they didn istop you at the
(9) secunty gate I mean they didn $t$ hold you up or not permit
(10) you to come in did they?
(1i) A No, we just went through the metal detectors and just went
(12) through the normal securlty procedure
(13) Q Okay Where did you go next?
(14) A Back Into the cab and the cab took us to the dock
(15) Q Did you drop off the other fellow first?
(16) A That I don trecall
(17) Q Okay You were at berth 5 that night am l correct?
(18) A That \& correct
(19) Q And where does the cab drop you off at the foot of the
(20) jetty?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q And then you have to make that long walk Do we have
(23) that? Let me just - watch this here we go
(24) Does that s accurately represent the jetty that you had to
(25) walk down that night?
(1) A Yes it does 172739
(2) Q Now what was the state of the weather do you remember?
(3) A belleve it was drizzling, light snow was beginning to
(4) fall
(5) Q You were walking with the two two pizzas?
(6) A Yes
(7) Q And Captain Hazelwood has his attache case?
(8) A Yes
(9) Q All right Now when you get to the end the end in the
(10) case happens to be here you have to negotiate a gangway do
(11) you not a gantry?
(12) A Well, there sa structure from which the gangway is
(13) suspended yes
(14) Q All right Let me show you what we ve previously marked
(15) as - it s in evidence DX155 - no that $s$ the video is that
(16) one 55 or am I wrong?
(17) I want to show you a video that we have of the gangway and
(18) ask you if the video accurately represents the situation as it
(19) existed that night as you recall Shall -
(20) Is this the one that shows - no just the nighttime one
(21) I ve been relieved of all responsibility for working the
(22) electronics They don trust me with it
(23) MR SANDERS Kind of the master of understatement
(24) BY MR CHALOS
(25) Q Okay Mr Glowacki can you make it out from where you

```
are?
A Yes
Q You can look at your screen there
A No this is fine
Q This gentleman is walking down the catwalk at this point
right the jetty that we ve been talking about?
A Yes
Q Okay Now this is the beginning of the gangway?
A There are two sets of stairs actually two stories
Q This is the first story?
A One leading to a plattorm and then another to another
platform
Q So far does it comport with your recollection of the
situation as it existed that night?
A Yes That s correct
Q Now you re headed down?
A That ls the gangway, that s correct
Q Were you also negotiating this with one hand?
A I was carrying the pizzas yes
Q Dld you stumble or fall or anything like that?
A No
Q Did any of the other two gentlemen stumble or fall?
A No
Q Everybody was able to go up and go down the gangway
(25) easlly?
```

farrly
) 900
Q Did that surprise you?
A Yes, it surprised us that s correct
Q That s because you expected to sall at 1000 based on what
was told to you at the Alamar office?
A That s correct
Q Now Mr Glowackı you ve salled for approxımately 20
years It is usual or unusual that the sailing board would
have been moved up from 1000 to 900 once it was set at
10007
A it shighly unusual to move the board up it s generally
moved back

- To a later time?

A To a later time
Q Okay So you re on board Now you go to your room you
(16) Call the first engineer Eventually you make your way down to
(17) the engine room?
(18) A lasked him, you know - knowing we had to sall shortly, I
(19) asked him, Are we ready is the engine ready to go, and are
we
20) ready, and I told him I II be down there shortly

Q And did you in fact go down there?
(22) A l went down after - right - not right away, but just as
(23) we started pulling away from the dock
(24) Q Now did there come a tume after the vessel departed from
(25) the Alyeska Terminal that you went up to the bridge to talk

## V어 172743

with Captain Hazelwood?
A Yes there was
Q What trme was that?
Ald say sometime after 1000
Q Why did you go up to the bridge?
A We have a requlrement to send certain Information to the company after loading or after discharge, after any port visit,
(8) with certain information so I went and gave the captain the

Information that was required of me for him to Include in his
(10) message
(ii) Q What type of information?
(12) A How much fuel we have on board at departure what how
(13) many lube oil - quantity of lube oil is on board, quantity of
(14) water on board
(15) Q And the captain needs this information to put into a
(16) departure message to send to the company?
(17) A That \& correct
(18) Q Now you say you got up there sometume after ten little
(19) bit after ten?
(20) A That s correct
(21) Q Was the captain on the bridge at that tume?
(22) A Yes, he was
(23) Q How long did you remain on the bridge?
(24) A Perhaps ilve minutes, ten minutes
(25) Q Now did there come a tıme when you and Captain Hazelwood

## Vol 172744

left the bridge together?
A Yes
Q About what time was that?
A Shortly after I came up and whatever time it was that I Ilngered on the bridge, the flve or ten minutes, that 8 when
left together
Q Do you have a recollection of approximately what time it was when you left the bridge?
A I would say somewhere between 1015 to 1030
Q Where did you go?
A I went back to my room to put the same information into my
(12) records, same information I gave the captaln into my recorde
(13) Captain went to his room his office
(14) Q And you don t know what the captain was doing in his
(15) office?
(16) ANo
(17) Q But he had the information you gave him?
(18) A That s correct
(19) Q All right Did you see the captain at all at any time
(20) after that prior to the grounding?
(21) A No, I dld not
(22) Q Let s talk about the period of ime around say eight
(23) minutes or ten minutes after midnight Tell us where you ware (24) and what you observed or what you felt
(25) A Well after the time that we Just talked about previously,

## Vol 172745

I went back to my office I probably apent about another ten minutes in my office or that - whatever the paperwork I had
to linlsh, and I went back down to the engine room
Q All right What did you do down there - I mean don t
) tell us everything you did 1 m irying to focus you now at the
moment of the grounding I know you didn t know that you were
(7) aground initially but you feit something you observed
something did you not?
A Well prior, around midnight that s when the watch is
(10) changed, meaning that difierent engineer comes on duty, so at
(11) that time both the first engineer who was going off and the
(12) third engineer who was coming on watch were in the engine room,
(13) so there were actually three of us In the engine room at the (14) time Sol was in the control room and they were down on the
(15) lowest level of the engine room performing some of the routine
(16) tests we normally do on the way out of port and by the time
(17) that you re referring to which I assume is the grounding
(18) moment 1208 -
(19) Q Incidentally did you know at that moment that you were
(20) aground?
(21) A No I dld not
(22) Q Okay Tell us what you observed and what you telt
(23) A I heard some muffled rumbling noises in the control room (24) emanating from the engine room, and the first thought that came
(25) to my mind was that it was the turbochargers surging based an
(1) our previous turbocharger problem So I went out of the
(2) control room and went toward the turbochargers, checked certain
(3) things on the turbochargers left hand side to them, and it
(4) Wasn $t$ - the nolses were not coming - at that tlme the noise
(5) had subsided and obvlously they were not coming from the
(6) turbochargers
(7) I went back to the control room and very shortly after
(8) that, within a couple minutes the lirst engineer walked in the
(9) control room -
(1) Q That s Mr Jones?
(ii) A That s correct
(12) Q Okay and -
(13) A When I-before Mr Jones walked Into the control room (14) and when I went back to the control room, I notlced that main
(15) engine one of the instruments on the main engine was reading
(16) something was unusual for that - for the speed that the main
(17) engine was doing at the time And instinctively, the deck
(18) didn tteel right to me
(19) Q What do you mean by that?
(20) A Just didn't feel the same as it was when I walked out or
(21) feeling as before
(22) QYes
(23) A lt just felt difierently and it a instinctive I can :
(24) explain it any further
(25) Q Did you do any investigation trying to find out -

## Vof 172747

(1) A Well after that, looking at the - that inatrument on main
(2) engine, the instinctive feeling that the deck didn took right
(3) I looked at an incilnometer, and I noticed we had a, I belleve
(4) It was one or two degree list
(5) Q What s an inclinometer?
(6) A It \& an instrument made out of a glass tube shaped in an (7) arc filled with fluid with an air bubble in the middte, so if you re tilted and which way, the bubble will tend to seek the
(9) center And there a graduation in degrees molt there a
)
(1) dit
(11) ls
(12) Q You sasd you noticed a one or two degree list?
(13) A That 8 correct
(14) Q Which side of the ship?
(15) A Port
(16) $Q$ So the ship was leaning to port?
(17) A Right
(18) Q What happened next?
(18) A Well, when - at that time I belleve the ilrst engineer
(20) Ray Jones walked In so the control room, and I-I sald to
(21) him something to the effect that There s something wrong 1
(22) know we didn t leave port with a couple degree list
(23) O Okay Did there come a tume when you recelved a phone call
(24) from the bridge?
(25) A Very shortly after that the bridge called down that $s$
(1) Correct 172748
(2) Q Do you remember who called you?
(3) A it was the third mate Greg Cousins
(4) Q And what did he say to you?
(5) A He said that we re going to stop the engines
(6) Q Say anything else?
(7) A No not at the time
(8) Q Did you question him?
(9) A No
10) Q Why?
11) A The bridge is in control and if they have a reason to stop
12) the engine I assume they have a good reason It s not the
13) time to discuss things
14) Q Okay and what did you tell him?
i5) A I said, Go ahead but do It slowly
15) Q Now did there come a time when you received a second call
17) from the bridge?
18) A Yes
19) Q When was that?
(20) A It was I d say perhaps five minutes later maybe between
21) flve and ten minutes later
22) Q Who was on the phone this time?
23) A lt was Captain Hazelwood
24) Q What did Captain Hazelwood say to you and what did you
say
(25) To him?

## Vol 172749

## A Captain told me that We have a problem we re aground

 He(2) also asked me it he can use the englne to which at that time
(3) from altercations and the information we had at our disposal
(4) and on the console for the main englne I saw no reason why the
(5) engine could not be used And he also asked whether everything
6) Is all right down there

Q Did you discuss about getting the engine room crew alerted
) to the fact that you were aground?
A Yes We - we discussed the fact that I told him since
(10) we re aground 1 m going to have someone sound all the engine
(11) room tanks to make sure there was no ingress of water at the -
(12) that the levels were where they ahould have been, and that I
(13) will wake up all the engine department personnel
(14) Q Okay When Captain Hazelwood called you on phone did his
(15) voice sound imparred?

A No
) Q Did he sound sad?
(18) A He sounded to me like Captaln Hazelwood
(19) Q Did he slur his words at all?

A No
(21) Q Did he - the discussion you had with him and the
(22) Instructions he was giving you were they clear?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q Did he appear to be at least on the telephone appear to (25) be in control of his faculties?
(1) A Yes I have to say that because he was concerned he asked
(2) how things were in the engine room Hewas concerned about us
(3) and the machinery and the crew
(4) O Okay Youtold Captain Hazelwood that based on what you
(5) were reading on your control board that he could use the
(6) engines if he wanted?
(7) A And I believe we also told - obviously told him that we
(8) will make thorough Inspection rounds of machinery spaces and I
(9) will let him know what we have
(10) Q Did there come a time when you called him up and conveyed
(11) the information to him?
(12) A Yes, there was
(13) Q You gave him all the information relating to the condition
(14) of the engine?
(15) A That's correct
(16) Q Now with respect to starting up the engine again did
(17) there come a time when Captain Hazelwood started up the engine?
(18) AYes
(19) Q At this point was the control of the engine still up with (20) the bridge?
(21) A It was
(22) Q So they had control over how this engine worked?
(23) A The bridge had control of the engine that s correct
(24) $Q$ There is a method by which the engine room can take over
(25) and run the engine from down there is that correct?

Voㅓ 172751
(1) A There are four methods of control ultimately but -
(2) Q Tell us about those
(3) A One which we use most of the time, which that st way
(4) thls being a highly automated vessel it was designed to be
(5) controiled from the bridge, that a what we use most of the -
(6) practically all the tlme And the other was - another was
(7) from the engine control room and also in the englne site
(8) There were two methods, locally, on the engine
(9) Q But in this instance Captain Hazelwood had the control on
(10) the bridge?
(11) A The control remained on bridge, that \& correct
(12) Q Let me ask you something about this engine
(13) What is the maximum available horsepower on this engine if
(14) you wanted to run it you know -
(15) A Thls engine was rated at 314 - 400 or 600 horsepower 1
(18) don t know exactly which
(17) Q What is the available horsepower at let s say full ahead
(18) maneuvering 55 rpms ?
(19) A l'd say somewhere between elght, 8,000 and 9,000
(20) horsepower
(21) Q What is the - the rpms if you were going full ahead sea
(22) speed as opposed to full maneuvering?
(23) A lt was 79 rpm
(24) Q if you re running the engine at 55 rpm you re only using
(25) about 8500 horsepower and you have avalable to you

Vol 172752
(1) approximately 31400 you said?
(2) A That s correct
(3) MR CHALOS This is my able assistant You re much
(4) better at electronics than you are manual stuff
(5) BYMR CHALOS
(6) Q Mr Glowackı this is exhibit - Plaintiffs Exhibit 81 in
evidence
(8) You recognize this as being the data logger or a copy of
(9) the data logger from your ship?
(10) A That E correct
(11) $\mathbb{Q}$ This information that we have here is printed down in the
(12) engine room is it not?
(13) A Yes
(14) Q You have a machine that prints this out?
(15) A it s automatlcally printed on a roll of tape llke on a
(16) calculator type thing
(17) QOkay
(18) You recognize this as being the data logger from the Exxon
(19) Valdez do you not - or a copy of it?
(20) A Yes yes
(21) Q All right Captain Hazelwood initialiy stopped the engine
(22) after you got that call you told us about at 1220 and then he
(23) restarted the engine at 1236 ?
(24) A That s correct
(25) Q Just so the jury understands what he was doing can you
Vol 172753
(1) tell us what he did starting let s say at 1236 and working
(2) its way up to 1256 T That s a period of about 20 minutes
(3) What did Captain Hazelwood do?
(4) A Well, if you look at -
(5) Q Excuse me one second
(6) Your Honor with your permission maybe we could have him
(7) come down it might be easier
(8) Mr Glowacki incidentally let me ask you something about
(9) dresel engines Do they thrust the same horsepower whether
(10) they re in the forward direction or the reverse direction?
(11) A Yeah The characterlatic of a diesel propulsion is such
(12) that you have the maximum horsepower available in both
(13) directions
(14) Q Okay As opposed to a steam engine where you only have a
(15) percentage of your power if you go astern right?
(16) A Steve driven propulaian only gives one - ls designed to
(17) oniy give maybe 30 to 40 percent of max power In the stern
(18) direction It's not the same as on the motor ship
(19) Q So on the stern - for instance if you wanted to go full
(20) astern - right not full astern maneuvering but full
(21) astern - you would have available to you 31400 horsepower in
(22) the full maximum stern?
(23) A That s correct
(24) Q And if you were going full astern maneuvering that would
(25) be again 84007
(1) tell us what he did starting let s say at 1236 and working
(2) Its way up to 12567 That s a period of about 20 minutes
(4) A Well, if you look at -
(5) Q Excuse me one second
(6) Your Honor with your permission maybe we could have him
come down it might be easier
19) diesel engines Do they thrust the same horsepower whether (10) they re in the forward direction or the reverse direction?
(11) A Yeah The characterlatic of a dieset propulsion la such
(13) directions
(14) Q Okay As opposed to a steam engine where you only have a
(15) percentage of your power if you go astern right?
(16) A Steve driven propuision only gives one - is designed to
(18) direction It's not the same ase on the motor ship
(19) Q So on the stern - for instance if you wanted to go full
(20) astern - right not full astern maneuvering but full
(21) astern - you would have avalable to you 31400 horsepower in
(23) A That s correct
(25) be again 84007
(1) A lt would be the same The engine doesn treally care which
(2) way it s running
(3) Q Okay all right
(4) So he starts the engine up at nine - at 1236 What s he
(5) doing now?
(6) A Hes starting right here
(7) Q Right okay
(8) A And it s running, he started at dead slow at $9 \mathbf{3 5}, 57$
seconds which is - I m sorry, this ls Greenwich mean IIme
So
(10) it a actually -
(11) Q Convert it to 127
(12) A Actually midnight And then at $\mathbf{4 0}$ minutes after midnight,
(13) went to slow ahead
(14) Q So for four minutes he $s$ running in the dead slow ahead?
(15) A That 8 correct
(16) Q Is that proper procedure if you re bringing your engine up
(17) slowly?
(18) A lt s certainly wiser I mean more prudent than to just go
(19) In large increments, yes
(20) Q What does he do then from 40 minutes after midnight to
(21) let s say -
22) A Okay, still slow ahead At midnight 48 minutes it 8 half
(23) ahead
(24) Q Okay What does half ahead represent in rpms?
(25) A I belıeve it was 45

## Vol 172755

(1) Q Right here see this - well she s climbing at this point?
(2) A She s climbing
(3) Q So he s down around 32 and climbing up towards 457
(4) A From slow ahead to half ahead, that scorrect
(5) Q Then he s at full ahead at 1256 and 19 seconds?
(6) A Right Right
(7) Q Now that full ahead maneuvering is that correct?
(8) A That $\boldsymbol{5} \mathbf{5 5}$ revolutlons, that s correct
(9) $Q$ And then he contınues on this full ahead maneuvering until
(10) 140 approximately?
(11) A That 8 right
(12) Q When he goes to slow slow ahead and then he stops the
(13) engine in that one minute at 1417
(id) A That 8 correct
(15) O Okay Thank you very much
(16) Mr Glowackı based on what you just told us what was the (17) maximum percentage of horsepower that Captain Hazelwood used as
(18) opposed to what was available to hım?
(19) A Well Isaid before, 55 rpm is somewhere between 8,000
(20) 9000 horsepower, let s say 8500 horsepower
(21) Q What was that in terms of percentage of what was avalable
(22) to him?
(23) A Ot 31000
(24) Q Yeah
(25) A Roughly 2627 percent

## Vol 172756

(1) Q So in this whole period of time he didn t use any more
(2) than about 2627 percent of the power avallable to him?
(3) A That s correct
(4) Q Did - reading this data logger did Captain Hazelwood at
(5) any time from the grounding over here which was - well they
(6) have it here as the grounding but assume it was at eight
7) minutes aher midnight
B) From that moment unil he stopped finally stopped the engine at 141 did he use any reverse on the engine at all?
o) A No All the speeds were in the ahead direction There (11) were no astern calls
(12) Q He never put the engine astern did he that whole time? (13) ANo no
(14) Q Have you had a chance to review Mr Van Hammen s testimony?
(15) A I ve read it, yes
(16) Q Mr Van Hammen was an expert that was called by the (17) plaintiffs And do you remember his testimony contrary to (18) what Captain Hazelwood had said? Captain Hazelwood had said
(19) that if he wanted to get full maximum horsepower on this
(20) vessel all he had to do was press two buttons on the bridge
(21) and within two minutes he could get it up to the full maximum
(22) horsepower avalable all right?
(23) Now Mr Van Hammen testified that that wasn t possible
(24) You remember that testimony?
(25) A Yes

## Vol 172757

(1) Q Okay You also remember reading his tesumony that he had (2) never been on board the Exxon Valdez do you not?
(3) Yes
4) Q That he wasn $t$ familiar with its engines?
(5) A Yes
6) Q And that he did not hold a seagoing engineer s ilcense?

AYes
(8) Q Based on your experience you - you were there when they
(9) built the ship you ran the ship for three years as its chief
(10) engineer Do you agree or disagree with Mr Van Hammen s
(11) testimony on this issue?
(12) Aldlagree
(13) Q Tell us why
(14) A Well, the capialn had actually two means of going up to
(15) maximum horsepower as quickly as he wished to
(18) Q Tell us about it
(17) A Even though the engine was already speeding up to speed -
(18) sea speed was In the preprogrammed program so to speak, there
(19) Is a button that you can hold, he could have held down which is
(20) called "find setting up and all you had to do was hold it down
(21) and the engine would have sped up in a couple two, three
(22) minutes to whatever - to ultimately maximum horsepower
(23) Or he could have thrown another awitch and given a control (24) to us in the engine room and we could have done it even faster,
(25) If he wanted to

1) Q How much faster?
(2) A Perhaps half that time even less than that
(3) Q Incidentally when Captain Hazelwood was using the engine
(4) for this approximately one hour and five minutes did you have
s) any problems at all with the engine?
2) A There was some transient alarms but they were not outside
3) of - they did not reach the limits where the engine was overloaded no
Q Was there any damage caused to the engine by the use of the
(10) engine at this point?
(11) A No
(12) Q Now Mr Van Hammen also testified that because the vessel
(13) was aground that the engine could not thrust its maximum
(14) horsepower Do you remember that testimony?
(15) A Yes
(18) Q Do you agree or disagree with that testimony?
4) Aldisagree
(18) Q Tell us why
(19) A The engine doesn t care
(20) Q But I do so iell us about it
(21) A Well, let met put It this way The engine is a dumb (22) obedient animal that wants to please and If you give it enough
(23) fuel and air it will run as fast as you allow it to until it
(24) could eventually self destruct
(25) So being a caring, loving master design engineer who

## Vol 172759

## designed - would Incorporate in the engine deaign features

to
protect itself such as governors overspeed trips and Ilmit
It
(3) to certain parameters so it doesn $t$ self destruct
(4) But no, certainly the maximum horsepower could certalnly
(5) have been developed even though we were aground
(6) Q Okay I have one more area -
(7) A Engines like this I ve testifled ashore in shop trials
(8) where they re not golng anywhere, not hooked up to
propellers
(9) at first horsepower
(10) Q That is when you re testing it you re not at sea?
(11) A That s correct
(12) Q And you re still developing the maximum horsepower?
(i3) A That s correct
(14) Q Okay Mr Glowackı one more area I want to go back to
(15) that time when you were in San Francisco when you had the
(16) problem with the turbochargers
(17) AYes
(18) Q You decided on two separate occasions to bring the ship
(19) back right? In other words you discussed it with Captain
(20) Hazelwood and you brought the ship back for further repairs?
(21) AYes
(22) Q Did anyone from Exxon ever criticize you for that?
(23) A Not for that no
(24) Q Did you believe Exxon had given you the authority if you
(25) felt that there was something wrong with the engine to either

| BSA | FEDERAL TRIALL TRANSCR |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Vol 172760 |
| (1) stop the ship or bring her back to port and take whatever time |  |
| (2) was necessary and reparr the problem? |  |
| (3) A I ve never had that type of judgment questloned in my |  |
|  |  |
| (5) MR CHALOS Thank you Mr Glowackı Your witness |  |
| (6) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JERZY GLOWACKI |  |
| (7) BYMR O NEILL |  |
| (8) Q Sir my name is Brian O Neill and we ve never met before |  |
| (9) I want to ask you some questions follow up on some of the |  |
| (10) questions that you were asked by counsel And I ve put in |  |
| (11) Pront of you your deposition transcript some transcript in a |  |
| (12) state trial the transcript of your testimony before |  |
| (13) National Transportation Safery Board and some interviews you |  |
| (14) gave to the FBI the state troopers - and we If use those |  |
| (15) we proceed okay? |  |
| (16) Now you graduated from New York Maritume Academy when in |  |
| (17) 19707 |  |
| (18) A That a correct |  |
| (19) Q And you knew Captan Hazeiwood at the academy? |  |
| (20) A He was at the school at the same time I was yes |  |
| (21) Q And you and hım go back 2425 years? |  |
| (22) A Yes |  |
| (23) | Q Did Kırntis go to that academy too? |
| (24) | A No he didn t, no |
|  | O When did you first meet Mr Kımtıs? |

(1) stop the ship or bring her back to por and take whatever time
(2) was necessary and repair the problem?
(3) A I ve never had that type of judgment questloned in my
(4) career, no
(5) MR CHALOS Thank you Mr Glowackı Your witness

CROSS EXAMINATION OF JERZY GLOWACKI
BYMR O NEILL
(8) Q Sir my name is Brian O Neill and we ve never met before
(9) I want to ask you some questions follow up on some of the
(10) questions that you were asked by counsel And I ve put in
(11) front of you your deposition transcript some transcript in a
your lestimony belore the
(13) National Transportation Satety Board and some interviews you
(4.) gave to the FBI the state troopers - and we l| use those as
(15) we proceed okay?
(16) Now you graduated from Naw York Martime Academy when in
(17) 19707
(18) A That 8 correct
(19) Q And you knew Captan Hazelwood at the academy?
(20) A He was at the school at the same time I was yes
(21) Q And you and him go back 2425 years?
(23) Q Did Kimtis go to that academy too?
(24) A No he didn $t$, no
(25) O When did you first meet Mr Kımtis?

|  | Vol 172761 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) | A While employed at Exxon |
| (2) | Q About what year? |
| (3) | A I have to say maybe late 80s mid to late 80s |
| (4) | Q Mid to late 80s And Captain Hazelwood was a friend of |
| (5) | Mr Kimtis too wasn the - youknow that? |
| (6) | A What do you mean by friend versus acquaintance? |
| (7) | Q Drinking buddy |
| (8) | A I wouldn t know that |
| (9) | Q Were you at all aware of the fact that at some point in |
| (10) | 1988 Captan Hazelwood and Mr Kimtis went out drinking one |
| (11) | atternoon and Captain Hazelwood had eight to ten drinks and |
| (12) | drove a car thereatter? Were you at all aware of the |
| (13) | A No sir |
| (14) | MR CHALOS Your Honor lobject Thatsa |
| (15) | mischaracterization of the evidence Mr Kimis had passed |
| (16) | away by that time |
| (17) | MR O NEILL I m sorry he wasn t with Mr Kimtis |
| (18) | He was with - going to Mr - Thats right going to Mr |
| (19) | Kımtis funeral he had eight to ten drinks and drank - was |
| (20) | he- |
| (21) | Have you ever heard about that? |
| (22) | A No sir |
| (23) | O Youknew though that Captan Hazelwood had a reputation |
| (24) | for partying didn tyou? |
|  | A I wouldn t say that I knew, no |

5-25-94 VOLUME 17
$x \max (45)$

Q Had you heard rumors prior to the grounding that Hazelwood had a chemical dependency problem?
A No sir, flrst time I learned of that was after the -
after the grounding and there were hearings and testimony
was
given
Q Would you go to your NTSB testımony at page 865 ?
A65? 865?
Q 865
AYes
Q And let me read the questions and answers and you tell me
II) If read them right

When did you become aware that Captain Hazelwood may
have
(13) had a chemical dependency problem? That was the question
(14) Answer I can t say exactly but being - working for a
(15) company for 19 years you hear certain rumors but these are
(16) innuendoes and rumors and I cannot exactly answer you
(17) Question When did you first hear a rumor to that effect?
(18) Answer I don trecall sir
(19) Question Was it prior to the grounding?
(20) Answer Yes It could have been a few years before that
(21) I can tell you
(22) Question But you think it would have been before the
(23) grounding?
(24) Answer Oh yes certainly
(25)

Were those the questions asked and the answers that you
gave?
A Yes
Q Thank you 172763
Now you testified at the beginning of your testimony about
the fact that the Valdez had to go back twice with regard to
the turbocharger?
A That s correct
Q And there was some questions at that point in time about
whether other arrangements had been made for another vessel
whether it had been put on quote a different rotation Do
you recall that?
A Yes
Q And I listened carefully to your answers as you tmed to
help counsel You don t know one way or the other do you?
A it certalnly - all i know that all I knew at the time is
that every oll company In the consortlum of Alyeska has to
certain number of barrels in certain amount of time and In
order to do that they have to provide the tonnage in Vaidez
do that, and since we were obviously delayed Exxon would
to make some other arrangements That was the premise of
answer yes, sir
Q It was an assumption about something you didn t know
one way or the other you don t know whether they made the
other arrangements do you?
A That s correct, right
gave?
(2) AYes
(3) Q Thank you
(4) Now you testified at the beginning of your testimony about
(5) the fact that the Valdez had to go back twice with regard to
(6) the turbocharger?
(7) A That s correct
(8) Q And there was some questions at that point in time about
(9) Whether other arrangements had been made for another vessa
(10) Whether it had been put on quote a different rotation Do
(ii) you recall that?
(12) A Yee
(13) Q And I listened carefully to your answers as you tried to
(14) help counsel You don t know one way or the other do you?
(15) A lt certalnly - all i know that all i knew at the time is
(16) that every oll company In the consortlum of Alyeska has to
111
(17) certain number of barrels in certain amount of time and In
(18) order to do that they have to provide the tonnage in Vaidez
$t 0$
(19) do that, and since we were obviously delayed Exxon would
have
(20) to make some other arrangements That was the premise of
my
(21) answer yes, sir
(22) Q It was an assumption about something you didn t know
about
(23) One way or the other you don t know whether they made the
(24) Other arrangements do you?
(25) A That s correct, right
(1) Q And you ve socialized with Captain Hazelwood since the
(2) grounding haven tyou?
(3) A We ve seen each other, yes
(4) Q Would soctalized be a correct word?
(5) A We ve had dinners together, yes
(6) Q And let $s$ talk a little bit about the day - the day spent
in Valdez on the 23rd That $s$ where I m going to go right
now
You lett at 1030 and you went to the agent s office
(1) That s a correct statement?

A Yes sif
(12) Q And at some point in time you make it over to the Pizza
(13) Palace and your testimony is that you were at the Pizza Palace
(14) for slightly over an hour?
(15) A From somewhere around $12 \mathbf{3 0}$ or atter that
(16) Q 1230 to 130 or 1407
(17) A About $2 \mathbf{0 0}$ or shortly thereafter
(18) Q Or shortly there before you said about an hour littie
19) over an hour?
(20) A I belleve I also said that we stayed there till shortly -
(21) till approximately 200
(22) Q Okay
(23) You had two beers there
(24) A Yes
(25) Q And then you walked around town?

Vol 172765
(1) AYe:
(2) Q And one of the places you walked to was the Westmark?
(3) A RIght
(4) Q They have a bar at the Westmark don they?
(5) A That s correct
(6) Q And you arrived at the Pipeline Club sometıme after 4007
(7) A That s correct
(8) Q And you belteve that you had three gin and tonics while at
(9) the Pipeline Club?
(10) A That s correct
(11) Q And when the FBI asked you it was ihree or four gin or
(12) tonics is that a correct statement?
(13) A 1 might have sald that, yes
(14) Q And had you ever been in the Pipeline Club before?
(15) A Some time prior to that, yes
(16) Q Why don tyou describe the Pipeline Club to us
(17) A it a a bar restaurant, and they have tables plus a bar (18) seatlng
(19) Q The restaurant is in another foom?
(20) Alt seeparated, yes There's a partition between the two
(21) Q it s a preity - it s a regular old dark bar?
(22) A it a a dark place yes
(23) Q And Mr Roberson was drinking beer is that a correct
(24) statement?
(25) A Yes
(1) Q And your testimony here today was I also recall three
(2) when you were talking about how much Captain Hazelwood had to
(3) drink That safarr statement of what your testimony was
(4) today isn that correct?
(5) A Yes
(6) Q And in the past when you ve been asked questions about
(7) this including questions under oath you ve said you didn t
(8) know the total number of drinks Hazelwood had because you were
(9) not counting
(10) A That $\mathbf{g}$ correct, I was not counting but at the time -
(11) period of time that we both all of us had spent there and
(12) knowing - remembering what I had to drink leads me to
believe
(13) It was the same amount
(14) Q So you re guessing?
(15) A lt leads me to belleve that yes sir
(16) Q And you were there for two hours more than two hours two
(17) and a half hours?
(18) A That s right
(19) Q So you were there for two and a half hours and you re
(20) guessing how much Captain Hazelwood had to drink?
(21) A I belleve that that s what he had yes
(22) Q Now you also made a statement about or volunteered (23) information about whether he was drinking singles or doubles
(24) And you said that your glass was the same size as his glass?
(25) A I believe that yes

## Vol 172767

(1) Q And 1 found that a very interesting comment because in
(2) your glass there was gin and tonic and in his glass
(3) according to you there was just vodka?
(4) A Yes
(5) Q Is that a correct statement?
(6) A That a correct atatement
(7) Q So that part of what was taken up in his glass - in your
(8) glass was the tonic?
(9) A Yes, sir
(10) $Q$ And with regard to what was poured into his glass you
(11) really don t know one way or the other other than the fact you
(12) had the same size glasses his was vodka and yours was gin and
(13) tonic?
(14) A That ecorrect
(i5) Q And then you went to the Pipeline Club - I m sorry
(16) Then you left the Pipeline Club and went over to the Pizza
(17) Palace?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q And you ordered the pizza and then you went they had
(20) already gone next door?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q And you went next door and you ordered a gin and tonic?
(23) A That a correct
(24) Q And your testimony today is you don $t$ - you didn $t$ finish
(25) your drink?

Vol 172768

（1）AYes
（2）Q And when you were interviewed by the United States Coast
（3）Guard your testımony was you drank your drink？
（4）A i drank some of it yes I did not finish it
（5）Q And your testimony today is you were in there for 15
（6）minutes but your testimony before the National Transportation
（7）Safety Board was you watted for 20 to 25 minutes
A SIr，all of these times were always approximate
Q Then let $\mathrm{s}-\mathrm{I}$ won $\mathrm{t}-\mathrm{if}$ the times are approximate and
10）you say they re approximate III move on III do you the
（11）courtesy of moving on to another subject
（12）A Slr the point ls we re really－
（13）Q It s tough to remember isn it？
（14）A It certalnly ls
（15）Q And indeed if it hadn t been for the grounding there
（16）would have been no reason to remember and it would have dritted
（17）away and－
（18）A Certainly wouidn t be
（19）Q I want to talk for a minute about whether Captain Hazelwood
（20）drank his drink over at the Harbor Club And what syour
（21）testımony today did he drink his drink at the Harbor Club or （22）not？
（23）A He drank some of it yes，but I know that none of us
（24）IInished all of our drinks
（25）O Okay Were you sitting there monitoring him as he drank

## （1）his drink？

（2）ANo，sir I wasen：
（3）O You really don t know whether he finished it off or not do
（4）you？
（5）A No，I don t
（6）Q And indeed when you talked to the Coast Guard
（7）investigators your description was he drank his drink
（8）A Meaning past tense？
（9）MR CHALOS Excuse me Mr O Nell May we have a
（10）reterence of what you re referring to？
（11）MR O NEILL 1 wasn i referring to anything I asked
（12）him if that 5 what he toid the Coast Guard investigators 1
（13）hadn tyet made the decision to go to the transcript
（14）MR CHALOS Okay
（15）BYMR O NEILL
（16）Q And now I m going to ask you a question from the－the
（17）transcript of the interview by the state guys and when you
（18）Were interviewed by the State troopers in answer to the
（19）question Would you have any idea whether it was one or two
（20）drinks over at the Harbor Club your answer was I couldn t
（21）tell you
（22）Is that a correct statement？
（23）A That $s$ what I had－that $s$ what I said yes
（24）$Q$ In point of fact it s really－I mean let me cut through
125）It and I II move on to another topic But with regard to how
（1）much he drank at one joint or another joint as you sit here
（2）loday all games aside it stough to reconstruct isn itt？
（3）A lt certainly is，sir But I know I only ordered one drink
（4）and we weren there long enough really to－knowing that I
did not ilnish my drink，ergo we weren there long enough
to
（6）have two drinks
Q Let s talk about that for a minute You were there 15
minutes to 25 minutes isn that right？
A Yes，sir
（10）Q Now my recollection in my better days was I could drink a
（i1）drink or two drinks or three drinks in 15 to 25 minutes how
（12）about you？
（13）MR CHALOS Your Honor Iobject We dontknow
（14）about Mr O Neill s drinking habits
（15）MR O NEILL III reask the question
（16）BYMR O NEILL
（17）Q Would it be fatr to say sir that it isn that hard in 15
（18）to $\mathbf{2 5}$ minutes to drink one drink or two drinks or three
（19）drinks？
（20）A lf one really wants to yes
（21）Q And then one last topic
（22）When you went through the Alyeska Termınal just so we re
（23）clear and again I－l listened to your answers on the
（24）questions with regard to going through the Alyeska Terminal （25）very very carefully You don t know one way or the other what
（1）they monitor for there do you you don t know？
（2）A What the guards are trained for specifically，no I don t
（3）know
（4）Q You don t know And then you were able to atter having
（5）five or six or possibly more drinks you were able to carry two
pizzas across the causeway up the gantry down the gantry
and
（7）onto the ship？
（8）Aldid
（9）MR O NEILL Thank you sir
（10）REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JERZY GLOWACKI
（11）BYMR CHALOS
（12）Q Mr Glowackı Mr O Neill showed you some NTSB testımony
（13）where the question was asked you about some drug
dependency？
（14）A Yes
（15）Q Did you understand that to be alcohol？
（16）A lassumed that，yes
（17）Q You don $t$ know of and you never heard of any rumors that
（18）Captain Hazelwood had a drug dependency drugs as we understand
（19）drugs？
（20）A No Not drugs，no
（21）Q Now in answer to counsel s question you were talking （22）about your own personal knowledge as opposed to rumors that you
（23）heard isn that correct？
（24）A That scorrect
（25）Q Let me ask you this
(1) When you were at the Pipeline Club with Captain Hazelwood
(2) and Mr Roberson describe to us how you - what you were doing
(3) there besides having your drinks? Were you talking with each
(4) Other?
(5) AYes
(6) Q Were you drinking socially at that point?
(7) A That s the only way I recall drinking yes,
(9) Q I mean nobody was there throwing shots down their throat
(9) Were they?
(10) A No they were not
(ii) Q No quick drinking stuft?
(12) A No, they were not
(13) Q Now with respect to the times we spoke about you said
(14) they were estimates?
(15) AYes
(16) Q You ve had a chance because of this grounding and because
(17) of the publicity and because you ve been called upon to testify
(18) any number of times you ve had a chance to reflect haven $t$
(19) you?
(20) A Certainly
(21) Q You ve reconstructed the situation the day as best as you (22) could?

Al hope so yes
(24) Q And your recollection is after having a chance to
(25) reconstruct and think about it because you ve been asked about

## Vol 172773

(1) it so many times your best recollection is that Captan
(2) Hazelwood had three drinks at the Pipeline Club am I correct?
(3) A Yes
(4) MR CHALOS Thank you no further questions
(5) THE COURT Thank you sir you may step down
(6) MR O NEILL I don iget another shot sir
(7) MR CHALOS No the reason I m standing here is I
(8) have the next witness
(9) THE COURT You re all through
(10) (The Witness Stepped Down)
(1i) THE COURT You may call your next witness
(12) MR CHALOS Your Honor defendants call for reading
(13) of the deposition Ms Emily Kaiser
(14) THE CLERK She s going to be reading the deposition
(15) of Emily Kasser?
(16) MR CHALOS Yes
(17) THE CLERK Would you rase your right hand please?
(18) (The Witness is Sworn)
(19) THE CLERK Please be seated
(20) For the record state your full name address and spell
(21) your last name please
(22) MR CHALOS That s your real name
(23) THE WITNESS My real name Glenda Faur (ph) English
(24) English
(25) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF EMILY KAISER (Read)

Vol $17 \quad 2776$
(1) with all my customers I asked him how Long Island was and we
(2) discussed Huntington And I lived in Malverne which is in Long
(3) Island and we discussed Long Island And if he d been
(4) drinking, I would have smelled it And he could not - and he
(5) was not drinking at the time he was in my shop
(6) $Q$ In addition to talking about your respective homes in Long
(7) Island did Captain Hazelwood buy anything from you?
(8) A Yes Hegent - he wired flowers and I put his credit card
(9) through the machine
(10) Q To where did he wire the flowers?
(i1) A To Huntington Long Island
(12) Q All right Now let me show you another piece of paper
(13) which is Exhibit 3456
(14) Have you had a chance to look at it?
(15) A Yes
(16) Q Have you seen this before Ms Kaiser?
(17) A Well, yes I wrote it
(18) $Q$ This is all your handwriting?
(19) A All my handwriting
(20) Q What is this form?
(21) A Okay, every person that comes in, I write an order out for (22) them so I have a record $\$ 45$ was what he bought a dozen (23) long stem red roses What they cost in Long Island eight is (24) for the phone call and the dellvery and it comes to $\$ 53$ (25) Q A total of 53?
(1) A Right
(2) $Q$ And the message in that section - let me stant again
(3) That telephone number is at the top is what what number
(4) ma am?
(5) A The number of the person that it s going to
(6) Q That it s going to okay And they delivered to Mrs Susan
(7) Hazelwood that s the person to whom it was sent is that
(8) right?
(9) A Right
(10) Q And when you said you didn itnow what the relationship
(11) was you just knew it was a woman s name?
(12) A Yeah I didn $t$ know if it was his mother or his wile
(13) Q And then the florist is listed there?
(14) A Main Street Floral, and the lady I spoke to was Jean
(15) Q And what did Captain Hazelwood order looking at this?
(16) A A dozen long stem red roses arranged in a vase
(17) Q What was the occasion for sending this do you know?
(18) Al don t know if it was Easter or - I don tremember I
(19) really don tremember I do so many
(20) Q Do you recall that this was Easter weekend?
(21) A lthlnk it was over Easter weekend but I don t remember
(22) I d be lying If I say I know deflnitely what he sent It for
(23) Q Let me do this Ms Kaiser Let me go - before I get to
(24) this telephone bill how long would you say Captain Hazelwood
(25) spent in the store from the time he came in untll the time -
(1) A He looked all around all the way around, up and down the (2) aisles And I would say he was there anywhere between
(3) three quarters of an hour to an hour
(4) I ve got a lot to see
(5)
(6) $t$
(7)
(8) 2
(9)
(10)
(1)
(12)
(13)
(14) Q Okay let s go back to what you said about your being close
(15) to him and having a considerable conversation with him
(16) A We were face to face
(17) Q And being face to face you smelled no alcohol on Captain
(18) Hazelwood s breath?
(19) A No, I did not
(20) Q Was he sober ma am?
(21) A Yes, he was sober And I know the difference because I had
(22) an alcoholic husband so I know the difference between and I
(23) see a lot of people that drink In my shop and i can tell the
(24) difference He hadn tbeen drinking I mean it he did he
(25) was hiding it But he didn t reek from alcohol and when you

## Vol 172779

(1) talk to something that ciose, you can tell
(2) $Q$ There was no sign that he was intoxicated?
(3) A Nosign
(4) Q And you just said a moment ago that there was no sign that
(5) he had been drinking in any way at all?
(6) A Correct
(7) Q Now you said that you ve had people come into your shop
(8) that had been drinking you had a family experience with it
(9) What do you look for in irying to detect whether somebody s
(10) been drinking or not?
(11) A Well, at that partlcular moment, I wasn t looking for
(12) anything He was just another customer
(13) Q Right 1 m not -1 m not even asking now about this
(14) particular moment 1 m ןust asking you generally what are the
(15) kind of things that you would see generally in somebody who
(16) might come into your shop or you might otherwise run across
who
(17) had been drinking?
(18) A They don t usually - they re not usually able to carry on
(19) a normal conversation, be polite sometimes
(20) Q Solt may affect their courtesy?
(21) A Correct
(22) OOr their manner of speaking?
(23) A That is correct
(24) Q You saw nothing like that in Captain Hazelwood is that
(25) right?

Vol ${ }^{-} \overline{17} 2780$
(1) A Not athing Nothing no
(2) Q You said a moment ago or a few minutes ago something about
(3) If he were he might have been hiding it You didn t see any
(4) sign that he was trying to hide that he had been drinking had
(5) you?
(6) A No he was doing everything every other customer comes In
(7) my shop does ןust looking around
(8) Q All right Let me get to the telephone charge with you -
(9) and let me mark one last piece of paper as an exhibit and have
(10) you look at this too Ms Kaser And we II mark this as 3457
(11) $A$
(12) Ms Kaiser you can see that this exhibit I just put in
(13) front of you has atop across the top Cooper [sic] Valley
(14) Telephone Cooperative - or that s the top printing on it ${ }^{\text {? }}$
(15) A Correct
(15) Q And there is a bill that you - you look down Ithink it s
(17) seven lines from the bottom?
(18) A Right
(19) Q There s a telephone charge for a call to Huntıngton?
(20) A Rlght
(21) Q All right Ms Kaiser let s look at the exhibit we ve
(22) marked for the deposition and one that was used at the
(23) Hazelwood trial
(24) This is a copy of some of your telephone calls in March of
(25) 1989 is that right?

## Vol 172781

(1) A Correct
(2) Q And these are all calls made from the Hobby Hut Kelly s
(3) Floral?
(4) A Correct
(5) ONow -
(6) A Excuse me can itell you it salso my home phone number
(7) It a the same one
(8) Q All right Now let $s$ go lett to right across this bill
(9) and see what you can tell me about it
(10) Down the lett hand column - we re going to look at the
(1i) Huntington New York entry okay? Are you with me?
(i2) A Right
(13) Q Let s look at the left hand come first where it says 03
(14) slash 237
(15) A Correct
(16) Q What does that mean to you?
(17) A The date I put his credit card into my machine and made
the
(18) call
(19) Q All right What is the second entry telephone number the
(20) 83544837
(21) A That 8 my telephone number
(22) Q And the third entry says Huntington New York?
(23) A That a the place I called at the time
(24) $Q$ And what $s$ the telephone number next to Huntington New
(25) York the 516/271 01607

5-25-94 VOLUME 17
Vol 172782
(1) A The number of the shop that I called to order the flowers
(2) Q And then there s a column labeled MINS and there sa
(3) Number 2 in this Huntungton New York entry You see that?
(4) A Yes
(5) Q Do you know what that stands for?
(6) A That it took two minutes to call
(7) Q All right The next one says time and the entry is 1402 ?
(8) A Correct
(9) Q What does that mean to you?
(10) A The hour that it was placed
(11) Q Allfight So does that mean 14 hours into the day two
(12) minutes after the 14 th hour of the day 14027 is that what it
(13) means io you?
(14) A I guess that $s$ what it means yes
(:5) Q Would that be 202 pm ?
(16) A Correct
(17) Q And you said before this call - before this - wait a
(18) minute let me start again
(19) And you said before that this call represented your putting
(20) the card through Is that how you put it?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q What do you mean by that?
(23) Al have a machine that processes credit cards, and it went
(24) through the credit card machine plus my telephone blli
(25) $Q$ And that $s$ something you do routinely when you get a credit

Vol 172783
(I) card charge?
(2) A Right I phone in as fast as I can
(3) Q Okay At the tume that you go inrough this exercise of
(4) putting the card through and having the credit card charge
(5) verified I guess it was Captain Hazelwood was still in the
(6) store?
(7) Almpretty sure he was yes I put it through right away
(8) Yes
(9) Q You used the card physically to do it didn tyou?
(10) A l used it physically, right, so he had to be there
(11) Q So he must have left sometıme after this?
(12) A Right Correct
(13) MR CHALOS Your Honor that ends our direct
(14) examination of this witness
(15) MS HANSON Plaintiffs have a brief cross Your
(16) Honor
(17) CROSS EXAMINATION OF EMILY KAISER (Read)
(18) BYMS HANSON
(19) Q Now your store was quite busy that day?
(20) A We were really busy Because It was just -
(21) Q Just before a holiday?
(22) A Yes really buay
(23) Q When Mr Hazelwood came into your shop did you take note
(24) of him walking into the shop?
(25) A No I didn teven know who he was He was just another
(1) customer
(2) Q And at that time you had a conversation with hım?
(3) A Yeah a nice conversation
(4) Q Do you know how long that conversation lasted?
(5) A Well it was a little while it had to be at least ten
(6) minutes, 15 minutes, and then he gave me his order and I
wrote
(7) that up And I was asking him questions while I was talking
to
(8) him and trying to be friendly, as I try to be with most of my
(9) customers
(10) Q But at the end of the conversation is when he gave you his
(11) credit card and paid for his purchase?
(12) A Correct
(13) Q And then after paying for his purchases he lett?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q Okay and you didn iknow where he went after that?
(16) A Nope $I$ don tollow them They walk out the door and
(in) they re gone I don t even ask them where they're going
(18) MS HANSON That concludes the cross Your Honor
(19) (The Reader Stepped Down)
(20) MR SANDERS May it please the Court we call Mr Ron
(21) French by deposition
(22) THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand please
(23) SIr?
(24) (The Witness is Sworn)
(25) THE CLERK Please de seated

## Vol 172785

(1) For the record sir state your full name address and
(2) spell your last name
(3) THE READER Howard Naughton Naughion
(4) Houston Texas
(5) THE CLERK Thank you
(6) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF RONALD FRENCH (Read)
(7) BYMR SANDERS
(8) QMr French would you state your full name tor the record?
(9) A My name is Ronald Lloyd LI oy d French French
(10) Q Where are you currently employed?
(11) A I drive a Yellow Cab in Valdez
(12) O Was that your job in March of 19892
(13) A Yes, it was I been doing it for nine years
(14) Q You said that you ve been a cab driver for how long sir
(15) nine years?
(18) A Nine years here in Valdez and three years in Anchorage
(17) Q So-
(18) A 12 years altogether
(19) O In the spring of 1989 March of 1989 how long had you been
(20) a cab driver?
(21) A Counting the time in Ancharage?
(22) Q Counting the time you drove in Anchorage
(23) A Nine years
(24) Q And what had you done - I don $I$ want a complete
(25) rectation but can you give me a little bit of a description?
(1) A You mean what kind of work do I normally do?
(2) Q Of what kind of work you did before that
(3) A When I was in the military and for the flrst two years
(4) after I got out of the military let ssay from 1960 to 1970 I
(5) was an institutlonal cook
(6) OOkay
(7) A Elight years in the military and two years working for
(8) Unlversal Services, Incorporated and Boatel and those people
(9) that cater to the pipellne crews and stuft like that
(以) Q All right And then from 70 until you started driving a
(11) cab again - I don i need to know everything but -
(12) A I was a cook at the state hospital here in Valdez Well, I
(13) was from 1970 to 72 - or 69, the last few months of 69 to
(14) 72 I was a Yellow Cab drlver in Anchorage
(15) Around 1972 I moved to Valdez and I went to work at the
(16) hospital here, Harborview Warking for the atate of Alaska
(17) And I worked there six or seven years And -
(18) Q Okay What did you do there at the hospital?
(19) A was a cook And then I went to college and learned you
(20) know, trade school I learned how to be an auto body repair (21) man I got chemical pneumonla sol had to quit that, sol went
(22) back to driving a cab again
(23) Q Did you make trips to the Alyeska Terminal on the evening
(24) of March 23 1989?
(25) A Yes
$\qquad$
 Vol ${ }^{-\overline{7}} 27 \overline{7}$

5-25-94
VOLUME 17
XMAX(52)
A One of them was sitting in the front and two of them in the back
Q Did one of the passengers have the pizza on him?
A The one in the front seat had a large combination pizza
Q What about the passengers in the back? Did they have pizza also?

ANo
Q And did you then go to the Pipeline Club directly to pick up the other passenger?
A Yes because I had another call at the Pipeline Club to go across the bay
Q So you went to the Pipeline Club and -
A I went inside and asked the bartender who the cab was for
(14) and she said That guy down on the end down there And I went
(15) over to the fellow and I says, Your cab s here, and I walked (i6) out and got In the cab and he came out And he was sitting In
(17) the back seat
(18) Q in other words that passenger also got in the cab without
(19) your really talking to him inside?
(20) Alknew him
(21) Q Okay
(22) A He sasteward off of the Arco one of - one of the - one (23) of the Arco ships
(24) Q How long were you stopped altogether at the Pipeline Club (25) to the best of your recollection?

## Vol 172789

(1) A Well long enough for me to walk in ask the bartender who
(2) the cab was for go over and tell the guy his cab was there,
(3) walk back out and get In my cab About - about $\mathbf{4 5}$ seconds
) maybe 60 at the most
Q And then did you drive directly from the Pipeline Club over
to the Alyeska Pipeline terminal?
AYes Idid
Q Did the three passengers not the - let me exclude from
this question the man from the Arco ship?
(10) A The man from the Arco ship
(11) Q Right Did the three other passengers talk among
(12) themselves about anything while they were in your cab?
(13) A Well something was said about some klnd of shaft or
(14) something being ready rotated or some damn thing or
(15) something
(16) I don t know $I$ really wasn t paying much attention
(17) There was a radio - we was busy that night and our radio
was
(18) calling We was getting, you know sometlmes two or three
(19) phone calls every five minutes
(20) Q Okay
(21) A You know
(22) Q But it was some talk about business or something
(23) mechanical?
(24) A Yeah They were - the guy In the front seat was talking
(25) to the guy right directly behind me and the other guy off the
(1)

Ank they were all three talking about
(2) something And It was going in one ear and out the other
(3) because I was listening to my cab radio 1 was listening to AM
(4) radio and I was trying to keep my mind off from that guy that
(s) was eating the pizza in the front seat you know and all that
(6) you know
(7) I mean after all I monly human Im IIke a little puppy
dog, you know what I mean? I mean it s-somebody sticks
(9) something In front of me and I m hungry, you know, I would Ilke
(10) to have a piece of it but I mot going to beg for it, you
(11) know what I mean?
(12) O Right
(13) MR SANDERS 1 m getting hungry up here Your Honor
(14) THE COURT I m glad I had my sandwich
(15) MR SANDERS This is a good time for a break
(16) BYMR SANDERS
(17) Q Again excluding the man from the Arco ship from this
(18) question did the three other passengers in any way appear
(19) intoxicated to you intoxicated with alcohol or any other
(20) substance that would do that?
(21) A i m not really qualifled to make such judgments or anything
(22) else All I can say is I did not see them drink anything and I
(23) couldn ismell any alcohol because of the pizza And without
(24) being some kind af a doctor or something, I couldn tiell you
(25) whether they were just tired or whether they were drinking or

Vol 172791
(1) what And I drink myself you know I have no idea whether
(2) they d been drinking or not
(3) O Did they act in any way like they were intoxicated?
(4) A No, they didn tact any kind of unusual to me Of course
(5) there was no reason to pay any attention
(6) Q Right
(7) A There was nothing - you know nothing had happened
(8) nothing had happened I mean they didn tspill no oll out
(9) there in the bay yet or anything else and why should I pay -
(10) why should I have paid any attention to them I was just
(iI) driving the cab minding my own business, whenever I got them
(12) from point A to B, they were to pay me and that was my job
(13) Q While they were in the cab they didn tact unruly?
(14) A No they were talking some kind of business between the
(is) three of them and I do remember something said sbout a
shatt
(16) being rotated or something like that Maybe it was a shaft
on
(17) a pump or something, you know that the pump man wanted done
(18) and asked the engineer for or something like that I don t
(19) really know
(20) Q i understand They didn itact boisterous?
(21) ANo
(22) Q And they didn t act in any way out of the ordinary you
(23) said is that right?
(24) A Just acted like seamen
(25) Q Now you said you did not smell alcohol because of the
$\qquad$
pizza I think that s the way you put it？
A Right
Q And you spoke to the passenger behind you the man who
asked about paying you and getting the receipt Did you turn around？
A i probably handed him the recelpt over my shoulder like
（7）that（Indicating），same way he handed me the money you know

Q Oid you smell any alcohol when either of those things
happened？
（10）ANo
（11）Q Now when you got to the Alyeska Terminal gate would you （12）describe for me what happened there？
（13）A it was a normal routine，they all－all of them handed me
（14）their identification cards and they got out and they walked
（15）through the bullding I got out of the cab I handed the （16）security guard my identification badge and handed hlm their
（17）IDs and told him what berths they were off from and the guys
（18）went in and got－went through the metal detector got their
（19）bage checked and all that kind of stuft And he checked my
（20）cab，they searched the cab，underneath the seat in the glove
（21）box the back luggage compartment，inside and all that it $s$ a
（22）station wagon，checked around the spare tire and everything
（23）eise make sure they re not hauling any alcohol in and then （24）they opened up the gate and they let me go through and I give
（25）the guys back their identification cards when they come back In
Vol 172793
（1）and I go on up to the berth
（2）Q They walked in and they walked right back out－I m sorry
（3）I just read your line
（4）A They walked in and they walked right back out
（5）Q Did you see them walk？
（6）A Yeah
（7）Q And any unsteadiness in their walk？And again I m
（8）excluding from this question the man from the Arco ship I
（9）want to know about the other three
（10）A There was no problem
（11）Q Where did you go from the gate？
（12）A I stopped at berth 4 and let the man off from the Arco
（13）ship and he paid me
（14）Q Okay
（15）A I drove up to berth 5 and pulled up there and the guy
（16）behind me says How much．do we owe you，and I told him
and he
（17）went and asked me for a receipt so he could get it back from
（18）the old man
（19）Q Mr French at berth 5 did you know on that evening what
（20）ship was berthed at berth 5 ？
（21）A Yeah，It was the Exxon Valdez
（22）Q In your experience as a cab driver and adding any of those
（23）other experiences including the hospital experiences－you ve
（24）had many opportunities I would think－to see people who were
（25）intoxicated or drunk haven tyou？

5－25－94
VOLUME 17
$\begin{array}{lll}\text { Vol } & 17 & 2794\end{array}$
XMAX（53）

A Yeah
Q Do they have a program in Valdez called a Safe Drive
Program？
A Yes，they do
Q How long has that been in operation？
A Three four years something like that Three years four years at the most
Q What is that program Mr French？
A Well that s if a person drives his car to town and he goes to a bar or two and he gets all messed up and he has too much
（11）to drink to where he can t pass the Breathalyzer，all he has to
（12）do is call a cab and the cab comes and picks hlm up and the
（13）bartender aigns a little card and we take him home The
next
（14）morning，he calls the cab and says Well，I took a safe ride
（15）home He signs the little card we take him back to the bar
$s 0$
（10）he can get his car That s to keep drunk drivers from driving
（17）drunk
（18）Q And as a result of that program did you pick up additional
（19）business from people who had had something to drink？
（20）A Yeah，yeah the ones that normally are hard core and would
（2i）drlve you know they drove anyway and got DWla anyway yeah，
（22）but some of them that we would－could talk into it－and
（23）yes，I ve talked quite a few of them into it，you know Hey
（24）are you sure you re okay，let me take you home you know and
（25）all that yeah You know I ve done that Imean I m sure

Vol 172795
（1）that s what you＇re getting towsrds Can Itell whether
（2）somebody ls drunk or not？Yes
Q All right Now let me go back to their demeanor and
behavior while in the cab That sall I m asking you did
anybody appear to be intoxicated？
A No They did not appear to be drunk to me－drunk to me
and I－no I dld not see them drink anything and no they did
not drink anything in my cab and the guy didn t drink a beer
with his pizza in my tront seat，no
MR SANDERS That concludes the direct Your Honor
MS HANSON Plaintitfs have brief cross－has
nothing to do with pizza
（13）MR SANDERS l object－
（14）CROSS EXAMINATION OF RONALD FRENCH（Read）
（15）BYMS HANSON
（16）Q All right Now let me ask you this about berth 5 Did （17）you see any of the three Exxon Valdez passengers walking away
（18）from the cab or walking anywhere at that point？
（19）A I wasn t paying any attention
（20）Q Do you have any recollection of any of those three men
（21）walking in any way unsteadily at berth 57
（22）A I had no reason to pay attention to them
（23）Q Now did you subsequently become aware of the identity of
（24）any of those－any of the passengers after the trip？
25）A Yeah－no because i already knew who the guy was off the
) Arco ship you know and no I didn t - well Idon t know how (2) to answer your question because no I did not find out who any
(3) of them were afterwards but I did find out who one of them was
(4) not

Q All right You made some reference to this before we started What do you mean by that?
A I found out later that I did not have Captain Hazelwood in
my cab I was led to belleve by the newspaper - by the Dally
News okay - and I was led to believe by one of the TV
(10) channels I believe it was ESPN, that I had Captain Hazelwood
(11) In my cab, but nobody would show me a plcture of Captain (12) Hazelwood, okay untll aiter they took Interviews and stuff and
(i3) all that and after they asked me questions about what I you
(14) know what happened that night and Did you take - you know
(5) how did I know I said I took three people back to the ship, (16) to the Exxon Valdez and I didn t know who they were
(17) Q You described for us in detall what they did on that night
(18) when you came up with your cab and you asked for
(19) identifications is that -
(20) A Before the oll spill, if a person didn t look overly (21) intoxicated or anything like that there was no problem They
(22) let them on the ship, let him in the terminal and everything (23) else
(24) Q When the three passengers went through the security gate
(25) and they were walking back from security to the cab did you

Vol 172797
(i) have much opportunity to observe them?

AUh uh
Q You ll have to say yes or no
A No The guy from the Arco shlp was already back in
Q Now in your six years experience before the spill would
it be out of the ordinary if you were to take a person you knew
to be a - or take let s say someone back to one of the
berths would it be out of the ordinary if that person was intoxicated?
A Well that depends Depends whether I went into the bar and the guy had a beer In front of him and I saye to him I
(12) says, Hey your cab s here and then I went outside or whether
(13) I pulled up in tront of the bar and the guy was standing (14) outside In front the bar with a newspaper in his hand and a bag
(15) fuli of afuff that he got at the market acroses the street, you
(18) know It would be - it wouldn't be - I guess it wouldn t
(17) be - If the guy was falling down drunk, yeah I would notice
(18) that But if the guy was - had, say he went in the bar and
(19) had a couple of drinks and he met me at the door, there would
(20) be no reason for me to pay any attention
(21) Q Have you ever taken an intoxicated individual back over
(22) 10 -
(23) A Yes
(24) Q - to get onto one of the vessels?
(25) A Yes
(1) MS HANSON Nothing further thank you
(2) THE COURT We ll suspend for the day now
(3) Ladies and gentlemen please remember my instructions about
(4) not reading or listening to anything concerning this case We
(5) will reconvene at 800 tomorrow morning Court is in recess at
(6) this time
(7) THE CLERK This court is in recess until eight a m
tomorrow
(9) (Jury out at 202 pm )
(10) (Recess at 202 pm )
(1) INDEX
(2) CROSS EXAMINATION OF PAUL MYERS

2588
(3) BY MR NEAL 2588
(5) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF PAUL MYERS

2609
(6) BYMR O NEILL 2609
(8) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF RICHARD L MASTERS
(LIVe) 2622
(9) BYMR MONTAGUE

2622
(1) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF RICHARD L MASTERS 2682
(12) BY MR MONTAGUE 2682
(14) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF NATALIE FOBES

2690
(15) BYMR O NEILL 2690
(i7) CROSS EXAMINATION OF NATALIE FOBES 2696
(18) BY MR SANDERS

2696
(20) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JERZY GLOWACKI 2698
(21) BYMR CHALOS 2698
(23) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JERZY GLOWACKI

2760
(24) BY MR O NEILL 2760

Vol 172800
(1) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JERZY GLOWACKI 2771
(2) BYMR CHALOS
(4) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF EMILY KAISER (Read) 2773
(5) BY MA CHALOS 2774
(7) CROSS EXAMINATION OF EMILY KAISER (Read) 2783
(8) BYMS HANSON

2783
(10) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF RONALD FRENCH
(Read)
2785
(ii) BYMR SANDERS 2785
(13) CROSS EXAMINATION OF RONALD FRENCH
(Read)
2795
(14) BYMS HANSON 2795
(1) STATE OF ALASKA)
(2) Reporter s Certificate
(3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA)
(6) 1 Joy S Brauer a Registered Professional
(7) Reporter and Notary Public
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
(9) That the foregoing transcript contans a true and
(10) aceurate transcription of my shorthand notes of all requested
(11) matters held in the foregoing captioned case
(12) Further that the transcript was prepared by me
(13) or under my direction
(14) DATED this 25th day of May 1994
(20) JOYS BRAUER RPR

Notary Public for Alaska
(21) My Commission Expires 51097

| Vol 172801 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| (1) EXHIBITS |  |  |
| (2) | 912391283509 and 3487 offered | 2588 |
| (3) | 1805 and 1806 offered | 2611 |
| (4) | 9147 offered | 2641 |
| (5) |  | 103 |
| (6) | 92A offered 26 | 2685 |
| (7) | DX9093 offered | 2685 |
| (8) | Court 1 offered | 2687 |
| (10) | 1805 and 1806 received | 2611 |
| (11) | 9147 received | 2641 |
| (12) | 1618 and 19 received | 2686 |
| (13) | 795A 1705827828829103 recelved | d 2686 |
| (14) | 92A received | 2687 |
| (15) | 9000 and 9093 recerved | 2687 |
| (16) | Plaintits Exhibit 1 received | 2688 |
| (17) | Defendants 3902A received | 2697 |

Beace Systorms Appications
Look-See Concordance Report

UNIQUE WORDS 2,930
TOTAL OCCURRENCES 13,101
NOISE WORDS 385 TOTAL WORDS IN FILE 42,675

Single File Concordance
Case Sensitive
NOISE WORD LIST(S) NOISE NOI
includes All TEXT
OCCURRENCES
IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES @ BOTTOM of PAgE

MAXIMUM TRACKED OcCurrence Thresholo 50

NUMBER OF WORDS Surfassing Occurrence THRESHOLD 21

LIST OF THRESHOLD WORDS
alcohol [114]
believe (69]
Captain [168]
COURT [59]
department [66]
drink [56]
engine [70]
Exron [84]
Hazelwood [167]
medical [68]
monitoring [ 81 ]
O'NEILL [51]
Okay [104]
right [105]
ship [65]
sir [156]
testimony [55]
three [60]
Valdez [57]
vessel [59]
years [54]

| $-\$-$ |
| :--- |
| $\$ 45[1] 277622$ |
| $\$ 53[1] 277624$ |
| $1-800[2] 26762$ |
| $1000[8] 265612,27211,5$ |
| 273192742491027434 |
| $1015[1] 27449$ |
| $1016[1] 265614$ |
| $1030[3] 2715227449$ |
| 27649 |

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-25-94 VOLUME 17
1059 [1] 271714
$1100[2] 271422271712$
1130 [2] 271817272019
11th [2] 2612426251
1202 [1] 271922
1208 [1] 274518
1217 [1] 271924
1220 [1] 275222
1230 [6] 271820272019
27212122764 15, 16
1236 [3] 27522327531 27544
1256 [2] 2753227555
13th [1] 25971
1402 [1] 27827
14th [2] 26056278212
1980s [2] 2654726602
100 [1] 26097
107 [1] 260919
130 [1] 276416
140 [2] 275510276416
141 [2] 2755 13, 27569

20-year (2) 270525272016 200 000-barrel [2] 2689615
20th [1] 260818
22nd [4] 2706 6, 2713 22, 24
23rd [7] 26041326059
26152327145,271519 2764727752
24th [5] 26042224260612 27742124
25th [3] 26911226925
280214
26th [1] 26921
28th [1] 266723
200 [4] 2604 23, 27249
27641721
202 [3] 2782 15, 2798910
207 [2] 26091926105
230 [4] 260915261023
2778810

| $-3-$ |
| :--- |
| 324 (1] 26891 |
| 343 [1] 26891 |
| $3-7$ [1] 26891 |
| 38 [1] 26891 |
| 30 [1] 26068 |
| 31 st [2] 2606426254 |
| $3901 A[1] 268910$ |
| $3902 A$ [2] 268811269714 |

$\frac{-4-}{400[2] 27262027656}+$

| $-5 m$ |
| :---: |
| $\frac{-5}{5-1097[1] 280221}$ |
| $516 / 2710160[1] 278125$ |
| $-7-$ |

70s [3] 2613 9, 2226208
747s [1] 265712
795A [3] 268517268618 700 [4] 2729 15, 2730 9, 19 27316

730 [2] 2597 1, 272915

- 8 -

80s [14] 26131023263016
265819252659141624
26602267425276134
8354483 [1] 278120
85 millimeter [1] 269415
800 [2] 2604 22, 27985
802 [1] 25882
824 [1] 273610
8230 [1] 274121

## -9-

92A [2] 2685826873
900 [6] 2604 13, 271523
272152741 19, 2742 1, 9
920 (2) 2605 8, 9
935 (1) 27548

- A-
a m [2] 2588227987
A89 0095 [1] 25886
AA [2] 26192122
able [12] 260017263422
2638202226491426557
2737 23, 2740 24, 27523
2771 4,5 277918
aboard [2] 258910270615
absenteeism [1] 268123
Absolutely [4] 264717
266510267569
absolutely [4] 265111
2656526653267015
abstention [2] 26711024
abstinence [1] 267210
Abuse [6] 2624 17, 262613
26291126421026433
266220
abuse [20] 26231526249
212627181926308
2644826526265811
266151026621 4, 2224
26638,152126769
268220
Academy [1] 276016
academy [4] 26991227009
2760 19, 23
accent [1] 27204
accents [1] 27205
accept [2] 262722263411
accepted [1] 26595
access [1] 26735
accompany [2] 259915
26388
According (1) 27369
according [1] 27673
accredited (1) 269913
accuracy [1] 26641
accurate [8] 259522
265422265522266715
26722526732280210
accurately [2] 273824
273918
achieve [1] 264617
acquaintance [1] 27616
acquainted (1] 26681
acronym (2] 262516
262924
act [10] 264172668310 26758112791341320 22
acted [1] 279124
action [3] 263814265823 26892
actions [1] 26898
activities [4] 26037261319
24264015
activity [1] 26138
actual [1] 262625
adamant [3] 26481926491
4
add [1] 259317
adding [1] 279322
addrtion [6] 25946268824
2691 6, 2702327327,
27766
addrtional [2] 2678 6,
279418
address [6] 26212225
269019269725277320
27851
Adequate [1] 264822
adequate \{3| 26012
263315266717
Administration [5] 264414
2649826619267013
26725
admission [1] 26851
admitted [21] 258818
26112226412226855
268614172124268726
2021268882526904
2691152696182526979
1013
adopted (1] 265212
advanced [3] 27001320
27014
advice [1] 26798
advise [2] 26701226813
advising [1] 268119
advisor [3] 264418264617
26666
Advisors [1] 262923
advocate [1] 267724
advocatıng [2] 26796
268115
aeromedical [3] 264217
26461726666
Aeronautics (1] 264413
affect (3) 2596926237
277920
afield (1) 265310
aftercare [7] 2633312
2636372674142124 afternoon (11] 259011
26042326926727213
2726152732 8, 276111
2778111213
afterwards [1] 27963
age [3] 264812664723
age-60 [3] 264820264959
agency (4] 26712223
267224267312
agent [8] 261712714923
2717327202324272120 27649
agree [13] 26452526464
266017267316267547
10267610268118

268510275710275816 agreed [4] 26556268813 14268924
agreement [8] 264725 26842426861726888
2689202697910
agrees [2] 259524
aground [8] 2609527457
2027491810275813 27595
aimed [1] 26331
Air $\{6] 2622232425$
26232324264420 air [18] 26241526445 26471426481426646
2668292669382021
267152526872527103
27477275823
aircraft [3] 264424269267
Aurline [3] 2642172670910
aurline [32] 26251126268
26431724264424511
26451214162324
26461822264724
264922265021824
26552426564265722
266018222666626686
26691226705267435
Aırlines [2] 2657716 airlines [3] 2668826693 267021
airman [1] 267220
aırplane [1] 263920
airport [1] 263924
alsles [1] 27782
Alamar [16] 26171271716 17192427188141618 27191272031827212
252722127425
alarms [1] 27586
Alaska [9] 2609619
268822268912271014
271735278616280220
Alcatraz [1] 271210
Alcohol [7] 262417262613 26291126421026432 26551266220 alcohol related [1] 26586 alcoholic [7] 260819 26181726191726206 2662327239277822 Alcoholism (10] 262417 262614262912 18, 23 264210264332661224 266220
alcoholism [22] 2615 10, 26242126251126465 265725265811266022 23266116102662511 266492665126681119 266941326707267222 268125
alert [1] 263114 alerted [1] 27497
allegations \{1] 267613
alleged [1] 25928
allocator [1] 27029
allow [3] 26189265316 275823
allowed [2] 266810268918 allows [2] 26691820

ALMCAA [1] 262924
alone [2] 259019263721 alongside [1] 25987
ALPA [2] $264417 \quad 18$
Alpha [7] 268515611
2686232687127757
altercation [3] 2650458
aftercations [1] 27493
altrtude [1] 26939
altogether [2] 278518
278824
Alyeska [14] 268819
268912132692227369
13274225276316
277022 24, 27862327877
27896279211
ambiguous [1] 259217
American [2] 262312
264715
Ames [1] 26459
amongst [1] 263011
amount [3] 26203276317 276613
amplify [1] 262217
analysis [1] 27186
analyst [1] 270211
anchor [3] 2598616
260617
Anchorage [7] 27101114 2711172785162122 278614
anchorage [7] 260617
2710101127111218
2712911
angle [3] 2694127418 274710
angies [2] 26921726932
animal (1] 275822
animosities [1] 267615
announced (1] 258817
annually [1] 268110
Answer [8] 26661526788 13267912762141820 24
answer [30] 258919
259121259211259614
25978260611260910
261021261991426201
2643212226485,16
265322265471026575
26606711266722
2733242762 16, 276321
276918 20, 2771 21, 27962
answered [3] 2592826545
265513
answers [4] 27621025
2763 13, 277023
Anybody [3] 27312224
274112
anybody [6] 261513
$261615 \quad 18 \quad 273013$
2741 13, 27955
anyway [2] 279421
anywhere [6] 2595727224
272662759 8, 27782
279518
appear [7] 273235
274924279018279556 appearance [3] 26201720 , 277519
appears [1] 26855
appendix (3) 26611516 26723
applicable [1] 265715
applicants [1] 270119
application \{2| 264725 266812
applies [1] 267023
apply [8] 26271226499
265720266014266868
268111
appreciate [2] 266823
26692
approach [5] 26042
26392426411826546
26604
approached [2] 26476
26516
approaches [2] 263115
263916
appropriate [4| 26332425
265312265618
approved [2] 265423
268821
approximate [4] 268821
27688 9, 10
Approximately [4] 271819
2726152727827368
approximately [17] 26058
26071426256270022
2703 10, 17271221
27291527309,27316
274272744727521
27551027584276421
27785
apt [1] 263822
arc [1] 27477
Arco [9] 2788222327899
10,2790172793812
2796127974
area [10] 25985260923
2624232644 18, 2657 21,
26681626742273213
2759614
areas [1] 26894
aren t [1] 269617
arguments [1] 265425
arranged [1] 277716
arrangement [1] 278725
arrangements [ 8 ] 2713 5, 10
27164271910272113
276392024
arrival (2] 260514
arrive [4] 2604192326063 272614
arrived [16] 260682691 11,
2706 2, 271323272619
27271102728921
273016273517273610
132741142327656
arrives [2] 260419260615
arriving [2] 260411273313
art [1] 266824
article [1] 265212
ashore [5] 27148914
27211027597
aside [1] 27702
Asking [1] 26078
askıng [8] 2592 4, 260722
2676526937277913 14,
2784727954
aspect [3] 261434264219
aspects [3] 26548269217 27749
assigned [3] 26121263410 27039
assignment [1] 262323
assignments [2] 266813
27003
Assistance [1] 26421
assistance [2] 263411 26603
assistant [8] 27005 18,
270125270781012
27523
associated [1] 264615
Association [2] 262922
264218
association [15] 26451417
2326461826471424
26492226502182125
26666266718267435
assume [17] 26082263417
26648181926734
267413268012268524
270912272925273419
27376274517274812
27566
assumed [1] 277116
assuming [5] 259913
26312226321826809
269621
assumption (2) 271321
276322
assumptions [2] 266318
26897
assurance [1] 265713
assure [1] 264421
astern [7] 275315202124
27561112
Atomic [2] 26446264522
atomic [2] 262446
atop [1] 278013
attach [1] 25987
attache [2] 2738627397
attached [1] 27102
attempt [2] 27121920
attendant [2] 26571718
attendants [5] 26431719
2325265721
attended [3] $270410 \quad 1216$
attention [10] 264024,
265617270815278713
2789162791510,279519
22279720
attentive [1] 261415
attrtude [1] 274710
Audio [1] 261011
audio [1] 26095
authorty [2] 26889275924
auto [1] 278620
automated [1] 27514
automatıc [1] 272521
automatically [1] 275215
auxiliary [2] 27032427041
availability [1] 260618
available [20] 26297,1416
2526304,16263381822
2647227131727511317
25275312 21, 27551821
2756222
Aviation [4] 2649826619
26701226725

Beace Systorra Appiczetions
aviation [7] 26231314 262520262621264613 266021266822
award [1] 25907
aware [18] 2593126153 4, 5 6, 7, 26163261714
261912670132673811 122713 1, 27619 12, 276212279523

- B -
bachelor [2] 2622826991 background [3] 26226 269824269919
Backward (1) 26537 backward [2] 2653420 backwards [1] 268520 badge [1] 279216 bag [2] 2737 25, 279714 bags [1] 279219 balance [2] 26781926803
balancing [1] 271216 ballpark (2) 270024273612 Bar [6] 273326278736 1119
bar [16] 262110 11, 267823 2732222733102765417 2127871627941015 279710131418
barrels (1) 276317
bartender [3] 278813
27891279413
base [2] 2639 8, 10
Based (1) 27578 based [10] 26301416 2637826617266312 27131827424274525 27504275516 Basically [1] 262510 basically [7] 259225 259422259911260513 1627042527187 basin (1| 27264
basis [5] 2659102668410 2706827086
Baton (3) 26041826968 27028
Bay [2] 2598 5, 25993 bay (4] 2598 16, 278718 2788 11, 27919
Bay-Mary [1] 26387
Baytown (1) 27033
Beach [9] 260631517 261710270217270313 270823270945 beach [2] 2693416 bearıngs [3] 2712514 beat (1] 26341 beautiful (1] 26956 becomes [1] 267013 bed [1] 27142 bedtime [1] 268525 beer (13) 2592424259317 2595126782426791 27222327232272825 27332127652327958 279711
beers [7] 259316267823 27222427233272913, 27328276423

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-25-94
V
VOLUME 17
beg [2] 262019279010
begins [2] 26311926784
behavior [6] 26311015
26321226391627954 behest [1] 259225
behınd [7] 269219269318
27122427134278925
27923279316
benefit [1] 258925
Benicia [4] 27021122
2703627196
berth [21] 259851318
260413141623260512
521260618273817
2793112151920 ,
27951621
berthed [1] 279320
berthing (1) 260411
berths [2] 27921727978
beside [1] 259813
besides [3] 2705 1, 27169
27723
bigger [1] 259811
bill (5) 27754277724
27801627818278224
brt [22] 262214264915
26527269215269322
2694110192225
2695161720269918
2708212716627217
27431927646278525
Bligh [4] 269219269319
269513
Blood (1] 265522
blood [3] 26551226561
blue (1] 269523
Board [3] 262312276013 27687
board [37] 25945260215
182612222613211
261471126182326233
122676127062270715
22271581013141720
2721892741181921
27428111527431213
142750527572
boat [7] 26131826921220
252693172694327263
Boatel (1] 27868
body [2] 267423278620
boisterous [1] 279120
book [1] 268515
boom (8) 26941517 18, 20
2695161718
booming [1] 269516
Borgen (7) 25895259915
2601142617162425
26388
born [2] 272067
bottles [1] 27072
bought [4] 27251927292,
273725277622
Boulevard [1] 262125
bounced [1] 259610
box [1] 279221
boxes [1] 27382
Bradford (1] 271620
Bradley [4] 27162125
27171927188
BRAUER (1] 280220
break [2] 269114279015
breath (6] 25951 25999
26531267716267821
277818
Breathalyzer [2] 26561
279411
Breathalyzers [1] 265424
breathalyzers [5] 2655111
12, 15, 19
Brian [1] 27608
bridge [17] 27422527435 212327441,58274724 252748111727502023 275151011275620
brief [3] 268918278315 279511
briefly [3] 26062326258
269824
bringing [3] 259919
2737 12, 275416
brings [1] 26182
broad [2] 263111264519
broadcast [1] 262218
broadly [1] 26595
brogue [1] 27204
broke [1] 26545
Bronx [2] 272045
bubble [2] 274778
bubbling [1] 260811
buddy [1] 27617
building [5] 27021227371
58279215
built [3] 270320270911 27579
bulk (2) 26451523
bulky [1] 26043
bulletın (1) 26761
bunch (1) 269116
burden [1] 267317
business (13) 25903
2597172714101517
2718727747918
27892227911114279419
busting [2] 25971314
busy [4] 2783192022
278917
button [1] 275719
buttons [1] 275620
buy [5] 267822272520 ,
2728 1, 27302527767
$\frac{-\mathrm{C}-}{\text { Cab [3] } 27352278511}$ 278614
cab [46] 273412182021
222736152225273814
192785142027861122
27871617182021
278813151618278923
12, 2790327911113
27921520279322
2794121427954818
27968111825
279712
cabs [1] 273419
calculator-type [1] 275216
Californa [1] 26063
Call (2) 25884268422
call [40] 2589225944
25971260941520 ,
26104262015262117

26263263613266322
266617266716266923
2676221268114269011
2697172027195,273412
18, 274216274723
274816275222277311
12277624278019
278118278261719
278420278810279412
calling (2) 263518278918
calls [10] 27141127184
27193275611278024
278122789 19, 279414
canceled [1] 261710
cancellation (1] 266323
capability [1] 26554
Capable [1] 267725
capable [2] 26772325
captain [21] 258912 23,
259442612 23, 2613518 26146 25, 26159262810 2637 15, 2664 6, 1627114 2743815 21, 27441214 19275714
captains [1] 268216
captıoned [1] 280211
car 18127171271813
27232527362527374 2761122794916
card [12] 2775527768
2781172782202427831 4927841127941315 cards [3] 278223279214 25
care [10] 2590 3, 260519
2633426761727141015
1827241927541275819
career [7] 26468911
26642227004270525
27604
careers (1) 264618
careful [1] 26795
carefully [6] 26313263420
21273116276313277025
cargo [9] 259891117
2599527108172713816
caring [1] 275825
Carolina [1] 26983
carried [1] 264522
carry [2] 27715277918 carrying [1] 274019
case [26] 25886260615
2633626382526479
2651615172026607
266224266361125
26662226691226745
267922268413268718
270011273862739710
27984280211
cases [4] 263416264613
14, 266517
cashier [2] 273213273418
cater [1] 27869
catwalk [1] 27405
caused [2] 26501627589
causeway (1) 27716
ceased [1] 26453
celebrate [1] 260813
celebratıng [1] 260818
Center [2] 264519
center [4] 263311272416

From aviation to Center

Basc Systems Applications
27479
certificate [1] 267019
certification [1] 26233
certified [1] 262312
CERTIFY [1] 28028
cessation [1] 26254 chairman [2] 2624126454 CHALOS [27] 26971820 2698 7, 2699910271918 272012273924275235 276052761142769914 277013277111277347
121622277412775612 14278313
Chalos [2] 269719271925
chance [7] 26092427084
2756142772161824
277614
change [4] 25933261317
264725272024
changed [7] 261325
26501112267213
27112427124274510
changes [1] 263115
channels [1] 279610
chapter [2] 26851522
characteristic (1) 275311
characteristics [1] 268411
characterization [1] 267517
characterize [2] 26326
26399
characterized [1] 266124
charge [5] 2707 5, 2780 8, 19
278314
charges [1] 267613
Charleston [1] 27032
chart [2] 26851516
chartered [1] 26926
check [2] 26969273613
checked [5] 2717527462
27921922
checklist [2] 259378
checks [1] 273623
chemical [3] 2762213
278621
Chief (5] 2589162592524 25941261223
chief [24] 258913151622
232594225972260710
112613526147270156
152122270381027051
7121527082127579
children [1] 263521
choice [1] 26506
chops (2) 25971314
Chuck [3] 25901625946 270516
circling [1] 260418
circumstance [1] 26775
claimed [1] 265211
clarification [6] 2591 20,
2669 2, 2685 4, 10 12, 13
clean [2] 26931826951
clean-water [3] 269213
269426
clear [10] 259417261510
261812661 18, 26957
26961727066274922
277023277512
clearer [1] 261018
clearinghouse (1) 262913

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-25-94 VOLUME 17
complete [6] 262210 2666162667315268410 278524
completed [3] 26232
26261726286
completely [1] 27098
completing (1) 262815
completion [1] 262616
complied [1] 26938
complimented [1] 260210
comply [1] 264911
component \{1] 26604
comport [3] 271714
273611274013
compresses [1] 27103
compressor [1] 27102
con [1] 265425
concelve [1] 263321
concentration [1] 265220
concept (9) 261317
262825263020263111
26582526592526609
26892
concepts [1] 265912
concerned (4) 260117
263113275012
concerning [1] 27984
concluded (5] 258819
25891625939259618
conciudes [2] 278418
279510
concurred [2] 2663 21, 24
condition [6] 263319
265812267324267911
273114275013
conditions [5] 26168
266992689826958
27112
conduct [3] 263915
264311267614
conducted [1] 264023
conference (1] 263216
conferences [4] 260722
26182226204268110
confidence [2] 259410 26181
confidential [1] 26411
confidentiality [1] 26739
confused [1] 25921
confusion (1] 26624
congenial [1] 277525
conjunction [4] 26357
2636626881026971
connect (1) 267820
connection (2] 265014
26518
consent [6] 2673141822
232674610
consequence [2] 262525
26623
Conservation \{2\} 268822 268912
consider (5] 262812
26291026561826771519
considerable [1] 277815 considerations \{1| 26899 considered [1] 262810 consigned [1] 27138
console [1] 27494
consorium [1] 276316
constrtute [1] 263717
constructed [1] 27056
construction [8] 27021618
1927034,5122027043
constructive [1] 26037
consult [1] 26815
consultant [2] 262410
264217
Consultants [1] 262923
consultation [1] 268023
consulted [2] 263215
26514
consulting [2] 26243
269817
consumed [4] 259241418
259316
contact [4] 262322262413
271114273419
contain [1] 26436
containers [1] 27072
containing [1] 269519
contains [3] 26893728029
context [5] 259716262813
15, 26551026795
contingencies [1] 266918
contingency [4] 266919
2688172689214
continuation [1] 25886
continue [3] 258810
261919266316
contınued [4] 262412
263332659126729
continues (2] 26941127559
Continuing [1] 269315
continuing [2] 26334
269420
Continuously (2) 27069
27087
contracts (1) 26243
contrary [1] 275617
contribute [1] 26038
control (21) 25904268911
27451423274627913
14274720274811
27492527505 19, 2223
275117911275723
controlled [1] 27515
controlling [1] 263919
conversation [22] 258915
13, 222593 13, 1921
260961226101319
261416261716273717
1827781527791927842
3410
Convert [1] 275411
conveyed [1] 275010
cook [3] 278651219
Cooper (1] 278013
cooperate [1] 26479
cooperation [3] 26021113
19
Cooperative [1] 278014
coordinatıon [1] 267819
coordinator [2] 259925
260316
coordinators [1] 26004
copies (7] 26264172021
2226427268424
copy [5] 260125268515
2752819278024
Corporation [2] 26093
261715
corporation [5] 2629514
2630126461267414
corporations [4] 2629317 2630710
corrected (3) 271123
27121324
correcting [1] 25922
correction (1) 266825
correspondence [2] 26509 10
Corrone [1] 266522
cost [1] 277623
Council [1] 262918 counsel [6] 26093261611 266062760 10, 276314 277121
counseling [1] 263522 counselor (2) 2636 3, 7 counted [1] 26016 counter [1] 277521
Counting [2] 2785 21, 22
counting [2] 2766 9, 10 country [1] 26262
couple [12] 26282266518 2692727082427182 271992725822273025 27468275721279719 couple-degree [1] 274722 couriers (2] 262414264411 course [7] 2611 5, 26547 26652426751426766 2693827914
courses [7] 270491011 1216 19, 24
Court [11] 258841125901 2604126272226871112
172688327842027985 court (2) 27192127987
courtesy [2] 276811277920
courtroom [2] 263618
26819
Cousins (1] 27483
cover [2] 2591 6, 268824
covered [8] 260925261822
2326204,26431265719
267821
covering [1] 26188
cranked [1] 26143
credrt [8] 2775 4, 27768
2781172782232425
27834278411
crow (7) 2593222607812 27151727242127497 27503
crews (1) 27869
crime [2] 26701822
Crinsky [1] 266523
criteria [5] 259056
261821263978
criticisms [4] 2654611 267857
criticize [1] 275922
CROSS [5] 25882426962 2760 6, 278317279514 cross [5] 262721264115 278315278418279511 cross examınation [1] 268514
cross-examine [1] 269120
crude [1] 260615
crying (1) 26788
crystal [1] 26957
current [2] 26722269417
currently (2] 27745278510
customer [3] 277912
2780 6, 27841
customers [2] 2776127849
cut [1] 276924
cutoff [2] 265567

- D -

Daily [1] 27968
dally [2] 2706827086
damage [1] 27589
damn [1] 278914
Dan [1] 261619
danger [1] 261511
Dangerous [1] 263911
dangerous \{2] 26391013
dangers [1] 26151
dark [5] 2694826952223
27652122
darker [1] 26947
data [4] 2752891827564
date [6] 260514260616
270511271515277420
278117
DATED [1] 280214
Day [15] 2589225941317. 2595101725961825979
2599101315261413
263624263732638 6, 8
day [38] 25901125923
25932025961721
260415260525260659
2608226161826882
269111269252226956
26996212706510
271442726232427295
2764627722127742023
242778627821112
27831927982280214
days [ 8 ] 26072526282
267822271221271348
277010
daytıme [1] 277425
dead [2] 2754814
deal [6] 262523262819
2642242646412267912
dealing [3] 262510263112
26461
dealings [2] 26661113
deals [2] 262420268722
dealt (2) 25972425984
debatable [1] 267821
December [5] 2594826124
26254269922270511
decide [2] 27169272417
decided [7] 2672127096
271262725127321522
275918
deciding [1] 267122
decision [4] 264716
265110267125276913
deck [4] 2602 14, 27419
27461727472
deckies [1] 260217
Defendants [11] 26044
26411922268522
2688112689 10, 269737
121420
defendants [8] 261118 2686326875626889 26892024277312
Defense [3] 258813
26001526022
defer [1] 269716
definitely [1] 277722
definition [2] 2661613
degree [7] 2622 891022
2526591726991
degrees [4] 2699131415
27479
delayed [1] 276319
delivered [2] 2594827776
delivery [2] 27037277624
demand [1] 265020
demeanor [1] 27953
demonstrated [1] 267215
denial [1] 263821
deny [2] 25941726541
depart [2] 260515271519
departed [1] 274224
Department (2) 268822
268912
departments [4] 26021620 2613611
departure [2] 27431216
dependency [4] 2762213
27711318
depending (2] 259919
269221
Depends [1] 279710
depends [1] 279710
deposition (20) 26128
2619226201426373
2645102648826501519
265324265925266610
26672126783268116
2760112773131427743
278022278421
depositions [1] 263621
Deppe [2] 26011216
derogatory [1] 265021
describe [4] 263013
2765 16, 27722279212
described [8] 263224
26371626392265621
2658 5, 26621626842
279617
describes [2] 268915
describing [1] 26725
description [3| 263220
27697278525
design [6] 27021415
2703192127582527591
designed [3] 27514
27531627591
designing [1] 270322
desks [1] 27182
destination [4] 26063615 271516
destined [1] 271320
detall [4] 26422426635
273712279617
detaled [4] 262522264215
26432268114
detailing (1] 262522
details [1] 261316
detect [2] 26781127799
detecting [1] 267713
detector [2] 27371279218
detectors [1] 273811
determination [6] 263123
263422266351214
266921
determine [5] 259610
259742599 20, 263818
270810
determined [3] 261310
2663 7, 10
determines [1] 26352
determining [1] 265821
Detrort [1] 26227
develop [3] 264325264621 268913
developed [10] 25949
2623 21, 2625 10, 264217
2526452126591921 26931027595
developing [2] 265912 275912
development [4] 264424
264511266125
devoted [1] 26468
diagnose [1] 26822
diagnosed (2) 265725
266223
diagnosis [12] 265810
266022252661 19,
26621122266371021
26641921
diagnosticians [1] 26758
Diego [2] 25947270319
diesel [7] 27011724
27021 2, 25, 2753 9, 11
difference (9] 2601 12,
2609132658 10, 26958
270117274710277821
2224
differentiates [1] 270118
differently [1] 274623
difficulty [1] 267712
dinner [1] 267224
dinners [1] 27645
DIRECT [5] 26223269024
2698627732527856
direct [12] 2610126426
264315264722265310
2660172662 17, 266637 270814278313279510
directed [1] 25954
directing [2] 26036265617
direction [5] 27531018
275610280213
directions [1] 275313
director [2] 266522
disagree [5] 264616
2757101227581617
disagreed [1] 268016
disagreement [1] 261421
disassembled [1] 271215
discharge [3] 25988
26841027437
Discharged [1] 271017
discharging [1] 27108
disclose [1] 264311
disclosure [1] 26436
discoloration [3] 269214
26945269511
discriminating [1] 26684
discuss [6] 2618 25, 26202
263216263421274813

27497
discussed [11] 259318
260715261722261823
2685122714927499
275919277623
discussing [1] 259920
discussion [8] 259215
259332602727141221
272423274921
discussions [2] 261824 27147
diseases (1) 26236
disparaging [1] 265016
dispensers [1] 272521
display [1] 268918
disposal [1] 27493
disqualifies [2] 2669513
disqualifying (1) 26699
disseminated [3] 26203
2643926571
dissemination [1] 265623
dissolution (3) 264823
264915
distinctly [1] 261024
distinguish [2] 26611314
distinguished [1] 26619
distinguishing [1] 26624
distributed (1] 262622
division [2] 262913268820
Doc [1] 268024
dock (2) 273814274223
Doctor $\{7126221416$
2623526251726281
267825268420
doctor [4] 2620226344
267918279024
doctor patient (1] 267420 document [15] 260511
2616222426412526423
5264358101226626
131419
documentation [4] 261820
26201326634267914 documented (1] 26714
documenting [1] 264014 documents (1) 268423
doesn't [9] 2655426686 2670926721626778 2690427541275819 27593
dog [1] 27908
dogs [1] 261711
door [7] 273222273411 2735127672022278416 279719
dots [1] 26894
double [1] 272923
doubles (2] 272924276623
doubt [2] 2648 10, 267320
downstairs [3] 27212123 27226
downtown [1] 27173
downward [1] 27418
dozen [2] 2776 22, 277716 Dr [31] 26211826225 2627 15, 2226411425 2647 6, 2651 15, 2653 13, 265617265913266320 26651920 25, 26661213 14 16, 2126671626681 2669226738267418

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-25-94
$\qquad$
26981426991820 empty [1] 27267 encountered [1] 27064 end [15] 26361126623 26711269118269325 269413172710227163 72739 و 278410278714 278814
ends [1] 278313
Energy [2] 26446264522
energy [3] 26036262456 engage [1] 273718
engaged [1] 273719
Engineer [4] 2592 5, 24,
25941261223
engıneer (37) 2589151622 259422597226135 261472700510 11, 1418 21270161521,2227038 10270571215270822
2736 20, 2741 17, 274216
274510111227468
2747192757610275825 279118
engineering [7] 26981217
2699127002270211 27071727085
engineers ( 8 ) 259411 ,
2607101127015,27051
427242127311
Engınes [1] 27597
engines [4] 2748527506
2753927574
Englewood [1] 262125
English [1] 277323
enhance [1] 26365
enhancing [1] 262411
enter [1] 262211
entered [1] 262223
entirety [1] 268917
entrtled [1] 26421
entity [3] $26145 \quad 26731318$
entry [5] 2781111922
278237
environment [3] 2615212
26238
Environmental [2] 268822
268912
environmental [1] 26898
environments [1] 26236
episodic [2] 26631622
equipment [1] 270417
ergo (1) 27705
ESPN [1] 279610
essence [1] 25944
essentally [1] 261320
establish [1] 267318
established (3] 26052
262913266025
estimate [2] 26261020
estimated [1] 260514
estımates [1] 277214
evaluation [10] 26337
2635 13, 25, 2636 10,
264020 23, 2652 25,
2658 21, 26762226772
evaluations [3] 2624 12,
263613267616
evening [6] 260413261523
27132327379278623 279319

Basc Systems Aoplications
event [7] 2591222592812 2608131617261317
Eventually [1] 274216 eventually [2] 272611 275824
Everybody [1] 274024 everybody [1] 26191 evidence [16] 258814 2604426351926421 266532669252671422 2687232427062427124 27171327391527527 276115
evolutionary [1] 266125 evolved (1] 266219
Ex'd [1] 27186
exact (2] 266310270511 exacted [1] 267323 oxactly [11] 25921259918 21, 2647202681326826 2711 14, 27511627621416 oxam [1] 268020
EXAMINATION [13] 258824
260912622 3, 268213
2690242696226986
27606277110277325
27831727856279514
examınation [4] 260925
26186265310278314
examine [1] 264115
examined (2] 25941426413
EXAMINER [3] 259119
259219259518
examiner [1] 266013 example [8] 26252126316 2226337263925265711
26781426792
examples [1] 26797
except [2] 2593526566 exception [2] 260114 261418
exchange [1] 259124
exchanged [1] 273720
exclude [1] 27898
excluding [2] 27901727938
exclusion [3] 2689235
Excuse [9] 258820261910
264872653926782
2736162753527699
27816
excuse [1] 27074
executive (1] 266522
exemption [7] 26498
26621526656266818
2669222670226729
exemptions [2] 266211
266820
exercise (1) 27833
exercises [1] 267019 exhaust [2] 27092027101 Exhibtt [43] 26001526022 2604 5, 26111926411920 232526851235711 212223268615 18, 20 23268737 11, 1226883 57111726891021 2690 9, 2691 15, 2696 16, 26972371427526 , 277613
exhibit [13] 26111718
2685182126881026904

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
2696222697527526 278091221
Exhibits [6] 25881415 2611102426842526852 exhibits [8] 25881726117 268516192686826875 268811268917
existed (2) 273919274014 expect (7) 26381516
264031418267910
268414
expected [3] 2675810
27424
('a
expense [1] 270420
experience [15] 26301014
2639126443 11, 2645 15, 26471820266515 ,
26761227211127578
2779 8, 27932227975
experienced [1] 267717
experiences [2] 279323
experiencing (1) 271020
expert [3] 262118262716 275616
expertise [3] 260210 26231521
Expires [1] 280221
Explain [1] 259623 \$
explain [5] 25971226104
26134, 264419274624
expla!ned [3] 2618 13,
2620526313
explaining [1] 269312
explanation (1] 26727
explicit [1] 264010
exploring [1] 265314
Express [1] 271911
expressed [1] 25966
extensive [2] 267910
268013
extensively [1] 267714
extent [1] 261313
extrapolated [1] 26554 extrapolating [1] 26557
extrapolation (5] 2653 4, 7
20265517268521
extremely [2] 26542126608
eye [1] 263120
өyes [3] 26327267515
268119
-F-
Fobes [1] 269021
Fr-e-n ch [1] 27859
FAA [18] 264725264820
26495265719202224
265842662681026631 37 21, 2224267012
face [6] $263423 \quad 277816 \quad 17$ face to face [1] 26508 facility [2] 26441626459 fact [28] 260721260812 2614162629 25, 26468 2647526531213265710 26646266551726681 2669426712126812 271110271424272218 2735212742 21, 274989 2761927635276711 276924
faculties [1] 274925
faculty [1] 269811
fails [2] $267018 \quad 19$
Fair [1] 277323
fair (14) 26092021261022
26152226171226305
26326926341426438
26451526752527663 277017
fairly [5] 263219267422
267821273721274024
fall [4] 27312427394
27402022
falling (1] 279717
familiar [4] 2674626969
27292327574
familiarize [1] 262518
family [2] 2635 22, 27798
fast [2] 27582327832
faster [2] 2757 24, 27581
father [3] 26206264719
265015
favor [1] 265116
FBI [2] 276014276511
features [2] 26301427591
February [8] 25992426125
917270522270646
27099
Fed [1] 27186
Federal [5] 2649826619
2670122672 5, 271911
federal (22) 265416266021
266182668291622
266937132021267010
26715252673926749
2687232425268823
269912
feedback [1] 26027
foel (6) 26391626531
2699112732127461820
feeling (3) 26608274621
27472
feels [1] 263422
foot (3) 26935823
fellow [2] 273815278815
fellowship (1) 26229
felt [8] 259410265121
2652222744242745722
274623275925
ferret [2] 26382022
field [4] 2643172226603 269818
file [2] 26402126413
files [3| 2640192641910
fill [4] 25988267020
26751819
filled (1) 27477
final [4] $261515 \quad 17 \quad 19$
264211
financial (2) 26352223
find [18] 25991726075
2609142629626371112
264012141826413
26491426831527266
2734112746 25, 2757 20,
279623
findings [1] 263217
Fine [3] 2690 2, 27162224
fine [4] 2656926779
27404278714
finish [11] 26252271915

27332227345727359 102745327672427684 27705
finished [7] 26841727108
27232427353274124
27682427693
firing [1] 26466
First [1] 266918
first [49] 26102426112
261259262910263025
2639142126426264318
26471126561020
26591926703268825
2691 13, 2692182697 17,
2027002127015,270222 2705 4, 17 24, 2706 4,
2707 8, 2712 19, 20272622
272817273815274010
274116274216274511
242746827471927599
2760252762317278113 27863
fit [1] 26413
fitness [2] 263123264421
fitness-for duty [1] 264022
five [12] 2595126051
2690112700327134
2743242744527482021
2758427715278919
fixed (1) 27106
fixed-wing (1] 26927
flat [1] 25969
fleet [17] 2600491021
260223260317260517
26072226132226143
261518261662617824
2618222620427001
fleets [1] 26142
Flight (1) 26451
flight (9) 264317182325
2644152645826571718 20
Floral [4] 277467277714 27813
florist [1] 277713
flowers (4) 2775 25, 27768
1027821
flown [1] 266422
fluid [1] 27477
fly [3] $266317 \quad 266817$
267221
flying [5] 26392026581
2664726655269215
FOBES [2] 26902426962
Fobes [1] 269021
focus [4] 2692827455
2775827874
folders [1] 26782
folks [1] 261310
follow [6] 26121226826
271331627609278416
follow-up [1] 265114
followed [5] 265621
2657112658616273618
following [3] 2589 5, 260121
269920
follows [2] 2591 18, 259517
fooling [1] 27758
foot [1] 273819
forbids [1] 26683
Force [6] 2622232425

Bastc Systers Appications
26232324264420
forecast [1] 25905
foregoing [2] 2802911
form (7) 262722628615
263031826946277620
formal [2] 26282126337
formalized [2] 263020
26311
formed [2] 264516
former [1] 26529
Fort [3] 269921112
forth (5) 26311263614
2641526439268025
forward [1] 275310
found $\{8\} 263711264015$ 242643427411823 2767127967
Foundation [2] 262324 265920
four [11] 2594726071418
26221326488272615 27511275414276511 27946
fourth [2] 278769 frame [5] 261325261818 26941221269523 framework (2) 26037 267918
Francisco [16] 259625 25985142525993 26387270816270912 271012131719271220 27131927186275915 free [3] 26731424271616 freelance [1] 26912
freely [1] 267318
FRENCH [2] 27856279514 French [5] 278421278589 27931927948
frequent [2] 263311268123 frequently (1] 268413 friction [1] 259723 Friday [1] 263624 friend (3) 266521276146 friendly [1] 27848 front [16] 26221727223 27245273321276011 2780132787 25, 278814 2789 24, 27905 9, 27959 2797111314 fuel [2] 274312275823 full (22) 26068262122 269019269725275117 2122275319202224 2755579275619 21, 2773202774227851 8, 279715
full time [1] 266018 fumbling [2] 25955268517 fumes (1] 26939
functions [1] 273713
funeral [1] 276119
$-\frac{-G-}{\text { G-l-o w-a-c k-i [1] } 26984}$
galley [1] 2741 15
Galveston [3] 259725
2598 23 2599 3
games [3] 26711820
2770 2

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-25-94
gamut [2] 263515263611
gangway [10] 27154718 27391012172740817 2427417
gantry [5] 2715424
27391127716
gas-driven (1] 27101
Gate [1] 271010
gate [11] 271010271768 11273691327389
27921124279311279624
gave [9] 26672227438
27441217275013
276014276312784610
generic [1] 265412
gentleman [2] 27405
277517
gentlemen [11] 25885
2604826377265611
268816268916271512
271920273610274022
27983
Geo [1] 26915
Geographic [1] 26915
gets [4] 260323266818
266914279410
Gin (1] 272713
gin [9] 272714272978
273317276581127672
1222
Give [1] 26664
give [14] 261925262122
263219266721266820
267410269019269824
27165272414275317
275822278525279224
given [15] 260114262010
263125265552660 6, 11
2663182673 18, 268111
269920270119270416
27572327592427625
gives [3] 26945269913
275316
giving [3] 267324268020 274922
glad (2] 26493279014
glass [11] 272923273012
274762766242767278 10
glasses [1] 276712
Glenda [1] 277323
glove [1] 279220
GLOWACKI [3] 26986
27606277110
Glowacki [18] 261211316
2697212698 2, 8270814
27091427132227203
2739252742727526
27538275516275914
27605277112
goes [2] 27551227949
Golden [1] 271010
goodness [1] 265017
goofed [1] 26869
gosh [1] 260524
gossip [1] 267619
gotten [1] 259224
Gould [1] 263619
government (3) 264622
267410268823
governors [1] 27592

Gradually [1] 26594
gradually (2) 2645526593
graduated [5] 26221321
269825269919276016
graduates [1] 27009
graduation [5] 269921
27008927479
Graeme [1] 270711
grant [14] 26242225
2625134913212425
2642926621119
grants [1]-2624 16
great [5] 262523263413
26422426635269119
green (1) 264811
Greenwich [1] 27549
Greg [1] 27483
ground [1] 26188
grounding [14] 270513
270652744202745617
2756562762141923
27642276815277216
group (5] 25992526004
260316265225
groups [2] 262624265222
Guard [6] 2693627007
270118276832769612
guard [3] 27362327374
279216
guards [3] 273771727712
guess [12| 25981259923
262025264419264916
26912326936273220
2778727821427835 279716
guessing (2) 27661420
guesswork [4] 26535 21, 2655818
guidelines [13] 263616
26406264172679 16, 19
232680 11, 132681211 268215268313
gulf (2] 26009261521
guy [14] 2788142789224
25279042793 15, 27958
252797411131718
guys [5] 260218273116
27691727921725
$\frac{-\mathrm{H}-}{\square}$
habrts [1] 277014
hadn't (3) 276815276913 277824
half (14) 260222260913
2026101326892324
2727 5, 2736 8, 27542224
2755 4, 2758227661719
half-plus (1) 272618
Hammen [5] 2756141623
275710275812
hand [10] 260422621 19,
265919269016269722
2703222740182773 17,
2784 22, 279714
handed [6] 26412527926
7 13, 15, 16
handle [1] 264314
handled [2] 2640 25, 26484
handler [1] 260311
hands [1] 26808
hands-on [1] 262413
handwriting \{2| 27761819
HANSON [6] 27831518
2784182795111527981
happening [1] 269423
happens [5] 260614
263419272112273619
273910
Harbor [3] 27682021
276920
harbor [3] 2726347
Harborview [1] 278616
hard (2) 268611277017
hard-core [1] 279420
Harvard (1) 26232
hauling [1] 279223
Haven [4] 2707131421
27086
haven't [5] 265715266318
27642277218279325
Hazel (1] 263715
he'd (5) 25902325953
26101627763
head [2] 2594527084
headache [1] 269310
headed [1] 274016
heads (1) 261619
health [4] 26231262420
26497,265423
healthy (1) 259718
hear [11] 2595725963
2597 9, 263752638 10, 26482526752327082 ,
2728527621517
heard [26] 2595 21, 25961
152597121325991113
142606 24, 26131426169
102628126361823 ,
2638626395268189
268812745 23, 276121
2762127711723
hearing [1] 262215
hearings [1] 27624
hears [1] 263212
held [3] $268717 \quad 275719$
280211
Hello (1] 26988
hello (1) 258912
help [3] 26432526767 , 276314
Henry [6] 25892259113
2592 8, 259316 17, 261212
HERBY [1] 28028
Hey [2] 279423279712
hide [1] 27804
hidıng [2] 2778 25, 27803
high [1] 266513
higher [1] 260225
highlighted [1] 266122
highly [2] 27421127514
HIMS [4] 262516 17, 26264
Hinch [1] 260419
Hinchinbrook [2] 2604 11, 19
history [18] 261718 19,
2660 25, 2664 8, 14, 2665 1,
26685 11, 182669412
2670 6, 7267222
hrt [1] 26934
Hobby [3] 27746727812
hold [9] 2660232668 17,
27018 10, 2127389.

275761920
holders [1] 267024
holding (3) 26695269418
269518
holds [1] 267313
holiday [1] 278321
home [5] 26182027816
2794131524
homes [1] 27766
Honor (48] 25881226011
26062126092326185
26202526211617
2627152026411819
26539112656 9, 2679 18,
26829122684 23, 26859
2686222687 4, 8 9, 26887
14, 268920 22, 2690110 2691 25, 2693 11,
26962426976 15, 18
2719182720127536
2761142770 13, 277312
27831316278418
279013279510
hooked [1] 27598
hope [8] 259422259524
269981727092425 277223
horsepower [20] 270116
27511315172025,
2753912 21, 27551720
2756 19, 2227571522
27581427594912
hoses [1] 25987
Hospital [2] 26651113 hospital [4] 2786121618 279323
hotel [1] 27261
hour [22] 2593326091320 2610132718 19, 22 272019272115272317 192726182727527368 , 275842764 14, 18, 19,
2778327821012
hours [13] 259012260325 2604162605 24, 26927 2712627258272617 27661617 19, 278211 Houston [2] 27031727854 Howard [1] 27853
Huh [1] 260019
Human (1] 262515
human [2] 26161827907
humans (2] 26237
Hundred [1] 26195
hundreds (1) 26261
hung [2] 2724 16, 27267
hungry [2] 2790 9, 13
Huntington [8] 2775 25,
2776211278019278111 222427823
hurried (1] 278717
hurry [1] 260324
husband [1] 277822
Hut [3] 27746727812

| $-1-$ |
| :--- |
| $1 \mathrm{~d}[281259010,2592424$ |
| 25931725948259720, |
| 2610172026213,26281 |
| 326301526371926446, |

192652726591726969
27081427099271322
27372227434274820
275119277722
I ve \{22] 25881226016
26051826131626169
26209262813263012
2632242641326461114
265717268325273921
275615275972760310
2778427942325
IDs[2] 273622279217 larossi [1] $261313^{2}$
ice [7] 2615252616345 8, 26951227238
Icy [3] 273115 17, 19
Idea [7] 265014266416
269321426952276919 27911
Ideas [1] 264521
identifiable [1] 26621
identification [5] 267613
268532792141625
identifications [1] 279619
identified [1] 268620
Identity (1) 279523
ill-advised [1] 26794
immediate [1] 26898
immediately [1] 258913
immigrate [1] 272010
immigrated (1] 27208
impaired [5] 27061827321 35274915
implementıng [1] 267920 implication [1] 268318 important (4) 261423
26332126351926716 importantly [1] 265221 impression [2] 26831720 improper [1] 267614 improve [1] 26036
inability [2] 26781820
incident [6] 259317261213 261414261710263721 263812
Incidentally [3] 27217 27451927583
incidentally [2] 273723 27538
inclinometer \{2] 274735
include [5] 25919262318
2640626451927439
inciuded (2) 26242226703
incorporate [1] 27591
Incorporated [1] 27868
increase [2] 26364270422
increasing [1] 26621
increments [1] 275419
independent [1] 268516 indicate [8] 2592131720
260914267815269625
26972271414
indicated [4] 260221
26128265121268414
indıcatıng [3] 259617 2694927927
indicative [1] 268124
indicator [1] 267720
Indiscernible (1) 259210
individual [14] 2613 22,
263023263213263514

25263612662226635
individually [2] 26721
27179
individuals [1] 263023
indulge (1] 260621
industries (10) 262519
262614714,262712
2643926591114
Industry [14] 26251226268
212644 4, 2646 22, 265622
26572462659522
266878
inebriated [3] 259419
259578
influence [1] 27088
information [36] 260624
2620392629 13, 16 19, 24
2630478912263358
222637826496265624
266919267013267810
268092743 6, 891115
27441112 17, 27493
27501113275211276623
ingress [1] 274911
initial [3] 26341126839
initially [4] 27111272414
27457275221
injuries [1] 268123
innuendoes [1] 276216
inpatient [3] 26312426633
268417
input [1] 26364
inquire (1) 261625
inquiries [2] 262616264314
inquiring (1) 262615
inside [6] 27321127377
27871127881319279221
insofar [1] 259216
inspection [1] 27508
instance [3] 26661527519
275319
instances [1] 26745
instant [1] 26553
instinctive [2] 274623
27472
instinctively [1] 274617
Instrtute [6] 262416262613
26291126421026432
266220
instrute (1] 262419
instrtutes (1] 262420
institution [2] 265920
266719
instrutional [1] 27865
instructions [2] 274922
27983
instructor [1] 269821
instrument (2) 274716
instruments [1] 274615
intended (2) 268514
270422
intensive [1] 26795
interact [5] 263125263213
264082706727084
interacting [1] 26453
interaction [1] 263118
interactions [1] 26358
interchange [2] 26306
264721
interdepartmental [2]

26021113
interested [1] 25961
interesting [2] 2655227671 interim [3] 264212264314 interjection [1] 265410
internship [1] 262222
interpret [1] 26726
interpreting [1] 267121
interrupt [1] 26349
Interyontion [1] 262515
interview [1] 276917
interviewed [3] 263511
27682276918
interviewing [1] 26382
interviews [3] 2640 24,
276013279612
intoxicated (10] 270618
2779 2, 2790 19, 2791 3,
2793252795 5, 279621
2797921
introduce [1] 268918
introduced [1] 263522
inundated (1] 261819
investıgate [1] 26777
investigated [2] 25896
271025
investigation [2] 263219
274625
investıgators \{2] 2769712
Invite [1] 26771
invited (1) 272115
involve [4] 26302126358
264614268119
involved [16] 262625
2643 16, 2644 9, 264720
2649192659152674614
16192700127021419
2225270318
involvement [7] 2643 15,
2647222651926601718
267424267816
involves [2] 26441114
involving (4) 262712
264322264615265923
Island (17) 26921924
269341519269514
271210277524277613
71123
island [1] 269218
islands [1] 269321
issuance [10] 266821
2669142326701 5,
26729 14, 17, 2673 1, 26747
issuances [1] 26704
Issue [9] 259921261422
232526172226181325 275711
issues \{2] 2619126204
tt II [1] 262218

## - J -

J-e-r-z y [1] 26983
JAMIN [2] 269769
January (3) 259923266723
270521
Jean [1] 277714
JERZY [3] 2698627606
277110
Jerzy (2) 26972126982
jetty [6] 2716137273820

Easc Systerns Adpications
2427406
job |21| 259923263116 2636913263946
2646182658212326603
26681314267325
26792324268012
269216273710278512 279112
jobs [1] 265620
Joe [5] 2602102226036 810
join [1] 270520
joined [7] 264417269921
2705192727352733410
joint [2] 27701
Jones [6] 270792127085
27461013274720
Joseph [2] 266414
JOY [1] 280220
Judge (4) 260825261810
26886269013
Judge [2] 267711267924
judgment [1] 27603
judgments [3] 263322
267813279021
June [1] 25927
jurisdiction [1] 26006
Jury 1712588225901
2656121427192224 27989
jury (11] 259423259623 260482605126225 2688101226891721 2715 13, 275225
justifiable [1] 26624

## - K -

KAISER [2] 277325278317 Katser [8] 27731315 27744277616277723 2780101221
Katherine [1] 270713
keep (5) 26221426289
26312027904279416
keeping [1] 263111
Kelly [3] 27746727812
Kende [1] 25921
Kennedy [1] 263924
Kerry [1] 267113
key [3] 2631212660422
Kımtis [16] 25901625925
252594162612131924
2705162760232527615
10151719
kinds [3] 265520266719
26793
Kings [4] 26994616
270412
Klinckhardt [2] 259520 259612
kneo-jerk [1] 26466
knowing [6] 27241727355 827421827661227704
knowledge [5] 265914
26678268113270422 277122
$\frac{-L-}{\text { LI-o-y-d [1] } 27859}$
labeled [1] 27822

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-25-94
VOLUME 17

Labor (1) 262923
laboratories [1] 265423
laboratory [1] 265422
lack [1] 26803
Ladies [3) 268816268916 27983
ladies [5] 2588526048
265610271512271919
lady [1] 277714
land [2] 262415269224
landed [1] 271119
language [2] 26611926714
large [8] 262810262912
26301026522225
26592027541927884
larger [3] 2598426929
272925
last [19] 260351415
26212226282263623
2639172672426833
268442690102026981
27702127732127809
27852278613
lasted [1] 27844
lasts [1] 26019
late [13] 2613922265819 252659141626602
267424270317276134
latter [3] 27017270215
270318
launch [1] 25952
law [4] 266413266913
267010268823
lawyer (2) 265023273621
lay [1] 26799
layman [1] 26808
lead (1] 262819
leadership [1] 260211
leading (2) 269522274011
leads [3] 268022276612 15
leaning [1] 274716
learn [1] 277511
learned [3] 27623278619 20
leave [19] 259625259825
26011619260413
26211227122021
27142227151271822
272320273011131617
2741 25, 274722
leaves [1] 260323
Leaving [1] 260612
leaving [6] 26921320
26931827155272420 273220
left-hand [3] 27463278110 13
legal [3] 265012426742
legends [1] 271515
lengthier [1] 271216
lens [2] 269323269415
letter (5] 26482267117
268910 13, 26977
letting (1) 26187
level (3) 26555 6, 274515
levels [2] 265415274912
Leyendecker [3] 259123
2592312
library [1] 265920
license [30] 264619

2660242662252663923
2668172669514267221
23267491126831924
270071011131421
270156810121421
2227576
ilcenses [2] 267024270120
lift [2] 27139276316
light [1] 27393
lightered [2] 259724
271018
lightering-[5] 259723
25982102125994
lights [1] 269122
limit [3] 264324264520
27592
limited (2) 26582026608
limits [1] 27587
line [12] 26101826115
26198914152654411
162678427933
lines [2] 26512278017
lingered (1] 27445
liquor [1] 27072
list [9] 26002026011317
27362427474101222
listed [5] 268510268945
27218277713
listen (1] 260921
listened [3] 26113276313
277023
listening [3] 2790327984
lists [1] 260410
Live [1] 26223
live [1] 277524
lived [1] 27762
living (1] 26911
Lloyd [1] 27859
load [5] 26392426923
2710927131920
loaded [2] 274137
loading [2] 27412427437
locally [1] 27518
located [1] 272523
location [1] 27877
locations [1] 25995
$\log (2) 2717827369$
logger [4] 27528918 27564
long stem [2] 277623 277716
looks (1] 272923
loose [1] 272416
lot (15] 25902226209
26282264521264918
26542526577266318
2677212693127222
2732122778423
Louisiana (1] 270212
Lovelace [5] 262324
264420264524265919
loving [1] 275825
low-alcohol [3] 26782324
26791
lower [1] 260222
lowest [1] 274515
lube \{2] 274313
lubricating [1] 27185
luggage [1] 279221
lunch [8] 2593327211415
272215182723161924
luncheon [2] 26081319
lying [1] 277722
LYNCH [17] 262720
2641161824264818
265311192656916
2682926872325268814
2696202426971116
Lynch [4] 265681526833 17
$-\quad-M-$

M-A-S-T E-R-S [1] 26221
M D [1] 262222
ma'am [5] 26911269612
2775327774277820
machine [5] 2752 14, 27769
27811727822324
machınery [7] 270216
270318212427041
275038
machınes [1] 27266
magazines [4] 269146
272520273725
maiden [2] 2612427058
Main [1] 277714
main (7] 26396270819
274614151627471.

27494
maintain [2] 265711267819
maintaining [1] 267818
major (2) 26261263014
Malverne [1] 27762
$\operatorname{man}[12] 25942526518$
2774172786212789910
27901727911727923
279381218
managed [1] 261319
Management [1] 262923
management [9] 25945
260312261221261327
1126147911
manager [2] 25907268911
managers [1] 268216
mandatory [3] 26481
26642224
maneuvering [6] 2751 18, 22
2753202427557,9
manifests (1] 263922
manner [2] 2641 1, 277922
mannerisms [2] 26101523
manual [1] 27524
manufacturer [2] 270825
27198
manufacturers [3] 270417
271118
map [3] 268935
March \{24] 2594 13, 25971 259924 25, 26052226064 626071426166269112 270662708 15, 27132224 271442715 19, 27741317
2775127802427851219
278624
marine [1] 27027
marine-type [1] 270417
Martime [5] 2698 13, 21
2717 3, 5, 276016
martime [3] 26981725
269911
mark [2] 2780910

|  | Baxc Syytems Applcationa | FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSC | 5-25-94 VOLUME | Concorrance by Look Seel |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | marked [4] 264125,268710 273914278022 | ```273222276025 meeting [5] 259413261921 2226351417 meetıngs [3] 26182526324 266216 meets [1] 267219 melded [1] 261521 member [2] 259322264724 Members [1] 25901 members [3] 2607812``` | misunderstand [1] 268018 misunderstanding (1] 25916 misunderstood [1] 267810 misuse [1] 26803 misused [3] 26772325 | $\begin{aligned} & 25925259520,25966,8 \\ & 202599622260121 \end{aligned}$ |
|  | market [1] 279715 |  |  | 202599622260121 <br> 2606232608232637617 |
|  | Martıneau (1) 26165 |  |  | 20, 263852673826818 |
| $1$ | Mary [7] 25941824 |  |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { myself [5] } 258925259017 \\ & 2620527211427911 \end{aligned}$ |
|  | 259512259917261414 |  | $26781$ |  |
|  | 263623 |  |  | - N- |
|  | mass [1] 26532 <br> master [6] 25982126229 |  | moderated [1] 26527 modification [1] 27092 |  |
| L- | 1025273923,275825 |  | modifications [4] 264424 27095 6, 9 | N a u-g-h t-o-n [1] 27853 name (33) 2621222324 |
|  | MASTERS [2] 2622 |  | modified [1] 270913 | name (33] 2621222324 $26221262421262514$ |
|  | 268213 | memo [1] 26026 | dify [1] 2659 | 262614267612690 19, 20 |
|  | Masters [17] 26211824 | memorandum [3] 260122 | moment [15] 260621 | 212696426972526981 <br> 227078271515271619 |
|  | 26225262715,23264114 | 26621026724 | 2619102641162652 |  |
|  | 25265115,265313, 265617265913,266320 | Memories [1] 26852 <br> memories [1] 261314 | $\begin{aligned} & 267320268412690 \text { 15, } \\ & 27456,18,19,27568, \end{aligned}$ | 227078271515271619 2127221627608277320 |
|  | 266822669 2, 267418 | memory [2] 26501112 | 27794111427802 | $\begin{array}{llllll} 21 & 22 & 23 & 2774 & 3 & 4 \\ 2777 & 11 & 2785 & 1 & 2 & 8 \end{array}$ |
| L' | 26812268215 | men [1] 279520 | moments [1] 259519 | named [1] 277418 <br> names [1] 273624 |
|  | masters [10] 2598 24, 26009 | mentioned [4] 25962 | Monday [3] 25962525971 |  |
|  | 12, 212601 7, 260 | 26132126387265917 | 26373 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { names [1] } 273624 \\ & \text { narrow [2] } 26609 \end{aligned}$ |
|  | 2615212670242678 | mere [3] 26681126694 | money [2] 2787 15, 2792 | narrow [2] 26609 <br> NASA [3] 2644 15, 2326458 |
|  | 268215 | message [4] 259652743 10, | montor [7] 260418261817 | NATALIE [2] 26902426962 |
|  | mate [3] 2589 13, 270010 | $16,27772$ <br> messed [1] 279410 | 26191726733268323 | Natalie [1] 269021 <br> National (11] 262416 |
|  | 27483 material [2] | messed (1] 279410 netal [3] 27371273 | monitored [4] 26 |  |
|  | matter [11] 25893260721 | 279218 | 26302326432326447 | 2626132629111826429 <br> 26432264413266220 |
|  | 2608122610 4, 2651 10, | method | MONTAGUE [14] 262117 | 2691427601327686 <br> national [1] 262420 |
|  | 265321265815266913 | methods [6] $262414{ }^{\text {d }} 26292$ | 262242026234262715 |  |
|  | 2683926853 | 6, 16275118 | 242526411421264817 | nature (4) 26541227074$2718727239$ |
|  | matters [1] 2802 | Michigan [3] 262271222 | 2653926821114268419 |  |
|  | $\max [1] 275317$ | microphone [1] 262216 Mid [2] 27051127614 | Montague [4] 262116 264920265918267517 | Naughton [1] 27853 <br> nauseating [1] 269310 |
|  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { maximum [11] } 275113 \\ & 27531222275517 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Mid [2] } 27051127614 \\ & \text { mid [9] } 265942426602 \end{aligned}$ | 264920265918267517 Montgomery [1] 263619 |  |
|  | 2756192127571522 | 267424270522270646 | month [4] 25926269112 | NEAL [23] 25889111925 259310259515260113 |
|  | 2758 13, 2759412 | 27081527613 | 14270519 |  |
|  | McCarthyism (1) 265210 | middle (4) 2615 15, 265819 | monthly [1] 266216 | 26062122260823 <br> 260923261069261111 |
| 1 | McRobbie [1] 259720 | 1627477 | months [9] 25947259720 | $\begin{aligned} & 142326185261910 \\ & 2620252621369 \end{aligned}$ |
|  | mean (50] 25913,25962 25971425983,260213 | midnight [8] 260962744 23, 274592754122022 | 25981270271427037 $18,270824278613$ |  |
|  | 260382022260421 | 27567 | 18, mooring [1] 274111 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Neal (4] } 2588 \text { 8, } 1823 \\ & 26385 \end{aligned}$ |
|  | 261122612 23, 261920 | military [3] 27863 | morning [12] 25885 , |  |
|  | 262022624926267 | mind [11] 260313261423 | 25901025934260422 | Nealy [1] 263619 nebulous [1] 265420 |
|  | 26274263922265312 | 2628 9, 262921263111 | 26122226371926957 | nebulous [1] 265420 <br> needing [1] 26055 |
|  | 265492657126654 | 265523266622273024 | 269892715219279414 |  |
|  | 2668121326752126771 | 27452527752427904 | 27985 | needs [3] 26302021 |
|  | 2718102734127389 | minding [1] 279111 | mother [1] 277712 | 274315 <br> negative [1] 25897 <br> negotiate [2] 27391027419 |
|  | 27454 | mıne [3] 26472226652 | motion [1] 269716 |  |
|  | 27461927549182761 | 27303 | Motivation [1] 262515 |  |
|  | 27692427728277824 | NS [1] 2782 | motor [4] 2701 15, 24 | negotiate [2] 27391027419 negotrating [2] 273118 |
|  | 2781162782911,22 | minute [7] 26141326217 | 270213275318 | $274018$ <br> nervous [1] 269119 |
|  | 278612790781127918 | 26394275513276819 | mouth [1] 267822 |  |
|  | 27942527966 | 2770 7, 278218 | move (8) 259812259922 | nervous [1] 269119 <br> News [2] 2691527969 <br> news [1] 272519 |
|  | Meaning [1] 27698 | minutes [47] 259512610 5, | 262169271212742 11, | news [1] 2725 19newspaper [2] 27968 |
|  | meaning [2] 2628 17, 274510 | 26561126892324 | 2768 10, 276925 |  |
|  | means [11] 25922025983 | 26901127192021 | moved [7] 27031927211 | $279714$ <br> [3] 272420 |
|  | 2604152326281626561 | 2722112724242727 | 2741192742912278615 | newspapers [3] 272420 <br> 27251927266 |
|  | 2671926824275714 | 2728910273113273218 | ves [1] 25995 |  |
|  | 27821314 | 273491027432427445 | moving [1] 276811 | Newsweek [1] 26915 <br> nice [4] 2595326971819 |
|  | meant (4) 2591425961 | 232745227468274820 | Mrs [3] 259981227776 |  |
|  | 25971625982 | 21275322754121420 | MS [6] 27831518278418 | 27843 <br> night (11) 25971261524 |
|  | Measures [1] 265220 | 2227567212757 22, | 2795111527981 | 2527361727381725 273919274014278917 |
|  | measures [3] 26521820 | 275842768672770811 | Ms [9] 2707142127085 |  |
|  | 26553 | 18278022782612 | 277313277616277723 | 27961417 <br> nighttıme [1] 273920 |
|  | mechanical [1] 278923 | 462789 | O10 1221 |  |
|  | Medical [3] 26232426335 | mischaracterization [2] | muffled [1] 274523 | nighttime [1] 273920 <br> Nine [2] 27851623 <br> nine [4] 26052427544 |
|  | 26357 | 26507276115 | Murphy [9] 2721131618 |  |
|  | Medicine [1] 262313 | mısleading [2] 2678 10, | 21, 27225927231325 | 7851315 |
|  | medicine [8] 26231513 | 26807 | 272410 |  |
|  | 1426241262716 | miss [1] 266917 | Murtiashaw [1] 269616 | nolse [3] 25912425962 |
|  | meet [9] 2632 3, 267410 | misspoke [1] 262023 | MYERS [2] 25882426091 |  |
|  | 27111827253469 | mistake [1] 263921 | Myers [18] 25881119 |  |

Basc Systerns Applicatons
nolses [2] 27452327464 non [3] 267291415
Nope (1] 278416
normal [4] 267819273812 277919279213
normally [4] 263825
27451627861279420
North [2] 26061426983
Notary [1] 280220
note (1] 278323
notebook [1] 26118
notes [8] 260914263719
2684152696679280210
notice [4] 26921527157
27204279717
noticed [3] 27461427473 12
notices [1] 263212
notıfy [2] 271115272024
notorious [1] 267619
NTSB [2] 27626277112 nuclear [2] 262413264412
Number [1] 27823
number [21] 260325
260417262428262614 26421126451269145 26962227631727668 27721827773527816
19212427821
numbers [1] 268520
numerous [1] 262623 nursing [1] 268415

| -O - |
| :--- |
| O Brien [2] 2689 11 |
| O Connor [2] 2647 |
| O'Nell [13] 2588 |
| O |

2594162597826219
2685101326961526996 2760827699277014 277112
Oaks [4] 2665111326676 9
oath [2] 25882127667
obedient [1] 275822
object [6] 2618726863
269125276114277013 279513
Objection [1] 259216 objection [11] 25881316 261191526187264121 268592426888268922 25
objections [1] 261122 obligates [1] 267522
obligation [1] 27139
observation [1] 260218
observations (3) 263114
263217268021
observe [1] 27971
observed [5] 2633427373
2744242745722
observing [2] 259418
267911
obvious [1] 26789
obviously [5] 269417
271722746527507 276319
occasion [7] 259018 26081226251826918

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-25-94 VOLUME 17 Concordance by Look See(58)

## 2706721277717

Occasıonally [1] 25994
occastonally [1] 267224
occasions [1] 275918
occupation [1] 269810
occupatıonal [6] 262315
14262716262912264612
occurred [1] 271210
off loaded [1] 269211
off-loading [3] 269210
26942226965
offer [8] 2588131426117 262715264119268424
268514268710
offered [9] 258815261110 2641202685823268621 2687121621
offering [2] 26632526863 offers [1] 268722
Office (1] 27175
office [39] 25991620,
26132226172426389
270032702810270622
252714911232717316
1720252718121416
182719172720318
2721221252722136
274252744131527451
227649
Officer [1] 259714
officer [7] 259713263215
20263420265122
27161127351
officers [4] 25982425
260722268110
offices (1] 27188
official [1] 26254
officially [1] 26252
Oh [15] 26109262521
265111266612526672
267532677126791
2683 25, 2684 10, 269119
2697727622427758
oh (2) 260524267021
oll [41] 262810268817
26891126924101314 21252693416171820 269449,1113171819 202326951591117
1921222696527185
27431327631627918
279620
okay [13] 26161426397 26861427041527121 2738427547276015
27776278111279424
2796912
old [3] 259717276521 279318
old fashioned [1] 267210
Oldham [3] 27071121
27085
On-the-job [1] 277510
ones [2] 264811279420
onset [1] 262524
opened [1] 279224
operation [3] 259810
26061927945
operational [1] 263022
operations [1] 264423
operator [1] 271611
opinion (4) 2637815 266325266513
opportunities [1] 279324 opportunity [5] 262211 27161527201627971 opposed (10] 265124 265252655226615 26872526994275122 275314275518277122 opposition [1] 267423 Order [1] 25884
order (21)-2662 1426749 267910272211272712 272832124272924 273211131625273311 1618276318277621 2777152782127846 ordered [17] 2727925 272856252733121920 2734231027412425 2767192227703
orders [1] 273713
ordinary (3] 27912227976 8
organization [6] 26038
261325261819262325 2629522
organizatıons [7] 26243
262931517263067
265624
oriented (1] 263914
original (1) 264914
originally [2] 270911
271320
Orleans [1] 270212
outcome [2] 26351626429 outmoded (4) 266010
2674222526752
outside \{13] 2626826338
2646222722627321521
252734202127373
2758627971214
overall [2] 262818263110
overhauled [3] 2709811
27106
overheard [1] 272021
overloaded (1) 27588
overly [1] 279620
overnight [1] 26065
overspeed [1] 27592
owe [1] 279316
owner \{2] 268821277415
$-\quad-\mathrm{P}$ -
p m (9) 2605692224
271523271922278215
2798 9, 10
pace [1] 26114
pacing [2] 26101923
packages [4] 273721124 27385
packed [1] 273115
page [19] 261171920
26192112648726511
26542410265925
26611626661026723
2685 14, 2226882427626
pages [6] 26118 11, 1522
26882526891
paid [5] 2646242734 25,

278411279110279313
Palace [17] 2722171820
27231014273025
27311220273210
27341117276413
27671727873612
Pan [4] 264715264819
2649426519
paper [2] $277612 \quad 27809$
paper-and-pencil [1] 268021
papers [6] 268313272419
272521232527387
paperwork [4] 263711
264021427452
paragraph [3] 26035
266121266821
paragraphs [1] 26897
parameters [1] 27593
paraphrasing [1] 259523
parcel [1] 259124
pardon [1] 262019
parking [1] 27222
part [18] 259123260113
261442616626242
26751626792026801
268718268841726896
26921627017272015
2725 1, 27371227677
parted (1] 27251
parties [3] 2707151619
parting [1] 27254
partition (1) 276520
parts [2] 27112427124
party [1] 270725
partying [1] 276124
pass [2] 267522279411
passage [1] 26168
passed [2] 259617276115
passenger [7] 2735 13, 21
278769278891827923
passengers [15] 263924
27875 11, 17192224
2788352789811
27901827951724279624
passes [1] 273623
patient (1) 264721
PAUL [2] 25882426091
Paul [5] 2616192637617
268910278713
pay [6] 278713279159
12, 2795 22, 279720
paying [4] 278413278916
2792 4, 279519
peer (1] 267612
people [29] 25982526207
2628242635 23, 26361
2638172644 4, 2646 6, 15
265222252656 19,
2657 11, 26676267629
2677212681927219
2732122736242737211
2778232779727868
279324279419279615
perceive [1] 25955
perceived [1] 25955
percent [5] 264614268821
2753 17, 2755 25, 27562
percentage [3] 275315
27551721
perception (2) 25942425
perform [3] 26337263513

27096
performance [9] 26028
2603626394617
26582126604267924 26801
performed [2] 268318 271124
performing [2] 27097 274515
period [24] 26414266125 26642026715267215 2699252706131621 270751527081625 27091127113271822
27191327224,2730614 2744222753227561 276611
periodic [3] 26324265124 265419
perıodically [1] 267021
permanent [1] 270512
permission [3] 2604 2,
2689 21, 27536
permit [2] 26572427389 Persh [1] 266613 person [27] 25955263123 263332634111824 2635126381826391519 264025264134267011 267281526768,26814 26836277621277757. 27949279620279768 personal [8] 259114 2593142637222659 14, 2665 21, 2676 15, 277122 personnel [7] 2631426413 , 926789 14, 274913 persons [4] 26241326302 264414267815 pertained (1] 260122 pertaining [2] 2633526497 pertains [1] 26714 petition [1] 26497
ph (4) 266523266613 277323
philosophical [1] 265413 phone [14] 2595426094 202610327184,27193 2747232748 22, 2749 14, 2776242781627832 278919
phones [1] 27183 photograph [5] 26921 2693 3, 20, 2694 3, 21 photographer [1] 26912 photographs [5] 26918 26921526931526953 phrase [1] 259315 physical [1] 271514 physically [4] 2715127179 2783910
physician [3] 2634 10, 12, 14 pick (10) 25911227109 2721222722912273513 21278722788 8, 279418 picked [5] 2716 17, 25, 27211827351127873 picks [1] 279412 picture [2] 269312279611 pictures [1] 26913
piece [3] 27761227809 ,

279010
pleces [1] 269512
Pilot [9] 264217271719
271882721132127225
9272325,272410
pilot [34] 264423264514
17232426461826564
265724266022 23, 26629
14 23, 2663914 16, 23
266413266816 17, 26695
1326701416267117
26722026762268318
26938271019271617
272116274124
Pilots [1] 26422
pilots [29] 264317 24,
26442511264512
264691519264724
264922265021825
26566265716 22, 266018
2662112665 15, 26666
26743 5, 626832326937 , 27164
Pipeline [40] 26881920 2725562726111922 2727146272959 14, 2730720273161119 2732172735151824 $\begin{array}{llllll}2765 & 6 & 9 & 14 & 16 & 2767 \\ 15 & 16\end{array}$ 2772127732278789 $\begin{array}{llll}2788 & 10 & 12 & 24 \\ 278956\end{array}$
pipeline [1] 27869
piping [2] 27411011
Pizza (17] 272217 18, 20
2723 10, 14, 2730 24,
273112 19, 2732 10,
2734111727641213
27671627872612
pizza [19] 273212 14, 16, 23
25273410121722
273812767192788345
2790523279212795912
pizzas [8] 273025273425
2738427395274019
27411527716
place [22] 2590 9, 26029
260915261417262910
2641 12, 265682674 19,
269014269416 18, 27136
27221416272320
2725 20, 273013276522
2774 7, 10 18, 278123
placed (2] 2628 13, 278210
placement [1] 260114
places [4] 2599126084
26651827652
Plantıffs [15] 261119
2621172684242686416 26883571626972515 27526278315279511 plaintiffs [9] 2611 18, 26473 9265162686326879 , 26889269621275617 plan [16] 263021263112 2632242640426416 2673 4, 268817 21, 26892 , 614271420272529 273022
planned [2] 261711271422 planning [1] 270319
platform [2] 27401112
play (8) 2591 16, 259515
260922261010263121
26712026861268923
Played [1] 26909
played [9] 2591 11, 17
259311259510 15, 17
25997,26095261011
playing [1] 267118
pleasant [1] 277520
pleasantries [1] 273719
Please [5] 262121269018
269724277319278425
please [16] 25881126116
262119232622526542
26901620269812715 12,
27582227731721
2784202227983
plenty [1] 26066
plus [6] 27184271910
2737 25, 2741 11, 276517 278224
pneumona [1] 278621
Point [3] 26994 6, 270412
point [38] 259511261923
2526342226522126608
266222678 17, 269222
26932126941316
269511192713513
271420271915272210
272515272811117
2730222731 7, 27332
2740527501927551
275810
2761927638276412
2768122769 24, 27726
279112279518
Pointers (1] 269916
Poland [1] 27207
policies [3] 2636 15, 16
264512
policy (19) 25931261546
261812126201016
2637926395264220
264519264612126798
92026821926834
273715
polite [1] 277919
politic [1] 260310
pollution [1] 268911
poor [1] 267819
populations [1] 265120
Port [3] 259812260318
274715
port [9] 2589102598 14,
26051527437274516
2747162227601
Portion [4] 25911725939
259517259618
portion (2) 25951015
portions [3] 2688102425
Portland [2] 2592 3, 263721
position [15] 2604 10,
26051626286112633 19, 26353263820264019
26444267116232672 13,
27038 9, 270822
positions [21] 262319
2624 23, 2625 11, 26271 13, 18, 2628142526303,18
26422026441522
26512126587265927

2326601526822327002 postive [3] 26457,265415 20
possibility [3] 261415
2676 13, 268124
post (1] 26761
posted [2] 27151017
potential [1] 260225
poured [1] 276710
power [3] 2753 15, 1727562
practically [1] 27516
practice [1] 26722
preceded [1] 266125
precisely [3] 26252226621
266719
predated (1] 265825
prolıminary [1] 263218
premise [2] 2646 16, 276320
preoccupled [1] 259611
prepared [1] 280212
preprogrammed [1] 275718
present [7] 2590 14, 26151
102669192698 10, 14 27043
presentation [3] 26201118 21
presentations [1] 262022
presented [3] 259423
261510267123
presently [2] 26981127019
president (3) 264922
26502122
press [1] 275620
pressure [1] 260318
pretty [3] 2708 11, 276521 27837
prevent [1] 262819
provention [2] 2633226604
Preventive (1) 262313
preventive [4] 2623114
26241262716
preventively [1] 263914
previous [3] 260525
26471827461
previously [3] 26887
273914274425
primary [1] 266315
Prnce [3] 2688182689314
principles [1] 262711
printed [4] 26261726426 27521115
printing [2] 262620278014 prints [1] 275214
prior [16] 2617 10, 26209
2647142703727082425
27162027242027254
273220273313274420
274592762119276515
pro [1] 265425
problem [36] 25931415
2597426092326159 ,
2632 19, 202635 19, 26462
5102651222655 19, 20
2658614266315 16,
266482126711426761
172677122711 22,
2712131827311827461
2749127591627602 ,
2762213279310279621
problems [31] 2591146
25962026172326207

Basch Systerns Adolications
$2627 \overline{18} \quad 19 \quad 263520 \quad \overline{22}$ 263722232644726465 1226511526541326566 266052665826685 2676122708181924 27091427115271223 27585
procedure [7] 271316 $\begin{array}{llllll}2736 & 14 & 15 & 16 & 18 & 2738 \\ 12\end{array}$ 275416
procedures [6] 262717 265314265619265711 2658516
proceed [2] 26902276015 proceeded [4] 271018 271834272523 process [6] 26131226717 2710427121617273217 processes [1] 278223
produce [1] 268418
produced [1] 264313 products [3] 27042324 profession [1] 268124 Professional [1] 26422 professional [10] 260210 26181626191626337 2635132526381264718 20267616
professionalism [1] 270425 professionals [1] 263917
Program [2] 2642127943
program [45] 26249
2625102626161726273 26287212630215
26312426322263313 121516263411263657 263792639826402 2641112642162124
26541326552426564 2657151718265921 26603
2667141526734267522 26796268118275718 27942818
programs [12] 262316 26251819242626115 262912263082644121 26592123
progress [2] 26333268414 project [2] 2625627035 projector [3] 269012 26911720
projects [4] 2702461820 promulgated [1] 268819
proof [1] 268722
propellers [1] 27598
proper [5] 26331726397 26692226764275416 proponent [1] 265418 proposed [1] 27092 propulsion [3] 270119 27531116
protect [2] 2673927592
provide [7] 262522263710 2669 21, 252679927139 276318
provided [5] 261816
2626142649 6, 26755 27182
provider [1] 267421
provisions [3] 263712

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5 25-94 VOLUME 17
26341926621526883 27009
recelved [21] 261124
26228262416264123
266219266525266615
267618268416268615
182687371726885
269714270071127016
274723274816
Recess [3] 265613271923
279810
recess [7] 26561011
2719192021279857
recration [2] 272415
278525
recognize [7] 260016
260232604626761112 2752818
recognized [2] 262825
268124
recollect [1] 260924 recollection [23] 259016 259322648212649613 2651357266638919
2717142719227247
27361127401327447
27701027722427731
278825279520
recollects (1] 259511
recommendation [1] 263511
recommendations [2]
26151626359
recommended [1] 26825
recommending [1] 26167
reconstruct [2] 27702
277225
reconstructed [1] 277221
reconvene [1] 27985
Record [1] 262111
record [21] 259125259417
259524261011262121
26412264914268411
2685417182687 18,
2688426901519269725
27732027742277622
278518
records [17] 263310 13, 18,
26416102651426634
$132673610 \quad 13,2326754$
268410269624274412
recounting [2] 259122
25927
recovering [2] 261817
261917
recrimination [1] 267614
recurrence [1] 267711
red [2] 277623277716
Redacted [1] 268424
redacted [2] 2686412
REDIRECT [3] 26091
268213277110
Redirect [2] 2608 24, 268210
Reeder [3] 25971314
259820
Reef [7] 2692192426934
15192695 13, 14
reef [1] 269521
reek [1] 277825
refer [5] 2620172026784
2681426822
reference [6] 265114

Basce Syrtorra Appicaicons
2653 4, 266222267611
27691027965
referred [4] 259717259820 26425266515
Referring [2] 2648 14, 26724 raferring [12] 2591 8, 25922 264310265411267117 26785 12, 26791326833 27451727691011 reflect [2] 2685 19, 277218 reflects [2] 264221268517 refresh [2] 2666919 refusal [2] 26484264925 retuse [6] 263012264856 2649121621
refused [3] 26483264911 22
regard [9] 2617 13, 16 2654172667 14, 2672 8, 2763 5, 2767 10, 2769 25, 277024
regarded [1] 27197
regarding [6] 259112 13, 260122261817261917 272022
regards [1] 270315
regular [1] 276521
Regulation [1] 266918
regulation [12] 265722
26689 17, 2669 3, 267023 26711314 15, 19, 21
26939
regulations \{14] 26571920 24, 2660 21, 26632226647 26683 22, 2669826719 2672 6, 2673 17, 268725 rehab [1] 26182 rehabilitation (4) 260715 261832668 3, 268319 reissued [1] 267223 relapse [2] 262819267713 relate [2] 2628426834 related (B) 261716264613 2647 25, 2651192654 12, 2655 10, 26822225 relates [2] 2642 16, 265312 relating [5] 2624910, 26301726897275013 relation [1] 26317
relationship (6] 26136 26302126313 8, 267420 277710
relativaly (1] 259717
release [2] 26731323
relevant [1] 26205
reliance [1] 26793
relied [2] 2667 5, 11
relieved [1] 273921
reluctantly [1] 26473
rely [2] $266717 \quad 272110$
relying [2] 2677 10, 15
remain [4] 271818272914
27361274323
remained [5] 260521
267122672 22, 2723 22, 275111
remarks [1] 265016 remember [35] 259114 259414 19, 259513 26111426131626169 , 2620 14, 2651132666 23,

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
26671,26964270816
271114271619271711
2728142729121327309
27311427321227392
274822756 17, 2427571
2758 14,
276813 16, 2777181921
27911527983
remembering [1] 276612
removed (1] 26414
repair [3] 2719627602
278620
repairing (1) 271217
repairs [3] 25937271124 275920
repeat [1] 265317
repetrion [1] 26188
repetitive (1) 26185
rephrase [1] 27874
replaced [2] 2659 3, 4
report [23] 260410262618
263212263417 20, 2638 3
2640202641126421116
21232426611526632
26641319266616
266714267051026724 268416
reported \{12] 2597"19
2638122640 16, 265122
2664152665 1, 4, 2677 18,
26903458
reporting [1] 26656
reports [25] 263223
2633112634212264022
252642111226432,4
26651624 25, 2666 12, 18
2326671116192684 5, 8, 12
represent [2] 273824,
275424
representative [3] 25945
26141127198
representatives [4] 261221
26132,27111720
represented [1] 278219
represents [1] 273918
reputation [1] 276123
request [10] 262522
264814151726491011
1721 23, 268425
Requested [1] 261812
requested [2] 261824
280210
requests (2] 2626423
require [5] 262820263317
26622526639271117
required (10) 2642 12,
2658132663 3, 26641315
2667202670122684 13,
26882327439
requirement [2] 267010
27436
requirements [1] 26141
requires [1] 266318
requiring [2] 2657 22, 26629
Research [3] 262325
264519
research [2] 264415
265920
reserve [1] 262720
reside [1] 26982
residency [1] 26232 resources [1] 261619 respect [13] 2624 6, 26263
26353263616263720
265462666 21, 2683613
16270321275016277213
respective [2] 261311
27766
respond [1] 26501
responded [1] 26502
response (5] 259519
25961326591826898
responses [1] 268425
responsibility [3] 263413
2635 8, 273921
responsible [5] 26135
262422631 9, 263316
264420
rest [2] 2605 20, 269715
restarted (1] 275223
restaurant [2] 27651719
restrict [1] 269311
restrictions [1] 26697
rests (1] 267125
result [5] 262517264815
2649102709 1, 279418
resume (1) 26581
retired (1) 26208
retirement [4] 26481
2664 23, 27201516
return (5) 26285 14,
2631 22, 2662 9, 26768
returned [6] 2627 2, 2630 3,
18, 26311026323,265822
returning (2) 2628 24,
263319
reuse [1] 267713
reverse [2] 27531027569
Review [1] 26422
review [10] 25892425902
6815261220263420
26631226854275614
reviewed [5] 26361526634
26676267914268215
reviewing [2] 26661223
revoked [3] 26622526639
267221
revolutions (1] 27558
RICHARD [2] 26223
268213
Richard [2] 26211824
ride [4] 271651627367
279414
Right [24] 2596426215
26692427101527331
274717275472755 1, 6
27653277522777 1, 9
2779 13, 27801820 ,
2781122783212278911
2790122791627922
rights [1] 26769
rise [1] 25883
risk (1) 261525
risks [4] 261535 7, 8
road [3] 26361227311419
Roberson [17] 271612
27211427231272422
2726 25, 272891121.
272912273016 24, 27325
142733 9, 20, 276523
27722
role [10] 2599426131718 263172126341326455 826751819
roles [3] 26248263024
26315
roll [1] 275215
Ron [1] 278420
RONALD [2] 27856279514 Ronald [1] 27859
room [31] 25962268917
270811271022274116
17274215172744 11, 13
274531213141523,24
274627913 14, 274720
274971127502,24
2751 7, 275212275724
276519
ropes [1] 274110
roses [2] 2776 23, 277716
rotated [2] 2789 14, 279116 rotation [3] 271313 19,
276310
rotor [1] 271215
Rouge [3] 26041926968 27028
rough [1] 262611
Roughly [1] 275525
roughly [2] 26138270211
rounds [1] 27508
routine [2] 274515279213
routinely [1] 278225
rpm [4] 2711127512324 275519
rpms [3] 2751 18, 21275424
RPR [1] 280220
Rule [1] 268710
rule [4] 264725264820 264959
rules [2] 26872324
rumbling [1] 274523
rumor [6] 267523267619 20267778276217
rumors [6] 26761127621
151627711722
run (6] 261524269117
275025275114275823
277916
runnung [6] 2664 22, 271224
27512427542814

## - S -

sad [1] 274917
Safe [1] 27942
safe [1] 279414
Safety [2] 27601327687 safety (20| 2614426152
261825262318262423
26251126271 13, 17
2628510142630217
26331926353263819
264220264422
safety-sensitive [13] 263919 2640 19, 2644415265121 2656 20, 2658726592 7,
11 23, 266014268223
sall [5] 27002527056
2715162742418
sailed [8] 270011827058
17 24, 27122327427
sailing [17] 2702327158
$\begin{array}{llll}10 & 13 & 14 & 20 \\ 22 & 272022\end{array}$
242721478927317
27411927428
samples [2] 27185271910
San [18] 25947259625
25985142525993
26387270319270816
270912271011131719
27122027131827186
275915
SANDERS [23] 262113
26859268651922 26874826892526907
269125269311269525
2696310273923277510 2784202785727901315 1627951013
sandwich [1] 279014
satısfactory [2] 266920
26715
satısfy [2] 26712224
save [2] 2646918
saying [11] 261222261410 263518264918265013 2664172680612272422 273519
scenario [2] 26897271212
scenarios (1] 268914
schedule [2] 27122427135 scheduled [2] 260616
26179
school [9] 262212265820
2660226741822270413
270916276020278620
Schuyler [3] 269921112
science [3] 2653521
26558
scope [2] 2695421
screen (2) 26612027403 screening [2] 265225 26532
sea [6] 26241526644 271020275121275718 275910
seagoing [2] 2700427576
seal [2] 26871416
seaman (1) 260310
seamen [1] 279124
search [2] 261736
searched [2] 26179279220
searches [1] 261713
seat [6] 2788417278924 , 279052792 20, 27959 seated (5) 262121269018 269724277319278425 seating [1] 276518
Seattle [1] 269022
second [23] 26102526112 26211026261926401 26512326612126664 267822689627001420 270123270710270913 27121427181271919 27281827481627535 278119
secondary [5] 265814
2662242663816
seconds [3] 2754927555 27893
section [3] 26161926698 27772

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-25-94
VOLUME 17 Concordance by Look See(T2)
security [12] 27362327371 357122738912
27921627962425
seek [1] 27478
seeking [1] 26747
sees [2] 26321126835
selection [1] 262412
self [1] 269811
self destruct [2] 275824
27593
self-employed [1] 269815
sell [1] 26913
sells [1] 272518
seminars [2] 26182226205
send [8] 26012526361
268112704927136
2719102743616
sending [2] 26165277717
sense [6] 2592325935
26141726661326751719 sensible [1] 26767
sensitive [18] 262319
2624232625112627113
182628510142630217 26331926353263819
26422026442226894
separate (5) 25931326108
26145268519275918
separated [1] 276520
September [1] 26251
series [3] 26161326833
26844
serious [2] 26581226699
served [3] 26084 19,
273314
Service [1] 268819
service [1] 27138
Services [2] 2717427868
serving (1) 261216
sets [1] 27409
setting [1] 275720
seven [5] 25947268923
278017278617
severe [3] 270823271020 27124
shade [1] 26947
shaft [4] 27103278913
27911516
shakiness \{1\} 269515
shaped (1] 27476
share [2] 26301112
sharp [1] 27418
she'll [1] 269011
Sheehy (2) 2637517
sheet [2] 26051626064
sheets [1] 271715
shelf [1] 26997
Shipping [6] 26149261519 2616725261819268110 shipping [1] 27027
ships [13] 2597 18, 25984
16, 1726021626051316
26142,2617726182324
269416278823
Shipyard [1] 263721
shipyard [1] 27036
shop [10] 27597277521
277652778232779716
27807,2782127832324
shore [1] 271215
shoreside [3] 260116

26031227003
shorthand (1] 280210
shot [2] 26932227736
shots [1] 27728
shoulder \{1] 27926
show [12| 26001526022
26041426712268623
2693232695427391417
277612279611
showing [3] 269419
26952027756
shows \{8)-2604 9260513
269222694141522
269516273920
sic [4] 266617267113
26738278013
sight [1] 273011
sights [1] 27268
sign (4) 277923427804
sign-out [1] 271715
significant [1] 26244
signing [2] 2717910
signs [6] 267713268012
26812327941315
silver [1] 262216
simultaneously [1] 273423
sine (3) 267291415
single [3] 2729212527302
singles [2] 27304276623
Sir [4] 261922760827688 12
sister [3] 270217270823
27091
st [2] 27701278724
stie [2] 2718 23, 27517
stes [2] 268935
sitting [4] 27339276825 2788116
stuation [5] 266416
271025273918274014 277221
six [11] 2592625947
2702714270317271221
27134827715278617
27975
sIze [3] 27303276624
276712
skill (1) 263917
skinny (1] 269218
skipping [1] 262322
slash [1] 278114
slick [1] 269413
slide (3) 26901226911720
slides (2) 26911517
slight [1] 27204
slightly [3] 27231719
276414
slippery [1] 273117
Slope [1] 260614
slow [7] 27548131422
2755412
slowiy [2] 274815275417
slur [2] 25952,274919
slurred (3) 26781926803
268122
siurring [1] 25999
smaller [7] 25986101617
21, 2691626965
smart [1] 270916
smarter (1) 269916
smell [5] 267715267820

27902327912527928 smelled [3] 25942527764 277817
smelling [2] 2599810
Smth [1] 268513
smoother [1] 261020
snow [2] 27311527393
so-called [2] 26162227028
sober [4] 26712267222
27782021
sobriety [5] 2670126716 9267216
socialized [2] 276414
socializing (1) 270724
socıally [1] 27726
solely [2] 26684267125 somebody [5] 267717 277991527908,27952 someone [8] 26131819
2634314263821,26397 27491027977
somewhat [2] 25949
262211
somewhere [10] 25938
27142227152272213
2724427301327449
275119275519276415
Sorry [3] 269515270916 27415
sorty [22] 26109261811
26218262710263715
26771269124269513
27032527092227133
272092721 24, 2725 12,
2727 23, 27291527416
2754 9, 276117276715
27932
sort (10) 2630824263611
26592426799270910 2724162726227282
27386
sought [1] 264617
Sound [3] 26881826894 14
sound (5] 270522271623
274910 15, 17
sounded (3] 26101726114
274918
Sounds [2] 2696 9, 27105
sources [2] 262969
South [4] 266511 13,
266769
Space [1] 264414
spaces [1] 27508
spacing [1] 261014
spare [1] 279222
spark [1] 25932
sparked [1] 25935
sparkling [1] 260811
speak [8] 2590 18, 259410
259692622 17, 26366
27204272716275718
SPEAKER [1] 259216
SPEAKERS [1] 259210
speaking [2] 2591 5, 277922
special (20) 26231215
262412264023264313
2657 19, 2668212669 14, 2326701,452672814
162673 1, 26747,27003
270246
specialist [1] 26362
specialized [2] 262817 263525
specialty [2] 2623913
specific [16] 25912225927
11121425995261324
261622631 5, 2643 13,
266672227259 11, 13 273713
specifically [9] 25914 ,
25922326079262717
265412661 16, 26781213 27712
specifics [2] 271125 272514
specified [2] 266021.
266214
specify [1] 26719
sped [1] 275721
speech [5] 2610 15, 267820
268034268122
speod [7] 2606 8, 264812 2710 20, 2746 16, 275122 27571718
speeding [2] 271020
275717
speeds [1] 275610
spell (5) 262122269020
269812773 20, 27852
spelled [2] 26221264221
spelling [1] 26983
spend [1] 27034
spent [7] 2597327002
2702112745 1, 2764 6,
2766 11, 277725
spill (16] 2688 17, 19, 26896
1526917112692523
269324 25, 2774212425
2791827962027975
split [t] 272425
spoke [9] 263721264218
2643162644327217
2772132775 23, 277714
27923
spoken [1] 259720
spot [1] 26948
spots [1] 26342
sprays [1] 267822
spring [1] 278519
stages [2] 270215270318
stairs (1) 27409
stand [1] 269014
standard [2] 26533265418 standardızation [1] 26551 standardized [1] 265421 standards [7] 262411 265417265621266210 26721926811526827 standing [4] 27321225 2773 7, 279713
stands [1] 27825
start [7] 262323264021 2700427101827126 27772278218 started [17] 2599 23, 260719 260932613 8, 12, 26229 2696152700 5, 2703 20, 2710 20, 2715 7, 2735 6, 2742232750 17, 27548 , 2786 10, 27966
starting (5] 269919273221

2750162753127546
starts [1] 27544
State [5] 268822268911
26981225276918
state [19] 25941925958
262122265219266820
2690 19, 269725269913
2739227601214276917
277320277422785 1, 8
27861216
stated [1] 27023
statement [12] 26305
265910268015268219
2764 10, 2765 12, 24, 27663
2227675 6, 276922
States [4] 2622 23, 27208
1027682
station [1] 279222
statutes [2] 2673912
stay (3] 271892327227
stayed [5] 26041626162
27191273215276420
steam [4] 2701151721
275314
steep [1] 27412
step [5] 2621 13, 26346
26842026961327735
Stepped [4] 268421
269614277310278419
stepping [1] 27153
steps [1] 26352
stern [3] 2753171922
Steve [6] 25892259517
25961826362426373
26386
Steve-driven [1] 275316
steward (2) 260215278822 stewardship [11] 2589 24,
25902681526137812
24261415
stıcks [1] 27908
stock [1] 267721
stop [5] 25892527388
274851127601
stopped $|6| 273024$
27522127568278824
279312
Stopping [1] 26568
stops \{1] 275512
store (4) 277517277725
2783619
stories [1] 27409
story 552599182638711
27181274010
Street (1) 277714
street [1] 279715
stratch [1] 269012
strident [2] 2676 25, 26771
strike [2] $2658 \quad 18 \quad 27019$
structure (1) 273912
stuck [1] 269517
Study [1] 262516
study (7) 2620102623 6,
262513 23, 2526263
stuff [6] 2752 4, 2772 11,
278692792192796 12,
279715
stumble [5] 2595 3, 2731 22,
274020 22, 274112
subject [10] 259422
25992226104262721

2642 22, 265324265823
2668226733276811
subjected [1] 266215
submitted [2] 264212
268713
Subsequent [1] 264913
subsequently [1] 279523
subsided [1] 27465
substance [2] 2627 19, 279020
substantal [2] 26602
267423
substituted [1] 271313
suffered [1] 26159
suffering [1] 266315
sufficient [1] 267122
suggest [3] 26411126777
271621
suggested [1] 26775
suggestion [2] 271222
27312
summary [3] 259422
2595 22, 268410
summed [1] 26026
Sunday [2] 2692226957
sunk [1] 259610
superintendent [2] 270216 27196
supermarket [2] 272456
supertanker [1] 261510
supervised [2] 265524
26565
supervisor [35] 2631789
1718 19, 25, 263261116
17, 1823263422126357
$1826384,26418,264425$,
2675222676181920
26774712 17, 26785
26792326801723
26811926835
supervisors [21] 261723
26302226325263616
2639626407 15, 267557
15, 2677112679 4, 6817
192680102226813
2682616
supervisory [3] 26313
2678814
support [2] 2647 25, 265218
supporter [4] 26482022 ,
26491.4
supposed [5] 26311
26781115267911274125 surface [1] 273117
surgeon (5) 2645 8, 266920
212671526721
surging [2] 25975274525
surmising [1] 26652
surprise [1] 27422
surprised (1] 27423
Surrendering (1) 26851
surrounding (4) 2596 21,
26131426153264423
Susan [1] 27776
suspend [1] 27982
suspended [3] 26639 ,
267221273913
sustainable [2] 26522224
switch [1] 275723
Swom [5] 262120269017
269723277318278424
symptoms [1] 267817
system [1] 26842
systems [1] 264425
-T-
table [1] 277523
tables [1] 276517
takes [2] 267123273623
talk [18] 2598 24, 2613 14,
2614131426161518
263212680252681 1,
27422527442227646
2768192770727791
27891122279422
talked [16] 258812261016 222426111826121319
20, 2643 8, 2675 15, 270613
2725142744 25, 27696
279423
talking [22] 2612 23, 26158
2636112644526644
26711427041270912
2710112715 3, 272414
2737212740627662
2771212772 3, 27766
27847278819278924
27901279114
talks [2] 261313267813
tanker [4] 2628102692911
tankers [9] 2692326942
2426952102122
270213
tanks [1] 274911
tape [6] 2609 5, 1114
261035275215
taxi [6] 273511 17, 23,
2736147
tea [1] 27238
teaching [1] 26229
team (1) 260219
technique [2] 262818
265625
Telephone [1] 278014
telephone [16] 261018
2611527141011274924
277542777 3, 24, 27808
19242781192124
278224
telephoto [1] 269414
telex [3] 2616345
telling [7] 259223259511
21259672605126417 26937
ten [13] 26139262224
266982743181924
274452327451274821
2761111927845
tend [1] 27478
tendrils [1] 269419
tends [1] 25969
tense [1] 27698
tenure [1] 261712
term [6] 259112263210
2652 11, 12, 2661 6, 266824
termed [1] 265415
Terminal [7] 26922274225
2770222427862327877
279211
terminal [5] 2717227365
27371627896279622

Terminology [1] 266825
terminology [1] 266923
terms [2] 264513275521
terrible [1] 26769
Terry [1] 278715
test ( 9 ] 2644232653723
265415202655145
26565
testified [12] 259910
2612121926161226403
26531326559266620
27562327581227597
27634
testify [4] 264737265019 277217
testifying [2| 263720
264510
testımonies [1] 263618
Testimony (4) 259117
25939259517259618 testing [28] $265116 \quad 19 \quad 25$ 265223515171821 23242653232654714 17181921222655225 26561268412275910 tests [12] 26535621 265492655202226793 2680161819270119 274516
Texas [1] 27854
Thank [33] 258817259222
26082325261810
262114152622219 20,
26272224264114
268419202687826886
2689182690101323
269612132698527201
2755152760527633
2771927734527855
thank [1] 27981
that'll [1] 269118
therapists [1] 267513
Thereafter [2] 25901418
thereafter (3) 26453
276112276417
they d [3] 25972267411
27912
They're [2] 265413278713 they're [16] 26043263820 2123267911268019 273761427531027598 276810277918278417 279223
they've [1] 26303
thick [3] 26922126959
thickness [3] 269221
2694423
thicknesses [1] 269317 thinkıng [6] 25935259614 16262022264513265515 third [11] 260222270059 10111827013270712 27451227483278122 thorough [1] 27508
thoughts [1] 267820 thousand [3] 26261722 26426
Three [5] 27297821 27946
three-quarters [1] 27783 throat [1] 27728
throwing [1] 27728
thrown [1] 275723
thrust [2] 27539275813
tied [1] 27141
Till [1] 271820
till [3] 2598127642021
illed [1] 27478
tumber [1] 261014
tımes [8] 260411260921
270623276889277213
1827731
tire [1] 279222
tired [1] 279025
Tom [1] 269122
tomorrow [2] 279858
tonic [7] 27271314
2733172767281322
tonics [4] $272978 \quad 27658$ 12
tonnage (2) 27139276318
topic [6] 26102261419
261922264519276925 277021
total [6] 2622242671923
26721027668277625
touch [1] 272023
tough [3] 266517276813 27702
tour [2] 261259
towards [3] 2603727553
27951
town [10| $2716510 \quad 1416$
27241627261617
27642527949
track [1] 26862
trade [1] 278620
traditıonal [1] 261318
Traditionally [1] 260214
train [1] 263919
trained [6] 263415263818 2026771426802227712
trainıng [10] 261816
261916262322679610
2680172681111415 277510
transcript (9) 2619326854
2760111227691317
2802912
transcription [1] 280210 transferred [1] 270210
transient [2] 2711127586
transmission [8] 260919 21,
22, 2610810261123,
272022
Transportation [2] 276013 27686
transportation [2] 262415 27029
transported [1] 262414
traveling [1] 269518
treated [2] 265115267525
treatıng [1] 267313
treatment [21] 26151
26272262861525
26304 19, 263124263310 18263819265813 23, 266052663 3, 266714 15,
$2668513,26735,268417$
tremendous [1] 26203
trial [4] 2588626011
276012278023
trials [1] 27597
triangle [1] 26946
trıp [4] 274112278745
279524
tripping [1] 274113
trips [3] 27592278623
27871
troopers [2] 276014276918
trouble [3] 26031112
262215
true [21] 265524265657
26581926591613
266217182663720
266413266811267325
2674726771623268125
2682727131128029
trust [1] 273922
truthfully [1] 259615
tube [1] 27476
tugs [1] 274125
turbine (2) 271012
turbocharger [10] 25975
$27098 \quad 10 \quad 13271021$
27112182719827461
27636
turbochargers [14] 270820
2425270931727106
2712152718527197
2745252746236275916
turning [1] 271116
TV [1] 27969
twice [1] 27635
two-degree [2] 2747412
type [15] 25912426309
263116263622638314
265225265322265525
2662162684827041118
27431127603
types [8] $262615 \quad 263312$
263524264421264612 26592122270119

-     - 

U S [1] 26915
Uh uh [1] 27972
ultimate (1) 26506
ultımately [3] 271213
27511275722
unannounced [1] 265124
unberthing [ [1] 260412
uncoordinated [1] 26804
undemeath [1] 279220
understand [20] 25881320
2592202598226111721
26283263013263112
26355267220267618
26782026791026871
273224273710277115
18279120
understanding [10] 261323
2617252667826874
269232713121518
272134
understands [1] 275225
understatement [1] 273923
understood [6] 25918 ,
25952126601726645
26801526974
uneven [1] 273117
unexpected [1] 262211

UNIDENTIFIED [2] 259210 16
unit [1] 261320
United (6) 26222326577
16272081027682
Universal [1] 27868
University [6] 262271221
2623226981225
Unlike [1] 259812
unlimited (1] 270116
unload [1] 259817
unreliable [2] $2677 \quad 16 \quad 19$
unruly (1] 279113
unsteadily [1] 279521
unsteadıness [1] 27937
unusual [5] 26321127428
1127461627914
upstairs [2] 271813274116 usual [1] 27428

-     - V -
vague [1] 259217
Valley (1) 278013
Vallury [10] 2665192025
26661216212667 16,
26845 9, 16
Van 5512756141623
275710275812
varied [1] 26944
varies [1] 269221
vase [1] 277716
verified [1] 27835
version [2] 25911216
versus [1] 27616
vessels [15] 259724
259821260036260317
2604112616727011522
242703120279724
vibration [2] 259725
vibrations [1] 271021
VIDEO [3] 259119259219
259518
Video (4) 25911725939
259517259618
video (5) 25912426373
2739151718
Videotape [1] 26909
videotape [1] 268922
view [15] 264219265124
2652179172653520
2658141826608 14,
267432677 4, 269520
views [4] 2642212643 6, 11
264515
violation [1] 259225
visit [2] 27437277516
vitiate (1] 267322
vodka [4] 27286727673
12
vodkas [2] 27291921
voice (9) 2610231423
26221418274915
volume [1] 26488
volumes [1] 26194
volunteered (1) 276622
voyage (6) 2612427058
27109 18, 271226
VTC [6] 26096,111418
26112
$\longrightarrow$

Basc Systerra Applezations
-W -
wagon [1] 279222
wait [6] 26061826369
2669252722227758
278217
warted [7] 26065261525
271652721212722311
27687
warting [4] 27191427225
273223273420
wake [7] 26921320
26931826942826951
274913
wakes [1] 26946
walk [10] 27251524
27311927382225
278416278913279357
walked [18] 271525
2718132726 16, 27337
274681320,274720
2764252765 2, 277521
2788 15, 2792 14, 279324
walking [9] 27311627374
2739527405278324
27951718 21, 279625
wanted [14] 2629526301
2662927241927272224
27281227341227506
275114275319275619
275725279117
wants [3] 26728275822
277020
Washington [1] 269022
waste [1] 26186
watch [7] 263119268119
2738232741172745912
27788
watching [1] 27376
water [10] 260811269214
26931826945269519
11274314274911
Wayne [1] 26227
ways [1] 26309
WCFM [1] 260223
we d [4] 268414268922
26911627254
We'll [6] $265610 \quad 11$
269014271920,272415 27982
we II [7] 2626326584
26901426971627254
276014278010
We're [2] 261223263217
we're [20] 2609 23, 262215
263521 23, 26711618
2695122697 17, 269916
27066271141216
27153274852749110
276812277022278110
We've [3] 26281276435 we've [10] 25892926052
26113826881273914
2740627608278021
weapons [3] 26241314
264412
wear [1] 27125
weather [1] 27392
week [4] 25973260812 269113
weekend [2] 27772021

FEDERAL'TRIÄL TRANSCRIPT : 5-25-94 VOLUME 17 2620826992227027 2703122704823270811 275022278617
Working [1] 278616 working [11] 25962325976
2599232703527281718 27392127531276214
2778927867
workplace [4] 26605
26802268120,26835
worrying [1] 269121
wouldn't [20] 26149
262025263813263918
26457266862673120
26754,26767268012
270424273024,273713
27618252768 18, 279716
write [1] 277621
writings [1] 26825
written [13] 26252226312
2640462641626475
2657 15, 2666 18, 2667 1, 2673 14, 26791326801021 wrong [3] 2739 16, 274721 275925
wrote [B] 26026265021
2666242685151620 27761727846

- Y -
yacht [1] 27264
yard [2] 25938270510
Yeah [19] 259121259524
26081261412263210
27254273722274111
2753112755 24, 27752
27771227843278924
27936 21, 2794120
279525
yeah (8) 259525263210 271552775727942021 25279717
year (9] 260022260818
26152026672425
2702101127031127612
Yellow [2] 278511278614
yesterday [17] 258819
25891259111259311
25941625951116
2596242597926093
2611121626121112
2618614266614
York [7] $26981225 \quad 276016$ 278111222527823
You'd [1] 26754
you'd [8] 25891510
259422672226757
26771526849
You'll [2] 26921527973
you'll [1] 260519
You ve [3] 261610277216 21
you've [24] 25968260214 2639252645 11, 26468 21, 26501026591526734 2681892684226868 2742727641276667 $27721718 \quad 25 \quad 27797$
278514279323
yours [1] 276712

Concordance by Look See(75) yourself [7] 260624262518 2626252647227052 2716927292

- Z-
zoom [1] 27759


I A It's - it's a restricted facility so only people with proper - proper Alyeska badge government officials or authonzed visitors could enter the facility in addition to ship's personnel returming to their vessels
Q Was that access control task of yours did that include
evaluating whether or not people were bringing in unauthorizud
materials on the Alyeska premises?
A Yes it did
Q Let me show you a portion of DX3499 III put it up on the
screen I only have one copy with me
Reading this note Exhibit 3459 is part of the Alyesha Port
Information Manual Was it vour understanding that possession
of firearms illegal knives illegal drugs or alcoholic
beverages was strictly prohibited?
A Yes
Q And what was your responsibility with regards to carrying out that prohibition?
A We would search the incoming baggage bags luggage that
(14) sort of thing for the incoming ships personnel
() Q The next line down reads tanker pursonnel Does that refur to people who work on tankers?
AYes
Q Returning to the terminal in such a condition that they
might require assistance to ensure thuir sate return to the
tanker will be detainted at the gate until the guard is

## Vol $18 \quad 2808$

in) satisfied that a member of the ship s company is with the
() person and will uscont them directly to the vessel Did you
(3) have that responsibility as part of vour aucess securtiv role?
(4) A Yes
(s) $Q$ And how did vou carry that out)
(6) A By intial observation of the individalal when thev returned
(7) from town in a cab or any other mode of iransportation We'd

81 watch them for any of these signs of intoxication untul they
passed through our screenang If we felt that thas existed
then we would notify the vessel to provide either one or two
people to help the individual get to the vessel if the person
(I) was in such a state that they were argumentative or combative
(is) or that sort of thing, then we would transport them down to
(14) the - to the gangway ourselves and then the ressel would
(Is) provide people to help them get over
(16) Q On that might did you say you were supervisor?

AYes
(18) Q And who was working with you that night?
(19) A Man named Charles Dudley was at the gate for vehicular
(\%) traffic There was 1 Cary Shoop who was in the CCTV monitor
(21) room and there was a Boyd Norton (ph) who was another patrolman
(22) in addition to myself
(3) Q This is Exhibit 9030 Can you identify this individuai? A That's Charles Dudley
(25) Q What was Mr Dudlcy s background?
) A He was 20 plus vear retıred Coast Guard chief pettv officer
Q And had he hucn cmploved for American - is it guard and alert'
A Yes American (ruard and Alert
Q Had he been employed at the Alveska terminal for a period of time?
A 1 believe it was somewhere close to a year at that point
Q And what was his ob assignment that night March 231989 ?
A That aight he conducted the identification process for the
(il) incoming individuals and would also do the vebicular searches
I MR LYNCH Excus me Your Honor Iapparently
misruad that That is 9130 and I dike to offer it as
9130 A Ihave a photo ot Officer Cratg which III offeras 9130 B
(Exhibits 9130 A and 9130 B offered)
MR O NEILL Noobjection
THE COURT 9130 A and B are admitted
(Exhibits 9130 A and 9130 B received)
MR LYNCH Thank you Your Honor
BY MR LYNCH
Q Now let me show you if I may a page from Exhibit DX3454
in evidence and ask you if you can identify that
A That's a copy of our gate register that documents the
activity through the main gate

## Vol $18 \quad 2810$

(1) Q Can you looking at your screen identify this signature downhere)
A That would be mine
Q And what is your procedure with reference to keeping this gate register or gate log?
A The log is intiated at just after midaght 001 and runs for a 24 hour period
Q And is it the responsibility of the persons at the gate to
makb Lntric) noting the arrival or departure of anyone who passes through the gate?
A Yes it is
Q And is it neclssarily the same person who makes each of those entries?
A No, it's not People work a six hour shift so four people
would have access to the log, in addition to anybody who might
(16) provide them a relief situation, and traffic might come through
(17) at that tume as well

Q Let me now refer you if I can to page 9 of Exhibit 3494
and specifically let me direct your attenition to the entries
at the top of the page where the entries read Roberson $J$
Glowackı J and Harllwood J?
A Yes
Q Were you present at the Alyeska security gate on the
evening of March 23?
A I was in the security office It was just adjacent to the
gate at that time

Roberson Glowachidnd Ha/clwood whenthe Mlurnad lo the
terminal that evening'
A Yes I did
Q Are you able to tull whar from vour racolluction or from
this record at what lime thev relurned)
A 2024
Q Not cvan loohing?
A No it's right there
' Q Could you point out where thal in'
A This
Q See if the light pen will work
A I'm not sure how this works but -
Q Let me just - have I highlightid the corrcul catrics'
A Yes yuu bave
Q Do you have anv wav toldll tron thin documan hou or when - who arrived with them ur how they arrived'
A They arrived at that time I here , 1 - should be mother ( U) cab driver entry on another page which would show the tume that
(-1) the cab arnved and was screened and how many people was in
1 ) the - that were in the cab and what the dispatch -
(3) Q Let me show vou page 11 of 3454 Can you find that miry +1 thers'
i s) A lt's - I may need vour help if un

## Vol $18 \quad 2812$

" Q is that the cniry'
A Yes it is
Q Now could you perhapsinturprci tor the - withurbany
way you can - not in thl Elno 11 Jucsn 1 - 111 Ir) In point
lor you as you rubll Mr Crale
Could you kll ur whal the - what thw entric, ars'
Lul satdrt hure What ducs thal itllu,
A Okat Ihe 2024 w the thote thit the seluctrin inctered through the gate
Q And that aln ide with h thol tha 4 tim $1 / 11$
Mussrs Ha/cluncod Gloud hiand Roh I on
A Yes at does
Q And then'
A l hat s the tume the cab departed the factitity
Q And that sthe name of the driver'
AYes it is
Q Yullow Cab what dous this cntry rulur to'
A That's the cab driver', badde number Niveska hadge number

Q Alycsha issues a badge to wah Jrivers -
AYes they do
$Q$ - who oplrat in $V_{\text {ald }}$,'
A That's the liceuse number of the vehicle
Q And what are these entricsover hurn'

s) at the time So the 4 would represeut that th it went to

## Vol 182814

If camer is I thank it th it time we lad just less thatu 30

## ( Huera)

1 , throushout the termin il oue which would view the securitv
1, office alud $G$ iry shoop worked there at that thme
d) Q And lat me we il 1 understand thin Mr Shoop was stting ist in a room that had monilory for lufuision tamuras thast

## 

I iten there w in
I (x) QThat covcred the room wher incoming personnel tanker

IIII I Iev III dddition to the fate ultivity
in Q What othor arcas couid Mr Shoop obvorve using these (12) cameras if you or he wished to do so'
" ${ }^{3}$ A In iddition to the of ite detivity at the security otfice adi there winc ineras throughout the termin il on each herth at
(1s) the bead of the berth and at the ead of the berth which would
IC: be the vhore ide and the ahip vide eventillv C imeras at
 (18) throughout the terminal

1) QSoll Mr Shoop wished ludow he would wwith the camera
( on un at berth 5 and waich the cab arrive and pcople discmbark)
( 1 ) A Yes We actually mant mined i separite monitor for each
1 1 berth
13. QI sucm to have mislaid my photos again
( 4) Did you have any procedure or any capability to vidcotape
(") pcople who you had un thw ramote camera)
＂A There is capability to videntape if the officer is monitoring the access and feels that the situation in the office is somehow etther out of control or could get out of control then he would mituate a viden process at that tume Q Now do you－do you recall being involved in the
screening of the four individuals who wurb in Mr French s wab
when it arrived al 2024 that a 824 -
AYes
Q-in normal limu reporting?
AYes
Q 824 pm ?
A Yes
Q Do you recall bune involved in the xracmine al thene
individuals?
A Yes
Q And could you tell the furv what you did? I m going to try
to - let me put a picture up here - not up ther Youneed
it again it scoming in il woming
Could you identify this picture?
A Yes Icma
1) Q Could you jusi describe what we re looking at huru'
, A That's the security office at the Alyeska manne terminal
i) Q And just in lurms of when the cab arrives at the Alveska
1 Terminal it arrives at a gate facility?
, AYes

## 11

mdividu is get nut
Q Whar were vou when vou did that＇
1 Back in the corner there sa printer I was Just standing next to it
Q This printar here＇
AYes
Q You whre standing hure？
AYes
Q And loohing oul this window）
A Yes
Q Coutd vou cleariv ace the cah when il arrived？
$\wedge$ Yer
Q Anduhld danいいいと
A I observed one individudl get out of the back of the cab ind then three stort to ext the other doors of the cab
（A）watched the identıfication－identification process with the
17）first gentleman and then he walked－you know he did the
（18）Identification process walked stratght past those windows
that
（19）are in the background
（0）Q These window huru）
（1）A Yes The entry door to come into the office is－
（．）Q Here？
（23）A Vot that door but just－just a few feet over
（4）Q Further off camera？
is A Yes col ${ }^{\prime}$ it ithed him go over to there and come into the

## Vol 182818

## office

Q And could vou fust－you said the identification process
sould vou fust vurv hricfly tell us what vou mean bv that？
A When iship arrives at the terminal they have in provide
1
s（rew manifest listong all the people on the vessel For them
to depart that person hav to be on the crew list and when
they
7．arnve they hive to be on the crew last So they must
provide
（8）photo identification or official identification to retura so
the officer at the gate actually verifies the identification
（10）before they are allowed to come into the office
（II）Q Ohay So iflunderstand you you watched out the window
（12）you observed one person get out of the cab and walk toward your
（13）
（14）A He got out of the cab and went to meet with the security （1s）officer for the identification process yes
（6）Q And then after completing that walked over past these
17，windows and into the sucurity office？
（18） AYes
（19）$Q$ What about the other people in the cab？
（30）A As I watched they were getting out of the cab this person （21）went right to the officer and－and finished that process and （22）as be walked in I watched hm walk over towards the front of
（3）the door and then has as be came in I initiated a screening （24）process for hım When that was complete I didn＇t see the （－s）other three guys come in the door so I looked back out there
and they were still standing outside with the security officer at the gate with the identification process
Q Now up to this point in tame - lirst ol all dad buu -
were you able to identily any ol those lour individualv by namb or did you know them independuntly'
A No, I did not
Q They were just four pcople?

## AYes

Q Did you see or observe anything which caused you concern
from your point of view of security that you either had a
problem with someone introducing contraband or that you had
probiem with somebody who might be in a state where they
wouldn t be safe on the property?
A No I did not
Q Did you see any stumbing or any other sign that would
cause you conctrn'
A No I did not
Q None of the lour'
A No
Q Did you have reason to bu concurnud aboul Mr Frunch' A Mr French bad been reported sometime eariter as being
condut to bootleg booze in for seamen We had initiated a process sometume before that for a tughter screenug of the cabs and even hand wand screemang of the cab drivers but nothing had turned up in any of those searches

## Vol 18 2820

Q So when Mr French arrived he was someone who al last you
() had concurn might be involved in trving to bring wontraband onto the propuriy'
A The officer at the gate would have had that cuacern yes
Q I uscd the you muaning the Amurioan fuard'
A Oh okay yes
Q And Mr Dudluy was the ulli ur dl the edle'
A Yes hewas
Q And his responniblll wavit he h the abluriv $r$ ind the tab'
AYes
Q And then what nuxi happincd with tho thru individuals who stayed out or who didn itome in with the lirst parson'
A Once the identufication process was complete then they followed the same route as Mr Mchregor walked past those
window - those windows excuse me watched them walk by the
(17) wadows they came into the office door one peeled off to go
(18) to the restroom which is farther off to the right down a short
(19) hallway The other two presented thear baggage onto the ( on counter and Ig ive them separite ir witor met il objects that
, they anght have on their pervon $t$ antructed them an thit process and then screened their $h$ ubalge
(3) Q Bear with mu just onc sucond whil I sce il I ian get a nuw (4) picture here

51 Is this an accurate picture of the gate structure as it
existed on March 23 1989?
A Yes it is
Q And the arriving cab would come in here?
A Yes
Q And then you observed the people - the cab was a station
wagon or something?
A Yes
Q And one got out of the back door?
AYes
Q Was it one of those back doors that open sideways?
AYes
Q And then the others got out of thu passenger area?
AYes
Q And where would Mr Dudley have been? Here?
A He would actually have been out of the - that shack to
meet the vehicle
Q About here?
A Physically outside yes
Q And then you observed the first tellow walk over what in through here?
AYes
Q And then you watched the other three walk through there?
A Yes
Q Ohay Now did you observe the other three from the tume
they left the island here untal they passed out of your sight

## Vol 182822

(1) past those windows?
(1) A Yes
(3) Q And that was because you were wondering why they were
(4) delayed and hadn itome in with the first individual?
(5) A Well I would normally try to observe that process
(6) Q Now in watching them walk did you sce yul any sign to
(7) cause concern on your part about whether they might be impairad
(8) or a danger to themselves or danger to the property?
(ज) A No I did not
(10) Q So nuther the lirst fullow nor the other three caused you
(II) any - gave you any reason up to that point to be concerned?
(12) A Correct
(13) Q Ohay Thenthey re in the - in the security room Could
(14) you describe then what process you went through with the three
(15) who came in afterwards?

UAI A As $I$ touched onetrier they came in through that door
(17) that has the window in it and the crash bar One of them
(18) peeled off to the left as they orrived - would be the right on
(19) that picture - two of them appronched the counter set some
( 7 ) baggage and 1 beineve a couple of pizzas on the counter I
( ") have them two suall trays to you know put personal metal ( ${ }^{\circ}$ ) objects in went through the bags the gentlemen went through
1 3, the screeung which is smalar to au airport metal detector
( 1) They picked up their personal effects on the other side and (-s) ouce I fiushed screening the baggage then handed that back to

```
Vol 18 2823
| them as well and then thes stood night in between the two
/ counterg wating for the other gentleman to come out of the
, restroom at which time we just intided some small talk
not
about anvthing that I con remember fust stond there and
l llked
Q Did you notlus - lirst of all did vou know at this point
whoanvol thow thrusindividuals werl?
A No I dad not
Q Did you later learn who those three individuals wure'
A Yes I did
Q And how did vou maccriain thal'
A With the gate register log
Q That , the log that we looncod at hefore'
A Yes
Q 3494`
A Yes
Q And do you have anv information or anv way to ascertam
, where Capla!n Harelwond was or who Caplan Harelwond was
Imone
(4) the threc'
()) ANo
1 Q Do vou have anv wavioiduntilv whuthurhe \thu individual
whowent to the rutronm'
, A I don't have recollection of which n|f it иня
| Q So the third individual came out ol the rouruomi'
& AYes
```


## Vol is 2824

- Q Whal happoncd thun)
, A Then he presented a bag of some surt that 1 went through
" as well Provided him a singulartriy for his personal met il
' objects Thev talked to him it the tame bouknow lie way
, going through Ife proceeded through I handed him his personal
, stuff They all three stood there ind wited fir ham toset
you know the thang ont of the tras inlked iltite hat then
s) they proceeded out the door and reentered the cab

Q Now from the lims vou saw themarrive in the lime they spent with vou in the sucuritivalfica to the ume thev sxited and went to the cah did you sec anvihing which suggested io , you if any of them was under the influencl or impared by alcohol'
A No I did not
Q Did vou see anvihing loindicalc thal thuv were in any wav lacking in coordination stumbling or waihing lunny? A No I did not
18) Q Anything ahoul thur vpeech that indicated in you that thw (9) might be using alcohol'

A No Id didnot
( 11 Q Okay Now at that point in lime March 1989 was it a
, regular part of wour rovponohility al the swartiv zalc ta
(") watch for alcohol vigno wl alcohol on incoming lanker people'
(4) A Yes
'i Q And did you obicrve thal occurring' I mean had you seen


5-26-94 VOLUME 18
Q Now subsequantl have vou had oceasion to get - be involved in lesting arriving tanker men -
AYes
Q - for blood alcohol level or breath alcohol level?
A Yes I have
Q And have you - have you had occasion to see what test
results you get with what signs of alcohol consumption that you observe?
A Yes
Q Let me see if I can tollow this Your practice is - is
your practice to にst uvurv arriving tanker man at present?

## A The tanker men that depart

Q That are coming into the Alyeska Terminal?
A Not every one We don't test every one of them, no
Q You test them if you see something that leads you to think you should"

## A For probable cause, yes

Q And based on the standards that you would use probable
cause standards that you would use do you believe that you would have tested these individuals - that you had any probable cause to test these three individuals on the night of March 237

## ANo

Q Onc last question Have you everdiscussed with Mr French
his rolu or his involvument in the delivery ot Captain

## Vol 182830

Hazelwood and Messrs Glowackı and Roberson to the Alyeska Terminal that night?
A Yes I beleve it was the next day or shortly after, I had ia iuterview with him where he provided a statement and I discussed with hum the situation At that tume he didn't feel lake he was the driver who brought the - the particular udividuals back Ile did say that he brought people back that
s) ught the tume frame wasn't exactly the same as what we had
(9) but he didn't think that it was those particular individuals
(10) Q And did you - did you check in to determine whether to
(II) your own satisfaction you had correctly described identufied

French as the cab driver who brought -
A Yes
Q - those three people?
A Yes
Q What was your conclusion?
A I hal he was the call driver who brought in those mdıviduals
MR LYNCH I have no lurther quistions Your Honor
(0) THE COURT You may cross cxaminalion
(1) MR O NEILL Keep that in your hand
(ב) THE WITNESS Thanh you
(3) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL CRAIG
(24) BY MR O NEILL
(7) Q Sir my name is Brian O Neill We met yesterday for about
ten minutes
A Yes we did
Q And I even told vou what questions I was going to ask you didn tI?
A Yes
Q Now Iamcurious I had understood that you had met
briefly with the - the Exxon Defendants at some point in time
is that a correct statement?
A Yes
Q Where did you learn how to use the trial link pen that you have in your hand?
A Have I - I don't know if I've used it lust previous to arriving here said I might have to pornt out vou know something with it but I don't know
Q And you knew how to click twice on the lefi hand side to bring up the color?
A They said something would come up on the side but I haven't been able to figure it out
Q You were ready you had the pen in your hand and you knew
where the bar codes were on the left hand side and I didn I go into that with you did I?
A (Shakes head from side to side )
Q You re an Alveska security guard that a correct statement isn 1 it?
A I'm a security officer with American Guard and Alert for

Vol $18 \quad 2832$

## (1) Alyeska yes

(2) Q Who works for Alyesha And Alycska is a consortium of oil
(3) companses and 20 percent of Alyeska is owned by Exxon Pipeline
(4) Company which is a wholly owned subsidiary of Exxon
(5) Corporation that a a correct statement isn 1 it?
(8) A I'm not sure what the percentage breakdown is but I do
(7) know that they are one of the owner companies
(8) $Q$ You have given a variety of interviews and have been
(9) deposed and have testified and I don $t$ recall the subject of
(10) the two pizzas coming up in any of your prior testimony do
(II) you?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q It does?
(14) A Yes
(1S) Q Your testimony about this cab going through was a litte
(16) over 30 minutes In point of fact they were there for two or
in three minutes isn that right?
(18) A It was a short penod of tume
(19) Q Very brief short period of time And your testimony about
(1.0) it was ten times longer than they were there isn that a
(21) correct statement?
(22) A Yes 2t 15
(3) Q And with regard to the log the Alyeska log if someone
( 4 ) came back in March of 1989 and had a few drinks and you noticed
(25) that they had alcohol on their breath you didn ilog it in
(1) did vou?
() A That's correct
(3) Q And if they were unsteady on their feet or their speech
(4) were slurred you didn ilog that in either did you?
(s) A Correct
(6) Q Now wa lalked lor d minut that il looh two or three
(7) minutus this procidur and vou don 1 hnow who was who
which
181 one was Hayclwnod which ne was Glnwacki which one was
(9) Roberson jusi don (hnow)
110) A Correct
(11) Q And one of them went - came in and went immediately to the
(1) bathroom?
(13) A Yes
(14) Q And would it be fair to sav at that point in time in March
(IS) of 1989 when people came in you didn $t$ screen them
(16) purposefully as to whether they $d$ been drinking or not did
(17) you?
(18) A I'm not sure I understand the question
(191) Q Now when somebodv goes through you testified that you
( 0 ) have these breathalyzers and stuff?
( 11 AYes
1 ) Q And now in 1994 when somehndy goes through the terminal
' 31 you din purpasclullv chach tham in and out in see whether
thev d
( () buendrinkıng'
(s) AYes
(I) Q And that procedure is new since the grounding isn itt?
, $\mathbf{A}$ Yes
(3) Q And at the ime of the grounding you didn t do that purposufully did you?

## A We didn't do the actual testing no

Q And vou didn i regularlv and programmatically screen them
lor whether they d buen drinking or not did you?
A Not just for drinking no
Q And indeed on the night shift when people came through
the night shift they $d$ come back after drinking and that was a
very very common occurrence wasn it?
AYes
Q And they d go through the gate?
A Yes
Q And many of theas people who had been drinking made it down
(16) the long Lausewav and madc il up the gantry over to their
"17) vesselv like salors have done for years isn that right?
(18) A Yes it is
(191 Q And would it be fas to say sir you talked about your
(20) perceptive abilities and recognizing somebody who had been
(21) drinking and you have a little more training than most in
(22) that don i you?
(23) A Littlemore yes
(24) $Q$ And it s harder to tell if someone s-the Coast Guard
(25) limit is 04 isn $t t^{?}$ ?


-     - Vol ix 2839

Vol is 2841
$Q$ And in this situation vou didn $t$ see signs to cause vou to test even if you were using the zero tour standard is that correct?

## A That is true

Q Now let sassume for purposes of this discussion even it
the person had hlond alcohol level of 10 based on your
training and experience do you belmeve vou would have bserved
signs of blood alcohol level of 10 in anv of these
individuals?
A Yes I do
Q What if the alcohol level of one or morl of them whr 20
do you believe it spossible that someone with a 20 could have
waiked through that checkpoint and you not observь " $^{\text {? }}$
A It would be verv unlikelv
Q And did you see anything - you didn I know who Captain
Hazelwood was did vou?
AI did not
Q And you didn 1 know Mr Glowackı or Mr Roberson or what
was the - Mr McGregor?
AYes
Q Did you see any reason to differuntiate between them?
A No I did not
Q You didn thave any reason to think that all of them were alcoholics did vou?
A No I did not

## A ABS ven

(1) Q What sthe function - this has been mentioned before here
(a) bya Mr Rich Van Hammen What sthe tunction of the

American
(4) Bureau ot Shipping' He described it as kind of the FAA of the
(s) maritime indusiry How would you describe if?
(6) A Our role is to set destgn standards and construction
(7) standards for merchant vessels of all types worldwide

We're
(8) one of about four organizations woridwide recognized to set
(9) standards for the design and construction of vessels
marine
(101 vessels
"ll QAll $\mathrm{n}_{e} \mathrm{ht}$ sir
(1) A And also for the minn lands
"la, Q We ru not going to spund anymore time with the American
(1t) Burcau ol Shipping but we are going to a time when you were
(191 cmploycd by Exxon But before that could you tell-deseribe
1161 tor thc Ladies and Gentlemen of the Jury vour education
(17) background educational backgrounds?
(18) A Yes I graduated from the U S Coast Guard Academy un
(19) 1959 I saled aboard Coast Guard vessels for about four
(0) years
( 11 Q Wail a minult When vou graduated from the United States
r_) Coast Guard Acadımy - where is that located?
(i) A Connecticut Vew I ondon Connecticut


1 s) Q New London Connesticut And did you come out of there
a) with a duyrch or a lucane or how did you emerge from that
Vol 182842
institution other than tired?
A I had an ensign commission I was commassioned as an
ensign in the C Coast Guard I had a bachelor of science
degree in engineering I ilso was a - I was qualified for
both deck operition and engineering operntion I was - I
what ic illed idouble ender We came nut both qualified 10

## handle deck ind engine operation of versels

Q Now I came out of Officers Candidate Schooi in the Marine Corps as second lieutenant Is an ensign the same thing?
A Yes same thing
Q For those who may have been in the Army or Air Force?
A Yes same grade
Q After you got out of there where did you work?
A I had positions afloat on three different vessels over a
course of ahout four years First year as a deck officer
deck
$(161$ watch officer the last three years as an engineering watch
officer up to equivilent of a first assistant engineer in a merchant type of connotation
Q And this was for the United States Coast Guard?
A Yes Sailing aboard Coast Guard vessels
Q All right sur So you were with the Coast Guard for about nine years?
(23) A Yeah, the - after the four years afloat the Coast Guard (7) assigned me to the Unuversity of Michugan for two years where
(9s) I received a master's degree in naval architecture and in

い mechanical engineering during that four yedr period during
(2) that two year penod
(3) Following the University of Michigan, I was assigned by the
(4) Coast Guard to manne techncal work for four years prumarily
(s) federal regulation activity associated with the design and construction of $\mathbf{U} S$ merchant vessels I did that for four years
Sometume during the course of the last year I enrolled in an evening program at New York Uunversity and I contunued that
no1 evening program for about five years and graduated in 1971 with
[1] a master's degree in international business
(II) In 19 - the end of 1968 which was after about almost ten 13) years on actuve duty, I resigned my commission And a short
(4) tume after that I took a position with ESSO International which was an affilhate of Exxon and I was a marine research engineer
Q Before we go into that you went into the Coast Guard as an ensign cquivalent of a second Ilculunent What was your ranh
when you ten years later or almost lun years later when you
resigned Irom the Codat Guard '
A Lieutenant commander which is equivalent in wour ;
udnat
( I life to a major
3) Q Well I m not sure il scquivaluat but the ranh
(4) equivalent
(5) All right Youbcuamucmployudbv Exaon then in 1968

## Vol 182844

, Vary bricfly bucausc I want to gothrough this dustribu your jub cxpericatcs with Exxon'

## A Well I-I was hired -

Q Or ESSO Intcrnatoonal sami thing' A I was hared by $f$ SSO Internatanal all in irame revearch and
study the safety aspects af trampourting hiquefied a itur al
gas At that time the compint had ibip proprimito develop
and build what was known as I V(, I nkers and thes were concerned
about the safety of the design of the vessel and they wanted an
101 outside look so I was hired My first project was - was the safety aspects of I NG transportatiou That lasted about that particular project lasted about two years and I don't know if you want me to go through -
Q Jusi yuich
A Okay I-I then moved into icommercial position a litte bit later 1971 I was moved tu lapan where i headed up
17. a tean of about 44 engineers where we reviewed the desigu and
(18) then the construction of inumber of lirget inkers for Exxon
(19) I came back to New York in '76 I was in a marketing
©) position and then in a corporate staff position in New York
, 1 with responsibility for reviewing the overall operational
, Safety of Exxon's fleets worldwide
1979 I was assigned to what was then the fixion - or tixion L S A manne department and I wis in charge of planaing and
 uf
(1) the corporate planning department for Exxon Then in 1982 ,
(7) became the president of Exxon Shipping Company actually I
is became the general mingaer of the mirme dep irtment and d few
(4) months later I hecame the president of $\mathbf{F}$ xyon thipping Company

51 Q In 1982 then to get down to it voubecame president of
Exxon Shipping Company?
$\Rightarrow$ A Yes sir
Q And Exxon Shipping Company in the company that owned
the
Exxon Valdez as of March $23 \quad 19897$
A That's correct
Q When did you luave the Exxon companies?
A I belseve it was April 2nd of 1990
1131 Q And became chairman of the board of ABS?
(14) A Yes At that time I was chairman president and chief (Is) executive officer
(i6) Q When you became - and let sexpand now We vebuen
(17) talking taking littl bits of what Exxon Shipping Companv was
(18) or little stortes here or there When vou hecamc prusident ol
(19) Exxon Shipping Company what was the mission of Exxon Shipping
(0) Company?
( i) A It was our role to transport crude onl and refined (in) products primanly for Fxxon but we also handled some smaller
3 magnitudes of product for other companies Id aay 95 percent
( 4) of our job was associated with moving $F$ axon oil and products
(5) Q When vou savoil and produch you would trinsport the

```
            Vol 18 2846
crude oll to a relincry in some ul your visscis)
A Yes
(n) \(Q\) And some of your vessels would some out the other ind
``` lake
(s) the product from the other end of that retinery gasoline Jt
(s) fuel et cetera and transport those products to some other location?
A Yes Both refined petroleum products and also chemic il products
Q And chemicals All right sir How was the company over
(10) the years you were there Exxon Shipping Company organized?
(i1) A Your headquarters unt was in Houston We had four field
(1) offices New York Baton Rouge Baytown Texas and han
(13) Francisco In each of thone field offices we had the peopie
(14) that primarily interfaced with the ships IIouston was
(15) primanly corporite function and a lot of our time was spent
(16) interfacing with our chent our customer Exxon Company

USA
17) The operation, were really controlled out of those four field offices
(19) Q And were there diffirent - did you have different fleets?
( 01 A Yes We - we actudllv divided the operation intoa-a
( 1 ) gulf coast fleet which we managed out of - primanly out of , I Baytown Texas a west coast neet which we managed prmanily
( ) out of San Francisco ind we also had in inland fleet which was
(4) managed both out of New York and Baton Rouge I oussiana
(25) \(Q\) And an inland fleet that means a fleet of tugs tugboats
, and barges that operate on the inland waterwavs the
Mississippi the Ohio and so forth?
A That's correct That's nght
Q We ll leave that one alone When vousad that the west
ndal llabl uad upuriled out il San Francoso the name of
Buncaha hacn manlionad hura
A Yes the - Fivon his alarge refinerv in Benicia and
thit , where our vessels dock to discharge their crude oil to
the refinery Benici C Ihforma And our office the Exxon
Shipping Company office also was in Benicia
Q And the headquarturs or the shorcsidc pcople of the west
cosast llut hlat Bunicia?
AYes
Q Now you said the gulf coast fleet was at Baytown?
A Yes Baytown Texas
(161 Q Where - tell me something I would recognize that Baytown
(17) is close to
(18) A Well it h partwiv between Houston and Galveston I
don't
(14) know if that helps
(10) QWell nola lot But down thuru nuar Gaiveston?
( 11 A It's close to the Sin Incinto Monument
, Q Not much help hul l have rad the booh What was the size
; 3) of the total thut now' Laving out the inland harges and
+1 tuks but the total of the wast coast theet and the gulf coast
, thel when vou became president?

\section*{Val 18 2848}

AI think we had - I don \(t\) recall exactly when I became
1 president but shortly therehfter we had 20 ocean tankers
that
(3) we were operating and we ilso had \(\mathbf{4 3}\) chartered vessels that
(4) were under our control but we were not operating those with
(9) our people

Q So you had 20 vessels you owned and operated and then
you
(7) chartered some vassels from other companies?

A Yes sir
Q Now when you - how many puople were employed when
you
1301
Iirst rointd Exxon Shippinz Company'
A In both the inland and ocean fleet together was about
1500
(1) people I think about \(\mathbf{1 2 0 0}\) were in the ocean fleet
(13) Q And when you - when you resigned I guess retired would be
(14) a good word you d been there 20 some years hadn ( you?
"ls A Yes but I resigned I did not retire I had to he 55 to \|l 1 retire and I was 52 when I left
(17) Q Good for you When you resigned from Exxon Shipping
(18, Company what was the size of the - leaving aside the inland
(19) barges what was the size of the Exxon Shipping Company
flee?
( 01 A 1 heloeve we atill had 20 vessels at that tame
(1) Q And how many pcople did vou cmplov?
( ) A I believe it was still around \(\mathbf{1 2 0 0}\) in the ocean fleet
(3) Q Ohav Mr larossi when you foined Exxon Shipping Company
(24) was there a first principal under which you sought to operate
( i) the company and the iransportation services provided bv the

\section*{ompany"}

A Yeah our - our mission was to move + anon \(s\) product in absolutely the safest manner we could so our first objectıve was safe operatuons
Q What Mr larossi did you do to maku sure the company
operated under that first principal of safely?
Could I have the - I d like to show - maybe I II show it
before I show -
MR NEAL There s no objection to this so III offer
Defendants 9131 into evidence Your Honor
(Exhibat 9131 offered)
MR O NEILL No objection Your Honor
THE COURT Defendants 9131 is accepled
(Exhibil 9131 receaved)
MR NEAL While I mhere I also offer Defendants
Exhibit 3679 and then Planniffs Exhibils 798 and 797
(Exhibils 3679798 and 797 ollurud)
MR O NEILL No objection Judg
THE COURT Defendants 3679 is admitled Plainuffs
798 and 797 - did I get those right'
MR SANDERS That scorrect
THE COURT - are admitted
(Exhibits 3679798 and 797 received)
BY MR NEAL
( s) Q Mr larossi you said you tricd to operalc the vassel under

\section*{Vul 182850}
safety Does safety make good sense just in a business aspect?
A Oh, absolutely Ithik most busınesses recognize that a safe operation makes a lot of sense from i busmess standpoint The costs of handing probleass are very very high, so if you were to look at - at operations of any business strictly from a cost standpoint you d come out with
(7) the same answer and that is a vale operation s -

Q You cant -
A - is a successful operation
Q You can thave an clficicnt praclict without having a salc operation is that what you re saying?
(I) A You can't have an efficient uperation you alsoc in thave
(13) a successful operation
(14) \(Q\) What steps did you take to operate the company under this
(is) principal first prineipal of safety? And let s go over them
(101 and then we ll go back and talh about each one
(17) A Okay The first concept was that we needed to have a us, commitment throughout the orgamization that s ifety \(w\) is our
1/91 number one objective and we needed to have apreement that that
( 0) throughout the orgauzation th it th it commitment is is number
I) one We needed to have both variabie proger iniv ind dwareness
( ) programs that keyed always an the einplovee, mind that thes was
(13) our objective and to do that we needed to really be dealing
(24) with permanent employees and that may seem rather obvious but
(_S) in the marine industry a lot of times companies deal - do not
(1) deal with permanent employees Within Exxon Shipping Company
( ) all of our seagoing employees were permanent employees They
(3) had the same rights and benefits that any Exxon employee had
(4) Q All right
(s) A Also, we had to - to deal with in my view it was very
(6) smportant to deal not only with permanent employees, but to
(7) make sure that the crews on our vessels served
continuously
(8) In other words we had a continusty within the crew as
(9) contrast to some companies where every tume a seaman comes off
(10) leave he would go to a different shap
(11) What we were trying to do in Exxon Shipping Company was (12) always return the officers and crew members back to the same
(13) ship because we felt that was very important to the safe
(14) operation of the ship, particularly if anything was to go (15) wrong, because in a response situation when there's a lot of
(16) pressure it's very important to know what other people in the
(17) team are doing and how they're responding, and that you can
(18, only get by familianzation by traming as a team and by
(19) having that expenence and confidence
(7o) So aot only was it permanent employees, but it also was
(-1) continuty of crew members
( \()_{1}\) Q I was going to come bach to thes but since we ve gone in
1) a little bit of depth on purmanent employees and continuty of
( 4) cruw Itake continuily of criw means if you re going to assign
(IS) Iwo masicrs to the Valde7 -

\section*{Vol 182852}

A Yes
(2) Q - so that they alternate with each other 60 days on 60
(3) days off they will stay on the Valdez and not - for a long
(4) puriod of time and not go to some other vessel?
(s) A When they finsh - for sustance when they would finush
(6) their \(\mathbf{6 0}\) days on board they would go on vacation 60 days
(7) When they would come back from vacation they would go back to
(8) the same ship
(v) Q Would that be true of the other officers the first second
(10) and third mate?
(11) A The chief mate chief engineer, first assistant engineer
(12) second mate, we had a high degree of continuity When we
get
(13) down to third mates and third engineers I'd say we were not
as
(14) fully utalizing continuity Maybe 5060 percent of the time
(1s) vou'd go back to the same ship whereas the higher officers
(16) almost a hundred percent
(17) Q But you could do it with the higher officers and the
(18) master,?
(19) AYes
( \(0_{1}\) Q Now you talhad sbout permanunt employees Mr larossi
1 I During your pariod of timu and up to the brounding where did
1 I most maritime companics gul thuir cmployees shipping
13) companies?
(-4) A Most of the shapping companies drew thear employees from
(25) unions from the mantume unions out of - assigned out of
union halls or through some agreement
Q Let stake Mr Kunkel who stestified here and your
captains such as Captain Staizer or Captain Hazelwood they
were full time employees paid an annual salary is that correct?
A Yes They were hired most of them right out of the merchant marine academies and then came up the ranks withu
) Exxon
Q Let stake these companes that you said where most of the shipping companies who used the national union How did how
Ilt would they get a first mate or a second mate or a third mate , for example?
A They would usually call the union and siv thev needed 1 first mate on such and such a ship leaving such and such a day
Q In other words if nne of these type of companics had a trip to go from Long Beach to Valdez they would go out and call and get a first mate to come from the hiring hall and get on the vessel?
A Yes Maybe for one trip or inavbe for i period of time whatever he was assigned
Q Would the master - would the masice for cxample
necessarily know about the qualifications or training of these officers?
A Well he would know what therr Coast Guard license was or

A M, understanding is he would know he san A certified by
, the Cuast Guard
Q We ve gone through agreement on the goal of safety
permanent employees continuitv and motivation What s
well trained emplovees? Talk about that
A Well we knew to have a truly safe operation we had to
provide proper training and that was our obligation to provide
training to our emptovees so thev could do the job safely and
" it menit we needed to have iven wide range of training programs
Q Let mu go bach up there to agreement on safe operations
and
1 ash to show you Dulundants Exhibil Number I-number 70 -
170 Ibulicve Yes Defendants Exhibit 170
MR NEAL MayIapproach Your Honor'
THECOURT Yes
BY MR NEAL
Q And ash if you recognize that?
\(\Lambda\) Yes This is the vafetr credo of Fxxon Shipping
Company
Q Was that sometheng that was vour idca?
A Theidea to create d adfetv credo was partly mine and
pirts other managers in the shopping company The words
of
, the credo itself were developed through a -
Q Excuse me fust a moment It il put this up so you can see that
A The actual words of the credo were developed by a group
of

\section*{Vol \(18 \quad 2854\)}
what their riting wis
Q In other words he would know they werv hucnsed an a third
mate?
AYes sir
Q Orheensed as a qecond mate'
A Yes
Q But he wouldn (know any more than that nccossarily'
A Unless he knew the individual personally I dun't kuow whatever information he would have
Q How about able bodied seamen who would go on the ship and
11) act as helmamen would thev also be taken from a hiring hall
for say one trip or two trips and that sort of thing?
3) A In the case of Exxon Shipping Company no
(14) Q No no the other companies?
(1s) A Other compantes I would say for the most part by and
(10) large they also drew from union union hails union ranks
in \(Q\) So in the case of an \(A B\) able bodied seaman who was going
(18) to be a helmsman what would the master know about that A B
( \((9)\) when he came oul from the hiring hall?
(.0) A He would know he had an able bodied seaman in his

\section*{papers}
( 1 ) from the Coast Guard
1 ) Q Certificate?
(-3) A Certificate
(4) Q And the Coast Guard would say they were an able bodied
(S) seaman and that sall they d know unless he knew the man?

Vol \(18 \quad 2856\)
employees both fleet operating employees and shoreside employees. They got together and established the wording of
(3) the credo ind it was h fairly large group and It thak they
olso sent out drafts of the credo fleet wide and asked for
vuggevtions from - from anshodv in the companv and what came
out was -
Q Can t coms up' Ohav Wcil ust hold that up there while you talk thlrl Mr larossi
A This happens to be the words printed on a steel plate and
put on a board and it was the type of thang that hung in all
of our offices and all of our ships to remind people There
were different versions of this they were priated on posters and -
Q What does that - what does that say Mr Iarossi" A It st irts out safetv credo It savs we the management and emplovees of Fxxon Shipping Company believe that while
:17, naks evint and theil there \(\boldsymbol{i}\) dist of wax pointed items The
(18) first one says accidents and injurnes are preventable each of
(19) us has a personal responsibility for our safety and the safety
(ro) of others both on and off the job No business objective is
( I) so amportant that it will be pursued at the sacrifice of
(2) safety safe conduct of operations as a condition of
employment
(73) at Exxon Shipping Company
( 4) What we meant by that is that if you don't carry out your
is) activities safely it was a potential for termination The

Vol \(18 \quad 2897\)
words - I'm trying to explain to you the words say safe
1 conduct of operations is a condition of employment at Exxon
(3) Shupping Company The fifth item says a job 15 well done only
(4) If it is done safely And the last one says Exxon Shipping

Company should have the best safety performance in the industries in which we do business
Q And that was the safety uredo that vou and othurs developed
when you became president ol Exxon Shipping Company'
A Yes I-I took part in the idea of creating the safety,
credo I did not take part in the words that were actually developed
Q What did you do with that?
A We gave it very great publicity withon the company We made sure that everyone in the company was aware of their safety credo We had plaques made up like this which were posted on all vessels, in all offices We had very big posters made up about it and we actually went over it in safety conferences and shipbodrd conferences went over the words
(19) what they meant how that - how these words pertaned to ( O) individual activities that different eimplovees carried out and
1 11 we basically tried to get evervbody to understand nut only what
1 I the credo was but what it meant to them and how thes do their
(3) Jobs
(4) Q You mentioned that you would try to - one step you would
i st take for safety was to motivatu the cmployces to follow the
 dlso
(8) have - ds I recall there was also a cash contribution to the ship's morale fund The ships that rectived the awurd for the
(0) year would get money to spend whether to buy new bonks for
ill their library or a new TV or somethug like that
1) We would also send all of the - to all of the employeer
" 3 , that sailed on that vessel for that vear that \(p\) irticular iear that the vessel received the valet in ird thes would pet brouze gold buckle, with all inscription of the slup und the tume and the safety award for the ye ir
We would also have different awards during the course of the year in which we would recogmite viperior vifets for different circumstances and we would award baseball caps with
( 0 ) the names of the vessels and jackets with the safety awards
( 1 ) embelisshed on them and we did a whole lot of things to try
1 , and keep awareness and attention fucused on s ifety
(3) We also had a program to - to try to muprove safety at
( 4) home And once a quarter we would send to all the employees'
irs homes sometimes differeat gadgets I remember oue tıme we
(1) sent a fire extinguisher like type thing you should keep in () your katchen Along with it we sent the booklet that described
(3) the risks of fire in kitchen and how to handle it And another
(4) tume we sent a flashlight home and we described what to do when
(s) power's out at home Another time we had a few injurnes from
(6) lawnmowers so we sent the little cartoon booklet home
(7) Q We re getting a litule far now from the - from the
4) supertankers
(9) A You get me started, you have to tell me when to stop
(10) Q Let me show you Defendants Exhibit 9118 I won take a
(11) lot of time with this It \(s\) in evidence
(12) Is this an example of some of your internal awards that you
(13) would give to motivate people for safety?
(14) A Yes Each of those plaques represents an award
assıgned or
(IS) given to a vessel for one year, whether it was the gulf coast
(16) fleet or west coast fleet The plaques up on the top there,
(17) you see that httle rectangular brass plaque, the buckles
(18) actually duplicated that award at the top Those were given
\(t 0\)
(19) each of the employees on the ship
( 01 Q So the Exxon Valdcz the record rellects got the fleet
( 11 managtr saward for 1987 and 88 the cmployees on that
vussel
1-1 got onc of these belt bucdles -
(3) A Yes
(24) Q-as well
(2s) AYes

\section*{Vol 182860}
i) Q Now Mr O Neill brings this oul I ve loohed through here
i) and I ve looked through hure and I don I see the Exxon Valdez
(3) on this Why not?
(4) A I cau only tell you I suspect that may have been taken off If the thip with a whole lot of other items and evidence that were
(6) taken off the shup
(7) Q Thure s no question howevur that the Exxon Valdez got the (8) fleet manager saward for 19871988 ?
(9) A Yes As I remember it was - there were two vessels who
(10) received an award in 1987 in the west coast fleet the Valdez
(II) and one other vessel it was decided to recognize both And
(I) then in 1988 the Valdez won the award by atself in the west
(13) coast flett
(14) Q Now Mr larossi did you also in order to motivate the
(19) employees to the goal of satety did you include this as an
(16) Itum on the ivaluation of employees purformances?
117. A Ye, vafety dw irenten ind , ifely cominousness is one
of
(18) the \(\mathbf{2 0}\) or \(\mathbf{2 5}\) items that edch officer aud shoreside employee
was
(19) graded on on roughly itwo vear frequency
( 0 ) Q Lel me see if I can raise this up
(21) A Yes Safety awareness
(2) Q Now these are in alphabetical order not necessarily order
(7) of importance but alphabetical order?
(-4) A I belseve so but I'd have to look at the whole chart agan
(s) to tell vou

Q Well you ve got \(K \mathrm{~L} M \mathrm{M} \mathrm{O}\) that looks like alphabetucal order to me A Okay
Q Was this - was this an element of evaluation for all the officers then and the crew?
A Yes Of all the officers I'm not sure if the crew's form was different
Q You also sav - you can tahe that away
You say you want a fleet wide clear set of operating instructions how did vou attempt to do that?
A Well we felt we had to establish safe operations ond sife operating procedures for all of what we felt were the critic il aspects of ship operation Probably the most ımportant mitiative we took was development of what we call the bndge
ifl organization and navigation manual which was very extensive
(i7) major revision in around 1983 or so but it was a manual which
(18) outhned the responsibilities and roles and approach and
procedures that needed to be followed for the operation und
nol navigation of our vessels
( 11 Q And were the masters and officers riquired to follow the instructions in this manual?
(3) A Yes It was - it was put forward as the manner in which
(4) the company wanted its vessels operated Certain segments of
s) it were guidance cert in uegments of it were requirements

\section*{Vol 182862}

Q Now was - did this bridge navigation manual was it required to be read and studied by every officer and was il required to be placed on evirv vissel?
A Yeah there were two copies assigned to every vessel
One
as was to be in the indster a cabin and one wis to be on the
bridge The officers heing assigned to the vessel there w is
d
7) signed sheet in the front of the manull where they had to
sign
8) that they read it and understood it

Q All right Let us - did this manual have this first
principal safety in it?
A Yes
Q Could we have that 11 : \(2^{7}\)
I mgorng to show you the part of the manual that salready
in evidence and ask if vou recognize this
Go ahead to the section first page Do you recognize
that?
A Yes
\(Q\) Is that part of the manual you retalking about?
A Yes absolutelv
Q And what does this say right here?
A Purpose of the navigation bridge organization manual is
assist the master and deck officers in planning for safe
operation of their vessel
4) Q All right Now look down at the 12 Is this a part of the manual?

A Yes sir
1 Q Read that for us please?
A Says the prime objective when navigating company vessels is
4) the safety of personnel vessel and cargo Speed and economy
(9) while important are secondary to safe operations
(6) Q Mr larobil d, lonk an you whre previdat of Exxon
(7) Shipping Company is this something that vou personally

8, inusted upon?
41 A Abmintely Without exception
(6) QMr Jrowsi vou had thes - vou had these steps in ensure
"ll salety including agreement on the goal motivation
(1) well traincd umploycus By the way - Iut sgo-we didn \(:\)
(1) talh about whll trained umplovees was that step to ensure
(1d) satety?
(15) A Yes We recognized it was the company's operation to (16) provide the tratning necessary so that operating - fleet (17) operating employees could carry out their functions safely and
(18) it stirted - there were mans different facets to the
(19) training It started with hasic skills training for A Bs We
- 0 , had a very extensive firefighting program where all the

Wemplorew went through iwn or three dav of actual

\section*{firefighting}

1 I evercises livefire exercises \(1 t\) went through deck watch ( 3) officer courses we used simulator many of our courses were
( 4) simulator based ind our navigating officers were required 10
( 1 go through simulator training

\section*{Vol 182864}
(1) We also for senior deck officers sent - sent the senior ( ) deck officers especially those slated to be masters to 1 rance
" for in (wil to three week program in Grenoble France which Was
, iship mineuverinh and ship handing exercise an which they
si actually ire on models of vessels the motions of the veqsels
(6) duplicate the motzons of actual maneuvering charactenstics of
(7) actual vessels
(8) Q Mr larossi could anyone regardless of whether they had a
(9) license as a master or not sall for Exxon Shipping Company
(10) without foing to this ship handling achool in Grenoble France
(II) for a wech?
", A I-I don't know that there were any exceptions It was
(i3) certanly nur objective that every master go through the
(14) Grenoble trannig program I can't swear that at some time
we
(1S) mught not have had one exception but we - we quickly tramed
(16) up every one I think with reasonable certanty I could say
(17) that every one of our masters went through Grenoble
(18) Q All right Let \(s\) move to another subject now
(19) When you became president of Exxon Shipping Company did (20) the company have an alcohol policy?
(21) A Yes, there was a - when I took over the company it was a
(2-) part of Fxxon Company LSA and Exxon Company USA had an
(23) alcohol policy which was created in 1977 When we became Exxon
(4) Shippuy Cumpant in I982 that policy was adopted from
the
first day so we were tollowing the same polacs Vol 182869
Q Did you have AN occaston to rad and study that policy when you became president?
AYes
Q Would you describe for the Ladies and Gentlemen of the Jury
just the significant features of that policy as it exisled when you became president'
A The policy started with - the first premise was that alcoholism was a treatable allness If the allness was not controlled it could impair job performance that the best way
(10) to - to cure the allness was through enrollment in one of the many rehabilitation programs that the compauy would financially
| I support and pay for the rebabilitation programs that the best
(13) way to get - and these are all tenets withn this program the 4) best way to get people to enroll in the program was through self identification, by the way, that was more important in shipping company than probably any other part of Exxon, cause we had little opportumity to really - on imanafement onde
really see the employees on their vesvels so self
identufication was a verv inportant fedture ol it
In order to encourage self identifications the same polics ensured the indivadual emplovee ul total confidentasiaty it also ensured the individual that has jub security - has or her job secunty or future opportumites would not be in ant way reduced or affected by self identification and it also stated that alcoholism atself was not a reasou for teriuin ition

\section*{Vol 182866}
although if that alcoholism led to a reduction un jub
performance or an imparment in job performauce that that
a reason for termination
Q So it in cfful sad looh 11 wou we eild problcill wh
help and wo won Ipunish vou ハthat vortal'
A Yes sur
Q Now was that thought - did you thinh tht wa agu d
policy when you bucame prosidcal'
AYes
Q Why?
A Well because particularly in the shapping company we had
111 in
191 some wav to our whole safetv effort
Q Did thure ombalume Mr larossi whan you hangedur modilicd this policy tor your tompanv ditir 1982'
A Yes in 1985 I think it was April of '85 a couple things
were going on One we had started a-a search program of our vessels and some of the results of this indicated that
had on different occasions found marijuana on board Sol
, became concerned that job imparment also could come as \(\downarrow\)

1 result of drug abuse and therefore we had to - to extend the policy or to make the policy in the self identification and the rehabilitation also avalable to employees who had a drug abuse
(s) problem as opposed to an alcohol abuse problem
(6) Also at the same tume because we had started these

7 ) searches on the vessels in 1982, we were begmong to get
(y) increasing resistance from our unliceused union and a
charge
that what we were doing was illegal So in this policy, in
0 , this letter - it really wasn't a policy change but it was a letter to all employees, I tried to get across the point that they may in fact, be inconvenienced from time to tume as a result of these searches but I asked them to understand
what
(14) our objectuve was that it was very, very amportant to thear safety and to the safety of the vessel to the safety of the environment that these searches be carried out and we do everything we can to ensure that our vessels were alcohol
free
(18) and drug free That I wrote in a letter

Q So you addud drugs and you reaffirmed your intent to ul bondual taruhusol vasuls'

A Yes and I tried to get the employees the seagoing
euplas ees to undernt ind the re ison behund why we had to
do it
i3) Q What hind of scarches did you mention?
4) A We beginning in 1982 -

Q Waila minute In your laller did you-did you rcferto

Vol 182868
(1) wrtain lypu of suarchus?
2) A I think I may have called them random searches
(3) Q Random starchus?
4) \(A\) Yes
is QNow what do you man by random scarchıs?
(1) A Randoun random se irch would come about periodically
when
17. une of the two fleet managers either the gulf coast fleet
y) manager or the west coast fleet manager would select a vessel
(9) for whatever reason we had a criteria that was used, we had
(10) agreed that each fleet would two or three tumes a year randomly
(11) select a vessel and that we would look at certain criteria
(12) One of the criteria was whether or not the vessel was tradeng
(19) an and out of Panama because Panama was reported to be a place
(14) where drugs were easy to get so that was kind of part of the II targeting
(16) QWCll would you -
(17) A Well what happened was the - the fleet manager would
(18) select a vessel and select a port tıme He would call me up
(19) for permission to carry out the sedrch and I would - I would
(30) always grant that request and usually, the fleet manager and
(21) myself were the only ones other than the agent team that knew
(22) about the selection of the vessel
(23) Q Is there something called a for cause search?
(24) A Yes For cause is different to random and a for cause
( g ) search there is some very clear reason ether a suspicion
drugs were found or alcohol was found or some unspicion enther
1) a tup off of a crew member but some reason to believe we lidd a
" problem In that case they didn't have to call me That was
automatic They had the - they had the names and numbera
and
is) the ability to just call and search themselves
6) Q And with respect to random searches you would just decide
to do it because you were trying to enforce your policy there
was no particular cause for doing it?
A That's nght
Q All right Now when did you start these random warches
A As I recall it was ether lite '82 or early 83
Q Okar Did voucontinue those up lo the time of th grounding?
A For - yes we dad with the exception of 1 perion th it maybe was close to about two years
Q When was that? When did vou have this period that vou didn 1 conduct random searches when did voustop the first
tume conducting random scarches?
A As I recall it was Inte '86 or eariv '87

Q Why did you stop?
A The untons had continued to push the legal proceedings that
, what we were doing was not legal and we hind of got tied up 11
( 1 a couple arbitration c ises and it was the opinion of the Fxxon
si law department that until the legal aspects of randum searches
is was defined in the courtroom or through legal proceedings or

\section*{Vol 182870}
(1) through government regulations that we just needed to back off
land wat for a legal definition
Q All right Did ther come a time thon when vou
recommenced these random searches that is butore the grounding in this case?
A Yes it was late ' 88
Q And were these random searchcs continuing up th the timb
the grounding?
(9) Aes
(10) QMr larossi now between the time of the April vou said
(11) 85 letter and the time of the grounding was there a further
(1,) modification of your alcohol policy?
(13) A Yes I believe that occurred in 1987
(14) \(Q\) What were the significant features of this policy?
(1s) A As I recall the policy change - I'm a little vague on
(16) this As I recall the pohcy change at that time-could I
(17) take a look at that pulicy?
(18) Q Sure Let shave Defendants Exhibit 3614 Wc waneither (19) put it up or I can hand it -
(0) MR NEAL May I approach the witness Your Honor
(91) THECOURT Yougot it
( \()\) BY MR NEAL
(13) Q I show you what is received in evidence as Defendants
(94) Exhibit 3614 and ash you to see if you recognize that
(L) A Yes Thus is a letter I wrote in 1980-March IIth 1987
( 94 totally on his own without the knowledge of the company by
enrolling into a rehab rehabilitation of his choice or her Vol \(18 \quad 2873\)
(I) chosce
) Q Mr Iarossi did this program also reaffirm your right to 3) conunue random searches?
(4) A Yes In the program and in my letter of - of March 1987
(5) we reaffirmed that - that the company - that it was the
6) company's nght to conduct random searches of ats property of
(7) its facilitues
8) Q Did it - did it - did this policy also affirm the right (9) to test fordrugs and alwohol?
(10) A Yes We for the first time said that for cause the (II) company had the right to intiate testing of individuals where
(12) we felt there were cause to carry out that testing
(13) Q Now you vegot a policy - now you va got in place the
(14) policy you ve got random searches you ve got
pre employment
(IS) drug testing and now you are saying you are affirming the
(16) right to test for drugs or alcohol in limited circumstances or
(17) when there s some cause How would that cause devclop?
its A Well many of our - some of our se irches of compiny (19) vessels would uncover a small quatity of marijuall ior a half
( 0 , opened bottle of hquor in someplace other th in a statervom
:21) of an individual So we then hid evidence that there was some
( -) abuse of alcohol or drugs on board but we had no way to find
(3) out who the individual was
( 4) So at that point we decided that we had to add to our
isi program for cause testiug of emploveen primarili urine
analysis
Q Now did this policy and the guidulinc atlathed to this
policy have anything to aavabout how vupurvisors hosuld
monitor cmploycus lor alcohol or drue problima'
A Yes We had - we had one the trammg programs I was
talking about earlier but also in addition to that we had
guidelines for supervisors and also fleet officers as to how 10
s. recognize sagas of alcotiol or drut ibuse ind whit to do when
(9) there was suspicion of use
(10) Q Did this - what wure they supposed to look for or look at
"ll in monitoring cmployucs)
(1) A Well the key was job performance and how the individaal (13) performed his or her job
(a) Q All right Lul vloch IO No what - godhad

Il9 A Aad was there - was there alls vigil in the \(n\) is they carried
10, out their duties that they were infict impured
[17) QRcad what I ve just undurlincd there and explain that
(18) beginning with -
(19) A The policy is not mended to mfringe on emplovee privacy
( O1 or uff the job activities but duev establish specific
t-I। standards for on the job behavior
1 , Q Now thinhing aboul that a minut ki golo-klszo
1) to the page of the zuidulinu ithat is it D parazraph D
t-4) Let me - okay Lut slook at this d minule When dn
(-S) cmployec sunsalisfactory purlormanct in bulicved to he the
result of alcohol and drug dependency - Mr larossi was that
what you were talking about when you said they must monitor
job
3. performance for drug and alcohol problems?

A Yeah within Exion we had a very very ngorous job
performance appraisal system in which every supervisor had a
6) responsibality to be carefully watching monitoning the performance of the people under his - his authonty and, in
fact, had a responsibility that they carry out their
assignments appropriately
So what we were really saying is part of that performance
dppraisal system that was ingrained in all of us that at any
tume unsatusfactory performance was evidenced, we needed
to -
(13) or the individual supervisor needed to - to reflect upon (4) whether that unsatisfactory performance could be the result of
\(\qquad\) drug or alcohol abuse
(16) Q Did you consider - did you intend or consider that your

71 supervisors would monitor an employec when he \(s\) off duty or at home that sort of thing?
A No I-my personal feelng, I thank it was the company's position very definitely that we had no busuness in the employee's private life In fact it was probably illegal, and therefore all of our activities were associated with on the-job performance or tume periods when the employee was on

Exxon fachities
Q The policies that you ve discussed hure - one thing I

\section*{Vol \(18 \quad 2876\)}
(1) didn tash you about In all of these policics the policy that was there when you beeame president the policy or the letter letter policy or policy letter when in 85 and the 87 modifications did all of those policies say anything about the possession or consumption of alcohol on board vessels?
A Yeah there were - there were tenets of the entire policy One was that it was aganst company policy, a violation of company policy to possess or use alcohol and later
(10) drugs on company facilities and that included company
(II) vessels It was against company policy to be carrying out
(1) company fuactions while under the influence of drug or
(13) alcohol
(14) So it was whule carrying out company functions so it was I Is iscociated with use or possession on company facalities or no1 being ampaired in any way while carrying out company duttes
(17) Q Regardless of where you got the alcohol huh?
(18) AYes
(19) Q Mr larossi prior - turning to a different subject prior
(0) 101985 were you aware of a captain by the name of Joseph
(1) Hazelwood?
( -) A Yes I was aware that Captan Hazelwood was one of the
( \({ }^{\prime}\) ) members of the Exxon Shipping Company and one of the captatns
( +1 14 our fleet
(9) \(Q \ln 1985\) did he particularty come to your attention?

> Q How did it coml to vnur allintion'
*) A The then the emplovee relations manager his name w is Ben

Graves informed me that he had had a discussinn with
Captain
(5) Hazelwood had questioned Captan Hazelwood found out that
(6) Captan Hazelwood had voluntarily entered a rehabilatation
(7) program near his home in Long Island and that subsequent to
(8) Hazelwood's release from that rehabilitation program Graves
w) had had a discussion with Hizelwnod bout the rehabilitation
101 program and about Hazelwood a st itus
(1) Q Let me have Plaintiffs Exhibit 160 if I mav
1) Is that something you ve gol' The Graves report
(1) MR SANDERS 1 think it s bach here
(14) MR NEAL Here we go
(19) BYMR NEAL
(16) Q Mr [arossi when Captain Hazulwood was brought to your 17) attention were you aware of this?
usi A Yes This is the first -
(19) Q Who is this right here?
o) A I believe that's Ben Groves sign iture I beloeveit sins 1) Ben

1-1 Q All right Lat me go to the next part olthis Whuld wou
(3) bring up the next part second page
4) Okay When vou were having the - whun vou whre having the
( 1 conversation with Mr Bun Graves were vouawart that

Vol 182878
(1) Mr Graves had had this conversation with Captain Hasclwnod and
1 ) had been told bv Captain Hazelwond that ho commentud that hi
is occasionally drank ahoard the thip hul noil ircquantly H. il ,
4) indicated he came hack in ship from port drunh un v varal
occasions Whre vou aware of this in vour conv ration with Mr Graves?
A Yes I had read - hefore the conversation Ben (iraves had
(8) sent me a one page memo outhing his conversation with Captaın
(9) Hazelwood and the fict that he had entered himself Captain
(10) Hazelwood had entered himself in a rehabilitation program The
(II) very last sentence at the bottom of the piqe and I thank
(12) that's what this is is the last sentence in the botiom of that
(13) memo Ben Graves sind in the course of conversation he asked
(14) Joe if he ever drank iboard ship and he meaning

Hazelwood
(19) commented that he uccantonally drank dboard ship but not (16) frequentiy
(17) Q Now this is dated May 281985 Was your conversation t181 somewhere around that hime your conversation with Mr Graves?
(19) A Yeah I believe it was within a week of thas when I
(20) received this memn
(-1) Q All right Al that time you understood that Caplatn
(2) Hazelwood had prior io his conversation with Mr Graves in
(23) Which he admitted this had prior to that voluntarily entered
(4) some sort of rehabilitation chinic?
( 5) A Yes It was not clear to us what the carcumstances were
(1) We talked about alcohol rehabilitation but I recail Ben at the
2) tume telling me that actually the program was associated with
(3) some mild depression that Captain Hazelwood apparently had,
(4) which was then associated whenever he had these depressive
( \(s\) ) bouts, apparently associated with excessive drinking
, Q Now when you -
A I don't know whether be was being treated for the depression or the drinking
Q When you had this discussion with Mr Graves and he syou have this information about the tonversation Mr Graves
has
"ll with Captan Hazelwood did you have the - did you understand
(12) or were you told by Mr Graves that Captain Hazelwood had
(13) already gone through this rehabilitation program by the tume he
(14) had the conversation with Capiain Hazelwood?
(1s) A Yes I recall Ben telling me that he had tried to get hold
(16) of Hazelwood earher but was in inpatient treatment and he
(17) really could not carry on an exteasive discussion with him
us, untul Hazelwood had been released from the progralu I thinle be
wi was released sumetime around mad Mar av I recall
(-0) Q When Mr Graves is illing you and vou ru having this
(1) conversation about Captain Ha/clwood did you understand

Irom
(22) Mr Graves that the conduct that Mistur - that Captain
(23) Hazelwood was telling about had obcurred some ycars earher?
('4) A Yeah the - the subject that caused Ben to get in contact
(2) with Hazelwood had to do with an ancident that occurred

Vol 182880
sometime prior to - to '82 and so the whole context of
, discussion that Den was relating to ine was vome years prior to
) the incident
QAll right Now Mr Gravisw umint loywuand he , telling you all this he s giving you the ruport he viclling you this what was the purpuse ol the unversation'
A We had to decide auw that Captan Hazelwood had velf identufied what - what du we do
Q What do you do about what?
A What do we do about his future employment And of course
(II) the question we bad to face was do we put him back on a , vessel
Q Did you maki the ducision tu pui him hach on the vasaci?
A Ultinutely yes
Q Would you tell the Ladics and Gunllmin of the Jury how
you
\|bi came about making that ducisum'
(17) A Well my first response very definitely was -
uy, Q You re sitling hure with Mr Graves you va bollun this
(iv) intormation wh talkcd about you vebucn told that Captain

10, Hacciwood was a sulf idenificr and he scomplulid
in rehabilitation right'
AYes
(23) Q For some sort of depression or alcohol problem associated
(4) with that that \(s\) all in your mind correct?
(25) A Yes, sır
(9) who
(17) had so self identufied had gotten their exact job back And
( 0 ) empluyees had assumed was that the individual who self ( ) Identufied having gone successfully through rehabilatation
2) having been deciared fit for duty would then get his job back
, We - I still wasn't convinced, and we talked a little bat 5) more, and Ben Graves told me that I had to understand a little

\section*{Vol 182882}
, bit of the law associated with disabled persons and how that
, impacted people with alcohol problems He told me that the
, Federal Disability Act cover empioyees with disabilitues and,
, in fact the company was probibited from denying
employment or
is denying a job to an individual solely on the basis of that a, dusabiluty
Q Solely on the basis that he d sought hulp and gone through rehabiltation?
A Yes, or had been identufied as having that disability
And in fact, while it had not been tested in the courts, the
I interpretation of outside legal counsel and the interpretation
"I of Fxxon counsel was that an andividual with an alcohol problem
(1), was considered to be dasabled and was considered to fall under
(14) the Federal Disability Act
(19) And at one point Ben sand you know whether you bke it
(16) or not you really don't have a decision It's spelled out
(17) very clearly both in policy that we could not deny Captan
(18) Hazelwood his job solely on the basis of the fact that he had
an aicohol problem although if his performance was impaired,
(20) then we could And he sand actually the federal law followed (2i) exactly the same way that simply because an individual had an
(2-) alcohol problem we could not deny him or her a job On the
(23) other hand if they could not perform or if their performance
(24) was im paired then we had the nght to remove them from
that
(7s) position
- \(-\quad\) Vol \(18-2883\)
) And we hemmed and hawed and I recall that Ben said to me in the course of the conversation toward the end he said
Frank you know what will happen if we deav Captan Hazelwood
has job back" And I told hem yes Captann Hazelwood would be
(s) the last individual we would ever see in Exxon Shipping Company
who would self identify
And I think more than company policy more than what the law said or dadn't say, that last fact that our whole efforts
to bring under coatrol or to control alcohol and drug abuse
within the company our whole effort was based on self ideatification of the employee I think that weighed solutely
the most in my decision and I recognized and Ben cognized
that we were in a very tough spot No matter what we did there were nsks If we put Captan Hazelwood back on the shap, we had a risk If we dened Captann Hazelwood his job we had a totally different kind of rask And being an engineer the logic of the decision was putting Hazelwood back
(18) on the ship was a rask it was a risk we knew and understood
(19) It was one mdividual and what we had to do was make sure
we
(20) did everything possible to ensure that Joe's performance was
(?) not in any way impaired We had to look for anv signs that he
(n) was consuming alcohol or was not following through with
his -
(3) had not completed his rehabilitation

we would never get anybody to seifidentify
A We didn't know what that nak was It was undefined so
made a choice between a nisk we understood and a risk we knew
(A) we potentially had but did not know the magnitude of

Q So the risk on the one hand was that whatever problem
Captain Hazelwood had would reemerge is that correct?
A That was a risk
Q And on the other hand was a risk that if you don I give him
his job back there may he other people unidentified puopla
with alcohol problems out there who may - who were also a
nisk is that correct?
A That's true absolutely correct
Q And if you give him his job back and run that risk then
maybe you ve eliminated this other nisk or reduced it?
(1s) A We will have gone a long way to convincung the employees
(6) that we would live by our side of the bargan because after
all, that policy was essentually a contract If you identify
(IB) we will do these things And if we didn't do our part of it
(19) that would be - that poincy would be over, that contract
would
(20) be over

○1) Q You really weighed this is that correct Mr larossi'
(22) A Yeah, it was not an easy dectsion
(23) Q Tough decision for you?
(24) A Yes, yes
(25) Q But you finally decided to return him to his vessel?
(I) A We decided to return bim back to the position of master
i MR NEAL Your Honor is this a good time?
(3) THE COURT We il tahe our first recess at this time
(4) ladics and gentlumen
(5) We ll be in recess for 19 minutes
(fi) THECLERK This court is in rlless for 15 minutes
(7) (Jury out at 1002 am )
18) (Jury in at 1017 am )
(9) MR NEAL MayI proceed Your Honor?
(10) THE COURT Yes
(11) BY MR NEAL
(12) QMr Iarossi having made this decision however torturous
(13) or tough what did you do then?
(14) A Told Ben that it was important that we watch Hazelwood
(is) closely that we make sure be completed the rehabilitation
||c| program was fit for duty and that subsequent to that we
(17) watched his job performance and anv sign that - that be
was
(181 drinking
(19) \(Q\) Did vou understand that - did you instruct Mr Graves
(20) anything atout having his personal - Captain Hazelwoods
rll personal doctor do or say anything?
(22) A Well, Ben was the EHAP coordinator so it was his
(23) responsibility to keep in touch with the medical department
(74) and it was my understanding the medical department kept
in
(25) touch with the personal physician or whoever was in charge
of

\section*{Vol 182886}
(i) the rehabilitation
(2) Q Was it your understanding that Captain Hazelwood s personal
(3) physician advised the medical department that Captain

Hazelwood
(4) was fit to return to sea duty?
(s) A Sometime after this discussion when I inquired I was told
(6) that he was declared fit for duty and that the medical
(7) department concurred with that
18) Q All right Now did you have any conversation about - you
(9) said vou wanicd him wathed was that the word you used?
(10) A I said we had to watch his performance very carefully
(II) Q Watch his performance?

11 AYes
(1i) \(Q\) Did you intend or expect anybody to monitor his private
(14) life or the times he was off duty and at home?
(15) A No absolutely not
(16) \(\mathbf{Q}\) You said you expected them to monitor him primarily for job (17) performance?
(18) A And job performance and any sign - I think I used the term
(19) that he was off the wagon was the exact term I used
(*) QMr larossi are the supervisors or were the supervisors of
(1) Exxon Shipping Company irained to monitor people for job
( ' performanč'
(23) A Yes absolutely from - from the tame we come into the
(-4) company the job apprassal and performance apprasal system
(25) within Exxon is very rigorous At this tume has a couple

\section*{Vol \(18 \quad 2887\)}
parts The first part is what I call moment of fact apprasal which is -
Q What term is that?
A Moment of fact, which that's my term What it means is that job performance is an ongoing operation that takes place
(6) \(\mathbf{2 4}\) hours a day If at any ume you see things that are exceptionally good it's the responsibility of the supervisor to tell the undividual hey that's a good job Don't watt two weeks, don't wat a month or a year When it happens, tell them it's good
If, on the other hand, something doesn't go nght at that point in tume exactly is the tume when you take the guy aside and say, look, that one didn't go right, we got to sit down and (14) decide what we learned from that And in my vernacular, I call
(1) that mument of fact apprasal There are probably uther terms
(16) for it But it is a performance appraisal that is ungoing every day, day m day out
, Then there's another facet of the program which is an - I will call after the fact which occurred one vear or maybe two
tor years and you look at performance over a long period of time
( 1) So there's two aspects, moment of fact and after the fact and
( -) that's what we're all traned in being able to du
13) Q Would you have expectid that if thure wax anv - by the (24) way you don 1 -
(2) A Takes a lutlle courage by the way because you have to

\footnotetext{
Vol 18 2888
If louk at somebody and say that wav oot right that did not meet
' standards now we have to talk about why it happened and how to
(3) improve on at
(s) Q Well that s what you re paid for isn I Il?
(s) A That's right We aren't even marnues
(0) Q That s right Marines werun i paid
7) Back to the time when you whr mahing the ducision to
(8) return Caplain Hazeiwood to duty whre you awarc of thb - what
(9) we ve ruferred to here as the IDR the individual disability
repore that contains the diagnossis ol Caplain Hadciwosed?
A I was not familiar with the term IDR I velearned that
"', subsequent to the grounding But I do know there was sumethang
1: 1 , calied a fit for duty viap I thimk it , the same thing
(14) \(Q\) And that it syour undcrstanding you mentioncd this
(1S) before your understanding that Caplain Hacelwood had some
sort
(16) ot deprussion and an alcohol problem assousated with it) That
(17) was your state of mind?
(ty) A Yes As I recall he was diagnosed us having - I don't
(19) remember the medical term but I was told it meint d mild
( o) depression aud that duriug thuse periods of unid
depression be
( ) was subject to excessive driakiun and that was -
Q That was your stath of mind'
1 31 A That was my utate of mand I hat, what I w wiold and
( 11 understood
is Q All right Now did you have - in rugardlowaluhing or
}

5-26-94 VOLUME 18
\[
\text { Vol } 18 \quad 2889
\]

I' monitoring or whatever word you want to use of Captain
, Hazelwood after he returned did you tell Mr Graves to tell 1) anybody about watching or monitoring?
4) A I told hum to make sure John Tompkins who was the - the gulf coast fleet manager to make sure that John was fully aware of the carcumstances and Ben and I also talked about
the
71 policy position on confidentiality We needed to do this and carry this activity out with a proper element of
confidentuality, but we also needed to make sure that his supervisors were fully aware of the circumstance and what their
(i) roles were
(2) Q All right Did you instruct Mr Graves or Mr Tompkins or anybody to have any meeling with Captain Hazelwood before
returned to duty?
A What I had tuld Ben in that same cunversation was that
we
(161 had to make sure that he was in fact declared fit for duty
(17) Some weeks after this discussion, as I recall it was - may
(18) have in fact been sometime early September, I learned through a
(19) meetung on fleet operations that Captan Hazelwood had been
(20) returned to the fleet and was now the master of Exxon
( I) Yorktown And I was a hittle upset at the tume that I had not
(22) been warned about that so I jumped on Graves and he told me to
(.3) relax that he had been declared fit for duty and he told me (4) that John Tompkins and Bill Sheehy had personally carried out
('s) an anterview of Captan Hazelwood

Vol 182890
(1) So I then called John Tompkins and I proceeded to read him
fi out because he didn't keep me informed of what was going on
(3) and he told me that they on purpose had flown Captan Hazelwood
(4) to Houston that buth Bull Sheehy who was the port captan for
s) the gulf coust group and be hanself Johu Tompkins who was
(6) the fleet manager had personally interviewed Hazelwood
(7) Tomplens told me he personally had warned Hazelwood about the
8. fact that any return to drinking or any evidence that he was
drinking on board or violating company policy would -
would
(10) result in termination And John told me that - that

Hazelwood
(1) clearly understood this
\((12)\) John's evaluatuon and Bill Sheehy's evaluation both,
(13) accordung to John Tompkins was that Joe Hazelwood clearly
(14) understood the situation clearly understood that he in fact
(19) was going to be watched very carefully and had to - had to
be
(16) living within the letter of the Exxon policy
[17) Q Did you understand that shorily aficr - oh 1 don 1 know
(Ix, shortly altior but somulimu after still in 85 that
(19) Mr Tomphins - bv thc way Mr Tompkins was the gulf coast
(20) lleet manager)
(21) A Yes
(22) Q Did you understand that sometime after Captain Hazelwood
(2) returned to duty aboard the Yorktown that a Mr Koops was
(-4) replacing Mr Tomphins as gulf coasi flucl managur?
(a) A Yes I was I was aware that John was actually beng Vol 182891
(i) releved by Dwight Koops Dwight Knops was going to become the

I gulf coast fleet group manager John Tompkins was taking an
3) assignment in headquarters as I believe it was fleet services
4) manager And I told John specifically to make absolutely sure
(s) that Dwight Koops was brefed on all of the circumstances and
(6) that Dwight understood the role he had to play in this
\(n\) Subsequent to that I had a discussion directly with Dwight
(8) Koops and I wanted to make sure he understood the need to watch
(9) Captan Hazelwood very carefully and what the carcumstances
(io) were
(II) Duning this conversation -
(12) Q This 18 a conversation with Mr Koops now?
(13) A Yes And it tools place maybe October, November of thus
(14) year, of 1985 I don't recall exactly But it was sometume
(IS) during the course of the conversation in which I was talking to
(16) hum about Hazelwood the need to watch Joe very carefully
7) Dwight revealed to me that he had a personal situation in
) family, has father was an alcoholic and Dwight told me be
sand, Frank don't worry he sand I know all the signs I've
Luved with at for years I know all the signs And be said I
know all the ways they try to hide at he said so l'm goang to
be - I'm going to stick very close to Joe is what he sand
Q Did you have - okay This is your first conversation with
Mr Koops then regarding Captain Hazelwood?

was but it was sometame following the return of Hazelwood
the fleet
Q But this was the first conversation regarding Captain
Hazelwood? With Mr Koops?
A As I recall, yes
Q All nght Did you have any occasion to have any further conversations with Mr Koops regarding Captain Hazelwoodn A Yes I-I had a number of conversations with him One in the gulf coast fleet office in Baytown when I was visiting
the office, I asked hm particulariy about Joe He told me that Joe was clean that he was performing very well We had another conversation sometime later when I asked hum
(13) agaun how Joe was doung, Dwight told me that he and Joe had
(14) developed - now this is maybe sux months or more after
(1s) Hazelwood had gone back to the fleet Mr Koops told me that he
(16) and Joe had developed a very close relatuonshup, that Joe
an really was very open with Dwight and that was somewhat
(is) surprising, because Joe tended to be not known to be open and
(19) very communicative but Dwight sand he felt that he really had
(20) eatablished a very close relationship with Joe And then he
(21) says, you know Frank I really like the gay
(22) \(Q\) Let me ask you this Duning the course of these
(23) conversatione with Mr Koops, did the name - did the name of (24) Jim Shaw or James Shaw ever come up?
(23) A I remember Dwight telling me - and he was very concerned

Vnt \(18 \quad 2893\)
that I would hear it from someone else or from rumor and he wanted to tell me first that he had Im Shaw who was -
worked for Dwight was the gulf coast fleet steward had been
(4) aboard the Yorktown while it was in Baton Rouge

Loulsiana and
(s) that lim had subsequently come back to the office and mentioned
(6) to ether Dwight or Bill Sheehy I don't remember that Joe
(7) Hazelwood was actung I think the term he used was kand of
(8) strange
(9) Dwight told me be said Frank I immediately sent Sheehy
(10) to Baton Rouge and Sheehv staved with Hazelwood for a
number of
(II) hours I thank he said sux or eight hours but I don't recall
(1.) exactly and that Sheehy came back and sand that there was
"IT) absolutely no evidence that - that Hazelwood was in any
way
(14) acting out of sorts or any sign that he was drnking and
(1s) Dwight said I just - just want to let you know that - that
(16) that thing did go on
(17) There was - there was another occasion when I asked

Dwight
(18) whether be was watchmg Hazelwood closely, and he told me
(19) Frank if I can't get on the ship Sheehy gets on the stup and
(20) we meet him practically every tume he comes unto port

Dwight
( ' ) toid me when be himself went on board he not only talked to
( ) Hazelwond but be also made it a point to go around to the
( 31 other crew members to try to open up discussions and so
that if
( 4) they had anything on their mind is there anything they wanted

(I) that and he made a point to tell me that
(2) In all of this, the scenano is that they're tryug to
convince me that they're doing the job and they're watching
very closely So these are all stones or events that they're
recurring to me that they are giving me
\(Q\) In the course of these conversations did the name of a
Captain Ivan Mihajlovic come up?
A Yes In one of these conversations that - between myself
9, and Dwight Koops he told me that Captain Mihajlovic had heard
(10) a rumor in the fleet and had personally gone to the Yorktown
(II) and, in Dwight's words, ransacked Captan Hazelwood's stateroom
(12) lookng for alcohol and had found none And I don't know (13) whether Mihajlovic had then reported back to Koops or whether
(14) he passed it on to Sheehy but Koops had found out about thes
(1s) for cause search or informal search of Captan Mihajlovic
(16) That was during the course of another discussion I had mith
(17) Dwight
(18) Q All right Now Mr larossi did you yourself have
(19) occastion to interact or contact or have contact with Captain
(20) Hazelwood on a person to person basis?
(l) A I dad on two or three occasions and all of the occasions (22) were during the course of the once a year semor officer (23) conferences that we would have As part of our traning and (24) system within Exxon Shupping Company, once a year we would
(24) minte all of the fleet managers and all of the ship captons,
(I) the chief engmeers chief mates we would invite them to
i) Houston for a one week conference and we would talk about a
(3) whole range of subjects duning the course of that We would
(d) talk about safety program we would talk about taxion policy,
(s) we'd talk about bndge and navigation policies
(6) We would also give the officery opportunitien to exchange
(7) views exchange thear expenences If during the course of
(8) that year there were any mendeuts within the fleet that gave
(9) us concern we would have what we called lessons learned
(10) sessions where we would go over the event and all of the
(11) circumstances as we understood it and then we would have
(12) sessions to define, okay, what did we learn from this how
do
113, we change our policy, how do we adjust to this so we don't
ever
(14) see this, thus type of uncident agan
(15) Q Mr larossi, I mpointing down hure now to Dufundants
(16) Exhibit 9131 under the caption steps to unsure safuly It
(17) gaya opportumty for ollictrs to sharı expuricncevand lassons learned Was that a saluiv ilcp'
AOb yeah it was an important step lot onls - it was an
, smportant step in the salets program not onts to look at what
, you learn from - from specific ancidents but also to \(\pm\)

\section*{exchange}
( \(-八\) ) near musses In fact in a safety program you learn more from
\((3)\) near misses because you tend to have more of those than you do
di ancidents so we - part of the prograilu wat to get the officers
( s ) to talk about difficult situations thev were in what we called

\section*{Vol 18 2xyn}
, a near mass and how they handled it aud low other officers who
might find themerelven in the adue positani could hatide it Qidunimant io divart (oo inuch on thi, but is this the
upportunity to shart expuricnub dind luswins harnad was that in effect the purpose of the fleet conleruncus that wh started to ralk about?
A It was one of the purposes yes
Q All right Now then did you at these flcet conterentes
have occasion to see and be with Captain Hacciwood?
A Yes 1 remember especially subsequent to the rehabilatation
Q 1 m talking about subsequent to the ruhahilatation A Yes I - there wav one feet confertice in March of 1988 that I recall because of a vpecific ancadent related til Hazelwoud I ben there nav anather one it wav entier the 86 conference or the 87 conference I don i recall which oate and
(17) during those tumes 1 - 1 made it a ponat duriug those five days to watch Joe not only to see whether - how he was particapating in the program une of the thongs that I was curious about was whether loe was fulls participating in the program how he was behaviug during the course of the five days, but also what he was consuming as far as liquad refreshment and I never at any tame saw fou consume any alcohol during that time whether it ov is during me \(\mathrm{N}_{\mathrm{s}}\) - he was
( si not drinking wine was not driakiag beer durimp meals ar
lavthing
Q These were over five days each tumb?
AYes
Q Now Mr larossi did ther, come a ume that you learned
that Captain Hazelwood then had been iransferred from the gulf
woast fleet and the Yorktown to the west coast fleet?
A Yes I beheve I learned of that in I believe it was August of 1987
Q All right How did you luarn about 11?
A I had called Harvey Borgen Harvey Borgen was the west
cuast fleet manager I called Harvev and told hum that
Mrs Margaret McVicker (ph) who was a director of Exxon Corporation and also was the sponsor of Exxon Valdez, she christened the bottle - chnstened the vessel and broke the bottle of champagne At the tume of the christening of the vessel, that she - , she and her father wanted to make a voyage
117 on Exxon Valdez from San Francasco - from San Francssco to
(18) Valdez and that she - Margaret McVicker was a professor at MIT (1v) University and she had a break in late August and wanted usto
1 0) arrange a trip on the vessel for she and her father
1 I) And at that time I told Harvey about that we had to make
the arrangements and we had to make sure that all the
arrangements were made I asked hum who the master of
the
(ra) vessel was and he said well let's see by that tume (rs) Hazelwood will be on vacation and I think he said Stalzer will

\section*{Vol \(18 \quad 2898\)}
be the uaster
I asked hisn when IIaxelwood had become the master of the
twon Vildez aud he cold me it was some months earher, I think April or May Again I was a little surprased that I
wasn't informed about it and I asked Harvey how they arrived
at that decision, and he told me that they had reviewed all the
(7) masters in the fleet They had an opening in the fleet because
(8) une master, Captan Bill Greg (ph) bad left the company to take
(9) upa position with the San Francisco pilot's association and no1 Bill Grey wab the previaus master of Exxon Valdez so they had
III to shift sonue masters around to fill that vacancy
1) 1 They had convented a group of port captans the port
(13, captanns had reviewed all of the candidates for that job and (14) had selected Hazelwood as the best qualified master for Exxon
(IS) Valdez and Harvey went on to tell me the reasons for that
(10) that, number one Captan Hazelwood had nore experience (17) uperating big ships in and out of Valdez than any other master
(18) in our fleet Captan Hazelwood was the first master in the (19) F xain fleet and to our knowledge the first master in any -(-0) any fleet tu qualify as a Prince William Sound pilot and ( I) recelve his pilot certificate and Harvey told me that thardly , \(\boldsymbol{i}_{1}\) he had been assured by Dwight Koops that Joe Hazeiwood was
(3) absolutely clean and performing quate well
(14) Aad on that basis be dad Dwight Koops together had made
(2S) the decision to shift Captan Hazelwood from the Exxon

Vol 182899
```

to the Exxon Valdez
Subsequent to that decssion or heanng that from Harvey I
called up Dwight and I asked Dwight what his view of this is
and was he sure that this was the right move to make and
told me be concurred totally that he qasd Joe is absolutely
clean There's no reason not to put hum on the Valdez He
all the expenence and all the background that's the nght
place forme
Q And this is - this occurred more - considerably more than
two years after his rehabilitation is that correct?
A Yes Dwnght told me that he had watched Joe perform for
two years and be was convinced Joe was clean and that he
not see any problern In fact he fullv endorsed shiftung Joe
from the Yorktown to the Valdez
Q All right Now then Mr larosst lrom the time - from
the time Captain Hazelwood returned to duty in somuthing lik
August of 1985 to the tume of the grounding with the
exception of this one Shaw thing you ve talked about did you
ever get any report that Captain Ha/clwond wavdrinhing or
violating company policy or anything lihe that?
A Absolutely not Never
Q And the - the one thing you got you were told it was
reported that it was investigated and that even a search by
Mister - or Capiain Mihajlovic had been carried out is that
correct?

```

\section*{Vol 182900}

11 A That's correct
, Q And nothing had been found?
3) A That's correct
(4) Q Now I want to go to something I want to be very brief
s) and I m sure that plaintiffs counsel will want to go into it
and I II just touch on it
Did you terminate Captain Hazelwood as employee some days
following the grounding?
A Yes I did
Q When?
A I beheve it was on Thursday following the groundiag
early
(12) Saturday morning
(13) Q All nght There s been some statement made here that you
(14) didn \(t\) give him a chance or an opportunity to state his case
(15) Did you try to give him an opportunity to state his case?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q And what happened?
(18) A We couldn't find bim He had - I had - when I - when I
(19) got to Valdez Friday afternoon I met Paul Myers and

Captan
(20) Bill Deppe At that pont they - they told me what they knew
(21) of the - of the grounding up to that point They told me that
(12) Captan Hazelwood was not on the bndge at the time of the
(23) grounding And I at that point told Captain Deppe that I
(24) wanted hum to proceed directly to the vessel to relieve

Captan
(25) Hazeiwood and I also sent a lawyer from Exxon Shipping Company
by the name of Bob Nicholas to proceed to the vessel to , question Hazelwond and also the other crew members and to let
131 me know what the circumstances were surrounding the grounding

There was a discussion about whether we should leave Ine on
the vessel and it was decided at this point he was under such
strain and stress from the grounding that it was much
preferabie to bring hum back to Valdez and I felt at that
point I would have an opportunity to speak to him directly and
also to - to convene a personnel board and allow - to go
through a procedure that we had in the shupping company to
allow the personnel board to also interview Joe Hazelwood
because from mv perapective and in mv mind of it was confirmed
i, he was not on the bridge then that was grounds for fing
Captam II izelwood It was not the first time I would have
faced that decision Sn it was not a unique situation for me
Q Not with Captain Hasclwond?
A Not with Captain Hazelwood but there was another carcumstance previnus to that and I had reacted the same way
(19) That - hut I clearly wanted an opportunity and I felt
strongly that before making that decision I had to - I had to
hear from Joe Hazelwoed if there was any - any plausible
reason un defense as to why he was not on the bridge
But before I got to Joe the NTSB had convened its - its heanng and subsequenf to the NTSB interview with Hazelwood
which I thenk eccurred on Vondas morning or something like
that th it dfter that we - VTSB released Hazelwood in the cognizance of his attornes, and we did not see or hear from hum We could not locate ham We did find that he had left
Valdez and Anchorage by plane He was somewhere in the
Lower
s) 48 but we could not find out where

Q Mr larossi one more thing I want to clear up then Im
going to turn you over to the tender mercies of Mr O Neill here
Thars shcen aome suggestion that Exxon Shipping Company
had ilv masicrigul a pilotage _ndorncmuni for Prince Willam Sound in ordurion xave moncy \(\quad\) Bv \(1986 \quad 87 \quad 88 \quad 89\) was having Exxon masters ohtain a pilotage endorsement was that
save money?
A No Actually I think it cost us money because we gave them a \(\mathbf{\$ 3 0 0}\) bonus Any master traveling in and out of Prace
(16) William Sound who had a plotage certificate recenved a
\(\$ 300\)
an boaus for the round trip
(18) Q The testumony s been 350 would you quarrel with that?
(9) No, 1 won't 350 On the other hand where we had asters
that did not have a pilotage certificate to was the same II circumstance The only thing we bad to do was to notufy the
, Coast Guard in advance We attll had to take a pilot from Rocky Point whether nur master had a Prince Williom Sound pilotage or ant There wasn't any savings It clearly was to our benefit to have masters with that experience and with

Vol 182903
(1) certification And I think at the tume of the grounding we
i ) only had one master dssigned to a Prince Willam sound vessel
(3) who did not have a pulotage certificate Everybody else did
, MR NEAL Mr larosst thanh you vary much
Look what he s got prepared over here to bring you
MR O NEILL It \(s\) my biggest stach so tar sir
MR NEAL Thank you Mr larossa
You may examine Mr O Neill
MR O NEILL How are you sur?
THE WITNESS Fine thank you
CROSS EXAMINATION OF FRANK IAROSSI
7
BY MR O NEILL
Q We met once before a number of years ago
MR NEAL Don \(t\) tell him you don 1 rumumber Mr
larossi he Il even be tougher on vou
BY MR O NEILL
Q I have placed in Iront of you your lustimony in thin tash
under deposition your testimuny butore the National
Transportation Safety Board and a number of exhibits and we
(20) may want to use those as tools as we proceed here for the next
(21) hour or so
(7) The first thing I d like to do is jusi figurc out the chain
\({ }^{1} 3\) 3) of command It sgoing to be on the monstor right next to
\({ }^{4}\), vou This is grual
(-5) Jubt prior to the grounding you wuru the prosident Fll *


Vol 182906

\section*{AYes sir}

QI m going to keep this
Now the Exxon Valdez won the flect manager - or the fleet
award in 1977 and 88?
AYes
\(Q\) And II din twin il in 89 dad It?
\(A\) No
Q And indced somchow or anothur the awards il got were
pulled off of the vessel waren ithey'

\section*{A Yes sar}
"ll Q Now on the bridge manual the bridg manual is an
important document isn t that correct?

\section*{AYes}

Q And aflur the grounding you made the dulcrmination that
Captain Hazulwood was not on the bridge when he should have been on the bridge?
A I was told that Captatn Hazelwood had told Paul Myers that
is, he was unt on the bridge at the time of the frounding |19, hubsequent to that Exxon lawyer had told me Bob Nicholas had
' \({ }^{\text {ºl }}\) told me that he had asked Hazelwood where he was and Hazelwood
i it hid confirmed he ir is not on the bridge and th it other crew ( ) members also cunfirmed that Hazelwood was not on the bridge
i 31 Q And not buing on the bridge at that point in time was such
(24) a berious breach of the bridge organization manual that that in
(.5) and of itself was sufficicnt reason to in iminate him from his
i) job?

A It was part of the pohicy that there were certain tumes
when the navigation and bndge organization manual stated that
(a) the master had to be on the bndge and there were certan circumstances defined in my judgment this particular passage
(f) would have qualified as one of those times
) Q And it was reckless not to be on the bridge wasn I \(^{\prime}\) ?
) A No I just said that it was my judgment that - that the captann should have been on the bridge at this tume
Q And il was a serious enough breach in your judgment to terminate the man sjob?
A He had failed moy view to - to live up to a policy and that clearly the - the result of not living up to that policy included termination
Q You stated that with regard to the seagoing emplovecs
quote there is vary litile opportuntiv ds managurs to ohncrva
them on vessels and quote we have so little upportunity to
see the employees on the vessels do you recall that
testimony?
A Yes
Q Those are true statements)
A Yes Most - you know the opportunty to see a master perform really is pnmanly associated with either in port penods while the vessel is discharging or other
opportunities such as conferences or things like that But

Vol \(18 \quad 2909\)
Q Would you go to page 196 of vour deposition transeript
1: A Yes
131 Q And page 196 line 20 and I mgoing to go through 197 (s) linc 6
(1) Al the lime you dincused Capiain Hacelwood s condition
(6) with Mr Graves and made the decision then to return him to duty -
MR NEAL Excuse me Could we hold on? What page? MR ONEILL 196 line 20
BY MR ONEILL
Q At the timl you discussed Captain Hapelwood s condition with Mr Graves and made the decision then to return him to duty would it be fart to say that you at that point in time didn \(t\) hnow whether Captain Hazelwood had self identified? Answur "tas my assumption that he had identified his problem io Bun Graves and that he had some contact to the mudical dupartmunt bualue thl medical department had awarentw il the prohlem dilundervand a
(|y) Quevtion do vouknow'
(0) Answur cyactly what the contact was no
(1) Do you sec that?

1 1 A Yes that was my statement
(1) Q Now Captain Harclwood has testified here on the same topic
i di and the question was vou didn isclfidentify did you?
(s) Answur no no
(8)

Q Now you talked - I want to go to the topic of self
identification
A Yes
Q You talked at great length about self identification?
A Set the basis of the whole program
Q With Captain Hazelwood you opined that hu sulfidentificd?
A Yes absolutely
Q Would it be fair to dav that with regard to exactly how
Captain Hazelwood s - and how Captain Harelwood and the subject of alcohol came to the attention of Exxon Shipping Company that specific topic you don iknow ahout you re surmising -

\section*{A The first -}

Q - or guessing or putling together what people may have told you including lawyers bul you don iknow how Caplain Hazelwood etther brought it to the attention of Exxon Shipping Company or was caught do you one way or the other you don 1
(19) know?

A What I was told first through the memo of May 29th or whatever the date was 1985 from Ben Graves was that he Ben
( 2) had found out and I don't know how that Hazelwood had turned
(23) himself in to a rehabilitation program subsequent to that Ben
( 4) had had the conversatson which was the - the point of the memo
( 5) that he wrote to me

\section*{Vol 182910}

You got a call from Exxon Corporation through Captain
Plerec who satd you have a problem Ithink you ought to get
some heip or work it out or -

\section*{Y Lah}

And at the time Mr Graves was reporting Mr Graves was
investigating instancıs of drinking prior to going to South
Oaks?
Judging from the date of the report veah
So volu didn I valt identify'
Answer no
You vat that?
(1) A I'm reading it veah
(131 Q Are you aware of - were you aware before you came in here
(1a) today of that testimony?
(1s) A Absolutely not
(16) Q You ve also lesulied that you became aware of the fact
(17) that Captain Hazelwood was going through treatment I think it
(18) was jusi by chance? Do you recall that to the NTSB?
(19) A Well I found out about it from Graves who unformed me of
(20) his discussion with Hazelwood after Hazelwood had completed the
(21) program and what Ben told me was that - try and recall the
(22) exact words Told me that Joe had turned hamself in for
(i) rebabilitation
(24) \(Q\) Why don 1 you go to page 921 of your testimony before the
(25) National Transportation Safety Board Yourtestimony now is

Vol \(18 \quad 2911\)
that - well let s read what vour testumony was then
Beginning on line 19 ill read the quistion and then why don 1 you read the answer
Question how did you become aware ol that atlur hu got out? And what was your answer'
A I said we learned through Ithinh is was juvt bs chance
one - I believe the adminastrative indnager had beell trying
get ahold of Captan Hazelwoud and as 1 remember it had learned that he was in the hospital in New York Long Island

\section*{believe it was, and tracing it down across this situation}

Q Now I m going to state a nother proposition with rugard to
how you found oul 1 m going to tell - 1 m going to say that
you found out because of an invesugation that was going on
Okay? Not an investigation that happened after but you found
out because of an invastigation that was going on Would you
agree with that statemint or not'
MR NEAL Your Honor could we approach the side
bar?
THE COURT \| Il allow the quastion But sumplva
straightforward answur to nothing hul that quistion
THE WITNESS Y cah thcrıwas- BunGravoswas
following up on a tomplaint
BY MR O NEILL
Q Would it be fair to say that the risk of Caplain
Hazelwood s conmaed use of alcohol brought in the question

\section*{Vol 18 291?}
salulv to the vassul)
A I thank the risk of auyone uning alcoluol or drugs whale on duty brings in a safet) question
Q Let meask - reask the question would it be lair to say
that the risks of Capiain Ha cilwod, sonlinucd usc ol aluohol atter 1985 was that it brought into yucstasn the saluiy ol the vessel?
A If it was on duty yes
Q Let s go to your deposition transuript This ingung to be a long day Lal sgolo page 87 ol vour duposition transeript line 157
41 A Yes
I \(Q\) And the quastion wa and th ri \(k\) ithe want il whal
(1s) were what what worb the rishsil he unlinucd ausealwohal'
(1s) Answer well the rish it he continusd io unc alcohol was
(16) that it brought in the question whuthor he could discharge his
(17) responsibilties
(18) Question 11 brought in the question ol the salety of the
(19) vessel?
(20) Answer yus
(1) Du you suc thal)
(n) AYes

131 Q You naver ructivad any ruport trom the madial dupartmani
ol Exxun Shippinz Compaar rolalad 1 C iplain Hachlwood up and
is through the timu ol the zrounding did volu'
(I) A Me personally'
(1) QYus sur
(3) ANo
(4) Q Do you know or are you aware of whther Captain

Hacelwood
( 9 ) altur his rehabilitation in 1985 rucuivad anv hualth advisory
( \(A\) ) survices from the medical department ol Exxon USA?
(7) A I do not know
(8) Q Now you testificd hure loday that this conversation that took place with Mr Graves dualt with the subject of depression
and then some kind of assousated drinking do you recall that testimony?
(12) A What - what I was told was that the actual symptom, I
(13) don't remember the medical term was a muld depression and
(14) duning the penods of mild depression Joe drank I think the
(Is) term was excessive drinking
1161 Q You were told that he went through alcohol abuse
(17) truatment?
(18) A I was told he went through rehabilitation
(1v) Q Alcohol abuse treatment?
( or A 1 don't recall that
(-1) QOkay Lat sgo to page 76 of your duposition transcript
( ) The quastion is uhdy And he voluntarily went tor alcohol
(.31 abuse treatment in 1985? This is at line 10
(94) And your answer at linc 12 was yes Ilcarned that
(i) subsuqucnily

\section*{Vol 182914}
(1) Do vous suc that'
(1)A No I'm not with you
(1) Q Okay Page 76 of the duposition not the NTSB lestimony
(4) A l'm oll page 76
ts) \(Q\) And the quistion on line 10 is ohay And he voluntarily
(6) want lor alcohol abusu ircaimant in 1989)
(7) And your answer was yes Ilearnod that subsequenily
(8) Do you suc that?
(9) A Yes
(iv) Q And when you get over to the next pagt on line 9 now you
(II) say you lasarned of his going tor alcohol abuse treatment six to
(1) bght woch, aftur he sommencod al?

13, Answur was vas Ithink il was lalc May when I first
(If) harnud ol il and I think hiv ircalminit staricd sumbitime in
"s, Apris
(101 Do you see that?
(17) A Yes
(18) Q I was interested when you said and you were talking about
(19) Ivan Mihajlovic and you isstifitd Ivan Mihajlovic hure in
130) tourt said he harard a rumor in the fluct do you rucall that?
(-1) A Yes theredare often rumors in the flett
in) Q But becausc of this rumor of Mihaplovic he went and did ( 3 some involligation)
is A Yeah I helieve it wis the wime rumor of Jim Shaw saying
_s, that Ilazetwood was acting hind of crazy or kind of strange

\section*{A I learned after the grounding}

\section*{Q This fillow came in and testificd I can itecall his name}
but he testified that Captain Hazelwood had a reputation at least among the Alamar emplovees as a drinker Are you aware
(s) at all of that?
\(A\) Vo
Q Now voulcullicd and I vou mav have misspoke on this
hecause this is not a vuhicul that vouknow a lot about but in
the IDR jual wiouknow I an ircad thin copy
Can we hring il up the IDR Scuil this is any better
Do vou know whethur on the IDR there sany notation as to whether he sfit for duty or not?
A I have never seen an IDR
Q Okav So when you tesitified with regard to what in fact is on the IDR you d never seen the IDR Have you ever seen is up to today other than the fact that it \(s\) before you?
A I don't recall ever seeng it but certanly before the incident I had never seen one
Q Captain Ha/tlwond has isstified here that no one from Exxon
Shipping Companv lold him not to drink that he resumed
drinhing in 1986 and that he didn 1 hide it from anybody Dow that surprisu vou)
AYes
Q Now vou kstiflud this morning that vou had iold vour subordinatus to mahc sure that Captain Hazelwood completed

\section*{Vol 182918}

Hazelwood has fallen otf the wayon'
A That was not reported to me that way
Q flwasn t?
A No Absolutely not
Q If indeed there was a report in the company that Ha ciwnind
had fallen off of ths wagon that he wav drinhing on bosard the
vessel that there was a party on board the vessel in
Hazelwood s room thosl arb scrious allcgations arm thav'
A If those were the allegations thev were senous
allegatıons yes
Q And the people who were winnesses to that situation
participants in that situation under your companv policy
should have been brought in and asked about them isn t that right?
A If it was known by company management yes
Q And indeed if it was known by company managemunt and those
a7) people weren t brought in and interviewed that a wrong isn 1 81 117

A Clearly if anyone knows of dranking on board they hould
ol make it known to the supervisor yes The policy was clear
as
( i) to that
(22) Q Were you aware of the agent - we had testimony Irom a
(13) fellow who worked with your agent in Valdez Alamar Whre you
(2a) aware that Exxon Shipping Company had an agent in Vaidez
(25) Alamar Alaska maritime agency?
rhahiliation plan'

\section*{A The proyeram}

Q The program Capiain Ha ciwood has tesufied that after about a month or a month and a half he quil his aftercare program is that something that you would - his aftercare program as prescrihud ty South ()aks ly that something that you would have expected your subordinates or people under their
control to lollow up on to make sure that he completed his aftercare program?
A What I told Ben was to make sure that he was fit for duty and that the medical department agreed with that or concurred
with that evaluation
Q My noles and I wrote them right here on my outhane You con see mv outline in nol much use to me hut my notes this morning werc that you lestificd to make sure that he completed his rehab plan is that now not your testimony?
A What I meant was that he went fully through the program and
(18) was declared fit for duty

Q Now -
A l'm talking about the program leading to a fit for duty determination
Q Do you know whether there is a fit for duty determination
in any of Exxon Corporation \(s\) or Exxon Shipping Company s records anywhere?
( 1 A I wav told that he was declared fil for duty by his - by

Vol 182919
his pravate physician und that the medical departiment concurred
( ) with that conclusion
Q My question is do you know if there sa plete of papor anywhere that documents that?
A I do not know I don't know what the files are
Q Do you know if there s a plece of paper anvwhere in your
company or your then company Exxon Shipping Company
that
details any of this monitoring stuff anywhere?
A I would be surpased of there is because we were trying to
handle it strictly confidential I didn't write auvthing down
Q You didn twrite anything down'
A No
Q Sir was there a rehabilitation plan tor Captain
Hazelwood?
A There were two facets to -
Q My question was was there a plan?
A A writen plan that said we do this and do that'
Q That s right
A No
(1) Q I want to il we could - your tustimony also loday was you

1 , had directed your employecs to mahe sure that thure wher no
3) signs that he was quole off the wagon luse quots do vou recall that"
( s) A Yes I told that to Ben Graven

Vol 18 292
1) Q You didn isupervise the monstoring wher did you?
1) A I did not supervise the monitoring directly but I kept m
(3) contact pernodically with John Tompkins Dwight Koops,
later
(d) Harvey Borgen and I left each of those contacts with the clear
(s) direction or direction to them that if they came across
anything of signaficance on this subject I was to be informed
(8) Q Let s just taike a look at your - you ve been asked the (w) question It sdeposution iranscript

1301 MR NEAL What page?
(11) MR O NEILL I don 1 know WL regoing to play tion
(1) the surcun Is that coming up?
(1) (Portion of Video of Franh larossi played as follows)
(14) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(15) \(Q\) And is it fair to say that other than thi conversations
(16) that you detailed to us you did not supervise the monitoring?
(17) A I was not a supervisor, I was the president of the
(18) company
(19) (Portion of Video of Frank Iarossi concluded)
(20) BYMR O NEILL
(-1) Q And the conversations you reterred to there were
( ) conversalions vou had with Harvey Borgun and Dwight Koops)
( i, A And John 「ompkias yes
it Q Now 1 d lihe to it wh could goover some of your
i a, politits Wull lut me justash you while we re on this

\section*{Vol 182922}
(1) subjecl
() Was an incidınt - did Mr Herb Leyundeckur uver make a
(i) ruport to you with regard io an incident in the Portand
(d) Shipyard)
(G) A Vo
(6) Q With rugard to Captain Ha/niwood orduring bucr overa
(7) waihis laihis)
(x) A No
(4) Q Did anybody from the whst coast lluet wever make a report to
(10) you that belr was orderid ovir a walkie talkie and there were
(11) Henry Wuinhards botles found on board the Valdes and Henry
(1-) Weinhards whro urdurud over the walkic laikie anybody report
(13) that to you?
(14) A No
(19) O Al the limi when Captain Hareiwood was on board the vussel
Ilot anybody ruport that to you?
(171 A No First time I heard about it was after the grounding
ist \(Q\) They should have roported it to you shouldn ithey?
(iv) Alf there was any evidence yes
(11) Q And they hould have raported i")
: II A I metructed Harvev Borgen that anythang out of the urdinsiry let me hilun
i T Q And indacd your politis reyuire that in stluations where
iti there sallegationvol alcohol ust that in vislation of a
is company policy drinhing on thip that the suspat or the

Vol 182923
person in question is supposed to be questioned by two members
1) of management isn t that right? Do you know what your
'I policies dictate with regard to that?
4) A Perhaps I'd have to review it I knew it required follon
s) up but I can't tell vou exactly what the follow up was
a) Q Was a situation cver hrought to vour allention with rugard
7) to San Francisco Bay a weeh or two before the Valduz - a wech
before the Valder started up north on tis tateful vovage
concerning a Marv Willamson and a Captain Ruder'
ANo
Q Afterthis -
A Following subsequent to the grounding I heard about it

NTSB or something like that
Q And should have been brought to your attention shouldn it it?
A If there was anvthing to it yes
(17) Q And it was reckless not to have if there was any substanc. to it?
A The instructions that I left with Harvey vern clearly would
have said that if - If he found out about any - anv violation
of company policy he had to let me know I had to be informed
1) Q Now I want to go hack in the time when vou talked in Bun

Graves and the concept of a rehabilutation plan You were of
if the view that part of Captain Hazelwood s rehabilitation was to

\section*{Vol 182924}
attend AA muelings wher hi wasal homb inn thal rifht'
A I - I don't helteve I ever was told of any AA meeting or what it was What I was told is that he was going on 90 day leave of absence dungg which he was going to attend AA meetings
Q Did you tefl the National Transporiation Safety Board that
to your knowiudge part of his rehabilitation was to attend AA
meetings when he was at home?
A During this 90 dav period
MR NEAL Page?
MR O NEILL 926
THE WITNESS The context I remember of Bun Graves discussion of AA was during this same first meeting \(H e\) said at that time Hazelwood was already out that he had requesticd 90 day leave of absence which we had granted and that he was
(16) going to be attending AA meetings while he was at home BYMR ONEILL
Q Now with regard to vour company policies I want you to
if you would to take a look at Exhibit 3617 Defendants
Exhibil 3617 which is an Exxon document Do you have that?
And I m going to -
A I'm going through
Q I Il put the page up on the screen then and we can take a look at it the document so we can put it in date context
AI haveit
(1) Q It s dated October of 1988 ?
1) A Yes I haveit
(i) \(Q\) And the section of the document that \(I m\) interested in is
(d) the section that I \(v_{L}\) got highighted on my copy which says
post rhahilitation icsling not addrissed in current policy
variation in application across company commonly done in indulri did aut wilul rahahiltation rubommendation ruvisu Luidulintilo incorporate posi rehabilitation testing do vou yce that'
A I m not famaliar it all with this document
Q You ve nuvar scen the document hafore?
\(\Lambda\) Vo
Q Well hi meask you another question Have you ever seen
(14) Delendants Exhibit 3683 which I ve put up on the screen?
(1s) A I don't beheve I ever saw this
(16) \(Q\) What s the management commuttee?
(17) A That's Fxxon Company U S A management committee which is
118, the - the president of Faxion Company L SA and three or four
tivi venior vice presidents of Favon Company LSA I was nota
(o) member of the management committee
(al) Q With regard to people who violated the company s alcohol
- policy in 1985 you regularly ierminated people who violated
( 7 , the company alcohol poitcy didn : you?
(4) A We had I believe from about 1982 to the time of the
s) grounding

\section*{Vol 182926}

\section*{Q5s'}

A I wh going to sav about \(\mathbf{3 7}\) terminations I think is what I
recall We had annther 24 suspensions without pay for certain
(4) penods Those are the statistics I remember over that seven
year period
Q So if in faci somebody was violating company policies
with regard io drinking on vessels or returning to vessels drunk you had the power and in fact you did terminate them? A Yeah the - the violations clearly were possessing or using alcohul on board or heing impaired in the course of duties Those were the two company violations And where
we
1 ) found people drinking on board possessing alcohol on board or
(13) being impared or intoxicated during duty, dunng a watch, then
(14) clearly we were ant very easy on people and we termanated
a
(15) number of people Some of which by the way, were returned to
(16) the fleet after arbitration and arbitrators forced us to take
(7) them back
18) Q But you did do ॥"
(19) A Yes we were not easy on them
(vo) \(Q\) And indted it was the companv spolicy that if an
( 1 employs , ruqueat for rehabilitation is made after the
i i company a discovery of a violation of the policy the company
(?) will take disciplinary action which may anclude termination?
(4) A That was our policy
(9) Q So if you got caught you were going to be subject to some
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline 8SA & FEDERAL TRIAL TRAN \\
\hline & Vol \(18 \quad 2927\) \\
\hline & kind of disciplinary action and thal distiplinary dallan ould include termanation' \\
\hline 131 & A Yes \\
\hline (d) & Q Does Captain Haculwuod s pursunncl lif wint whar \\
\hline (5) & company record that you ru aware of rolluct any advorst \\
\hline (6) & personnel action with regard to the Graves report' \\
\hline (7) & A This occurred - this statement in this conversation \\
\hline (8) & between Ben Graves and Captain Hazelwood occurred after \\
\hline (9) & Hazelwood's rehabulitation \\
\hline (10) & Q Could you answer my question? \\
\hline (11) & A Would you ask it again" \\
\hline (1.) & Q Was there any adverse personnel action taken as a result of \\
\hline 1131 & this? \\
\hline (14) & A None was requred \\
\hline 1151 & Q None was uken whether il was requirid or nol? \\
\hline (16) & A None was taken none was required \\
\hline (17) & Q Now with regard to Capiain Haculwood sassignmint to the \\
\hline 118 & Yorktown you discussed this anguish about that In point of \\
\hline (19) & fact you found out that Captain Ha/clwood was dsignud to th. \\
\hline (20) & Yorktown four weeks atter he was alruadv on hoard the vessel \\
\hline (י) & didn t you? \\
\hline \((2)\) & A Yes I thonk it was in september \\
\hline (-3) & Q And when you found out you woru upsel' \\
\hline (24) & A I was upset that I hadn't been told beforehand \\
\hline (3) & Q And with regard to his reassignmint to thi Valder vou wire \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline Vol 182928 \\
\hline told that after the fact? \\
\hline A Yes \\
\hline Q After he was on buard the vessel' \\
\hline A Yes \\
\hline Q And you wert quole shouhed" \\
\hline A I was surprised that he had been re informing me without eather IIarven \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Q I want to gobach to if we could lora minuic vur carlicr
disulustion aboutallurtari Wavil vur under tanding thal atler the \(\mathbf{6 0}\) dav outpaliunl pariod Capiain Hactuarsd would be ¿valualcd again'
A I did aut know that Other than the fuct that - that !
wanted somehody in the shipping compans to - to suterview Joe
141 and make a decision that - that be was fit for duty if that's what you mean clearly that's what I wanted Q Lus go - do you know that following the inpalisni treatment there would bu a 60 day oulpatisnt puriod and then he
would be cvalualud at that pornt '
A I don't know of there was a medical evaluation or whether his physician - the evaluation I w uted was lor vomebody at
the shipping company before we gave hitu all asogataent was to
1 1 meet with him and clearli make a decision h ived on that face to
(23) face meeting that be was fil for duts Irrespective of what ( 4 ) the doctur said
(25) Q Okay And what kind of - you wanted somebody from the
regard to Captain Hazelwood Lill mi what the law is dhoul that did vou'
A No Ben told me he had conferred with the fxan lawven dad that was the opinion of the rivon lawyers
Q So we ought to ask Ben then as to whethur he conterred with them and it netther you nor he conterred with the Exxon lawyers about this particular topic and a ducision was madz on this assumed law that nohody uverashcd ahout somuthing wrong right? You expecicd him to tahc carc of it for you? A He was mi expert on - on emploveer rel itans in itters including contact with law ind if he told tme th it that \(w\) is
opinion of the Fxxon lawvers I beheved him
Q And at that point in time while you whre having this discussion with Mr Graves you hnew that if vou caught somebody in violation ol company poltuy with rugard to alcohol you could iceminate thum and you did?
A If we - if it was a clear case where we could prove violation of the policy we did I believe on 37 occasions Q Now I do want to ask vou a quistion or two about the press release I wasn igoing to ask vou ahout il hutaficr Mr Neal sintroduction ifldon I people will thinh I mnot doing my job
MR NEAL. We won i If you want in fust move along
I II withdraw that invilation lo volu I wann I Irving lohall you Mr O Neil!

Q lt hav hucn reporicd to u hure hv onc of the participants in the contirence that vou made a statement to the following cllcul that woucouldn I holicve that thev had spent the allurnoon in Valdes al d number of bars Did you make that statement?
A I don't belseve I made that statement no
Q Youdanvil?
A I don trecall making that statement
QOhav Now whr vou dsappointid and outraged that an olli crin vuchacrilcal povilion would have leopardized the hip stalu and the cnvirunment through vuth dations'
A I wav ven ongrn I guess I could certaniv use the word
outraped Outraged at the fact that the vessel was - had
grounded the fact that there were 32 square miles of oul all
over Prince William Sound the fact that I was spending five
hours a day in front of the press answering questions I
was - I was outraged
Q You still can t get away from answering questions today
can you'
A No
Q And Iminicrasicd in thc sccond paragraph the last
paragraph whert il says crilual posituon vou see that?
AI-ves I seecritical position
(1) Q is a hip captaina critical position'

A With retiard in operation of the vensel he is the most

\section*{Vol 182934}
critical member of the crew With regard to operation of that
; versel ves
Q Andindted ha wavalso part ol the managument laam and part ol manaztmint wavn 1 hc,
A He why part of the management of that vessel He was not
part of Exxon Shippang Company management He bad no
responsibilities outside of that vessel when he was on
board
that vessel
Q With rugard to the vessel wasn itia major program of
yours as related in Surrendering the Memones to turn the
ship captains from people who drove boats into people who
paricipated in the management of this vessel as an cconomic unil?
A Actuall, went well bevond the ship master It included the
entire what we c ill the shophoard management team was the -
"Ial the senuir officerv the four senior officers assigned to the (17) vessel at that tume and then their counterparts so there were
(18) really eught They formed what we call the shupboard
(19) management team and their role was to manage the
actuvitues of
(ro) that vessel
(1) Q So we had four memhers of this management team who managed
1, this viswel ay a husincss unit economic unit safety unit for , Exxon Shipping Company
I They were respunsible fur the sufety and whatever took part Ihes weren I responsible - I have to hedge on

\section*{Vol 182935}
" economics because thes weren \(t\) revponsible decidant what
(2) cargos they carned or what rates they got for it
(3) Q No but within the context ot saluly'
(4) A Yes They were responsible for the safety of the vessel S) yes
of Q And they were also rosponathle lor within the conicxit of
7) safety gelling the vessel moving being - buing prudunt with
\&) regard to ship stores that wirt put on - not put on the
management of the persunal on the vessel all those kinds of things?
AYes
Q And one of your contributions as the president of Exxon
(3) Shipping Company was through the years to upgrade these guys
(14) from ship drivers to this managembnl team \({ }^{\text {? }}\)
(15) A Yes We were trying to give them a broader perspective and
(16) understanding of their - of their roie as it related to all
(17) facets safety safe operation
(18) \(Q\) And at the time of the prounding of the Exxon Valdue you
(19) had a member of this manazumbnl luam and inducd the hiy manager
(20) of the vessel who violated his dutv undur vour policy manual
(?) when he left the bridge?
( - A The - yeah the bridge navigation manual in in, view
required has presence there I here are other opinaons who say,
( a) no My opunana as -
is) Q I undurstand at that time -

\section*{Vol 182936}

A - upinuon he should have been un the bridge
MR NEAL Lul ham timish Mr U Null
BY MR O NEILL
(4) Q Are you finished sir? I wasn t trying to cul you olf
s) Are you finished?
6) A Yes
17) Q So we have a managumunt leam imsmber who in vour opinion
(8) violated the bridge policy manual hv luaving the bridgs'
() A In my opinion one of the circumstances - the

O1 carcumstonces of the vesuel were ill - were une uf those
III carcumstances which required tua preneluce ou the bridge

ill bridge instiad of iwo'
(1山) A That's true
119, \(Q\) And in lact thare warcn itour cyes on the hridgbinvicad (6) of (wo
"17) A That's correct
als) \(Q\) And the vossel ran aground withoul the hclp aid
(1) assistancu of this additional pair ol cycs?
(1.0) A In my view it was a coatributulp factor
( I) MR O NEILL Thank you 1 m gornz Io yuil whil 1 m
' ahcad uhay'
13 I could go on for hours but ther ve haard il holirs and
i it he s heard it hofore and thank sou vir
, \(\mathrm{s}^{\text {I }}\) THECOURT Mr Nal'

52694
VOLUME 18
MAM3
Vol \(18 \quad 2937\)
MR NEAL Wbil notwitholdndine that vashol papers
thal wasn I so bad was it Mr larowi'
(3) THEWITNESS No
(4) MR NEAL I mgoing to be as kind I believe

REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF FRANK IAROSSI BYMR NEAL
Q You talled about management ot the ship management team ol
(s) the ship Was Captain Hacelwood a part of the management of Exxon Shipping Company?
A No not at all He took part in no decistons or conferences or meetings on anything other than that shap
Q You re lalking about saying you know don be a driver of
the vessel think about all aspects of the vessel but only
that vissul that s what you re talling abuut?
A Yes sir
Q All richi Now than you - this prass ruluase talked
about violanon of akohol policy or - what - what was that?
PXI73 sould we have that again' Maybe I can read this This
linc prini I bliluve a may be easicr to do thes
Failud - something about icrmanation lollowed the
announcument by government invesligaturs that the employee had
(-) fatied the blood alcohol lust administurud on the Exxon Vaidez ldat Friday
Was thin prass rulcasc or the writing ol thin pruss ruluasc rulving on these lust that wh ve discurnad in wourt here tor

\section*{Vol 182938}
(1) solong now to your knowledgt?
(1) A Yes The results of the tests and the public furor
3) after - following it in my view prompted the release i had
(4) 40 intention of terminating Joe IIazelwood's employment until!
(9) talked to ham aud that s what I steadfastly held out for
(6) Q This press rcluasc came aflur the bovernment and

ChumW.si
171 and all thesc plople tame out with this so callud blood aicohol ts) lust content right?
(4) A Yes Ia my view it preempted what I was trying to do
10) Q Lut inc sct that transuripi pagt 87 dupusition page 87
", You sald that in answarto Mr () Nall s quastion that you did
(1) not supcrvisc Captain Ha/clwood smonitoring
(I) Was there anv other master in your warcurat Exxon Shipping

IIA, Company that you wid them logive me rugular roports on?
(19) A No
(16) Q Just Captain Harciwood?

117 A Yes
118) Q Now you wura alxo ashud br Mr O Nall whol at page 86
(19) of your deposition and sue il this quivtion wasn itashed and
© O1 thuscanswcrs given ohay?
" Quastion whay And the rind ol his uning alcuhol ware
what what whre the rishit he conlinucd to ust alcohol
17 conlinucd to uš aicohol?
it Answir wull the rish if he conimucd to usc alcohol was
is) 11 brought inlo question whether he could discharge his
responsihilities
Question it brought in the quastion ol satcir of the
vessel?
And you answered yes
What was nol read is this
Question okav And the risk of - rishs of not returning
him were that il would be a signal in othurs who might have a
problem not 10 seeh hulp on their own in that corrotl'
And your answer in a long wav was vol that corrubl
 AYes
Q So you were weighing the risk again as voudiscussed now)
A It's the same answer I tried to give earlier about the different nsks
Q One more question I believe In talking about Joe
Caplain Joc Hazulwood and - and monitoring and so forth one more time Did you intend that he be montured while he sat home?
A No
MR NEAL Thank you Thank you Mr larosst THE COURT Thank you ur
MR O NEILL You vegotogo sir Idontzul
another chance
THE COURT You mav step down sur Thand vou
MR SANDERS Mavil plaab the Court our naxi

\section*{Vol 182940}
1) witness is Mr Alan MiGrugur and in urduriohtahlu io , preseni Mr MsGrlzor whart pravinling qulvilomsand answers
131 read back and forth a taped interview not a deposilion a
4) taped interview and the inturvicw oucurrad on March the 27th
(4) 1989 at 930 pm
(1) THE COURT Go ahlad
, MR SANDERS Ithink we should still swear the
(R) witness

THE COURT Do the samb drill that hu should well and
in iruly read the answers
(1) THECLERK Raise vour right hand plase
(1) The Witness Is Sworn)
(13) THE CLERK For the record state your full name
(14) address and spell your lasi name please
"l9 THE WITNESS Martin Casev New York New York
(16) CASEY

117 THECLERK Thanh you
18, DIRECT EXAMINATION OF ALAN MCGREGOR (RLBd)
(19) BYMR SANDERS
, Q Mr McGregur who do vou work lor'
A Arco Manne Inc
( ) Q And what ship are vou attached in right now?
(3) A Arco Independence
(94) Q And on Thursday might did you go into town into Valder? (25) AYes
" Q Do vou romemher ahoul what tume that was?
Al went in oh I guess about six o clock
i, Q And that would have been six p m?
(4) A Yeah 1800
(s) Q Could youtell me when you were returning did you take a
(6) taxicab to ruturn to the ship?
7) AYes
k) Q Ahout what lime was that'

ง A Between eight 2000 and 20132030
(0) QWhere did you catch the taxicabal'

I A It the Pipeline Cafe or whatever it is in Valdez
(1) Q When vou fot into the taxi whe thare already other
(1) plople fares in the taxı?
(14) AYes
(19) Q And do you rumember how many there was?
(1/6) A I thak there were three I m not certan It might have
7) been four
8) Q When you - where did you sit in the cab?
(19) A Tall end Charise They have a reverse seat facing aft and
( o) I was the only one in that
i" Q Thun thare warl iwo puapic guvt in irnni of vou that would
, he facing lorward?
1) Althinh \({ }^{10}\)
*) \(Q\) And -
s) A titmigh harebeenthree

\section*{Vol 182942}
i) Q You ru nol surb whiru the other threc people were sutting?

A I thinh there were three perople One in the front seat
in, with the driver and two in the immediately rear seat but I'm
(A) not sure It might have been four I don't think so but
is) I m-I m not - I mant trying to get in where I know is a (A) case after the fact
(7) Q Right right I want just from your memory not possibly
(8) what somebody else said or anything else what you know?
(9) A Yeah

1101 Q The iwo people that were siting in front of you is there
"ll) saything you remember about them as far as the type of blothes
II they wore whether they wore giasses were tall short had a
(13) beard mustache anything like that? Is there -
(14) A Nothing at all It was dark I really couldn't see them
is that well and I wasn t that interested
is, Q Did vou - warc thiv talking among themselves?
117. A Yes
ix, Q Did they way anyihing that vou hcard?
a, A No 1 could hear their vosces but I wasn't - as I say I
on was not interested I put my head back and dozed
( :) Q How long did it take you to get from Valdez out to the
, 1 terminal?
(i) A Oh 1 suppose 20 mınutes
(9) Q The normal ah -
ral A Half an hour I don't know

\section*{Vol 182943}
(I)
(3)
(4)

I can get out, and I gave my identification card to the guard 7 and he gave it immediately back Usually in the past we have
(8) all given - all the occupants an the cab have given their cards their \(\mathbf{Z}\) cards or what have you to the driver and gone o) through the metal detector or what have vou and have them given
(11) back to the dnver This tume it was changed Wegave our
|12; \(\mathbf{Z}\) cards to the guard and he gave them smmediately back Then
(13) we went through the metal detector got back in the cab and
(4) went on our way

Q All - all of you did that?
A As far as I can remember yeah
Q When you were in the cab was thurb anything vou noticed
as far as whether the other people had been drinking'
A No
Q I m not saying that thw whrt drunh hul had thbs hocn drınkıng?
A No I have no occasion to uotice anls - thes - the other
people seemed to be perfectls vtandard is pe peuple comana back
( a) to the shap I dadn't know who thes were or I - I had no
s) eccasion to remarh ou their condition one \(w\) is or the other

Vol 182944
Q So thure was nothing that stood oul to you as laras any of the othar pouple?
A No
Q And vou didn Italh ladar wh the other pouple durnme
this -
A Well I thank I probabls, ind hello and th iuh voul ur oute thing or another
Q Who did thay hit out - thath them aut lisst'
A No I was first out
Q You whre oul lirst and thay whit to -
A Yeah I was surprised at that because I was dazing and I thought - I don \(t\) know why I thought it but I thought that they were from the other ship that \(s\) stall here and when the cab stopped I wus told it was berth 4 okay 1 got out
Q Whan thuy pasd for the bill wire you th the ab when they paid for thale part of the hill'
ANo
Q You paid yours'
A Yeah
Q Just aboui whan tha) wars in thiva urilv huilding whan
you ware in the sotully buildat bolle thiouzh the mald
straen or whatnol whrb volu right with the othur thrus quy whure you might obsurve them walhing and moving in thare ath or were you alone'
A \| was in their company but not with them
Q You werc in the same general arca'
AYes
Q The point is did you have an opportunity to see them if
they were ah stumbling or whatever or did you not even have
the opportunity to sec them?
A Oh I had the opportumity to see them but I thmik -
but - and I thinh I'm not sure but \(I\) - as I said to the
security man last ught 1 had nothing to cause me to notice
what they were dong
Q Nothing triggernd yur interisal
A No
Q You -
A They behaved like people coning back to a ship
Q You had wunt oll lor I believe approximately two hours?
A Yeah two two and a half something like that
Q Did you - well whan you were downtown did you drank?
AOh, yeah
Q Did you have anything to drink that night?
A Of course
Q Did you - would it be like onc drinh or iwo drinks?
A Oh, I may have had three or four I don't know
Q But still there wasn I anything nolictahk to you about
the other thral'
Q lather davihing that vou san thinh ol that vou would want

\section*{Vol 182946}
to say butore Iturn the lape rucurdur olf'
A About their condation or - ar -
Q Anything' ()rat vou havea quastion)
A The ouly thag I can remember that actually had to be brougit to iny attentanilast might when the security guys, thes
had a couple of pirzas with them When I climbed into the backs seat \(I\) was careful aut to sat on oue
Q Ohay 1 mg ging to concludt the lapt at 9 21 pm
Atine
MR SANDERS Good luminz Your Honor
THE COURT Good iaming and aspebillv whan they star discussing pi/fas again
Ladey and gunlemen -
MR NEAL Mahcs you hunfry about 1200
THE COURT W6 II lake our stuond ractss at this
point Would counsil standby at this point' Therearea
ouple thing I want to aay lo counval
(Jurv out al \(1202 \rho \mathrm{~m}\) )
THE COURT When wh cunclude al 200 thiy afternoon ! want to muct bricily in chamburs with as luw people as possible bul anough to covar thruc subgulis Ont where we re going to gol Irom hure with the procodure for tinalising jury instrublions
Point number iwo that I want to discuss is a couple of
appeals that have bucn taken from discoviry master order 247

\section*{- Vol 182947}

1 And thun I have a copvol request tor Plaintiffs Exhibits
that s been made by a nonpartv and I want 10 discuss that with
i) whoever from vou all s sides that will have some intormation
4) about duplicating exhibits

191 We II be in recess now tor 15 minules
s) MR NEAL Your Honor could we have that ruling
7) again the numberol the -

THE COURT Discovery master 247
MR NEAL Thank vou
THECOURT We ll bu in ruclss for 19 minutus
(Recess al 1203 pm )
(Juryinal 12 18)
MR NEAL WL call Mr Harry Jach Claar
THE CLERK Would you rase your right hand pluase
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name address and spell your last name
THE WITNESS Harry Lamoyne Claar Box 7673 Inclinc
Village Nevada
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF HARRY CLAAR (Live)
BY MR NEAL
Q is it Mr Claaror Mr Clayr'
? \(\triangle\) Claar
(A) QMr Claar I mgoing to aet a record with vou on the
, lastust on and olf the wand al thivtrid!

Vol 182949
(today)
A Yes sir
Q Caplain Hazelwood Greg Cousins and vou and for a brief perind of limu the pilol is that correct?
A Yes
Q The rucurd rullusls in thin casc that the pilot got off
ahoul around 1120 ohav \({ }^{7}\) Now during the ten-during the
hour pariod that vou werl on the hridge with Captain
Hacclword
did vou sul - did he plve vou orders?
AYer
Q All right Tull us quichly what orders he gave you
A We had a course change from 219 to 200 and from 200 to
180
(14) \(Q\) He gave vou from 219 he satd some to 200 ?
us, A 200 yes
(16) Q 200 and then he later on said come to 180 degrees?
(17) AYes

Q That s the course vou were on right?
1191 A Yes
(th \(Q\) Did he give vou anv other orders)
I He instructed me when I come steads up on 180 to put it
101
the mike
Q Put it on the mike what dou that mean' WL ve talked
ahout here the mihe the gyrn the automatic pilot Toput the
vassel on automalis pilot right?

\section*{Vol 182948}
1) You rea scaman righi?

A Yes
Q You ru now emploved by Arco'
AYes
Q As of the date of grounding in this caš vou whri amploved
by Exxon Shipping Company'
A Yes
\(Q\) And vou were on the grounding voyage'
A Yes
Q All right From - trom 1050 to approximatelv \(1 / 50\) vou
were on the bridge of the Valder is that correct?
A Correct
Q And you had the - vou sol called had the hulm in that right?
A Yes
\(Q\) And the helm as vou r xtanding rizht here - I mpirinting
now to Defendanta Exhibit 225 correct"
A Yes
Q You restanding thcr with the wheel Okay Whn ilse -
during that approximat hour period who else was on - who
else was on the bridge with you?
A The third mate (, reg Cousins pilot and the cuptain
Q Captain Hazelwood"
A Yes
Q You recognize Captain Hazelwood in the courtroom here

\section*{Vol 182990}

\section*{A Automatic pilot yes sur}

1 QTu puta visul on automatic pilot what do you do"
A tteady up on the course and there's a couple of buttons
(1)
the brigge there that - thev re on the console there that vou
push
Q Okay la it farto say to put a vessel - when you steady
up to 180 dugrees to put a vessel on the mike or put it on
automatic pilot vou punch this button right here?
A I don't know I can't read that what's there
Q Well it s on this - what do you call it up here?
A Okay That's looks familar
Q Anv cvant vou punch a hutton?
AYer
Q And "fones to automatic pilot instanily"
AYen
Q And then you punch a bution to take it off
A Yes
Q And \(i l\) comes off instantly?
AYes
Q Can you read that bution right - I can iread it etther
You punch a bution take il off"
AYes
Q Were Captan Hazelwood s orders crisp clear?
A Yes they were -
(2s) Q Authoritative?


\section*{Vol 182952}
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & way? A No \\
\hline 13) & Q Was his movements unsteady? \\
\hline (4) & A No \\
\hline (S) & MR NEAL Thank you Mr Claar \\
\hline (6) & THE COURT You may tross \(\llcorner x a m i n c\) \\
\hline 171 & MR O NEILL Thanh you Judgb \\
\hline 181 & CROSS EXAMINATION OF HARRY CLAAR \\
\hline (4) & BY MR O NEILL \\
\hline & Q You lull the cimploy ol Exxun Shippug Company wime aths \\
\hline & after the grounding? \\
\hline 111 & A Yes \\
\hline 1131 & Q And you work for Arco now? \\
\hline (14) & A Yes \\
\hline 1151 & Q Before you sailed with Captain Hazciwood you knew that he had a reputation as a partier didn 1 you? \\
\hline [17) & A I had heard that \\
\hline 1181 & Q And this cvening when you werc on the bridge with him \\
\hline & would it be lair to sav that al no fime did vou gut slone to \\
\hline 101 & him' \\
\hline 111 & A I don \(t\) know what you mean by clove to hum liow close is cluse' \\
\hline 31 & Q 1 don 1 know Lul sgolo vour National Transpurtation \\
\hline 141 & Satety Board lcstimunv and sce what vou muant when you said \\
\hline & \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\section*{Vol 182954}
(1) while -
(2) MR NEAL Your Honor if he s going to take him over
(3) as his witness he must quit the leading \(I\) merely asked him
(4) as a fact witness
(5) MR O NEILL He testified about the putting it on

161 make
(7) MR NEAL I withdraw the objuction I withdraw the

181 oblublion
THECOURT Thanh you thank you Go ahead
(10) BYMR O NEILL
(11) Q You thought it was unusual because from your experience
(12) It was unusual to put it on mike while you were still in Prince
(13) William Sound is that right?
(14) AYes
(1s) MR O NEILL Thanks
(16) THE WITNESS That sit?
(17) MR O NEILL Yes sir
(18) THE COURT Unless Mr Neal has something further
(19) Mr Neal anything further?
(20) MR NEAL Yeah just - just one question
( 1) Would you put the bridge up - never mind Never mind
1 I) Naver mind
(i) No lurther questions
(d) THECOURT Thanh you Mr Claar
(ـ) MS STEWART Detense calls -
\(\rightarrow\) Vol 18 2999
THE COURT 1 m vorrv Ididn 1 MS STEWART - Edward Murphy hv dupovition
" testimonv
(a) THECOURT Thank vou
(s) THE CLERK Rase vour right hand sir
(6) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(7) THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name
wi your address and spell vour last name
(9) THE WITNESS Michael Silver S I L V ER and I m
(10) from Houston Texas
\|l THECLERK Thand vou
1 । DIRECT EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM MURPHY (RGad)
? BYMS STEWART
 is name?
(in) A William Fdward Murphy M UR P H Y
17) Q Mr Murphy I see vou hrought a sopy of the trip tichets of

I the Southwest Alavha Pilols urad lor hilling purponcs loday
(i) With the small priat is the pilotage clause - what shown as
, the pilotage clause statement of liahility limitations lt s
, hard to read hut is that correct) Is it the back of the
ticket?
) A That is the back there Fach trip tucket there's \(\boldsymbol{d}\) white
a cover and iwn - I don \(\mathbf{t}\) know if , ou call them carbons anymore
si we don't actually use carhon Under the white ticket is a

\section*{Vol 182956}
(1) yellow and a pank and we write on the white of course and It
, goes through to the vellow and the pink After the master signs we deliver the pink (ops to hili We aend or tiketil mir
office the white and vellow \(\mathbf{c}\) upies whichare wed 1 beltere
one copv is retained in our recorda and the other copy in vent
. along with the bill to the shapper
1) On the back of each of those individual pages is the thing y you're referring to
Q And thistickel il a signed Whatare the two
signatures?
A The upper signature in this case is mine or whomever the
pilot would be and the lower signature is the master \(s\)
sugnature In this case Captan Hazelwood
Q And were they both signed this is the inbound iransil 3/22/89?
A Yea botb of those are signed
Q Shall I call it the Southwust Alasha Pilots Assoriation
lickel would that bu torrul or what do you tall it?
A Tripticket probuhls
QOkay Triptichal Ohay And that s DX3460 Thur-小d
ticket for the outhound transit is that borreal?
A Yes sir That's correct
Q And its similar to this and - and with your signature and
Captain Haselwoods'
A Correct


Vol \(18 \quad 2057\)
1) Q ll will be marhcd DX3461 A, to the liming of the signing I when and where dous 11 tahc place on March 22nd?
(i) A Well generallv speaking when the pilotage is completed
(4) and before the pilot disembarks the vessel whether abound or
(s) outbound we ask the master to sugn the trip slip In some
(6) cases the pulot has filled out the upper part of the trip slip
(7) sometime during the transit and the master may just see it

181 laying there and he'll sign it prior to the pilot geting off
(9) Sometime dunng the transit but always before the pulot
(a) divemitarks the mather ugns it
(11 Q In wour rebollcution av to the outhound transit sitp
1, DY346| whenuds that vencd hr Captain Hasclwood?
is I Well I have to all ithink just prior to my getting off id hut I connot rememher observing him sign the trip slip in I
191 can't siv with any precision
rial Q Asa profosional pilot for Prince William Sound do you
(17) Lul that il s part ol vour responsibility to be familiar with
usi the operation of the VTS system?
(19) A Yes I di
(o) Q Could you tell me sir based on your experience or what

1 " your underatanding wot the purpose of the VTS ayatum how il 1. - works?
i, A M) understanding it wav eatablished for the purposer of ( a) safety It's to advise vessels of traffic and to provide radar
( 1 surveils and alert them if thev strav out of whatever navigable

\section*{Vol 182958}
(b) bounds the Coast Guard has set That's my understanding
1) Q And is ther anv particular reason why it was the summer of

181 1977 when this \(v\) alem was put into place?
A Well it \(\mathbf{u}_{\text {d }}\) put into place to conacide or precede by a
, hort timie the openimi of the TrancAlaska Pipeline terminal
QWhat , Urunderalandine as apilal ol the range al the
radar monllor, which wire in ulfalas ol the lime of this
accidunl
A There are two Were I heleeve and stall are two radar
1101 s at
(II) the small hoat harbor the other is at Potato Point So the (1) entirety of the Port Valdez the green area is monitored and i3i my understanding was and is that the radar at Potato Point (14) monitors vessels down as far as Bligh Reef or possibly a little
(19) bit south of that

11si Q Based on vour understanding of the VTS system what would
171 you expect the watch standers in do if they viewed a vessel
ixi approaching known hazard on their radar?
(14) A I wouid expect that they would transmit their observation
( 01 to the ship via the VHF radio
( it Q Would you chash vour position)
in A Yes
(7) MS STEWART Thank you Mr Murphy
( \&) CROSS EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM MURPHY
(s) BYMS HANSON

\section*{Vol 182959}

Q When did you imilally get your pilotage endorsement on your federal license for Prince Willam Sound approximately? A I think about sometume in 1974
Q In order to get that endorsement can you tell us what
training you underwent? You toid us about Cook Inlet Do you
have a required number of trips you had to make for your
federal endorsement for Prince Willam Sound?
A To obtan federal - the federal -
Q Yes
A And Coast Guard endorsement' Yes I can't recall how many
(11) there were, but as is typical with Coast Guard pilutage
(12) requrements, the applicant is required to document a certans
(13) number of observed trips over the pulotage ground When he's
(14) satisfied that requirement he takes a written exammation
(IS) Q Now you have a certain number of trips that you re
(16) required These trips are they round trips whatever number a
(17) day?
(18) A Yes they are
(19) Q That sup and back and with respect to Prince William
(30) Sound was \(1 t\) - you tull mi where was il from like
(?) Hinchinbrook all the way into the Port of Valdue or whure was
1. It from and to?

1 3. A I can't remember with any precision what the Coat Guard
(4) pilutage requrements for Prince Wilham Yound were in 1974
(2s) but they requred a certain number of round trips suto the

\section*{Vol 182960}
is princspal portsin the Gound which would be Whittoer Valdez

1 and Cordova and they also required a certana number of round
13) trips through the ocean entrances to Prince Willadm gound How
4) many trips were required I don't remember
(s) Q Now atter you ve made the number of trips that are
(6) required you have to take a written exam?
(7) A Yes sar
(8) Q And can you lull us what that cxam consists of gincrally?
(9) A Okay After producing evidence that one has made the
(10) requared observed trips there is an examination 1 believe
(I) on - a written examination on shap handing perhaps on
(12) seamanshup I don't recall Then there s a chart sketch of
(13) the area in quevition
(14) Q So for Princu William Sound you wher saying they make you

IISI prepare a chart Can you lull us what thev mahe you put on the
(16) Lhart?
(17) A They call it a chart sketch und I haven't written - I
cis finshed writing my pilotage a number of years ago so it may
(19) havechanged but at the time the Coast Guard gives the
(20) applicant a prece of paper with the land contours of the area
ill in question They direct you to take that prece of paper and
( ) draw in all the principal - mark the principal points of land,
( ) 1 capes and label them draw in all the dangers usually the ten
1 4) fathom curve auy draw in randy draw in the nuan thep routes
(-S) with distances off course soundings along those routes the
magnetic variation for the area and so forth Then you turn
the sheet of paper over On the back of at, you - excuse me,
as part of the chart sketch you also draw in all the ands to
navigation
Q Like for this area Busby Island light you d have to put in -
A Sure
Q And its characterisucs?
A That's right
Q And you d have to put in the Bligh Reef buoy?
A Yes
Q With its characteristics?
A That's correct
Q And when you put it in they have you put in its exact location?
A Yes, they do
Q Go on What else would you put in?
A So when you're finushed with that chart sketch you turn
the
(19) sketch over and on the back of it, you write from memory the
complete light lust for the area The light hist is all
navigation ands in addition to lights buoys day markers
and
(22) so forth The location of those devices, the charactenstics
of any lights fog horns and so forth That pretty much
completes the chart sketch and lists of ards of navigation
MS HANSON Thank you and that completes the

\section*{Vol 182962}
cross txamination
MR RUSSO Your Honor the defendants call by deposition Paul Radike
THE CLERK I m sorry I didn I catch that last name
MR RUSSO Paul Radihe RADTKE
THECLERK Rase your right hand please
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record state your full name
address and speil your last name
THE WITNESS Malcomb Flynn Justice J USTICE
New Port Beach Calılorma
THECLERK Thank you
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF PAUL RADTKE
BY MR RUSSO
Q Please slate your full name
A Paul R Radtke
Q Your home address?
A 1832 East Fourth Street Supenor Wisconsin
Q What age are you?
A 34
(21) Q You also produced a copy of your third mate s license?
(22) A Yes
(13) Q And you received this license when?
(24) A August of '87
(25) Q Was that upon graduation?
- \(\quad\) XMAX(A2)

Vol \(18 \quad 2969\)

\section*{A Yes}

Q From where?
A Texas Mantume Academy
Q You also got a degree when you graduated from Texas
Martime?
A That is correct
Q What was your degree in?
A Bachelor of science in manne science
\(Q\) And this license this is the first issue)
A Yes that is correct
Q Now your resume covers your education For the record
can you tell us what your formal education has becn?
A Yes I have a bachelor of arts from Valparaiso University
in Englush 1 have a bachelor of science from Texas A \& M in manne science
Q You got your bachelor of arts degree after your graduated
from Texas Maritime Academy?
A No sir
Q Im sorry Vice versa It was - there was quite an
interval of time there?
AYes
Q You got your BA in 1978?
A Correct
Q And between 1978 and then graduating from Texas mariume what did you do during the interval between 1978 and going into

\section*{Vol 182964}

Texas?
A I was a junior high English teacher from 1978 until 1981 I
belıeve Then I spent a year of both working part tume and
going to school part tume here in Supenor Wisconsin prior
attending Texas Maritime Academy in '83 or '84
Q And you were employed by Exxon Shipping to start with in 1987 is that correct?
A That is correct
Q As an able bodied seaman?
A That's correct
Q And did you apply with them to become a licensed officer but they just didn thave an opening and they hired you as an \(A B ?\)
A I was hured as an A-B and I belıeve st was company policy at that tume that they were not directly hinag licensed
officers They were requang people to work on the deck for
certan penod of time I think for evaluation reasons pnor to sailing as an officer
Q Just turning for the present to the period of time that you
were on the Exxon Valdez and you were in Valdez and then you sailed with the vessel you were aboard at the time of the grounding is that correct?

\section*{A That is correct}

Q Prior to the Exxon Valdez grounding had you ever sasled as a licensed officer?

A No sir
Q When you were aboard the Exxon Valde7 you had what
watches?
A I was assigned to the eight to 12 watch
Q The morning to 2400 in the evening?
A That's correct
Q What was your watch partner?
A Harry Claar from - from the tume l joined the ship to the tme I left the ship
Q Mr Kagan wavaboard while vou were aboard?
A That scorrect
\(Q\) Did vou ever observe him stcering?
A No sir
Q Did vou cver hear anvihing ahout his ability to steer?
A No sar
Q Did you ever hear anything about his - about the
evaluations he received?

\section*{A No sir}

Q You received evaluations while you worked with Exxon?
A Yes Idid
Q And how were they and in what gencral range?
A I beheve from very good to exceptional
Q Were vou cver while you were aboard the Exxon Valdez on watch whun Cousins was the mate?
A Yes In fact he was the mate on my watch

\section*{Vol 182966}

Q You had the eight to l2'
A Correct
Q Was this the first uncounter ynu had had with Cousins
during your smploy with Exxon?
A Yes
Q Whan vou gel an ordurasa normal practice when vou get
an
order len degrees righl rudder -
AYes
Q - would you repeat the order?
A Yes
Q After you put the wheel over ten degrees would you tell
the mate that your wheel is over ten degrees so that you not
only repeated the orders but you tell him again?
A Sometames yes, sometimes no Depending on the circumstances
Q Would the mate watch you 10 - during this process as a
matter ol routine when you were given an order whether it was by the mate or captain or pilot would they watch what you did? AI belteve so
Q They d be watching you wouldn they? In esaence no matter what the order was to make sure number one you put the
wheel in the right direction?
A Correct
(24) \(Q\) And number two to see that you put to the proper number (25) of degrees he \(s\) told you to put it so if he gave you a number
of degrees of the rudder correct'
A That's correct
Q So il doesn i make any difference if you re given a right
five degree rudder order or a right 15 degree rudder order or a
right 30 degree rudder order it s important for the mate on
watch to watch to see that you put that wheel in the right
direction that is to the right for that order not to the left?
AYes
Q And the second thing he stosce that vou pulit io the
number of degrees you va han wld lopul il (t) urrall' A Correct
Q What I m wondering is you re steering a steady course
whatever it is You re trying to hold it to that course and
(5) let a say you requite successful There are tumes aren t there when you re steering you re able to hoid it almost (17) right on the gyro heading that you re on is that correct? (18) AYes
(19) Q Then you re given a rudder order in this example I gave
(20) you a right rudder order let say il sight ten degrees
(21) rudder I would like to know the inturval of lime Irom the
(22) moment you turn your whucl in rusponsc wheel -1 maan the
(23) helm in response to the ordur vou ru givin loturn the whul
(-4) from that being the starting point the inicrual of time irom
( st that point to when you re louking at the byro and you start to

Vol \(18 \quad 2968\)
, see the gyro ruspunding to your moving the whed over going 10

1181182 so the minulc you acc 11 muve olf 180 what is that interval of timb?
A It's been so long smece I have had - had a feel for that shap that I don't think I call give you a good answer for that Q Would you agree that il would only be a matler of butonds? In other words il s not a matlicr of minutes tor surl?
A Yes, I'd agree with that
Q Did you find that the Exxon Valdez as compared to other
vessels you served on to bu a more difficult vissel 10 steer
easier the same or is there any comparisun you can make?
A I was aware that she was a much larger shap than I had steered prior to that tume The sheer momentum of the ship was
(14) something that the helmsuan certanly had to hear in mind In
il' terms of respoasiveness I didu i kuow that she wav anty more
6) difficult to deal wath than bet say a suall thip

Q Did you find that she was an casy ship to stier casy to hold onto a course that you were given a slady heading?
A In all waters that I happened to be helmsman on Yes I beheve she was an easy ship to steer
Q You were in the Port of Valdes how many times prior to the grounding let s say?
A I'll guess five tumes
Q So you wert there mayblanywhere from two lo four times
within that rang '

Vol \(18 \quad 2970\)
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 182970 \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(1) either impaired or intoxicated?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{1) A That is currect} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(3)} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(w) ANo sir} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(s) Q Did you cver drinh aboard any Exxon vissel?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(6) A No, sir Outside of a holiday dinner where I believe wne} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(7) was served, New Year's Eve and Chnstmas Eve, I believe,} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{and} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(8) that was some years shortly after i joined as an \(A\)} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(10) Q Before you were employed by Exxon did you undergo any} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(11) testing for drugs or anything of that nature?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(12) A Yes, I did} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(13) Q What sort of tusting did you undergo'} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) A My interview in Houston I was giver} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(15) screensing} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{1161 Q Now referring to the evening of March 23rd 1989 do you} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(17) rucall when you were at the stern that - maybe not necessarily} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(18) at the stern but do you recall that Cousins contacted the} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(19) second mate? Were you aware that there was a - there were} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(.0) discussions between Cousins and the second mate concerning} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(21) Cousins staying up on the bridge into part of the second mates} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(22) watch?} \\
\hline (23) & A Actually, I remember that discussion when I was on the \\
\hline & bridge I overheard Greg talking to the second mate \\
\hline & \(Q\) When was that? About what time \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\[
-\quad \text { Vol } 182971
\]

A I believe it was either moments before leaving the dock or possibly shortly after leaving the dock The guys would still have been down on the deck securng for sea even after we departed the dock
Q That was a radio conversation was it or was the second mate on the bridge?
A It was a radio conversation
Q Do you recall what was said by Cousins or the essence of what was said \({ }^{2}\)
A As I recall it was just a - I beheve Greg offered so he mututed the conversation just saying I feel pretty good If you want to catch some extra sleep go ahead I'll take part

\section*{your watch}

Q And obviously the second mate must have sald yes or do you know?
A Uh-huh I think he did
Q All right When did you take over the wheel right after leaving the dock?
A I would have been at the wheel shortly before the vessel cast off her last few lines
Q When you went to the bridge who was there? What other individuals?
A The chief mate the captan and the pilot
Q Okay As far as the chief mate went was he subsequently
relieved by Cousins?

\section*{Vol 182972}
(1) AYes
(2) Q When did that take place?
(3) A Sometime after leaving the dock
(4) Q Was it before going through the Narrows?
(5) A I belueveso yes
(6) Q Further concerning the evening of March 23 rd 1989
(7) And what was the captain s demeanor on the bridge during
(x) this initial puriod when you took over the wheul?
(9) A What do you mean by demeanor'
or Q First of all let me ask you could you see him? li was ) nightıme Il was dark?

A I do recall receiving orders from him and I do recall seeng him as we were leaving the dock and I recall seeng him
(14) at the window for some penod of time after leaving the dock
(15) \(Q\) Was he giving you the orders to the wheel or was the (6) pilot?
1) A He was relaying orders to the chief mate who was in turin (1) relaying orders to me At the tume we left the dock the palot 9) and the captan were on the wing relaying orders bv radio

Q Who initiates those orders? Are they initiated bv the pilot and then relayed through his offices to you?
2) Ay assumption was that the pilot was initiating those 3) orders
(24) \(Q\) Did you notice anything unusual about the captain at all in (23) his speech?

5-26-94
VOLUME 18

A Vo ur
Q Did voustul clove anoush io him io mell his breath while you were on the bridge?
Aldon't believe so
Q Did you hear any conversation between the capiain and the pilol?
AYes
Q What did you hear if you can remember the essence of it? A I recall them swapping a sea story leaving Valdez
together
(and the helmsman making some steenng mistakes I recall
the
HI) captan on the radin to somenne I m not gure who I do
recall some inbound traffic I helieve it was a ferry And I recall some radio traffic with that ferry Again I don't remember if it was the pilot or the captain
Q Would that be within the Port of Valde7?
A Yeah before the Narrows
Q Backing up to the conversation with Hazelwood when you were
(18) on the bow was there anything you noticed in the conversation
(9) that you thought was unusual about his voice?

A No
Q When he spoke with you on the walkie talkie when you were on the bow did he laik with you slowly then?
A I did not notice any difference if that's what you're getting at no
Q Now on the night coming out of Valdez that is the evening

\section*{Vol 182974}
(1) of March 23 rd you had a chance to observe Captain

Hazelwood
() walking pacing the bridge?
(3) A I would not say observe I saw hm on the bridge
(4) \(Q\) Did you notice anyihing unusual ahout his walk?
(9) A No sir
(6) Q Warhi stumbling'
\(\because A\) Vn ur
(8) Q Washe weavink'
(i) ANo
(10) \(Q\) When you heard him speaking to the pilot did you observe

U1। any slurring of his words?
(I) A No, I didn't
(13) \(Q\) When he spoke to you on the radio at least on one
(14) occasion did you notice any slurring of his words?
(IS) A No, sir
(16) MR RUSSO Your Honor that concludes the direct
(17) examination of Paul Radike
(1y) MS HANSON A brief cross Your Honor
(19) CROSS EXAMINATION OF PAUL RADTKE
rol BYMS HANSON
1 " Q Did you cver see any shiphoard searches made by the caplain
1 , of the shap for alcohol or drugs'
(3) A None that I can recall
(4) MS HANSON Thank you Nothing further
(יs) MR CHALOS Good afternoon

Vol 182975
Your Honor the defendants call Jack Stewart live
THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand please
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record stats your tull name
address and spell your last name plsase
THE WITNESS Name s Jack Sitwar S TE W A T I
live at 1399 Sacramento Avenue West Sacramento
THE CLERK Thank you sir
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JACK STEWART (Live)
BY MR CHALOS
Q Mr Stewart what do you do for a living?
A Right now I'm transporting propane
Q As a driver?
A Right
\(Q\) How long have you had that job?
A About three years
Q What did you do before that?
AI was a seaman
Q How long were you a seaman for?
A Almost my life on and off
Q How many years would you say'
A Oh, 2530 years
Q Did you have a job as a seaman at a spucilic rank or rating?
A Yes I sanled pumpman for Exxun

A It was on Exxon North Slope in 1980
Q He was captain at the time?
A Yes, he was
Q When was the next - and you made a trip with him on that
occasion?
A Uh huh yes Panama
Q Was that for about 30 days?
AYes
Q Okay When was the next time you met Captain Hazelwood?
A It was a trip I made on the Valdez about - it was prior to
the grounding, a year or so prior to it
(12) Q Would that be 1988 ?
(13) A Yes, must have been
(14) Q Where did you go on that occasion?
(15) A Panama Valdez to Panama
(16) Q How long - how long were you on the ship that tume with
(17) Captain Hazelwood?
(18) A Approximately the same tume
(19) Q 30 days or so?
(30) A 30 days give or take
(?l) Q During that 30 day period during that 30 day period that
( a) we re talking about did you ever observe Captain Hazelwood
(23) drinking on the ship?
(24) A No
(25) Q Did you ever smell any alcohol on his breath?

\footnotetext{
Vol 182976
Q Did you say pumpman'
AYes
Q ls that a rating that the Coast Guard gives'
AYes
Q You have a certificate as a pumpman'
A Yes 1 have all engine roum endorsement
Q Whal did you do as a pumpman what is your job'
A To assist the chief mate in the loading discharging all
deck machinery Of course it schief engineers but l orked
under the chef on the deck muchnery
Q As a pumpman you worhud lor the \(-n_{z}\) ine dupartment of the ship is that right?
A Engme and deck I kind of weat both of them lu the port
you'd usually work for the chief mute
Q Okay Al sea you were working for the thefengineer?
A Yes in most cases
Q Now you worked for Exxon for a period of timu did you not?
AYes
Q What ycars did you work for Exxun'
A I worked for them in the early part of '74 and then from
' 81 to '90 1 thank
Q1981 to 19907
A Yeah
Q When was the first time you met Captain Ha/clwond?
}

\section*{Vol 182978}

A No
Q Did you ever see him impaired?
A No
Q I m talking now about that 30 day trip?
A Yeah
Q You gol olfin Long Beach did you not?
A Yes
Q Did you drink anything when you gol off in Long Beach?
A No I dıdn't
Q Did Captain Hazelwood get off with you in Long Beach?
A No not with me
Q All right When was the next tume you saw Caplain
Hazelwood after that trip?
A It was close to a year later, I belıeve I went back on
the Valdez
Q Would that have been in February of 1989 ?
A Yes
Q And you - so you were on board about a month before the
ship ran aground?
A Yes, I joined down in Los Angeles I thank
Q During that period of time you had occasion to interact with Captain Hazelwood?
A Yes quite a bit We were lightering up north
Q Okay Now did you evar see Captain Hazelwood drinking on
(2s) board the ship during that 30 day period before the grounding?
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{- Vol 182979} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(1) A No} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{() Q Did you ever see him impaired?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(3) ANo} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(4) Q Intoxicated?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(s) A No} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(6) Q Now you said at sea you were assigned to the engine} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{17) department Did you work for Chief Glowackı?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(8) A Yes} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(9) Q Are you familar with a first assistant by the name of Rav} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(10) Jones?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(11) A Yes I am} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(1) Q How about a second assistant named Oldham?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(13) A Yes} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) Q And third assistant named Katie Havens?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(1s) A Yes} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(16) Q Did you ever see any of those three people drinking on the (7) ship?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(18) A No, I didn't see any drinking on that ship} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(19) Q Did you see any parties on that ship?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(ro) A No} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(21) Q Did you hear any rumors of any parties?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(r2) A No, 0} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{3) Q You dealt with these people on a regular basis?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{( 4) A Almost every night I worked over time in the engine} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{room} \\
\hline & Q You got close to these three peopie from time to time? \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\section*{Vol 182980}

\section*{A All the tume}

Q Did you smell any alcohol on their breath?
A Never
Q Now you said that you never saw any liquor on board the
Exxon Valdez?
A No I haven't
Q Now in the period of time that you worked for Exxon did
you ever see the ship searched for drugs or alcohol?
A Yeah a lot of tımes they'd call it a sanitary inspection
and they'd shake down the rooms and it was a search And
also
III a sanutary inspection
Q Well during the sanitary inspection what were they
searching for?
A Anything that was contraband according to their rules
and
(5) regulations

Q Including liquor?
AOh yeah absolutely
Q Alcohol of any kınd?
A Certanaly
Q Who conducted the search?
A It was usually an officer chaef mate and the captan supposedly Ideally there would be a ship's delegate from the
(23) umon along with them and maybe one other officer
(24) Q And you saw these searches on more than one occasion?
(2S) A I knew they took piace In fact, I thunk I came in my room

Vol \(18 \quad 2983\)
Q Did you notuce any stumbling on his part?
A No
Q Any unsteady movements?
A No
Q Now I d like to direct your attention to the period of time after the grounding?
AYes
Q Did you have occagion to see Captain Hazelwood again?
A Yes, later on after the grounding
Q Say within an hour hour and a half after the grounding?
A Something hive that Sometume's pretty murky
Q Where did you see Captain Hazelwood at that tume'
A I was coming back up out of the pump room and he was out on
(14) the man deck and I mentioned to hum as I went by that the pump
(1s) room was intact but I'd already anformed the mate of this and
(16) I'm sure the captan had known, but just in passing I told
(17) hm
(18) Q All right 1 want to concentrate on your meeting with
(19) Capiain Hazelwood
(30) A Uh huh
( 1) Q You got close to himat that point?
( ) A Yes we were fairly close
(3) Q Did he appear to you to in any way be impaired by alcohol?
(24) A Not to me he didn't at all
(.S) Q Did you observe him walking at that period of time?

\section*{Vol \(18 \quad 2984\)}

II A He wus stull there when I left
Q Whan he - and ha spohe lu you'
A Uh huh
Q Did he slur his words at all?
A No no
Q Did he appear to you to be calm under the circumstances?
A I've sanled with Captann Hazelwood and I thank be's one of the best captans I've sailed with be's very focused There
(4) was no panic among the crew or the captan Fverything was in
(10) pretty bad shape at that tume but everybody semed to havea
(11) good handle un it
(12) Q Did you have - at that point in time I take it you wher
(13) prelly shook yourself?
(4) Oh sure
(1S) Q Did you have fath that Caplain Ha/nlwood would handle the
(16) situation and do the righi thing by way of the ship and the
(17) cruw and the targo and the tnvironment)
(18) A Yeah it's something that you're not going to sit there and
(19) artuculate, but you have the feeling that what Captan
(30) Hazelwoud would do would be the right thing, so that's a burden
(-1) off you, you go about your -
(- ) Q That s how you fell al that tumb?
( 3 3) A Absolutely
(4) MR CHALOS Thank you Mr Sluwarl
, THE COURT You mav cross cxaminc

MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
CROSS EXAMINATION OF JACK STEWART
BY MR O NEILL
Q Sir you receive a pension from Exxon Corporation?
A Yes, ten year pension
Q You re loyal to both Exxon and to Captain Hazelwood aren t you?
A I'm not loyal to Exxon I - I admire Captonn Hazelwood I respect ham
Q And you testified here today that you had the opportunity
to observe Captam Hazelwood as he came on board the vessel
You said I had the opportunity to observe him?
A Did I say that?
Q Yes you did
A Okay I think that question was asked if I had an
opportunity to observe hum
Q Yeah
A I didn't say I observed hm I saw the captan when he came down the gangway
Q You didn tobserve him?
AI saw ham yes
Q You had been awake for 39 hours?
A 36 off and on
Q You had started work you went on duty the morning of the 22nd at six that morning and you worked through and you got

Q As I turn these pages over it means you re lucky Im not as bad as I seem sir
And when you ran into Captain Hazelwood later on again that was just for a moment wasn \(t t^{\text {? }}\)
A Yes it wasn't any length of time no lengthy conversation
\(Q\) So the two situations that you ve just been questioned
about were two very brief moments one in which you were tired
30 to \(\mathbf{4 0}\) feet away and then the one after the incident you
passed him in the hallway?
A No it was on deck
Q You passed him on deck?
A Yeah and talked for a bnef moment
Q Brief moment five seconds ten seconds?
A Yeah something lake that
MR O NEILL Thank you
MR CHALOS No redirect Your Honor
THE COURT You may step down sur Thank you
MS STEWART Your Honor defendants call Ray Jones to
the stand By deposition
THE CLERK Was that Ray Jones' Extuse mc in that
Ray Jones?
MS STEWART Ray Jones by deposition
THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand please (The Witness Is Sworn)
( s) THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name
```

Vol 18 2988
your address and spell your last name
THE WITNESS Mike Stehle S T E H L E Anchorage
Alaska
THECLERK Thank you
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF RAY JONES (Read)
BY MS STEWART
Q There s an interjection al the beginning off the deposition
that says this is the deposition of Raymond Jones
A Ray
Q Ray Sones I take it you have a license?
AIdo
Q Could you describe your license?
A It's a chief engineers steam and diesel unlumited
horsepower upon oceans
Q You graduated from Kings Point?
A Yes
Q And you had the dual degree engineer and third mate?
A Yes I do
Q What year did you graduate from Kings Point?
A1976
Q You graduated from Kings Poוnt in 1976 What was your
first job upon graduation?
(23) A My first employment was with ExxonUS A that was the
(24) name of the company at that tume Exxon Company U S A
(25) third assıstant engineer

```
as a

\section*{Vol 182990}
reports directly to the chief engineer under his supervision
Q What was your next assignment with Exxon after you left Exxon
A I took the SPOSA the early retirement after that
Q What sthat?
A It was a program they were offering monev or incentive
to
retire or terminate employment
Q How long had that program been in effect?
A It was just being offered They were laying up some ships and they had a surplus of people

don Inccessarily have 10 rifurto that hut can you just give
us a chronology of the whole lime you were in Valder and when you sated? And take your time and be as specific as you can A That moraing we had had some turbocharger problems when we
(10) left San Francisco So my intention that day was to opea up (17) the oil sumps up on those and inspect them, which I proceeded
(8) to do And that took basically the enture day That afternoon I was in the engine room basically the whole tume doing those mspections That afternoon I can't be specific about the tıme but I was notified that there was a telephone call for the chsef engineer in the radio officer's room I went up there to talk to Paul I can't even remember his last name now the port engineer from San Francasco wanted to talk
(25) to the chief engineer about this turbocharger problem

\section*{Vol 182991}
1) I went up, I had a conversation with him I went back
2) below I rinushed the turbocharger unspections and proceeded
3) to get the plant ready to leave that aght
4) Q This is the 23 rd now"
s) A Thus is the 23rd, Thursday, standby leaving the dock was at
6) 2054 That was uneventful Everything proceeded normally
(7) Q Had you seen Joe Hazelwood any tume that evening?
8) A No I hadn't I talked to him on the telephone After we
(9) were clear, it was our usual procedure as a routioe to wash
the
(10) efficiency boosters on the man engue and before 1 did that, I
(1) always informed the bndge that I was going to do it I talked
to hum I called the bridge to let them know that I was gong
(13) to proceed to do this Captann Hazelwood answered the phone
(i4) Informed ham of my mitentions he said fine, go ahead Then we
(Is) joked Thus was - I thunk Pete Rose had just gone through
hus
1101 I
117) hung the telephone up and I went below and proceeded io wash
( 18 , the turbochargers
(?2) Q Before you get to that did Joc Harclwood lalh about what (13) he had done ashorl?

1 41 A No hedidn's

A No he didn't
Q Going to page 49 Ms Haven is asked if thure was any Iiquor on board the Exxon vessels she serves on She hatifies that thcre was - that there was inuluding the Exxon Valdel
Do you agree with her that there was liquor on board the Exxon
Valdes whic you weru aboard il?
A Inever saw it
Q Is u your testimony that you vo nuvar yctn liquor on the Exxon Valdez?
A l've never seen hquor on the \(f\) xavon Valdez
Q Ms Haven lestilied that she saw unpage \(\$ 0\) line II she said tan you tell me - can youltll nit in whusc yuaricrs you saw that liquor and she answers the lirst assistant a second assistant \(s\) and the captain \(s\) Did you ever have liquor in your roum on board the Exxon Valdez'
A No I did not
Q Do you know whether or not there was ever liquor on board the Exxon Valdus while you were thart?
A I never saw any liquor
Q Did you ever sce anyone drinh ahoard thi Exxon Valdus
while
(1 Itwasal sua)
A No I did not
Q You mantioncd you raceivida adl Irom Caplain Haculwond prior to the grounding?
A I called him
(1) Q I see to tell him you were washing the turbochargers Do () you recall what ume that was?
(3) A It was just before the vessel began to load program up It
(4) was after the pulot was away It has to be that because we
(5) can't wash during maneuvening
(6) MS STEWART Thank you That concludes defendants
(7) direct examination
(8) MR O NEILL No questions
(9) MR LYNCH I have the honor to call Admural Clyde
(10) Robbins by deposition video deposition Your Honor
( +1 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF CLYDE ROBBINS
(12) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(13) \(Q\) Would you state your full name FOR the record please?
(14) A I'm Clyde E Robbins
(15) Q And by whom are you currently employed?
(16) A I'm employed by - I'm active duty Coast Guard officer (17) assigned to the Department of Transportation
(18) Q At the tume of the Exxon Valdez spill you were commander (19) of the Pacıfic area?
(20) A That's correct
(21) \(Q\) What were your duties in that post?
(22) A Well, they were for the overall supervision of Coast

Guard
(23) dutues west of the Rockies throughout the Pacific, Asia and
(24) over to the center lime of Africa any responsibilities the
(rs) Coast Guard had shipbulding supervision law enforcement

\section*{Vol 182994}
(1) responsibilities in the areas around, for anstance, Guam and (2) other fisheries areas that the United States has

\section*{responsibility}
(3) for and of course, search and rescue ands to aavigation, all (A) of the Coast Guard duties
(5) \(Q\) In that position did you report directly to the
(6) commandant?
(7) A Yes
(8) Q And how many areas are there for the United States?
(4) A There's two areas one on the east coast, one on the west
(10) coast
(II) Q Admiral how did you first learn that the Exxon Valdez had (1) run aground in Prince William Sound?
(13) A 1 got a phone call at the office that the - actually,
(id) the - my chief of staff brnefed me upon going to work on
(15) Friday morning that we'd had a problem there and - and
gave me
(16) a rundown on what was going on
(17) Q I d like to show you a memorandum dated August 301989
(18) Irom Admıral Robbins to Admırals Yost and Lusk which we I!
(Is) marh as 46521 This is predesignated Exhibil 164
(20) A Okay
( 11 Q Did you send Exhibit 46521 to Admurals Yost and Lusk on or 1-1 about August 30 1989?
(3) AIdid
(-4) Q And at about this tume Senator Stevens from the State of
(2s) Alaska was visiting Valdez?
) AYes
Q And did he pose a question to you as to whether the third mate on the Exxon Valdez had broken any regulations in fating to report the movement of the ship on the night of March 23 March 247
A Yes he did - he did ask some questions about it in a general discussion
Q Did he ask you whether any regulations had been broken when
(9) the ship did not report that it had gone outside the inbound lane?
A I'm - I don't remember you know exactly what the
conversation was but I am - I'm sure that he was of - that
) it concerned hum as to whether a regulation had been broken or
(14) not, and in my dascussions with various people you can't be
(15) around an operation such as that and not pick up some sorts of
(16) information, even though I wasn't deeply involved with it And
(17) my answer to that was to the best of my knowledge he did not
(18) break a regulation
(19) Q Did you have any discussion with Admiral Yost about paragraph three of your memo in which you indicate you got that
(-1) inquiry from the senator and what your response was?
(22) A I don't - as far as I recall it that's the only time I
broached the issue was nght there
Q Did anyone subsequently tell you that you d been incorrect
in advising the senator that no regulations had been broken

\section*{Vol 182996}
) when the third mate failed to report that the ship had gone
outaide of the inbound lane?
A No one ever dad and I stall don't know to this day whether
that is correct or not
Q I take it it s still your belief that no violation
occurred?
A To my knowledge it was no violation
Q Can you take a look at Exhibit 46521 please
AYes
(10) Q In particular paragraph three can I just read that into
(11) the record? This is the memo from yourseif io Admirals Yosi
(12) and Lusk dated 30 August 1989 I want to read paragraph three
(13) into the record
(14) I also told him that Cousins broke no specific VTS
(ts) regulation when he failed to report passing through the upbound
(16) lane The senator assumed a regulation was broken Not so (I) from what I can determine He may aak you about it
(18) Admiral, my only question is with regard to your statement
(19) there from what I can determine did you look at any
(20) regulationa regarding the VTS procedures at all before you d (21) spoken to the senator?
(22) A I'm sure I had read them over and - and talked to some of
(23) the people that were involved that had more expert knowledge of
(24) what the regulations were than I did and I was told that he (25) had not broken a regulation by not reporting passing through
(1) the upbound lane
1) Q During part of the interrogation yesterdav you provided us
(a) some somments on navigating in Prince Willam Sound and I wanl
(d) to go bath and louch hrieflv on that

141 I belteve vou gave us a figure vesterdav of how manv
(o) transits had been made of Prince William Sound in the TAPS
(7) tanker trade prior to this incident Do vou recall how many
(8) sate passages had occurred -
(9) A I belteve it was -
(10) Q - prior to this incident?
(11) A - close to 9000
(I) QTo your knowledge are there any particularly difficult
(13) navigational problems in navigating from the Gulf of Alaska
(14) into the port or out?
(15) A The one that we were very concerned with from the very
(16) beginning was the Narrows as one approaches the Valdez Harbor
(17) there's a lattle rockv island there that's as I recall very (18, near the center of the Narrows and it makes maneuvenng
(19) difficult There was - there was great concern about that
(ro) Q Once a master has taken his ship out of the Port of Valde7
(al) and through the Narrows are there any particular great
(22) difficulties or navigational problems in caling the ahip from
(23) Valdez Arm past Hinchinbrook out to the Gulf of Alaska?
(74) A Navigatung a vessel from after the Narrows out to the Gulf (25) of Alaskg has never been considered a great problem

There is

Vol 182998
i one obstacle that was considered early on un the development of
(?) the traffic patterns out of Prince Willam Sonnd and that was
(3) the - the growlers that come off the -

Q Columbia Glacier?
A The glacier nght The name - the word shpped me for a
moment And those small growlers find their way out into
the
in and outbound lanes of the Prince William Sonnd
Q Well lut me ask you this vou were twice the districi
commandur correcl?
A Yes
Q And as part of those commands you commanded vessels
correct?
A Rught
(14) \(Q\) And you had to be concerned with the safety of those
(IS) vessels correct?
(16) A Right
(17) Q And I take it you informed yourself as to where there were
(18) easter or more difficult passages that your ships would
(19) regularly traverse?
(20) A Surely
(1) Q And did you have - when you were Pacific area commander
is you had ships in your command did you not?
(3) A Yes
(14) Q Did you come to an understanding as to whether there were
(9) any places known generally by mariners to be difficult to
(n) A I think if you're looking to my expenence in comparison of
channels and entnes into areas i will-I can only compare it to my dutues as captan of the port and responsible for the
ads to navigation going in and out of Houston and Galveston,
(6) and the navigation problems of going in and out of there were
overwhelming in companson to going in and out of Prince Willıam Sound
MR O NEILL We have no cross examination
THE COURT Okay
MR LYNCH Your Honor may I olfer DX3523 which is
the paragraph of the Auguat \(\mathbf{3 0}\) memorandum which was
referenced
(13) in Admiral Robbins deposition testimonv
(4) (Exhibit DX3523 offered)
(Is) MR O NEILL We have no objuclion
(10) THE COURT DX3¢23 is admillud
(17) (Exhibil DX3S23 received)
(18) MR SANDERS May il plase the Court our naxi

191 witness is Mr Gurdon Taytor I have to doalillle alaging
20) here Il is by video but there is a minor problem and I have (1) to put up a chart
(12) May il please the Court there was a problem with the a
( 3) videotape in reproducing il or something and the first several
ad) lines are missing Irom the vidcotape and with your permission
(2s) and I hope no objection Irom the plaintitifs I would hith to

\section*{Vol 18 3(KH)}
simply ruad the iniroduciory qualionna and anvu \(r\) and then
we II start the tape at the IIrst plact whore wh have

\section*{sumething}

MR O NEILL Noubjccion
THE COURT Fine go ahead
MR SANDERS The first question is would you state
your name for the record please Thu answer is Gordon Paul Taytor
Qucstion what did you do in lurment amploymanalitr -
immodatuly allurgradualing Iromhigh thoul
Answer Coast Guard
Question and did you gillo the Codst Guard as an cnlisicu man The answurwas yw
Qucstion and then what did vou du
Answer then I worked as a wivilian wath stander for the
Departmint of Transportation in Valdue Alasha
Question that s from 87 untal when sir
(18) Anawer to 89 approximately
(19) Question when in 1989 did you leave that job
(20) Anawer oh about July
11) Now Ithind wh have tape Irom that poist on Your Honor
( \(\because\) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GORDON PAUL TAYLOR (Video)
(3) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
( +) Q Do you ruall - what shitt did you uurh on Marah 23 19x9)
(s) A Four pm to midanght 1600 to 24010
(1)
() Vessel Traffic Center the day of March 23rd 1989 ?
(3) A Approximately what tume did I get there?
(t) QYes
(S) A 1530 1545, that's just what thme you show up

161 Q Who did - who did you relieve as watch stander?
(7) A I believe it was F rank Shepard
( (8) \(Q\) Was there a vessel called Arco Juneau that was transiting
(9) outbound in the system during your watch on March 2319897
(10) A 1 beheve there was Outbound at the start of my watch
was.
(II) Arco Juneau
(12) Q Ohay have you ever histened to any purtion of the March
(13) 231989 tape recording that deals with communications any
(14) communications you may have had with the - with the Arco
( 15 ) Juneau?
(16) A No, I have not

1171 Q Okay Let scontinue talking about the Arco Juncau Do
(18) you recall receiving an ice report from the Arco Juncau on
(19) March 23 1989?
(20) A I believe I did
(1) Q What was the content of that int report to the best of
(-1 your rewollection)
(23) A Let's see Beat I can remember is it was - they sand the (74) ice was extending extending down from Point Freemantle across
(2s) to Glacier Island across to Bligh Reef I beheve that's what

\section*{Vol \(18 \quad 3002\)}
(1) they sand And i believe they even had to deviate a little
i ) bit I dou't know if they went - how far out they had
(3) deviated but they had to do sume course changes and speeds to
(4) get down through the ice That's dll I remember on that
(s) Q Do you recall how many different tumes you talked to the -
(6) to the Arco Juneau on its nutbound voyage?

171 ANo 1 don't
(si Q Did you follow the Arco Juncau on radar?
(9) AYes Idid
(10) Q How lar did you lollow the Arbo Juneau on radar)
(11) A I dou trecall As far down as I could but I can't tell 1) vou exactly where
(13) Q You sadd a moment ago that you recall that the Arco Juneau
(1a) had to deviate to some extent although you zaid you couldn :
(19) recall the particulars Do you recall whether you were able to
(16) tollow the Arco Juneau during all or part of its deviation?
(I7) A I don't think I recall being able to plat them or follow
(18) them on any other than just the radio radio calls There's
(19) nothing that I - you know no visual or anything lake that
(20) It was all radio done by the radio
t-1) Q Are you saying that as you sil here today you didn isee
(2.) any part of the course of the Arco Juneau that represented a
i ) deviation from the outbound lanc on radar?
(4) A Not that I recall not that I recall
(S) QOkay Do you recall anything further about what the Arco
\(\qquad\) Vol 183003
(1) Juncau reported to you about its intentions in deviating from I its assigned lane?

A No I don't
QMr Taylor al sometime after the transil of the Arco
Juneau the outbound transit of the Arco Juneau did you pass
on to the Exxon Valdez the ice report that vou had received from the Arco Juncau?
A I beheve I did
Q What did you pass on to the - to thu Exxon Valder"
A I recall I passed on to them that there was ice extended completely across the lanes and that was - and that I had gotten a report a lot earlier and that I would request a report
from them when they got down to there
Q You testified earier in this deposition that the Arco
Juneau told you that the tce was all the way across the lanes didn \(t\) you?
A That's what I recalled yeah
Q And if that s the tee report that you got that s the ice
report that you should have conveyed to the Exxon Valdez isn t it?
A If that's the ice report I got then that's the ice report
(2) I should have conveyed
(73) Q I asked you earlier whether you racalled how far you
(4) plotted the Arco Juneau on radar and whether you could pick
up
(s) the deviation on radar Do you recall that?

\section*{Vol 183004}

\section*{A Yes}
(?) Q Do you recall that testimony?
(3) A I recall
(4) Q And I believe you tustimony was that vou did noll ohncrus (s) the deviation on radar?
(6) A I don't recall observing the deviation on radar
(7) Q You re saying now that you don 1 recall observing it (8) A Right
(9) Q Okay It thought you testified earlier that you recalled
(10) that you did not observe it?
(II) A Well I didn't observe it that I recall how's that sound
(1) Q Okay Turn over to page 499 in the same exhibit starting
(1) at line 2 down to line 12 question even under - you just
(14) can \(t\) remember whether you piolted it you can 1 remember
(15) whether you monitored them at all and this is referring to the
(16) Arco Juncau?
(17) AYes
(18) Q Okay Answer I monitored it I can remember monitoring
(19) it yes however I lost this - from what I recall ! losi it
(20) on radar somewhere at the ten to twelve mile range
(י) Question did you obscrve the vessel alter course into the
( ) northbound lane at that point
(23) Answer the Arco Junesu
(4) Question yes
(-s) Answer yes Idid

Now does that change your testimony or refresh your
recollection with regard to what you observed the Arco Juncau
do and how tar you followed it?
A No
Q Again do vou have any reason to doubt the accuracy of this transcripl as in what vou recalled on May 17th 1989 under oath to the NTSB'

\section*{\(A\) V}

Q Again would vou turn to page 522 again in the NTSB
testimonv Wbre you ashed thise questions and did you give
thestamiviry I \(m_{\text {eoing to ruad over to line } 5 \text { on the next }}\)
page
Qucstion ohay so did you observe the Arco Juneau
leaving where you figured the Iraffic lanes were
Yes I did I saw it make its turn when they said they
were going to cut over towards Bligh Reef buoy I saw it make its turn towards Bligh Reef yeah I saw that
Question did you see \(1 t\) long enough to see that it had
actually crossed the northbound line and left the TSS enturely
Answer I do not know if il lefl the TSS They did nol passit ontome
Now did vou give thosi answers to those questions?
A I could have
Q Okay Youdon (recall)

\footnotetext{
ANo
Q Any fla son to doubt you gave that testimony?
A No
Q What did vou man whan you said I do not know if it lefi
the TSS they did not pass it on to me?
A That means of they leave the traffic separation scheme
they're supposed to let you know prior to doing that and
8) didn't pass it on to me

Q Now when you say I do not know if it left the TSS did you
mean left the TSS enitrely outside the -
A Right
Q - eastbound lane?
A Yeah
Q The northbound lanc'
A Well all of the lanes
Q All of the lanes okav
Now did there come a point in your watch when your relief
Mr Blandford arrived?
A Yes there did
Q What time did he arrive?
A Somewheres arnund 23302335
Q I m sorry what did you say?
A 2330 or 2335
Q Was Mr Blandford very predictable in his arrival time? AYes
}
they
\[
\rightarrow \quad \text { Vol } 183007
\]

\section*{Q And what was the predictable time that he arrived?}

A From what I recall about 15 minutes prior to the watch
rehef, which is a quarter of, so somewheres around 2330
He
liked to get there a lattle bit in advance you know
\(Q\) Did he follow a routune when he lame in?
A Well, yeah, I guess he followed a routune You ask what's going on
Q Now when Mr Blandford same in to rclicve you what did
you - what did you tell him?
A I don't recall my exdct words
Q I m sorry did you say vou -
A 1 don't recall my exact words
Q - don I recall your exacl words' \(^{\prime}\)
A Yeah
Q in words or substance what did you tell him?
A I told hm what was happening as far as the vessels in the
(17) system If vessels, gear how the gear what gear was up,
what
(18) gear was down Who was the OOD Basically that's about

At, I
(19) would thenk

1501 Q And you said - wall kitme take these in ruveriturdur
( I) Who was th OOD'
1 \(\because\) A I don't recall
131 Q Wasil John Gonsalus '
\(1+1\) A I don \(t\) recall
(s) Q Ohay What glar - you said you lold him what ghar was up

Vol 18 3008
I) and what guar was down What - what did you inll hum aboul
' ' the glar that was up and gwar that wan down' What spchifically
'31 did vou lall him'
A 1 don a actually know I remember \(C\) ipe llanchaibrooh site
(s) was down That's the VHF site UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER Is thal radio THE WITNESS Yıs I beltev thal was - I thinh il was down Naked Island there was something wrong with Naked
(9) Ialand also I didn \(t\) - ihat \(s\) about it that I can rucall BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Then you said you told him whal was going on with the vessels in the systim?
A Right what vessel sabound what vesselv uuthund Q What vaszely did you have in the systamat this limis)
(is) A Oh I don't recall exuctly which onew ther were I thank I
16, had four I thank I had the Bartlett the Valdec Californus
171 and another one behind that or ahead ol it I here has two
of
IIs, them outbound - or anbound outside of Cape IInichanbruok
(19) Q All right So including those iwo vassuls that ware
(-1) oulside Cape Hinchinbrouk but whra - ILi me ulrihe that !
( 11 A I hadn't checked the system yet
1 1 Q Lul me - lei mb cstablish this a lilllu hollicr Did you
131 consider the two vesbuls that wark outsid Cape Hinchinbruoh
in
(4) the system al that point?
(3) A They call in on a three our precall which is three hours
11) outside of Cape Hiachinbrook Then they are in the system and
-) then one hour and then at Cape Hunchinbrook
3) Q And were those vessuls within that lumu trame aftur the
(4) three hour precall?
s) A I belueve so yes
(6) \(Q\) So they were in the system in the terminology that was
7) used?

AYes
Q And you had two vessels outbound the Exxon Valdez and the
Bartlett?
AI beheve so
Q Those are the two vessels that you meant?
A Yes
Q What dıd you tell Mr Blandford about those vessets?
A Just their locations, where they were at, what was going
on I don't know what - recall what I told hum about the
(7) Bartlett I told hum Valdez was outbound going through the
) ice nght now and would give me an updated ETA to Naked Island
(19) as soon as they got through the ace and also give an
updated
170, sce report
1 " Q Did voulull him anyiting ulsu about the Exxon Valdea?
A tot that I recall
1) Q Did woullll - did woull him what cuurne the Exxon
« Valdue was on at that pount'
1 st AIdon't recall
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 18 3010 \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{\begin{tabular}{l}
1 Q Did you know what course the Exxon Valdez was on at that \\
1 poini?
\end{tabular}} \\
\hline a & A I belseve the last course they gave me was 200 Now if I \\
\hline (1) & passed that on then I dad and if I didn't I didn't I don't \\
\hline (1) & recall \\
\hline (6) & Q Now whin Mistcr - I had askud you a minute ago if you had \\
\hline & related to Mr Blandtord what the Exxon s course was do you \\
\hline (8) & recall that? \\
\hline (9) & A Uh huh \\
\hline (10) & Q And you say you didn \({ }^{\text {a recall? }}\) \\
\hline (11) & A Rught \\
\hline 11 & Q How long did you and Mr Blandford take to go through your \\
\hline 1131 & relief procedures before you left that evcaing' \\
\hline 1141 & A 1520 menutes \\
\hline 119 & Q What timb did you luave? \\
\hline (18) & A I don't recall what tume I left but I'm just by it usually \\
\hline & takes us 1520 miautey to do it \\
\hline 1181 & Q Al the lamb Mr Blandiord arrivad at the station and the \\
\hline |19) & ruliul prowedurus bugan was the Exxon Valduc visibic on \\
\hline 101 & radar' \\
\hline 111 & A I don't recall I don't think it was though Ithink it \\
\hline 121 & had already - I'd already lost it on the screen by the tume \\
\hline 31 & tkıp came in \\
\hline (9) & Q What happıned? \\
\hline & A It just started getting antermittent readings every other \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
(1) sweep and the data data logger would not hold onto it And then it just disappeared from the screen
Q Let me show you this document which has previously been marked 24040 to the deposition of Lieutenant Commander
Falkenstein it spredesignated document 21 for this
deposition Gopast the first page That sthe copv of the
vessel data sheet is that right'
A Uh huh
Q And the second page is the vessul data shucl with an
authentication stamp at the bottom with Mr Duloricrs namb do
you see that?
A Uh huh Yes I do
Q The page after that?
A Ob the aext page
Q Yeah See next two pages?
A Yes, I do
Q That begins at 2044 does it not that s the data logger and goes to 2256 ?
AYes
Q As a matier of routine at this time at the VTC was th.
data logger in tis entirety stapled or ntherwisu dilathed to
the vessel data sheet?
A Yes I believe so
Q Mr Taylor what did you tell Mr Blandford about the radar status of the Exxon Valdu/"

\section*{Vol 183012}

\section*{A I can't recall what I told hmm}

Q What did you do with the data logger'
A What'd I do with it' 1 just shut it off
Q And did you do - did you do anything eise other than shut
the data logger off during this period of time bulwecn the -
when the - when the image became intermittent and when you saw
7) it disappear from the screen?

A No I switched over to the 12 mile scale trying to pick it up and there was nothing on the \(\mathbf{1 2}\) male scale So I tched
back do the six mile and this was the tume when it was
untermittent It was still intermittent at the time and I
could see it better on the six male because I was getting an
antermittent - what do you call it there return no return on
the \(\mathbf{1 2}\) mile scale So I - it was offset and so I just
watched it on the offset six miles and - let me see yeah
because it was no - I couldn't see it on the 12 well that's about all I did switch at back and forth that I can recall
Q When you say switch it back and forth -
A From the six mile to the twelve mile
Q From the six to the twelve that \(s\) what you meant?
AYes
Q When you say switch 11 back and forth from the six to the
twelve how many times did you try the twelve mile scale?
A Conple of tımes
Q Couple times? Why did you try it more than once?

1 A I just did I remember switching switching it over it's , not there bring it back to the six and see a little bit
Bring it back to the \(\mathbf{1 2}\) it's just a click of the wrist It's no big deal It's not a major evolution
(s) Q Did voudo anvihing cise during thal puriod of time?
ai A messed with the gain a little bit trving to tune up the radar wimuch in possible sometimes of vou turn the gain up d
little bit you ll get a little more power going down little
better return vou might be able to see it you know if you turn the gana up but didn twork
"II) Q Is that a single knob the gain knoh?
(1) A Yes yes
(131 Q Did vou do anvthing ulse?
(14) A As I recall I remember I cussed
(is) Q Did you describe to Mr Blandford your efforts to switch
(16) out to the 12 mile scale?
(17) A I can't rememher if I did or not
(18) Q Did - do you recall prepaning a statement of the events of

1191 your watch with regard in the Exxon Valder on March 241989
, the dar ol the prounding'
AYer Ido
Q Did you duscrith in that slatument that the Exxon Vaide7 had disappeared trom radar hclore the end of vour watch?
( 4) Aldon \(I\) recall if I did or not
( s) \(Q\) When you sav - you told us before as vou know that vou

\section*{Vol 183014}
(1) cursed when vou last II?
\(i I_{1} A\) Uh huh
(i) Q Did - sxplain to me a little hil more why you cursed when (4) you lost 1t?
(s) A Because I thought - well it went off a little sonner I
lost it a little sooner than I usually do Now if that was
due to a snow storm moving through or whatever you know 1
lost it before I usually do
Q Now a snow storm or a similar kind of squall that could cause interference that makes the vessel disappear doesn 1 it? A Yes if it gets - if your vessel's in the snow storm or it gets between you and the radar you can definitely lose the whole nane yards just gone disappears
Q Were there snow atorms or squalls in the area that evening? A I didn't see any I ater I'd heard that - that the tanker had reported it or something like that I don't know where I got this from but there was a pretty severe snow squall down
(18) in the Potato Point area that I attributed this problem with
(19) that moved - that moved out and it actually got clear that
(20) might So -
(21) Q Now if - if a squall is interfering with radar reception
( )) that II improve if the storm moves out -
1231 A Yes
(9) \(Q\) - isn that right? I mgoing do hand you the \(O\) Donovan
('s) report again and it sopen in enclosure nine - I m sorry
(1) enclosure eight which is statement is dated March 241989
-1 and a - and amendment to that statement datid April 1789
3) Did you prepare both buth the March 24 statemant and the
(1) April 17 slatement'

A Yes I did
QMr Taylor those are your signatures at the bottom?
A Yes sir
Q Before we get into the March 24 statement let me ask you
about the April 17 statement What were the circumstances that led to your preparing the April 17 amendment?
A I had my points muxed up, my Rocky Point and my Busby Islond
Q And you made a correction with regard to that'
A Yes, yes
Q Did you offer il on your own or did somıbody alsı ask you to do this?
A I believe somebudy else asked nue I hey brought it tomy
attention and I weat oups sorry so I made this amendment up
Q Who was that sombodl tlsc?
AI do not recall
Q In the March 24 statement - strike that lulsme ask you
this When you pruparad this had you ruvicwud the vissul data sheet for the Exxon Valdes?
5ı A I don't belueve I did

\section*{Vol 183016}

Q Had you revicwed wher the taph rutording of outhound transit of the Exxon Valdec or a transcript based on that tape recording \({ }^{7}\)
A No I did not
Q You see at about two thirds of the - 1 m sorry aboul five or aix linus down starting on the lourith line lut me rcad this il says al approximaicly 2900 the pilot un hoserd the
 sull in the port at this lumb llotd hiol there wavia reporicd from Poini Frbemanile and all the wayd rovithe Bligh

duviale in into the northbuand lanas lat the Blizh Rual huar and I gol a rogur aut
Nuw in vicw of the transuripl wh Ve rabicwid in this deposition would you agree thas that statement is in error? A This statement I wrote down is an error"
Q Lattl bal farthcr down it says - al appriximalulv ninc or tun linus down start ruading thire says 1 thun ructivide a call from tank vessel Exxon Valdu/ at Rowhy Poinl intorming mu that the pilot was away and they fave mb an ETA Io Nahbd Island
1 I to be approximataly 0100 The wasclappodrad loh han the
1 Wustern cdycol the suathbound tralli lans whan the pilat disumbarhud
Is that your racollcilion todav Mr Taviot that the image
of the Exxon Valdu/ was al the whitern tdge ol the southbound

\section*{Vol 183018}
(1) Q Any reason to doubt that you did that given that you said ) so in this statement?
(1) ANo

MR SANDERS Your Honor that sa good stopping
(a) point

THE COURT All rught WL II ruccss now tor the day
ladics and ginilemen Pluase rumember my instructions about nol ruading ur listiming lo anything about this casc during our rucuss WL II ruconvenc at 800 tomorrow morning and as I indsatcd carlicr therears somb things I nucd to talk to ounsel ahout in chainhers
We ll bu in reblos now subjubl to call
THE CLERK This court is in rcubss until uight a m tumorrow
(Jury oul at 200 pm )
(Proceedings recessed at 200 pm )

Vol 183019
INDEX
। DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL CRAIG (Live)
2806
, 1 BYMR LYNCH
2806
\(\checkmark\) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL CRAIG
2830
(6) BYMR O NEILL 2830
8) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL CRAIG 2837
(9) BY MR LYNCH 2837
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF FRANK IAROSSI (Live) 2840
11) BYMR NEAL 2840
(14) CROSS EXAMINATION OF FRANK IAROSSI 2903
\|9, BY MR O NEILL 2003
17) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF FRANK IAROSSI 2937
IN1 BY MR NEAL 2937
01 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF ALAN MCGREG()R
(Ruad) 2940
" BYMR SANDERS 2940

1" DIRECT EXAMINATION OF HARRY CLAAR (Live) 2947

A BY MR NEAL


DIRECT EYAMINATION OF CLYDE ROBBINS
12993
BY VIDEO EYAMINER
2993
- DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GORDON PAULTAYLOR (Vidco) 3000
(s) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 3000
-
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{Vol 183022} \\
\hline (1) EXHIBITS & \\
\hline 1) 345934543463 and 3462 offered & 2809 \\
\hline (1) 9130 A and 9130 B offered & 2809 \\
\hline (4) 9131 offered & 2849 \\
\hline (s) 3679798 and 797 offered & 2849 \\
\hline (6) DX3523 alfered & 2999 \\
\hline (k) 345934543463 and 3462 rabcived & 2806 \\
\hline (w) 9130 A and 9130 B recolvid & 2809 \\
\hline 1019131 ruscived & 2849 \\
\hline 1113679798 and 797 raceived & 2849 \\
\hline 11: DY3¢23 ructived & 2999 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
(い STATE OF ALASKA)
(: Reporter s Curthlablc
(7) DISTRICT OF ALASKA)
(6) I Joy S Brauer a Regisicrad Prolessional
(7) Reporter and Notary Public
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
(9) That the foregoing transtript contains a true and
(10) accurate transcription of my shorthand notes of all requested
(II) matters held in the foregoing captioned case
(12) Further that the transcript was prepared by me
(13) or under my direction
(14) DATED this day
(1s) of 1994
(?) JOY S BRAUER RPR Notary Public for Alaska
(יר) My Commission Expirss 51047

Benc Srakne Appl catcone
Look-S̄ee Concordance Report

UNIQUE WORDS 2,905 Total Occurrences 14,148
NOISE WORDS 385
Total words in file 45,160

Single File Concordance
Case sensitive
NOISE WORD LIST(S) NOISE NOI
includes all Text OCCURRENCES

IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES @ BOTTOM of PagE
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline -\$ - \\
\hline \$300 [2] 29021516 \\
\hline -1- \\
\hline 1000 [1] 28262 \\
\hline \(1002|1| 28857\) \\
\hline 1017 [1] 28858 \\
\hline \(1040|1| 295121\) \\
\hline \(105012 \mid 294810295121\) \\
\hline \(1120|1| 29497\) \\
\hline 1150121294810295121 \\
\hline 11th |1] 287025 \\
\hline \(1200|1| 294614\) \\
\hline 1202 [1] 294618 \\
\hline 1203 [1| 2947 /1] \\
\hline 1218111294712 \\
\hline 17th |1| 30056 \\
\hline -2- \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{\begin{tabular}{l}
20-plus-year |1| 2809 I \\
22nd \(15 \mid 2951172029572\)
\end{tabular}} \\
\hline \\
\hline 298525 \\
\hline 23rd 17129701629726 \\
\hline 2974 / 29816299145 \\
\hline 30012 \\
\hline 24-hour |11 28107 \\
\hline 27th [1] 29404 \\
\hline 29th |1| 290820 \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{```
200 [3| 2946 19 3018 15 16
2nd || 2845 l2
```} \\
\hline \\
\hline - 3- \\
\hline 3/22/89 [1| 295615 \\
\hline -5- \\
\hline 5-109711|3023 22 \\
\hline -8- \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{\[
\begin{aligned}
& 800[2 \mid 2805230189 \\
& 824[2] 2815711
\end{aligned}
\]} \\
\hline \\
\hline -9- \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-26-94
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}9130-A & 14 \mid & 2809 & 14 & -16 & 18 & 19\end{array}\) \(9130-13|3| 2809151619\) \(921|1| 29468\) 930 [11 29405
-

A B \(16 \mid 285417 / 82855\) I
\(2964131+297 / 18\)
A Bs \(1112863 / 9\)
a m 14| 28052288578
301813
A89-0095 [1] 28056
AA (6) 292412471316
abbreviated |11 284025
abeam [1] 301716
abilities (1) 283420
ability [2| \(28695 \quad 296514\)
able |12] 2811 628194
28311828351624
28372328872229401
\(296716 \quad 301015 \quad 1730139\)
able-bodied \(|5| 38541017\)
202429649
aboard |l61 \(2841 / 19\)
284220287831415
28902328934296421
296521023297035
2992620
ABS |31 \(284025 \quad 2841\) /
\(2845 / 3\)
absence [2] 29244 15
Absolutely 16128639
289921250522291015
29164298423
absolutels |13| 28493
2850? 2862142883 ll
2884122886152328914
28931328982328995
29088298017
abuse [14] 2867245
28732228748287515
288392913161923
29146 // \(29158 / 3\)
dcademies |l| 28537
Academv |s| \(2841 / 822\)
296331729645
accepted 111284913
access \(16 \mid 2806 \quad 23 \quad 25\)
\(280752 \mathrm{~S}(\mathrm{KK}\); 2810 15
28152
accident 11129588
accidents 121285618
290514
according [2] 289013
298014
decuracy (11) 30055
accurate [2] 282025302310 acknowledge |II 29305 dcknowledges 11129308
Act [3! 2882314293023
det |11 2854 //
acting \(1+1\) 2893 714
291425291523
actoon |9| 2926232927 | 6 12
actions |1| 2933 /l
dctive [2| 2843 13 299316
actuvely [1] 292020
activittes 161285625
28572028713287420

287522293419
activity \(161280925 \quad 281410\)
132843528661228898
datual \(16 \mid 28345285525\)
286321286467291312
add |l| 287324
added (1) 286719
iddituon 18128073280822
2810152814101328746
29513296121
additional [1] 293619
Address |ll 28069
address [11] 28067284012
29309293222294014
294717295582962917
2975529881
addressed \(11 \mid 29255\)
adjacent 111281025
adjust [1] 289513
administered ||| 293722
admunstrative [1] 29117
Adınıral |6| 29939299411
182995192996 /8 299913
Admirals |3| 29941821
2996 /I
admure (1) 29858
admission [1] 2805 11
admitted [6] 280525
28091828491922
287823299916
ddopted |I| 286424
advance |2| 29022230074
adverse [2] 2927512
advice [1] 2872 11
advise |l| 295724
advised (1) 28863
advising |l| 299525
advisory [3] 28728 /l
29135
dffected (3) 28252282612
286524
affilate |I| 284315
affirm [1] 28738
affirming (11 287315
afloat [2] 28421423
Africa [1] 299324
aft [5| 2941 1929826710
aftercare |5| 2918459
29289293016
afternoon [7] 283512
\(290019 \quad 29334294619\)
29742529901920
afterwards [1] 2822 15
age (1] 296219
agency (1) 291625
dgent |4| 286821291622
2324
agree \(1712835 \quad 13 \quad 25\)
29111629686829925
\(3016 / 5\)
agreed \([21286810 \quad 2918\) 11
agreement [5] 285019
2853 / 2855311286311
dground 131293618
297819299412
ah \(|3| 294224294423\)
29454
ahold |t] 29118
and (1) 293618
ands \(|6| 292572961321\)
242994329995

Air [1] 2842 II
air 11129826
durport |11 282223
Nlamar|3| 29162325
29174
MI AN |1| \(2940 / 8\)
Alan (3) \(281317 \quad 18 \quad 29401\)
Alaskd |11| 28069291625
29551829561729883
299425299713 23, 25
300016302321
Alcohol [21 \(2913 \quad 19 \quad 298018\)
alcoholic [5] 280713
\(\begin{array}{lllllllll}2835 & 12 & 14 & 2836 & 19 & 2891 & 18\end{array}\)
alcoholics [2] 283621
283924
alcoholsm (3) 2865825 2866 /
Alert [5] 2806171921
28095283125
alert [2] 28094295725
allegatrons (7) 29155712
29168910292224
allow [3| 29019 |l 291119
allowed (11) 281810
alone [2] 28474294424
alphabetical [3] \(286022 \quad 23\)
28612
alter [2] 283522300421
alternate |l| 28522
alternately |1| 2904 /1
Alyeska [23] 28061822
2807271128096
28102328121819
2813122328152223
28262528291328301
283123283212323
28356
amendment [3] 3015210 18
American [10] 28061719
2128093528205
2831252840242841313
amount (3) \(283518 \quad 19 \quad 24\)
analysis [1] 28741
Anchorage [2] 2902429882
Andy [1] 29209
Angeles (1) 297820
angry (1) 293312
angush (i] 292718
announced [1] 280524
announcement (1] 293721
annual [1] 28534
Answer [16] \(290915 \quad 2025\)
29101029121520
291413293824300011
\(\begin{array}{llll}15 & 18 & 20 & 3004 \\ 18 & 23 & 25\end{array}\)
300521
answer [20] 2850729113
52029132429147
29159 IS 2927102938 II
293991329531112
\(29685296923 \quad 25 \quad 299517\)
3000713
answered (3) 2939429538
299113
answering [2] \(293316 \quad 18\)
answers [8] 293820
2939102940210299213
3000130051123
anybody [10] 281015

H imeme Applicume
\(28565 \quad 2883 \quad 25-289613\) \(2889313291721 \quad 29229\)
1216
anymore \(1212841 / 3\)
295524
invwhere [5| \(29 / 824\)
2919468296824
dpparently |4| 280912
28793529306
dppeals 111294625
dppear 1412837429821
29832329846
וppeared (3) \(2 \times 4019\)
29532301621
applicant [21 2959 /2
296020
application |l| 29256
apply [1] 2964 //
apprasal [7] 28755 1/
\(2886242887 / 1516\)
approach 14| \(2855 / 4\)
2861 18 2870)20 \(291 / 17\)
dpproached 111282219
approaches |1| 2997 /6
approaching \(1112958 / 8\)
appropriate |l| 2872 /2
dppropriately |l| 28759
approximate||| 294820
Approximately (4) 282524
29771829896 3001 3
approximatelv \(19 \mid 2945\) /4
29481029592301018
3016717213017921
April|10| 284512286622
\(287010 \quad 28984290422\) 291415301524910 arbitration [2] 286923 \(2926 / 6\)
arhitrators 1112926 /6 archutecture 111284225 Arco \(271281320 \quad 294021\) \(2329483295213 \mathrm{3mOl} 8\)
 \(13162225 \quad 3(K) 3457\) \(1424300416 \quad 2330052\) 13301611
irea |121 282/ 122945 /
2958122960132029611
520299319299821
30141418
areas [6] 2814 || 2994 | 2 8929993
aren't 1512840328885
2916829671529856
argumentative [1] 280812
Arm||| 299723
Army |11 2842 /1
arrange 111289720
drrangements \(|2| 289722 \quad 23\)
arrival [31 \(2810928 / 39\)
300624
arrive [4] 28/4 \(20 \quad 28 / 87\)
28249300620
arrived \(1161281118 \quad 1921\)
2813132815728161213
\(28171 / 2820 / 2822 / 8\)
28281928985300618
30071301018
irrives 3 |3 \(28 / 52324\)
28184
drriving \(51 \begin{array}{llll}2816 / 8 \quad 28213\end{array}\)

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5 26-94 VOLUME 18
behaving |1| 289621
behavior [3] 28251328714 287421
behund |3| \(2867222981 \quad 15\) 300817
behef \(11 \mid 29965\)
helreved |2| 287425293112
helt 121285922290515
Ben 134128773202125
\(28787132879 / 1524\)
288022881151825
\(2882152883 / 12288514\)
\(22 \quad 2889615 \quad 290821 \quad 23\)
290916291021291121
2918 IO 2919252920914
2923232924 /2 29278
2931 35
benefit |i] 290225
benefits |11 28513
Bentas 151284767910 12
herth |12| 2812 2428131
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}13 & 14 & 2814 & 14 & 15 & 20 & 22\end{array}\)
2K2n 25 2828 20294414
beside 11129893
beverages 111280714
higgest III 29036
Bill [7] \(288924 \quad 2890412\)
289362898810290020
bill l3| \(294415 \quad 16 \quad 29566\)
billing (11 295518
hit |16| 28247284416
28512328814242882 I
290514295815297823
\(3(x) 22300743013268\) 30143301617
buts 111284517
Blandford 19130061824
\(301078 \quad 30\) O \(1430107 \quad 12\)
18301124301315
Bligh 171 \(2958 / 4296110\)
\(3(x) 12530051617\)
30161012
blood 171282942838921
28396829372229387
Board \(|x|\) -
291561029246295224
295337
thoard |31| \(2845 / 328526\)
2ห9к 10286625287322
2876528909289321
2901 9 |l 29166719
2922 II 1529261012
2927202928329347
2978182529804298113
2985 I/ 2992351517
30167
boat |11 2958 I]
boats |11 2934 ||
Bob [2] 2901 / 290619
body |II 283520
bonus |2] 29021517
book |l| 284722
booklet |2| 285926
hooks 111285810
boosters |11 2991 10
bootleg |I| 281922
brope 111281922
Borgen |l0| 28971029044
523292010142921422
292221

Haxic Syotear Appicaucris
bottle [3] \(287320 \quad 289714\) 15
bottles |l| 2922 /]
bounds [1] 2958 I
bouts [1] 28795
bow [2] 29731822
Box [2] 28069294718
Boyd [1] 280821
brass [1] 285917
BRAUER [1] 302321
breach (2] 290624290710
break (2) 289719299518
breakdown [1] 28326
breaks (1) 29863
breakwater [1] 295810
breath [7] 28294283225
2835729691229732
29772529802
breathalyzers [1] 283320
Bruan 111 283025
bridge l491 2861142862 I
62128955290022
2901132229041317
2906111516182122
232429073479
\(293521222936 / 811 / 3\)
152948 /1 2129498
29504295123295218
29542129702124
29716212972729733
29742329911112
Brief (1) 298713
brief 16128321929004
294932974182987712
briefed [2] 28915299414
briefly [5] 2818328317
2844129462029974
bringing |1| 28076
brings \(|2| 2860129123\)
broached 111299523
broader (11) 293515
broke [2] \(2897142996 / 4\)
broken 1612995381325
\(299616 \quad 25\)
bronze |11 285815
buckles \(1412858 / 5 \quad 285917\)
22290515
build [1] 28448
building l3| 281325294420 21
bunch |1| 2837 I
buoy |4| 296110300516
3016 /1 12
buoys |1| 296121
burden |1| 298420
Bureaul3| 2840 ) 2428414 14
Busby \(131296 / 5311 / 5 / /\) 301716
business |91 2843 /| 2850 )
3628562028576
287520293422298624
businesses (1) 28502
busy 111298619
button \(|5| 29508 \quad 1216 \quad 20\) 21
buttons |11 29503
buy 111285810


FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-26-94 VOLUME 18

C A-S-E Y \(11 \mid 294016\)
C R A-I G|H28069
Cab|l| \(28 / 217\)
cab 14012808728112021
\(22 \quad 28121418 \quad 19 \quad 24\)
2814202815623281611
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}13 & 18 & 25 & 2817 & 11 & 14 & 15\end{array}\)
\(2818121419 \quad 20 \quad 281924\)
282091028213528248
1128282028301217
283215294118294358
\(13 \quad 17 \quad 294414\)
15
cabin |l| 28625
cabs |l| 281924
Cafe lil 2941 //
Californua [3| 28479
2962 II 300816
Call [3] 28054284038
call (33) \(282717 \quad 28531318\)
286114286818286935
28871141929101
\(29341518 \quad 294713\)
295010295524295617
182960172962229751
29809298718299022
29922329939299413
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}30 \times 14 & 25 & 3012 & 13 & 301619\end{array}\)
30171320301812
calls |21 \(2954253(x) 2 / 8\)
Calnn |l| 29846
camera ||| \(28 / 4\) /9
Cameras |11 281416
camerds 1712814 I 5612
1425
Candidate |1| 28428
candidates 111289813
capability |31 28142428151
Cape \(16 \mid 30084182023\)
\(30091 ?\)
capes || 296023
caps \(1112858 / 4\)
captain 126| 287620128904
\(25(14929179243324\)
294822295115296618
297123297271424
29735 // 14297421
\(297722980212981 / 417\)
2982829831629849
\(2985 / 8 \quad 29921429994\)
captains \(17128533 \quad 2876 \quad 23\)
\(289425 \quad 2898 \quad 1213\)
2934 // 2984 8
caption ||| 289516
(apthoned |l| 3023 /]
(arboon |l| 295525
carbonull| 245524
card III 29436
cards \(13 \mid 2943\) y 12
care|9| 282722292923
29319
career 111 \(2938 / 3\)
careful (3) 29297829467
carefully [4| 28756288610
2890152891916
carefulness [1] 292924
cargo [3| 28634298214
298417
cargos 11129352
carried |6| 285720286716
2874 IS 288924289924

29352
carry (9] 28085283516
\(\begin{array}{llll}2856 & 24 & 286317 & 286819\end{array}\)
28731228758287917 28898
carrying [5] 280716
2828152876111416
cartoon [1] 28596
case [17] \(28056 \quad 285413 \quad 17\)
2869328705287216
29001415290317
2931172942629485
\(29496 \quad 2956 \quad 11 \quad 13 \quad 30188\)
3023 II
cases [3] 28692329576
297616
Casey (1) 294015
cash [1] 28588
cast [1] 297120
catch [3] 29411029624
297112
caught [3] 290818292625
293114
caused (3) 28199282210 287924
causeway |1| 283416
CCTV I! 280820
Center 11130012
center (3) 283717299324 299718
certanty |1| 286416
Certuficate [2] 28542223
certuficate [5] 289821
290216202903329765
certufication (11) 29031
certufied [1] 2855 I
CERTIFY [1] 30238
cetera [2] 28465 2951 12
chain (11) 290322
chairman |3| 284023
\(2845 / 314\)
CHALOS (4) 297425
297510298424298716
Chalos 111295124
chambers \(\{2 \mid 294620\)
3018 II
champagne [1| 289715 chance 181290014291018 2911629392329517
2974 / 2981 2022
change [7] \(283522 \quad 286710\)
\(2870 \quad 15 \quad 16 \quad 2895 \quad 13\)
29491230051
changed [3| 286620
2943 /1 296019
changes III 30023
channel (1) 30168
channels |l| 29993
characterıstics (4) 28646
296/8 1222
charge [S] 28442428678
28852529041112
Charles \{2\} 28081924
Charlie [1] 294119
chart [9] 286024296012
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}15 & 16 & 17 & 2961 & 18 & 24\end{array}\)
299921
chartered [2] 284837
check [4] 28209283010
283323295821
checked [1] 300821
checkpoint [2] 281813
283913
chemical [1] 28467
chemicals [1] 28469
ChemWest [1] 29386
Chester [1] 298910
Chief [2] 29797298112
chıef [24] 28091284023
28451428521128951
2971232429721729768
\(9101415 \quad 298021\)
29811429881329895
299012225299120
299414
choce (3) 28722528731
28843
christened [3] 289714
298913
christenung [1] 289715
Christmas [1] 29707
chronology [1] 299013 crrcumstance [3] 288910 290118290221
carcumstances [15] 285819
28731628782528896
28915928951129013
29075293691011
2966 IS 2984630159
civil [1] 28056
civilan (1] 300015
CLAAR [2] 29472029528
Claar [9] \(29471318 \quad 22 \quad 23\)
242952529542429658
clause [2] 29551920
clean (6) 2892 11 289823
289961229291516
clear (14) 28619286825
28782529026291620
2921429291014293117
29502329511429919
301419
cleared (2) \(28128 \quad 29328\)
CLERK [28] 2805328063
61028409111628856
2940111317129471416
29555711296246812
\(2975248298720 \quad 2325\)
29884301813
click [2] \(283115 \quad 30133\)
client [1] 284616
climb [1] 298221
chmbed [1] 29466
chanc (I) 287824
closed (1) 28262
clothes [1] 2942 11
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}\text { clutter } 14 \text { | } & 2982 & 11 & 12 & 13 & 24\end{array}\)
CLYDE 1112993 II
Clyde [2] 2993914
Coast [311 28091283424
283522841181922

172028532528542124
2855229022229581
2959101123296019
297632993162225
2994430001112
coast [29] 28462122

2859151628601013
286878288952890519
24289122892928933

Benx Sywant Apotiation
28976 |/ 29043 24224
2994910
codes [1| 2831 20
cognizance |l| 29022
coincide [1] 29584
coincides |1| 2812 In
color [11 283116
Columbia [1] 29984
combatuve [1] 280812
coming [18] 280522

28712428804292112
2943123294513295111
297325 298/ /3 17 22
\(2983 / 3 \quad 2986 / 3\)
command 121290323
299822
commandant [1] 29946
commanded [1] 2998 /]
Commander [1] 30114
commander [4] 284321
2993 /8 29989 21
commands |l| 2998 //
commenced [1] 2914 12
comment [1] \(2991 / 6\) commented (2) 2878215 comments |1| 29973
commercial |1| 284415
Commssion |1| 302322 commssion [2] 28422 2843/3
commissioned [1] 28422
commitment [2] 2850 /8 20
committee \(13 \mid 2925 / 617\) 20
common [31 282642834 /] 292923
commonly | \(1 \mid 29256\)
communicated [1] 292015
(ommunications |3| 28/324
3 \(10 / 1 / 314\)
communicative \(11 \mid 289219\)
companies ||51 283237
2845 /I 2328487285025
285192852222324
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}2853 & 9 & 10 & 16 & 2854 & 14 & 15\end{array}\)
compare |l| 29993
compared ||| 2968 و
comparison 1312968 // 299927
complaint [1] 291] 22
(omplete 13| 281824
282014296120
completed 191288020
\(\begin{array}{llll}2883 & 23 & 288515 & 2910 \\ 20\end{array}\)
\(291725 \quad 2918815 \quad 29573\) 2991 19
completely [1] 3003 // completes \(\{2 \mid 29612425\) completing [1] 281816 concentrate [1] 2983 /8 concentration [1] 28279 concept [2] 285017292324 concern [8] 2819916 2820242822728959 \(2930 / 8 \quad 2997 / 9\)
concerned 1111281920
2822 // \(284482867 /\)
\(2892 \quad 25 \quad 2915 \quad 12 \quad 24\)
\(293020 \quad 2995 \quad 13 \quad 299715\) 299814

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5 26-94 VOLUME 18
concerning [4] 29239
29321329702029726
conclude [2] 2946819
concluded |1| 292/ 19
concludes (2) 2974 /6
29936
conclusion 121283016
29192
concurred |4| 2886728995
\(2918 / / 2919\) /
condition 11112807 2?
\(2825 / 2 / 516285622\)
2857229095 /l 294325 2946229866
conduct \(16 \mid 2856 \quad 22 \quad 28572\)
28672028691728736
287922
conducted \(|2| 280910\) 298020
conducting ||| \(2869 / 8\)
condur |l| 28/9 22
conference|9| 2R95 2
2896 /3 16 293: 2
conferencer \(|x| 285718\)
289423 2896 5 8 29n7 25
2920232937 /1
conferred 1312931356
confidence |1| \(2851 / 19\)
confidentual \(\{2 \mid 2881 / 1\) 2919 /0
confidentiality \(13 \mid 286521\)
288979
confirmed \(13 \mid 290112\)
29062122
Connecticut \(\mid 3128412324\) connection \(|2| 28284\) \(2866 / 7\)
(onnotatun |l| 2842/8 conscrousness 111286017
consider \(13 \mid 2875 / 6\)
302823
considerably |1| 28999 considered 141288213 2997252998 /
conststs |l| 29608
console |1| 29504
consortium ||| 28322
constitution \(1112836 / 8\)
construction 1412841 万 9
284362844 /8
consultants \(11 \mid 28723\)
consulted |1| 2930 /6
consume ||| 2896 23
consuming 121288322 289622
consumption [8| 282525
2828928297283724
\(\begin{array}{lllll}2838 & 5 & 10 \quad 13 & 28765\end{array}\)
contact |10| 287924
\(289419290916 \quad 20\)
2920171829213 2931/11
contacted |1| \(2970 / 8\)
contacts |1| 29214
contains 1212888 In 30239 content \(|2| 29388 \quad 3(x) \mid 21\) context |5 \(2880 / 292412\) 24293536 continuation |1| 28056 continue 1312869 /2 28733 300117
continued [9] 28439
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}-2869 & 2 H & 2911 & 25 & 2912 & 14\end{array}\) \(15 \quad 293822 \quad 23 \quad 24\)
continuing 11128707
contınuty 171285182123
242852121428554
contınuousiv 11128517
contours |l| 296020
contraband \(13128 / 9 / /\)
\(28202298(14\)
contract \(131288 / 10\)
\(2884 / 719\)
contractett|t| \(2806 / 8\)
contrast |1| 285/9
contributing ||| 293620
contribution |1| 28588
contributions ||| 2935 /2
control |111 28062325
2807528153428268
\(28484288\} 929188\)
299120
controlled \(12 \mid 284617\)
28559
(onvent \|ll \(29 \times 1 / 9\)
convened \(12 \mid 289812\)
2901) 23
conversation 1361287725
\(2878 / 578131718122\)
\(28791014121 \quad 28806\)
2883228868288915
\(28911 / 1215 \quad 23 \quad 25\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}2892 & 3 & 12 & 2908 & 24 & 29138\end{array}\)
292772929329715711
29735171829875
\(2991 / 2995 / 2\)
conversatmons \(\mid \times 1289278\)
23 2894 \(68292 / 152122\)
conveved lif \(30 \times 13 / 922\)
convincell| 2 Y Y \&
convinced |2| 288| 24
2894 1?
convincing |11 \(2884 / 5\)
Cook |11 29595
coordination \(|2| 2824 / 6\)
282723
coordinator |2| 288522
29046
copies \(|2| 2862429564\)
copv lll| 280710280924
291792925429471
2955172956 अ 5296221
30116
Cordova 111 2960 2
core 111293219
corner 11128173
corporate |3| 284420
\(2845 / 2846 / 5\)
Corporation [5| 28325
2897 /3 2910/ 291823 29854
Corps [1] 28429
correction |1| 301513
correctly ||| 2830 //
cost (2) \(28506 \quad 2902 / 4\)
costs |11 2850 4
councel \(|6| 2882 / 112\)
29KO 52946 16 17 3018 II counseling \(1112872 / 3\)
counselor \(|3| \quad 2872 \quad 15 \quad 18 \quad 22\) counter \(141281619 \quad 2820 \quad 20\) 28221920
counterparts [1] 293417
counters |1| 28232
Couple [3| \(283710 \quad 301224\) 25
couple \(|8| 282220286622\)
2869232886252946617
2429503
courage II 288725
course \(136 \mid 28371923\)
28421528438285817
28781328801028832
2891152892222894616
22289537289621
2926 IO 2945192949 I2
18295032956 I 296025
\(29671314296818 \quad 29769\)
299433002322300421
3009233010137301710
courses [2] 286323
COURT [391 280551618
24 2806 2280918283020
2840 272849131922
2855152870212885310
291119293625293921
24 2940 642946 / 15 IS 19
29478102952629549
1824295514298425
298717
299910163000530186
Court |51 2805428406
29392529991822
court 14| 28856291420
293725301813
courtroom [21 286925
294825
courts |l| 2882 in
Cousins 113129041315
29051029482229493
\(296524296632970 / 820\)
\(212971825 \quad 299614\)
cover 131 28823294621
295524
covered |l| 28148
covers |1| 2963 /I
CRAIG |3| 2806 // 283023 2837 II
Craig [7] 28059280638
1328791428125282624
crash (1) 282217
crayy 111291425
create II 285520
created 111286423
creating |I| 28579
credo|ls| \(285518 \quad 20 \quad 22\) 25285634152857710
15222858129051416
18
crew [211 281318281856
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}7 & 2826 & 1 & 2851 & 12 & 21 & 24\end{array}\)
28615628692289323
29012290621293311
293412984917298916
crewmen |1| 282725
crews |I| 28517
(risp l2| 29502329514
(riterta |3| 28689 Il 12
critical 6 6| \(286112 \quad 293310\)
22232429341
CROSS 161283023290311
29528295824297419
29852
cross [11 297418
codes to cross

Hanc Syaumis Applucalans
cross-examination \(|3|\) \(2830202962 / 29999\) cross-examine [2| 29526 298425
crossed [1] 300519
crude (3) 2845212846 I
28478
cure [1] 286510
currous [2] 2831 6289620
current [1] 29255
currently [1] 299315
cursed [2] 301413
curve [1] 296024
cussed (1) 301314
customer [1] 284616
cut 12129364300516
\(-\frac{-D-}{-}\)
danger [3] \(28228 \quad 282510\)
dangerous ||| 298222
dangers |1| 296023
dark [2] \(294214 \quad 2972\) /1
data 110130111791721
22301225301523
date |4| 29082129108
29242429485
DATED 11302314
dated 1612878172925 I
\(2994172996123015 / 2\)
day (27) 28303285315
2864252887617291210
2924391529281017
293316295917296121
2977212978425299016
182996330012301320
30186302314
days 11512852236
2863 21 2896182228972
2900729202429699
297771920
deal \(1612850252851 / 56\) 29681630134
dealing [2| \(283720 \quad 285023\)
deals 111300113
dealt \(|2| 29139297423\)
decide |31 2869628807 \(2887 / 4\)
decided 161 2860 /| \(2872 / 4\)
2873242884252885 /
29015
deciding (1) 2935 I
decision \(\{20 \mid 28801316\)
28821628831217
\(28842223 \quad 28851228887\)
289862528992290115
20290961229281422
29317293212
decisions 111293710
deck \(123 \mid 28425715\)
2862222863222864 | 2
\(29041517 \quad 296416 \quad 29713\) 2976910132981917 29824 // \(2983 / 4298710\) 11
declared 16128812228866 \(288916 \quad 232918 / 825\) deeply \(1112995 / 6\)
Defendants [14] 283] 7 \(\begin{array}{llllllll}2849 & 10 & 13 & 15 & 19 & 2855 & 12\end{array}\) \(132859102870 / 823\)

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-26-94 VOLUME 18
Cansondanos by Look-Soci(3)

289515292419292514
294817
defendants |4| 29622
2975 / 29871829936
Defense 111295425
defense 111290122
define [1] \(2895 / 2\)
defined [2] 28692529075
definttely [3] 287520
288017301412
defintion (1) 28702
degree [12] 28412528424
2528431128521229634
716296745298817
degrees \(1101294916 \quad 29507\)
29667 1/ 12252967111
20301711
delayed |11 28224
delegate |1| 298022
deliver (1) 29563
deliverv (1) 282925
Detozier 111301110
demeanor \(\{3\) ) 2838629727
9
denıal (8) \(2929 \quad 13 \quad 16\)
293019101113
demed [2] \(288315 \quad 24\) :
denv 14| \(288217 \quad 22 \quad 28833\)
29337
denying |21 288245
depart |21 28186282912
departed [2] 28121429714
Department [2| 299317
300016
department |20| 284424
2845 / 3286924287212
142328852324288637
29091729122329136
2918 // 2919 / 2976 II
29797298925
departure [1] 28109
dependency 1112875 /
Depending (1) \(2966 / 4\)
depending (2) 2827 /4
283617
deposed 11128329
deposition \(12+12903 / 8\)
290912912910291321
291432915229219
293810192940329552
296232987192229887
8299310299913300314
301146301615
Deppe [2] 29002023
depression \(|9| 287938\)
2880232888162029139 \(13 \quad 14\)
depressive 11128794
depth 111285123
describe 191281521
282214284151528441
2865429881230131522
described \(14 \mid 2830\) //
28414285924
design |s| 28416928435 2844917
desk (2) \(2816 \quad 13 \quad 15\)
destination |1| 281224
detall [2| 2813 \(22 \quad 292920\)
detaled [2] 2921 1629297
details 11129198
detamed [1] 280725
detector ( 3 ) 282223
29431013
determination (4) 290614
2918212229292
determine 131283010
29961719
develop [2] 28447287317
developed [7] 283511
285522252857711
28921416
development [2] 286114
29981
deviate [3] 3002114
301612
deviated [1] 30023
deviatung [1] 30031
devtation [5] 30021623
300325300456
devices [1] 296122
duagnosed (1] 288818
dragnosis [1] 288810
dxctate [1] 29233
diesel [1] 298813
dufference [4] 29511419
29673297323
differentrate [1] 283921
difficult (10) 28271628285
1528952529681016
\(29971219299818 \quad 25\)
difficultues [11 299722
dinner [1] 29706
DIRECT [10] 2806 /I
284017294018294720
29551229621329759
29885299311300022
direct [7] \(281019 \quad 292018\)
29602129741629816
2983529937
directed [1] 291922
direction (S) 29215 296622
29677302313
director (1) 289712
Disabilities ||| 293023
dsabilittes (1) 28823
Disabilty (2) 2882314
desability [3| 288269
28889
disabled [2] 2882 l 13
disappear \(\{2] 30127\)
301410
disappeared [2] 30112
301323
disappears [1] 301413
disappointed [1] 29339
discharge [3] 28478
291216293825
discharging \(|2| 290724\)
29768
disciplinary [3] 292623
29271
discontunued ||| 29709
Dscovery (1] 29478
dscovery [2] 292622
294625
discuss (3) 282615294624
29472
discussed [9] 282618
28292428305287525
2909511292718293725
293912
discussung [1] 294612
discussion [20] 28395
287749287991728802
28811328865288917
2891728941629014
29102029241329289
293022293114297023
2995719
discussons [3] 289323
297020299514
disembark [1] 281420
disembarkation [1] 282824
disembarked [2] 301623
30171
disembarks [2] 2957410
disorder [1] 287219
dispatch [1] 281122
distances [1] 296025
distributed [1] 28711
district [1] 29988
divert [1] 28963
divided [1] 284620
dock [11] 28478297112
41829723131418
29821929915
doctor [2] 288521292824
document [10] 281117
\(29061229242024 \quad 29253\)
1011295912301135
documents [2] 280924
29194
doesn't [5] 281242887 11
29322529673301410
door [9] \(281721 \quad 23 \quad 281823\)
2528201728218282216
2824829435
doors [2] \(281715 \quad 282110\)
double-ender (1) 28426
doubt [3] 3005530062
30181
downtown [1] 294516
dozed [1] 294220
dozing [1] 2944 11
drafts [1] 28564
\(\begin{array}{llllll}\text { drank } & {[4]} & 2878 & 3 & 14 & 15\end{array}\)
291314
draw [5] 2960222324
29613
drew [2] 285224285416
drill (1] 29409
drink [13] 28255928266
12282722291720
\(29451618 \quad 2029703 \mathrm{~s}\)
29788299220
dranker [1] 29174
drinking [451 28276283316
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}24 & 283478 & 10 & 15 & 21\end{array}\)

287958288518288821
289089289314289625
2899192910629131015
29157132916619
29172129203612
29222529267
122943182129696
\(297723 \quad 29782429791618\)
drinks [4] 283224283518
25294520
driver [15] 281120281215
182813452820928306
\(12 \quad 17 \quad 29371229423\)

294359 II 2975 13
drivers [3] \(281219 \quad 281924\)
293514
drove [3] \(28135 \quad 293411\)
drug [23] 28672418
28711611172125
\(\begin{array}{llllll}28721 & 3 & 5 & 19 & 2873 & 15\end{array}\)
28744828751315
\(2876 / 2 \quad 28839297014\)
drugs [14] \(280713 \quad 286719\)
286814286912871810
\(2873916 \quad 22 \quad 287610\)
29122297011297422
29808
drunk [6] \(2826 \quad 13 \quad 2835 \quad 16\)
2878429268294320
296923
drunkenness [1] 2836 1/
dual [1] 298817
Dudley [7] 2808192425
28132228207282114
282620
due [1] 30147
duplicate [l] 28646
duplicated [1] 285918
duplicatung [1] 29474
duties [8] \(287416 \quad 287616\)
2926 I1 298922299321
232994429994
duty [32] \(281323 \quad 2843 \quad 13\)
287517288122288516
\(28864614 \quad 28888 \quad 13\)
\(28891416 \quad 23 \quad 289023\)
2899162909713129123 \(8291712 \quad 29181018 \quad 20\)

29292293520298524
299316
Dwight \{291 28911567

2893369151720
28949 11 1728982224
\(2899311 \quad 292014 \quad 29213\) 2229287
DX3454 [1] 280922
DX3459 [2] \(2805 / 1 \quad 28079\)
DX3460 [1] 295620
DX3461 [2] \(2957 / 12\)
DX3523 [4] 2999 // /4 /6 17
\(\overline{-E-}\)
early [7] 2869 /1 19 288918290011297621 2990429981
easier [3] \(293719 \quad 2968\) 1/ 299818
East [1] \(2962 / 8\)
east [1] 29949
eastbound [1] 300612
easy [7] \(2868 \quad 14 \quad 2884 \quad 22\)
\(29261419 \quad 2968 \quad 17 \quad 20\)
economic [2] \(2934 \quad 12 \quad 22\)
economics [1] 2935 1
economy [1] 28634
edge [2] 30162225
education [3] 284116
29631112
educational [1] 284117
Edward [3] 2806829552

16
effect 1612838628664
289652933329587
29908
effects [3] 28222428725
effictency (1] 2991 10
efficrent [2] \(2850 \quad 10 \quad 12\)
effort [2] \(286619 \quad 288310\)
efforts [2] \(28838 \quad 301315\)
egress [1] 28166
EHAP \(1612872815 \quad 17 \quad 22\)
288522
eight |81 2893 // 2914 /2
2934182941929654
2966 I 3015 I 3018 /3
element [2] 286/ 428898
eliminated [1] 288414
Elmo |l| 28124
embelished (1) 285821
emerge (1) 2841 25
Emergency [1] 280623
emotional [2] 28812 3
employ [3] \(284821 \quad 295210\) 29664
employed [12] 280936
284022284115284325
2848929483529646
29701029931516
employee [25] 285022
28513 \(2860 / 8286521\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}2871 & 5 & 28727 & 10 & 11 & 14 & 17\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}18 & 22 & 2874 & 19 & 25 & 2875 & 17\end{array}\)
21232877328819
2883 /I 29007292621
293110293212293721
employment [8] 285622
2857228801028824
2938429882329907
30009
enclosure 121301425 30151
encounter |11 29663
encourage |2| 286520
286615
end 1912814 IS 2843 /2
28463428832294119
298267301323
endorsed (1) 2899 13
endorsement [7] 2902 10 12
29591471029766
enforce [11 28697
enforcement 111299325
Engine [1] 297613
engune 181 2842729766 //
2979624298925299119
2991 10
Enguneer (1) 298113
engineer (16) 284217
28431628521128815
288317172976 15 2988 17
25298922232990122
2425 2991 20
engineering (5) 28424516 28431284425
engineers [5] 284417
2852132895129769
298813
English [2] 29631429642
enlisted |1| \(38(80) 12\)
enroll |l| 2865 /4
enrolled |11 28438
enrolling [1] 287225
enrollment 113286510
ensign |4| 2842239 \(2843 / 8\)
ensure \(|6| \begin{array}{ll}2807 & 24286310\end{array}\) 13286717288320289516 ensured [2| 2865 21 22 entall [1] 29293
enter |11 28073
entered |4| \(28776 \quad 28789\) 1023
entirety \(12+2958\) 12 3011 21 entrances |1| 29603 entries \(18128 / 09 \quad 131920\) 281115281262329993 entry \(171281 \mid 202328121\)
17281339281721
environment [3] 2867 /6
2933 // 2984 /7
equal [1| 2835 /8
equivalent [¢] 2842 17
284318212324
error \(1213016 \quad 15 \quad 16\)
escort [11 2808?
ersence 13129662029718 29738
essentrally 141281416
288110288417292017
HSSO 31284314284445
establesh |4| 2861 I/ 28714
287420300822
established [5] 28562
28712325289220295723
et [2] 28465295112
FTA \(131300918 \quad 301620\)
301713
evaluated [2] 2928 /] l8
evaluating 11128076
evaluation [8| 286016
28614289112291812
29281920296417
evaluations 12129651719
H ve 12| 29707
evening \(112 \mid 28102428114\)
284391029521829655
29701629726297325
29917301013301414
event [2] \(289510 \quad 2950 \quad 12\)
events [2] 28944301318
Everybody [1] 29033
everybody (2) 2857 21
298410
evidence |ll| 280923
\(28491028591 / 28605\)
\(2862 / 4 \quad 287023 \quad 287321\)
289082893 /3 2922 /9
29609
evidenced 111 2875 12
evolution 11130134
exact \(|8| 2881 \quad 1417\)
288619291022 2961 14
\(300710 \quad 1213\)
exactly (131 283082848 )
288221288712289114 2528931229089290920 29235299511300212 300815
exam |2| 296068
F XAMINAIION \(118 \mid 2806\) II \(2830232837 / 1284017\)
2903 // 29375294018

29472029528295512
295824296213297419
297592985229885
2993 / 1300022
examınation [5] 295914
2960 |0 || 2974 |7 29937
examine |1| 29038
F XAMINFR |4| \(2921 / 4\)
299312300023300810 examining |1| 28817
example |c| 283882853 I2
\(222859 / 22967 / 9\)
except (I) 28263
exception \(|5| 28639\)
2864 I5 2869 /4 2881 18 2899 /8
exceptional ||| 296522
exceptionally |l| 28877
exceptions [1] 2864 12
excessive [31 28795
288821291315
exchange [3| 28956721
Excuse (4) 280912285523
\(2909 \times 298720\)
excuse \(12 \mid 2820\) 16 29612
executive |니 284023
284515
exercise |1 28644
exercises \(|2| 286322\)
Fxhibit \(|29| 28071 \mid 280823\)
2809222810182849 ।1
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}14 & 16 & 2855 & 12 & 13 & 285910\end{array}\)
\(2870182428771 /\)
28951629241920
292514293235294817
2994192129968299914 17
exhibit 121280518300412
Fxhbits 1912805 /1 13
\(2806 / 28091619284916\)
172329471
exhibits 131280524290319
29474
exist |1| 285617
existed [31 280892821 I
28655
exit |11 281715
exted 111282410
expand [1] 284516
expansюn 11128727
expect \([31288613 \quad 295817\) 19
expected [6] 288616
2887232918729291921
29319
experience [14] 282838
28351028361728397
28511928981628997
290225295325295411
29572029691829992
experiences [4] 28442
289571728964
expert [2] 2931 \(10 \quad 299623\)
Expires (1) 302322
explain [31 2857 l 287417 30143
expression |1| 2930 I
extend \(|2| 28672 \quad 28719\)
extended III 300310
extending | \(21300 / 24\)
extensıve \(1312861 / 5\)

Benve Symeme Applicalsors
286320287917
extent [2] 286614300214 extangusher (1) 28591
extra [1] 297112
eyes [3] \(293612 \quad 15 \quad 19\)

\section*{- F-}

FAA [1] 28414
face [7] \(2880 \quad 11292822 \quad 23\) 2929918
faced 111290115
facet [1] 288718
facets 131 \(286318 \quad 291916\) 293517
faciltues (5) 28141728737
28752428761015
facilty [4] 280713281214 281524
facing [2] 2941 1922
fact [44] \(283216 \quad 28363\)
2838212867122872 11
287416287582128789
28819288241018
28838288714151921
288916182890814
289522289913291016
29171416292668
\(2927192938 / 122929\) /2
2933131415293615
294262951929544
296525298025
factor [1] 293620
Failed (I) 293720
failed 14! 290712293722
\(2996 / 15\)
failing [1] 29953
falure |l| 29158
fair (11) \(2833 / 4283419\)
28362629084290913
29112429124292115
29506295219
farrly |2| \(28563 \quad 2983\) 22
fath |11 2984 IS
Falkenstem ||| \(301 / 5\)
fall (2) \(288213 \quad 293220\)
fallen [2] 2916 16
fallung |11 283521
familar 15| 2888 11 292510
29501129571729799
familarization |1| 2851 18
family |II \(2891 / 8\)
fares (|| 2941 13
farms |1| \(28 / 4\) /7
fastest |l| 294725
tateful |II 2923 8
father 131 2891/8 289716 20
fathom ||| 296024
feature (1) 286519
features [2) 28655287014
February [1] 297816
Federal \{3| 2882314
293023
federal \(16 \mid 28435288220\)
2959278
feel 14128305295717
29684297111
feeling |2| 287519298419
leeval|l| 2815 2
teet |4| 28/7 2328333

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
29862229878
Felipe [1| 284014
fellow [4] 282119282210
29162329172
felt [11] 28089282621
2851 13 2861 11 12
287218287312289219
2901719298422
ferry [2] \(2973 \quad 12 \quad 13\)
field [3] 2846 I/ 1318
fifth 11128573
figure \(13 \mid 2831 / 8290322\) 29975
Chyured 111300514
file |l| 29274
Files |11 29195
fill [1] 2898 11
filled (1) 29576
finalzing [1] 294622
financually [1] 2865 /]
find [14] 2811 23282758
283889287212287322
28962290018290235
2968 9 1729986
Fine \(13 \mid 29(1) 31029469\)
30KO 5
fine \(12 |\)\begin{tabular}{lll}
2937 & 19 & 2991 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
finsh \(\mid 312852529362\)
inashed 171281821282225
293645296018296118
2991 2
fire [3| 2859 / 3286322
firearms [1] 280713
fired |l| 2932 I5
firefightung [2) 28632021
firing |1] \(2901 / 3\)
First |4| 2842 /5 292217
2972 (1) 298923
fisheries III 29942
fit |16| \(288 / 222885 \quad 16\)
2886 46288813288916
232917122918101820
22252928142329292
five 1 l0 \(284310 \quad 28961721\)
28972292024293315
29674296823298713
30165
fixed \(12 \mid 2827 / 8 \quad 20\)
FJI 111290325
flashilght [1] 28594
fleets |2| 284422284619
Hown |II 2850) 3
Hynn |l| 296210
focused \(12 \mid 28582729848\)
fog 1112961 23
follow |11| 282910285725
2861212915829188
\(292343(0128101617\)
30075
follow-up |1| 29235
followed 161282015
286119288220293720
3005330076
Following II 28433292312
following |11| \(2826 / 8\)
28642528832228921
2900 \& \(1 / 291 / 222928 / 6\) 2930 2() 2933229383
follow 111 2921/3
Force |l| 2842 /1
forced |1| 292616

288112
- G -
gadgets [1] 285825
gain [4] 3013671011
Galveston [3] 28471820 29995
gangway [5] 280814
28262528272298519 298614
gantry [5] 282718282819 13283416
Gary [2] 28082028143
gas [2] 28447298214 gasohne [1] 28464
gate [26] 280725280819
280924252810581023
2811128129281323
2814101328152428167
252818928192282047
25282312282422
283413129431
gave \(\{24 \mid 2820 \quad 20 \quad 282211\)
2128571328958290214
\(291515 \quad 292821293910\)

2953 |l 12296625
29671929941529975
3006230103301620
gear (9) \(300717 \quad 18 \quad 25\)
\(3008 / 2\)
gentleman (2] 281717
28232
Gentlemen [3] 2841 16
28654288015
gentlemen [5] 28055
28222228854294613
30187
gets [3] 28931930141112 give |21| \(284012 \quad 285913\)
2881/4 288481328956
\(29001415 \quad 293515\)
2938142939132949920
29685297720299012
3005102330091819
301712
given [15] 28328285915
1829301729382029438
10296617296731923
\(296818 \quad 29701430181\)
gives [2] \(296019 \quad 29763\)
giving [3] 2880528945
297215
Glacier [2] 29984300125
glacier [1] 29985
glasses (1] 294212
Glowackı [9] 281021
2811328121128301
2833828391829797
298113299121
goal (4) 2855328581
286015286311
goes [6] 28331922
29501429562301118
30179
gold [1] 285815
Gonzales [1] 300723
GORDON (1) 300022
Gordon [2] 29991930007 gotten [3] \(288018 \quad 288117\)

300312 -
2870129372129386
grade [1] 284212
graded (1] 286019
graduate [1] 298819
graduated [7] 28411821
2843102963416298815 21
graduatung [2] 296324
300010
graduation [2] 296225
298822
grant [1] 286820
granted [1] 292415
Graves [41] 2877481220
252878167131822
\(287991012 \quad 20 \quad 2228804\)
1828812528851928892
12222908212909612
162910519291121
291392919252920914
292324292412292768
293023
293114
great [6] 285713290324
290852997192125 green [1] 2958 12
Greg [6] 2898810294822
29493297024297110
Grenoble [4] 286431014 17
ground [1] 295913
grounded [1] 2933 14
grounding [43] 283413
285221286913287058
11 28881228991729008
11212329013629031
25290414161824
\(290522906 / 418291225\)
29171292217292312
292525293518294858
295211296422
24296822297711
29782529836910
299224301320
grounds (1) 290113
group [8] 28552528563
2890528912289812
2904629321921
growlers [2] 299836
Guam [1] 29941
guaranteed [2] 288110 11
Guard [36] 2806171921
280915283125283424
283522841181922
284231920212328434
172028532528542124
2855229022229581
2959101123296019
297632993162225
2994430001112
guard [7] 28072528093
2816728205283123
2943612
guess [7] 284813290510
1329331229412296823 30076
guessing [1] 290815
guidance [I] 286125
gurdelines [4] 28742723

29258
Gulf [3) 2997132324
gulf [14| \(284621 \quad 284714\)
242858528591528687
28895289051924
289122892928933
28975
gun |1| 29826
guy (2) 288712289221
guys |S| \(2818 \quad 25 \quad 2935\) 13
2944222946529712
gyro |s| \(294924 \quad 295320\)
2967172529681
\[
-\mathrm{H}-
\]
habits [2| 28361828376
hadn't [5] 28224284814
29272429918300821
Half [1] 294225
half (4) 28731929184
294515298310

halls [31 2853 / 285416 292019
hallway [2| 28201929879
Hammen |11 28413
hand [21| 28064281924
282816283021283111
1928409287019288223
2883242884 S 82887 II
290219294011294714
295552962629752
298723301424
handed [2] 28222528245
handle [6| 2842728593
289622919102984 11 15
handled [2] 2845222896 I
handling 1412850428644 10296011
handralls [2| 282724
2828 /2
HANSON 151295825
2961252974182024
happening (1) 300716
happens [3] 2856928879 29433
Harbor [1] 299716
harbor (1) 2958 II
hard [2] 28353295521
harder [2] 28342428388
HARRY [2] 29472029528
Harry [3] \(29471318 \quad 29658\) Harvey (16] 2897 10 1/ 21 28985152128992
290452920101429214
2229222129231929287
Haven [2] 29922 Il
haven't [3] 2831 \(18 \quad 296017\) 29806
Havens [1] 297914
hawed (1] 28831
hazard (1) 295818
he'd [1] 28827
he'll [2] 29031529578 head [3] 2814 15 283122 294220
headed [21 284416 299] 19 heading (2) \(296717 \quad 296818\) headquarters (3) 2846 II 2847 11 28913
health [3| 28727 I/ 29135
hear [91 2893 / 290121
\(29022294219 \quad 29651416\)
297358297921
heard [13| 28161828949
29142029154292011
292217292312293623
\(242942 / 8 \quad 295217\)
297410301415
hearang |2| 28992290124
heart |l| 29293
hedge [1] 293425
held \(|3| 288 \mid 1 / 293 \mathrm{~K}\) 3023 /I
hello [1] 29446
helm \(|3| 29481316296723\)
helmsman (4| 2854 /8
\(29681419 \quad 297310\)
helmsinen [1] 2854 11
help [12) 2808 Il 15
2811252828 / 6284722
2866528722328827
\(291032936 / 829398\)
helped II 29299
helps 111284719
hemmed III 2883 /
Henry [2| 2922 //
Herb [2] 2920 10 29222
HERBY 11130238
Hey [1] 298616
hey \(|2| 28878 \quad 293025\)
hill| 298624
hide [2] 2891 212917 21
high [4] 2850 S 285212
29642300010
hugher [2] 2852 IS 17
highest 11128586
highlighted \(|2| 281 / 15\)
29254
Hinchunbrowk |x| 295921
249723 3 1 NX 4182023
300912
hired 16128443510
\(285362964 / 214\)
huring (4) 2853 /8 2854 /I 19296415
hold (91) 28272428567
2879152909829671416
29681829901130111
holiday (1) 29706
home [12 285824285945 6 2875 /8 \(287772886 / 4\)
\(2924 \mid 816293918\)
296217
homes |11 285825
Honor \({ }^{1271} 280591022\)
28091220283019
\(283710 \quad 28491012\)
285514287020288529
29111729461029476
295422962229741618
2975129871618299310
29991130002130184
honor (I) 29939
hope [1] 299925
horns [1] 2961 23
horsepower |l| 2988 /4
hospital |1| \(29 / 19\)
hour \(191290321 \quad 294225\)
29482029498295120
298310300924
hours |10| 288762893 II 293316293623294514 \(2985222986 /\) /। 300825 Houston 1131284014
2846 II 1428471828904 289522904242905167 29551029701429995
huh 111287617
hundred III 285216
hung 121 \(285610 \quad 299117\) hungry |1| \(2946 / 4\)

\section*{- I -}
l'd 1161280913284523
28497285213286024
2903222915 I 292124
292342968829816
2983515299417301022 301415
I've [13| \(282724 \quad 2831 \quad 12\)
2860122874172888 I/
2891192925414296920
2984782992 IO
I A-R-()-S-S-I |11 \(2840 / 4\)
IAROSSI [31 284017
29031129375
\(\begin{array}{lllll}\text { larossi } 1371 & 28408 & 13 & 19\end{array}\)
222848232849525
2852202856814286014
286361028648286620
28701028711228732
2875 / 287619287716
288421288512288620
28941828951528974
2899152902629034
715 2921 1319293211
29372293920
ice \(119130011821 \quad 24\)

3009181920301689
\(\begin{array}{lllll}3017 & 121314\end{array}\)
Ideals| 28362128551920
28579296921
Ideally |l| 298022
identification [21| 280910
28171618281828915
2819228201428651519
202428661628673
28831129083529436
identified [101 2830 I/
287217288082881917
212882929087290914
15
Identifier (1) 288020
identify [12] 280823
28092328101281519
28194282321282624
2883625288417290924 29109
Identıfying (I) 283720
IDR [8] 288891129179
\(\begin{array}{lll}10 \quad 11 & 1315\end{array}\)
illegal [4] \(280713 \quad 28679\)
2875 21
illness [3] 2865810
image [2] 30126301624
ammedrately [6] 2833 /l
28939294232943712
300010
impact |11 29826

Buare Syatern Applicuisers
mpacted \(\|\) | 28822
umpair |11 28659
umparred [26| 28227
28241228256928289
2836192837246
287416287616288112
28821924288321
29261013296961419
22297012978229792
298323 2991 25
umparment [9] 282516
2835202838132866217
28671287252951525
umportance (1) 286023
mportant 1 |17| 285161316
28562128611328635
\(28651519 \quad 286614\)
286714288514289519
2029061229306729675
mprove [3] 28582328883
301422
mbound [7] 29561429574
2973122995929962
\(3008 / 13 / 8\)
Inc |11 294021
incentive |l| 29906
incident |11| 282623
28792528803289514
289614291718292223
298782997710
incidents 3128958 21 24
Inclune |l| 2947 18
include |4| 280752860 IS
29262329272
included (5) 2871710
\(2876102907 / 4293414\)
incoming 16128071819
28091128148282423
282525
meonvenienced [1] 286712
incorporate [1] 29258
incorrect [1] 299524
increasing |1| 28678
Independence \(12 \mid 28132()\) 294023
independentiv 11138195
indicate |3| \(28 / 33 \quad 2824\) /5
299520
indicated [5] 282418
28282328662428784 301810
indications ||| 282525
individual |27| 28086 |/ 23
2817142822428232124
2854828572028652122
28732123287412
\(287513288120 \quad 2882512\) 21288351928878 28889292923293057 29567
individuals |191 2809 /] 28156142817128194 2820 12 2823792826 II 1728281928292021 2830791828399 2873 11 297122
industries [1] 28576 mdustry |3| 28415 285025 29257
influence [2] 2824 I2 \(2876 / 2\)

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
intormal |l| \(2894 / 5^{-7}\)
Information |1| 2807 /2
information 161282317
28549287910288019
29473299516
Informed |l| 299114
mformed [10] 2877428902
2898529101929217
292322298315299111
299817301710
mforming (3) 29287301619
infringe [2] 28712287419
ingramed [1] 287511
untual |2| 2808629728
intually (11) 2959 )
mituate |21 281542873 /I
intuated [7] 28106281823
\(281922282332871 / 1\)
2971 II 297220
intuates [1] 297220
intuating (1) 297222
intuative [1] 286114
muluries (3) \(285618 \quad 28595\)
290519
inland \(|6| 284623 \quad 25\)
\(2847 / 232848 / / 18\)
Inlet 11129595
inpatient |2| 2879 I6 292816 mquired |1| 28865
mquiry |l| 2995 2/
inscriptuon \(1112858 / 5\)
insisted |1| 28638
inspect |l| 299017
inspection [3| 29809 || 12
inspections |2| 299020
2991 2
instance [3| 285252872 15 29941
mstances [1| 29106
instantly [2] 29501418
institution |1| 2842 /
instruct |2| \(2885 \quad 19 \quad 2889 \quad 12\)
instructed \(13 \mid 2820\) ) 21
2922 If 2949 ? 1
instructions|912861 1022
29231929462330187
intact |11 298315
intend [3] 2875 /6 2886 /3
2939 /7
intended [2] 287] 2287419
intent III 286719
intention \(|2| 29384299016\)
intentions |21 299)/4
30031
interact [2] 289419297821
interest |l| 2945 10)
interented \(15129 / 4 / 8\)
2925329332129421520
interfaced |11 \(2846 / 4\)
interfacing |11 \(2846 / 6\)
interference |1| 301410
interfering II 301421
interjection [1] 29887
intermittent \([5] 301025\)
30126 |l 13
internal (1] 285912
International [3] 284314
284445
international ||| 2843 /]
interpret 11128123
interpretation \(\mathbf{Y}^{31} 288119\)

2882 /I
interrogation [1] 29972
interval |S| 29632025
2967212429683
interview [9] 28304288925
2901112429281329403 4297014
interviewed [2] 28906
291617
interviews [1] 28328
Intoxicated [1] 29794
intoxicated [3] 292613
29691629701
intoxcation [2] 28088
2836 /I
introduced [2] 28711721
introducing [1] 2819 11
introduction [1] 293121
introductory [1] 30001
unvestugated [1] 289923
investugatung [1] 29106
investigation [4] 29111314
15291423
investugators [1] 2937 21
invitation [1] 293124
tuvite |2| \(289425 \quad 28951\)
involve |11 283723
involved 1712815513
2820228272528292
299516299623
invoivement [2| 282925
2838 I
Irrespectuve [1] 292823
Island [111 2877729119
29615300125300889
300918301512301620
30171317
ssland [2| 282125299717
Lssue [2| 29639299523
Lssues [1] 281219
issuing (1) 29514
ttem |2| 28573286016
ttems |3| \(285617 \quad 2860518\)
Ivan |3| 289472914 /9
- J -

J-U-S-T I-C-E [1] 296210 Jacınto [1] 284721
JACK [2] 2975929852
Jack [3| 2947132975 l 6
Jackets [1] 285820
James [2] 284013289224
Japan |l| 284416
jeopardized [1] 293310
jet |l| 28464
Im |5| 289224289325
29142429209
jobs |1| 285723
Joe 136| \(2878 \quad 14288320\)
28901328911622

289362896182023
28982228995111213
29014 11 21 23291022
291314292024292813
2929102938429391516
2991722
John [16] 28894524

289124292021429213

23300723
joined [5] 28481023
2965829708297820
joked [1] 299115
JONES [1] 29885
Jones [7] 297910298718
2021222988810
Joseph [1] 287620
JOY [1] 302321
Judge \{3) 28491829527
29851
judge [2] 2826511
judged [2] 282519
Judging [1] 29108
judgment (4) 29075810
29695
July [1] 300020
jumped [1] 288922
Juneau [22] 300181115

2230031571524
300416233005213
3016 II
junnor [1] 29642
Jury [9] 28052284116 28654288015288578 294618294712301815 jury \((3) 281516 \quad 284020\) 294622
Justice [1] 296210

\section*{- K -}

Kagan [1] 296510
Kate [1] 297914
Keep [1] 283021
keep (5) 28582228591
2885232890229062
keeping [1] 28104
kept [2] 28852429212
key [2] \(287412 \quad 293519\)
keyed [1] 285022
kinds [2] \(293592982 \quad 12\)
Kings |3| 2988 IS 19 21
kitchen [2] 285923
knives (1) 280713
knoh 12| 3013 11
knots 1113017 11
knowing [2] 283735
knowledge [9] 287224
2881 1828981929247
293812995172996723
2997 I2
Koops |l9 2890232891 ]
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}5 & 8 & 12 & 24 & 28924715 & 23\end{array}\) 28949131428982224
2920142921322
Kunkel [1] 28532

\section*{- L-}
label [1] 296023
lacking [1] 282416
Ladies [4] 28411628654
288015294613
tadies (3] 2805 528854
30187
Lamoyne [1] 294718
land [3] 2816629602022
lands [1] 284112
lane [12] 28166299510
299621629971300223
\(30032300422-30061214\) 30162230171
lanes [8] 2998730031115
\(300514300615 \quad 16\)
301612301712
large [4] \(284418 \quad 28477\)
28541628563
larger [1] 296812
last [28] \(280678 \quad 282924\)
28401228421628438
\(2857428781112 \quad 28835\)
\(8293321 \quad 2937231294014\)
2945829465294717
2955814296249
\(297120 \quad 29755298117\)
2988129902330103 301718
lasted [2] \(284411 \quad 12\)
late [6] \(28691119 \quad 28706\)
28771289719291413
laughed [1] 299116
law [8] 2869242882120
\(28838 \quad 293118111299325\)
lawnmowers [1] 28596
lawyer [2] \(2900 \quad 25 \quad 2906 \quad 19\)
lawyers [7] \(290816 \quad 293025\)
293134712
laying [2] 2957829909
leading [2] \(291820 \quad 29543\)
leads [1] 282915
learn (7) 28239283110
289512212228979
2994 /1
learned [19] 2816 11
\(282618 \quad 28724288714\)
\(2888 \quad 11 \quad 288918 \quad 2895918\)
28964289747291169
29132429147 II 14
29171293225
leave [10] 2845 1/ 28474
285110290142924415
2991330001930066
301015
| eaving (1] 284723
leaving (12] 284818
\(2853 / 429368\) 2971/1 2
\(18 \quad 297231314129739\)
29915300514
left hand \(1212831 \quad 15 \quad 20\)
leg (2) \(2981 \quad 1718\)
legal [6] \(286921 \quad 22 \quad 24 \quad 25\)
287022882 II
length [3] 2908529151 29875
lengthy [2] 2929329875
lessons [4] 2895917
28964293224

287011252871828734
28763289016
level [8] 28294283519
2838921283968 11
Leyendecker [2] 292010
29222
luability [1] 295520
library [l] 2858 11
license [11] 281222
28412528532528649
295922962212329639
2988101229895 hcensed [5] 285425

2964 /1 1525
Lieutenant [2| 2843 21
30114
lieutenant \([2] 28429284318\)
life [4] 2843222875 21
2886 /4 297520
light [5] \(281113 \quad 2836 \quad 17\)
2961520
lightering (1| 297823
lights \(\{2 \mid 29612123\)
liked [1] 30074
limit [3] \(283425 \quad 283523\)
limitations [1] 295520
limited [1] 287316
line |20| \(280720 \quad 28133\)
\(2909349291 / 2291211\)
291323242914510
298116298262992 II
\(2993243004 / 33005\) II
1930166
Lnes |l0| 29534297120
298291920299924
3016618
link [1] 283110
Iqquefied (1] 28446
Iqquid [1] 289622
liquor |ll| 28732029804
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}16 & 2992 & 3 & 5 & 8 & 10 & 13 & 14\end{array}\)
1719
lıst \(15128186 \quad 7 \quad 2856 / 7\)
296120
Instened |1| 300112
Istening (1| 30188
lsting [1] 28185
lists [1] 296124
Live [4] 2806 // \(2840 / 7\)
29472029759
live |6| \(2840 / 4 \quad 286322\)
2884 /6 \(2907 / 22975 / 7\)
lived \(11 \mid 289120\)
living 131289016290713
2975 II
I NG |2| 28448 ||
load |l| 29933
loaded [11 2827 /4
loading |l| 29768
locate |1| 29023
located ||| 284122
location |3| \(28466 \quad 2961\) /S
22
locations [1] 300915

132832232528334
logger [5] \(30111 / 1721\)
301225
logre |1| 288317
London (2) 284/ 2324
looks [2] 2861 / 2950 //
Los (1) 297820
lose [2] 2982 / \(3014 / 2\)
lost [7] \(300419 \quad 301022\)
3014 / 468
lot [111 \(284615 \quad 284720\)
2850325285115285821
2859 ll 2860 S 29178
29809300312
Louistana [2] 28462428934
low [2] \(2838 / 8\)
Lower |1| 29024
kower |3| 28382425
\(2956 / 2\)
loval |2| 298568
lucky |11 2987 I
luggage |l| 2807 I8
Lusk (3) 2994 /8 \(2 / 2996\) /2
I YNCH [12] 28059 2]
2806122809122021
2830192837101228401
299392999 II
Lynch [3| 280582428363

\section*{\(-\mathrm{M}_{-}\)}

M-U-R-P \({ }^{-}\)Y \(|1| 295516\)
machnery |3| 2976910
298924
magnetic ||| 2961 /
magnitude 11128844
magnitudes |l| 284523
main 16128092528167
284112296024298314
299110
maintained [1] 281421
major 14| \(2843222861 / 7\)
2934930134
Malcomb [1] 296210
Man |1] 280819
man |71 2829 || 285425
2907 /l 2920122929 /
29458300013
manage ill 2934 /9
managed (4) 2846212224
293421
management |26| 285615
28651729161516
\(29201318 \quad 22 \quad 29232\)
29251617202934345
\(6 \quad 121519212935914\)
1929367293778
manager [20] 284425
2845328592128608
286881720287217
28773288952890620
\(24289 / 2428971 /\)
2906329117293519
managerv 161285521
28661228687287216
289425290716
mandatory 111293019
maneuvering 141286446
29935299718
manifest [1] 28185
manifold [3] 2981 \(16 \quad 29827\)
manner |2| 28493286123
Manual (11 280712
manual 117 ll \(2861 / 151722\)
286217913182125
2906 Il 2429073293520 2229368
March \(\mid 3512806 / 422\)
2809928102428211
282421282922283224
\(2833 / 42836928459\)
28702528734289613
294042951172021
2957229701629726
2974129816299545
3000243001291219
301319
301513822
Margaret 121289712 /8
marijuana |3| 286625
\(28725 \quad 287319\)
Marine 12128428294021 marine \(\mid 12128152228419\) 2843415212844524
2845328502528537
\(29638 \quad 15\)
mariners [1] 299825
Marines |1| 28886
marınes |1| 28885
Maritume [4] 29633517 29645
maritime [9] 28415285222
25291625296324
mark |3| 280523296022
299419
marked \(|2| 2957130114\)
markers |11 2961 21
marketing (1) 284419
Martin (11) 294015
Martineau III 2920 IO
Mary |11 29239
mask 111283725
master |35| \(2842 \quad 25 \quad 2843\) I/
2853222854182862522 28649 13 2885 l 288920
28972328981281014 \(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}17 & 18 & 19 & 2902 & 15 & 23\end{array}\)
290322907422293414
29381329462529478
295621229575710
299720
masters |14| 285125
\(\begin{array}{llll}2852 & 18 & 2861 & 21 \\ 2864 & 17\end{array}\)
28987112902101219
252904101112
mate [34| 2852 lO 1112
2853111418285435
294822296221296524 25296612161829675 \(297019 \quad 20 \quad 242971614\) \(\begin{array}{lllllll}23 & 24 & 297217 & 29768 & 14\end{array}\) \(298021298315 \quad 298817\) 2989 | 299532996 |
materiais 11128077
mates |3| \(2852 / 3 \quad 2895\) / 297021
Matter 11129519
matter [7] 28831329151
29661721296867
301120
matters [2] 2931 103023 ll
MCGREGOR [1] \(2940 / 8\)
McGregor [7] 28131718
282015283919294012 20
\(\begin{array}{llll}\text { McVicker } & 121 & 2897 & 12 \\ 18\end{array}\)
meals [21 28962425
mean \(15 \mid 28062528183\)
28242528685287119
2881 14291510292815
294923295221296722
29729298123006410
meaning [2] 28205287814
means [6] 284625285124
288742920329871
30066
meant [12] 28559285624
28571922288113
28881929181729205
295224295319300912
\(30 / 220\)
28881929181729205
301220

mechanical [1] 2843 I
Medical (1) 280623
medical [171)2872 12141423
28852324288636
288819290917291223
291361329181129191
29281929303
meet (7) \(2818 \quad 14 \quad 2821 \quad 16\)
2888 / 289320292822
29291294620
meeting \(171288913 \quad 19\)
\(2924 / 32928232929\) y
\(293221 \quad 2983 / 8\)
meetings (6) 29241258
16293711
member [7] 2808128692
29252029341293519
29367298916
members [8] 28511221
28762328932329012
29062229231293421
memo [7] \(2878813 \quad 20\)
290820242995202996 // memorandum |ㄴ| 299417
249412
Memorte |l| 2934 (1) memory \(12 \mid 29427\) 2961/9 men |3| 2829212128372 mention [2] 286723291519 mentioned ( 10 ) 283713
283822841228476
28572428881428935
291521298314299223
merchant |4| 28417
2842182843628537 mercies |1| 29027
messed 11130136
Messrs |3| 28/I 2 2812 II 28301
metal 171282020 2822 21
232824329431013
294421
MICHAEL (3) 2806 // 283023283711
Michael [3| 2805928068 29559
Michigan [2| 28422428433 mid (1) 287919
midnight 131 2810628263 300025
Mihajlovic \(|x| \begin{array}{ll}2894 & 7 \\ \text { y } & 13\end{array}\) 1528992429141922 Mike |l| 2988?
mike |y \(294922 \quad 23 \quad 24\)
295072953161925
2954612
mild (S] 2879328881920 2913 /3 14
mile [12] 300420301289 \(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}10 & 12 & 14 & 19 & 23 & 3013 & 16\end{array}\) 30171421
males [2) 2933 /4 3012 /5
mind |11| 285022288024
2888172223289324 298111229542122296814 mene 13128103285520
2956 /I
minor ||| 299920
minute 1912816828336
284121286725287422
24292882968230106

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-26-94 VOLUME 18 Conocortanco by Look-Sood (69)
minutes [13] 2831/ 283216
1728337288556
294223294751029687
3007230101417
musland [1] 281423
misread [1] 2809 13
mass |l| 2896 /
misses |2| 28952223
missing |l| 299924
mission 12| 28451928492
Mississippi ||| 28472
misspoke |11 29177
mistakes (1) 297310
Muster 13| 287922289924
30106
MIT [1] 289718
mxxed [1] 301511
mode [11 28087
models [1] 28645
modsfication ||| 287012
modifications (I) 28764
modified |1| 286621
Moment |11 28874
moment \(11012855 \quad 23 \quad 28871\)
15212967222987412
\(13299863(x) 213\)
moments |21 2971 / 29877
monentum 111 2968 /3
Monday (1) 2901 25
money (5) 285810290211
131429906
monstor 1141280820
28132425281421
282818212428744
\(2875217 \quad 2886131621\)
291323
monitored \(1+1293417\)
2958 123018415 ls
montoring 113128152
2874 // 2875 万 2989 / 3
2919 K \(2920202921 / 2\)
\(16 \quad 293812 \quad 293916300418\)
montors |3| 2814529587
14
month 16128879290424
2905 । 29184297818
months \91 28454289214
2898329055295210
Monument 111284721
morale 111285 x y
moramy 112123055
282618290112290125
2917 I4 2918 1529655
29852425245015
29441530184
motons \(12 \mid 286450\)
motivate 14| 2857252858 ।
\(285913 \quad 2860 / 4\)
motivation [2] 28554
2863 /1
move 15128492286418
2899429312329682
moved \(|4| 28441516\)
301415
movement |l| 29954
movements 12 24523
29833
moves 111301422
moving |s| 28452429357
2944232968 / 30147
Mrs 1112897 I2

MS [13] 2954252955213
29582325296125
\(297418 \quad 20 \quad 24 \quad 298718 \quad 22\)
2988629936
Ms [2] 2992211
murky [1] 2983 11
MURPHY [2] 2955 /2
295824
Murphy (4) \(29552 \quad 16 \quad 17\) 295823
mustache [1] 294213
Myers [7] 2900 19290469 10290513290617 myself [5] \(280822 \quad 282620\) 28351628682128948
- - N -

Naked [5] \(30088 \quad 300918\)
301620301713
Name [1] 29756
name (40) 2806678
28121528194283025
2840 I/ 12 1328475
28762028773289223
289462901129172
2940131429471617
\(2955781415 \quad 2962489\)
1529754529799
2987252988124299024
\(2993 / 3\)
2998530007301110
named (4) \(280819 \quad 29046\)
29791214
names [2] 28582028694
narrower |1| 282715
Narrows 16| 29724297316
\(299716 \quad 18 \quad 2124\)
National 181290318
291025291551629246
295223295336
national III 285310
natural |11 28446
nature [1] 2970 1]
naval (1) 284225
navıgable |I| 295725
navgate [3] 2827816
28289
Navigatung III 299724
navigating |4| 2863324

\section*{2997313}
navigation \(|14| 282810\)
286115202862121
2895529073293522
29614212429943
299956
navigational [2] \(299713 \quad 22\)
NEAL [38] 28406818
\(\begin{array}{llllll}2849 & 9 & 15 & 24 & 28551416\end{array}\)
2870202228771415
2885291129034714
29098291117 2921 10
292410 2931 2329323
293622937146293920
2946 14 2947691321
29525295427
20
Neal |ك| 284072931 21
29362529541819
negotudting [1] 298223
nervous [1] 287219

Nevada [1] 294719
Nicholas [2] 2901 1290619
nught [26] 28061315
\(28081618 \quad 2809910\)
\(2813232826122 \quad 282921\)
2830282834910
294024294581829465
29732529792429817
2991329954301420
30177
nighttume (1] 2972 11
nune 14128422230141325 301617
nobody [2] 2835729318
nonparty (1) 29472
normal [5] 28159294224
2943129666296920
normally [2] 2822529916
North [1] 29771
north [2] 29238297823
northbound (5] 300422
300519300614301612
301712
Norton [1] 280821
Notary \({ }^{11} 302321\)
notation (1) 291711
note [1] 2807 1]
notes \(\{3] \begin{array}{llllll}2918 & 13 & 14\end{array}\)
302310
Notuce (1] 298124
notice (10) 2823628727
29432229458297224
297323297441429831
298613
notuceable [3] 282810
294522
notuceably [1] \(2826 \quad 12\)
noticed [31 \(283224 \quad 294317\)
297318
notufied (1] 299021
notufy [2] 280810290221
noting [1] 28109
notwithstanding [1] 2937 I
November (1) 289113
NTSB |l11 2901 2324
2902129101829143
291534292313300579
Number [1] 285512
number [31] 2805 21
28121822284418
2850192028551228583
28928289310289816
\(29031319 \quad 292615 \quad 29334\)
294624294772959613
15162529602518
2966212425296711
numbers [1] 28694
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline - 0 - \\
\hline o'clock (1) 29412 \\
\hline O'Donovan [1] 301424 \\
\hline O'NEILL [39] 2805141720 \\
\hline 2809172830212428379 \\
\hline 284052849121829036 \\
\hline 912162909910291123 \\
\hline 2921 112029241117 \\
\hline 2932142936321 \\
\hline 29392229527929545 \\
\hline 101517298513298715 \\
\hline 2993829999 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Benc Syntere Apolacikros
1530004 -
O'Neill [l0] \(283025 \quad 283713\)
283822860129027
2903829312529362
29381118
Oaks [2] 2910729186
oath [4] 2915416295313 30056
objection [12] 28051114
17280917284991218
2954782999152530004
objective (71) 28493285019
2328562028633286413 286714
objects [3] 282020282222 28244
oblugation [1] 28557
observation [2] 28086
295819
observe [36] 2814 /1
28171328199282124
28225282425282524
2826528298283913
286612290716294423
29517296512296911
29741310297722
29812022298223
298325298511121620
298689
1230044101121 300513
observed [20] 28149
2816252817142818 /2
2821519282514812
282616283851228397
295913296010298518
29861030052
observing (3) 295714
300467
obstacle [1] 2998 I
obtain [2] 2902 I2 29598
obvious [1] 285024
obvously [1] 297114
occasюn [22] 2826 15
282722828118282916
2865128926289317
2894192896929432225
2974142977514297821
2980242981451229838
occasюnally [2] 2878315
occasюns [6] 286625
28785289421292022 293118
occupants [1] 29438
occurred [11] 287013
2879232528871928999
29012529277829404
2996629978
occurrence [1] 2834 /1
occurring [1] 282425
ocean [5] \(284821112 \quad 22\) 29603
oceans [1] 298814
October [2] 2891132925 I off-camera [1] 281724 offer [6] \(280913 \quad 1428499\) 15299911301515 offered [7] 280513280916 2849 11 1729711029909 299914
offering [1] 29906

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5 26-94 VOLUME 18 mantiance in 1 mink Soel 701
office [21| 28102528143 13281532228161 281721281811017 282017282410282514 282617284791028929
102893529564299413
Officer [1] 280914
officer [28] 2809228151
28189152128191
282047282821283125
2840232842151617
28451528601828622
286323289422290417
2933102964 /| 1825
29802123299022299316
Officers |1| 28428
officers |25| \(285112 \quad 28529\)
151728532428615621
286262228632428641
228722287472895617
2428961290415293219
21293416296416
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}\text { offices } 161 & 2846 & 12 & 13 & 18\end{array}\)
2856 /1 285716297221
official [1] 28188
offictally [2] 28717
offictals [1] 28072
offset [2] 30121415
Oh |14| 2820628502
2895192942232945617
21297522298017
2982 /2 /4 \(2984 / 4\)
300815301114
oh [3] 28901729412
300020
Ohю [1] 28472
oll (8) 2832228452124
252846128478293314
299017
Okay \(1471 \begin{array}{lll}2805 & 18 & 28128\end{array}\)
\(28131628 / 8\) |l 282124
28221328242128378
2844 /5 \(284823 \quad 285017\)
2856728613286912
\(2877242911 / 4291321\)
29143291714292825
2933929468294819
29506 |l 2953 / 9
295620
29609297124297615
2977929782429819
298515299420299910
3001121730022530049
1218300525300725 301723
okay [14] 28206287424
289123289512291322
\(29145293622 \quad 293820\) 21
2939629441429497
300513300616
Oldham (1) 297912
on-the-job [3] 28714
287421287523
ones [2] 286821300815
ongoing [2] 2887516
OOD [2] 30071821
oops [1] 301518
open [7] 2821 10289217
182893232930 /1
299016301425
opened [2] 28732029435
\(2964 / 2\)
operate (9| 2812212847 | 284824284925285014 operated |4| 2847528486 28496286124
operating [8] 284834
285612861912286316 17289817
operation [22| 284257
28462028503791112
132851 14 28556286113
\(\begin{array}{llllll}19 & 2862 & 23 & 2863 & 15 & 38875\end{array}\)
2933252934 / 293517
\(2957182995 / 5\)
operational ||| 2844 2]
operations |91 284617
28494285052855 II
285622285722861 II
28635288919
opined [1] 29087
opinion 18128287286923
293141229352429361
79
opimons |1| 293523
opportumitues |912855 23
2871528811228956
290725
opportunity \(\{181286517\)
28932528951728964
290014152901819
\(29071617 \quad 22 \quad 292025\)
29453562985101216
opposed (11) 28675
Order [1] 28054
order [24| 2860142223
286122865202902 11
2929 / 2940 / 294625
2959429666791721
2967457192023
300720
ordered [2] 2922 In 12
ordering |11 29226
orders |131 2949 9 || 20
29502329514296613
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}2972 & 12 & 15 & 17 & 18 & 19 & 20 & 23\end{array}\)
ordinary |1| 292222
organization \(16 \mid 28501820\)
286115286221290624
29073
organizations [1] 28418
organized (1) 284610
ought [31 \(2838 / 4 \quad 29102\)
29315
ourselves |1| 280814
Outbound (11 300110
outbound (13) 2956 2]
29575112998730019
300262330035300813
18300991730161
outcome 11| 29307
outhne \(\left[\begin{array}{llllll}29 & 2918 & 13 & 14\end{array}\right.\)
outlined [1] 286118
outhoing (1) 28788
outpatient [2] \(292810 \quad 17\)
Outraged [I] 293313
outraged [3] 293391317
Outside [1] 29706
outside |12| 2819 | 2821 /8
2844102882 // 29347
2995929962300610

30018 I8 \(20 \quad 23 \quad 30091\)
outward ||| 2951 22
overall [3] 284421298923
\(29932 ?\)
overheard ||| 297024
overiay [1] 30173
overwhelming [1] 29997
owned |4| 28323428458 2848 6
owner |l| 28327
- P-
pm 191 \(2815 / 129405\)
2941329468 /8 2947 II
30002530181516
Pacific 14| 29931923
29982129991
pacing |1| 29742
Page (2) 29143292410 page |33| \(280922 \quad 281018\)
2028112023286215
28742328772328788 II
2909138291024
2912102913212914410
292110292423293810
18295332992211
300412300591230116
91314
pages [3] 295672987 l
301115
pand 16128534288846
2944 IS 16 /8
pair III 293619
pairs |ll 290410
Panama \(|5| 2868 / 329776\) 15
pante [1] 29849
paper \(|\varsigma| 291936296020\)
2129612
papers 121 2854202937 I
paragraph |7| 287423
29332122299520
29961012299912
part |49| 2807 /| 28083
28131828227282422
28261928371923
2854152857910286213
1824286422286516
286814287510287722
2328811028841828871
28942328952429072
29232529247293019
2932242934345625
293781029441629576
1729613297021297112
2976212983 1 29972
29981130021622
part-tume \{2| 296434
partucipants [2] 291612
29331
partucipate [2] 28112
292020
participated [1] 293412
participating [2] 28961920
particulars [1] 300215
partier [1] 295216
partues [2] \(297919 \quad 21\)
partly [2] 28552021
partner |1] 29657
parts |II 2887 |

Hesu by krrm ippl Lat or
partway 11 2847 18
party \(11 \mid 29167\)
pass [6] 289325300359
300522300658
passage [1] 29075
passages [2] \(29978 \quad 299818\)
passed |71 28089282125
2894142987911300310
30104
passenger [1] 2821 12
passes (1] 281010
passing [4] \(282725 \quad 298316\)
29961525
patrolman [1] 280821
patterns [1] 29982
PAUL [3] \(2962 \quad 13 \quad 297419\)
300022
Paul [8] 290019290617
29623516297417
29902330007
pay [3] 28651229263
298114
peeled [2] \(282017 \quad 282218\) pen (3) \(281113 \quad 283110 \quad 19\) pension 121298545

peoples |1| 28386
percent \(|5| 28323284523\)
\(2852 / 416 \quad 287220\)
percentage ||| 28326
perceptive |l| 283420
perfectly ||| 294323
perform |3| \(288223 \quad 2899\) //
290723
performance |29| 28575
28659286621318
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}2874 & 12 & 25 & 2875 & 3 & 5 & 7 & 10\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}12 & 14 & 23 & 288219 \quad 23\end{array}\)
\(288320 \quad 288517 \quad 288610\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllllllll}11 & 17 & 18 & 22 & 24 & 2887 & 5 & 16\end{array}\)
20) 2948 /
performances [1] 286016
perforined |1| 2874 13
performing [2] 2892 /]
289823
perfunctory [1] 29297
pernod [35] 2809628107
28321819284312
\(2852421 \quad 2853 \quad 20 \quad 2869 / 4\)
162887202924929265
\(29281017 \quad 2948 \quad 20 \quad 29494\)
\(8 \quad 2964 / 7 \quad 1929698\) I/
2972814297617297721
297821252980729835
2530125
30135
perwodically \(\mid\) ? 28686
29213
perwods \(|4| 287523288820\)
29072429131429264
permanent \(|8| 285024\)
\(2851126 \quad 2023285220\) 28554
permission [2] 2868 19 299924
person [14] 28082 1]
\(2810 \quad 12 \quad 281316 \quad 17 \quad 28186\)
\(12 \quad 20 \quad 2820132128396\)
28942029231
personal ||4| 28222124
\(282435285619 \quad 287519\)

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-26-94 VOLUME 18 Concordance by Look-Soel 711
\(2885202125288 \overline{6} 2\)
\(289117 \quad 24(1523 \quad 25 \quad 296918\) personally [7] 28548
28637288924289067
28941029131
personnel 1121280741920
28148286342901911
2927461229359298925
persons [2] \(28108 \quad 28821\)
perspective \(\mid\) ? \(12901 / 2\)
\(2935 / 5\)
pertained [11 285719
Pete|l| 299115
petroleum |11 28467
petty 111 2809 )
ph [3| 280821289712
28988
phase [8] 29291316
2930129101113
phone [2] 299] 13299413
photo 131280914281614 28188
photos |11 281423
Physcuily |1| \(2821 / 8\)
phvaician |4| 288525
24ヵの \(\leqslant 24 / 5 / 292820\)
prak \(1312945 / 53(K) 324\)
3il12 X
picked |1/ 2822 24
preture |5| 28151719
\(2820 \quad 24 \quad 25 \quad 282219\)
pictures |1| 280522
prece 151291936296020
21 301718
Pierce (11 2910 2
pilot 1341289892021
290222294822294946
2425295012814
2956122957468916
29586296618297123
29721618212229736
142974 IO 2993430167
20) 22 30171
pilotage 11412902101216
20242903329551920
\(2957329591 / 11324\)
296018
Plots [2] \(295518 \quad 295617\)
pink |3| 2956 / 23
Pipeline 151 28061822
28323 2941/1 29585
Piping I2 29821516
plping \(13 \mid\) 29x? 14
 2946 612
 28731328811628875
2891132894829139
2957229583429722
\(29802529815 \quad 30002\)
placed |3| 28141728623
\(2903 / 7\)
places |। 299825
Plainuffs 16| 28491619
2877 II 29323529471
plantuffs [2] 29005299925 plan \(16 \mid 2918\) | 16291914 \(\begin{array}{lll}17 & 18 & 2923 \\ 24\end{array}\)
plane \|ll 2 SHI 24
planning |3| 2844242845 / 2862 22
plant [2] 29892429913
plaque [1] 285917
plaques [4] \(285715 \quad 28587\)
28591416
plate [1] 28569
plausible [l] 290121
play [2] 28916292111
played [1] 292113
Please [2] \(296215 \quad 30187\)
please (19] 28063728406
1228632293925294011
L4 29471429551429626
297525298723299313
\(29968 \quad 299918 \quad 22 \quad 30007\)
plenty [1] 289325
plot [1] 300217
plotted [2] 300324300414
Point [12] 290223294624

300124301418301511
30161019
pointed [1] 285617
pointing [2] \(2895 \quad 15 \quad 2948 \quad 16\)
pounts \(12 \mid 2960223015\) /1
policemen |1| 28723
policies 1101 \(287525 \quad 28761\)
42895529158292125
\(292223292332924 / 8\)
29266
Port [7] 2807 /] 295812
2959 21 2962 /1, 296821
297315299720
port |15| \(286818 \quad 28784\)
28904289320289812
\(290492907232951 / 1\)
29761329829299024
2997142999430169

portion |3| 28079283612
300112
Portland |1| 29223
ports |I| 2960 |
pose |l| 29952
position |161 284314
\(284415 \quad 20 \quad 287520\)
\(2882252885 / 28897\)
289622898929331022
232429582129945
positions [1] \(2842 / 4\)
possess [1] 28769
possessing [2] \(29269 \quad 12\)
possexsion \(13 \mid 280712\)
2876515
post |21 \(29258 \quad 299321\)
post-rehabilitation |1| 29255
posted 111285716
posters 12 | 2856 12 285716
Potato (3) 2958 I/ 13
301418
potential [1] 285625
potentually [1] 28844
power [3] 2859529268
30138
practically [1] 289320
practice [6] \(282513 \quad 282910\) 112850102966629709 pre-mployment [5] 287 ] \(1 /\)
\(\begin{array}{llll}17 & 21 & 25 & 2873\end{array} 4\)
precall \(12130 \times 82530094\)
precede |1| 29584
precept |11 2905 18
precssion [2] 295715 295923
predesignated [2] 299419
30115
predictable [2] 300624
30071
preempted [1] 29389
preferable [1] 29017
premuse [1] 28657
premuses [1] 28077
prepare [2] \(296015 \quad 30153\)
prepared [3] 29035301523
302312
preparing [2] 301318
301510
prescribed [2] 29186
293016
presence [3] 292024
293523293611
present [5] 2810 23, 282516
28291129402296419
presented [2] 282019
28242
presenting [1] 29402
president [19| 2845245
\(\begin{array}{llllll}14 & 18 & 2847 & 25 & 2848 & 2\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{lllll}28578 & 28636 & 286419\end{array}\)
2865262866828762
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}2903 & 25 & 2921 & 17 & 2925 & 18\end{array}\)
293211293512
press [10] 2931 19293258
\(10 \quad 17 \quad 293316 \quad 293716 \quad 24\)
29386
pressure [1] 285116
pretty |71 28262296123
2971 |1 2983 /1 298410
13301417
preventable [2] 285618
290519
previous [3] 283112
289810290118
previously [1] 30113
primarily [9] 28434284522

288616290723
prumary [1] 298924
prume [1] 28633
Prunce [20] \(289820 \quad 290210\)
\(\begin{array}{llll}15 & 23 & 2903 & 293315\end{array}\)
295412295716295927
192429603141299412
29973629982729997 principal [8] 28482428496 \(2850 \quad 15 \quad 286210 \quad 2960122\)
print \(12 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llll}2937 & 19 & 2955 \quad 19\end{array}\right.\)
printed [2] 2856912
printer [2| 281735
Prior (1] 296424
prior [23] \(283210 \quad 28355\)
\(28761928782223 \quad 28801\)
22903252910629578
\(132964417 \quad 296813 \quad 21\)
297710 11 29922429977
103006730072
privacy [2] 287131287419
private [3] \(287521 \quad 2886 \quad 13\) 29191
probable [3] \(282917 \quad 18 \quad 21\)
problem [29] 2819 /1 12
\(282620 \quad 286641428675\)
28693287219288023
\(28821219 \quad 22-28845\)
288816289913290916
182910229306812
29398299025299415 \(2997252999202230 / 4\) /8 problems |131 282810 2837202850428744 2875328822288410 292911299015299116 2997132229996 procedure [8] 28104 2814242833728341 29011029431294622 29919
procedures [5] \(286112 \quad 19\) \(2996 \quad 20 \quad 30101319\) proceed [5] 28859290024 29011290320299113 proceeded [7] 282458 2890129901729912617 Proceedings [1] 301816 proceedings [2] 28692125 process (16) 28091028112 281542817161828182 1521242819223 282014222822514 296616
produced [1] 2962 2]
producing [1] 29609 product [3] 28452328464 28492
products [6] 2845222425
2846578
professronal |1| 295716
professor [1] 289718
programmatically |l| 28346
programs [10] 28502122
2855102858328651112
287291328745
prohibited [2] 2807 l4
28824
prohibition [1] 280717
project [3] \(284410 \quad 12\)
292016
projects [1] 290423
prompted [1] 29383
promulgate [1] 2871 14
propane (1) 2975 /2
proper [5] 2807228557
28898296624
property [5] 28191328203
2822828251728736
proposition [2] 283513
291111
prove 11293117
proved [1] 283821
provide [9] 28081015
28101628184728557
286316295724
Provided [1] 28243
provided [4] 28304284825
28721029972
prudent [1] 29357
Puble (1] 302321
public [1] 29382
publucity (1) 285713
pull (2) 2816252932 /
pulled [1] 29069
pump (2) 2983 /3 14
pumpman \{5| 297525
2976 I 5711
punch 141 \(29508 \quad 12 \quad 1621\) -
punish [1] 28665
Purpose |l| 286221
purpose 14| 2880 6 28903
28965295721
purposetullv [3| 2833 /6 23
28344
purposes (4) 2839528967
295518295723
pursued [1] 285621
push [21 28692129505
putting [3] 288317290815 29545
PX173 |1| 293718
\(-\overline{\mathbf{Q}-}\)
qualifications |11 285323
qualified \(|4| 284246\)
28981429076
quahfy [1] 289820
quantrty [1] 287319
quarrel |l| 2902 /8
quarter |2| 28582430073
quarters |1| 299212
Question (15) 290919
29114291218293821
29392630009121417
\(19300421 \quad 2430051318\)
questoon [49| 282924
2833182836328375
286072880 /1 29012
29092429112192025
2912346131618
291322291452915512
\(152919317 \quad 29219\)
2923 / 292513292710
2931192938111925
29392
152946329532710
29542029601321
29851529868929952
29961830006300413
questioned [3| 28775
2923 / 29876
questrons 1151283019
283132837110293021
\(29331618 \quad 29391029402\)
2954232993829956
3000130051023
quick |1| 2844 /4
quickly [2] 2864 15 2949 I/ quit [5] 29051029184
29301729362129543
quote \([5129071617\)
2919232928 S
\(-\quad-\mathbf{R}-\)
radar [24] 2951 11 /2
2957242958791318
30028102330032425
30045620301020
\(3011243013723 \quad 301412\)
21301741421
radю [13] 295820297157
\(297219 \quad 29731113\)
297413299022300218
2030086
RADTKE [2] 296213297419
Radtke |4| 29623516
2974 /7

Ralse |3| 2940 /| 29555 29626
ralse 1612806428409
2860202947142975 ?
298723
ran 1312936 /8 2978 19 29873
Random |2| 286836 random |17| 286825624 \(\begin{array}{lllllll}28696101718 & 24 & 28704\end{array}\) 72871151920287336 14
randomly |1| 286810
range 1612855928953
29586296521296825
300420
rank |3| 28431823297523
ranks \(12 \mid 28537285416\)
ransacked ||| 2894 ||
rates |1| 29352
ratung |3| 2854 / 297524 29763
RAY |11 29885
Ray (71) 2979929871820
21222988910
Raymond |l| 29888
re 11128056
react 111283514
reacted \(1112901 / 18\)
Read |s| 28632287417
29401829551229885
read 1291281020284722
2862282865 / 28787
289012911 / 2329179
293718293952940310
\(2950920 \quad 295521299610\)
1222300013005 II
30166
Reading ||| 2807 I/
reading [31 291012301618 30188
readings 111301025
reads 111280720
reaffirm |11 28732
reatfirmed 121286719
28735
rear III 2942 ?
reask |11 29124
reason |191 \(28 / 9202822\) // 2839212328652528663 286722286892528692 28996290122290625 2920 II 2936 I2 29582 300553006230181 reasonable [1] 2864 I6 reasonably [1] 282716 reasons [2] \(2898 \quad 15 \quad 296417\) reassugned |2| 29286 292919
reassignment |11 292725 recalled \(14 \mid 300317 \quad 23\) 3004930056
receive |2| 2898 2l 29854 received [21] 2806 I
280919284225284914 232858914286010 28702328726287820 29021629122329135 29622329651719 29922329991730036 301618
receiving 121297212
300118
reception 111301421
Reress |11 2947 |/
recess 11012885356
294615294751030186
91213
recessed 111301816
recite 11128125
reckless |2| 29077292317
recognize |13| 284716
285022855172858418
\(28601 / 28621415\)
2870242872428748
294825296920
recognized [6] 28418
\(28584286315 \quad 2883 / 2\)
2929 //
recognizing |I| 283420
recollection 19128116
2823232957113001122
3005230162430172023
recommenced [11 28704
recommendation |1| 29257 reconvene 11130189
record 11912806628117
2840 II 28586285920
2927529401329471624
294962955729628
2963 // 29754298725
2993 /3 2996 /I 13 3000 7
recorder |1| 2946 |
recording 131300113
301613
records \(|2| 29182429565\)
rectangular |1| 285917
recurring 11128945
redacted \(|2| \begin{array}{lll}2805 & 15 & 18\end{array}\)
REDIRFCT [21 2837 |/
29375
redirect |1| 298716
reduced |2| 286524288414
reduction ||| 2866 /
Reeder III 29239
Reet 171295814296110
30112530051617
20161112
reemerge |l| 28846
reemphasized [1] 28715
reentered III 28248
refer |s| 280720281018
281217286725299012
reference [1] 28104
referenced (1) 2999 12
referred [2] 28889292121
referring [3] 29568297016
300415
refers |1| 28139
refined 12 ) 28452128467
refinery [4| 2846 / 428477
9
reflect [2| 28751329275
reflects |2| 28592029496
refresh [1] 30051
refreshment [1] 289623
regard [30] \(280515 \quad 283223\)
2837228882529043
2907 15 29089291111
291714292236292336
29241829252129267
\(29276172529311 / 5\)

Buc Syuame Appotauce:
2932182933252934 / 9 2935829961830052
301319301513
regarding [4] 289124
289237299620
Regardless [1] 287617
regardless |1| 28648
regards [1] 280716
register [3] 28092428105 282312
regular (4| \(282422 \quad 2938\) 14 297923298916
regularly [3] 28346292522 299819
regulation [6] 28435
\(29951318 \quad 2996151625\)
regulations [7] 28701
29801529953825
29962024
rehab [3] 2872925291816 rehabilitation 1401283717
2865 /1/ 1228674287213
25287768928781024
2879113288021288121
28828288323288515
2886 / 28961112289910
2908232910232913518
291591029181291914
292324
2529247292578
2926212927929295
293047
retterated |I| 28712
related 1712872 2/ \(2896 / 4\)
291224293022293410
29351630107
relating |11 28802
relation ||| 2816 |
relations |3| 28721728773
293110
relationship (2) 28921620
relax [1] 288923
relayed |1| 2972 21
relaying (3) \(29721718 \quad 19\)
release |121 28778293120
29326891017293716
24293836
released \(1312879 / 8 \quad 19\) 29021
relief \(1912810 \quad 16300617\)
3007330101315
relieve |3| \(2900243001 \mid 6\) 30078
reheved |21 \(2891 / 297125\)
relying [I| 293725
remark [1] 294325
remember (37) 280613
28131628234285825
28609288819289225
28936289610290314
29118291313292412
\(292642941 / 152942\) I/
2943 /6 \(294642957 / 4\)
245923 296(1) 4297023
29738 /4 299() 232945 /I 300123
300243004141830084 3013 ! 141730187
remind [1] 2856 11
remote [2] 2814625
remove [1] 288224

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-26-94 VOLUME 18 Concordence by Look-Soer 73
repar (1] 29054
repeat (1) 29669
repeated (1) 296613
replacing [1] 289024
report (31) 28771228805
28881028991929108
29122329165292239
12162927629945
\(2995492996 / 1530011\)
18213003612181921
30092030142530168
301713
reported [14| 281921
286813289413289923
2915222916229201315
292218202933130031
301416301610
reporting |4| 2815929043
29105299625
reports [2] 2938 /4 2990 I
represent |2| \(28 / 2252813\) I
represented |1| \(3(\) K)2 22
represents |1| 285914
reproducing 111299923
reputation \(12 \mid 29173\)
295216
request |5| 2868202926 2]
2947 / 2951 24300312
requested l2| 2924 /4
302310
require [2] 280724292223
required |18| 286121
28622328632429234
2927141516293523
\(2936 \mid 129546121625\)
2960 2 + 610
reyuirement |1| \(2959 / 4\)
requirements |3| 286| 25
29591224
requiring 111296416
rescue ll| 29943
research l2| 2843 15 28445
resugned |5! 28431320
\(2848 \quad 13 \quad 15 \quad 17\)
resstance 11128678
respect |4| 28696295919
2959 ? 29859
responding \(1212851 / 7\)
2958 1
response 171 3851 15
28KO) 17 28KI 2 3296722
23244521
responsibilties \(1612861 / 8\)
2912172934729391
29932429941
responsibilty |171 280621
2807162808328108
28209282422282519
284421285619287568
2885232887729052325 2957172994 ?
responotble \(|x| 29342425\)
2435 / + 6 29892324 2994 +
responsiveness |11 296815
restruted 1112807 |
restroom |4| 2820 /8 28233 2224
result |71 286721328751
14289010290713292712 results !3| 28297286624

29382
resume [1] 2963 11
resumed [1] 291720
retamed [1] 29565
\(\begin{array}{llllll}\text { retire }[3] & 2848 & 15 & 16 & 2990 & 7\end{array}\)
retired [2] 28091284813
retirement [2] 290421
29904
return [15] 28072428188
28511228842528851
288642888828908
2892 I 290961229416
30121330139
returned 1912808628113
7288921420289023
\(289916 \quad 292615\)
Returning [1] 280723
returning [4] 2807429267
2939629415
revealed |1| 289117
reverse 12| 2941 19300720
review |l| 29234
reviewed [6] 28441728986
\(1330152330161 / 4\)
reviewing [1] 284421
revise (1] 29258
revised [1] 28711
revision [1] 286117
Rıck |I| 28413
Rught |13| 2837829427
29532129751214
2981 Il 1929981316
30048300611300813
301011
rughts 11128513
ryorous 121 28754288625
rise ll 28053
risk \(\left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lllllll}23 & 2825 & 16 & 17 & 2883 & 15\end{array}\right.\)
161824288423578
11131429112429122
15293821242939612
risks [9] \(285617 \quad 28593\)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}2883 & 14 & 2912 & 5 & 13 & 14\end{array}\)
2938222939614
ROBBINS |11 2993 /]
Robbuns 14| 2993 10 14
2994 /8 2999 /3
Roberson 171281020
28113 2812 \(1 / 28301\)
28339283918298113
Rockien 111299323
Rocky [3] 2902233015 1] 301619
rocky |11 299717
roger [11] 301613
role [7] 28083282925
2841628452128916
293419293516
roles [2] \(2861 \quad 18 \quad 2889\) /1 room |18| 280821281324
\(2814582816 / 9282213\)
2828212916829766
29792429802529812
2983131529901922
299120299215
rooms ||| 298010
Rose 111299115
rotate (I) 282719
Rouge [4] 28461224
2893410
roughly (1) 286019
round 141 290217295916 2529602
route (11 282015
routes [2] 29602425
routune [5] 29661729919
300756301120
RPR [1] 302321
rudder [8] 29667296714 5192021
rules (1) 298014
ruling [1] 29476
rumor |5| 28931289410
2914202224
rumors [3] 2914212920 11 2979 21
run |4| 28729288413
298219299412
rundown [1] 299416
running [1] 298923
runs |11 28106
RUSSO |4] 29622514 297416

\section*{- S -}

S-I-L-V-F-R [1] 29559
S-T-E-H-L-E [1] 29882
S-T F-W-A-R-T [1] 29756
sack [1] 2986 I
Sacramento [2] 29757
sacrifice (1) 285621
safe [171 280724281913
2849428503710
2851132855611285622
285712861 II 286222
2863529351729978
safely [4| 28558285625
28574286317
safest [1] 28493
Safety [9] \(286021 \quad 290319\)
291025291561629246
295224295336
sail |l| 28649
sated [11| 2841 19285813
2952 IS 2964212429698
29752529847829891
299014
Sailing III 284220
salung |il 296418
sailors \(121283417 \quad 283613\)
salary |1] 28534
San (12) 284014284612
232847521289717
289892905329237
29901624
SANDERS [9] 284921
\(287713293925 \quad 2940719\)
29461029991830006
30184
sands \{1] 296024
sanitary [3] 29809 11 12
satisfaction |1] 2830 I1
satusfied [2] 28081295914
Saturday (1] \(2900 / 2\)
save [2] 2902 I] 13
savings |1] 290224
saying [10] 2850 I1 287315
2875 10, 291424293712
294320296014297111
30022130047
scale [7] 3012891423

From regarding to scale

Haste Systent Applications
\(3013163017172 \%\)
scanners [1] 295810
scenario |l| 28942
scheme 11] 30066
School [1] 28428
school [3] 28641029644
300010
science [5] 2842329638
1415
screen [13] 28071028101
28331528346284020
292112292423292514
29442230102230112
3012730174
screened [2] 2811 21
282022
screening [12] 28089
281122815613281823
2819232428222325
2836911297015
sea 1612886429713
2973929761529796
299221
seagoing [3] 2851 2
286721290715
seaman [9] 28519285417
20252948129649
2975181923
seamanshıp (1] 296012
seamen [2] 2819222854 In
search [13] 280718286623
2868619232528695
289415289923298010
2029943
searched [1] 29808
searches [27| 2809 /]
28192528677131620
23286812352869610
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}17 & 18 & 24 & 287047 & 287119\end{array}\)
\(20 \quad 2873361418297421\)
29802429814
searching [2] 29293
298013
seat [4] 2941 19294223 29467
second (20] 28202328429
2843182852912285311
28545287723293321
\(294615 \quad 296710297019\)
2021242971514
\(297912 \quad 299213 \quad 30119\)
secondary [1] 28635
seconds [3] \(29686 \quad 298713\)
section (3) 286215292534
securing [1] 29713
security (26] 28083281023
252813222814213
2815222818131417
2819110282213282410 2228251428312325 2835628652223288112
294420212945829465
seek [3] 28664287223 29398
segments [2] 28612425 \(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}\text { select [4] } 28688 & 11 & 18\end{array}\) selected [1] 289814 selection [1] 286822 self \(\left[\begin{array}{lllllll}201 & 2865 & 15 & 18 & 20 & 24\end{array}\right.\) 286615286732880720 288191720288361025

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-26-94 VOLUME 18
\(29082572909 / 424-\mid\) show \(119128079280922 \quad\) Slope|l| 29771

29109
Senator II| 299424
sendtor [4| 29952125
2996 /6 21
send [5] 285871224
29563299421
semior [6] 2864 / 289422
\(2925 / 9293416\)
sense [3| \(2850 \quad 1 \quad 3 \quad 292923\)
sentence [3] \(2878 \quad 11 \quad 12\)
301718
separate [2] 281421282020
separation [4| 30066
3017111624
September \(\mid 212889 / 8\)
292722
serter |l| 290410
serrous \(14 \mid 290624290710\) 291689
served |31 28517296810 29707
serves [1] 29923
Service \(121280618 \quad 22\)
Services [1] 280624
services 13128482528913
29136
serving |1] 29692
sessions \(|2| 289510 \quad 12\)
seven (2) 288) \(15 \quad 29264\)
severe [1] 3014 17
shack 12128167 2821 15
shake [1| 298010
Shakes [1] 2831 22
shape 111298410
share [2] \(2895 \quad 17 \quad 28964\)
Shaw |lol 28922428932
2899182914242915119
212529209
Sheehy [9] 28892428904
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}12 & 2893 & 6 & 9 & 10 & 12 & 19\end{array}\) 2894/4
sheer 111 2968 /3
sheet 1612862729612
\(301 / 7922301524\)
Shepard 11130017
shuft \(181280615 \quad 281014\)
\(2826 / 28349102898 / 1\)
25300024
shiftung (1) 289913
shıpboard [4] 285718
2934 15 18297421
shipbuiding [1] 299325
shipper [1] 29566
shipping [13] 28522224
\(285310285521 \quad 286516\)
2866112871824287216
\(290110 \quad 292813 \quad 21 \quad 29291\)
shups [8] \(2807 \quad 19 \quad 2846 \quad 14\)
2856 11 28589289817
2990929981822
Shupyard [1] 29224
shocked [1] 29285
shook [1] 298413
Shoop [9] \(280820 \quad 281434\) \(\begin{array}{llllllllllllllll}11 & 19 & 2825 & 19 & 2826 & 15 & 21\end{array}\) 282821
shore [1] 281416
shoreside [4] 284711
2856128601828722
shorthand 111302310
\(281 \mid 20232813428497\)
8285512285910286213
28702329941730015
30113
shut [2] 3012 34
stdes [1] 29473
sideways [1] \(2821 \quad 10\)
sight [1] 282125
sign 113128191528226
28627287415288517
28861828931429305
\(2951525 \quad 29575814\)
signal [1] 29397
signature 16128101

signatures 1212956 /n
30156
signed 15128627 29569 14 \(162957 / 2\)
significance |l| 29216
significant |2| 28655
\(2870 / 4\)
signing |I| 2957 /
sıgns |18| 28088282423
282972837242838512
\(132839 / 828748\)
28832128911920
29192329563295710
2969 /9 21
Silver |l] 29559
silver |1| 284019
sımulator |3| \(286323 \quad 2425\)
single [1] 3013 1]
singular [1] 28243
Sir |3| \(283025 \quad 291914\)
29854
sit \(16 \mid 2887 / 3 \quad 2941 / 8\)
2946729825298418
300221
site 121300845
sittıng |s| 28144288018
\(29421102986 / 2\)
situation |19| 281016
\(28 / 522828528305\)
\(2839 / 2851 / 15\) 289n 14
289117290115291110
2915192129161112
29236292924293223
29434298416
situations 131289525
29222329876

289311291411294123

20223013230166
30171421
sw-hour [1| 281014
size [3] \(2847 \quad 22 \quad 2848 \quad 18 \quad 19\)
sketch \(1612960 \quad 12 \quad 17\)
\(\begin{array}{lllll}2961 & 18 & 19 & 24\end{array}\)
skils \{1] 286319
Skıp (1) 301023
skurt [1] 3017 12
slated [l] 28642
sleep [1] 2971 12
slightest [1] 283817
slightly [1] 28386
slip [5] \(288813 \quad 29575 \quad 6 \quad 11\) 14
shpped |1| 29985
slowly ||| 297322
slur |1| 29844
slurred |2| 28334295125
slurring [2] 29741114
smaller (1) 284522
smell [4] 2872429732
\(297725 \quad 29802\)
smelled [21 28357283614
snow [5] 301471111417
so-called [2] \(29387 \quad 294813\)
Solely [1] 28827
solely [2] 2882518
Somebody [1] 2930 1]
comebody \(118128 / 912\)
2828628331922283420
28352 2888 / 29203
2926 \(62928 / 32025\)
\(2931 / 5 \quad 29428 \quad 296921\)
\(301515 \quad 17 \quad 20\)
Somehow |l| 291521
somehow |2| 2815329068
somenne [14] 2819 //
\(2820 / 2825 / 228288\)
283223283424283511
\(28388 \quad 9 \quad 18 \quad 2839\) /2
2893 / 2969232973 /I
someplace [1] 287320
somewhat ||| 2892 /7
somewhere [4] 28098
28781829024300420
Somewheres [1] 300621
somewheres [1] 30073
sooner [2] 301456
sorry [10] 2881629153
2955 / 29624296319
300622300711301425
30151830165
sort [11] \(280519 \quad 280719\)
28081328242283523
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}2854 & 12 & 2875 & 18 & 2878 & 24\end{array}\)
\(288023 \quad 2888 \quad 15 \quad 2970 \quad 13\)
corts \(|2| 2893 \quad 14 \quad 2995 \quad 15\)
bought |2| \(2848 \quad 24 \quad 28827\)
mound \(121 \mid 28982029021 /\)
\(16 \quad 2329032293315\)
\(2954 / 3295716295927\)

29973629982729998
sound 121299125300411
soundings |11 296025
South [21 2910629186
south |1| 295815
southbound [2] 30162225
southern [1] 301716
Southwest [2] 295518
295617
space [1] 28161
speak [1] 29018
SPEAKER [1] 30086
speaking [2] 29573297410
special [1] 290423
specialzzed [1] 28723
specufic [ll] \(283510 \quad 28714\)
\(287420 \quad 289521289614\)
\(290812297523 \quad 299011\)
\(14 \quad 20 \quad 299614\)
Specifically [2] 280623
28261
specifically f3] 281019
2891430082

Burc Syuenu Appikulore
specufy (1) 29296
speech 14| \(282418 \quad 28333\)
295125297225
Speed (1] 28634
speed [1] 280510
speeds (1) 30023
spell [11] \(28067284012 \quad 14\)
292920294014294717
29558142962929755
2988 I
spelled [1] 2882 I6
spend [2] 284113285810
spending [1] 293315
spent |4| 282410284615
2933329643
spill (1) 299318
spoke |4| 292023297321
29741329842
spoken [1] 299621
sponsor [1] 289713
SPOSA |1] 29904
spot [3] 282819283724
288313
Spring |11 2982 19
spring \(\mid\) | 129829
squall 131301491721
squalls |l| 3014 /4
square |l| \(2933 / 4\)
stack |2| 290362937 |
staff [2| 284420294414
staging ||| 2999 /9
starways |1| 282710
Staker \{2| 28533289725
stamp |1] 301110
stand 13128063294725
298719
standard \(13 \mid 2838\) /8 28392 294323
standards 1812829 I8 19
284167928714287421
28882
standby [2] 2946 16 29915
stander \(1213(0 x) / 53(x) 16\)
standers 111295817
standing 171281737
2819 I 2948101929519
29862
standpoint [2| 285046
stands [1] 281224
stapled 111301121
starboard \(1112951 / 2\)
start 19128127281715
28691029461229646
29672530002300110
301618
started |13| 2859 9 286116
2863181928657286623
286762881728965
\(2914 / 429238298524\)
301025
starting [31 296724300412
30166
starts \(121285615 \quad 2905 / 8\) State |l| 299424
state 120128066280812
2819122840 H 288817
\(22232900 / 4152911 / 11\)
2940132947162955714
296281529754298725
\(2993 / 3\) 3 (KNO 6
stated \(\mid+1286524288 / 8\)

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
2 M)7 315
thatement [32| 28304
28318 242832521
283525283615290013
2904 / 290922291116
292772932102933256
\(8295520 \quad 299618301318\)
22301512348922
301615163017930182
statements 111290721
stateroom |2| 287320
2894 /I
States [4| 284| 2 ] 284219
299428
Staton |-1 28215301018
statistics |1| 29264
status |2| 287710301125
stay 11128523
stayed [2] \(282013 \quad 289310\)
staying [1] 297021
steadfastly |II 29385
Steady [1] 29503
steady (5) 29492129506
\(2953162967132968 / 8\)
steam |I| 2988 13
steel|l| 2856 y
teep |21 2827 || \(29 \times 1 / 8\)
vteer \(1+129651+296810\)
1720
ittered |11 \(2968 / 3\)
steering 14| 2965 /2 \(2967 / 3\)
16297310
Stehle |11 29882
step \(1101282715 \quad 2835 / 8\)
28402285724286313
\(28951819 \quad 20293924\)
298717
steps |4| \(2827 / 72850 / 4\)
286310289516
vtern 12129701718
trevens 111299424
steward III 2893 3
い1FWARI IIM 295425
2955 \(213295 \times 2329759\)
298522987 /8 2229886 29936
Stewart [4] 2975 / 6 II 298424
stick (11) 289122
stop \(|+| 12859928691720\) 287112
stopped III 294414
stopping |I| 30184
voren |l| 2935 \%
storien ! 2 I \(2845 / 828944\)
vorm \(1+13(1 / 47\) y \(1 / 122\)
storms||| 3014 14
viorv 1112973 y
Uraझht I2 2917 \(1 \times 2 \times 3523\) straghttorward III 2911 20
straln |l| 29016
strange |3| \(2893829 / 425\)
291523
strav |1| 295725
Street |1| \(2962 / 8\)
stress 1312872202129016
strictly 131 28071428506
291911
strike \(141282523295 / 15\)
\(3(x \times 8\) ? () \(3(115\) ?2

structure |3| 282025
28262425
structures [1] 28272
studied |1] 28622
study [2| 2844628651
stuff |3| 28246283320
29198
stumbing 171281915
28241628281029454
2974629812429831
subject |121 28329286418
287619287924288821
2908112913929178
292162922 I 292625
301812
subjects [3] 28953292917
294621
submitted [1] 283820
subordinates [2] 291725
29187
Subsequent [3] 28917
28992290619
subsequent [10] 28777
288516288812289610
1229012429082329159
10292312
subsequently \(16 \mid 2829\) /
2893529132529147
297124299524
subsidary |II 28324
substance | 21 1923 17
300715
successful 14| 2850913
292572967 IS
successfully (1) 2881 21
sufficient 121283814
290625
suggested |1| 2824 |]
suggestion |1| 29029
suggestrons ||| 28565
summer 12129321929582
sumps |1] 299017
superimposed 11130174
Superor \(1212962 / 8 \quad 29644\)
superbor 111285818
supertankers [1] 28598
supervise [4] 2921 1216
293812
supervision |4| 2825 21
2990129932225
supervisor \(|8| 280615\)
\(280816 \quad 287551328877\)
291620292117298925
supervisors |x| 2872 | 2
287437287517288620 2889 (1)
support 111286512
suppose 111294223
supposed \(1+1287410\)
2923 / 29822130067
supposedly (1] 298022
Surely [1] 299820
surmising 111290813
surplus |l| 299010
surprise |2| 291524291722
surprised \(|4| 2898429199\)
292862944 /I
surprising 111289218
Surrendering ||| 2934 IO
surrounding 11129013
survents [11 295725
suspect [3| \(2860-4 \quad 292011\)

\section*{292225}
suspenstons [1] 29263
suspicion [4] 283817
\(2868252869 / 28749\)
swapping [1] 29739
swear [2] 28641429407
sweep [1] 30111
switch [5| 281419301217
\(18 \quad 22 \quad 301315\)
switched [2] 301289
switchung [2] 30131
Sworn [8] 28065284010
29401229471529556
2962729753298724
sworn [1] 28062
symptom [1] 291312
'system [16] 2875511
288624289424295718
21295831630019

300916

\section*{- T -}

Takes (1) 288725
takes (4) 28272328875
295914301017
Talk |l| 28555
talk |181 28233285016
2856828631328882
28952452528966
29444297322298612
\(299023 \quad 24 \quad 299122 \quad 301810\)
talked [32| 28235282447
2833628341928362
28522028791288019
288142428896289321
289918290514290825
2915 / 29201723292323
293218242937716
\(29385294923 \quad 298712\)
29418 || 299622
30025
talking 120| 283523284517
2862182874628752
28817289115289612
\(291418 \quad 291820 \quad 293012\)
29371214293915
294216297024297722
2978429866300117
tall |l| 2942 /2
tank 13| \(28 / 417301619\)
30179
tanker l10| 28072025
28148282423282715
28292 II 1229977
301415
tankers 151 280721282525
284481828482

300113301612
taped [2] 294034
TAPS |II 29976
targeting |11 286815
task 11128075
taxı |2| 29411213
taxicab [2] \(29416 \quad 10\)
TAYI OR 111300022
Taylor \(16 \mid 29991930008\)

H te Systems Appl catrons
3003430112430450 301624
teacher [1] 29642
team [12] \(284417 \quad 285117\)
18286821293431519
212935141929367
29377
technical||| 28434
telephone [31 2990 21
2991817
television |1| 28145
telling \(1712879215 \quad 20 \quad 23\)
28805289225
ten |1912831 | 283220
2843121929497296023
29667 11 12296720
29855298713300420
301618
tend (1) 289523
tended [1] 289218
tender [1] 29027
tenets [2] \(2865 \quad 13 \quad 28767\)
term \(1101288618 \quad 19 \quad 28873\)
42888 II 1928937
29131315291525
lerminal |S| 2813 /2
28152428271382913 28302
termmal [15] 280617
2807232809628114
281421418281522
281842833222835613
28361429422229585
terminate 17129007
29062529071129268 2931/6 29321229907 terminated [31 29058
\(292522 \quad 292614\)
terminating |l| 29384
termination \(|8| 285625\)
28652528663 2890 10
29071429262329272
293720
terminations ||| 29262
terminology |11 30096
terms [4] 281523288715
29681530009
test |15| 2826 /1 \(282961 /\) \(\begin{array}{lllllll}14 & 15 & 21 & 2838 & 14 & 17\end{array}\) 283922871252873916 29372229388297014 tested (2) 282920288210 testified [21] 28329283319 28532290923291016 291382914192917237 1419242918315 29531529545298510 29921130031430049 testufies (1) 29923
testrfying [1] 298610 testumony [26] 28321015 1929021829031718 2907192910142425 2911129131129143 29153291622291816 29192129522429553 29928299913300424 300511030062 testing |161 2829228345 \(28383202871 / 11517\) \(212873111215 \quad 25\)

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-26-94 VOLUME 18 \(\qquad\)
\(29255829701 / 13\)
tests |2| 29372529382
Texas |12| 284015284612
222847152955 In 29633
4 l4 17 242964 I 5
Thank 132| \(280610 \quad 280920\)
28302228379 2840) 12
1629037293621293920
212429401729479
295257245492429554
11295823296125
29621229742429758
2984242985129871517
2988429936
thank (5) 2903410293624
2944629549
Thanks |1| 295415
that'll [1| 301422
thereabouts ||| 29898
thereafter |11 28482
They'd |l| 296620
they d \(|x| \begin{array}{llllllll}2833 & 16 & 23\end{array}\)
283471013285425
2980910
They're 13128272028405 29829
they're llol \(282213 \quad 283618\)
285117289423429203
2950430067
they've [1| 293623
thinking (2) \(282710 \quad 287422\)
third |13| 282324285210
\(1328531 / 28542294822\)
\begin{tabular}{llllll}
2962 & 21 & \(2979 / 4\) & 2988 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
252995229961
thirdlu \(1112 \times 98\) ?/
three |45| 28051422
281715 2818 25 292012
2821222428221014
2823791928246
\(282620 \quad 282921283014\)
\(283217 \quad 28336 \quad 28421416\)
28632128643286810
28942129042029054
2920222925 /8 294116 25

2942 | 294422294521
23294621297516
\(297916 \quad 25 \quad 299520\)
\(2996 \quad 10 \quad 1230082530094\)
Thursday \(13 \mid 290011\)
29402429915
tricket \(|x| 295522 \quad 2325\)
2956918192021
tuckets |1| 295517
the 13| 28362528371
298218
tued [1] 286922
tughter (1] 281923
tumed 111281210
tumes 1171283220285025
286810288614289617
2907262967 15 296821
232429809299611
300253012232425
tuming 312946101129571
tup l3| 28381428692
301716
tred |2| 2842 / 29877
tomorrow (2) \(30 / 89 / 4\)
Tompkins |15| 288941224
- 2890 ト 57131924 2891229202142921323 tools III 290320
topic \(|6| \begin{array}{lllllllllll}2905 & 15 & 2908 & 2 & 12\end{array}\)
29092329317293218
torturous |11 288512
total|31 28472324286521
totallv \(1312872242883 / 5\)
28995
touch \(|4| 2885232524(x) 6\) 29974
touched 1 H 282216
Tough [1] 288423
tough |2| 2883131388513
tougher 111290315
towards [9| 28182229828
2530051617
tower III 2958 IO
town \(|2| 28087294024\)
tracing |l| 291110
trade 11129977
trading |II 2868 12
Traffic 11130012
traffic |13| \(280820 \quad 281016\)
2957242973121329982
30051430066301622
30171111624
tramed [31) \(286415 \quad 2886\) 21
288722
training [20| 283421
28371328397285118
2853232855789
\(28631619 \quad 25 \quad 286414\)
287214628745289423
29595296920
TrancAlasky |I| 29585
transcript |12| 29091
29129 1129132129152
2921929381030056
30162143023912
transcription 111302310
transferred [3| 28975
29042329051
transtt [9] 29561421
295779 |l 2999130034
530162
transiting ||| 30018
transts 11129976
transunt |1| 295819
transport \(14 \mid 280813\)
2845212528465
Transportation |10| 290319
291025291561629246
295223295336299317
300016
transportation (3) 28087
284411284825
transporting [2] 28446
297512
traveling |1] 290215
traverse |l| 299819
tray [2| 282437
trays 1 I2 282020 2 282 2 21
treatable |l| 28658
treated [11 28797
treatment [11] 287916
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}2910 & 17 & 2913 & 17 & 19\end{array}\)
29146 11 14292817
29294293016
trial|31 28056283110
294725
triggered 111294510
\(\operatorname{Trip} 12129561920\)
\(\operatorname{trip} \mid 19128131228531720\)
285412289720290217
\(295517 \quad 23 \quad 29575 \quad 6 \quad 14\)
29774102978413
trips|ll| 2854122959613
\(15 \quad 16 \quad 25296034510\)
true 1612839428529
288412290721293614
30239
truly |2| \(28556 \quad 294010\)
TSS [9] 3005192130065
910
tugboats |1| 284625
tugs \(\{2\} 284625284724\)
tune lll 30136
turbocharger [3| 29901525
\(2991 ?\)
turbochargers [2] 2991 /8
2993 /
turning [2] 2876 19 296419
TV II 2858 II
twelve \(151300420 \quad 301219\)
\(20 \quad 23\)
twice [2] 283/ 152998 8
two thirds 11130165
type \(|8| \begin{array}{llll}2842 & 18 & 2853 & 16\end{array}\)
2856102859128681
289514294211294323
types 11128417
typical |11 2959 |1
-U -

U 4 \(1312841 / 828423\)
28436
U S A 1111284424284616
\(286422 \quad 2913629251718\)
192988232429899
Uh-huh 19129711629776
2983202984330109
\(30118 \quad 123014230172\)
Ultımately \(1112880 \quad 14\)
unauthorized |1| 28076
uncommon |1| 28265
uncover 111287319
undefined |II 28842
undergo \(\{2 \mid 297010 \quad 13\)
underlined [1] 287417
understand [19] 28144
2818 I/ 283318285721
\(\begin{array}{llllll}2866 & 17 & 286713 & 22\end{array}\)
2879 |l 21288125
28851928901722
\(290918 \quad 2929102930914\)
29352529868
understanding [15] 280712
2855128852428862
2888141529289293516

299824
understood (14) 28316
\(286282878212883 / 8\)
288432888242890 I/ 14
289168289511292910
293019
undertakıng [1] 286116
underwent (1) 29595
uneventful |11 29916
UNIDENTIFIED 1130086
unidentufied [1] 28849
union [8] 285311013
28541628678298023
unions (3) 285225286921
unique (1) 290115
unit [5] 2846 II 29341322
Unted (4) 2841 21284219
299428
University [5] 284224
284339289719296313
unlicensed [1] 28678
unlikely [1] 283914
unlumited [1] 298813
unsafe [1] 28256
unsatusfactory [3] 287425
28751214
unsteady [3| 2833329523 29833
unusual |8| 28815295322
2529541112297224
29731929744
uphound (2) 2996 /5 2997 I
updated (3) 30091819
301713
upgrade |1| 293513
upper [2| 2956 /| 29576
upset |3| 288921292723
24
urine [1] 287325
usual [1] 2991 9
utulizing || 2852 /4
-
vacancy |1| 2898 //
vacation |3| 285267
289725
vague \(1112870 / 5\)
Valpardso |1| 2963 /3
Van 111 28413
vartable |11 285021
varuation [2] 29256 2961 /
variety [1] 28328
varюusly (1) 281417
vehicle \(\{3 \mid 2812822\)
2821 16
vehicular 121280819
2809 /1
verifies 11128189
vernacular |1| 2887 /4
vershons 1112856 12
Vessel III 3001?
VHF \(121295820 \quad 30\) OXX 5
via \(|2| 29582030168\)
vice-presidents (1) 2925 19
Vice-versa [1] 296319
VIDEO |4| 2921141299312
300023300810
Video \(312921 / 319\)
300022
video |3| 28154299310 299920
videotape |ك| 281424 \(2815 / 2825 / 329992324\) videotaped 111282616 view [11] 28142281910 2851528993290712 292325293522293620 293839301614
viewed |11 295817
views [1] 28957

Village [1] 294719
vnlated [5] 29252122
29321229352029368 volating |3| 28909289920 29266
volation [9| 28769292224
292320292622293115
18293717299657
volations [2] 29269 /I
visible |1] 301019
visitung [2] 28929299425
visitors [1] 28073
visual [2] 28725300219
voice [1] 297319
vores [1] 294219
voluntarily [4] 28776
28782329132229145 voyage [5] 28971629238 2948829512230026
VTC [11 301120
VTS (5) 2957 I8 2l 295816 \(2996 / 420\)

\section*{- W -}
wadgon 17 기 2821 6288619
\(2916 / 6291923292036\)
Watt [2] 2841 21286725
watt |3| 28702288789
wated III 28246
watting III 28232
walk [7] \(2818 \quad 12 \quad 22 \quad 2820 \quad 16\)
2821 19222822629744
walked 17138171718
28181622282015
28341329827
walkie-talkie 14| 2922710 12297321
walking [7] \(282416 \quad 283523\)
2944232951 I/ 29742
29828298325
wand (1) 281924
wanted |l6| 28449286124
28869289182893224
\(289716 \quad 19 \quad 290014\)

292917299024
warned |2| 28892228907
wash|31299/9 1729935
washing II 2993 I
Watch 1112886 /1
watch \(136 \mid 28 /\) (x) \& \(28 / 420\)
\(2 \times 2423 \quad 244216286322\)
2885142886.102891816
\(2896 / 82908 / 2926 / 3\)
2958172965472425
2966161829676297022
2971 1329823529862
30001530016910
30061730072301319 23
watched |19| 281625
\(281716 \quad 25 \quad 2818 / 1 \quad 2022\) \(282016 \quad 282122288517\)
2886928915289911
30121530171523
watcher |1| 29653
watching \(|8| 2822628756\)
28882528893289318 28943296620298612
waters |1] 296819
waterways [1] 28471
wave [2] 29862324
ways [4] 28368289121
298115298621
We'd [1] 28087
we'd [2] 289552994 15
We'll t10 2816828474
28853529461529475
1030186912
we'll [3] \(285016 \quad 299418\)
30002
We're [4] 284171328597
2921 II
we're [6] 28152128403
288722292125294621
297722
We've [3] 28451628553
294923
we've [4] 28512228889
293725301614
weaving [1] 29748
week [6] 28643111287819
2895229237
weeks [4] 28879288917
2914 /2 292720
weughed [2] 2883 // 2884 2]
weighing (1) 293912
Wenhards (2] 29221112
well-trained [3] 28555
28631213
weren't [8] 2826 9, 28369
2888629069291617
\(293425293512936 / 5\)
West |1] 29757
west ||5| 28462228474 I/
2428585285916286010
12286882897610
2904329229299323
29949
western [2] 30162225
What'd [1] 30123
whatnot [1] 294422
whatsoever \(31 \begin{array}{llllll}2951 & 5 & 15 & 19\end{array}\)
wheel [13] \(294819 \quad 2966\) II
122229676222329681
2971 \(1719 \quad 2972815\)
whenever [1] 28794
whereas [2] 2835242852 IS
white [4] \(295523 \quad 2529561\)
4
Whitter [1| 2960 I
whoever |2| 28852529473
wholly |l| 28324
whomever [1] 2956 11
wide [3] 2855928564
28619
WILLIAM [2] 295512
295824
Willaan [21] 289820
\(290210 \quad 16 \quad 23 \quad 29032\)
293315295413295516
2957162959271924
296031429941229973
629982729998
Willedmson [1] 29239
win [l| 29066
winches [3] \(298218 \quad 2025\)
window [7] 2816928179
2818 II 282016282217
297214
wnadows 16128171820

2818172820161728221 wine [2] \(289625 \quad 29706\)
wing [1] 297219
wings [1] 298210
Wisconsm [2] 296218
29644
wished [2] 28141219
withdraw [3] 29312429547
WITNESS [15] 28068
283022284013290310
2911 2129241229373
294015294718295416
2955929621029756
2988230087
Witness [8] 28065284010
29401229471529556
2962729753298724
witness [8] 2806228403
28702029401,8295434
299919
witnesses [2] 28405
2916 11
won [2] 2860 12, 29063
won't [4] \(285910 \quad 28665\)
290219293123
wondering [2] 28223
296713
word [5] 28481428869
2889129331229985
wording [1] 28562
words [21] 28518285316
285422855212528569
28571101819289411
2910222968729741114
29844300710121315
wore [2] 294212
work [20] 280721281014
2811 1328421328434
29103294020295213
\(296416 \quad 297614 \quad 20 \quad 29797\)
298524298931119
29941430002430011
301310
worked [14] 28143283716
28933291623296519
29769111721297924
2980729852529890
300015
working [5] \(280818 \quad 282521\)
29301229643297615
works [3] 2811 1428322
295722
world [11 293215
worldwide [3] 284178
284422
worry (1] 289119
wouldn't [4] 281913
28352428547296620 wrist [1] 30133
write [4] \(291910 \quad 12 \quad 2956\) I 296119
writugg l2] 293724296018
written [S] 291918295914 296061117
wrong [4] 285115291617 2931930088
wrote [5] 286718287025
290825291813301616

\section*{- Y -}
yards [1] 3014 13-
Yeah [39] 283624284223 294922862428754 28767287819287924 \(288422 \quad 28912529104\) 29112129142429269 29414 294292944 II 19 294515295420297316 2976242978529809 2981323298418298517 2986257182225 29871214300613 300714301115 \begin{tabular}{llll} 
yeah 112\(]\) & 2895 & 19 & 29108 \\
\hline
\end{tabular} \(293522 \quad 294316 \quad 294517\) 29801729815300317 30051730076301215 Year 11129707
year [29| \(28098 \quad 284215\) 284312828442528584 \(\begin{array}{llllllllllllllll}6 & 10 & 13 & 16 & 18 & 2859 & 15\end{array}\) 2860192868102887919 2891142894222428958
29265296432977 II
29781429855298819 29897
years [35] 283417283613
284120284215162223 24284347101319 2844 I2 2846 10 2848 /4 28691528792328802 288115288720289120 28991012290313 \(290430293513 \quad 296018\) 297082975162122 29762029896 Yellow [1] 281217 yellow (3) 2956 I 24 yesterday (3) 283025 299725
York 181 2843928441920 2846122429119294015 Yorktown [101 288921 28902328934289410 \(289762898252899 / 4\) \(292718 \quad 20292919\)
Yost |4| \(299418 \quad 21 \quad 299519\) 2950 11
you'd [III 2835 I7 2837 /3
28481428506285215
2917152961510297614
299524299620
you'll (I) 30138
You've (3) \(291016 \quad 2925 \mathrm{ll}\) 293922
you've [27] \(281321 \quad 282721\) \(25 \quad 28381213 \quad 20 \quad 28611\) 2866428711928731314 287525287712288018 1928841428991829218 2960529671129876 29928
yours [3] 28075293410 2944 /8
yourself [7] 28285283522 \(289418 \quad 292021 \quad 298413\) 299611299817
- Z -

7ero 131281314283821

28392
rone |3] \(30 / 7 / / 1624\)
rone |3] 3017 || 1624



Vol \(19 \quad 3026\)
PROCEEDINGS
2) (Jury in at 800 am )
3) THECLERK All rise
(Call to Order of the Court)
(5) THE COURT Good Friday morning This is the
continuation of trial in case A89 0095 Civil in re the Exxon
Valdez
MS STEWART Your Honor detendants would like to
continue with Gordon Taylor this time by read deposition
(10) THE COURT Are we completed with the video portion?
(1) MS STEWART We are completed with the video portion
(12) of Mr Taylor
(13) MR LYNCH Your Honor in an effort to speed it up
(14) we ve substituted the reading tor the video the video has some
(15) delays in it
(16) THE COURT We thank you
(17) MR O NEILL We re real happy
(18) THE CLERK Rase your right hand please
(19) (The Reader Is Sworn)
(20) THE CLERK For the record state your full name
(21) address and spell your last name please sir
(22) THE WITNESS I m Daniel Gage Taft Houston Texas
(23) TAFT
(24) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GORDON TAYLOR (Read)
(25) BYMS STEWART
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|}
\hline & & Vol 193025 \\
\hline \multirow[t]{4}{*}{1} & \multirow[t]{9}{*}{for defencant} & couclas 3 sequanely \\
\hline & & bogle 6 Gates \\
\hline & &  \\
\hline & & Anctorage ax \$49501 \\
\hline (J) & & Pn 901/276 455 \\
\hline \multirow[t]{4}{*}{4} & & michael chalos \\
\hline & & THOHS M Russo \\
\hline & & Chelos 8 Brow \\
\hline & & 300 E 42nd Street \\
\hline \multirow[t]{5}{*}{(0)} & & Hew lort wy 10017 \\
\hline & & Ph 212/661 5440 \\
\hline & & James f samders \\
\hline & & Janes f heal \\
\hline & & Meal \& Harmell \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{(v)} & & 2000 First Union lower \\
\hline & & 150 dth A enue Morth \\
\hline \multirow[t]{8}{*}{1101} & & Mashrille in 37219 \\
\hline & & Pn 615/244 lils \\
\hline & & Datalce limen \\
\hline & & utat eny o Myet \\
\hline & & duos mope sireet \\
\hline & & Los Angeles Nery \\
\hline & & Pn 13/664 6000 \\
\hline & In Court & \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{3} & Deputy Clers & TOM Marilasmam \\
\hline & & US District Cort \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{( 61} & & 222 \% 7th Avenue 04 \\
\hline & & Ancharage ax 99513 \\
\hline (1) & & Ph: 901/271 4529 \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{81} & Reported by & JOY 5 braute R RPR \\
\hline & & Registered Protessional Reporter \\
\hline \multirow[t]{4}{*}{v)} & & Mathight Sun Court Reporters \\
\hline & & 2550 Denal street \({ }^{\text {a }}\) te 1505 \\
\hline & & Anchorage a w \({ }^{\text {a }}\) ( \({ }^{\text {aj }}\) \\
\hline & & Ph 901/258 1100 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\section*{Vol 193027}
(1) QAll right Mr Taylor now tet me -1 m not tinished with
(2) the March 24 statement but I want to ask you about the April
(3) 17th amendment because it deals with this Busby Island Rocky
(4) Point
(5) A moment ago you said that somebody you didn \(t\) recall who
(6) asked you to prepare the April 17 statement because you had
(7) your - I forget whether you said my islands mixed up or
(8) something like that?
(9) A My points
(10) Q Your points mixed up
(11) When you prepared the April 17th statement did you thunk
(12) that you had made a stip of the pen on this point of Busby
(13) Island versus Rocky Point a slip of the typewriter?
(14) A No I was just wrong it wasen taslip of anything I was
(15) Just wrong
(16) Q Do you recall being interviewed by Captain Douglas
(17) O Donovan?
(18) Aldont even - no noldon \(t\)
(19) Q Do you remember a Coast Guard captain who came up to -
(20) came up to Valdez to carry out an internal investigation for
(21) the commandant?
(22) A No, I do not I can recall about 25 or 30 Coast Guard
(23) people standing around at ungodly times and hours asking
(24) questions but I don t recall anything - any specific
(25) captain There was probably ten of them there
(1) Q Well is it your testimony as you sit here today that on this point of whether you watched the vessel to abeam the
southern tip of Busby Island or watched it to abeam the
southern tip of Rocky Point you don t know which is correct?
A Right now, no I can t recall I'm just going by what I have here
Q On March 24th 89 did you believe that the southern tip of Busby Isiand was correct?
A Well, that s what I put down here I don \(t\) know What can 1 say
(11) Q On Apni 1789 do you believe that it was correct that
(12) you had watched the vessel only to the southern tip of Rocky
(13) Point?
(14) A You know, I don \(t\) know
(15) Q Did you make the April 17 change only because you were (16) asked to?
(17) A I was shown on a chart that that where it was I
(18) can t-trying to think Might have been an NTSB guy because
(19) I remember he had the chart there and the - the positions that
(20) the tank vessel had had, you know, on there that somebody had
(21) plotted is on this - the tank vessel plotting machine you
(22) know that runs all the time when they're underway And I
(23) recall he showed me that and said that this is where they were
(24) at the time, so this can't be correct
(25) So i said, well, you re absolutely right, I had my points

\section*{Vol 193029}
mixed up So 1 made this emendment \(I\) think it was a guy from
(2) the NTSB I can t be sure, but he hed the plote of the tanker
(3) and the tlmes and all that he showed me
(4) Q Where did this convarsation about the plots with the NTSB
(5) man take place?
(6) A In the traffic center
(7) Q In the VTC?
(8) AYes
(9) Q Okay Let me just - I think you omitted a word It may
(10) not be ternbly important but reread the first sentence of
11) that again
(12) A Due to a poop rader return, the vessel sterted blinking on
(13) and off the radar screen
(14) \(Q\) And then the next sentence of what we re reading says \(\mid\)
(15) was then relieved by Bruce Blandford at 2340 is thet right?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q Now does this statement say that the vessel was lost to (1a) radar?
(19) A it doean t say it was loat to radar It was loat, then it
(20) wasn tlost, then it was lost, then it wasn't lost
(21) Q And would you open this to page 36 Mr Taylor the (22) context here is that you re describing to the NTSB questioners
(23) what occurred at the tume at the time that we re talking
(24) about close to the watch relief by Mr Blandiord
(25) Let me start at ine 25 at the bottom The questioner says
(1) right
(2) Then you say starting on line one on page 36 So he said
(3) he might be going out of the traffic separation scheme into the
(4) northbound lanes you know to get through this ice I will
(5) give you a call when I get down through there
(6) Now at this time you know he is starting to come up and
17) down on my radar screen and I m starting to lose him and
\({ }^{\prime 8}\) ) everything So he says he sgoing to 200 at 12 knots and pick
(9) his way through the ice there and he would call me with an
(10) updated ETA to Naked Island and an undated ice record And at
(11) that time I sard Roger out Well that was probably about
(12) 2330 somewheres in that vicinity close quote
(13) And then the tape gets changed and you say quote so at
(14) this time Skip is in there to relieve me and he is putting his
(15) stuff away and is getting ready for him to relieve me and takes
(16) me aboard to see where everything is at moving the little
(17) tanker suckers so it does help me have that stuff in order and
(18) the big work in order
(19) I Il repeat the question You didn it say anything to the
(20) NTSB interviewer at this point about the Exxon Valdez
(21) disappearing from radar did you?
(22) A Doeen t seem to be, no
(23) Q Do you recall speaking by telephone with Matt Kinney within
(24) a fow days after the Exxon Valdez grounding?
(25) A No, I do not

\section*{Vol 193031}
(1) Q At the tume of the Exxon Valdez grounding was Mr Kinney
(2) living in Valdez?
(3) Albeliave 80
(4) Q I mgoing to read you - well let me ask you this Do you
(5) recall that you said you don \(t\) recall speaking to Mr Kinney by
(8) telephone Do you recall ever telifing Mr Kinney that at the
(7) time you left the MSO Valdez the vessel traffic center on the
(8) night of the grounding the Exxon Valdez was still held on
(9) radar?
(10) Aldon't recall no
(i1) Q You don i recall?
(12) ANo
(13) Q Well question that was put to you eartier quote so as
(14) you sit here today is it correct that you don t recall whether
(15) Gordon Tayior told you as to whether or not the image of the
(18) Exxon Valdez which as he last saw it was a clear image or
(17) whether it was unclear or intermittent image close quote
(18) You answered quote he told me he had the tanker on radar
(19) when he was relieved close quote
(20) Now Mr Taylor did you have that conversation with
(21) Mr Kinney?
(22) Aldon trecall
(23) Q Mr Taylor isn it true that the first time you ever told
(24) any authority investigatıng the NTSB accident that the Exxon
(25) Valdez went off radar was at the NTSB hearing in Anchorage on

Vol 193032
(1) May 17th 1989 nearly two monits after the grounding?
(2) Aldontrecall
(3) Q Mr Taylor the last question I asked you let me restate
(4) It Was it your March 28 interview by the NTSB that you
(5) said - didn t you say at that time that you had lost the Exxon
(6) Valdez from radar did you?
(7) Aldontrecall
(8) O All right When you were interviewed by the state
(9) troopers Burke and Grimes on April 10 you didn tell them
(10) the Exxon Valdez was lost from radar did you?
(11) Aldon trecall
(12) Q When you made the amendment to your March \(24 \mathrm{th}^{2 *}\) statement on
(13) April 17 you didn tadd that the vessel was lost from radar
(14) did you?
(15) A I don t belleve I did
(16) \(Q\) Isn tit a fact sir that the first time that you ever
(17) told any authonty investigating the Exxon Valdez grounding
(18) that you tried the 12 mile scale was on May 17th 1989 at the
(19) NTSB hearings in Anchorage?
(20) Aldon trecall
(21) Q About how big was the target of Bligh Reet buoy?
(22) A Well, you want me to estimate the target, estimate the
(23) size?
(24) Q Yeah
(25) A ldon \(t\) know it might be 12 feet across maybe And maybe

\section*{Vol 193033}
(1) 10 teet tall, 12 teet tall
(2) O Okay
(3) A Somewhere in that vicinity
(4) Q And to your knowledge about how big a target would the
5) stern end of a vessel such as the Exxon Valdez be?
(6) A Could be maybe 75 feet wide Loaded? Talking loaded now?
(7) Q Sure
(8) A Maybe 75 feet wide right at the stern and maybe \(\mathbf{7 5}\) feet (9) tall
(10) Q Okay So it s fair to say just as a rough approximation
(11) four five times as big as the image of the - as the target
(12) presented by the Bligh Reef buoy? I m talking the target the
(13) size of the actual target Bligh Reet buoy versus the stern of
(14) a vessel the size ot Exxon Valdez?
(15) A Lots bigger
(18) Q Given the discussion we have had about the relative sizes
(i7) of the Bligh Reef buoy versus the size of the - of a tanker
(18) the size of Exxon Vaidez 75 by 75 ballpark versus ithink
(19) you said 10 or 15-10 or 15 -
(20) A Sure
(21) Q-if you can see the image of the Bligh Reet buoy on (22) radar and you ve got a tanker stern on same distance or even a
(23) littie closer than where the Bligh Reet buoy is would you
(24) expect that you would be able to see the image of the stern of
(25) the tanker?
\(\qquad\) 5-27-94
(1) A I would expect to see it Yes i would
(2) MS STEWART Thank you That concludes our direct
(3) MS WAGNER Your Honor we have about five minutes of
(4) Video
(5) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GORDON TAYLOR (VIdeo)
(6) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(7) Q Did you ever have any discussion as to whether or not it
(8) was appropriate for watch standers to give directions to a
(9) vessel that was standing into danger?
(10) A You guys have all asked me how come we didn't call this
(土) vessel and how come we didn t tell the vessel they're atanding
(12) into danger You know, if I knew they were standing into
(13) danger, I probably would have toid them But you don't - as
(14) soon as you tell a vessel to do something you take command of
(15) that vessel That s not what we re there for
(16) Q I m going to shift gears one last tume I think here
(17) Mr Taylor It s a subject that you touched on earlier today
(18) but to your understanding who has control over the vessels as
(19) they participate in the system?
(20) A The master has controf over his vessel
(21) D Do you have an understanding as to whether the VTC can
(22) issue specific letter commands to a vessel participating in the (23) system?
(24) A Did you say, specifle rudder commands?
(25) Q Yes sir
information which the master or pilot has and will not attempt to con the vessel
Are you familiar with this provision of the operating manual?
A Fairly familıar yes
Q Do you agree with those sentences that I ve just read that
that \(s\) the role of the VTS? Weil let me - let me focus on
the last sentence I read
Do you - what is your understanding of the phrase at that
ime the VTC does not have the advantage of immediate scene
information?
A That sinformation that is on the scene
Q Okay Do you have an understanding of the portion of the statement that says that the VTC will not attempt to con the vessel?
A Yes I understand what con means
Q And what s your understanding of that?
A lis to navigate the vesael
O Do you agree with the statement that the VTC does not have
the advantage of immediate on scene information?
A Yes 1 do
Q And do you believe that that is pertinent information that
should be considered in the operation of the vessel?
A Yes, I do
O And do you agree with the statement that the VTC will not

\section*{vol 193037}
(1) attempt to con the vessel?
(2) A Yes, I do
(3) OMr Taytor what I wanted to ask you about is regards to
(4) the Exxon Valdez transmissions to the VTC regarding their intentions on the night of the grounding and you have
previously this document has previously been identified as a
transcript of the vessel radio communications between the Exxon
(8) Valdez and the VTC What I d like to do is refer your
attention on the first page of the document to where it s marked from vessel time 2325247
A l see that
Q Okay The vessel the transcript at least states the
vessel communication to be okay I was just about to tell you
that uh judging by our radar I will probably divert from
uh the TSS and end up in the uh inbound lane if thare \(\mathbf{s}\) no conflicting traftic over
And then if you drop down to 232553 the vessel says
(18) that \(d\) be fine yeah we may end up in the uh inbound lane
(19) outbound transit We ll notify when we leave the uh and!
(20) cross over the separation zone over
(21) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER (Indiscernible)
(22) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(23) Q Okay it s not on my copy Will notify you when we leave (24) the TSS and cross over the separation zone over
(25) Do you recall receiving that transmission on the night of
the grounding?
A Something to that effect yes
Q Now there s a reference to the inbound lane To your
understanding would the inbound lane still be within the TSS?
AYes
Q Do you recall receiving any transmission from the Exxon
Valdez when they in fact did cross over the separation zone?
A No I do not
Q To your understanding would that have been a requirement
for a vessel operating within the system to in fact contact
the VFC and let them know when they were leaving one lane of
travel and exiting out of the traffic separation scheme?
A What I recall that © one of the requirements
UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER I would ask you under Rule 106
(15) to - either for you to read it or ask the witness to read the
(16) 233054 communication from the Exxon Valdez
(17) BYVIDEO EXAMINER
(18) Q At the present time uh I ming to alter my course to (19) 200 and reduce speed to about 12 knots to uh wend my way (20) through the ice and Naked Isiand ETA might be a litte out of (21) whack but uh once we re clear of the ice out of Columbia Bay
(22) we ll give you another shout ovar
(23) Mr Klinckhardt asked you some questions putung in front
(24) of you the exhibit that was predesignated document 28 that (25) short transcript of the communications between the Exxon Valdez

\footnotetext{
Vol 193039
and - and the VTC Could you put that back back in front of the witness
(3) My question is going to be about the passage that I read at
(4) the end of that line of questioning That 8 the 233054
(5) communication from the vessel the one that begins at the
(6) present tme I moing to alter my course to 200
(7) A Yes
(8) Q You see that? Now given the time of that transmission
(9) 233054 you held the vessal on radar at that point did you
(10) not sir?
(11) Albelleve so
(12) Q Where was the vessel within the TSS at that tume?
(13) A lt was on, I d eny, the eastorn side of the outbound lane
(14) Q So it was - it was through the separation zone at that
(15) point?
(16) A No It was not
(17) Q Didn tyou say east side of the outhound lane?
(18) A Eat side of the outbound lane which would be on the
(19) Inboard side closest to the separation zone
(20) Q Just about to cross the boundary of the separation zone?
(21) A Yes from what I recall, yes
(22) MS WAGNER That conctudes it Your Honor
(23) MR LYNCH Your Honor we II call Coast Guard Watch
(24) Stander Bruce Blandford regrettably by deposition as well
(25) Your Honor defendants would like to offer Exhibit 3512
}

Vol 193040
(1) which is the vessel traffic center manual I understand there (2) is no objectuon
(3) (Exhibit 3512 offered)
(4) MR O NEILL No objection
(5) THE COURT Defendants Exhibit 3512 is admited
(6) (Exhibit 3512 received)
(7) MR LYNCH I mgoing to display a couple of portions
(8) of that manual which will be discussed but not quoted in the
(9) testimony if I may This is just the front page indicating
(10) that the manual provides instructions for operation of the
(11) vessel traffic center Provisions that will be relevant to the
(12) testimony and inquiry of Mr Blandford are section 232 which
(13) specifies that there should be positive identification of all
(14) radar targets when the watch is replaced or relieved
(15) Provision 31217 which was discussed in the Taylor testimony
(16) and will also be somewhat discussed in the Blandford tesumony
(17) relatung to what the watch stander should do in a case where a
(18) vessel is observed on radar to be standing into danger or
(19) heading into a dangerous situation Provision 3-426
(20) which relates to plotting the location of the vessel on paper
(21) as you heard in the prior testumony that 5 done by an
(22) automatuc machine which was shown yesterday by Mr Sanders
(23) And provision 494 c which has to do with advising the
(24) officer of the day in any case where a vessel needs to deviate
(25) out of the traffic lanes because of the presence of ice and

\section*{Vol 193041}
(1) permission to do that is given
(2) MR LYNCH These are all excerpts from exhibit
(3) Defendants 3512
(4) THE CLERK Sir would you stand and raise your right
(5) hand
(6) (The Reader Is Sworn)
(7) THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name
(8) address and spell your last name
(9) THE WITNESS My name is Wolfgang Johan Konkel My
(10) address is \(\mathbf{4 0}\) Gatehouse Road Holland path
(11) THE CLERK Spell your last name
(12) THE WITNESS The last name is spelled KONKEL
(13) MR LYNCH One question before we go to deposition
(14) Mr Konkel you re not related to Jim Kunkel who testitied here
(15) earlier?
(16) THE WITNESS No 1 m not
(17) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF BRUCE BLANDFORD (Read)
(18) BYMR LYNCH
(19) Q Okay All right Just for the record Mr Blandford your
(20) full name is?
(21) A Bruce Leonard Blandford
(22) Q Have you finished?
(23) A Yes
(24) And where do you live now?
(25) A Valdez
(1) Q And where are you currently employed?
(2) A At the Coast Guard, at the tratfic center
(3) Q And what is your position?
(4) A Vessel trafilic controller
(5) Q When did you begin your current employment?
(6) A August, August 13 Ithink
(7) MR LYNCH And Mr Berns the lawyer from the Coast
(8) Guard intervened

What year?
(10) THE WITNESS 1986
(1) BYMR LYNCH
(12) Q On March 231989 what was your assigned shift?
(13) A That would have been the midnight to eight
(14) Q Okay What tume did you arrive at MSO Valdez that night?
(15) MSO stands for marine satety office
(16) A As best I cen recall, it wes about 2335
(17) Q Now when you - when you arrived at the MSO Valdez who
(18) did you see?
(19) A The off-going watch stander whom I was relloving,
(20) Mr Taylor
(21) Q All nght And what did Mr Taylor tell you?
(22) A Okay I have not - I have not reviewed any of my previous (23) testimony Okay? I'm just thinking of what I remember that -
(24) without reviewing anything that I ve said previously As best
(25) I can recall he told me that there was - the Exxon Voldez was

\section*{Vol 193043}
(1) outbound There was ice in the trattic lenes He told me that
(2) the Exxon Valdez had dropped their pllot and that they were
(3) altering course to \(\mathbf{2 0 0}\) to avoid lce They had glven anew \(\square\)
(4) now ETA at Naked Isfand of 0100, but they sald that they would
(5) call when they were free of the ice, whon they had - when they
(6) had successfully weaved their way through the ice they would
(7) call with an updated ETA for Naked Island He also told me
(8) that the ice was reported across both traffic Ilnes or there
(9) was - there was ice I don i recall exactly what he said, as
(10) far as the concentration or the size of the ice, but he told me
(11) that a couple of hours prior to that or a few houre prior to
(12) that that the Arco Juneau had gone out successfully without
-
(13) problem They had maneuvered over into the Inbound lane in the
(14) vieinity over by the buoy and had Bligh Reef buoy, and had not
(15) experienced any problems He'd seiled rlght on through
(16) Q I m sorry what else did he tell you?
(17) A This is out of order He probably told me this first, that
(18) the Exxon Valdez was gone from the scope or had gone from
(19) radar
(20) Q So are you saying that when you first came in when you
(21) first went by the status board -
(22) A Uh huh
(23) Q - or the board as you call it you probably looked at the
(24) status board is that - I m not sure I understand what you re
(25) saying
```

A Probably
Q Okay When was the first time you looked at the PPI radar
screen?
A Probably right after I got there
Q Do you remember looking at the radar screen?
A Yes that I remember
Q Now you said that Mr Taylor fold you that the Exxon
Valdez was gone from the scope I think that was the way you
put it?
A Okay He sard elther gone from the scope or gone from
radar I can t - it was one of the two
Q Now when he sald that to you had you looked at the radar
by that time?
A Yes
Q And what - and what scale was the - was the PPI scope set
on at that time?
A Six mile
Q Did Mr Tayior leave immediately atter that?
A I think he left somewhere in the neighborhood of 2340 to
2345
Q All nght After Mr Taylor left what did you then do?
A Atter I - I probably spent about five minutes
familiarizing myself with what was golng on around me the
different - looking over the different data sheets and after
I - after a short period of time when I felt as though I

```
had - was well aware of everything that was golng - was happening I went out to get a cup of coffee At that time we had no - there was no kind of coftee There was no coffee facilitles or anything like that We had to go downstaira to get a cup of coffee I went down to get a cup of coffee and I stopped at the weather office on the way back to see what
weather was forecast was because we d had some periods
typically crummy weather and I wanted to apprise myself of what
9) was going on in that regard and I probably got back Into the
traffic center maybe five minutes to midnight \(I\) can tsay for sure -
Q How long -
A - on the timing
Q All nght
A I do know that I was there at midnight when the tapes -
when the - when the alarm on the tape machine goes oft
Q Okay

A Tells you the reels - you got to stop the reel, wind it and start the other one
Q All right Now you said you got back to the VTC sometime before midnight?
A Right
Q And what did you do then?
A I started In on my mid watch chores, which at that time
were - or involved changing the tape, filing the day straffic

Vol 193046
(1) and making the mid watch log entry which Inciuded checking the
(2) bearing and range on middle rocks to make sure that the radars
(3) were callbrated This usually took about oh anywhere -
is well it really depends on how involved the tape changing
5 process could be Those three jobs could take up to 20
(6) minutes
(7) Q Now was it your - your practice to accomplish those tasks
(8) at the same time during your watch as a matter of routine?
(9) A Uhhuh
(10) Q And when did you usually do that?
(11) A Right after midnight, started on the tapes
(12) Q Did the tape the new 24 hour tape it 5 a communications
(13) tape I guess night?
(14) A Uh-huh
(15) O You said sometimes it started automatically and sometımes
(16) it didn t?
(17) A Uh-huh
(18) Q Why was that?
(19) A I think it st way the thing is hooked up One of them, (20) regardless of how it set you get an alarm at midnight and
(21) you have to physically go over there and turn it off I don t
(22) remember which reels was going, but which reel wes on
(23) standby - and which reel was on standby, but it's always
been
(24) a good idea to be there to deal with it at midnight
(25) Q In case it doesn it start automatically?
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 193047 \\
\hline (1) & A Right \\
\hline (2) & O On this night the night of the Exxon Valdez grounding did \\
\hline (3) & the tape in fact start automatically? \\
\hline (4) & A I belleve it did \\
\hline (5) & Q Now the other - in addition to the standard entry \\
\hline (6) & including the bearing range rage of middle rock - \\
\hline (7) & A Uh huh \\
\hline (8) & Q - and seeing that tape starts automatically doing \\
\hline (9) & something if it doesn t what else - what else did you attend \\
\hline (10) & to in these minutes after midnight? Was there anything else? \\
\hline (11) & A Filing the traffic \\
\hline (12) & O Filing the - \\
\hline (13) & A The day etraftic \\
\hline (14) & Q All right That s March 23 traffic? \\
\hline (15) & A Uh huh \\
\hline (16) & Q And what does that entalt? You have to gather forms? \\
\hline (17) & A We gather the data sheets that have been completed \\
\hline dus & \\
\hline (18) & the dey and tabulate them as far as the different veesel \\
\hline (19) & categories, and then we have another form that we fill out to \\
\hline (20) & keep tallies on all the different veasel categoriee It gets \\
\hline (21) & logged in there, they get stapled together and then flied in a \\
\hline (22) & file \\
\hline (23) & Q How long does that take? \\
\hline (24) & A It all depends on how many - how many day sheets there \\
\hline & are you know it might take three four minutes \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
(1) A Right
(2) O On this night the night of the Exxon Valdez grounding did
(3) the tape in fact start automatically?
(5) Q Now the other - in addition to the standard entry
(6) including the bearing range rage of middle rock -
(7) A Uh huh

Q - and seeing that tape starts automatically doing
something if it doesn t what else - what else did you attend
(10) to in these minutes after midnight? Was there anything else?

Filing the traffic
(12) O Filing the -
(13) A The day \& traffic
(14) Q All right That s March 23 traffic?
(15) A Uh huh
16) Q And what does that entall? You have to gather forms?
ir) A We gather the data sheote that have been completed
(18) the dey and tabulate them as far as the different veasel
(10) categories, and then we have another form that we fill out to
(20) keep tallies on all the different veasel categories it gets
(21) logged in there, they get stapled together and then flled in a
(22) file
(24) A It all depends on how many - how many day sheets there
are you know It might take three four minutes

Vol 193048
(1) (2) to do
(7) that right away, too if you ve got - particularly if you ve got somebody current in the system
Q All nght Have we gone through each of the tasks that you
(10) pertormed after you returned to the VTC?
\({ }^{6}\)
A I belleve so
(12) Q Okay How long did all that take?

A It probably took me 15 minutes
Q All nght So approximately when then would you have fonished those tasks?
A Probably at 0015, anywhere from - I mgoing to say a minimum of 10 minutes a maximum of 20
Q Okay What did you do from that point whether it was 0015 or plus or minus a few minutes from your estimate what did you do then when you came back - I m sorry when you finished with
(21) those tasks?

A I don \(t\) - I don \(t\) recall exactly what I may have looked at (23) or occupied myself with All I can remember is that about 20 (24) minutes after is that I was beginning to wonder why I hadn't (25) me

Q Now what was your reason for doing that at the beginning of the shutt as opposed to some later ume?
A Well, again, they go on this completed board and if you start - if you keep going, adding - we d be adding more vessels to it for the current day, like March 24th, that would, you know, they may get mixed up in there and so you have
(日)
(13)
(14)
(15)
(17)
(18)
(19) (20)

Voㅓ 193052
A Okay I saw a - a foreign blip, if you will, which was over in the area of - north of Bligh - north of the reet which le not normally there
Q Mr Blandford what else did you do with the radar if anything after you acquired the target by shifting up to the 12 mile scale as you told us?
A Well, I used it to determine just by sighting relative the relative position that the ship was to the buoy Now whether it was to the actual target of the buoy or the circle It's unclear, but i do remember that I eatimated that it was probably a mile, a mile or so north of the area of the buoy
(12) And then I asked Captain Hazelwood if he was in that poaitlon
(13) about a mile or so north of the buoy, and he said, yes So
(14) that's how I poattively Identified the Exxon Valdez
(15) Q Did you at any time from the time you came top the VC -
(10) VTC that night until after you had gotten a report from the
(17) Valdez and acquired it on radar
(18) A Uh-huh
(19) Q Did you at any tume contact the officer of the day?
(20) ANo
(21) Q Who was the officer of the day?
(22) A I belleve it was petty officer Gonzales
(23) Q Were you required as a civilian watch stander to notify
(24) the officer of the day if a vessel was deviating from its
(25) assigned course?
(1) C
(2) you said it before you were told that the vessel was gone from
(3) the scope and gone from the radar isn that nght?
(4) A Rlght, one of the two
(5) Q The radar was on the six mile scale was it not?
(6) A Uh huh
(7) Q Have you ever tried to raise the vessel on the 12 mile
(8) scale?
(9) ANo
(10) Q Let me ask you about the circumstances With the
(ii) information that Mr Taylor had made avalable to you on that
(12) evening did you feel that operations were normal at the time
(13) that you relieved him with respect to the Exxon Valdez?
(14) A Okay Prior to that time, it was not unusual for people to
(15) deviate, If you will, from their traftic lene to avoid lee it
(18) was not at all unusual it wasn tunusual for them to go into
(17) the Inbound lane In this particular clrcumatance the master
(18) had outined exactly what he intended to do, which wase even -
(19) probably in most cases you wouldn't even have that thorough of
(20) Information In most cases, probably the master would have
(21) said, I m going to be goting into - into the - into the
(22) inbound lane to skirt this lee That s probably all he would
(23) have said He wouldn't have given a specifle course or a
(24) specific - specifle speed
(25) Now with that - with that Information in hand, I saw no -

\section*{A I belleve we were}

Q is that requirement in the VTC manual?
A I believe it is
Q Did you at any tume from the tume you came to the VTC that night until you received the report from the Exxon Valdez
attempt to identify the target on the 12 mile scale of radar?
A Okay You want to say that one more time?
Q Ill ask it again Did you at any time from the time you
arnved at the VTC center that night untal the time you
received a report from the Exxon Valdez try to identify the
target of the Exxon Valdez on radar by using the 12 mile scale? ANo
13) Q Were you required to attempt to identity the Exxon Valdez
(14) on the 12 mile scale during that tume penod?
(15) A I was - as part of relief procedure, I was requlred to
(10) identify all of the - along with the off-golng watch, all
(17) targets held on radar Sorry, that'e a requirement in the VTC
(18) manual Sorry, that'e a requirement In the VTC manual
(19) O And then it continues adds an answar
(20) A I belleve so
(21) Q All nght Now did you - are you saying that you don t (22) believe that that requirement is in the VTC manual that
(23) requirement in the VTC manual applied to you?
(24) A No, I'm saying - what I m saying is that at the time of
(25) rellef, the target was not held on radar

Vol 193055
() nothing out of the ordinary, under those particular
(2) circumatances with lice in the lanes in the tratic lanes in
(3) othar words, there was no - thare was nothing to sand up a red
(4) fiag, okay Although it wasn't - obviously it wasn ta
(5) routine transit, if it were routine, the guy would have stayed
6) in his lane and, you know, gone the whole course through
the
7) rest of the syatem You know this is - it was not are you -
8) it was not routine in that regard but it atill did not raise
) cause for alarm Okay
(10) Q So it was not routine but it was not unusual?
(i1) A That's correct.
(12) Q Mr Blandford if on the night of the grounding dunng your
(13) shift bafore you got the report from the Exxon Valdez if you
(14) had turned the radar scale up to the 12 miles and had seen the
(15) target of the Exxon Valdez and had gotten a contact that
(16) indicated to you that the vessel might be standing - steering
(17) it says into danger what would you likely have done?
(18) A I probably would have called on the radlo it he would have
(19) been doing something other than what he had related to un,
he
(20)
me,
(21) okay, If the ship had - were doing something other than -
(2) than what he had told us he intended to do, I probably would
3) have told him where he held - where we held him on radar
a) we held him on radar and asked him what his Intentions ware
(25) \(Q\) And is that approach consistent with the policies of the

VTC and the practices that were in eftect during your time as a watch stander?
A Yes, it ls We can't - we can t con other people 8
vessels
Q Right
A Nor can we give them course of speeds or anything
MR LYNCH There safragment question which I won t
read
That concludes our reading of the testimony of Bruce
Blandford Your Honor
MR O NEJLL Your Honor by way of correction when e
Mr Lynch read section 31217 and described it he described
it as talking about standing in danger and the word standing
in danger doesn \(t\) appear in that section of the manual
MR LYNCH You want to show it again?
MR O NEILL No We have a short video
cross-examination
CROSS EXAMINATION OF BRUCE BLANDFORD (VIdeo) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
O You ve said today and you ve said before I think that the ratuo of the returns of the Valdez when broadside viewed broadside in your view would be about ten to one is that rightr
A Probably
Q And what would be the relative size of the return of stern
4

5-27-94 VOLUME 19
xamax ( 9
Vol 193058
(1) really ice and we ve - it s happened to the extent we re -
(2) myself and some of the operators have asked a tanker, you
see
3) Ice and they aay, no, there a no ice out here, well, we think
4) we see some ice on the radar, well, it s not there

Q Mr Blandford the dogleg is south of Bligh Reef buoy is it not?
A Uh-huh
Q It 5 past the Bligh Reef buoy?
A Uh huh
Q The Exxon Vaidez on the night of the grounding -
A You originally asked me if it was a reasonable assumption
(2) that I d be sble to pick up a tanker on the same - at the same time that I was picking up the buoy
Q That s right
A Okay Now what l'm - the point I m trying to make is
) maybe not, okay, at the eame range es the buoy, maybe not And
(17) for conditions unknown
(18) Q Are you saying that dunng these observations that you made
(19) since the time of the grounding that you re seeing the target
(20) of an inbound tanker become lost in the area of the dogleg?
(21) A in the vicinity of the buoy, from the dogleg up to the
2) buoy
(23) Q Up to the buoy?
(24) AUh huh
(25) Q Let me read to you from a transcript of the - this is a
```

                    Vol 19 3057
    on - viewed stern on Exxon Valdez and the Bligh Reef buoy?
A Maybe three to one
Q Three to one?
A That s just a guess
Q Now If the weather were clear enough to see the end return
on }12\mathrm{ mile scale and the Bligh Reef buoy is it then -
A A reasonable aseumption
O - a reasonable assumption that you would get a return from
a stern on vessel in the same area?
A That sa-that sa reasonable assumption that one could
draw However, there are - this has never been brought out
before but since the accident in the intervening years I ve
watched closely inbound tankers particularly coming in at
ballast, which are presenting tar more surface aroa to be -
presented as a target, and in the vicinity of the buoy, whlch
is just maybe flve degrees in from the traffic fane
particularty when they re making that corner that dogleg In
the trafflc lane, they II |ust disappear
Q At the dogieg?
A RIght And It - it doesn tsaem to be consistent with any
type of weather conditions We do have some interterence
the arm if you turn the - the gain up on the - if you
overdrive the gain on the }\mathbf{12}\mathrm{ mile scale for Instance theres
Interterence which is always in the same place going down
outbound lane and it looks like lce but it s not it's not

```

Vol 193060
(1) generally down to Bligh Reaf buoy That is also providing the
(2) equipment is working up to par
(3) Question okay You explained the reason you usually watch
(4) a vessel based on your own initiative so to speak?
(5) Answer nght This is not a requirement of the watch
(6) standing procedures this is strictly my personal method of (7) operating a watch
(8) Question what is the policy - under established policy
(9) what must you watch?
(10) Answer that we physically plot them and observe them for (11) the transit out of the Narrows
(12) Question let me ask this The reason you did not do this
(13) why it is not normal watch standing procedure is that it is
(14) clear weather is that correct that there is no real reason
(15) for you to be attending traffic routinely in that area?
(16) Answer I hate -
(17) Question we are irying to see why there is a policy
(18) Answer I hate to really hypothesize on the whys Can I
(19) Explain?
(20) Question sure
(21) Answer the whole purpose of the VTS is to ensure one way
(22) traffic through the Narrows This is the area that is the
(23) responsibility of the vessel traffic service it is not a
(24) vessel traftic control This is a navigation service provided
(25) to mariners It is not the responsibility of the VTS to

\section*{Vot 19-3081}
(1) Control the operation of the vessel only to provide service to
(2) the vessel to ensure there is only a one way operation that
(3) they use the correct speed and to advise them of traffic coming
(4) in either direction
(5) So once they are outside of this vessel iraffic service
(6) area the rest of it is purely check in points so that they can advise other ships that will be going through the VTS of the location of other vesseis in the system
Question so the whole focus of this thing is the Narrows
(10) Answer correct And the only reason they check in and you
(II) have the traffic separation scheme through the rest of Prince
(12) William Sound is to provide - is to maintain spacing adequate
(13) enough so that you can allow the one way traffic
(14) Question so once they are through the Narrows it 8 fust
(15) primarily keeping a rough track of where the vessel is in the (i8) system?
(17) Answer nght Any assistance I can give further down the (18) line whether it be inside or outside the port I figure is (19) more or less of a bonus
(20) Now having heard me read and having looked on at the (21) transcript as I did so do you stand by everything you said in (22) that interview?
(23) A As far as the way we were - what I sald at the time, I m (24) sure that s what I meant at the time
(25) Q I also wanted to try and get a better understanding of the
(1) relationship between the vessel - vessel traffic center and (2) vessels transiting in the area Could you just tell me bnefly
(3) your understanding of what the relationship is? And by that I
(4) mean does the vessel traffic center have any control over the
(5) operation of vessels within the - within the system or is it
(6) an advisory system?
(7) A It's strictly an advisory syatem to the extent of apprising
(8) the vessels of potential hazards and other traffic and we are
(9) not similar at all to air traffic control where there are
(10) speciAc flight levels given couraes to steer et cetera In
(11) no way do we attempt to give out directions of that nature
(12) \(Q\) In your years working at the vessel traffic center have
(13) you ever directed a vessel to follow a particular course?
(14) A No
(15) Q Are you aware of any of the watch standers at the vessel
(16) tratfic center ever directing a vessel to follow a partucuiar
(17) course?
(18) A No, I m not aware of and had they been found out, they
(19) would have been chastised
(20) Q Who s in the best position to navigate a vessel operating
(21) within the system?
(22) A The person at the con of the ship
(23) \(O\) That would be elther the master or the pilot?
(24) A Or whoever is plloting the vessel at the time
(25) Q Why do you say that that individual would be in the best

\section*{Vol 193083}
posituon to navigate the vessel?
(1) what
(3) he sees nor what his radar sees
(4) Q Did you receive any calis from the Exxon Valdez on the
(5) night of the grounding indicating to you that the Exxon Valdez
(6) was going to deviate outside the northbound lane of travel?
(7) A No
(8)
night of the grounding indicating that the Exxon Valdez was
(10) going to leave the TSS completely?
(11) ANo
(12) Q Did you get any calls from the master of the Exxon Valdez
(13) indicating that he was leaving the bridge and that he wanted
(14) you to watch over his tanker while he was away?
(15) ANo
(16) UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER Objection
(i7) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(18) Q Do you believe that masters transitung in the - in the
(19) system know or rather knew that the VTC would not direct a
(20) particular course for them to follow?
(21)
(22) Q Now what do you base that beliet on?
(23) A All ot the companies, to my knowledge, had coples of our
-
(24) our VTC manual, the one we have been referring 80 , and all 01
(25) the vessels for certain had copiea of the user manual and I

\footnotetext{
Vol 193065
THE CLERK What was the last name?
MR LYNCH Cavett CAVETT
THE CLERK Rase your right hand please sir (The Reader is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name address and spell your last name
THE WITNESS it s Kevin Michael Harr its 1101
Cordova Anchorage Alaska ItsHARR
THE CLERK Thank you sir
MR LYNCH Your Honor defendants will offer DX3495 which is a letter signed by Commander I now understand
Cavett dated August 291984 And Exhibit 3496 which is an
undated letter signed by Commander Cavett
(Exhibits 3495 and 3496 offered)

MR O NEILL No objection
THE COURT Defondants Exhibits 3495 and 3496 are admitted
(Exhibits 3495 and 3496 received)
MR LYNCH Ithink Your Honor we are going do break Mr Neal s shortest time on the stand record but this may
not - this may get an asterisk in the book
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL CAVETT (Read) BYMR LYNCH
(24) O Would you state your name for the record
(25) A Mlchael Gary Cavett, C A V E T Y
}

\section*{Vod 193067}
underatanding that any kind of information that was developed
(2) would be avallable to us in order to enhance and facilitate
(3) sate transit of the area by tank vessels Easentially, vessels
(4) that came to Alyeaka That \(s\) pretty much all I recall about
(5) it
(8) Q All right So tar as you recall were you provided the Information that this group was able to gather?
(8) A l'm sure we were given all the information they had

MR LYNCH Your Honor the next question and answer
(10) relate to Exhibit 3496 which is a letter to Alyeska Pipeline
(11) Service Company
(12) I can \(\mathbf{t}\) get it all on the screen and have it legible and
(13) there is one question and answer
(14) BYMR LYNCH
(15) O Did that meeting actually take place?
(16) A I belleve it did
(17) MR LYNCH The next series of questions relate to the
(18) Exhibit DX3495 which followed that same meeting
(19) BYMR LYNCH
(20) Q Captain you attended this meating correct?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q Who prepared this summary?
(23) A Looks like Ray Engel did
(24) Q Did you review it before it was sent out?
(25) A I m sure I would have, yes

\section*{Vol 193068}
(1) Q Having reviewed it and in light of your best recollection ) today as - as it may be aided by anything else we ve looked at today does it appear to you to be an accurate summary of what occurred at that meeting?
A I don't recall everything that happened at the meeting, but

I have no reason to doube that this is an - that this is an accurate refiection of that
Q On page 2 in the third paragraph down there 5 some
discussion about unpredictability and forecasting the future of
the glacier Then there \(s\) a sentence that begins no
evidence Do you see that?
AYes
Q Would you read that sentence that begins with no evidence?
A No evidence is available for anyone to say that a situation
Is going to be created by the ice where there is a danger to
the shipping traffic that can t be safely handled under the present traflic syatem structure
Q Now is that a tenet that was voiced either by yourself or somebody else on behalf of the Coast Guard at that meeting?
A That was my ongoing sentiment Whether that was a collection of sentiments at the meeting, I can't say Q Butit s set forth in this and you believed that at the tıme?
AYes
(25) Q Would you read into the record on the second to last

\section*{Vol 193069}
(1) paragraph and last paragraph of the summary just the last
(2) paragraph that begins in summary?
(3) A In summary -
(4) MR LYNCH ill put that on the screen betore you
(5) start Mr Harr I hope I II put it on the screen before you
(6) start

All nght sir would you read it?
A In eummary it was generally agreed that operations will continue as at present ice reports will be requested from a
10) hundred percent of the vessels transiting the area Vessels
(11) will be allowed to divert out of the lanes to transit around
(12) Ice plumes If the situation develops, the lanes will be
(13) considered close to a specific vesed if the master of that
(14) veesel feels the transit of the lce field is unsafe The Coast
(15) Guard will continue to provide the beat information
avallable
(16) and then let the master make his own decisions
(17) \(Q\) is that an accurate summary of what was voiced at the
(18) meeting?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q Also during your tenure did you ever develop an opinion
(21) as to whether masters should maneuver tankers around ice or
(22) slow down and go through them?
(23) A I developed the opinion that the matater ahould take
(24) whatever course of action they deemed prudent to safely
(25) navigate their vessel through the ice
(1) Q But you didn t have an opinion one way or the other what
(2) you thought was the best course of action?
(3) A What I thought was the best course of action was to let the
(4) person on the scene make up his own mind
(5) MR LYNCH I believe we made the record Your Honor
(6) MS WAGNER Excuse me we have a brief cross
(7) Do you have a copy of the script?
(8) THE WITNESS No I don t
(9) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL CAVETT (Read)
(10) BYMG WAGNER
(11) Q Captain I d like to ask you to look at Exhibit 36105
(12) which was number 16 Do you have the exhibit in front of you
(13) Captain?
(14) A Yee, I do
(15) Q Paragraph Number 3 the last sentence says quote two oll
(16) Companies Exxon and Mobile limited their tank vessels to
(17) daylight transit of Valdez Arm and one company SOHIO
placed a
(18) six knot speed limit on their tank vessel transits Do you see
(19) where I m reading?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q Do you have any recollection of Exxon limiting their tank
(22) vessels to daylight transit when ice existed in the traftic
(23) separation scheme?
(24) A I recall that daylight tranaits were common and aix knots (25) was a common speed that some vesseis slow to when there's lce

Vol 193071
(1) conditions
(2) \(Q\) is it is easier to see the ice during the daytime?
(3) A The ice was pretty much undetectable by radar so the
(4) daylight was the best time you had to sae it You had to see
(5) It visually
(6) Q ll you would turn to Exhibit 36114 which you
(7) predesignated document 42 If you turn to what I believe is
(8) the fourth page of that exhibit you testified about this
(9) exhibit earlier and I believe this is a summary of a
(10) confarence that was held in August of 1984 regarding the
(11) disintegration of Columbia Glacier is that correct?
(12) A That correct
(13) Q Now on the first page of this document there 8 a list of
(ia) attendees to that conference is that right?
(15) A Yea
(16) Q About haltway down the list the name Captain Seth
(17) Hargrave Exxon Shipping Company appears Do you see where
(18) I m referring?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q Do you recall Captain Hargrave being present at that (21) Conforence?
(22) ANo
(23) Q If you ium to the third page of the summary itsalf about
(24) two thirds of the way down there \(s\) a paragraph that reads
(25) quote Seth Hargrave Exxon Shipping believes the safety

Vol 193072
(1) record and satety precautions of the masters can be relied on
(2) He does not foresee the ice causing any problems for shipping
(3) and would like to see things continue to operate as they are
(4) close quote
(5) Do you see where I m reading?
(6) A Yes, I do
(7) Q Do you recail Seth Hargrave makıng that comment at the
(8) Conference?
(9) A No, I don t
(10) Q Do you recall anyone from Exxon making that comment or a
(i1) similar comment at the conterence?
(12) A No, I don't
(13) O Do you have any reason to believe that Captain Hargrave did (14) not make thus comment at the conference?
(15) A believe that this is a truthful and accurate account of (16) what happened by a very responsible officer that says if he
(17) did - says if he said that, I belreve he did
(18) Q You agree with the statement that at least as exhibited to
(19) Captain Hargrave in this summary that the satety record and
(20) safaty precautions of the masters can be relied on?
(21) AYes
(22) \(Q\) What were the safety precautions of the masters that were
(23) occurring at the time of this conference?
(24) A From my conversations with the masters and other people in
(25) the shipping world the safety precautions they re talking

\section*{Vol 193073}
(1) about were their decisions to reduce speed or to make dayllght
(2) transite or otherwise ensure that they could see what was going
(3) on through this area before they made a transit
(4) Q And in your experience those precautions were effective in
(5) providing for sate navigation when ice was present in the
(6) traffic separation?
(7) AYes
(8) Q To your knowledge was Exxon involved in the industry study
(9) On the retreat of Columbia Glacier?
(10) A It was my impression that each member of the consortlum
was
(II) Involved
(12) MS WAGNER Thank you
(13) MR SANDERS Your Honor the defendants call Maureen
(14) Jones Higgins
(15) THE CLERK is this another deposition?
(16) MR SANDERS Yes Im sorry by deposition
(17) THE COURT I thought I had a live one
(18) THE CLERK I need you to stand and raise your right
(19) hand please Witness
(20) (The Reader is Sworn)
(21) THE CLERK State your full name address and spell
(22) your last name please
(23) THE WITNESS Patricia Balie 2861 West International
(24) Airport Road Anchorage B A I LIE
(25) THE CLERK Thank you
(1) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MAUREEN HIGGINS (Read)
(2) BY MR SANDERS
(3) Q Could we have your full name for the record?
(4) A Maureen Louise Higgins
(5) Q You also have a United States Coast Guard license Number
(6) 664145 issued to Maureen L Higgins which finds you
competent
(7) to serve as a master on ocean vessels of not more than 1600
(8) gross tons and secondly on ocean vessels of any gross
(9) tonnage I assume those are on any waters?
(10) A Yes
(11) Q And also as a radar observer?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q When did you tirst get your \(Z\) card?
(14) A In April 1987
(15) Q And when did you first become licensed as a merchant
marine
(16) ofticer?
(17) A In April iga7
(18) Q Was that when you graduated from Maine Marine Academy?
(19) A Maritme Aeademy
(20) Q You obtained a bachelor s degree at the academy didn it
(21) you?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q And what kind of courses do you take besides maritime
(24) courses?
(25) A You have to get economics English literature, physics
and

\section*{Voㅓ 193075}
(1) calculus
(2) Q Kind of a science oriented course?
(3) A Natical science is the degree - is what the degree is in
(4) but you have to take the regular stuff for a bachelor s
degree,
(5) history
(6) Q And then do you - If you graduate do you then have to sit
(7) for an exam to get a merchant mariner s license?
(8) A Yes
(9) Q You actually shipped on your license the first time in
(10) October of 1988 did you on the Exxon Charleston?
(i1) A Yes
(12) Q And you shipped with Exxon on the Exxon Boston the
(13) Charieston the Baton Rouge the Baytown and the Valdez is
(14) that correct?
(15) A Yeah, and the Jamestown
(16) Q Jonestown?
(17) A Jameatown
(18) Q The last discharge I see here from Exxon Shipping Company
(19) is the Baytown in February of 1990 Did you then leave the
(20) employ of Exxon Shipping Company at that tume?
(21) A Yeah I belleve it sin March There a few of them there
(22) from the Baytown but when I quit I think it was about the
(23) middle of March
(24) Q You re right 7th of March or sometime around there?
(25) A Sometime around there

\section*{Vol 193076}

\section*{Q And why did you leave Exxon?}

A Because I wanted a third mate sjob
Q And they didn thave one for you?
(4) A Well, they were stepping me up, up scaling me third mate
(5) then putting me down A B It was nothing permanent and I
(6) wasn t promoted to a permanent third mate's position
(7) Q You had shipped at third mate on the Baton Rouge and the
(9) Baytown?

A And the Charleston
Q And then you would go up and then back down to A B? A Yes
Q So you re kind of a replacement mate when the permanent mate was off the vessel?
A Yes, basically when they needed somebody
Q You then went to work with the American Trading Transport
Company What kind of vessels?
A Tankers
Q And those discharges are all west coast discharges also right?
A One is on the east coast, I believe Well, we started on the east coast We went over to the weat coant, though Q You went to work with them as a third mate and then the last discharge I see here is July of 1991 Is that the last vessel you were on the Delaware Trader? A Yes

\section*{Vot 193077}

\footnotetext{
(1) Q And that was a second mate?
(2) \(A\) Yes
(3) Q Have you ever - have you been on any other vessels other
(4) than tankers?
(5) A Yes, sir I was on a contalner vessel
(6) Q What?
(7) A Container ship
(8) \(Q\) And was the largest tanker that you were on the Exxon
(9) Valdez?
(10) A Yes, sir
(11) O How many voyages into Valdez had you made prior to the
(12) grounding in March of 1989?
(13) A I belleve it was about flve
(14) Q And how many of those were on the Valdez?
(15) A All of them
(16) Q Was Hazelwood the master on the vessel at all umes or was
(17) Stalzer the master on some of the trips?
\({ }^{(19)}\) A One trip the other captain was on there for a while
(19) Q Had you ever shipped with Hazelwood except on the Exxon
(20) Valdez?
(21) A No, sir
(22) Q Have you ever seen Hazelwood take a drink?
(23) A Of water, a drink of what?
(24) Q A drank of booze?
(25) ANo, sir
}

\section*{Vol 193079}
mate and the mate would be right there watohing
Q Having stood watch with Kagan for quite a while have you
come to any opinions or conciusions about his ability to steer
prior to the grounding of the Exxon Valdez?
A No sir
Q How would you - If you had to have a couple of words to describe somebody how would you describe Kagan?
A As a person?
Q Intelingence quotient?
A His intelligence quotient who am I to say? I would consider he san average guy
(12) O Was he a little slower than average in his ability to
(13) understand orders and carry them out?

A Not to my knowledge
Q What do you do on a watch in port on the Valdez?
16) A Do the few valyes that are hand turned valves if t situation arises that they need opened or closed we do that of
we walk around the deck, make sure that all the scuppert in Make sure you re not leaking oil anywhere Just watch
general deck
Q The vessel is aimost totally automatic loading isn tit?
A Yes, sir
Q The loading is controlled from a panel?
A Yee, sir
Q ls that done by the mate?

Vol 193080
1) A Yes sir with the heip of your A B You verify your fact that the valve is actualiy open They push the button but you re out on deck and you tell them it the valve has opened or
(4) not

Q He pushes a button you check the valve to be sure it \(s\)
open and you report back?
A Yes, sir
Q You observed Captain Hazelwood return to the vessel didn t
you?
A Yes, sir
Q And who came back with him do you remember?
A The chief engineer and the radio reporter
Q You had a brief discussion with him?
A With Captain Hazelwood, yes
Q And then did the vessel leave the dock shortly thereatter? 16) A That evening we were preparing to leave, securing the deck,
(17) which is the one thing you do before you leave out of there
(18) Q Then after you undocked you then went in and took a nap?
(19) A After we finished undocking and finished securing the deck,
(20) then I went to my room
(21) Q And when you undocked and isn it - and it isn it on your
(22) watch do you get overtime for that?
(23) A Yes, sir
(24) Q You were then called at 1120 ?
\(\xi^{*}\)
(2) Yes, sir

\section*{Vol 193081}

Q Is that the normal time to be called to go up on watch?
AYes sir
Q You got up dressed go in get a cup of coffee?
A No sir, I went directly to watch from my room
O Approximately what time did you arrive?
A On the bridge?
Q On the bridge
A 23472348
Q And when you went onto the bridge who was present on the bridge?
A Mr Claar Mr Cousins and the cmptain
Q Where were they located?
A Mr Claar was behind the helm the wheel, and the third mate and the captain were on the starboard side forward Q You didn thear - did you hear anything at all that the
captain may have said while you were on the bridge between
11 47-2347 and the grounding?
(18) A On my way out to the bridge wing he commented on - 1 have
(19) a big snow suit, all nyion, and it makes a lot of nolse when
(20) you walk and reflective stripes made a comment how 1 couldn t
(21) sneak up on anybody
(22) Q Other than that any conversation at all?
(23) A No sir
(24) Q So you came to the bridge you had the one brief
(25) conversation with the captatn about the snow suit and then you

1, went outside?
A it was just said while I was passing It wasn t even a
conversation It was a comment
Q And then you went outside?
AYes
Q Were you aware that the captain left the bridge?
A I wasn t aware, no
Q The next time you came in was he there or not there?
A I wouldn t know for sure
Q Well did you see him when you came in?
A No, sir
Q And between the time of the comment by the captain and the
time you came in to report a light did you have any discussion
with anybody any taik with anybody?
A No, sir
Q Did you hear anybody talk?
A No, alr
Q Fine When you looked ahead you saw a light?
A Not when I immedlately went to the bridge wing
(0) How long were you on the bridge wing before you saw a light?
Al don't know
Q Approximately?
A A guess?
(25) Q An estumate

\footnotetext{
V어 193083
(1) A An estimate I would estimate, guess it was - it was (2) before midnight, so that would be approximately 13 minutes, in
(3) that time period
(4) Q And was the bearing of that light constant or changing?
(5) A it changes somewhat
(6) Q Where did you first see it?
(7) A Broad on the starboard bow
(8) Q And how did it change was it apparently moving forward or (9) att?
(10) A it was apparently dead in the water the light
(11) Q Broad on the starboard bow?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q When you first reported the red light that you saw you
(14) reported the flashing interval of the light didn t you?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q What did you report it as?
(17) A Every flve seconds
(18) Q And did you later change that report?
(19) A Yes, sir
(20) Q To what?
(21) A Every four seconds
(22) Q And why did you make that change?
(23) A When I went back out - when I went back out there -
(24) Q You counted it7
(25) A - I had more time
}

Vol 193084
(1) Q When you first saw the light you had been out on the
(2) bridge wing how long?
(3) A Somewhere between 2347 and I would guess before midnight,
(4) so that s 13 minutes, somewhere in that time frame
(5) Q And you went in and reported it to someone?

A Yes, sir
Q To whom?
A Mr Cousins
Q Where was Mr Cousins at the time you reported if?
A Behind the chart table
Q And behind the curtain then?
A Yes
Q Did you go into the chart room to report it?
A l |ust pulled the curtain back
Q What did you say to him?
A l said, red light flashing, broad on starboard bow,
flashing every tive eeconds
Q is that exactly what you said?
A In that order, or tlashing red light, every five seconds,
broad on the starboard That was the content of the words I sald to him
Q What did he say?
A He acknowiedged my reply
Q How?
A Elther he repeated it or he said red flashing light He

\section*{Vol 193085}

Just acknowledged my report
Q But whatever he said led you to believe that he understood
what you said to him?
A Yes, sir
Q Did you stay there? Did you go immediately back to the bridge wing?
A I went Immediately back to the bridge wing
Q What was Cousins doing when you looked in?
Aldont know
Q Well was he at the chart rable?
A He was behind the churt table
Q Was he looking at the chart table when you pulled the curtain aside?
A Yes, sir
Q Did he have navigational instruments in hie hands?
A I don't know I Just saw him, reported it and left I
didn t study him
Q When you left did he leave with you?
A No, slr I left and he wes still behind the chart table
Q You went back out on the bndge wing?
A Yes, sir
Q Did you have any discussions with the helmsman?
A On the way out to the bridge wing, no, alr
Q Or on the way in?
A No, sir
1) Q When you went back out on the bridge wing what did you do?
(2) A Looked again
(3) Q At the light?
(4) A Yes, sir, and all around
(5) Q Did you see any other lights other than the red light on (6) the starboard bow?
(7) A I don \(t\) recall if there were lights abeam or astern The (8) one I definitely remember in my mind is the light I reported
(9) Q You recounted the sequence of the flashes?
(10) A Yes, sir
(11) Q And when you discovered that it was a different sequence
(12) than you had reported you decided to report it again?
(13) A Yes, sir
(14) Q When you went back into the bridge your purpose was to
(15) report the light again?
(16) A Yes, sir
(17) Q And did you do so?
(18) A Yes, sir
(19) Q To whom?
(20) A To Mr Cousins
(21) Q Where was he?
(22) A On the port side of the bridge behind the radar
(23) Q And what did you say this time?
(24) A I said, the light the flashing every four aeconds sir,
(25) Greg, or something like that Flashing every four, not every

\section*{Vol 193087}
(1) tive
(2) Q What did he say?
(3) A He acknowledged what itold him
(4) Q So you were of the opinion from what he said that he
(5) understood what you told him?
(6) A Yee, sir
(7) Q Did you see him do anything about it?
(8) A I walked right back out on the bridge wing
(9) Q When you walked back out on the bridge as far as you know
(10) did he remain at the console?
(i1) A I had my back to him I wouldn t know what he did
(12) \(Q\) When you walked back out on the bridge did you continue
to
(13) Observe the light?
(14) A Yes, slip
(15) Q For how long?
(18) A All the time I was out on the bridge wing I was observing
(17) It all along with everything else around me
(18) Q Did that light contunue to remain at the same postion
(19) relative position or did it move in relative position atter
(20) you went back out on the bridge for the second time?
(21) A For how long?
(22) Q At any time while you were out there
(23) A I noticed the light coming to port after I was out on the
(24) bridge, after the eecond report
(25) Q How long after you got out on the bindge the second tume

Vol 193088
(1) did you notice that the relative position of the light had
(2) begun to swing toward the bow?
(3) Aldon tknow
(4) Q Approximately?
(5) A Approximately after my second report
(6) QYes
(7) Aldon't know
(B) Q When you went back out on the bridge the second time you
(9) contunued to watch the light and at some ume did the light
(10) remain relatively stationary for a period of ume after you
(11) went back?
(12) A For a short period, yes
(13) Q Do you know how long?
(14) A No, sir
(15) Q What s your best estimate of how long the light remained
(16) fairly stationary in its relative position?
(17) A A guess would be-a guess would be less than five
(18) minutea
(19) Q Ma am we re talking about the tume involved between the
(20) ume you went out on the bridge and the tume you saw the
(21) relative heading of the vessel and the light You ve told us
(22) that it was in your opinion less than five and more than one?
(23) A it \(s\) a guese lese than five and more than one
(24) Q Were you aware that the vessel went aground?
(25) A Yes, sur

\section*{Voㅓ 193089}
(1) Q How did you become aware of that?
(2) A When we hit the reel
(3) Q What was the sensation that you had? What did you feel or
(4) hear or see?
(5) A i heard a scraping sound I saw a light up around the bow
(6) and I felt a gradual stopping
(7) Q You felt the vessel stopping Were the engines continuing?
(8) A Yes sir
(9) Q Have you ever figured out what the light was you saw on the
(10) bow?
(II) A Did I figure out?
(12) Q Yes
(13) A Since the event yes
(14) Q What was it?
(15) A The light was Bligh Reef light
(16) Q When the vessel went aground what did you do?
(17) A What did I do?
(18) Q Yes
(19) A Immediately after the veszel went aground I looked at the (20) Iand around me and verified that we were stopped and I went
(21) into the bridge
(22) Q Before the vessel ran aground did the relative position of
(23) the light begin to change?
(24) A itold you earlier it started swinging towards the bow
(25) Q And that would indicate to you that the vessel was turning
(1) to starboard wouldn it?
(2) A Correct
(3) Q Could you give us any idea of the rate of turn of the
(4) vessel?
(5) ANo, sir
(6) Q From where you were on the wing of the bridge you didn t
(7) hear any of the - did you hear any of the orders that were
(8) given in the bridge between the mate and the helmsman?
(9) \(\mathrm{ANo}, \mathrm{sir}\)
(10) \(Q\) And the two times you went into the bridge the first tume
(1) When Cousins was in the bridge in the chart room and the second
(12) turne when he was on the bridge looking at the radar did you
(13) see the captain present?
(14) A No, air I did not see the eaptain
(15) Q When is the first time you did see the captain after first (16) reporting the light?
(17) A The first time I saw he was there after the grounding
(18) Q Do you have any ectimate as to how long atter?
(19) A Shortiy
(20) Q Did you hear - atter the grounding did you go into the
(21) bridge house?
(22) A Yes, sir
(23) Q How soon after? Right away?
(24) A Soon yes As soon as I verified we were stopped, I went (25) into the bridge

\section*{Vol 193091}

\footnotetext{
(1) Q Al that point did you hear anybody saying anything?
(2) A Not that I recall No, sir
(3) Q Did you see Mr Cousins using the telephone?
(4) Albelieve so
(5) Q Did you overhear what he said?
(6) ANo, sir
(7) Q Do you know who he called?
(8) A No, sir
(9) Q Did you have any discussion with him at any ume before you
(10) left the bridge?
(11) A Discussion? No, sir He said a couple of words in
(12) passing
(13) O What were those?
(14) A When he walked out to the bridge wing, and he also verified
(15) the fact that the vessel was stopped and later when there was
}
(18) some oil spewing out of the coffer dam, I said to him we have
(i7) pulled all the scuppers do you want me to go down and put
the
(18) scuppers back?
(19) O What did he tell you?
(20) A He said I think it suseless now, too late
(21) Q Were you present when the captain returned to the bridge?
(22) A I was present when the captain came out from behind the
(23) chart - chart room
(24) Q And you don i know whether he had been there betore or not?
(25) A No sir

Vol 193092
Q But when he came out from the chart room what did he say? A What did he say?
QYes
A I don't believe he said anything
Q He didn t talk to you at all?
A I don t believe so no sir
Q Didn t talk to Kagan at all?
A I didn't overhear any converastion
Q Did he talk to Cousins?
A At one time, the chief mate came up and he spoke He was
(11) speaking with the two of them
(12) Q With Cousins and -
(13) A believe he was talking with both of them
(14) Q Did you overhear any of the conversations?
(15) A No, sir
(16) Q Where were you?
(17) A I was on the bridge
(18) Q Do you know whether or not Captain Hazelwood took any steps
(19) to sound the area around the perimeter of the vessel prior to
(20) initiating rudder orders?
(21) A Sound the water around the vessel?
(22) Q Yes
(23) A 1 m not aware of any
(24) Q So do you know if he took any steps to sound the penmeter
(25) of the vessel the area around the vessel?

\section*{Vol 193093}

A No, I don \(t\) know it he took any I don't know how he could
(3) Q Were you given any orders by the captain or Greg Cousins or anyone else for that matter after the grounding?
A WaE I given any orders?
Q Yes
A Greg had gone down and notified some people and he told me
(8) who he did and I went down and notlited some other on the suggeations, some other people I was given the order to go
(10) out and rig a pilot ladder for the Coast Guard and that a all I
(11) can recall
(12) Q You mentioned earlier that on the evening of March 23
(13) 1989 you had occasion to observe Captain Hazelwood as he came
(14) on board the Exxon Valdez Do you recall that?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q Can you please describe for us approximately where you were
(17) and where he was when you first saw him arrive on board the
(18) Exxon Valdez?
(19) A On the port side of the vessel on the stern alongside the
(20) house
(21) Q And did you actually see him come off the gangway?
(22) A No, sir, not that I can recall
(23) Q Approximately how far from you was he when you first saw
(24) hum?
(25) A Well, I Just spoke to him I can give you a guess, two or
1) three feet
(2) O Now I m talking now about the first time you saw him when
(3) he came on board the vessel I think you may have been a
(4) little confused in your last answer as to what I was referring
(5) 10
(6) A Yes, sir
(7) Q So let me clarity that again for you 1 m talking about
(8) the frrst time you saw Captain Hazelwood come on board the
(9) Valdez on March 231989 do you recall that?
(10) A Yes I recall him coming on board and I don \(t\) know where
(11) how far aft he was I recall seeing him and I made a point of
(12) speaking to him as he came back to the house
(13) Q Now did you see him come off the gangway at that tume?
(14) A No sir I don't believe I did I don't recall seeing
(15) that
(16) Q Do you recall seeing him being about 40 feet away from you
(17) When you first saw him?
(18) A 40 feet? Yes, well, he was away I would say 40 feet
(19) Q And at the tume you saw him did you observe him walking
(20) towards you?
(21) A Yes, sir He was waiking aft
(22) Q And in addition to Captain Hazelwood did you see anybody
(23) else walking with him at that particular point in time?
(24) A In front of him was the chief engineer and the radio
(25) operator

Vol 193095
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{(1) Q Did you notice anything unusual about the way Captain} \\
\hline (2) & Hazeiwood was walking during this period of time that you \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(3) Ob} \\
\hline (4) & A No, sir \\
\hline (5) & Q Did he stagger? \\
\hline (6) & ANo sir \\
\hline (7) & Q Was there any sway in his walk? \\
\hline (8) & ANo \\
\hline (9) & Q Was there any - was there anything about the way he walked \\
\hline (10) & which would indicate to you that he was in any way impaired by \\
\hline (11) & alcohol? \\
\hline (12) & A No, sir \\
\hline (13) & Q Now was he walkıng towards you? \\
\hline (14) & A He was walking to hls destination, was where I was \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{working} \\
\hline (15) & Q And whare wera you working? \\
\hline (16) & A Just by the door on port side The hatch that goes into \\
\hline (17) & the house \\
\hline (18) & Q And was that the door he was walking toward? \\
\hline (19) & A Well thare a ladder alse right there that goes up to the \\
\hline (20) & cargo control roam deck or the door, I don trecall which he \\
\hline (21) & went into, but he was walking back there for the purpose of \\
\hline (22) & getting inte the house \\
\hline (23) & Q Did there come a time when he passed you? \\
\hline (24) & A Yee After we spoke in crossing, he crossed \\
\hline & Q Before he passed you did he in fact stop and talk \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Vol 193096
A He stopped I don \(t\) know it I - it I walked up to him
or - I think I walked up to him and he stopped
Q And where was that?
(4) A That was just outside the house

Q And approxımately how close to Captain Hazelwood were you
(6) when you walked up to him to talk to him at this particular ) point in time?
A 1 guess about two to three teet
(9) O And did in fact you have a conversation with him at that ime?
A I just joked with him
(12) Q Can you recall as best you can what you said to him and
(13) what he sard to you at that partucular point in time?
(14) A Only part It was very short Just in passing, I recall I
(15) eaid to him, asked him if he had a good time, and he had a
(16) brietcase, and he showed me his briefcase and I said
something
(17) about business and something about him having red suspenders on
(18) and always working even when he was going ashore, you know,
(19) powar tie lasked him it he had a power tie on or something,
(20) Just making fun of the fact that he was doing business while he

\section*{was ashore}

Q And did he respond to your remarks?
(23) A don t remember what he aaid or if he just chuckled or
(24) What I don iremember
(25) O Was there anything about your conversation with him at that

\section*{Vod 193097}
(1) tume which led you to believe that he was in any way impaired
(2) by alcohol?
(3) ANo
(4) O Was his speech slurred when he was - when he was
speaking
(5) with you at this time?

A No,sir
Q Was there anything about his demeanor which would indicate
(a) to you that he was intoxicated?
(9) ANo sir
(10) O At approximately
(11) And approximately how long would you say this interchange
(12) or this brief conversation with him lasted?
(13) A A guess of maybe 30 seconds, 45 seconds I guess it was
(14) just in passing
(15) Q After this conversation with Captain Hazelwood did you
(16) observe where he went?
(17) ANo sir
(18) Q Well what did you do atter you had this conversation with
(19) Captain Hazelwood7
(20) A I was in the process of securing fire hoses and rolling (21) them up and \(I\) don \(t\) know what step of the process I was in when
(22) I spoke with him Either I finished rolling the hase or I took
(23) It Into the phone room inside the - right inside the hatch
(24) there I was securing fire hoses at the time
(25) Q Did you observe him going into the house?(8)(9)
(11) the (12) more
(13) over to the starboard side And I walked up to the bridge, (14) went around the port side, and from the aft slde of the console
(15) a 1
(16)
(17)
(18)
(19)
(20)
(21)
(22)

He
(24) spoke how my stripes were reflected in the dark on my snow
suit He mentioned that fact, so he looked at me

\section*{Voㅓ 193099}

Q Approximately how close were you to Captain Hazelwood at
) that particular point in ume if you recall?
A Once again I will guess two to three feet
Q Was there anything about his demeanor or anything about
him
which would have indicated to you at that time he was in any
) way impaired by alcohol at that time?
A No, sir
Q Did he appear sober to you at that time?
A Yes, sir
Q When you first encountered him on the deck when he arrived
(11) On the vessel did he appear sober to you at that time?
(12) A Yes, sur

Q Now you ve just stated that you went up to the bridge
dressed in this sult this heavy weather sult I suppose
right?
A Yes, sir
Q Now you also testified to what you observed after the
grounding of the Exxon Valdez correct?

\section*{A Correct}

Q I would like to draw your attention to your observations
) after the grounding during the time that Captain Hazelwood was ) on the bridge and various engine commands were being given and
(23) also helm commands Were these engine and helm commands being
(24) Given at the same time?
(25) A From what I can recall engine command was given and then
1) hard right or hard left while the engine command was still in (2) procese
(3) Q And the commands were being given by whom?

A The captain was giving all commands
Q And who was he giving the commands to?
A Mr Kagan in the helm and Mr Cousins on the telegraph
O After Captain Hazelwood gave the command did enther
Mr Kagan or Mr Cousins acknowledge the order?
A I don t remember distinctiy, but from sailing, that is alwaya done Every time an order is given you repeat the
order as you do it I don \(t\) remember in my mind them
saying
(12) It
(13) Q At this time you could hear Captain Hazelwood giving these 4) orders?
(15) A When I was - yes
(16) Q And did you hear him give these orders many imes while you
(17) ware in the wheelhouse during this episode?
(18) A All the orders he gave while we were maneuvering I was (19) there for the full time period
(20) Q Did you also observe Captain Hazelwood physically see him (21) while he was giving these orders?
(22) A Yes, sir
(23) Q And approximately how close to him were you at the time?
(24) A idon trecall I believe I was - it was in the
(25) wheelhouse in the pilot house I think I was behind the

\section*{Voㅓ 193101}
(i) console but I don tremember exactly where I was seeing him
(2) Q Were you standing in the same place all during this time or
(3) were you moving around?
(4) A I was probably moving around
(5) Q And where was he standing at that time?
(6) A I believe he was over on the port side by the helmsman
(7) Q Was there anything about him at that ime which indicated
(8) to you that he was in any way impaired by aicohol?
(9) ANo, sir
(10) Q Did he appear sober to you at that tume?
(11) A Yes sir
(12) Q Were his commands clear?
(13) A Yes, sir
(14) Q Did you notice any slurning of his speech during those
(15) exchanges?
(16) A No, sir
(17) Q Did he sound normal to you?
(18) A Yes, sir
(19) Q Did he seem to you to be in contral of the situation
(20) insofar as giving the orders to Kagan and to Cousins?
(21) A In control, I don \(t\) know how in control you can be in that (22) situation, but he seemed to be sure of himself and what he was
(23) doing He wasn trunning around like a chicken with his hend
(24) cut off, what am I going to do, what am I going to do He (25) seemed sure of himself and completely - handling himself in a

\section*{professional manner}

Q He never told you what the purpose of the orders were that
he was giving up there at that time did he?

\section*{A No sir}

Q Do you recall whether or not you had observed the ship s heading during the time that these orders were being given?
A I wes watching the heading, yes, sir
Q And do you have any recollection at this point in time as
to what the heading was?
A Just from reading my reports I belleve I said in there
289 +don tremember the number in my head now
Q Do you recall during all of these engine and helm maneuvers whether or not that heading changed?
A What I was watching, the sensors, it sot if your ship s
bow is turning to the right or to the left along with your
heading, and I was watching the forward one - I don t know
You could elther set it to the forward or to the aft doppler sounding thing And I don t know - on that ship you could elther switch it to the forward or aft one I don \(t\) know if it was on the forward one but I was watching that and there whe
(21) maybe two degrees at the most There was a little change in the heading and I was also looking out and seeing that we didn't go forward or astern I was watching to see if we were moving
5) Well did the heading of the ship change from 289 or did it


A if it changed at all, it would have been one op two
degrees It didn t change aignificantly No
Q Now there was also some testumony concerning the VTS system and about what you would think the VTS system would
relative to informing you of the ship s location Do you
recall that?
A Yes
Q At the lime of the grounding of the Exxon Valdez you were (10) aware in general terms of what the VTS system was supposed
(11) do?
(12) A in general terme, yee
(13) Q Were you aware that one of the purposes of the VTS was to
(14) help ships prevent collisions and groundings?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q And you also were under the impression at that tume that
(17) ships in Prince Wiliam Sound were being tracked by radar at
(18) VTS?
(19) A Well I maware of the fact that there was a radar syatem
(20) that VTS operated and also you have call-in points where every
(21) shlp calls in and they tell their position and their course and
(22) their speed That s another way that VTS keeps track of the
vesael
(25) the VTS s mission of helping to prevent colisions and
(1) groundings were you aware of the fact that the VTS was also
2) tracking ships on radar?
3) A Would you repeat that, please?
(4) Q Maybe I II ask it again Were you aware of the fact that (5) there is a radar facility in VTS?
6) A Yes, sir
7) Q And did you think that in conjunction with this radar
8) facility ships in Prince Willam Sound were being tracked by
radar by VTS?
(10) A Did I think that they were tracking the vessels on the
(11) radar system?
(12) QYes
(13) A Yes
(14) Q Now at the time of the grounding of the Exxon Valdez
(15) based upon what you were led to believe relative to the VTS
(16) system would you expect VTS to warn a ship if it was tracking
(17) it on radar and saw that it was about to have a collision with
(18) another ship?
(19) A Do ithink it will be the responsibility of the VTS to
(20) inform a ship if a collision is pending?
(21) Q Yes?
(22) A Yes, sir I believe that would be the VTS s job
(23) Q And if you thought that and if the VTS had a ship on radar
(24) and saw that there was a collision about to occur would you
(25) expect that they would radio the ship to warn the ship of that

\section*{Vot 193105}
(1) possibility?
(2) A Yes sir if the VTS was aware of the collision were going
(3) to happen they were tracking it on their radar I would think
(4) that the VTS would call the ship and notity them of the
(5) Bituation and make sure they were aware and see what they were
(6) going to do yes sir
(7) Q Now let me take this question one step further If the
(8) VTS had a ship on radar and saw that it was about to go aground
(9) on Bligh Reet or Bligh Isiand or any point in Prince Wiliann
(10) Sound would you expect that they would atso notity the ship of
(11) that by radio?
(12) A From the pamphets and other VTS systems up in the Straits
(13) of Juan de Fuca, if you go out of the travel lane or you go out
(14) of the southern or northern boundary the VTS calls you up, and
(15) I would definitely think if they saw your vessel heading for an
(16) object in the water they would tell you That ts their job
(17) That is what they re there for
(18) MR SANDERS You may ask
(19) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MAUREEN HIGGINS (Read)
(20) BYMS WAGNER
(21) Q Had you ever seen ice on the radar before you looked at the (22) radar whenever you did look at it?
(23) Al d never encountered lce before on the trip to Valdez (24) Q When you did look at the radar and you saw what you thought
(25) was ice did you talk with somebody and say is that ice?
(1) A I asked Mr Cousins what it was and he told me, yes it was
(2) Ice
(3) Q And at that time the ice was somewhere two and three miles
(4) from the vessel or five miles depending on which testimony
prior testumony -
A I never - I don think I ever gave any miles away I
don \(t\) know what range the radar was on, what scale
Q When you first went out on the bridge wing what did you
do?
(10) A Looked
(11) Q Where did you look?
(12) A Forward
(13) Q Did you look any place else other than forward?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q Where else?
(16) A Along the sides, you look astern
(17) Q When you looked astern did you see any lights?
(18) A I dont recall
(19) Q Are you aware of THE characteristics of the Busby inght?
(20) A Yes, EIr
(21) Q Do you remember what they are?
(22) A There 8 g green sector, I believe \(I\) don \(t\) have it
(23) memorized, no, sir
(24) Q But there are two sectors in any event one color and one
(25) another right?

\section*{Voㅓ 193107}
(1) A Yes sir
(2) Q Are you aware of what it means to go from a white sector
3) Into a red sector in a light?
(4) A Yes, sir
(5) Q What does it mean?
(6) A It means that you re in a danger area
(7) O When you tooked astern do you recall seeing a red light?
(日) A No, sir
(9) Q Do you recall not seeing a red light?
(10) A t don t recall what lights I saw what color they were
(11) Q You fust don \(t\) recall ether way?
(12) A Right
(13) Q Did you consider yourself friends with Hazeiwood before
(14) this accident?
(15) A Yes sir
(16) Q Before the captain came up to the bridge were the engines
(17) Stopped?
(18) A Not that I recall
(19) Q Were you present when the engines were stopped?
(20) A I was present during the time but I don \(t\) know when it
(21) happened I saw they were full ahead and next time that I
(22) remember looking at the telegraph it was off, stopped
(23) Q Between the tume that the vessel was - well there was a
(24) period of tume that s been reported when the captatn was (25) maneuvering with the engines He d used various speeds and
on Before that time before the time when the vessel ran aground and the time when the captain commenced to do this did
the engines go dead?
Albellieve so sir
Q And were you still on the bridge when that happened
whether you know how it happened?
A Yes, sir
Q And this is a fully automated vessel You run the engines from the bridge is that what that means?
A You either have bridge control or engine room control it can be run from either place
Q So that you can basically like you would on a small boat
tell the engines from the bridge what to do without the
intervention of an engineer in the engine room?
A li you re on bridge control, yes sir
Q Do you know if that s how the engines were stopped whether there was an engineer in the engine room?
A Someone on the bridge would have to put the telegraph
stop It doesn t move automatically
Q But you don t know who did it?
A No, sir
Q Do you know who started the engines again?
(23) A When we were maneuvering, Mr Cousins was on the telegraph
(24) Q Was he receiving orders from the captain?
(25) AYes, sir

\section*{Vol 193109}

Q Were you present while those orders were being given?
A Yes, sir
Q And what of those orders do you remember?
A Dead slow half ahead and full ahead
Q So you remember there was dead slow half ahead full
ahead?
A Yes
(8) Was someone on the helm at the time those were being given?
(9) A Yes, air
(10) Q Who was that?
(ii) AMr Kagan
(12) O And was he also being given orders?
(13) A Yes, air
(14) Q Did you hear those orders?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q What were those orders?
(17) A Hard right hard left to the beet of my recall, and then I
(18) think they ware east to ten, right and ten left
(19) Q Pardon I didn thear
(20) A think he eased it to ten right and ten left also
(21) Q At the tume he was giving those orders of hard right hard
(22) right or ten right ten left were the engines running?
(23) A Yes, sir, I belleve so
(24) Q Where were you during this period?
(25) A I was on the bridge
(2) vessel change?
(3) A Slightly a couple of degrees maybe
(4) \(Q\) is that all?
(5) A As a guess yes sir
(6) MS WAGNER Thanks
(7) MR SANDERS May it please the Court we call
(8) Mr Lloyd LeCain by deposition
(9) THE CLERK Raise your right hand please sir
(10) (The Reader is Sworn)
(11) THE GLERK For the record sir state your full name
(12) address and spell your last name
(i3) THE WITNESS Robert Hilliard Scott 318 East
(14) Broadway Glendale Californa S C O T T
(15) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF LLOYD LECAIN (Read)
(16) BYMR SANDERS
(17) Q Please state your full name and home address
(18) A Lloyd LeCain 416 Evesham Place Longwood California
-
(19) Longwood Florida
(20) Q Are you aware of the vessel organization manual encouraging
(21) masters to conduct training exercises?
(22) A Yes, I belleve
(23) Q Did you say you couldn 1 remember reading that?
(24) A No, I can trecall
(25) O Well how about if I ask you whether or not you remember

\section*{Vof 193111}
(1) any master actually conducting training exercises?
(2) AOh, yee
(3) Q What did they consist of?
(4) A There wes firefighting training There was - I used to be
(5) In charge of giving training in flretighting Sound damage to
(6) people's ears
(7) Q You mentioned also participating in the EXCEL program?
(8) A Yes
9) Q Can you explain your participation?
(10) A ti was sort of like a problem thing You would solve
(11) problems by working together ses team A lat of

\section*{corporations}
(12) use that
(13) Q Did you have a cartan amount of training for EXCEL?
(14) A No, no some of the stuff is rldiculous it seemed
(15) ridiculous Later on when we looked at it, it - IIke
(18) everybody would cover themselves with the black hood and we
(17) would all try to get in a box and ft was - like they would
(18) have theae problems you would solve, llke people put hoods over
(19) their heads and - and can I see a littie bit and I - I could
(20) see a littie blt, and we would all try to get ropes to do that, (21) and another one was we would try to jump over some ropes We d
(22) have a rope course and you have to flgure how to get people
(23) over these ropes Seemed silly at the time But it was way
(24) to work together mes team
(25) Q Was this mandatory training that you went inrough?

Vol 193112
i) A It was mandatory for captains and chief mates I had
(2) Mr larossa tell me As for other oflicers, they would like
(3) you to go to it You didn thave to but they would like you
(4) 10
(5) Q How long did it take?
(6) A I believe that was a week also
(7) And then was there follow up EXCEL work that you did or was
(8) that it?
(9) A That was it Oh wait a minute There was an EXCEL
(10) program on the ship because we did have these
brainstorming
(11) Ideas for Improving the fleet We'd try to implement these
(12) things on the ship using the resources we have on the ship
(13) And so some of the stuff was real good on the fleet and some of
(14) It wasen t good It was input from the people below in (15) management
(16) Q I don t want to spend a lot of time on this but could you
(17) just give me some idea of the brainstorming that you you re
(18) talking about ideas that you implemented on the ship?
(19) A One trouble we have when a stup goes alongside the dock ls
(20) the lining up with the risers which is where you load the
(21) ship, with the arms on the dock Okay? It s often hard when
(22) you re 60 feet up in the air on a loaded ship to see exactly
(23) where the arm is What we did on the ship i was on we drew
(24) circles on the side of the ship exactly at the same position as
(25) the arma were on the ship and we put the diameter of the

\section*{Vol 193113}
(1) reducer on it We would paint this on the ship so when we came
(2) alongside the ship the guys down there could see where your
(3) arm was That was one of my ideas and we did try it on the
(4) shlp and it worked pretty gaod There were other Ideas that
(5) people had I don trecalt
(6) Q And then as part of EXCEL would you communicate your good
(7) Ideas to other -
(8) A Yeah, what you did was you d come up with the ideas and
(9) then samebody from management and engineering would come or
(10) engineering would come and talk to you about it and see it it
(II) was feasible to do that It was nice it was nice to have
(12) input from the officers It was an intereating program
(13) Q What sort of training did Exxon have for helmsmen? In
(14) other words you talked about Kagan before But can you tell
(15) us how a man ends up being a qualified helmsman?
(16) A Well Coast Guard document asye you re a qualifled helmsman
(i7) It you re an able seaman an \(\mathrm{A} B\) you re automatically
(18) qualifled But go back you re a qualified helmeman if you re
(19) an able seaman
(20) Q An A B you re automatically qualified but did Exxon have
(21) any check in addition to that that they went through or any
(22) type of training they put the \(A B\) through if he was a new \(A B\)
(23) or did they just put him on the heim?
(24) A We would put him on the helm but I want to quality it I (25) know Joe Hazelwood and a number of captains like the guys to
steer half an hour in the manual steering at night so they get
(2) practice at sea and there was no set rule but we always tried
3) to do it and it helped the guys steer
(4) Q That was when you were an a steady course at sea?

\section*{A Right}

Q So he could practice trying to hold it on that course?
A Right And any time l'd change course at sea of course
we would put it on manual and we would have a quarter master on
-19) the wheel at that time and he would be steering
(10) Q Was there any pressure put on you that you were aware of
(11) when I say you I mean the ship to have a fast turn around
tume?
(13) A Not -
(14) Q To meet the scnedule let sput it that way?
(15) A I would say no more than normal
(16) Q Well what do you mean by that?
(17) A Well, the owners of the ship expect the ship to turn
around
(18) with maximum efficiency within safety guidelines, that sit
(19) I mean we always had safety first in my company
(20) Q Now you mentioned the safety drills and fire drills?
(21) AUh huh
(22) Q Can you tell me first of all how often these were
(23) conducted?
(24) A Well at least once a week We always had them on every
(25) trip As soon as we got out to sea if the weather was good we

\section*{Vol 193115}
(1) would have a fire drill and then an abandon ship drill Test
(2) the equipment, and then he we would have a demonstration
(3) afterwards and usually the second or third mate gave a
(4) demonstration
(5) Q Do you know whether Exxon had any policy concerning fatigue
(6) or stress?
(7) A Well, Exxon is always safety first so I mean if you were
(8) really tired, you could say I m really tired and they could
(9) work something out
(10) Q Mr Blank asked you a bunch of questions about your duties
(11) and the hours you worked on the 22nd and 23rd 1 don \(t\) want to
(12) go back through all of that but what I want - what I do want
(13) to ask you is whether or not the work routine that you
(14) described is typical of what you would have normally done in
(15) the Port of Valdez?
(16) A it coutd be depending on which watch we tied up at What
(17) I m saying is some offlcers would catch it wrong, you know,
(18) there are only so many hours in a day and you tied up at the
(19) wrong watch, you got hit That a the way it works
(20) Q To use your words did you catch it wrong this time in
(21) Valdez?
(22) ANo I just caught a lot of work that 8 atl 1 didn \(t\)
(23) feel tired or anything I paced myself
(24) MS WAGNER Do you have a cross examination script?
(25) CROSS EXAMINATION OF LLOYD LECAIN (Read)
(1) BYMS WAGNER
(2) Q You have another document here that s been marked as 20036
(3) which is a memorandum to Paul Myers from Captain Stalzer Did
(4) you ever sall with Captain Stalzer?
(5) A Yes
(6) Q Do you know who Paul Myers is?
7) AYes
(8) Q This is dated January 221989 and it s entitled safety
(9) fatigue concerns And I II let you look at this but in
(10) summary Captain Stalzer points out a period of three days in
(11) which a chief officer worked over 60 hours and had only a few
12) hours oft in a 60 hour period And Captain Stalzer is
(13) complaining about it and then he makes some recommendations
(14) And I II ask you a question about it after you look at it
(15) Actually it s 62 hours and he had I believe nine hours
(16) off in a \(\mathbf{6 2}\) hour period
(17) Okay The question I have for you did you find this to be
(18) common with chief mates in port to be working hours like
(19) this?
(20) A Not necessarily It depends on the officers on the ship
(21) and how everything goes He may have sald 62 hours but maybe
(22) the second mate relieved him for a while Maybe he rested in a
(23) chair That doesn tell you anything
(24) Q Well if you take what s being said here by Capiain
(25) Stalzer he 5 complaining about this and he itemizes the

\section*{Vol 193117}
(1) periods of time In taking Captain Stalzer s calculations as
(2) fact all right just for purposes of the question 1 m asking
(3) you did you encounter other chiet mates inat worked these
(4) types of hours in port?
(5) A Not that many hours
(6) O This is an unusual situation?
(7) A That would be an unusual situation I might add that I was
(8) On the Exxon San Franciaco and we had a lot of hours sometimes
(9) and the chlef mate and I would apell each other sometimes
(10) cargo officers
(11) Q So when you spelled each other how many hours a day were
(12) each of you working?
(13) A it - I might get an extra hour or two That s purely
(14) circumatantial How do you feel, do you feel awake do you
(15) feel that you can handle the cargo, good glve me a littie
(16) Epell, a little reat, I'm sure you would do it In your job
(17) Epell each other
(18) Q What was Exxon s policy concerning watch officers standing
(19) watch leaving port as far as when they are on duty leaving
(20) port not having been on duty for six hours out of the required
(21) 12 hour period? Do you understand what I m saying? Did you
(22) ever hear any regulation?
(23) A heard a Coast Guard reguiation, something about it
(24) Q Do you know what the regulation is?
(25) A No Llke Isay, I resily don t know I don t know about
(1) that
(2) Did you ever stand a watch leaving port with Exxon you
) sald you did on occasion where you had not been off duty for
more than six hours in the 12 hour period preceding -
preceding penod?
A Many times
Q So that was a violation of the regulation as you
understand it?
A No that \(s\) what you retelling me
Q Well assuming there is a regulation that says you re not
to have been on duty for at least six hours within a 12 hour
period when leaving port you either - there were occasions when you had been on duty for more than six hours in a 12 hour period when leaving port isn t that correct?
A Occasionally
(16) Q And Exxon Shipping Company - does Exxon Shipping Company
(17) pay its deck officers for overtime?

ANo
Q Did they ever do so?
A Yes but that needs explanation What happened was we had
(21) a base aalary and we had an overtime company made us managers
(22) and incorporated the overtime into the base ealery, which in
(23) actuality ia more when you go to retire because your
(24) retirement is based on your base salary
(25) O Okay When did they do this?

Vol 193120
MR SANDERS Your Honor I m pleased to announce we (2) have a live witness We call Mr Greg Ferrone
(3) THE CLERK Would you rase your right hand please (4) sir Witness
(The Witness is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record state your full name your address and spell your last name
THE WITNESS My name is Gregory John Ferrone Im from North Hampion Pennsyivania My last name is spelled
FERRONE
THE CLERK Thank you sir
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GREGORY FERRONE (Live)
BYMR SANDERS
Q Mr Ferrone you re employed by Exxon Shipping Company now
(15) Sea River Maritime?
(16) A That E correct
(17) Q And let me take you briefly before we go to our break
(18) through your background How long have you worked for Exxon?
(19) A 13 and a half years
(20) Q And before you started work with Exxon where were you?
(21) A College
(22) Q All right Where did you go to college?
(23) A New York Maritime College, Fort Schuyler
(24) Q All right Now I want you the talk a litte bit slower so
(25) we can all hear you You went to what college?
Vol 193121
(1) A New York Maritime College in Fort Schuyler Bronx, New
(2) York
(3) Q You don thave to talk as slow as I do And you
(4) graduated -
(5) A New Yorkers don t do that
(6) Q And you graduated from Fort Schuyler in what year?
(7) A May of 1981
(8) Q And as a graduate did you have a icense?
(9) A Yes sir
(10) Q And what was that license?
(11) A Third mate s license
(12) Q And then you came to Exxon as a third mate?
(13) A That s correct
(14) Q How long did you sail as a third mate tor Exxon?
(15) A Until 1984
(16) Q All right And in 1984 what did you become?
(17) A Second mate
(18) Q And prior to that had you gotten a license sat for a
(19) license exam with the \(U S\) Coast Guard?
(20) A Yes sir
(21) Q And how long did you sall for Exxon as a second mate?
(22) A For two years until 1986
(23) Q And in 1986 had you - by 1986 had you received your
(24) license as a chiet mate?
(25) A Yes sir

\section*{A New York Maritime College in Fort Schuyler Bronx, New} York graduated -
A New Yorkers don \(t\) do that
Q And you graduated from Fort Schuyler in what year?
A May of 1981
Q And as a graduate did you have a license?
A Yes sir
And what was thaticense?

Q And then you came to Exxon as a third mate?
A That s correct
Q How long did you sall as a third mate for Exxon
A UntII 1984

A Second mate
Q And prior to that had you gotten a license sat for a license exam with the U S Coast Guard?
A Yes sir
Q And how long did you sail for Exxon as a second mate?

Q And in 1986 had you - by 1986 had you received your icense as a chiet mate?

\section*{Vol \(19 \quad 3122\)}
(1) Q And did you then start sailing on that license or sati as a
(2) chief mate for Exxon?
(3) AYes sir
(4) Q Now you are currently assigned to what ship?
(5) A Right now 1 massigned to the Exxon Philadelphia Sea River
(6) Philadelphia
(7) Q And you are currently employed by Exxon?
(8) A That scorrect
(9) Q Now in the Exxon way of doing things the Exxon Shipping
(10) Company way of doing things were you called upon over your
(11) career to do performance evaluations of people that you were
(12) supervising?
(13) A Yes, sir
(14) Q And you were supervising?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q And in fact were you by your supervisors?
(17) A Yes, sir
(18) Q Is that - well how long has that gone on?
(19) A As long as I ve been with the company
(20) Q All night And in the course - how often were these
(21) evaluations done? For example A Bs or people sailing as
(22) Ordinary seamen or maintenance seamen?
(23) A Well, the guidelines were 28 days there was review at
(24) least 28 days, be prudent to do evaluation but there were
(25) instances where if an individual was with you for a shorter

\section*{Vof 193123}
i) period of time, an evaluation or just input for that period of (2) time would not be out of the norm
(3) Q Okay And did you use a particular form to do these
4) evaluations?
(5) A Yes, gir there \& a particular form for the unlicensed
6) Individual
7) Q And where did you get that form?
A) A it in all the officer s files
(9) O Exxon -
(10) A Yes correct
(11) Q-gave you the form to use to do these evaluations?
(12) A That s correct
(13) MR SANDERS Your Honor would this be a good time
(14) to -
(15) THE COURT We ll take our first recess ladies and
(16) gentiemen We ll be in recess for 15 minutes
(17) THE CLERK This court is in recess for 15 minutes
(18) (Jury out at 959 a m )
(19) (Jury in at 1016 a m)
(20) BYMR SANDERS
(21) O Now Mr Ferrone there has been testimony in this case (22) concerning Mr Bob Kagan and indeed Bob Kagan was at the helm
(23) at the time the Valdez ran aground on March 24th 1989 I want
(24) to ask you do you know Bob Kagan?
(25) A Yes, sir
11) Q Have you sailed with Bob Kagan?

\section*{A Yes sir}

Q And indeed have you done pertormance evaluations on Bob Kagan?
A Yes sir
Q And in the course of doing these performance evaluations or preparing to do pertormance evaluations did you take care to look at how Mr Kagan was pertorming various parts of the job that he was performing?
A Yes, sir
"'1 Q All right Let me ask you specifically when did you do performance evaluations on Mr Kagan how many tirnes? A Two times
Q When was the first one?
A 1984
(16) Q And the second one?
(17) A 1987
(18) Q And in either/or both of those occasions what time frame
19) did those evaluations cover?
(20) A Two months or 60 days
(21) Q Both times?
22) AYes sir
(23) Q Two times - two months in 84 two months in 19877
(24) A That e correct
(25) Q And in those times - those tours of duty let s call it -
(1) did Mr Kagan stear?
(2) AYes sir
(3) Q Was he sailing as an able bodied seaman on either of those
(4) two occasions?

A No sir
Q And generally it is the able bodied seaman who steers
correct?
AYes sir
Q Why did Mr Kagan steer on those occasions?
A Because he had asked permisaion to do so
Q And was that granted?
(12) A Yes, sir
(13) Q And did Mr Kagan steer with you watching him in 1984 ?
(14) A Yes, sir
(15) Q Can you - I know it s a long tume ago but can you
(16) estumate on how many occasions you watched him steering?
(17) A Four times
(18) Q All right And in 1987 can you tall us how many umes you
(19) Watched him steer?
(20) A Two times
(21) Q All right In 1984 can you recall the location or
(22) locations where you had Mr Kagan at the helm?
(23) A The Miasiasippl Rlver
(2a) Q All right Now is the Mississippi River an easy or a hard
(25) place to navigate and to steer?

A Hard
Q And was he steening a tanker?
A Yes sir
Q Which tanker?
A The Exxon Huntington
O How did Mr Kagan do steering on the Mississippi River?
A Very well
Q Now on the occasion that you had him steering in 1987 can
you remember where he steered on those occasions?
A The Ambrose Channel which is the approach channel to
New
(11) York Harbor
(12) Q Are those pilotage waters?
(13) A Yes sir
(14) Q Are those within the definition of confined waters?
(15) A Yes sir
(16) Q And how did Mr Kagan do?
(17) A Very well
(18) Q Let me ask that two pages of exhibit - Plaintifts Exhibit
(19) Number 69 be brought up piease
(20) MR SANDERS Your Honor I misspoke and I ve been
(21) corrected Plaintiffs Exhibit 69 I don \(t\) believe is in
(22) evidence What I would like to do is offer the two pages of
(23) which Mr Ferrone has knowiedge of that exhibit I d like to
(24) offer that as an exhibit Can we call that 69 or should I give
(25) It a new number?

\section*{Vo 193127}
(1) MR O NEILL How about 69 Alpha?
(2) MR SANDERS Is that all right Mr Murtasinaw? Your (3) Honor?
(4) THE COURT Mr Murtiashaw will that confuse things?
(5) MR O NEILL Let me - before we get to that Exhibrt
(6) 69 is Mr Kagan s service record as provided by Exxon
(7) Corporation to the National Transportation Satety Board it s
(8) his complete service record as produced by Exxon Perhaps
we
) should just offer Exhibit 69
MR SANDERS Well it was - it was referenced during
the course of his deposition and I have no - I have no
objection to putting this in 1 do want to correct something
though I do not believe it is a complete service record it
doesn t go back beyond about 1984 or 5 It 8 not complete
but -
MR O NEILL it s as provided to the NTSB Why don t
we just offer 69 ?
(Exhibit 69 offered)
THE COURT Plaintifts Exhibit 69 is admitted
(Exhibit 69 received)
BYMR SANDERS
Q As I was saying two pages of Exhibit 69 I wish you would
look at the first page please - and let me bring it up a little bit You have a screen right to your left or you can
) use this one over here

Vol 193128
(1) Alcan see that
(2) Q Now is that your name at the top of this?
(3) A Yes, sir
(4) Q And is that the evaluation you did of Mr Robert Kagan in
(5) \(1987 ?\)
(5) A Yes, sir
(7) Q And what ship was that on?
(8) A The Exxon Charleston
(9) Q And the ume frame of that evaluation was from June 10th
(10) 1987 to August 4th 1987 is that correct?
(11) A That s correct
(12) Q Now this portion that i ve highlighted or brought out
(13) this is the evaluation part for the deck department?
(14) A That © correct
(15) Q Now there is a section here that \(s\) very hard to read I m
(16) going to underine it and ask if you from memory or from any
(17) other copy that you have up there can tell the ladies and
(18) gentlemen of the jury and the Court what that - what is
(19) Written there?
(20) A it pertains to his ablities at the helm of the veseel
(21) O But what does it actually say?
(22) A can't recall from the specific -
(23) Q Can I help you? Steers in confined waters?
(24) A Steers in contined waters
(25) Q Now there is an \(X\) mark in the column opposite steers in

\section*{Voㅣ 193129}
) confined waters correct?
A That \& correct
Q Now let me go up here to this part so we know what that \(X\) mark means The third column in from the left does that say above normal?
A Yes, sir
Q Going back then to this block this \(X\) mark being the
third in from the left you rated him as above normal?
A That s correct
Q All right
Now in your practuce or in the practice of the people who do these evaluations like yourself is it appropriate or do you from time to time make comments?
A Yes, sur
Q And if the comment has to do with his steering where would you put that comment?
A Ta the right of where the box is for boxes for the \(X\) are as you can see on this form
O I munderining the comment section opposite steers in confined waters What did you put there?
A Steers well to pilot s orders
Q Now you used the word pilot \(s\) there Does that have a specific meanings?
(24) A That s correct
(25) Q Does that mean that Mr Kagan was steering with a pilot
(1) aboard?
(2) A That s correct
(3) Q In pilotage waters?
(4) A That scorrect
(5) Q In confined waters?
(6) A Yes, Bir
(7) Q And your comment was that he steered well to pilot 8
orders?
(9) A Yes, sir
(10) Q Now this - this concerns one aspect of the job for which
(L) he was being evaluated correct?
(12) A That's correct
(13) Q Now let 8 go to some other aspects because some of your
(14) comments were not that favorable and let s bring those out
(15) The second item on the list has to do with quantrty of
(16) work is that correct?
(17) A That's correct
(18) Q And opposite that you wrote this comment - would you read
(19) that for the ladies and gentlemen of the jury? It 8 not -
(20) doesn t come through very well

A Volume of his work is borderine
(22) Q And underneath that you make another comment What is that?

A Bob must be supervised constantly
(25) Q And then underneath that another comment is what?
(1) A Tends to detract from productive operations
(2) \(Q\) And then under that you say he acts quickly on counseling
(3) correct?
(4) A That e correct
(5) Q Let 8 go to the second page of this evaluation Now this
(6) is the page where you talk about the employee s strengths and
(7) weaknesses correct?

A That s correct
(9) And at one point you mention that At times and with (10) supervision Mr Kagan is a productive member of the deck
(1) force correct?
(12) A That's correct
(13) Q And then on down here you say that he must learn to (14) concentrate to maintain his attention span and then later you
(15) say he needs to avord being a distraction and become more
(16) productive?
(17) AThat s correct
(18) Q Now tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury what were
(19) you referring to here in respect to Mr Kagan s needing
(20) supervision maintaining his attention span and avoiding
(21) distraction?
(22) What did Bob Kagan do that caused these comments?
(23) A Bob tends to like to talk to people, a great deal, as a (24) matter of fact And in his work area, should someone wander
(25) through if for any reason he would tend to go off of the job

Vod 193132
that he was assigned and tend to talk to that individual whether that person wanted to be talked to or not thus not only reducing his productivability [sic], also the person that he was talking to That was basically the gist of that description
Q All right Now at this time - in 87 and I think in 84
also - Mr Kagan was wanting to be able to sall as an
able bodied seaman right?
A That s correct
Q And for that reason and because of these - well strike that
For that reason did you make a comment about whether he was ready to sall as an A B in the summer of 19877
A Yes, I did
Q And that comment I munderining right now you said he s not ready at this time to sail as an A B7
A That seorrect
Q Now what was the reason that you made that comment?
A Because I felt that Bob at that time was unable to fulfili
the duties as able seaman and he should continue in the
position as ordinary seaman continue his training
Q All right Now let s talk a little bit about this tour of
duty with Mr Kagan and this evaluation and this ship What is
the Exxon Charieston?
A Exxon Charleston is a clean products carrier carriea

\section*{Vol 193133}
refined solvents and lubricating oils on the East Coast to porta in the Gulf of Mexico all along the east coast of the United States
Q All right And at any given time how many different clean
products would the Charieston be carrying say in the summer of

19877
A On average, about 30 and could be as much as 35
O And it makes port calls all up and down the East Coast?
A That s correct
Q Would you compare the work aboard the Charleston with
the - or can you compare the work aboard the Charleston as
compared with a crude oll carrier that trades between Valdez
Alaska Benicia or San Francisco Long Beach or Panama?
A I would say that the work and the workload and the demands
(15) on an Individual on a clean producta carrier are greater than that than on a crude cill carrier
Q What about steening?
A The demands on a helmsman would be greater on the East
(19) Coast, the clean products carrier, due to the fact of the more
(20) numerous port calle and the more narrow channela
(21) Q Would you compare stearing in the Mississippi River with (22) steering on the Pacific runs?
(23) A Yes, the Mississippi River demands Ifeel a greater
(24) degree of concentration it le less forgiving of errors
(25) Q All right Now let me ask you about the way that a watch

Vol 193134
1) Officer and a heimsman relate when they re doing their jobs
2) A All right
(3) Q Whose job is it to give the commands?
4) A Whaever has the con and closed - in a channel or narrow
5) channel or a river it would be the pilot

Q Either the pilot or the watch officer or let s call him
the conning officer - or her the conning officer?
A That s correct
Q What happens when a conning officer gives a command to
the
(10) helmsman?
(11) A The heimaman repeats back the order to him and then follows
(12) out the command
(13) Q What is the responsibility then of the conning officer?
(14) A Conning officer responsibility, utmost responsibility is to
(15) make sure that that order was followed out correctly
(16) Q All nght
(17) Now is that just a good idea or is that a common practice
(18) or a necessary practice on board any ship?
(19) A That is a vital practice aboard any ship
(20) Q Are there heimsmen who make mistakes?
(21) A Yes sir
(22) Q What kind of mistakes are made?
(23) A Misunderstanding the order or going the wrong direction
(24) with the wheel or not hearing him
(25) Q All right is that the reason then for the

Vol \(19 \quad 3135\)
responsibility being placed on the conning officer to ensure
that the order is being carried out?
A Yee sir
O Does the helmsman have any say so about that order when
stop when to start when to do it?
A No, sir
Q Now is that what you would call a close super -
supervised activity?
AYes, sir
Q In other words when a heimsman when an A B or ordinary seaman is at the helm he is required to be closely supervised
-
A Absolutely
Q-correct?
Is there a difference with respect to commands giving -
given to a helmsman between a rudder command and a course command?
A Yes sir
O What is the difference? What sa-tell us what a rudder
command is
A A rudder command is simply a order to bring the rudder
to a
(22) specific angle and hold -
(23) What is required what do you have to do in order to pull
(24) that Off?
(25) A You give the order to the heimsman of right ten left ten

Vol 193136
whatever it may be He repeats it he goes to that angle as
represented on the rudder angle indicator, and then he repeats
3) back that the order has been done, and that is it
(4) Q Does the helmsman do anything other than put it on that
) number that \(\mathbf{s}\) given himn night or left? Is he required to do (6) anything else other than just keep it there?

A A good helmsman - and I venture to say it may not be
(8) required, but a good helmsman would notify the bridge that the
ship is beginning to turn or is passing a certain number on the
(10) compass
(il) O Okay I - I beg your pardon I was asking with respect to (12) the heim
(13) After say if it s right ten degrees after turning if to
(14) the ten does - is he required to do anything else other than
(15) Just hold it on that ten?
(16) A No, sir
(17) \(Q\) is he allowed to do anything else?
(18) A No, sir
(19) Q Other than hold it on that ten?
(20) A No, sir
(21) \(Q\) All right
(22) Now a course order though is different What is that?
(23) A Course order is when the pilot or the conning officer would
(24) direct the helmsman to bring it to a particular number on the (25) compass heimsman would repeat that and depending on how the

\section*{Vof 193137}

\footnotetext{
(1) pilot wants that done the pllot would say, Bring it over
(2) smartly or easy, which would be, you know, quickly or slowly
(3) He would follow through and bring the ship over to that
(4) course
(5) Q And once having gotten it to that compass heading does the
(6) heimsman have further responsibilities?
(7) A Just to matntain that course Other than that, no
(8) Q And if the current or the wind causes the ship to vary from
) that course he has to get it back on there right?
A That s correct
Q On his own?
A That s correct
(13) Q Now in the situation where Mr Kagan would be at the helm
(14) and you were the conning officer do you have an opinion as to
(15) whether or not Mr Kagan needed extra supervision in that
(16) particular setung?
(17) A No sur he did not
(18) Q Could you compare Mr Kagan to other helmsmen who salled
(19) with Exxon as far as steering ability?
(20) A He was a little above average
(21) Q Now could you compare sallors who salled with Exxon with
(22) those who sall for other companies or for other entuties like
(23) the Coast Guard or the Navy or something like that?
(24) A Yes, sir I belleve they re above average
(25) Q Exxon sallors?
}

Val 19.3139
(1) dermatitis caused by exposure to paint - paint thinner, 1
(2) believe
(3) Q He had a history of problems including sinus problems (4) allergy problems hay fever vision problems hearing problems
(5) Isn that right?
(6) A I munaware of those
(7) Q I was interested when you were testifying about your
(8) evaluation that you made the comment Kagan must learn to
(9) concentrate to maintain his attention span Do you recall
(10) that?
(11) A Yes, sir
(12) Q And Kagan is not ready at this time to sail as an A B?
(13) A Yes, sir
(14) Q Do you recall that?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q Now Exhibit 69 which is in front of you is a coliection
(17) of evaluations?
(18) A Yee, 8 Ir
(19) Q And Mr Kagan was evaluated at various times according to
(20) Exhibit 69 by a fellow named McDonald Do you know him
(21) Michael G McDonald?
(22) A Yes sir
(23) Q And he was evaluated by a fellow named George Maynard

Do
(24) you know him?
(25) A Yes, zir
O And he was evaluated by a David Witherall Do you know
him?
A Yes sir
Q He was evaluated by a Rafael Rojana (ph) Do you know
A Yes sir
Q He was evaluated by you and evaluated by Bill Regan do
know him Willam Regan first engineer?
A No sir
Q And he was evaluated by Michael Stalzer who came here
testried and Stalzer s evaluation didn thave him as
above avarage steerer are you aware of that?
A No sir
Q Are you aware of any of the evaiuatıons that are in Exhibit
\(69 ?\)
A Other than mine, no, sir
Q Were the contents of Exhibit 69 or these other evaluations
made avalable to you?
A No sir
Q Were they kept from you?
A Yee, sir
Q And indeed do you know why the other evaluations were
from you?
A No, sir, other than proprietary Informetion
Q Would it surprise you to find out that the other
evaluatıons with regard to steering were not favorable?

\section*{Vol 193141}

MR SANDERS I ll object to that both as a
mischaracterization and he s already brought out that there s
no foundation for asking him that question
THE COURT Sustained You can ask specific
questions
MR O NEILL 1 II ask some specific questions
BYMR O NEILL
Q McDonaid rated Kagan as cannot rate in the following
areas steering in confined waters were you aware of that?
A No, alr
Q That isn t consistent with your evaluation was it?
MR SANDERS lobject to that Your Honor That -
the testimony is that he asked Mr Kagan about that at the
deposition that he didn isteer in confined waters That s
why he couldn t rate him
MR ONEILL I II try another one
THE COURT Try another one
BYMR O NEILL
Q David Witherill said Needs to practice steening in
confined waters before steening as A B Ware you aware of that?
A No sir
Q He had an attention span problem?
AYes, sir
Q What is the difference between being an ordinary seaman and

Vol 193144
1) A He s got an \(X\) in the box above normal 25
(2) What do the other boxes say?
) At the bottom of the page?
(4) Yeah The general categories reading from left to right?
) \(A\) The first box says outatanding 10 Next to that to the
(6ight is high, 20 Box that he has checied is above normal
2 25, followed by normal, 30 , and below normal 35 , and
) 1inally inadequate, 40
Q Okay let s go to the next one
(10) He asked you about Mr Witherill Would you look in the
(11) evaluation of Mr Witherill the next one down?
(12) A l see it, sir
(13) Q What box does he check under steers in confined waters?
(14) A Cannot rate
(15) Q What does cannot rate mean?
(16) A That he has not
(17) Q in the evaluation system at Exxon?
(18) A That he has not had the opportunity to observe that
(19) operation
(20) OAll right
(21) Go down to the next one He mentioned Mr Rojana

A Yes, sir
Q Under steers in confined waters on Mr Rojana s
evaluation what does it say?
A There is an \(X \ln\) cannot rate

\section*{Vol 193145}
Q And is there a comment?
A Yes sir
Q What does it say?
A Not observed
Q And then the next one down is yours right?
A Yes, sir
Q And then the one beyond that is by Mr Regan Wiliam
Regan?
A Yes, sir
Q Is there a block on this evaluation which says steers in
varying - various conditions and situations i e confined
waters heavy weather et cetera?
A Yes, sir I see it
Q Have you found that?
A Yes, sir
Q is there anything marked in those blocks?
A No sir They're all blank
Q Now you were also asked by Mr O Neill about whether
evaluations were kept from you correct?
A Yes, sir
Q Remember that?
A Yes sir
Q Now when you answered that question were you reterring
the time when you were on the vessel?
A No sir I m talking about at all times

Q And is there a comment?
A Yes sir
Q What does it say?
A Not observed
Q And then the next one down is yours right?
A Yes, sir
Q And then the one beyond that is by Mr Regan William
Regan?
A Yes, sur
O Is there a block on this evaluation which says steers in varying - various conditions and situations ie confined waters heavy weather et cetera?
a Yes, sir l see it
Q Have you found that?
A Yes, sir
Q is there anything marked in those blocks?
A No sir They're all blank
Q Now you were also asked by Mr O Neill about whether evaluations were kept from you correct?

\section*{A Yes, sir}

Q Remember that?
A Yes sir
Q Now when you answered that question were you referring
the time when you were on the vessel?
A No sir I mialking about at all times

\section*{\(\begin{array}{lll}\text { Vol } & 19 & 3146\end{array}\)}
(1) Q Now when you were on a vessel were you given these
(2) evaluations past evaluations to look at?
(3) A Absolutely not
(4) Q Is that what you mean by kept from you?
(5) A Yes, sir
(6) MR SANDERS No further questions
(7) THE COURT Thank you sir you may step down
(8) THE WITNESS This Exhibit 69 should I leave it up
(9) here?
(10) MR SANDERS Give it to Mr O Neill
(H) MR O NEILL We ll give it to the jury
(12) MR SANDERS Give it to Mr O Neill and let him read
(13) it
(14) (The Witness Stepped Down )
(15) MR LYNCH I get to take us back to the deposition
(16) trall Your Honor Call Commander Steven McCall by
(17) deposition
(18) THE CLERK Was that last name McCall or Call?
(19) MR LYNCH McCall
(20) THE CLERK Would you raise your nght hand please?
(21) (The Witness is Sworn)
(22) THE CLERK For the record state your full name
(23) address and spell your last name please sir
(24) THE READER My name is Gary Howard Haney spelling is
(25) HANEY Address is 6411 South River Road Tempe Arizona
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vod 193147 \\
\hline (1) & THE CLERK Thank you sir \\
\hline (2) & DIRECT EXAMINATION OF COMMANDER MCCALL \\
\hline (3) & BY MR LYNCH \\
\hline (4) & Q Commander McCall you like this tue my wife gave me? \\
\hline (5) & A i would llke to have one just llke it myselt \\
\hline (6) & Q I had to get that in the record \\
\hline (7) & THE COURT I was going to comment on it if you \\
\hline (8) & didnt \\
\hline (9) & MR LYNCH My wife is in the room Your Honor \\
\hline (10) & THE COURT Then I won t say what I was going to say \\
\hline (11) & BY MR LYNCH \\
\hline (12) & Q Would you state your full name for the record? \\
\hline (13) & A Steven Alexander McCall \\
\hline (14) & Q Commander would you describe your education let s say \\
\hline (15) & beginning with high school? \\
\hline (16) & A I went to Archbishop Malloy High School In Kew Gardens \\
\hline New & \\
\hline (17) & York 1961 to 165, and then I went, upon graduation of high \\
\hline (18) & school I went to the State University of New York Maritime \\
\hline (19) & Callege at Fort Schuyler from 65 to 69 and then Coast \\
\hline Gu8 & \\
\hline (20) & In 1969 and stayed in the Coast Guard for 22 years \\
\hline (21) & Q And what was your next assignment after that? \\
\hline (22) & A Vaidez Alaska, commanding officer for the marine satety \\
\hline (23) & office \\
\hline (24) & Q All nght So do you recall the date of your retirement? \\
\hline (25) & A July 1 st, 1991 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Vol 193148
Q And you retired with what rank sir?

\section*{A Commander}

Q What was your position in Valdez when you arrived position or posituons?
A Okay, I was the commanding officer of the marine safety
office, which also included captain of the port and
responsibilitios for Prince William Sound, the otficer in
charge of maritime inspection for the Valdez marine inspection
zone, and there was various maritime defonse zone
responsiblities, basically wartime or time of conflict roles
Q With regard to the VTS - and I m going to be as I said
focused -
A Okay
Q - in large part on VTS for my questioning Before you
came aboard in Valdez other than the career we have traced
did you have any other - any specific orientation to the
Vessel Traftic Service responsibilities either shortly betore
you arrived or shortly atter you got there in terms of
refresher traming orientation whatever?
A Formal training, no Familiarization training from the -
(21) from the prior commanding officar, Mike Cavette, and obviously
(23) to what their duties were, what their thoughts were on their
(24) duties And somewhere along the line, I can't remember
(25) exactly, but I dld attend a course, I belleve down there in

Vol 19-3149
Alameda on radar, on radar therapy application
Q Theory?
A Theory, excuse me, theory application I know that - I know it was after I arrived at Valdez
Q What was the overall purpose of the Vessel Traffic Service in Valdez?
A The purpose of the VTS in Valder was to assist the vessels
(8) in arriving and parting safely In aimplest terms it was to keep two shipe from meeting in the Narrowe it was well (10) recognized that ships could not see through the mountain and
(11) see who was coming through the other side elther into the port
(12) or out of the port, so a system had to be eatablished to ensure
(13) that basically vessels didn t meet in the narrows and take (14) precautions to avoid that from happening
(15) Q Now if vessels - by vessels meaung in the narrows do you (18) mean collisions?
(17) A Oh, yes, or running aground to avoid a collision or running
(18) aground as a result of trying to avoid a collision, put it that
(19) way
(20) Q Okay recalling the discussion we had about the objectives
(21) of preventing groundings on the one hand or collisions on the
(22) other what would you say was the principal objective of the
(23) Traffic Separation Scheme with respect to groundings versus (24) collisions?
(25) A Well, the Tratlic Separation Scheme was designed to keep

5-27-94
VOLUME 19
Vol 193150
) the traffic separated, separated vessel trafic separated
Q Wasn t then the principal objective of the Traffic
Separation Scheme to prevent collisions?
A lt was to keep the ships a diatance apart to avoid them in
becoming situations where they would have to take evasive
actions to avoid each other which could result in a collision
or grounding or near miss
Q Okay What were the elements that made up the Vessel
Traffic Service in Valdez? What were its parts?
A Well, the most-used parts was the radio network, where
-
spoke to the ships while coming - you know, prior to coming into Prince William Sound They had various check-in times and
(13) check in locations to let us know where they were, where
they
(14) were coming in, and then that was aupplemented as the veasels
(15) approached the Valdez Narrowe with a radar site at Potato Polnt
(16) and a radar site at the apit site in Valdez
(17) Q What was the designed range for the radar covening Valdez
(18) Arm?
(19) A I don \(t\) know the technical status of what the radar
(20) coverage is
(21) Q What was your understanding of what the area was that was
(22) actually covered in general?
(23) A Before the grounding, routinely, my best answer would be
(24) routinely In the vicinity of Bligh Reef
(25)

Q Okay Are you famitiar with the Vessel Traffic Center

Vol 193151
manual?
Alwae
Q In Valdez what was generally the traffic center manual?
A it was a publication put together for the peraonnel in the
veasel traffic control center to 1 gueas you d say explain
) their dutles and give them some potential scenarios and
altuations as to what might go on during their watch, an
Inhouse document designed for their use
Q Would you consider it to be a fair authoritative source
for information about something like the operating objectives
of the Vessel Traftic System?
A in conjunction with the other documente, you know other regulations, the marine safety manual guldance, it wes not a atand alone document
Q Let me ask that this document be passed to the witness
This is enclosure 16 from the \(O\) Donovan report and I believe
It \(s\) Exhibit 101 PX 101 in this case which is the edition of
the VTC manual that was in effect at the tume of the
grounding
Commander the first page of that document is a cover
letter from yourself isn tit?
A Yes, I signed the cover letter yes
Q And that s a letter dated November 219887
A Correct
Q And did that place the manual into effect as of that date?
Vol 193152
(1) AYes
(2) Q Was this the edition of the VTC manual that was in effect
(3) at the tume of the Exxon Valdez grounding in March of 1989 ?
(4) A I believe so, yes
(5) Q Would you turn to page 21 Would you just read into the
(6) record Section 43 2-just the title and the first sentence 7) would be sutficient

A Section 432 reads, Operating objectives the principal
objectives of the TSS is to prevent collisions. The rules (10) themselves are sufficient to control the vessel movement within
(11) the iraftic lanes during routine transits Active control
(12) should bekept to a minimum uniess deviations or potential
(13) confllcts are observed
(14) Q When did you first learn of the grounding of the Exxon
(15) Valdez?
(16) A i guees a littie after midnight I guess the phone rang at
(17) home, woke me up
(18) Q Going back to your conversation with Mr Blandford was
(19) that basically it in substance what you have told us?
(20) A Yeah, I spoke - he told me we had an exchange about -

Are
(21) you kidding, \(f\) think - I think his phrase was 1 mas serious
(22) as heart attack, and then I said, All right contact the XO
(23) get him up tell him I ll swing by and pick him up on the way
(24) in
(25) I may have told him then or after I got to the office to

\section*{Vol \(19 \quad 3153\)}
(1) notity the other people, Mr Delozier Mark Delozier, I don \(t\)
(2) know who else but within \(\operatorname{l}\) fair amount short order most
(3) people were contacted elther at my direction or at the XO s or
(4) Delozier s direction
(5) Q You are saying that you or either somebody at your
(6) direction notfied those others And then what did you do (7) next
(8) A Proceeded Into the office myself and Falkenstein I picked
(9) him up and we drove in, you know trying to get our thoughts
(10) together as to how the heck could a ship end up where it ended
(11) up uniess something - something drastically was wrong And we
(12) got to the office and -
(13) O What happened when you got to the office?
(14) A Went upstaurs probably proceeded directly into the Vessel
(15) Traffic Center I don \(t\) know my exact words but What s going
(16) on what shappening what sup, and - and we, you know
(17) looked at the radar and saw the image of the Exxon Valdez
in
(18) the vicınity of Bligh Reet, you know basically broadside,
(19) broadside to the channel or the inbound lane
(20) I don \(t\) know whether or not Blandford was already on the
(21) horn talking to Captain Hazelwood whether or not I - well,
(22) It \(s\) on the tape I m sure whether I instiated the call to
(23) Captain Hazelwood or to the ship at the time I didn t know
(24) who the captain of the ship was at that time
(25) Q Before we get to that call with regard to the question or

5-27-94 VOLUME 19
Vol 193154
xamax(33)
(1) questions you asked when you first came in the door did you
(2) ask Mr Blandford what was happening what was going on?
(3) A I'm sure I did yeah
(4) Q What did he say in response?
(5) A I don t recall his exact words, but he showed me, you know,
(6) It sover there, and I, you know, I wes - I was - probably
(7) showed surprise and shock at How the heck did he get over
(8) there You know, at the time it was - my concern was what
(9) kind of situation we had with the ship, you know, how dit -
(10) how it got there, how it ended up at the time didn't reaily,
(11) you know cross my mind What crossed my mind was an event,
(12) actually it was - well, It was what © the status on the ship,
(13) you know, are we aground or are we hard aground There is
a
(14) blg difference
(15) Q So is it your recollection that - let me withdraw that
(16) question
(17) Did you discuss at this ume with Mr Blandford whether he
(18) had made any observations of the vessel before the grounding?
(19) A I don trecall We talked about it sometime, but at
(20) that - you know, prior to contacting the ship and during those
(21) Initial minutes I don think I asked too many questions about
(22) how it got where it was My main focus was, you know is
(23) what \(s\) the situation now that - now that it s where it is
(24) Q Commander I moing to read you from a transcript of a (25) press conference in Valdez on March 251989 This was Exhibit

\footnotetext{
Vol 193155
(1) 26808 to the larossi deposition in this case - and it s
(2) predesignated document 134 counsel 1 mgoing to be looking
(3) at page 53 page 53 line 191
(4) Your answer continues but to answer your question
(5) specifically once that vessel had cleared the pilot station
(6) and was entered into the traffic lanes departing he was not
(7) under constant radar coverage as were all the other vessels in
(8) the area He was in an area where he has entered - as he
(9) dropped the pilot the distance from bank to bank was over
(10) three miles and - there s an inaudible entry the sound I m
(11) not sure what the next word is looks like stand - standardize
(12) or something like that - standardize it over six miles
(13) Speaker Are you saying then that he couldn t see the vessel
(1a) on radar then commander?
(15) ANo
(16) Q No 1 mreading - no 1 m not saying that Speaker what
(17) are you saying then inaudible inadequate
(18) Commander McCall No the vessel at the point in time
(19) after the pilot had departed the radar watch unit did not have
(20) the vessel under its constant radar survellance after he had
(21) entered into the traffic stream and was departed Prince William
(22) Sound
(23) Speaker May I ask you why?
(24) Commander McCall it s not mandated not mandated
(25) according to the EPS I think probably VTS traftic rules
}

\footnotetext{
Vol 193156
Speaker If it was under survellance probably couid have
avoided this whole situation?
Commander McCall I wouldn t say that
Do you recall making those statements at a press conference in Valdez on March 2519897
A In general terms, this is the tirst time I have actually
seen a transcript of whet was said
Q I want to -
A I was very tired
Q Pardon me sir?
A Never mind nothing
Q Do you recall making those remarks?
A I remember the press conference and I remember having exchange of question and answer with an individual stting
(15) In the audience who I didn't know at the time
6) Q Do you have reason to doubt that you said what I read to you?
A I believe I said words - yeah, I believe I said these
words There some inaccuracies in them
Q But the thrust of what you said -
A Given the intenaity level of the day, it e not too bad
Q I m going to show you another transcript and I would like to have this marked as the next numbered exhibit This is predesignated document 221
Before we look at this Commander are you saying about the
}

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT out

\section*{Vol \(19 \quad 3157\)}
(1) previous transcript that we looked at that you misspoke in some
2) way didn \(t\) mean to say what you said there?
(3) A No basically I said what was sald there was aaid I
imagine, 1 m sure in all honesty But other ihings were on
my
(5) mind at the time and i felt I d answered the Individual s
(s) question, you know, satistactory enough at the time without getting into great detali
Q Up to the tume of the Valdez grounding and around that time in March of 1989-of 89 was it the responsibility of the
(10) watch stander to discover that a vessel had gone outside of the
(11) boundary of the TSS?
(12) A That phrase sounds famillar, Ilke it's written in some
(13) publlcation, so i vaguely recall it
(14) Q Is your answer yes?
(15) A Yes I recall the phrase you used it triggers a thought (16) that a in either the umer's menual or some inetruction, so 1 (in) would say yes, that's correct
(18) Q Is it the responsibility of the watch stander to discover a
(19) vessel that has gone outside the TSS?
(20) A Within his capabilities, yes
(21) Q Now if a-if a watch stander should become aware that a (22) vessel within the VTS area is standing into danger what is the (23) responsibility of the watch stander to do in that case?
(24) A lt he saware that the vessel is standing into danger?
(25) Q Yes sir or suspects it

Voㅓ 193158
(1) A Well, it he suspects it or he s concerned about the
(2) progress of any vessel, whether he sees it visually you know,
(3) or if he saw it on radar, it would be to inquire what the
(4) vessel is up to you know, what are the vessel's intentions
(5) Q Does the watch stander in that situation have the authority
(6) to direct the vessel to get back in the traffic lanes?
(7) A Authority common sense whatever
(8) Q Under the provisions of -
(9) A He should, yes I say he should
(10) Q How far out was the responsibility of the VTC on the night
(11) of the Valdez to attempt to keep the image of the - I m not
(12) sure this is a correct transcription but I II read it as it 8
(13) typed How far out with the responsibility of the VTC on the
(14) night of the Valdez to attempt to keep the image of the Exxon
(15) Valdez on radar?
(16) A Port Valdez Narrows and Valdez Arm untll the veasel (17) Until the image was lost in the arm
(18) Q As far as you could track it?
(19) A Welf, through the arm I mean, once they got out, even -
(20) even if you could cover them further out what was the (21) beneflt?
(22) Q As far as Bligh Resf?
(23) A Yeah I think the phrase we normally used was the vicinity
(24) of Bligh Reef, and again some of that depends on congestion
(25) traffic, what s more important if you got traffic in other

\section*{Vol 193159}
(1) parts of the port, then, depending on the congeation or lack
of
(2) congeation In Valdez Narrowe, Valdez Arm, you may not pay
(3) attention to that one because you ve got other traffic in
(4) Valdez Narrows or in port
(5) Q Was there any other traffic in the system in the areas
(8) you va just referred to during the Exxon Valdez \(s\) outbound
(7) passage past Potato Point?
(8) A I don't belleve so, no
(9) Q Well let me ask you this Was Mr Taylor required to
(10) contunue to attempt to hold the vessel on radar past Rocky
(11) Point?
(12) A Was he required to attempt to hold it on radar? What do
(13) you mean to attempt to hold it on rader? You mean make
(14) edjustment to the screen to see If it would remain on the
(15) scope?
(16) Q Yes sir
(17) AYee
(18) Q Commander you said a few moments ago that your pnncipal
(19) focus when you arnved at the VTC was the status of the vessel
\({ }^{(20)}\) and in particular you were concerned with whether the vessel
(21) was aground or hard aground and that was an important
(22) distinction in your mind between the two How long after you
(23) arrived at the VTC did you contact the vessel with that in
(24) mind?
(25) A l'd sey almost Immediately As tar as trying to contict

Vol 193160
(1) the vessel and I did - spoke with Captain Hazelwood
(3) you spoke to him during this conversation?
(4) A Not happy
(5) Q What gave you that impression?

A Very serious, you know, as expected I mean he came
across to me like a master who was concerned with - with
his
ship Yeah, that just he was concerned with the ship and was
(9) passing the information I didn t you know think much into it other than he passed on the information
(11) Q Did he sound calm to you?
(12) AYes
(13) Q Did he sound like he was in control of himself?
(14) A Yes Like I said the perception I had was that he was in
(15) control but something was going on with the third mate I
(16) didn t know whether the third mate was injured or, you know,
(17) getting overly nervous whatever, but something
(18) Q What was your perception of what Captain Hazelwood was
(19) attempung to do with respect to the - with respect to
(20) determining the status of the vessel that is the aground
(21) versus hard aground?
(22) A At the time it was kind of like you know he may have (23) Just been in a situation where he may have been just you know
(24) in his mind he may not have felt like he was hard aground and
(25) he was trying to assess Well am I on it or am I not am I

Vol 19 3161
going to sllde oft, if I m going to slide off the reef I d rather slide off with my hands on the sticks where I still have some power before ishut down the engines and worry about salvage
So that was you know my thinking the comment about rocking or whatever it was iforgot the particular words Basically wanted to make sure of what you ve got Theres nothing worse than thinking you re aground and all at a sudden
you know you re FWE and all of the sudden you re finished with
(10) the engines and all the sudden the ship starts to shift on you
(11) or alip and you ve got no - you know no control over the events So that sasically when you know at the time that kind of - that sall that went through my mind Q FWE?
A Finished With Engines Basically all stopped you know
Q What would be the problem with having the engines off in a situation where the ship was coming off the reet?
A Well in my opinion it a like it in fact you d shut down the engines or had no one in the immediate vicinity of the engines to take poaitive controi and be able to put motion on
the vessel then you are basically at the mercy of the elements, whatever they may be
(23) Q Commander McCall my questions are going to relate to some
(24) text on page 14 You might want to look at the first couple of
(25) pages and familiarize yourself with the document I m just

Vol 193162
(1) trying to determine if you recognize this as a transcript -
(2) A Yes, I do
(3) Q - of your radio conversation with Captain Hazelwood?
(4) A Yes
(5) Q And is this the conversation to which you referred in your
(6) colloquy with Mr Carey that you had to determine what the
(7) ship how the ship was doing?
(8) AYes
(9) Q is it correct that you concluded as a result of this
(10) Conversation that the captain was attempting to verity that he
(1i) was whether he was merely aground or whether he was hard
(12) aground?
(13) A Correct
(14) Q That - that was your understanding of what the captain
(15) told you he was doing correct?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q Did you consider that to be a reasonable thing in fact a
(18) prudent thing to do under the circumstances?
(19) A Yee, I did
(20) Q My question to you really as you look back on that
(21) conversation and the efforts of Captain Hazelwood relating to
(22) that conversation do you have any difterent view today as to
(23) What Captain Hazelwood was trying to do?
(24) A No
(25) Q This is a February 1990 article from Life Magazine You

\section*{Voㅓ 193163}
(1) were authorized to give at least some interviews in connection
(2) with your duties with regard to the Valdez grounding?
(3) A You mean as far as guidance trom the Coast Guard?
(4) QYes sir
(5) A Yes, I was pretty much to fully cooperate with everybody
(8) O See there is a numbered - there is a paragraph numbered
(7) three numbered three about haltway down the page?
(8) AYes
(9) Q And that s entitled the hours after the wreck?
(10) A Okzy
(11) Q Let me read into the record let me read this into the
(12) record Number three the hours after the wreck Hazelwood is
(13) accused of teaning a bigger gash in the ship and making the
(14) spill worse by running the engines Coast Guard Commander
(15) Steven McCall backs the captain open quote He was trying to
(16) assure himself the vessel was hard aground says McCall
(17) Continuing the quote He didn to anything reckless
(18) unquote Do you recall saying these words to a reporter about (19) around this time?
(20) A Yeah, I don t recall talking to this reporter, Pope Brock
(21) The words and phrases seem anmilar to something I may

\section*{have ald}
(22) earlier in - you know, earlier on in the casualty, yes
(23) Q You have reason to believe you re not being quoted
(24) accurately here?
(25) A Do I have reasons to belleve? No I don thave any reasons

Vol 193164
to belleve that I m being quoted accurately elther I mean it sa toss up, 50/50 whether I m quoted accurately or not from
(3) the reporter
(4) \(Q\) After looking at this does it refresh your recollection
about whether you were quoted back in this time period as
saying Captain Hazelwood didn i do anything reckless?
A l seid words to that effect, yes, early, you know, sometime during this I mean, obviously not February ' 90 when this was
done, I wasen \(t\) even there, but during this stage of the casualty, probably yes
Q Do you feel any differently today?
ANo
Q Can you recall did you recall expressing the opinion in
mid 1989 that the allegation that Captan Hazelwood had been
15) dnnking as far as being a cause of the grounding was just
16) smoke?
(17) A I may have expressed that, yeah
(18) Q Just look at the face of the page of it page one
(19) Commander Do you \(\mathbf{s e e}\) the date of this record of phone
(20) interviews on Monday July 117
(21) AUm hum
(22) Q Does that comport with your recollection when this
(23) occurred?
(24) A That would be about right I left a few days later
(25) Q And did you go on to say I mean that s the whole cause of
(1) the problem 193165
(his smoke about Hazelwood had been drinking and
(2) Hazelwood had done this and Hazelwood had done that period
(3) The biggest mistake Hazelwood made was having too much
(4) conference in his third mate and leaving the bridge when he
(5) thought the third mate could steer it out of port
(6) Do you recall saying that?

AYes
Q Was that your view at the time?
AYes
10) Q i ve handed the witness a transcript of what appears to be
(i1) his file of documents produced for this deposition and ask that
(12) it be marked as Exhibit 47276 This is a six pege transcript
(13) that appeared in Captain - Commander McCall \(s\) box of
documents
(14) produced in response to the subpoena
(15) Are you ready Commander?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q Have you seen this transcript before?
(18) A This one here?
(19) Q Yes How did the creation of this transcript come abort?
(20) A I don't recall specifically
(21) Q You told us yesterday that some transcripts from VTC
(22) telephone recordings were made in your office at your
(23) diraction is this one such transenpt?
(24) A Can you repeat that?
(25) Q You testified yesterday that some transcripts of telephone
conversations on the recorded innes in your office were made at
(2) your direction by others within the VTC and I masking you
(3) whether this is one such transcript prepared in your office?

A l can t say for aure
(5) Q If you turn to page six you see there s a - there s what
appears to be the beginning of a transcript with a time code
over it halfway down the page quote call to GS-9 end quote
Taylor
A Yea
(10) Let me ask you this Do you know whether this was the
(11) entire-six pages of transcript that appeared in your
12) documents? Do you know whether there are more of this
(13) particular set of pages?
(14) A No Idon i know
(15) Q Looking at the transcript that appears at the bottom of
(t6) page six do you recall whether you have ever reviewed it
(17) betore I mean the one that says call to GS 9 Taylor and what
(18) follows?
(19) A I can t recall apectilcally, but I probably did
(20) Q Okay Would you read for the record beginning about
(21) halfway down beginning with where it says Un she said she
(22) was going slow down to the word lanes about four lines
(23) below - I m sorry down to the word did tive lines below
(24) A Okay I see He starts out by saying, uh, she said she
(25) was going slow because she was picking her way through Ice

\section*{Vol 193167}
(1) Yeah And she was - and she way - wae golng to divert to the
northbound lane Right
(3) Q And the next two lines?

AOh
(5) Did she ever requeat to leave the lanes? Uh, they sald
(6) they wore going to, yeah, ase matter of finct they did

Q Now at the time you reviewed this transcript the one
you re looking at now was it your understanding that the
speaker for the line uh they said they were going to yeah
(10) as a matter of fact they did was Mr Taylor speaking to you?
(11) A Yes
(12) Q Do you have any reason to doubt the accuracy of this
(13) transcript with respect to the lines that we have just read
(14) that you ve just read aloud?
(15) ANo
(18) Q Okay I m going to pick up near the bottom of that first
(17) page?
(18) A Which document?
(19) Q I m - only 47276 not the government transcript
(20) A Oh, 275 then
(21) Q 275 you are right Defendants transeript
(22) Taylor quote They said they were going to depart the
(23) TSS Those are his exact words end quote
(24) McCall quote Oh depart the TSS yeah That \(s\) the
(25) separation scheme end quote
(1) Taylor quote But he did not say the lanes he said the
(2) TSS He sald depart the TSS on 200 I believe was his -
(3) inaudible end quote
(4) McCall quote On 200 Ends quote
(s) Taylor quote Right end quote
(6) McCall quote Okay This is when he was in the
(7) northbound lane end quote
(8) Tayior quote He had just dropped off the pilot when this
(9) happened that \(s\) when he calied me He said he - and says he
(10) called me back up and says he s going to divert over uh into
(II) the northbound lane and that looks like the way to come
(12) through That \(s\) what I told him earlier that they d come up
(13) through the northbounds That s what the last guy did The
(14) southbounders got over in the northbound lane end quote
(15) McCall quote Yeah yeah but it sounds like he went out
(16) of the northbound lane is what happened
(17) Taylor quote Oh okay
(18) Okay does that refresh - does that passage refresh your
(19) recollection further about your discussion with Mr Tayior (20) about whether the Valdez had requested to depart from the TSS?
(21) A Okay, this is not a yes or a no answer This brings back
(22) memories, recollections of conversations to this extent 1
(23) mean, you know, on the subject matter from various sources that
(24) I can recall, voice tapes were later, you know - Captain
(25) Hazelwood type of thing Simplest way to describe it

\section*{Vod 193169}
(i) obviously I read the rest of this document while discussions
(2) were going on if you imagine three lanes one two and three
and four lines one two three and four I mbeing careful
with I mon camera All right separation scheme, TSS,
separation, separation The operative word is separation as
in -as people used it Separation, the lane in the middle,
going down a three lane highway with your car, right lane left
(B) lane the left turn lane whatever you want to call it the middle versus lines or lanes
(10) But there s no curb in the water if we had a curb aut (11) there, he would have felt a bump when he went over the curb
(12) Anyway, what he ssaying here but he did not say lanes he (13) said the TSS the lanes did not say leave the lanes but leave
(14) the TSS separation end up in the inbound lane That is my (15) recollection uh what he meant by this that with everything (16) else that I can recall
(17) Q Did you become aware that vessels were deviating in
(18) February March 1989 time frame were deviatıng either within
(19) the lanes you know in the - from the southbound lane into
(20) the northbound lane into the separation zone or outside the
(21) lanes completely because of the ice situation in Valdez Arm?
(22) A You re putting a lot of caveats into this To the best of
(23) my recollection I can recall that the vessels had deviated -
(24) you know crossed the lanes or transited across the lanes you
(25) know on occasion during the whole time I was there You know
(1) I mean, on occasion, vessels - vessels would deviate and go
(2) outside lanes to pick up a pliot on the inbound lane So yes
(3) It was It was - vessels were known to be crossing throughout
(4) the lanes on and off, occasion, yes
(5) MR LYNCH I believe the cross will be by video Your
(6) Honor
(7) MS WAGNER Cross will be by video Your Honor
(8) CROSS EXAMINATION OF COMMANDER MCCALL

BY PLAINTIFF EXAMINER
(10) Q Was there a period of time following the grounding when you
(11) were under the impression from looking at the statements of Mr
(12) Blandford and Mr Taylor and your interviews with them that one
(13) of those two possibilities I mentioned was in fact the case
(14) that is that the vessel had gone off the edge of the six mile
(15) screen and not disappeared from it?
(16) A it la my recollection that's - that the lmage was - was
(17) orratic and Irregular on the six mile seale during Mr

Taylor :
(19) watch, not - not to mention in here was Taylor's comments that
(19) he attempted to acquire the target on the 12 mile scale, could
(20) not and therefore was not on the screen any longer
(21) Q I m not sure that I understand your answer Were you under
(22) the impression that the image should not actually disappear
(23) from the six mile other than traveling off its edge?
(24) A I don think that thought process about disappearing off
(25) the edge or disappearing from the screen came - came into play

\section*{Vol 193171}
(i) as far as a distinct difference between the two The image was
(2) no longer reliable on the radar screen It was fading in and
) out is was unreliable Whether it was off the edge of the
(4) screen or diaappeared from the screen, the image was unreliable
(5) in Taylor's mind
(6) Q Did you ever discuss with Mr Taylor whether he tried to
make any adjustments to the - either the six mile scate or the
12 mile scale the radar while he - the scale was turned to
either six-or tweive?
(10) A I can t recall whether I did
(11) Q Did you ever talk to Mr Blandford about whether he made
(12) any adjustments to the radar for turning it up from six mile to
(13) twelve mile immediately after he received the report of the
(14) grounding?
(15) A l can trecall
(16) Q And the transcript identifies Captain Deppe as being an (17) employee of Exxon Shipping corporation Did you know Captaın
(18) Deppe prior to this occasion when he questioned you?
(19) A Yee
(20) Q And did you know him to be an Exxon Shipping Corporation
(21) employee?
(22) A Yes Well, I mean backtrack on that 1 knew him to be a
(23) master I believe, you know - I belleve he wat employed by
(24) Exxon
(25) Q Okay Captain Deppe asked you the question the following
(1) question quote Commander McCall the Exxon Valdez is a VLCC
(2) a very big beam very high structure Whether it was abeam of
(3) the radar or astern to the radar it seems like it should be a
(4) pretty big radar target Is it possible that Mr Tayior
(5) just - once it got beyond the six mile scale just stopped
(6) monitoning the vessel and didn it really lose it on the radar
7) screen?
(8) And your answer according to the transcript was no is
(9) that still your view today?
(10) A Yes
(11) Q Let me ask you to look at page 1358 of the same
(12) transcript At this point in the proceeding you were being
(13) questuoned by Dr LeResche Dr LeResche asked you down toward
(14) the bottom of page 1358 Did Mr Taylor in fact grant
(15) permission for the Exxon Valdez to leave the Trafic Separation
(16) Scheme enturaly?
(17) And you answered No he did not it was never requested
(18) Is that still your view today as to what the facts are? -
(19) A Yeah
(20) \(Q\) - in that regard?
(21) AYe
(22) Q Mr Taylor by the way was he - is that the Mr Taylor
(23) who is a watch stander at the Vessel Traflic Center?
(24) A Yes
(25) Q Let me direct your attention to page 1362 of this

\section*{Vol 193173}
(1) transcript of your testimony at the National Transportation
(2) Safety Board where you were asked by Commander Waldron quote
(3) Is there anything in the VTS is there anything that the VTS
(4) could have done that would have prevented the grounding?
(5) And your answer was No is that still your view today?
(6) AYes
(7) Q Sitting here today Commander McCall do you believe that
(8) anything that the VTC watch standers Mr Blandford and Mr
(9) Taylor did or did not do on March 231989 contributed in any
(10) way to causing the grounding of the Exxon Valdez?
(11) ANo
(12) Q I want to take you back to the - the morning of the
(13) grounding and you previousiy have testufied that after you
(14) arnved at the MSO in the morning after being awoken you sent
(15) Mr Delozier and Falkenstein to the vessel is that correct?
(16) A Correct, yes
(17) Q Once Mr Delozier and Mr Falkenstein arrived on the
(18) vessel did you have any conversations with them?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q What was the purpose of that telephone conversation?
(21) A Again, to I guess update me on the situation, and the only
(22) thing I can recall right now is - is the bomb, so to apeak,
(23) that was dropped when Commander Falkenstein said that
(24) apparently the master had been drinking
(25) Q Okay I want to focus for a minute on - on that

Vol 193174
(1) Conversation When Commander Falkenstein informed you of this
(2) fact do you recall what he told you about what he observed?
(3) A Okay As beat as l can recall right now, he indicated
) that in a very deadpan voice that - words to the effect of
Boss, we got another problem And I said, What sthat And
he
said The master's been drinking And I-probebly said, Oh,
shit or words to that effect
O Did he tell you how he determined that the master had
allegedly been drinking?
A By the aroma of alcohol in the vicinity of Captain
Hazelwood The arome of - at least that he smelled alcohol
(12) O Let s go back to Mr Taylor On what was your testımony to
(13) Mr Adams based when you said that in your view Mr Taylor
(14) had lost the vessel to radar rather than simply stopped
(15) following it?
(16) A On the information that I received from Mr Taylor
(17) Q What Mr Taylor told you?

A Um-hum
(19) Q Okay You belıeve Mr Taylor?

AYes
MS WAGNER That it Your Honor
MR LYNCH Your Honor we ll call Admiral Paul Yost by deposition
THE CLERK Rase your right hand please
(The Reader Is Sworn)

\section*{Vol \(19 \quad 3175\)}
(1) THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name
(2) address and spell your last name please
(3) THE READER My name is Charles Loggie L o-g-g ie
(4) I live at 4 Hilishire Grove Lane in Houston Texas
(5) THE CLERK Thank you sir
(8) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF PAUL YOST (Read)
(7) BYMR LYNCH
(8) Q Would you state your name for the record sir?
() A Paul A Yoet, Junior
(10) O What is your current business address Admiral Yost?
(11) A 2000 K Street, Northwest, Washington, D C , Sulte 303
(12) Q Are you the former Commandant of the United Siates Coast
(13) Guard?
(14) Alam
(15) Q And what is the correct title by which you are known at (16) present Admural Yost?
(17) A I'm known as Admiral Yoot, yes
(18) Q Admiral Yost I wonder if you d look at - I wonder if you
(19) would take a look at Exhibit 40415 which for conventence is
(20) predesignated document Number 111 I d like to spectically
(21) refer you to the first sheet under the cover sheet of that
(22) document Mr Yost which appears to be a resume or
curriculum
(23) vitae
) Are you acquainted with that document?
) A Yee, that's the - that's a blo and yee, I'm famillar with
(1) it
(2) Q Does it accurately describe your education in the military
service up to the present up to approximately 1989 ?
A I haven t read it recently but I think it does yes
Q And subsequent to that date subsequent to the date of this
document - which for purposes of this discussion we ll assume
was May 101989 which is the cover sheet the date on the cover sheet - what changes have occurred?
A linished my four-year term as a commandant at the Coast
(10) Guard in the end of May 1990 The next day lassumed the (i1) responsibilities and position as president of the James Madison

Memorial Fellowship Foundation here in Washington DC I think that \& the major change or addition to this bio
Q That has been your sole employment since the completion of your -
A it has
Q - your service
Are you currently an active officer in the United States
Coast Guard or is your status Retıred?
A lam currently retired
Q Do you have any current assignments from the Coast Guard in
(22) your retured position?
(23) A l've had no offlicial contact with the Coast Guard since my retirement
(25) Q Admiral Yost I note that on Exhibit 40415 it s indicated

\section*{Vod 193177 \\ that you were chiet of staff and chief of operations for the \\ 17th Coast Guard disirict in Alaska in 1975 How long did that contunue? \\ A l served in Alaska for three years, one of those as chief of operations, two of the remaining two [sic] as chief of stalf \\ Q Sir can you tell me what factors you determined as Commandant of the United States Coast Guard to have caused}
grounding of the Exxon Valdez?
(10) A lformed the opinion that the causal relationship here (11) I'm not sure I m using the term word causal in the legal sense
(12) that - that all of you are used to, so not belng a lawyer, I m (13) treading on thin ground, but in my view, the primary cause or
(14) the causal effect of that grounding was a perfectly quallied
(15) third mate on a bridge of a ship that, through a period of a
(18) fow minutes of Inattention to duty or lack of knowiedge of
(17) exactly where he was, ran the ship aground on a clear night
18) with all the navigational bida watching him That sthe -
(19) that \(s\) the primary cause
(20) Now, there are a whole bunch of secondary causes and (21) everybody spointing their finger Pilotage a man was on the
(22) ship who had pllotage and wasn ton the bridge as required, (23) that maybe would have kept him from grounding I think that -
[24] you know I m speculating now And I don t know whether I
(25) ought to speculate but 1 m wondering it there was a proper
(1) rellef of command that when the third mate assumed the con of
(2) the vessel that the commanding officer, if he fully knew where
(3) he was where he was supposed to turn the speed and course of
(4) the vessel, all of those things Did he fully know all of
(5) those things before he was - the vessel was turned over to
(6) him
(7) There sprobably some secondary responsiblities there
(B) There \(s\) all kinds of secondary and tertiary responalbilties
(9) I come back to the primary cause of that grounding was a
(10) perfectly competent, apparently competent third mate who
for a
(11) period of a few minutes, lost track of the ship sosition and
(12) the proximity of Bligh Reet
(13) Q Sir did you ever look into whether or not the captain was
(14) On the bridge of the ship at the tume of the grounding?
(15) A Well, I looked into it only from the viewpoint that the
(16) Investigations that wore done and the briefings that I was
(17) given said that the master had turned the con of the ship over
(18) to the third mate and the master had gone below to do his
(19) paperwork in his cabin He was available, he was on the phone
(20) when called, he came to the bridge as soon as he was called et
(21) cetera So yes, those - that s my understanding
(22) Q Your understanding is that -
(23) A That the master was in his cabin doing paperwork at the (24) time and had turned the con of the ship over to the third mate
(25) giving him some instruction regarding the iurn point and to go

Voㅓ 193179
(1) out the inbound lane That s my undergtanding
(2) Q Yesterday you testified about your opinion regarding the
(3) causal effect of this grounding Can do you recall whether -
(4) do you recall the testumony in which you stated that you
(5) believe the causal effect to be a third mate who through
(6) Inattention to duty or lack of knowledge of where he was ran
(7) the ship aground?
(8) A That - that was my opinion, atill is, and when 1 say
inattention to duty, lought to \(\mathbf{-} /\) ought to categorize that
(10) with a littie expianation I think that - that he was not
(11) attentive to that part of the duty that required him to know (12) exactly where his vessel was regarding, vis a vis shoal water
(13) and other dangera
(14) Ithink that he was actively engaged in his duty, which was
(15) conning the ship and trying to fix his position and doing a
(16) number of other things, but he obviously wasn \(t\) aware that he
(17) had overshot his turn point And so that is where I mat when
(18) I sald inattention to duty
(19) Q Do you have an understanding as to whether one of the
(20) reasons for requiring the pilotage endorsement in these
(21) particular waters is to make sure that you have a pilot on the
(22) bridge of the vessel who will have knowledge of where the
(23) vessel is and will understand the shoais and so forth that you
(24) Just mentioned?
125) A Well that \(s\) - that s the reason for having somebody on
the bridge who has - who has pilotage for those waters He
would be able to fix his position probably faster than somebody
(3) who didn't have pilotage just because he \(s\) more familiar with
(4) the aid and the area and would know what to look for
(5) I also think that the third mate had made several
(6) transits He just didn't have his 24 transite I don't know
(7) how many he had
(8) Q Following the grounding of the Exxon Valdez in March of
(9) 1989 you had occasion from time to time to comment on the
(io) accident is that correct sir?
(11) Aldid
(12) Q And you testified in Congress -
(13) A Yea, I did
(14) Q-among other places about that?
(15) Aldid
(16) Q Let me refer you to what I think was marked as Exhibit
(17) 40414 If you look at page erght of that document sir let me
(18) first of all refer you to the second sheet of this exhibit
(19) which begins with the words the Whrte House Office of the
(20) Press Secretary
(21) Have you had a chance to look at that sir?
(22) \(\mathbf{A}\) (Nodding head up and down)
(23) Q Admiral Yost do you recall giving or taking part in a
(24) press briefing given at the White House on or about March 30

19897
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Voi 193181 \\
\hline (1) & Aldo \\
\hline (2) & Q And in connection with that did you have occasion to \\
\hline (3) & comment on the navigation existing in the localities where the \\
\hline (4) & Exxon Valdez ran aground? \\
\hline (5) & Aldid \\
\hline (6) & Q Now I return to - refer you then back to page seven In \\
\hline (7) & particular I ask you if you would look at the second paragraph \\
\hline (8) & of the statement attributed to you which reads as foltows and \\
\hline (9) & 1 m now quoting - I being Admiral Yost will look at the \\
\hline (10) & response of the Vessel Traffic Service itself but that 5 a \\
\hline (11) & very wide roadstead Remember we ve got miles of open water \\
\hline (12) & here For that vessel to have come over and hit the reel is \\
\hline (3) & almost unbelievable It s not something that the Vessel \\
\hline (14) & Traftic System is designed to keep vessels from doing You \\
\hline (15) & would need vessel traffic systerns up and down the coast of the \\
\hline (6) & United States if you re going to try to keep every vesmel from \\
\hline 7) & hitting the beach You can t do that \\
\hline (18) & This is not a treacherous area as you people in the press \\
\hline (19) & have called it it is not treacherous in the area they went \\
\hline (20) & aground it s ten miles wide Your children could drive a \\
\hline (21) & tanker through it \\
\hline (22) & Did you make that statement sir? \\
\hline (23) & Aldid \\
\hline (24) & Q The last sentence of that statement your children could \\
\hline & drive a tanker through it Ithink you testified eariter the \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Vol 193182
you recelved some feedback from various sources in regards to ) that comment is that a fair statement?
(3) A Yes That comment was an overstatement it was an obvious
) exaggeration and well there should have been laughter as
it
overstated my position considerably
Q In regards to the remaining portion of that statement do
you still stand by what you said there?
Aldo
Q Now 18 it also your belief that a person who had recerved
a license properly issued by the Coast Guard as a third mate on
a vessel like the Exxon Valdez should have no diffculty
navigating a vessel in that area?
A That was my feeling at the time and it s my feeling at this time as well
Q Did you ever look into whether or not crew fatigue was a factor in the grounding of the Valdez on Bligh Reef?
A Only to the extent that I was briefed on the manning of the
(18) bridge at the time of the accident The fact that the crew
had
19) been working all day and loading the tanker and getting ready
(20) for sea, which is normal, that they had departed Port Vaidez

In
(21) the early evening after dark and had been at sea for - had
(22) departed about three or four hours earlier, prior to the
(23) accident, three or four, so it s likely that any ship that
24) departs the port in the early morning, that there might be some
(25) fatigue in the crew but that is normal operating practice on

\section*{Vol 193183}
I) every Coast Guard ship, Navy ship, merohant ship in the world,
(2) that when the time - when the ship is loaded and it's time to
(3) go, you sall Time and tide walts for no man came out of the
(4) sea, but I m going away - but l'm not aware thaf fatigue was
-
(5) factor in this ship going aground
(6) O Let me refer you to Exhibit 40414 which was the press
(7) release press briefing at the White House on March 301989
) and specifically page 7
(9) When you gave this answer on March 301989 it was your (10) understanding that what you testified here was correct with (11) respect to the nature of Prince William Sound?
(12) A That was at that time and is my optnion of that particular (13) part of Prince Willimen Sound The anawer here indlcated It E
(14) ten milee wide I think at that point, at Bligh Reet, it's
(15) something leas than ten miles, but it savery wide roadetead,
(16) so the impact of what I aaid is stili my opinion
(17) Q So basically if \(s\) my understanding that the area we re
(18) talking about here is the area around Bligh Reof the same
(19) would apply to the whole of Prince William Sound south of Rocky
(20) Point and north of Hinchinbrook Entrance is that true?
(21) A All of that area is relatively wide, most of it ten milea
(22) or greater Yes
(23) \(Q\) And it 5 your testumony that that \(s\) a very very simple
(24) place to navigate very wide?
(25) A That part of Prince William Sound is not treacherous
(1) think was my comment not treacherous and by that I meant
(2) It s very deep, it s very wide, the shores are very steep, so
3) that they paint on it, radar set very well it s from that
(4) point of view that I m talking about
(5) Q is it a correct statement that in saying that you re
really expressing a sentiment that it wasn ta very difficult
place to navigate and it didn \(t\) require any particular
expertise to steer a tanker in that particular area?
A That was my opinion A competent mariner, one who is
(10) qualifled and so licensed ought not have any problem
nevigating
(11) that particular body of water, because it was not treacherous
(12) Q When you say a competent man so licensed would that be
(13) someone with a Coast Guard issued mate s license?
(14) A Yes, it s-
(15) Q Either the third mate second mate chief mate or a master?
(16) A Yes, yes
(17) \(Q\) And they wouldn \(t\) require any particular pilotage
(18) endorsement?
(19) A I dldn tsay that
(20) Q Well I m saying from the expertise required in that
(21) particular area didn \(t\) require any particular knowledge or
(22) paricular expertuse other than what an ordinary mariner would
(23) have?
(24) A What I intended there is that this water was not en
(25) particularly trescherous plece of water, that a competent

\section*{Voㅓ 193185}
(1) mariner holding a mate or a master sicket for a
(2) supertanker size vessel should not have any trouble
navigating
(3) that particular plece of water That was my intention
(4) Q Let me ask you one more question about this exhibit for
(5) the time being one more question I It probably come back to
(8) it At page 1896 -
7) A Okay
(8) Q 69 excuse me This is a briefing paper from \(G M V\) - is
(9) that P?
(10) A Yeah, MVP
(11) Q Marine safety vessel?
(12) A Probably vessel personnel would be the division that would
(13) have cognizance over manning standards perhaps plotage that
(1a) kind of thing
(15) Q And the question was quote The Coast Guard has currently
(16) posed as a quote as current end quote - start over again
(17) I could have skipped that
(18) The Coast Guard currently has a proposed rule making which
(19) If finalized will eliminate the requirement for pilotage on
(20) PWS - meaning Prince Willam Sound - quate between the hign
(21) seas and Rocky Point
(22) Why have you made this proposal? In view of the Exxon
(23) Valdez incident do you feel that this is a good proposal?
(24) And the major points are first quote statutes require
(25) the secretary to designate the waters of Prince William Sound
upon which a vessel will not require a pilot end quote
Do you have a recollection of that statute sir?
A Not specifically the statute but I \(m\) aware of the Impact
of it, yes
Q And that was a statute sponsored by Congressman Young of Alaska?
A I don t know whether Congressman Don Young, that was
his
statute, what Don - the initiative by Don Young in support of
the Alaska Pilots was to eliminate pilotage in that particular
piece of water
Q And that was the water in which the Exxon Valdez evidently
ran aground is that correct?
A think it was That sa very long piece of water and the
Exxon Valdez went aground on a rock in a part of it
(15) Q Okay And that was the part we discussed earier that was
(16) ten miles wide and in many places 500600 feet deep is that
7) right?
(18) A lt was at least at least ten miles wide in many places,
(2) yes
(20) Q And item two of the major points is quote Opinion of the
(21) maritume community and Alaska state pilots is that pilotage is
(22) not necessary seaward of Rocky Point end quote is that
(23) statement correct to the best of your knowledge?
(24) A When you talk about the maritime community I don t know
(25) who all that is But the State pilots went to Don Young, as I

\section*{Vod 193187}
(1) understand, and asked him to propose this They had specific
(2) reasons for wanting to do so and perhaps valld reasons, and
(3) When it went out as a proposed rule making, the Coast Guard put
(4) It out as proposed rule making, I understand that nobody
(s) commented on it That means either the maritime

\section*{community}
(6) didn thave any problems with it or didn t take any notice of
(7) it, it was just not a major issue
(8) Q is it accurate to say that the Coast Guard in formulating
(9) a proposal rule making about pilotage would use its best
(10) judgment the best judgment of its staff and its experts as to
(1i) whether or not pilotage was objectively required is that -
(12) A That s correct And the major input would be from the
(13) captain of the port in the area
(14) O Well my point is - but I guess my point is the Coast
(15) Guard would not simply issue a rule making to elıminate
(16) pilotage requirements on the ground that the Alaska pilots had
(17) some reason for wanting to do it that way?
(18) A No, I think before the Coast Guard would even go out with
(19) an advance notice or proposed rule making that they would have
(20) to feel that there was some justification and they would want
(21) them to get comments from a much wider group, which they
did
(22) Q So the fact that the Coast Guard issued an advanced nouce
(23) of proposal rule making indicates that within the Coast Guard
(24) taking into account the special local knowledge of the captain
(25) of the port it was believed that there was no - that there

\section*{Vol 193188}
were no conditions that mandated the need for pilotage south of Rocky Point
Is that a fair statement?
A No, that s probably an overstatement it would indicate that within the Coast Guard there was no adamant opinion that
we had to have pilotage in this area A suggestion had been made by the pilots association, the Coast Guard was not adamantly opposed and, therefore, it decided to get further input from a much wider range But the Coast Guard mind was
0) far from made up

Q I understand that But I guess my question to you
Commandant Yost is the standard that the Coast Guard would
in deciding whether it the Coast Guard was opposed - as to
whether it was opposed as to whether in it fudgments there
were local conditions that required a pilot to be aboard is
that nght?
A That s - yeah, that s - that a a fair - probably a fair statement
Q I mean isn that the service that a pilot or an endorsed pilot -
A Yes
Q - brings to a ship?
A Yes
Q And the fact that the proposed rule making issue would indicate that no one in the Coast Guard was aware of local

Vol 193189
(1) Condittons that suggested to them the need for a pilot in the
(2) Waters below Rocky Point between Rocky Point and the sea?
(3) A it certainly an indication that, in the captain of the
(4) port's mind, the mind of the office of M at the district level
5) and in the much - and in the mind of the office of \(M\) at the
(6) headquarters level there was reason to believe that they ought
17) to go out with a proposal rule, proposed notice of rule making
(8) and that being that nobody was adamanily opposed within the
9) Coast Guard and nobody saw a major reason why that particular
(10) plece of water would require pllotage, but they needed a much
(11) wider input and it really means they were vanilis on this at
(12) this point and thelr mind was open
(13) Q Admiral do you recall in April of 1989 giving testımony
(14) before Congress which you refer - in which you refer to the
(15) Vessel Traftic System as an advisory system?
(16) A I don ispecifically remember the testimony, but I have
in often described the Vessel Traffic System as an advisory
(18) syatem
(19) Q Would you just explain to us what you mean when you use
the
(20) phrase advisory system?
(2i) A Yes, that the Vessel Traffic System is one more aid to the
(22) master in safety of navigation It advises him It advisea
(23) him of other traffic in the area It advises him of hazarda
(24) that he may encounter It advises him of weather
sttuations,
(25) conditions, fog, it advises him of navigation alde that may be
out, not working properly It advises him of anything that
they - that the Vessel Traffic Center feels would be an
assistance to the person on the bridge of the ohip
O Let me ask to have the next document marked as the numbered
) exhibit
Do you recall making a comparison between the Seattle VTS
and at Valdez yesterday in your testimony?
A I do, and I think the thrust of that comment was that the
Seattle Vessel Traffic System was much more complex and the
(10) reason for that is the Port of Seattle is very busy port
(11) There will be tens of ships in the system at any one time The
(12) Valdez traftic system is the separation scheme is in very open
(13) water in a very little used body of water where it is uncommon
(14) to have even more than one ship in the system at any one
time
(15) let alone tens of ships
(16) Q Have those differences resulted in differences in the
(17) design of the two systems?
(18) A Each system is designed for the port that it 8 in and the
(19) systems that were deaigned for most ports maiched the
(20) complexity of the port
(21) However, in Valdez the system was mandated by law as a
(22) part of the veseel - as a part of the oll terminal it
(23) anything, it was probably an overkill both in coverage and (24) complexity
(25) Take out the word if anything it definitely was an

\section*{Vol 19-3191}
(1) overkill in terms of coverage and complexity
(2) \(Q\) In what way was it an overkill?
(3) A it had a watch system around the clock and redar coverage
(4) of a more dangerous part of the syetem which was Valdez Narrowe
(5) In a system that seldom had more than one major vessel in It 1 It
(6) a time, where you had a three-section watch that sat for hours
(7) and hours and hours with absolutely nothing to do and no ships
(8) In the syetem It was required by law and that's the reason It

\section*{was put in}
(io) Q Would you say that as between groundings and collisions
(i1) there s a higher relative risk of groundings in the Prince
(12) William Sound VTS when compared to the higher tratic VTSs
such
(13) as Seattie?
(14) A Except in Valdez Narrows, it is very difficult to go
(15) aground in the reat of the syatem It a very deep water The
(16) water falls off precipitously right next to the beach, the
(17) shore It a very difficult to put a ship aground In open water
(1a) Ilke that, notwithetanding it was done In the Exxon Valdez
(19) case It salso, when there are almost no other ships in the
(20) syatem, very dificult to hit somebody So it's a simple
plece
(21) of water where we had an overkill, in my view, of a traffic -
(22) of a Veasel Traffic Syatem and in which we had a terrible
(23) incident, accident that caused the biggest oil spill in the
(24) history of the United States So it's a real - It's a real
(25) problem and that st why we all here agonizing about it, I

Voㅓ 193192
gueas
(2) Q Was it your understanding at the time that you testified (3) before the House subcommittee on April 6th 1989 that the watch standers had no duty to observe a vessel after it had cleared the approach to the Narrows on an outbound voyage?
There s an objection calls for a legal conciusion
When I say duty I mean according to the procedures that were in effect
A it was my understanding of the procedures that were in effect in 1989 that, once a vessel arrived at the pilots station in the vicinity of Rocky Point and discharged the pilot that the procedures of the Vessel Traffic System did not
(13) require padar tracking from that point on out past Bligh Reef (14) and on out past Hinchinbrook
(15) Q Now when you say radar tracking what do you mean by (16) that?
(17) A I mean for the radar to be turned on a scale that would -
(18) that would paint the vessel, would print the vessel postion
(19) and track it out It certainly wasn their procedure to plot
(20) It at thle point They had an automatic data plotter that
(21) recorded digitally the location of the vessel any time it was
(22) under - whether it was in the narrows or whether it wasn t
(23) Q And when you say radar tracking you mean have the radar on
(24) a scale so that the target could be painted?

院
(25)

A Yes

\section*{Vol 193193}
(1) Q Do you mean painted also so that it could be observed by 2) the watch stander?
(3) A ithink, yes, so that it could be observed which could also - also say so that the data plotter whatever that piece of equipment was would in fact record lis position numerically
Q All right Just let me ask this first question Do you recall getting this document?
A don t spectically recall getting it it a document that came directly from Commander McCall directly to me It
(11) was probably the result of one of my visits to the Vessel
(12) Traffic Center where \(I\) expressed some surprise and concern at
(13) the change in procedures and, as a result of that asked
(14) Commander McCall it he would write me a memo tracing through
(15) the changes sunce I had not had any contact with this system
(16) since 1977 This appears to be his response to that and it
(17) appears to have come directly to me and I have no doubt but
(18) that I got it because some of the things here are at least
(19) Vaguely familiar
(20) Q It \(s\) unusual in its form isn it without any Coast Guard
(21) organization designations at the top?
(22) A it a unusual in that it was a memo directly to me not
(23) through the chain of command and would only have happened had I
(24) specifically requested it
(25) Q All right

5-27-94
VOLUME 19
Vol 193194
\(\operatorname{xMax}(43)\)
) A Or if the officer felt that something was so important that (2) he needed to talk to me directly That wasn the case I most
(3) certainly requested this for this to have come to me

Q Let me refer you to the document that Mr Carey referred
you to last week Exhibit 40430 it s predesignated document
100
Now is it your understanding that the procedures followed
by the watch standers on the night of the grounding were in
accord with the requirements Commander McCall sets forth in
hus
(10) memorandum?

A The memorandum states hat the watch stander was still required to track all participating vessels out to the Bilgh Reet buoy area. He just did not have to record the six minute fixes That is Commander McCall s description of
requirements on the watch stander
Q Is it your understanding that that practice was followed on the night of the grounding from your observation in the Vessel
Traffic System when you were there?
A I'm not sure The watch - 1 m not sure. The watch
atander reported that he was unable to track the vessel out
to - out to Bilgh Reef and was not tracking the vessel out to
Bligh Reef I think the watch stander sasd that he didn t have
(23) the radar even on the scale it was going out there, because
he
(24) didn thave a requirement to plot the vessel out that far

Whether the data plotter was on or not I don \(\mathbf{t} k n o w\), and

\section*{Voㅓ \(19 \quad 3195\)}
(1) Whether the data plotter works when the radar is on a different
(2) scale, I don iknow
(3) Q What about the monitoring requirement that Commander McCall
(4) sets forth in his memorandum?
(5) A You re asking me to interpret McCall \& memo to me I don \(t\)
(6) remember how I interpreted it at the time except to feel that
(7) this wasn the way that I now wanted to operate the system
(8) He was trying to tell me how the syatem was operating and
he
(9) seems to be saying that the watch stander did not have to plot
(10) the vessel but he had to track the vessel because he had a
(11) radar watch on the vessel Tracking is not a term that ifully
(12) understand here particularly when he says in other parts of
(13) the memo that the reason they put in the plotter is so if the
(14) watch ofticer had to take a radio call, he wouldn t mise any
(15) data points Which Indicates that the watch stander had
other
(16) things to do besides watch the radar scope
(17) So what he meant by tracking apparently, does not mean
(18) watching the radar scope He stalking about the radar
(19) tracking the vessel but there was no six minute plot
(20) required That show interpret this memo to me
(21) Q You interpreted this to mean that they weren i required to
(22) Observe the vessel on radar after Rocky Point is that correct?
(23) A No, 1 said that's the - my perception of the underatanding (24) of the watch stander McCall sunderstanding was that the radar
(25) would be on and the vessel would be tracked, but that there

Vol 193196
wasn ta requirement to plot it Neither a requirement for the
watch officer to sit and watch the radar continuously as the vessel went out
Q So it appears there s some discrepancy between what McCall
) is looking for and what the watch standers understood they were
required to do?
Al-that may be an appearance
Q You say that the Vessel Traffic Service did not have a
plotting requirement but based on McCall s memorandum to
you
(10) they had had a monitoring or tracking requirement correct?
(1) A His feeling was in his memo as I read it, that they had a 2) tracking requirement That term, he doean idefine, and I can
(13) only assume in the way he uses it and in the context that it
(14) does not involve manual plotting, that it involves the radar
(15) tracking the vesael while the watch officer attends to his \({ }^{(16)}\) dutles, whatever they might be, including watching the radar
(17) but not solely watching the radar That s how I interpret his memo
(19) Q Admiral let me refer you to enclosure 16 of the \(O\) Donovan
report which is the manual in effect at the ume of the
grounding and specifically to Chapter 4 Section 441
(22) That \(s\) a part of Exhibit 3512 that we offered this morning
(23) Your Honor
24) Your answer?
(25) A Well, given that understanding, this - the operative

\section*{V여 193197}
sentence in Section 41 on page 19 is quote, In certain
clrcumatances recommendations will not be sufficient and it
will be necessary for the Veasel Tratfic Center to direct or prohlbit vessel movement, end quote
Now, let me explain that a little in context with what I just said Most vessel traffic centers do not contemplate and
(7) the United States do not contemplate rudder commands What
(8) they contemplate, as it says here and I quate again to direct
or prohibit vessel movement, end quote and that a normally
(10) meant to tell the vessel to Do not proceed into a certain area
(11) that may have a danger in it and that would be the direction or
(12) prohfbiting They might even direct the veasel to atop and
(13) anchor, but if's never been consldered that they would give
(14) rudder commands for the veseel
(15) I don't know that that a impertent, but go ahead
(16) Q Well the preceding sentence says that the VTC should
(17) recognize potential trouble spots and recommend any practice
(18) which could result in danger of collision or grounding?
(19) A Yes, I agree with that
(20) Q if the watch stander were plotting or tracking the vessel
(21) While it is in the system and it were to see the vessel were
(22) standing into danger did the watch stander have an obligation
(23) to advise the vessel of the fact that it was standing into (24) danger?
(25) A if the watch stander was aware that the veasel was teanding
(1) Into danger he had an obligation to inform the veasel of the
(2) situation and even to recommend action If the veasel the
(3) master or the watch officer on the veasel disagreed he was not
(4) to become argumentative he was to make recommendations if he
(5) became aware that the danger exiated He wan then to inform
(6) the officer of the day at the Vesad Traffic Center or at the
(7) MSO that he had made a recommendatlon, the master had not
(8) agreed and was not taking them

That s my understanding of the system
(10) \(Q\) is it also your understanding that the watch stander had an
(11) obligation to direct the vessel to stand away from that danger
(i2) as opposed to just recommend it?
(13) A Enlarging the testimony I just gave, the watch stander had
(14) the responsibility to inform the master it he felt the master
(15) was standing into danger or entering a dangerous stuation and
(16) he had the obligation to make recommendations to the master how
(17) to mitigate that danger
(18) O The answer continues
(19) A There s been a discussion an argument from the very
(20) inception of Veseel Traffic Services in this country what the
(21) miselon of that Vessel Traffic Service was, as far as directing
22) the master or the vessel It's pretty widely accepted that
(23) rudder commands are not given by the Veseel Traffic Service
(24) Information is given to avoid hazards, but that the person
(25) on the bridge of that vessel is far better able to make a

\section*{Vol 193199}
(1) deciaton on actual maneuvere than the Veasel Traffic Service
(2) MR LYNCH I have about this much Your Honor
(3) BYMR LYNCH
(4) O Okay let 8 go to page 18 which is the one previous to -
(5) A I got it l'm there
(6) Q Okay under VTC directions the third example down it states
(7) as follows quote Trenton this is Valdez Trafic Our radar
(8) shows you 100 yards to the left of the traffic lane inside the
(9) separation zone You are directed to take corrective action
(10) Over end quote
(il) is that the type of recommendation you are relerring to?
(12) Mr Klinckhardt says Let me -
(i3) A lt is This is an illustrative example of the kind oi
(14) direction that the Veasel Traftic Syatem might give, and the
(15) following paragraph ie an explanation of the worde, quote,
(16) directlve, end quote So this example says, quote, Our radar
(17) showe you a hundred yards to the left, you are directed to take
(18) correctlve actlon, over, end quote
(19) It daesn tsay, quote, You are directed to stop, quote it (20) doesn \(t\) say You are directed to stop, you are directed to take
(21) right full rudder It doean t say, You're given direction to (22) drop the anchor it tells him to take corrective action
(23) Now, the direction in the next paragraph ls explained, (24) quote, Watch etanders are not fo argue or try to convince a (25) master that the orders are necessary However, if the master

Vol 193200
disagrees, no further attempt should be made to justify the
action taken and the OD should be contacted end quote
MR LYNCH This would be a good place to stop Your Honor
THE COURT We il take our second recess ladies and
gentiemen We ll be in recess now for 15 minutes
(Jury out at 12 02)
(Recess)
(Jury in at 12 17)
THE COURT Could I see Mr O Nelll and Mr Lynch
behind the cabinet please
(At side bar off the Record)
THE COURT We have a couple of questions from one of your jurors One of the questions is in substance and I may be paraphrasing it too grossly but is - basically how come there are so many deposituons But believe me these attorneys and I know how difficult it is to de attentive to depositions it s not the best way to take testimony We all know that But there a couple of problems that these people have to deal with one of which is that this court s subpoena powers - that is the power to require someone to come here and testity - in a civil case doesn \(t\) reach past the
23) boundaries of the state of Alaska I can trequire somebody to
(24) come from New York or Washington or whatever if they don t want
(25) to come So the attorneys have to go there depose them and

\section*{Vol 193201}
we wind up reading and you wind up listening to a deposition
(2) In some instances there are federal regulations that have to do with whether or not you can subpoena Government witnesses That s probably the case that we re up against here there s-l think there s probably a government regulation that precludes Admiral Yost from being here to testity or anybody else from the Coast Guard to testify So we had to use depositions There just wasn \(t\) any choice about \(\boldsymbol{I}\)
As to the second question about readers being from out of
state Frankly there are a lot of people on both sides of the case who are in town from other places who are working on the case and it \(s\) simply people who happen to be handy who are working in some way or another on the case otherwise who are being used as readers
Mr Lynch
(17) MR LYNCH We didn t leave the office early enough
(18) Your Honor Pick it up with the examination of Admiral Yost (19) BYMR LYNCH
(20) Q Okay Are you aware that the Coast Guard in Valdez had
21) been for some years routinely authorizing deviations from the
(22) traffic lanes from the assigned iraffic lanes?
(23) AYes
(24) O As a result of ice coming down into the lanes from the (25) glacier?
(1) A I maware that deviations were authorized by the Vessel (2) Traffic Service
(3) Q My question was are you aware that those deviations were (4) authorized routinely?

\section*{A Yes}
(6) Q The last question I have about your tes - I have about
) your testimony to the House committee on April 6th is about
(8) your statement quote I am not convinced however that the
(9) vessel could not have been tracked had the procedure directed
(10) that it be tracked
(1) What did you mean by that?
(12) A meant by that the area of Biligh Reel and that far out the
(13) arm If you will, that far out, the radar tracking is not - my
(14) understending was that it was problematical whether you could
(15) be able to track a ship that far out it would depend on how
(16) well the radar was picked up it would depend on whether it
(17) would
(18) It would depend on the aspect of the vessel but it might be
(19) possible that, had the watch officer been plotting thls vessel
(20) all the way out, that he might have been able to track it
(21) When you re plotting a vessel on radar every three minutes you
(22) can sometimes pick up a target on radar that, if you haven \(t\)
(23) been piotting and you just walked over to the radar, you
(24) wouldn t see because you wouldn \(t\) know about where to look and
(25) that - that littie echo you re getting back is that target you

\section*{V여 193203}
(1) had been tracking
(2) So I wasn t convinced that it coutd not have been tracked but neither was I convinced that it could have been We re out
) at the extent of the radar sange and it going to be very problematical out there That was my understanding
Q Did you have an understanding whether the vessel was visible immediately after the grounding when the watch stander came back and looked for it?
A it was my understanding, when he got the

\section*{communications}
(10) report that the vessel was aground that he walked over to the
(11) radar, it was either on the 12 mile scale or the - an upper
(12) scale or he filipped it on the upper scale, and it was my
(13) understanding he furned it to the upper scale and the vessel
(14) was clearly visible on Bligh Reat
(15) Q Now did you not - did that not indicate to you that the
(18) vessel could have been seen shortly prior to the grounding had (17) the same maneuver been carried out?
(18) A I was told that it was vislble because it was abeam aspect (19) and therefore I would assume had it been going out the channel
20) sideways he certainly would have been able to track it But it
(21) wasen \(t\) It was going out with an end on stern aspect, and my
(22) understanding was that it was very difficuit to plek up targets
(23) at that range, but that was what was reported to me and I was
(24) just kind of regurgitating what my understanding was at that
(25) time

\section*{Vol 193204}

Q All right Are you familiar with a buoy in that area the Bligh Reef buoy?
Alam
Q Do you know how big it is approximately?
A it s very small compared to any aspect of a supertanker
It \(s\) more the size of a - a fishing vessel
Q if the Bligh Reef buoy were visible on radar would you
conclude that an end on tanker could be seen on radar?
A I would
Q In the same area?
A Yes I would
Q Inasmuch as we have testimony that after the grounding that Lieutenant Blandford rather Mr Blandford at that time
swithed the scale was able to observe to determine whether or not he could observe the vessel after it was reported to have
been grounded he testified that he was able to see the Bligh
Reef buoy at that time at that point in tume Would it be a
safe assumption that if he had been able to see the Bligh Reef
buoy he should have been able to - should have been capable of tracking the vessel up to that point in tume?
A ti a my underatanding, my feeling, that if you can see a lighted buoy on the radar scope, you would be able to see a ) supertanker in an end on or any other aspect the asme range
(24) Q As of 1989 Admıral Yost did the United States Coast Guard
(25) have in place any programs for united - for Coast Guard

\section*{Vol 193205}
(1) officers or enisted persons who had substance abuse problems?
(2) A What year?
(3) Q As of 1989?
(4) A Yes
(5) Q What was that program?
(6) A Program for substance abuse within the military

\section*{personnel}
(7) within the Coast Guerd was broken down into basically two
(8) areas, one, alcohol, and that policy was basically to afford
(9) the person it he was addicted to alcohol or an alcoholic to
(10) attend a substance abuse program to rehabilitate him or her, as
(11) the case may be I ve agonized the same way sbout somebody
(12) recovering from alcohol problem and you have - and you
(13) rehabilitate them and you bring them back on duty and you sit
(14) there as the aeparate leader and decide dollet thle guy go
(15) back to his job or do I ruin his life and his career when he s
(16) just made a great effort to be rehabilitated, and it sa very
(in) difflcult corporate decision
(18) With drugs, the position of the Coast Guard was not to
(19) attempt rehabilitation Anybody who was found using drugs
(20) would be discharged from the service
(21) Ol assume when you say drugs - well strike that With
(22) reference to alcohol what career effect did an individual 5
(23) obtaining rehabilitation treatment have on their future
(24) assignments in the Coast Guard if any?
(25) A lt was the intention of the top management of the Coast
(4) back and in fact had gotten rid of his abuse problem
(5) I can say that at least in most case this was in tact
the case And there is at least one fiag officer who went to
the program prior to being setected for flag and so it was -
certainly didn thurt his career
Q Was advanced to a flag office after a flag -
(10) A Yes
(11) Q - what do you call it rank?
(12) A Yes yes it was a very successful program in those who (13) successtully completed it but there was some, there was a
(14) fallure rate as well but the feeling was that in druga that
(15) the fallure rate would be so high that it was not worth the
(16) rehabilitation effort and so we separated those people from
the
(17) service
(18) Q Did your policy for providing rehabiltation for Coast
(19) Guard officers have any provision with regard to respecting the (20) Confidentiality of those who elect to take part in the program?
(21) A That was the Intent to provide confidentiality I would (22) say practically it was very difficult to do that for a person (23) suddenly to diasppear trom hls unit, go into what we will call,
(24) quote, the dry dock quote, for several weeks and then to
(25) reappear at his unit without somebody saying, Where have you

Vol 193207
(1) been what's going on
(2) So though confidentiality was maintalned up to a point, it
(3) wes not - it was not perfect
(4) Did the Coast Guard -
(5) Ol think that \(S\) me
(6) A Oh, that syou
(7) O Did the Coast Guard have a policy for random testing of
(8) rehabilitated alcoholics?
(9) A When a person went through rehablitation and came back to
(10) duty, the Coast Guard did not put them in I separate category
(11) so they joined the reat of the forces and the random -
(12) randomness of the test put them at riak for tests ase well, but
(13) I don't remember that we gave them apeelal inereased
(14) randomness on the teat or anything
(15) Q Do you know if any attempts were made to monitor the
(18) sobnety of recovering alcoholics while you were Commandant
of
(17) the Coast Guard?
(18) Al don t remember whether we had a program of monitoring the
(19) rehabilitated people or not I |ust don tremember
(20) Q Sir? -
(21) A We may have had
(22) \(Q\) - I wanted to clanfy something I minrough with the
(23) report
(24) You told Mr - one of the plaintiffs counsel that there
(25) was a requirement in the Coast Guard with respect to its own

Vol 193208
) personnel for random testing and I believe your testımony was
(2) there was a requirement for random testing for drugs and
(3) alcohol When did that requirement go into effect?
(4) A Very shortly after I became - very shortly after secretary
(5) Samuel Skinner became secretary - well, before that before
(6) that, must have been very shortly after I became commandant
(7) Somewhere around 86 is my memory
(8) Q Did the requirement implement random testing for those two
(9) different classes of substance and I mean non alcohol drugs
(10) and then alcohol at the same time?
(11) A Do you mean were the teats done at the same time, both
(12) drugs and alcohol?
(13) Q Let me rephrase the question
(14) Did the requirement for random testing for drugs and the
(15) requirement for random iesting for alcohol go into effect at
(16) the same tume?
(in) Aldon tremember First I don think - I may have
(18) misspoken myself, I don't think that thare was ever a random
(19) testing or alcohol I don think you can really random test
(20) for alcohol it s done on an incident basis
(21) MR LYNCH That completes our deposition examination
(22) Of Admıral Yost Your Honor
(23) MS WAGNER Your Honor our cross will be by
(24) videotape
(25) CROSS EXAMINATION OF ADMIRAL PAUL YOST (VIdeo)

\footnotetext{
BY PLAINTIFF EXAMINER
Q What I d like to do first Admural is direct your attention to Exhibit 40420 which was predesignated document
225 I believe it s the rubberband material in the stack of
documents you have there in front of you
A Thanks
Q id ask you Admıral to turn to page 1751 I ve got some
questions about that page
A All right
Q Okay Admiral now to put this document in context I
believe that you testified that this document is a briefing
book that would be prepared for you by your statt for your
review prior to your providing testumony is that correct?
AYes
Q Okay Sol \(m\) sure we re on the same page does the page that you re looking at have the heading VTS Control of Course Recommendations?
A Yes
Q Admural what id like to do is refer you to a portion of
this page that under the heading major points number one
(21) Id like to read some of this into the record and then ask you questions about the information here Underneath that paragraph is the heading answer major points no VTS watch standers are prohibited from issuing specific course speed and rudder orders to vessel operators
}

Vol 193209 and

Vol 193210
(1) In the right hand column I II fust read portions of this
(2) It says The Coast Guard policy is VTS is never to make
3) specific course recommendations The VTS radar should be made
(4) available to the mariner who is having navigational
5) difficulty VTS making course recommendations is not prudent
seamanship The VTS does not take - does not have
immediate - let me begin again
8) The VTS does not have advantage of immediate quote
) on scene info which master and pilot have The VTS only has
(+0) radar info Ship has that and much more The VTS does not
(11) have intimate knowiedge of the vessel s design or actual
(12) handling characterisics and limitations The responsibility
(13) for sate navigation rests with the master
(14) Admiral my question to you 1 understand that this was
(15) put together by your staff Are you in agreement with those points that are out - outlined on page 1751 that I ve read?

\section*{A Yes, I am}

O In specific are you in agreement with those three bullets that I read which give the reasons that the VTS making course recommendations is not prudent seamanship?
A Yes
Q The document contunues on point two VTS control vastly
different from air traffic control The right hand column it
says No comparison valid The VTS may direct a vessel to slow
down or wait to avoid congestion and facility the flow of

\section*{Voㅓ 193211}
(1) traffic VTS never issues heim orders Directions given in (2) terms of specific tume prior to which the vessel should not
(3) arrive at a point of reference And Admiral my question is (4) Just again are you in agreement with the statements contained
() in point two of this paper?

AYes
(7) Q You have previously testified about your position with the Coast Guard at the time that the VTS was initially accomplished in Vaidez and your involvement in that Without going back (1)) through that testimony let me ask you Based upon that
(i)) involvement do you recall whether there was any consideration
given at that time for the VTS to exercise further control over vessels participatung within the system?
A There s been - at the time of Inception of vessel traffic
systems including the initial one which was in Seattie mandated by law there has been a discusslon of how much quote, control, unquote, the Vessel Traftic Services should have over a veasel And although some ayatems have been mandatory and some syatems voluntary, the amount of control has
(20) not changed By mandatory, means the vessel must participate
(21) In the syatem, voluntary means the vessel may participate in
(22) the system if the vessel desires
(23) But regardless of whether a system is mandatory or (24) voluntary, the control has remained the same, which is you (25) don t give rudder orders you don t give speed changes What

\section*{Voㅓ 193212}
you do is - is give times of arrival and advise - advise of
hazards and maybe prevent access to certain areas at certain

\section*{times}

Q And are the reasons for those limitations on a VTS s
control of a vessel the same reasons that we had referred to
earlier on page 1751 of this document that the VTS does not
have the advantage of immediate on scene information that the
VTS only has radar information and the ship has much more
) information and that the VTS does not have intimate knowiedge
of the vessel s design and actual handling characteristics?
AYes
Q Are there additional reasons that you can think of as you st here today?
A I don t think there are additional reasons, however, the all of those reasons are steeped in the tradition that the master or the officer of the deck has full reaponaibility for the navigation of his vessel And that no aid to navigation or
18) pllot or outside radar can relieve him of that responsibility

It sa-it saccountability thing that is steeped in the maritime tradition
Q During Mr Carey s questioning last week you testifted that it was your opinion that nerther the Vessel Traffic
23) Service or the Coast Guard in general had any negligence in the 24) grounding is that correct?
(25) A That may be the exact of my - of my testimony I think I

\section*{Vo 193213}
was a Ittle more specific In saying I didn tsee a causal
relakionship, but maybe I didn tsay that but I don tsees
causal relationship between the grounding and the performance
of the Vessel Traffic Service
At the time, as I fold you, I was very concerned that the Vessel Traffic Service may have in some way contributed to this
(7) accident and for that reason, I asked National Transportation
(8) Safety Board to Investigate the accident so if the Veasel
) Traffic Syatem had a part in It, that the Coast Guard would not
(10) be investlgating itself In marine board
(11) But after seeing the Inveatigations seelng O Donovan's
(12) study, talking to Vessel Traffic Service commanding officer,
(13) it a my feeling that the Veseel Traffic Service did not in eny
(14) way contribute to the veseel grounding
(15) Q What facts do you rely on to make that conctusion?
(18) A That the vessel was in clear water on a clear night with
(17) all of the aids to navigution watching properly, that it had on
(18) the - on lia bridge a competent third mate who should have
(19) been able to navigate without any problem in that kind of an
(20) area, and it had aboard a master who held pllotage In that
(21) area, and who had e requirement to be on the bridge

Somebody
(22) is at fault when a ship goes aground, in this case, it is not (23) the Veasel Trafflc Service
(24) MS WAGNER That concludes the cross Your Honor
(25) MR CHALOS Good atternoon

Good atternoon Your Honor
THE COURT Mr Chalos
MR CHALOS I m happy to report to you and to the
Jury I have a live witness Having said that watch me annoy
him now The defendants called Julius filights to the stand -
that is your first name isn f it?
THE WITNESS Yes
(The Witness is Sworn)
THE CLERK Please be seated
For the record sir state your full name your address and spell your last name
THE WITNESS Full name is Julius Herman Leitz Leitz
spelled Leitz imfrom Portland Oregon
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JULIUS HERMAN LEITZ
BY MR CHALOS
Q And 1 forgot the Herman You go by the name Mick Mick Lertz?
A That s correct
Q I don t blame you
What s your occupation?
A I ma heavy marine aalvor
Q How long have you been a marine salvor?
A l've been in the salvage industry for about 35 years
Q Are you an owner of a company that does salvage work?
A Two companies that do salvage work
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{3}{*}{Vol 193215
Q What s the name of those two companies?}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{7}{*}{\begin{tabular}{l}
Leitz and Associates Incorporated And then I malao owner \\
of Fred Devine Diving and Salvage, Incorporated \\
Q What does a manne salvor do? \\
A Marine salvor goes to the atd of any kind of a voasel that sin trouble it includes groundings sinkings, fires all manner and form of dietress that floating objecte can get themselves involved in \\
Q You were the salvage master for the Exxon Valdez were you not? \\
A That s correct \\
Q In your career how many vessels have you salvaged from groundings colisions strandings? \\
A Approximately 150 vessels of consequence \(I\) ve done
\end{tabular}}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{many jobs on small vessels}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{Q When you say a hundred and fifty vessels of consequence what do you mean?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{A Well, the larger-type veasels, traighters and bulk carriere, tankers drill riga, that type of thing} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{Q How many - how many tankers have you salvaged in your carser?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{A Four, Including the Exxon Valdez} \\
\hline & \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Vol 193216
A In excess of 20
Q And how many of those were tankers?
(3) A Two - two of them That sincluding the Exxon Valdez
(4) Q You - you salvage vessels all over the worid parts of the world?
A) Well, not all over the world There s an economic

Ilmitation as to how far I can go I ve been as far west as
) Guam I ve done several jobs in Guam, quite a few done work
(9) in Mexico and as far east as Trinidad

Q And have you done work up here in Alaska?
A Quite a bit of work in Alaska
(12) Q Now in the salvage jobs that you were involved with did
(13) you ever have occasion to use the vessel s engines?
(14) A Yes, I do use a vessel sengines if the engines are
(15) operatlve and it the vessel in fact has engines
(16) Q And the rudder?
(17) A And the rudder
(18) Q Mr Leitz based on your experience what is the
(19) traditional way of removing a vessel from a grounding a vessel
(20) that has grounded going ahead?

A About 90 percent of the time vessela that run aground under power are extracted in the same direction that they ran
(23) in in other words they go in forwards they go out backwards
**
(24) Q So if you re using the vessel s engines and rudder to get
(25) the vessel off the ground if you will that has run aground

\footnotetext{
Vol 193217
going forward you would back up?
A That scorrect
Q Now in connection with your salvage job on the Exxon
Valdez when did you arrive in Alaska for that job?
A On Easter Sunday I belleve it was the 26th
Q Where did you go?
A I went to Exxon soffice at the hotel there in Valdez
Q When did you first get out to the ship?
A My naval architect arrived on Tuesday and that s when
(10) went out to the ship
(11) Q That would have been the 28 th?
(12) A Yes
(13) Q Between the 26th and the 28th what did you do?
(14) A Well after I arrived in Valdez I met with a lot of the
(15) Exxon people and reviewed blueprints of the ship and fust
(16) gathered data about a \(\mathbf{1 6}\) hour \(\mathfrak{m}\) day basis and polished
(17) salvage plan or made the pretty complete outline of it, you
(18) know subject to a littie modifications as you learn more
(19) the vessel as time goes on, but that was all - and order
(20) equipment and order people to come up to participate
(21) Q All right Was part of the information that you received
(22) some soundings that s had been taken at the request of Captain
(23) Hazelwood on the 24th of March?
(24) A That \(s\) correct
(25) Q Let me show you those soundings
} we plain up a about
i) Could I have one of those - I ve lost my license to
operate this machine so I m going manually now
I want to show you what we ve marked as Defendants 9171
which I offer into evidence at this time
(Exhibit DX 9171 offered)
MR MONTAGUE No objection
THE COURT Defendants 9171 is admitted
(Exhibit DX 9171 received)
BY MR CHALOS
Q Now I know you didn t get it in this form but you
recognize this don tyou?
A Yes, I do
0 These were soundıngs that were taken at 945 on March
24th
(14) \(1989 ?\)
(15) A Right
(16) Q Can you tell the jury please what we re looking at here?
(17) A Well, that'e - just a rough aketch of the Exxon Valdez
(18) and I beliave some of these were taken by the pilot boat up
(19) there, and what they did was just made a sketch, recorded the
(20) depths of water certain distances out from the side of the
(21) ship and I think this particular on the starboard side -
(22) \(Q\) So this is - now we re looking at the right side of the
(23) ship?
(24) A That seight
(25) Q And I see here these are in feet - right these
soundings?
A Yes
Q Over here looking on the starboard side starting with 19219
around number three three tank?
A wouid say so
Q Three tank forward?
A Yeah
Q We have 35 feet 46 teet 50 feet 50 feet and 60 feet at
the bow?
A Yes
Q That s the piace where the vessel was aground?
A That's where it was hardest aground, that sorrect
Q The ship - because the ship was drawing something like 57
feet at the time she went aground?
A Yes
Q And the general indication from these soundings here the
general indicatuon is that there was shallow water on the
starboard side of the ship am I correct?
A That confirms it yes
Q Now let me show you this is - let me find is this the
same exhitit this is the second page of the same exhibit
9171 What does this depict?
A The same thing on the port aide of the vessel
Q And now we re looking at on the left side of the vessel?
A Yeah, the left side of the vessel
soundings?
A Yes
Q Over here looking on the starboard side starting with
around number three three tank?
A I would say 80
Q Three tank forward?
A Yeah
Q We have 35 feet 46 feet 50 feet 50 feet and 60 feet at
the bow?
AYes
Q That s the piace where the vessel was aground?
A That's where it was hardest aground, that scorrect
Q The ship - because the ship was drawing something like 57
(14) feet at the time she went aground?
(15) AYes
(16) Q And the general indication from these soundings here the
(17) general indication is that there was shallow water on the
(18) starboard side of the ship am I correct?
(19) A That confirms it yes
(20) Q Now let me show you this is - let me find is this the
(21) same exhibit this is the second page of the same exhibit
(22) 9171 What does this depict?
(23) A The same thing on the port side of the vessel
(24) Q And now we re looking at on the left side of the vessel?
(25) A Yeah, the left side of the vessel

Q On this one it looks like it s all pretty good water on the
(2) left side except near the bow right?

A That's correct
Q And the general depth of the water away from the ship is -
is farly deep except for some shallow spots here right?
A That \& correct
Q Okay When you formulated your salvage plan you had this information at hand as well?
A Yes Idid
(10) Q And you took that into account?
(11) A Yes, I did
(12) O Okay Now you got out to the ship on the 28th?
(i3) A Yes
(1a) Q Tell us - tell us what your plan was Tell us how you
(15) salvaged this vessel
(16) A Well, the plan basscally -
(17) Q Can I just interrupt I got ahead of myself
(18) Tell us about the type of damage that you found when you
(19) went out there before - before you formulated your - and put
(20) your plan into operation?
(21) A Okay I was fairly aware of most of the damage to the
(22) bottom of the vessel even before I went out on - on Tuesday
(23) This Information came from diver s reports, they had a diver (24) out there early on and I interviewed him and found out what
(25) part of the ship was actually bearing on the rock We also

\section*{Vol 193221}
(1) took ather soundings besides the ones that were mentioned I
(2) had the ship s crew take the soundings on every trame space
(3) down both sides of the ship and these soundings were all a
(4) proflle was made from them so you could see the relationship of
(5) the bottom of Prince William Sound there in relationship to the
(6) bottom of the ship, and put those two together, the
(7) descriptions of the divers on the area they can see
(8) You got to understand that there a - there was some
(9) \(\mathbf{3 0} \mathbf{0 0 0}\) square foot at the bettom, bottom of the ship that
was
(10) actually in contect with rocks so there was no way for divers
(11) to take a look at that, and that was all on the - in way of
(12) number one starboard tank, number two atarboard tank, and parts
(i3) of one and two center tanke, that's where the ship was actually
(14) reating on the bottom
(15) Q Let me - If I may approach the witness Your Honor I want
(16) to bring over a model it \(s\) Exhibit 154 into evidence This
(17) is a model of the ship Maybe if you can just sort of stand up
(18) and demonstrate tor the ladies and gentlemen of the jury where
(19) where the vessel was damaged and while you de that let me (20) put up one other exhibit
(21) This is the one where - the damage extibit and this way
(22) they can follow along on the schematic as well ithink im
(23) going to have to bring this up a little closer
(24) Your Honor this is Defendant s Exhibit 3581 which 1 offer
(25) into evidence at this time
(i) Vol 193222
(Exhibit DX 3581 oftered)
MR MONTAGUE No objection
THE COURT Defendants 3581 is admitted
(Exhibit DX 3581 received)
BYMR CHALOS
Q Mr Leitz before you describe the damage can you tell us what 3581 represents?
A Yes During the course of the salvage operation we kept \(a\)
(9) running drawing and this is a copy of it This drawing was
(10) manufactured on butcher paper to be honest with you it พаะ
(11) eight feet long And each day as the divers did their work
(12) down there and reported information back to us my naval
(13) architect and I would we would interrogate them at the end
of
(14) the day and plot the information on the drawing
(15) And it was neceasary to keep doing this thing, you know, (16) sometimes the divers would get confused about which trame space
(17) they were on We d have to erase something we d get the same
(18) type of damage described 20 foot from where we seen it betore
(19) so pretty soon you get this thing you know massaged down to
(20) something that \(s\) halfway reliable, you know and that smake
(21) alot of decisions based on the information the divers give
(22) you
(23) We also use a rove vehicle which is an
underwater operated
(24) vehicle to do a lot of the measuring and investigation
(25) Q Mr Leitz just so I can heip the fury what I mpointing

\section*{Vol 193223}
to here on the right side of the exnibit is the bow right?
A That 8 right
Q And back here is the stern?
A No it doesn t quite -
Q it doesn igo all the way Where sitgo back to number live?
A Back to the number five tank
Q Is this the house the white structure?
A There was no damage atter that
Q Okay And this area here where you have all the squiggly
marks that represents the area of damage?
A That s correct
O Am I correct that it looks like there was no damage to the
left side or the port side of the center tanks?
A Yeah the bottom of the port tanks that port side were untouched
Q So the oil that was in the port tanks was stull intact?
A That s correct
Q it remained there What was lost was the oll coming out of the starboard side and the center tanks one two three four and partally five nght?
A Well all of the center tanks lost oil Number one lost oll Number two is a - is a segregated ballast tank that was empty and it actually took on oil As the oil poured out of number one perhaps or number iwo center or whatever it
(1) actually spilled into the empty tanks
(2) The same thing is true of the forepeak which is a
(3) segregated ballast tank
(4) Q Over here?
(5) A And number four starboard - yeah Number four starboard
16) is also a designated ballast tank that was empty, and it did (7) take on some oil too
(8) Also, underneath the number flive slop tank is a void and it
(9) was ruptured in the incident and it took on oil also So there
(م) was quite a bit of oil trapped in empty tanks in the ship at
(11) the time that it collided with the rock
(12) Q Could you show the ladies and gentiemen of the jury where
(13) the ship was hung up where she was resting aground?
(14) A Well, Just the area - well, basicaily on the starboard
(15) side over to - not quite the center in an irregular fashion (16) all the way up through number one tank and some up underneath
(17) the bow
(18) So it would be atarting about in - let s see, what have I
(19) got here - wall, starting at about this area in here on the
(20) bottom, going across here and up through in here and out
(21) through in here near number one is roughly the affected area
(22) that was still bearing on the rock that we couldn \(t\) - while it
\({ }^{123)}\) was on Bligh Reet we couldn tget in there to actually take a
(24) real look at it you know
(25) Q So except for that area where she was resting on the rock

\section*{Vol 193225}
(1) where she was aground the rest of the ship was floaing free
in deeper water am I correct?
A That 8 right
Q Okay You can put that down Let me move this back
Okay tell us about your plan how you got the vessel off the reet
A Well, it was pretty obvious that there wasn tany way to
patch the bottom of the ship considering the extent of
damage
to it, so a common salvage practice is to seal up the top of a
(10) vessel and inject a gas in it normally it sair in this (11) particular case, we used inert gas out of the ship : - she had
(12) a SS system that protects you from explosions and etuff from
(13) the oil inside the ship The whole idea was to make adapters
(14) that could be fitted to the ship to inject this - this gas
(15) from portable salvage equipment and all the stuff was planned
(16) and done Equipment was brought up to Alaska and hauled out to
(17) the ship
(18) Q When you did the salvage job did you have sufficient
(19) equipment - was sufficient equipment made avalable to you?
(20) A Absolutely I have access to a lot of salvage equipment
(21) Exxon was excellent about bringing things in from god
knows
(22) where, you know copious quantities if you asked for one you
(23) usually got two
(24) Q What did you do with the oll - when you first got on
(25) there what was being done with the oll that was in the ship?
A And they were pumping oll off of the Exxon Valdez with
portable pumps into the Baton Rouge I observed that
operation The only part of the lightering operation I really
got into was early on, just some advisory type thing where
had to work out a plan so as to not disturb the equilibrium of the ship on the rock Actually the starboard and center tank:
(11) were an easy thing to pump out because you lowered the pump
(12) Into the oil and start pumping Oll is lighter than water so ) the water is -see just brings the oll right up to the pump 4) and the ship doesn t change anything The only effect you have
(15) Is the tide rocking it up and coming down every six hours
6) The port tanks on the other hand were intact, so therefore
(7) a plan had to be developed so that we could pump the oll out of
(18) those tanks and at the same time put water back in the spaces,
(19) you know for example the number two port segregated ballast
(20) tank was empty so it could be ballasted down as oll was pumped
(21) out In the adjacent tank
(22) Same thing with number four port ballast tank
(23) That s basically how it was done untll we established a toe
(24) hold until we could get something out to pump out water into
test-the-qotuat-aterboard-tefore 19 3227
1) Q You talk about the center and the starboard tanks having
(2) water in them Was that because the damage was such as that 3) the bottom was ripped up and you had holes in the bottom?

A Most of the damage to the bottom of the ship was caused by
) the initial collision with the rock, sliding up on the rack
That s what stopped the ship
You got to keep in mind, you got a 214000 ton deadweight
vessel being driven at 11 knots that suddenly comes to an
abrupt stop That takes a lot of friction, interference
whatever you want to call it , it stops in a very short
distance
Q The point is that the bottom in this area was open to the

\section*{sea?}

A Yee, It was
Q All night You got the oll off you got all the oll off before you started your refloating procedure?
A Yos The oll was taken off from, 1 gueas - let saee
They started the 25th, I belleve, and it was completed April the 4th
Q All right And then once you got the oll off you said you
closed the valves the deck valves and you put inert gas into the ship?
A That s right During this period of time adapters were made We had to remove the - let s see, let me back up here a
(25) little bit To put the fittings In to Inject the gas into the
1) ship we removed something called the gems (ph) which are the
top alarms in the tank There \(s\) an alarm system on the top 01
the tanks that only goes down like 10 or 15 feet it's kind of
an emergency alarm when they refilling loading the shlp
There sother measuring systems but when the oll gets to a
certain level the gem systems come in So we removed those
and that gave us an orifice or hole in the deck that we could
bolt these adaptors into
So all that kind of stuff was done Equipment was going out, hoses were connected up - there was some 3000 foot
hoses - or 13000 foot of hoses used to connect all the systems to make this thing float
All that stuff was done prematurely and we had to plan
on - Aprill 5th was the date to refloet it and atep by atep
and we had people atationed all over the ship to close valves
(16) and do this and do that and we started injecting gas and she
(17) floated
(18) O She came up off the reet?

A Yes
O On high tide?
A No, it wat actually pianned to refloat at half tide and did exactly that
Q And ultimately you towed the ship somewhere to another place in Prince William Sound?
A Yeah To Naked Ialand outside the bay

Vot 193229
O Was this ship towed with the holes in the bottom stull?
A Yes
Q And then there came a time when the ship was taken from
Naked Island down to San Diego nght?
A That s correct
Q And she was towed down to San Diego?
AYes
Q Again with the holes in the bottom?
AYes
Q How come the ship didn t sink?
A Because it was floating on this air that was trepped Inside
of ti See the - the thing that - on a ship this size you
got so darn much area - you know, a 900 foot ship, 186 foot
wide it only takes a relatively littie skinny block of
(15) buoyancy through here to make the thing float. The hull of
(16) the - the hull of the ship weighe roughly 30,000 tons and it 8
(17) kind of a hydreulic you divide that up to the whole deck and
(18) the amount of pressure required to flont this thing, it sery
(19) very low
(20) The actual pressures we used to refloat the Exxon Valdez
(21) was about - varied from about, oh, about one pound, In some of
(22) the center tanks because they were so large up to five and (23) three quarters pounds was the highest pressure we used And
(24) they were all stages the different levels to protect the
(25) vessel, you know, the longitudinal bending problem, you
know

(2)
(3)
(4) pressur

Q Let me see just out of curiosity I put 32 pounds of pressure in my car tures?
A Yeah
Q So you re talking about what one tenth of that one sixth of that?
A Yeah, yeah It was very - actually very, very low
pressure
Another interesting thing if you re interested in it you
could take an air gauge and blow into your mouth and blow roughly two and a half pounds and it you blow hard into an
gauge you can check them that way It should read iwo and
half pounds
Q That 5 all it took to refioat it?
A That's right
Q Now Mr Leitz based on what you saw out there based on
the experience you had with this vessel and based on your
previous experience with grounded vesseis in your opinion had
this vessel come off the reet at any time atter the grounding
do you believe that she would have sunk or capsized?,
A No, I dont
) Q Why do you say that?

\section*{V이 193231}
(1) A Well we run some calcuiations on the thing, my naval 2) architect and I - I should give him credit his name is Donald (3) \(\mathbf{R}\) Hudson, I been uaing him for about \(\mathbf{3 0}\) years - but we run some calcuiations on that
The PV valves on all the cargo tanks are a Waukeshau type valve and they re set at set points about iwo and a half pst Now when the cargo - after the thing ran aground the bottom wos wiped out and the cargo went out that tripped the
9) liquid PV system which is a prevention system in the I G system It a actually water tilled and it a designed to
(11) prevent a vacuum from - or an excessuve vacuum from forming in
(12) the tanks
(13) Just basically what I told you a few minutes ago about the (14) Emount of pressure it took to float this ship, we had them (15) adjust it very selectively to minimize the bending problem with
(16) the ship in the aea wake But the thing - whether it was (17) still water or whatever probably sea weight would have stayed
(18) together Two and a halt pressure is designed in - the (19) Waukeshau PV valves is plenty of trapped air to keep the vessel
( 20 ) from sinking
(21) Now this would require minimum intervention by the crew to (22) close the slider vaives, which is the valve that shuts the IG (23) system off from the cargo tanks The IG system ian t hooked to
(24) the segregated ballast tanks so they would have to go out (25) they didn thave to worry about the port side they would have
\(V^{2}:\)
5-27-94
(i) had to close the sliders on one through five center and one
(2) three and flve atarboard and that sall on God s green earth
(3) they would have had to have done
(4) The ship would have rolled approximately - the maximum it
(5) would have laid over would have been about 12 degrees

\section*{That}
(6) all that needed to be done to keep it alloat They would have
(7) had more than enough time to go out and do those things

Another interesting twist to all this la i had some -
before we retloated it I had soundings made in a great fan
(10) shape off the port side of the ship to tind out exactly what
(11) direction were we going to remove it from the reef ln, how much
(12) water was out there We didn t want to run over another rock
(13) so wo went a thousand foot and took soundings all around there,
(14) and for as much as a thousand foot away from the ship, that
(15) soundings that they had there kind of indicates a litie bit,
(16) only about, oh, 60, 70-75 foot of water
(17) It could have went quite a waye sidewaye, and it didn't
(18) have enough water to stick over because it would have sat down
(18) and the deck would have stuck out That 888 foot, 80 it could
(20) have sit down in 87 foot of water and still stick out
(21) Q Mr Leitz you ve had an opportunity to read some of the
(22) testimony that s been given in this trial?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q You read Captain Hazelwood s testımony?
(25) AYes

\section*{Vol 193233}
(1) Q Portions of Captain Hazelwood \(s\) testimony?
(2) A Portions
(3) O Portions of Mr Kunkel s testımony?
(4) A Yes
(5) Q And I think you read some of Mr Van - did you read Mr
(6) Van Hammen \(s\) testumony?
(7) A Yes, I did

O You read that Captain Hazeiwood used his rudder and the
engine atter the grounding?
A Yes
(11) Q Do you remember that?
(12) A Yes, I do
(13) Q Did you have a chance to review Mr Van Hammen s video?
(14) AYes I did
(15) Q Let me put this on and ask you some questions about it
(16) You remember Mr Van Hammen testified that while the
(17) engine was shut down from about 1220 to 1236 the vessel
was
(18) moving?
(19) A From 1220 -
(20) \(Q 1220\) in the morning to about 12367
(21) AYes
(22) \(Q\) There was no engine rudder being used at that tume the
(23) vessel was swinging do you remember that?
(24) A Yeah
(25) Q I want to show you - can we cue that up? I want to show

Vol 193234
i) you the video which starts at 1230 but Mr Van Hammen states there was movement about four minutes before that - and 1 m
just going the run the first six minutes and show you how the
vessel was swinging
Can you go back to 1230 ?
VIDEO TECHNICIAN That s where it starts
MR CHALOS At 1231 okay Well start at 1231
You can run it a little faster
BYMR CHALOS
Q You see the vessel swinging?
A Yes
Q Okay stop
Now sir based your experience and based on what you
observed with this vessel when you got out there do you
believe it to have been unreasonable for Captain Hazelwood to think that his vessel during those 15 minutes when the vessel
was moving without the use of the engine or the rudder do you think that it was unreasonable for him to believe that he was not hard aground at that time?
A No I don't belleve it sunreasonable for him to believe he wasn thard aground
Q You think it was reasonable for him given the testimony
and given what I ve ןust showed you to think that he needed to take some action at that point?
A Well, I think that any prudent master needs to it he runs

\section*{Voㅓ 193235}
(1) aground like in this case he needs to evaluate the situation
(2) as best he can with the tools he has available And I think
(3) that -
(4) Q You heard Captain - or Commander McCall this morning?
(5) AYes
(6) Q He said that - he made a distinction between hard aground and just aground Do you remember that?
A Rlght
Q And you remember he sald you have to - to do something to (0) find out if you re hard aground of just aground?

\section*{A That s correct}
(12) Q And he also said that if you re just aground as opposed to
(13) hard aground he d rather have the strick in his hand right?
(14) A He sexactly right
(15) Q Does that mean to you that he wanted to have his engines on
(16) and his rudder going to assess the situation?
(17) AYea
(18) Q Okay Did you read the testımony of Captain Hazelwood
(19) where he said I started my engines at 1236 brought them up (20) slowly to half ahead maneuvering because I was trying to assess
(21) the situation?
(22) A Yes, I read that
(23) Q And do you agree with that or disagree based on your (24) experience?
125) A Absolutely agree with it

\subsection*{57.94}

Vol 193236
(1) Q Captain Hazeiwood testified that one of the things he took
(2) into account he had a rising inde in about an hour hour and a
(3) half he was coming up to high water?
(4) AYes
(5) O Would that be one of the factors you would consider in

161 determining whether you were aground just aground as
opposed
(7) to hard aground?
(ө) A think he was trying to determine - where he was
aground
(9) In the-middle of night, it shard to do much In the dead of (10) night it s hard to take soundings, especially when you got oll
(11) coming out of the ship For soundings to be meaningiul, they d
(12) have to be taken some distance away from the ship so he was
(i3) Justifled in being concerned about this thing sliding back
(1a) oft He didn \(\boldsymbol{t}\) know what was out any distance from him from
(15) the side of the ship so he had to determine that
(16) And Commander McCall made a very good polnt there that
you
(17) better have your hands on the control lf something was going to
(18) go haywire than to just alt there and watch
(19) Q So I take it that you - you make no criticism of Captain
(20) Hezelwood using his rudder and his engines the way he did?
(21) A No It was the right thing to do
(22) Q You also read I take it that Captan Hazelwood used only
(23) full ahead maneuvering speed?
(24) A That eright

125, O You had an opportunity to check the power curves of this

\section*{Vol 193237}
(1) vessel when you went on board?
(2) A Yes I did
(3) Q What did you determine was the full available horsepower to
(d) him?
(5) A You mean at that speed?
(6) Q Full ahead full astern whatevar
(7) A Absolute full ahead, you got about 31000 32,000
(8) horsepower You'd have something less than that, certainily
(9) have that mueh horsepower on the engines but the
propeflera
(10) are inefficient going backwards because you got a different
(i1) thrust There s propellers and thrust golng together here
(12) Q You had a chance to look at the data logger for this
(13) vessel?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q Did Captain Hazelwood ever put this in reverse?
(18) A No, he didn't
(17) Q Based on removing this vessel from the reef would you
(18) expect he d go in reverse even once?
(19) A Yee or more than one time
(20) Q He didn teven go in reverse is that right?
(21) A That's right
(22) 085 horse - did you say maneuvening was 8500 or did I say (23) that?
(24) A My celculations come up to -
(25) Olsald that okay

\section*{Vof 193239}

A Well after the oll belched out of the ship and everything, the pressure against the rock was in the neighborhood of 9200
(3) long tons
(4) Q So it we were to put a scale under the ship at that moment (5) that 5 what she would read?
(6) A Yeah that a the bearing on the rock The reat of the (7) the rest of the \(\mathbf{3 0} 000\) tons of ship and the ail that stacked (8) Up higher than the water line outside - which now is only in
(9) the port tanks not - all of these are selt supporting, by the
(10) bottom of the ocean we got \(\mathbf{3 0} 000\) tons of hull to support
(II) About 9200 tona of it is reating on the rocks the reat is
(12) being supported by buoyancy on the port side and in the engine
(13) room spaces
(14) That s what held the ship there but the thing bearing down
(15) on the rocke, 9200 tons were long tons worth
(16) Q Now let me see if 1 understand this Mr Leitz The
(17) engine at 8500 or 9000 horsepower full ahead maneuvering is
(18) only thrusting you sald about 160 tons?
(19) A 112
(20) Q Hundred and 12 tons?
(2) A Long tons
(22) O Okay Well talking again in layman terms if he wanted -
[23) if Captain Hazelwood wanted to remove this ship forward would
(24) he have to then thrust 9201 tons to get it moving?
(25) A That \(s\) an interesting question if - if the surface of

\section*{that regard?}

A Again, It ends up really being an Inaignificant number You're putting 112 tons of load - obviously if you run the engine, it's going to push a little bit on the thing But in relationship to the structure that s down there, it isn it anything This ship s made out of - It sa high tensile
steel, I think the designation is A.50, which is a very high
steel Normal is A 36, and it's got a minimum yield at 36,000

\section*{Vot 193243}
pounds per square inch
This ship, it s in excess of 50000 pounds per square
3) Inch In other words \(\mathbf{1 1 2}\) tons if you had three aquare
inches
(4) of this material you couldn \(\boldsymbol{i}\) - that much force wouldn \(\boldsymbol{t}\)
s) break it in tensile
6) Q Are you saying that the rudder and the engine used by

Captain Hazelwood whatever stress was put on would be taken
by three square inches of the hull of the ship?
A That a just an example it would be taken up by a little
speck against a rock here and a littie speck against a rock
over there You got lots of area down there
Q So the bottom line in your opinion was that there was no additional or minuscule addrtional stresses if any?
A l think the term is minuscule
MR CHALOS Did Iget it wrong?
MR SANDERS Oh no
MR CHALOS You got me
BYMR CHALOS
Q Mr Leitz okay based on the information that you saw when you were on board and based on the testimony that you heard and
(21) based on your experience Mr Leitz do you have an opinion as
(22) to whether Captain Hazelwood was trying to extract this vessel
23) On the reat by the maneuvers he was making?
4) A Yeah, I do have an opinion
(25) Q What \(s\) your opinion?

A There was - everything that he was doing was trying to keep it on the reef not to get it oft the reef
Q Why do you say that? What do you base that opinion on?
A Welt the ship grounded going forward at 64 turns which
that also - that works out in the neighborhood of about
1300013500 horsepower
Q 64 turns means 64 roms on the propeller?
A Yes And it ran aground going frontwarde and at this time
19) had to stop at 211000 deadweight ion it wouldn't have been
(10) quite that high because they were short loaded, but it was
(11) still you know \(\mathbf{1 8 5 0 0 0}\) or something deadweight tons plus the
(i2) force of the engines driving it , and it came to a complete halt
(13) so you don thave to be a brain surgeon to figure out that you
(14) can \(t\) - i mean, it s like driving a truck against the side of
(15) a brick wall and decide you re going to go ahead with it
(16) brick wall has already stopped you and you are going to put
(17) In drive and drive through it not going to happen
(18) Ship came up stopped and to operate that engine in a
(19) forward mode eapecrally at 55 turns or thereaboute or actually
(20) quite of bit of time it was leseer turns than that, dead slow,
(21) slow, half and so on, lesser powers and all that during that
(22) period of time there \& no way the thing can move forward
(23) It's illagical
(24) Q Are you saying that Captain Hazelwood did not use - or the
(25) power that he used was less than the power that was being used

Vot 193245
when the vessel came to a complete stop?
A That E right
O And what do you deduce from that?
A That there s no - 1 mean what 1 can deduce from that is
you wouldn thave to be very smart that - to figure out you re
not going to drive the thing ahead If you want to get off,
you're going to have to go backwards, the way you came in
And
(b) he never did go backwarde

O Well let me ask you this Mr O Neill has played a tape
which was a transmission that Captain Hazelwood made to the
(1) Coest Guard At 107 he was talking to Commander McCall and
he
12) toid Commander McCall that I mirying to extract this vessel
13) from the reef
(14) You read those transmissions?
(15) AYes
(16) Q How do you square what you just said with what he \(s\) telling
(17) Commander McCall?
(18) A Well I think that Captains Hazelwood was still In the
(19) throes of \(-I\) think he was very upaet He was still in the
(20) throes of trying to evaluate the altuation Mr Kunkel, the
(21) chief mate, was busy taking readings in the control room which
(22) tells yau, you know, what liquids are coming in and what
(23) Ilquids are going out Basically telling you what tanks are
(24) breached, and looked over the side and he seen lots of oll
(25) coming out He knew he was losing oll I think that - two
1) things, 1 suppose

Part is I think he was trying to tell the Coast Guard a Iftle bit that - what they wanted to hear or what he thought they wanted to hear Other thing, I don think he had a full grasp of the situation \(I\) also don think he knew what the full situation or the severity of the situation was right then,
and i also - you know, kind of wonder if he really had
accepted it in his own mind that he might be in one hell of a picikle out there
(10) Q Based on your experience you ve seen you said a hundred (i1) and fifty or so strandings Have you seen this kind of (12) behavior before -
(13) AYes
(14) \(Q\) - atter a stranding?
(15) A Yeah, l've seen - a lot of the hundred and fifty vessels
(16) I ve worked on are large barges or unmanned vessels Same of
(1n) them have been abandoned vesseld But ive also gone on quite
(1a) a few veasels that were still manned, and it depends, the
(19) condition of the captain - call it a condition - varies
(20) sometimes if the accident is directly related to weather
(21) causes or mechanical causes or something like that, you don t
(22) see too much change in him but if the accident is a reault in
(23) of an error in judgment or somebody \(s\) judgment then you see
(24) huge reaction
(25) You know I ve seen - I had a Greek ship one tume called

\section*{Vol 193247}
(i) the Captlanos around the mouth of the Columbia River Greek
(2) captain on board He entered the Columbla no navigation
3) charts didn \(t\) get a pllot didn \(t\) - didn \(t\) do anything right
(4) drove up on Clatsop Spit which is south side of the entrance
5) of Columbia River

We got on board that ship, coming through the top of it what have you This fellow locked himselt in his room He wasn t violent or anything like that, he locked himself In the room After a couple of days had a Coast Gumed helicopter (10) come out and put a man down there and opened the door and
(11) forcefully removed him He was a nice guy, you know, he was
(12) Just was a little upset
(13) \(Q\) This is all because of the shock and siress of the
(14) grounding?
(15) A That ship ended up being total loss it was fish meal the
(16) total cargo was lost Ithink the fellow didn thave a pilot
(17) or anything was because he didn thave any money
(18) O You heard Commander McCall tesilty today that he heard the

119, same transmission but he didn t believe that Captain Hazelwood
(20) was trying to extract the vessel Do you remember that?
(21) A Yes, I do
(22) Q Those were his words But were his deeds consistent with (23) those words?
(24) A No they weren \(t\) at all if you re going to - everything
(25) that he did out there is the type of things that you would do

Vol 193248
ii) if you wanted to keep the ship on the beach
(2) Q Such as what?
(3) A Or on the rock Pardon?
(4) Q Luke what such as what?
(5) A Well, work the engine ahead The ship grounded he didn't
(6) know how well it was ground for aure he wanted to make sure it
7) didn t slide off by ltself on a rising tide He hadn t -
(8) there was no time to do soundings, it was - high tide was I
(0) think 0157 or something that - that it was only a hour and a
(10) halt away, so there was precious tittle he could have done away
(11) from the ship, so you have to do what you can on the ship
(12) He also talked to Mr Kunkel about ballasting and ho -
(13) really, the thing was pretty well ballasted and baliasting
(14) itself I don't even know whether that dawned on him, but
he
(15) had one tank on the starbaard side he could have put water

In,
(16) which was number four, segregated ballast tank, also he had the
(i7) anchors lowered down - if you re going someplace why lower
(18) the anchors you know
(19) Q You heard Ms Jones Maureen Jones the lookout state
(20) today that she was told to rig the pilot ladder for the Coast
(21) Guard Does that sound to you like something somebody would do
(22) If they were planning to take off?
(23) A Well probably not I mean the pilot ladder goes when
(24) you re underway so the pilot can get on and off the ship, and
(25) they do that while the ship \(s\) moving soldon \(\&\) know

V어 193249
(I) Q You don tattach any significance to that?

A Not a lot
) MR CHALOS Mr Lettz thank you very much Before !
let you go let mejust conter one second
5) Thank you very much

THE COURT You may cross examine
MR O NEILL We re both going to get you
THE COURT No you re not
THE WITNESS Thank you
THE COURT One at a time
MR MONTAGUE We re not going to use all these
Mr Lertz but just in case
CROSS EXAMINATION OF JULIUS LEITZ
BY MR MONTAGUE
Q You re very proud of the job you did salvaging the Exxon
Valdez I can see that?
A Yeah
Q You did a good job I think everybody s thankful for that
A We also did it without any serious injurles whatsoever in
a
(20) four and a half month operation so that makes you feel good to
(21) Itaelf

Q That was a four and a half months operation?
A Yeah From beginning to end
4) Q Now let \(s\) - did I hear you say correctly that the - one
(25) of the reasons why you thought Captain Hazelwood may be saying

Vol 193250
things different than he was doing was because that the
accident was an error in judgment? is that what I heard you say?
A Yeah you did hear me say that I mean as opposed to the steering breaking or something I mot trying to say that I m not somebody else to decide, I m not deciding whether
made an error in judgment or not, somebody did
Q And you used that error in judgment as a basis for explaining away why the transmissions and the things that
Captain Hazelwood said to oiners as to what he was doing was actually ditferent from what you say he intended to do?
A Yeah everything he did about the satety of the ship and the people that were on it was the correct thing to do And on
(14) the other hand, he susy telling the Coast Guard that trying
to get if off or all sorts of things Actually he minimized
the amount of damage in those tranamissions rather than -
It :
7) like he really wasn't facing reality

Q Okay Well let slook at what he said okay and that s
the first transmission through to the captain of the port was
at - It started at 107 in the morning okay?

\section*{A Yes}

Q And let 5 see what - what was said He says that first well the question was - go back a minute
The question was This is the captain of the port
Commander McCall good evening Do you have any more of an

\section*{Voi 193251}
(1) estimate as to your situation at this time?
(2) And Captain Hazelwood answers Not at the present un
(3) Steve or uh a little problem here with the third mate but (4) uh we are working our way off the reef We ve uh the vessel s been hoied uh and we re ascentaining right now we re trying to just get her off the reef And uh well get back to you as soon as we can over
Do you remember that?
A Yes
Q And do you recall it s your - excuse me
It s your opinion is it not that at the time he said
that in fact he thought he could get the vessel off the reef?
A No, I don think he thought that at all I know he asid
that, but you have to - in my businese, you know, I got to
look at real llife You got to look at what he did, deeds not
(16) words If you will And because that st the only concrete -
(17) Q You have betore you - may I approach the witness a
moment
(18) Your Honor?
(19) THECOURT Yes
(20) BYMR MONTAGUE
(21) Q - some testımony you gave at a previous proceeding do you
(22) recall that? Could you turn to page 4902? I want you to make
(23) sure that that s your testimony under oath you have 4902
(24) A Oh My testimony okay
(25) Q And would you look at - there s a question that begins -
(1) I don t know how that color got in it - begins at the bottom
(2) at line 23 where Mr Chalos asks you So my question to you
(3) is Captain Hazelwood is based on your opinion trying to keep
(4) the vessel on the reef but he stelling the Coast Guard at
15) about the same time that he strying to get the vessel off the
(6) reef Do you have an opinion as to why there 5 a difference
17) between those two?
(8) Do you see that question?
9) A Um hum
(10) O And your answer is Yeah Well okay the first
(11) conversation that I think he still thought he could get the
(12) thing off I don \(\boldsymbol{t}\) think the severity of the situation had
(13) sunk in
(14) Did you - were you asked that question and did you give
(15) that answer?
(16) A That s the answer I gave last time
(17) Q Now let s go on to the conversations - and this is still
(18) during the same conversation with - with the commander of the
(19) port The second - the next statement made by Captain
(20) Hazelwood is Okay we re uh pretty good shape right now 1) stable - stability - wise we re uh just trying to extract her off uh the shoal here and uh you can probably see me on your radar And once we get underway I Il let you know Had you read that? A Yeah
(1) Q And then that conversation contunues a third - there sa
(2) third part of Captain Hazelwood s conversation in that
(3) repartee and he says Yeah I think it \(s\) uh major damage has
(A) kind of been done We kind of rock and rolled over it and uh
(5) we re just kind hung up in the stern here
(6) That 5 the back of the ship -
(7) A Yes
(8) Q-for us land lubbers?
9) AYes
(10) Q We ll just uh well dritt over it Ill get back to you
(II) Okay did you read that?
(12) AYes
(13) Q Now do you recall that - that after the maneuvering of
(14) the vessel stopped by Captain Hazelwood there was a further
(15) communication there was a further communication with the
(16) captain of the port Do you remember that?
7) AYes
(18) Q Let 5 look at that
(19) Captain of the port - and this is at almost 200 in the
(20) morning right? And the engines stopped around

140 something?
(21) A141
(22) Q And the captain of the port says And you re still working 3) at trying to get off over?
4) And Captain Hazelwood his answer is No our engines are stopped right now Uh we re going to watt till theres uh a

Vol 193254
(1) little more water underneath us
(2) Okay did you read that when you reached your conclusion?
(3) A Yes, I did
(4) Q And are you aware that about half an hour atter that or so
(5) someume around that tume Captain Hazelwood received a call
(6) from Paul Myers of Exxon on the ship? Were you aware of that?
(7) A Well, I don't know anything about the call from Paul

\section*{Myers,}
(8) no
(9) Q Did you consider what Captain Hazelwood had told Paul Myers
(10) during his conversation?
(11) A No
(12) MR CHALOS Your Honor may we approach have a side (13) bench for Just One second?
(14) (At side bar off the Record)
(15) BY MR MONTAGUE
(16) O I m told that this call with Mr Myers was somewhere (i7) between around 130 between one and 130 and Mr Myers wrote
(18) down during his conversation with Captain Hazelwood think he
(19) can get it oft
(20) Were you aware of that when you made your decision?
1) A No, I was not
2) And are you aware that the next day and the next - I guess

It was the next early afternoon the early afternoon of the
a1 241h - that Captain Hazelwood was interviewed by Mark
Delozier
(25) from the Coast Guard Have you seen that?
(1) Q What I m saying is he was doing what he said he was doing
(2) In all those communications that s would have been absolutely
(3) the wrong thing to do?
(4) A That's right
(5) Q And in your view it would have been reckless?
(6) ANo
(7) Q it wouldn t have been reckless to -
(8) A Well now, let get it straight I don t want to be
) misquoted here
(10) What he was doing was not reckless -
(1+1) Q No no walt a second
(12) A it he had \(\mathbf{3 2 0 0}\) horsepower on that reet and tried to drive
(13) her off -
(14) MR CHALOS Your Honor Your Hanor -
(15) THE COURT I don t want - we re all talking at once
(16) now
(17) MR MONTAGUE Let me ask you a question -
(18) THE COURT And let him finish And let me finish
(19) 100
(20) MR MONTAGUE it s just that he was unresponsive to
(21) the question I don think he heard the answer
(22) THE COURT Talk one at a time and the reporter will
(23) be able to report everything because she can t do that when
(24) you re talking over one another
(25) BYMR MONTAGUE

\section*{Vol 193257}
(1) Q I want you to listen to the question I said if Captain
(2) Hazelwood intended to do what he told the VTS he was doing
(3) through the communications and that he told the others it he
(4) was intending to do that - that is to remove the vessel from
(5) the reet - you agree that that was absolutely wrong?
(6) A it wouldn t be the prudent thing to do, but a minute ago
(7) you used the word reckless and I wouldn t go nowhere nears that
(8) far
(9) O So it wouldn \(t\) have been reckless to try to remove it from (10) the reef is that your testimony?
(11) A Pardon?
(12) Q So it would not have been reckless to iry to remove it from (13) the reet?
(14) A Well, depends under what circumstances I sat here a few
(15) minutes ago and the calculations showed the things, the ship
(16) could have been kept afloat It it d have slipped off, there
(17) would have been plenty of time to take some corrective action,
(18) so It wouldn thave laid over or capaized or sunk or any of
(19) those things Sol don't know how reckless it would have
(20) been
(21) There was alew things that needed to be done I can t
(22) help but think an experienced tanker crew would have done
(23) them
(24) Q Okay Now if he was telling everybody that he spoke to
(25) that morning that he really didn it mean what he was doing what

\section*{Vol 193258}
he was saying but he was doing something else that \(\mathbf{s}\) - that s what you subscribe to is that correct?
A I really do because I ve seen - I ve seen captains act much like this before where you go out go to the atd of the thing and the captain refuses to take a towine because I says

I can handle this thing and I ve got it under control we re
going to have it fixed in a few minutes and none of these
things happen, and, I don \(t\) know, imagine shock or tever
causes these guys to act that way but they - it does happen
and this isn treally unusual at all It s just a bigger
incident
Q And that s particularly true as you said before when an error of judgment caused the grounding right?
A When something - yeah, yeah, being blamed, if it s the
weather or something sout at everybody 8 control and
everybody \(s\) kind of half dumb and happy, I guess
Q Now I just have a few other things
The grounding - the soundings that you opened up with
taken by Captain Hazelwood?
A Yes
Q Those were taken at 945 in the morning isn t that correct?
A According to the radio transmiastions they were ordered at
(24) 8 44, 1 believe and the time on them 18940 They were taken
(25) during a perrod from 844 until 945 I believe is what it aays

\section*{Vol 193259}
on there
Q So the soundings you referred to were ordered to be taken by someone?
A By Captain Hazelwood
O With the Coast Guard?
A And it in the radiotransmissions here ithink it was 844 that he requested the pllot take the soundings, and the soundings of course say 945
Q So that was - okay so that was about eight eight and a half hours after the grounding is that correct?
A Yeah
Q And he didn t have that information when he was maneuvering
(13) the vessel?
(14) A No he didn \(t\) He was maneuvering the vessel right after
(15) It went aground and the soundinge would have become more
16) Important before high water it he had any Intentions of (17) refloating the ship, that information would be really useful (18) before high water because, If you're going to refloat, you want
(19) to do it at high water so once high water passes theres no (20) great urgency to do these things Once the ship sits there and
21) goes through high water, nothing horrible s happened you can
(22) relax a little bit and do things in a more logical fashion
23) Q Do you recall what the high water the difference between (24) the high water mark and the level of the water the tide at the
25) tume of the grounding what that was?

Vol 193260
A Well Ithink high water was about 12 and a half feet
Q Do you know the difference between what it was at the time
of the grounding and what high tide would have been?
A I d just be guessing, probably about two foot maybe two
and a half foot would be the difference I didn iplot it
no But that a roughly what it would be
Q If it was anything less than two feet would that sound right?
A Could have been
Q Is that significant?
A Two foot \(s\) quite a bit of lift that s right
Q Now when the vessel went aground Captain Hazelwood didn t
(13) know that it was impaled night? He found that out?
(14) A Yeah No he would have had no way of knowing that
(15) Q And by moving the vessel anything could have happened 6) Isn that correct?

A No, the one - I maan, you have to back up now He knew
one thing, is that ship was heading on -1 think it ran aground on a course on a heading of about \(\mathbf{2 9 0}\) degrees, and
(20) after she hit I think it had hard right rudder so it went to 305 and it came back somewhat I can t remember how far it came back, but the one thing he did know is that that ship drove into something strong enough to stop it And so orking
4) the engine ahead was low risk, I would say The risk of not
knowing if it could alip back off was a greater risk

\section*{Vol 193261}
(1) Q li was low risk but there was some risk?
(2) A There s always some
(3) Q You agree with that?

A Yeah, sure There s aiways some risk in doing anything
Q And in fact the vessel between the time that it hit the
rock and the time that it - the engines were turned off and
the engines were on load program up you testufied the rpm was
up to what 64 rpm at the tume they were shut oft?
A That s correct
Q Those engines ran for approximately 11 minutes isn that correct? Between the ime of the impact on the rock and the ume the engines were shut off they ran for about 11 minutes?
A Yeah, the - the official time for the grounding ta 0009,
Ian tit, or 107
Q Well it depends who you talk to - Exxon s expert says 7
minutes after and for my purposes III accept that And the engines started slowing down at 18 after so that 5 about 11
minutes?
A Yeah
Q And did you calculate anything about the damage or what was
(21) done during those 11 minutes while that engine was going at -

A64
Q Up to 64 rpm ?
A I just kind of considered that to be part of initial casualty thing come steaming in there 11 knots and stopped and

Vol 193262
engine going and rudder hard over and so that damage or the
2) fact that the engine was running would be reflected in the
3) original damage, really part of the original damage

Q All right Now do you recall testifying that there wasn \(t\)
any damage caused by the maneuvering done by Captain
Hazelwood?
A Yes
Q Would you agree that any evidence of damage that was caused
(9) by Captain Hazelwood \(s\) rotating - that is turning the vessel
(10) that morning - very likely would have been lost by the
(11) crushing effect that occurred due to subsequent events? Do
you
(12) agree with that statement?
(13) ANo,I dont
(14) Q Could you turn -
(15) Althink that -
(16) Q Go ahead
(17) A - what you re saying is probably possible, but the
(18) crushing would just shove any kind of evidence further up in
(19) the hull I mean, if you had some scratches of some kind of
(20) slgniticance, they would just merely be pushed up
(21) Another thing that happened out there is on the -1 don \(t\)
(22) know who going to look at the stuff while it was on the rock
(23) there was no way for divers or anybody else to get in between
(24) the ship and the rock but on - I think it was a Sunday they (25) had something like \(\mathbf{6 0}\) mile an hour winds and the ship moved 14

V여 193263

\footnotetext{
(1) degrees and was pushed back by tuga again so the maneuvering
(2) that Captain Hazelwood did during that period of time was from
(3) one side to the other about 13 degrees you know six and a
(4) half degrees both sides of center if you will
(5) Also when the ship ran aground, it came in at a heading of
6) 290 degrees went to 305 and then came back and when he
(7) siraightened the rudder up the thing came back - 1 don \(t\)
(8) remember just what number it is but around 290292 or
(9) something So it made a 15 degree sashay on grounding which
(10) would have been a rotating motlon there too sol don t know
(i1) how you - how this can be important, Important because you re
(12) looking for a rotating type damage in a place that s-
(13) that E-
(14) \(Q\) That there s been a lot of rotations?
(15) A Lots of rotations yeah
(16) \(O\) And that \(s\) what you testutied to earlier isn \(t\) it that
(17) you really couldn t tell - and that was my question that you
(18) really couldn \(t\) tell what damage was done by Captain
(19) Hazelwood s maneuvering because there was so much other
(20) rotation as well as what he did isn t that correct?
(21) A You re talking about evidence of damage but you can (22) laok -
(23) Q Evidence of damage?
(24) A But you can look at this from another standpoint and that (25) is how much horse was being applied and what would the effect
}
of that be and the effect on that particular structure would
have been in my opinion insigniflcant
O Okay Now one last question
All these calculations and the information you got from the
divers none of that was avallable to Captain Hazelwood when
was on the vessel correct?
A Not that night, no
Q When he was doing his maneuver he didn thave any of that
information?
A No, he didn t
MR MONTAGUE Thank you very much
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JULIUS LEITZ
BYMR CHALOS
Q Mr Leitz Captain Hazeiwood knew on that night did he
not that he was damaged on the starboard side and that he was
not damaged on the port side?
A Yes, he knew he was damaged in the center tanks, as
well
(18) Q And he knew that his vessel was moving?
(19) A That's right
(20) Q Now is there anything that he did the deeds that he did
(21) that suggests to you that he was trying to get this vessel off
) the reet?
A He did absolutely nothing that would suggest to me he
was
(24) trying to get off the reet
(25) Q Mr Montague read to you something from the interview that

\section*{V어 193265}
i) Captain Hazelwood had with Mr Delozier You remember that?
2) A Yes, yeah Yeah
3) \(Q\) The context of that was that - and there s been testimony
(4) to this - was that Captain Hazeiwood said to Mr Delozier
5) When I ran aground in the first ten minutes I had a fleeing
6) thought to get the vessel off the reef but then I said no no
7) that s not the right thing to do so i shut my engine
8) The engine he shut down was at \(12 \mathbf{2 0}\) okay? That s the (9) context
(10) Based on your experience is it a strange thought that a
(11) mariner would have initially after he s grounded to say What
(12) am I doing here let me iry and get ofl Is that a strange
(13) thought to have?
(14) A No, it ian t That s the first thing that would go through
(15) the mariner shead
(16) Q You would expect that wouldn \(t\) you?
(17) A Yes, I would
(18) Q And what he said to Mr Delozier was After I had that
(19) thought 1 decided I m not going to do that And that was at
(20) 12207
(21) A Um hum
(22) Q is that something that s consistent with what he was doing
(23) then thereafter?
(24) AYes
(25) MR CHALOS I have no further questions thank you

Vol 193266
THE COURT You may step down sir thank you
12) (The Witness Stepped Down)
3) MR LYNCH Your Honor we never thought that Mr
(4) Chaios would be able to finish this early and I m afraid to say
15) we don thave another examination
6) MR CHALOS Wat a minute wasn t that a signal for
17) me to stop? I had a few more questions I looked over they
were signaling
THE COURT I think it is time to quit I do need to
see counsel for just a minute I will be brief with you
Ladies and gentiemen you will recall I assume that
Monday is Memorial Day I hope you all enjoy the holiday But
please remember my instructions that you not listen to or read
4) anything about our case and we will see you at 800 on

Tuesday
(15) morning You re excused until that time
(16) (Jury out at 1 53)
(17) THE COURT The one thing that I need to do is call up
118) the motion people again We have a - we have a motion by the
) Chugach Alaska Corporation et al plaintifts to remand their
case to state court We re - we ve tried to put that on sort
of a fast track What I would like to do is - is hear any
2) oral presentation anyone has We ll take ten or 15 minutes
3) from each side at two \(p m\) or as soon thereafter as we adjourn
) for the trial day on Tuesday which is I think the 31st
(25) Again that \(s\) Tuesday the 31 st at two p m
1) And Mr Murtiashaw if you would be sure to notify Mr
2) Petumenos who is counsel for the plaintitfs that are involved
(3) in this I haven t seen him here today and since he doesn t
4) want to be here he probably isn i here if you d notify him
s) MR JAMIN I If let him know as well Your Honor
6) THE COURT Fine I appreciate that
7) Is there anything else we need to do?
(8) MR ONEILL No sir
9) MR SANDERS No Your Honor
(10) THE COURT All of you have a good weekend and we Il
(i1) see you on Tuesday We re adjourned now
(12) (Proceedings recessed 202 pm )
(i) INDEX
(2) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GORDON TAYLOR
(Read) 3026
(3) BYMS STEWART 3026
(5) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GORDON TAYLOR
(Video) 3034
(6) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 3034
(8) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF BRUCE BLANDFORD (Read) 3041
(9) BYMR LYNCH 3041
(1) CROSS EXAMINATION OF BRUCE BLANDFORD (Video) 3056
(12) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 3056
(14) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL CAVETT (Read) 3065
(15) BYMR LYNCH 3065
(17) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL CAVETT (Read) 3070
(18) BYMS WAGNER 3070
(20) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MAUREEN HIGGINS
(Read) 3074
(21) BYMR SANDERS 3074
(23) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MAUREEN HIGGINS
(Read) 3105
(24) BY MS WAGNER 3105

\section*{Vol 193269}
(1) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF LLOYD LECAIN (Read) 3110
(2) BYMR SANDERS 3110
(4) CROSS EXAMINATION OF LLOYD LECAIN (Read) 3115
(5) BYMS WAGNER 3116
(7) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GREGORY FERRONE
(LIVe) 3120
(8) BYMR SA

3120
(10) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GREGORY JOHN FERRONE 3138
(11) BY MR O NEILL 3138
(13) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF GREGORY JOHN FERRONE 3143
(14) BYMR SANDERS 3143
(16) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF COMMANDER MCCALL 3147
(17) BYMR LYNCH 3147
(19) CROSS EXAMINATION OF COMMANDER

MCCALL 3170
(20) BY PLAINTIFF EXAMINER 3170
(22) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF PAUL YOST (Read) 3175
(23) BYMR LYNCH 3175

D
\(\qquad\)



)

Vol 193270
(1) CROSS EXAMINATION OF ADMIRAL PAUL YOST (Video) 3208
(2) BY PLAINTIFF EXAMINER 3209
(4) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JULIUS HERMAN LEITZ 3214
(5) BYMA CHALOS 3214
(7) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JULIUS LEITZ

3249
(8) BYMR MONTAGUE

3249
(10) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JULIUS LEITZ

3264
(11) BYMR CHALOS 3264
(1) STATE OF ALASKA)
(2) Reporter s Certificate
(3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA)
(6) I Joy S Brauer a Registered Professional
(7) Reporter and Notary Public
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
(9) That the foregoing transcript contains a true and
(10) accurate transcription of my shorthand notes of all requested
(11) matters held in the foregoing captioned case
(12) Further that the transcript was prepared by me
(13) or under my direction
(14) DATED this day
(15) of 1994
(21) JOY S BRAUER RPR

Notary Public for Alaska
(22) My Commission Expires 51097

Beme Systorna Appucations
Look-See Concordance Report

UNIQUE WORDS 3,344
TOTAL OCCURRENCES
16,289
NOISE WORDS 385
TOTAL WORDS IN FILE 52,324

Single file Concordance
Case sensitive
NOISE WORD LST(S)
NOISE NOI
includes all text
OCCURRENCES
IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES @ BOtTOM of Page
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & -1- \\
\hline & 1016 [1] 312319 \\
\hline & 10th [1] 31289 \\
\hline & 11.20 [1] 308024 \\
\hline & 1147 [1] 308117 \\
\hline & \({ }_{320311}^{12 \text {-mile [3] } 31701931718}\) \\
\hline & 1202 [1] 32007 \\
\hline & 1217 [1] 32009 \\
\hline & \[
\begin{aligned}
& 12.20[5] 3233171920 \\
& 3265820
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline & 1230 (2) 323415 \\
\hline & 1231 [2] 32347 \\
\hline & 1236 (3) 32331720 \\
\hline & 323519 \\
\hline & 15-degree [1] 32639 \\
\hline & 16-hour-a-day [1] 321716 \\
\hline & 17th [5] 302731130321 1831772 \\
\hline & 185,000-or something [1] \\
\hline & 324411 \\
\hline & 107 [2] 324517325020 \\
\hline & 130 [2] 325417 \\
\hline & 1 40-something [1] 325320 \\
\hline & 141 [1] 325321 \\
\hline & 153 [1] 326616 \\
\hline & 1st [1] 314725 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\begin{tabular}{l}
\hline -2 - \\
\hline 214,000-ton [1] 32277 \\
22nd [1] 311511 \\
23rd [1] 311511 \\
24-hour [1] 304612 \\
24th [7] 30287303212 \\
3048 5312323321723 \\
321813325424 \\
25th [1] 322718 \\
26th [2] 3217513 \\
28th [3] 32171113322012 \\
\(200[1] 325319\) \\
\(202[1] 326712\) \\
\hline \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-27-94
VOLUME 19

31st [2] 32662425
\begin{tabular}{c}
\(-4-\) \\
\hline 494 c [1] 3040 23 \\
\(40 \mathrm{~s}[1] 314215\) \\
4 th [2] 3128 10, 322719 \\
\hline\(-5-\) \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

5-10-97 [1] 327222
50/50 [1] 31642
5th [1] 322814
- \(\quad\) -

6th [2] 3192332027
\(\frac{-7-}{7 \text { 7h }[1] 307524}\)
7th [1] 307524
\begin{tabular}{l}
\hline\(-8-\) \\
\hline 800 [2] 30262,326614 \\
844 [3] \(325824 \quad 2532597\)
\end{tabular}
\begin{tabular}{l}
\hline\(-9-\) \\
\hline \(940[1] 325824\) \\
\(945[4] 32181332582125\) \\
32598 \\
959 [1] 312318
\end{tabular}
- A-

A-50 [1] 324224
A-B [15] 30765103080 1,
31131720223132 13, 16
3135 10, 313912314120
3142113
A-Bs [1] 312221
am [3] 3026231231819
A89-0095 [1] 30266
abandon [1] 31151
abandoned [1] 324617
abeam [5] 30282330867
31722320318
abilities [1] 312820
ability [3] 3079 3, 12, 313719
able [25] 303324305812
3067 7, 3113 17, 19, 31327
20314268 9, 316120 ,
31802319825,32021520
320320320414161819
223213193241 23,
32562332664
able-bodied [3] 312536 31328
aboard [9] 3030 16, 307812 3130131331011313419 314815318815321320 abort [1] 316519
above-average [1] 314011
abrupt [1] 32279
Absolute [1] 32377
Absolutely [4] 313513
314633225 20, 323525
absolutaly (8) 302825
3191732552032562
32575326423
abuse [4] 3205 1610 32064

Academy [2] 30741819 academy [1] 307420 accept [1] 326116 accepted [2] 31982232468 access [2] 3212 2, 322520 accident [12] 303124
3057123107 14, 3180 10, 3182 18, 23, 3191 23, 32137
83246 20, 22, 32502
accomplish (1] 30467
accomplished [1] 32118
accord (1] 31949
According [1] 325823
according [4] 313919 3155 25, 3172831927 account [4] 3072153187 24, 3220 10, 32362
accountability [1] 321219
accuracy [1] 316712
accurate [6] 3068 3, 7 ,
3069173072 15, 31878 ,
327210
accurately [4] 316324,
31641 2, 31762
accused [1] 316313
acknowledge [1] 31008 acknowledged [3] 308423 3085130873
acquainted [1] 317524
acquire [1] 317019
acquired (2) 3052517
act [2] 325839
action [16] 3035 3, 6 10,
3049 9, 3064 6, 193069 24,
30702331982,3199918
22320023234 24, 325717
actions (1) 31506
Active [1] 315211
active [1] 317618
actively [3] 3059519
317914
activities [1] 306621
activity [1] 31358
acts [1] 31312
actual [8] 30331330529
319913210 11, 321210
322625322920324111
actuality [1] 311823
adamant [1] 31885
adamantly [2] 3188 8, 31898
Adams [1] 317413
adapters (2) 322513
322723
adaptors [1] 32288
add [2] 30321331177
addıcted [1] 32059
adding [2] 30484
addition (4) 30475309422
311321317613
additional [6] 32121214
32427 16, 324313
Address [1] 314625
address [12] 30262130418
10, 3065 6, 3073 21, 311012
17, 31207,31462331752
10, 321410
adds [1] 305319
adequate [1] 306112
adjacent (1] 322621
adjourn [1] 326623
adjourned [1] 326711
adjust [1] 323115
adjustment \{2] 305112 315914
adjustments (2) 3171712
ADMIRAL (1) 320825
Admiral [20] 3174 22,
3175101617 18, 317625
31802331819,318913
31961932016 18, 320424
32082232092 7, 1019
32101432113
admitted [5] 3040 5, 306517
3127193218732223
advance [1] 318719
advanced [2] 31872232069
advantage (5) 3035 25,
\(303610,20,32108,32127\)
advise [5] 3061 3, 7319723
32121
advises [6] 3189 22, 2324
2531901
advising [1] 304023
advisory [5] 3062 6, 7,
3189151720
advisory-type [1] 32268
affected [3] 30662224
322421
afford [1] 32058
afloat (2] 32326325716
afraid [1] 32664
aft (6) 3083930941121
3098143102 17, 19
afternoon [4] 321325,
3214 1, 325423
afterwards [1] 31153
age [1] 314216
agonized [1] 320511
agonizing [1] 319125
agree [11] 3036 6, 19, 25
307218319719323523
2532575,326133262812
agreed (2) 30698,31988
agreement [3] 321015 18, 32114
ard [5] 31804318921
3212173215632584
arded (1) 30682
ards [3] 3177 18, 318925
321317
air [8] 30629311222
3210 23, 3225 10, 322911
32301314323119
Airport [1] 307324
al [1] 326619
Alameda [1] 31491
alarm [5] 304516304620
30559322824
alarms (1) 32282
Alaska [16] 3065 8, 313313
314722317724318669 21, 3187 16, 320023 ,
321610113217 4, 322516 326619327221
alcohol [16] 3095 11, 30972
30996310183174 10, 11
32058912223208310
12151920
alcoholic [1] 32059
alcoholics [2] 3207816
Alexander [1] 314713
allogation [1] 316414

Son Systernt Apotemions
aliegediy [1] 31749
allergy [1] 31394
allow [1] 306173
allowed [2] 306911313617
alone (2] 31194319015 alongside [3] 309319
3112 19, 31132
aloud [1] 316714
Alpha [1] 31271
ahter [2] 3038 18, 30396
altering [1] 30433
Alyeska [2] 3067410
Ambrose [1] 312610
amendment [3] 30273
3029 1, 303212
American [1] 307615
amount [7] 31111331428
3153 2, 3211 19, 322918
323114325016
anchor [3] 303522319713 319922
Anchorage (5) 3031 25, 30321930501630658 307324
anchors [2] 32481718
angle [3] 313522313612
announce (1) 31201
annoy [1] 32144
Answer [12] 30597911 15, 223060510161821 3061 10, 17
answer [23] 30531930679
133094431502331554
315714316821317021
317283173 5, 31839,13
319624319818320923
324173252101516
325324325621
answered [4] 303118
31452331575317217
answars [1] 32512
Anybody [1] 320519
anybody [8] 308121
3082141630911309422
32017326223
Anyway [1] 316912
anywhere [4] 30463
304816307919324123
apart [1] 31504
apparently [5] 3083810
3173243178103195.17
appear [5] 30561430683
30998 11, 310110
appearance [1] 31967 appeared \{2] 3165 13.
316611
appears [8] 307117
3165103166615317522 3193 16, 17, 31964
application [2] 314913
applied (2) 305323326325 apply [1] 318319
appreciate [1] 32676
apprise [1] 30458
apprising [1] 30627
approach [6] 305525
312610319253221 15, 3251 17, 325412
approached [1] 315015 approprate [2] 3034 8, 312912

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-27-94 VOLUME 19
Approximately [7] 30815
308223308845309323
30991321515
approximately [11] 304814
3083230931630965
3097101131002331763
3204432324326110
approximation [1] 303310
Apnl [15] 30272611
3028 11, 153032913
30661330741417
3189133192332027
322718322814
Archbishop [1] 314716
archrtect [3] 32179322213 32312
Arco [1] 304312
areas [4] 3141931595
3205832122
argue [1] 319924
argument [1] 319819
argumentative [1] 31984
arises [1] 307917
Arizona [1] 314625
Arm [5] 307017315018 31581631592316921 arm (8) 30353305722
3064731122331133
31581719320213
arms [2] 31122125
aroma [2] 3174 10, 11 arrival [2] 3148 22, 32121 arrive [5] 30421430815
3093173211332174
antived [13] 30421730539
30991031483 18, 31494
315919 23, 3173 14, 17 31921032179,14 arriving [1] 31498 article [1] 316225 ascertaining [1] 32515 ashore [2] 30961821 aside [1] 308513
asking (6) 30272331172 3136113141331662 31955
asks [1] 32522
aspect [6] 3130 10, 320218
320318 21, 3204 5, 23
aspects [1] 313013
asserbato (1) 32557
ansess [3] 316025,323516 20
assigned [7] 3042 12,
30522531224531321
31426320122
assignment [1] 314721
assignments [2] 317621
320524
assist [2] 31497323817
assist-tug [1] 323817
assistance [4] 303523
3059 19, 3061 17, 31903
Associates (1) 32153
assocration [1] 31887
assume [6] 307493176 6,
3196133203 19, 3205 21. 326611
assumed [2] 31761031781 assuming [1] 311810
assumption [5] 30577810

305811320418
assure [1] 316316
asterisk [1] 306521
astem [7] 30867310223
310616173107731723
32376
attach [1] 32491
attack [1] 315222
attempt [13) 3036114
303713053613306211
315811143159101213
32001320519
attempted [1] 317019
attempting [2] 316019
316210
attempts [1] 320715
attend [3] 30479314825
320510
attended [1] 306720
attendees [1] 307114
attending [1] 306015
attends [1] 319615
attention [10] 30379
306414309920313114
203139931412331593
31722532093
attentive [2] 317911320017
attomeys (2) 32001725
attributed (1) 31818
audience [1] 315615
August [5] 304263065 12,
307110312810
authortative (1) 31519
Authorty [1] 31587
authority [3] 303124
3032.17, 31585
authorized [3] 31631.
320214
authorizing [1] 320121
automated (1] 31088
automatic [3] 304022
307921319220
automatically [7] 304615
25304738310819
31131720
autopilot [6] 30786912
15, 1623
available [12] 305411
30672306814306915
31401731781932104
3225 19, 3235 2, 3237 3,
3238 6, 32645
average [5] 30791112
3133731372024
avoid [10] 3043 3, 305415
31311531491417 18,
315046319824321025
avolded [1] 31562
avolding [1] 313120
awake [1] 311714
aware [44] 3035213
3045 1, 306215 18, 30826
7, 3088243089 1, 3092 23,
310310 13, 19310414
3105 2, 5, 3106 19, 3107 2,
311020311410,31193
3140 11, 133141 9, 20,
3142 23, 31572124.
31691731791631834
31863
31882531972531985

Concordence by Look-Soe(66)
320120320213322021 3254462022
awoken [1] 317314
- B-

B-A-I-L-I-E [1] 307324
bachelor [2] 30742030754
background [1] 312018
backs [1] 316315
backtrack [1] 317122
backwards [4] 321623
323710324578
Baihe [1] 307323
ballast [8] 305714322323
32243632261922,
323124324816
ballasted [2] 322620
324813
ballasting [2] 3248 12, 13
ballpark [2] 30331831191
bank (2) 31559
bar (2) 320012325414
barges [1] 324616
base [5] 306322311821
222432443
Based [4] 321110323717
324610326510
based [17] 3060 4, 3104 15,
3118243174 13, 31969
3216183222 21, 323019
20, 323413323523
32431920 21, 32523
Basically [3] 31697 15, 324523
basically [18] 307614
31081231324314810,
314913315219315318
3157 3, 3161 12, 21, 318317
320015320578322016
322414322623323113
basis [3] 3208203217 16,
32508
Baton [4] 3075 13, 30767
322626
Bay [1] 303821
bay [1] 322825
Baytown [4] 3075131922 30768
Beach [1] 313313
beach [3] 318117319116 32481
beam [2] 3172 2, 324014
bearning [8] 3046 2, 30476
3050 3, 30834322025 ,
3224223239614
becoming [1] 31505
Beer [1] 30781
beg [1] 313611
begins [7] 303953068 10,
13, 3069 2, 3180 19, 325125 32521
begun [1] 30882
behalf (1) 306819
behavior [1] 324612
Behind [2] 3084 10, 309820
behind [10] 3081 13, 308411
308511 19, 3086 22,
30912230981819
310025320011
belched [1] 32391

charactenstics [3] 310619 321012321210 charge [2] 3111531488 Charles [1] 31753
Charleston [9] 30751013 307693128831322425 313351011
chart [12] 30281719
\(308410,13,3085101112\)
1930901130912330921
charts [2] 32381932473
chastised [1] 306219
check [6] 30611030805
311321314413323015 323625
check-In [3] 30616315012 13
checked [1] 31446
checkıng [1] 30461
chicken [1] 310123
chief [16] 308012309210
3094 24, 3112 1, 3116 11, 18,
31173 9, 3121 24, 3122 2,
3177145318415324521 children [2] 31812024
choice [1] 32018
chores (1) 304524
chronic [1] 311912
chuckled [1] 309623
Chugach (1) 326619
curcle [1] 30529
crrcles [1] 311224
circumstance [1] 305417
circumstances [5] 305410
3055231621831972
325714
circumstantial [1] 311714
Civil [1] 30266
crvil [1] 320022
crvilian (1) 305223
Claar [2] 30811113
clanty (3) 30502430947,
320722
classes [1] 32089
Clatsop [1] 32474
clean [4] 3132253133415 19
cleaning [1] 31425
cloar [10] 303116303821
305753059243060 14,
3101123177 17, 321316
323821
cleared [2] 3155 5, 31925
CLERK [28] 30263 18, 20
304147 11, 30651359
307315 18, 21, 2531109
1131203611312317
314618202231471
3174 24, 31751 5, 32149
climb [1] 324021
clock [1] 31913
closed [4] 307917309815
3134 4, 322721
closer [2] 303323322123
closest [1] 303919
CO [2] 30662232063 co-owner [1] 32153
coast \((B) 3076\) 18, 20, 21,
31332318115
code (1) 31666
coofficiont [2] 3240 8, 32415

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-27-94
VOLUME 19
coffee [6] 304523530813
coffer [1] 309116
cognizance [1] 318513
collection [2] 306821
313916
College [4] 31202123
31211314719
college [2] 31202225
collided [1] 322411
collision [9] 310417 20, 24
310523149171831506
31971832275
collisions [9] 31031425
31491621 24, 31503
31529319110321514 colloquy [1] 31626
color [3] 310624310710 32521
Columbia [8] 303821
306617203071 11, 30739 , 3247125
column (4) 3128 25, 3129 4, 3210123
coming [18] 305016
30571330613308723
309410314911315011
14316117320124
3223193226153236311
3245222532476
command (12) 3034 14,
30992531001 7, 31349
12313516172021
31781319323
Commandant [4] 317512 31778318812320716 commandant [3] 3027 21, 3176 9, 32086
COMMANDER [2] 31472
31708
Commander (36) 306424
3065 11, 1331461631474 1431482315120315424 315518243156325 315918316123316314 316419316513 15, 31721 3173 2, 72331741
319310143194914
3195332354323616
32451112 17, 324718
325025
commander (2) 315514
3252.18
commanding [8] 3066310 13, 3147223148521
31782, 321312
commands [16] 30342224
30356930992223
3100345,31011231343
3135 15, 3197 7, 14319823 commenced [1] 31082
comment [20] 3072 7, 10, 11, 14, 3081 20, 30823 12, \(312915,1619,3130718\) 22 25, 313212 15, 18, 31382131398,31451 314773161531809 3181 3, 3182 2, 3, 31841 3190 8, 325512
commented (2) 308118 31875
comments [5] 3129 13,

313014313122317018 318721
Commission [1] 327222
committee [1] 32027
common [6] 30702425
31161831341731587 32259
communicate [1] 31136
communication [5] 303713
\(303816,30395,325315\) communications [6] 30377 30382530461232039 3256232573
community \(\{3] 31862124\) 31875
companies [6] 306323
30701631372231382 32142532151
Company [10] 306711
3071 17, 3075 18, 20
307616311816311915 3120 14, 312210
company [6] 307017
311419311821312219
32142432152
compare [5] 3133101121 31371821
compared [3] 313312
31911232045
comparison [2] 31906 321024
compass [3] 31361025 31375
competent [7] 30746
3178 10, 318491225 321318
complain [3] 3119 17, 1923 complaining \{2\} 31161325 complete [6] 312781314 32171732441232451 completed [7] 30261011 304717304833206313 322718
completely [4| 305917
3063 10, 3101 25, 316921
completes [1] 320821
completion [1] 317614
complex [1] 31909
complexty [3] 3190 20, 24,
31911
comport [1] 316422
con (10) 3036214 16,
3037 1, 305633062 22,
31344317811724
concentrate [2] 313114
31399
concentration [2] 3043 10,
313324
concern (2) 3154 8, 319312
concerned [7] 30351
315813159 20, 316078 8,
3213 5, 323613
concerning [4] 3103 4,
3115 5, 3117 18, 312322
concerns [2] 31169,313010
conclude [1] 32048
concluded [1] 31629
concludes [5] 3034 2,
3039223056 9, 306420
321324
conclusion (4) 31384

3192632131532542

\section*{conclusions [2] 30793} 325517
concrete [1] 325116
condition [2] 324619
conditions [13] 303521
305721305817305912
23, 3071131191718
314511318811531891
25
conduct [1] 311021
conducted (1] 311423
conducting [1] 31111
confer (1) 32494
conference [11] 3071 10, 14,
2130728111423,
315425315641331654
confidentiality [3] 320620
21, 32072
confined [13] 3126 14,
312823243129120,
3130 5, 3141 9, 14, 20,
314314314413 23, 314511
confirms (1) 321919
conflict [1] 314810
conflicting [5] 303541114
303716305918
conflicts [1] 315213
confuse [1] 31274
confused [3] 305910
3094 4, 322216
congeation [4] 315824
31591 2, 321025
Congress [2] 318012
318914
Congressman \{2] 318657
conjunction [3] 3103.24,
3104 7, 315112
connect [1] 322811
connected [1] 322810
connection [5] 31631
31812321733241412
Conning [1] 313414
conning [8] 31347913
3135 1, 3136 23, 3137 14, 317915
consequence [2] 3215 15, 17
consider [7] 3079 11.
3107 13, 3151 9, 3162 17,
323653238832549
considerably [1] 31825
consideration (2) 3211 11,
323813
considered (4) 3036 23,
3069 13, 3197 13, 326124
considering [1] 32258
consiat [1] 31113
consistent [5] 3055 25,
3057 20, 3141 11, 3247 22,
326522
console [5] 3051 6, 308710
3098 14, 15, 31011
consortum [1] 307310
conatant [3] 3083 4, 31557
20
constantly [1] 313024
contact [10] 303810
3052 19, 3055 15, 313825 ,
31522231592325
3176 23, 3193 15, 322110
contacted [2] 3153 3, 32002

Buac Syiterna Applications
contacting [1] 315420
contained [1] 32114
Container [1] 30777
container [1] 30775
contains [1] 32729
contemplate [3] 3197678
content (1] 308420
contents [1] 314016
context (6] 302922319613 319753209103265 3, 9 continuation [1] 30266
continue [10] 3026930699
153072330871218
3132202131591031773
continued [1] 30889
continues [5] 305319
31554319818321022 32531
Contınuing [1] 316317
comtınuing [1] 30897
continuousiy [1] 31962
contribute [1] 321314 contributed [2] 31739
32136
Control [1] 320916 control [31] 30341820 30602430611306249 30952031011921
310810 15, 31515,315210 113160131531611120 3210222332111217 19, 24, 3212 5, 323617324521 3258615
controlled [1] 307923 controller [1] 30424 convenience [1] 317519 conversation [26] 30294 3031203081222530823 309283096 9, 25309712 151831521831603 31623,5102122317320 317413252111832531 232541018
conversations [6] 307224 3092143166 1, 316822 , 317318325217 convince [1] 319924 convinced [3] 3202832032 3
cooperate [1] 31635
copies [2] 30632325
coprous (1] 322522
copy (4) 30372330707
31281732229
Cordova (1] 30658
comer [1] 305717
corporate [1] 320517
Corporation (3) 31277
317120326619
corporation (1) 317117
corporations [1] 311111
corrected [1] 312621
correction [1] 305611 corrective (6] 3064 6, 19 319991822325717 correctly [2] 313415 324924
counsel [4] 31552320724 32661032672
counseling [1] 31312 counted [1] 308324

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-27-94 VOLUME 19

Concordance by Loom-See(69)
country [1] \(3198^{-} 20^{-}\)
couple [10] 30407304311 3079630911131103 314222316124320013 1932479
Course [2] 313623320916 course [39] 30381830396 30433305225305423 30556305663062 13, 17 30632030692430702 3,
3075 2, 3103 21, 3110 1, 3111223114467,
31222031246312711
313516313622313747
93148 25, 3178 3, 320924
321035193222832555 32598326019
courses [3] 3062 10, 3074 23, 24
COURT [32] 3026510 16, 30405306516307317 312315312741931414 17314673147710, 32005101332142
321873222332496810 3251193256 15, 18 22, 326619173267610 Court [3] 3026 4, \(3110^{\circ} 7\) 312818
court [3] 312317320020 326620
Cousins [15] 30811130848 930858308620309011 30913309291230933 31006831012031061 310823
cover [9] 311116312419 3143931512022315820 317521317678
coverage (5] 315020
315573190 23, 3191 1, 3
covered [1] 315022
covering [1] 315017
created (1] 306815
creation [1] 316519
credt (1) 32312
crew [6] 3182151825
32212323121325722
criticism [1] 323619
CROSS 19 ) 30345305618
30709310519311525
31381831708320825
324913
Cross [1] 31707
cross \(19 \mid 3037202430387\) 30392030706315411 31705320823321324 cross-examination [3]
305617306420311524
cross-examine [1] 32496
crossed (4) 309524309815 315411316924
crossing [2] 30952431703
crude [2] 31331216
cruising [1] 32404
crummy [1] 30458
crushing [2] 32621118
cue (1) 323325
cup [4] 30452530813
curb [3] 31691011
curiosity [1] 32305
current [7] 30425304858 31378317510317621 318516
currently [7] 3042131224
73176182031851518
curriculum [1] 317522
curtain [3] 30841114
308513
curves [3] 3236 25, 32388 cut [1] 310124

143068 15, 31076,315722
24319711182224
319815111517
dangerous [3] 304019
3191 4, 319815
dangers [1] 317913
Daniel [1] 302622
dark [2] 3098 24, 318221
dam [2] 322913324213
data [11] 3044 24, 304717
3049 18, 2031922031934 3194 25, 31951153217 16, 323712
date [7] 314724315125
316419317657,322814
DATED [1] 327214
dated [3] 30651231168 315123
David [2] 3140 1, 314119
dawned (1) 324814
Day [1] 326612
day [21] 304024304525
3047131824,30485
3052 19, 2124311518
311711315621317610
3182193198632221114
322623254 22, 3266 24,
327214
daylight [5] 3070 17, 2224
3071 4, 30731
days (7) 303024311610
31222324312420
31642432479
daytime [1] 30712
de (1) 310513
Dead [1] 31094
dead [5] 30831031083
3109532369324420
deadpan [1] 31744
deadweight [3] 32277
3244911
deal [5] 3046 24, 3059 16,
3131 23, 3200 20, 324214
dealing [1] 30492
deals [1] 30273

December [1] 30668
decide [3] 320514324415 32506
decided (3) 30861231888 326519
deciding [2] 31881332506
decision [3] 31991320517
325420
decisions [3] 3069 16,
30731322221
deck [18] 3079 18, 20
3080316 19, 309520,
3099103118 17, 31194
3128133131 10, 31429
3212 16, 3227 21, 3228 7,
3229173232 19, 324015
deduce [2] 3245 3, 4
deeds [3] 3247 22, 325115
326420
deemed [1] 306924
deep [4] 3184 2, 3186 16,
31911532205
deeper [1] 32252
Defendant (1] 322124
Defendants [7] 30405
3041 3, 3065 16, 316721
32183732223
defendants [5] 30268
3039 25, 3065 10, 3073 13,
32145
defense [1] 31489
define [1] 319612
definntely [3] 30868310515
319025
definition [1] 312614
degree [7] 30742030753
431332432401316
degrees [11] 3057 16,
3102213103331103
31361332325326019
32631346
Delaware [1] 307624
delays [1] 302615
Delozier [10] 315314
3173 15, 17, 32542432552 32651 4, 18
demands (3) 3133141823 demeanor [3] 3097730994 31602
demonstrate [1] 322118
demonstration [2] 311524
depart [4] 31672224
3168220
departed [4] 31551921
31822022
departing [1] 31556
department [1] 312813
departs [1] 318224
depend [3] 3202151618
dependable [1] 314210
depending [4] 31064
3115 16, 31362531591
depends [7] 30464304724
311620315824324618
325714326115
depict [1] 321922
depose [1] 320025
deposition [16] 30269
303924304113306423
3073151631108312711
3141143146151731551

31651131742332011
320821
depositions [3] 32001618 32018
Deppe [3] 3171161825
depth [1] 32204
depths [1] 321820
dermatitis [1] 31391
describe [8] 30797309316
30988314714316825
3176232226
described [5] 305612
311514318917322218
describing [1] 302922
descmption [2] 31325 319414
descriptions [1] 32217
deserve [1] 313811
design [3] 319017321011 321210
designate [1] 318525
designated [1] 32246
destgnation [1] 324224
designations [1] 319321
designed [11] 314925
31501731518,3181 14,
31901819323110 18, 3238 10, 11
dasires [1] 321122
despite [1] 313821 destination [1] 309514
detall [2] 3098831577
detailed [1] 314822
determination [1] 323822
determine [7] 3052731621 632041432368 15, 32373 determined [2] 31748 31777
determining [2] 316020 32366
detract [1] 31311
devalop [1] 306920
developed [3] 30671
306923322617
develops [1] 306912
deviate [4] 304024305415
3063631701
deviated [1] 316923
deviating [3] 3052 24,
31691718
deviations [4] 315212
3201 21, 320213
Devine [1] 32154
diameter [1] 311225
Diego [3] 32294632422
difference [11] 3135 15, 19 3141253142 2, 315414 3171132401532526 3259 23, 326025 differences [2] 319016 differently [1] 316411
difficult [8] 31846319114 17, 20, 3200 17, 320322, 320517320622 difficulty [3] 307818 31821132105 digrtally [1] 319221 DIRECT [9] 3026 24, 304117 3065 22, 30741311015 31201231472,31756 321414
direct [13] 30342306319
306414307825313624
31586317225319738
1231981132092321024 directed [9] 30621330646
19, 3199917192032029
directing [2] 306216
319821
direction [14] 30614
3134233153346
3165233166 2, 3197 11,
3199142123321622
323211327213
Directions [1] 32111
directions [5] 30348 ,
305211306441331996
directive [1] 319916
disagree [1] 323523
dlagreed [1] 31983
disagrees [1] 32001
diasppear [3] 305718
317022320623
disappeared [2] 3170 15,
31714
disappearing \(\{3\) ) 303021
3170.24, 25
discharge [2] 307518
307623
discharged [2] 3192.11
320520
diacharges [2] 307618
discomfort [1] 313822
discovar [2] 31571018
discovered [1] 308611
discrepancy [1] 31964
discuss (2] 31541731716
dineussed [4] 30408 15, 16,
318615
Drecussion [1] 309111
diacussion [11] 3033 16,
3034730689,308013
30821330919314920
31681931766319819
321116
discussions (2] 308522
31691
disintegration [1] 307111
diaplay [1] 30407
diatance [6] 3033 22, 31504
3155 9, 3227 11, 32361214
diatencos [1] 321820
distinct [1] 31711
distinction [2] 315922,
32356
dietinctly [1] 31009
distraction [2] 31311521
distress [1] 32158
district [2] 3177231894
disturb [1] 32269
diver [2] 322023
divers [7] 3221710
3222.11, 16, 21326223

32645
divert [4] 303714306911
3167 1, 316810
divide [1] 322917
Dhing [1] 32154
division [1] 318512
doek [3] 3080 15, 31121921
document [32] 303769
303824305913071713

311316311623151814
152031552315624
31612531671831691
317520222431766
31801731904319389
319445,320931011
32102232126
documents [6] 306619
31511231651113
31661232095
Doesn't [1] 303022
doesn't [18] 302919
30462530479305614
305720310819311623
312714313020319612
3199192021320022
32234532261432673
dogleg [5] 30571719
305852021
Don (4) 3186 7, 825
Donald [1] 32312
door [6] 3095161820
3098 15, 31541324710
doppler [1] 310217
doubt [6] 30686315616
3167123193 17, 32411923
Douglas [1] 302716
downstairs [1] 30454
Dr [2] 317213
drasticalty [1] 315311
draw [2] 305711309920
drawing [4] 32191332229 14
drawn (1) 325517
dressed [2] 30813309914
draw [1] 311223
diff [1] 325310 :
drill [3] 31151321520
dillis [2] 311420
drink (3) 3077222324
drinking [5] 31641531651
3173 24, 317469
drive [7] 31812025
32401832441732456
325612
driven [1] 32278
drtving [3] 324412 14, 32556
drop [2] 3037 17, 319922
dropped [5] 3043 2, 3059 13,
3155931688317323
drove [4] 3153932404
3247 4, 326023
drugs [8] 3205 18, 19, 21
3206 14, 3208 2, 91214
dry-dock [1] 320624
Due [1] 302912
due [2] 313319326211
dumb [1] 325816
duties (9) 3049 3, 3115 10,
3132 20, 314211314823
24, 3151631632,319616
duty [18] 3066 12, 3117 19.
20,3118311 13, 3124 25,
3132 23, 3177 16, 317969 ,
\(11,1418,31924,7320513\), 320710
\(\mathrm{DX}[4] 32185,8,32221,4\) DX3495 [2] 3065 10, 306718
-E-
earty [9] 3164731822124
32011732202432268
32542332664
ears [1] 31116
earth [1] 32322
ease [1] 32301
eased [1] 310920
easier [1] 30712
East [5] 3039 18, 3110 13,
31331818
east [6] 3039173076 20, 21
3109183133232169
Easter [1] 32175 i , ;
eastern [1] 303913 7 13
easy (3) 31252431372
322611
echo [1] 320225
economic [1] 32166
economics [1] 307425
edge [4] 3170142325
31713
- -
editton (2) 3151 17, 31522
education [2] 3147 14,
31762
effect [22] 3038 2, 3050 10,
3056 1, 3151 18, 25, 3152.2,
3164 7, 3174 4, 7, 3177 14,
3179 3, 53192 8, 10,
3196203205 22, 3208.3, 15
3226 14, 3262 11, 3263.25,
32641
effactive [1] 30734 c-
effects [1] 311912
efficiency (1) 311418
efficient (1) 323812
effort (3) 3026 13, 3205 16,
320616
efforts [1] 316221
enght [6] 3042 13, 3119 2,
3180 17, 3222 11, 32599
eloct (1] 320620
elemants [2] 31508316122
eliminate [3] 3185 19, 31869
318715
emergency (1] 32284
employ [1] 307520
employed [4] 30421
3120 14, 3122 7, 317123
employee [3] 3131 6,
31711721
employeos [1] 31381
employment [2] 3042 5.
317614
empty [5] 3223 24, 3224 1, 6
10322620
enclosure [4] 3035 16,
3064 9, 3151 16, 319619
encounter [2] 3117 3,
318924
encountered [2] 3099 10̀.
310523
oncouraging [1] 311020
and [28] 30335,3037 15, 18
3039 4, 3057530669 9,
3153 10, 316673167 23, 25,
3168 3, 5, 7, 14, 3169 14,
3176 10, 3185 16, 3186 1, 22,
31974 9, 319910 16, 18,
320023222 13, 32407
1 ,

324923
end－on［3］ 32032132048 23
ended［3］ 3153 10， 315410 324715
endorsed［1］ 318819
endorsement［2］ 317920 ．
318418
Ends［1］ 31684
ends［2］ 311315324219
engaged［2］ 306621
317914
Engel［1］ 306723
engune（29） \(309922,23,25\) ， 3100 1， \(3102.12,310810,14\), 17， 3233 9，17，22， 3234 17， 3238 8， 3239 12，17， 3241 21，
3242 1，8， 16 21， 3243 6， 3244 18， 32485,326024 ， 3261 21， 3262 1，2， 3265 7， 8 engincer［5］ 3080 12，
3094 24， 3108 14，17， 31407 engineering［2］ 3113910
Engines［1］ 316115
engunes（37） 30897310716
192531083 8，13，16，22，
3109223161310 16，19，
203163 14， 3216 13，14，15， \(24,323515,19,323620\) ，
323793241 16，17， 3244 12， 3253 20，24， 3255 3，8，
3261 6， 710 12， 17
English［1］ 307425
enhance［1］ 30672
enjoy［1］ 326612
Enlarging［1］ 319813
enlisted［1］ 32051 ensure［5］ 30602130612 3073 2， 31351,314912 entail［1］ 304716 entered［4］ 31556 8，21． 32472
entaring［1］ 319815
entities［1］ 313722
entitled［2］ 3116831639
Entrance（1］ 318320
entrance［1］ 32474
entry［3］ 3046130475 ， 315510
episode \｛2］ 30989310017 EPS［1］ 315525
equilibrium［1］ 32269
Equipment［2］ 3225 16，
32289
equipment［8］ 30602
3115231935321720
3225151920
erase［1］ 322217
erratic［1］ 317017
error［5］ 3246 23， 3250 2，7． 8325813
errors［1］ 313324
Essentially［1］ 30673 established（3） 30608
3149 12， 322623
estimate［10］ 3032 22，
3048193082 25， 30831
3088 15， 3090 18， 3125 16，
32511
estimated［1］ 305210
et［4］ 306210314512

3178 20， 326619
ETA［6］ 303010303820, \(304347,30491,4\)
evaluate［2］ 3235 1， 324520
evaluated［8］ 313011 ，
3139 19，23， 3140 1，4，6， 9 evaluation［21］3122．24，
31231312849 13， 3131 5，
3132．23， 313892031398 ，
3140103141113142 22，
31436 12，23， 3144 11，17，
24， 314510
evaluations［18］ 3122 11，21，
3123 4，11， 3124 3，6，7，12，
19， 3129 12， 3139 17，
3140 13，16，21，25， 3145 19， 31462
evaluator［1］ 314323
evasive［1］ 31505
evoning［5］ 3054 12， 3080 16，
3093 12， 3182 21， 325025
evont［3］ 3089 13， 3106 24，
315411
events［2］ 3161 12， 326211
eventually［2］ 3240 12，
325512
everybody［7］ 3111 16，
3163 5， 3177 21， 3249 18，
3257 24， 3258 15， 16
Evesham［1］ 311018
Evidence［1］ 326323
evidence［10］ 3068 11，13，
143126 22， 3218 4， 3221 16，
25 3262．8，18， 3263.21
evidently［2］ 3186 11， 32413
exact［4］ 315315,31545 ，
316723321225
exactly［13］ 3043 9， 3048 22，
3054 18， 3084183101 1，
311222243148 25，
3177 17， 3179 12， 3228 22，
323210323514
exaggeration［1］ 3182.4
exam［2］ 3075 7， 312119
EXAMINATION（20） 3026 24，
30345,3041 17， 3056 18，
3065223070 9， 3074 1．
3105 19， 3110 15， 3115 25，
312012313818,31432,
3147 2， 317083175 6，
3208253214143249 13，
326412
examination［3］ 3201 18， 32082132665
EXAMINER（ 8 ） 30346 ，
303573037 22， 3038 17，
3056 19， 3063 17， 3170 9， 32091
oxample［12］ \(30645,8,13\) ，
153119 19，3122．21，31996，
13，16， 3226 19， 32439
EXCEL［5］ 3111 7，13， 31127, 9，31136
excellent［1］ 322521
Except［1］ 319114
except［5］ 3077 19， 3195 6，
3220 2，5， 322425
excerpts［1］ 30412
oxcess［3］ 3216 1， 32419 ， 32432
excessive［1］ 323111
exchange［2］ 3152 20， 315614
exchanges［1］ 310115
Excuse［1］ 30706
excuse［4］ 3051 19， 3149 3，
31858,325110
excused［1］ 326615
exercise［1］ 321112
exercises［2］ 3110 21， 31111
Exhibit［39］ 3039 25， 3040 3，
5，6， 3065 12， 3067 10，18，
3070 11， 3071 6， 3126 18，21，
3127 5，9，18，19，20，22，
3139 16，20， 3140 13，16， 3143 4， 3146 8， 3151 17， 3154 25， 3165 12， 3175 19， 3176 25， 3180 16， 3183 6， 3194 5， 3198 22， 3209 3， 3218 5，8， 3221 16，24， 3222 1， 4
exhtit［17］3058．24， 30412 ， 3070 12， 3071 8，9， 3126 18， 23，24， 3156 23， 3180 18， 3185 4， 31905,3219 21． 3221 20，21， 32231
exhibited［1］ 307218
Exhibits（3） 3065 14，16， 18
exneted［2］ 3070 22， 31985
existing［1］ 31813
exting［1］ 3038.12
expect［8］ 3033 24， 3034 1， 3104 16，25， 310510, 3114 17， 3237 18， 326516 expected［2］31427， 31606 expecting［1］ 30492
upprimen［9］ 3073 4，
3216 18， 3230 20，21，
3234133235 24， 3243 21， 3246 10， 326510 ，\({ }^{2}\) experienced［2］ 3043 15， 325722
expert［1］ 326115
expertise［3］ \(31848,20,22\)
experts［1］ 318710
Expires［1］ 3272.22
explain［5］3060 19， 31119 ， 3151 5， 3189 19， 31975
explained［2］3060 3， 319923
explaining［1］ 32509
explanation［3］ 3118 20，
3179 10， 319915
explosions［1］ 322512
exposure［1］ 31391
oxprossed［2］ 3164 17．
319312
expressing［2］ 3164 13，
31846
extent［7］ 3058 1， 30627,
3168 22，3182．17， 3203 4，
3225 8， 324011
extra［2］3117 13， 313715
extract［7］ 32408,3243 22，
3245 12， 3247 20， 3252 21．
3255 4， 19
extracted［1］ 321622
\begin{tabular}{l}
\hline\(-F=\) \\
\hline F－E－R－R－O－N－E［1］ 312010 \\
face［1］3164 18 \\
faclitate［1］ 30672
\end{tabular}
facilities［1］ 30154
facility［3］ \(31045,8,3210 \cdot 25\)
facing［3］3098：12， 3250.17
fact［38］3032．16，3038．7，10，
3047 3， 3064 5， 3080 1．
3091 15，3095：25，30969，20，
\(309825,3103.19,3104.1,4\), 3117 2，3122．16， 3131 24，
3133 19，3161．18，3162．17．
3167 6，10， 3170 13，3172．14，
3174 2，3182，18；3187－22；
3188 24，319355，，foif 3197 23， 3206 4，5， 3216 15， 3241 13，3251．12，3255．23，
 factor \(\{2\} 3182,16,31895\)
factors［2］ 31777,32965
facts［2］3172718，3213．15
facuties［1］3255：5 mi
fading［1］ 31712 ．axitiont falled（1］ 32412 －br： fallure［2］3206．14， 15 fatr［7］ 303310,31519 ， 3153 2，3182．2，3188，3， 17
Fairty［1］3036＂5 Sinw fairty［4］3078．20，3088．16； 32205,21 —
Falkenatoin［5］ 31538 ，
3173 15，17，275，31741．
falls［1］ \(319118 \rightarrow\) Hint＂ famillar［8］ 3038 3，5，－＋7h 3150 25， 3157 12，3175．25， 3180 3， 3193 19， 320487
Familiartation［1］3148．20 familiartze［1］ 310125 familiarizing［1］ 304423 fan［1］ 3232.8 14．timitani］ fachion［3］ 3066 2， 3224 15， 325922 gixac klinif fant［2］ 3114 11， 326821 faster［2］3180．2； 32348 fatigue［7］ 31155,31169 ， 3119 12，3182 15，25，3183．4 fault［1］ \(321322 \quad 3_{1}\) t ？ favorable［2］ 3130 14， 314025 TH0e spiec feasiblo［1］ 3113.11 ． 8 ct Fobruary［3］3075．19；．．二 3162．25， \(31648^{-} \rightarrow\) 万， 1 1 February－March［1］3169－18 federal［1］3201．2：\(\$ 35\) feedback［2］3138．12，3182． 1 fiel［12］ 3054 12， 3089 3， 3115 23， 3117 14，15； ，
3133 23， 3164 11，3185－23，
3187 20， 3195 6， 324920
feoling［ 6 ］3182．13， 3105 11，
3204 21， 3208 14， 3213.13
feels［2］ 3069 14， 31902
feet［25］ 3032 25， 3033 1，6，
8， 3094 1，16，18， 3096 8，
3099 3， \(3112.22,3186\) 16，
3218 25， 3219 8，14， 3222 11， 3228 3， 3260 1， 7 －\({ }^{4}\) 每
follow［4］ 313920,23 ，
3247 7， 16 ㄷ％is：
Fellowship［1］ 317612
fott［9］3044 25， 30896,7 ，
3132 19， 3157 5， 3160 24，
\(316911,31941,319814\)
FERRONE［3］ 312012

Banc Systerne Appticztions
313818,31432
Ferrone [5] 31202814
312321312623
fetched [1] 305010
fever [1] 31394
fiold [1] 306914
fifty [3] 32151732461115
figure [5] 306118308911
31112232441332455
frgured [1] 30899
file [2] 304722316511
filed [1] 304721
files [1] 31238
Filing [2] 30471112
filing [1] 304525
fill [1] 304719
filled [1] 323110
filling [1] 32284
final [1] 31383
finalized [1] 318519
find \(\{9\) ) 3050 22, 30514
311617314024314316
321920,323210323510
323825
finds [1] 30746
Fine [2] 30821832676
fine [1] 303718
finger [1] 317721
finish [3] 3256 18, 32664
Finished [1] 316115
fintshed [11] 30271304122
30481520304926
3080 19, 30972231619 31769
fire [4] 3097 20, 24311420 31151
firefighting [2] 311145
fires [1] 32157
First [1] 320817
fish [1] 324715
fishing [1] 32046
fitted [1] 322514
fittings [1] 322725
five [28] 30331130343
304422304510305716
30592307713308317
3084171930871308817
222331064,313816
31662332236721
32248322922323034
\(3232.1232382,324125\)
fix [2] 31791531802
fibed [1] 32587
fixes [1] 319414
flag [5] 30554320667,9
flashes [1] 30869
Flashing [1] 308625
flashing [6] 308314308416
\(17,19,25,308624\)
fiat [2] 32404,7
fleeing [1] 32655
floot [2] 31121113
finght [1] 306210
fights [1] 32145
flipped [1] 320312
float [4] 32281232291518 323114
flosted [1] 322817
floating [3] 3215832251
322911
Florida [1] 311019

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-27-94
VOLUME 19
Concordance by Look Seeliz)
flow [1] 321025
focus [5] 3036730619
315422315919317325
focused (1] 314812
fog [1] 318925
folks [1] 306625
follow [5] 30621316
30632031373322122
follow-up [1] 31127
followed [5] 3067 18,
313415314473194716
Following [1] 31808
following [6] 30352431418
317010317125317415
319915
follows [4] 3134 11, 316618
3181831997
foot [17] 32219322218
3228 10, 11, 3229 13,
\(\begin{array}{llll}3232 & 13 & 14 & 16 \\ 19 & 20\end{array}\)
324015162532604511
force (3) 31311132434
324412
forcefully [1] 324711
forces [1] 320711
forecast [1] 30457
forecasting [1] 30689
foregoing [2] 3272 9, 11
foreign [1] 30521
forepeak [1] 32242
foresee (1) 30722
forget (1) 30277
forgoving [1] 313324
forgot (2) 31616,321416
form (9) 3047193123357
1131291831932032158
321810
Formal (1) 314820
formed [1] 317710
former (1] 317512
forming [1] 323111
forms [1] 304716
formulated [2] 3220719
formulating \([1] 31878\)
Fort [4] 3120 23, 312176
314719
forth [4] 306822317923
3194931954
Forward [1] 310612
forward [15] 3081 14, 30838
31021617192023
3106 13, 3217 1, 32196
3239 23, 3244 4, 19, 22,
325525
forwards [1] 321623
found [6] 3052 18, 3145 14.
3205193220 18, 24, 326013
Foundation [1] 317612
foundation [1] 31413
Four [2] 3125 17, 321523
four [17] 3033 11, 304725
3083 21, 3086 24, 25
3166 22, 3169 3, 31822223
32232032245322622
3234 2, 3240 25, 324816
four-and-a-half [2] 324920
22
four-year [1] 31769
fourth (1] 30718
fragment [1] 30567
frame [7] 3066 16, 3084:4

31241831289316918
32212322216
Francisco [2] 31178
313313
Frankly [1] 320111
Fred [1] 32154
free [2] 3043532251
freighters (1] 321519
friction [4] 3227932408
3241511
Friday [1] 30265
friends [1+3107 13
front [10] 30382330391
304093070 12, 309424
3098 18, 3139 16, 3143912
32095
frontwards [1] 32448
Fuca [1] 310513
fulfill [1] 313219
Full (2) 32141232376
full [27] 3026203041720
3065530732130743
310721310945311011
17, 31206314622314712
31751319921321216
321410323623323736
7323814323917324113
324646
full-time [1] 310019
fully [5] 3108 8, 31635 ,
31782 4, 319511
fun [1] 309620
funded [1] 306625
future [2] 30689320523
FWE [2] 3161914
\(\square\)

G-MV [1] 31858
Gage [1] 302622
gain [2] 30572223
gangway (2] 309321
309413
Gardens [1] 314716
Gary [2] 3065 25, 314624
gas (6] 3225 10, 11, 14,
32272125322816
gash [1] 316313
Gatehouse [1] 304110
gather \([3] 3047161730677\)
gathered [1] 321716
gauge [2] 32301315
gave [14] 3100718,31066
311533123 11, 3138 11.
3147 4, 3160 5, 31839.
3198 13, 3207 13, 32287.
325121325216
gears [1] 303416
gem [1] 32286
gems [1] 32281
gentlemen [8] 312316
3128 18, 313019313118
3200 6, 3221183224 12,
326611
George [1] 313923
gets [4] 303013304720
3228532405
giat [1] 31324
Give [2] 31461012
give [27] 3030 5, 30348 ,
3038223056 6, 3061 17.

3062113064430903
309325310016311217
31171531262431343
31352531461131516
31631319713319914
32101932112532121,
32222132312325214
Given [3] 303316315621
324113
given [34] 3039 8, 30411
304333054 23, 3062 10,
30678309083093 3, 5, 9
30992224253100310
310263109181231334
31351631365,31461 .
317817318024319625
3198232431992132111
12323222323422

\section*{23}
gives [2] 30641331349
giving [12] 310045 13, 21
31012031023310921
31115313515317825,
3180 23, 318913
Glacter (4) 30661720
30711130739
glacier [2] 306810320125
Glondale [1] 311014
God [1] 3232.2
god [1] 322521
goes (14] 3045 16, 3095 16,
19, 3112 19, 3116 21, 31199 ,
3136132132232156 ,
3217 19, 322833240 19,
324823325921
Gonzales (1) 305222
Goose (6) 30501011 14,
18 23, 30512
GORDON [2] 3026 24, 30345
Gordon [2] 30269303115
gotton [5] 305216305515
3121183137532064
Government [1] 32013
government (2) 3167 19,
32015
gradual [1] 30896
graduate [2] 3075 6, 31218
graduated [3] 3074 18,
312146
graduation (1) 314717
grant [1] 317214
granted [1] 312511
grasp [1] 32465
great [8] 3059163131 23,
31577,32051632329,
325920
greater [5] 3133 15, 18, 23,
318322326025
Greok [2] 3246 25, 32471
green [2] 31062232322
Greg [4] 3086 25, 3093 3, 7, 31202
GREGORY [3] 3120 12,
3138 18, 31432
Gregory [1] 31208
Grimes [1] 30329
gross [2] 30748
grosesty [1] 320015
ground (4) 3177 13, 318716
32162532486
grounded [ 8 ] 3204 16,

3216 20, 32302132444 3248 5, 326511
groundings [9] 3103 14,
3104 1, 314921 23, 319110 11, 3215 7, 14, 25 group [2] 3067 7, 318721
Grove [1] 31754
GS-9 [2] 3166 7, 17
Guam [2] 32168
guass [25] 3046 13, 3051 19,
3057 4, 3082.24, 3083 1.
3084 3, 3088 17, 23, 3093 25,
309683097 13, 3099 3,
3110 5, 3151 5, 3152 16,
3173.21, 3187 14, 318811.
3192.1, 3227 17, 3254 22,

325816
guessing [1] 32604
gurdance [2] 3151 13, 31633
guidelines [2] 3114 18,
3122.23

Gulf [1] 31332
guy [7] 3028 18, 3029 1,
30555,3079 11, 3168 13,
3205 14, 324711
guys [5] 3034 10, 3113 2, 25, 3114 3, 32589
\(n \cdot f a-H-\)
H-A-R-R [1] 30658
hablt [1] 305915
hadn't [2] 30482432487
half [20] 3109 4, 5, 3114 1.
3120 19, 3228213230 2, 14 16; 3231 6, 18, 323520 ,
3236 3, 3244 21, 324810 ,
325443258163259 10.
3260 1, 5, 32634
halfway [5] 3071 16, 3163 7,
31667 21, 322220
halt [1] 324412
Hammen [5] 323361316
32341324215
Hampton [1] 31209
hand [15] 30261830415
30542530653307319
3079 16, 31109,31203
3146 20, 3149 21, 317424
3220 8, 3226 16, 3235 13,
325014
handed (1) 316510 handie [3] 3117 15, 3241 22, 32586
handled [1] 306816
handling (3) 310125 ,
321012321210
hands [3] 30851531612 ,
323617
handy [1] 320113
Haney [1] 314624
happening [5] 3045 2,
311973149143153 16,
31542
happens [1] 31349
happy [4] 3026 17, 3160 4,
3214 3, 325816
Harbor [1] 312611
Hard [2] 3109 17, 31261
hard [27] 3049 21, 305923
3100 1, 31091721311221

FEDERAL TRIAL'TRANSCRIPT

312524312815315413
315921316021 24,
316211316316,323014
32341921323561013
3236 7, 9, 10, 3260 20, 32621
hardest [1] 321912
Hargrave [6] 3071 17, 20 25, 3072 7, 13, 19
Harr [2] 3065 7, 30695
hat [1] 319411
hatch [2] 3095 16, 309723
hate \{2] 3060 16, 18
hauled [1] 322516
haven't [3] 3176 4, 3202.22,
32673 - \(\quad\) -
hay [1] 31394 y
haywire [1] 323618
hezards [4] 3062 8, 3189 23, 3198 24, 32122
Hazehwood-type [1] 316825
He'd [2] 3043 15, 310725
he'd [3] 3138.12, 3235 13,
323718
head [4] 3101 23, 3102.11, 318022,326515
heading [18] 3040 19,
3088 21, 3102.6, 7, \(9.13,16\), 22 25, 3105 15, 3110 1, 31375,3209 16, 20, 29, 3260 18, 19, 3263.5
headquarters (1) 31896 hasds [1] 311119
hear [21] 30494 7, 3081 15, 3082 16, 3089 4, 3090 7, 20, 3091 1, 3100 13, 16, 3109 14, 19, 3117 22, 3120 25, 3246 3, 4, 3249 24, 3250 4, 326821 heard [14] 3040 21, 304825 , 30612030895,3117 23. 3119 7, 8, 3235 4, 3243 20, 3247 18, 3248 19, 32502, 325621
hearing [3] 3031 25, 313424 31394
hearings [1] 303219
heart [1] 315222 T
heavily [1] 305925
heavy (4) 3099 14, 3145 12, 3214 21, 323823
heck [2] 3153 10, 31547
hold [11] 3031 8, 3039 9,
305317 25, 3055 23, 24,
3071 10, 3213 20, 323914
327211
helicopter [1] 32479
hell [1] 32468
folm [16] 3081 13, 309923
31006,3102 12, 3109 8,
31132324312322
3125 22, 312820313511
3136123137 13, 314210 ,
32111
holmsman [22] 3078 23, 25,
3085223090 8, 3101 6,
311315 16, 18, 3133 18,
3134 1, 10, 11, \(31354,10,16\),
25, 3136 4, 7, 8, 24, 25,
31376
helmsmen [3] 3113 13,
3134 20, 313718
help [7] 3030 17, 3080 1.

310314312823,322225 325522325722
helped [1] 31143
helping [1] 310325
HERBY [1] 32728
HERMAN [1] 321414
Horman [2] 3214 12, 16
HIGGINS [2] 3074 1, 310519
Higgins [3] 3073 14, 3074 4, 6
High [1] 314716
high (20) 3144 6, 3147 15, 17,
3172 2, 3185 20, 3206 15,
3228 20, 3236 3, 3242 23, 24,
3244 10, 3248 8, 3259 16, 18,
\(19,21,23,32601,3\)
high-water [1] 325924
higher [3] 3191 11, 12, 32398
highest [2] 322923,32304
highlighted [4] 312812
highway [1] 31697
Hilliand [1] 311013
Hillshire 11 1 31754
Hinchinbrook [2] 3183.20,
3192.14
hittory [3] 3075 5, 3139 3, 319124
hit (8) 3089 2, 3115 19,
3181 12,-3191-20, 326020 ,
32615 Fn orbe ,
hiting [1] 318117 -n
hold [8] \(31146,3135.22\),
3136 15, 19, 3159 10, 12, 13,
322624
holding [1] 31851 - 1

holed [1] 32515 - เ\%
holes [3] 3227 3, 3229 1, 8
holiday [1] 326612
Holland [1] 304110
home [2] 3110 17, 3152.17
honest [1] 322210
honesty [1] 31574
Honor [43] 3026 8, 13,
3034 3, 303922 23, 25,
3056 10, 11, 3064 21, 22.
3065 10, 19, 3067 9, 3070 5,
3073 13, 3120 1, 312313 ,
3126 20, 3127 3, 3141 12,
3146 16, 3147-9, 3170 6, 7.
3174 21, 22, 319623,31992,
3200 4, 3201 18, 3208.22,
2332132432141,3221 15,
24, 3251 18, 3254 12;
3256 14, 3266 3, 3267 5, 9
honor [1] 306422
hood [1] \(311116 \rightarrow \mu\)
hoods [1] 311118 t
hooked [2] 3046 19, 323123
hope [2] 3069 5, 326612
hom [1] 315321
horrible [1] 325921
horse [2] 3237 22, 326325
horsepower [8] 3237 3, 8, 9.
3238 7, 18, 3239 17, 3244 6,
325612
hose [1] 309722
hoses [5] 3097 20, 24,
3228 10, 11 ज्न v ?
hotel [1] 32177
hour [13] 3114 1, 3116 12, 16,

3117 13, 21, 3118 4, 11, 13 323623241 25, 3248-9, 32544
hours (29] 3027 23, 304311
311511 18; 3116 11, 12, 15,
18, 21, 3117 4, 5, 8, 11, 20 ,
3118411 13, 311920,21
3163 9, 12, 3182:22, 31916
7, 3226 15, 325910
House [5] 3180 19, 24,
3183.7, 31923, 32027
house [9] 3090 21, 3093:20
3094 12, 3095 17, 22,3096 4
3097 25, 3100 25, 3223.8
Houston (2) 3026-22; 31754
how'd [1] 31549 amm
Howard [1] \(3146: 24\)
Hudson [1] 32313
huge [1] 324624
hull (7] 3229 15, 16, 32301 ,
3239 10, 3242.17, 3243 8,
326219 ti Desismm
human [1] 3138.12
humped (2] 3240 23, 25
Hundred [1] 323920
hundred [7] 3064 18,
3069 10, 3199 17, 3215 2, 17
3246 10, 15
5月, 2
hung [2] 3224 13, 32535
Huntington [1] 31265
hurt [1] 32068
드﹎
hydraulic [1] 322917
hypothesize [1] 306018
- \(\quad 1-r-1-\quad . r m\)

I'd [19] 3035 15, 18, \(30 \overline{3} 78\) 8, 3039 13, 3058 12, 3070 11, 3105 23, 3114 7, 3126 23, 3138 2, 3157 5, 3159 25, 3161 1, 3175 20, 32092,7, 19, 21, 32604
l've [27] 3035 17, 3036 6,
3042 24, 3057 12, 31198 ,
3122 19, 3126 20, 3128 12, 3138.17, 3165 10, 3176 23,

3205 11, 3209 7, 3210 16, 3214 23, 3215 15, 3216 7, 8,
3218 1, 3234 23, 3246 15, 16,
17, 25, 3258 3, 6 - צej.
 IG[1] 32319 larossi [2] 3112 2, 3155 1. \(_{k}\) lee [1] 30699
lee [43] \(30304,9,10\),
3038 20, 21, 3040 25, 3043 1, 3, 5, 6, 8, 9, 10, 3054 15, 22, 3055 2, 3057 25, 3058 1, 3, 4
\(30595,17,3068\) 15, 306912
14, 21, 25, 3070 22, 25,
3071 2, 3, 3072 2, 3073 5,
3105 21, 23, 25, 3106 2, 3,
3166 25, 316921.
320124
idea [6] 3046 24, 3090 3,
3112 17, 3134 17, 3142.16, 322513
ideas [6] 3112 11, 18, 3113 3, 4, 7, 8
identification [1] 304013
identified (2) 3037 6, 305214

Identifies [1] 317116
identify [4] 3053610 13, 16
IG [2] 3231 22, 23
illness [2] 31382224
illogical [1] 324423
illustrative [1] 319913
image [14] 3031 15, 16, 17
3033 11, 21, 24, 315317,
3158 11, 14 17, 3170 16, 22,
3171 1, 4
umagune [4] 3098 23, 31574. 3169 2, 32588
immedlate [7] 3035 25,
3036 10, 20, 3161 19, 32107 , 8, 3212.7
Immediataly [1] 308919
immediately [7] 3044 18,
3082.19, 3085 5, 7, 315925,

3171 13, 32037
impact (3) 3183 16, 3186 3, 326111
impaired [4] 3095 10, 3097 1,
3099 6, 31018
impaled [2] 3241 21, 326013 implement [2] 311211.
32088
implemented [1] 311218 important (9] 3029 10, 315825,3159 21, 3194 1, 3197 15, 3255 23, 3259 16, 326311
impossible [1] 325525 impresston [5] 3073 10, 3103163160531701122 improving [1] 311211
inaccuracies [1] 315619
inadequate [2] 3144 8, 315517
Inasmuch [1] 320412
inattention [4] 317716
31796, 918
inaudible [3] 31551017 31683
inboard (1) 303919
inbound [13] 3037 15, 18,
3038 3, 4, 304313305417
22305713305820
31531931691431702
31791
inception [2] 3198 20, 321114
inch (3) 3241 18, 3243 1, 3 inches [2] 324338 incident (5] 3185 23, 3191 23, 3208 20, 3224 9, 325811 included [2] 3046 1, 31486 includes (1) 32157 Incorporated [2] 3215 3, 4 incorporated [1] 311822 increased [1] 320713 indicate [ 6 ] 308925,309510 3097 7, \(31884,25,320315\) indicated \([8] 305516\)
3099 5, 3101731743
3176 25, 318313
Indicates [3] 318723
3195 15, 323215
Indicating [4] 3040 9, 3063 5, 9, 13
indication [3] 31893
3219 16, 17
indicator [2] 3051731362 Indiscemible [1] 303721 individual [8] 3062 25,
3122253123631321
31331531561431575
320522
mndustry [3] 30662530738 321423
inefficient [1] 323710
inert [2] 322511322721
info [2] 32109,10
inform [4] 3104 20, 319815 , 14
Information [1] 319824
information (33) 3036 1, 11,
12 20, 22, 3054 11, 20, 25 3066243067 1, 7, 8
3069 15, 3140 23, 3151 10,
3160 9, 10, 3174 16, 320922
3212 7, 8, 9, 3217 21, 32208 ,
23, 3222.12, 14, 21, 3243 19,
325912173264 4, 9
informed [1] 31741
informing [1] 31036
inhouse [1] 31518
initial (4) 3154 21, 3211 15,
3227 5, 326124
initially [2] 3211 8, 326511
initiated [1] 315322
initiating [1] 309220
initiative [2] 3060 4, 31868
inject [3] 32251014 ,
322725
injecting [ 1 ] 322816 injured [1] 316016
Injuries [1] 324919
input [6] 3112 14, 3113 12,
3123131871231889
318911
inquire [1] 31583
inquiry [1] 304012
Inside [1] 32426
inside [8] 3061 18, 30647 ,
1830972331998322513
322911
insignificant [3] 32421319 32642
insofar [1] 310120
inspection [2] 31488
Instance [1] 305723
thatances [2] 3122 25, 32012
instruction [2] 3157 16,
317825
inatructions [2] 304010
326613
instruments [1] 308515
intact [2] 3223 17, 322616
Intelligence [1] 30799
intelligence [1] 307910
intended (5] 305418
3055223184 24, 325011 ,
32572
intending [1] 32574
Intensity [1] 315621
intent [1] 320621
intention [2] 3185 3, 320525
Intentions [4] 30375 ,
3055 24, 31584,325916
interchange [2] 3097 11,
30982
Intorested [2] 31397.

323012
interesting [5] 311312
32301232328323925
32418
interference [3] 30572124
32279
intermittent [1] 303117
internal [1] 302720
Intemational [1] 307323
Interpret [3] 3195520
319617
interprated \{2] 3195621
Interrogate [1] 322213
Interrupt [1] 322017
Interval [1] 308314
intervened [1] 30428
Intervening [1] 305712
Intervention [2] 310814
323121
Intorviow [3] 30324306122 326425
Intervrewed [4] 302716
30328322024325424
interviewer [1] 303020
interviews [3] 31631.
3164 20, 317012
intimate [2] 3210 11, 32129
intoxicated [1] 30978
inveatigate [1] 32138
Investigating [3] 3031 24,
3032 17, 321310
investigation [2] 3027 20,
322224
Investigations [2] 317816
321311
invite [1] 306422
Involve (1) 319614
Involved \(\{8\) ) 30452530464
30738 11, 3088.19, 32159 ,
32161232672
involvement (2) 3211911
Involves [1] 319614
iron [1] 30786
irregular [3] 317017
322415324025
Island [19] 3027313
302838303010303820
30434730491305010
1114182330513
3059 24, 31059322825 ,
32294
Islands [1] 30277
lasue [4] 3034 22, 31877 15, 318824
issued [4] 3074 6, 3182 10,
318413318722
lssues (1] 32111
lssuing [1] 320924
H'd (1) 325716
Hem [2] 313015318620
hemizes [1] 311625
-

J H [1] 32152
James [1] 317611
Jamestown [2] 3075 15, 17
JAMIN [1] 32675
January [1] 31168
foer [1] 3050-9
jlibe [1] 305025

Jim [1] 304114
job [14] 30762310422
31051631171631248
31301031312531343
320515321734322518
32491518
jobs [5] 3046531341
3215163216 8, 12
Joe [1] 311325
Johan [1] 30419
JOHN [2] 31381831432
John [1] 31208
joined [1] 320711
joked (1] 309611
Jones [3] 307314324819
Jonastown [1] 307516
JOY [1] 327221
Juan (1] 310513
judging [1] 303714
judgment [B] 3187 10,
324623325027 8, 325813
judgments (1] 318814
JULIUS [3) 321414324913
326412
Julius (2) 3214512
July [4] 306616307623 ,
314725316420
jump [1] 311121
Jume [3] 3066 15, 16, 31289
Juneau [1] 304312
Junior [1] 31759
jurors [1] 320014
Jury [6] 3026 2, 3123 18, 19,
320079326616
jury [ 9 ] 3128 18, 3130 19,
3131 18, 3146 11, 32144,
3218 16, 3221 18, 322225,
322412
justification [1] 318720
justified [1] 323613
justify [1] 32001
\(\overline{-K-}\)

K-O-N-K-E-L [1] 304112
Kagan [42] 30792 7, 30927
3100 6, 8310120310911
311314312322 24, 3124 1,
4, 8123125191322
31266 16, 3127631284
312925313110 19, 22,
\(31327,23,3137\) 13, 15, 18,
\(31385,6,9,20,31398,12\),
19, 31418 ,
13314219
keep [17] 3047 20, 30484 4, 3136 6, 3149 9, 25, 31504,
3158 11, 14, 3181 14, 16,
3222 15, 3227 7, 3231 19,
3232 6, 3244 2, 3248 1.
32523
keoping [1] 306115
keeps [1] 310322
kept [8] 3140 19, 21, 3145 19,
314643152 12, 3177 23,
32228325716
Kovin [1] 30657
Kow [1] 314716
kidding [1] 315221
kinds [1] 31788
Kinney [5] 303023303115

6,-21
Klinekhardt [3] 303823
3064 2, 319912
knot [1] 307018
knots [7] 303083038 19,
3070 24, 3227 8, 323811 12,
326125
knowing [2] 32601425
knowiedge [13] 3033 4,
3063 23, 3073 8, 307914
3126 23, 3177 16, 3179 6, 22,
3184 21, 3186 23, 318724
32101132129
Konkel [2] 3041 9, 14
Kunkel [4] 3041 14, 32333 ,
3245 20, 324812
\(\longrightarrow-L\)

L-6-ht-z (1] 321413
L-o-g-q-He [1] 31753
lack [4] 3138 1, 3159 1,
3177 16, 31796
ladder [4] 309310309519 324820.23

Ladies [1] 326611
ladies [7] 312315312817
3130 19, 3131 18, 32005 ,
322118322412
laid [2] 3232 5, 325718
land [2] 308920,32538
Lane [1] 31754
lane [35] 3037 15, 18, 3038 3, 4, 11, 3039 13, 17, 18,
3043 13, 3054 15, 17, 22,
3055 6, 3057 16, 18, 25,
3063 6, 3084 18, 3105 13,
3153 19, 3167 2, 3168 7, 11
14, 1631696,7 8, 14, 19
20, 317023179131998
lanes [28] 3030 4, 304025
3043 1, 30552305917,
308911 12, 3152.1131556
3158631662231675
31681316929 12, 13, 19
\(2124,31702,432012224\)
large [5] 314814322922.
3238 16, 324616
larger-type [1] 321519
largest [1] 30778
last [34] 3026 21, 3031 16,
3032 3, 3034 16, 30368 ,
3041 8, 11, 12, 3065 1, 6,
3066 15, 3068-25, 30691.
3070 15, 3073 22, 3075 18,
30762330944311012
31207931461823
31681331752318124
3194532026321221
321411
3252 16, 32643
lasted (1) 309712
late [1] 309120
laughter [1] 31824
law [3] 3190 21, 3191 8,
321116
lawyer [2] 3042 7, 317712
layman [1] 323922
loader (1) 320514
leaking [1] 307919
learn [6] 307835313113

FEDERAL TRIALLTTRANSCRIPT

31398,3152 14, 321718
leave [17] 303719 23,
3044 18, 3063 10, 3066 13,
3075193076 1, 3080 15, 16
17, 3085 18, 31468,31675
3169 13, 3172 15, 320117
leaving [9] 3038 11, 3063 13,
3117 19, 3118 2, 12, 14
3165 4, 325521
LECAIN [2] 3110 15, 311525
LeCain [2] 3110 8, 18
logal (2) 3177 11, 31926
legible [1] 306712
LEITZ [3] 3214 14, 3249 13, 326412
Leitz [15] 3214 12, 17, 3215 3, 3216 18, 3222 6, 25, 3230 19,
3232 21, 3239 16, 3243.19,
21, 3249 3, 12326414
Leonard [1] 304121 n
LeRosche (2) 317213
leaser [2] 3244 20, 21
lefter [7] 3034 22, 3065 11,
13, 3067 10, 3151 21, 22, 23
lovel [5] 3156 21, 3189 4, 6,
3228 6, 325924
levels [2] 3062 10, 322924
lover [1] 324120 *:
license [13] 3074 5, 30757 ,
93121 8, 1011 18, 19, 24,
3122 1, 3182 10, 3184 13,
32181
licensed [3] 3074 15,
3184 10, 12 Fincos Lieutenant [3] 3064 24,
32041332552 *
Life (1) 316225 on
life [2] 3205 15, 325115
ift [1] 326011 -rocr-
lifted (1) 324017
light [36] 3048 25, 3068 1,
30821318 21, 3083 4, 10,
13 14, 3084 1, 16, 19, 25,
30863 5, 8, 15 24, 308713
18 23, 30881 9, 15, 21.
30895 9, 15, 23, 3090 16,
3106193107 3, 7, 9
lighted [1] 320422
liohter [1] 322612
lightering [2] 322617
lights [4] 3086 5, 7, 3106 17, 310710
limit f1| 307018
limitation (1) 32167
limitations [2] 3210 12,
32124
limited [2] 3035 21, 307016
limating [1] 307021
line [13] 30292530302.
3039 4, 3059 1, 2 3, 3061 18,
3148 24, 3155 3, 31679 9,
3239 8, 3243 12, 32522
lines \([8] 3043\) 8, 3166 1, 22,
23,3167 3, 13, 3169 3, 9
lining [1] 311220
liquid [1] 32319
liquids [2] 3245 22, 23
liquor [1] 30781
list [4] 3071 13, 16, 313015 324016
listed [1] 324012
listen [2] 3257 1, 326613 IIstening [1] 32011
It
Live [1] 312012
live [5] 3041 24, 3073 17,
3120 2, 3175 4, 32144
living [1] 30312
LLOVD [2] 3110 15, 311525
Lloyd [2] 3110 8, 18
load [3] 3112 20, 324220 32617
Loaded [1] 30336
loaded [3] 30336311222 3183.2
loading [4] 3079 21, 23,
3182. 19, 32284
focal [3] 3187 24, 3188.15, 25
localities [1] 31813
located [1] 308112
location [5] 3040 20, 30618 ,
3103 6, 3125 21, 3192.21
locations (2] 3125 22,
315013
locked (2) 3247 7, 8
\(\log (2) 3046\) 1, 304920
logged [1] 304721
logger [2] 3049 18, 323712
Loggie [1] 31753
logical (1) 325922
longitudinal [1] 322925
Longwood [2] 3110 18, 19
lookout [2] 3142 10, 324819
Looks [1] 306723
looks [5] 3057 25, 3155 11.
3168 11, 3220 1, 3223.13
loose [1] 32416
lose [2] \(30307,3172.6\)
losing (1) 324525
loss [1] 324715
lost [19] 302917 19, 20,
3032 5, 10, 13, 305820,
3158 17, 3174 14, 317811.
3218 1, 3223 19, 22, 3247 16, 326210
lot (18) 3081 19, 3111 11, 3112 16, 3115 22, 3117 8,
3119 21, 316922,3201 11.
3217 14, 3222.21, 24,
3225 20, 3227 9, 3246 15,
32492326314 is
Lots [2] 3033 15, 326315
lots [2] 3243 11, 324524
Loulse [1] 30744
low [4] 3229 19, 323010 ,
3260 24, 32611
lower [1] 324817
lowered [2] 3226 11, 324817
lubbers [1] 32538
kubricating [1] 31331
lucky [1] 305923
LYNCH [38] 3026 13,
3039 23, 3040 7, 3041 2, 13,
18, 3042 7, 11, 3056 7, 15,
3064 22, 3065 2, 10, 19, 23,
3067 9, 14, 17, 19, 30694
3070 5, 3146 15, 19, 3147 3,
9, 11, 3170 5, 317422,
3175 7, 3199 2, 3, 3200 3,
3201 17, 19, 3208 21, 32663
Lynch [3] 3056 12, 320010
320116

Ma'am [1] 308819
machine [4] 3028 21,
3040 22, 30451632182
Madison [1] 317611
Magazine [1] 3162.25
main [1] 315422
Maine [1] 307418
maintan [5] 3061 12,
3131 14, 3137 7, \(3139 \cdot 9\), 31429
mantained [1] 32072
mauntaining [1] 313120
mauntenance (2) 3122:22,
3142.6
major [10] 3176 13, 3185 24,
3186 20, 3187 7, 12, 31899 ,
3191 5, 3209 20, 23, 3253.3
Malloy [1] 314716
man [7] 3029 5, 3113.15,
3142 17, 3177 21, 3183.3,
3184 12, 324710
management [3] 3112.15,
3113.9, 320525
managers [1] 311821
mandated [5] 3155.24,
3188.1, 3190 21, 321116
mandatory [5] 3111 25,
3112.1, 3211 19, 20, 23
manouver [3] 3069 21,
3203.17, 32648
maneuvered [1] 3043.13
maneuvering (19] 30595 ,
3100 18, 3107 25, 3108 23,
3110 1, 3235 20, 3236 23,
3237 22, 3238.3, 14, 323917
3241 13, 3253 13, 3255 18,
3259 12, 14, 3262.5, 32631 19
maneuvers [3] 3102.12,
3199 1, 324323
manned [1] 324618
manner [2] 3102 1, 32158
manning [2] 3182.17, 318513
manual [30] 3035.17, 30364.
3040 1, 8, 10, 3053 2, 18, 22,
23, 3056 14, 3063 24, 25,
3064 1, 3, 6, 9, 311020,
3114 1, 8, 3151 1, 3, 13, 18,
25, 3152.2, 3157.16, 3196 14,
20
manually [1] 32182
manufactured [1] 3222.10
March [25] 3027 2, 3028 7.
3032 4, 12, 3042 12, 304714
3048 5, 3075 21, 23, 24,
3077 12, 3093 12, 30949 ,
3123 23, 3152 3, 3154 25,
3156 5, 3157 9, 31739,
3180 8, 24, 3183 7, 9 ,
3217 23, 321813
Marine (3) 3074 18, 3185 11, 32156
marne [10] 3042 15, 307415
3147 22, 3148 5, 8, 3151 13,
3213 10, 3214 21, 22, 32155
manner [7] 3075 7, 31849 ,
22, 3185 1, 32104,326511
15
mariners [1] 306025

Martime [5] 307419 3120152331211314718 martime [7] 30742331488 93186212431875 , 321220
Mark [2] 31531325424 mark [4] 3128 25, 312947, 325924
marked [8] 3037 10, 31162 3145163156 23, 316512 3180163190432183 marks [1] 322311
massaged [1] 322219 massive [1] 324213 master [44] 3034 20, 3036 1, 3049 22, 3051 10, 20, 21, 23, 3054 17, 20, 3062 23,
3063 12, 3069 13, 16, 23,
3074 7, 3077 16, 17, 3111 1, 3114 8, 31607,317123 , 3173 24, 3174 6, 8, 3178 17, 18, 23, 3184 15, 31851 \(318922,31983,7,14\),
16, 22319925 32109, 13 321216321320321510 323425
masters [7] 3063 18, 306921 3072 1, 20, 22, 24311021 matched (1) 319019 mate [46] 30762 4, 6, 712 13, 22, 3077 1, 3078 23,
3079 1, 25, 3081 14, 30908 ,
3092 10, 3098 11, 3115 3, 3116 22, 3117 9, 3121 11, 12. 14, 17, 21, 24, 3122 2. 3160 15, 16, 3165 4, 5, 3177 15, 31781 10, 18, 24, 3179 5, 3180 5, 3182 10, 318413 15, 31851321318 32452132513
material [2] 3209432434 mates [3] 3112 1, 311618 31173
Matt (1) 303023
matter [6] 304683093 4, 3131 24, 3167 6, 10, 316823 matters [1] 327211
MAUREEN [2] 3074 1,
310519
Maureen [4] 3073 13, 30744 6, 324819
maximum [3] 3048 17.
3114 18, 32324
Maynard [3] 31392331437 25
MCCALL [2] 3147 2, 31708 McCall [35] 3066 11, 3146 16, 18, 19, 31474 13, 3155 18, 2431563,316123316315 16, 3165 13, 3167 24, 31684 , 61531721,31737
3193 10, 14, 31949 14.
3195 3, 5, 24, 319649
3235 4, 3236163245 11, 12
17, 3247 18, 325025
McDonald [3] 31392021 31418
meal [1] 324715
meaning [2] 3059 25, 318520 meaningful [1] 323611
meanings [1] 312923
means [11] 30361631072 6310893129431875 318911321120 21, 32408 32447
moant [6] 3061 24, 316915
31841319517319710
320212
measuring [2] 322224
32285
mechanical [4] 32414511 324621
meet [2] 3114 14, 314913
meeting [10] 3067 15, 1820
30684519213069 18,
3149 9, 15
nember [2] 3073 10, 313110 memo [7] 3193 14, 22,
31955 13, 20, 3196 11, 18
memorandum [5] 3116 3,
3104 10, 11, 31954,31969
Memorial [2] 3176 12,
326612
memories [1] 316822
memorized [1] 310623
memory [2] 31281632087
menial [1] 31425
mention [2] 31319,317018
mentioned [8] 309312
3098 25, \(31117,311420\).
3144 21, 3170 13, 3179 24,
32211
merchant [3] 3074 15,
30757,31831
mercy [1] 316121
method [1] 30606
Mexico [2] 3133 2, 32169
MICHAEL [2] 30652230709
Michael [5] 30642430657
25,313921 31409
Mick [2] 321416
mid [3] 3045 24, 30461. 316414
middle (8) 30351930462
3047 6, 3050 3, 307523
3169 6, 932369
midnight [12] 3042 13,
3045 10, 15, 21, 3046 11, 20,
24, 3047 10, 3049 18, 30832,
3084 3, 315216
Mike [1] 314821
mike [1] 30786
mile [19) 3032 18, 3044 17,
30491519233051913
3052 6, 11, 13, 305361114
3054 5, 7, 3057 6, 23
mile-an-hour [1] 326225
miles [15] 3050 12, 3051 16, 3055 14, 3106 3, 4, 6
315510 12, 3181 11. 20.
3183 14, 15, 21, 3186 16, 18 military [2] 3176 2, 32056 mind [19] 30704,30868 , 3100 11, 3154 11, 315611 \(31575315922,24,316024\) 3161 13, 3171 5, 31889 9, 318945 12, 32277,32468 mine [1] 314015
minimbe [1] 323115
minimized [1] 325015
minimum [4] 304817
3152 12, 3231 21, 324225

\section*{minus [1] 304819}
minuscule [3] 324212
32431314
minute [7] 31129317325
3194143250 23, 32576
3266610
minutes (38] 3034 3, 304422
3045103046630471025 30481317192430832
3084430881831231617
313816315421317716
3178 11, 32006320221
3231 13, 32342316
3241 25, 3255 3, 3257 15,
3258 7, 3261 10,
12, 16, 182132655 326622
mischaracterization [1]
31412
miequoted [1] 32569
miss [2] 31507,319514
misston [2] 3103 25, 319821
Mlasusappi [5] 3125 23, 24
3126 6, 31332123
misspoke (2) 31262031571
misepoken [1] 320818
mistake [1] 31653
mistakes [2] 31342022
Mlsunderstanding [1]
313423
mitigete [1] 319817
mbred [4] 3027 7, 10, 3029 1, 30486
Mobile [1] 307016
mode [3] 3078 9, 32389 , 324419
model [2] 32211617 modifications [1] 321718 moment [3] 3027532394 325117
moments [2] 304910
315918
Monday [2] 3164 20, 326612
money [1] 324717
monitor [2] 3059 6, 320715
monitoring [4] 3172 6,
3195 3, 3196 10, 320718
MONTAGUE [10] 3218 6,
3222 2, 3249 11, 14, 3251 20,
3254153256 17, 20, 25
326411
Montague [1] 326425
month [1] 324920
months [6] 3032. 1, 312420
23, 3142.22, 324922
morning [13] 30265 ,
3173 12, 14, 3182.24,
3196 22, 3233 20, 3235 4,
3250 20, 325320,325725
3258 21, 3262 10, 326615
most-used [1] 315010
motion [4] 3161 20, 326310
326618
mountain [1] 314910
mouth [2] 3230 13, 32471
move [8] 3087 19, 310819
3225 4, 3240 19, 20, 324212
3244 22, 325525
moved [2] 3241 18, 326225
movement [5] 306414
3152 10, 31974, 9, 32342
moving [12] 30301630838
310134310224323318
323417323924324122
324825326015326418
MS [18] 3026 8 1125
30342330392230706
10, 3073 12, 3105 20, 31106 ,
31152431161311925
317073174 21-3208 23
321324
Ms [1] 324819
MSO [9] 303173042 14, 15
1730666723317314 31987
Murtiashaw [3] 3127 2, 4, 32671
MVP [1] 318510
Myers (7) 31163 6, 32546 79 16, 17
myself [10] 3044 23, 30458 ,
3048 23, 3058 2, 3115 23,
314753153 8, 3208 18,
32201732402
\(\frac{-N-}{\text { Naked (7) } 303010303820}\)

30434 7, 30491322825
32294
name (40] 3026 20, 21,
30417 8, 9, 11, 12, 20,
3065 1, 56 24, 3071 16,
307321 22, 30743, 311011 ,
12, 17, 3120 6, 7, 8, 9, 3128 2,
314618 22, 2324314712
31751238,321461011
12 16, 3215132312
named [2] 31392023
nap [1] 308018
narrow (2) 3133 20, 31344
Narrows [12] 3060 11, 22
3061 9, 14, 3149 9, 3150 15,
3158 16, 31592431914
14, 31925
narrows [3] 314913 15,
319222
National [3] 3127 7, 3173 1, 32137
nature [2] 3002 11, 318311
Nautical [1] 30753
naval [3) 3217 9, 3222 12,
32311
navigate [8] 3036 18,
306220306313069 25,
3125 25, 3183 24, 3184 7,
321319
navigating [3] 3182.12,
3184 10, 31852
navigation [10] 3060 24,
3073 5, 3181 3, 318922,25 ,
3210133212 17, 321317
32472
navigational [3] 3085 15,
31771832104
Navy [2] 3137 23, 31831
Neal [1] 306520
nears (1] 32577
needing [1] 313119
Needs [1] 314118
neods [5] 3040 24, 311820,
3131 15, 3234 25, 32351
negligence [1] 321223 neighborthood (3] 3044 19, 3239 2, 32445
nervous [1] 316017
network [1] 315010
nice [3] 3113 11, 324711
night [24] 3031 8, 3037 5, 25
3042143047 2, 3052 16,
3053 5, 9, 3055 12, 3058. 10,
30635 9, 3114 1, 315810
14, 3177 17, 3194 8, 17
\(32131632369,10,32647\) 14
nine [1] 311615
nobody [3] 3187 4, 3189 8, 9
Nodding [1] 318022
notse [1] 308119
non-alcohol [1] 32089
nomm [1] 3123.2
Normal [1] 3242.25
normal [13] 3054 12, 3060 13,
3081 1, 3101 17, 3114 15,
3129 5, 8, 3144 1, 67.
3182 20, 25
normally [7] 305012 13,
30523311514315823
31979322510
North [1] 31209
north (8) 3050 10, 30512.
3052.2, 11, 13, 3183.20
northbound [8] 30304 ,
3063 6, 3167 2, 3168 7, 11
14, 16, 316920
northbounds [1] 316813
northem [1] 310514
Northwest [1] 317511
Notary [1] 327221
note [1] 317625
noted [1] 324012
notes (1] 327210
notice [7] 3088130951
3101 14, 318761922 31897
noticed (1] 308723 notified (3) 3093 7, 8, 31536 notify [9] 3037 19, 23, 3052 23, 3105 4, 10, 31368 8, 31531326714
notwithstanding [1] 319118
November (1) 315123
nowhere [1] 32577
NTSB [10] 3028 18, 302924 2230302030312425 , 3032419312716 Number [8] 30701530745 312619316312317520 322322 23, 32245 number [27] 3059 1, 307012 3102113113 25, 312625 31365924317916, 3209 20, 32194322112 \(32235725,32245,8,16\), 21, 32261922324023. 32421932481632638 numbered [5] 315623 31636731904 numencally [1] 31936 numerous (1] 313320 nylon [1] 308119
- 0 -

O'Donovan (5) 3027 17, 3035 16, 3151 16, 3196 19, 321311
O'NEILL (19) 3026 17, 3040 4, 3056 11, 16, 3064 20, \(30651531271,5,16\), 3138 15, 19, 3141 6, 7, 16 18, 31422531461132497 32678
O'Neill [6] 314383145 18, 314610 12, 3200 10, 32459 oath (1] 325123
objoct [3] 3105 16, 3141 1, 12 Objectron [1] 306316 objection [7] 3040 2, 4, 3065 15, 3127 12, 3192 6, 3218 6, 32222
objectlve [2] 3149 22, 31502 objectively [1] 318711
objectives [4] 314920 ,
3151 10, 3152 8, 9
objects [1] 32158
obligation [4] 3197 22,
319811116
observation [1] 319417
observations (3] 3058 18,
3099 20, 315418
observe [13] 3060 10,
3087 13, 3093 13, 309419,
3097 16, 25, 310020 ,
3144 18, 3192 4, 3195 22, 320414 15, 32425
observed [12] 3040 18,
3080 8, 3095 3, 3099 17,
3102 5, 3145 4, 3152 13,
3174231931 3, 32266
323414
observer [1] 307411
obsarving [1] 308716
obtained \{1] 307420
obtainıng [1] 320523
obvious [2] 3182.3, 32257 obviousty [8] 3055 4, \(31482131648,31691\). 3179 16, 3242.20
occasion (11) 3093 13,
3098 21, 3118 3, 31268 , 3169253170 1, 43171 18, 3180931812321613
Occasionalty [1] 311815 occasions (8] 3035 2, 13, 3118 12, 3124 18, 312549 16, 31269
occupation [1] 321420
occupied [1] 304823
occur [1] 310424
occurred (6) 302923 ,
3035 13, 3068 4, 3164 23, 31768326211
occurring [1] 307223
ocean (4) 3074 7, 8, 323910 32403
October (1] 307510
OD [1] 32002
off-going (2) 3042 19,
305316
offer [8] 3039 25, 306510,
312622243127 9, 17,
3218 4, 322124
offered [6] 3040 3, 306514 3127 18, 3196 22, 3218.5, 32221
Office [1] 318019
office [18] 3042 15, 3045 6,
3147 23, 3148 6, 3152 25,
3153 8, 12, 13, 316522.
3166 1, 3, 3189 4, 5, 3201 17. 3206 9, 32177
officer [38] 3040 24, 305219
21, 22, 24, 3068 4, 10, 13 ,
3072 16, 3074 16, 3116 11,
3123 8, 3134 1, 6, 7, 9, 13, 14,
3135 1, 3136 23, 3137 14,
3147 22, 3148 5, 7, 21:
3176 18, 3178 2, 31941.
3195 14, 3196 2, 15, 3198 3,
6, 3202.19, 3206 6,
3212 16, 321312
officers (12) 3112.2, 3113.12,
3115 17, 3116 20, 3117 10,
18, 3118 17, 31195,9 24,
3205 1, 320619
official [3] 3064 23, 317623 326113
Oh [13] 3111 2, 31129 .
3119 1, 3149 17, 3167 4, 20
24, 3168 17, 3174•6, 32076
3243 16, 3251 24, 32552
oh (5) 3046 3, 3050 9,
3059 22, 3229 21, 323216
Oll [1] 322612
oll [30] 3050 18, 20, 3070 15, 3079 19, 3091 16, 3133.12,
16, 3190 22, 3191 23,
3223 17, 19, 22, 23, 24,
3224 7, \(9,10,3225\) 13, 24, 25, 32265 12, 1317 20;
\(3227151720,3226.5\).
3236 10, 3239 1, 73245 24, 25
olls [1] 31331 -9t
okay [16] 3037 13, 3055 4,
21, 3058 16, 3059 15, 3060 3, 3168 17, 3234 7, 3237 25,
3243 19, 3250 18, 20;
3251 24, 3252. 10, 32599 ,
32858 - wie
old (1) 314213
omitted [1] 30299
on-scene (5) 3035 25,
3036 10, 20, 3210 9, 3212.7
one-or-one [1] 324111
one-sbixth [1] 32308
one-tenth [1] 32308
ones (1) 32211
ongoing [1] 306820
Open [1] 30549
open [9] 3029 21, 3080 2, 6,
3163 15, 3181 11, 3189 12,
3190 12, 3191 17, 322712
opened [5] 3035 17, 3079 17,
3080 3, 3247 10, 325818
operate [5] 3072.3, 3142.8,
319573218 2, 324418
operated [1] 310320
Operating [1] 3152.8
operating [8] 3035 16,
3036 3, 3038 10, 30607.
3062 20, 3151 10, 3182 25,
31958
operation [13] 303623,
3040103061 1, 2, 3062.5
3144 19, 3220 20, 3222.8,
3226 1, 73249 20, 22
operations [5] 3054 12,
3069 8, 3131 1, 3177 1, 5
operative [3] 31695 ,
3196 25, 321615
operator [1] 309425
operators [2] 3058 2, 320925
Opinıon [1] 3188.20
opinion [27] 306920,23,
3070 1, 3087 4, 308822 ,
3137 14, 3161 18, 3164 13,
3177 10, 3179 2, 8, 3183.12,
16, \(31849,3188.5,3212.22\).
3230 21, 3242.7, 3243.12, 21,
\(24,25,32443,325111^{\prime}{ }^{\prime}\),
3252 3, 6, 32642
opinions [2] 3070 3, 32387
opportunity \([3] 3144\) 18,
3232 21, 323825 =5;
opposed [9] \(30482,3188^{-8}\)
13143189 8, 3198 12,
3235 12, 3236 6, 32504
opposite [4] 3128 25,
3129 19, 3130 18, 3143.14
optimal [1] 305922
oral [1] 326822
Order [1] 30264
order [28] 3030 17, 18,
3043 17, 3049 19, 3064 13,
3067 2, 3078.25, 3084 19,
3093 9, 3100 8, 10, 11,
3134 11, 15, 23, \(31352,4,21\),
\(23,25,31363,22,23,31532\),
3217 19, 20
ordered [3] 30352,325823 ,
32592
 3079 13, 30907,309220,
3093 3, 5, 3100 14, 16, 18, '21
3101 20, 31022, 6, 3108 24,
3109 1, 3, 12, 14, 16, 21,
3129 21, 3130 8, 319925
3209 25, 3211 1, 25
ordinary [7] 3055 1, 3122.2.22,
3132 21, 3135 10, 314125,
3142.5, 318422 Y" Tirs

Oregon [1] 321413 *~,
organization [2] \(3110{ }^{2} 0_{3}\)
3193.21
ortentation \([2]\) 3148, \(76,1^{9}\)
oriented [1] 3075.2 4 ²
orifice [1] 3228.7~~-3
origural [2] 3282.3 \(\quad\) - raf
originally [1] 3058.11
ought (5) 3177 25, 3179 9, 3184 10,31896-274
outbound [9] 3037 19,
3039 13, 17, 18, 3043.1,
3057 25, 3059 14, 31596 ,
3192.5
outline [1] 321717
outlined [2] 3054 18, 321016
outside [13] 30515,18 ,
3063 6, 3082 1, 4, 3096 4,
3157 10, 19, 3169 20, 31702
3212 18, 3228 25, 32398
outstanding (1] 31445
overall [2] 31432331495
overdrive [1] 305723 overhear [3] 3091530928 , 14
overkill [4] 31902331911 221
overty [1] 316017
overshot [1] 317917
overstated [1] 31825
overstatement [2] 31823 31884
overtime [4] 308022
311817 21, 22
owner [1] 321424
owners [1] 311417
—————
p m [3] 3266 23, 25326712
paced [1] 311523
Pactic [1] 313322
Page [1] 30592
page [48] 3029 21, 30302,
3037 9, 3040 9, 305912
\(306410,30688,3071813\)
233127 23, 3131 5, 6
\(31437,9,22,31443\) 3151 20, 3152531553 3161 24, 3163 7, 316418, 3166 5, 7, 16, 3167 17, 3172 11, 14, 25, 3180 17. 3181 6, \(31838,31856,31971\) 31994,32097 8 15, 20, 3210 16, 321263219 21, 325122
pages (6] 3126 18, 22, 3127 22, 3161 25, 3166 11, 13 paint [5] 3113 1, 3139 1, 3184 3, 319218
painted [2] 31922431931
pamphlets [1] 310512
Panama [1] 313313 panel [1] 307923 paper [4] 30402031858 , 3211 5, 322210
paperwork (2) 31781923 par [1] 30602
Paragraph [1] 307015 paragraph [11] 3035 19, 3068 8, 3069 1, 2, 3071 24, 3163 6, 3181 7, 3199 15, 23, 320923
paraphrasing [1] 320015 Pardon [4] 3109 19, 3156 10, 3248 3, 325711
pardon [1] 313611
parentheses [1] 303520 Part [1] 32462
part [28] 3050 1, 3053 15, 3066 15, 3078 5, 3096 14, 3113 6, 3128 13, 3129 3, 3148 14, 3179 11, 3180 23, 3183 13, 25, 318614 15, 3190 22, 31914319622 3206 20, 3213 9, 3217 21, 3220 25, 3226 7, 32532 3255 23, 3261 24, 32623 partially [1] 322321 participate [4] 3034 19, 3211 20, 21, 321720 participating [4] 303422,

3111 7, 319412321113 participation [1] 31119 parting [1] 31498
parts [7] 312483150910 315913195 12, 32164 322112
pass [1] 309818
passage [3] 3039331597 , 316818
passed [8] 3095 23, 25
3098 6, 10, 18, 21, 315115 316010
passes [1] 325919
passing [6] 30822309112
3096/14 30971431369
31609
patch [1] 32258
path [1] 304110
Patricia [1] 307323
patting [1] 32402
PAUL [2] 3175 6, 320825
Paul [7] 3116 3, 6, 3174 22,
3175 9, 32546 7, 9
pay [2] 3118 17, 31592
pen (1) 302712
pending [1] 310420
Pennsylvania [1] 31209
people (30) 302723305414
3056 3, 3059 19, 3072 24,
3093 7, 9, 3111 6, 18 22,
3112.14, 3113 5, 312211 21,

3129 11, 3131233153 1, 3,
3169 6, 3181 18, 3200 19,
3201 11, 13, 320616
3207 19, 3217 15, 20,
3228 15, 3250 13, 326618
percent [3] 3069 10, 32152 321621
parception [3] 316014 18, 319523
perfect [1] 32073
perfectly [4] 317714
3178 10, 324037
performance [6] 3122.11
3124 3, 6, 7, 12, 32133
performed [1] 304810
performing [2] 3124 8, 9
perimeter [2] 3092 19, 24
period (29) 3044 25, 305314
3083 3, 3088 10, 12, 3095 2,
3100 19, 3107 24, 3109 24,
3116 10, 12, 16, 311721
3118 4, 5, 12, 14, 31231 ,
3164531652,317010 ,
3177 15, 3178 11, 322723
3241 25, 3244 22, 325825,
32632
periods [2] 3045 7, 31171
permanent [3] \(30765,6,12\)
permiasion [3] 3041 1.
3125 10, 3172.15
person [14] 3062.22, 30704 3079 8, 31322, 3, 3138 10,
11, 3182 9, 3190 3, 3198 24,
3205 9, 3206 2, 22, 32079
personal [3] 3059 15, 3060 6, 313821
personnal [4] 3151 4,
3185 12, 3205 6, 32081
persons [1] 32051
pertains [1] 312820
pertinent [1] 303622
petty [1] 305222
Petumenos [1] 32672
ph (2) 3140432281
Philadelphia [2] 312256
phone [4] 309723315216
316419317819
phrase [6] 303693152 21,
3157 12, 15, 315823318920
phrases [1] 316321
physical [1] 311911
physically [3] 304621
306010310020
physics [1] 307425
Pick [1] 320118
pick [7] 30308305812
31522331671631702 2,
3202 22, 320322
picked [2] 3153 8, 320216
pleking [2] 3058 13, 316625
picklo [1] 32469
picture [1] 305111
plece [7] 318425,31853 ,
3186 10, 13, 318910
31912031934
pilot [36] 3036130432
305913306223309310 3100253129 21, 22, 25 3130 7, 3134 5, 6, 3136 23, \(3137131555,9,1931688\)
31702,3179213186 1,
3188 15, 19, 20, 3189 1,
3192 12, 3210 9, 3212 18,
3218 18, 3247 3, 16, 324820 ,
23, 24, 32597
Pllotage [1] 317721
pllotage [18] 3126 12, 3130 3,
3177 22, 3179 20, 318013
318417318513 19, 31869
213187911 16, 318816
3189 10, 321320
piloting (1] 306224
Pilots [1] 31869
pilots (5) 3186 21, 25
3187 16, 31887,319210
pipe [1] 324122
Pipeline [1] 306710
Place [1] 311018
place [16] 3029 5, 305724
3087 15, 3101 2, 3106 13,
3108 11, 3125 25, 3143 22, 3151 25, 3183 24, 3184 7,
3200 3, 3204 25, 3219 11,
322824326312
placed [2] 3070 17, 31351
places [4] 3180143186 16,
18, 320112
plain [1] 321715
PLAINTIFF [2] 3170 9, 32091
Plaintiffs [3] 3126 18, 21
312719
plauntiffs [3] 3207 24,
3266 19, 32672
plan [9] 3217 17, 3220 7, 14,
16, 20, 3225 5, 3226 9, 17,
322813
planned [2] 3225 15, 322821
planning (1) 324822
play (1] 317025
played (1] 32459
Plase [2] 3110 17, 32149
plasse [21] 30261821
3065330731922309316 3104331107931203 3126193127233143614 3146202331742431752
320011321816326613
pleased [1] 31201
pienty [2] 323119325717 plot [8] 3060 10, 3192 19,
31942431959 19, 31961
32221432605
plots [2] 302924
plotted [1] 302821
plotter [5] 31922031934
3194253195113
plotting (8) \(302821 \quad 304020\)
31969143197 20, 3202 19,
21, 23
plugged [1] 305917
plumes (1) \(306912 \quad 1204\)
plus [3] 3048 19, 305011
324411
Point [15] 30274 13, 30284
13, 3150 15, 31597 11,
318320318521318822 3188231892319211 319522
point (38) 3027 12, 30282
3030 20, 3039 9, 15, 3048 18, 3050143058 15, 3063.2,
3091130941123,30967 13, 3099 2, 3102 8, 3105•9,
3131 9, 3155 18, 3172 12; 3178 25, 3178173183 14;
3184 4, 3187143189 12; 319213 20, 320417
203207 2, 32102232113
5322712323424323616
pointing \((2) 3177\) 21, 322225
points [13] 30279 10,
3028 25, 30616310320,
3116 10, 318524318620
319515320920 23,
32101632316
policies [1] 305525
policy [10] 3059430608 ,
17, 311553117 18, 32058 ,
3206 18, 3207732102
polished [1] 321716
poor [2] 3029 12, 305918
Pope (1] 3163.20 wan
Port [4] 311515 3158.16,
3182 20, 319010
portable [2] 32251532266
portion (8) 3026 10, 11,
3036 13, 31281231826 6,
320919
Portions [3] 32331 2, 3
portions [2] 3040 7, 32101
Portland [1] 321413
ports (2] 3133 2, 319019
posed [1] 318516
postion [27] 3042 3, 30528
12, 3062 20, 3063 1, 30766
3087 18, 19, 3088 1, 16,
3089 22, 3103 21, 3112.24,
3132 21, 3148 3, 3176 11, 22
3178 11, 3179 15, 3180 2,
318253192 18, 3193 5,
3205 18, 32117
positions [3] 302819
\(3 \overline{31422} 31484\)
postive [3] 3040 13, 313811 316120
postively [1] 305214
possibllites [1] 317013
possibility [1] 31051
Potato [2] 3150 15, 31597
potential [4] 3062831516
315212319717
pound [2] 3229 21, 32302
pounds [8] 3229 23, 32302
3, 5, 14, 16, 3243 1, 2
poured [1] 322324
power [9] 3096 19, 31613
3200 21, 3216 22, 3236 25,
32385,324425
powers [2] 3200 21, 324421
PPI [2] 3044 2, 15
practically [1] 320622
practice [15] 3046 7, 3059 16,
31142631193312911.

31341718 19, 3141 19.
3182 25, 3194 16, 3197 17,
32259
practices [1] 30561
precautions [6] 3072 1, 20,
222530734314914 proceding [3] 3118 4, 5, 319716
prectous [1] 324810
precipitously [1] 319116
procludes [1] 32016
predesignated [8] 3038 24,
305913071731552
3156 24, 3175 20, 3194 5, 32093
preliminary [1] 30661
promaturely [1] 322813
prepare [1] 30276
prepared (5) 3027 11,
3067223166 3, 320912
327212
preparing [2] 30801631247
presence [3] 3035411
304025
present [16] 30381830396
306817306993071 20,
3073 5, 308193090 13,
3091212231071920
3109131751631763
32512
presentation [1] 326622 presented [2] 303312 305715
presenting [1] 305714
president [1] 317611
Prass [1] 318020 press [7] 3154253156413 318024318118318367 pressure [11] 3114 10, 32291823323014611 323114183239232405 pressures [1] 322920 pretty [13] 3067430713 311343163 5, 31724 , 3198 22, 32171732201 32221932257,32381 324813325220 provent [6] 310314 25, 315033152932122 323111

FEDERAL TRIALTRANSCRIPT 5-27-94 VOLUME 19 prevented [1] 31734 preventing [1] 314921 prevention [1] 32319 previous [5] 3042 22, 31571
31994323021325121 previously [5] 3037 6,
3042 24, 3173 13, 32117
primanly [1] 306115
promary [4] 3177 13, 19,
3178 9, 32152
Prince [17] 3061 11, 310317
3104 8, 31059,31194,
314873150 12, 315521
\(3183111319,25,318520\)
25, 31911132215,322824
principal [4] 31492231502
31528315918
print [1] 319218
Prior [1] 305414
prior [17] 3040 21, 3043 11,
30771130794309219
31065312118314821 ,
3150 11, 315420,3171 18. 3182 22, 3203 16, 32067,
3209 13, 32112
problem [14] 3043 13,
3111 10, 3141 23, 3161 16, 3165131745,318410 , 3191 25, 32051232064, 3213 19, 3229253231 15, 32513
problematical (2) 3202.14, 32035
problems [12] 304315
3072 2, 311111 18, 3139 3,
431876,32001932051
procedure [7] 305315
3059 4, 3060 13, 3078 20,
3192 19, 32029322716 procedures [6] 3060 6, 3192 7, 9123193 13, 31947 proceed [1] 319710
Proceeded [1] 31538
proceeded [1] 315314
proceeding [3] 3059 13,
317212325121
Procaedings [1] 326712
process \{5] 30465309720
2131002317024
produced [3] 31278
31651114
produces [1] 323814
productivability [1] 31323
productive [3] 3131 1, 10, 16 products [4] 3132 25, 31335 15, 19
profossional [2] 31021
325522
profile [1] 32214
Program [1] 32056
program [10] 31117
3112103113123205510 3206712203207 18, 32617
programs [1] 320425
progress [2] 30661931582
prohibit [2] 3197 4, 9
prohibited [1] 320924
prohibring [1] 319712
Project [2] 30661720
project [1] 306622
promoted [1] 30766
propellor [4] 3238 8, 9, 10,
32447
propellers [2] 3237 9, 11
proper [1] 317725
property [3] 31821031901
321317
proposal [5] 318522 23,
3187 9, 23, 31897
propose [1] 31871
proposed [6] 3185 18,
3187 3, 4, 19, 3188 24, 31897
propriatary [1] 314023
protect [1] 322924
protects [1] 322512
proud [1] 324915
provide \([5] 3061\) 1, 12,
3069 15, 3142.10, 320621
provided [5] 3060 24, 3064 3,
3067 6, 3127 6, 16
provides [1] 304010
providing [4] 3060 1, 3073.5,
3206 18, 320913
Provision [2] 3040 15, 19
proviaion [3] 30363
3040 23, 320619
Provisions [1] 304011
provisions [1] 31588
proxamity [1] 3178.12
prudent [7] 3069 24, 3122 24,
3162 18, 32105 20, 323425
32576
pal [1] 32316
paychological [1] 311911
Public (11 327221
publication [2] 31514.
315713
pull [1] 313523
pulled [3] 3084 14, 3085 12,
309117
pump [5] 3226 11, 13, 17, 24
pumped [1] 322620
pumping [2] 3226512
pumps [1] 32266
puraly (2) 30616,311713
purpose [7] 306021.
30861430952131022
3149573173.20
purposes [4] 3103 13,
3117 2, 3176 6, 326116
push [2] 3080 2, 324221
pushed [2] 3262 20, 32631
pushes [1] 30805
putting [8] 3030 14, 303823 ,
3076 5, 3127123169 22,
324220
PV [3] 3231 5, 9, 19
PWS [1] 318520
PX [1] 315117

question-and-answer [1]
315614
quastioned [2] 3171 18, 317213
questioner [1] 302925
quentioners [1] 302922
quentioning [3] 3039 4,
3148 14, 321221
[5?
questions [17] 3027 24,
\(3038.23,3087\) 17, 3115.10 .
3141 5, 6, 3148 6, 3154 1, 21
3161 23, 3200 13, 14, 32098
22, 3233 15, 3265 25, 32687
quickly [2] 31312,31372
quit [2] 3075-22; 3268•9
quoted (5] 3040 8, 3163:23, 3164 1, 2, 5
quotiont [2] 3079-9, 10
quoting [1] 31819

radars [1] 3046-2
radio [11] \(30377,3055 \hat{18}\),
3080 12, 3094 24, 3104 25,
3105 11, 3150 10, 3162.3,
3195 14, 3258 23, 32596
Rafael [1] 31404
rage [1] 30476
raining [1] 305925
Rale [4] 3026 18, 30653
3110 9, 317424
ralee (6] 30414, 3054 7)
3055 8, 3073 18, \(31203^{3 *}\)
314620

3123 23, 3177 17, 31796
3181 4, 3186 12, 3218 22,
3231 7, 3240 10, 3244 8,
3260 18, 326110 12, 32635
32655
random [9] 3207 7, 11,
3208 1, 2, 8, 14, 15, 18, 19
randomness [2] 32071214
rang \{1\} 315216
range [12] 30462,3047 6,
3050 3, 3051 24, 3058 16,
3059 8, 3106 7, 3150 17,
3188 9, 3203 4, 23, 320423 rank [3] 306425,31481 1503 320611 wint or
rate [8] 3090,3, 31418, 15, 3144 14, 15, 25, 3206 14, 15
rated [2] 31298,31418
retio [1] \(305621^{2}\), ECSE
Ray [1] 306723 - ino of
re [1] 30266 e. 3+ +r
reach [1] 320022
reaction [1] 324624 ina.
Read [9] 3026 24, 3041 17,
3065 22, 3070 9, 3074 1.
3105 19, 311015,311525 ,

\section*{31756}

READEA [2] 3146 24, 31753
Render [6] 3026 19, 30416
3065 4, 3073 20, 311010, 317425
readers [2] 3201 10, 15
rending [10] 3026 14,
30291430569307019
30725 3102.10, 3110 23,

3144 4, 3155 16, 32011
readings [1] 324521
reads [3] 30712431528 31818
real [7] 3026 17, 3060 14,
3112 13, 3191243224 24,
325115
reality [1] 325017
reappear [1] 320625
reason [24] 303543048 1,
306031214306110
306863072 13, 313125
313210 12, 18, 313425
3156163163 23, 316712
317925318717318969
3190 10, 3191 8, 319513
32137
reasonable [6] 305778,10
3058 11, 3162. 17, 323422
reasons [13] 303510
31632531792031872
321019321245121415
324925
recalling [1] 314920
recave \([3] 3063\) 4, 8, 30666
recerved \{14] 3040 6, 30535
10, 3065 18, 312123
3127 20, 3171 13, 317416
3182.1, 9, 32172132188

3222 4, 32545
recerving [3] 3037 25, 30386
310824
recently [1] 31764
Recess [1] 32008
recess [5] 3123 15, 16, 17,
32005,6
recessed [1] 326712
recipient [1] 306624
reckless [9] 3163 17, 31646
32565 7, 10, 3257 7, 9, 12
19
recognize [4] 311911
3162 1, 319717321811
recognized [1] 314910
recollection [11] 30681
3070 21, 3102 8, 3154 15,
3164 4, 22, 3168 19, 3169 15, 2331701631862
recolfections [1] 316822
recommend [3] 3197 17, 3198 2, 12
recommendation [2] 31987 , 319911
Recommendations [1]
320917
recommendations [7]
3116 13, 319723198416 3210 3, 520
Record [2] 3200 12, 325414 record [31] 302620303010 3041 7, 19, 30655 20, 24, 3068 25, 3070 5, 3072 1, 19, 3074 3, 3110 11, 3120 6, 3127 6, 8, 13314622 3147 6, 12, 3152 6, 316311 12, 3164 19, 3166 20, 31751 83193 5, 3194 13, 320921 321410
recorded [3] 3166 1, 3192 21, 321819
recordings [1] 316522
recounted [1] 30869
recovering [2] 320512 320716
recriminations [1] 32062
red [10] 30553308313
3084 16, 192530865
3096173107379
REDIRECT [2] 31432
326412
reduce [2] 3038 19, 30731
reducer [1] 31131
reducing [1] 31323
Reef [37) 3032 21, 303312 13, 17, 21, 23, 3043 14,
305123057 1, 6305858 ,
305922306013089 15,
3105 9, 3150 24, 3153 18,
3158 22, 24, 317812
3182163183 14, 18,
3192 13, 31941321 22,
320212320314320427 17, 18
32242332422325519
reof [28] 3052 2, 30892
31611 17, 3181 12, 3225 6,
3228183230 22, 323211
3237 17, 3243 23, 32442 ,
3245 13, 3251 4, 6 12,
3252 4, 6, 3255 22, 25,
325612325751013
3264 22, 24, 32656
reel [3] 3045 18, 30462223
reols [2] 3045 18, 304622
refor (12) 3035 15, 30378
3175213180 16, 18, 31816
3183 6, 31891431944
319619320919
reference [7] 3038 3,
3050 12, 14 17, 18, 3205 22,
32113
raferenced [1] 312710
roferred [5] 3159 6, 31625
319443212 5, 32592
referning [6] 3063 24,
307118309443131 19,
3145 23, 319911
refors [1] 30641
refined [1] 31331
reflected (2) 3098 24, 32622
reflection [1] 30687
reflective [1] 308120
refioat (5) 3228 14, 21.
3229 20, 3230 17, 325918
refloated [1] 32329
refloating [2] 3227 16,
325917
refrash [3] 3164 4, 316818
refresher [1] 314819
refuses (1) 32585
Regan (4) 31406731457 8
regard [9] 3045 9, 30558 , 3140 25, 3148 11, 3153 25,
3163 2, 3172 20, 320619
324218
regarding [8] 30374 ,
3064 14, 3071 10, 3178 25,
31792, 12
regardloss [2] 3046 20,
321123
regards [3] 3037 3, 318216
regrettably [1] 303924
regular [1] 30754
regulation [6] 31172223
24311871032016
regulations [2] 315113
32012
regurgitating [1] 320324
rehabilitate [2] 32051013
rehabilitated [3] 320516
3207 8, 19
rehabilitation [6] 32051923
32063 16-18, 32079
relate [4] 3067101731341 316123
related [4] 304114305519 20, 324620
relates [1] 304020
relating [2] 304017316221
relationship [8] 306213
3177 10, 32132 3, 322145
324222
relative [13] 30331630527
8, 3056 25, 30871930881
16, 213089 22, 31036
3104 15, 319111
ralatively [3] 3088 10,
3183 21, 322914
relax [1] 325922
relayed [1] 305520
release [1] 31837
relevant [1] 304011
reliable [2] 31712322220
ralied [2] 3072120
relief [5] 3029 24, 305315
25, 3054 1, 31781
ralieve (3) 303014,15,
321218
relieved [5] 3029 15, 303119
3040 14, 3054 13, 311622
ralreving [1] 304219
rely [1] 321315
remain (5) 3087 10, 18,
3088 10, 3103 1, 315914
remained [3] 3088 15,
321124322319
remaining \(\{2\) ) 3177531826
remand (1] 326619
remarks [2] 309622315612
Remember [2] 314521
318111
remember [47] 302719
3028 19, 3042 23, 3044 5, 6
3046 22, 3048 23, 3051 10,
11, 3052103080 11, 30868 ,
3096 23, 24, 3100 9, 11,
310113102 11, 3106 21.
3107 22, 3109 3, 5311023
25, 31269314824315613
3189 16, 3195 6, 320713
181932081732261
3233111623,323579
3247 20, 32518325316
3260 21, 3263832651 ,
326613
romembering [1] 304921
remove [6] 3227 24, 323211
3239 23, 3257 4, 9, 12
removed (3) 3228 1, 6,
324711
removing [2] 3216 19,
323717
repartee [1| 32533
repeat (5) 303019310010
31043313625316524 repeated [1] 308425
repeats [3] 313411313612
rephrase [1] 320813
replaced [1] 304014
replacement [1] 307612
reply [1] 308423
raport [23] 3035 16, 305216
3053510305513306621
308063082133083 16, 18,
308413308513086 12, 15
30872430885315116
317113319620320310
32072332143325623
reported [13] 30438 ,
308313143084 5, 9
3085163086812310724
319420320323320415
322212
reporter (5) 308012316318
2031643325622
roporting [2] 309016
314822
reports [4] 3066 19, 30699
3102 10, 322023
represented [1] 31362
represents [2] 32227
322311
request (2) 3167 5, 321722
requested [7] 30699
3168 20, 3172 17, 319324
3194332597327210
require [10] 31847 17, 21.
3185 24, 3186 1, 318910,
3192 13, 3200 21, 23, 323121
required (22) 305223
305313 15, 3117 20,
313511 23, \(31365,8,14\)
31599 12, 3177 22, 3179 11,
3184203187 11, 3188 15,
3191 8, 3194 12, 31952021
3196 6, 322918
requirement (22) 30389
30532171822 23, 30605
31851931942431953
319619 10, 12320725
3208238 14, 15321321
requirements [4] 3038 13,
3187 16, 3194 9, 15
requiring [1] 317920
reread [1] 302910
Research (2) 3066 17, 20
research [1] 306622
resources [1] 311212
respect [11] 3054 13,
3131 19, 3135 15, 3136 11,
313811314923,316019
3167133183 11, 320725
respecting [1] 320619
respond (3) 3096 22, 31388 ,
12
reaponded [2] 31389,10
response [5] 3050 21,
3154 4, 3165143181 10,
319316
responsibilitios \([8] 31376\) 6,
3142 3, 3148 7, 10, 17,
3176 11,3178 78
responsibility [17] 3060 23,

Benc symema Apptation
25, 31041931341314 313513142.73157918 233158 10, 13319814 3210 12, 3212.16, 18 rasponsible [1] 307216 rest [11] 30557,30616 11, 3117 16, 3169 1, 3191 15, 3207113225 1, 3239 6, 711 restate [1] 3032.3
rested (1] 311622
reating [4] 322114322413 25, 323911
rests (1) 321013
reault [B] 3149 18, 3150 6, 3162.9, 319311 13, 3197 18, 320124324622
resulted [1] 319016
resume [1] 317522
retire [1] 311823
Retired [1] 317619
rettred [3] 3148 1, 3176 20, 22.
retirement [3] 3118 24,
314724317624
rotreat [1] 3073.9
return [7] 3029 12, 305625
3057583066630808 31816
roturned [2] 304810309121 returns (1] 305621
reverse [3] 3237 15, 1820
reviow [4] 306724312223
3209 13, 323313
reviowed [5] 30422230681 31681631677,321715 reviowing [1] 304224 Ind (i) 32064
ndiculous [2] 31111415 rig [2] 309310324820 Right [17) 3028 5, 304522
30461130471305114
3054430565305720
309023310712311457
312253167231685
3218 15, 32358
right-hand [2] 3210123 rigs (1] 321520
ripped [1] 32273
rise [1] 30263
risers [1] 311220
rising [2] 32362,32487 riak [8] 3191113207 12,
32602425,326114
River [10] 3120 15, 3122 5,
3125232431266313321
23, 314625324715 river [1] 31345
Road [3] 304110307324 314625
road [2] 324020
roadstead [2] 318111 318315
Robert [2] 3110 13, 31284 rock [25] 3047 6, 3050 3, 318614322025322411 22, 25, 32261032275 323212323926324013 11, 19, 20, 32431032483 326161132622224 rock-and-rolled [1] 32534 rocking [2] 31616322615

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT rocks [9] 30462321525 322110323823323911 15324051832411 Rocky [13] 3027 3, 13,
3028 4, 12, 3159 10, 3183 19, 3185213186 22, 3188 2,
3189 2, 3192 11, 319522
Roger [1] 303011
Rojana [3] 3140 4, 3144 21, 23
role [1] 30367
roles [1] 314810
rollod [1] 3232.4
rolling [2] 30972022
room (16] 3080 20, 3081 4;
3084133090 11, 3091 23,
309213095 20, 309723 ,
3108 10, 14, 17, 31479 ,
3239 13, 3245 21, 324779
rope [1] 311122 *2"
ropes [3] 3111 20, 21, 23
rotate [1] 324119
rotating (2) 3262.9, 326310
rotating-type [1] 3263.12
rotation (1] 326320
rotations [2] 3263 14, 15
Rouge [4] 3075 13, 3076 7. 322626
rough [3] 3033.10 306115
321817
roughly \(\{5] 3224\) 21, 3229 16, 3230143240 16, 32606
routine (9) 30468,30496 ,
3050 3, 3055 5, 8, 10, ..
3115 13, 315211 +T \&
routinaly [5] 3060 15,
315023 24, 3201 21, 32024
rove (1) 322223
Tpm [3] 3261 7, 8, 23
pms [1] 32447
RPR [1] 327221 ~
rubberband [1] 32094
rudder [33] 30342430355
9309220313516 19, 21,
3136 2, 3197 7, 14;-3198.23
3199213209 25, 321125
321616 17, 24 3233.8, 22;
3234173235 16, 323620 ,
3238 3, 632421 8, 16,
324363255 3, 326020 ,
3262 1, 32637
ruin [1| 320515 - 11
Rule [1] 303814
rule [2] 3114231897
rulo-making [9] 318518
318734 9, 15 19, 23
31882431897
rules [2] 3152 9, 315525
run [10] 3108811321621
253231133232 12,
323438324220
running (8) 3101 23, 310922
31491731631432229 ,
3240532622
runs [3] 3028 22, 3133 22,
323425
ruptured [1] 32249
- S -

S-C-O-T-T [1] 311014

\section*{safe [4] 3067 3, 30735 ,}

320418321013
safely [3] 306816306924
31498
Safoty [3] 3127 7, 3173 2, 32138
safoty [18] 3042 15, 3071 25,
3072 1, 19, 20, 22, 25,
3114 18, 19, 20, 31157 ,
3116 8, 314722,31485 ,
3151 13, 3185 11, 318922.
325012
sall [10] 3116 4, 3121 14, 21,
3122 1, 3132.7, 13, 16,
3137 22, 3139 12, 31833
sailed [4] 3043 15, 3124 1, 3137 18, 21
salling [5] 3100 9, 3122.1, 21,
3125 3, 31421
sallors [2] 3137 21, 25
salary [3] 3118 21, 22, 24
Salvage [1] 32154
salvage [17] 31614,3214 23,
24, 25, 3215 10, 24, 3216 4,
12, 3217 3, 17, 32207 ,
3222.8, \(32259,15,18,20\)
salvaged [3] 32151321
322015 -~ 37 *
salvaging [1] \(3249 \cdot 15\)
salvor [4] 3214 21, 22,

Samuel [1] 32085
\(\operatorname{San}(5) 3117\) 8, 3133.13,
3229 4, 6, 32422 Iz-
SANDERS [ख] 3073.13. 16,
3074 2, 3105 18, 3110 7., 16,
3120 1, 13, 3123 13, 20,
3126 20, 3127 2, 10, 21,
3138 14, 3141 1, 12, 3143.3
3146 6, 10, 12, 3243 16, 32679
Sanders [1] 304022
sashay [1] 32639
sat [4] 3121 18, 31916
3232 18, 325714
satisfactory [1] 31576
say-so [1] 31354
saying [38] 304320,25 ,
3049 24, 3053 21, 24,
3058 18, 3091 1, 3100 11,
3115 17, 3117 21, 3127 22,
3153 5, 3155 13, 16, 17. 3156 25, 3163 18, 3164 6, 3165 6, 3166 24, 3169 12,
318452031959,320625,
3213 1, 3238 21, 3241 10,
3243 6,
3244 24, 3249 25, 3255 13, 3256132581326217
scale [34] 3032 18, 3044 15, 3049 15, 17, 19, 30519 13, 153052630536,1114 3054 5, 8, 3055 14, 3057 6, 23, 3106 7, 3170 17, 19 , 3171 7, 8, 3172.5, 319217. 24, 3194 23, 3195 2, 3203 11, 12, 13, 320414,32394 scenarios [1] 31516 scene [2] 3036 12, 30704 schedule (1) 311414 schematic [1] 322122
- Consorderon by Lock \(\sec (31)\)

Scheme [4] 3149:23, 25,
315033172.16
scheme [7] 3030 3, 303812
3061 11, 3070 23, 316725
3169 4, 319012
Schoof [1] 314716
school [2] 3147 15, 18
Schuyler [4] 3120 23, 31211
6314719
scrence [2] 3075 2, 3
scope [10] 3043 18, 30448
10, 153050 24, 30543,
3159 15, 3195 16, 18, 320422
Scott (1) 311013
scraping [1] 30895 -
scratches [1] 3262.19-
screen [16] 3029 13, 30307.
30443 5, 3067 12, 306945
3127 24, 3159 14, 3170 15,
\(20,25,31712,4,3172.7\)
scrow [1] 3238.10 nसw
seript [2] 3070 7, 311524
scuppers [3] 3079 18,
3091 17, 18 « \(\because\) 「...n
Sea [2] 3120 15, 31225
soa [12] 3114.2, 4, 7, 25,
318220 21, 3183.4, 31892
3226 13, 3227 13, 3231 16, 17
seal [1] 3225-9 3 3 4
seaman [11] 3113 17, 19
3125 3, 6, 3732.8, 20, 21,
3135 11, 3141 25, 31425, 6
seamanahlp (2) 3210'6, 20
samen ( 2 ) 0122,22
seas [1] \(3185 \cdot 21 \quad\) in c
saated [1] 321419 TM15
Seattle [5] 3190 6, 9, 10,
3191 13, 321115
seaward (1] 318622
Second [1] 312117
second [25] 306825,30771
308720 24, 25, 3088 5, 8,
3090 11, 3115 3, 3116 22,
3121 21, 3124 16, 3130 15,
3131 5, 3180 18, 31817 ,
3184 15, 3200 5, 3201 10;
3219 21, 3249 4, 3252.19,
3254 13, 3255 22, 325611
secondary [3] 3177 -20,
3178 7, 8 \& 51 yt iesta
secondly [1] 30748 sha
seconds [7] 3083 17, 21,
3084 17, 19, 3086 24, 309713
Secretary [1] 318020
secretary [3] 3185 25,
320845
Section [4] 3152 6, 8 , 3196 21, 31971
section [9] 303517 19,
3040123056 12, 1430649 12, 3128 15, 312919
sector [3] 310622310723
sectors [1] 310624
socuring [4] 3080 16, 19,
3097 20, 24
seos [3] 3063 3, 31582
segregated [5] 3223 23,
3224 3, 3226 19, 3231 24,
324816
soldom (1) 31915
selected (1] 32067

Besce Systerne Appicatuons
selactrvely [1] 323115
self [1] 311912
self-supporting (1] 32399
send [1] 30553
sensation [1] 30893
sense [2] 31587317711
sensors [1] 310214
sentence [11] 30291014
30352430368,30681013
30701531526318124
3197116
sentences [2] 303518
30366
sentiment [2] 3068 20, 31846
sentiments [1] 306821
separate [2] 3205 14, 320710
separated [4] 31501
320616
Separation [5] 31492325
3150331696317215
separation (22) 30303 ,
3037 20, 24, 3038712
3039 14, 19 20, 306111
306471930702330736
3167 25, 3169 4, 51420 3190 12, 31999
sequence [2] 3086911
series [1] 306717
serious (3) 31522131606 324919
serve [1] 30747
served [1] 31774
Service [16] 3067 11,
3148 17, 3149 5, 31509 ,
3181103196831982123
3199 1, 32022321223
32134 6, 12, 1323
service [12] 30602324
30611531276813
31763 17, 3188 19, 320520 ,
320617
Services [2] 3198 20, 321117
serving (1) 31385
Seth [3] 3071 16, 25, 30727
sets [2] 3194 9, 31954
setting [1] 313716
settled [1] 32413
soven [2] 3119231816
severely [1] 303521
severity [2] 3246 6, 325212 shallow [2] 32191732205
shape [2] 323210325220
sheet [5] 3175 21, 3176 7, 8, 318018
sheets [3] 304424304717 24
shift [5] 303416304212.
3048 2, 305513316110
shifted [1] 304922
shifting [1] 30525
Ship [2] 3210 10, 324418 shipped [4] 3075 9, 12, 30767307719
Shipping [11] 307117 25, 3075 18, 203118 16,
3119 15, 3120 14, 31229 , 31711720
shipping [3] 3068 16, 3072 2, 25
ships [15] 3061 7, 3103 14, 17, 3104 2, 8, 3119 4, 31499

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-27-94 VOLUME 19
Concordance by Look See(82)

10315041131901115 3191719324018
shit [1] 31747
shoal [2] 317912325222
shoals [1] 317923
shock [3] 31547324713 32588
shore [1] 319117
shores [1] 31842
short-loaded (1] 324410
shortest [1] 306520
shorthand [1] 327210
shout [1] 303822
shove [1] 326218
show [9] 305615315622,
3217253218 3, 321920 ,
32241232332532343
shows [3] 30641731998 8, 17
shut [7] 31613 18, 323317
3261812326578
shuts [1] 323122
sic [3] 313233177532558
sides [4] 3106163201 11,
3221332634
sideways [2] 320320
323217
sighting [1] 30527
signal (1] 32666
signaling (1] 32668
signed [3] 306511 13,
315122
signiftcance [2] 3249 1, 326220
significant [1] 326010
significantly [1] 31033
silly (1) 311123
simple [3] 307820318323
319120
Simplest [1] 316825
simplest [1] 31498
sink [1] 322910
sinking [1] 323120
sinkings (1) 32157
sinus [1] 31393
Sir [4] 3041431777
317813320720
sit [8] 30281303114
3075631962320513
3212 13, 3232 20, 323618
site [3] 31501516
sits \([1] 325920\)
Stting [1] 31737
sitting [1] 315614
stuation [31] 304019
3068143069 12, 307917
3101 19, 223105 5, 31176
7, 3137 13, 3154 9, 23,
\(31562,31585,316023\),
3161 17, 3169 21, 317321
3198 2, 15, 3235 1, 16, 21.
3241 11, 3245 20, 324656
3251 1, 32521232554
stuations [4] 314511
3150 5, 3151 7, 318924
Sx [1] 304417
sx [18] 3049 15, 23, 30545 5, 30701824311720,31184 11, 133155 12, 3166 5, 11
16, 31719,3194 13, 322615 3234332633
six-mile [6] 3170141723
317171231725
six-minute [1] 319519
six-page [1] 316512
size [9] 30322330331314
1718304310305625
32046322912
sizes [1] 303316
sketch [2] 32181719
Skınner [1] 32085
skınny (1) 322914
Skıp [2] 303014303523
skip [1] 303523
skipped (1) 318517
skurt [1] 305422
slave [4] 3049 22, 305110 23, 24
sleep [1] 31195
sird [4] 3240111732412
slide [4] 31611 2, 32487
slider [1] 323122
sliders (1] 32321
sliding [2] 32275323613
Slightly [1] 31103
slip [5] 3027 12, 13 14,
3161 11, 326025
slipped [1] 325716
slop [1] 32248
slow (10) 3069 22, 3070 25,
\(31094,5,3121\) 3, 316622
25, 3210 24, 3244 20, 21
slower \([2] 3079\) 12, 312024
slowing (1) 326117
slowly [2] 3137 2, 323520
slurred [1] 30974
slurring [1] 310114
smart [1] 32455
smartly [1] 31372
smelled (1] 317411
smoke [2] 31641631651
smooth [1] 32407
sneak [1] 308121
snow [3] 3081 19, 25 ,
309824
snowing (2) 3059 23, 25
sober [3] 3099811310110
sobriaty [1] 320716
SOHIO [1] 307017
sole [1] 317614
solely [1] 319617
solve [2] 3111 10, 18
solvents (1) 3133.1
Somabody [1] 321321
somebody [19] 30275
\(302820,30488,306819\),
3076 14, 3079 7, 310525
3113 9, 3153 5, 317925 ,
3180 2, 3191 20, 3200 23,
3205 11, 3206 25, 3246 23,
3248 21, 3250 6, 7
Someone [1] 310818
someone [6] 3084 5, 31098
3131 24, 3184 13, 320021

\section*{32593}
someplace [1] 324817
somewhat [3] 304016
3083 5, 326021
Somewhere [3] 3033 3,
3084332087
somewhere [6] 304419
308443106 3, 314824

322823325416
somewheres [1] 303012
Sorry [2] 30531718
sorry [4] 304316304820
307316316623
sort (5) 311110311313
31384322117326620
sorts [1] 325015
Saund [19] 306112309221
31031731048310510
311153119431487
3150123155 22, 318311
13192531852025
31911232215322824
sound [9] 30895309219
243101 17, 3155 10,
316011 13, 3248 21, 32607
sounding [1] 310218
soundings [19] 32172225
321813321911632211
23323291315323610
113248832581832592 7815
sounds [2] 315712316815
source [1] 31519
sources [2] 3168 23, 31821
South [1] 314625
south [4] 3058 5, 3183 19,
3188132474
southbound [1] 316919
southbounders [1] 316814
southern [5] 302834,712 ,
310514
space [2] 3221 2, 322216
spaces [2] 3226 18, 323913
spacing (1) 306112
span [4] 3131142031399
314123
speak [2] 30604317322
SPEAKER [4] 30355 ,
3037213038 14, 306316
Speaker (4) 3155131623 31561
speaker (1] 31679
speaking [6] 3030 23, 30315 3092113094123097 4, 316710
spectal [2] 318724320713
specific [26] 3027 24,
303422 24, 3035 3, 6,
305423 24, 3062 10, 30645
13, 3066 18, 3069 13,
3128 22, 3129 23, 3135 22, 3141 4, 6, 3148 16, 31871 ,
3209 24, 3210 3, 18, 32112 32131
Spectically [1] 30989 specmically [11] 3124 11. 3155 5, 3165 20, 3166 19, 3175 20, 3183 8, 3186 3,
3189 16, 3193 9, 24, 319621
specified [1] 303510
specifies (1) 304013
speck [2] 324310
speculate [1] 317725
speculating (1) 317724
speech [2] 30974310114
speed [14] 3026 13, 3038 19,
3054 24, 3061 3, 3070 18, 25
3073 1, 3103.22, 3178 3,
3209243211 25, 3236 23,

32375323811
speods [2] 30566310725
Spell (1) 304111
spell [12] 302621,30418 ,
3065 6, 3073 21, 311012
3117 9, 16, 17, 31207.
3146 23, 3175 2, 321411
spelled [4] 3041 12, 311711
31209,321413
spelling [1] 314624
spend [1] 311216
spent [1] 304422
spowing [1] 309116
spill [2] 3163 14, 319123
spilled [1] 32241
Spit [1] 32474
spit [1] 315016
spoke [11] 3092 10, 3093 25,
3095 24, 3097 22, 309823,
24, 3150 11, 3152 20, 31601
3, 325724
sponsored [1] 31865
spots [2] 3197 17, 32205
square [6] 32219,324312
38324516
squiggly [1] 322310
SS [1] 322512
stability [1] 325221
stable [1] 325221
stack [1] 32094
stacked [1] 32397
staff [6] 3148223177 1, 6,
3187 10, 3209 12, 321015
stage [1] 31649
stages (1) 322924
stagger [1] 30955
Stalzer [11] 30771731163 4, 10122531171,31409 10, 31421922
stand [10] 30414306121
30652030731831182
3155 11, 31827319811
32145322117
stand-alone [1] 315114
standard (2) 30475,318812
standardize [2] 31551112
standards (1) 318513
standby [2] 304623
Stander [1] 303924
stander [25] 304017.
3042 19, 3052 23, 30562.
3064 4, 3157 10, 1821 23,
3158531722331932 2,
31941115202231959
15243197202225
3198101332037
standers [8] 303483062 15,
3173831924,31948
31965319924320924
standing [24] 302723
3034 9, 11, 12, 3040 18,
3055 16, 3056 13, 305915
3060613309810 11,
310125311718315722
24, 3197222325319815
3238912
standpoint [1] 326324
stands [1] 304215
stapled (1) 304721
starboard [28] 308114
30837 11, 30841620

FEDERAL TRIALL TRANSCRIPT

308663090130984,12 13, 173218213219 3, 18 32211232232032245 14, 322610 25, 3227 1, 3232.2 3248 15, 326415
start [12] 302925,304519 3046 25, 3047 3, 3048 4, 30695 6, 3122 1, 3135 5, 3185 16, 3226 12, 32347 started [14] 3029 12, 3045 24, 304611 15, 307620 ,
3089 24, 310822312020 322716 18, 3228 16, 323519325020,326117 Startıng [1] 30591 starting [6] \(30302,6,7\). 3219332241819 starts (6] 3047 8, 3161 10, 3166 24, 3234 1, 6, 32405 State [3] 3073 21, 3147 18, 318625
state [18] 3026 20, 30328 , 3041 7, 3065 5, 24, 3110 11, 17312063146 22, 3147 12, 317518318621320023 3201113214 10, 3248 19, 326620
stated [4] 3059 4, 309913 31794325520
statement [21] 3027 2, 6, 11 3029 17, 3032 12, 3036 14, 19, 25, 3072 18, 31818,22, 24, 3182 2, 6, 31845 .
31862331883 18, 32028 8, 3252 19, 326212
statements [3] 3156 4,
31701132114
States [9] 3074 5, 31333
3175123176 18, 3177 8, 31811631912431977 320424
states (5) 303520303712 3194113199632341 station [2] 3155 5, 319211
stationary [2] 3088 10, 16 stationed [1] 322815 status [7] 304321 24, 3150193154 12, 3159 19, 316020317619
statute [4] 31862 3, 5, 8
statutes |11 318524
stay [1] 30855 . 5
stayed [3] 3055 5, 3147 20, 323117
steady [1] 31144
steaming [1] 326125
steol [2] 32422425
steap [1] 31842
steeped \{2] 32121519
steer [13] 3062 10, 3078 3,
307933114 1, 3, 312519
1319253141 14, 3165 5, 31848
steared [2] 3126931307
steerer [1] 314011
stearing (20) 3055 16,
307813311419312516 31262 6, 83129 15, 25, 31331721223137 19, 314025314191920 31422032505

Steers [3] 31282324 312921
steers [7] 3125 6, 3128 25, 3129 19, 3143 14, 3144 13, 23, 314510
step [7] 3097 21, 31057 , 3142 13, 31467,3228 14, 32661
Stepped [2] 31461432662
stepping [2] 3076 4, 31421
steps (2) 3092 18, 24
stem [12] 30335 8, 13 22,
24, 3056 25, 3057 1, 9 ,
3093 19, 3203 21, 3223 3, 32535
Steve [2] 30661132513
Stoven (3) 3146 16, 3147 13,
316315
STEWART [4] 3026 8, 11, 25, 30342
stick [3] 3232 18, 20, 323513
stickers [1] 303017
sticks [1] 31612
stop [15] 3045 18, 3095 25,
31081931355319712
319919 20, 3200 3, 32279 ,
3234123240632449
3245 1, 3260 23, 32667
stopped [21] 30456 ,
308920,3090243091 15,
30961 2, 3107 17, 19, 22,
3108 16, 3161 15, 3172 5,
3174 14, 3227 6, 3244 16, 18,
32531420,2532558 。
326125
stopping (2) 3089 6, 7
stops [1] 322710
straight [1] 32568
straightened [1] 32637
Stralts [1] 310512
stranding [1] 324614
strandings [2] 321514
324611
strange [2] 3265 10, 12
stream [1] 315521
Stroet [1] 317511
strengths [1] 31316
stress [4] 3115 6, 3242 17,
32437,324713
stresses [2] 3242 16, 324313
strictly [2] 3060 6, 30627
strike [2] 3132 10, 320521
stripes [2] 3081 20, 309824
strong [1] 326023
structure [6] 30681731722
322383241 2, 324222
32641
stuck [1] 323219
study [3] 3073 8, 3085 17, 321312
stuff [11] 3030 15, 17, 3075 4,
3111 14, 3112 13, 322512
15, 32289 13, 323819
326222
subcommittee [1] 31923
subject [3] 3034173168 23,
321718
subpoena [3] 3165 14,
32002032013
subscribe [1] 32582
subsequent [3] 31765
3262.11
substance [6] 315219
320014320516 10, 32089
substituted [1] 302614
successful [1] 320612
successfully [3] 3043612
320613
successor [1] 306610
sudden [3] \(31618,9,10\)
suffering [1] 313825
sufficiont [5] 3152.7, 10, 3197 2, 3225 18, 19
suggest (1) 326423
suggested [1] 31891
suggeation [2] 3188.6,
324215
suggestions [1] 30939
suggests [1] 326421
sult [5] 3081 19, 25, 309825 ,
309914
Sulte [1] 317511
summary [12] 30662,
3067 22, 3068 3, 3069 1, 2, 3
8, 17, 3071 9, 23, 3072 19, 311610
summer [2] 3132 13, 31335
Sunday [2] 32175326224
sunk [3] 3230 23, 3252.13,
325718 _*
super [1] 31357
supertanker [2] 3204 5, 23
supertanker-size [1] 31852
supervise [1] 31386
supervised [3] 3130 24,
31358,11
supervising [2] \(3122.12,14\) supervision [3] 3131 10, 20 313715
supervisor [1] 313810
supervisors [1] 312216
supplemented [1] 315014 support [2] 31868,323910 supported [1] 323912
suppose [2] 3099 14, 32461 supposed [2] 3103 10, 31783
surface [2] 3057 14, 323925 surgeon [1] 324413
surprise [3] 3140 24, 31547 3193.12
surveillance [2] 3155 20,
31561
suspects [2] 3157 25, 31581
suspenders [1] 309617
Sustanned [1] 31414
sway [1] 30957
swing (2) 3088 2, 315223
swinging [5] 308924,
3233 23, 3234 4, 10, 324125
switch [1] 310219
swrtched [1] 320414
Sworn [9] 3026 19, 30416.
3065 4, 307320311010
3120 5, 3146 21, 317425
32148
Syatem [11] 3151 11,
3181 14, 3189 15, 17, 21
3190 9, 3191 22, 3192 12,
3194 18, 3199 14, 32139
syatems [10] 3105 12,
3181 15, 3190 17, 19,

Basic Syriame Mppicmions
\(32 \overline{1115} 181932285612\)
-T-
T-A-F-T [1] 302623 table [5] 308410308510 , 111219
tabulate [1] 304718
Taft [1] 302622
takes [3] 30301532279 322914
Talk (1) 325622
talk [22] 3082141630925
7, 93095 25, 30966 3105 25, 3113 10, 3119 24, 3120 24, 312133131 6, 23 3132 1, 22, 3142193171 11, 31862431942,32271 326115
talked [4] 3113 14, 3132 2,
3154 19, 324812
Talking [1] 30336
talking [24] 3029 23, 3033 12,
3035 5, 3056 13, 307225
308819309213309427
31121831324314525 3153 21, 3163 20, 3183 18, 3184 4, 319518321312 3230 8, 3239223245 11, 32561524326321
tall [3] 303319
tallies [1] 304720
tank (2)] 302820 21, 3067 3, 3070 16, 18, 213219 4, 6,
3221 12, 3223 7, 23, 32243,
\(68,16,322620,21,22\)
322823248 15, 16
tanker [20] 30292303017
3031183033 17, 22 25,
30494305821220 ,
3063 14, 3077 8, 3126 2, 4
3181 21, 25, 3182 19, 31848 ,
32048325722
Tankers [1] 307617
tankers [6] 305713306921 307743215202132162 tanks [22] 3221 13, 322314 1517 20, 2232241 10, 32261016182532271 3228 3, 3229 22, 3231 5, 12, 23, 24, 3239 9, 3245 23, 326417
tape [11] 3030133045 16, 25304641213304738 31532232459
tapes [3] 3045 15, 304611 316824
target [19] 3032 21, 22
3033 4, 11, 12 13, 305259 , 3053 6, 11, 25, 305515 3057 15, 3058 19, 3170 19, 3172 4, 31922432022225 targets [3] 304014305317 320322
tasks [6] 304673048915 21, 3049631425
TAYLOR [2] 3026 24, 30345 Taylor [48] 3026912
3027 1, 3029 21, 30311520 23, 3032 3, 303417303515 18, 3037 3, 3040 15, 304220

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-27-94 VOLUME 19
21304471821304825 30491315305411
305520315993166817 31671022316815817 1931701217
18, 31795, 6317241422 31739317412131617 19
team [2] 31111124
tearing [1] 316313
technical [1] 315019
TECHNICIAN [1] 32346
techniques [1] 305125
telegraph [4] 31006
31072231081823
tolephone [6] 303023,
303163091 3, 31652225 317320
telling [7] 3031 6, 31189 ,
324516 23, 3250 14, 32524 325724
Tells [1] 304518
tells (2) 319922324522
Tempe [1] 314625
ten [25] 3027 25, 3050 11,
3056 22, 3109 18, 20 22,
313525313613141519
318120,3183141521
3186 16, 1832381112
3265 5, 326622
ter-degree (1] 32383
tend [2] 3131 25, 31321
Tends [1] 31311
tends [1] 313123
fenet [1] 306818
tens [2] 31901115
tensile [2] 3242 23, 32435
tenure [2] 30669306920
term (6) 3138231769
3177113195113196 12,
324314
terminal [1] 319022
terms [9] 3103 10, 12
3148 18, 3149831566
3191 1, 3211232386,
323922
terrible [1] 319122
terribly [1] 302910
tertiary [1] 31788
tes (1) 32026
Test (1) 31151
teat [3] 3207 12, 14, 320819 temtifled (20) 30411430541 3071 8, 309917314010 3165 25, 3173 13, 31792
3180123181 25, 318310
31922320416320911
321173212 21, 323316
3236 1, 3261 7, 326316
testify (5) 3064 23, 320022
3201 7, 324718
testifying [2] 3139 7, 32624
testimony [43] 3028 1,
304091215 16, 21,
3042.233056 9, 30985 ,

31034310645312321
3141 13, 31731317412
317943183 23, 3189 13, 16
31907319813320018
32027,32041232081 ,
3209 13, 3211 10, 3212 25,

323222
243233136323422
32351832382324320
3251212324325710 32653
testing [7] 3207 7, 320812
8141519
tests [2] 320712320811
Texas [2] 30262231754
text [1] 316124
Thank [14] 3034230659
307312 25, 311925
31201131422531431
314673147131755
324959326411
thank [4] 30261632493 ,
3265 25, 32661
thankful [1] 324918
Thanks (2) 3110 6, 32096
that'd [1] 303718
Theory [2] 314923
theory [1] 31493
therapy [1] 31491
thereabouts [1] 324419
thereafter [3] 3080 15,
3265 23, 326623
they'd [2] 316812323611
they'll [1] 305718
They're [1] 314517
they're [9] 3028 22, 303411
3057 17, 3072 25, 3105 17.
3134 1, 3137 24, 32284.
32316
thin [1] 317713
thinking (3) 3042 23, 31615 , 8
thinner (1) 31391
Third [2] 31211131439
third [34] 30641530688
3071 23, 3076246722
30811330981131153 ,
312112 14, 312948 ,
31437316015 16, 31654
5,31771531781 101824
3179 5, 31805318210
3184 15, 3199 6, 321318 ,
3251 3, 3253 1, 2
thorough [1] 305419
thoughts [2] 3148 23, 31539
thousand [2] 3232 13, 14
Three (2) 3057 3, 32196
three (31] 3046 5, 304725
304919 23, 3057230941
309683099331063
3116 10, 3155 10, 3163712
3169233177 4, 318222
233202213210 18, 32194
322320,3232232401516
25, 3243 3, 8
three-lane [1] 31697
three-quarters (2) 3229 23,
32304
three-section [1] 31916
throes [2] 32451920
thrust [6] 3156 20, 31908 8,
3237113239 24, 324113
thrusting (1) 323918
ticket [1] 31851
tide [9] 3183 3, 3226 15,
3228 20, 213236 2, 32487,
832592432603
tıe [3] 30961931474
tied (2) 31151618
till [2) 325325325514
tilt [1] 324016
times [22] 30272330293
3033113077 16, 309010
3100 16, 3118631241213
2123253125171820
31319313919314211
314525315012321213
tuming [1] 304513
\(\operatorname{tip}\) [4] 302834712
tired [4] 311582331569
tires [1] 32306
trite [2] 3152 6, 317515
thted [1] 306412
toe [1] 322623
ton [1] 32449
tonnage [1] 30749
tons [21] 307483229 16,
32381522323937,1011 ,
15 18, 20212432409
32419143242 20, 32433
324411
tools [1] 32352
toss [1] 31642
total [2] 32471516
totally [2] 3079 21, 324213
touched [1] 303417
tour (1] 313222
tours [1] 312425
towards [6] 3089 24, 309420.
3095 3, 13, 3098.12, 23
towed [3] 3228 23, 3229 1, 6
towline [1] 32585
town [1] 320112
traced [1] 314815
tracing [1] 3193.14
track (12) 3061 15, 310322
3158183178 11, 3192 19,
3194 12, 20, 3195 10,
320215 20, 320320326821
tracked [8] 3103 17, 31048 ,
319525320291032032
Tracking [1] 319511
tracking [17] 3104 2, 10, 16,
3105 3, 3192 13, 15, 23,
3194 21, 3195 17, 19,
3196 10, 12, 15, 3197 20,
3202 13, 3203 1, 320420
Trader [1] 307624
trades [1] 313312
Trading [1] 307615
tradition [2] 3212.15, 20
traditional [1] 321619
Traffic (40) 3148 17, 31495
23, 25, 31502 9, 25, 315111
3153 15, 317215 23,
318110 14, 3189 15, 17, 21,
31902 9, 3191 22, 3192.12
3193 12, 3194 18, 31968 ,
3197 3, 3198 6, 20, 21, 23,
3199 1, 7, 14, 3202.2,
3211 17, 3212223213 4,
6, 9 12, 13, 23
trail [1] 314616
trained [1] 311911
training [13] 3110 21, 3111 1,
4 5, 13, 25, 3113 13, 22,
3119 14, 3132 21, 3148 19, 20
transcript \(\{29] 3037\) 7, 12,

\author{

}


303825305825306121 315424315672231571 3162 1, 3165 10, 12, 1719 23, 31663611 15, 31677 13, 19, 213171 16, 31728 12, 3173 1, 32729,12 transeription [2] 3158 12,
327210
transcripts [2] 31652125
transit [9] 30371930555
306011306733069 11, 14
3070 17, 22, 30733
transited [1] 316924
transiting [3] 30622
3063 18, 306910
transits [8] 3070 18, 24,
3073 2, 3152 11, 31806
transmission [6] 303725
3038 6, 30398,324510 324719325019
transmissions [ 6 ] 3037 4,
3245 14, 3250 9, 16, 3258 23, 32596
Transport [1] 307615
Transportation [3] 31277
3173 1, 32137
trapped [3] 322410322911 323119
travel [3] 3038 12, 3063 6, 310513
traveling [2] 30353317023
treacherous \([6] 3181\) 18, 19,
31832531841 11, 25
tranding (1) 317713
Treat [1] 313812
treatment [1] 320523
Trenton [3] 30641517 31997
trial [3] 30266323222
326624
tries [1] 313821
triggers [1] 315715
Trinidad [1] 32169
trip [3] 3077183105 23, 311425
tripped [1] 32318
trips [1] 307717
troopers [1] 30329
trouble [4] 3112 19, 31852
31971732157
truck [1] 324414
true [7] 303123306412
3183203224232415
32581232729
truthful [1] 307215
TSS [16] 3037152430384
30391230631031529
3157111931672324 3168220316941314 Tuesday [6] 32179322022 32661424 25, 326711 tug [1] 323816
tugs [1] 32631
turning [6] 308925310215 31361331711232062 32629
tums (5) 323814324447 19, 20
twelve [1] 31719
twelve-mile [1] 317113
twist [2] 32328324123
two-thirds [1] 307124
type [8] 305721311322
319911321520322018
32221832315324725
typed [1] 315813
types [1] 31174
typewriter [1] 302713
typical [1] 311514
typically [1] 30458
\(-\quad\) U-
US [1] 312119
Uh [3] 3166213167 5, 325325
uh [28] 303714 15, 18, 19,
3038 18, 19, 21, 3166 24,
316793168103169 15,
32512 3 4, 5, 6, 3252 20, 21, 22, 325334 10, 25
Uh-huh [18] 3043 22, 30469 ,
14, 1730477153049816
25, 30502430518
305218305463058 7, 9,
24, 311421
ultimately [1] 322823
Um-hum [4] 3164 21,
31741832529326521
unable [2] 3132 19, 319420
unaware [1] 31396
unbelievable [1] 318113
unclear (2) 3031 17, 305210
uncommon [1] 319013
undated [2] 303010,306513
underine [1] 312816
underining (2] 3129 19,
313215
Underneath [1] 320922
underneath (5) 31302225
3224 B, 16, 32541
understand (16] 3036 16,
3040 1, 3043 24, 3065 11,
3079 13, 3117 21, 31188 ,
3170213179 23, 3187 1, 4
3188113195123210 14,
3221 8, 323916
understanding [36] 3034 18,
2130369 13, 173038 4, 9
306125306233067 1,
31502131621431678 ,
3178212231791 19,
318310173192 2, 9,
31947163195 23, 24
31962531989103202 14, 3203569 13, 22 24, 320421
understood [3] 3085 2,
3087531965
underwater-operated [1]
322223
underway [5] 302822
303522322613248 24, 325223
undetectable [1] 30713
undocked (2) 3080 18, 21
undocking (1) 308019 ungodiy [1] 302723 UNIDENTIFIED [4] 3035 5, 3037213038 14, 306316 unit [3] 3155 19, 3206 23, 25
United [9] 3074 5, 31333.

3175 12, 31761831778 , 3181 16, 31912431977 320424
united [1] 320425
Univarsity [1] 314718
unknown [1] 305817
unlicensed [1] 37235
unmanned [1] 324616
unpredictability [1] 30689
unquote [2] 3163 18, 321117
unreasonable [3] 323415 18, 20
unreliable [2] 317134
unreaponsive [1] 325620
unsafe [1] 306914
untouched [1] 322316
unusual [10] 3054 14, 16,
3055 10, 3095 1, 31176 7,
3193 20, 22, 325810
up-scaling [1] 30764
update [1] 317321
updated [2] 3030 10, 30437
upper [3] 3203 11, 12, 13
upset [3] 3245 19, 3247 12,
32555
upstairs [1] 315314
urgency [1] 325920
usoful [1] 325917
useless [1] 309120
user [3] 3063 25, 3064 1,
315716
users [1] 30643
uses [1] 319613
utmont [1] 313414
- \(\quad \mathrm{V}\) -
vacuum (2) 323111
veguely (2) 3157 13, 319319 valid [2] 31872321024
valve [5] 3080 2, 3 5, 3231 6, 22
valves (9) 3079 16, 3142.9,
3227 21, 3228153231 5, 19, 22
\(\operatorname{Van}(6) 3233\) 5, 6, 13 16,
32341324215
varilla [1] 318911
vantage [1] 30632
variance [1] 323820
varied [1] 322921
varies [1] 324619
vary [1] 31378
varying (1) 314511
vastly [1] 321022 , 22
VC [1] 305215
vehicle [2] 3222 23, 24
venture [1] 31367
vertiod [3] 308920,309024
309114
verify [2] 3080 1, 316210
versus (7) 3027 13, 3033 13, 17, 18314923316021, 31699
Veasel (36] 3042 4, 3148 17, 3149 5, \(31508,25,3151\) 11, 3153.143172 23, 3181 10, 13, 31891517 21, 3180 2, 9, 3191 22, 3192 12, 319311 3194 17, 3196 8, 3197 3, 3198 6, 20, 21, 23, 3199 1, 14,
32021321117.321222 3213468
121323
Vessels [1] 306910 vessels [48] 3034 18, 30485 , 3056 4, 3061 8, 3062 2, 5, 8 3063 25, 3067 3, 3069 10, 3070 16, 22, 25, 3074 7, 8, 3076163077 3, 30784 4, 3104 10, 3138 2, 3149 7, 13, 15, 3150 14, 31557,316917 23, 3170 1, 3, 3181 14, 3194 12, 3211 13,
3215 13, 15, 16, 17, 19, 24, 3216 4, 21, 3230.21, 324615
16, 17, 18 efior an vicinity [11] 3030 12, 30333, 3043 14, 3057 15, 3058 21, 3150 24, 3153.18, 3158 23, 3161 19, 3174 10, 319211 VIDEO [7] 3034.6, 30357 , 3037 22, 3038 17, 3056 19, 3063 17, 32348
Video [3] 3034 5, 305618 320825
video [11] 3026 10, 11, 14, 303443056 16, 317057
3233 13, 3234 1, 324124
videotape [1] 3208.24
viow [13] 3056 22, 3142 12,
3162 22, 3165 8, 3172 9, 18, 3173 5, 3174 13, 3177 13,
3184 4, 3185.22, 310121.
32565 Jor ial ber
viowed [2] 3058.21, 30571
viewpoint [1] 317815
violation (1] 3118.7
violent [1] 32478
vis-a-vis (1) 317912
visibility [2] 3035.21, 305918 vasible [4] 3203 7, 14, 18,
32047
vision [1] 31394
visits [1] 319311
visually (2) 3071 5, 31582
vitae [1] 317523
vital [1] 313419 erzare
VLCC [1] 31721 ~uw
volce [2] 3168 24, 31744
voliced [2] 3088 18, 306917 vold [1] 32248 35ジ~ Volume [1] \(313021 \quad \mathrm{w}\) voluntary [3] 3211 19, 21, 24 voyage [1] 3192.5
voyages [1] 307711
VTC [42] 3029 7, 3034 21,
303528 10, 25, 30361014 19, 25, 3037 4, 8, 3038 11, 3039 1, 3045-20, 3048 10,
3052163053 2, 4, 9, 17, 18,
22, 23, 3056 1, 3063 19, 24,
30642 5, 9, 12; 3151 18,
3152.2, 3158 10, 13, 3159 19,

23, 3165 21,
316623173 8, 319716
31996
VTSs [1] 319112 of

\section*{-W -}

WAGNER [14] 30343,

3039 22, 3070 6, 10307312 31052031106311524
3116131192531707,
317421320823321324
Wart [1] 32666
wart [5] 31129321025
325325325514325611
wants [1] 31833
wake [1] 323116
Waldron [1] 31732
walk [3] 307918308120 30957
walked [11] 30878912 309114309593096126
309813320223320310
walking [10] 3094192123 ,
30952313141821
309816
wall [2] 3244 15, 16
wander [1] 313124
wanted [16] 3037330458
30612530631330762 313223161731957 320722323515323922 23324634324816 wantıng [3] 3132731872 17
wants [1] 31371
warn [2] 31041625
wartime [1] 314810
Washington [3] 317511
3176 12, 320024
Watch [2] 303923319924
watched (6] 30282312 30571331251619 watching [12] 3079131027 14162023312513 317718319518319616 17321317
waters (20] 30749312612
\(14312823,2431291,20\),
313035314191420 31431431441323
31451231792131801 31852531892
Waukeshau (2) 3231519 ways [1] 323217
We'd [3] 311121311211 322217
we d [3] 3045730484 , 322217
We'll [9] 303719312315 16, 3146 11, 32005 6, 3234 7, 3253 10, 326622 wa'll (8) 3038223039 23, 3138 15, 31742231766 3251 6, 325310326710 We're [6] 30261732033 3249711326620326711
we're [21] 30291423
30341530382130581
308819318317319125
320143209 15, 32181622 32192432515 6, 325220 21, 3253 5, 25, 3256 15, 32586
We've [1] 32514
we've [6] 30261430581 3068231811132183 , 326620
weaknesses [1] 31317
weather [14] \(3045 \overline{6} 78\)
305752130592324
306014309914311425
314512318924324620
325815
weaved [1] 30436
weak [4] 31126311424
31945321221
weakend [1] 326710
weaks [1] 320624
waighs [1] 322916
weight [1] 323117
wend [1] 303819
weren'f (2) 319521324724
West [1] 307323
west [3] 3076 18, 2132167
whack [1] 303821
whatsoever [1] 324919
wheel [3] 30811331149
313424
wheelhouse [5] 3098610
31001725,31429
whenever [1] 310522
Whichever (1) 304922
White [3] 3180192431837
white [2] 3107232238
Whoever [1] 31344
whoever [1] 306224
whys [1] 306018
wide [12] 303368318111
20318314152124
3184231861618322914
widely (1] 319822
wider [3] 31872131889 318911
wife [2] 314749
Wiliam [19] 306112
3103173104831059
311943140731457
31487,315012315521
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}318311 & 13 & 19 & 25 & 3185 & 20\end{array}\)
25, 31911232215322824
wind [4] 30451831378
32011
window [1] 309812
winds [1] 326225
wine [1] 30781
wing [16] 3081 18, 308219
20, 308423085 6, 72023
3086130878 16, 30906
3091 14, 3098 4, 1631068
wiped (1] 32318
wise [1] 325221
wish [1] 312722
withdraw [1] 315415
Witherall [1] 31401
Witherill [3] 314119
31441011
WITNESS (16] 302622
30419,1216304210
3065 7, 30708307323
31101331208,313817
31431314683214712
32499
Witness [7] 3073 19, 31204
5, 3146 14, 21, 3214832662
witness [8] 3038 15, 30392
3120 2, 3151 15, 316510
3214 4, 3221 15, 325117
witnesses (1) 32014
woke [1] 315217

Wolfgang [1] 30419
won't [2] 30567314710 wonder (6] 30482430493 731751832467 wondering [2] 30499 317725
word [10] 30299305613 312922315511316622 23, 31695317711319025 32577
words [25] 3055330796
308420309111311314
311520313510315315
315453156181931616 3163182131647316723
317447318019319915 3216233243332472223
325116
Work [1] 313815
work [23] 303018307615
22, 3111 24, 3112731159
13, 22, 312020,31301621 3131 24, 3133101114 3214242532168 10, 11 3222 11, 3226 9, 32485
worked [6] 31134311511
31161131173312018 324616
working [18] 30602306212
309514 15, 309618
311111311618311712
311917 18, 20318219
3190 1, 320112 14, 32514
3253 22, 326023
workload [1] 313314 works [3] 31151931951 32445
world (5) 30722531831
3216456
worry [2] 31613323125
worse [2] 3161 8, 316314
worth [2] 320615323915
wouldn't [20] 305013
3054192330829308711 3090131563318417
31951432022432434 324493245532567
325767 9, 18, 326516
wreck [2] 3163 9, 12
wrench (1] 324122
write [1] 319314
writton [3) 312819314318
315712
wrong [12] 3027 14, 15,
3064253115171920
3134233153 11, 324315
3255203256332575
wrote [2] 313018325417
\(\frac{-X-}{X O[2] 31522231533}\)
\(\frac{-\mathrm{Y}-}{\text { yards [3] } 306418,31998,17}\)
Yeah (38) 3032 24, 307515
21, 31138314443152 20, 3158 23, 31608316320, 3167 1, 3168 15, 317219 3185 10, 3219725322315 3228253230710323324

3238732396324324 3246153249172332504 1232521025
32533325510325911
326014326141319
32652
yeah [15] 30371831543
315618316417316769
243168 15, 3188 17, 32245
323010325814326315 32652
year [3] 3042931216
32052
years [10] 305712306212
31192312019312122
31472031774320121
32142332313
Yesterday [1] 31792
yesterday [4] 3040 22,
3165212531907
yiald [1] 324225
York [7] 3120 23, 3121 1, 2
31261131471718320024
Yorkers [1] 31215
YOST [2] 31756320825
Yost [15] 3174223175910
16171822317625
31802331819318812
3201618320424320822
You'd [1] 32378
you'd [6] 3113831515 ,
3161183175 18, 32407 ,
32674
You've (2) 305620308821
you've [14] 3033 22, 30487
305413056 20, 3099 13,
31593 6, 31617 11,
3167143232213246 10,
325519
Young [4] 318657825
young (1) 314217
yours [1] 31455
yourself [7] 3064 4, 306818
307815310713312912 315121316125
\(-\frac{\mathbf{Z}-}{}\)
zone [12] 30372024
303873039141920
3064 7, 19, 314893169 20, 31999
\({ }^{2}\)
Interin

) Case Na A89-0\%S CN (ARS)
) Archarege Alasia
) Tuesty, Mey 31, 197
) 800 an
TPAEDRITI OF PRCOHDINES


LOUE D, PBES 3203 3K9
feal time Tramaptan

\section*{APPEARANCES}
(4) For Plartiffs. ERTY S DEN

Oitar mistren, hasfeld 8 Toll
KOM Na Yoak Aerse, NL. ste. 60

क力 \(2121 / 63-3 / 73\)
truw onell
loul mar
Fapge 8 arsen
Cum invest Ortor

fh 62 \(3 \times 3530\)
H. LDEDEMTRAE, \(R\)

Bregr 8 нrtage
162 Loat Strex
Philatyhna, PA MTB
Ph 28. \(185-30\)
RIOHAD \(F\) corr
Bith cound cony
80 K Surer sure IP
Actraye ax

\begin{tabular}{|c|c|c|}
\hline (1) & \multirow[t]{7}{*}{For Deferart} &  \\
\hline 0 & &  \\
\hline (1) & & Andrese * 4 PD क \(907 / 2640\) \\
\hline (4) & & Matre Oras \\
\hline & &  \\
\hline G) & & Cralos 8 rron \\
\hline & & 308E cadsurex \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{(6)} & & Nes York, NY 10017 Ph 20h661-5 40 \\
\hline & & Jiem F Sill \\
\hline (8) & & JuEs F MER \\
\hline & & Neal 8 terell \\
\hline Q & & 20 Finst umon tose \\
\hline & & B0 4th Ame, Mrat \\
\hline \multirow[t]{3}{*}{( \()^{\text {a }}\)} & & nermille in sizis \\
\hline & & Pr 65/94 173 \\
\hline & & Panrix LMOH \\
\hline (b) & & orelvery Mmars \\
\hline & & 40 s . 14 p S Srex \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{(B)} & & Los Abeles, Ca 9 fr \(2134+0 \times 00\) \\
\hline & incart & \\
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{(b)} & \multirow[t]{4}{*}{ofacy Clerk.} & TOM MRTLIESH \\
\hline & & U.S. Distret Cart \\
\hline (1) & & T2 7 Th Aers \\
\hline & &  \\
\hline \[
\pi
\] & \multirow[t]{4}{*}{Peprotior} & Ph ST/RT-45 \\
\hline (B) & & MPRLANE Y LLNCEY RR-OM mingit in cart Paporters \\
\hline (8) & &  \\
\hline (a) & &  Fh \(90 / 108-700\) \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

5-31-94
KMAXII
PROCEEDINGS
(Jury inaly 01 a m)
(Call to Order of the Court)
THECLERK All risc
THE COURT Good morning lades and genilemen
This is the continuation of the trial in case A89 0095
civil in re the Exxon Valdez Mr Russo?
MR RUSSO Judge before we call the first witness
may I make a request to have a brief side bar with the Court?
(At side bar off the record)
MR RUSSO Your Honor the defendants call Jack
Mendelsonas an expert
THE CLERK Raisc your right hand please
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK Pleage be seated
For the record sir state your tull name your address and spell your last name please
THE WITNESS My name is Jach H Mendelson My
address is 1010 Memorial Drive Cambridge, Massachusetts
My
name is spelled \(M\) e ndel-s on
THE CLERK Thank you sir
THE COURT Mr Russo
DIRECT EYAMINATION OF JACK MENDELSON
BYMR RUSSO
(1) Q Goud inurning Dr Mundelson)
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 203276 \\
\hline & A (rood marumg \\
\hline & Q Dr Mundulson what is your present position? \\
\hline (3) & A Presently I am professor of psychatiry and neuroscience \\
\hline 1 & \\
\hline drus & the Harvard Medical xchool and darector of the alcohol and g \\
\hline & thuse treatment center and research center at the McLean Huspital an Belmont Massachusetts \\
\hline & Q Doulur are you licanbud to practiol medicane? \\
\hline & A Yes I am \\
\hline (9) & Q And how long have you been licensed to practice medicine? \\
\hline & A l've been licensed to practice medrcine sunce 1956 \\
\hline & Q And do you have any areas of specialization? \\
\hline & A Yes my ırea of specialization is psychiatry \\
\hline & Q Mr Mundulson Id lihe you to tell the jury a litle bit \\
\hline & about your cducational bachbround Start olf wath your \\
\hline & ollugt your medual school training plcase \\
\hline & A Yeah a viandard undergraduate school at the Johns \\
\hline & \\
\hline & Lniversity Following uy undergraduate education I went \\
\hline (1) & \\
\hline & unedical nchool at the University of Maryland I received my \\
\hline & dactur of medicute in 1955 Following completion of \\
\hline & \\
\hline & schoul I had a medical internship at the Boston City \\
\hline & \\
\hline & and following completion of tiy medical miternship I \\
\hline & ertuok a \\
\hline & three-year period of residency training in psychiatry at the \\
\hline & Massachusetts General Hospital in Boston Massachusetts \\
\hline & I hat three y ear period of psychaatric residency traunug \\
\hline & was required for certification by the American Board of \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
(1) Neurology and Psychratry I received my certificates in 1963
2) Q Can you tell the jury what it means to be certified in psychiatry?
A It means that one has to complete a prerequsite amount of
s) training, and also pass both written and practical examinatıons
(6) which indicate that you're competent to practice the specialty
7) of psychuatry
(B) Q After you completed your residency what did you do"
9) A After I completed my residency traming I had a tour of
duty in the United States Navy as a medical officer My
I) responsibilities as a medical officer in the Navy were to carry
(12) out diagnoses and treatment for medical personnel and naval
(13) personnel who had problems with psychuatric disorders
(14) Q And in conjunction with your duties and responsibilities in
(1s) the Navy did you also have occasion to treat people with
(16) alcohol problems?
(in) A Yes frequentiy
(18) Q Subsequent to the Navy tell us what you did
(19) A Subsequent to my tour of duty in the Navy I hegan a
(20) five-year post doctoral training program specializing in the
(21) diagnosis and treatment of alcohol-related disorders and
substance abuse related disorder I was sponsorship of a
(23) special tranung grant award from the Natuonal Institute of Health
Q Where did you do that training?

\section*{Vol 203278}

A I completed that five-year traming penod at the
Massachusetts General Hospital in Boston, Massachnsetts
Q Duning that time that you were doing this post doctoral
work that you described were you also on the faculty of
Harvard University Medical School?
A Yes at what tume I was apponited as an associate professor
, of psychuatry at the Harvard Medical School
Q After completing this post doctoral study that you just mentioned what did you do next?
A I then was invited to become the chief of the National
Center for the Prevention and Control of Alcoholism an
organization established withun the National Instututes of Health
Q Can you describe this institution a little bst for us?
A Yes, thes instutution was the predeceasor agency for the () National Instutute on Alcohol Abuse and Alcoholism And it's (IT) estableshment by the Natuonal Instututes of Health was (18) anglogous to the accomplushment of other unstututes such as the
(19) cancer anstutute
(20) \(Q\) When you say you were the chief of this agency does that
(21) mean that you were the head of the agency?
(22) A Yes, I was the chief or director of the agency
(23) Q How long did you remain in that position?
(24) A I remaned in that position for three years
(25) \(Q\) What was the mission of this particular agency?

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3279\)}

A Well the mission of the agency generally was to improve ' our knowledge about the causes and consequences of alcoholism
(3) with the hope that we could amprove both prevention and control
(4) of the problem
(5) Q Did there come a tume that you left that position?
(6) A Yes
(7) Q Where did you go then?

A I was appoiated as d professor full tenured professor of
psychatry at the Harvard Medical School and I also
(10) concurrentlv was chef of the department of psychatry at
the
(11) Boston City Hospital
(I) Q When vou hclame a full lunurud professor of psychatry at
(13)
(14)
(15)
(16) tum
(17)
(18)
the
(19) research which I had reported on the causes of alcohol related
(30) problems
(-1) Q Now as a full tenured professor at Harvard Medical School
(I) in addition to instrucling students what duties and
(-3) responsibilutes did you have?
(24) A My responsibilities included supervision of a department
(2S) which had as ats promary goal the diagnosis and treatment
of

\section*{Vol 203280}
persons with psychiatric disorders which included
alcohol related and substance abuse disorders in both
outpatient and sapatient clumical facility
\(Q\) In conjunction with your duties and responsibilities did
you have the dultes and responsibility to diagnose and treat
people with alcohol rulated problums and other psychiatric problems?
A Yes I did Many individuals
Q Did there come a time that you lefl City Hospital?
A Yes when I left the City Hospital I went to the alcohol and drug abuse research and treatment center was tablished
by Harvard Medical School at the Mclean Hospital which is
an
(13) affiluate of the Massachusetts General Hospital
(14) Q All right And the McLean Hospital is alio affiliated with
(1s) Harvard Medical School is it not?
(16) A Yes it is a major psychatric teaching hospital for
(17) Harvard Medical Hospital
(18) Q What was your position at the McLean Hospital?
(19) A I was darector of the alcohol and drug abuse research
(20) center and also director of their substance abuse treatment (21) program
(22) Q And that is your present position today up untal today?
(23) A Yes, my present position which I have held for 20 years
(24) \(Q\) In conjunction with your duties and responsibilities at the
(25) McLean Hospital do you have occasion to diagnose and treat

Vol 203281
patients who have alcohol related problems?
A Yes, we admit approximately 800 patients a vear to our inpatient facility, and our outpatient treatment faculity has approximately eight to 10000 outpatient visits
Q Doctor can you estumate tor us approximately how many patients you ve had occasion to treat and diagnose for alcohol related problems'
A Well, over the past 20 years those patuents that I have been intumately involved with - that is I provided the
diagnostic evaluations and the treatment recommendations
would say about two to 3000 patients
Q Doctor do you belong to any national or international associations?
A Yes
Q Can you name a few of the more significant ones for us?
A Amencan Psychuatinc Association which I hold a Life fellowship I also am a member of the Socsety for Clinucal
Pharmacology and Therapeutics This organization is a organization which consists of physicians from medical and
(20) scientusts from many disciplines and the purpose is to umprove
, our knowledge about drug treatment for a viriety of conditious
, including psychiatric faculities
I am a member of the American bousty for Pharmacology and
(4) Experimental Therapeutics I have been elected to membership
(2S) in the Psychoneuroendocrinology Society which is a special

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3282\)}
organization that consists of physicians who are interested
bow hormones function mat iffect the conapronise of in individual's ability to work and to remain well
Q Doctor do you hold any aditorial positions on pecr review journals?
A Yes I ve held editorial responsibihtaes for a aumber of juuraals including the periud of time when I was cueditor of the Journal of Studies and Alcohol This journal is one of
oldest and most widelv circulated journals of reportiug alcohol related studies including studies on treatment and
diagnosis throughout the world
Q Can you expiain briefly for the jury whal a pler rovitw journal is?
A It is a journal in which a person vubinitiag au article to that juuraal has that article resiewed aneminoulv bs lwa expert indivaduals who make judpmeats thaut its viladity and
17. suatability for publication

Q Have you yoursull authorwd and had artulu puhlished in peer ruview journals?
A Yes I have
Q Approximatuly how many?
A Well I've had a total of about \(\mathbf{4 0 0}\) articles published in a vanety of journals as well as in texts
Q Approximately how many of the articles - what percuntage
of the articles that you have published have to do with
(1) alcohol reiated problems?
(-) A Roughly, I'd say about 75 to 80 percent
(3) Q In addition to articles have you also authored books?
(4) A Yes I've authored textbooks on The Diagnosis and

\section*{Treatment}
(5) of Alcoholism and I've also contributed chapters to textbooks
(6) of internal medicine on this topic
(7) Q The textbook that you have writien on alcoholism what is
(8) the name of that book?
(0) A The most recent version is the Medical Diagnosus and
(10) Treatment of Alcoholism
(t) Q Is that a texibook that \(s\) widely used in medical achools?
(12) A It is my understanding that it's a textbook most widely
(13) used in medical schools It is the companion volume to a
(14) textbook entutled Harrison's Prunciples of Interim Medicine
(IS) which is a text that is very widely used m medical schools and
(16) throughout the world
(17) Q Just one more short thing about your credentials
(18) Have you received any honors or awards?
(19) A Yes, I have
(20) Q Can you tell us what honors and awards you have received ( ") rulalud to your experience in alcohol related problems?
1 , A Yes I have received the major award from the Amencan
1 3, Puychatric society their majur research prize for studies,
(24) which I and my colleagues carned out relating to the diagnosis
(-s) and treatment of alcohol related problems

\section*{Vol 203284}
(I)
(2) Alcohoinsm which is the major research instatutional gronp

In
(7) the Uuited States for investugative work which I have carned
(4) out with my colleagues an alcohol related areas
( \(s\) ) I ve recenved the Jellinek award which as the major
internatuonal prize given for investigators throughout the
world who have conducted work in alcoholism
I I have also served as a member of the nominating comuittee
for the Nobel Prize in physiology or medicine
(10) Q Just so the jury is clear on that doctor you haven \(t\)
"li) rullived the Nobel Prize?
(I) A No I haven't I've been on the nominating committee
(13) MR RUSSO Your Honor Id like to offer

1di Dr Mundelsond ds ancapuri in paychatryand the diagnoxis and
141 Iratment and prevention of alcohol related problems
(16) MR O NEILL No objection
(17) THECOURT The doctor s qualifications are accepted
(18) BY MR RUSSO
(19) Q Dr Mendelson in conjunction with your preparation for
(20) icstifying in this case have you had occasion to review the
(21) documbnt hnown as thi Individual Disability Report?
(22) A Yes I have
(23) \(Q\) Have you also had occasion can to review a book or manual
(24) L nown as the DSM III?
(25) A Yes I have

Vol 203285
QId like in have put up on the screen PYIO Plainitifs Exhibit 10
You Il nolice there is a video screen right next to you
also one here too (indicating) if you prefer to look at this one
I d like you to look at this document that s been displayed
up on the screen Is that the individual disabilitv report that you reviewed?
A Yes it is
Q li is your understanding that thin is the individual
disability report that was sent to Exxon Corporation hy
Dr Vallurv?
AYes
Q Is it possible to have that brought up a little bit in the center?
(i6) Doctor in looking at this particular individual disability
(17) report can you see an area here which relates to Captain
(18) Hazelwood s diagnosis?
(19) AYes Ican
(20) Q Can you tell us where that is?
(?) A I am sorry I don't have a pornter but it's the line -
(י2) yes, that is it
(23) \(Q\) (Indicating) Now what is it that you see here that you
(74) say is the diagnosis?
\& A Thase are two diagoostic conde numbers which are denved

\section*{Vol 203286}

From the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual III which is itt parentheses DSM III
Q There shere right this litile thing here DSM IIt in parenthesis?
A That's correct
Q And those are code numbers?
A Those are code numbers
Q So if one wanted to determine what Captain Hazelwood s diagnosis was in looking at this form you would look at these code numbers and you would go to the manual DSM III? A That is correct
Q And that would tell you correct?
AYes
Q Now can you tell the jury what DSM III a? A Dragnostic and Statustical Manual III was a publication compled by the Amencan Psychuatric Association following contributions by experts in the field for describing the diagnostic criteria for establishment of a diggnosis of an individual who had a psychiatric illness Q Now in 1985 Doctor was DSM III the primary diagnositi manual for individuals in the United States?
1 ) A It was the - not only promary but I would say the exclusive diagnostic manual which achieved consensus in most
1 4) inpatient and outpatient settings in the United States
(25) \(Q\) Now in terms of this diagnosis night here on the
(1) diagnown wation 30040 and 30902 according to the
' diagnostic manual DSM III what is this diagnosis?
A That diagnosis is dysthymia
Q That s \(30040^{\circ}\)
A That's correct
Q And this diagnosis 30502 what is that diagnosis?
A That is alcohol abuse episodic
Q Now in conpuncion with the fatl that the dusthymia is lislad lirsi and the alcohol ahuse cprods is livied scuond in thersans modical stgnilicansc lo that'
A Yerrthe primari dagnusin in ans medical record ss usualls
(1) the firve listed diagnosis
"ivi Q So you would conclude then that the primary diagnosis on
(1+1) this form in what'
(IS) A Dysthymia
(16) Q And the second carry diagnosis is what?
(i7) A It would be alcohol abuse episodic
(18) Q And Doctor in terms of DSM III what it saya in DSM III
(19) the manual is that diagnosis a diagnosis for alcoholism?

A It is ubsolutely not a diagnosis for alcoholesm
( 1 ) Q Why is that not a diagnosis for alcoholism?
( ) A Becauve in urder to achieve the diagnostic citena for
1 3, alcoholism the diagnosis would have to anclude critena which
indic ite etther alcohol withdraw al ar sagnificant alcohol
( 51 intolerance

Vol \(20 \quad 3288\)
(1) Q In conjuncion with that Doctor undur the criteria of
i? DSM III il that whr the case diagnosis would be alcohol
in dependencrax upposed to alcohol abuse ᄂpisodic?
(d) A That scorrect DSM III stater explicitly that alcoholusm
(s) is - ulcoholism is alcohol dependeacy
(b) Q As opposed to -
(7) A Which is not alcoholism

181 Q Now I d like you to explain as besi you can in laymans
(9) terms what is dyathymia? What is the primary diagnosis
(101 dysthyma? What does that mean?
(1II A Well dysthymia is a form of depression It's relatuvely (12) common, many many individuals have expenenced it It's
(13) charactenzed by feelings of sadness at tumes, by mability to
(14) sleep well either sleeping too short a tume or sleeping too
(IS) long a time It's charactenzed by difficultues that
(10) individuals may have in their perception of happiness or
(i7) sadness in the world about them They may bave
difficulties
(181 eating thev mav have difficultiev sleeping as I mentuoned
(19) It is not a severe depressive disorder but a relatively
(20) common one
(21) Q So would you say that it s a mild form of depression?
(22) A It's a muld form of depression
(23) Q All right Now the secondary diagnosis there alcohol
(91) abuse episodic Will you please explain to the members of the
(25) Jury what that is?

A Well alcohol abuse episodic is basically thappropriate
of alcohol on an episodic basts It is alcohol abuse but not alcohol dependence or alcoholism
Q Now you have testified and noted that there is a primary
and a secondary diagnosis here the primary being dysthyma and
the secondary being alcohol abuse episodic What is the
significance ol the primary diagnosis being dysthvmia and the secondary being alcohol abuse episodic?
A Well the general significance of a primary and secondary diagnosis is that the secondary diagnosis is the result of

\section*{prumary duagnosis}

Q So in a situation where you have dysthymia and alcohol
abuse episodic is il your opinion that in that particular
stuation the person would bu drinking because they re depressed?
A That is correct
Q Now Doctor you mentioned a term before when you were talking aboul alcohol dependence the term being tolerance Do
"|y| you recall that'
(20) A Yes Idid
( II Q All righi Under DSM Ill how is tolerance dulined)
1 A Tolerance is primarily defined as the need of an individual
(3) to ingest an mereasing amount of ethanol in order to achueve
the desired effect


\footnotetext{
Vol \(20 \quad 3290\)
alcohol abuse episodic as opposed to alcohol dependent that
1 mesns that they do nol exhibil signs of inferane w inat
correct?
A That is correct If they did exhibit it they wouldi't achieve a diagoovis of ticohol abuse epiondic
Q Now bulore wh laye the icrmituleran - I would lit In
tald to you just a litile hit ahoul the phraological cilcol or the metabola tifat ol tolerancu
If a pursonexhibits toluranse asdclinudin DSM III dow thuir ability to climinatc ala ohol Irom thair blood ivsicm change'
A lt does significantly
Q Ther has been some lastimony in this tase about the avcrage elimination rate buing /woo onc live'
AYes
(16) Q is that consistent with your percepion of what an avcrab elimination rate would be?
(18) A That's a conservative but a reasonable estum ite of an
(19) average elimsation rate in a nontolernint individual
(0) Q In a purson that is lolcrani to alcoholand would ho

1 dependunt undur the crilcria ol DSM III what would he the ralc of climination in such a purvon?
i it A lt could edsily dunble und there ire a variets of atudies which have been carried out under ver, \(c\) irefull, controlled
that is to determine thit they elamante the alcohol from
}
(3) average person is zero one five what would be the rate for a
person exhibiting tolerance in accordance with DSM WI?
A Zero three zero
Q Now I d like you to look at this form a little further
and I call your attention now to the treatment section Doyou
see that? Do you see these various things listed under one
two three tour and five?
AYes
Q Are these listings under the treatment section in your
opinion consistent with treatment for alcohol Doctor for
dysthymia and alcohol abuse?
A Yes, they are
Q Could you look at those particular categones of treatment
and tell the jury what in your opinion is consiatent say
with treatment of the primary diagnosis dysthymia?
A Treatment of the primary diagnosis of dysthymia would
mvolve individual psychotherapy, group therapy, and, if the
individual were a marined person, mantal therapy
\(Q\) Those particular treatments that you have just described
are in fact treatments number one two and three on this
(reatment section is that not correct)
A Yes they would be
Q In tact the first treatment is individual psychotherapy

\section*{Vol 203292}

\section*{Is that correct?}

\section*{AYes}
, Q Is individual psychotherapy particularly consistent with a diagnosis of dysthymia as a primary diagnosis?
A lt's the major form of therapy that you utilize for treatment of dysthymia
Q Now looking once again at the overall treatment section
what categories of treatment in your opinion are consistent with treatment for alcohol abuse episodic?
A Well stem number four AA which is Alcoholics

\section*{Anonymous}
(11) but I think it's only far to point out that many persons who
have sustanned problems psychatric problems which have
never
(13) tavolved alcohol - an alcohol problem have often ganed a
(14) great deal of benefit by boing to AA There are persons
that - patients that I have known who have held AA
membershıp
who hive not had alcohol problems but have felt that
pirticipation in that aroup ictivity is very helpful and very supportive
Q Doutor does a paticnt or person have to be alcohol
dupendent to bu ruferred to \(A A^{\text {? }}\)
A No absolutely not
\(Q\) And it s consistent with a diagnosis of dysthymia and alcohol abuse?
A It would be 1 would say about a 50 percent consistency
ves

\section*{Vol 203293}
(1) Q The fifth one there lectures seminars workshops
i) pertaining to alcoholism Is that conststent with a diagnosis
(3) of dysthymia and alcohol abuse episodic?

A Yes, I thunk that those - that last item would be perceived at least m my opanion to be an effort to prevent the occurrence of alcoholsm
Q Now Doctor looking at this treatment section would you
say that this treatment would be consistent if the diagnosis
were alcohol dependence or alcoholism?
A It - no, it would not
QWhy not?
A Becouse of an individual or person had alcohol dependence
(13) or alcoholsm from a medical and psychiatric point of view atem one would not be individual psychotherapy
Q What would tem one be?
A Item one would be pharmacotherapy
Q What is?
A Pharmacotherapy is a medical management for use of a (19) medication, and there are and have been medications avaulable

\section*{Vol 203294}

A Yes Yes
Q Is a 28 day program that \(s\) referred to here is that
consistent with treatment for dysthymia and alcohol abuse episodic?
A Yes It would be
Q Okay Is there anything in vour opinion magical about a 28-day program being limited to just treatment for alcoholism' A Absolutely not At our inpatient treatment facalities and in many inpatient treatment facilatiev throuphout the world
persons with mald or moderate or severe depression receive
days of inpatuent treatment
Q Now following along further on this particular eniry you see Mr Hazelwood will be given a leave of absence to get involved in AA and aftercare What is aftercare what is your underatanding of aftercare? Why is that relative to someone with a diagnosis of dysthymia and alcohol abuse episodic?
(in A Well, aftercare could vary quite widely It could range
(is) from continuation of individual psychotherapy, to occassional
(19) attendance at group meetings in which there was no professional
(20) personnel at all supervising the treatment
(21) \(Q\) In your experience Doctor what is the normal length of (22) time that a patient with a - with a diagnosis of dysthymia
(23) primary and alcohol abuse episodic would attend an aftercare (24) program?
(25)

Vol 203294
Q And what would be the - how would it bu decided that a ' paticnt would stop going to such a program'
A Well the basic decision of any patient to either enter or
(4) remain in aftercare is based upon the patient's decision And
(S) the patients usually contuaue an aftercare treatment program
(6) based upon how they're feelng and how well they have resolved
(7) the problem which brought them into the aftercare program
(8) Q Dootor do you have an opinion concerning whether or not a
(9) person who has been treated for dysthymia and alcohol abuse
(10) episodic can resume drinking afterireatment resume social
(II) drinking after treatment?
(12) A Yes I think someone who has had -
(is) \(Q\) What is your opinion relative to that? What is your uls opinion relative to that?
(1s) A Well my opinion would be that an individual who has had
(10) dysthymia and episodic alcohol abuse could resume social
(in) draking following completion of treatment
(18) Q Why do you believe that? What is the basia of your
(19) opinion?
(20) A Well, as I mentioned previously, dysthymia is a very, very
(21) frequent occurrence in the world And episodic alcohol abuse
n) associated with dysthymia is also a very very frequent
(3) occurrence Many persons will dnak too much and
(1) inappropriately in the context of experieacing dysthymia
(S) People drink to alleviate sorrow

\section*{Vol 203296}
(1) Q So there is no medical reason then that you re aware of
(2) why a person who has undergone treatment for dyathymia and
(3) alcohol abuse episodic could not after treatment resume
(4) social drinking?
(s) A That is correct
(6) Q Doctor in confunction with vour experience and your
17) rescarch are you tamiliar with the signs of intoxication in
alcohol dupendent pcopls?
AYer I im
Q And you mentioned bufor we discussed tolerance
something
Ill ahout elimination rates And you said that the efimination
(19) rate for a alcoholic person would be double that of an arrange
(13) person?
(14) A That is correct
(Isi Q You are talking about the rate per hour right?
1101 A Right Clearances or the disappearance of alcohol from
the
(17) body over an hour - or over hourly intervals

118, \(Q\) Do you have an opinion as to whether - as to whether an
(19) alcohol dependent person would show sugns of intoxication if
(20) they had a high blood alcohol level of say 35 to 47
( 1 ) A Any individual with or without tolerance at a blood alcohol
( ) level of zero - I'm sorry'?
123) Q 35 to -
(24) A 3 to point -
(2) Q Four

Vol 203297
(1) A Four yes would probably be eather comatose or very close
(2) to coma The lethal-you're now approachng the - an almost
(3) lethal dose of alcohol

Q What about level of 25 to \(30^{\circ}\)
A Most individuals would be in incipient coma at that point
Certannly near coma or just prior to coma at those blood alcohol levels
Q all right And what about at 226?
A Severely intoxicated
Q Can you describe what you expect to observe in such a
(11) person?
(12) A They would be unable to walk and to move about in a
(13) coordinated manner Their speech would be drastucally
(14) slurred They would be virtually incapacitated
(1s) Q What about at 2417
(16) A That's - the phenomena would be relatively sumilar at that
(17) point
(18) MR RUSSO Thank you Dr MLndeison Yourwitness
(19) THE COURT You may cross examine
(30) MR O NEILL Thanh you
1) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JACK MENDELSON

1', BYMR O NEILL
( '1 Q How are you sir'
(4) A Fine
(-s) \(Q\) I took the oucasion last night to read your books

\footnotetext{
Vol 20 324x
You icslificd brichly aboul - wall hil mash youa question
3) What dues 11 mean woblan oudtor ot a booh the the
ti diagnosis and ircatment ot alcoholism which savs edited by Jack
(s) Mendelson M D and Nancy Mello Ph D? What does it mean to
(6) be the coeditor of the book?
(7) A Well editing that specific text was based upon the request
(8) made by the publisher and I think was - don't recall who the
(9) publisher was - through Harvard to publish a text on the
(10) diagnosis and treatment of alcoholisin
(1) Q Now you tastilicd iodav that vou halisvad that wom hudv
(1) who suflerad Irom dysthy mua and alcohol ahuac cpisodis could
is rulurntodrinhint That, a orre ' latumbal'
(A) A l hev could retura to stekal druiking
usi \(Q\) Social drinking Andindeud at cemain timesin the pasi
116, you have taken the position that pcople who sulfer from
(i7) alcoholism can return to social drinhing haven 1 you?
(18) A We have quoted work completed by anvestıgators who have
(19) ascertanned that certain persons calu return to work
following
(D) drinking
(1) Q And would those be Rand invontizatorn or the Rand

1 , Corporation invastigulors amone whars'
Fi, A The grant to the Rand Corporation for the atud, that I
i th thank you're referriag to was provided bv the I itano il
is Institute on Alcohol Abuse ind Alcoholisin and the Rand
}
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 203301 \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{, A I'm sorry'} \\
\hline & Q The conviction that tolerance to aicohol mav be linked to \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(3) development and maintenance of abusive consumption} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{patuerns is} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(4) not a new one?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(5) A That is correct} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(6) Q Aftercare as you talked about on Exhibit 10 the IDR is} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(n) associated also with alcohohsm isn it \({ }^{\text {a }}\)} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(8) A I'm sorry'} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{(9) Q Aftercare is a prescription for people who suffer from the (10) disease of alcoholism}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\begin{tabular}{l}
(il) A Persons who suffer from a vanety of diseases including \\
(12) alcoholism
\end{tabular}} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(13) Q Including alcoholism?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) A Could receive aftercare} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(15) Q And they} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(10) Anonymous?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(1) A I wouldn't call it a prescription to attend} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(18) Q You wouldn t?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(19) A I would call it - excrise me I would call it a dascussion} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(20) that they would engage in with their therapist, and if both of} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(2) them deemed that that would be helpful and useful, that} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(22) be undertaken} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(3) Q Would you agree with the proposition that abstinence is a} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) goal appropriate for all alcoholics one would certainly not} \\
\hline & S alcoholic taxi driver pilot or accountant \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\section*{Vol 203302}

\section*{aspire to anything else?}

A The problem that I have is the term alcoholic Which is a genenc - generic term that doesn't really specify alcohol abuse or alcoholism
Q Are you aware that Peter Nathan (ph) a colleague in your
book published a chapter which states Abstinence -and in the chapter that statement is made Abstinence is a goal appropnate for all alcoholics Onc would certainly not want one a alcoholic taxi driver pilot or accountant to aspire to anything else
Are you aware of the statement being made in your book? A Yes and I know Dr Nathan, and quate well and be would define alcoholic as aicoholesm
Q Does Dr Nathan take the position that alcoholics who have achieved sobriety muat not be lead to believe that they can etther drink in a controlled fainion no avaiable data suggeat that we have the means to enable an alcoholic to achieve that goal Is that Dr Nation answer s position in your book? A That could be Dr Nathan's posituon What year was that text publushed, sur?
Q I m working on this one and I II eventually get to the other one Is this - 19851979 is this the right one?

\section*{A That's right}
(24) Q Psychotherapy is in fact prescribed - you talked about the (25)

Vol \(20 \quad 3303\)
(1) prescribed tor alcoholism isn : 11 ?
() A Yes but it would ant be the pmmary listing under
(3) treatment regimen Primary regimen would be formatuve therapy
(4) Q What is the third tradition of Alcoholics Anonymous do you (s) know?
(6) A I haven't memonzed the traditions no
(7) Q Have you even looked at them?
(8) A Of course I have
(9) Q If I were to state that the third tradition was something
(10) along the tines of the requirement for membership in
(il) Alcoholics Anonymous - is a desire to stop drinking the only
(1) requirument' is the desire to stop drinhing would that accord (13) with your recollection?
(14) A That would accord with my recollection but it would not usi accord with my knowledge that persons can attan participation
(16) in Alcohoincs Anonymous and never be asked what thear problem
(In is In fact anonymity and the option to remain salent is a
(18) wonderful and standard procedure in Alcoholics

Anonymous
(19) Q Sir I have a book here called Medical Diagnosia and
(20) Treatment of Alcoholism and I think you mentioned this in your
(1) direct testımony
(1) A Yes
" Q Thin a houk that you wrule"
(9) A This is a hook which I and my colleague friend and wife
( 5 ) edited

\section*{Vol 203304}

\footnotetext{
Q This one you edited?
AYes
Q Okay
A It's an edited text that have contributuons by 22 other individuals
Q You ru right Thivluxt 1 -as \(\{\) looh al the preface -
wav lacilitalad agrant trom the Liscnucd Blverage Information
Council
A That is correct
Q Whal is that?
A Licensed Beverage Information Council is a trade organization that is based in Washington D C Thear actavities include providing a better fund of anformation to
undividuals in order to reduce the prevalence of
alcohol-related problems
Q Who gives them their money -
A Who gives who their money?
Q - the Licensed Beverage Information Council?
A You would have to ask them that
Q Do you know?
A I don't know
Q The text was also facilitated by the Distilled Spirits
Council of the United States
A That is correct
Q Okay
}

Vol \(20 \quad 3305\)
(1)

\(\qquad\) cont
(3) (4) (6) thing that I should add There was a very explicit agreement
(7) between Harvard and the royalty funds which are received from
8) the publisher to be used for a very specific purpose That
(9) purpose was to provide educational support for women and 10
(10) particular minonty women who had lacking financial resources
(11) for thear medical tramug
(12) Q You wrote the grant proposal or participated in writing of
(13) the grant proposal for the Distilled Spirits Council of
(14) America didn \(t\) you?
(15) A I did not I should add, the grants are not given eather (16) by the Natronal Institute of Health or by most orgomizations,
7) to undividuals, they're given to instututions The institution si is the recipient to the grant
(19) Q With regard to your two books on alcohol vou got grants
1.0) Irom the liquor indusiry'
: "1 A No Harvard Medical School received fund fromituol 1 , organizations plus many other orgailizations to prepare these
( 3) texts
(4) Qlwant to taik for a munule it we could hulore we get on (-5) to the yecond book about DSM IIl and about what alcohol abuse

Vol \(20 \quad 3306\)
episodic is
Episodic is a form as 1 understand it in DSM 111 of
alcohol abuse It sonc of thruehind ol alcuhelahua - at
least in DSM III?
A That is correct
Q And alcohol abuscincludes among othorthings the need
for the dally use of alcohol tor adcyuate functioning
A lt could but doesn't specifically require it
Q Okay I mgoing to read through what is in DSM III and you tell me whether it \(s\) this is your recollection of what \(s\) in DSM III
The need for the daily use of altohol for adequati
functioning is that in DSM III for alcohol abuse?
A Would you read in DSM III -
Q 1 mgoing to ruad the whole thing
A Excuse me Would you read the fact that each of the items
117, that you are reciting is nut a requarellent hut that there cals
isi be alternate items that are required '
\|y) QOhay Thal s lin
1-0, A In uther words what iou re readang tuphes thit evervoue
( ) with alcohol abuse has to have this particular symptom
(2-) Q We looked at the diagnosis on the IDR The diagnosis on
, IDR includes alcohol abuse That sa correct statement?
(24) A It is alcohol abuse episodic
(25)

Q DSM III defines first alcohol abuse in a general format

5-31-94
VOLUME 20
\(\operatorname{XMax}(9)\)
Vol 203307
(1) doesn \(t t^{\text {? }}\)
(a) A It defines it in a general format but specifies how many of
(3) those conditions must be present If you -
(4) Q Let 8 discuss the conditions first -
(s) MR RUSSO I object The witness must be allowed to
(6) finsh the answer He was in the middle of an answer and he
(7) was interrupted
(8) THE COURT You re going already
(9) BY MR O NEILL
(10) \(Q\) In fact you listed - and you tell me if I m wrong on a
( - ) tactor DSM III include the need for datly use of alcohol for
(12) adequate functioning Is that a factor to look at?
(13) A It is a factor that would not be requred for all persons
(14) who are diagnosed as alcohol abuse
(1s) Q Is it in the DSM?
(16) A Of course it is Hypertension is in there too
(17) Q Inability to cut down or stop drinking Is that in the DSM
(18) for alcohol abuse?
(19) A That is there

Q 2 Repeated effort to control or reduce excess drinking by
going on the wagon Periods of absunence or restricung
2) drinking to certain tumes of the day, is that in there?
(3) A That is in
(9) Q Binges is that in there?
') A That's in there

\footnotetext{
Vol 203308
(1) Q Occasional consumplion of a fifth of spirits or its
(2) equivalent in wine or beer Is that in there?
(3) A That is in there
(4) \(Q\) What is the equivalent of a fifth of spirits in wine or (5) beer?
(G) \(\mathrm{A} \backslash\) don't hnow what the equivalent of a fifth of spints in
(7) beer is
(8) Q Amnesic periods for events occurring while intoxicated
(9) blackouts is that in there?
(10) A That's in there
(11) Q Continuation of drinking despite a serious physical
(12) disorder that the individual hnows is exacerbated by alcohol
(13) abuse is that in there?
(14) AYes
(is) \(Q\) Is drinking of nonbeverage alcohol in there?
(16) A That is there
(17) Now only one of those entuties only one of all of those (18, entities which you read would be required to establush a
ifl diagnonis of alcohol abuse A young person consuming
(ro, mouthwath which is a nonbeverage alcohol, could be diagnosed
( I) as alcohol abuse by those criteria
(1) \(Q\) So your position is that a young person who consumes
(23) mouthwash can be diagnosed as an alcohol abuse episodic
person?
(24) AYes
(rs) Q The IDA has on il listed lectures semanars workshops
}
pertaning to alcoholism Do you recall that?
AYes
Q It has on it under treatment Alcoholics Anonymous or AA
Do you recall that?
A Yes
Q Are you aware of the fact that the Hazelton ( ph ) model with
regard to treatment is often referred to as a 28 day treatment?
A I have not seen that in the biomedical hiterature
Q Have you ever heard it among colleagues?
A No
Q Scuttlebutt?
A No
Q With regard to the presenption there for aftercare you
testified with regard to a fercare that the proper tume with
regard to the termination of aftercare in part depends upon
where the patient thinks that he sdone with aftercare Do you recall that?
A That's correct
Q Do you know in this case whether Captain Hazelwood quil
aftercare didn t quit aftercare or were you trying to justify
him quithing aftercare?
THE WITNESS Your Honor may I ask the question' I
(2) believe this pertains -

MR RUSSO May we have a brief side bar? I believe
the witness read -
") to alcoholism doesn 1 it
-) A Yes it is the - it is the format that is used primanly
(3) un European and Scandiaavian countries
(4) Q With regard to may be physical behavioral or paychological
s1 is that a corrcet statement?
(6) A That is correct
(7) Q A clear example would be the consumption of amounts -
(8) eg a quart of vodka that would be sufficient to incapacitate
(9) or kill nontolerant drınkers
(10) Is that an example of tolerance?
(II) A Yetr
(12) Q Marked tolerance is suggested by little or no impairment
(13) even at high blood alcohol concentrations is that a correct
(14) statement?
(15) A With the qualification of the word "high" High being in
(16) excess of 100 milligrams per decımeter but when one reaches
(17) levels of two to \(\mathbf{3 0 0}\) miligrams per decameter or 2 to 3
(as) your terminology very few individuals could conceal severe
(19) intoxications
(20) Q People who go in for treatment for alcohoism often go in
(21) because of a precipitating event a life crisis such as an
(22) accident increased difficulties with the spouse job or legal
(23) problems Is that a correct statement?
(2a) A. That can occur
(25) Q There are - in Chapter 11 of the book that you edited

\section*{Vol 203310}

MR O NEILL I believe the teatimony from Captain
Hazelwood in this courtroom is that he quit going to aftercare
because the people in the aftercare sessions were preoccupied with alcohol That is the force and effect of my question BY MR O NEILL
Q Did you know that?
THE COURT Does that help you answer the question? THE WITNESS Yea it helps me answer the question
A If his primary diagnosis was dysthymia and be perceives that the primary in aftercare was alcoholism or alcohol dependence, he may have decided not to contunue ticipation
BYMR O NEILL
Q Would you agree with the comment made in chapter one of Medical Diagnosis and the Treatment of Alcohol the book that you and your wife edited the acceptance of a commonly recognized term with regard to alcohol related problems has
resulted in commonly accepted diagnostic criteria Would you agree with that comment?
A That comment was made in the context of the fact that most (20) medical organizations throughout the world do not ill uve the
(21) same diagnostic cnteria

Q Thank you
What is ICD 10 ?
A ICD 10 was the international classification of diseases
Q That also has a separate classification scheme with regard

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3312\)}
there \(s\) a description of an inpatient treatment program for alcoholism that includes group therapy individual psychotherapy Alcoholics Anonymous and group lectures or discussions concerning alcoholism
Are you aware of that?
A Yes I was OrI am
Q is it a correct statement to say that because alcohol problems generally go on for a long time before the patient is confronted or confronis the problem that it is not surprising that the recovery procesy tends to nctur over a long difficult period?
A For some andividuals but not for all
Q You had - you re - you were questioned by Captain
Hazelwood s lawyer here today?

\section*{A I beg your pardon?}

Q The person who put on your direct testimony was one of the lawyers for Captain Hazelwood?
AI assume so
Q Why didn t you just examine Captain Hazelwood and give him
(20) a mass (ph) test?

A Because I wasn't asked to examane Captan Haxelwood and !
(22) thank that a request to do so would be medically - not be
(23) medically ethical unless the patient requested it
(24) Q Let me talk to you a litule bit about medical ethics or (25) ethics common decency Captain Hazelwood was given a 90 day

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3313\)}
leave of absence to get involved in AA and aftercare Do you recall that?
AYes
Q Did you know he wasn I paid during that leave the absence?
MR RUSSO lobןul Judge Beyond the scope
MR O NEILL He s right
THE COURT I thinh so lou Sustamed
BY MR O NEILL
Q Should have watted and see what the answer was
Definitions - here is a - a statement in general
Alcoholism alcohol dependencies and alcoholics are used to
describe the more severe disease forms of this disorder specifically repeated harm from drinking Johnson and Clark 1989
Do you recall that statement it s in Chapter 14 of your book?
A I think the description is the statement what is people what terms people use The adequacy or correct use of those
terms is not dıscussed People talk about heart attacks A heart attack can be widely varying from severe myocardial unfarction to transient pann from which recovery occurs very promptly
Q I don thave - you re going to be disappointed in me on this one because I didn 1 buy the hard paper copy 1 mean the hard bound copy See have we looked at alcohol use and ; abuse

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3314\)}
") in Amerina yet?
A Yes
3) Q Have we looked at - is this a booh that - is this a book
4) that you wrote completely or is this also a collection of
s) articles?

A No this is a book that I wrote with my collearue and wife Dr Nancy Mello
Q l enjoyed reading your hooks
Here is page 268 ot your book Al page 268 the statement
is made Alcohol addicis also develop tolcrance lor many
toxics such as methanol and others that would be latal to others
Du you sue that'
A Ibat scorretl
Q And then the nuxi parabraph The lacl that the alcohola tan tolerale blood altuhol levels in a 200 to 400 millig ram pur - is that dusilitur or ducaliter?
A Deciluter
Q - deciliter range that separat him or her from occasional
social drinkers Alcoholics may show minimal behavioral signs
of intoxication at thuse blood alcohol luvels whercas soual
drinkers may be severely intoxicated at blood alcohol luvels
above 100 milligrams perduciliter Do vousth that'
AYes
Q 200 to 400 millizramspurduclilur whith Exxunapplius
(1) as 20 to 40 alcohol level isn \(t t^{t}\)
() A That's correct
(3) Q In here you and/or your wife make the statement that
(4) Alcoholics may show minumal behavioral signs of intoxication at
(s) these blood alcohol levels 2 to 4 Isn that right?
(6) A We say may show", but you also didn't read the paragraph
(7) before which says, The alcoholic rarely develops blood alcohol
(8) levels above 450 milligrams per deciliter Resparatory
(9) depression and death can occur at a concentration above

500 to
(10) 600 milligrams per deciliter
(11) Q But I m concerned about 2 to 4
(12) At 2 to 4 in your book your words are that Aicoholics
(13) may show minmal behavioral signs of intoxication at these
(14) blood alcohol levels
(15) A These refer to the term alcoholic or alcohol-dependent
(16) persons Alcoholism is alcohol dependence
(17) Q Let s put it up and we II show everybody in its context so
(18) that everybody can put it into context becauge it san
(19) important statement
(20) A If I may just emphasize yon're reading the words in the
( 1 ) middle of the page Alcohol addicts is the reference
Alcohol
(22) addicts that is those persons who are addicted to alcohol
(23) alcoholism
(24) Q Let sassume that Let s assume that a person is an
(2S) alcohol addict or addicted to alcohol That person can

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3316\)}
(1) function at blood alcohol levels of 2 to 4 and show minimal
(-) signs of imparity whereas the rest of uscannot Is that a
(3) Lorrect statement an aicohol addict -
(4) A An alcohol addict could show tolerance to alcohol
(5) Q Now with regard to this book there is an acknowledgment
(6) to the Economic Research Department of the Wine Institute the
(7) United States Brewers Association and the Distilled Spints
(8) Council of the United States and the Brewers Association of (9) Canada
(10) Did they provide assistance in the preparation of this
(11) lext?
(1) A They did not provide assistance If you read it brefly,
(13) they provided tables and figures publeshed in one of the
(14) chapters describing the role of psychatry and the regulators
(15) Q I minterested in a statement in your book perhapa alcohol
(16) turst affects the cortical centers believed to be involved in
(I7) cognative function then progressed to lower brain centers
(18) involved in motor control then respiration
(19) Is that a correct statement?
(20) A That's a supposition
(?) Q Supposition a supposition that you made?
(I) A A supposition that we made based upon hypotheses which have
( 3) been generated by people examining the field
(i) Q And the suppostion the conclusion at least in layman s
( s) hrms trom the supposition that alcohol affects judgment and

Vol 203317
then thereafter affects motor skills Is that a fair
conclusion to draw assuming the supposition is right?

\section*{AYes}

Q Alcoholics may develop enormous tolerance for alcohol Is that a correct statement?

\section*{A That is correct}

Q There is increasing evidence that alcohol and intoxication is associated with a great increase in the risk taking and of aggression while driving is that a correct statement? A That is correct
Q And the chronic alcoholic can assume far higher doses of alcohol than the casual social drinker without appearing to be
intoxicated or exhibiting gross motor discoordination
Is that a correct statement?
A That is correct for someone who would be diagnosed a alcohol dependent
Q Now I want to talk for a minute about alcohol and
depression Okay that \(s\) where we re going to a new subject
Alcohol and depression - alcoholism and depression often coexist?
A That's correct
Q Indeed chronic heavy drinking may result in depression?
A For some individuals, yes
Q And indeed research has shown that repeated - has shown repeatedly that alcohol may produce profound dysphoria anxiety
and tension
A That is correct
Q Statistics show the blood alcohol levels in deceased
dnversare above 15 The nontolerant individual would
probably be able - unable to dnve at these blood alcohol levels
Is that a correct statement?
A That's correct
Q So we have people who have a tolerance able to drive automobiles at 15 is that a correct atatement?
A I'm sorry'
Q Somebody who has a tolerance to alcohol can drive a car
there are people who have a tolerance to alcohol that can drive automobiles at 15 ?
A Persons could do that but persons who have intolerance
for
(IG) alcohol could probably do it, too
\(n\) Q What would it take how many danks would it take over
three four five hours to get up to a 157
A Well, it depends on the body weight of an mdividual total
body mass
Q 160 pounds 170 pounds?
A 170 pounds male or female
Q Male?
A To acheve a blood alcohol level of -
Q About - let say \({ }^{\text {(5 }}\) ?

I A 15' 170 po
(1)QMayhしにп)
(3) A If you want ten voucan-voucan have ten
(4) Q Okay thank you That gels us through about six pages so

I approciate il
A Maybe 14
Q It depends on the person?
A For you today
Q Yeah
Now you talked for a minute about the fact that - let me go back to a subject that we talked about
(12) It is difficult if not impossible to decide if alcoholism
(13) followed depression or if depression emerged as a
consequent
(14) ot alcoholism
(1s) A That statement is true withn the context of talking about
161 depression is major depression And that is depression
(17) including depression only severe or manic depressive
episodes
(18) Q I ma litile bit interested in your comment that people who
(19) have developed tolerance for alcoholism metabolized at a
(20) different rate than people who don thave that tolerance
\(r u\) That s sort of a general statement so we can get into the
(7) subject matter
(23) A There is a form of tolerance called metabolic tolerance (24) which involves an imcreased elumination rate of alcohol
(25) Q But after a period of sobriety if somebody drinks

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3320\)}
episodically - drinks for a while doesn I drink for a while drinks for a while doesn \(t\) drink for a while-during the nondrinking penods their meiabolism moves back as to where
a
normal drinker \(s\) are and their rate moves back to where normal
drinker \(s\) rates are
Isn that a correct statement?
A That is correct
Q in other words what you re saying is that if anyone has an alcohol related problem and they abstain from drinking for a long enough perind of tume their cthanol hreakdown or elimination rate would be more back toward where the norm would
(12) be?

A That is correct
(14) MR O NEILL I have nothing further Thank you
(1S) Thank you Doctor
(10) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JACK MENDELSON
(17) BYMR RUSSO
(18) QI just have a few questions for you Doctor just to
(19) clanify a couple of things
(20) Mr O Neill went through the - mintioned some of the
21) diagnostic criteria of DSM III for alcohol abune Do you
(2.) recall that?
(23) A Yes
(-4) \(Q\) The diagnosis on the IDR that we ve been discussing was
(2S) alcohol abuse episodic Is that correct?

\section*{Vol 203321}

\section*{A That's correct}

Q Now those llems that he read to you whre a numbur ol llems
that are included in - as part of the diagnostic criteria for alcohol abuse correct?
A That's correct
Q You don thave to meet all of those llems that he read to you -
A Absolutelv not
Q - as to be diagnosed as alcohol abuse '
A That is correct
Q Now one of the things he ruad to you was need for datly use for alcohol tor adequati tunctioning Do you recall that? A Yes
Q Now in terms of alcohol abuse episodic would it be your
understanding that a person who was diagnosed as alcohol abuse
16) episodic would not meet that criteria?
(17) A By delinition they couldn't meet that criterion because
18) that refers to episodic not danly
(19) Q Isn \(t\) it a fact that in this diagnostic manual DSM III
(20) there are calegories Episodic is onc another one is
) continuous correct?

\section*{A Right}
(3) Q So there sagniticance to the labl that the dage nosisot
i ti Captain Hacelwood in the IDR is alcuhol abuse cpisodic as
is) opposed to alcohol abusc contınuous orrcul \({ }^{2}\) s?

\section*{AYes}

Q And cpisodic maans that tpisodiallv or on on daton that
person would ahuse alcohol ar drinh low much'
A That scorrect
Q And that would satisfy the diag nosis crituria in and of Iself for alcuhol abusu episodie correal?

\section*{A That is correct}

Q Now there s maybe a litilc confusion about some of the terminology
You re using 100 to 200 milligrams per deciliter Do you
recall what you sald that?

\section*{A That scorrect}

Q We ve been using ierms lihc 1 and 2 so could vou fust dufinc - I d lihe vou toexplaintothe furv how 100 (o 200
 that wu ve been distussing in thincase
(17) A I apologize if I veintroduced anv confusion but the way
ily, blood alcohol levels are reported in uedical lateriture is
191 differeat than the was they re discussed often in ifunction of
( or legal fimits of intoxication
1 " For example a hundred malligrams per deciliter would be
1 , equivalent to 1200 malligrams per deciliter would be
- 31 equivalent to \(2 \mathbf{3 0 0}\) malligrams per deciliter would be (4) equavalent to 3400 tuallipr ims per decaliter would be 4 and
( i 500 malligrams per deciliter would be 5
(1) QMr O Neill also questioned you about the relationship
() between depression and alvoholism Do you remumber that)
(3) A Yes
(d) Q Okay Now we ve discussed what dysthymia is but is there
(s) a distinction between dysthymia and depression as used in your
book that Mr O Neill was talkıng about?
A Yes there is There's a distinction between dysthymia
and
major depression in DSM III
Q So in other words depression from a psychiatrist \& point
of view is a different diagnosis than dysthymia is it not?
AYes
(12) \(Q\) And it samuch more serious diagnosis much more senous
problem is it not?
(14) A That is correct
(15) Q Now DSM III in the diagnostic criteria for dysthyma does
(16) DSM III not recognize that a person that has dysthymia -
(i7) meaning mild depression - that that dysthymia or mild
(18) depression can cause substance abuse or alcohol abuse?
(19) A It's very specifically stated in DSM III that dysthymia can
(-0) induce or result in substance abuse and can include alcohol
( ) abuse That's in the text
(. ) MR RUSSO Thank you Doctor
(3) THE COURT Thanh vou
(4) Doctor you mav step down
( si Call your next witness
\(\qquad\)
of 1979
Q Have you been continuously employed by the department of public safety since January of 1979 ?
AYes
Q What is your rank in the deparment at this point?
A Trooper
Q Trooper Fox when did you first hear about the grounding of the Exxon Valdez?
A It was about 230 in the morning approximately
Q How did you hear about it?
A. Phone call from the Coast Guard

Q Was there another phone call between or phone nversation
between you and the Coast Guard and the manne safety office
later that morning?
AYes
Q What was the nature of that call?
A They wanted me to go out to the ship
Q Do you recall who you were speaking with in that conversation?
A That was with Commander McCall
Q Trooper Fox about what time was at when you made it aboard" I understand there was some problem about actually getting on board the Valdez but what tume was it when you arnved on deck on the deck of the Valdez?
A Just after seven

\section*{Vol 203326}

Q Who do you recall talking to you once you got on board the Valdez?
A My first contact was with two seamen who met me at the top
of the ladder
Q Did they take you to Mr Delozier or Mr Falkenstein"
A They escorted me to near the bridge I think I got kind of near the bridge and they sand you know down this hall and through that door-type of thing
Q Who was on the bndge at that time?
A If I remember correct there was one of the mates I think was the second mate, the two Coast Guard guys Delozser and
12) Falkensten, and Mr Lawn of the Alaska Department of Envirommental Conservation
Q Now although you ve described what you perceive sa your
role in cooperating with the Coast Guard officers were you
still intereated as a state law enforcement officer in
developing and preserving evidence of a poantble crime?
AOh , sure
Q In other words you never took off your hat as atate law enforcement officer?
ANo
Q And indeed you took certain steps to investigate the possibility of a crime and to preserve evidence did you not? AYes
Q Would you tell us what you did?
(1) A One example is I noticed there was some Moussy or Moussy
ir beer don't know the correct pronunciation we'll call it
(3) Moussy in the refngerator in the officers' mess and I took
(4) some of that
(s) Q Why did you thinik that might be significant?
(6) A Because it was mentioned as something that the Captan
had
(7) consumed on the vessel with alcohol in it It has alcohol in (8) it
(9) Q Yes- sir When you say that it was mentioned did Captain (10) Hazelwood himself say that he had consumed some Moussy beer?
(II) A Yes, he did
(12) Q Before the Cousins interview did you have an encounter
(13) with Captain Hazelwood?
(14) A Yes
(1s) Q Tell us about that
(16) A I literally bumped snto him an the companionway
(17) Q To Captan Hazelwood?
(18) A We were face to face
(19) Q I m sorry of you already testified to that but were you
(20) actually on board the vessel? Where were you exactly on board (21) the vessel?
(22) A My memory is we were in the companionway between the bndge
(23) and the stateroom ['m not absolutely certain that's the case
(24) but I thunk that's where it was
(25) Q Were you close enough to smell his breath?

Vol \(20 \quad 3328\)

\section*{A Yes}

Q Did his breath have any odor to it?
A Lots
Q How would you describe that odor?
A Bad
Q When you say bad can you be more specific? I mean
what -
A Bad Sour Bad
Q Would you describe it or have you described it in the past as morning breath?
A Sure It could be described as morming breath
Q At that point were you irying thinhing to yourself that
you need to look for signs of alcohol imparment?
A Sure
Q Did you see any?
A No
Q Now at some point Trooper Fox you actually obtained a bottle of the Moussy beer and asked Mr Delozier and Mr
Falkenstein to amell it did you not?
A Yes I did
Q Do you recall asking both Mr Delozier and Mr Falkenstein
to smell the Moussy beer?
A Yes
Q How did you present it to them for them to smell it?
A On my hand

Q On your hand? Lul me ask you this What prompled you to ask them to smell \(t^{\text {? }}\)
A What prompted me' My expenence that in investigating d
statement or a clam you can investigate a negative as well as
a posituve fashion And if a person clams to have drunk
Moussy beer to explann the presence of that alcohol breath on
their breath it would only make sense to have the people who
(8) winessed that smell to smell the control which is the Moussy
(9) beer and either retain at as a possibility confirm it or discard at as not a possibility
ill Q Did you ask both the Coast Guard officers if the Mousay
|l) beer odor was the odor they had smelled on Captain
Hazeluoods
13) breath?

AYes
Q Okay let atake Mr Delozier first What did he say?
A He said that it could be
Q Was there any more discussion about il between you and
Mr Delozier?
A Not really no
Q What about Mr Falkensteın? What did Mr Falkenstein say?
A He sand it could be
Q Again same question Was there any more discussion about
) "t betwein you and Mr Falkenstein that you recall?
A No not that 1 recall


\section*{Vol 203330}

\footnotetext{
(1) smell any - well let me just ask it When you smelled
(i) Captain Hazelwood a breath that morning did it smell like any
(3) alcohol - alcoholic beverage that you could -

4 A No
Q All right
si So there wouldn thave becn any purpose - so vou diun 1
, check yourself as to whethur the Moussy bucr smelled the
Captain Hacelwood s breath?
A Correct
Q All right Did you maintain a samplu of the Moussy beer and tahe It with you after you lelt the Valdcz'
A Yes
Q Did you observe any part of the actual process ol drawing
Caplain Hazelwoods blood?
A Yes I did-oh Captan Hazelwood?
Q Captain Hazelwood
A No I didn't
Q Did you happen to observe any pari of the process of drawing blood sample of any other crew member?
A Yes I did
Q Who was that'
A That was the lady Maureen Jones think I her name is
( Q What did you ohsurve' What did you nte about Ms Jones 1 blood drawint'
1. A Sbe was seated in the captain's office area lle has bis
}
(1) suite has a hitle desk a hittle lounge kind of couch area,
() and then a separate stateroom, and she was at - the desk is In
the little office area in hus office And a corpsman was taking the blood out of her arm
Q Did you ever see Captann Hazelwood s blood samples? A I don't think so
Q In addition to Maureen Jones blood samples did you ever
see anybody else s blood samples?
A Not that I remember
Q I would like to explore with you a little bit more this
procedure that you described relative to Moussy beer that was on board the Valdez I believe you testified this morming that
(13) you took some of this Moussy beer and placed it on your hand
(14) and then questioned Lieutenant Commander Falkenstein and

Mr Delozier about its odor Is that correct?
A Yes
Q Do you recall approximately what ume of day that - that you did this?
A It had to be after lunch
Q After lunch
(21) In relation to the interview of Captain Hazelwood, how soon
(22) after the interview with Captan Hazelwood did you do this?
(23) A Well, I can just figure that his interview was after lunch
(24) and I left about \(2 \mathbf{3 0}\) or three so it had to be between his
25) interview and my departure

\section*{Vol 203332}
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multirow[t]{2}{*}{} & Q All right \\
\hline & A That's a pretty narrow tume \\
\hline (3) & Q Do you recall where you conducted this experment? \\
\hline (4) & A I believe one of them was in the radio operator's office \\
\hline (5) & nght across the hall from the captan's stateroom \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{remember} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{\begin{tabular}{l}
(6) talking with the others there about the Moussy beer and I \\
(7) think that might have been where at least I did one of them
\end{tabular}}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(8) Q Was that the first one tha} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(9) A I don't remem} \\
\hline (10) & Q Who were you talking to about the Moussy beer in the radio \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(11) officer s room?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(12) A I don't remember for sure} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(13) Q Do you recall where yo} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) Commander Falkenstein?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(15) A No, I couldn't say which one was where} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(16) Q So we have one of them in the radio officer \(s\) qua} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(17) the other one was conducted at a different location?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(18) A I don't remember It could have been nght there} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(19) Q Do you recall if both Lieutenant Commander Falkenatein and} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(20) Mr Delozier were together when you conducted the test?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{( 11 A No, I don't remember} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(29) Q Can you describe for us in detall exactly how you recal} \\
\hline 131 & purforming the iest? \\
\hline (2) & A How I did \(\mathrm{tt}^{\text {? }}\) \\
\hline & Q Yes \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Vol \(20 \quad 3333\)
A I splashed some on my hand ont of the bottle so it would be
2) Warmed, because it's my impression that warm stuff smells
different than cold stuff And ther I held the palm of my hand
4) in front of thear face and asked them to smell it

Q And you have a recollection that each of them did that they did in fact smell the palm of your hand?
AYes
Q Do you have a recollection if ether of them smelled - in
addition to that smelled the Moussy out of the bottle?
A I can't say May have, may not
Q Do you have a recollection of Mr Delozier also smelling the Moussy out of the bottle?
A I can't remember He may have, he may not have
Q Do you recall whether or not the Moussy that you used for
this teat was out of the same bottle for both individuals or
did you use a new bottle for each individual?
A I opened one bottle
Q After this test was completed did you take any action to remove any of the Moussy beer present on the ship to feguard
tt?
A Yes I took two bottles
Q What did you do?
A I had one bottle already in my pocket that was unopened and then Delozer went and got another bottle and gave it to me, so then I had two bottles, and I took those two bottles

\section*{Vol 203334}
back to Valdez
Q And when you took them back to Valdez what did you do to
anfeguard it? Did you did you voucher them?
A One of them I dropped off at the Valdez manne safety
office with instructions that it was from Delozier And the
second one I entered into evidence at the state troopers office
Q Ase result of the conversations with Mr Delozier did you
go down to the captain a quarters to see the blood testing?
A I don't remember It was specifically as a result of that
conversation but he told me while I was in the radio room and
(12) the captan's quarters were directly across the hall so it
(13) wouldo't have been a long walle or anything
(14) Q So obviously subsequent to this conversation you had
s) occasion to go across the hall and view what you testified to earlier here?
A Right
Q Did you actually walk into the room where the blood testing was being conducted?
A Yes, I did
Q You have already described Maureen Jones suting at the
desk and having blood drawn in her arm In addition to that can you describe what else you observed when you walked into (20) the room?
(25) A There was a number of people in there It wasn't private

I know that
Q Who was in there'
A I can't sav exactly who it was but there was a number of people in there
Q Werc these cruw members or Coast Guard people who?
A I just don't remember
Q Approximately how many people would you say were in the room?
A With the understanding that it' 9 just a complete guess I'd
say sux or etght
Q Is ittis in addition to the medics and Maureen Jones or in total?
A Yes
Q In addition?
A In addition yes
Q To your knowledge did there come a time when Mr Delozier
searchud the caplain s quarters?
A Yes
Q How did that come about do you hnow?
A He searched it
Q Did he consult with you hefore he searched the captain s
quarters)
AYes
Q Can you relate to us the nature of the conversation that
(25) you had with him about searching the captain \(s\) quarters?

\section*{Vol 203336}

A We talked about what we might find of value we talked about whether or aot he bad the authonty to conduct that search and then I was present in the doorway to the mann entrance of the captan's suite when he did the search so I observed him going about the room and I talked to ham duning
(6) the search about what he found or didn't find
\(Q\) This conversation that you had with him relative to what authority he had to conduct the search can you relate to us what he said about his authority and what you said to him relative to that?
A He said that be could do it And I said that I thought it was a good idea that he went ahead and do it Q Did he say on what authority he could do it? A No I don'i remember that Q Did he ask you whether you had the authonty to do it? A I don't remember that I don't think so Q Did you ever tell him - did you ever diacuse with him whether you had the authority to search the captain 8 room? AI don't remember
Q Did you ever give him any insiructions of what to look for when he searched the captain a room?

\section*{AYes}

Q What types of things did you tell him to look for?
A I asked him of he found any alcohol
(25) \(Q\) Just so the record is clear 1 m talking now about before
I) he searched the captain s room not afterwards Did you give
, him any instructions or advice as to what to look for?
(3) A Before I would say you should look for alcohol or signs of
(4) alcohol
(s) Q After you had this conversation with him he went into the
6) room and started the search?
(7) A Yes
(8) Q Where were you standing?
(9) A I was night in the doorway by the hall
(10) Q And were you watching him do this?
(II) A He would disappear, you know there were different rooms in
2) there

Q But you were looking in the room?
A Sometumes in, sometimes out I was just standing there
(5) Q However did you not go into the room - you did not go into
(6) the room and search correct?
7) A I didn't search, right
) Q Why didn \(t\) you go there and help him search?
A It was has search It was his
Q Do you recall whether or not Mr Dulozter came out of the i) room and you directed him to go book into the room and cununuc
1 , with the search?
(-3) A Yes
(24) \(Q\) What did you say to him and whal did he sav to you when he
came out of the roum?
) the time or as a follow up to your time on board the Valdez in
your capacity as a state law enforcement officer?
(3) I was out there for eight or ten hours I don't remember

I was there from 700 until 230 so I did a lot of things I
, suppose some of the important things I could remember would be
(6) that I checked to make sure that the evidence was sealed
(7) correctly in the Styrofoam kits that contaned the blood
(8) samples I thought that I better make sure that the Coast
(9) Guard was correctly handing that evidence I
tepe-recorded
(10) the captan's interview without any mstructions or approval or
(1) help from the Coast Guard I took notes of the - the other (12) two interviews I made phone calls from the communications
(13) center to my office - not my office but my supervisor's office
(14) in Palmer and recommended some courses of action that
we
(IS) should start moving on
(16) Q Did you have any conversation with Captain Hazelwood?
(17) A Yes I did
(18) Q Tell us then about the conversation you had with the
(19) captain
(0) A I introduced myself and told him that I was on the boat
(-l) representing the State of Alaska, and that we were going do
be
(22) trying to figure out what happened I don't know if I used the
(23) word investagator or not And after that I just looked into ( 4) his eyes and sasd what the heck is the problem here? And he

A About what I remember is Did you looh in the bathroom
Did you look here there did you look in the waste bashet?
He
sand no I saad -
Q Well let sbreak il down What did he say about did he look in the bathroom? Did he say he looked in the bath room?
A I think he sand yes but I don \(t\) realiy remember And I remember asking him if he looked in the waste basket
\(Q\) What did he say to that?
A He said no
Q Did you ask him if he looked anywhiru ilst?
Alsaid look in the waste basket
Q Asa rusult of that did vou dirul him lo gob hach in look in the waste bashut?
A Well he - he was already in there there was -
Q Did you ever push him bach into the room?
A No
Q As a result of searching the room did he ever come out with
any - did he ever bring anything out of the room as a rusult of this search?
A I didn't see anything that he brought it
MS STEWART Thank you that concludesdufunse direbl
CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL FOY (rad)
BY MS WAGNER
Q What clsc can you tell us that vou did ulther at that -
( s) satd You're looking at it

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3340\)}
\(Q\) What did the captain - how would you describe his
appearance?
A Tired red eyes depressed Quiet He was smoking and drinking a soft drink can
Q Trooper Fox and you ve already made reference to this but
I Il ask this anyway Were blood samples finally drawn from
Captain Hazelwood and certain of the other crew members?
A Yes
Q Who finally drew the samples?
A A medic from the United States coast guard
Q Because the name Scolt Conner sound right?
A Yeah It sounds familar
Q All right Well how would you describe what you aaw your function as at that tume relating to the blood testung?
A Evidence bandler
Q Evidence handler all right What does that mean to you?
A That it's secured
Q So my question to you is What did you do when you went into that room to perform that function that you just described?
A I asked the medic how he was secuning the kits
(2) Q What did he say to you?
( ) A He showed me how he was doang at by holding up a package
( 4) and showing me the seals that he had placed over the crack of
(s) the Styrofodm contaner and how he signed and marked the seals

Vol 203341
Q And you had had training I assume in mantaining a chain of custody for physical evidence?
AYes
Q And not just training you had also had experience over the
course of your employment as a fish and wildife trooper in
maintaining and preserving and taking steps to ensure that you
had a good chatn of custody for physical evidence?
AYes
Q Were you interested to see the procedure he was following as it related to the chain of custody?
A Yes
Q In other words you took a professional interest in how he was going about this would that be a fair statement?

\section*{A Sure Yes}

Q Did you see anything about the procedure that he was
following that in any way troubled you?
A No
Q Did it appear that he knew what he was doing?
AYes
Q And then I think you have testıfied that after lunch
around 100 you paricipated in an interview of Caplain
Hazelwood?
A Correct
Q Who was present at that interview?
A Me and Delozier

Q About how long did that interview take?
A Boy, I just can't guess It wasn't very long
Q Was that interview tape recorded?
A Yes
Q Why was that one tape recorded?
A Because I tape-recorded it
Q Do you do so over Mr Delozier s objections or how did that come about?
A I didn't ask hum I just did it
Q Did Mr Delozier know you were taping it?
AYes
Q How would he have known it?
A I sat the tape recorder on the table on the table in front of all three of us turaed it 0 n , and then there's a red light on it that it was lit
Q Did Mr Delozier make any kind of protest abous
tape-recording \(g\) the interview?
A.No

Q What about Captain Hazelwood?
A No
Q Did you capture the entire interview on this tape
recording?
A The mterview' Yes
MS WAGNER Thank you Nothing further
MR SANDERS May it please the Court defendants call
```

Captain Mark Pierce
THE CLERK Raise you right hand
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record sir state your actual
full name your address and spell your last name please
THE WITNESS Mark R Pierce 474 Lake Shore
Boulevard Incline Village Nevada Picrce
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARK PIERCE
BY MR SANDERS
Q Good morning Caplain
A Morning
Q Captasn Pierce bv whom were you are you employed?
A Previously by Sea River Mantime
Q Is Sea River Manitime the succeasor company or the name
change from Exxon Shipping Company?
A That is correct
Q And as a captain are you assigned to a particular vessel?
A Yes I am
Q What is your vessel assignment al this time?
A The S/R Mediterranean
Q And that is of course the formur Exxon Valdez?
A Yes
Q Captain Pierce would you tell a litile - a litte to us
about your educational background?
A I am a graduate from the manne Maritme Academy in
() Captain Mark Pierce
(2) THE CLERK Rase you right hand
(3) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(1) THE CLERK For the record sir state your actual
(s) full name your address and spell your last name please
THE WITNESS MarkR Pierce 474 Lake Shore
Boulevard Incline Village Nevada Picice
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARK PIERCE
BYMR SANDERS
Q Good morning Caplain
A Morning
Q Captasn Pierce bv whom were you are you employed?
A Previously by Sea River Marntime
Q is Sca River Maritime the succeasor company or the name
change from Exxon Shipping Company?
A That is correct
Q And as a captain are you assigned to a particular vessel?
AYes Iam
$Q$ What is your vessel assignment at this time?
A The S/R Mediterranean
And that is of course the formur Exxon Valdez?
A Yes
Capiain pierce would you tell a litile - a little to us
A I am a graduate from the manne Maritime Academy in

```
1971

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3344\)}

Vol 203343 1971
ol 20 33a
11
the
() unson organization through '71 and '72 and joined Humble

Onl
(3) Company at the time in early '73
(4) Subsequently that became Exxon subsequently Sea River
(s) Maritume I started out as third mate sailed second mate
(1) chief mate and in 1980 began to sail as master
(7) Q And when did you get your Coast Guard license as a master?
(8) A 1979
9) Q And you began to sall sometime in 1980 as a master or
capiain for Exxon Shipping Company or Exxon Marine?

\section*{A Yes as a relief captonn at that the}

Q And as - let me ask you a question I want to take a
short diversion here
There s been some testimony in this case that calls into question the weather on the trip that the Exxon Vaidez took (16) from San Francisco which began approximately the 18 th of March
(17) and ultimately resulted of course in the grounding on March
(18) the 24th Is it possibie to look at the deck log of a ship for
(19) a given voyage or trip and tell what the weather conditions
(20) were?
(21) A Yes a deck log provides space records, the weather hourly
(22) and then in more severe weather I'm sure every four hours
for
(23) the watch- in severe weather we go ahead and record it
hourly
(24) MR SANDERS May lapproach the witness Your Honor?
(25) THE COURT You may

\section*{Vol 203349}
```

BY MR SANDERS
Q Captain I have here what I am told is the deck log of the
Valdez - which Your Honor I believe is admitled in evidence
on May the 9th first day of trial as Plannuff's Exhibit
140
Now is it customary for there to be a recording of this
weather every four hours while on watch?
AYes
Q That s a normal thing that is done on a ship at least an
Exxon shup?
A It's a normal duty of the watch officer
Q Would you turn please to the portions of this deck log
Plannuff's Exhmbil No 140 which is the deck log for the
Valdez in March of }1989\mathrm{ Would you turn to the page that
garts the voyage from San Francisco which I believe to be on
or about March the 18th
A Yes, the deck log mdicates that the vessel was anchored
San Francisco on March 18th
Q Can you tell -
A For the enture day
Q For the entire day all right
Turn then to the page where the voyage starts
A Sorry these are out of order
Q Caplain I apologize Have you found it?
A Not yet Okay starting on the 23rd it says - of \$

```

\section*{Vol 203346}
```

February I'm sure -
Q f think we need to go into - to the middle of March
Tell you what if the Court would permit me Itake that
exhbil back have sumebody find the right place and we can
talk about something else instead of wasting everybody s lume
with this
A We're un tebruary
Q Thal always happens when I dulour
Captain Pierce we lefl off betor, our detour with the tact
that you were a captain from 1980 forward I wanted to ask
you Are you a friend of Caplasn Hazelwood s7
A Yes
Q And how long have you and Captann Hazelwood been
nds?
A I met Captan Hazelwood in the early '70s and
bsequently
our friendship started about the mad 1970s forward
Q And has that friendship continued through the years?
A Yes it has
Q And you rc still a friend of Capiain Ha/clwoods?
A I consider him a friend ves
Q Would you describe to the ladiss and guntleman ol the jury
dnd the Court that Iricnduhip uhat hind of fricndhop wavil?
A The friendshap started when Captan Hazelwood was in
(3) Valdez trade I beheve on the Exxon Baton Rouge as chief
(24) mate And I was mate on the Exxon Galveston which was a
(_s) Lighter vessel So at pretty much started as a working

```
the

\section*{relatuonshup over the rail Develop -}

Q What rail is that?
A The rall of the two shups as they're side by side in San
Francisco Bay, transferring cargo
Qokay
A And it started with passing back and forth things to read,
primarily our deep interest in maritume mdustry, and it
contanued on to - enjoyed sense of hamor, and then we had
the
opportanty to meet at company-sponsored traming
programs and
(10) conferences, so it was pretty much a woring relationshup and
working friendship
Q Do you and he correspond?
A Yes, we did
Q Wrote letters back and forth?
A That's correct
Q Talk on the phone?
A Very rarely
Q Talk on the radio?
A Agan, very rarely
Q Did you ever visit in his home?
AI havenot
Q As a matter of fact you ever meet his wife?
A I havenot
Q Has he visited in your home?
A On one occasion when I was port captan, he visited us,
but

Vol \(20 \quad 3348\)
he's never been to my home in Nevada
Q That was your home in Houston?
AYes
Q During the time you were port captan?
A Correct
Q Now you mentioned the time you were port captain When
did you become a port captain?
A It was in the summer of 1983
Q1983?
AYes
Q I didn thear you I m not questioning you
A Yes, 1983
Q And you were port captain where?
A In the Baytown office, Baytown, Texas
(1s) \(Q\) And as port caplain were there certain ships that you (16) were in the sense of being port captain responsible for?
(17) A Yeah 1 basically hasoned whth 13 different shups
(18) \(Q\) Was one of those ships or one of the masters on one of
(19) those ships Captain Hazelwood?

A Yes he was
(1) Q As a matter of fact did you have occasion during your (22) tenure as port captain to make comments in respect to 1 i, ivaluationa that were buing dont for Captain Hazelwood?
(94) A On occasion I was asked as a - as part of port captan to (25) come on to comment on strengths and wealmesses of individual

\section*{Vol 203349}
(1) captans for the fleet manager Agan I was considered a peer
(2) to those captoins so it was not a formal type evaluation it
(3) was more of what were the strengths and wealnesses of that
(4) master in dealing with me and his crew as I saw them and to
(5) that job
(6) Q But in any event did you understand that these comments
n you were making were being - were part of the evaluation
process?
A Yes It was to help the fleet manager make those kind of determinations
Q And the evaluation process had effects as far as I
suppose promotion some affect on pay and those kinds of
things right?
A Yes, it dud
Q Okay And who asked you to do that do you recall?
A Mr Tomkins, gulf coast fleet manager at the tume
Q Was Mr John Tomkins the gulf coast fleet manager during
the entire time that you were the port captain?
A He was
Q And jumping ahead a bit afier you completed this tour of
duty ashore as a port captain, did you ever go back and be a
port captain again?
A No, I did not
Q You went back to sea and stayed at sea?
A That's correct
management and vice versa in that he worked there and that
(2) the second part that Joe really needed - needed a challenge
and perhaps wasn't at all achueving his potential
Q Did you use the words did not even remotclvapproach
achieving his potential?
A I believe those were the words that I used
MR SANDERS Now Your Honor I mgetting ready to
change topics would this be a good ume or -
THE COURT Let stake our first recess ladies and
gentlemen We 11 be in recess for 15 minutes
(Jury out at 958 am )
(Recess at 1000 am )
(Jury inat 1015 am )
MR SANDERS May I proceed Your Honor?
THE COURT You may
BY MR SANDERS
Q Let stake another look at these dech logs Captain
Pierce
Have vou localud the right duck log? I gave you the wrong ones
A We have March 18th and now so we're in the right month
any
(22) way
(23) \(Q\) Would you tell us according to the deck log when the
(24) voyage started?
(25) A They departed on the 18th of March 1989

Vol \(20 \quad 3352\)
Q And that s 200 in the afternoon?
A Correct
Q Where is the firsi recording of any sort of weather
information on the deck logs?
A The weather is recorded on the left hand page in about
the
(6) middle and it's recorded again throughout the entire day

Q So these weather reports what lume do you get the first weather recordation?
A 0400 in the morning for that day As I said agan unless
it's severe weather So from the start of the voyage we have
the first recorded outside weather would be at 1600
Q Now I m not going to try to pass the chart around or blow
it up and put it on the screen or anything but on this - this
deck log there is a page for every day Is that correct?
A That is correct
(16) Q And there are on the left hand half of the page are
(17) various columns for information and initiala and comments
(18) correct?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q And then on the right half or third of the page are lines
(21) where written entries are put in and kind of a line form is
(22) that correct?
(23) A That is correct
(24) \(Q\) And the weather information is on the left hand side of the
(25) page about in the middle of these columns correct?

\section*{Vol 203353}

A Yes
Q What three types of columns are there that would pertain to weather condilions?
A The direction the velucity of the wind the weather formula which is the cloud state the visibiity the state of sea relatug to how rough the sea or smooth the sea would be

Barometric pressure air temperature and water temperature

Q And can you as an experienced captain or mariner are you
able to look at this information on the deck \(\log\) and tell the
jury what the weather was like whether it was good or bad weather what the state of the sea was those kinds of things? AYes
Q And more specifically there has been a suggestion in kind
of a hypothetical way in this case thas if you were in an area
where there were 40 foot seas that it would seriously disturb
one sabilty to sleep and you would be exhausted after a
voyage like that?
AYes
Q So -
A Uncomfortable on those seas
Q That s the context for these questions
Now could you look at the weather information that you ve just described for the jury for the 18 th of March Saturday 1989 and after you have had a chance to look at it could you explain to the jury what the weather conditions were as

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3354\)}
(1) recorded on this deck log?
(2) A for the 18th of March, leaving - leaving San Francisco so
13, this would be on the north coast approximately off of Point
(4) Rays (ph) at southerly winds farrly light they're force
(s) three so less than ten knots per hour
(6) Q Let me just stop you a second That has gone beyond whal I
(7) understand
(9) Is there a sode on this weather for these different solumns thal gives you a range?
(10) A Yes th the beginning of the log buoh we have a code by III, which these culumas are filled out and we re usiuk a Beaufort
(1.) Scale (ph) which is the normal marntume scale for wind (13) velocity
(14) Q So when you say force three that meana something on a (1s) Beaufort Scale?
, A Basically a breeze
(1), QOkay all right That a good
(18) And as far as like the cloud conditions is there a letter
(19) code for that that tells you if you pul an M in there or
(30) whatever that is there a legend at the beginning of the dech

1211 log which tells you cxactly what that letter means?
: 2 A That's correct
(3) Q And is there any other code or lugend that the ladies and
al gentlemen of the jury should buaware of when they look at
1 S1 thuse duck logs)

\section*{(1)}
(2) (4) the legend if you re-you don \(t\) know the legend and see what that corresponds to?
A Correct
Q Okay I m sorry to interrupt you Go back to the 18 th and describe the weather Now I m going to ask you to do this on a day-to bay basis and I don \(t\) want to spend all day, \(30-I\)
know there a a reading every four hours If there a a change
in the weather tell the ladies and gentiemen of the jury of
that but if it s pretty constant just tell us a constant
weather won t be a forecast, it would be a back-cast, wouldn t it?
A All right Back-cast would be a moderately high pressure nige was in evidence in there The wnds were sontherly
but
(17) brought about some fog Some overcast And then towards the
(18) end of the day the wind came around to the north, northenst,
(19) which cleared up and the seas were very moderate Some ground
(20) swelling
(21) Q When you say the seas are moderate describe for the jury (22) what you mean by that Quantufy that for us
(23) A Moderate sea would be in the four- to five-foot root range, (2A) so it would be comfortable to be out there in a small sallboat,
(25) provided you didn't get sea sick

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3356\)}

Q And on a tanker the size of the Exxon Valdez would four or five foot seas be notuceable if you were trying to sleep?
A Be very pleasant day
Q Would you turn to the 19th?
A The morning of the 19th, the northwesterly wind
contnnued
agan on a breeze basis The sea state was moderate, and it was blue skues with some clouds, so pretty constant
weather
(8) pretty normal for that tume of year

Q Did that weather stay the same throughout the day on the (10) 19th?
(II) A No, it came to the southerly and calmed - calmed very much
(12) down Agan, that high pressurestill in evidence, bat whth
(13) the wind comang south then you could expect some - pretty soon
(14) you're going to have fog But the sea state agan was very
(15) moderate
(16) Q So at went from moderate to even better -
(17) A Yes
(18) \(Q\) - during the day?
(19) A Correct
(20) Q What about the 19ih?
(21) A That was the 19th
(22) Q I m sorry the 20th
(23) A Agan the 20th looks to be exactly the same sort of (24) up
(25) and the barometer began to drop slightly

Vol \(20 \quad 3357\)
Q What about the state of the sea?
A As recorded here it's still, all moderate A little bit of chop, which is a shorter sea, developed in the afternoon Q What do you mean by a shorter sea?
A Pacufic has a long swell to it and then when you get the
wind progressing, especially over a great penod of time it
can get choppy So it's - what you see in late afternoon
breeze, probably on Cools Inlet breeze comes up it's a real
short, choppy sea
Q Does that affect the way the boat will ride a ship the
size of the Valdez' Does a short chop affect the ship as far as going up and down?
A Not until it gets exasperated and you get up around 15 foot
(14) sea, then you'll start to notice it

Q And what was the - what was the - I don \(t\) know how you
refer to it but what was the height of the sea on the
aftemoon of the 20th?
A We're stall seeng moderate sea, so four five feet
Q Would you turn then to the 21 st ?
A Olay The 21st it was starting to get closer to Alaska
Wind has come around to the northwest we're up to now a full
(22) breeze or a force four So a 1520 knot wind
(23) As recorded here, that the sea state is still moderate and
4) the barometer is fairly constant getting a little colder weather

Vol \(20 \quad 3358\)
(1) Towards the aftermoon - around 18001900 the wind does
(2) pick up some more and we're startung to see the ground swell
(3) that comes across from the Asian Continent down off of Canada
(4) and Cape Flattery (ph) so we're getting more of a developed
(S) swell
(k) Q All right And what would he the extent of a devaloped
(7) swell in these waters this ume of the year how high?
(8) A Ten to 15 feet Very long So shap would be in motion
) but it wouldn't be that uncomfortable or unpleasant
(10) \(Q\) And in the late afternoon did the seas then calm back down ) agan on the 23 rd ?
(12) A It undicates about midnght then it went back to moderate ) and the swell was not in evidence
(14) Q Would you turn please to the 23 rd?
(15) On the 23 nd can you tell from the deck log where the ship (1) Was?
(In A Yes The shup was approaching Huchunbrook in the (18) morning They were testung gear What tume of - they took
(19) arrival about \(\mathbf{5} \mathbf{3 0}\) in the afternoon What we're seeing is the
(20) wind is coming back to the west, west northwest and pretty
(21) much the same kind of weather
(22) Q During any time - and then of course on the 22nd you enter
(23) Prince William Sound or the ship enters Prince William Sound?
(24) A That's correct
(25) \(Q\) And the state of the sea and the chop in Prince William

Sound is less than out in the Gulf of Alaska?
(1)AOn most occasions
(3) Q On this occasion what was if?
(4) A On this occasion in particular
(5) Q Now at any time did the Valdez Sea and the Gulf of Alaska
(6) or in the Pacific Ocean be rough any more than that short
(7) pertod where there was perhaps a 10 to 15 foot sea?

A The indication of my log deck book is it was a pleasant
trip for that kind of year and with the exception of the
101 ground swell for at least 12 hours or 90 pretty nuce trop
"II weather wise
") MR SANDERS Maylapproach Your Honor?
(13) THE COURT You may
(14) BYMR SANDERS
(15) Q Caplain in the apring of 1985 were you still the port
(16) captain for the gulf coast fleet?
(17) AYes I was
(18) \(Q\) In the spring of 1985 did you have a conversation with
(19) Captain Joseph Hazelwood?
(20) A Yes
(i) Q Was this conversation face to face or some other way?
(יㄱ) A It was a telephone convervation --
(73) Q Who called whom?
(74) A I called Captann Hazelwood
(s) Q Why did you wall Capiain Hazulwood?

\section*{Vol 203360}
I) A I had received an anonymous phone call by an officer of a
( ) ship showing concern and 1 called -
131 Q Lut mu vop you just a vicond Lul alahcil slowly and
a onc slap ala ame You said vou rectivad an anonymous call?
(s) ACorrect
(6) \(Q\) Was it usual or unusual for you to receive calls from (7) people who didn \(t\) want to give their name?
(8) A On occasion it did happen Not on a daily basis but in

191 the course of a month or so you may have it happen
(10) Q Obviously the anonymous caller didn I Iell you who he or
"II) she was Could you tell whether it was a he or a she?
(I) A I believe was a male
(13) Q Male Did that person tell you anything about who they (14) were who he was?
(Is) A No all he sad be was an officer who had saled with
1101 Captan Hazelwood
(17) Q Tell the jury as best you wan what this caller said
(18) A As I said before he sand before he identufied humself as
(19) an officer he had salled with Captan Hazelwood and be wasn't
(20) going to gave hus name but he was calling me as a friend of
(21) Captan Hazelwood saying that I needed to talk to hum
(29) basically of concern that things weren't going well for Joe
or
(23) things weren't night for Joe He's different than he had been
(24) Q Did you ask this caller any questions?
(25) A I don't recall that

\section*{Vol 203361}

Q Did this caller say to you that what was not right with Joe had to do with the way he was doing his jub?
A No it seemed like it was more on a personal level
Q You said he called you as a friend meaning he called you
as a friend or the caller was lou sfriund'
A No that 1 was Joe s friend
Q Is there anything eise that you can recall of significance that the caller told you'

\section*{A No}

Q All night Now at the tume that you received this information this call had you had any other information indicating to you that things weren \(t\) right with Joe Hazelwood? A I had no concrete incident so to speak I did have a feeling or an undercurrent that something wasn't going nght
(1S) with Joe
(16) Q Is there anything or any person you can put your finger on
(1) here to tell the ladies and guntlemen of the jury the source or
(18) the nature of thas whal you tall an undercurrent?

A No, 1 can't Not at this time
(20) Q I guess it a hard to describe or pull apart an
(21) undercurrent bul did the undercurrent as you perthived it 1 have anything to do with Joe s job pertormance?
(3) A No that was never mentioned job performance in the 41 professional sense It's more on a dealing with people
rsi \(Q\) Capiain had you been in the office continuously through
" this period of lim \({ }^{2}\) I lurgol to ash you Can you fix the
, dalc of this call from the anunymous caller'
(3) A I belseve it was late March
(4) Q All right And ina minute we re going to get to the call
(5) to Captain Hazelwood Was it the same day?

AYes it was
Q So aflur you got the call from the anonymous caller you
then called Captan Hazelwond?
A That's correct
Q And this was in lati Marth'
A Yes
, Q Had you been in the otlac prooriolate Marsh? Had you
3) been in the ulficual Baytown cuntinuously going hach wards?

A No I had not
Q How long had you bucn in the office whan thix call samu in? A Probably less than a week
Q All rught Whers had you heen?
A Starting in late fall, '84 we had entered into umon negutiations with our unlicensed personnel took through
1301 Nuvember December I had taken a holiday at Christmas and
(21) then we reached negotıations in January February might up (2) into March So I had just recently come back into the office
i23) \(Q\) Where had these negotiations occurred at least in 857
d) A Lake they were splat between Texay and Vew Jersev area
a) Q And in the winicr and carly xprinz al 1989 had viou bucn in
(1) New Jersey?
(1) AYes
(3) Q So where you had this call you had come from New Jeraey
(4) back to the office in Baytown Texas Was that your regular
(9) office as port captain?

161 A Yes
(7) Q And you had been there about a week when you got this call?
(8) A Correct
(9) \(Q\) And this undercurrent that you have told us about when did (10) you pick that up?
(II) A When I came back to the office As a routune, even though
(12) I was checking in whth secretanes and shift, I went through
(13) all the masters, what all the shups were doung And agan,
(14) there was nothng definite, but it just seemed like there was
(IS) something not quite nght with Joe, then though he was on
(16) vacation at that time
(17) Q All night Now, let go to the call to Caplan
(18) Hazelwood This is in late March?
(19) A That's correct
(201 Q You called him?
? II A Yes
1, Q Wher did you call hım?
(23) A At his home in Huntmgton, New York
(24) Q Did you reach him?
(2s) A Yes, I did

\footnotetext{
Vol \(20 \quad 3364\)
(1) Q Did you have a conversation with him?
, AYes
(3) Q Would you tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury the
(4) conversation that you had with Captain Hazelwood?
(s) A Very short conversation He learned that I had recenved a
(6) anonymous phone call And basically sand, If somethung is
7. troubling you Joe you need to seek help, if it is not, we
(8) need to understand what as going on
(9) Q Did you say anything more?
(10) A No, I dad not
"II) Q What did he say?
(1) A Sand I'll thank about at
(13) Q Did he say anything else?
(14) A No
(19) Q Did you say anything elae?
(16) A No
(17) Q After you had this phone - that ended the call I guess?
(18) A That ended the call
(191 Q After you had this call - well let me ask you In your
(30) anonymous call with the officer the male officer was the word
(21) alcohol ever used?
(r) A No at was not
("3) Q Was there any suggestion that you could detect from the
(9) anonymous caller that any of this had anything to do with (2s) alcohol?
}

\section*{Vol 203365}

A No sir
Q In your detection of this undercurrent did it have anything to do with so far as you could perceive it with alcohol?
ANo
Q And obviously given your recounting of the conversation with Captain Hazelwood alcohol was not mentioned in that call correct?
A That's correct
Q At the time you called Captain Hazelwood and told him what
you told him did you have an opinion to the extent we lay
people can have opinions about what was troubling Joe?
A Yes, I did
Q What was that opinion and if you would tell the jury not only what your opinion was, but what you base that on A Having known Joe as I did through the years, and also having mutual friends with Joe, often talted about hum, we all
(18) knew that he was given to what we call black moods or dark (19) moods, and he would go into these purple funks and tend to bea
(20) Lttle bit more reciusive than normal He could become very (21) sarcastic, not very pleasant to be around So my feeling was
(22) that - and it's extremely noticeable in the master's position
(73) when all of a sudden greganous caring persons becomes
(24) affected like that, st affects his crew treatment And I felt
s) that's probably what was happening

\section*{Vol 203366}
(1) Those moods were coming more and more frequently and it (2) was troubling to people that were sailing with him
(3) Q Is that what you thought the anonymous caller was telling you?
AYes
Q Is that what you thought the undercurrent was?
AYes
Q Now when you finsohed the telephone call with Captain
Hazelwood did you report either your anonymous call or this
(10) undercurrent or your call to Caplain Hazelwood to anyone?
(i1) A No, I did not
(12) Q Why not?
(13) A Well, I felt that the anonymons caller was callng me to
(14) let them know that a friend of mine basically was having
(1s) problems of some sort And I was calling Joe to let hm
know
(16) that it was becoming prevalent and notrceable Agam as a
(17) friend
(18) Q Did you have anything to report?
(19) A And 1 had nothing to report
(20) Q All nght Did Captain Hazelwood - did you talk to
(21) Captain Hazelwood again after this call?
(22) A Later that afternoon, Captan Hazelwood called me
(23) \(Q\) This 18 the asme day now?
(24) A That's - the same day
(2J) \(Q\) In other words the anonymous call the - the call that

Vol \(20 \quad 3367\)
(1) you made to Captain Hazelwood and the call that he made back
(2) to you all occurred on the same day?
3) AYes
(4) \(Q\) In this next call would you tell the ladies and gentlemen
5) of the fury what the discussion was who said what?
(6) A Again it was a very short conversation and Captan
(7) Hazelwond agreed that perhaps he should seek some help

Q Wall a minute Try not to summarife - try to say as beat
(9) you can - what did he say actually and what did you say
actualty?
(II) A He called back and said that he was going to seek help
and
(12) how to go about doung that
(13) Q All right Did he say what kind of heip?
(14) A No he didn't
(15) Q Did you ask him what kind of heip?
(16) A No I did not
(17) Q Why didn i you ask him?
(18) A I felt at was a private matter Both of us being private
(19) people that if he wanted to tell me he would have or he would
(20) tell rae at the appropnate tame

1 11 Q You didn \(t\) ask him?
1 ) A I did not ask him
(3) Q Did you ask any questions kind of designed to slip around (24) the edges of \(1 t\) and try to find out what it was?
(2s) ANo

\section*{Vol 203368}

Q When he aatd that he had decided in seek help he asked
you
what to do?
A Yes he asked how to go about doing it
Q And what did you take that to mean?
A Well who does be contact within the organzation to get approval for the medical process
Q Captain Pierce in the spring of 1985 was there a process
or a program in Exxon Shipping Company for a perion who had
some sort of a medical problem?
A Yes
Q All right And what was the - would you describe briefly
what that program was? What benefit was there to the employee?

A In addition to the normal surgical phyaical dental
(4) programs the company had what we called an employee assistance
program or help And that revolved around dependency or counseing -
Q When you say dependency what do you mean druga or alcohol?
A Drugs and alcohol dependeacy
Q All right Counseling?
A Counsehng And for mental health or for a myrnad of reasons
Q Was there a specific person al that time in Exxon Shipping
(2) Company that was kind of the contact point for an employee who
(25) wished to avail himgelf or herself of such benefits?

A That's correct The admanist rative manager was the contact
Q And when he asked you who to contact or how to go about
doing it what was your response to ham?
A I told hum to contact a Mr Ben Graves un the Houston
office, and he would lay out the paperwork and the process
go about getting help
Q By the way, did you make a response to the news that he was going to seek help?
A I just remember saying good
Q Now did you say anything else in this conversation or did
he say anything else in this conversalion?
A No agan it was a very short conversation
Q All right You gave him the name of Ben Graves?
A Yes
Q Did you yourself conlact Ben Graves?
A Yes, I did I called Ben shortiy after, basucally make
sure he was in the office for Joe's call
Q Did you talk to Ben Graves?
AYes
Q What did you say to him?
A I sand one of - one of my masters would be calling him
shortly in relation to this EHAP thing
Q Did he make a rusponse to that?
; st A He says Does the captann s name start with \(H\)

Vol \(20 \quad 3372\)
Q And your responsl?
A Yeah
Q Did you ask Mr Gravis how he wan able to gutas the first inimal?
A No I did not
Q Did you have any idea of how he would have come up with that rexponye?
A No unless it was assuciated ugun with this undercurrent we seemed to be having
Q But other than that you dun I knuw why Ben Graves would have asked that question?
A No I do not
Q But you answered the question?
A Yes
Q Did you have any further conversalion with Mr Graves?
A No
Q Did you have any furthur conversation on this date or latur on with Capian Harblwond?
A Yes a couple of days later when Captan llazefwoud entered
\(1^{2} 0\) into the medical factits he called me to let nue know that he
was going to Aad at that tome I inituated bs leave for
medical purposes
Q Whale we re there how did you - well no Lel me back up
(S) At the time that Captain Hazelwood told you he was going to
hopefully that would resolve whatever the problem was
Q All right I take il you didn I want to rock the boat?
A Correct
Q Now up until this time then of course alcohol is not
mentioned in any of the conversations you re having with
anybody Capiain Harelwood the anonymous caller or Ben Graves?

A Yes that is correct
Q Did you find out from either Captain Hazelwood or
Mr Graves whether or not Captain Hazelwood had called
Mr Graves?
A No, I didn't
(12) Q Okay What is the next contact that you had in respect to
(13) Captain Hazelwood?
(14) A Talking to hım personally?
(15) Q Yes
(16) A When he -
(17) Q Orif anyone else in the company or any fnend contacted
(18) you What is the next thing that happened?

1191 A Well 1 called shortly thereafter and talked to Mrs
non Hazelwood Agan that conversation revolved more around how
( 1 she was doing than Joe was doing Then he contacted me elther
(22) after he had gotten out of the program or shortly thereafter,
(23) regarding a leave of absence
(I) a hoapital did he give you the name of the hospital?
(2) A No, I don't recall hum giving me that name
(3) Q Did he tell you what kind of hospital it was?

A No
Q Did he tell you what kind of treament he thought he was
going to receive in that hospital'
A No
Q At that time did he tell you what he perceived to be his problem or problems?
A He did not
Q Did you ask him?
A No
Q Did you inquire indirecily to try to determine what kind of
problem or what kind of treatment he was going to have?
A No, I didn't Agan, I felt that was a very private affaur
and he would tell me when he felt it was appropriate to do
so,
(17) if ever
(18) Q All right As port captain - not as Mark Pierce friend of
(19) Joe Hazelwood but as Port Captain Mark Pierce - did you think
(20) you should ask him any of those questions at the ume that he
(21) entered or was going to enter this facility?
(22) A Not at that tume
(23) Q Why not?
(24) A Basically taking that giant step, that reainzing he may ( 5 ) need help I thought that was enough for hum to deal with. And
(24) Q Now let me - I m going to come back to this in a minute
(25) but let s go back to the call to Mrs Hazelwood

Vol 203373
Did Mrs Hazelwood - you asked her how she was doing? AYes
Q And then you asked her - did you ask her if vou could gel
in contact with Captain Hazelwood?
A I belleve I did She said no he was - some sort of facility
Q Did she tell what you kind of facility it was)
A No
Q Did you ask her?
A No
Q Did you get any sort of date from her as to when he might
be out of the facility or able to be contacted)
A Shesand it was abont a month
4) Q Okay Did you have more than one conversation with her
s) over this month period of time?
6) A Yes, I did I thank I called her two or three tumes
(i7) Q In any of these conversations did she ever tell you
(18) exactly where Joe Hazelwood was?
(19) ANo
(20) Q Did she ever tell what you kind of treatment he was
(il) receiving?
(2) A No
(3) Q All right Did vou - when did vou find out what kind
(4) of - or anything about the treatment that Captain Hazelwood
(25) Was undergoing?

Vol \(20 \quad 3374\)
A Specifically or -
Q Well anything about it
A - anything about it"
Q (Nods head)
A When Captan Hazelwood called me in relation to the
leave
(6) of absence it was - as I recall bim saying was to attend meetungs, you'd be a patient in meetungs lake an AA
Q And by AA you took that to mean Alcoholics Anonymous?
A Yes
\(Q\) And he said meetings like \(A A^{\text {? }}\)
A Rught
Q And under the Exxon process let sall it at that time was a person who was receiving medical ireatment entiled in be
(1d) paid during that?
(15) AYes
(16) Q All right And if a person was going on a leave of
(in absence would they be paid?
(18) A Not necessarily
(19) Q Okay In any event Captain Hazelwood was calling you
(20) to - he wanted to you help him get this leave of absence is
(21) that the gist of it?
(22) A The gist of it is he didn't want to go back to see he (23) needed some more tume
(24) Q Did you in fact intercede on his behalf and see if you
(25) could arrange a leave of absence?
i A Yes I did
, Q Do vou remember how long that leave of absence was your best recollection?

A My recollection it was two months 60 days
Q Did vou contact anybody?
A Yes I called our fleet manamg person in Houston
Q Whowarthal do you rumbmbur'
A Helen turrett And alerted her that Captan Hazelwood wouldn the avalable for another two months
Q Captain Pierce when you had the conversation with Captain
Haceiwood in which he told vou that he was going to attend
among other things meetings like AA did he tell you anything
else about his treatment?
A No he did not
Q Did you ask him anything eise about his treatment?
\(A\) No
Q Did you infer or deduce anything from the fact that he said
he was going to attend meetings like AA?
(19) A Well the inference was a suppart group outside of whatever
(r) treatment be had had And the fact that he used AA I may have
' 1 I issociated that mav have been a component of it also
1 Q You thought that this treatment or this problem did involve alcohol in some wav or another)
A At that ponnt it may have been a component of that
(s) Q Did that change your opinion as to what the problem was


\footnotetext{
Vol 20 3378
(I) Q Now before you left did you have any occasion to have any
(2) discussions about masters in the gulf cosst fleet with your
(3) successor?
(4) A I did
(5) Q Who was your sutcessor?
(6) A Captan Willagm Sheehv

171 Q And did you have any convcration with Captain Shuchy about
(8) Caplain Hasclwood)
(4) A I did At the tame we were goug through ull our masters 101 and when we came to Captan IIazelwnod I told Captam Sheehy
("I) that he was on medical leave and would be available sometume
(1) Later in the summer und be would let them know
(i3) Q Did you tell Captain Sheehy anything more than thal in
(14) let say carly June when you had this conversãtion' Did you
(19) tell him anything more than that the caplain was on medical
(16) leave?

117 A No
(18) Q Why?
(19) A As i understood the policy at the time there wan 4
(30) confideatiality part to it And again avilprevaoult ntited
( I) both Captan Hazelwood and I ire provate penple ind I
1 I respected that vert much And tried io abide bs it
, Q Did therl coma a limb howevar when you didiall Caplain
1 4) Shechy mor about Capiain Hasclword and thu modisal leavu'
(2S) A Later that day Captan Sheehy called me about a meeting
}

\section*{Vol 20338}

A He appeared to be doung well
Q All right After he returned to sea and atter vou returned to sea did you maintain this friendship with him?
A Yes And the - the correspondence contunued and the book
(a) exchange between us

Q What kind of books did you all exchange?
A Books like Between the Deep Blue Water and the Devil
things like that again maritime hastory type books
Q Did you have an occasion in this succeeding period of time
to see and observe Captain Hazelwood?
A Occasionally we would meet at company sponsored supported
conferences meetungs and traming session
Q Let s take conferences first Do you have a recollection
of seeing Captain Hazelwood at any fleet conterences in 85

\section*{\(86 \quad 87\) 887}

A Don't remember the specific year but I know we attended
at
17) least one of those type of conferences together \(\mathbf{y}\) es
118) Q Did you other then these conferences training sessions
(19) et cetera did you see him at any other place or any other
(20) occasion?
(21) A We were together for an extended penod of time in Dallas
1 ) Texas in -
(3) QImgoing to get do that That \(\sin 89\) Lut mis stay on
(4) this side of 1989 for a second
(25) A Okay

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3382\)}

Q Other than fleet conference and say training scssions did
you - did you have occaston to see Captain Hazelwood face to face in person?
A I thunk there was one occasion where I relieved hm in
Baton Rouge That was a brief exchange over - he was nying
(6) out almost immedately and I got on the \(-I\) believe it was the

Yorktown or the Praceton one or the other
Q Did you all have tume to have dinner?
A No we didn't
Q How did he look to you when you saw him on those casions
let saay prior to January 19897
A Helooked good
Q And from the tone of the conversations that you had with
him and from the tone of the letters exchanged and the
correspondence how did you think he was doing?
A It seemed that the relationship was as it had been before
He had entered into treatment He seemed to be in good spinits
Q At these fleet conferences or meetings did you happun to have occasion to see Captain Hazelwood in a social stlling?

\section*{AYes}

Q Did you happen to see Captain Hazelwood in a selting where
alcohol was either provided or available?

\section*{A Yes}
(25) Q Do you have a recollection as to whether or not Captain

Vol \(20 \quad 3383\)
(1) Hazelwood drank at anv of these occasions?
, Alcan -
( \({ }^{\text {i }}\) Q Drank alcohol?
(4) A Never drank alcohol in my presence yeah His

\section*{preference}
(s) was the tonic water with a piece of hme in it

Q Now let s go to 1989
Did you - you mintioned attending some sort of training
session with Captain Ha7elwood Would vou tell the ledies and
guntemen of the jury what that was'
(10) 1 A group of masters in 89 in the winter of 89 were sent
to Dallas to FCC federal communications course
Q Was Captain Harelwood in that group?
A And he was part of that group yes
Q How long did that course lasi?
A Seemed like forever
Q But in fact how long did it last?
A More than two weeks
Q Over two weeks
In Dallas in the wintertime?
A Right
Q Altending a radio course?
A Yes a radio electromics course
Q And how many hours a dav would you have to spend in the tlassroom or in the coursc?
A heemed like we were there in the beginning at least eight

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3384\)}
hours in aclassronm setting Fight to nine bours Towards
the end of the second week course shortened we were supposed
? to study on our own
al Q Did vou have a thancu lo ohberve Caplain Haselwond on a
s) almust minuls bv minulc hasis aver this iwo what period?

AI did We-in fact in the afternons when we were
supposed to be studying usually went to the ravie and we also
(s) had dianer

Q Are you trying to tell us you didn 1 study at the end of this course?
A We passed the course
Q Did you have occasion to go out and socialize?
A Yes we did
Q Did you do that just you and Captain Hazelwood or were other people in the group?
A Usually a large section of the group went out each night
(1)

1 dinner
Q Al these dinners did anyone partake of alcoholic
beverages?
(ro) A Usually there was a cocktanl and then a bottle of wine that (?) we splet around
, Q Did Captain Hazelwood have any wine or any cockiail?
A No he did not In fact we kiddangly called ham the designated driver, and that's what he was
(23) Q Now were you with him al each - at each evening for

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3385\)}
dinner or were there tumes when he stayed away or you stayed away?
A Yes, I'm - there were both those over that extended penod
(4) of tume

Q All nght But did you have a farr number of umes where
you actually went out for an evening and had a meal had a
cocktail and had a glass of wine or maybe even two glasses of
wine?
AYes
Q And so during this entirt puriod in carly 1989 Capiain
Hazelwood did not drink when others did?
A That's correct
MR SANDERS Thank you saptain
THE COURT You may cross examine
CROSS EXAMINATION OF MARK PIERCE
BY MR O NEILL
Q You have and in the courtroom as counsel said that your call to Captain Hazelwood was job related and work related And I mgoing do explore that subject with you right now Your understanding of Captain Hazelwood a problems by the summer of 1985 the problems that led him to go on medical
leave was that he way having somu family problems marital
problems duprussion problums and job prohlums is that a torrbll statemsat'
(9) A 1 thage with the jub purtion of it - previuus to that :

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3386\)}
that is all correct The job portion it was mure of an administration part of the joh aut the technical part Q You whre duposud in this lawnull wivilation un Auguxt 3rd 1993 Inn ithal worretl'

\section*{A Yes that scorrect}

Q And you took an oath to tull the truth That sa corrul statement?

\section*{AYes}

Q And at that deposition you were asked the question Okay by the summer of 1989 did you have an understanding as to what
III Caplain Haselwood a probluma were that led him togo on medical
(1) leave)
(13) Anywer No delinitively nu
(14) Okay did you have a glaeral undurstanding'
us, Yey
(16) What was your g -neral understanding of thoye prohlema'
17. Answar Ithinh he wanhaving romb lamily prohluins
isi marital problems Azain litinh there wasbilin duppossion
(iv) problems jub problems I think we could add themall up
(201 Do you see that testimony)
(-1) A Yes 1 do
1-2) Q Was that the quastion asked and was that the answurs given?
(23) A So it's stated here
- 4) Q Lut agoto pagu 87 of your deposilion transcript Goto
(-S) line 6 and we 11 go all the way through 88 on line I
(1) Line 16
() The question was When did you speak to him about his job
(3) performance?
(4) And the answer was I beheve it was last - the last week
(5) of March 1985 first week of Apral 1985
(6) What caused to you have this conversation with Captan
(7) Hazelwood?
(8) Answer I received an anonymous telephone call from an
(9) officer That s how he identified himaelf It was a phone
(10) call of concern that something was troubling Hazelwood to the
(H) extent it was affecting the way he conducted business on the
(1) ship
(13) Do you see that?
(14) A Yes, I do
(15) \(Q\) And that was the question that was asked you and the answer
(16) that you gave?
(17) A That's correct
(Ig) \(Q\) And in your testimony here today would it be farr to any
(19) that you atudiously avoided bringing to the attention of the
(20) Jury the fact that the anonymous caller told you that something
(21) was troubling Captain Hazelwood to the extent that it wat
(-) affecting the way he conducted business on the ship?
(.3) A I don't belleve "avoid" is partucularly correct Let me (24) clanify that
(ヶ) As master my opinion is you have to have three spheres

\footnotetext{
\section*{Vol 203388}

You have a private sphere behnd your closed door, you

\section*{havea}
( i professional sphere which is operation the safe conduct of the
(3) vessel, and then there's a busmess sphere which is your
(4) interaction with people And that's what I inferred from that
(s) statement -
(6) Q Is that statement -
(7) A - is has interaction with people was being affected
(8) Q My question for you sir is did you studiously avoid
(9) telling us here today that part of the report from you or the
(10) report to you from the anonymous caller? Did you avoid telling
(II) us thal?
(1) A No I dsd not
(13) Q Now we have seen at least three times in your deposition
(14) transcript where you talk about job problems job performance
ust and now getling a report that something was troubling
Hasclwood
(1A) (o) the cxicnt that it was affecting the way he conducted
(i7) business on the ship Do you see that?
(18) AYes
(191 Q Now after this telephone call you called Captain
(30) Hazelwood and you told Captain Hazelwood - your testimony here
(21) today was We need to understand what s going on and your
(22) testimony at the time of your deposition transcript was If he
(23) didn ifeel that there was any problem or he was performing
(1a) his job as he always had then let \(s\) talk about that why other
(.S) phoplc purceived that there had been a change
}


Vol \(20 \quad 3390\)
(1) sometime thereafter and that is to Mr Tomkins And that \& \((1)\)
(2) inform Mr Tomkins that Captain Hazelwood was going on leave or
(3) on disability leave?
(4) A That was not a phone call
(5) Q It was?
(6) A It was a conversation with person in the office in

Baytown
7) and Informed Mr Tomkins that Captan Hazelwood was gosng on
medical leave
Q And Mr Tomkins was your boss and his boss?
(10) A That is correct
(11) Q And Mr Tomkins had a one word answer or a one word
(12) response to this information and his one word was -
(13) A As I recall was good"
(14) Q Good
(15) And the anonymous caller who - the anonymous caller calied
(16) you in a atuation where you already had lult some

IIn undercurrent that something was wrong?
(18) A That's correct
(19) Q And the anonymous caller identified himself as an officer (o) at Exxon - Exxon Shipping Company?
(1) A Just sand an officer who had sailed with Captan

Hazelwood
(22) Q An officer who satled with Captain Hazelwood And you were
(23) the - at that time you were the ship group coordinator and as
(24) part of your duties Captain Hazelwood s ship was a ship
(25) that - whose activities you coordinated?

A That's incorrect
() Q His ship didn i fall under your responsibility al all?
(a) A I wasn't a ship group coordinator

Q I m sorry what were you?
A I was a port captan and as such I hassoned between the
ships and line management
Q Including Captain Hazelwood s ship?
A lncluding his ship yes
\(Q\) And that was part ol vour dulla'
A That scurrect
Q And the anonvmoustelephone callur who called ifin fact
he was a ship solficur and working with Captain Harelwood
was
(17) a part ol his duties)
(14) AYes
(15) Q And I want to - you tell this series of events in 1985
(16) but other people have come in here and have said that Captain
(17) Hazelwood was the most montored man in the fleet Okay?
(18) You reaware of no monstoning are you?
(19) A In what time pernod?
(ro) Q Time period that you worked - the time period that you
(I) worked with Captain Hazelwood

1 I A Well we bad coatact with Captan Hazelwond as we would any
\(1 \mathrm{i}_{1}\) other master during that tume frame
(4) Q You reaware of no monitoring are you?
( s , ANo

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3392\)}

Q And indead you had information with regard to Capiain
Hacluwod and Captain Harclwood going into a hospital for some
li kind ol trcatment and later on that Caplain Hazelwood had something lo do with Alcoholics Anonymous and you passed that
If on in one cryptic convarsation to Mr Tomkins and you passed It on to nobody else did you)
A I'm not aware that I passed it on to Tomkins other than he
was going on medical leave
Q Thank you
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARK PIERCE
BY MR SANDERS

Q Caplain Pierce you left the gulf coast fleet port
captain s job in June of 1985 correct?
A Yes
Q And Caplain Hajelwood didn 1 return to his job as the
master of the Yorkiown until August of 1985-85 isn that correct?
A Yes
Q So therefore there was no montoring that could have
happened in the guif coast that you would have knownanything
about correct?
A That's correct
Q Where were you in the fall of 1985 and all through 1986 and all through 19877
(2s) A Attending my own ship the Exxon Boston

\section*{Vol \(20 \quad 3393\)}

I）Q And what walcriware vou saling in＇
（a）A At that ume she was saling from Batuwil lexds to Santa
（3）Barbara on the Hondo trade and subsequently in＇87 tramp trade
（4）most everywhere including Valdez
（S） Q Is there any way in this world that you would have
（6）monitored Captain Ha／clwond aboard the Yorkiown while you were
（7）sailing on the Exxon Bosion in the Hondo trade or in the tramp trade？
A I had my hands full wath my own shap coulda thave monitored has
111，Q Now you werc ashcd a scricsol qucsilons and vhown vour
（1－）deposilion by Mr \(O\) Nuill and he wants to suggist that you \(r_{2}\)
（13）coming in here and holding your punchis and not telling the
（14）Jury everything Ay a matler ol lat Caplain Picrit did you
（IS）not tell them in your duposition exachly what you have told
（16）this jury \({ }^{\text {a }}\)
（17）A That＇s correct
（18）Q And at page 92 which is two or three pages beyond pages
（19） 867 and 8 were you ashid this quistion and did you give
101 this answer
1 11 Qucstion－i in raadint down Irom linc 2）
1－1 Question Lul mabuginagain fual wwer lay 1
bucss what ！mading bou wavithers somuthing that－mo

in
（ Si his mannerisms somuthing that Captain Ha／clwood had donc which

Vol \(20 \quad 3394\)
（1）led to this undurcurrunt that inmathing was fust not right with
（ ）Joe？
（3）Answur \(N(1\)
（s）Was that quistion ashcd and that answur piven）
s）A That＇s currect

17）this quastion ashcd and this anvucizハール
Qucstion Now－thuniviturrint toth anomamou Lallur
Now why do you thinh this individual called rou＇
＂Ill Answhr Itruly belleve hc called mchcaukc hc fall I was
（1）a friend of Caplain Harelwood s The eontext ot the call as ！
1131 expressed earlier was ont of concern lor an individual for a
（14）human being virsus the professional end of it
lis And then－was that quastion asked you at volur deposition
116，the vary samb day－
：7，AYes
181 \(Q\)－as thase wher quavions and dad voug five that anawar＇
（1）\()^{\text {A Yes I did }}\)
1201 Q And then again at page 243 linc 24 qucxition
ill Did you at any lume have any redson lo bulluk that there
1 ，were issues rulaling lo valuly ziven Capiain Hastiwaind fah
31 that wavinvolvad hare
i it Answar 1 did nol
（ 5）And then linally at 246－cxcust me

Vol 203395
Did ther a a vou that quastion and did vou give them that

\section*{answur＇}

AYes 1 did
Q And then at page 246 －this gets right to the nub of it
Captain question again at line 22
Okay well now you re using the word acting But you did
use the word pertorming in the earlier answer correct
Answer I know I did That is correct I had nothing to
indicate that his performanes as master or doing the job as
master had changed
Was that question askid and did you give that answer？
A Yes
Q Nothing further Your Honor
THE COURT Captain you may step down
（The winness stepped down）
THE COURT You may call your nexl witness
MS STEWART Your Honor the defendants call Dan
Lawn Dan Lawn by video tape duposition
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DAN LAWN（Video）
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q When did you become the supervisor in the Valdez district office？
A In the early＇80s
Q Prior to January ol \(1983^{\prime}\)
AIdon trecall

Vol 203396
i）Q Why don i vou look at uxhibit lo81 then？
，AOkay
is \(Q\) So that indicalus that an of July of 1982 you were the
（1）districi ollicl supervisor in Valdez correct＇
a A 「hat＇s correct
（b）And you rumainud the supervisor of that office at least up
7）through the approval ot the 1987 plan didn \(:\) you？
\(x 1\) AIdid
w）Q Whun did you casu lo be the supervisor in that office？
Ho，A summer to fall of＇ 89 I don＇t recall the specific date
ill Q Sometime alter the prounding of the Exxon Valdez？
। A That scorrect
（17）Q Whare did you actually board the pilot boat that went out （1）the Valder＇
（15）A I beheve it was at the dock that the Coast Guard uses （16）which is an old ferry dock night below the Coast Guard station
117，Q How long was the ride out to the Valde，＇
liki A I－wasn I real lomb that－that boat was pretty fast as
114．I rec ill
（ 0 ）Q Was il（wo hours）
1）A Oh mo lt wasillamatter of manutes
QMinulı，
A Well I mean voll know half an hour to an hour
Something like that is inv best recollection I just－you
know I don \(t\) recall real clearly

Q Now let spint down who was on the boat with vou I

\section*{believe it was yourself it was Delozter from the Coast Guard'}

A Delozier
Q Delozier What shis - what was his title?
A My recollection he was in the \(M\) shop and dealt with oll pollution He may have dealt with manne inspection too I just don't recall
Q And it was - the XL Falkensten?
A Yes Tom Falkenstein
Q Did you find your way to the bridge on your own?
A I had been on enough vessels that I can find mr way to the
(12) bridge on my own I wasn't on my own as I recall I was in the two Coast Guard people I don't know whether there was a
(14) crewman there or not
(15) Q Now you went up to the bridge?
(16) A I did
(17) Q And tell me who you saw as soon as you cnicrud the bridgu'
(18) A My recollection of - the first person I remember is
(19) Captan Hazeiwood
(0) Q What was he doing?
(1) A As I recall he was looking - I have a notion that he was
) looking out over the deck
3) Q You recall that or this is -
(4) A My - the thing that I remember most is when I siw him he I said \(\mathrm{H}_{1}\) Dan I belteve I saıd \(\mathrm{H}_{\mathrm{c}} \mathrm{c}\) iptann Ididn t
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{Vol \(20 \quad 3398\)} \\
\hline & recognize him \\
\hline 11 & \(Q\) You hadn t recognized him when vou first asw him? \\
\hline 131 & A Yeah \\
\hline (4) & Q Didn t you just testify the first person vou saw on the \\
\hline & bridge was the caplain? \\
\hline (6) & A Well what I'm saying is I learned thut he - vouknow \\
\hline (7) & learned that it was at captain \\
\hline (8) & Q Did someone introduce him to you at that limb' \\
\hline 191 & A I don't have a good notion on that \\
\hline (10) & Q Now how close did you get to him' \\
\hline [11] & A A few feet \\
\hline (1) & Q Did you shake his hand? \\
\hline (13) & A I don't recall \\
\hline (14) & Q Now my question now related to your meeting on the \\
\hline (15) & bridge That was what I asked you And lasked you what you \\
\hline (16) & had testified at an earlier tumel think in response to the \\
\hline (17) & question whether you had smelled alcohol on his breath or \\
\hline (18) & person and I believe your testimony at that time was that not \\
\hline (19) & you did not Is that correct? \\
\hline \((201)\) & A That's - I thank that's what I said just now too \\
\hline (1) 1 ) & Q The other question I have and this is someihing I believe \\
\hline (22) & you ve testified to earlier besides not smelling any alcohol \\
\hline (23) & on his breath or person at the time did you notice any \\
\hline & unusual - anything else unusual ahout the baptain al that \\
\hline & time? \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\section*{phone on the vessel?}

A I ded
Q Did you not?
A Yes I have some vague ontion that the captan helped or
at least inade if possible for me to use the phone
Q What do you muan mads it posithle' Did he hand vou the phonl'
A I have some notion that there was some inctructinas
given
(9) to the radio officer or sometbing of that ature Q Was he there physically when that happened? A I have a recollection that I saw Captan Hazelwood in the radio room and on places other than just the bndge
Q When you met the captain in the radio room did you smell alcohol on his breath or person?
A I don't recall that
Q Did you see him acting in any - did you see any physical
impairment sbout any of his actions?
A I don't recall
Q Did you see him speaking in a slurrid manner?
A!don't recall no
Q Now that sat luast twolimus wh Vu said that you ve seen the caplain on board the vassul rizht? Now you ve mentioned

1 31 third inimi or -1 m not trying to suggust it is in this
chronology by the way but you did mention passing him by in the statrs or -

A I have a recollection of - I was elther going downstairs
and he was comang up or vice versa and it's a very narrow
companionway and that is the first time that I was within a
foot or so of hum
Q Now how soon after the inusial meeting on the bridge was
that?
A I think it was sometame afterwards but I don't recall
the -
Q Was he going up the stairs or golng down the statrs?
A I don't recall
Q Well let ssee Lul sturn to your - ware you going up
and down stars? By the way -
AYes
Q - someone was going up and someone was going down?
A That's just what itestified to, yes, sir
Q Okay Did you sec Captain Hazelwood having any difficulty
going up or down the stairs that you re referring to?
A I don't recall
Q Did he fall at any point or stumble that you rccall?
A Not that I recall
Q By the way that passing in the stairway did that oltur
before or after you wert in the radio room with him during your
effors to use the MARSAT phenn?
AI don t know
Q Q You donithcall Youdonirball -


Vol 203403
A I don't have a goud recollection of that
Q Okay How far apart do you think you were at your closest point?
A I don't recall being closer at that point in tume than a couple of arm lengths
Q Okay That is what you meant by a couple of arm lengths?
A That's my recollection I beheve my earher testumony
was
I wasn't real close to bim untul several hours later or vometime later
Q So if you shooh his hand you would not consider that to be real close to him is that what your testimony is?
A I guess the testumony I'm giving had to do with whether I
had my nose in his - dround his breath close enough to smell
(14) alcohol and I testufied that no that I didn't at that tume
(15) Q Now you jusl sand you tesufied You mean at some prior (16) lime you testafied?
(17) A I beleve that in - dt court in the Hazelwood matter
(18) Q And you tesuficd when asked whether you had amelled
(19) alcohol on his breath or person you answered no that you did not?
( i) A My recollection is that I had two portions of that
i I testamasiv une beng I didn't notice it untul he and I passed
in a companoniway or in the stairs which was sometume
later
( d) when we were very close together
t-1) MS WAGNER That soncludes the cross Your Honor

\section*{Vol 203404}

MR SANDERS Mar If plast the Court the detcndants
adl Ms Gabriclla Gulrra
THE CLERK Raisc your right hand
(The Winness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK Please be seated
For the retord please state your full name your address and spell your last naine please
THE WITNESS My full name is Gabriella Maria Guerra
My addruss is \(581 /\) Vallcy Forge in Houston Tcxas My name
is
(10) ५pulled Guerra
(II) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GABRIELLA GUERRA
"1) BYMR SANDERS
(17) QMiss Gucrra whire are you employcd?
(1d) A I'm with bei Kiver Maritime Incorporated
(9) Q And that , Exron right?
(6) A 7hat veorrect

117, Q And belore that how long have you been employed by Exxon'
(18) A I joined Exxon September 8th of 1969
(19) Q Would you tell the ladies and gentlemen of the jury about (*) your educational bachyround?
( 1) A I graduated from the University of Houston in secondary , educ ition with cliemistry and math is my teaching fields and I
1 " have vorue course worh ifter that in computer science
id) Q Now in the uprine if 19 and 85 what was vour job at , Ervon,
\(\qquad\)

A I was with Exxon Shipping Company in the admiantrative
department in human resources section there and I
coordmated
it1 the ment compensation program and administered the savings and
novestment plan benefits and the disability benefits for the ocean fleet
Q Now I want to ask you some questions today betore lash vou to put on your disability section hat
A All right
Q Okay
Now as the person who - were you the onlv firson
responsible for disabilities the disabilities section for
Exxon Shipping Company?
A For the ocean fleet yes
Q What is in the ocean fleet?
A The deep sea tankers and the men and women that crew those
If1 tankers
Q All nght Was the Exxon Yorktown part of the ocean fleet?
A Yes sir
Q And was Captain Hazelwood a person as master of the
Yorktown that was within vour realm there as the disabilities person?
AYes
Q Now tell the ladies and gentlemun of the fury what you did as disabilities person
(2s) A Well, i, in administening the benefits I would determine

\section*{Vol 203406}
based on employee information or information from one of the
1) Neet officers whether a person was entitled to receive
disability benefits Based on imitial information I would submit the paperwork that would change their pay status from
(s) eather being on the shap or being at home on paid leave to one
of receiving disability benefits
Q Now when we talk about disability bunulits is that when
somebody gets sick or needs help they go in and seek that help? Is that what you mean by the disability?
A That's right They're seeng a doctor for treatment and our benefits allow that you don't lose pay statos based on your
(12) service You receive pay duning the time you're receiving treatment
Q Now in the - and you were in that joh in the spring of 1985?
A Yes I was
Q And in that capacity and in that particular job did you
have a communication with someone regarding Captain Joseph
Hazeiwood?
A Yes Idid
(1) Q Do you recall from whom that communication came?
(2) A Yes that was from Ben Graves
(23) Q Who was Ben Graves?
(24) A He was administrative manager of Exxon Shipping

Company
(25) \(Q\) Is he the person to whom you reported?

Vol 203408
I mgoing to show you Defundant s Exhibit 3471 First Im
going to show you the top part so that we can all read it A Okay
Q is this the bunclit いchncwrucord?
AYesit
Q The rucurd that vou stancd for Captain Ha/clwond in 19859
AYes 11 M
Q And is this the card that vou starticd ab a result of vour
communication with Ben Graves)
AYes it is
Q Can you look on the card and tell the ladies and gentlemen
of the jury of the approximate date - let me back up
After you started this record what is the first thing that
you need to do in order to do your job?
A The first thing I do is complete a-it's called a
personnel change notice which is referred to on the card as
a
117, PCN
(181 Q All right Hold on just a minute
(14) A That -
ron \(Q\) (Indicating) Is that PCN?
( 11 A Right
( ) Q All right And what does a personnel change notice do?
1 3, A It informs the fleet mannagg group that their pay status
(4) should be pand to 5105 and that tells them what date to put
(s) them on that pay status

Vol 20 3+uy
Q Now does vour record on Captain Ha/nlwood tell you what date you did this viry tirst thing'
AYes OnApril 9
Q Is this the date I ve circied the second cirule?
A Yes and then I intial it
Q Is that a five there \(510<\) ?
A 5105
Q What does that mean'
A That means it's a non andustrial disability does not commence on a ship
Q Now lat s me go up hare io the lup part
A All right
Q This information here (indicaling) whire did vouget that?
A Combanataon of places Ben Graves told me that loe 5) Hazelwood was the person who was being placed on disabled for
(16) alcohol treatment so I gut - I had that from Ben Then the
(17) next to that, M 100 is Just the - what we call the rating or
(3) classification That meant he was a master and then the
pay
(19) system That code is \(\mathbf{1 0 0}\) for a master and I needed that
20) information for the PCN I usually recurded it on the card

Q I mgoing to draw anuthcr what might lowh a lilll hil lihe
a rectangli
MR NEAL Thalハa Tunncsutro lanzl
MR SANDERS Wusld vouadmonish souncl'
THECOURT \(H_{L}\), wourhudd mom
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 203410 \\
\hline & MR SANDERS I wanthimdisuiplinud \\
\hline & BY MR SANDERS \\
\hline & Q Now this othcrinformation up there at the top lirvi it , \\
\hline & hard to ruad what thin bloch is' \\
\hline & A All right 1 did that fromus recurds the anic rofiche und \\
\hline & the top lane is his sucial securits nusuber \\
\hline & Q His buing Caplain Ha/clword' \\
\hline & A Him being Captanil llazelwond And the PI meams paid \\
\hline leav & \\
\hline & that means that was the puy statur he was on before going \\
\hline on & \\
\hline & disabilaty And '85 \\
\hline & Q What aboul this numble un the far right hand aids' \\
\hline & A That sthe vear 1985 \\
\hline & Q So you fillad out on thix vary - wall firn lat mic asi \\
\hline & you Do vou have a ¢pabli re wlowhin if whenvulilled \\
\hline & this card oul? \\
\hline & A Well 1-il would have beell on April yth lin vihe \\
\hline & date I put on there \\
\hline & Q And what inlormation did wou pui 1 all this inlormation \\
\hline & that I have justashod wou ahoul the PCNand the what - \\
\hline & what is in thesciwo Tunnussuc rutanglus is that the \\
\hline & information vou put on the ward at lirnl \\
\hline 1 & A That plus the \(4 / 1\) date ont the lower - that one right \\
\hline & there \\
\hline 131 & \(Q\) That numbur' \\
\hline & A That number That would have been the start date of the \\
\hline
\end{tabular} then?
(3) A No, I did not
(4) Q Okay So the information you got as to alcohol treatment
5) Lame from Mr Graves on or aboul April the 9th 1985?

\section*{A That is correct \\ A That w correct}

Q Now we want to spend a little bit more ume on this card
but is this a card that you kind of heep as a running record?
A Right I kept all of the active disability cases together and that - I use them to record what was goung on with hum Q Is there any particular reason that you keep those logether?
A Well I needed to know who was on dasability, and I needed
(14) to monitor to make sure that they were seeng their physician
(15) and that I was receiving physician's reports doctor's reports
(16) \(Q\) With these kinds of records do vou take any special care 7 with respect to these records?

A They were considered confidential because I did record
the
(14) uort of - wy interpretation of the diagnosis on it

Q Ohay And-wall lut mb bach up sinct you said that
I II Did Mr Graves tell vou that that was the diagnosis?
1 A I don thnow that he used the word diagnosis He just sald

13 that Captan Hazelwood was entering an uicohol treatment
facılıty
Q Okay
disabulity
Q What about this nuxi number did you have that number

Q

Vol 20341
Orhad unturad)
A Or had entered that s right
Q As a matter of fact vou had to backdate that to start the
huncfits what corrcul)
A Yer I dad have to backdate that
Q So can you reball whithur Mr Graves said this is the
diagnosis or he simply said he syoing into an alcohol trcatment center)
A I thank he just said he's going ato an alcohol treatment center
Q But you did put this in the block where it says diagnosis?
AI dıd
Q While we ru on that can I have the IDR please
Plantilfs Exhibil 100
I have bulore you Plainulf, Exhibil 10 which has been
admitled into cvidunce as the Hacliwood individual disability
ruport or the IDR Do vou recognize that?
Aldn
Q Lul ma avd you if there ind place where the diagnosis is pul'
A It , supposed to be put su the lower part of what you're
showing there The first part is history the second part is diagnouss
Q Okay And is this the diagnosis (indicating) on the IDR?
A It's supposed to be

Vol 203413
Q Ms Guerra do vou know what that is'
A I do not
Q Are you famitar with the DSM?
A I am not
Q And you don t know what those numhurs mians'
A I do not
Q Is there anv other place from which vou got anv inlormation
as to the diagnosis?
A No
Q And from this form vou don i know what thal diagnosis was?
A That's correct
Q All right Now after you started your - leave the 3471
Back up please
After you atarted your benetit sickness record for Captain
Hazelwood and you - and you had changed the - what s called
the PCN?
A That's correct I completed that PC 1 uh huh
Q What did you do next?
A I complete the PCN and I mail the person - and I mailed to
Joe Hazelwood the individual disability report form
Q Why do you do that?
A So that they can authorize a doctor to release information
to Exxon Shipping Company and for them to give that to the
doctor so that we will get a report of the treatment
Q And what is the purpose of this individual disabiliv

Vol \(20 \quad 3414\)
repor IDR which is Plaintiffs Exhibit 10'
A To validate that the person is seeing a physicion is in treatment and to get an idea of how long the length of that treatment will be Q Did you in faci send a blank IDR to Capiain Hazelwond? Aldid
Q And did vou get back what wav up on the cureen a while ago a filled out portion of the IDR trom Dr Vallurv? A I did Q Now when you got that what do vou do with il'
A I record anything that I consider pertinent infurimation as far as how long their length of treatment will he ind sometımes if there was a diagnosis I could read I would - I had something to add to my section then I would Q In this casc you didn \(t\) do that?
A No I did not Q Do you put any other information down from the IDR? A No the date that the doctor completed it and any antes Which is on the part there
Q Hold on a second there
A Below Tennessee
Q This part nght there (indicaung)? A That - nght
(4) Q So this information that you put on your bencfil Uchncus ist record for Capian Haselwood which is Dufundant , Exhibit 7674
il is intormaioun veru iunt
, A Tlit scorrect
Q Do voukcep the IDR'
A Vn Ifurwarded that to Dr Montgomery
Q Do vou mah a copv of it?
AIdonot
QKıcpa topv'
A No
Q Why is that?
A Because that is confidential medical information and I
had
(il) all the information I needed for my job
(1) Q All right I m not sure whether I asked you this or not
(13) but do you - because it a medical confidential information (is) even on this benefil sichness torm do you take steps to make
us, surl that people don I have ascorviot that hut vou?
1161 A I did
[17, Q All right and how did vou do that"
118, A Well it stared so my office in a closed box in my office
(19) Q Myolfice?
1.0) A If I left the office I cloaed the door and it locks and i I) at aight I would lock it up in a cabinet
(22) Q All right Do you recall getting the individual disability
13) report bach from Dr Vallury lahing down what information you (24) needed from it and sending it on to the medical department?
( s) A I would have done that

\section*{Vol 203416}
(1) Q Do vou rusall doing il'
(r) A Yes
(3) Q Do you rucall to whom in the medical department you sent (4) \(1^{7}\)
(s) A Dr Charies - Dr Hunter Montgomery
(6) \(Q\) And at that time was he the primary contact in the medical

171 departmant for Exyon Shipping Companv?
(k) A Yes he was our medical director
4) Q Did vou have ans cunversaluon with Dr Montgomeryabout (10) this IDR?
(II) A I would have - i don i remember exactls when but it - I
" 1 did have a convervation with Montgomer
(13) Q Do you recall why you had that conversation or the - what
(14) prompted you to have the conversation?
(1s) A I had recenved a call from Captan Pierce to extend

\section*{Captann}
(16) Hazelwood's disabality benefits to Mav 15
(17) Q Let me stop you just a second
(18) Had you talked to Captain Pierce prior to this time that
(19) you got this call?
(20) AI-not-no
(21) Q All right So this is the first tume that you had talked
i ) io Caplain Picrui in rugard to Captain Ha/clwood?
(3) A Right

1 4) Q Do vou hnow do vinu ratall whan Caplain Picrat balled you?
(25) A I didn i write the date down sol don \(t\) remember exactly

Vol \(20 \quad 3417\)
It would have been probably prior to April 29th
Q But in any event whatever that date is you didn \(t\) write t down on your form?
A That's right
Q And this form has downat the remarks section starts oul saying per Mark Piercl
A Per Mark Pierce Extend to \(5 / 15\) then check un SA shore
assignment or LOA which is leave of absenct
Q All right Do you havc a rabllation ol your convirsation with Captain Pierce?
AYes Ido
Q You mention in here and III put a litile circle around
It SA what is that?
A That's a shore assignment
Q What did Caplain Picruc ask you about in regard to a shore assignment?
A That we were to look for and I thank they were involved in loolung for an assignment for Captasa llazelwood in a - in one
(19) of the offices versus one of the shaps to that \(s\) what we
called shore assignment
Q For what period of 1 mL '
A For about 90 day,
Q in other words a shore assignmini during this llave of absence correal'
A Rught
, kind of a benefits expert with Exxou USA He was an advisorto
() the field units where I could extend it to May 15th
(i) \(Q\) As a result of your conversation or after your
(a) conversation with Mr Duke did you in fact extend the leave
for 15 moru days?
A Right I did
Q All right Now in regard to the - to the conversation
vou had regarding the leave of absencu for 90 days with
Caplain
(1) Picre you were - I think you were mentioning that in the
context of talking to Dr Montgomery and I kind of sidetracked , you there Why did that prompt you to call Dr Montgomery?
(I) A Then I needed to find out from the doctor the uformation I
(13) then got from - Bob Dukes said if you're medical durector
and
(141 management people lake he's stall nut able - not able to
(is) return to work then he can continue to receave disabulaty 1161 benefits So I checked with Dr Montgomery to see if that was
(17) indeed the situation should he stall be on disablity
(18) \(Q\) is there also under vour pay system and benefits system
(1) is it necessary to end a disability period before you can start
( O, a luave ot absuncu)
" AYes
(27) QOkay
(i) A Can't -
(4) Q Was that also part of vour call to Dr Montgomery to
d dicrmane that whun - whuther the disability puriod was up

\section*{Vol 203420}
and so thurulore you could staricd a leave of absence?
A Right
Q Now that shind ol hyper technical but you re changing
pay scalus correct?
A Right - well in other words yes becuuse now if dunng disability he is receiving pay because he is unable to do his job After April - May 15th be - was no longer eligible for disability benefits uot considered disabled and therefore if he needed more time off it was leave of absence
Q Didn iful paid tor that'
A No he did not get pasd for that
Q Undur the sysicm is that was in torcu at that time?
A That hright
Q But in urdur to und the disabilaty puriod you had to have somuthing from Dr Monigumery to say Well the disability pariod is ovar?

\section*{A That', right}

Q And you called Dr Montgomery?
A That's right
Q Did you mahe a requast of him?
A Well I called for advice and - from him and that's the uformation he gave me
Q Did you ask him to get in touch with Dr Vallury'
AIdon I know whether I shed hin to do that or whether he had alreidy done that

Vol 203421
Q Okay In anvevent were vou ahle to at leant lor pav
purposes for disabled benefits purposes wars vouahle to
terminate this disability?
A Yes
Q And is there a specific form that vou usc or a in -
A Yes
Q - all other things in life are there some initials you use to do that?
A It's a DTR disability termination report form
Q And I meircling DTR issued and there sadate buside that
A May 20th 1985
Q Does that show the date that you terminated the disabilitv termination - or let me start again
The mitials have gotten me confused
Is that the date on which the disahilitviermination repon was done by you'
AYes sir
Q All right Now down here at the bottom humblean this up
Down here at the bottom after it says come oft leave of
absence around \(8 / 15 / 85\) you ve written something clse here
What is that?
A Come back through send medical reported to Dr CHM [sic]
( is Q Are those two related?

11 ar -
A I went to his office
in) Q All right And did voullilhim that vou werw reminding (4) him?
(s) A Right
(6) Q What did hu inll vou'
(7) A That be would call Hazelwood tomorrow which was 8/1/85
(8) Q Did you make a note of vour reminding Mr Graves?
(9) Aldid
(10) \(Q\) Is that note this last thing at the bottom of the benefit
(11) sickness record?

111 Altis
(13) \(Q\) And after vou did that and fillod that out did you then
(14) put this - did you close this file out'

Ils, A Well I-ves I moved the card over to the inactive
"lit Q All right Arw those kepl bontidential"
117) A Yes
(18) Q Did vou have anv furthur invoivemont with Capiain

Hacelwood
(19) or his treatment or his disability puriod Irom then on?
(0) A I did not
(21) MR SANDERS Your Honor I move the admission of
(22) Defendant Exhibit 3471 and I have no further questions
(23) MR O NEILL That s already in as a plantiff's
( 4) exhibit but we have no ohpction to il coming in a second
(.s) lime

\section*{Vol 203424}
(Exhibil 3471 offered)
THE COURT Defendant Exhibit 3471 is admitted
(Exhibil 3471 received)
MR SANDERS Thank you Your Honor
THE COURT And we il take our recess Be back in if minutes
(Jury oulat 1201 pm )
(Recusat 1201 pm )
(Jurvinat 1217 pm )
THECLERK All risc
(1] THE COURT Cross examinl'
(1) MR O NEILL Thank you Judg.

1131 CROSS EXAMINATION OF GABRIELLA GUERRA
(14) BYMR O NEILL
(IS) QMa am'
(16) AYes
(17) Q Let stake a looh on this form if we could for a moment
(18) We II go the same thing we did before?
(19) A All right
(20) \(Q\) Where it saya diagnosis it says alcohol treatment You
(1) testified that you got that information from Ben Graves who
(2) told you that the captain was cnicring an alcohol treatment
(3) facilily or wnter?
(a) A That's correct
(.S) \(Q\) So the company s state of mind al the lime you made this
entry was the captain was entering an alcohol treatment facality or center?
A That's what I understood from Ben Graves
Q Okay and you dulitully made the entry in the company
record the best you could?
A Yes sir
Q And then this says \(416 \mathrm{K5}\) through hospital through
4/20/89 and then lave ol ahwnce Inr troup - and thun what
does that say?
A IND for individual
QYes
A And then marital therapy
Q I want to admit I once thought that was marital axe? A Mantal
Q Martal therapy So the records reflect he would be
hospitalized through 4/29 and then after \(4 / 29\) he would be in for group - he would have a leave of absence for group
individual and marital therapy and Alcoholics Anonymous and lectures?
A I copred that from the individual disability report
Q You testified that these records are confidential
A Yeah
```




``` things within the re urduat the mipans and hup theil
```

Val 20 3426
' conlidanial isn 1 it
AYev
Q And in vourhuanco suuduildilh limb'
AAthat - uh huh veah lithit-veah
Q And than ther, , anosamon anche $h$ through rizht there
(Indicating)?
A Right
Q And that s for Captain Hacelwond to come bach through
righi?
A That's correct
Q Then the next thing is send medical report to Dr
Montgomery?
A That scorrect
Q Do you have an und critandine ut uhv you whr lodo that or ware you jusl supposud la and il tir him'
A Well I alwas dad that
Q Did vou hnow what Dr Montzomari did it with ir not do with (1)

A He wan to review all of them
Q Hi wastorivicw them okay Wasn isohad was it?
ANo
MR O NEILL I have nofurther quaslions Thanh you
MR SANDERS You may tomi down Miss Gubrra

1) THECOURT You may sall your nuri wilnass

Vol $20 \quad 3428$
 1979

1 I heus had emplovee reldion suignment in Houston before 13, transfermag to Norwalk Connecticut Human resources job for
(he marketing department 1983, transferred to the
corporation's headquarters in Manhattan And then in 1984
(a) transferred back to Houston with the Eaxon Shipping

Company I
think that was in August or -
(8) Q What was the title you were to assume in 1984 with Exxon

Shipping Company?
(10) A Administrative maauger

111 Q What whry your dulicy as administrative manager with Exxon
11 Shipping Companv in 1984 through 1986?

Fxan
(14) Shipping Company

Ifs Q Couid you he a litlle more spucific about what your duties
1161 with human rusource would entan at that lume?
(17) A Well it involved the labor relations activities
(18) compensation and benefit admamstration general persamel
Ify activity man power iccounts - let's see
101 That was personael staff that was involved in some safety
(21) and environmental issues I think that's about it
, Q Prictding pagh to this memo is your memo dated May 28 1985
anclening vour disubvion with Joncph Hacclwood on May 19
1985)
( ${ }^{1}$ A 「hat'n)

## Vol $20 \quad 3429$

Q This was the tirst opportunity you had to speak with Caplain Hazelwood?
AYes
Q Was this a face to tace or was this over the telephone' A Telephone
Q You don i recall reporing anv of vour findings io the medical department for instance)
A I had a conversation with Dr Montgomery about Captan
Hazelwood's hospitalization Now whether you call that reportang or not -
Q So that conservation would have just been in regards to Captain Hazelwood saicohol rehabilitation?
A That's correct That's my recollection of that conversation
Q You talked hefore about your belief that the medical department would have known because of the way the pany does
things and $l-I$ didn $t$ louch on that comment al the fime Do you recall making that statement'

## A Yes

Q What did you mean by that'
A Well subsequent to -1 mean mitiation is in any number of ways If it's a serious illness or something like
rehabilitation sometume duning that process and generalls before the emplovee is out of the hospital the medical department will have some tvpe of form that routes through them

## Vol 203430

or to them about the employee disability Thev mav not necessanly know in advance what was going on but they ld be
advised sometime along the way
Q Did vou ever speak with anvone in the medical duparimint who indicated to you that in fact that prosess had occurred in the case of Captain Hazelwood $s$ hospitalization?
A Yes
Q Who did you speak with if vou ricall?
A Dr Hunter Montgomery
Q When was the conversation with Dr Monigomary'
A Few things I wish I had kept better nutex ull I don I know exactly when it took place It was ohviously sometime after 1
(13) knew he was in the hospital and sometime - and I hate to be so vague as before be went back on the vessel or a vessed in
(is) August My recollection is that it's sometime in the June kind
(16) of tsme frame
(17) Q That same time frame did you have any conversations with
(18) Frank larosai regarding Captain Hazelwood salcohol
(19) rehabilitation?
(20) A Well I think he - I think shortly after the May 28th
(21) letter I think Frank asked me to reconfirm agan what the
(22) company policy was on employees completing
rebabilatation And
(23) I thank as a result of that request of Frank , and the ordinari
(24) follow up that you do in a situation like this I contacted the
(26) HR department and coatacted the medical department to give
(1) Frank hack a complete story
() Q Could vou just tall us guneratlv what the substance of vour conversation was with Dr Montgomery)
A Generally the substance was was a medical department aware that II izelwond had been in rehabilatation And the doswer wat ves til that and that - he told me that Hazelwnod had completed his rebabilitation successfullv That be was attending an - and that loe was attending AA meetings on a regular basis Don't remember I think he sand three tumes a week or something like that
I think I said he's successfully completed the program and that was about the sum and substance of the conversation
Q Did you report the findings from your conversation with Mr Duke as well as Dr Montgomery back to Frank laroasa?
A I believe so I know I reported back to Dake the conversation and I'm pretty sure I reported-yes Yes
Q Okay Was that hy way of vorbal communication or was that a wrillendecumanl'
A Verhal
Q Did Mr laroxsi and vou lo do anvihing cive in regards to follow up on the issuc ot Caplain Harelwood a alcohol
(2.) rehabilitation?
1.3) A 1 don't remember whether it was at that particular time or
(4) subsequent to that but Frank asked me to ensure that John
i is Tomkins the gulf coast fleet manager counseled with Joe

## Vol 203432

'I) before he went back ahourd a ship as a master
(-) Q Did you ask Gabbil (ph) Guerra to notily you two weeks
(3) hefore Captain Hazelworod was due to come back from his leave of
(4) absence?
(5) A I could bave I mean I don't really recall that but I
(6) very well could have
(7) Q Do you know why you would have made that request if you
(8) did'
(9) A Well it would seem fairly logical that if Prank wanted to
inn ensure that liazelworod was talked to before he went back uboard
III, the versel we wanted to be vure we could in fact
urchestrate
(t i that and make it happen
(I) Q And I m just not clear You wert the one responsible for
(Idi coordinating that to makc surc that Tomkins spoke with Captain
(15) Hazelwood?
(16) A I'm not sure whether I was the onginal one or not but
(17) certaninly Frank reminded me to be sure, you know Don't
forget
(18) that somebody tells Tomkins to talk to Hazelwood before he goes
(19) back aboard the ship He may have had samiar discussions with
(m) Revere ( ph ) or anvbods else for that matter Ithak it was
( 11 Frank \clear intent th it loe get the benefit of some
1 , conversation before he went back aboard the vessel
(23) Q And il s your undurstanding that that conversation and
(-4) Lounseling did oclur?
( s$)$ A Yes

Vol 203433
If $Q$ And do you get that understanding - did Tomkins tell you
i, he had a conversation whth Hacelwood)
3) A Yes and be also told me that Sheehy had talked with 4) Hazelwood
5) Q Did Tomkins icll vou what il was he had discussud with (6) Captain Hazelwood?
7) A He didn't given me all the specifics Ile generally I
8) think said that he told Joe that - the company hoped that he
9) would do a good job and that be would contunue with a
(i0) rehabilitation program and looked forward to him having a
(II) long, successful career and that he was going to be
watched
(1) pretty closely
(131 Q Did you tell John Tomkins about the desire to have close
(14) montoring of Captain Haselwood?
(15) A Yes, I thmik that's one of the things that Frank asked me,
(16) to remind - to ensure that John talked to Hazeiwood about when
(17) he came through Houston on the way to assignment after his
(18) vessel
(91 MS STEWART Your Honor that concludes delendants
dis dircl cxamination
( ") MS WAGNER Thurb sa hhort viduo lor ross
1 1 CROSS EXAMINATION ()F BEN GRAVES (VIdu)
1 ; BY VIDEO EXAMINER
( 41 Q Would you read this last paragraph tor the re ord please'
( s) A I asked Joe if he ever drank aboard the rhip lle commented

## Vol $20 \quad 3434$

" that he occasionally drunk aboard the vhop but ant frequently

He also indicated that he came bith tis the vinp irnam part drunk

1 un several occavions
+1 QLul mu dsh you Mr Graves Did Capidin Ha/ciwatrd say 10
s) you that he Caplain Ha/clwosd had ome hach (o) the ship from
6) port drunh on stveral ollasions'

71 AYes
(b) Q I took the iniliative - your understanding was he took the
4) inilialive to go into rehabilitation Did vou spual with

1101 anyone in an attempt to discover generally what sinvolved with
(II) alcohol rehabilitation'

1. A No Again - I don t convider myvelf an expert in that (13) It's hike whether I know whether the thip is being navigated
(1a) properly or not 1 mean it vdactor vprerogitive infards
lls I m concerned
llo MS WAGNER That inntludw the row Yirur Honor
2. MR SANDERS Marupleast the Court the notilive
(18) withesscs wh have all ruspond lo varlouv portum, ol Mr Shaw s
(ig) lestimony Thankfully thrue ol themare live hut
( ot untortunately the first two we call by viduotaps duponition
( 11 and the first of those Mr Jose $\mathrm{D}_{\text {colivuira }}$
, ' MR SANDERS HL scuming from a long wav
(3) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF IOE DLOLIVEIRA (Video)

141 VIDEOGRAPHER This is casc number A 89095 cnlillud

) P DeOliveira The video deposition is requested by
, plainliff
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Are you currently employed by
A I'm retired
Q When did you relire?
A First of '89 January 1st
Q And who were you working for before your requirement?
A Exxon
Q What was the spccific company if you hnow that you were
working tor?
A That - before I retired '
Q Yes
A Exxon Company
Q Exxon Company
AYes
Q What was your lasi position with Exxon Company before you reured?
A Fleet chef
Q Couid you tell me what a fleet che! does?
A Does all the cooking for the - ou the shaps
Q Does he cook for more one ship at a time?
A One vhip at a time
Q How long had vou hacn worhing tor Exxon bulore your
rtircmenl)

## Vol $20 \quad 3436$

(1) A 19 vearv and a half

1) QWay thir a poltuly that Exxon would allow wine at certatn
(1) holidavs to be survid with mals)

1 Alen
(i) Q And what was thal)
(n) A For Thanksgiving Christmas and New Years
(7) Q And how did that work Exxon provided wine and -
(3) AYes
(1) $Q$ - il was surved?
(10) AYes
(11) Q And how long did that - was that policy still in effect
(12) when you relired?
(13) A No it was stopped in '88
(14) Q Do vou rombmburwhin in K8?
(1s) A That , the Vew Year, and the Thanksgiving Christmas in
(10) '88
(17) Q That was the last lumb)
(|x) A Yes that's when they stopped
(4) Q And how did that wint ztl ordurad?

ข) $A$ lt calue by cases
1 11 Q Did the iness person or the cook order it or did Exxon just 1 1 sund Il'
i 11 A The port steward used to order the wine for the holidays
(4) QOLay would at bu tair lo say than when you were serving
ins, on the Exxon Valdu/ that thin policy was still in effect?

```
A Untal - untrl 1988
Q So on your last voyage on the Exxon Valdu/ uine was
served?
A No
Q Your last vovage was in 1988?
A '88 Was nomore wine that yehr
Q Let me gust clarifv with him becauvelundlrstood vould
previously say and I may have misundurstood you that the
practice ended at the end of 1988 and at the beginning of 1989?
ANo no
Q That s not right?
A No that was the year that thev stop
Q So the last tume -
A It was '87
Q It was in 87`
A Right
Q And then new year s eve 1987 88?
A For the '88 on was no more
QOkav
A No more wine
1) Q Did you ever serve on the Exxon Valdu/ during the timu that
~) this policy was in effect?
(3) A I was there but was no more wine served that year
(4) Q That was the 1988 run?
A 88 right
```

Vol 203438
Q And von never were on the Exxon Valdef hefors that?
A No I was only one tıme I was there
$Q$ That was the first time?
A Yeah
Q Okay First and last?
A First and last
Q When you sailed on hoard the Exxon Valdes in 1988 was
Captain Hazelwood the captain of the vessel?
AYes
Q So is it fair to say that you sailed with him un the Vaidu/ in 1988?
A Yes sir $\mathbf{3 0}$ days or $\mathbf{3 3}$ davs tomewheres in there
Q 33 days?
A Somewheres in there l'm not exactly sure one day or more It was just -
Q That was your last voyage for Exxon?
A Right
Q IfI ve got that straight
A (Nods head)
Q Do you know a gentleman named James Shaw?
AOh yes
(2) Q Who is he?

A He used to be the port steward
74) Q For which fleet?
(23) A Exxon feet

Vol $20 \quad 3439$
ll Q West coast or gull?
A Just - ent codast
, Q Eayl conast'
A Yeah Back here from here to -
Q Okav And?
A Vew hork
Q What was vour - what was vour - did vou meal with
Mr Shaw trom time to time?
A Well when he comes aboard
$Q$ And how oflen did he come aboard?
A If he comes to Baytown he will come aboard If it saton
Rouge maybe once once in a while He didn't go there too
often
Q Do you recall wver drinking with Captain Hazelwood now?
A Vo sir
Q Iasked vou carlier ahoul meeting with Mr Thomas
yesterday
A Lh huh
Q For this daponition
A Lh huh
Q Did he show vouany papersor documents)
A This (indicating)
(3) Q What are you relurring to ${ }^{7}$
(1) A The question is in here about Mr Jim Shaw made a statement
(s) that I driah with Mr Hazelwond

## Vol 203440

Q Whll Iu mul interiect I have handed the witness a topy
of the - or the documents that werc predcsignated for this deposition
Thank you
And that , what you reviewed with him that $s$ what - okay that s what you looked at?
A Yeah
QSollake il you have read the - the reluruncu to yourscif
in Mr Shaw , dupovilion'

## A Right Raght

Q Without reruading it what do vou recall Mr Show aaying?
A James thaw said that 1 had a drink the night before with Hazelwood which he is a liar The only tume I -
Q Lut him finish the suntence
A The only tume I saw Mr Jım Shaw he was on the Exxon Galveston tied up next to Exxon Valdez I was in the gallery around 1000 before noontume meal and they seat one of the
(18) A B s on the Exxon Valdez he wants talk to me I went on the
(191 deck I saw Mr Jım Shaw and he says, I'm low in eggs and
(20) something else Can you supply me with some eggs
' 11 I says sure So I went back and I got the second cook
, they carried half a dozen - it was five six sheets of eggs
, and left them on the deck
I asked one of the $\mathbf{A}$ Bs on the other side to call Jim Shaw
to come pick it up lie didn thow up so I left the eggs on

Vol $203+41$
" the deck and whatever wa, the other item And that sthe only
() tume I saw Mr Shaw And he made a statement that he saw me
(3) next day on Exxon Valdez that I made that statement about that
(4) I had a drink with the - Joe Hazelwood on which Mr Jim Shaw
(s) was not - be did not came aboard that mornang
(6) I remember it was Mary Willamson that came ill I was
7) heiping her the fleet chef in the morning before 600 bhe
says you got your relief folake vour shower and after the
lunch pick you up
So I wait until 800 and I did see Mr Jım Shaw Period
Q You were saling with Captain Hazulwood in 1988 on the
Valdes rught?
A Right, uh huh
Q And did Mr Shaw ever come on board the Valdez while you
were sailing with Captain Hazelwood?
A No sar
Q In 1988
Now during the time that you saikd on the Valdef in 1988
with Captain Ha/liwood wavil common lor paple lo brint
aluohul on buard the vessall
A Mo vir
Q Didanvbody avirlull vou thov did thal
A Vo ar
Q Did you har anv rumors ahout pcople hringint alcohol
aboard?

## Vol 20 34.42

## $A$ Vo ur

Q And you vourscll navir drank on hoard that vonv!'
A No sar
MS STEWART Your Honor thal inm ludu, dilandanis
dirbl txaminalion
MS WAGNER Wh have another hort vidul ruw
CROSS EXAMINATION (IF JOSE Dul)LIVEIRA (VIde() BY VIDEO EYAMINER
Q Do you know ol anybody who was tvar lirud lor having
alcohol on board an Exxon vessel while you whre there'
A No
Q Do you know of anybody buing waugh with alcuhol on hoard
a
(1) vaybl while you wurt surving on an Exxun voixal'

A Vo
Q Did vou hear ahout anvhody havinz al shal laund ir huinz
uaghi drinhing ty an ollocor or tiv Exxun managtmint on board a

7 vเงx.!
A No ur
(iv) Q Naver haard aboul that in all the lime wa -
(.N) A Vo
( i) $Q$ - sailed abuard the vesicis
1-1 In 1988 you hnew that il you had alcohol or dranh on hoard
(23) you d befired?
(4) A Right
( s) $Q$ Now vou said carlicr that vou camc iol larn that aluohol

Vol 203443
was being brought on commonly back betore the policy was
directly enforced?
A Right
Q Okay Because people told you that right?
A Uh huh
Q And now that the policy was supposed to be strictly
enforced your understanding is that it he told you that you
were required to report to them right?
ARight
Q Okay Did you cvir ask any of thcse people you worked with
after the conversatson with Shaw about the strict enforcement
al the policy -
A Uh huh
$Q$ - whether they continued to bring alcohol on board?
A No, sar
Q Did you want to know?
A Yeah
Q Okay if you wanted to know why then didn t you ask any of
these people whether they contunued to bring alcohol on board?
( 0 ) A I don't know I'm not going to ask them if they bring or not alcohol If they tell me that they have it I have to report at but they uever tuld methat they bnagit If they did if I ever find out I'd have to report geah
41 OIn vour 19 vears al tmplovmint are you aware of any Exxon
il Shippint Companv umployee ever reporting that another -mploser

## Vol 203444

" had urad alwohol in vislation of the cumpany apolicies?

1. ANo

II MS WAGNER That wontludw the cruss Your Honor
d MR SANDERS May upleasc the Court we call
si Mr Jussl Watts by vidco deposision
DIRECT EYAMINATION OF JESSE WATTS (Video) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q How long have you been with Exxon Shipping Company?
A A total of $\mathbf{2 3}$ vears one month and a few days $\mathbf{l}$ started Hebruary 7th - 9th 1970
Q Ohay Why don I wh have you state your lull name for the
rutord and your residencu address also?
A Jesse Ray Watts
Q And vour residunlial address)
A 1035 Charlutte Vtrett that $s$ Roanoke Rapids
Rornoke $\boldsymbol{R}$ apid, Vorth Curohua 27870
Q Have you evcr texlilied betore in a case)
A Va sur
Q Would you give una brici description of vour educational hackground)
A I ve - I finished gramuar school eighth grade and went
unto the muth I quat several tumes and decided I didn't need uo more education and then went back in 1991 early part of '91 and got GED 31 years later
(2s) Q And through what program did you do that?
() County near Roanoke Rapids where I live
(7) Q That s at your home?

A Yes sur
Q And you indicated that you ve been with Exxon tor 23
vears Has that been your onlv emplover or have vou had other employers?
A No sir I was with the Roanoke Rapids textile mills from 1959 till about 1966 off and on give or take and -
(10) Q And I m sorry?
"Il A And then I was in the cigarette factory for a couple of
(1) months and then I done odd jobs in food hnes - I mean food
( 1 service
(14) $Q$ What did you do in the textile factorv'
(1s) A I run - I operated tinners drvers and loop dryers which
(16) is drying tules and so forth running - basically I had to do
(17) with tiles
(18) Q And approximately what year did you first become involved

191 with activities involving the sea or shipping cumpanv'
( 0$)$ A 1967 or '8 I heheve it was '68 Dected to leave cotton
( ) mill and cigarette factory and all that stuff and go and find a
job And I did I found a position I wanted and I stayed with
(3) it And that with the U S Department of Commerce which was
( 4) NONOR - NORA I belıeve it was at the tume
( s) Q Do you know what that stands for?

## Vol $20 \quad 3446$

(1) A Yeah Natıonal Ocean Graphic - I forgot all the names to it It was out of Rockville Marylond It wan vill part of the government
Q It was part of the federal government?
A The federal government yes
Q And what were you doing with NORA?
A I was on mess man part time in the steward's department
and I was also a wiper part time in the engine room
Q So NORA had a fleet of vessels $I$ assume?
A Yes sir and at the time they did renearch
Q And you were saling?
A Yes sur ah all research
Q And type of vessels were these?
A They were all research
Q And for what penod of time did you sail with -
A I stayed with them until February of 1970
Q I was asking you how long I think you were sailing with vessels that were run by NORA
A Well approximately two and a half years
Q Did you have any qualification requirements to get this
job any kind of licensing requirements?
(22) A No, sir Sorry no sur
(3) Q Was this your first sea experience?
(4) A Yes sir
(.S) Q Okay Had you ever satled before elther as a hobhy or lor

Vol 203447
" rumuneration prior to vour tob with NORA?
1 A Vo sar
(3) Q And wher did vougoaflur the luo and a half vears hetween

Fubruarv 1970 and 19721973 vou fonncd Exxon in Fehruarv 1970?

A Yes sur
Q And what was vour postion with them at that time?
A 1 was mess man
Q And who - what company was vour employer if you recall
in 1970' Who did you work tor?
A Exxon oh ESSO I mesory
) Q It was called ESSO then'
() A Right
(1s) $Q$ Do you remember when the name changed?
(19) A I heleve it was $77 \mathbf{7 8}$ or somewhere along there $\mathbf{7 6}$
(16) maybe I don t remember for sure
(17) Q What hind of vasci did vou hall for ESSO when you first
8) started working for them'
(19) A All tanker
( 01 Q What st/e lanhers)
( 1) A I started with the T2s I believe that is right
1 1 Q And what is your current position?
(23) A I'm retired as of nght now I'm on medical disability
(74) Q Okay Lel me ask what the disability is?
(S) A Yes sir Right knee replacement didn't take and I could

## Vol $20 \quad 3449$

A Yes sir The Yorktown which I just mentioned and also on the Valdez in October of 1988 to November of 1988
Q And could you tell us spobifically the lime trame you sailed with Captain Hazelwood on the Yorkiown? Was the lume
(5) that you gave us before?

A Yes sir
Q So he was the captain of the Yorhtown during that whole
period"
AYes sir
Q And then you also sailed with him on the Valdes through
October 88 to November 88 ?
AYes, sir
Q Now during the limc that you were on the Valdez with
Captain Hazelwood did you ever observe him drinking?
A No sir
Q Did you ever observe - did you ever have a - did you ever
smell alcohol on his breath?
A No sir
Q Did you ever see him with aluohol?
A No sir
Q Did you ever give him anv alcohol?
ANu sar
131 Q Did you sec anybody drinking on board the Valdes in 1988 ?
(4) A No sar I did not
(.s) Q Did you drinh with anybody on huard"

A No sur Vol $203+50$
QOLay Didanybodv avortill vou that thcr wavalcohol on
buard the Valde/ when you war vallank in 88 )
A vot to my knowledge nos sir
Q Galling bach to the puriod that you wure on the Yorkiown
did you - were you permanintly assigned to that vussel or how
did you get assigned to It' Lut ma ruphrave the quastion
because that was (wo quastions
How did you and up galling assignad to that vasul)
A lt was Chnstmas and they needed somebody on there I was
elected to go And I wav the firvt oute waslable from pand
leave 0 I was the one elected to qu
Q Dn you rumbmber where vaugul un hasard the vassul'
A Yes sir I suredu
QWhure wasit'
A In Bayway New Jersey
Q Please let me rephrase that
A Bayonne New Jersey I beheve il was
Q Bayonne?
AYes vir
Q Now to your Anowlidet was thare alcohol on hoard the Yorkiown during the lime you warb sasling'
A Nonethat I, iw no sir Vone thit lviw
(4) Q You didn i ictanvaltohol -
(s) A No sir
(I) Q - on board
(1) Who was the port steward during that period if you
(3) remember?
(s) A Yes sir Jum Shaw
(s) $Q$ And who was the fleet chef?
(k) A Warren Adams
(7) Q Did you read the deposition of Mr Shaw?
(8) A Yes, sir, 1 did
(4) Q Did you read the part about Mr Shaw having observed
(10. Captain Hazelwood with alcohol smell on his breath according
(L) 10 Mr Shaw?
(1) A Yes, sir I dad
(13) Q Did you ever smell alcohol on Captain Hazeiwood a breath
(14) while you were on the Yorktown?
(IS) A No, sir
(18) Q Were you ever asked by Captain Hazelwood to buy alcohol
and
(17) bring it on board the vessel?
(18) A No, sir
(19) Q Well did you read what Mr Shaw said?
( 01 A Yes sir I sure did
rll Q And what do you think aboul that?
1 A I don't thank he told the truth to be honest with you
(1) Q So did you have a discussion with Mr Shaw about it at the
(4) 1 ImL )
( s) A No sir Not at the tume he said I did

## Vol 203452

iI) Q Do vou rumumbur talking to Mr Shaw about alcohol at all
" during that amb'
(3) A Yes ur I quredo
(4) QTell us the best you can recall about that conversation?
(s) A Yes sir Let mego back from the beganngg, okay?
(6) I joned the ship in New Jersey okay We went from there

17, back to Texas From Texas we went back to New York

## trom New

isi lork we went up to Chalmette Loussana Mr Shaw met the shup
(9) in Chaluette Lousaana There's a walk way about almost a (10, mile that you have to get from the shore to the ship Me and
(II) two other guys I can't recall the name the one was a utulity (1) and I don t remember who the other guy was, but two or three of
II us was nulking ashore to go out and have a beer or

## whatever we

(14) wanted
(191 And Mr Shaw approaclied ue and the other two guys weut on
(161 ahead and kind of vlowed down and wated for me They kept on
(17) Walking and I toid them I'd catch up with them and Mr Shaw
tri sald Jesse there will ant be anyinore drinkang ou the ships
(1) and if $I$ do hear of gou drinkiug you will not saal fleet chef
:201 aydin
' 11 And I told hua ves ar do whatever you have to do And
( ) that was the discus siou as $f$ ir as I'm concerned That $I$
1 31 remenuber

( ${ }^{1}$ drinking rizhi caus -

Vol $20 \quad 3453$
A No sir James Shaw spoke to me directly about it
Q And was Captain Hazelwood s name cver muntioned in that conversation?
A Not that il recall sir Vo
Q Do you Lnow who Laslie Pennington is'
A Yes sir very well Ido
Q Who is she?
A She was a manning's assistant at the tome handing the steward department
Q Do you know anything about Mr Shaw talking to Lcslie
Pennington about this conversation you just described for us)
A No sir because I feel hake Miss Pennington would have told me if there was a probiem with it
Q Okay Let me just make sure it sclear With Mr Shaw, testimony in mind is it your testimonv that Caplain Ha/eiwond never asked you to bring alcohol on board the vassel?
A Definitelv yes He would never ask that question He would never have asked anybody to do something like that That's stupid any way
Q Now going back to the Shaw conversation again did thi conversation that you had with Mr Shaw occur on your wav hack
( ) to the vessel from that restaurant that you re referring to ${ }^{\text {? }}$
13) A No sir It happened on the way to the restaurant He was
(74) coming from the shore I was going ashore
( s) QOkay

## Vol $20 \quad 3494$

II A And he was coming to the ship I was going back the other
'1 way
(3) Q Now when you joined the Yorktown vour joh was whal?

A Shup's cook
Q Ship s cook And there was on hoard a Heet chulf
A Yes sir
Q Do vou remember his name?
A Yes sir Warren Adams
Q And there came a time did there not when vou ralitved Warren Adams?
A Yes sir Warren had his 60 days off approximately four days before I had mane over and he was getting off at Ft Lauderdale so I relieved him in Ft Lauderdale
Q So you left on February the 21 st 1985
A Somewhere basically around that time yes
Q All right So are you saying that it was within four or five days of that that Warren Adams left in Ft Lauderdale? AYes
Q So that would have been in February?
A Rught
Q Of 1985?
(22) A '85 ub bub
(23) Q And you stepped up as fleet cher
(24) A Rught
(25) Q When you relieved Warren Adams?

A True
Q And onc ol the mess min vipped up to vour iob as cook?
A Rıght
Q Wen vou stupped up to ralleve Adams'
A (Vods head)
Q All right Is that right'
A Yes sir
Q And that was in February of 1985 ?
A Right
Q Now this conversation that you had with Mr Shaw that
occurred where?
(1) A In Chalmette I (1) matana
(19) Q All right was this hbfore or aftur volu had rulteved Warren
(1s) Adems?
191 A Before
(16) Q Do vou know how long bulors'

1171 A Somewhere in the neighborhond of lanuary 20th to
Februarv
(18) IOth Somewhere in that neughborhood
(19) Q Ohav And again thal occurred in Chalmette Loursiana?
1.01 A Yes sir
(1) Q All right Now after February the 21 st 1985 did vou ever
(29) sail with Captain Harelwood on the Yorktown ever again?
(13) ANo sir
(4) Q And the onlv lime vou satied with Captain Hazelwood again
is on any ship was in October and Novambur ol 1988 is that right?

## Vol $20 \quad 3496$

(1) A Yes sir
() Q And that was on the Exxon Valde7?
(3) A Yes sir
(4) MR SANDERS Your Honor that soncludes the direct
(s) examinalion
(o1) MS WAGNER Your Honor until the momunt Mr Sanders
(7) said videodaposition $I$ bulicvad this was a read deposition
18) Mr Jamin in going to hulp me with this We II have a shon
(4) cross
(10) THE CLERK Raise you right hand
"ll The Witness is Sworn)
(1) THECLERK Pluast bu scalad
(13) For the record state your full name address and apell your
(14) last name please
(1s) THE WITNESS Mathew D Jamin 323 Carolyn Street
(16) Kodiak Alaska
(17) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JESSE WATTS (read)
(18) BYMS WAGNER
(19) Q Tell mi what you re understanding was of the alcohol policy
'ri around the time of the Valdes spill hefore the spill like in
1 1188897
1 A It wan the same policy tupposed to be the same policy it
(i) was in 1970 when $i$ jorned the ship but it was not enforced
(4) Q Do you rucall while you were sating at any time between
t-5) 1970 and today any discussions with Exxon personnel about

Vol $20 \quad 3459$

## alcohol policy on board their vessels?

A Yes sir and about 1986 is when -1 m sorry 85 '86 somewhere in the neighborhood is when it all started about the
drankang yes sir
Q And could you tell us what you re relerring to when you
mentioned that something - something started or somuthing
happened in 1985 or 86
A There was rumors of the company crackung down on the drinking They had already started cracking down on drugs
(10) thes is about the time it started

Q Okay What do you mean by rumors' Is it that - is that something that you heard?
A It was going all over the fleet I can't give you a specific person or specific answer All you hear is they're cracking down on so and so for drinking
Q By sracking down what did you understand that to mean? A Well that meant that there would be no more drinking on the ship eventually Before that it was overlooked Q So there was drinking on board the ship before that?
A l'm sure there was 1 don $t$ know about the rest of them
but I know I did before and there w in nothing that was gaid
okay"
MS WAGNER Thanh vou
MR SANDERS May ll pladx thb Courl un ill M,
Laslic Punningion

## Vol 203498

## THE CLERK Raise your rizhi hand

(Witnuss sworn)
THE CLERK Fur the rucord plasas stalc vour lull
namb your address and lill vour lavi namb
THE WTTNESS Ľslı Dınis Pとnninglon 30636 Juhn
Drive Dunham Springs Luusiana My lasi name is spelicd
Penntnglon
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF LESLIE PENNINGTON BYMR SANDERS
Q I m gorng to anh you to spcah up so we can all harar you okay?
I think the siiver one is the most opcralive one soif you sould point that towardr vou a latle hil'
A (Indicating)
Q Good By whom are you umplavad
A Sea River Maritime
Q And wharl do you work now
A In Baton Rouge I 1 arstana
Q And how long have bou worhbل I or Sad Risol ir lor Exxon'
301 A About 13 vears
(i) Q Andiull us a lith bit ahout your codusational
( -) background
1 31 A I graduated frum Michigau Dtate Lniversity with a bachelors
41 degree in general business admmistratann in 1980
1 si Q And than in what ytardid voustart with Exxon?
"1) A 1981

1) QRight -
(3) A May
(4) Q Right after school?
(s) A Right
(6) Q Now I want to ask you about your job in the time period of
(7) X5 86 and 87
(8) What was your job then?
(9) A I was fleet manning assistant
(10) Q Okay And where were you located"
(山) A ln Houston Texas
(1) Q And were you fleet manning assistant tor Exxon Shipping
(13) Company)
(14) A Correct
(1s) $Q$ And what does a fleet manning assistant do or did one do
(16) in those - in those days?
(17) A Our job was to crew the oceangoung tankers When someone
(18, was due off the vessel we would find a relief for them and plan
(19) the relief basically get them to the joining port

101 Q Now in the tume trame of $1985 \quad 86 \quad 87$ did you have
( ) rusponsibility at your desk tor crew assignments for fleet
( I thuls and ship s wouks'
1 " A At onte pomt in tune ves
if Q Was that unt point in lime during this lime trame?
1 it AYes it was

## Vol 203460

iI) $Q$ And in that goh did you know a man by the name of Jesse

1) Walts'
(13) A Yes I dad
2) Q And did you know a man by the name of Jim Shaw?
(1) A Yev I did

161 Q Now I want to get right to the point Miss Pennington
17) Mr Shaw testificd in this trial by way of video deposition
(s) toa-an incident let suallit alleged incident in which
(v) he said that Mr Walts told him that he was bringing booze a
(10) wouple of botilu of hoore bach to the ship for Caplain
ill Haselwood and he would drinh and that Mr Watts invited
(I) Mr Shaw (o) join them And Mr Watts - Mr Shaw has further
(in) lustilicd that tollowing that convursation that he made a
(la) tall in you and told you that you should not assign - or he
"Is would requist that you not assign Mr Watts to any vessel
lor involving Captain Haselwood You got that?
17 ) A Lh huh Yes
"ty $Q$ And $m y$ qucstom (t) vou is did Jim Shaw over call and you
(H) hill you anything lihe thal aboul lesse Watls and Captain
(r) Hacelwoud)
( 11 A No he dad not
1 - Q He further testified that he told you that the reason for
(31 that was that Captain Haselwood had asked him -asked
(i) Mr Wallsioguboocu lor him and that s whure he was making
is that long recommendation to you did he lull you that?

Vol 203461
A No he did ant
Q Is that something you would recall if vou had been told that by Mr Shaw?
A Yes
MR SANDERS Noturthurqulslions You may dak CROSS EXAMINATION OF LESLIE PENNINGTON BYMR O NEILL
Q This is your deposition transcripl Lei s see how quick we candothis
At your deposition you testified on page 62 of - page 98
and page 62 that in tact you may have had a conversation with
Jim Shaw about Jesse Watts and Captan Hazelwood You on 1
3) particularly recall if Was that a fair statement'
a) Aes I may have had a - I had conversations with Jim

Shaw I had conversations with Jim Shaw on a regular basis
6) about the steward's department So I could have had a
conversation about one or the other with him I don't remember
si any specific conversation
Q You don tremember one way or the other and vou could have
(0) had a conversation with Shaw ahout Watts and Harclwood'

A I may have
Q Okay
A Not one that I-
MR O NEILL Thank you
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF LESLIE PENNINGTON

[^39]Vol 203462
$Q$ And before that did you go do school?

1) A Hagh schnol little college
(3) Q And did vou go from a litle college on into Exxon
d dirccill arwirl woll -
s A lo sar
2) Q Did you work for other paopla'
$T_{1}$ A I had other emplovment - life hefore $f$ xxon ves
(s) Q Youdid have a - life hefore Exxon all right
3) And let me take you straight to the time frame of 1985 -
not like the last half of 1985 or the year 1986 or the first half
(11) of 1987
4) Do you recall where you were working in that time frame?
(13) A 85-84 and '85 I was un the gulf coast fleet office
(14) '86 I left 1 left Fxxon Shipping in 1986 August to go to
(1s) Exxon Company USA
(101 Q But in January thmogh Augusi of 1986 you did work for
117, Exxon Shipping Company?
(18) A Yes

191 Q And than in $19 \times 5$ vou wirhud for Exxon Shipping Company?
(10) AYer

1 " Q Now in that timu tramb were vou in the same job"
1 A Dumng that time ves I was in the gulf coast feet
1 1 office
: it Q And what was vour joh in the gulf coast flew office?
( i) A I was sent there basically as an extension of the benefits

[^40](1) Q Did you have uscaston to vi it the ship, at the vallic lime
() thal Mr Shawdid?
(3) A Quite often
(4) Q All right Now let me ask you about a specific oclasion
(5) Sometime in this time frame - and if il s you the Ellen
(6) Share that he stalking about thas to be in 85 or up until
(7) August of 1986 correct?

A Uh huh
Q Mr Shaw has lcstified that - hi me lust ruad it
(10) Was any - counsul I m ruading in the trial transuript
(11) page 1011 or 1011
(1) The question Was anybodv with you that tourth lime whan (131 you went aboard?
(14) Answer When I went aboard the vissel I had an assistant
(is) that would do several things with me That purson was Sam
(10) Pierpoint Ellen Share was also in the company at that time
(17) She had something to do with safely Shc may have gone aboard
(18) with me at that tume Frank Pasolca (ph) worked for Ellen
(191 Matchell may have been may have gone aboard with me also
(30) Question Can I ask you to do something for me Mr Shaw?
(-1) When you say she may have it docsn iteally give us your
( - ) best racollculion Is your hast rucollculion that the wanl
3) aboard with you on that in daton?
4) Answer lthink she did vas


|  | Vol 20) 3+66 |
| :---: | :---: |
| that $u$ castundid you gu wc Mr Haccluond ' |  |
| Antwler Yus Idid |  |
| (3) Qucstoon Could youste him' |  |
| 11 | Answler Not then The dour wav lachld onthin weavoun |
| a) Qucslion Washeaboard' |  |
| 6) Answur Tothe husial minnowladge hawav I donithnou |  |
| 7 becaus the roum was lochud I wasn iaware |  |
| 81 Qubston Did bou lind sul why the room was loched? |  |
| 4, Answur Wcll the pursonnclahoard the vasbutwcre mahing |  |
| 1101 remarks to the point that there was a femalu companion or |  |
| (111 somuthing in the room with him And they whre having a party |  |
|  |  |
| 131 Qucstion Olay thendid you lanally act him that day? |  |
| 19, Answar Yis Idid |  |
|  |  |
|  | anything on his bruath? |
|  | 171 Answur Yus Idid |
| Qucstion What' |  |
|  | Answur Hurezain Igolthe dialin lidural alabhal |
|  | Shipping down topazt l013 Qucolion Did tou divaus |
| '1 this with Ellun Shars' |  |
|  | Answler $W_{\text {L }}$ hada convervalunahaul il Va |
|  | Now my qucstion to you M, Shars in umply thin |
|  | Do you have any rucollchion of that oc urrime while you |
|  |  |

1 Antwlr Yts Idid
Qucstan Could you suc him
1 Answer Not then The dour wavabhadonthivocsavoun
Qucstion Washsaboard'
A Answur Tothe husial my howledge hewav Idonithone
becaust the room was lochcd I wasn Iawart
(1)Qussion Did bou lind aut why the room was lochcd?

1. Answur Wcll the pursonncl aboard the vasbelwart mahing remarks to the point that there was a femalu companion or
somcthing in the room with him And they whr having a party and Joe was busy
Qucstion Ohay thendid you linally inc him that day?
Answar Yos Idid
Qucstion All right Andat that line dad voun smill
anything on hiv bruaih?
Answur Yusluic
Qucstion What'
Answar Harbzain Izoltha dinan ladural alabhal
, Shipping down in patc l013 Qucallon Didtou diouse
this with Ellun Shars'
Answle $W_{t}$ had a convervaluna ahoulil Yos

Do you have any rucullublan of that ac urring while you
wert on board the Yorkiown with Mr Jim Shaw'

```
A \o mr Idonut
MR SANDERS Youmavash
CROSS EXAMINATION OF ELLEN SHARE
BYMR O NEILL
Q Ma am would |l be farr so say that you and JIm Shaw went
on board Exxon vessels numerous limes?
A Yes
Q And would it be farr to say with regard to this
onversation that you don i recall this conversation one way
or the other so that you san not realistically deny that the
conversation took place?
A I can not recall the conversation
Q You don i recall tl one way or the other'
A No
Q My statement - we have a double negative problem here
I m not trying to badger you or anything I just want to make
sure that reads right on there and I used a double negative
Let me if I magood enough grammarian to figure this out
You can I- your recollection isn t such that you can
recall one way or the other that this conversation took place
is my statement correct?
A Yes
Q Can tracall one way ur the othor'
A I can t recall one wis or the other yes
Q Thanh vou vory much
```

And with rugard io Mr Shat you gol to ruvicw Mr Shaw
duposituon lcstimony -
AYes
Q - when you whre duposed
And you consider Mr Shaw to be an honest man don 1 you?
A In wr dealings with hun ves
Q And vou wonsidur him to be an honest many and you do not
doubt the iruthfulncis of his deposition testimony do you?
A During the dealings with ue I have no reason to doubt
has
(10) honesty
MR O NEILL Thanl you ma am
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF ELLEN SHARE
BY MR SANDERS
QMs Shar your dnuwiraboul Mr Shaw shoncsty that was
hascd in vour duposilion - and in response to Mr O Neill
havad upan vour own purvonal dalings with Mr Shaw is that
vorrubl?
A 7hat , correct iey
Q And in vour daling, with him vou didn itver have an
(ucasion lolind that ha way dishonsti)
$\Lambda$ Vo
Q Let me tahc thin a step further
If Mr Shaw has Luslticd in this tast that Mr Jusse Watls
was bringing hoore back to Captain Haselwood after Captain
Haselwond rulurnad lrom alcohol ruhabilitation which would

Vol 203469
have occurred in August of 1989 and said that Mr Jusse Walts
) was doing that after Captain Harelwood rulurned and if the
, records show that Mr Jesse Walts ncver cven salled with Captain Hazelwood -
MR O NEILL Object to this question an hang
speculative invading the province of the jury and without foundation
MR SANDERS I m following up on his question as io the honesty
THE COURT You better get in it real quick it sounds
to me like its pretty tar out
BY MS SANDERS
Q If Mr Shaw made a claim like that would that be the claim of an honest man?
MR O NEILL Same objection
THE COURT I II sustan the objeclion Youmay b
able to approach the subject other way but not with a
convoluted question like that
BYMR SANDERS
Q Is your opinion as to Mr Shaw shonesty based on anything
other than your own personal dualings with him?
A Absolutely no
Q One final question Do vou rememhor any description to you
or my reading to vou from the rutord of what Mr Shaw said?
A Yes

BY MR SANDERS
Q Therb vouarl M, Shorls whereare you imployed?
A I memploved with Sea River Maritime Incorporated
Q That is a good idea Stav close to that uiver one and wh Il he able to hear vou
How long have vou becn employed by Sca River or by Exxon?
A 17 years
Q Tull us your cducational background'
A Attended the Unversity of Houston with approximately 86
hours towards a degree
Q Now what is your job with Sea River this time?
A At this tume my job assignment is a commercial assistant
with the business development and commercial group
Q And in that poh are vou the custodian of records of Sea
River Marilime which boncurn assignment histories deck logs port logs that hind of information'
A Yes
MR SANDERS Your Honor maylapproach the witness?
THECOURT YL
BYMR SANDERS
Q I am handing you what is a part of Plaintiffa Exhibil
No 1 and this part is in four pages and it is the assignment
hisiory for Caplain Joseph Harelwood
The page that I have op nocd up is the page that covers a
limu period Would you tell the ladies and gentlemen of the

|  | Vol 203470 |
| :---: | :---: |
| (1) | Q If that had occurred do vou think that is something you |
| 11 | would remember? |
| 31 | A Yes 1 would |
| (4) | MR SANDERS Nofuriher questions |
| 151 | THE COURT Thank you you may step down |
| (6) | MR SANDERS Your Honor we call Ms Marsha Shorts |
| (7) | (The Witness Is Sworn) |
| (8) | MR SANDERS I seem to have inherited all the |
| (9) | problems with documents today |
| (10) | Our Exhibit 3476 A which is an assignment history for |
|  | Jesse Watts was missing everv other pagk I would liku it) |
|  | MR O NEILL lobject to it as incompleth |
| (13) | MR SANDERS And I join in that ohlchlion buil have |
| (14) | a complete version here and I d like to move that into |
| (1) | evidence |
| (16) | MR O NEILL I have no objection to the complete one |
| (17) | or the incomplete one for that matter |
| (18) | (Exhibit 3476 A offered) |
| (19) | THE COURT 3476 A is admitted |
| (20) | (Exhibit 3476 A received) |
| 111 | THE CLERK Would you state your full name your |
|  | address and spell your last name |
| (3) | THE WTTNESS Marsha Renee Shors 9llo Tavastoch |
| (9) | Drive in Houston Texas My lasiname is spellid S h orl |
|  | DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARSHA SHORTS |

## Vol 203472

(1) pury what time period that covers?

1) A The tume period that's covered is from October fith 1981
i, through March 24th 1989
(4) Q All right What information is contained on this
(9) assignmint history from Plainiff s Exhibil No 11)
(大) A lt contains the vessel q name the vessel code the
2) rating - called the rating scale I m sorry The start date
isi the stop date and the total davs
vi Q Can you looh at that assignment hostory and find out when
110, Captain Hactwood was sating abord an Exxon ship'
H: AYen
(1) QCan vou icll what dates he valled)
(I) A That is correct
(14) Q And how many days -
usi A That's correct
(10) Q And does it give you the name of the ship?
(17) A Yes
(18) Q All right Would you stan in about I guess halfway down
(19) the page and 1985 start with August of 1985 - well start
(30) with January of 1985
(1) How many ships did Captain Ha/clwood sail on from 85
, through 89?
i A A total of two
( A) Q What whr those iwo ships?
(2s) A The $\mathbf{F} \times x$ on Yorktown and the F ixon Valdez

Q And the Exxon Yorktown the first-strike that
Whether does - when is the last date on which Captain
Hazelwood served aboard the Exxon Yorktown?
A April 17th 1987
Q What is the firsi date on which he sailed on the Exxon Valdez?
A July 30th of 1987
Q 1 ask you jusi kind of put that asidu
Did you also al my ruquisl onsull with duch leys and port logs?
A Yes
Q And which port logs did vou riview for me'
A I reviewed the Exxon Yorktown as it - and in Baytown
Q Now the por log would have what information?
A The port logs would have the uformation as to the tume
vessel arnved in port all of the operations that occurred in
port the product loaded or discharged
Q All right Now you also mantioned and Ialso muntioned deck logs
A That's correct
Q What - where did the duck logs - which ships did I ash you (1) chuch on duch log,"
A On the Faxun Yurktowin and Vilder
Q So the port logs whre lor what port'
A Baytuwn Texas

## Val 203474

" Q And the duch ligs wart lur the - what vhip'
1 A for the Yorktown und the Vildez

- Qla il possithle lolll amparing thoveluo-aruving
(4) those two is il possible to tell when the Exxon Yoritown

15) called al Baytown when Caplain Hazelwood was the master of
the
16) vexsel - using the assignment history the dech loga and the porilogs)
A Yes it is
Q All right ls there - would the duch log of the Yorkiown
say whun It was in York - whan it was in Baytuwn'
A Yes
, Q And would the port log Irom Baviown show whan the
Yorklown
', tamu into Bayloun'
A That scorrect
Q All risht And in comparing those iwo wanthbri - was
there an agrecment butween the two or whro thure any
dispariliss'
A There was an agreement
Q Now dad Ialso ash you lo double thubl that?
AYes
17) Q And how did you double chach that?
' ' A That was double checked by runnang an extracted report
from
is our STAR byntem whach an our tatantical and Revenue System for
1 d) bea Kiver Manime which would indicate ill port calliv that a
( s) vessel makes dt port
(1) Q All right Did I ask vou to then give me a lisung of all
() the tumes that the Exxon Yorktown was in Baytown Texas with
(3) Captain Hazelwood as master of the Yorktown?
(4) A Yes
(s) Q And s Defendant Exhibit 7420 a blowup of your work on that?
(6) A That's correct

171 Q Now you have on this information start thing August of
(8) 1985 through April of 1987
(9) The first time that the ship was in Baytown ship being the
(10) Yorktown at Baytown with Captain Hazelwood aboard or - this
(H) date right here August the 28th 1985 Correct?
(1) A That's correct
(13) Q And how long did the ship stay?
(14) A It stayed tull April 30th of 1985
(IS) Q To-see 1 lured you into an error?
A Same thing you are -
Q August -
A August 301985
Q All right And then Irom then on these are the dates
I inrough the 30th ol Marib 1987 when the Yorktown was at
Baytown with Caplain Hazelwood aboard?
A That's correct
( i) Q Now Mr Shaw hav kstilied that ther were three or maybe
lour times when the - the Yorktown was al Baytown they were
all xv-n to 14 days apart

[^41]1) Captain Hazelwood?
, A That's correct
i) Q Let me ask you to compare those iwn assignment histortes
2) for the period starting with 1985
(s) A Okay
3) Q And first let me ask vou il those iwo salled together in
4) January or February of 1985 ?
5) A Yes
6) $Q$ And on what ship was that'
(10) A The Exxon Yorktown

1111 Q All right Now in 1985 after Februarv did-dothose
, records reflect that Jesse Watts ever sailed on the Yorktown
when Captain Hapelwood was master again'
A No they - they do not
Q All right Solmhaving Mr O Ncill sprohlum lihure
any evidence in those records that he cver satild on the
Yorktown with Captain Hazelwood again¹ vu zol a double
negative Nolyou me
Did he or didn the?
( 0 ) A He did not
" Q Thank vou
, , Now do the records reflect that Mr Watts did sail with

1. $\mathrm{il}_{\text {Captain Hapelwood on board another ship in } 1988 \text { ? }}$
a) A Mr Watts did sail with Captain Hizelwood on board the
$\varsigma_{1}$ Fxxon Valdez in 1988

## Vol 203478

" Q Can you tell the month there or is that -
') A Sure Mr Watts was on board the Exxon Valdez from 3) September 30th through October 25th

Q Of 1988?
A Of 1988
QThank vou Now lalsoashed vou lodotwortherthing
for me
Is it possible to take the information in your robords and
determine how many cruw crew membles - vailor - werc on
board with Captain Hazelwood during a period of time?

## A Yes

Q And in doing so did I give you any instrublionvaboul
(3) making sure you didn ! count anybody twice?

A Yes
Q And at my request did you go through the records and
compile a total number by year by time period for the total
number of different people who served on Exxon vessels with
8) Captan Hazelwood when he was a master?

A Yes
(20) MR SANDERS I move the admission of Defendani

1) Exhibit 7419

1 ) (Exhibst 7419 offered)
: 3 MR O NEILL No objection
(24) THE COURT 7419 is admutted
(-5) (Exhibit 7419 received)
, BYMR SANDERS
Q And this nt course goevirnm August the 14th 1985 in the date of the grounding in 1989)
A Yes
Q Is that corrucl'
And the lotal number ol differunt puople who sated with
Captain Harelwood during that lime perind was what?
A 269
Q Did I also ask you if it was possible to look at the deck
logs for the ships on which Captain Ha/clwood was sailing to
dulurmint how manv visilors werc ruborded as having visited
the
"। vasul whun Capiain Harelwond wav aboard)
A Yes
11s Q Now to the dach - tothr-axcusc ma
If 1 Dothu duch logn - I II get it rizht in about a half an hour

Do the duch logs contain that sorf of information?
A That's correct
Q Do vou have an understanding as to why that information is
put in the duch loss'
A It's required These are not normally Fxxon employees so

। there needs to be a record as to who boards the ship that is not an employee
Q Did vou go through the duch Ions lor the Yorktown during
( ${ }^{\text {s }}$ the appropriak lime puriod and the duck logs for the Exxon

## Vol $20 \quad 3480$

Vaides during the appropriate time period and come up with a number by year of visutors who came aboard those ships when Captain Hazelwond was the master?

## A Yes

Q And did vou - dnas Dufendant Exhibul 7424 accuratelv
portray vour summars of that word'
A That in correct
MR SANDERS 1 move the admission ol Defendant
Exhibu 7424
(Exhıhı 7424 offirud)
MR O NEILL Noobjection
THE COURT Dulendant Exhihit 7424 is admitted
(Exhibil 7424 received)
BY MS SANDERS
Q And the total number of visitors is?
A 272
MR SANDERS Thank you very much You may ask CROSS EXAMINATION OF MARSHA SHORTS
BY MR O NEILL
Q Got a couple of questions lor you
Now Baytown is in Tuxas?
A That's carrect
Q And ships come in to Baytown and this ship came in to Baytown on these days (indilating) isn that correct?
A That's correct

## Vol 20 3481

(I) Q Now the Baytown is one of scvural ports that are surviced
(?) by or were serviced by at this point in time the gulf coast
(3) fleet office isn that right?
(4) A That's correct
(5) Q And there was - and listening to Mr DeOliveira testifying
( earlier today I heard him say that Shaw Jim Shaw the port
I steward not only visited ships at Baytown buithey hu visited
, them when they came in to Baton Rouge? Do you know that?
A I'm - no I have no recollection of that
Q The Baton Rougt is down in the guneral gtographic area
near
(iII) Baytown they re in adjoining states arun they?
(1.) A Baton Rouge is in Loussiana
(13) Q And where is Texas City?
(14) A I'm sorry
(15) Q Do you know where Texas City is?
(16) A I've heard of Texas City yes
(17) Q Do gulf fieet coast ships come in to Texas City too don $t$
(18) they?
(19) A I'm quite sure they do
(20) Q And this chart doesn i cover Baton Rouge when thi Yorktown
(2i) came in to Baton Rouge does 11 ?
(-2) A No it does nut
13) Q And il docsn I covar whun the Yorhtown came in to Tusas

1 +Cily dousits"
st A No ut daes not

Vol $20 \quad 3482$
" Q And vou didn i purporitoirv lopul on this chart vou
is didn tiry to pui on this thart the number at limes that
(3) Mr Shaw would have visiled the Exxon Yorklown when the Exxun
(4) Yorkiown was in and around the gult coast?
(s) MR SANDERS Objul to that Asbumes a lact not in
(6) evidence

171 MR O NEILL Idskadhar whetherthuy tricdto -
(8) MR SANDERS I mobjecting to whether Mr Shaw would
(y) have visited those places Thure s curtainly no proof of 1101 that
ull MR O NEILL Mr DeOliveira has alrcadylustified to (1) that
"li THE COURT That s something the jury will have io
(14) dulde
is BYMR ONEILL
(16) Q You didn tiry tu put that un this chart did vou?
"17) A 1 was not asked tu put that information on the chart
"181 Q You were not asicd to put that information on the chart?
(1) A No
(20) Q Okay
(יI) And we talked a litile bilabout Mr Walts vessel
( - ) assignments and Captain Hasclwood s vissulassignments
Okay?
(3) Rumember wh laiked about that?
(4) A Uh huth

1 s Q And I $m$ jusi aboulto bl vou off the stand
(b) You couldn thell from the records or you weren $t$ asked to
(2) tell from the records whether Captan Hazelwood and Mr Watts
(3) were in the same port together assuming they came in on
(4) different ships? Nobody asked you to do that did they?
(5) A I'm sorry could you repeat the question?
(6) Q Mr Watts and Captain Hazelwood - I mgoing to try it with
(7) a couple of questions - could be in the same place and tume
because they came in on the same ship That a a correct
statement? Or they could be in the same place at the same tume
(10) because they came in on different ships that s a correct
( H ) statement isn $($ it $)$
(1) A (Nods head)
(13) Q Two ships come in to Baytown at the same time two friends
(14) see each other they re at the same place at the same tume Do
(15) you understand?
(16) A Yes, I understand
(17) Q You didn $t$ attempt to investigate all of the tumes that
(18) Shaw and Hazelwood - I m sorry all of the tumes that Watts
(19) and Hazelwood were at the same tume in the same place
because
(20) they came in on different ships?
(21) MR SANDERS Object to that as assuming facts not in

1, evidenle
( ', THE COURT It sa tair cross exam Youmay answer
(1) 11
(s) BYMR O NEILL

## Vol $20 \quad 3484$

Q Ithink il sa fair -
( ) A The information that I - reviewed indicated that Jesse
(3) Watts was assigned what has assignments were Andin comparing

## (4) those assignments with the assignments of Captan

Hazelwood
(5) Jesse Watts and Captan Hazelwood sanled together on the
(6) Yorktown in 1985 and also on the Exxon Vaidez
(7) $Q \ln 88$ ?
(8) A That's correct
(9) Q But i m asking the question one step beyond that
(10) Let a assume I wanted to see whether they were together in
(il) Baytown or Texas City or Baton Rouge and came in on different
(l) ships Did you go and do any analysis of the posability that
(i3) they came in on different ships and were together? Was that
(14) something that you lookud at as part of this analyas? Do you
(19) undurstand what I m saying?
(16) A I under what you're saying
(17) Q Do you want me to try at again?
(18) A According to the assignment masters they were not

They
(19) were on the same ship
(n) Q But I m talking about times when they weren t on the same
( I) ship Let staku the second half of 1985 or the first half of
(12) 1986 Now we know they re not on the same ship Did you
(23) try - and I - maybe it s obvious You didn t try to figure
(4) out whithur the ships that they were on came into the same
(2s) port different ships came into the same port? That was not

| BSA | FEDERAL TRIAL TRA |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Vol 203485 |
| (1) something that you analyzed was it? |  |
| () ANo it was |  |
| (7) | MR O NEILL Okay Thank you very much ma am |
| (4) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARSHA SHORTS |  |
| (5) BYMR SANDERS |  |
| (6) Q Ms Shorts I guess this is obvious also You don I know |  |
| (7) If it is so that those two people arrived at the same port on |  |
| 181 different ships? |  |
| (9) A No I do not |  |
| 1101 Q All right |  |
| (11) | MR SANDERS No lurther questoons |
| (1) THECOURT Thank you you may sllp down |  |
| "17 MS STEWART Your Honor delindants call Licutenant |  |
| 1141 Commander Falkenstein by video deposition |  |
| as THE COURT I m sorry the name again? |  |
| (16) | MS STEWART Lieutenant Commander Falkenstein ) |
| 117 | DIRECT EXAMINATION OF THOMAS FALKENSTEIN |
| (18) | BY VIDEO EXAMINER |
| (19) | Q For the record commander would vou identify yoursell' |
| 10121 | A My name is Thomas G Falkenstein I malieutenant |
|  | commander in the United States Coast Guard |
|  | Q When in 1987 did you arrive in Valde ${ }^{\text {? }}$ |
| 131 | A I reported in on July 31st 1987 |
|  | Q And who was the commanding officer in Valder at that lime |
|  |  |

Vol $20 \quad 3486$
III Q Did you remain in the position ol cxacutive offi tr durint
() the entire time that you were stationed in Valdes'
in A Yes sur

- Q Can vou descrihb what vour dulich whreascraculive uflicur

I in Valdcy"
A The executive officer runs the adminutr itimion
admanisters the operation of the unit The commandiag officer
dictates what's to be done and the executive officer sees to
it that it's carmed out by the appropriate departments within
(10) the unat
(II) I was assigned as the alternate captain of the port and in
(12) the captan's absence or the commanding officer sabsence 1
(13) would be the acting officer in charge of marine ins pection as
(14) well as acting commanding officer
(1s) My duties required me to be fully aware of anything the (10) commanding officer was aware of so that in the event of his II unability to command or his absence that I would be able to (18) step in and carry out his duties
(19) Q Did you have rusponsibility for the opcration of the VLssal
(o) Traffic Service?
(.1) A Not directly
(2.) Q Did you have indirect rusponsibilili心)than?
(") A The head of the department the divinion was responsible
( 4) for the direct supervision and operation of the Vessel Traffic
(25) Center reported to me

```
momething that you analy7ed was it 
A No it was
MR O NEILL Okay Thank vou verv much ma am
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARSHA SHORTS
BY MR SANDERS
QMs Shorts I guess this is ubvious also You don I know
If it is so that those two people arrived at the same port on
different ships?
A No | do got
Q All right
Nolurther question
THE COURT Thank you you may slup down
STEWART Your Honor dullndanis call LItutenani
Con
THECOURT Im sorry the name again
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF THOMAS FALKENSTEIN
Q For the record commander would vou identify yoursell'
A My name is Thomas G Falkenstem I malieutenant
commander in the United States Coast Guard
Q When in 1987 did you arnive in Valde&?
Q And who was the commanding officer in Valdez at that lime?
A Steven McCall
```

the captan's absence or the commanding officer sabsence
would be the acting officer in charge of marine inspection
well as acting commanding officer
My duties required me to be fully aware of anything the
unability to command or his absence that I would be able to
Q Did you have rusponsibility for the oparation of the $V_{L s s u l}$
Noi directly
Cent reportor
Traffic

Q And who was that commander?

1) A That was I ieutenant Rice
(3) $Q$ Whan - when whre vou first nolificd of the grounding?
(A) A Approximatelv $12 \mathbf{3 0}$ in the morning
" QWhosalled vou'
(0) A Mr Blandford
(7) Q What did Mr Blandiord icll you'
(x) A He informed me the F won Valdez had gone aground on

Blugh
91 Reef
(10) Q Now about what time did vou arrive at the Vesqel Traffic
(ll' Center)
(1) A Approximately 1240
(13) Q And who was prisent when you arrived?
(1s) A Mr Blandford radio operator I believe that's all
asi Q And was Commander McCall whih you?
llat A Yes ulr
(17) Q On what - onto what part of the Exxon Valde7 did you
"।81 evcnituallv hoard'
(1s) A We boarded from the starboard side near midships
(20) Q And what did you do upon boarding the vessel?
( 11 A The - the seaman at the head of the ladder directed us to ( ) the bridge Weanked him where the captain was itheve and
1 3) he indicated the brigge and we proceeded immediately to
the
(24) bridge
(s) Q Now when you say we who - who else was with you?

## Vol 20 3488

A Mr Iawn and Mr Delozier
(' Q What did you do then'
(3) A Wegut up on the bridge I arnved on the bridge I
(s) believe there were three people on the bridge at the time
the
Isi best of my memory One was near center line of the ship
(A) pacing There was unother one in the corner and I belteve
the
(7) third was standing at the helm position
(x) I asked the one near the center line of the ship if he was
(4) the captan And he directed me toward the pont comer port
(10) forward corner of the pilot house
(II) Q And did you coml upon the captain al that point?
11) A Yes sir I went oyer and spoke to the captan

131 Q All right Who was with you whin you went over and spoke
(14) to the captarn?
(1s) A No one
1161 Q How long did this conversation lasi?
(i7) A Three - five minutes maximum Probably about three
(18) minutes
(19) Q Did Mr Deloaier some over and join you at some point?
roi A No sir
1" Q Was hc continuing totalh to Mr Lawn?
1 1 A Yes sar I believe sos
( ' Q Thun how did the conversation and' Did you walk away or
( 4) did the captain walk away what happencd?
( 1 ) A I walked away ur

Q You walked away What did you do thin?
A I went over to explana to Mr I awn what I had been told
We discussed the situation a little bit between us
Mr Delozier I believe then went and got into a discussion with the captann bnefly
Q And commander did you - did you say anythang to etther
Mr Lawn or to Mr Delozter when you first came over to them about smelling alcohol anywhere near Captain Hazelwood? A No sir
Q Now what happened next?
A After my discussion with Mr Lawn Mr Delozier returned and undicated he wanted to talk to me on the brigge wing ad we
went outside
Q And did you - what occurred then out on the bridge wing?
A Mr Delozier asked me if I'd smelled the captan's breath
And I andicated I had I said yes Ite said that we needed to - something along the lines of we needed to do blood test for
(18) drugs, alcohol
(19) Somewhere in there I - I suggested to him that maybe the (20) captain had just seen his career go down the tubes and gone
1 11 down do get a drink afterwards I huow that he pointed out
( -) that we had to consider the other possibility that he had
been
('3) dranking before the ship went aground that we bad to cover
4 the - dll possibilities by ordering the tevt
And we then went back minde after that discunvinil und

## Vol $20 \quad 3490$

I) notified the commanding officer

Q Now you whre Mr Dulozitrssuphrior correct?
A Yes sar
Q Who actually made the dubiston to procucd with the alcohol (cstıng)
A I made the phone call to the commanding officer to
request
2. that we get the chemical tests or breath als aer if pownible the equipment out to the ship to unake the tests
Q What was the authority undur whi h you wure procecding in
making that recommindation?
ill A Under - I don $t$ recall the number in the code of federal
(i2) regulations under Title 46 which authorizes the Coast Guard to
(13) conduct chemical tests or to have the employer conduct the chemical test
Q Whan did you mahe that phonc tall to Commander McCall?
A I don't recall the exact time It was within one hour after we got aboard the vhip
Q Was il farrly immidialcly allur this hridge wing
conversation you dusuribud with Mr Dulopicr'
AYes sur
Q Whan you had thin cunviraalion with himi rulative lia the
blood icst undur what duthority whre gou thinhlile ahoultahing
(his blood last at that time)
A Lader the provision of the law whindein $\mathbf{t}$ quate at exactiy which permat the Coast (iuard to urder a test or havea

5-31-94
VOLUME 20
XMAXISs,
, test conducted after a major marne casualty
, Q So if I understand this correctly this is a test that
would be administered to all of the crew members that were on
(4) watch during that particular casualty is that correct?

A Yes, sir
Q It s clear in your mind that the suggestion for this test,
then came from Mr Delozier is that correct?
A Yes, sir I think you could say that
Q If Mr Delozier had not spoken to you on the bridge wing at
that particular point in time would you have considered
ordering a blood alcohol test at that particular point in time?
A Probably not
Q Now in your observation of Captain Hazelwood when you
spohe to him in the wheelhouse did you see any angas which
led
(1s) you to beiseve that he was intoxicated or under the influence
of alcohol?
A Other than the odor of alcohol in and around the area of
Captain Hazelwood alone, no
Q Did he appear lucid to you?
A Yes sir
Q Was there anything about his - was there anything about
him standing there which would lead you to believe he was
3 unsteady or unable to sland properly?
A No sir
is) Q So thuru was nothing other than this alieged smell that you

[^42]
## Vol 203493

Hazelwood of his command of the Exxon Valdez on that night is that correct?
A Yes sir
4) Q In fact Captain Ha7elwood remained in command of the Exxon
(5) Valdez until he was relieved by another Exxon master I believe (6) it was Capt Deppe later on?

A Friday evening yes, sir
Q Right When you spoke with Captain Hazelwood regarding his
instructions to Cousins as to where to turn the vessel did
either you or Captain Hazelwood indicate the position with reference to the char'?
A Yes, sur, pointed it out with his finger
Q And to what did he point to?
A Pomed toward Busby Island
Q Now do you recall what point ifany Captain Hazelwood pointed to with regard to Busby Island?
A No sir Busby Island is a very small island I
(18) understood that - you know abeam of Busby Island seemed very
(19) clear to me So there was no point that I specifically asked (20) hum to point to
(1) Q As you sit here today commander what s your best
(2) recollection as to what Mr Delozier told you that Hazelwood
(3) had told him regarding Hazelwood s instructions to - 10
(24) Cousins to turn the vessel?
(2ك) A To my best memory, Mr Delozier indicated that the captan

## Vol 203494

(I) had directed the third mate Cousins to commence a turn back
() into the shipping lanes at a mark and be indicated a - a 38
(3) fathom mark and Mr Delozer I belseve said that Captan
(4) Hazelwood circled that particular mark That mark is abeam
(9) of - roughly abeam of Busby Island
(6) Q Now just to make it clear when you asked Captan
in Hazelwood where he had inatructed Cousina to turn would it be
(8) correct to say that he did not point to that 38 fathom mark but
he pointed to Busby Island?
(10) A He pointed toward Busby Island The island itself has a
(II) lught on at That's an easy reference to figure out when (12) you're abeam of Busby Island He didn't specifically point $t 0$
(13) a 38 fathom mark he didn't carcle anything when be was in (14) discussion with me
(15) MS STEWART Your Honor it a that time We have
(10) about ten more minutes We can continue tomorrow
(In THE COURT Ladies and gentlemen we will adjourn for (18) the day Please remember my instructions not to read or insten (19) to anything about the case We ll see you at 800 tomorrow (20) morning Counsel remain for a few minimums please
(21) (Proceedings recessed at 200 pm )

INDEX
( FOR THE DEFENDANTS
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JACK MENDELSON
3275
(s) BYMR RUSSO 3275
(7) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JACK MENDELSON

3297
(8) BY MR O NEILL 3297

1101 REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JACK MENDELSON
3320
(11) BY MR RUSSO 3320
(13) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL FOX (read) 3324
(14) BYMS STEWART
(16) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL FOX (read)

3338
(17) BY MS WAGNER 3338
(19) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARK PIERCE 3343
(20) BY MR SANDERS
( 7 CROSS EXAMINATION OF MARK PIERCE 3385
(.1) BY MR O NEILL

[^43] FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT

5-31-94
VOLUME 20
xmaxisn

Vol 203497
Vol $20 \quad 3499$

Vol 20 3498

1. DIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARSHA SHORTS 3470
$\because B Y M R$ SANDERS
(d) CROSS EXAMINATION OF MARSHA SHORTS
3480
, BYMR ONEILL $3+80$
2. REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARSHA SHORTS 3485
18, BYMR SANDERS 3485
(10) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF THOMAS
FALKENSTEIN 3485
แい BY VIDEO EXAMINER 3489
(1) EXHIBITS
Ils, 347 ! ollered 3424
14, 3476 A olfcrad 3470
17,7420 ullurud 3476
x1 7419 wllurud 3478
4) 7424 ullcrad 3480
5) 3471 rechivad 3424
13476 A ruccivad 3470
(3) 7420 racuived 3476
(4) 7419 reseived 3478
( S$) 7424$ received 3480

Beax Syинан Appicatuas
Look-See Concordance Report

UNIQUE WORDS 2,978
TOTAL OCCURRENCES 14,135
NOISE WORDS 385 TOTAL WORDS In File 43,888

SINGLE FILE CONCORDANCE
Case sensitive
NOISE WORD LIST(S) NOISE NOI

Includes all. TExt OcCURRENCES

IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES (4 BOTTOM of Page

| - 1 - |
| :---: |
| $1000\|2\| 3351 / 2344017$ |
| $10151113351 / 3$ |
| 10th \|1| 345518 |
| 1201 \| 1342478 |
| 121711134249 |
| $1230\|1\| 34874$ |
| $1240\|1\| 348712$ |
| 14th [1] 34792 |
| 15-foot [1] 33597 |
| 15th [2] 3419234207 |
| 17th \|1| 34734 |
| 18th $\|8\| 3344163345161818$ |
| 3351212533532333542 |
| 33557 |
| 19-and-85 \||| 340424 |
| 1970s $113346 / 5$ |
| 19 th \|5| 335645102021 |
| 100111334121 |
| 1st\|3| 34071334357 |
| 34483 |



34783
31st [2| $3485 \quad 23 \quad 349914$ 3476-A 7 l $3470 \quad 10 \quad 18 \quad 19$ 2034761834981622 38-fathom |I| 34948
3rd [1] 33864

| -4- |
| :---: |
| 4-16-85 [11 34257 |
| 4/1 [1] 341022 |
| 4/20/89 [1] 34258 |
| 4/29 [2] 342516 |
| 40-foot [1] 335315 |
| - 5- |

5/15 11134177
530111335819
-

600 [1] 34417
6th [1] 34722
$\cdots-7-$

70s $1113346 / 4$
76-A |11 347620
70011133394
7th |1| 3444 10
-

8-21 95 |11349921
8/1/85 |1| 34237
8/15/85 |113421 22
80s (1) 339523
800121344110349419
$801|1| 3275$ ?
8th $11 \mid 340418$

- -9-

90-day |1| 331225
958 |11335/ 11
9 9h 14133454341016
34115344410

$\begin{array}{llllll}14 & 17 & 19 & 23 & 34665 & 9\end{array}$
 34791234802349017 34921215
absence [29] 329413
33131433722333746
$\begin{array}{llllllll}17 & 20 & 25 & 3375 & 3 & 33768 & 24\end{array}$
3377243417824
341813341982034201
93421223422221
342581734324348612 17
Absolutely [3] 32948
33218346922
absolutely [3] 328720
329221332723
abstan [i] 33209
Abstinence [2] 330267 abstunence [2] 3301 23, 330721
Abuse [2] 327816329825
abusive [2] $330025 \quad 33013$
Academy (1) 334325
academy [!] 332425
acceptance [1] 331015
accepted [2] 328417 331017
access 111341515
accident [2| $33 / 1223324$ /4 accomplushment 1113278 /8
accord $13 \mid 3303$ I2 1415
accordance [1] 32914
According [2] 330020 348418
according (3) 32871
335123345110
accountant [2] 330125
33029
accounts [1] 342819
accrued [1] 337715
dccurate [3] 3300722 349910
accurately [1] 34805
acheve |S| 328722328923
32905330217331824
achueved [2] 328623
330215
achieving (2) 3351 35
acknowledged (1] 32999
acknowledgment [3]
$329913 \quad 14 \quad 33165$
actung [4] $339563400 \quad 16$ $3486 \quad 13 \quad 14$
action $[3] 333318 \quad 333914$
33863
actions |1| 340017
actuve (I) 34119
actuvitues 14 | 330413
$339025 \quad 342817344519$ actuvity [2] $3292 \quad 17 \quad 3428 \quad 19$ actual $[2] 333013 \quad 33434$
Adams (7) $34516 \quad 34548 \quad 10$ 17253455414
add $|5| 33051615$
338619341414
addict (3) $331525 \quad 331634$ addicted [2] $331522 \quad 25$
addicts [3] $331410 \quad 331521$ 22
addition [9] 32792232833 3331733339333422
$\begin{array}{llllll}3335 & 11 & 14 & 15 & 336813\end{array}$
address [12] 32751619
3324633435340469
3444121434561334584
346214347022
adequacy [1] 331318
adequate [4] 3306712
330712332112
adjouning [1] 348111
ddjourn [1] 349417
admunistered [2] 34053
34913
adminstering [1] 340525
administers [1] 34867
administration [4] 33862
34281834582434866
Administrature [1] 342810
adminustrative [5] 33691
33801534051,340624,
342811
admiss.on [4] 342321
$347610347820 \quad 34808$
admut [2] $32812 \quad 342513$
admitted [7] 33453341216
34242347019347614
347824348012
admonish [1] 340924
advance [2] 3422334302
advice [2] 33372342021
ddvise (1) 3377 I
advised [1] 34303
advisor [1] 34191
affaur [1] 337115
affect [4] 32822334912
$335710 \quad 11$
affected [2] 33652433887
affecting [3] 33871122
338816
affects $141331616 \quad 25$
33171336524
affiluate [1] 328013
affiluated [1] 328014
Aftercare [2] 330169
aftercare $\begin{array}{lllllllll}20 & 3294 & 14 & 15 & 17\end{array}$
233295457330114

3310231033131
afternoon [9] 33521
33562433573717
335811019336622
afternoons [1] 33846
afterwards [3] 33371
34017348921
agency [6] $327815 \quad 20 \quad 21$
22253279 I
aggression [1] 33179
agree [4] $3300 \quad 23330123$
33101318
agreed [1] 33677
agreement [3] 33056
34741618
aground [2] 34878348923
ah [1] 344612
ande (1) 332417
aur [I] 33537
ALASKA [2] 349913
Alaska [9] $332412 \quad 332612$ 333921335720335915 34023345616349920
Alcohol [8] 32781632828 329825331014331410

331521331719
alcohoi-dependence [1]
331516
alcohol-dependent [1]
331515
alcohol related [14] 327721
328026328117328210
3283121253284415
33041533101633209
alcoholic [13] 329612
330018330125330229
13173314153315715
33171133303338418
Alcoholics [15] 329210
33011533034111618
3309333123331420
33154123317433748
33924342518
alcoholics $[6] 330017$
3301243302814331311
Alcoholism [12] 32781116
328351032842329825
329973300 II 15330320
331311331516
alcoholsm [40] 32792
328373284732871920
2/ 23328845732893
32932691332947
32984101733001013
330171012133302413
3303133091331010
3311120331224
331523331719331912
141933232
alerted [1] 33758
alleged [2] 34608349125
alleviate [1] 329525
allow [3] $337923 \quad 3406$ 11
34362
allowed [1] 33075
alone |1| 3491 18
alpha |11 347620
alternate $[2] 3306 \quad 18$
3486 /1
America [2] 33051433141
American [5] 327625
32811623328322328616
Amnesce (1] 33088
amount [2] 32774328923
amounts [1] 33117
analogous [1] 327818
analysis [2] $348412 \quad 14$
analyzed [1] 3485 1
anchored [1] 334517
anonymaty [1] 330317
Anonymous [1] 329210
33011633034111618
330933312333748
33924342518
anonymous [21] 336014
10336227336462024
336639132533726
3387820338810339015
1933911133948
anonymously [1] 328215
Answer [17) 33861317
33878339431124
339583465142434662
46914171922
answer [21] 33021833076
331078331393387415

3390 I1 339320339447
183395271134316
345714346411346814
348323
answered [2] 3370 13
340319
answers [1] 338622
anxiety |11 331725
anybody $1141333 / 833726$
$33755343220 \quad 344122$
34429121534492325
34502345318346512
347813
anymore [11 345218
anywav [11 33406
anywhere $\{2133381034898$
apart |313361 $20 \quad 34032$
347525
apologize |21 3322 I7
334524
appear [4| 3341 18 3491 19
3492 /2 /8
appearance |l| 33402
appeared [1] 3381 |
appearing |1| 3317 /2
applies [1] $33 / 425$
apponted [2] 3278632798
apprectate |II 33195
approach [6] 334424
33514335912346917
3471 18347617
approached (1) 345215
approachung $\{2 \mid 32972$
335817
appropriate 171330124
33028336720337116
$3479253480 / 34869$
approval $|3| 33391033686$ 33967
approximate [1| 340812
Approximately $|\varsigma| 32822 /$
24333573487412
approximately $\mid 111328124$
533259333117334416
$33543344518 \quad 344619$
3454 || 34719
April 112133875338917
34071334093341016
341153417134207
$344833473434758 \quad 14$
area 1 10 327612328517
$3330253331 / 33353 / 4$
336224348110349117
34924
areas [2] 3276 I] 32844
aren't |l| 3481 ||
arm (4) 33314333422
340356
arrange [2] 329612337425 arrival [1] 335819
arrive [2] $348522 \quad 348710$
arrived $[5) 332524347316$
$348573487 / 334883$
article $1213282 \quad 14 \quad 15$
artucles [6] 3282182224
253283333145
ascertamed 111329819
ashore [3] 334921345213
345324
Astan (1) 33583
asıde [1] 34738
asking 16133282133387
33803339323344617
34849
aspect (1) 335025
aspire [2] 3302 / 9
assugn |3| $3460 / 415$
34625
assugned |6| 3343 /7 3450 万 7934843348611 assigniment |2이 334319 341781416182023
$3418 / 8-34282343317$
3470103471121522
34725934746347622
$25347733484 / 8$ assignments $[7] 342721$
345921348222348434
assistance $|3| 3316 \quad 10 \quad 12$ 336814
assistant |8| 33241934538
$345991215 \quad 346514$
347112
associate 11132786
associated [ 5 ] 329522
330173317833708 337521
Association $14 \mid 3281 / 6$
328616331678
assocrations (11) 3281 13
assume [10] $329123312 / 8$
33152433171133411
3402193428834469
348410
Assumes ||| 34825
assuming 1313317234833 21
attack |11 331320
attacks |1| 331319
attain |1| 330315
attempt [2] $3434 \quad 10 \quad 3483 \quad 17$
attend $161329423 \quad 330115$
173374633751118
attendance [1] 329419
Attended (2) 3464434719
attended [1] 338116
Attending ${ }^{2} 21338321$
339225
attending 1313383734318
attention (2) 32917338719
August [15| 33772333863
33921634287343015
346314163465734691
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3472 & 19 & 3475 & 7 & 11 & 17 & 18\end{array}$
34792
author [1] 33897
authored (3) $328218 \quad 32833$ 4
authority [9] 333628913
15183490922349221
authorize |1| 341322
authorizes [1] 3490 /2
automobiles $[2] 331810 \quad 14$
avall (1) 336825
available 161329319
330216337593378 /1
3382233450 II
 32913
avoid (3) 3387233388810
avoided (I) 338719
award [4] 327723328322

3284 / 5
awarded [1] 327918
awards [2] $328318 \quad 20$ aware |17| 3296 / 33025 113309633125335424 3376333792133898 339118243392734315 3443243466734861516 dxell| 3425 /3
$\frac{-B_{-}}{\text {B-a-k-er [11 } 3324}$
BC III 338913
baby 111344813
bachelor 111342715
bachelors [11 345823
Back-cast III 3355 15
back-cast |11 3355 /3
backdate |2| 341235 background $1713276 / 4$ 334324340420342713
34442034582234718
backwards [11 3362 /3
badger [1] 346716
Baker |l| 33247
Baltumore lll 342724
har [31 3275910330924
Barbara |ll 33933
Barboula [1] 346216
barometer [2] 335625
335724
Barometric [1] 33537
hase |1| 3365 /5
Based III 34063
based $\mid 10132954632987$
$33041233162234061 / 1$
34681516346920
basc |II 32953
Basically $[2] 335416$
337124
bascally |14| 3289 /
$3348 / 73350 / 4336022$
33646336614336917
$3399213428 / 3344516$
345415345919346325
346424
bass $191328923295 / 8$
3324153355933566
336083384534319
3461 15
basket 14] 3338278113
bath 11133385
bathroom [2] $3338 / 5$
Baton [101 33462333825
3439113458183481810
122021348411
Bay [1] 33474
Bayonne [2] 34501819
Baytown [29] 334814
3362133363433906
339323439 // 346467
34731325347451012
13347529102124
348021232434811711
3483 /3 3484 /11
Bayway |11 345016
Beaufort (2) 3354 // 15
becomes |1| 336523
becoming [1] 336616
beer |191 329923330825
$\square$5


alcohol-dependence to beer

[^44]

(1) 32772332832
-

[^45]

Beave Sy\%erm Appleatura
7332721033281822 332969123330710 333111133332610 $3333193452 \quad 13$
beg 111 331215
behalf [1] 337424
behavior [1| 34928
behavioral [4| 33/14 4
$331420 \quad 3315413$
behind (1) 3388 ।
belief 113429 15
belleve [48] 32951832999
3302153309232433101
333112333243345315
33462333516336012
336233373533826
33874233394 II 21
3396 /5 3397225339818 21 33991123403717 34189 3431/5
3445202434471521
3450183487142234884
6223489434911522
3492163493534943
believed 1413298 /l
3316163379634567
Belmont |1| 32766
belong $1113281 / 2$
BEN 14| 34273343322 34961619
Ben $123 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llllll}3369 & 5 & 14 & 1617\end{array}\right.$ 193370103372633894 713 341622 23 34489 340914163418934221 19222534242134253 34271
benefit |l0| 3292 /4 3368 /2 34072434084341314 $34142434 / 5 / 4342310$ 3428183432 21
benefit related 11134642
benefits |19| 33682534054 25340636711340710 $34124341616 \quad 341820 \quad 23$ 34191161834208
3421 2346325
Benjamin 11134277
beside 111342110
beside |11 339822
Beverdge |3| 33047 // /8 beverage |1| 33303 beverages (1) 338419
Binges |11 330724 bromedical 11133098 bit |23| 3276 /3 3278 /4 $3285 / 432907329925$ 331224331918333110 33492033502533572 3365203379933806 34071434092134117 3418 IS 1634581321 3482 2134893
black 1113365 /8 blackouts 11133089 Blandford |3|34876714 blank [2] $335019 \quad 34145$ Bligh (1) 34878
block [2] 341043412 ll blood $1351329010 \quad 329620$ 2132976330018331113 331416212233155714

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-31-94
VOLUME 20
Canoordence by LDot-Socir 11

3316 / 33183524
332215183330141924
33314578333491822
333973340614348917
349022233491 /I
blow |11 3352 I2
blowup [1] 34755
Blue |1| 33817
blue III 33567
Board (1) 327625
board (36] 33252333261
33272033311233391
33961334002234387
34411420344221012
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}16 & 22 & 3443 & 14 & 19 & 3449 & 23\end{array}$

345316345453457119
3466253467634772324
347810
348718
boarded [2] 3402 2] 348719
boarding ||| 348720
boards [1] 347922
boat 161333920335710
337223396131833971
Boh |3| $3418 / 825341913$
thody 14 | 329 / / $3296 / 7$
33181920
book 1291 32838328423
3298363299624
330012330261118
$33031923 \quad 24330525$
331014331125331316
331436933151233165
1533236333721335410
3359833814
Books 11133817
books |6| 32833329725
33051933148338168
booze |51 346091024
34624346824
boss $12 \mid 33909$
Boston 17132762023
$3278 \geq 327911337719$ 33922533937
hottle $1013328 / 83333 / 9$

bottien $|4| 33332125$
3460) 10

Houlevard III 33437
box 111341518
Boy 11133422
brain 11331617
break |l| 33384
breakdown 111332010
breath |191 $3327 \quad 25 \quad 33282$
10113329671333302
\& $3398172334(x) 14$
$\begin{array}{llll}3403 & 13 & 19 & 344917\end{array}$
34511013346616348915
breathaly/er |11 3490 ) 7
breese 19133541633566 33578 2?
Brewers |\{1 331678
bridge [24| 3326679
 339851534001234015
3402 21 3487222324 34883434891214 34901834919349214 brief |4| 32759330924

33825344419
briefly [5| 3282 12 3298 / $3316 \quad 123368$ /1 34895 bringing (5] 338719
3441243460934624
346824
buddy [1] 340925
bumped [1] 332716

3494591012
business [7] 33871122
338831734263345824
347113
busy (1) 346612
buy $[2] 3313243451 \quad 16$
$-\quad-\quad$ -
cabinet [1] 341521
Californta [1] 32993
Call $12 \mid 32753332325$
caller (19) 3360101724
3361158336227
336424336631333726
338720338810339015
1933911133949
calling [6] $336020 \quad 3366 \quad 13$
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}15 & 3369 & 22 & 3374 & 19 & 3379 & 10\end{array}$
calls (4) $3339 \quad 12 \quad 334414$
33606347424
calm |11 335810
calmed [2] 3356 //
Cambridge 111327519
Canada |2| 3316933583
cancer [1] 327819
capacity [2] 33392340617
Cape |l| 33584
Capt ||| 34936
captains [21 3349 | 2
captioned (1) 3499 11
capture [1] 3342 21
car 11 | 331812
card |11| 34072434088 /1
1634092034101521
$3411783423 / 5344813$
care|II 341116
career [1] $3433 / / 348920$
carefully [1] 329027
cargo |l| 33474
caring |l| 336523
Carolna (I) 3444 16
Carolyn (1) 345615
carried (6] 32832432843
32902432994344022 34869
carry [3| 327711328716 348618
Carter 11134277
case [19] 32756328420
32882 329) 13330919
$332216332723 \quad 3344 / 4$
3353 /4 33767 /4 3414 /5
34221734306343424
$3444173468 \quad 23349419$ 3499 /1
cases [2] 3411 9343620
casual [1] 331712
casualty (2) 349114
catch (11 345217
categories [3] 329115
32928 332/ 20
caught $1213442 \quad 12 \quad 16$ caused [1] 33876
cease [1] 33969
Center [3] 3278 11 348625 348711
center [12] 32765328011
2032851533391334128
1034242334252348858
centers [2] $331616 \quad 17$
Certuficate [1] 34992
certuficates [1] 32771
certification [1] 327625
certufied [1] 32772
CERTIFY [1] 34998
cetera [1] 338119
cham [3] 33411710
chatlenge [1] 33512
Chalmette [4] 345289 34551219
chance [4] 33532433801 1033844
change [9] 329011334315 33518335510337525 3388253406434081622
changed [3] 339510
341315344714
changing (1] 34203
Chapter [2] $331125 \quad 3313$ IS
chapter [3] 330267
331013
chapters [2] 32835331614
characterized (2) $3288 \quad 13 \quad 15$
charge [2] 338924348613
Charles [1] 34165
Charlotte [1] 3444 IS
chart $1813352 \quad 12 \quad 3481 \quad 20$
 check [3] 3330734177
347322
Checked [1] 341818
checked (3) 33396341916
347422
checking [2] 3363 /2
341825
chef $[8] \quad 3435192034417$
3448534515345219
3454523
chefs |11 345922
chemical $[3] \begin{array}{lllll}3490 & 7 & 13 & 14\end{array}$
chemistry [1] 340422
chnef $\{6 \mid 327810 \quad 2022$
32791033446334623
CHM [1] 342124
chop ${ }^{31} 133573111335825$
choppy [2] 335779
Christinas $15 \mid 336220$

chronic [2] 33171122
chronology [1] 340024
cigarette [2] 3445 II 21
circle [3] 34094341712 349413
circled [2] 3409434944
carching [1] 342110
circulated [1] 32829
Caty [10] 3276203279 11
32809103481131516
1724348411
civil [2] 3275733863
clam |3| 332943469 13
clams (1) 33295
clarify [3] 332019338724 34377
Clark [1] 331313
classufication [3] $331024 \quad 25$
340918
classroom [2] 338324
33841
clean [2] $341815 \begin{array}{llllll} & 3421 & 19\end{array}$
clear [10] 32841033117
333625339322343213
2134531434916349319 34946
Clearances 111329616
cleared (11 335519
CLERK [19] 327541315
213324359334324 340435342410345610 1234581314621113 347021
Clincal [1] 328117
clinical [2] 3280332994 closed [3] 33881341518 20
closer [3] 33572034034 34641
closest [1] 34032
cloud [2] 335353354 /8
clouds [1] 33567
Coast [17] 3325 Il 13 3326111533291133355 33398 II 334473396 IS
163397213348521
34901225349220
coast (1913340 10334916
1733543335916337621 3378233921220343125
34391233463132224 348121734824
cocktail [3] 33842022
33857
code [14] 328525328667

| 10 | 33548 | 10 | 19 | 23 | 3355 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

34091934181734726 349011
coeditor (4) 3282732983
6329924
coexist [1] 331720
cogntuve 113331617
cold [1] 33333
colder [I] 335724
colleague [3] 33025
33032433146
colleagues [3] 328324
3284433099
collection [1] 33144
College [1] 342714
college [5] 327615342720
34451346323
column [1] 33553
columns [5] 33521725
335323354811
coma [4] 3297256
comatose [1] 3297 I
Combination [1] 340914
comfortable [1] 335524
coming [11] 335613
33582033661337924
33931334012342324
34342234532434541
34642
command [4] 348617

349222349314
Commander 181332520
33311433321419
$3485 / 416 \quad 348715 \quad 349015$
commander $|5| 34851921$
3487134896349321
commanding [7] 348524
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3486 & 7 & 12 & 14 & 16 & 3490 & 1 & 6\end{array}$ commence $[2] 340910$ 34941
comment $161 \begin{array}{lllll}3310 & 13 & 18 & 19\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llll}3319 & 18 & 3348 & 25 \\ 342917\end{array}$
commented 111343325
commenting [1] 33502
comments [7] 334822
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}3349 & 3350 & 3 & 9 & 17 & 18\end{array}$ 335217
Commerce |l| 344523
commerctal 12 1 34711213
Commesson [1] 349921
commssioned [1] 332421
commat [1] 342523
committee $\left\{2 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lll}32848 & 12\end{array}\right.\right.$
common [4| 3288 /2 20
$331225 \quad 344119$
commonly [3] $331015 \quad 17$
34431
communication 1533779
$340618 \quad 21 \quad 34089343117$
communcations $[9] 333912$
$335015 \quad 24 \quad 338021 \quad 338311$
community |11 3445 /
companon $12 \mid 3283 / 3$
346610
companonway [4] 332716
2234013340323
Company [27] 334315
33443103368824

34132334167342711
$3428 / 691214343514$
151734432534448
345913346223346315
1719
company ||5| 334314
$\begin{array}{llllll}3368 / 4 & 337217 & 342425\end{array}$
3425425342916343022
3433834351034441
3445193447934578
346516
company-sponsored [2]
33479 3381 JI
compare [1] 3477 3
comparing $\{313474315$ 34843
compensation |2| 34053
342818
competent [1] 32776
compile [1] 3478 I6
compiled (1) 328616
complete [8] 32774
32932333359340815
3413193431134701416
completed [121 327789
32781329818333318

$341418 \quad 3422103431711$
completely $[3133 / 44$
$3448 / 7$
completing 12132788
343022
completion $|3| 32761921$ 329517
component [2| 33752124
compromise 11132822
computer [1] 340423
conceal [1] 3311 18
concentratron [1] 33159
concentrations [1] 331/ 13 concern $[513360222$
$338710339413 \quad 347115$
concerned 141331511
33994343415345222
concerning |4| 32958
33124338019342823
conclude (1) 3287 13
concludes [8] 333821
34022340325343319
3434163442434443
34564
conclusion \{2] 331624
33172
concrete [1] 336113
concurrently 111327910
condition |l| $3492 / 6$
conditions |7| $328 / 21$
$3307343344 / 933533$
25335418
conduct $|5| 333628$
3388234913
conducted [101 32847
$\begin{array}{llllll}3332 & 3 & 13 & 17 \quad 20 & 333419\end{array}$
338711223388163491 /
conference [2| 33821
338910
conferences 171334710

338219
confidentral $161341 / 18$
$341510 / 3 \quad 3423 / 6$
3425213426 I
confidentidity 121 337820
337914
confirm|l|33299
confronted 11133129
confronts |11 $33 / 29$
confused $121337993421 / 5$
confusion [2| 3322817
conjunction [7] 327714
328042432841932878
3288 / 32966
Connecticut [1] 34283
Conner [11 3340 I]
consensus |1| 328623
consequence |21 3279 /8
$3319 / 3$
consequences |1| 32792
Conservation [2] $3326 / 3$
34024
conservation |1| 3429 /]
conservative-but-a reason
[1] 329018
consider $1813346 \quad 19 \quad 33995$
340310341411343412
346857348922
considered [5] 3349 I
$341118341823 \quad 34208$
349110
consistencv ||| 329224
consistent |9| 3296) /6
3291121632923822
32932832943
consists $1213281 / 1932821$
constant |4|3355 1233567
335724
consult |2| 33352134739
consumed 1313327710
34927
consumes [1] 330822
consuming (1) 330819
consumptron 141330025
330133308133117
contact |14|3326 333685
24336923516337212
3373433755339122
3399173416634641
contacted $15 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lll}3372 & 17 & 21\end{array}\right.$
33731234302425
contain |1| 347917
contained [2] 3339734724
container (1) 334025
contans | 2 | 3472634999
context 181329524331019
$33151718 \quad 331915$
335321339412341910
Contunent |11 33583
Continuation 1113308 /1
continuation $|2| 32756$
$3294 / 8$
continue [7] 32955331011
33372134184341915
34339349416
contunued (6) 334616
334783356533814
$3443 / 419$
continuing [1] 3488 21
continuous $\{21332121 \quad 25$
continuously [31 33252
$336125 \quad 336213$
contributed [21 32835
33052
contributions $|2| 328617$
33044
Control III 3278 //
control |4|3279 3330720
$3316 / 833298$
controlled [2] 329024
330216
conversatons $\{9 \mid 33348$
$33725337317 \quad 338018$
33821334226343017
34611415
conviction [2] 330023
33012
convoluted [1] 346918
Cook III 33578
cook $16 \mid 343522343621$
34402134544534552
cooking [1] 343521
cooks 111345922
cooperating [1] 3326 IS
coordinated [3] 329713
33902534052
coordinatung [1] 343214
coordmator [2] 339023
33913
copied [1] 342520
copy $[5] 331324 \quad 25 \quad 34155$
734401
cornea |l| $3448 / 4$
corner $13 \mid 3488$ 6 9 In
Corporatmon [4] 3285 /1

3298222332991




$\qquad$

$\qquad$
-

\author{

}
$\qquad$

$\qquad$

$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

$\qquad$<br>
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
-
,
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$











$\qquad$



-


相




[^46]Benc Sywerse Applicuician
corporatron |11 34285
corpsman (1) 33313
correctly (3) 333979
34912
correspond [1] 334712
correspondence [2] 33814
338215
corresponds [1] 33555
cortical [1] 331616
cotton (1) 344520
couch [1] 3331 1
Council (ll| 3299 || 1517
3300 /1 $1533048 / 118$ 2333051333168
Counsel [2] $3376 / 3 \quad 349420$ counsel [5] $337613 \quad 3385 \quad 17$
338910340924346510
counseled [1] 343125
Counseling [2] 33682021
counseling [3] 336816
337922343224
count [1] 347813
countries [1] 33113
County |l| 34452
couple 110133002332019
337019340356342724
$3445 / 1346010348020$
34837
course 120133038330716
33415334321334417
3358223360933724
33831114212224
338421011339914
3404233476734792
courses 111333914
COURT [3513275 522
32841732971933078
3310733137332323
$334425 \quad 3351915 \quad 335913$
$3385 / 4 \quad 3395 / 416$
34092534242511
3426253462934691016 $34705193471 / 93476 / 4$ 19347824348012
$3482 / 3$
$\begin{array}{lllllll}3483 & 23 & 3485 & 12 & 15 & 3494 & 17\end{array}$
Court |9| 327539334235
33463213404 / 343417
34444345724
court 111340317
courtroom [2| 33102
338517
Cousins |9| 33271234939
243494 / 7
cover |3| 34812023
348923
covered |l| 34722
covers |2| 3471243472 /
crack [1] 334024
cracking [4] 34578981516
credentuals [1] 3283 17
crew 111133301933355
3340733494336524
3405153459172134789 34913
crewman |11 339714
crime $12 \mid 33261723$
crisis 111331121
criteria $11713286 / 8 \quad 328722$ $233288 / 329021330010$ 122021330821331017

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
21 3320213321316
33225332315
criterion [1] 332117
critucal [1] 338012
criticism [11 335014
critucisms (2] 3350811
CROSS [22] 329721
33382333851534027
34241334332234427
3456173461634673
348018349571622
$34967 / 319 \quad 253497612$
2134984
cross |6| 340325343321 3434163442634443 34569
cross-exam [1] 348323
cross-examination [1] 34026
Cross-examine [1] 3424 11
cross-examine [2] 329719
338514
cryptic |1| 33925
current [1] 344722
currently 1313427810
34354
custodian ||| 347114
custody 13133412710 customary 11133456
cut |1| $3307 / 7$
————
DC $12 \mid 329916 \quad 330412$ daily $[6] 3306712330711$
3321111833608
Dallas|3| 3381213383 l 19
DAN 14| 33951934027
349647
Dan $\mid 5133951718339725$ 3402323
dark 113365 IK
data $11 \mid 3302$ I6
date |26| 33622337017
337311338916339610
3407121534081224
3409243410172225
34141834162534172
$3421101316 \quad 347278$
3473253475 // 34793
DATED | 1 | 3499 /4
dated |11 3428 2?
dates 131344812347212 347519
day $12 \times 133072233317$
$3345 \neq 202133526$ y 14
335591833563918
336253366232433672
33782533832333894
33941634071112
34381434413346613
$3494 / 83499 / 4$
day tu-bay 11133559
days |24| 3294 1/ 337019
3375433768341722
34188341958343812
13344493448163454 I/
12173459163472814
347525347638348024

dealong I2l 33494336124
dealnggs [6] 34642234686
91619346921
dealt [2] 339756
death [1] 33159
decaliter [1] 331417
deceased [1] 33183
December [2] 336220
344810
decency [1] 331225
decide [2] $331912 \quad 348214$
Decided (1] 344520
decuded [4] 3295 / 3310 I/
33681344422
Deciliter (1) 331418
deciliter (13) $331417 \quad 19 \quad 23$

$\begin{array}{lllll}21 & 22 & 23 & 24 & 25\end{array}$
decmeter [2] 33111617
decision [3] 32953434904
deck [38] 332524334418
21 33452121317

33539335412025
$335815 \quad 33598339722$
$34401923344113471 / 5$
347391921223474 | 6 $93479914151720 \quad 24$ 25
deduce |1| 337517
deened (1) 330121
Deep [1] 33817
deep [2] 33477340515
Defendant [12] 340719
34081341425342322
342423475534761418
34782034805812
defendant [1] 347610
DEFENDANTS |1| 34952
Defendants |1| 3427 I
defendants 1713275 /1
33422533951734041
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllll}3433 & 19 & 34424 & 3485 & 13\end{array}$
defense 111333821
define [2] $\begin{array}{llllll}3302 & 13 & 3322 & 14\end{array}$
defined 13| 32892122 32909
defines [2] 33062533072
definite [1] 336314
Definately [1] 3453 /7
definttron |l| 332117
Defintions |11 331310
defintively $1113386 / 3$
degree 1713279141517
$18 \quad 342715345824347110$
Delozier |34| 33265 /1
$3328 / 821332915 / 8$
3331 153332203333 /1
24333458333516
333720 3341 253342710
1633972343488119
34894711153490219
3491793493222534943
demeanor [1] 34929
Denham [1| 34586
Denise [1] 34585
dental |1] 336813
deny III 346710
DeOLIVEIRA |4| 343423
3442734962225
Def)livera |4| 343421
$3435 / 348153482$ II
departed (1] 335125
Department [5] 33166
33261234023344523
department [23] $327910 \quad 24$
332415332525338923
243405234152434163
734284342971625
34304253431434467
34539346116348623
departments [1] 34869
departure [1] 333125
dependence [6] 3289318
$3293912 \quad 20331011$ dependencies [1] 331311
dependency $[5] 328835$ $336815 \quad 1719$
dependent [6] 3290121
$329220 \quad 3296819331716$ depends [3] 330915
33181933197
deposed [2] 3386334684
deposition [26] 33242
338692433881322
$\begin{array}{llllll}3393 & 12 & 15 \quad 339415\end{array}$
33951834272343420
34351343919344039
344453451734567
346073461810346828
15348514
Deppe [1] 34936
depressed [2] 328915
33403
depression [23] 3288 11 2]
2232941033159331718

332325891718
$338523 \quad 338618$
depressuve [2] 328819
331917
derived [1] 328525
describe $11513278 / 4$
329710331312332849
3332223334233340113

3368 /1 34864
described (13) 32784
3291213326143328911
3331 11 333421334020
33502335323345311
349019
describing [2] 328617
$3316 / 4$
description [4] 33121
$331317 \quad 344419 \quad 346923$
designated [1] 338424
designed [1] 336723
desire [3] 33031112
3433 /3
desired [1] 328924
desk 14| 333112333422 345921
despite |l| 3308 /|
detall [1] 333222
detect [1] 336423
detection [1] 33652
determinations [1] 334910 determine [7] 32868
$329025 \quad 337113340525$ 34192534789347911
detour $(2) 334689$
Develop (1) 3347 I

Besce Sivterras Applicatinne
develop［2］ 33141033174 developed［4］ 331919
33573335846
developing［1］ 332617
development［3］ 330024
33013347113
develops［1］ 33157
Deal［1］ 33817
daggnose［3］ 3280525 32816
diagnosed［7］ 328925
33071433082023
3317153321915
dıagnoses（1］ 327712
Dragnosis［s］ 328349
32996330319331014
Dtagnostre［2］ 3286115
dragnostre［13］ 328110
3285253286182023
328722233101721
 dictates［1］ 34868
difficult［4］ 33005331210
33191233503
difficultes［4］ $3288 \quad 15 \quad 17$
18 331122
difficulty 111340116
dinner［4］ $33828 \quad 33848 \quad 17$ 3385 1
dinners［1］ 338418
DIRECT［24］ 327523
33241033438339519
34041134273343423
3444634588346218
3470253485173495413
$19349641016 \quad 2234973$
9183498110
direct $\begin{array}{lllllll}9 & 3303 & 21 & 3312 & 16\end{array}$
3338122234022343320
3442534564348624
directed（4） 333721
3487213488934941 durection［2］ 33534349913 durector 16132764327822 $328019 \quad 2034168341913$ disabilitues（5） 3405 II 20 24340716
Dssabulty［1］ 328421 disability（43） 328571116 33903340547340636 79340710121734099 34101034111913
$341216341320 \quad 25$
341522341616341820 23341915171925 3420681415342139 1316342210342319 3425203430134472324 disabled［3］ 34091534208 34212
dsagree［11 33768
disagreement［1］ 330021
dsappear（1） 3337 11 disappearance［1］ 329616
dsappointed［1］ 331323 discard［1］ 332910 dsscharged［1］ 347317 discipluned（1） 34101 dsciplunes［1］ 328120 dsecoordmation［1］ 331713 discover［1］ 343410

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 531.94 VOLUME 20
（ mendance th Inom Seer（x）
discuss 1313307 \＆ 3336 －17 346620
discussed 181329610
$331319 \quad 332219 \quad 33234$
3380163418934335
34893
dıscussing $\{2\} 332024$
3322 ／6
discussion｜1313301 19 $332917 \quad 22 \quad 3367533805$

$34894 / 1 \quad 25 \quad 3494 / 4$
discussons 14133124
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3378 & 3432 & 19 & 3456 & 25\end{array}$
disease 1 ？ $1330 / 10 \quad 331312$
diseases $|2| 330111$
331024
dishonest［1］ 346820
dsorder［4］ 327722
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}3288 & 19 & 3308 & 12 & 3313 & 12\end{array}$
disorders（4） 3277 ／3 2／
3280 ／ 2
dsparitues｜11 347417
displayed｜！｜ 32856
Dıstalled 15｜ 3299 ／／／5
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3304 & 22 & 3305 & 13 & 33167\end{array}$
distalled（2） 32991723
distunct［1］ 346619
distinction［2］ 332357
DISTRICT［1］ 34993
district［2］ 33952133964
disturb［1］ 335315
diversion（1） 334413
division（2） $3324 \quad 16 \quad 3486 \quad 23$ divorce［1］ 33506
 Doctor $\{2013276732815$
1232824328516328620 $3287 / 8 \quad 3288 / 328917$
$3291 / 2 \quad 3292 / 9 \quad 3293722$
3294213295832966
$332015 \quad 18 \quad 332322 \quad 24$
doctor $1101327619 \quad 328410$
$17 \quad 340610 \quad 341115$
$\begin{array}{llll}3413 & 22 & 24 & 3414 / 8\end{array}$
$3419123434 / 4$
doctoral（1） 327720
document［3］ 328421
32856343118
documents［3］ 343921
3440234709
doesn＇t 1913302333068
$3307 / 331 / 13320 / 2$
34652134812023 door［4］ 3388 । 34079
34152034664
door－type［1］ 33268
doorway［2］ 3336333379
dose［1］ 32973
doses［1］ 331711
double［6］ $329023 \quad 329612$
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}3467 & 15 & 17 & 3474 & 22 & 347717\end{array}$
double－check［2］ 34741921
doubt［2］ 346889
downstairs［1］ 34011
dozen［1］ 344022
Dr $\{33132752532762$
3284／4 19 $3285 / 2$
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}3297 & 18 & 3302 & 12 & 14 & 18 & 19\end{array}$
33147341483415423
341659341910111624
$3420 / 5 \quad 18 \quad 231342124$
342273426 II 1734298
34309103431314
Drank［1］ 33833
drank［6］ $3383 / 4343325$
3434 l 3442222
drastically［1］ 3297 ／3
draw $\{2 \mid 33 / 72340921$
drawing（3） $3330 \quad 13 \quad 19 \quad 24$
drawn｜2｜ 33342233406
Drayton｜11 34073
drew｜｜｜ 33499
drink｜l51 32952325
$33008 \quad 330216332012$
33223334043385 ／I

3449253460 I／ 348921
drinker $[3] \quad 331712 \quad 332045$
drinkers $131331 / 91331420$ 22
drinking 137｜ $3289 / 4$
329510111732964

$330043303 / 1 / 23307 / 7$

3317223320933404
$3439 / 4 \quad 3442 / 6 \quad 3449$／4
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}23 & 3452 & 18 & 19 & 25 & 34574 & 9\end{array}$

drinks［5］ $3318 / 7$ 3319／
25332012
Drive［31 32751934586
347024
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}\text { drive } & 14] & 3318 & 5 & 9 & 12 & 13\end{array}$
driver［3］ $330125 \quad 33029$
338424
drivers［1］ 33184
driving 11133179
drop｜1｜ 335625
dropped｜1｜ 33344
drug $1413276432801 / 19$ 3281 21
Drugs l11 336819
drugs［3］ $3368 / 734579$ 348918
drunk［4］ 33295339921
343426
dryers［2］ 344515
drying［1］ 344516
DSM［3］ $330715 \quad 17 \quad 34133$
DSM III｜31｜ 32842432862

32882432892125
329092132914330525
330624911131425
330711332021332119
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllllllll}3323 & 8 & 15 & 16 & 19\end{array}$
DTR［2］3421 $9 \quad 10$
due［4］ $342219 \quad 20 \quad 34323$
345918
Duke［6］ 3418182534194 34311415
Dukes［1］ 3419 ／3
dutues［13］ 327714327922
32804524339024
339191313428 I／ 15
$34864 \quad 15 \quad 18$
dutufully｜1｜ 34254

334921338022
dysphorıa $11 \mid 331725$

Dysthymis｜l｜ 328715
dysthvmia｜34｜ 328738
32889101132895712

$3293313294316 \quad 22$
$3295916 \quad 20 \quad 22 \quad 24 \quad 32962$
329812331093323457 $10 \quad 15 \quad 16 \quad 17 \quad 19$
————
eg 11｜ $331 / 8$
earty $1813344 \quad 3 \quad 3346 \quad 14$

$338917 \quad 3395 \quad 23 \quad 344423$
ease｜l｜ 3464 ／
easuly｜l｜ 329023
East｜l｜ 34393
east［1］ 34392
easy｜l｜ 3494 ／］
eating $1113288 / 8$
Fconomic［1］ 33166
economics［1］ 342715
edges｜1｜ 336724
edited $16 \mid 32984330325$
$3304 / 4331015 \quad 331125$
editung $12 \mid 3298733054$
editorial｜2｜ 328246
education $|3| 3276$／7
340422344423
educational［8］ $3276 / 4$
$\begin{array}{lll}\text { educational } & 81 & 327614 \\ 33059 & 3343 & 24 \\ 340420\end{array}$
$342713 \quad 3444191945821$
34718
effect［8］ $328924 \quad 329078$
3310434022434361125
343722
effects｜1｜ 3349 ／］
effort［2｜ 32935330720
efforts｜1｜ 340123
eggs｜4｜ $344019 \quad 20 \quad 22 \quad 25$
HHAP｜｜｜ 336923
Fught｜l｜ 3384 I
etght $15 \mid 32814329425$
$3335 \quad 10 \quad 33393338325$
exghth｜11 344421
elected $|3| 328124345011$ 12
electronics［1］ 338322
eligible［2］ $341823 \quad 34208$
elimmate［2］ $3290 \quad 10 \quad 25$
elimination［9］3290 14 I7
1922329123296 II
$331924 \quad 332011$
ELLEN［6］ 34621834673


$\begin{array}{llll}16 & 18 & 3466 & 21\end{array}$
emerged［1］ 331913
emergence［1］ 329321
emphasize［1］ 331520
emphasize［1］ 331520
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}3343 & 12 & 3376 & 19 & 340413\end{array}$
1734271034354345815
3462223471236
employee［10］ $3368 \quad 12 \quad 14$
$243406 / 34282342924$
34301344325347923
employees［4］ 343022
$3464 / 11347921$
employer $\{3 \mid 3445634479$
$\qquad$
 8

$\qquad$
$\qquad$

23

析
dited $|6| 32984330325$
$\qquad$

Fught III 3384 I
etght IS 32814

12
$\qquad$


$\qquad$



$\qquad$
都

\author{

}

$\square$教

3490/3
employers $11 \mid 34457$
employment $14 \mid 33415$
34271934432434637
enable [1] 330217
encounter 111 332712
end (10) 335518338429
339414341919342014
3422153437934509
348823
ended (3) $33641718 \quad 34379$
enforced $|3| 344327$
345623
enforcement |S| 332420
3326 16 $20 \quad 333923443$ //
engage |11 330120
engine [1] 34468
enjoyed [2] 3314833478
eaormous |11 33174
ensure [4] 33416343124
343210343316
ental (1) 342816
enter $\{3132953335822$
337121
entered $18133346 \quad 336218$
337019337121338217
339717 3412/2
entering |3| $341 / 23$
34242234251
enters |l| 335823
entutes $|3| 3299 / 133 /$ R $/ 7$ 18
entutled $1+13283 / 43374 / 3$
34062343424
entrance 11133364
entries 111335221
entry $13 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lll}3294 & 12 & 3425 / 4\end{array}\right.$ Environmental $\mid$ | $3326 / 3$ 34024
environmental [1] 342 x 2]
episodes $11 \mid 331917$
Eplsodic 12133062332120
epsodic |32 32877417
32883243289126813 $329(1) 53292932933$ $3294416 \quad 23 \quad 32451016$
$21329633298123306 /$
24330823332025 $3321 / 41618 \quad 24 \quad 332226$ episodically $|2| 3320$ / 33222
equipment 11134908 equivalent $16 \mid 3308246$ 3322222324 error 11 | 347515 escorted |l| 3326 6 essentially 1113299 21 ESSO |313447 |/ 12 17 establesh 111330818 extablushed $12 \mid 327812$ $32801 /$
establuhment $[\geq 13278 / 7$ $3286 / 8$
estumate I2 328153290 I8 et 11 | $3381 / 19$
ethanol [ 31328923332010 ethical||| 331223
ethics $12 \mid 33122425$
Furopean |11 $331 / 3$
evaluation $|3| 3349271 /$
evaluations $|3| 3281 / 0$

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-31-94
VOLUME 20
Crncondance bo Look Soectas,

3348 23 3350 3
eve 111343717
evening 13133872533856
34937
event |7| $331 / 2133496$
3374193379734172
$3421 / 3486 / 6$
events $|2| \begin{array}{llll}3308 & 8 & 3391 & 15\end{array}$ eventually 141330221
34029345718348718
everybody $131331517 \quad 18$
33465
F vidence $[2] 33401516$ evidence $119 \mid 330019$
331773326172333346 33396933412733453
335516335612335813
341216347015347620
34771634826348322
exacerbated (1) 330812
exact [1] 349016
exactly 112$\} 332720333222$
33353335421335623
3373 /8 3393 /5 3416 /1

examination $|4| 34023$
3433203442534565
exammations 11132775
examine [2] 33/2 19 21
FXAMINFR $116 \mid 339520$
3412 834274343323
343533442834447
$34851834965817 \quad 2023$
$3497 / 4349811$
examining 111331623
example 1413311710
33222133271
exas perated 1113357 /3
exctptron |1| 33599
excess|21330720 331116
exchange $|3| 338156$
33825
exchanged |11 1382/4
exclunive 111328623
Fxcuse 111 330616
excuse 14| 3301 19 339425
$3402 / 3479 / 4$
executive $|4| 3486 / 468$
exhausted 111335316
Exhibit $[3113285233016$
$3345413 \quad 34071934081$
$3412 / 41534 / 4 / 25$
3423223424123
$347010 \quad 18 \quad 20 \quad 3471 \quad 21$
347253475534761215
18347821 22 2534805 y 101213
exhabil $10 \mid 32412+33464$ $3396 / 3423$ 24 347611 exhubiting $12 \mid 329143317 / 3$ F YIIIBI $|\rightarrow| I 349 \mathrm{~K} / 3$ exhibits 1113250 ) 9 expect $12 \mid 329710 \quad 3356 \quad 13$ experience $16 \mid 328321$
3294213296633293 33414344623
experienced |2| 3288 /2
33538
experiencing ||| 329524
experment ||| 33323
Fxperımental |11 328/ 24
expert $|5| 3275$ 12 328216
$3284 / 43419 / 343412$
expertuse [1] 329925
experts [1] 328617
Expires 111349921
explain $[7113282 \quad 12 \quad 32888$
2433221433296335325
34892
explicit [1] 33056
explicitly [1] 32884
expiore [2] $3331 \quad 10 \quad 3385 \quad 19$
expressed [1] 339413
Extend 11134177
extend $1413416 \quad 15 \quad 3418 \quad 24$
341924
extended [2] $338121 \quad 33853$
extension (11) 346325
extent [5] 33586336511
3387 11 21338816
extracted [1] 347422
extremely [1] 336522
eye 12 [ $3448 \quad 13 \quad 17$
eyes [2] 33392433403

- F -
face $11113327 / 833334$
335921338223340220 2234294
face-to |l| 34294
facilitated [2] 3304722
facilities $|3| 328 \mid 2232948$ 9
facility [111 3280332813
$337020 \quad 337121337367$
1234112434242334252
fact $143132878 \quad 3291 \quad 22 \quad 25$
33001733022425
330317330616330710
$33096 \quad 331019 \quad 331415$
331910332119233336
$33469334722 \quad 334821$
$33508 \quad 33742433751720$
3380101233831633846
$233387203391 \quad 11$
339314340218340721
341233414534194
3422 22 34305343211
34611134825349225 34934
factor [4] $3300 \quad 17 \quad 3307$ //
$12 \quad 13$
factory (3) 3445 |l 1421
facts 111348321
faculty 121327843299 /
fair |l4| 3292 /1 330016
3317133411333855
33871834029343624
3438 10) 346113346758
3483 2334841
fairly 14133544335724
$343293490 / 8$
FALKENSTIFIN 12 | 348517 349810
Falkenstem ||5| $33265 \quad 12$
3328192133292023
$3331 / 43332141933978$
93485141620
fall 16 | $332424 \quad 336218$
$33912339223 \quad 339610$
340119
familar $\{3 \mid 32967 \overline{334012}$
34133
family [2] $3385 \quad 223386 \quad 17$
fashon [2| 33021633295
fast (1) 339618
fatal 111331411
fathom $12 \mid 3494313$
FCC [1] 3383 /]
February [IS] 334617
336221344410344616
3447434481134541419
3455817213477711
federal |4| 3383 /l 344645
3490 II
feel [2] $338823 \quad 345312$
feeling [3| 32956336114 336521
feelings (1] 328813
feet $[3] 335718 \quad 33588$
3398 II
fell [1] 34584
fellowshup (1) 328117
felt [12] $329216 \quad 33506 \quad 25$
336524336613336718
$3371 \quad 15 \quad 16 \quad 338015$
3390163394 II 349221
female [2| $3318 \quad 22 \quad 346610$
terry 111339616
field $1313286173316 \quad 23$
34192
fields [1] 340422
nfth $14 \mid 3293 / 3308 / 46$
figure|9| 333123333922
$3467 / 83484233494$ //
figures $11133 / 6 / 3$
file [2| $3422 \quad 18 \quad 342314$
filled |4| 3354 |/ 341013
14342313
filled-out 11134148
final |l| 346923
financral|l| 330510
find 1 I8| 33361633464
3350333672433728
337323337911339710
1/ 341810341912
344323344521345918
$34668 \quad 34682034729$
findings [2] $342963431 / 3$
Fine [1] 329724
fine | 1 | 330619
finger [2] $3361 \quad 16349312$
finsh [2] 33076344014
finsshed [2] 336683444 2)
fired | $1 \mid 13442923$
First |4| 3408 / 34357
343856
fish $13 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llll}3324 & 16 & 17 & 33415\end{array}\right.$
tivellol 32901432913 y
$3318 / 83357 / 834096$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3434 & 17 & 3440 & 22 & 345417\end{array}$
348817
five-foot $12 \mid 335523 \quad 33562$
five-year [2] 3277203278 /
fix |11 3362 /
Flattery $\mid 1133584$
Fleet [2] 34351934485

3359163375633782


34062340716340823

343125343520343824
25344173446934515
3452193454523345713
345991215
21346313222434813 17
flying [1] 33825
focus [1] 339912
fog [2] $3355 \quad 17 \quad 3356 / 4$
follow-up [3] 3339 I
343024343121
followed [1] 331913
Following [2] $3276 \quad 17 \quad 19$
following [9] 327621
328616329412329517
3298193341916346013 34698
food [2] $3445 \quad 12$
foot [2] 335713134014
force |5| 331043354414
335722342012
forecast [1] 335513
foregoing [2] 34999 ll
forever [1] 3383 IS
Forge [1] 34049
forget [1] 3432 I7
forgot [2] 336213446 I
form [21] 328693287 /4
3288 I1 212232916
3292532932333062
331923335021335221
3413102034151434173
5342159342417342925
formal-type [1] 33492
format [4] 33062533072
3311233551
formative 11133033
former (1) 334321
forms [1] 331312
formula [1] 33535
forth [3] 3347614344516
forward (5) $334610 \quad 15$
$338017 \quad 343310348810$
forwarded [11 34154
found 1613336624334524
34421534452234762
foundation |1| 34697
Four [2] 3296253297 I
four [14] 32919329210
33181833442233457
$335510 \quad 23 \quad 33571822$
34481634541116
347122347524
four-or (11) 3356 I
fourth (1) $3465 \quad 12$
FOX [4] $332410 \quad 3338 \quad 23$
34951316
Fox (5) 332413325721 33281733405
frame [13] 3350111337721
3391233430161734486
344933459202434639
122134655
Francisco [5] 334416 334515183347433542
Frank [11] 3430182123
343111424343291721
343315346518
frequent [2] 32952122
frequently [3] 327717
3366 I 3434 I

Friday 11134937
triend |17| 3303243346 //
181933505336020
336145633661417
$337118 \quad 337217 \quad 337613$
3379 /5 $3394 / 2$
frıends [3| $3346 \quad 13 \quad 3365 \quad 17$
348313
friendship $\mid 8$ ) $334615 \quad 16$
212233471133501
33813
front |4| 32991333334
334213347625
Ft [3] $3454 \quad 12 \quad 13 \quad 17$
full $117 \mid 3275 \quad 16 \quad 32798 \quad 12$
21332452233435
33572133939340468
$342753444 / 113456 / 3$
34583346213347021
fully |I] 3486 IS
function |7l| 3282233161
$17 \quad 33221933401419$
34643
functioning [4] 3306713
330712332112
functons 111339910
fund 11 | 330413
funds $1413299193305 / 7$ 21
funks 111336519
$\frac{-G-}{\text { G-uetrer } 11340410}$
G-ueer-r a
Gabble |I| 34322
GABRIFI LA $14 \mid 3404$ //
$342413 \quad 34961013$
Gabriella $12 \mid 340428$
gain [1] 346019
ganed ||| 3292 /3
gallery |II 344016
Galveston [2] 334624 344016
gave $16 \mid 333324335 / 19$
$3369 / 4338716342022$ 34495
gear 111335818
GED III 344424
generated |11 $33 / 623$
generic $\{2 \mid 33023$
gentleman (1) 343820
gentlemen |15| 32755
334620335110335424
33551133611733643
336743379733839
3404193405233408 /I
347125349417
geographic (11) 3481 10
gets [4] 33194335713
3395434068
grant (1) 337124
gast [4] $335022337421 \quad 22$ 337910
give [24] 33007331219
33362033371335011
336072033711339319
3394183395111341323
$34271218 \quad 343025$
34441934459344921
345713346521347216
3475 / $3478 / 2$
given $11+132846329413$ $330515 \quad 17 \quad 331225$
3344193365618338622
339447223400834337
gives $\mid 31330416 \quad 1733549$
giving [2| 33712340312
glass 11133857
glasses (11 33857
goal [4] $327925 \quad 330124$
3302718
goes |3| 3422 // 3432 /8 34792
gotten |2| 337222 342/ 15
government |3| 3446345
grade |1| 344421
graduate |I| 334325
Graduated |1| 3427 14
graduated |2| 340421
345823
grammar |l| 344421
grammarian |1| $3467 / 8$
grant [10| 327723329823
32998101533047
$\begin{array}{lllll}33051 & 121318\end{array}$
granted ||| 33774
grants $12 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{ll}3305 & 15 \\ 19\end{array}\right.$
Graphe |1| 3446 /
GRAVF 1 |4| 34273343322 34961619
Graves $140 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lllll}3369 & 5 & 14 & 16\end{array}\right.$ $\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}19 & 3370 & 3 & 10 & 15 & 3372 & 6\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{llllll}10 & 33894 & 7 & 13 & 1619\end{array}$
$20 \quad 233406222334074$
$340893409 / 4341 / 521$
34126341893422119
222534238342421
34253342715734344
great 13132921433178
33576
greater $1113300 / 8$
gregarious ||| 336523
gross 121330119331713
ground 1313355193358 2
335910
grounding |\{| 33257
$3344 / 73396 / 134793$
34873
group |20| 32842329119
329217329419331223
$337519 \quad 338310 \quad 12 \quad 13$

340823341843425817
347113
Guard |li7 3325 |/ 13
3326 /1 15 3329 // 33355
33399 II 334473396 I5
163397213348521
34901225349220
guard [1] 334010
GUERRA 1413404 /I
$342413 \quad 34961013$
Guerra [7] 34042813
3413 / 341816342624 34322
guess 11013335933422
33612033641733703
339323340312342722
34721834856
Gulf 121335915
gulf 115133491617
$3359163376 \quad 2033782$
$339212 \quad 2034312534391$
 34824
guy $\{2\} 332420 \quad 345212$
guys |3| 3326 Il 3452 I/ 15

- H-
hadn't |l| 33982
half $11213352 \quad 16 \quad 20$
$3396233436 / 344022$
34461934473346310
3479 IS 348421
halfwav |11 3472 I8
Halfax |l| 3445 I
hall|s| 3326733325
3334121533379
hand 119132751333243
33282533291333113
$3333 / 3633432339812$
3399734006340225
34031034043345610
3458 / 3462 I/
handed [1] 3440 I
handing [11 347121
handler $12 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llllllll}3340 & 15 & 16\end{array}\right.$
handling $12 \mid 3339934538$
hands 11133939
happening |11 336525
happens $\{2 \mid 33468 \quad 338017$
happiness 111328816
hard $14 \mid 329922331324$
33612034104
hard-bound [I] 331325
harm |11 331313
Harrison |! 3283 /4
Harvard |18| 3276432785

$32801215 \quad 1732989$
$329910 \quad 20 \quad 33052721$
hat $12 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3326 & 19 & 34057\end{array}\right.$
hate 1113430 /3
havent 1413284 10 12
3298 1733036
Hazelton II 33096
head 17132782133744
$343819345553483 / 2$
348623348721
headquarters [1] 34285
healed [1] 3448 I7
Health [4] 327724327813
17330516
health (1) 336821
hear l91 3325710334811
$344124344215 \quad 345219$
34571434581034715
heard 15133099344219
$3457 \quad 12 \quad 3481616$
heart [2| 33131920
heavy |l| 331722
heck |1| 333924
heught (1) 335716
held [〔| 32802332826
$3292 \quad 15333333499$ /1
Helen $13 \mid 33758 \quad 337718$
Hell |l| 33996
hello [1] 340223
helm [1] 34887
help $120 \mid 33107333718$
3339 // 3349933647


336979337125337420 3376134068934568
346411
helped |1| 34004
helpful [2| 329217 3301 2]
helping 11134417
helps $11 \mid 33108$
HERBY [1] 34998
$H_{1}|3| 339725340223$
High |2| $331 / 1534632$
high $16 \mid 3296 \quad 20$ 331/ /3 15 $3355 / 5 \quad 3356 / 2 \quad 33587$
higher (1| 3317 11
Hunchmbrook [1] 335817 hrre [1] 332420
hured [3] $33241416 \quad 25$
huring [1] 332424
histories [3] 33007347115 34773
history [9] 341222342719
$347010347123 \quad 347259$ 3474634762225
history-type |1| 33818
hit |l| 344813
hobby 111344625
Hold 121340818341420
hold $|2| 328 \mid 16 \quad 32824$
holding 121 $334023 \quad 3393 / 3$
holuday |l| 336220
holidays $[2 \mid 3436323$
home 1913347202433481
233632333771424
3406534453
Hondo |2| 339337
honest 141345122346857 $3469 / 4$
honesty $1413468 / 1 / 14$ $34699 ?$
Honor |27| 3275 // $3284 / 3$ 33092233442433453 3351714335912339513 17340225340325 34232134244343319 $3434 / 63442434443$ 34564634621034706 $3471 / 8 \quad 3476 / 8 \quad 3485 / 3$ 349415
honordry $1313279 / 3 \quad 15 \quad 18$ honors 12132831820
hope | 2132793 3380 9
hoped |l| 34338
hopefullv |11337? /
Hopkins $1213276 / 632945$
hormone 1113282 ?
Hospital $\mid 1+1327662023$ 327823279 // 3280 y 10 $\begin{array}{lllllllllll}12 & 13 & 14 & 17 & 18 & 25 & 3299 & 2\end{array}$ hospital $11013280163371 /$ $\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3 & 6 & 3392 & 2418 & 24 & 34257\end{array}$ 342924343013
hospitali/dtion [2| 34299 3430) 6
hospitalired 111342516 hour $171 \begin{array}{lllllll}3296 & 15 & 17 & 33545\end{array}$ $33962334791634 \times 116$ hourly $1313296 / 73344$ 2/I 23
hours $11213318 / 833393$ 334422334573355111 33591033832333841 $33962034038 \quad 347110$

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
house 111348810
Houston 11513324733482
33695337563404921
34224342725342826
3433173459 1/ 346216
34702434719
HR |11 343025
Human |I| 34283
human |ك| $3389233394 / 4$
3405234281316
Humble |l| 33442
humor $11 \mid 33478$
hundred (1) 3322 21
Hunter [2] 3416534309
Huntungton (1) 336323
hyper technical [1] 34203
Hypertenswn [1] 330716
hypotheses 11 | 331622
hypothetical (I) 3353 /4

## - I -

l'd |14|3276/3 32832
3284 13 1285 / 6 32888
$329163293223322 / 4$
$33359344323 \quad 3+5217$ 3470) $143489 / 5$

I vellili3276 1013282622
3283453284512
$332217 \quad 33891034094$
$3438 / 8 \quad 344421347717$
348116
larossi |3| $3430 / 8$ 3431/4 20
ICD $12 \mid 33102324$
ID) 111330 K 25
idealal333612 337016
3414334271234714
identified |3| $3361 / 18$
33879 339019
identufy $1113485 / 9$
IDR |10| 33016330225
33062223332024
3321243412131724
$3414 / 58173415 / 3$ 341610
III |2| $3286 / 15$
uliness (21 3286/9 3429 22
immedrately 13133820
348723349618
unpaired III $33541 /$ mpairment $|+|$ \{3/| 12
 maparti |l| 18/6?
пирагt 1113379 /1
unples 111330620
important [2 33151933395
mpossthle 11] 3319 /2
impression |1| 33332
mprove |31 3279 / 3
328120
in hospital $11134182 ?$ Inability |1] 330717 inabilaty $12!3288 \quad 13 \quad 3486 \quad 17$ mactuve 1113423 /5
mappropridte |1| 3289 | mapproprtately 111329524 Inc $12 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{ll}1299 & 18\end{array}\right.$ incapacitate 11133118 incapacitated $1313297 / 4$ $3492 / 3 \quad 18$
tacident 3 | $3361 / 334608$
incipient [1] 32975
Incline (1) 33437
include [4] $328723 \quad 330413$
3307 II 332320
included |3| 3279243280 I
33213
includes [3] 3306623
33122
incomplete [2] $347012 \quad 17$
Incorporated [2] $3404 / 4$
34713
incorrect (I) 3391 I
uncrease [1] 33178
ncreased [2] 331/ 22
331924
mereasing [2] 328923
33177
IND 111342510
indicate $\{5 \mid 32776328724$
33959347424349310
indicated [91 343053434 2
3445534842348723
3489121634932534942
mdxates |3| 334517
33581233963
Induating 131328523
340820345814
indicating 19132854
$3361 / 2337617340913$
34122434142234266
343922348024
indration |?| $33598 \quad 34926$ indirect || 348622
Indirectly |l| 346423
indirectly |1| 3371 13
Individuat |11 3284 2/
individual | 32132823
$\begin{array}{lllll}328571016 & 328619\end{array}$
328922325019329119

329418329515329621
330812331223318419
333316334825339410
1334121634132025
34152234184342510 1820
individuals 113132808
328216328621328812
16329753304514
330517331118331212
331723133315
induce|1| 332320
industry 1313299 22
33052033477
infarction |1| 331321
$\operatorname{mfer}$ 12) $3375 \quad 17 \quad 337923$
inference (1) 337519
inferred 13133792233808 33884
influence (4) 33002339919 $349115 \quad 34927$
inform (1) 33902
Information 3133047 /1 18
information $14613304 / 3$
3352417243353922
$3361 / 13376143379$ /1
$339012339213406 / 3$
$340513 \quad 20341031821$
341143413722341411
17243415110 Il 1323

341912342022342421
34711634724
347314153475734788 $34791719 \quad 34821718$ 34842
informed [2| 3390734878
informs [1] 340823
ingest (1) 328923
inherited (11) 34708
intual (6) $33704339911 \quad 15$
340153406334095
intually [I] 349214
initals [3] 33521734217 15
intiated [1] 337021
inituation (1) 342921
intuative [2] 343489
Inlet [1] 33578
inpatient [7] 3280332813
328624329489113312 ।
inquire || 337113
inside |l| 348925
inspection [2] 33976
$3486 / 3$
instance |2| 34072034297
Instutute $15 \mid 327723327816$
32982533051633166
institute 11 ! 327819
Instatutes [2] $3278 \quad 12 \quad 17$
institutes |1| 3278 /8
institution |3| $3278 \quad 14 \quad 15$
330517
institutional ||| 32842 institutions [1] 330517
instructed ||| 34947
instructing |1| 327922
instructions 19133345
$333620 \quad 33372333910$
340083478123493923
349418
intent 111343221
interaction [2] 338847
intercede [1] 337424
interest [2] 3341 1233477
interested [5] 3282 ]
$3316 / 5331918332616$
33419
Interim ||| 3283 /4
interject [1] 3440 1
internal |l| 32836
international $|3| 328112$
32846331024
internship |2| 32762021
interpret |11 341817
interpretation [1] 3411 19
interrupt |l| 33557
interrupted (1) 33077
interval (1) 3476 /
intervais |11 3296 /7
interview |13| 332712
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}3331 & 21 & 22 & 23 & 25 & 333910\end{array}$
$334121243342 / 31721$
23
interviews [1] 333912
intumately [1] 32819
intulerance [2] 328725
331815
intoxicated [8] 32979
33088331422331713
$339918 \quad 3491153492922$
intoxication [8] 3296719

3300193314213315413
33177332220
intoxications [1] 331119
introduce [1] 33988
introduced [2] 332217
333920
invading [1] 34696
investugate [3] 332622
33294348317
investugating ||| 33293
investigative [1] 32843
investrgator [2] 333923
349220
investugators [5] 32846
329818212232995
investment [1] 34054
nvited [2] 327810346011
involve [4] 329] 19337522
33791920
involved |14| 32819
32921332941432998
$33131331616183380 / 1$
339423341717342817
20343410344518
involvement 12133763
342318
involves [1] 331924
involving [2] 344519
346016
Island [10] 341858
$349314161718 \quad 349459$ 1012
island [21 349317349410
issue [11 3431 2 I
Issued [1] 3421 10
sssues [2] 339422342821
Item [1] 329316
Item [5] $329210 \quad 3293414$ 1534411
Items $1513306 \quad 16 \quad 18 \quad 33212$ 6

- J -

IACK $16 \mid 327523329721$
33201634954710

lames $|5| 33247343820$
3440123452243453 I
Jamin [2] 3456815
January [10] 33242533253
336221338211339524
34357345517346316
34722034777
Jelinek [1] 32845
Jersey [6] 336224336313
$345016183452 \sigma$
JESSE [4] 34446345617 349736
Jesse [16] $34445 \quad 13$ 345218243460119
34611234623346823
346913347011347622
347712348425
Jum [17] $343924 \quad 344015 \quad 19$ 24344141034514
34604183461121415
3464171934662534675 34816
job [50] 3311 22332417
33495336122223
$337616 \quad 2033771012 \quad 22$
$33852325 \quad 33861219$
338723388142433891
33921315339324
33942233959340424
$3406 / 417340716$
$3408 / 434151134207$
34283
343393445 22 3446 21
34471345433455 2
$\begin{array}{lll}34596 & 8 & 1734601\end{array}$
34632124346419
3471111214
job-related $1113385 / 8$
jobs 111344512
JOE [2] 343423349622
Joe |33| 335025 3351 2
$336022 \quad 23336115612$
152233631533647
$336512 \quad 16 \quad 17 \quad 336615$
$336918 \quad 337119337221$
33731833791533942
3409143413203422219
343182534322134338
$25344 / 4346612$
John |s| 334917 343/ 24
$3433 / 31634585$
Johns $12 \mid 3276 / 632995$
Johnson $11133 / 3 / 3$
Join l3] $346012 \quad 347013$
348819
jomed 16| 33442340418
344743452634543
345623
joining |1| 345919
Jones (5) $333022 \quad 23$
33317333421333511
JOSE |2| 34427349625
Jose [2] $34342 \mid 25$
loseph $1413359 / 9$ 3406 18
342823347123
lournal|l| 32828
journal 14132828131415
journals |ك 328257919
23
Judge |3| $32758 \quad 33135$
342412
judgment |l| 331625
judgments 111328216
July (4) 33963342224
34737348523
jump [1] 3407 /4
jumping (11) 334920
June $1513377 \quad 12 \quad 23$

Junnor [2] 3389 14 34277
Jury $151327523351 / 1 / 13$
342479
jury |31| 3276 /3 32772


3346203353102325
3354243355 II 21
33601733611733643
3365143367533797
3383933872033931416
$340419340523 \quad 340812$ 34696
3472 ! 348213
justufy |I| 330920


Keep 111 34157
keep [5] $341 / 81134153$
342218342525
kept $14 \mid 34119342316$
343011345216
kiddingly (1) 338423
klll [1] 33119
kinds $15 \mid 33063 \quad 3349$ /2
3353 /I 341/ 16342524
Kingwordill 34279
kits $|2| 3339733402 \mid$
knee 111 344725
knots (11) 33545
knowing |II 33504
knowledge 17132792
3281 21330315333516
345042134666
Kodıak |1| 3456 /6

- L-

Labor 111342817
lacking 111330510
ladder [2] 332643487 2]
I adies |l| 3494 I7
ladies |14| 32755334620
33519335423335511
3361173364333674
3379733838340419
3405233408 1/ 347125
lady [1] 333022
Lake [1] 33436
lanes ||| 34942
large 111338416
Last [33| 32751732934
3297253324633435
$3380 / 103383 / 416$
3387434047342310
343324343517343617
3437251334385616
345614345846346214
1634631034702224
3473234764348816
late 171 33577335810
33623101218336318
Lauderdale [3] 3454 /3 17
Law 15 | $332419332616 \quad 19$
33392349024
LAWN [4) 33951934027
349647
Lawn (101 $3326 / 2 \quad 3395 / 8$
34023233488121
34892711
lawsurt (11) 33863
lawyer (1) $33 / 2$ /4
lawyers |11 331217
lay 1213365 I/ 33696
layman (2) 32888331624
lead [4] $330215 \quad 3491 \quad 22$
3492 / 6
learn [11 344225
learned [3] 33645339867
leave [46] 32906329413
331314337021337223
3374516202533752
337682024337724
3378 II 1624338522
33861233902833928
3406534108341312

341782334181219
3419482034201
93421213422220
342581734323344520
345012
leaving |2| 33542
lectures [4] 3293 / 330825
33123342519
left-hand $|3| \begin{array}{lllll}33525 & 16 & 24\end{array}$
legal |2| $331 \mid 22332220$
legend 14133542023
33554
length 313294213414312
lengths $12 \mid 340356$
IFSIIF $16 \mid 34588 \quad 34616$
$25 \quad 34979 \quad 12 \quad 15$
I eshe 1413453510
$345725 \quad 34585$
lethal [2| 329723
letter $1413354 / 8 \quad 21 \quad 33552$
343021
letters |2| 334714338214
level |8| $329620 \quad 2232974$
33001833151331824
$33613 \quad 33764$
levels |13| 32977331117


latasoned $|2| 3348 / 7 \quad 33915$
Llar |II 3440 /3
Isense III 33447
Licensed [3| 33047 1/ 18
Icensed [3] 32767910
Icensing |I| 3446 21
I teutenant |6| 3331/4
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllll}3332 & 13 & 19 & 385 & 13 & 16\end{array}$
34872
Lreutenant |1] 348520
life 16| $328116 \quad 331121$
33992434217346378
light |3| $3342 / 433544$
3494 /I
lighter |II 334625
lime II 33835
limited |11 32947
limits |2| 3322203418 I
LINDLEY 111349920
Lindley |11 34996
Line [1] 3387 I
lme [18] 328521335221
3380791415338625
339163393213394620
3395534106341816
346525348858
lines |5| $330310 \quad 335220$
$3445 \quad 123465 \quad 25 \quad 348917$
linked [2] 33002433012
Luquor [2] $329922 \quad 330520$
listed 161328791232918
330710330825
listen [1] 349418
LIstening [1] 34815
listung (2| 330323475 I
listungs (11 329111
int (1) 334215
Itterally [1] 332716
literature $12133098 \quad 332218$
Iftrgation |11 343425
hive |3| 3434 /9 34452
$3462 / 5$
I OA |2| $34178 \quad 341812$

Hask Sruciry Appleaikime
loaded (I) 347317
local (I) 3445 /
located 3 l $335119 \quad 345910$
346423
location (1) 333217
lock (1) 341521
locked \{3| 3466478
locks [1] 341520
$\log |18| 334418 \quad 2133452$
12131733511923
335214335393354110
$213358 / 533598 \quad 3473 / 4$
$34749 \quad 12$
logical |1| 34329
$\operatorname{logs}(22 \mid 33511733524$


34741673479101517
202425
looks [1] 335623
loop (1) 344515
lose [1] 3406 /]
lot 14| 33394337715
34642234768
Lots 11133283
Loumana |7| 34528 g
$3455121434586 / 8$
348112
lounge |l| 3331 /
low $1113440 / 9$
lower |3| $33 / 6 / 7 \quad 341022$
3412 21
lucid |l| 349119
lunch |5| 3331192023
3341 2034419
lured III 3475 /5

- M-
 M D |11 32985
Ma'dm |21 $3424 \quad 15 \quad 34675$ ma'din |2| 3468 /| 34853 magical||l 32946 mal|l| 341319
maded |11 34/3 19 man (1) 33363 mantan [2] 33301033813 maintaining | 2 | $3341 / 6$ maintenance |3| 330025 33013332419
mayor 11 ण1 $338016 \quad 32 \times 322$
23328425329253299 ? $331916332383491 /$ Male $12133 / 8233360 / 3$ male |3| $331822 \quad 33601$ /2 336420
man $19 \mid 339 / 173428 / 9$ $344673447 \times 34601 / 4$ $3464 / 6346853469$ /4 management $110 \mid 3293$ /8 $3350 / 53351 / 338089$ 141533916341914 $3442 / 6$
manager |l0| 3349 / 916 17336913380163417624 $3428 / 0$ /1 343125
Manhattan $11!34285$
manc $11133 / 917$
manner 12 | 3297 13 3400 ) /9 mannersms |i| 339325

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
manning 16| 33756340823
$3453834599 / 2 / 5$
Manual [2] 3286 / 15
manual [7] 328423328610
$\begin{array}{llllll}21 & 23 & 32872 & 19 & 3321 & 19\end{array}$
March [181 33441617
334514161833462
3351212533532333542
$336231012 \quad 22336318$
3387534723347520
Marld |l| $341 / 4$ X
MARIANNE 111349920
Marianne 11344996
Marine lll 3jat 10
marine $1613325 / 333344$
$334325339763486 \quad 13$
34911
mariner (1) 33538
Marital [2] 34251415
marital [6| 3291 20338522
$\begin{array}{llllll}3386 & 18 & 3425121318\end{array}$

33445340414345816
3471315347424
marilime |3| 31477335412 338/ \%
MARK $10 \mid 33438338515$
$339210349519223496 /$
Mark $1713343 / 63371 / 8$
19341767341824
mark 1613494234813
Marked |11 3311 12
marked |11 334025
marketing 13134272123
34284
married 111329120
MARTA1 [21339925
340123
MARSHA $16 \mid 347025$
34K() 18 $348543498 / 47$
Marshall| $4+7 / 10$ 23

Maryland $13 \mid 3276 / 8$
34272434462
mass $13 \mid 331220331820$
Massachusete [7] 327519
327662332782328013 master \{20] 3344679
33494336522338725
3391233392163395910
34115153410181434321
$34745 \quad 3475$ з 347713
3478 /8 34K(1) 3 3.492 5
masters |91 3344 / 3348 /8
335014336313336922
337 x 2 $933 \times 3113+8418$ mate $713326 / / 334456$ 33462434941
mates | 2 | 3326 /0 3344 | math 111 340422
matter |11| 331922334722
$334821335083367 / 8$
$33931433962 / 340317$
34123343220347017
mattern 1113499 /1
Mauhew 111345615
Maurwn |t| 333012233317 $3334213335 / 1$
maxımum ||| 3488 /7
Mc(all |4| 332520348525 348715345015

Mcl ean $|5| 32765328012$ $\begin{array}{lll}14 \quad 18 & 25\end{array}$
meal [2] $338563440 \quad 17$ meals [1] 34363
mean [28] 327821328810 32983533132433286 33401633552233574 336841733748339623 3400634031534069 340983418121921 3429202134325343414 34451234481734571116 meaning [2] 33231733614 means 111| 327724 3290) 2 3302173322233541421 3404934108934135 meant [3] 34036340918 345717
medic [2] 33401021
Medical |15| 3276432785 73279913 14, 21328012 151732839329920 330319330521331014 medical ${ }^{5}$ 50| 3276 IS 1819 20213277101112
 3287101132931318 $3296 / 3305 / 1331020$ $3312243322 / 8336869$ $337020223374 / 3$ 3378 1/ 1524338521 3386 // 3390833928 341510
13243416368341913 34212434227342611 3429715243430425 34314344723
medrally 12133122223
medication [1] 329319
inedicutions 111329319
Medume 1213283 /f 32992 medicine |6| 327679 IO 193283632849
medics |1| 3335 /|
Medsterranean [1] 334320
meet [7] 3321 61617
334792233811134397
meeting [9] $337825 \quad 33794$
$5693398 / 433991 /$
34015343916
metings 1 |ol 329419
337471033751218
33811233821934318
34644
Mel |l| 34073
Mello [2] $32985 \quad 33147$
member $14 \mid 32811723$
32848333019
menters |与| $328 \times 24$
333553340734789 34913
membershup |3| 328/ 24
$329215 \quad 330310$
memol리 342 K 22
Memorial 1113275 /9
memorised 111 33036
 349325
men !2 3405 /5 34552
MENDHI SON 161327523
329721332016349547

Mendelson |y| 327512 18 25327621332841419 32971832985 mental |l| 336821
mention [2] 340024341712
menthoned $120 \mid 32789$
328818328917329520
329610330320332020
33276933486336123
336573372533837
3400223449134532
34576347318
mentooning 11134199
merit |I] 34053
mess [5) 332731343621
344673447834552
metabolc [2] 32908
331923
metabolsm [1] 33203
metabolized [1] 331919
methanol [1] 3314 11
MICHALL [4] 332410
$333823 \quad 34951316$
Mrehael |l| 3324 |
Mrhigan |11 345823
inkrofiche |1| 34105
mad |l| 334615
Mad-June |11 337622
middle |x| 33076331521
334623352625337712
23344811
midnught [1] 3358 12
midships 111348719
mild |9| 328821223294 (1)
332317
mule ||| 345210
mill |i| 344521
milligram ||| $33 / 4$ /6
miligerams $11313311 / 617$
331423253315810
332210152122232725
malls [1] 34458
mind (4) 3399 /3 342425
34531534916
mme [6] 336614340925
34541234622134642325 manımal [41 33142033154 13 33/6 1
minumums $11 \mid 349420$
minority 111330510
manute (7) 330524331717
3319103362433678
$3372 \quad 243408 / 8$
minute-by-minute 11133845
Minutes 111339622
minutes [6| 335110339621
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllll}34246 & 3488 & 17 & 18 & 349416\end{array}$
MLs |9| 3414 /3 342624
34531234610634622
missing |11 3470 /1
mbswon |21 3278253279 /
msundervtood |3| 335025
3380634378
Mituhell 11346519
model 11133096
Moderate 111335523
moderate 1101329410
$33551921 \quad 335661516$
$\begin{array}{llll}33572 & 18 & 23 & 3358 \\ 12\end{array}$
moderately [1] 335515

Hanc Byuterne Applicticion
moment [2] 34241734566
money $[2 \mid 330416 \quad 17$
monitor (11 341/ 14
monitored [31 339117
3393610
monitoring |4| $3391 / 8 \quad 24$
$3392 / 93433 / 4$
Montgomerv ||8| 34154 341659123419101116 $24342015 \quad 1834227$
$3426 / 2173429834309$
l! 3431314
month 17133512133609
3373131533762334449 34781
months [3| 3375493445 I2 moods [3] $3365 / 819$
3366 I
Morning [1] 3343 II
morning [17] 3275525
3276/33259 14332810
1133302333112334310
3352933565335818
34415734874349420
motion [1] 33588
motor $14 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lll}3316 & 18 & 33171\end{array}\right.$
13339910
Moussy|19| 33271310
3328182233296811
333071033311113

mouthwash $121330820 \quad 23$
Move [1] 347610
movels| 3297 I2 3423 2]
34701434782034808
moved 1113423 15
moves $|2| 332034$
movie lll 33847
moving || $3339 / 5$
Mrs 1313372192533731
MS |2913324 | 11333821
2433422433951734022
$53403253427 / 343319$
21343416344246
$34443 \quad 34560 \quad 18 \quad 345723$
34691234761621
34801434851316
3494153495141734977
Ms $[12] 333023 \quad 34042$
3413134572434621020
2234662334681434706
3471234856
Mt 11132992
mutual $1113365 / 7$ myocardial [1] 331320 myrıad (1) 336821 myself [2] $333920 \quad 343412$

| $-\mathrm{N}-$ |
| :---: |
| name $[5013275 \quad 16 \quad 17 \quad 18$ | 203281153283833245 $63330223340 / 133435$ 14336072033691425 337112338920340467 8934072534275 3444 || 3447 /4 3452 // 345323454734561314

34584634601
$\begin{array}{llllll}4 & 3462 & 13 & 14 & 15 & 16\end{array}$
346417347021 22 24

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5-31-94
VOLUME 20
1 mametunce by 1 fonk ficei 70 )

347261634851520
named |11 343820
names |11 3446 /
Nancy ${ }^{121} 3298533147$
narrow [2| 3332234012
$\begin{array}{lllll}\text { Nathan } 14 \mid 3302 & 5 & 121419\end{array}$
Natmo |1| $3302 / 8$
Natюnal |lo| 327723
$\begin{array}{llll}3278 & 10 & 1216173298 & 16\end{array}$ $3300111 / 433051634461$ natюonal $1113281 / 2$
nature |41 3325 /6 333524 $3361 / 834009$
naval 113277 I2
navigated III 3434 /3
Navy $1513277 / 01 / 1518$ 19
NCAls| 330010121420
NEAL |l| 340923
needs [2] 34068347922
negative |4| 33294346715 $173477 / 8$
negotratrons |3| 336219 21 23
neughborhood $|3| 345517$
1834573
Neurology |l| 3277 |
neuroscience |l| 32763
Nevada [3| 33437334 K / 337714
news |l| 33698
nice |l| 3359 /1)
night|a| 329725338416
34152134411234931
ninell| 3384 |
ninth |11 344422
Nohel [ $3132849 / 1$
Nobody 11134834
nohody 11133926
Nods $1+133744343819$
34555348312
nommatung [2] 3284812
non industrial 111341069
nonbeverage 12133081520
nondrinking III 33203
NONOR $11 \mid 344524$
nontolerant |4| 329019
$3291 / 3311933 / 84$
noontume |1| $3440 / 7$
NORA |S| 344524344669 1834471
norm [1] 3320 \|
normal|ll| 32942133204
334591133541233568
33652033681333995
$3422 / 4$
normally |II 3479 2]
North |1| 344416
north $121335433355 / 8$
northeast $1113355 / 8$
northwest 1113357 2]
northwesteriy ||| 33565
Norwalk 11134283
nove 111340313
Notary 1213499720
notation 11134265
 10
noted [11 32894
notes 1413339 // $34 / 4$ /8
$3430 / 13499$ /0
notice $\mid 81328532357 / 4$ $339823 \quad 3399914340322$ 34081622
noticeable |3| 33562
336522336616
noticed || 3327 )
notified |2| 348733496 ) |
notify |1| 34322
notion 14133972133989 340148
November 141336220
34492 IL 345525
nub |l| 33954
number 12 ¢ 132826329122
3292 IO 3299 10 330225
3321233342533353
3355233855 34106 11
2425 34112 3429 21
$343424347816 \quad 1734796$
348021534822349011
numbers |9| 32852532866
71034135
numerous [1] 34676

## - 0 -

O'NFIII $138 \mid 328416$
329720223307933101
$\begin{array}{lllll}5 & 123313681332014\end{array}$
338516342323342412
143426223461724
346743468113469515
$34701216 \quad 347613$
347823 34K() / 19 24K2 7
$11 \quad 1534832534853$
34958
23349614349713 こ2
34985
()'Neill |6| 3320 20) 3323 / 6
$3393123468 / 5 \quad 347715$
oath |1| 33866
Object 13134695 3482 5
348321
object |3| 3307533135
3470 I2
objecting |l| 34828
objection $|9| 328416$
$342324346915 \quad 16$

$347823 \quad 348011$
objectrons [|| 33427
observation [1] 3491 13
observations [1] 349210
observe [8] $3297 \quad 103330 / 3$
182333811033844
34491416
observed [3] 333423
33365 345/9
observing 121329925 33071
obtained 111332817
obvious [2! 348423 3485 5
Obvюusly |11 336010
obviously |3| 333414
33656343012
occasюn |29| 327715
3280253281632842023
32972533222333415
3347253348212433593
4336083378 / 338024
338192033822420

33841234074346514 23 34Kत $/ 4346 \mathrm{~K} 20$
(Iccanonal |l| 3308 /
occasonal |2| 3294 /8 $33 / 419$
()ccavonally |1] 3381 /] oxcasюnally |l| 3434 /
occasmons |ك| 33592
$3382103383 / 343436$ occur 1613311243312 10) 33159340121343224 345321
occurred 191 33622333672
3430) 53455 // 1934691

3470 / 3473 /6 $3489 / 4$
oscurrence |3| 32936
2295 21 23
occurring $12 \mid 33088346624$
occurs 111331321
Ocean [2] 335963446 ।
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}\text { ocean } & 15 & 3405 & 5 & 13 & 14 & 17\end{array}$
340716
oceangoing 1113459 I7
October |5| 34492 II
3455253472234783
odd $1113445 / 2$
odor 18| 3328243329 /2
333115346619349117
34923
offer 111 328413
offered |101 3424 / $3470 / 8$
347612347822348010
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3498 & 15 & 16 & 17 & 18 & 19\end{array}$
office $14213325 \quad 13 \quad 333025$
3331333324333457
$33391313348 / 4336125$

11336961833906
339522339646934077
$341518 \quad 19 \quad 20 \quad 342225$
3423234272334631323
2434641
562334813
officer |321 $327710 \quad 11$
$33261620 \quad 33321116$
333923345113360115
1933642033879339019
212233911234019
$3442163485243486 / 4$

6
officers [5] $332418 \quad 3326 \quad 15$
332733329 I/ 34062
offices 111341719
official |l| 34483

Oh $14 \left\lvert\,$| 3299 | 9326 |
| :--- | :--- | 8\right.

339621343821
oh 1313319 | 333015
344711

oil |2| 33975343425
okay 17134262034405
345256345722345811
346220
old 111339616
oldest |II 32829
on-scene 111 349220
oneword [2] 3390 I/
ones [2] $328115 \quad 335120$

operated III 3445 I5
moment to operated
operatron (5) 33882
$342723 \quad 348671924$
operations |1| 347316 operatuve |1| 345812
operator [2] $333243487 / 4$ opinon |18| 328913
329112163292832935
$\begin{array}{lllllll}3294 & 3295 & 8 & 13 & 14 & 15 & 19\end{array}$
3296183365111415
337525338725346920
opmions [1] 336512
opportunity [2] 33479
34291
opposed [4] 328836
32901332125
optron |11 330317
orchestrate (1] 3432 /l
Order (1) 32753
order [11] 328722328923
329321330414334523
340714340814342014
34362123349025
ordered [1] 343619
ordering |2| 3489243491 /|
ordmary ||| 343023 organization [11] 327812
$3281 / 81932821329919$ 213304123344233685 $342721 \quad 3428 / 3$
organcatrons $|4| 330516$ 22331020
origmal III 343216
outpatuent $|4| 32803328 \mid 3$ 4328624
outside|3| 3352 /| 337519 $3489 / 3$
overall |11 32927
overcast |11 $3355 / 7$
overlooked III $3457 / 8$
$\frac{-\mathbf{P}-}{\text { P-en-n-1-n g t-o-n }|1| 34587}$

P-e-n-n-1-ng t-o-n |l| 34587
Prer-cec|ll 33437
pm 14|3424789 349421
Pacific (2) 3357533596
pacing |l| 34886
package |1 334023
page |26| $3299 / 333149$
3315213345142233525
$1416 \quad 20 \quad 25 \quad 338624$
339318339462033954
34282234611011
3465 I/ 3466203470 /1
347124347219
pages (4] $331943393 / 8$ 347122
pand $19133134337414 \quad 17$
3406534082434108
34201011345011
pain 111331321
palm $12 \mid 333336$
Paimer |l| $3339 / 4$
paper 111331324
papers |11 343921
paperwork |3| 33696
340643422 /I
paragraph 131331415
33156343324
pardon [1] 331215 parentheses [1] 32862
parenthesis [1] 32864
part |36| 33091533213
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3330 & 13 & 18 & 3348 & 24 & 33497\end{array}$
33512337820338313
3386233889339024 ,
339191334051734082
3409 |1 34122122
$341419 \quad 22341812$
341924344423344624
7834519346410
347121
22348414348717
partake [1] 338418
partucıpated [2] 330512
334121
participation [3] 329217
330315331011
parts |1| 335024
party |1] 3466 /I
Pasolca (1) 346518
pass [2] 32775335212
passed [5] 3384 // 33924
5 7340322
passing [3] 33476340024 340121
patuent |91 329219329422
329523433091633128 2333747
patuents 171 3281/1 268
Il 3292 IS 32955
patterns $13 \mid 330025 \quad 33013$ $3349 / 4$
pay l121 3349 12 3406411
$12340823 \quad 25 \quad 340918$
34109341918342046
34211
payment |2| 33052341823
PCN 17] 34081720340920

peer [4] 328241219
33491
PENNINGTON 16$] 34588$
$34616 \quad 25349791215$
Pennington 1713453511
123457253458534606 34622
pensive $12 \mid 339923$
People [3| 3295253311120 331319
people |4 513277 IS 32806
3296832981633002
330193310333131718
3316233318913331918
203329733342533354 5733607336124 33651233662336719 337821338415338847 $253389 / 339116$ 339713341515341914 $3441 \quad 19243443410 \quad 19$ 3463634781734796 3485734884
percerve l2| $3326 / 4 \quad 33653$ perceived $|+| 132935$
33612133718338825 perceives 11133109
percent [3| 32832329224
$3448 / 4$
percentage |1] 328224
perception [2] 328816 329016
perform [1] 334019
performance [8] $336122 \quad 23$
3376161833873338814 33932433959
performing [3] 333223
33882333957
Perod [2] 329425344110
period [41] 32762224
3278132827331211
33192533201033576
3359733621337315
33819213384533853
1033911920341721
3419192534201416
3422910342319344615
344983450534512
34596
347125347212,34774
3478101634797,25
3480 I
Periods [1] 330721
perrods [2] 3308833203
permanently [1] 34506
permit [2] 33463349025
personal [4] 3350733613
346816346921
personally [1] 3372 14
personnel [10] 32771213
329420336219340816
2234281820345625
34669
Persons [2] 3301 // 331815 persons (13) 3280 / 3292 11
14329320329410
$329523 \quad 329819330315$
33071333151622
331815336523
pertain (1) 33532
pertaning [2] 3293233091
pertams [1] 330923
pertinent (1) 341411
Peter [1] 33025
ph [11| 3302533096
331220335441233584
340733432220346216
346518
Ph D [1] 32985
Pharmacology [2] 328] 18 23
Pharmacotherapy [1]
329318
pharmacotherapy [1]
329316
phenomena [1] 329716
Phone [1] 3325 11
phone [15] 332512333912
334716336013364617
33879339043400157
3401233490615
physical $171330811331 / 4$
33412733681333999
340016
physically |1| 340010
physician $|3| 3411 / 415$
34142
physicians [2] 328119
3282 」
physrological (1) 32907
physiology [1] 32849
prek [4] 33582336310
34402534419
prcking [1] 335624
prece [1] 33835
PIERCE [6] 33438338515
3392103495192234961
Pierce [22] 33431161223
3346933511833687
$337118 \quad 19 \quad 337510$
$3376 \quad 20 \quad 339212339314$
341615182224341767
101534199
Pierpoint \{1] 346516
pilot [4] 3301 $25 \quad 33029$
339613348810
plots [1] 33441
pint [1] 33971
PL [1] 34108
place [14] 334643376 16,
33807338119338925,
34121934137,343012
$34671120,34837914,19$
placed [4] 3331 13, 334024
340710340915
places [3] 3400 12, 340914
34829
Plantuff [8] 3285133454 133412141534141 34712134725
plamuff [2] 34232334352
plan [3] 3396734054
345918
pleasant [3] 3356333598
336521
Please [5] 32751534045
345017345612349418
please 124| $327513 \quad 17$
32761532882433246
33422533435334512
3358143404167 ,
340719341213341313
34276343324343417
34444345614345724
34583346214349420
plus [2] 330522341022
pocket [1] 333323
Point [1] 33543
pont (35] 3292111329313
329624329751733239

33682433752433766
$338016 \quad 17 \quad 340119$
340211340334345813
3459232434606346610
3481234881119349110
1134931315
$192034948 \quad 12$
Pointed [1] 3493 /4
pointed [5] 348921349312
163494910
pointer [1] 328521
policies [1] 34441
poluy |131 $3378 \quad 19343022$
34362 II 25343722
3443161234561922
34571
pollution \{1] 33976
Port [1] 337119
port [49] 334725334846
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}7 & 13 & 15 & 16 & 22,24 & 3349 & 18\end{array}$
212233591533635
337118337621337710
122233915339212

Hasic Syaterte Apptrations
243426343623343823 34512345919346420 $3471 / 16 \quad 347310 \quad 121415$ 16172434747
1224253481634833 34842534857348611 24889
portron $\{51329934$ $3385253386 / 34148$ portwns 131334512 340321343418 portray |1| 34806 ports [1] 3481] position $|2| \mid 32762327823$ $2432795 \quad 3280 / 822 \quad 23$ $3298 / 6 \quad 3302 / 4 / 819$ 33082233652233809 3435173445223447722 3486 / 34887349310
positmons [1] 32824 positive [1] 33295 possibilities [1] 348924 possibility [^] 332623
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}329 & 10 & 3484 & 12 & 3489 & 22\end{array}$ post[1] 327720
post-doctoral |2| 327838
postgraduate [1| 342716
potentral [2] 3351 35
pounds $141331821 \quad 22$ 33191
power [I] 342819
practical [1] 32775
practice $[5132767910$ 3277634379
Preceding |l| 3428 22 precipitating |l| $331 \mid$ 21 predecessor [1] 327815 prederignated 1113440 ? preface [2| 3299 y 33046 prefer [1] 32854 preference [11 33834 preoccupied |1| 33103
Preparation |l| 3299 /4 preparation |4| 328419
3299720331610
prepare [1] 330522
prepared [1] 3499 /2
prerequisite [1] 32774 prerogative [1] 3434 [4 prescribed $\{21330224$ 33031
prescription [4] 3301915 17330913
presence [2] $33296 \quad 33834$
present [9] 32762328022

33363334124348713
Presently [1] 32763
preserve [1] 332623
preserving $\{2$ \} $3326 / 7$
33416
pressure [3] 33537335515 $3356 / 2$
pretty [14] 33322334625
$334710 \quad 335512335678$
$133358 \quad 20 \quad 335910$
$339618 \quad 340219 \quad 343116$
$3433 / 23469$ /1
prevalence |1| 3304 /4
prevalent [2] $3350 / 4$
336616

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
5 31-94
VOLUME 20
prevent |2| 32935 21
Preventon |1| 3278 // prevention 121 32793
$3284 / 5$
prevous 12| $332925 \quad 3385 \quad 25$
Prevously |1| 334313
prevкияly 131329520
33782034378
primarily [3| 32892233112 33477
Prımarv |1| 33033
primary || $19 \mid 327925$
3286 20 $223287 / 1 / 3$
328893289457911
$32911718 \quad 32924329423$
330イ2 331091034166
Prince |3| 33582325
Princeton |1| 3 382 7

328021329324329427 24329525733121
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3368 & 8 & 12 & 15 & 3372 & 22\end{array}$
$337643379 \quad 19 \quad 22 \quad 34053$
3431 I/ 343310344425
programs [2] 33479336814
progrensed 111 23/6 /7
progressing $11 \mid 33576$
promotion |1| 1349 /2
prompt |1| 3419 /1
prompted 1313329 / 3
$3416 / 4$
promptly |l| $33 / 3$ 22
pronunciaton ||| 33272
proof [1] 34829
proper [1] 3309 /4
properly 1213434141349123
proposal livi 3305 12 13
proposition |1| 330123
protect |21 $3379 / 4$ /S
protection 121 37241618
protext |l| 3 342 16
provide $1313305933 / 6$ /0 12
provided $|9| 338 \mid 9329824$
$329910193305 / 331613$
$\begin{array}{llllll}3355 & 25 & 3382 & 23 & 34367\end{array}$
provides [1] 334421
providing [1] 330413
province [1] 34696
provision [1] 349024
Psychiatric $13 \mid 328 / 16$
328323328616
psychuatric $19 \mid 327624$
3277 /3 3280 / 616
328/22 3286 /4 329212
$3293 / 3$
psychatrist |l| 33239
Psychıatry ||| 3277 /
psychıatry $111 \mid 3276312$
223277373278732799

psychological 11 | $331 / 4$
Psychoneurdendocrinology
[1] 328125
Psychotherapy [2| 330224 25
psychotherapv 171 329/ /9
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}25 & 3292 & 3 & 3293 & 14 & 394\end{array}$
33022533123
Public 1213494720
public |기 $3324 / 5 \quad 33253$
publication |2| 328217
3286 /5
publush |!| 32989
published [6] $328218 \quad 2225$
3302620331613
publisher [3] 329889
33058
pull [1] 336120
punches ||| 3393 /3
purple [1] 336519
purport |1| 3482 |
purpose $\mid$ | $\mid 328 / 20 \quad 33058$
$933306 \quad 341325$
purposes |3| 337022 342/ 2
push [2] $3338 \quad 15 \quad 3448 \quad 15$
PX10 [1] 3285 /
-
qualificatron (2) 331 1 15
344620
qualifications [1] 328417
Quantufy |1] 335522
quart [11 33//8
quarters $16 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llll}3332 & 16 & 33349\end{array}\right.$

12 3335172225
Quextion 111133932122
339483465203466358 $\begin{array}{llll}13 & 15 & 18 & 20\end{array}$
quextion |41| 32982
3309223310478
$332922334018 \quad 334412$
153370111313386922
$\begin{array}{llllllllllll}33872 & 15 & 3388 & 8 & 3393 & 19\end{array}$
3394471520339515

$34392434507 \quad 345317$
$3460 / 8 \quad 346223465 / 2$
$\begin{array}{lllllll}3466 & 23 & 3469 & 5 & 8 & 18 & 23\end{array}$
3483534849
questioned $13 \mid 3312 / 3$
\{323/3331/4
questioning ||| $3348 / /$
questmons $11813320 / 8$
335321336024336723
$337120 \quad 3393 / 11339418$
34056342322342622
345083461534628
3464 // 34704348020
34837348511
quick $121346 / 8 \quad 346910$
Quiet |l| 33403
quit |41 3309192033102
344422
quitting |I| 330921
quote |l| 349024
quoted |l| 3298 /8
$\overline{-\mathbf{R}_{-}}$

R-g-p-i-d-s ||| 344416
R-o-s n-o-k-e |l| 344416
radı0 |12| 333241016
$3334 / 1 / 3347 / 8 \quad 338321$

$3487 / 4$
rall|3| 3347 / 23
Rasce|71 $3275 \quad 13 \quad 33243$
3343234043 3456 10
3458 / 3462 /1
Rand $14 \mid 3298212325$
$\begin{array}{lllll}\text { Rand } 4 \mid & 3298 & 21 & 23 & 25 \\ \text { range } 141 & 3294 & 17 & 33 / 4 & 19\end{array}$
33549335523
ranges 11133003
ranging [1] 329425
rank [1] 33255
Rapids [3] 344415344528
rarely [3] $33157334717 \quad 19$


331920243320411
rates $\mid 213296 / / 33205$
ratung |3| 34091734727
Ray [1] 3444 13
Rays |11 33544
re|l| 32757
reach |1| 336324
reaches 111331116
reaction [1] 33995
read |301 $329725 \quad 3306914$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}15 & 16 & 3308 & 18 & 3309 & 25\end{array}$
33156331612332126
I1 33241033382313476
$34082341043414 / 3$
34332434408345179
19345671734659

| 3319 | 20 | 24 | 3320 | 4 | $1 /$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |



- R -
$\square$
portion to read
34659
$\qquad$
1




#  



[^47]Henc Syweme Applicaucrs
$349418 \quad 34951316 \quad 34976$ READER [1] 33247
readuly [1] 337921
reading [8] $330620 \quad 33148$
33152033241335510
339321346510346924
reads [2] $3299 / 4346717$
real 16$] \begin{array}{llllllllll}3357 & 8 & 3396 & 18 & 25\end{array}$
34038 /I 346910
realistucally |1] 346710
realizing |1| 337124
realm [1] 340520
reason |6| 329611337615
$339421341111 \quad 346022$
34689
reasons [1] 336822
recenve [9] $3279 \quad 13 \quad 17$
$3294 / 0 \quad 3301 / 433606$ 337163406212341915 recerved [27] 327618
 $223284 / 5113305721$ $3360143361 / 033645$ $33878 \quad 3416 / 5 \quad 34243$ $347020 \quad 347615 \quad 347825$ $348013 \quad 349821 \quad 222324$ 25
receiving 161337321
$3374 / 3 \quad 34066123411 / 5$ 34206
recent ||| 32839
recently |1| 3362 22
Recess (2) $3351 \quad 1234248$
recess $\{31335191034245$ recessed |II 349421
recipient |1| 330518
reciting |11 330617
reclusive $11 \mid 336520$
recognition |l| 3402 //
recognive [3| $3323 / 6$
$3398 / 341217$
recogniced $|3| 3310 / 6$
33982340218
recollectron 32 ) $3303 / 3 \quad 14$
33061033335811
33753433769 338/ 13
3382253396243397518
$33991234001 / 3401 /$
34031721341014
$341793429 / 3 \quad 3430 / 5$
346522346624346719
34819349322
recommendation 121
346025349010
recominendations |I|
3281 10
recommended 11 ] $3339 / 4$
reconfirm |1] 343021
record $|33| 3275 \quad 10 \quad 16$ $3287 / 133245333625$ 3343433442333767
340463407172123
$340846133409 / 341 / 8$
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}10 & 18 & 34 / 3 / 4 & 34 / 4 / 1 & 25\end{array}$
$34231 / 3425534275$
$3433243444123456 / 3$ 34583346213146924 3479 22 348519
recordation 11133528
recorded $|8| 3352561 /$
$3354 / 3357223340920$

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-31-94 VOLUME 20
Casoordarcos by Look-Smor(73)

3479 11
recorder [1] 3342 /3
recording [3] 334222
3345633523
records [18] 33442133767
$34072434105341116 \quad 17$


$34788153483 / 2$
recountung |1| 33656
recovery [2] 331210
331321
rectangle [2] 34092223
rectangles [1] 341020
red $\{2] \begin{array}{llllll}3340 & 3 & 334214\end{array}$
REDIRECT [10] 332016
$3392 \quad 10 \quad 346125 \quad 346812$
3485434951034961
$349715 \quad 2434987$
reduce [2] 330414330720
Reef [1] 34879
refer |2| $331515 \quad 335716$
reference 15 | 331521
33405 3440 8349311
3494 /I
referred 14132922032942 33097340816
referring 16 | 32982433948
$3401 \quad 17 \quad 343923345322$
34575
refers [1] 332118
refinery [1] 34646
reflect 13 | $3425 \quad 15 \quad 347712$ 22
refrgerator 11133273
resard ||9| 3299625
3300173305193309713

$331653392 / 341622$
3417153419734678
$3468 / 3493 / 6$
regarding 171337223
$\begin{array}{llllll}3406 & 18 & 3418 & 18 & 34198\end{array}$
3430183493823
regards [2] 3429 // 343120
regimen [21 33033
regron |l| 342723
Registered [1] 34996
regular 1313363434319 $3461 / 5$
regulations $11 \mid 3490 / 2$
repulators |11 $3316 / 4$
rehabintation |11| 3429 /2
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}23 & 3430 & 19 & 22 & 343 / 5 & 72\end{array}$
34331034349 // 346825
relate $12 \mid 33352433368$
related |71 $327722 \quad 327919$
328321334110337618
$3398 / 4$ 3421 25
relates [1] 328517
relating $141328324 \quad 3340 / 4$ 33536339422
relation [4] 3331 $21 \quad 336923$ 3374534282
relations |1| 342817
relatmonship |9! 3323 / $3347 / 1033507338216$ relatuve [7] $3294 \quad 15 \quad 3295 \quad 13$ $143331 / 13336710$ 349021
relatuvely $13 \mid 3288 / 1] 19$

329716
release [1] 341322
relief [4] 33441134418
34591819
relieve [3] 34554349221 25
relieved [6] 3382434549
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllll}13 & 25 & 3455 & 13 & 34935\end{array}$
remain (6) 32782332823
3295433031734861
349420
remanned [3] 327824
3396634934
remarks [2] 34175 5, 346610
Remember [1] 348223
remind [1] 343316
reminded (1] 343217
reminding [2] 342338
remotely [1] 33514
remove [1] 333319
remuneration [1] 34471
Renee [1] 347023
repeat [1] 34835
Repeated [1] 330720
repeated $\{2 \mid 33 / 313$
331724
repeatedly [1] 331725
rephrase [2] 3450717
replacement [1] 344725
Report [I] 328421
report [26] 328571117
$\begin{array}{llllllll}3366 & 9 & 18 & 19 & 3388 & 9 & 10 & 15\end{array}$
33897816341217
$341320243414 / 1341523$
3421916342520342611
$343 / 133443822 \quad 23$
347422
reported [8] 327919
$332218 \quad 3406 \quad 25 \quad 342124$

Reporter [2] 349927
reporting [4] 3282934296
$10 \quad 344325$
reports [4] 33527 3411115 34227
representing [1] 333921
request [10] 3275932987
331222342020343023
3432734601534739
34781534906
requested |4| 331223
3379 / 3435 / 349910
requestung |l| 33772
require [1] 33068
required 17 ] 327625

$\begin{array}{lllllllllllllllll}3443 & 8 & 3479 & 21 & 3486 & 15\end{array}$
requirement [4] $3303 \quad 10 \quad 12$
$330617 \quad 34358$
requirements [2] 34462021 rereading [1] 3440 1/
Research [2] 3284133166 research [12] 32765
32791932801119
3283233284232967
$331724 \quad 3446 \quad 10 \quad 12 \quad 14$
34762
reside [2] 342789
residence [1] 3444 /2
residency [4] 32762224
327789
residential [1] 344414
resolve [1] 3372 I
resoived [1] 32956
resource [2] $3428 \quad 13 \quad 16$
resources [4] 330510
3389233405234283
respect [4] 330551334822
337212341117
respected [1] 337822
respuratuon [1] 331618
Respiratory [1] 33158
respond [1] 343418
responded [1] 330014
response [8] 33694824
337017339012,339816 346815
responsiblitues [8] 327711
14327923243280424
32826348622
responsibility [6] 32805
3391234592134641025 ,
348619
responsible [4] 334816
340511343213348623
rest [3] 33162345720
34768
restaurant [2] 34532223
restrictung [1] 330721
result [11] $328910 \quad 331722$

$\begin{array}{llllllll}17 & 18 & 34088 & 34193\end{array}$ 343023
resulted [2] $331017 \quad 334417$
resume [4] $329510 \quad 16$
32963
retain [1] 33299
reture [2] 3435634482
$\begin{array}{llllll}\text { retured } & {[6]} & 3435 & 5 & 12 & 18\end{array}$
34361234472334484
returement [2] 343525
34483
return $[7] \begin{array}{llllll}3298 & 13 & 14 & 17 & 19\end{array}$

Returned [1] 337714
returned (7) 33802223
3381234682534692
3489 11
Revenue [1] 347423
Revere [1] 343220
review [9] 328241219
$\begin{array}{lllll}3284 & 20 & 23 & 3426 & 19 \\ 20\end{array}$
34681347312
reviewed [5] $328215 \quad 32858$
$34405347313 \quad 34842$
revolved [3] 335015
336815337220
Rice [1] 34872
ride [2] $335710 \quad 339617$
ridge [1] 335516
Right [35] $329616 \quad 332122$
333417337411338320
34021734082134119
34162334172534186
34196342025342213
3423534267343716
343817344010344113
344224344339344713
253454202434553
93459245,34938
right-hand [1] 341011
rise [2] 32754342410

Banc Syncurs Apppravare
FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 5-31-94
risk [1] 33178
River [11] 33431314
3344434041434581619
3471361115347424
Roanoke [3] 34441534452
8
rock [1] 33722
Rockville [1] 34462
roie [2] $331614 \quad 332615$
room [28] 3332 11 333411
182433358333651821
$\begin{array}{lllllll}33371 & 61315 & 161 & 25\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3338 & 5 & 15 & 17 & 18 & 3340 & 19\end{array}$
3400121334012234468
34667811
rooms [1] 3337 11
root [1] 335523
Rouge [10] 33462333825
3439123458183481810
122021348411
rough [2] 3353633596
Roughly [1] 32832
roughly [1] 34945
routes [1] 342925
routine [1] 3363 11
royalty [1] 33057
RPR [1] 349920
RPR-CM (1) 34996 rumors [3] 34412434578 11
run [3] 343724344515 344618
rundown (1) 342718
running [3] 34118344516 347422
runs [1] 34866
RUSSO [13] 327581124 3284131832971833075 33092433135332017 3323223495511
Russo [2] 3275722
-

S-h-a-r-e [1] 346217
S-h-or-t-s [1] 347024
SA [2] 3417713
sadness [2] $3288 \quad 13 \quad 17$
safe [1] 33882
safeguard [2] 333319 33343
safety [9] $332416 \quad 33253$
1333344339422342820
346434346517
sal [9] 334469344615
344717345219345522
34722134772224
salboat [1] 335524 salled [24] 33445336015 $19339021 \quad 223438710$ 344118344221344625 3448621223449410 34552434693347212
34735347761216 3479634845 sauling [14] 33662339312 73441111534461117 344820,3450322345624 347210347910
sators [1] 34789
Sam [1] 346515
sample $\{2133301019$
samples [6] 3331578
33398334069

3347333542
Sanders |113456 6
Santa [1] 33932
sarcastic [1] 336521
sat [1] 334213
satusfy (1) 33225
Saturday [1] 335323
savings [1] 34053
saying [14] 33208336021
33691033746337924
3380233986340223
34176344011345416
34841516
Scale (2) $3354 \quad 12 \quad 15$
scale [2] 33541234727
scales (1) 34204
Scandınavian |1| 33113
scarred [1] 3448 /4
scheme (1) 331025
School [12] 32764327857
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}3279 & 9 & 13 & 14 & 21 & 3280 & 12\end{array}$
153299220330521
school [8] $3276 \quad 15 \quad 16 \quad 18$
$20344421 \quad 34594346312$
schools [3] 3283111315
science [1] 340423
scientusts (1) 328120
scope [1] 33135
Scott [1] 3340 II
screen (5) 3285 l 37
33521334147
Scuttlebutt 1113309 /1

3355133595340414
 347424
sea [27] 3344 / 334924
335361133552325
 $\begin{array}{llllllllllllllll}16 & 18 & 23 & 3358 & 25 & 33597\end{array}$
$338023 \quad 338123340515$
344519344623
sealed [1] 33396
seals [2) $3340 \quad 24 \quad 25$
seaman |l| 348721
seamen [1] 33263
search $\{12\} 33363468$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}18 & 3337 & 16 & 17 & 18 & 19 & 22\end{array}$ 333819
searched (5) 3335172021
3336 21 3337 !
searching [2] 333525
333817
seas 16$] 335315 \quad 20 \quad 335519$
2133562335810
seasonal [1] 332415
seated (4) $327515 \quad 333025$
34045345612
second [21] 3287916
3305253324233326 //
333463344533512
3354633603338124
3384234094341222
341420341617341816
34225342324344021
348421
secondary [7] 328823
$32895689 \overline{10} 340421$
secretarial [1] 33053
secretaries (1) 3363 12
section (12) $3287 / 32917$
11233292732937
33841634052711
34141434175
secured 111334017
securing |1| 334021
security [1] 34106
seek [6] 3364733677 II
3368 / 3369934068
sees [1] 34868
semmars $\{2\} 32931330825$
send [6] 34145342124

sending [1] 341524
sense (S) 3329733478
33481633612433993
sentence |1] 344014
separate 131331025
$331419 \quad 33312$
September 131337721
34041834783

serwous [4] 330811332312 342922
sernously [1] 335315 serve [2] 34372134641
served (7) $32848 \quad 343639$
343732334733347817
Service (11) 348620
service 13133053340612 344513
serviced [2| 3481 | 2
serving |2| 3436243442 /3
session $12 \mid 33811233838$
sessions $131331033381 / 8$ 33821
setting [3] 33822022
33841
settings [1] 328624
seven [2] 332525347525
severe $\left[\begin{array}{llll}9] & 3288 & 19 & 329410\end{array}\right.$
33111833131220
$331917334422 \quad 23335210$
Severely |1| 32979
severely [1] $33 / 422$
shake (2) $3398 \quad 12 \quad 340225$
SHARE [6] $346218 \quad 34673$
3468123497182124
Share [9] $346210 \quad 15 \quad 20 \quad 22$
346561634662123
346814
Sheehy $[14] 3378671013$
$24 \quad 25337918 \quad 22338046$
$8 \quad 13 \quad 18 \quad 34333$
sheet [1] 335019
sheets [1] 344022
shft [1] 336312
Ship \{2] 345445
Shupping [211 334315
3344103368823339020
3405112340624341323
3416734281691214
34432534448345912
3463141719
shipping [2] 34451934942
shups [36] 33473334815

34171934352134481
 $\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}16 & 24 & 34651 & 3472 & 21 & 24\end{array}$ 3473213479103480223


shock |11 3492 13
shocked III 3492 IS
shook |11 3403 IO
shop |11 33975
Shore [11 33436
shore $191335015 \quad 3417714$

345324
shortened [1] 33842
shortest [2] 3476 / 7
shorthand [1] 349910
SHORTS $16 \mid 347025$
348018348543498147
Shorts 141347062334712
34856
show 1171329619331420
3315461317331614
3318333768340812
$3421 / 3343921344025$
34693347412
shower [1] 34418
showing $|3| 33402433602$
341222
ssc $[2] 340219 \quad 342124$
suck [4] 33552534068
34181819
suckness $|5| 34084341314$
$3414243415 / 43423$ /l
sidetracked III 341910
sugned 111334025
sugnuficance $15 \mid 328710$
32897933212333617
sugnificant |4| 3281/15
32872433002133275
stgnuficantly |11 329012
signs |lo| 329023296719
331420331541333162
3328 /3 33373 3491 14
stlent (1) 330317
silver $1213458 \quad 12 \quad 34714$
Sinal 11132992

stt |1| 349321
Sttka |l| 332425
sttung |11 333421
stuation (9) 32891214
33901633997341917
34221434302434893
sxx |3| 33194333510
344022
size [3] 33561335711
344720
skies (1) 33567
skills (1) 33171
skıp (1) 346525
Skipping [1] 346620
sleep |3| $3288 / 4 \quad 335316$
33562
sleeping $|3| 3288 / 4 \quad 18$
slightly 111335625
shp |1| 336723
slowed [1] 3452 16
slowly [1] 33603
slurred (2) $329714 \quad 340019$
smell |19) $332725 \quad 3328$ /9
2224332928333012

Benc Sywans Applrouliore
 344917134511013
$346615 \quad 349125 \quad 34923$
smelled [11] $3329123330 /$
7333389339817
$340318 \quad 348915 \quad 349213$
smeling [3| 3333 /]
33982234898
smells |l| 33332
smoking [1| 33403
smooth [1] 33536
Snappy [1] 340725
so-and-so [1] 345715
sobriety [2] $330215 \quad 331925$
Social [1] 329815
soctal [10] $329510 \quad 16$
$329643298 \quad 1417 \quad 331420$
$21 \quad 3317 \quad 123382 \quad 20 \quad 34106$
socialize |1| $3384 / 2$
Society [5] $3281 / 17 \quad 23 \quad 25$
3283233284 I
soft |1| 33404
Somebody [1] 3318 /2
somebody [10] 3298 /]
3300433192533464
33807934022234068
$3432 / 8 \quad 345010$
someone 1101329415
329512331715338013
$33988 \quad 339921 \quad 3401 / 4$
$340618 \quad 345917$
somewhat 111338012
Somewhere 141345415
$345517 \quad 18 \quad 348919$
somewhere 13134185
$3447 / 534573$
Somewheres |2| 34381214 sorrow [1] 329525
Sorry 13| $334523 \quad 33997$
344622
sorry [18] 328521329622
$3301 / 83318 / 11332719$
3355733562233896
339143445103447 II
$34572347273481 / 4$
$34835 \quad 18 \quad 348515$
sort |l01 33192133523
$335623 \quad 3366 / 533684$
33735 1/ 33837341119
3479 /7
Sound $13 \mid 33582333591$
sound |l| 3340 /I
sounds $121334012 \quad 346910$
Sour |11 33288
source [1| 336117
south |1| 3356 /3
southerly $13 \mid 33544$
$3355 / 63356 / 1$
space III 334421
speak $1813361 / 3 \quad 33872$
$3429 / 34304834349$
345810346220
speaking $13 \mid 3325 / 8$
$3394 / 534(K) / 4$
special|3| $327723 \quad 328125$ $341 / 16$
specialuzation [2] $3276 / 1 / 2$
specializing [I] 327720
specialty [1] 32776
specific [14] 3298733058
33286336823338116

33961034101434215
$3428 \quad 15 \quad 3435 / 0 \quad 3457 / 4$
$346118 \quad 34654$
Specifically [1] 3374 ]
specifically [10] 33068
$\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3313 & 13 & 3323 & 19 & 3334 & 10\end{array}$


specifics [1] 34337
specifies [1] 33072
specify [1] 33023
speculative [1] 34696
speech [2] $329713 \quad 339914$
Spell [1] 346216
spell [7] $327517 \quad 33246$
3343534047345613
346214347022
spelled [4] $327520 \quad 340410$
34586347024
spend |3| 33559338323
34117
spent |1| 332423
sphere [3| 3388 l 23
spheres [1| 338725
spill|3| $343425 \quad 345620$
Spirits 1613299 /1 1517
$330422 \quad 3305 \quad 13 \quad 3316.7$
spirits |5| $329923 \quad 3308 / 4$
$63382 / 8$
splashed 1113333 /
split $12 \mid 336224338421$
spoke |91 343214345224
$3453 / 3488 / 213$ 349/14
$34921 / 1434938$
rpoken |l| 349/ 9
sponsorship ||| 327722
spouse l|| $331 / 22$
spring 16133591518
33622533687340424
$3406 / 4$
Springs |1] 34586
staff [1] 342820
stairs |6| $340025 \quad 34019 \quad 12$ 17340323
stairway |1| 340121
stand $1313324 / 348225$
349123
standard I? 327616
$3303 / 8$
standing $14 \mid 33378 \quad 14$
34887 3491 2?
stands $|2| 3300 / 4344525$
STAR 111347423
starboard 111348719
Start |l| $3276 / 4$
start [17] $333915 \quad 335210$
$335714336925 \quad 338920$
$34071721341025 \quad 34123$
$3419 / 93421 / 4345825$
34727181934757
started [21] 3337633445
$33461522 \quad 2533476$
335124335624340868 13 341312 1434201
$34449 \quad 34471821 \quad 34573$ 6910
Starting [1] 336218
starting [5] $334525 \quad 335720$ 3358233761434774 starts [4] $334515 \quad 22$
$340717 \quad 34175$

STATE [1] 34991
State [2] $333921 \quad 3458 \quad 23$
state [27] 32751633039
$\begin{array}{llllllll}3324 & 5 & 12 & 25 & 3326 & 16 & 19\end{array}$
333463339233434
33535113355133566
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}14 & 33571 & 23 & 3358 & 25\end{array}$
$34046342425 \quad 34275$
3444 /l 345613134583
346213347021
stated (4] $330021 \quad 332319$
337820338623
statement [43] 329813
3300233302711330623
$3311514,23 \quad 33127$
$\begin{array}{llllll}3313 & 10 & 15 & 17 & 33149\end{array}$
$\begin{array}{lllllllll}3315 & 3 & 19 & 3316 & 3 & 15 & 19\end{array}$
331759143318710
$331915 \quad 213320633294$
33411333852433867
338856338949342918
3439243441231346113
346715213483911
stateroom [3] 332723
3331233325
States [12] $327710 \quad 32843$


348521
states [3] 3288433026
3481 /1
station [1] 339616
stationed |l| 34862
Statustucal |3] $3286 / 15$
347423
Statustics |11 33183
status (5) 34064 11
3408232534109
Stay [1] 34714
stay [3] 33569338123
347513
stayed [7] 33492433851
$341518 \quad 3445 \quad 22 \quad 344616$
$3475 / 4$
step 110133232433604
33712433951434629
3468223470534849
$3485 / 23486 / 8$
stepped [4] 339515
345423345524
steps 13 | 33262233416
341514
Steven [1] 348525
steward [8] $343623 \quad 343823$
344673451234539
$3461 / 16 \quad 3464 \quad 20 \quad 34817$
STEWART [12] $3324 / 1 /$
$333821 \quad 3395 / 7 \quad 34022$
3427134331934424

stuck \|l| 340225
stop l9 $91329523303 / 1 / 2$
3307173354633603
$3416 / 7 \quad 3437 / 2 \quad 34728$
stopped [21 $3436 \quad 1318$
story |1] 34311
stowing [1] 346420
 34639
Street [2] $344415 \quad 345615$
strength [1] 33504
strengths [2] 33482533493
strict [1] 344311
strictly [1] 34436
strike [1] 34731
students [1] 327922
Studies [1] 32828
studies [4] 328210328323
329023
studnously [2] 3387 19,
33888
study [7] 32788329823
3299134338439
studying [1] 33847
stuff [3] 33332 3, 344521
stumble [1] 340119
stunned [1] 349215
stupid [1] 345319
Styrofoam [2] 33397
334025
subcontracted [1] 32991
subject [5] 331718,331911 ,
$\begin{array}{llll}22 & 3385 & 19 & 3469 \\ 17\end{array}$
subjects [1] 342524
submit [1] 34064
submitting [1] 328214
Subsequent [2] $327718 \quad 19$
subsequent [3] 333414
342921343124
Subsequently [2] 334414
subsequently [3] 33444 33461433933
substance [8] 327722
$\begin{array}{llllll}3280 & 20 & 3323 & 18 & 20\end{array}$
34312412
succeeding [1] 33819
successful [1] 3433 11
successfully [2] 3431711
successor [3] 334314
337835
sudden [1] 336523
suffer [3] $3298 \quad 16 \quad 33019 \quad 11$
suffered [1] 329812
sufficient [1] 33118
suggest [4] $3302 \quad 16 \quad 3393 \quad 12$
34002334929
suggested (2) 3311 12
3489 /9
suggestion [3] 335313
33642334916
suitability [1] 328217
suite [2] 33311133364
sum [1] 3431 12
summarize [1] 33678
summary [1] 34806
Summer [1] 339610
summer [8] $3324 / 4 \quad 20 \quad 23$
$\begin{array}{llllll}33488 & 3378 & 12 & 3380 & 23\end{array}$
338521338610
superior [1] 34902
supervising [1] 329420
superviswn [2] 327924
348624
supervisor [6] 333913
339521339646934071
supply [1] 344020
support [2] 33059337519
supported [1] 338111
supportive [1] 329218
suppose [2] 33395334912
Supposed [1] 345622
supposed [6] 338427

3412212534261534436
Supposition [1] 331621
supposition [6] $331620 \quad 21$
$22 \quad 242533172$
surgical [1] 336813
surprising [1] 33129
Surrett [3] 337581337718
suspense [1] 342218
sustam [1] 346916
Sustaned [1] 33137
sustamed [1] 329212
swell [6] 335753358257 $13 \quad 335910$
swelling [1] 335520
Sworn [7] 32751433244 3343334044345611
34621234707
sworn [1] 34582
symptom [1] 330621
System [2] 347423
system [5] $329010 \quad 3409 \quad 19$ $341918 \quad 342012$

-     - T -

T2s [1] 344721
table [3] $330012 \quad 3342 \quad 13$
tables [1] 331613
takes [1] 338925
Talk [2] 33471618
talk [17] 32907330016
330524331224331319
33171733465336021
$3366 \quad 20 \quad 336919 \quad 338814$
$2434067343218 \quad 344018$
348821348912
talked [18] 330166330224
33191011333615
$3365 \quad 17 \quad 337219 \quad 33893$
$341618 \quad 21 \quad 342915$
$343210 \quad 3433316 \quad 348221$ 23
Talking [1] 3372 /4
talking [13] $328918 \quad 329615$
3319153323633261
$3332610 \quad 3336 \quad 25 \quad 341910$
3452134531034656
348420
tanker [1] 3356 1
tankers (5] 34051516
$344719 \quad 20 \quad 345917$
tape $[3] \begin{array}{lllllll}3342 & 13 & 21 & 3395 & 18\end{array}$
tape-recorded [4] 33399
3342356
tape-recording [1] 334217
taping [1] 334210
Tavastock [1] 347023
taxı[2] 3301 $25 \quad 33029$
teaching [2] $3280 \quad 16 \quad 340422$
technical [1] 33862
Telephone [1] 34295
telephone [8] 335922
$33668 \quad 33878 \quad 338819$
33892533911134076 34294
Teiling [1] 33004
telling [4] 3366313388910 339313
tells [4] $335419 \quad 21 \quad 3408 \quad 24$ 343218
temperature [2] 33537

Ten [1] 33588
ten 16$] \begin{array}{lllll}3319 & 2 & 33393\end{array}$
33545349416
tend [1] 336519
tends |1| 331210
Tennessee 131340923
341020341421
tensron [1] 33181
tenure [1] 334822
tenured [3] $32798 \quad 12 \quad 21$
term [8] $328917 \quad 18 \quad 32906$
330223331016331515
341819
terminate [1] 34213
terminated [1] 3421 13
termmation [4] 330915
342191416
terminology $|2| 331 / 18$ 33229
terms [12] $3286 \quad 25 \quad 328718$


3379192134643
test [15] $3312 \quad 20 \quad 333220$

$34901422 \quad 23 \quad 25349112$ 6 11
testufied [28) 328943298 l
11329924330914

$334120 \quad 33501339816 \quad 22$

$342421 \quad 342521 \quad 344417$

$346593468 \quad 23 \quad 347523$
3482 I/
testify |l] 33984
testifying [2] $3284 \quad 20 \quad 34815$
testumony (21) 329013
$3303213310 / 331216$


$339818 \quad 339913403711$

346828
testung $[5] 3334918$
$3340 / 4 \quad 3358 / 8 \quad 34905$
tests $14 \mid 333213349078$ 13
Texas [22| $33248 \quad 3348 / 4$
33622433634338122
339323404934279
345273459 /1 346216
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllll}3470 & 24 & 3473 & 25 & 3475 & 2\end{array}$

23348411
text $[16\} 328315329879$ 3299710131420
33022033044622
3305353316111332321
textbook $14 \mid 32837$ I/ 12
14
textbooks (2) 328345
textule [2] 3445814
texts [2] $3282 \quad 23$ 3305 23
Thank [27] 3275 21 329718
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}20 & 3310 & 22 & 3320 & 14 & 15\end{array}$

33422433851333929
342441234262234404
345723346124346725

34681134705347721
347863480173485312
thank 11133194
Thankfullv |l| 3434 /9
Thanksgiving |2| 3436615
Therapeutics [2] $3281 / 8 \quad 24$
therapist 111330120
therapy 19$] 32911920$
329253303333122
$341843425 \quad 12 \quad 15 \quad 18$
thereafter [4] 3317 I
3372192233901
They're [2] $329921 \quad 340610$
they're [10] 32891432956
33051733221933473
335443457143481 II
3483 14 348422
they've $11 \mid 33008$
thunking $12 \mid 3328 \quad 12 \quad 349022$
third 17133034933445
33522034002334887
34941
THOMAS [2] 348517
349810
Thomas [2| 343916348520
Three [1] 348817
three (22) 327824329159
2233063331818333124
334214335323354514

339318340216 34319
343419345212347523
3488417
three-year I2l 32762224
thed III 3440 /6
tules 12 | $344516 \quad 17$
till [3] $344593448 \quad 10$
347514
tumes $\{20$ 1 $3288 \quad 13 \quad 3298 \quad 15$
$330722337316 \quad 337613$
338515338813340021
3431934442234482225
34676347522434822
$348317 \quad 18 \quad 348420$
tunners |11 344515
Tired ||| 33403
Title (1) 349012
tutle [21 3397434288
Tolerance |I| 328922
tolerance [25] 328918 21
3290268932914
$329610 \quad 21 \quad 3300161724$
3301233111012331410
33164331743318912
133319192023
tolerant [1] 329020
tolerate [1] 331416
Tom [1] 33979
Tomkins [16] 33491617
3350213390127911
339257343125343214
$183433 / 513$
tomorrow [3] 34237
34941619
tone [2] $338213 \quad 14$
tonsc [1] 33835
tope [1] 32836
topics [1] 33518
total (10] 328222331819
333512344493472823
34781634796348015
totally 111346425
touch [2] $342023 \quad 342917$
tour [3| $3277919 \quad 334920$
Towards 13133562433581
33841
towards $13 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lllll}3355 & 17 & 3458 & 13\end{array}\right.$
347110
toxics 1113314 /1
trade 1813299 19 21
3304 // 3346233393378
tradition |2| 330349
traditions (1) 33036
Traffic [3] $348620 \quad 24$
348710
traming |181 3276152224
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}3277 & 5 & 9 & 20 & 23 & 25 & 3278 & 1\end{array}$
330511332412334114
33479 338/ $12 / 83382$ I
33837
tramp 12| 339337
transcript |기 338624

3499912
transcription [1] 349910
transferred (3) 342723
342846
transferring $\{2 \mid 33474$
34283
transtent |l| 331321
translates [1] 332215

32816
treated |11 32959
Treatment 1613283410
$3291 / 832996330320$ 331014
treatments |2| 3291 2122
trial $14 \mid 3275633454$
34607346510
$\operatorname{trip} 14 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llllll}3344 & 15 & 19 & 33599\end{array}\right.$ 10
Trooper [5] 33256721
33281733405
trooper [3] $3324 \quad 13 \quad 25$
33415
troopers |l| 33346
trouble |l| 338919
troubled |1| 334116
troubling 16| $336473365 / 2$
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllll}3366 & 2387 & 10 & 21 & 3388 & 15\end{array}$
True ${ }^{2}$ 2 337616 3455 1
true (2) 3319 IS 34999
truly [1] 3394 11
truth [2| 33866345122
truthfulness [1] 34688
tubes (1) 348920
Twice [1] 344824
twice [2] 329111347813
two-week [1] 33845
type $13 \mid 338117 \quad 342925$
$3446 / 3$
types [2] $3336 \quad 23 \quad 33532$
typically |1| 341822

| - U - |
| :---: |
| U S [1] 344523 |
| Uh-huh [7] 34391820 |
| 344351334601734658 |
| 348224 |
| uh-huh [4] 34131734264 |

Buac Syume Applawan
344113345422 ultumately [2] 334417 337716
unable (5) 32971233185
34206349123349222
Uncomfortable [1] 335320
uncomfortable [1] 33589
undercurrent [11] 3361 14
18213363933652
336661033708339017
33941
undergoing |1| 337325
undergone [1] 32962
undergraduate [2] 3276 /6 17
understand [12] 33062
3325223349633547
33648338821345716
34641314831516
34841534912
understandably [1] 3492 I6
understanding [16] 3283 /2
$328510329415 \quad 332115$
3335933852033861014
$163426 / 434322334331$
3434834437345619 347919
understoud $14 \mid 337819$
3425334377349318
undertaken |1| 330122
undertook |l| 327621
unfortunately $11 \mid 343420$
unbon (2) 33442336218
unit (2) 3486710
United (121 32771032843
328621243299111617
330423331678334010
348521
unts |11 34192
University 19132761718
327853299235340421
34582334719
unlcensed 113362 19
unhke III 346221
unopened |l| 333323
unpleasant 11133589
unsteady |l| 3491 23
Untrue 111337617
untrue 111337616
unusual |4| 33606339824
339914
upset [1] 349216
USA |5| 3419 | 3427 |/
34622324346315
useful |11 3301 21
uses 111339615
usual | $2 \mid 33606 \quad 3422 / 4$
uthlty 113452 /1
uthice |l| 32925

- V -
vacation 111336316
vague [4| 33791318
$340043430 / 4$
validate |II 34142
validity |II 3282 /6
Valley II| 34049
Vallury 14| 3285 /2 34148
341523342023
value |11 3336 /

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
varies |1| 344822
variety |4| 3281 21328223
$3290233301 / 1$
vary (1) 329417
varying [1] 331320
velocity $\left[\begin{array}{lllll}21 & 3353 & 4 & 3354 & 13\end{array}\right.$
Verbal (1) 343119
verbal [1] 343117
versa [2] 3351 1 34012
version [2] 32839347014
versus $121 \begin{array}{llllll}3394 & 14 & 3417 & 19\end{array}$
Vessel [3] 34861924
348710
vessel 1461332772021
33431719334517
334625338833400122
34301434321122
34331834388344120

34506913345117
34531622345918
34601534651434669
34726347316
3474625347912348221
22 348720 3492 12 23
3493924
vessels 11013397 I/
$34422134469 / 318$
3457 / 346422134676
347817
vice $1213351 / 34012$
VIDEO |16| 33952034028
3427434332334353
3442834447348518
34965817202334971
$43498 / 1$
Video |14| 33951934027
34273343322343423
344273444634964716
$1922 \quad 2534973$
video $11113285 \quad 3 \quad 3395 / 8$
$340253427 / 343321$
343513442634445
$34567346073485 / 4$
VIDF OGRAPHER II 343424
videotape 111343420
view |31 329313332310
333415
Village [l] 33437
volatom (1) 3444 )
Virginua |2| 342722
virtually |1] $3297 / 4$
visibility 11133535
visut|3|334720 34649
3465 /
visted 19133472425
3464 /3 243479 /| 34817
348239
visting |1| 346416
vistors |3| 3479 /| 34802 15
visits [2] $328 / 43476 \quad 1$
vodka |11 33118
voce |l| 346221
volume [1] 3283 /3
voucher [1] 33343
voyage (9) $334419 \quad 3345 \quad 15$
22335124335210
335317343725343816
$T-\frac{5-31-94}{-W-}$

WAGNER [13] 333824
33422434025340325
34332134341634426
344433456618345723
34951734977
wagon [1] 3307 21
Watt [1] 33678
watt [1] 344110
watted [2] 33139345216
walk [6] $\begin{array}{lllllll}3297 & 12 & 3334 & 13 & 18\end{array}$
3452934882324
walked [3] $333423 \quad 348825$ 3489 I
walking [2] $3452 \quad 13 \quad 17$
wanted [14] $32868 \quad 332517$
334610336719337420
34223183432911
344318344522345214
348410348912
wants [2] 339312344018
warm [1] 33332
warmed [1] 33332
Warren $\{713451634548$
$\begin{array}{lllllllllll}10 & 11 & 17 & 25 & 3455 & 13\end{array}$
Washington [3| 3299116
330412
waste |4| 333827 II 13
wasting |11 33465
watch $14 \mid 33442333457$
1134914
watched [1] 3433 I1
watching [1] 333710
Water (1) 33817
water [2] 3353733835
waters [2] 3358733931
WATTS [4] 34446345617
349736
Watts $\left[\begin{array}{lllllll}28 \mid & 3444 & 5 & 13 & 3460 & 2\end{array}\right.$
 20346235346823
3469 / 3347011347622
347712222434782
34822134832618
348435
ways (1) 342922
We'll [4] 3351 10342418
34568349419
we'll [5] 33151733272
3386253424534715
We're [2] 33467335718
we're l11] 331718335121
335411335721335824
1933624337023339322 341213
We've [1| 3322 /3
we've [4| $3320243322 \quad 16$
33234340021
weaknesses $\{3 \mid 334825$
3349333504
weather [28] 3344151921
22233345733523578
1011343353341011
222533548335581113
33567924335725
335821
weather-wise [1] 3359 11
week [6] 33621633637
33842338745343110 weeks [7] 329425338317

1834223202234322
weught [1] 331819
Wen [1] 34554
weren't [7] 33602223
33611233891346424
34831348420
West [2] 34272234391
west (1) 335820
west-northwest [1] 335820
wheelhouse [1] 349114
whereas [2] 33142133162
widely [6] 328293283 11
$\begin{array}{llll}12 & 15 & 329417 & 3313 \\ 20\end{array}$
wife|5| 330324331015
3314633153334722
wildlife [3] 33241618 ,
33415
Willham [5] 33582325
33786342714
Willeamson [1] 34416
Wind [1] 335721
wind [9] 33534335412
335518335651333576
223358120
winds (3) 33544335516 335624
Wine [1] 33166
wine [15] 329923330824 33842022338578 8,
3436271923343726 2023
wing [4] 34891214
$349018 \quad 34919$
winter [2] $3362 \quad 25 \quad 338310$ wintertme [1] 338319
wiper [1] 34468
wish [1] 343011
wished [1] 336825
withdrawal [2] 328724
3293 2I
WITNESS [9] 327518
3309223310833436
3404834561534585
346215347023
Witness [8] 32751433244
3343334044345611
3458234621234707
witness [13] 32758329718
33075330925332325
33442433951516
34262534342534401
347118347617
witnessed (1] 33298
witnesses (1] 343418
women (3) 3305910
340515
won't (2) $335513 \quad 338912$
wonderful [1] 330318
word [7] 331115333923
336420339012339567 341122
words [17] $330620 \quad 331512$
203320833239332619
33411233514633552
3366253379202333802
34022334172334205
work [22] 3278432823
32843732981819
$332415 \quad 23340423$
3419153427162034367
3447103448115345817

Beace Syskers Appicatuors
34636163464234755 34806
work related [1] 338518
Worked [2] 3427203428 I worked [8] 33511339120 21344310345819 346319346420346518 working [10] 330221 334625334710 II 33911234358 I/ 24 344718346312
workshops [2] 3293 /
330825
world [8] 3282 /I 3283 /6
3284732881732949
32952133102033935
wouldn't [8] 32904330117
1833306333413335513 3358933759
write [3] 33553341625 34172
writug [3] $330512 \quad 335018$ 342524
written [5] 3277532837 335221342122343118 wrong [31 $330710 \quad 335119$ 339017
Wrote [1] 334714
wrote [5] $3303 \quad 23 \quad 330512$ 331446335022

- X -

XL [1] 33978

- Y -

Yeah [12] 32761633199
33401233481733702
3398334252234384
3439434407344317
34461
yeah [5] 3383433996
34264344323
Year (1) 343615
year [18] 32812330219
335683358733599
337622338116341012
$\begin{array}{llllllllll}343761217 & 23 & 344518\end{array}$
34483345825346310
34781634802
Years [1] 34366
years [17] 327824328023
32818334616336516
34021634272434361
344324344492434456
34461934473345820
34622534717
yesterday [1] 343917
York [5] 33632334396
345278347410
Yorktown [39] 33827
3392163393634051720
34487203449147
345052234511434543
345522346625347225
34731313233474249
12347523102024
3477101217347924
3481202334823
434846
you'd [2] 33747344223

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
You'll [1] 32853
you'll [1] 335714
You've [1] 339921
you've [9] 328] $6 \quad 3326$ 14 33405335322339822 3400212234212234455
young [2] 33081922
yours [1] 33505
yourself $181 \begin{array}{lllll}3282 & 18 & 3328 \quad 12\end{array}$
3330733691633972
3440834422348519

- Z -

Zero (1) 32915
zero (4) 329014329135 329622


| In cart Depry Clerk． | Page |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | TOM MRTIASA |
|  | U S．District 0art |
|  | 拖以 Thanere |
|  |  |
|  |  |
| Paprod br | JY 5 ERARR，FR |
|  | Registered Professioral Papater |
|  | Midngt ln Cort feprters |
|  |  |
|  | Antrae \＃ 481 B |
|  | Ph 901／E8－700 |

（i）Incart

In re－
）Caxe No．A89－0乃 CIV（IRH）
）Anctrafe Alaska
） 288 PM



Pages 1 子
APPEARANCES
For Plantiffs TMOIN J PEINENS
Birch ifrem bittuer \＆Chend
112 Lest Th Averue
（ 007 ） $26-180$
ORNS J THFEY
JONDEM
1081 W 4th Avere 9nte 60
Ph $90 / 2048$
（1）PROCEEDINGS
1）THE COURT We ll be bach on the record at this tume
（1）Court is ready to take up the motion of Chugach Alasica
（t）Corporation and certain others for remand of their case or
（s）cases to state court
（6）Mr Petumenos are you going to lead the charge？
（7）MR PETUMENOS I am Your Honor thank you
（8）THE COURT I wish in addressing this that you d
（9）tocus if on nothing else the matter that s of most concern to
（10）me which is the status of the stipulation that you all entered
（L）into in state court about the involvement of federal law
（I）Beyond that I think that needs to be the main focus of the
（13）thing If you d each take about 15 minutes to sum up your
（14）position
（1s）MR PETUMENOS Very well Your Honor Id like to
（16）address the stipulation certainly I dalso like to thank the
（17）Court for its handling of this matler in expedited review and
（18）its sensitivity to the calendaring issues that the motion
（19）presents and as you will hear Ithink at the end of my
（20）argument our rush to get these briefs to you if I do run over
（21）a few minutes we have by submital today found out a few more
（－）things about the removal that we weren taware of before
（ 3 ）THE COURT Don Irunover Mr Petumenos It sbeen
（ r ）a long day
（ 1 ）MR PETUMENOS First of all quickly the standard of

## Page 4

（1）review is of course any doubt about this motion for remand
（2）that you have to remand One of the things I wanted to state
（7）as a complete answer to Exxon scontentions ts that we do not
（4）bring in the state court a negligence per se ciaim undera
（5）federal statull We do not bring in the statc court an implied （6）causc of acition under ARPA We simply do not assert one The
17）context of the record the time that the April I Sth paper was
isi lilud which Exxon contcnds cruales the remand was this We （1）had a compensatory damages ulaim pending and a compensatory
（10）damages trial only pending in the State Superior Court
（II）Order Number 40 further restricted the issues and legal
（1）issues to be tried in that case The motion for summary
（13）judgment that was brought by Exxon asserted that the
（14）defendants claim for archacological damages insofar as it
（15）purported to clatm for artifacts that were not yet stoien－
（16）THECOURT Defendants or plaintıffs？
（17）MR PETUMENOS The defendants motion for summary （18）judgment
（1）THECOURT On whose Llaim your clam？
（ ${ }^{(0)}$ MR PETUMENOS On ourclasm for artifactsthat
（ \｜I weren t stolen yet was speculative and premature The
（7）plaintiffs wure responding that their claims under state law
（23）should bu rugardud as having asserted a property interest in
$(9)$ confidentiality cited to ARPA and to the state giatute
（ s）rulating－rugulaing archacological artifacts to persuade the

Court in-under state law that there was a property interest
that the Court should recognize under public policy and we stand or fall under state law on that motion for summary judgment
If Judge Shortell determines under state law that claim of
damages is too remote or too speculative we are prepared to lose the motion We do not rest upon negligence perse or an implied cause of action under ARPA to resist the motion You
will find no cause of action like that in our state
complaints You have reviewed our state complaints on a umber
of occasions and have determined that those state complaints
assert only state law and we have done nothing to change that
Now one of the things that I wanted the Court to bu sure of is that when the Court examines the record before it on a motion for remand you may also rely upon the representations of counsel who are here before you when we argue the motion
This is not like a Groucho Marx comedy routine where a duck
falls out of the sky and says you said the magic word you gel a free trip to federal court if we are able to assert here today that we are not bringing negligence per se claims are bound by it are not bringing claims under ARPA
I would cite the Court to follow the language from Coardus where the court heard similar argument to this and said likewise the court is unpersuaded that plaintiffs claim is in reality a claim under federal law Before the huaring

## Page 6

plaintiffs had assured the state court that they were not urging a cause of action based upon the federal statute and reiterated this position at oral argument in this court Indeed counsel for defendant conceded that plaintiffs would be
(5) bound by the representation to both the stath and fudural court
We deny that we violated the stipulation or had any intent to do so We are - we feel bound and welcome the Courts order extinguishing any cause of action under ARPA and extinguishing any cause of action for negligence per se This is the complete answer to Exxon 3 motion for remand The rest of the briefs that go on at some length describing whether negligence per se creates a federal question and describing whether or not ARPA even allows for an implied cause
(15) of action are totally unnecessary if this court comes to the
(16) conclusion that we are simply not bringing a claim under the
(17) federal statute
(18) The brief that was filed on April 15th was succeeded by
(19) another pleading In between the April 15 th pleading the
(20) opposition the motion for summary judgment brought by the
(21) defendants there was a motion in limine that was brought by
(22) the defendants over a similarissue I ve been looking forward
(23) to doing this all day Could I have the Elmo please? I could
(24) probably have handed this to you but this is just way too
(25) important
(i) Page 7
(1) Thure sa tootnote here Idon thnow how to bring this
(' down to a side you cansec it but wh dropped a footnole that
(3) said sce the Archacological Rcsourcas Protuclion Act ARPA
(4) Plaintiffs are not making a claim for damagus under ARPA but
(5) rather refer to it as an example of proper archaeological
(6) damage assessment methodology This footnote was presenled in
(7) a pleading served on Exxon after the opposition for the motion
(8) for summary judgment and before the rumoval
(9) The point is I mprepared to tilc an alfidavil lam
(in) preparad in itpresent as an otficurof the court we said it to
[11) Expon and to the world wh art not bringing a claim under ARPA
11 nor are we bringing a claim tor nugligunce purse at all
(13) In the stipulation that was signed by the parties there
( 14 ) was a lutler that was sent with it and it satd to Exxon wi
(15) don I want to see in essence the Groucho Marx duck fall from
(16) the ceiling and have us rumoved to federal court If we wish
(17) to assert under state law that a federal statute relates to
(18) some of the things we do that is not removal and we made it
(19) clear We did no more than that in this instance
(70) Remember that this Court must rimand if there is a doubt
(21) and in this instance Exxon even points to a foolnote contained
(2) right in the pleading that they contend crualus the rumoval in
( ${ }^{\prime}$ ) which wh say we ru not rulying on fuderal law and federal law
( A) is not controling hurl But it mavhilp you Judge interms
is) of the insucs that are before you under stale law

## Page 8

(1) Exxon says that the foolnote is ambiguous Well remember
() that you must remand if there is a doubt And there is no
(3) ambiguity curtainly now that we are not asserting either
(4) negligencu pur at or an implied causual action
(S) There are co manv layers io what is wrong with this removal
16) that it would take more than 15 minutes lo describu them but
(7) the tact of the matter remains that if you go through all these

181 cases and go through all this tortuous process even if we were
(9) doing what Exxon is saying it still not removal and the
(10) reason for that is there is no substantial federal question
(II) presented Substantial federal quistions of this nature you
(12) firse look to the complaint to determine if anything there is
(i3) alleged There $s$ no dispute here that there s nothing in the
(14) complaint
(15) Exxon points to the other paper rule and makes a very
(16) disingenuous argument If you recall al the time that the
(17) stipulation was entered into we were given 48 hours to sign
(is) the stipulation or we would bl rumoved and remember also that
(19) the grounds for the - for the alluged removal were briefs that
( 0 ) we d filud in front of the TAPA fund Exxon here contends
(i) well Judge that s not another paper filud in a state court
(22) that couldn thave triggered removal which raises the
(3) question why then were these plaintiffs subjected to a 48 hour
(24) demand that they signa stipulation when thure was no paperin
(25) the state court from which to bring the removal It a a bit

Page 9
inconsistent isn $1 t^{7}$
But we signed the supulation for the reason that once
you re removed it can tahe you a bit of tume to get back to state court and it can be very disruptive and the other reason is we weren tbringing a clam in that area We were giving up nothing by signing the stipulation
Turning to the issue of Merrill Dow Exxon concedes essentially that if Merrill Dow applies to this case and even if all of their arguments about bringing negligence pur su clatm were correct they lose And the ruason that they say Merrill Dow doesn tapply they state a couple of othcr reasons which are unpersuasive laku maritime law applics that sa defense as you know and have ruled and you can (plead that as (I4) removal Your Honor
(1s) They say it s because ARPA provides us with an implied (16) cause of action under federal law Well it does no such
(17) thing It does no such thing because ARPA doesn $t$ apply to (18) lands that are owned by a native corporation ARPA by th 1191 terms says nothing in this chapter shall be construed to
(20) effect any land other than public land or Indian land or to
(1) effect the lawful recovery collection or sale of

1-) archaecological resources from land othur than public land or
(3) Indian land
(4) THE COURT What dousthulurm Indian land incan
s) theres

Page 10
(1) MR PETUMENOS Suction 470(b)(b)(4) defincs the lurm Indian land and it providus that it muans land which has a restriction on alienalion which is turned over And now you have othcr cascs I know wher thal inuu has cumb up THECOURT That $s$ whylashod MR PETUMENOS Nalive corporalion the nalive curporation lands about which wh claim in stat court have no such restriction on altenation lixbeen clear in other contexts that Indian lands art not native corporation lands and those are the lands over which we seeh recovery So we could go through together the Cort factors as we do in the brief as to whether there sa legislative intent and whether Wh ra a lass that sprotcelid undur the ARPA statut and so
(la) forth but il sunnecessary because the statute does not even
ils, purport to control the lands about which we claim
(10) In the Cort case you will rumumbur stackholders sued (17) their corporation because thuir corporation was providing (18) financing 10 a fuderal ulection and thuy wint through the Cort
 (0) It would be as if those stochholdurs had sucd thuir corporation

1 i) lor biving muncy to a munisipal sthool board clution and they
1 , would have been out of court quick bueause the statute that
1 31 was involved didn icvun purport to cover anything othur thana
1 4) fuderal tection The ARPA statute does not covar the lands
i s) about which the claims are being brought in state court and
(1) Exxon should be out of court quick on the issue of the implied
(2) right of action under ARPA
(3) So if the Merrill Dow case applies then one can take a
(4) look at the dissent in Merrill Dow and it reads just like
(5) Exxon s brief farly well reasoned but in a stare decisis
(6) dissent before this court negligence per se necessanily
(7) includes a determination of federa! law about which the
(8) planniffs clams succeed or fail is the argument
(9) Remember also under Merrill Dow that when you are talking (10) about federal question jurisdiction and the complaint is only
(L) state law and there is some underlying principle of federal
(19) law behind the state law that is the basis for the
(131 Jurisdiction Merrill Dow teaches that you are now Judge on
(14) the outer limis of the removal statute In addition to having
(IS) a doubt you - you find words and opinions like, now the Court
(16) is to be cautious now the Court is - has got sensitive isaues
(17) of federal/state relations and the burden goes even higher
(18) And there 3 more Even if you were to find an implied
(19) cause of action somehow under these circumatances for a federal
(20) statute which doesn $t$ concern these lands which has no
( I) legislative intent suggesting a private cause of action
1 ) bucause there are criminal statutes civil penalties all at
(1) the behest of the sceretary even if all that were true the
( 4) rumedy in the implied cause of action has to be the ame remedy
( 5 ) as the rumudy that $s$ buing sought in the underlying state

## Page 12

(1) case
(2) The remedy that we re speahing in the underlying state case
(3) is excavation of the sites because they ve been diacovered and
(s) thure s a confidunuslity property interest How can ARPA
( 5 ) surve a rumedy of excavation on lands that ARPA doean $t$ sover?
(6) If that were true there $d$ be an implied cause of action on (7) private lands State of Alaska land the house next door (8) Can tbe
(9) Finally even if there was a private right of action the
(10) Zeek case teaches that absent clear case law that that
(it) statute existent case law intended to preempt the state
(I) court the party sover and remand is to be granted
(13) This distinguishes the stuation you had in Order 61 where (14) the plaintiffs remember actually pled in their complaint a
(1s) negligence per se claim and lo and behold the federal
(16) statute that was undurlying the negligence per se claim was
(I7) TAPA itself a strict liability statute governing the very oul (18) spill and that sthe stuation that the cases are talking
(19) about
(.o) Hurb by contrast we re talking about one damagea remedy ( I) as to one part of a complaint remembering that the bulk of the
(r) native corporation complaint is for land claims unrelated to (י) archaeology that most of the archaeological clatms are related (-4) to direct impatis as opposed to secondary impacts that this ( -5 ) one relatus to sucondary impacts and the paper that is alleged
(1) to create the jurisdiction is an opposition paper responding to
() a defense and that sounds familiar Lihe Papadopoulos if you
3) respond to something rased by the detense il s not
(4) removable
(5) As to an attempt to convince the state judge of a public (6) policy grounds to recognize the property right under state law (7) and if that is in fact what the plaintiffs are doing the case
8) is virtually indisinguishable from the holding - I II have II
9) here in a minute in Donofrev ( ph ) which was ciled in our
(10) opening brief
(ll) The defendants quote from a casc called Salveson which
(1) before discussing timeliness hare I will quolu from As the
(13) foregoing discussion shows the plaintiff's right to control
(14) his pleadings is firmily established and could not be curtailed
(is) by binding him to the characterization others may have placed (16) on the same claims
(17) And what Salveson was about was a case in which the
(18) plaintiffs the ones that didn iget remanded had previously
(19) filed in federal cour had suffered summary judgment and
(20) tried to recharacterize their claims in anti trust law as state
(21) claims and the court didn tallow it The case here couldn t
(2) be more different And the Salveson court was careful to note
(03) that the defendants cannot recharacterize the plaintiffs
(r4) claims They are the masters over their claims
(s) And finally I d like to tell the Court that there is vet

Page is
II Ithinh that this is not a elosu question and the
() dutendant s removal should be not sustained and our motion
(3) should be granted Thank you
(4) THECOURT Mr Daum?
(s) MR DAUM Mayit please the Court John Daum for
(s) Exxon Corporation We rumoved this cas Your Honor for the
(7) vurv simplust of reasons Platntiffs brought a claim which so
'ri far as wh arc aware cannot possibly hi valid under state law
(9) and when they rualised that stak law did not support them
(10) they chosc to ruly on a provision ol Iaderal law the

Ill Arshaerolngical Resourcts Protction Acl Wbthinh federal law
"! 1 whes belong in fidaral tourt
(13) Now Me Petumenos said at considerable length that the
(14) plaintiffs weren tassurting a clasm based on nugligence per
(1S) se thcy whren tasserting a claimbased on ARPA What he
(16) proved to mean by that was that there was no claim called that
(17) in the plaintiffs complaints and that strue But there was
(18) such a claim in the document on the basis of which we removed
(19) Mr Petumenos didn t talk about that document

101 Now hu quotud a greal New Yorkcr Groucho Marx Lul me
(') quote anothcrone Al Smith Let slooh at the record Page
137 of thuirdocument Exhihit 4 savsundur Alaska law
violation ol a rugulation or statule stath or hedural
constilutcancgligencl pur se and then thay say a few lines
latur below plaintifls discuss the appropriatc statutory and

## Page 16

(1) regulatory standards of care as applied to archacological sites () and dinturbance of those sties And then on the next page (1) their hwading says state law incorporated the appropriate
(s) standard of care and then they go on to talk about ARPA And (s) then on page 39 toward the bottom of the page they say an (6) Lxamination of ARPA s statutory scheme as it is incorporated in (7) the state law and then they go on
(8) So the proposition that there s nothing about negligence
(9) perse that there $s$ no claim based on ARPA in this pleading (10) in this memorandum is just not true And the fact that it $s$ (II) not in the complaint doesn t make any difference under Section (12) 1446(b) The question is is it in another paper and if you (IJ) read that paper it s there
(14) Now the second thing Mr Petumenos seemed to alay is that (15) he can stand up here and say oops we re sorry we didn : (18) intend to make such a claim if you II send us back we ll give (17) it up We re sorry about that
(18) Well you can to that it is absolutely clear that
(19) jurisdiction is judged at the time of removal that if there is
(30) jurisdiction at that moment there is jurisdiction and the
(21) fact that a plaintiff may give up a federal clam later on
( ${ }^{(2)}$ ) doesn $I$ deprive the Court of jurisdiction once acquired and
(23) there are excellent policy reasons why that should be so
(4) Your Honor asked me to address the stipulation and let me
(n) do that The plaintiffs entered into a slipulation saying that

Page 17
(1) they would not make slams undur ARPA in this litigation Thuy 1, have done that Thuy said that they would not assurt that ARPA
(3) was incorporated in the State law They have done that Thuy
(4) said they would not assert that ARPA governed or controlled the
(s) damages they could rucover They have done that They said
(6) that they would not argue that ARPA provided the approprtate
(7) standard of care and they have done that They have - we
(8) leaned over backwards Your Honor nol to remove these wases
(9) When the materials came in from the TAPS fund those
(10) materials did not standing alone - Mr Pulumenos is quite
(ll) correct - standing alone thu TAPA briefs did not provide a
(I-) basis for removal but they certannly raisud a concern in our
(131 mind that the plaintiffs were making thuse claims in the state
(14) court litigation That $s$ why we proposed to them the
(15) stupulation They signed it they agreed to that We thought
(10) the ciaims were out of the stath court hitigation wh rulied on
(17) that We had every right to rely on that $W_{L}$ had cvery reason
(18) to rely on that
(19) They have breached their word their stipulation and Judge
(20) Shortell sorder Il seems to me that ought not to bu tahtn
ill very lightly
(22) Now what the plainiffis say is that they re entitled to

131 breach thuir stipulation they rc cntitled to mahu this claim
( 4) under ARPA and then they can come in hure and say well we
did
1 " abrec lo it but when we breached the stipulation you re not

## Page 18

alt anlilled to remove your only rumbdy is (o) ash the vale court
in to strike our plading
(3) Well I submit to Your Honor that the statute says if a
(4) fuderal claimis made in another paper the dufundanithas a
(i) right to remove and il cannol be the casc that a stipulation or
(0) LVen a stath court order candeprive a delundant of a right
(7) provided by a fuderal statute and it eannol bu equity that
tit somuanc who makesenatrumunt whoviolatc)!l whi
violalus a

1101 defundants wh gut toc choove what rumblics you have for our
111 braschus of our conducl That inn 1 rieht
(1) Now lut me talh if 1 may lor a momint ahnut the ral
(13) issut and that $s$ whather their opposition to trur motion in
(14) state court shows that they ru making a claim which is in the

119 original jurisdicion of this courl becausw it arisus undur
(10) Ederal law We think it does Order 61 is squarely on
(17) point Plaintiffs say in thuir opposition to our motion the

Hy papur that gave risu to removal that they ruly on the Alasha
wh1 varsion of nugligunce purse and the statutory violation is a
(20) violation of ARPA Nut every state ircals nugligunce purst in
i 11 the samb way And that simportant io undurstand in ruading
1 ) the cascs But in Alaska nugligence puricint a maticr ol
(_3) evident or a rubuttal prusumplion In Alasha all you have to
( 4 show is a statutory violation and taundion And in Ordur 6 )
is Your Honor held quile worrcotly thal the Aldahd varvion ol

Page 19
(1) negligence per se is a form of strict liability and that when a (-) plaintiff relies in whole or in part on a federal statute as (i) nugligence per se that the claim is a variety of strict (4) lability under federal law and creates federal jurisdiction (5) However you slice it the plantiff whose sole claim is (6) you violated a federal statute and that caused my harm I can (7) recover that plaintiff in the most simple and direct sense (8) is making a claim that $s$ based on and arises under federal law (9) there $s$ federal jurisdiction That $s$ what the Court held in (10) Order 61 That sright
(H) Now let me move on from Order 61 because even apart from (i) that there is federal jurisdiction here We cate Franchise (13) Tax Board for the proposition that if a substantial proposition (14) of federal law must be decided in order for the plaintiff to (is) recover there is jurisdiction The plaintiffs principal (16) argument in opposition to that is that the clam is not
(17) substantial and they rely on Merrill Dow which they
(18) mischaracturize but even on their theory the argument
(19) collapses if ARPA provides a private right of action and they
(.) don t really argue why it doesn $t$
( 11 Congress passed ARPA precisely to provide protection to
( 7 ) archacological resources on federal land and Indian land it ( 3 ) included native corporations in the dufinition of Indian tribes ( 9 d contrary to the usual rule that Section 470 (b)(b)( 5 ) of the
statute specifically required federal land managers to consult

[^48]Page 21
Il are here but those who someday mav be here and who are
() simularly situated who have valuable archacological resources
(a) Now Mr Petumenos did make one argumunt that I need to
(s) respond to He says at somb length that their lands are not
(5) Indian lands and therefore they are not entilled to suc undur
(6) ARPA Now I don 1 think that aright in terme of the specitic
(7) definition of native corporations as a tribl under Suction
(8) $470(\mathrm{~b})(\mathrm{b})(5)$ but even if they were right that wouldn t change
(9) the rule here Under Merrill Dow thu test is whether the
(10) statute provides a private rumedy not whether a particular
(II) plaintiff has a valid clarm
(1) To take an uxample thure selcarlya private remedy undur
(I) Rule $10(\mathrm{~b})(5)$ of the Securitics Exchange $A$ al and thure $s$
(14) federal jurisdiction for that clasm That rulu limuts the
(19) private remedy to people who are purchasury or sellirs but if
(16) someone who is not a purchaser or seller sucs undur Rule
(17, 10(b)(5) there s clearly jurisdiction svenit latur on the
(18) court has to say that there $s$ no cause of action or at least no
(19) successful cause of action
(0) So if there sa privale righi privalu rumbdy undur ARPA
(1) even if plaintiffs don ifit within it there is still federal
( ) jurisdiction for the purposes of the Mcrrill Dow ruling and
( 3 ) the reason for that brings me to the plainuffs
( 4 ) mischaracterization of that rule
is The planntiffs ovcrsmplify it They say it sabout

Page 22
whether a private remedy cxists Well ils not llsabout the intent of congress What Merrill Dow says is that whin congress has affirmatively excluded a private remody that decision is tantamount to a direction that only state courts should construe a particular statute and thurulore the federal courts should not do so When thers is a privalu remedy that analysis doesn $t$ follow even if the particular plaintiff may not be within the scope of the private remady That s why when there is a private remedy foderal jurisdiction exists in this circumstance and Merrill Dow dousn ! apply And that salso relevant because this is a maritime case Merrill Dow was not We point out in our papurs plainliffs papers don $t$ say otherwise that the rationale of Merrill Dow doesn tapply al all in a maritime case because in that kind of case the plantiff can always come into federal court In a maritime case a determination by congress not to provide a federal statutory remedy can t possibly be taken as a congressional directive that only state courts should inlurpret a particular federal statute Quite the contrary congress intended that all such suits could be in federal court and the Merrill Dow exception to the general rule that theres jurisdiction when a federal statute is called into play simply doesn tapply in a maritime case
We ask that Your Honor - unless Your Honor has somb questions I I! sul down We ash that Your Honor dany the

## motion to ramand

(1) THECOURT Thanh you ur

MR DAUM Lat me poinal out fust one bricl thing
Excusc mb Mr Pulumbnos Thuy did lik this last-last
minut paper Mosi ol il is addrussud to the TAPA fund
documbnts As I say nobodv conlends that the TAPA tund
documents themsulves ureated a right to remove They waren I
(8) in the paper They also rely on onc document of ours from

March of this yuar A defendants documant cannot create is not anether paper for purposes of creating a right to rumove
II) Thiy don t sugest that at any time prior to April 15 they

II dsscricd a causu ol attion undur ARPA and they haven t shown
(IV) anything that sugt wis that the rumoval was unlimely

11d Thank you
ils THECOURT Mr PLlumLnos save yourbreath Iam
(1) foing to grant the motion to rumand I ll give some thought in
[17) whuther or not wh should give a wrillen ducision on this or
(18, not hucausc there are somb aspucts - therlare some aspects
(19) of this stluation that are a complele mystery to me and while
(0) 11 might be inlurasting to $\quad$ xplore them 1 m not sure it ,
i If worthwhile but I It think about it
1 I What I would have you understand is that I was totally
(n) perpluxed bv the position that the plaintiffs have takun here
( ) It sucms in me thal the plaintiffs have heen all over the yard
i $\{1$ on their - thur position ubout the ludural statut Had I

Page 24
(1) been a private attorney in Exxon 3 shoes faced with what they
i) were faced with I surely would have removed this case also and
(3) tried as hard as I could to make it stick
(s) But when all is said and done il s my vicw of this maticr
(f) that the plamilify whor are sueking rumand inflered into an

(7) law and 1 m going in take the plaintiffs litcrally at their
xi word onthat ltahe the position that vou have no fuderal
(9) clarm hclause you kdve il up that you have no nugligunce per
(10) st claim in stath courl bucausc you ve disavowed il All the
(1) talk about that hind of clasm all the talk about the
(1) involvement ol ARPA in your case to the contrary
(13) notwithstanding you ve got no clamm for either the federal
(14) statutio or any theory basud upon it You vi got no negligence
(1S) per se clam based on fuderal law and on that basis 1 m going
(16) to send you all back to state court with if nothing else a
(17) summary order that relates to Judge Shortell what I ve said
(18) just now and quite frankly if you start talking about a claim (19) based on ARPA or negligunce pur sL hasud on ARPA again these
( 0) folks art going to remove your casc again and they may have
( 11 you if it happens again bucauscat this point Itake the
1 I position that you ra sill bound by that stipulation Even
(3) though il appears to me that you violated Ithink you re bound
(2) by it and bucause you re bound by il you regoing back to
(2s) state court
(1) We ll be in recess subject to call
() THE CLERK This courl is in rucus subject to tall
(3) (Recess al 245 pm )
(") STATE OF ALASKA)
' ' Ruportur $\triangle$ Curtilicall
(3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA)
161 I Joy S Braucr a Rubincurad Prolcinanal
(7) Ruportur and Notary Public
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
(9) That the toregorng transcript contarns a truc and
n0, accuratc ranscription of my shorthand notus of all raquestud
Ith matlers huld in the forcgoing captoned adse
(1) Further that the transcripl was prepared by me
(13) or under my diruction
(14) DATED this day
us) of 1994
: 11 JOY S BRAUER RPR
Notary Public lor Alava
1 , My Cummission E\pirus $\{1047$

```
dance Syblem: Appl callumy
Look-See Concordance
Report

UNIQUE WORDS 786
TOTAL OCCURRENCES 2,123
NOISE WORDS 385
TOTAL WORDS IN FILE 5,706
Single File Concordance
Case Sensitive
NOISE WORD LIST(S)
NOISE NOI
includes all Text OCCURRENCES

IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES @ BOTTTOM of Page

Maximum Tracked OCCURRENCE THRESHOLD 50

NUMBER OF WORDS
SURPASSING OCCURRENCE Threshold 2

LIST OF THRESHOLD WORDS
federal |Sol
state |Si|

dgreement \(\{2 \mid 188246\)
Al|l| 1521
Alaska 101331271522
\(181822 \quad 2325202124\) 2621
Thenation (2) 1038
alleged \(14 \mid 813 \quad 19 \quad 1225\)
1414
dllow 111321
dlows 111614
alone [2] \(1710 \quad 11\)
ambiguty [1] 83
ambiguous 11181
dnalysis 111227
answer [2] 43611
anta trust [1] 1320
apart 1119 II
appears [1] 2423
applied [1] 16 I
applies \([4] 98 \quad 12 \quad 113\)
1423
apply|s|9 \(1 / 17 \quad 221014\) 23
approprittel3| 1525163
176
Apral4|47618 192311
Archaeological [2] \(7315 / 1\)
irchaeological|lu| 41425
7592212231417161
19222012212
archacology (1) 1223
area (1) 95
aren't111 2015
argue \(31516 \quad 1761920\)
argument 19132052363
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}8 & 16 & 118 & 1916 & 18 & 2017\end{array}\)
213
arguments 1199
arses [2] \(1815 \quad 198\)
ARPA|38146 245821
69147341191517
181013241121245
1415151516469171
246241820191921
20523216202312
241219
artufacts [3| \(415 \quad 2025\)
Ash 11| 207
aspects \(12123 / 8\)
assert \(171 \begin{array}{lllll}4 & 5 & 12 & 19 & 717\end{array}\)
1724246
dsserted 1314132312312
dsserting \(\left\lvert\, \begin{array}{llllll} & 8 & 3 & 15 & 14 & 15\end{array}\right.\)
assessment 1176
dssume \(111 / 4\) /
assured 1116 /
attempt |11/35
attorney |11 24 1
avoid [1| 2018
dwarel2| 322158
- B-
backwards [1] 178
based \(1916215 / 415169\)
19824141519
basls |s| \(1 / 1212151518\)
17122415
behest |l| // 23
behind II| 1112
behold 111 12 IS
belheve [1] 143
belong [! 1512
binding [1] 1315
bit [2] 82593
Board [1] 1913
board [1] 1021
bound [7] 521658246
222324
BRAUER [1] 2621
breach [1] 1723
breached [2] 171925
breaches [1] 18 11
breath 1112315
brief [5] \(6 \quad 18 \quad 1012115\)
1310233
briefs \([5] 320612819\)
1481711
bringing [7] 52021616
71112959
brings [1] 2123
broad (1) 202
bulk (1) 1221
burden |11 1117
————
calendaring \(1113 / 8\)
call 1212512
captioned 11126 II
care [31614177
careful [I] 1322
case 12513441298
1016113121210 II
137111721156185
 2026 II
cases 1613588104
12181781822
causation |1] 1824
caused (1) 196
cautious |1] 1/ 16
cealing 111716
CERTIFY III 268
change [2] 512218
chapter 11919
characterization (11)/3 15
charge [1] 36
choose (1) 1810
chose III 1510
Chugach 11133
circumstance 11 ) 2210
circumstances [1] 1119
cite \(12 \mid 522 \quad 1912\)
cted [3] 424139206
civil 11 |l 22
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}\text { clamm } 145 \mid & 44 & 9 & 14 & 15 & 19\end{array}\)
205524256167411
\(12951010715 \quad 1215\)

\(\begin{array}{llllllllllllllll}169 & 16 & 21 & 1723 & 184 & 14\end{array}\)
1935816211114246
91011131518
clatms |ls| 42252021
10251181222231316

class (II 1013
clear \(141719108 \quad 1210\)
1618
CLERK |1| 252
chent \(11 / 14 / 6\)
chents [1] 2020

Coardus [1] 522
collapses [1] 1919
collection (1] 921
comedy [1] 517
Commission [1] 2622
compensatory [2] 49
complaint (7) 81212141110
121421221611
complaunts [4] 51011
1517
complete [3] 436112319
conceded [1] 64
concedes 11197
concern 3 [3139 11 201712
concerned [1] 1412
concluson [1] 616
conduct [1] 18 11
confidentuality [2] 424124
Congress [2] 1921202
congress [5] 2032223
1619
congress.onal [1] 2218
consider (1) 2025
considerable 111513
consututes (1) 1524
construe [1] 225
construed 11919
consult [1] 1925
contained (11 72 )
contains [1] 269
contend lil 722
contends [3] 48820236
contentions 11143
context [1] 47
contexts [1] 109
contrary (3) 19242219
2412
contrast (1) 1220
control [2] \(1015 \quad 1313\)
controlled (1) 174
controlling [1] 724
convince [1] 135
Corporation [2] 34156
corporation [10] 918106
\(\begin{array}{llll}7 & 9 & 17201222 & 20421\end{array}\)
corporations [4] 1923201 15217
correctly [1] 1825
Cort 14] 10111618206
costs (1) 2018
counsel (3) 516642018
couple (11) 9 11
course [1] 41
COURT [10] 32823416
1992410515423215 Court [16] 331741051
2131422687201115
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}16 & 13 & 25 & 15 & 16 & 22 & 199\end{array}\)
court 14113511445519
 82125941072225
\(\begin{array}{lllllllll}11 & 1 & 12 & 12 & 13 & 19 & 21 & 22\end{array}\)

\(\begin{array}{lllllll}14 & 15 & 20 & 18 & 21 & 18 & 22 \\ 15\end{array}\)
2024101625252
courts [3] 224618
cover [3] \(1023 \quad 24 \quad 125\)
create [2] 131239
created [2] 205237
creates [4] 48613722
194
(reating [1] 2310
crumunal|1| \(/ 122\)
curtailed \(111 / 3 / 4\)
\(-\quad-\mathrm{D}-\)
damages \(17149 \quad 101456\)
741220175
DATED (1) 2614
DAUM [2] 155233
Daum 1211545
dav1313 \(24623 \quad 2614\)
decided 111914
decision [2I 2242317
decisis 111115
defendant [4] 64152184 \(万\)
Defendants |l| 416
defendants 1914 /4 17 6 21
2213112314231810
239
defending 11 | 2017
defense \(31 \begin{array}{lllll}9 & 13 & 1323\end{array}\)
defines 11101
defintion [?1) 1923217
demand lil 824
deny 121672225
deprive [2] \(1622 \quad 186\)
describe 11186
describing 12161214
desecrated 111204
despite 111147
determination \(\{2 \mid 1172216\)
determine \(121812 \quad 1019\)
determined 11511
determines ll| 55
differencell| 16 /1
direct l2| 1224197
direction \(12122426 / 3\)
directive \(11122 / 8\)
disavowed 11124 IO
disclosure 1/| 14 /4
discovered [1] 123
discovery \(121 / 41319\)
discuss 1111525
discussing 1111312
discussion \(11 / 13 / 3\)
dasingenuous \([1] 8\) /6
dispute [1] 813
disruptive [1] 94
dissent [2] \(1 / 46\)
distingurshes \(11 / 12 / 3\)
disturbance 11162
document (5) \(15 \quad 181922\)
2389
documents \(|2| 2367\)
doesn't 1111911171120
1251611221920227
\(10 \quad 14 \quad 23\)
dollar [1] 1416
Donofrey [1] 139
door (1] 127
double-edged \(111 / 422\)
doubt 14141720821115
Dow 1515981111349
1319172192222210
121321
dropped 11172
duck \([2] 517715\)
\(\frac{-\mathbf{E}-}{}\)

Friday \(111 / 421\)
front 111820
fully 11149
fund 1418201792356
-G -
gavel리 1818249
give \(14 \mid 1616 \quad 21231617\)
given 111817
giving 121951021
goes 1111117
governed Till 174
governang \(111 / 217\)
grant 1112316
granted 1211212153
great \(121 / 520 \quad 2024\)
Groucho \(131517 \begin{array}{llllll} & 15 & 15 & 20\end{array}\)
ground 11141
grounds [2] \(819 \quad 136\)
\(-\quad \mathrm{H}-\)
handed 11624
handling |1| 317
happens 1112421
hard |1| 243
harin 11196
haven't |ll 2312
heading [1] 163
hear 111319
heard |11 523
hearing \(111^{5} 25\)
held (3) \(1825 \quad 199 \quad 2611\)
help III 724
HFRBY 11268
hugher |11 \(1 / 17\)
holding 111138
Honor 11413715914156
 22222425
horse l11 1420
hours 111817
house [1] 127
\(\frac{-\mathrm{I}-}{-}\)
l'd \(131315 \quad 16 \quad 1325\)
l'vel31622 1422417
umpacts \(131 / 22425\)
implication (1) 208
implied [11] 4558614
8491510191111824
126145
importance |l| 2024
umportant \(\left[\begin{array}{llll}31 & 65 & 18 & 21\end{array}\right.\)
2011
included 11 | \(/ 923\)
includes \(111 / 17\)
meoncervable |1| 203
inconsistent 119 |
incorporated 1311636173
Indian [10| \(920 \quad 23 \quad 24 \quad 102\)
9192223201521215
indstingutshable 11138
information \(111 / 415\)
insofar |2| 4 /4 1422
instance [2] 71921
intend 111616
intended \(131 / 21 / 203\)
2220
intent 1416710121121

222
interest \(|3| 42351124\)
interesting 1112320
intereats 13120142025
interpret \(11 \mid 2218\)
involved III 1023
involvement \([2] 3\) /l 2412
tssuel71622 97104111
1813201122
wnet 16131841112
72511161512
- - J -

John 111155
JOY 1112621
Judge 16155724821
\(\begin{array}{lllll}1 / 131719 & 2417\end{array}\)
judge 111135
judged 111619
judgment|6| \(41318 \quad 54\)
620781319
Jurisdiction 1171111013
131161920221815

22922
\(\overline{-L-}\)
10141920 \(22 \quad 24\)
10212722192225
lands llill 918107910
1524112012572145
language 111522
last|3| 1421234
law 13813114225135
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}12 & 25 & 717 & 23 & 25 & 912 & 16\end{array}\)
1171112121011136
2015891011221637
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}173 & 18 & 16 & 194814 & 206\end{array}\)
162324715
lawful|l| 921
layers 11185
lead 11136
leaned 111178
learned 111/421
legal 111411
legislative 12110121121
\(\begin{array}{lllll}l & \text { length } 131612 & 15 & 13 & 214\end{array}\)
letter |11 714
luability \(|3| 12171914\)
lightly 111721
likewise IIIS 24
limine 111621
limits |2| 11 /4 21 |4
lines |11 1524
literally 111247
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}\text { litgation } & 14 & 14 & 17 & 1714\end{array}\)
16
lo 1111215
long-term III 2020
lose 12157910
\(-\quad-\quad \mathbf{M}\)
magic 111518
main |l| 312
managers |II 1925
March 14| \(141318 \quad 24239\)
maritune \(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}5 & 9 & 12 & 22 & 11 & 14\end{array}\)
1623
Marx \(13!5177151520\)
creating to Marx
\(\begin{array}{llll}\text { master } & \text { (2) } & 14 & 13 \\ 19\end{array}\)
masters |1] 1324
materials [2] 17910
matter [6] 3917871822
2024244
matters |1| 26 ||
mean \([2 \mid 9241516\)
means |l| 102
memorandum [1] 1610
Merrill |l5|978 11 |l 34 913191721922222
\(10 \quad 12 \quad 1321\)
methodology 11176
mullion (1) 1416
mind 111713
minute [2] 139235
minutes 1313132186
mischaracterization |1]
2124
mischaracterize [1] 19 /8
moment [2] \(1620 / 812\)
money (1) 1021
motion (19133184112
175378151661120
2177152181317231
16
move [1] 19 /]
inunicipal 111021
mystery (1) 2319
\(-\mathrm{N}-\)
Native (3) 106201421
natuve 18191810691222 19232013217
nature 111811
needs |1] \(3 / 2\)
negligence 1231445720
610137128499116
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}1215 \quad 16 \quad 144 & 1514 & 24\end{array}\)
168181920221913
2491419
nobody 111236
nonsense 111/4 2
Notary |11 2621
note [1] 1322
notes 1112610
notwithstanding III 24 /3
Number 11411
number llls 10
-O-
objectuve 1112019
observer [1] 2020
occastons |115 11
occurs [1] 1422
odd (1) 2016
officer 111710
oil 111217
ones 1111318
cops \(11116 / 5\)
opening |1| 1310
opinions \(111 / 1 / 5\)
opposed |11 1224
opposition \(16 \mid 62077131\)
\(\begin{array}{llll}18 & 13 & 171916\end{array}\)
oral 11163
Order 16| 4 /l \(121318 / 6\) 241910 /l
order 1616917201869 19142417
original [1] 1815
ought [1] 1720
ours [1] 238
outer 111 1114
oversimplify |l| 2125
owned 119 /8
\(-\mathrm{P}-\)
pm [1] 253
Page [1| 1521
page [3] 1625
Papadopoulos [1] 132
paper [15] 478152124
12251311421241612
1318418235810
papers \(|3| 148 \quad 22 \quad 12 \quad 13\)
part \(\{2 \mid 1221 \quad 192\)
parties [2] 7132025
party (1) 1212
passed 111 1921
passing [1] 2010
penaltues [1] / 22
pending [2] 4910
people (1) 2115
perplexed [11 2323
persuade 111425
petation (2) \(14720 \mathrm{r}_{\mathrm{r}}\)
PETUMENOS [7] 371525
417201016
Petumenos 19 lllllll \(\begin{array}{llllll}6 & 23 & 15 & 13\end{array}\)
1916141710213234
15
ph 11139
placed 111315
plantuff 19113131621
1925714211122815
\(\begin{array}{llllll}\text { Plaintiffs } & 13174 & 15 & 7 & 18 & 17\end{array}\)
planntiffs [27] 41622524
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}614 & 4 & 23 & 11 & 1214137\end{array}\)

\(1713221915 \quad 20182121\)
23252212232324245
7
play |11 2222
plead [119 13
pleading 1716197722
1413169182
pleadings 1111314
please [2] 623155
pled 11| 12 /4
pount \(17179 \quad 1817 \quad 201011\)
22122332421
poments 21 \(^{7} 721815\)
policy 131521361623
position \([8] 314632016\)
\(\begin{array}{lll}19 & 23 & 23 \\ 25 & 248 \\ 22\end{array}\)
potential 1112024
precisely (1) 1921
preempt |l| 12 I/
premature 1 I 421
prepared \(\mid+1567910\)
2612
presented 121 \(7681 /\)
presents 111319
presumption [1] 1823
previously (1) \(13 / 8\)
principal III 19 /s
principle [1] /1 /1
prior 11123 II
private \| \(171 / 1\) 2/ 1279
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}19 & 19 & 208 & 23 & 21 & 10 & 12 \\ 15\end{array}\)
202213689241
process [1] 88
proper [2] 752013
property [4] 42351124
136
proposed [1] 1714
proposition \([3] 168 \quad 1913\)
protected (1) 1013
Protection (2) 731511
protection [1] 1921
proved [1] 1516
provide [3] 17,11 1921
2216
provided [3] 176187206
provides \([4] 915,102\)
19192110
providing [1] 1017
provision [1] 1510
Public [1] 2621
public (4) 5292022135
purchaser [1] 2116
purchasers [1] 21 15
purport [2] \(1015 \quad 23\)
purported [1] 415
purpose (1) 202
purposes (3) \(1422 \quad 2122\)
2310
puts [1] 2018
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline - Q - \\
\hline question \([6] \begin{array}{llllll}613 & 810 & 23\end{array}\) \\
\hline 11101511612 \\
\hline questions 12181112225 \\
\hline quick \(12 \mid 1022111\) \\
\hline quickly [1] 325 \\
\hline quote l3l 131112121521 quoted (1) 1520 \\
\hline - R - \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
raise 111143
rased [2] 1331712
rasses [1] 822
rationale (1) 22 /3
read (1) 1613
reading (1) 1821
reads \(111 / 14\)
real [1] 1812
reality (1] 525
realized (1) 159
reason (6) 81092410
17172123
reasoned [1] 115
reasons [3] 9111571623
rebuttal [1] 1823
recall [1] 816
Recess 111253
recess [2] 2512
recharacterize \([2] 132023\)
recognize \([2] 52136\)
record [4] 3247514
1521
recover (3) 17519715
recovery \([2] 9211010\)
refer [1] 75
regarded [1] 423
regulatung [1] 425
regulation (1) 1523
regulatory [1] 161
retterated 11163
related [1] 1223
relates (3) \(717 \quad 1225 \quad 2417\)
relating [1] 425
relations (1] 1117
relevant [1] 22 11
rehed [1] 1716
rehes [1] 192
rely \(\begin{array}{llllllll}71 & 5 & 15 & 15 & 10 & 17 & 17 & 18\end{array}\)
\(1818 \quad 1917 \quad 238\)
relying [1] 723
remains [1] 8
remand [12] \(34,41,28\),
515611720,821212
23116245
remanded [1] 1318
remedtes [2] 1810206
remedy [18] \(112425 \quad 122\)
5201812023211012
1520221378917
Remember [2] 720119
remember [4] 81181016 1214
remembering [1] 1221
remind [1] 2022
remote [1] 56
removable [1] 134
removal [20] \(3 \begin{array}{lllll}22 & 78 & 18 & 22\end{array}\) \(85919 \quad 22 \quad 259141114\) 14720241521619
\(1712 \quad 18 \quad 18 \quad 2016 \quad 2313\)
remove [6] 1781815
237102420
removed [6] 71681893
15618242
represent [1] 710
representation [1] 65
representations [1] 515
represents [1] 2014
requested [1] 2610
required [1] 1925
requirements \([1] 205\)
resist (11 58
Resources [2] 731511
resources (4) 9221922
2012212
respond \([2] 133214\)
responding [2] 422131
rest [3] 57612146
restricted [1] 411
restrictron [2] 1038
review [2] 31741
reviewed [1] 510
rught (18) 722112129
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}13613 & 146 & 17171856\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{ll}11 & 191019208 \\ 10168\end{array}\)
2023710
rise [1] 1818
routine (1] 517
RPR [1] 2621
Rule (2) 211316

21914242221
ruled [1] 913
rules (1) 2016
ruling [1] 2122
run [2] 32023
rush 111320
- -S -
sale [1] 921

Conoordence by Look-See(12)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}71710131422 & 241114\end{array}\)
 \(\begin{array}{llllllllll}7 & 1926 & 25 & 21 & 10 & 22519\end{array}\) 2223252414
statutes |11 || 22
statutory \([5] 1525166\)
1819242217
stick [1] 243
stipulation \([18) 3101667\)
7138171824926

23251852422
stockholders [2] 101620
stolen [2] 41521
strict [31 1217191913
strike [1] 182
subject [2] 25 / 2
subjected 111823
submit [1] 183
submittal 111321
submittals |1] /4 9
Substantial 1118 /I
substantial [4] \(810 \quad 1913\)
172012
succeed [1] 118
succeeded (1] 618
successful [1] 2119
sue (1) 215
sued [2] 101620
sues [1] 21 16
suffered (1) 1319
suggest 11123 I/
suggesting |11 1121
suggests [1| 23 /3
suits [1] 2220
sum 11 ] 313
summary \([7] 4121753\)
6207813192417
Superior 111410
support [1] 159
surely (1) 242
sustained (1) 152
sweeping [1] 202
sword [1] 1423
- T -
talk \(15115 \quad 1916418 \quad 12\) 24 II
talking [4] 119121820
2418
tantamount [1] 224
TAPA 6\(] 8201217148\)
17112356
TAPS [1] 179
Tax [1] 1913
teaches 12 111 131210
term [2] 924101
terms 131724919216
test [2] 208219
Thank [3] 15323214
thank [2] 3716
theory \(\left[\begin{array}{lllllll}31 & 19 & 18 & 24 & 14\end{array}\right.\)
there'd 11126
they're \(\begin{array}{lllll}31 & 17 & 22 & 23 & 18 \\ 14\end{array}\)
they've [1] 123
tuneliness (2) \(1312 \quad 1422\)
tumely [1] 1425
tortuous [1] 88
total (1) 142
totally [2] \(615 \quad 2322\)
transcript |2| 269 /2
transcription 1112610
treats 1111820
tral \(111+10\)
tribe \(\begin{array}{lllll}21 & 20 & 3 & 21 & 7\end{array}\)
tribes \(1311923 \quad 2015 \quad 21\)
triggered 11 | 822
trip 111519
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}\text { true } 161 & 1 / 23 & 12 & 6 & 14 & 19\end{array}\)
15171610269
Turning 11197
\(-\quad-\mathrm{U}-\)
underlymg [4] 111125
12216
understand 12118212322
unnecessary \(|2| 6151014\)
unpersuaded 111524
unpersuastive |11 9 /2
unrelated III 1222
untmely 12 | 14723 /3
urging (1) 62
usual [1] 1924
- \(-\mathrm{V}_{-}\)
valid \([21 / 582111\)
valuable |l| 212
variety 11193
version [2| 181925
versus (11 207
view III 244
volated \(14167 / 412196\)
2423
volates \(\{2 \mid 188\)
volation \(15 \mid 14 / 515 \quad 23\)
18192024
virtually \(111 / 38\)
- W -
wanted [2] 42513
we'd [1] 820
We'll [2] 3225 I
we'll [11 1616
We're 1111617
we're 1917231013122
20143461615
welcome 11168
weren't [6] 32242195
151415237
wish [2] 38716
word (3) \(518 \quad 1719248\)
words [111115
works [1] 207
world (1] 711
worthwhule [1] 2321
wouldn't [1] 218
written |11 2317
wrong [1] 85


7eal|112017
/rek |1| 1210

Vol 213500
IN TE UNITE STATE DISTRICT CORT FRR TEE DISTRICT OF RUSA
```

In re
) Case Na. A8-00% CIV (AFH)
) AThurge Alaka
) Thuscay dre 1,1984
) 800 am
TRMECRIT OF PCNEDINGS

```

```

                VOLFE 21, Pages S500 3,10
    ```
(9)
                Rasitime framonptian
    APPEARANCES.
    For Plairtiffs. RIOAD F CBET
        Blity Conen \& cerry
        80 K . Street, sute dP
        Antarage AC 9 SO
        个. \(97 / 67.810\)
        RIN ONELL
        ION HORR
        Fargre \& Barson
        2010 Nanest Catis
        MrTagroi is M
        h. \(612 / 36-3510\)
        H. LODIE NOTACDE, R
        Begr \& Mrtage
        162 LOMST STEX
        Philadelphia PA \(970 B\)
        Th 25/85-310
        ERT S. TOEN
        Cher, Mhlstein, Hasfeld \& Toll
        100 Nb York Alere NW Ste 6 O
        Wenveran DC 206
        h \(212 \% 8-50\)
    For Deferdat
        Dars J Erow y
        segle 8 caves
        1651 W 4th Aerre 9 Itr 60
        Andorage AK 9501
        中 \(90 / 20687\)
        MORE वस이
        THOPS M. RISO
        chalos 8 aran
        30 E 47d Suext
        New York, NY 1017
        Ph. 212/6t-540
        JTES F SNDETS
        Jate \(F\) NEA
        maxd \& Itanell
        am First Unon Tore
        E0) 4h Agure Nath
        mesculle in 3719
        Ph 65/a4 T7B
        PATRIOK LINDH
        onelvery \& Mers
        400 S Hpe Stest
        Los Abeles oa pan
        Ph 2B48060
    In cart
(b) Depry Clex.
    TOM MRTLAFAN
            US. District cart
            20W 7h Amer th

            Ph \(97 / 21480\)
            OIS. ERAR FPR
            Registered Professicral Reputer
            Munagtt SnCart Reportis
            201 Dral Suret, 9ate 5
            Adrage, AK 9 Si
            Ph 90/RB-7/0
(1) PROCEEDINGS
(2) (Jury in at 800 am )
(3) THECLERK All rise
(4) (Call to Order of the Court)
(5) THE COURT Good morning ladies and gentlemen This
(6) is the continuation of trial in case A89 0095 civil in re the
(7) Exxon Valdez
(8) MR NEAL May it please the Court before we commence
( 9 ) I d like to introduce to the Court and Jury Mr Lee Raymond
(10) who \(s\) lestified here by deposition and who is the chairman of
( \(H\) ) the board of Exxon Corporation
(12) THE COURT Good morning Mr Raymond
(13) MR RAYMOND Good morning
(14) MS STEWART Your Honor at this time we re ready to
(1) contunue with the video depoation of Lieutenant Commander
(16) Falkenstein
(17) CONT D DIRECT EXAMINATION OF THOMAS FALKENSTEIN (Video)
(18) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
(19) \(Q\) Who was present during that conversation?
(20) A To the best of my memory, just myself and Captan
(21) Hazelwood
(22) Q All right Mr Delozier was not present during that
(3) conversation?
( 4 ) A l don theleve 50 no sar
(5) Q You also tesulted that therc came a ume when Mr Delozier

\section*{Vol 213503}
(1) told you soinething about the captain saying he had told the (?) third matu to turn nuar or on a 38 fathom mark do you
rumbmber
(3) that'
(4) A Yes sir
(5) Q When did Mr Delozier tell you that?
(6) A I don't remember whether it was very late durng our stay
(7) on the shup or at sometume later the next week I don't
(8) remember when he told me that
(9) Q All right When you say late during your atay on the ahip
(10) about what dates are we talking about?
(II) A Maybe Sunday Saturday night at the earlest, but maybe
(12) Sunday I thunk it was more later, the next week after we were
(13) both back at the office but I don't remember for sure
(14) Q Ohay And how did he come to tell you that?
asi A He came and asked me if l'd had a conversation with the
(16) captain about where he had told the mate to turn, and I told
(17) him yes And he specifically asked me dad he ever circle or
(18) mark that number I believe I thunk that's how it happened
(19) Q He asked you whether the captain had circlud the 38 fathom
(20) mark)
(21) A Yes sir
(22) Q And you told him that he didn in \(^{\text {? }}\)
(23) A Yes, sir
(24) Q Did you also tell him that the captain did not mention the
(23) 38 fathom mark to you?

\section*{Vol 213504}
(2S) sure And I don't recall how I came to know about this
A Yes, sir, I believe so
() Q You re aware of Mr Blandford sprior lestimony and his statements that he had a number of mid watch duties to accomplish during this changeover period on the 23 rd and 24.h?
(s) A Yes, sir vaguely Vaguely

Q Are you aware of the - beyond what we ve aiready
discussed are you aware of any housckeeping tasks that he
needed to accomplish during that - in the neighborhood of that
changeover period that couldn thave waited until a later time?
A Not to my knowledge
Q Now commander these - these three tapes represent
March 2324 and 25 is that right?
A Yes, sir, apparently
(14) Q What about the March 221989 tape? Was that preserved?
(15) A No, sir
(10) Q And why was it not?
(I) A The tapes are cycled through every 30 days and erased
and
(18) reused They are preserved for 30 days and erased and reused
(19) If I remember correctly the tape for March 22nd was requested
(0) on April 21 st and it was on the machine and in use at the time
1 1 I got the request
(2) Q Commander can you - do you recall seven to ten days
(23) before the grounding of the Exxon Valdez getting - getting a
(24) call from a Captatn Andre Martineau?
(25) A The office got a call I don't remember who got the call

\section*{Vol 21 350s}
though
Q Who is Captain Martineau?
A Captain Martineau is the master of another Exxon tanker
Q Now tell me what you recall about Captain Martineau a call
and how you know him?
A Let me preface st by saying Captan Martunean and I do not
(7) exactly have a good relationshap so his call was over the
telephone I believe he was mang satellite communications
phone to the office, talking about the extent of ice out into
(10) Prince William Sound He was suggestung complete closure of
(II) port because of what he perceived as a sugnuficant ice hazard
(12) Of all the tanker captains coming in and out of there that tume
(13) of year, he was the only one to gave us that kand of report (1\&) that I recall Others would report heavy ice, but none went so
(Is) far as to suggest closure They seemed to undicate that it was
(10) possible to - for a vessel to worl its way through the ice
(in) without any difficulty you just had to pay attention to what
(18) you were doing
(19) Captan Martineau I believe suggested closure of the
(20) port And I beheve we had one or two other Exxon tank shups
(21) ether w the port at that tume or shortly thereafter, shortly
(22) before, who agreed there was heavy ice but didn't seem to think
(23) it was necessary to close the port down, which is something I
(24) beheve Commander McCall spoke to them about, but I can't be

\section*{Vol 21 3506}
(1) information But I don't - I don't know who talked to Captan
(2) Martineau

Q Did you discuas the matter with Commander McCall?
A I don't remember exactly, something hike that ordinarily
would have been duscussed with the captam, commanding officer,
6) but I don't remember exactly whether I did or nut
(7) Q One of the things you said was that as you recall one or
8) more other Exxon tankers were in port and that Commander McCall
9) had discussed this request with them did I understand vour
(10) testimony correctly?
(11) A Okay Generally speakng, Commander McCall would have
(I.) asked about that He may have had Lieutenant Rice or somenne
(13) else taik to the tanker masters to get their view of it I
(14) know other shups - the way I remember it, other ships' masters
(15) were asked what they thought of the situation, and none went \(s 0\)
(16) far as to suggest port closure, but they did agree that it was (i7) heavy
(18) Q Now you satd other ships masters just now Do you
(19) know - do you know whether other Exxon tankers masters were (20) consulted?
(1) A It was a question I believe asked ot masters of any of
(22) the tankers that were available in port and I know - I do
(23) recall around that tume, beades Captan Martuean's shup which
(24) was the Exxon North Slope, that there were one or two other (2J) Exxon ships either before or mmediately after hum his arrival

\section*{Vol 213507}
(1) and departure that discussed this su -
(2) Q Commander have you - 18 that something that you check on
(3) at the time the other Exxon vessels that were in bufort or (4) shortly after Captain Martineau)
(s) A No sir There's several vessels that come un and out and
(6) they all run a similar schedule The Exxun Nurth Slupe had 7. gotten held up because it experienced some storm damage and had
(8) to undergo repar which is why Captan Martuneau did not have
(9) an amiable relationship The Exxon shups that come in and out
(10) were Exxon North Slope, Exxon Baton Rouge, Exxon San Francisco,
(II) Exxon Baytown All the Exxon ships would run m and out on a
(12) periodic schedule Sometimes we'd have one or two in port (13) sometrmes we d have none in purt but they wauld all seem to be
(14) on a consistent schedule and there'd always be an Exxon ship in
(15) and out of there That's why I remember that there was Exxon
(16) ships in between the tıme Captain Martıneau made his phonecall
(17) and the Exxon Valdez went aground which would be-you know
(18) Captain Martineau's report was early thurd part - the early
(19) part of March, and the Exxon Valdez went aground on the 23rd or
(20) 4th, whichever day you're looking at
(21) Q Did you or anybody else in the MSO give Captain Martineau
(2?) an answer to his request?
1.31 A lt wasn 1 irequest sar It was a nuggestaun And it
( 4) believe the answer nas you know thanks for your mput But 1
(25) don't know what exactly was said

Vol 213508
Q No - no change in procedures resulted from Captain
Martineau s suggestion as you put it?
A No sir
Q Who made the deciston not to take anv action on Captan
Martuneau 3 suggestion?
A Well, action was taken in that other captams were asked
the same thing about how heavy is the ice Their feeling
was - is that it was heary, but not such an impediment to
narigation that they couldn't get through So I belreve the
action was - the action was that other captans were asked
the
(11) same question what did they think about is it necessary to \({ }^{2)}\) close to port And based on the mput of several masters
who
(13) navigate that area that no change was deemed necessary

Q Did you write any report about this?
A No, sir
Q During the period of time that you were in the Port of
Valdez and involved in this vessel traffic system had you evur
known the iraffic avatem to he shut down hecause there was too much ice in the system for the vessels to transit the area)
A No, sir
Q Within your experience in Prince William Sound have there been occasions when the ice would extend all the way across
Valdez Arm and Columbia Bay to cover the - both the outbound lane the separation zone and the inbound lane?
A Chunks of ice have drifted all the way cross I wouldn't

\section*{Vol 213509}
(i) use the word cover but there has been ice blown across in hotb
(2) lanes
(3) Q Are you familar with vessels that have deviated on
(4) occasion outaide the traffic lanes because of ice extending
(s) across those lanes?

A Yes, sar They have deviated
7) MS STEWART Your Honor that concludes defendants direct
MS WAGNER Plaintiffs have a video cross
CROSS EXAMINATION OF THOMAS FALKENSTEIN (VidLo)
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Now were you - were you present during eather the first
or the second visits to the Vessel Traffic Center' Were you
present during any radio communications between the Exxon
Valdez and the Vessel Traffic Center?
AYes, sir
Q How many?
A I recall one for sure probably two or three
Q And the one for sure that you recall between whom was that conversation?
(2i) A It was between Commander McCall and Captan Hazelwood
(22) \(Q\) And what was the nature of their conversation?
(23) A Captan Hazelwood relayed that they were hard aground or
(24) aground, I beheve He didn't use the words hard aground I
(25) beheve he said something about having some problems with the
third mate but he didn't elaborate and that he was going to
try to get it off the reef
\(Q\) And what did vou do upon - upon hoarding the vessel?
A The geaman on - at the head of the ladder directed us to
the brige We asked him where the captann was I belseve and

6e indicated the bridge and we proceeded immediately to the
bridge
Q Did you come upon the captain at that point?
A Yes, sir I went over and spoke with the captan
Q Do you recall what you said?
A I introduced myself and asked him what the situation was
Q And what did he tell you?
A I believe he indicated that the ship was hard aground they
(1s) were unsuccesaful in - the engine wh amid - engine was off
(Is) shut down was amidships He may have given me the vessel's
(161 heading and told me that thev were unsuccessful in trying
to
(1) get it off the rock at high tude
(18) Q Commander you said when you went out on the bridge wing
(19) with Mr Delozier that he asked you if you - if you smelled
(20) alcohol and you said that you answered yes?
(21) A He asked me if I smelled the captan's breath, and I sand
(22) yes
(23) Q Commander when you - when you say that you smelled
4) alcohol what - can you be anymore specific than that?

A No sir

\section*{Vol 213511}

Q You just smelied alcohol?
A I smelled hike an alcohoinc beverage had be consumed.
yes
(3) sir
(4) Q Did that alcohol smell fresh?

A No sir
Q Did it smell stale?
A Yeq sir
Q Didn 1 Trooper Fox ask you if the Moussy beer on his hand smelled similar to what Captain Hazelwood s breath -
(10) A He asked me if that smelled like the smell on the captan's
(II) breath not did I smell the captan's breath And I told him
(12) to the best of my recollection, it could be, but I didn't thank
(13) 30
(14) Q Why didn't you think so?
(15) A Just didn't smell the same way, exactly But that was
(16) poured freshly on the back of his hand so we'retalling two
(17) different circamstances
(18) \(Q\) What was the smell up on the bridge when you were
utanding
(19) next to Captain Hazelwood?
(20) A Smelled like the captan had been consuming an
alcohohe
(21) beverage
(22) Q Now I believe you testified that you were aware that there
(23) came a point in tume when the Exxon Valdez noufied the Veasel
(24) Traffic Center that it was leaving or intended to leave the
(2s) outbound lane in the traffic separation scheme is that
correct?
A Yes, sur
Q And I believe you also indicated that you were aware that
they informed the Vessel Traffic Center that they were changing
thear heading to 200 degrees is that correct?
A Yes, sur
Q Now did it come to your attention that the Exxon Valdez
changed its heading at a point prior to the grounding from 200
degrees to 180 degrees?
A Not untll after I got off the shup on Sunday
Q To your knowledge did the Exxon Valdez inform the Vessel
Traffic Center of any change in ts heading from 200 degrees to
180 degrees?
A If I remember correctly, after the Exxon Valdez indicated
that it was goug to go out of the southbound traffic lane
that was the last communcation from it untul it called to
mform us it was aground
Q Okay I d like to refer you to page six of the user s
manual sectson Roman numeral four sub 5 A
A All nght, sir
Q Do you have that before you?
A Rught
Q And could you just read what that provides?
A Radıo equipped vessel may join cross or leave a traffic
lane only after the VTC has been notufied of the point at which

\section*{Vol 213513}
the vessel will join cross or leave the traffic lane
Q And to your knowledge did the Exxon Valdez comply with
that requirement when ti left the shipping lanes?
ANo sir
Q And is cvery tand vessul that loads in the Port of Valdec required to have aboard it a manual for the usc of that system in the Port ol Valdue'
A Yes sir
Q And does that manual outline the relationship between the Coast Guard and those vessels as they transit into and out of the port?
A I belseve it does, yes, sar
Q The - now does the Coast Guard ever tell any of those vessels what tourses to steer?
A No, sir
Q Does it tell them what speeds to run and elsewhere than in the Narrows'
A No, sir they do not
Q And then as il continues outbound there are on the chart
various lines of zones marked southbnund Prince Wilfiam Sound
(21) traffic lane sprays zone and northbound Prince William Sound 22) traffic lanc Are the vessels going to the traffic suparation

31 schumb supposed to ruinain within thone - within a proper trach (24) in those areas?
(25)

A Vessels that are outbound are supposed to stay withun

Vol 21 3515
THE COURT Thank you Mr Montague Let me see as 1017 -
MR NEAL 35 A able -
THE COURT Yeah my notes show that that s been admitted also
MR NEAL Thank you Your Honor
THE COURT The lirst three exhibits 1733 A 1736 A
and 1734 A are also admitted
(Exhibits 1733-A 1736 A and 1734-A received)
MR NEAL Thank you Your Honor
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF CHARLES CUSHING (Live)
BY MR NEAL
Q You re Mr Charies Cushing?
A Yes, sir
Q Robert Charles Cushing?
A Charles Robert Cushung
Q Charles Rubert all right What is your presunt occupation?
A I'm President of \(\mathbf{C}\) R Cushing and Company firm of naval
(20) archutects and manine eugineers
(21) \(Q\) Where is your business located?
(22) A Our offices are in New York City
(31 Q How long have you becn in this pruscat position as (24) president of Cushing Associates?
25) A The firm is a little over 26 years old

\section*{Q Have you been there throughout that time?}

A Yes, sir, I've been president of the company for that peniod of tume
\(Q\) What is the business of this company?
A Our firm designs and supervises the construction and tests
vessels, cargo ships of all types tankers onl carriers gas carners
Q Now prior to this 26 year carcer with your firm would vou give us your educational background?
A Yes sir I'm a graduate of U S Merchant Marne ademy
at Kings Point bachelor of science degree in marine
transportation, where I also obtanced a U S Coast Guard third
113) officer's hicense and a commission in the naval reserve
(14) I'm a graduate of the Massachusetts Instatute of Technology
(IS) with a degree in naval architecture and marme engueenng, and
(6) also the State University of New York, the Marntime College at
(17) Fort Schuyler with a master of science degree
118) Q Before you - 26 years ago when you formed and joined your (19) firm tell us your work experience
(20) A Well, part of my work expenence has been going to sea
(21) I - before the Merchant Marme Academy, I sailed as an
(22) ordmary seaman on a Danush flagged vessel And then as a
(23) cadet midshupman I sailed as a deck cadet on shups of Pharaoh
(4) Lines, U S Lines and Grace Lines then after graduation (2) Q After graduation from the maritume academy?

\footnotetext{
Vol \(21 \quad 3917\)
A Merchant Marine Academy I jomed the masters mates and
) pilots and sailed as a deck officer with U S Lines Steamshup
3) and Pan Atlantic Steamshp Companes In addition to that,

I've - on the sips that we've designed and supervised the
) construction of of which there's been a couple hundred many
s) of them have had sea trials where l've participated to the sea
trals of the shaps
Q Have you done any work in or around Anchorage Alaska in
the past?
A Yes, sar When I jomed - after I went to sea and
obtaned the naval architecture degree I worked for
Sea Land
(12) Service starting in around 1961, and one of my assignments
(13) early on was to come up here to Anchorage to determme whether
(14) Sea Land would be able to operate a year round service through
(is) the ace in Cook Inlet and I'm happy to say that the report was
(10) and the decision was to operate that weekly service here into
(In Anchorage
(18) We also did other work up here relating to the port and (19) also feeder shaps for Dutch harbor and Brastol Bay and other -
(20) other small vessels operating in the Alaskan waters

Q Are you a member of any professional associations or organizations?
A Yes, sir I'm a member of the Society of Naval Architects (2A) and Manne Engineers, a fellow in the Royal Instutute of
}

\section*{Vol 213518}
) member of -a fellow in the Society of Mechanical Engineers
(2) and many other organzations
(3) MR NEAL Your Honor I m not sure that the witness
was aworn
THE COURT That what?
MR NEAL Not sure the witness was sworn in
THE CLERK The witness was sworn I just never got
) his name on record but I think he probably clarified that
unless the court reporter needs that information
(10) THE COURT To tell you the complete truth I have a
(II) complete blank on it I was doing some other things first
(12) thing this morming and was sort of on autopilot here
(13) MR O NEILL Aha
(14) MR NEAL Well I don t want you on autopilot when
(15) I ve got the con Your Honor
(16) THE COURT Point well taken
(17) MR NEAL Would it hurt to swear him in and I II ask
(18) him if everything he said at this point was the truth
(19) THE CLERK I already administered the oath Your
(20) Honor we just never got his name on record
(21) MR NEAL Oh would you give us your name then
(2) THE WITNESS Yus My name is Charles Roben Cushing
(23) C U S HIN G
(24) THE COURT I heard that part because he corrected you
(23) on the order of his name
1) year, professional achevement award and a number of other
(.) awards
3) Q Have you published articles Mr Cushing?
4) A Yes, sir over 50 artucles and professional journals and
5) trade publications

Q On naval architecture?
A On naval architecture
Q And related subjects and safety on tank vessels?
MR NEAL May it please the Court Itender thia
witness as an expert
MR MONTAGUE Your Honor I have no objection as
long as the expertise is limited to the area of his expert
report
THE COURT Which was?
MR MONTAGUE Well I could read it
THE COURT No what was the specialty naval archilecture?

MR MONTAGUE No the specialty was analyzing the track of the Exxon Valdez and certain other vesseia
MR NEAL That s what he s going to testify about, Your Honor
THE COURT The track what does that mean?
MR MONTAGUE The track line how it -
reconstructing the voyage the track of the voyage BYMR NEAL
Vol 21 3519
BY MR NEAL
Q All right Lut s see if we can puithis thing on helm now and move forward Where were we
A You were asking me if I had any expenence in Alaska, and
then I thank you asked what organizations I belonged to and
I
said many
Q And you ve given us some of those?
A Yes sur
Q Are you or have you bcen a member of the United States
Naval Reserves?
A Yes sir, for a penod of about 30 vears
Q Have you repruscnicd the Unilud Status governmunt on anv technical committees)
A Yes sir I've been a member of a number of US Coast Guard safety commattees been part of the \(L S\) delezation
the U N's solace conventions, been a U S delegate to ISO.
(17) International Standards Organzations and a number of other
(18) committees
(19) Q I have noticed in talking to you before that you are a
(20) farrly modest man but I m going to ash you not to he so modest
(21) here
(2-) Have you won any awards)
(23) A Yes sir a number of awards The Admiral I and award for (24) excellence in naval architecture at the Merchant Marine
(25) Academy awards of also dlumuus of the yeir marine man of the

\section*{Vol 21 3521}
(1) Q Getling right to -
(r) THE COURT Well just a minute I mtakenabit by
3) surprisc here because I thoughi we were in for something about
(4) naval architecture about which this witness seems to have all
(s) hinds of wonderful qualifications but I didn thearanything
6) that relates to the subject of his report Can you help me
7) with that?

MR NEAL Sure Ican
BYMR NEAL
Q Mr Cushing you have salled a number ot years as a deck olficer?
A Yes, I have
Q In the merchant marine?
A Yes sar
Q You have also I gather had an occasion to review and
study course recorders of vessels)
A l've buth studied and reviewed them and mstalled them
0n
(18) the ships, too

Q And have you had occasion using those course recorders to
(20) determine track lines OF vessels at various times?
(21) A Yes sir I have In France and Mexico in the U S Gulf
(29) Copeuhagen a number of places around the world
(23) MR NEAL Should I go further Your Honor?
(14) THE COURT Have you testified previously in a court
(ns) proceeding on this subject?

VOLUME 21
-ー_ XMAX(8) Vol 213522
THE WITNESS Yes sir Ihave
THE COURT And have been quahfied as an expert to
offer opinions as to the trace or tracks of vessels?
THE WITNESS Yes sir I have
THE COURT I II accept the witness qualifications BY MR NEAL
Q Mr Cushing at my request have you conducted a study to determine the trach line of the Exxon Valdez on the night of March 23 March 241989 and prepared a chart to demonstrate the course of your studv?
A Yes, sir, I have
MR NEAL I d like to have put up Exhibit 1733-Able if I could
BYMR NEAL
Q Mr Cushing I show you what is now in evidence as
Defendants Exhibit 1733 Able and ask if you would explain to the Court and the Ladies and Gentiemen of the Jury what this represents?
(19) A This exhibit is a portion of the government NOAA chart (20) showing Valdez Arm in Pnnce Wilham Sound The blue trace on
( 1 ) the chart represents the track of the vessel or the track line
(2) or the course that the vessel followed during that portion of
(23) the voyage
(4) MR NEAL Your Honor could the witness come down and
(rs) now go through this chart with my pointer I brought with me?

\section*{Vol 213523}

THE COURT Curtanly
MR NEAL I think the Court may want to see it
Could you - would you stand over here?
THE COURT it sokay
BY MR NEAL
QMr Cushing would you now go through what you testified as the track line of the Valdez for a certain portion of its
voyage on the night of March 23 and the first tew minutes of March 24 1989?
A Yes, sir The - the course begins up with a position marked 2339 or 1139 at mght, where a fix had been taken and
(12) marked on the Exxon Valdez's chart The course contunues
una
(13) southerly direction changang course to 180 degrees moving
(14) southward, where it moves out of the traffic separation zone
(IS) and traffic lanes to a powt at 2352
(16) Q Now it s on a course then of 180 degrees from what (1) from what point to 23527
(18) A Well, from the point up about - about here where it's
(19) moving through the northbound - northbound lane
(20) Q All night Now stop at 2352 Why do you note 2352 there
(21) or 1152 in the evening?
(22) A The vessel at this point, 2352, commenced a - an operation
(23) in its automation system called load program up
(24) Q Explain to the Members of the Jury what load program up was
(25) on this vessel
(3) gradually increase the speed of the engune from its normal
(4) maneuvening speed to its sea speed At the point at which the
(5) ship was traveling south here, she was traveing at full -
(6) full maneuverng speed about 55 rpms or about 11 knots
(7) Q Now just a moment Let s make sure the record indicates (8) what a knot is Can you relate that to miles per hour of an (9) automobile? What is a knot first?
(10)

A A knot is one nautical mile per hour
(II) \(Q\) What does that translate to or relate to in miles on the
(12) ground roughly?
(13) A Well a nautical male is about 15 percent more than a
(14) statute or a land mile so one knot is about \(\mathbf{1 5}\) percent greater
(1s) than a mile per hour
(10) Q All right So if it a going 11 knots what would be the (17) speed on land miles then?
(18) A Maybe about 15 miles an hour
(19) Q About 15 miles an hour?
(20) A Oh, sorry, sorry, no, about 12 miles an hour
(21) Q About 12 miles an hour So going 11 knots it puts load
(22) program up and you sald that gradually increased the speed of
(23) the vessel up to sea speed?
(24) A That's correct
(s) Q On this - you ve said that full mancuvering speed was

\section*{Vol 213525}
about around 11 knots and that s what he was going?
A That's correct
Q What is full sea speed or what was full sea speed on this vessel?
A About 159 knots
Q And then if it sabout 12 you said about 12 land miles what would 159 knots be?
A Be a little over 16 males an hour
Q Little over 16 miles per hour?
A About
Q So to go from 12 to 16 or 17 miles an hour, with load
program up how long does it take to reach that five or six
more miles per hour?
(4) The system is -15 adjusted to take about three-quarters
s) of an hour to do - to step up that half an hour to do - to
(16) step up that five miles an hour
(17) \(Q\) So it increases that vessel about five or six msles per
(18) hour over 45 minutes?
(19) A Yes sir
(20) \(Q\) Would you conalder that puung the pedal to the metal?
(21) A No, sir
(22) Q All right And load program up, then, was put on at 1152 ?
(23) A Yes, sir
(24) Q Go ahead
(25) A At the position She was steaming south due south at

\section*{Vol 213526}
degrees travelng up to this point at about 11 knots and 55
(2) rpm or 56 rpm once she put the load program up
(3) As she contunued south she came to a pout abeam of Busby
4) Island hight at 2355

Q Or about five minutes till midnight?
A Five minutes to midnight
Q All nght sir
A And she was a distance off of about one mule due west At
this pount the vessel had increased speed because of load program up and she was now doing 111 knots The vessel II) continued moving south \(\mathbf{1 8 0}\) degrees until at midnight, almost
(12) precisely at midnight she crossed a sector known as the red
(13) sector, crossed into the red sector of Busby Island light
(14) Busby Island Light shines white around most of its sector, but
(1s) at a certan portion, it's called a red sector or caution zone
(16) in here, and the veasel moved mito that - that zone where the
(17) light would change from whute to appear to be red
(18) Q Now as I undersuand that if I may approach here when you
get - as the vessel is traveling hiro alung this line would
you follow me?
AYes sir
(22) Q Along this line if it looked over to the Busby Island
(23) light it would see white is that correct?
(24) A That's correct
(2) Q Now if it moved along here to something after midnight or

\section*{Vol 21 3527}
, 0000 as you have there and looked at Bushy Island light what
2) would it see?

A It would see red
\(Q\) And that sa cautionary?
A Yes
Q Now 2355 to midnight in that tive minutes there did you
see any indication that there was any turn of the vessel?
A No, sur The course recorder which is one of the
9) documents we used showed that the vessel was moving
due south
180 degrees
Q Continue on Mr Cushing
A All nght At this point the vessel had increased its speed even further now because of the load program up The
(14) vessel was at this point traveling at 11.3 knots
(15) Q 113 It had increaged then three tenths of a hnot over
(16) that period of time over something lihe ten minutes?
(17) A Seven about seven minutes
(18) Q Seven minutes?
(19) A Yes sir or eight manutes
(20) Q All right
(21) A All right Just after midnight, then at about two manutes (2) past midnight the vessel's head started to swing to the right, (23) and the vessel followed a -
(24) Q Now before you do that how would you know that at two
5) minutes after midnight the vessei begins to swing to the right?

\section*{Vol 213528}
(1) A The vessel is equipped with a course recorder, and the 2) course recorder which has a clock in it modicates the tume and
(3) it indicates that the direction of the vessel was pointed at
(4) all tumes It's thed into the gyro system of the ship
(5) Q All right The vessel begun to swing to the right or now
as we ve all learned swing to starboard at about two minutes
after midnight is that correct?
A That's correct, yes, sir
Q All right Now if the bow - if the course recorder
(1) reflects the two minutes after midnght the bow begins to swing
(11) to the right okay when would the rudder have to be put on?
(12) Let \(s\) agy it sten degrees When would you have to put on the
(13) rudder on the helm ten degrees to get an indication on the
(14) course recorder that the vessel is beginning to swing to the (15) right at two minutes after midnight?
(16) A That would have to have been done between 20 and 30 seconds
(I7) before that
(18) Q All nght So the rudder then was moved to right rudder
(19) at some degree about a minute and a half after midnight, is
(20) that correct?
(21) A That's correct
(2) \(Q\) And that is the first indication you have seen that the -
(23) that there was any rudder put on this vessel?
(24) A Yes, sir
(25) Q All right Now then - now then at that time were you

\section*{Vol 213529}
(1) able to determine the degree of right rudder that was put on
(2) the vessel?
(3) A Yes, sir, we have been
(4) Q All right What degree of right rudder was put on the
(5) vessel as you say a minute and a half after midnight so that
(6) you can see the bow turn on the course recorder at two minutes
(7) after midnight?
(8) A Well, we have determmed that that rudder angle was ten
) degrees
(10) Q Ten degrees?
(11) A Yes, sir
(12) Q So according to your - in your opinion in your work
(13) rudder angle was put on of ten degrees right at a minute and a
(14) half after midnight and the vessel began to show some turn it
(15) two minutes after midnight?
(16) A Yes, sir
(17) Q All right Now, were you able to - how long did the ten
(18) degree right rudder continue in effect?
(19) A That contunued at least through the pernod of - penod of
(20) five minutes, at which point the vessel struck a pinnacle in
(21) Bligh Reef
(22) \(Q\) And is that represented by seven minutes after midnight on
(23) your chart?

A Yes, sir, it is, at this point here
(23) Q Okay What happened at that point then in terms of the
(1) rudder angle?

1 A Well the trace on the course recorder shows an indication
(3) of an abrupt change in direction which could have been
(4) caused - I say abrupt, but very slight but abrupt change which
a could have been caused either by the vessel passing over the
hi pinnacle off center causing the shap to akew as it passed nver
(7) the pinnacle or by the apphcation of addituonal rudder such
8) as a \(\mathbf{2 0}\) degree night rudder or a combination of both of those

Q So you cannot determune whether 20 degree rudder nght
(10) rudder was applied at seven minutes after midnight although
"ll) that is a possibility"
(12) A That's a possibility
(13) Q All right What happened then'
(14) A Well the ship as it followed its track around had slowed
(19) from 114 at the point of which it started to turn and the
(16) ship when it goes unto a turn does slow down, just naturally
(17) for hydrodynamic reasons When it passed over this pinnacle at
(18) seven minutes past it further slowed down because the pinnacle
(19) sliced a long shice in the botiom of the ship and she came off
(_O) the pinnacle about a minute later at eight minutes past and at
(21) that point she had slowed down from about 104 knots to about
(22) 7 knots as she came off the pinnacle She was still moving (23) shead though
14) Q All right And then what happens'

here
about 248 degreec was her course at that point until she struck the - struck the reef at about nune minutes past,
(3) traveling at a speed of about \(7 \mathbf{k n o t s}\) and then about a minute
(4) Iater her forward motion stopped when she was up on the reef at

\section*{, ten minutes past}
\(Q\) And so that s the track line of the Valdez as vou
determined it from II 39 in the evening untal ten minutes after
midnight on the 24th?
A Yes sir
(10) QMr Cushing I want you to assume - you have stated that
(II) ten degrees right rudder was applied at about a minute and a
(12) half after midnight so that the turn would begin to show at two
(13) minutes after midnight correct?

A Yes sir
(Is) Q All right Now I want you to assume certan facts for me (16) that I believe are facts in the record in this case but you
(17) assume them okay' Let sassume that there was a lookout on
(18) the atarboard bow of the vessel, as it moved down your track
(19) line okay?
(20) A On the starboard bow?
(21) Q On the starboard wing

A All nght
(23) Q Starboard wing And let \(s\) assume that that lookout came in
(24) and told Mr Cousins red light flashing every five seconds
(29) broad on the starboard bow Will you assumb that?

\section*{Vol 213532}
(1) A Yes sir
() Q Let s lurther assumi that that lookout went back to the
(3) starboard wing looked again came back in and said red light
(4) flashing every four seconds broad on the starboard bow
( 9 ) Now given the facts you have described here and assuming (b) those facis do you have an opinion - oh one more fact to assume Assume that when the lookout on the bndge wing came
(8) In the sucond tume and said red light flashing every four seconds broad on the starboard bow and assume that at that
tume that is the time Mr Cousins testified during that
conversation he gave the order ten degrees nght rudder You with me?
AYes sir
Q Do you have an opinion then where that vessel was when
the first order of ten degrees right rudder was given?
A Yes sar I do
Q Where was the vessel when the first order of ten degree right rudder was given'
A The vessel was abnut a half a minute north of this point where the vessel actually started to swing at two minutes past In other words one and a half minutes after midnight
Q And do you have an opinion then assuming the order to
(23) first be given at that tume do you have an opinion whether
(24) that rudder order was properly carried out by the heimsman?
(25) A Yes I do

\section*{Vol 213533}
(11) Q And what is that opinion?
(2) A That the vessel actually followed a course of ten degrees
(3) right rudder
(4) Q So the helmsman when given a ten degree right rudder put
(S) on a ten degree right rudder and what we have is the result is that correct?

\section*{A Yes sir}

MR NEAL Can we take this one down for the time
being Your Honor'
Mr Cushing I show vou what is in evidence now as
Dufendanis Exhihil - what have I fot there'
MS STEWART 1736 Alpha
MR NEAL I m sorry?
MS STEWART 1736 Alpha
BY MR NEAL
Q And I mating to ask you if what you see nght now is simply the track line of the Valdez you ve juat deseribed without the ume entries?
A Yes sir it is
Q All right At my request did you prepare a chart or
overiays showing what this vessel would have done had it started to come anto - back to the lanes at abeam Busby Isiand hght?
A Yes sir we did
(25) \(Q\) All right And what is the rudder turn that you assumed on

Vol 213534
the first overiay?

\section*{A The first overlay was ten degrees right rudder}

Q All right Let show the Ladies and Gentlemen of the Jury
that Now explain to the Members of the Jury and the Court what they re seeing here
A Well the initual part of the track is the blue track we've just described, but at a puint just south of abeam of Busby light, to other words 235530 We've shown a track where the
bow of the shup would have - the track the vessel would have
(10) followed where the bow of the shup would have started to swing
(it) at \(\mathbf{2 5} \mathbf{- 2 3 5 5 . 3 0}\), or five minutes, four manutes and \(\mathbf{3 0}\)
seconds
(12) before midnght
(13) Q All right Now you have said that the vessel was abeam
(14) Busby laland light at 23557
(IS) AYes, sir
(16) Q Why do you have 235530 on there?
(17) A Because if the vessel were to have followed this - this
(18) red course here, the order would have had to have been given at
(19) \(\mathbf{2 3 5 5}\) to cause the vessel to start swnging at this pornt
(20) Q So you re assuming this assumes a ten degree order was
(-1) given and executed at 23557 y
(22) A Yes, sir
(23) Q And what you re showing here is what the course - on the
(24) course recorder it would be approximately 30 seconds later
(25) before you d see the bow begin to swing?

\section*{Vol 21 3535}
(1) A Yes sir
(2) Q All right Now go ahead And the red line there what (3) does that show?
(4) A Well, that is the track of the vessel if that ten degree
(5) nght order, right rudder order had been given abeam of Busby
(6) Island light and executed and you can see that the course actually curves well north of the \(\boldsymbol{-}\) the track that the vessel actually took
Q If that - If that had been carried out if a ten degree
right rudder had in fact been carried out at abeam Busby Island light how much would the vissel have missed the grounding point'
A By over a mile
Q All right You reawarl are you not that the testimony in this case is that Captain Hazelwood asked Mr Cousins to come back into the lanes at abeam Busby Island light?
A Yes, sir
Q Now at my request did you do something else did you assume a five degree turn?
A Yes sir we did
21) Q At abeam Busby Island light?

A Yes sir we did
13. Q Now would you explain to the Court and the Mumburs of the
( d) Jury what you ru dumonstrating hure'
(2S) A Well the yellow - the yellow trace shows the track that
the vessel would have followed if a five degree -
Q Is that yellow?
A Well dayglow or whatever
Q All nght
A If a five degree order had been given and executed abeam of
(6) Busby light, it would have followed this yellow track, just
slightly, curving just slightly further south than the ten degree course
Q Okay And if even a five degree turn had been put on at
(1)) abeam Busby Island light, how far would the vessel have missed
(11) the grounding apot?
12) A By a intle over enght-tenths of a mile
(13) Q Now I mgoing to ask one other - I m going to ank you to
(14) assume one other thing Let assume that Mr Cousins went
(15) outade to the port wing, took a fix he a abeam Buaby Leland
(16) light at 1155 He looks at his watch it has a second
(17) indicator on at but he can \(t\) see that so he a abeam Busby
(18) Island at 1155 by his watch or somewhere between 1155 and
(19) 1156 He comes back he stops briefly at the port radar, then
(20) goes into the chart room plots that fix and just brefly for
(21) the Ladies and Gentiemen of the Jury for my benefit, you take
(22) a fix by esther sight or instruments and then you come in and
(23) plot that fix What does plotting that fix mean?
(24) A Well that means taking a set of dividers and stepping off
(25) the distance and puttung a position mark on the chart and
the

\section*{Vol 213537}
tume
Q All night Let sassume then that the tum wasn't made
at - or there was something that prevented the turn being made
at precisely 2355 Have you constructed what would have
happened given a turn of ten degrees right at say 1158 ?
A Yes, sir, I have
Q All right Could we see that? Now would you explain what we re seeing here Mr Cushing?
A The dark blue - the dark blue trace assumes the order -
0 an order was given at 1158 and was executed at 11.58 , and
the
(a) bow starts to swing at 115830 it would follow thes dark blue
(12) trace south of the other two traces we just described, but
(13) north of the actual trace of the ship
(14) \(Q\) And how much would that a ten degree right rudder at
(15) 1158 have missed the grounding site?
(16) A A ittle over 45 miles
(17) Q Let \(s\) do one other thing Let \(s\) assume that there is -
(18) it 8 two minutes after midnight and let \(s\) - when the bow
(19) begins to turn correct according to your testimony?
(20) A Yes sir
( 11 Q Lut s assume that a 20 dugree right ruddur was put on
(22) rather than a ten degree Do we have that now?
(23) A Yes sir Orange I beheve urange an color 20 degrees ( \({ }^{74)}\) right rudder at two minutes after midnght would cause the
(29) vessel to follow this - this orange trace here

\section*{Vol 213538}

Q And would it have missed the reef?
A Yes sir by - close to it but by a tenth of a mile
QMr Cushing the record in this case reflects that two
other vessels went out of the - two other tankers went out of
the Port of Valdez on March 23, preceding the Exxon Valdez
Are you aware of that?
A Yes, sir
Q At my - and those vessels were the Brooklyn and the Arco
Juneau At mv request did vou prepare a track line of the
Brooklyn and the Arco Juneau as they exited Prince William
Sound on the night or - day or night of March 2319897
A Yes, sir, we did
Q Would you looking at Defendants Exhibit 1735 Able A or Able, would you explain to the Court and the Jury what they re seeing there?
A The orange trace agan is the - a track of the tanker Brooklyn as she travels southward through Prince William Sound,
(18) first in the traffic lane and then leaving the traffic lane to
) avoid reportedly or what I understand to be ice in the traffic lane
Q Now is she - she is the Brooklyn totally outside of the traffic lanes itself?
A She is at this point here
Q And she continues on further out?
A Yes, sir she does

\footnotetext{
Vol 21 3539
Q Or farther out? Okay
A Until she's abeam of Blagh Island, Bligh Reef IIght
Q How close does the Brooklyn come to Bligh Reef' Were you able to figure that out?
A Yes, str, we were
Q And what is the distance?
A The closest point of approach to Bligh Reef was about enght tenths of a male Q Eight tenths of a mile?
A Yes, sir
Q All ught sir And you testified that had the order been
carried out on the Valdez you d been over a mile away on a ten degree right rudder?
AYes, sir
Q All right By the way were you able to delermane the times what times of the day do these tracks - let astart with the Brooklyn what times of the day are represented ty the track line of the Brooklyn?
A Well the Brooklyn left Port Valdez early in the morning around 800 in the mornug and she was up - up at this point here about \(10 \mathbf{4 7}\) in the morning, and her - her charts from which we got this information show the tumes at which she
(23) at the vanous points along the track and she arnved down
thus point here at about 1126
Q So you are representing on your chart here a tume for the
} was at

Vol 21 3541
Q How close did the Arco Juneau come to Bligh Reef? A She came to within sax tenths of a mile
Q Six tenths of a mile?
A Rught
Q Now Mr Cushing a Mr Jerry Aspland of Arco Marine testified in this case and I want to read you a question and answer Question did you have - was there ever - were there ever any rules as to what speed would be conaidered a prudent speed in transiting through ice in Prince William Sound and the answer 1 don 1 recall having put out a writen memo but I do recall having discussed that we could go - if there was ice in the area we could go up to five knots
Was there ice in the area when the Arco Juneau was
transiting this part of the Prince William Sound you ve discussed?
A That's my understanding, yes, sir
Q Were you able nevertheless to determine the speed of the
Arco Juneau as it transited that portion of Prince Willinm Sound?
A Yes sir we were
(21) Q And what was that speed?
(22) A That was 12 -sorry, 1296 knots
(23) Q 1296 knots?
(24) A Yes sir
(25) Q Now as a matier of curiosity did you ever determine the

Vol 213542
(1) speed of the Brooklyn as it stransitung transiting this part
(2) of Prince Willam Sound?
(3) A Yes, sar Because we had the - the positions and the
(4) fixes and the tumes of both vessels, we were able to determine
(5) that the Brooklyn was traveling at 117 knots through this
(6) region
(7) Q Okay Now another chart Mr Cushing Ishow you now
(8) what is defense exhibil - Mr Serdahely would you help me oul
(9) there Defense Exhibil 1734 A \(^{7}\)
(10) MR SERDAHELY 1734 A
(11) BY MR NEAL
(12) Q 1734 A And to move things along a little bit that
(13) reflects without any other notations the track line of the
(14) three vessels that left the Port of Valdez on March 23?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q All right Now let s put over the overlay reflecting a
(17) ten degree turn at abeam Busby Island light Mr Cushing
(18) assume that Captain Hazelwood ordered Mr Cousins to commence
(19) this turn back into the traffic lines abeam Busby Island light
(20) and considering the track lines of all three do you have an
(21) opinion as to which of these courses ot the thruc vessels
(2?) carried the least amount of risk as to the plan tor exil?
(23) A Yes, sir 1 do
(24) Q Which one?
(25) A The Exxon Valdez

Vol 213543
Q And why do you say that?
(-) A Well for several reusous First the Exxun Valdez in
(3) traveling southward and executing her turn was in deep water
(4) with more-more room to maneuver especially should anything
(5) go wrong with the - the equpment on the ship, as compared \(t 0\)
(6) the Brooklyn and the Arco Juneau who were pointed nght at
(7) Blagh Reef and came very close and had to maneuver at a later
8) tume or when they were closer

The second thing is that the Exxum Valdez sa making her (10) turn up here would have been altgned in a more parallel (11) direction earier on to run between what was reportedly the ice
(19) in this region and the Bligh Reef so she would have been able
(13) to adjust herself and get herself lined up with a straight (14) course eariser on rather than to maneuver between the ice and
(1s) the reef at the last minute
(16) Q All right 1 m going to have one more chart put up there (17) let a leave that one up
(18) Mr Cushing I show you what is in evidence as Defendants
(19) Exhibit 1729 okay?
(20) A Yes sir
(21) Q Could I have my pointur bach hure? I mgoing to ask you to
( ') assume - can evcryone sec this? I II go around this way
(23) 1 m going to ask you to assume or 1 m going to point out
(24) that the evidence in this case by Captain Hazelwood is that the
(25) leading edge of the tee when he left the bridge or when he was
1) planning to leave the bridge was as I mdrawing here now Do you see?
A Yes, sur
Q Okay Now you see Busby Island you see nobody a tned to make this to scale but the letter \(D\) there represents the approximate location of the vessel All nght Now I want you to consider where Captain Hazelwood saw the see you got (t)

A Yes, sir
Q And I want you to consider the planned course, according to
+) Defendents Exhibit 1734-A and ask you if that was an
appropriate course considening where Captain Hazelwood saw
the
(13) ice?
(14) A I beheve so, yes
(15) Q And why do you may that?
(16) A Well, the point at which he picked - the point at which he
(17) pricked to make the turn was the pount at which the ice was
(18) closest to Busby - Busby Island In other words, he came to
a
(19) point of just about halfway between the two, as a pount to
(20) commence his turn The ten degree right rudider turn would have
( 1 ) started to align hum with a course that would have brought hm
(22) parallel to the ree and parallel to the edge of the reef at a
(23) pount halfway between the two and he would have been able \(t 0\)
(24) bring humself back into the traffic lanes on a straight
(25) course

Vol 213545
(1) MR NEAL Excuse me just a moment Your Honor
(?) MR NEAL Thank you Mr Cushing
(3) You may examine Do you want me to leave Mr Moniague
(4) some of these up here?
(s) MR MONTAGUE Yes sir
(6) MR NEAL Which one?
(7) MR MONTAGUE Both
8) CROSS EXAMINATION OF CHARLES CUSHING
(9) BY MR MONTAGUE
(10) Q We re going to have to just watt a second untal the charta
(II) come up Mr Cushing
(12) Can you see this Mr Cushing?
(13) A Yes, sur, I can
(14) Q By the way I m Laddie Montague we haven \(t\) met
(is) I d like to just ask you a couple things about this chant
(16) This is the chart that - your course line of the Exxon Valdez?
(17) AYes sir it is
(18) Q Okay And the 2355 is when the vessel was abeam Busby
(19) Island light?
(20) A Yes, sir
(21) \(Q\) And do you recall that Captain Hazelwood left the bridge
(22) about two munutes before that about 2353?
(23) A Yes sar
(24) Q Now you say that the turn you agree that the turn was
(25) made the order was given around one and a half minutes after
```

mmdngght?
A Approximately, yes
Q Okay And that would be about six and a half minutes after
Busby Island light was passed?
A Yes,sir
Q And about eight and a half minutes after Captain Hazelwood
left the bridge?
A Approximately Approximately
Q And it was that ume that after Captain Hazelwood left the
bndge to the tume of the turn, that was - that - over that
eight and a half minutes there was no communication between
Captain Hazelwood and Mr Cousins untul Mr Cousins called
telling him that he had made the curn is that correct?
A I'm not qualified to answer that
Q You re not familiar with that information?
A No, sur
Q Okay Now these are your vanous hypotheticals that you
made, nght? The red the yellow the blue and the orange?
A Yes, sur They are
Q Okay Did anybody tell you that Lieutenant Delozier
testified that when he interviewed both Mr Cousins and Captain
Hazelwood that when they were asked where the turn was to be
made they both circled the }38\mathrm{ fathom mark?
A I had heard that
Q Did you make any determination as to turns at that mark?
midnight?
A Approximately, yes
Q Okay And that would be about six and a half minutes after
Busby Isiand light was passed?
A Yes, sir
Q And about eight and a half minutes after Captann Hazelwood
left the bridge?
A Approxumately Approxımately
Q And it was that tume that after Captan Hazelwood left the eight and a half minutes there was no communication between
Captain Hazelwood and Mr Cousins until Mr Cousins called
telling him that he had made the turn is that correct?
A I'm not qualified to answer that
You re not familiar with that information?
A No, 3 ur
Q Okay Now these are your vanous hypotheticals that you
made, nght? The red the yellow the blue and the orange?
A Yes, sur They are
Q Okay Did anybody tell you that Lieutenant Delozier
testified that when he interviewed both Mr Cousins and Captain
Hazelwood that when they were asked where the turn was to be
A I had heard that
Q Did you make any determination as to turns at that mark?

```
A No, sar
Q Now am I correct that for each of these hypothetucal turns
that you ve indicated here there would have to be a counter
rudder command in order to successfully complete the
euver?
A Not necessarily a counter rudder The rudder could have
been brought back gradually to amidships
Q There would have to be some work done on the rudder?
AYes sir
Q In other words it couldn istay on ten degrees or five
degrees forever right?
A That's correct
Q And that is a navigator s job to determine how to handle
that rudder?
A Yes, sir, the person conning the shap
\(Q\) How would you determane what to do?
A Well, you would determine what your next course as gomg
be First determine where you're going to make your turn
y0u
(18) then determane what your next course is goung to be from
that
(19) point, and then you bring the ship around to that course,
and
(20) then you steady up on that course
(21) Q Have you made that determination with any of these?
(22) A No, sir, we haven't
(3) \(Q\) And that takes a little hit of thinking doesn 1 it 10
figure out how to get back on the right line?
A Yes, it does
(1)
(20) then you steady up on that course

Q Have you made that determination with any of these?
A No, sir, we haven't
figure out how to get back on the right line?
A Yes, it does
Now am I correct that for each of these hypothetical turns
udder command in order to successfully complete the uver?
A Not necessarily a counter rudder The rudder could have

Q There would have to be some work done on the rudder?
A Yes sir
degrees forever right?
A That's correct
And that is a navigator s job to determine how to handle

A Yes, sir, the person conning the ship
A Well, you would determme what your next course is gomg
e First determine where you're going to make your turn
point, and then you bring the ship around to that course,

\section*{Vol 213546}

\section*{Vol 213547}

星

Vol 213548
Q Okay Now you testified that each of these four spots had
a turn been made or each of these three spots had a turn been
made in two different degrees there ten degrees here ten
degrees there each of those times had the turn been made this - this wreck would have never happened is that correct?
A That's correct yes, sir
Q And am I correct that all during these three the times of
these three dots we ve established Captain Hazelwood was not on the bridge isn ithat correct?
A I'm not qualificd to -
Q WeH we just said he was off the bridge from 1253 to
after - after the grounding?
A. Yes, sir that's what you told me

Q Okay So it s posatble then that had there been another person on the bridge lake the maater theac urns might have
(16) been made and the whole wreck would have been avoided an t
(I7) that correct?
(18) A I'm not sure I understand your question You're saying if (19) another person had been on the bridge they would have
been
(20) made but they weren't because -
(21) Q No What I maying had someone else been on the bidge
(22) that was alert they maght have caught this and those turns
(23) would have been made?
(24) A That's possible
(2s) Q Okay Now lastly let s just look at the - one thing you

\section*{Vol 21 3549}
didn \(t\) discuss at all with respect to the Valdez track line is the fact that once the course went to 180 the vessel was on autopilot?
A Yes There were - yes, sir
Q Did you make any determination as to whether these vessels were on autopilot?
A No sur we didn't We couldn't in fact All we had was the positions from the chart
Q Okay Next - I m sorry for these vessels what did you look at? A We looked at the copies for each of the charts from each
of
(12) those two ships
(13) Q What do you mean the charts? -
(14) A Each shup has a navigation chart on which they piot their
(1s) fixes We were provided with copies of the navigation chart
(16) for the Arco Juneau and for the Brooklyn, which showed the
(17) posituons that they had plotted and the umes
(18) Q Okay By the way what did you look at to determune the
(19) speeds of the vanous times that you testified to for the Exxon
(20) Valdez? What did you look at what records did you look at to
(21) get those speeds?
(22) A Well, we had the - the engine bell logger, which is an
(23) automatic printout that shows the revolutions of the ship and
(24) at each tume There was a sea tral conducted after the (25) accident and repair of the shap that showed, and they sımulated

\section*{Vol 213550}
(1) the - went through an entire sea trial and sumulated both
(2) moving in straught directions and in various rudder curves what
(3) the speed of the vessel would be, what tracks the vessel would
(4) follow and what turning rates and what drift angles the ship
(S) would have for vanous revolutions
(6) Also at showed what the speeds of the vessel would be for
(7) the load program up, so that we were able to use the identical
(8) conditions and data to establesh what the speeds and tracks
(9) were
(10) Q Okay So you used all that in order to determine the speeds of the Exxon Valdez?
A Yes, sar
Q Did you have that information avasiable for the Juneau or the Brooklyn?
A No, but we had something even better We had the position
(16) of the shup and we had the tume of the shup, and knowng the
posstion and the tume, you can determine the speed
Q So you - that was a calculation that you used, something
different than what you used to determine the speed of the
Exxon Valdez?
A Yeah Well, there are many ways to determme speed
Q I understand I just want to see that there were different \({ }^{\text {f }}\) methods used
A Yes, sar
(25) Q Now one last question Are you aware that in both of the

\section*{Vol 21 3551}
testimonies here in both of these cases has been that the captain or the master was on the bridge at all tumes?
A I've heard that
MR MONTAGUE Thank you very much
MR NEAL No questions Your Honor
THE COURT Thank you sir You may step down
MR LYNCH Call Dr Gary Richardson Your Honor
THE CLERK Wouid you rase your right hand plase sir
(The Wuness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name your address and spell your last name please
THE WITNESS Gary S Richardson The last name
Richardion is apelled R 1 CHARDSON and I live at 94
Wendell Street, W-E N D E-L L in Cambridge Massachusetts
THECLERK Thank you sir
MR LYNCH Your Honor may I approach the witness DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GARY RICHARDSON (Live) BYMR LYNCH
Q Dr Richardson you ve been employed by the defendants in
this case to evaluate certain issues relating to the issues in this trial?
Al have
(4) \(Q\) And what is your present imploymıni?
(2s) A I'm the director of the Sleep Disurder Service the clanc
(1) and the laboratory at Brigham and Women's Hospital in Boston,
(י) Massachusetts
(3) Q Could you tell us a little bit about what Bagham and
(4) Women s Hospital 18 ?
(5) A Brigham and Women's Hospital is one of three or four
(6) teachung hospitals in Boston, Mass It's a general medical
(7) hospital
(8) Q Are you a medical doctor?

AI am
Q And as director medical director of the Sleep Disorders
(11) Clinuc at Bngham and Women s Hospital what 8 - what do you
do when you go to work?
(13) A My dutues as in that position involve both research and (4) clinical care for patsents with sleep disorders

Q Could you - the word clinical care means actually treating patsents?
A That's correct I see patients in clunic, evaluate, (18) diagnose and treat disorders
(19) Q And what does research basically consist of doing?
(20) A Our research miterests are broad but much - all of our
(21) research is chnical research, meanugg research on homan
(22) subjects, and it covers a vanety of subjects mvolving
(23) endocrinology, sleep disorders sleep, physiology
(24) Q Does its involve doing experiments?
(25) A Yes, it does

\section*{Vol 213553}

Q Under controlled conditions and carefully recording those results?
A The experments we do are both in the laboratory, controlled conditions, and also worked on in the field
Q Dr Richardson how long have you been at sleep disorder research or study?
A I've been involved in this field for a very long tume, since 1978 actually
Q And how did you first get involved?
A I did my undergraduate traning and my medical tranng
Stanford Medical School in California, and that facility is one
(12) of the leading mstututions in the evaluation of sleep,
(13) sleepiness and performance, and I first became involved as
a
(14) student in that laboratory
(15) \(Q\) And have you been working in that field continuously since (16) that time?
(17) A Yes I have
(18) Q What professional degrees or educational degrees have you
(19) attained sir?
(20) A Well, I have my bachelor's degree in scsence from

Stanford
(21) and a medical degree and M D from Stanford, as well
( \({ }^{\circ}\) ) \(Q\) And for how long have vou been practicing medicine?
(23) A My degree was granted in 1983 I was hcensed at Brigham
(24) and Women's Hospital the year after that and I've been
(25) practicing uninterrupted sunce that tume

Vol 213554
Q Do you teach?
A Yes, I do I'm an instructor in medicine at Harvard
Medical School
Q And what subjects - on what subjects do you teach?
A I teach both endocnnology, which is my formal specialty, and sleep disorders medicme
Q And at what schools? Harvard only or -
A I teach at Harvard Medical School I've done lectuning
and
9) bref teachung elsewhere

Q Have you published in the field of sleep or sleep disorders?
A Yes, I have
Q And did that publication involve what was described yesterday as peer reviewed articles?
A Yes, it does
Q Without taking up a lot of time or without taking up as
much time as it might otherwise take let me just display your
resume for a second And I realize that this is hard for us
all to see Are these a list of your publications?
A That's a partal lust, yes
Q Do they include books that you ve edited or authored sir?
A In this case, the screen is focused on books that I've been
involved in the preparation of either as an editor or
contributor
Q Then for the next several pages are lists of the articles

\section*{Vol 213555}
(1) abstracts and other learned materials that you ve publiahed sir?
A Yes I apologaze for the arcane organization of the curnculum vitae Harvard Unversity requires that it be organized in that way
MR LYNCH Well rather than run through the lati I just thought it would be faster if we could show them but II
offer Dr Richardson as an expert on the subjects of sleep
disorders and sleep research Your Honor
MR GERRY No objection: Your Honor
THE COURT Doctor s qualifications are accepted
MR LYNCH Thank you Your Honor
BYMR LYNCH
Q Were you asked by counsel for the defendants to evaluate
whether there sa scientufic basis to conclude that lack of
6) sleep affected the actions of third mate Gregory Cousins in the

30 minutes prior to the grounding of the Exxon Valdez?
(8) A I wres

Q And in that connection what procedure or steps did you
(20) follow to advise yourself about the facts and circumstances
(21) relating to Mr Cousins sleep hastory and sleep situation at
(22) the time of the grounding of the Exxon Valdez?
(23) A I procipally - I reviewed principally depositional
(2A) testumony available from individuals anvolved,
reconstructung
(2S) his schedule I also reviewed documents provided to me,

Vol 213556
(1) meludung deck logs and other documents that provided
quantrtative estumates of his work schedule
3) Q Now what technique do you use from your point of view in
(4) trying to analyze whether sleep or lack of sleep may have been
si a factor in various performance issues as they relate to
(s) Gregory Cousins?

A Well, our - our take on sleep and sleepiness makes use of
extensive data that we've collected using an objectuve test of
sleepuness One of the umportant components I thunk is to try
(io) and objectify, try and be objective about what is inherently a
very subjectuve quantuty We use a test called a Multuple
Sleep Latency Test which is an objectuve test of sleepuness
that measures how quickly someone can fall asieep The
assumption underlying this is that the sleepier someone is
the
(15) we
(16) put them in bed, turn out the lights and ask them to try and fall asleep, and then we can precisely measure the thme it takes in minutes for them to actually fall asieep Thus test has been used now and is in widespread use and allows us
make certan quantatatuve estumates about levels of sleep un different conditsons
Q By whom was the Multuple Sleep Latency Test developed?
A I was anvolved in ats development along with Dr Bill Dement and Mary Carskadon
Q Is that test used only in experimental purposes or


A No As I mentioned, that test is now in very widespread
use It's considered part of the standard approach to the
diagnosis of sleep dusorders so for example patients with
sleep apnea insomma or narcolepsy who complain of being
excessively sleepy during the day are given this test as a
means of objectuvely showng that they are sleepy
Q Now if that littie beep I heard is accurate we Il have a chart here
MR MONTAGUE Excuse me
MR LYNCH Excuse me Your Honor I failed the test
here What il put up is Exhibit DXI 744
BY MR LYNCH
Q Dr Richardson I wonder if you could explain to the jury
what this chart depicts as it relates to the multuple sleep latency test? A Now, can I use this pointer' Which screen can I use this Okay Can I do that'? Doesn't really show up well Can you see that?
Q I can see it and I 11 try and follow the bouncing ball
A Thes is a study I did some years ago using thus Multuple
different times of the day And if we can just onent the jury
first to what we're showing here Along the hornzontal axis
the bottom if you wall is the time of day, and you can see

Vol 213558
the tumes noted there, so it's an enture 24 hour a full day in the life of these individuals Along the vertical axis are the monutes that it takes someone to fall asleep and you can see about where we are nght at the moment Normal adult individuals here, 1 guess it's roughly what 1011 a m in the morning would take something on the order of 15 minutes now
(7) I can't see my ponter either, there we are - \(\mathbf{1 5}\) minutes or so
to fall asleep Older undividuals differ somewhat from the
young adults, but for the most part the pattern is the same
(10) Q Now these hines that are depicted on the exhibit what -
where did you get the information that led to ploting those lines?
(13) A Okay This was a study that we did some years ago in which
(14) we actually performed the Multuple Sleep Latency Test and
(15) measured sleep latency at regular intervals across the entire
(16) day
(17) Q And when you talk about sleep latency you mean the time it
(18) takes people to fall asleep?
(19) A Exactly
(20) Q And your research indicates that by measuring that time you
(21) can determine how alert or sleepy they are?
(22) A Exactly, exactly
(23) Q Now you -
(24) A The longer it takes someone to fall asleep, the more alert
(25) they are

Vol 213559
(1) Q You used the term sleepy I used the term tired ls there a correlation of those?
A Well, I feel strongly that the term sleepy and alert, at least in the scientific arena, is a much more precise term than
(s) tired or fatugued or other terms that are in colloqual use,
(6) common use but don't have the same precise meaning that
(7) sleepiness does We use the term sleepiness to denote the
(8) state when an induvidual has unadequate sleep The other
(9) terms although they are in general use have much

\section*{different}
(10) definitions
(II) Q These lines were used to test puople more or luss sleepy
(1) more or less lacking in sleep?
(13) A Exaculy
(14) Q If they were not sleepy then they were alert?
(1) A Right
(16) Q And on this chart the higher the number the higher the
(17) what?
(18) A The alertness
(19) Q And the lower - the more sleepy?
(20) A Exactly
(-1) Q Now what - does this \(W\) shaped pattern have any
(22) significance?
(23) A This was a very amportant study 1 believe in that it was
(24) the first to describe the normal course of sleepiuess across
(25) the day There are a couple of features that I think are
) important The first is that you can see at about two th the
2) afternoon that all individuals undergo a decrease in alertness,
(3) a nap phase, where sleepiness increases and there's a tendency
(4) to fall asleep Then there's a rebound, so that in the late
(s) evening, really, sleepiness decreases and alertness peaks
(6) People are most alert and most functional in this reaard at
(7) about enght to mine in the evening, actually Sleepaneas
then
(s) mereases more or less linearly across the nught and
(9) sleepiness, and with it problems performing, sleepiness is
(10) maximal actually well into the morning, between five and sux
m
(11) the morming typically for most individuals
(12) Q Is that pattern according to your research related to any (13) biological processes?
(14) A Yes We've suce been focused on in the years sunce thus
(1s) study is the role the body's internal clock has in firing this
(16) pattern This is a remarikably consistent pattern from
(17) individual to individual, and that's because thes pattern is
(18) fixed by a clock that we all hove mside our heads, a
circadian
(19) or biological clock that fixes this pattera un tume and orients
(20) us to the external worid
(21) Q Now looking at this chart alone if I were trying to
(22) predict what level of alertness or what level of sleepiness
(23) a - a nominal individual John \(Q\) Public would have at say,
(24) midnight what would this chart say about the probable level of
(25) aleriness or sleepiness of an individual if that a all you

\section*{Vol 213561}
knew was a hypothetical man?
(2) A We should step back one moment and say these data were
(3) collected on the assumption that undividuals were sleeping
(4) reasonably well There are no patuents, for example, whth
(s) sleep disorders in this muxture, but if we can assume our John
(6) \(Q\) Public fit into that category alertness at midnight is
(7) actually fairly high As I mentioned the munimum of alertness
(8) the peak of aleepiness doesn \(t\) occur untul many hours latar
(9) MR LYNCH Your Honor one moment
(10) Your Honor may I approach? I II just hand the witnese a paper copy This is DX3495 Alpha [sic] For record keeping
purposes Your Honor 1 will offer the exhibit on the sereen
(Exhibit 2495 offered)
MR GERRY No objection Your Honor
MR LYNCH Offer DX1744
(Exhibut 1744 offered)
THE COURT DX1744 is admitted
(Exhibit 1744 received)
MR LYNCH And I will offer - I beheve Mr Gerry
has no objection to 2495 Alpha
(Exhibit 2495 offered)
MR GERRY No objection Your Honor
THE COURT Is a 24 or 34?
MR LYNCH 2495 I misspoke Your Honor
THE COURT Okay Defendants Exhibit 2495-A is alno
```

admitted
(Exhibut 2495 recetved)
BYMR LYNCH
Q Dr Ruchardson I put up on the screen another chart and
maybe you could try to help us make some sense out of it
Firat of all what - what are the axes what is portrayed on
the verticalaxis?
A Well, here agam, what we've attempted to do is - is
summanze the normal sequence of alertness in an
dividual, so
on the vertcal axis, agam, we bave estumated sleep latency
which is the tume it would take them to fall asleep under
standardized conditions
Q So this is the Multuple Sleep Latency Test tume to fall
asleep?
A That's nght
Q Ranging from zero minutes to 20 minutes)
A Exactly
Q And the longer it would take?
A More alert the undividual would be that's correct
Q And then along the horizontal axis what have we presented?
A Here we've expanded the scale somewhat representing
days sn question, March }22\mathrm{ and }23\mathrm{ of 1989 and we have
(3) marked mudnght, noon and then mudnight again on the
(24) Q Have you made any specific assumptions about the
geographical location of the individual'

```
the
tume
24th

\section*{Vol 213563}

A Yes, as I mentioned we've since learned that the body's biological clock is important in fixing this pattern in time determming when the peaks are going to occur and when the
troughs are goug to occur We also know that the body's clock
(5) is oriented by sunlight and recognizing that Mr Cousins was
(6) un a farly far northern latitude at the tume thas all (n) occurred, we attempted to ascertan whether the unusual
suninght pattern at the far northern latutude should requre some adjustment in his sleepuress pattern What's I depricted
(10) is nautical twilght and sunnse, and end of nautucal twilight
) at the latutude approximating the Valdez on the day in question, and what we've done as adjust - using our sumulations, we've adjusted the position of this curve to fit that sunlight pattern Q This blue line what does the blue line represent?
A The blue line is an average of our data on young and old (17) undividusls Mr Cousuns is a little older than our younger (18) subjects and much younger then our older subjects, so we (19) weighted the two curves as an average to produce an estumate of
(20) his normal alertness
(21) \(Q\) This is an attempt to portray the probable alertness based 22) on generalized study?
(23) A That's correct
(24) Q Of a person who had normal rest is that correct?
(25) A That's correct

Q And trying to adjust for age because you didn thave subjects who exactly matched Mr Cousins age -
A That's correct
Q-as of these dates? What are these red bars?
A Well the red bars encompass the period of relerant sunlight meaning the twinght the twilight period between the
onset of nautical twinght and sunrse and the onset of sunset
and the end of nautical twinght in the evening
Q Now in this gray bar down here on the bottom there are these boxes and would you explain what those represent?
A From the depositional testumony that I reviewed, we've obtaned the estamated tumes at which Master - or the tumes, rather, at which Mr Cousins worked and slept The first box,
(14) then, is his \(p\) m watch from 2000 hours to midnght on the uight before the incident in question
Q So this would be from 800 pm to midnight on March 22nd?
A That's correct Mudnught would be on the morning of the
23rd Then his reported nocturnal sleep or aughttume sleep episode when he reports that he went to sleep that nught Q How much sleep did you -
A Did we allow him?
Q Did you understand that he had then?
(23) A He reported that he went to bed at approximately one and (24) was called for duty the next morning at 720 so we gave hm (25) sux and a third hours of sleep

\section*{Vol 213565}

Q What s the next entry?
A The next entry is his morning watch on the 23rd,
beginaing
at eight in the morning and running until noon
Subsequently,
the nap that he reported taking at roughly 100 in the
afternoon and lastag until he was called at 1700 hours
Q Now can you tell the jury what if any conclustons you
drew from the data represented on this exhibit?
A Yes The conclusions we drew was that based on thas these
(9) data we had every reason to expect that Mr Cousuns should be
(10) very alert Sleepiness was clearly not relevant in the
(II) descrnption of his behavior at the tume, specifically for
(12) several reasons, but briflly, because the - the nocturnal
(13) sleep episode The nightume sieep episode you'll note,
(14) corresponds precisely with the optumal tume of sleep, it
(15) occurred nght in the minmum of alertness and brackets that
(16) minmum on either side in almost an ideal fashon
(17) Q Let me just interrupt you for a second Is there a point
(18) on this \(\mathbf{2 0}\) to zero minutes spectrum where you begin to judge
19) people as being quite sleepy or very prone to go to sleep?
(20) A The pount at which someone can sleep is actually a very
(21) individual ssue Sleep becomes possibie and sense of (22) sleepness becomes real in most people somewhere below ten
23) minutes Performance real senous performance errors are (24) described in individuals below five minutes
(25) Q So if I understand you correctly unless you get into the

Vol 213566
gray area which the line doesn \(t\) get into a person is able to perform cven if they may wish they could get to sleep?
(3) A Well, we have to be careful there The data on thus
(4) partacular point are based on the facts that severely sleepy
(5) individuals almost routinely will show sleep latency below five
(6) minutes, and that has become a kind of marker For example, if
(7) we have a patient who tells us that they're severely sleepy
(8) because they have narcolepsy or sleep apaea syndrome, we would
(9) define sleepiness of a degree sufficiently severe to impar
(10) their ability to drive a car, for example as that sleepiness
(II) which occurs beiow a Multuple Sleep Latency Test of five
(12) minutes
(13) \(Q\) And in this time frame here if - assuming that the
(14) standard curve applied the sleep latency would have gone down
(1S) to a low about what, about five in the morning or something?
(16) A That's correct
(17) Q And then gone up and now the same is true here is
(18) there -18 there any cultural significance to the biological
(19) fact that people have a tendency to sleep in the afternoon?
(20) A Well that's the ongin, of course of the siesta Siesta
(11) cuitures make use of that increase in sleepmess in the
(22) afternoon and routuely nap at that time The interesting
(23) aspect I think for western cultures maybe a cautionary lesson
(24) 4 that that biology occurs in all of us we all develop an
(25) increase in sleepiness in the early afternoon hours We as a

\section*{Vol 213567}
(1) society have elected to ignore it
(2) Q Dr Richardson you made the comment that you don 1
(3) typically get into the five minutu sluep latency range unless
(4) you ve been deprived of slecp Did you consider whether there
(5) wasany evidence that Third Mate Cousins was chronically
(6) deprived of sleep as of March 2319897
(7) A Wedid We reviewed the deck logs The depositional
(8) tesumony on the days leading up to these days as limited
(9) There is little data direct data on whether or how much he
(10) slept Inferning from hus own tesumony about how he was doing
(II) and his decis logs and his discussion of a typical day we were
(12) able to conciude that it was reasonable to expect that he was
(13) sleeping a normal amount for the days leading up to the
tume in
(14) question
(1S) Q Did you find any evidence from which you could conclude on
(16) the basis of a susentific probability that he was - that he
(17) was chronically deprived of sleep as of daybruak?
(18) A No sir
(19) Q Even March 237
(20) A No sir there was no reason to conclude that
(21) \(Q\) In your own opinion is it appropriate to use the blue line
(22) measuring the sleep latency of a person who has an adequate
(23) history of sleep?
(24) A We feel it is, yes
(25) Q Now could you explain the evebrow on the second pump of
the -
A Yes, sur, the eyebrow is an attempt to - most of the data
that - or the data that we used in this model, in the
development of thus estumate, were based on an indindual
who
5) was sleepung at nught but not nappung for a long penod of tume
dunng the day So what we did in thus case is we took data
actually that Dr David Dinges and others have collected
showing that the nop occurring at that tume will mereose
alertness subsequent to the nap So actually, nappang for a
long period of tume in the early afternoon will ranse your
alertness levels beyond what they would normally be in the early evenung
Taken from data by David and others, takang a conservatave
estumate of what that mcrement would be, the top of the
eyebrow, the top of the yellow portion describes what we would
(16) conservatavely estamate Mr Cousins' alertness to be for the hours following his nap
Q Dr Richardion in connection with the analyais of
Mr Cousins' situation that you did were there other factors which in your professional judgment would have contributed
an alertness on Mr Cousins part in the period from say, ten
of 12 until ten after 12 around midnight of March 23?
A Well I think it's siguificant to try and examme those events in detal We spend a lot of tume working whth shift workers who are working much - in a much more - a much later

\section*{Vol 213569}
tume of the night, helping them identify things that they can do to minmize sleepiness Many of those were inherent in the
actions that Mr Cousins took From what we were able to ascertan for exampie he was physically and mentally active
(S) dunng that enture penod The tasks he describes and which
others describe hm performing melude goung out onto the
bridge wing into what really was rather bracing cold arctic alr
to take his sughting, has bearing on the Busby Island light
This is somethug that we teach shift workers can result in a significant mprovement in alertness The physical movement
(11) that he made around the bridge, all of that contributes to
(12) alertness We all know that sleepiness is more of an assue when you're sittang rather than standing or wallong around and
(14) physically active
(15) Q Would you recommend that the jury stand when watching
(16) deposition?
(17) A I was just goung to say that actually some of this might be (18) relevant today
(19) THE COURT Certanly relevant to what happens to me
(20) after 1200
(21) THE WITNESS I think there are other aspects that
(22) need to be considered about the alerting influence that
(23) occurred at that tume allowing for the moment that sleepinesa
(24) might conceivably have been a factor, and I don \(t\) believe that
(2J) 11 Was

\section*{Vol 213570}
) The other thing to consider is that it s clear from the depositional testimony that this was not a boring situation for
) Mr Cousins Having responsibility lone responsibility for
the ahip was not something that he did routunely It was
something that he clearly had to regard as a novel situation
and under those circumstances it s reasonable to expect that
the task itself would have some alerting impact just being in an unusual situation
And then finally, there is a great deal of social interaction the idea that there were people coming and going the woman coming in to report the position of the - of the buoy the calls to the captain the interaction with the helmsman a fair degree of social interaction which is something we also teach shift workers can be alerting interactung with other individuals makes it much less likely that any sleepiness that might have been present would have impaired his performance
Q Is there - you mentioned that you recommend getting fresh air and maybe stepping outside Is there a biological
advantage or biological factor related to cold coldness the outside temperature?
A Well, the mechanism whereby cold air alerts an individual is not entirely clear, but it is known that cold or stimulating atr darectly inhibats sleep and sleepiness that's been shown un several studies

\section*{Vol 213571}

Q Did you see evidence that Mr Cousins lake me was a heavy coffee user?
A I have - I did come across that in the testumony, yes
Q And what argnificance if any, did you see to that fact?
A Well, coffee - we've studied a large number of shuft workers and have heard very, very umpressive accounts of coffee
n consumption, and there are several things that need to be consudered about that rather limsted descraption One of the things we found for example, is that when an individual reports drnikng, partucularly a shaft worker, someone who's physucally active and moving around as part of his job if he reports drunling five or sux or ten or \(\mathbf{2 0}\) cups of coffee a day, one has to be careful to question them about how much of a cup
(14) they actually get through The typical cup of coffee on a shift work antuation gets thrown away half full or even more than that So beang - one has to be very carefol about extrapolating, about moving from a deacription of cups of coffee to any sort of estomate about how much caffeme they consumed
More important, caffeine consumption on a regular day in, day out basis is very, very different than the minvidual who rarely drunks coffee and then has a large cup of coffee right before going to bed The adverse or the disruptave impact that
(24) coffee will have on sleep is significantly, even dramatically
(25) reduced in an individual who is used to that kind of caffeine
(1) consumption
(2) And finally, one of the things we've gone back and forth
(3) with shuft workers is that it is possible that coffee can be a
disruptave influence if it's alertung, but it's also a
countermeasure It's also something you can do to improve
alertness when sleepiness occurs So to the extent that
Mr Cousins was dranking coffee at the tume in question we
would expect that to be vet another reason not to worry
about
sleepiness win this particular setting
Q On the whole Dr Richardson do you believe there is a
scientufic basis to conclude that it is probable that any
mustakes made by Third Mate Cousins on the aight of March 23
24 were attributable to a lack of sleep?
A No, sir, I don't thunk there's a basus for that
MR LYNCH I have no further questions Your Honor
THE COURT You may cross-examine
Fine Okay Let stake our first recess rather than break
things up We il be in recess for 15 minutes
THE CLERK This court is in ruclss for 15 minutes
(Jurv out at 9 56am)
(Jury in at 1013 am )
MR GERRY May I proceed Your Honor?
THE COURT You may cross-examine Mr Gerry CROSS EXAMINATION OF GARY RICHARDSON (Live) BY MR GERRY

\section*{Vol 213573}

Q Dr Richardson my name is Dick Gerry and I represent the plaintiffs in thie ease I don think we ve ever met, have we?
A We have not
Q I underatand that you re an matructor at the medical
school in -
A That's correct
Q - Harvard, and you experiment in sleepiness iab Most of
your experiments deal in your - in the relationship between
(0) sleepiness and your specialty of endocrinology, do they not?
(11) A I'm sorry, I couldn't understand your question
(12) Q Most of your experiments in - experiments in your
(13) laboratory deal with the relationship between sleepiness and
(14) your specialty of endocrinology is that correct?
(1s) A No, sir, I wouldn't say that Most of the work we've been (16) doing looks at the relationship between sleep and sleepiness in
(in normal undividuals
(18) Q Okay As it applies to the body then?
(19) A That's correct
(20) Q The exhibits that were on the board, they do not reflect
(21) any examination that you ever did of Mr Cousins do they?
(22) A I've never exammed Mr Cousuns
(23) Q And you do not have any pernonal knowledge of whether or (20) not he is a normal individual, as far as sleep is concerned a
(2)) normal individual or whether he has any kind of abnormalitues,

Vol 213574
is that correct?
A Beyond the depositional testimony that describes hum as reportung that he feels well rested no sir, I do not
Q And what you have done is to take a senes of experimental
data which you have put up on the first exhibit and constructed
another exhibit which is a hypothetical of what Mr Cousins may be like if he is a normal individual right?
A That's a reasonable statement of a hypothetical situation, yes
Q And it also does not take into account any variation in the
fact that it may be caused by the fact that he doesn i work an eight hour day but works a split shift does it?
A On the contrary We did attempt to include that aspect of hus day unto the model and, as I mentioned, one nsequence of
s) the split shift was the nap, and we attempted to add just the model for the sleep he obtanned during the nap
Q Dr Richardson you do not know of any atudies of split shift workers do you?
A There are limited data on spht shift workers I am aware of reports, actually, having to do with that shift Q And you - so what you did was to as you did with the enture model you attempted to determine without facts from studies what the astuation would be with a split shift worker like Mr Cousins isn t that correct?
A To the extent that we adjusted the model to fit his

\section*{Vol 213575}
sleep/wake schedule and I think that's the relevant part of his shift work schedule We did extrapolate from data, from
facts most of them provided in artucles written by Dr Dinges
Q And Dr Dinges is an expert in the field of napping is he not?
A I would consider him that yes
Q And he a also an expert in the field of fatigue?
A As I've mentioned I have trouble with that term He describes himself as an expert in the field of fatugue
Q And you are not an expert in the field of fatigue are you?
A I would consider myself an expert un the field of sleepiness
Q And a person may be fatigued without being sleepy may they
(1s) not?
(16) A Well now you're asking me to use what I consider to be a (17) colloquial and mprecise term I say a person may describe (18) themselves as being fatugued without being sleepy I would (19) agree with that statement
(20) Q Is it a colloquial term when it is used by the governmental
(21) bodies who study fatigue for which Dr Dinges does his work?
(22) A It's a term lake many others I mean when we use terms 11
(23) research, we like to have them have very precise meanings The
(24) government also uses a term like rest or activity two things
(25) which also have very imprecise meanings I think the issue is
(1) less whether the term is precise or not but simply that, in
my
2) view, the situation here is better described as a question of
3) whether or not the individual was sleepy

Q Would you - is it colloquial then if it sused by the
governmental bodies in naming themselves? Is that what you
mean by colloquial? That a the question
A I thunk we are forced to - we can't sumply ignore the term
and I'm not suggestang that we do We routurely, for xample,
ask our shift workers or our patients do you feel sleepy, do
you feel fatugued, do you feel tured, because we know that
undividuals in general may use any one of those terms, and we
) have to be ready for a very broad and very general use of a
concept that we're trying to get to, so that's what I mean by
the term colloqual, forces us to address and use the term
QMy question -
A And the government used - I would just say that the government is being umprecise, something that I think they might not object to
Q Not colloquial?
A Imprecıse
Q But imprecise when they name their bodies to atudy faugue
okay Do people vary in their circadian clocks that you were talking about the clocks that are in their head?
A Individuals vary with regards to the precise parameters
of
(2s) those clocks

\section*{Vol 21-3577}
(1) Q And ien it a fact that you do not know whether or not
(2) Mr Cousins has a clock which fits within your norm or whether
(3) he has a clock that may be outside your norm?
(4) A I - before I left for Alaska, I stopped in to the
(5) laboratory where I work and asked them to estumate the total
(6) number of individuals of all ages in whom we have precisely (7) characternzed the circadian clock, and we've studued roughly
(8) 280 individuals and the variance around that, aronid those
(9) parameters is remarkably small in people who don't have
severe
(10) nearologic problems So I thunk it's a reasonable assumption
(II) that aithough mdividuals vary from andividual to mdividual,
(12) that that vanance is small and that Mr Cousins, whol am
(13) presuming to be a normal individual would fall well withu
(14) those parameters
(1s) Q A person can be a normal individual and have a circadian
(16) clock that doesn \(t\) fall within your parameters can't they?
(17) A I would find that surprising
(18) \(Q\) Well normal in all other aspects besides having this -
(19) A As I mentioned the only severe deviations we've seen from
(20) our understandang of the clock, occur in very old andividuais
(21) and in individaals with neurologic disease
(22) Q Does that explain why I tend to doze off here when I'm
(23) supposed to be widest awake according to your clock?
(24) A There may be several explanations for that, str, but I
(23) don't think any of them have to do with your clock

Vol 213578
```

    QIsee
    THE COURT Show stopper wasn t tt?
    MR GERRY These young people don t contradict me
    that much
    BYMR GERRY
    Q It & intereating to me to note that you ve increased
    Mr Cousins alertness Is that what happens with your
eycbrow?
A The intention of the yellow portion of this fignre is to
make use of data provided by Dr Dinges and others to
mate
whot the mncrement in the Multiple Sleep Latency Test would
wnth a nap of thus duration
Q But you don t know what the duration of the nap was do
you?
A We know the reported duration of the nap, sir
Q In fact you do not know how much sleep Mr Cousins got
that day?
A We know the reported duration of sleep, sir
Q And it is - in your experience those reports are not
totally accurate isn t that correct?
A I thunk it is common for individuals to not precisely
estumate sleep The error can vary from individual to
mndividual
Q The - you are not an expert in the alerting factor of
thermoregulation are you?

```

\section*{Vol 213579}

A My principal field of research is not thermoregulation I wouldn't describe myself as an expert in that area Q And you recall in your deposition you were asked whether or not you were an expert You said well I m not an expert in how thermoregulation is accomplished is that correct?
A I have a very - I did say that in my deposition yes sir I have a very precise -
Q You want to contradict it now?
A No I would only say that I - I did my undergrad honors work for a man who is probably the leading expert in thermoregulation and alertness, Dr Crang Heller, and I'm more
(12) than passingly famular with the proncipal, that I discussed
(13) the relationship between cold and alertness

Q Do you know whether or not Mr Cousias drank any coffee during the 15 or 20 munutes half hour on the bridge.that day? Al do not know that, sir, no
Q From what study did you get the fact that half of the coffee that is poured on a ship is thrown out?
A I didn't say on a ship, sir I sand studies have shown And our studies of shift workers where the amount of coffee (21) consumption was a very umportant ussue, as we followed shuft
(22) workers around typically, and then asked them the next day to
(23) report how much coffee they would consume, our own people would
(24) report them throwing away cups that were more than half full
(23) and they would report that as, quotes, a cup of coffee
(1) Q You have no study or data at all as to whether or not that
(?) is true of ships or in particular of Mr Cousins do you?
(3) A No sir I do not
(4) Q Thank you It sinteresting to note on your chat here
(5) that following the eight \(p \mathrm{~m}\) watch when he goes on watch his
alertness is at the higheat level of the day night? According
(7) to your chart?
(8) A That's correct
(9) \(Q\) And it begins to fall from then untal the vessel runs
(10) aground doesn \(t\) it?
(11) A That's correct it does
(1) \(Q\) And you were asked to determine whether or nol sleepiness
(13) was one of the causes of the - was one of the causes of any
(14) errors that might have been made by Mr Cousins were you not?
(15) A It's one of the thmgs I was asked to do yes sur
(16) Q And I d like to read to you from page 29394 of your
(17) deposition 293 at page - at line 19 is your answer to - as
(18) I mentioned repeatedly these terms developed in the laboratory
(19) are extremely hard to apply in the real life setting and
(20) that s one of the reasons I feel so strongly that one cannot
(21) infer that sleepiness was a cause of these errors because
(_י) they re nol easily categorized as the type of error
(3) characteristic of sleepiness
(4) A Strictly speaking, the error sumply is that a very complex (25) task wasn't performed correctly and it's impossible in my view

\section*{Vol 21358}
(I) to dissect that task adequately and adentify errors of ombssion
(2) that would have been charactenstic of sleepiness That's your
(3) Conclusion as it not'
(4) A That's one of the conclusions The specafic context -
(s) MR GERRY Thank you sir That Eall
(6) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF GARY RICHARDSON (Live)
(7) BYMR LYNCH
(8) Q Did you want to explain the context of the pasage that
(9) Mister -
(10) A Yes, actually I dad The question I was asked to, which (II) that was the answer was whether errors of omission, sleepiness
(12) related errors were committed The problem I found was that
(13) Dr David Dinges un attempting to prove that point, deacribed
(14) vanous actions taken by Mr Cousins as errors of omussion
(IS) which he failed to act And in my view one cannot look at
(16) something as complex as pilotung a shap and conclude that
(17) anything that was done or wasn't done was an error of
(18) ombssion
(19) Q Now Mr Gerry asked you some questions about whether you
(20) had examined Third Mate Cousins do you remember that queation?
(21) AIdo
(22) Q And whether you had information about his circadian clock (23) and how it related to those that have been calibrated for other (24) people do you remember those questions?
(25) A Yes I recall that

\section*{Vol 213582}
(1) Q Now firat of all in science the process of the research
(2) you do 18 designed to enable you to apply or establish rules
(3) that you can apply to other people when they come in the door?
(4) A That's a fair statement
(5) Q And when you treat people you apply these general insights
6) that you ve learned from research to the people who come in for
treatment?
A Yes
Q And they get better?
(10) A That's correct, when we're iucky, I would say they get (II) better
(12) \(Q\) We hope they get better As a scientist are you satisfied
(13) that on the data available from the records that exist the
(14) conclusion that you testified to that there - that there s no
(15) basis to infer that sleepiness was a cause of any errors Third
(16) Mate Cousins may have committed is a scientifically accurate
(17) answer?
(18) A Yes, I beleve that it's consistent and accurate to the
(19) best of our ability to do that
(20) MR LYNCH I have no other questions Your Honor
(21) THE COURT Thank you sir You may step down
(22) MR SANDERS May it please the Court we call
(23) Mr John Tompkins
(94) THE CLERK Rasse your right hand please
(2S) (The Witness Is Sworn)

Vol 213586
the tume you left the job of gulf coast fleet manager?

\section*{A Yes, he did}

Q All nght And do you recall the exact date that you left as gulf coast fleet manager?
A It was about September of 1985, I took on a new assugnment
6) \(Q\) What was your new assignment?
7) A New assignment was to manage a special project for Exxon
(8) Shupping Company
9) Q And what was that called?
(10) A That project was called EXCEL
(11) Q And I think there s been some testimony from Second Mate
(i2) Lloyd LeCann that that involved exereises where people put
(3) hoods on, and is that part of your program at EXCEL?

A Well, the design of the program was to enhance the leadership capability of our organzation and to umprove the teamwork and the decision making process
Q How long did this EXCEL program last? How long did you head that up?
A Until about 1986, the latter part of '86
\(Q\) So this was a program to enhance and promote leadership
and
(21) teamwork that consumed over a year of your life?

\section*{A Yes, maybe a intele more}

Q All night And in doing this program is that something
that was used exclusively with the ships and ship personnel or
was that for shoreside also?

Vol 213588
(1) Q So by the late spring of 1985 you knew that one of your
(2) captans that you supervised had gone into some sort of a
3) treatment program which did involve alcohol am I right?
4) A That's correct
5) Q All right Now did Captain Hazelwood return to work while
6) you were sull his supervisor?
() A Yes, he did
8) Q Prior to his returning to work did you do anything?
9) A Yes I did I arranged to have a meeting with Captan Hazelwood
Q Do you recall getting a phone call about having such a meeting?
A Well I recall that - I believe it was Ben Graves had called me and suggested that I have a meetung with Captinn
Hazelwood before he retorns He suggested that I make sure he
(16) understands that he only has one more chance when he comes
(In back, and he also suggested that I should have some kind of way
(is) to keep an eye on hm, make sure I monitor him when he is back
(19) in the fleet
(20) Q All right Did Mr Graves tell vou that that - those
(21) suggestions came from someone else or did he just simply tell
you I suggest this?
(23) A I don't recall I don't recall
(24) Q Okay Now had you had the experience and I'm not -
(25) don I want to ask you any names but had you had the
experience

\section*{Vol 213589}
) by this time in the summer of 1985 of having someone who had
(2) some sort of a chemical problem chemical problem involving
3) either ahuse or dependency go away to treatment and then come
(4) back to work?
s) A Yes I did
(8) Q All right Now based on that is the prompting that you
(1) got - was the prompting that you got from Mr Graves was that necessary?
A Not really I had mitended to meet with Captan
(10) Hazelwood I wanted to make sure that I had my own evaluation,
(11) that I knew that - I felt comfortable that he was in pretty good shape, how he looked, how he chatted
I had some other things that I wanted to talk to hum about I also wanted to make sure that he understood that he
(15) had his opportunity for rehabulitation and that he cannot afford to have any further probiem with alcohol or he would
discipluned
Q All right Now when you say you intended to do these
things, did you form that intention sometime in the summer of 1985?
AYes, that was -
Q Orlate spring?
A I don't know about late spring, but I would say that would
be my normal activity and I was planning on doing that
\(Q\) In fact Mr Tompkins were arrangements made to have

Vol 213590
(I) Captain Hazeiwood come through Houston on his way to his next
(2) assignment?
(3) A Yes, they were
(4) Q Did you make those arrangements or did you have somebody
(5) do that?
(6) A I can't recall I think I made those arrangements myself,
7) but I could have asked someone to do them on my behalf
(8) Q Did there come a time when Captain Hazelwood actually came
(9) to Houston Texas, and you had a meeting with him?

A Yes, there was
(1) Q All nght Now at the time that this occurred your
) office as the gulf coast fleet manager was where?
A In Baytown Texas
Q Okay And do you recall where you met Captain
azelwood?
A Yes, I do
Q Where is that?
A That was at the Windham Hotel near the arport, Houston Intercontinental Arport
Q Now prior to going to the Windham Hotel did a problem
arise with respect to whether or not you thought you could
make
(21) that meeting?
2) A Yes, it did

Q And as a result of that problem arising did vou have a
(2) conversation with Captain Shechy?

A Yes I did

\section*{Vol 21 3591}
(1) Q Would you tell the Ladies and Gentlemen of the Jury as best ) you can recall what that conversation was or the gist of at?
(3) A Well, as mentroned, I was concerned that I may not be able
(4) to - to meet Captan Hazelwood so I asked Captan Sheehy who
(5) was my port captan to meet with him in case I can't get
(6) there And what I asked hm to do was simular to what I
(7) mentioned to you before was that how does he act how does he
(8) look, how does he feel is he ready to come back make sure we
kund of have the adea that - make sure he knows that he's (0) he's had hus opportunity, he's had has chance and that he can't
(il) have any further problems in that type of area is what we (12) talked about
(13) Q Mr Tompkins do you recall where you had this conversation (4) with Captann Sheehy?

A I beheve it was in the Baytown office my office
Q Were you on your way to bo sombwhere when you had this meetung?
A Yes 1-
Q If you can recall
A I was not too far away from going to this other activity that I was asked to come to
(72) Q Was there any sort of a rush in this meeting that you recall?
A I think there may have been I can't recall totally, but I
thank so

Q In any event did it turn out that you were able to meet
with Captain Hazelwood)
A Yes, I dud
Q Do you recall whether or not Captain Sheehy met with
(5) Captain Hazelwood that aught also or that afternoon, whenever
(6) it was?
(7) A He did meet with hm
(8) Q Do you recall who met with Captain Hazelwood first, you or
(9) Captain Sheehy?
(10) A I met wnth Captan Hazelwood first
(H) Q All right Do you recall what ume of day this was?
(12) A Yes, it was in the very, very early evenung of that
(13) particular day
(14) Q All right What tume would that be in your -
(15) A I'd say it was around six, 6.30 somethug like that
(16) Q Mr Tompkins when you met with Captain Hazelwood, did
you
(17) meet with him in a bar?
(18) A No, I didn't
(19) Q Where did you meet with him?
(20) A I met hum one of the conference rooms that was being
(-1) used at that tume, I think, if my recollection is correct, it
(22) was on the second floor in the Windham Hotel
(23) \(Q\) The potential conflict that you thought you might have that
(24) would have made you either late for the meeting with Captain
(25) Hazelwood or make you miss it do you recall what that was?

Vol 213593
(1) A Yes, it - I don't recall exactiy the detanls, but it had
(2) to do with a unom related issue that I was called to - to get
(3) involved with
(4) Q Do you recall where that meeting was?
(s) A I think it was at the Woodlands which is a lattle ways
(6) away from the Windham Hotel
(7) Q Okay But farrly close?
(8) A Yeah 1 mean it's not too long, half hour
(9) Q All right You had - you then met with Captain Hazelwood
(I0) in a conference room on the second floor of the Windham Hotel
(11) in Houston Texas near the arport Would you tell the Ladies
(12) and Gentiemen of the Jury, as best you recall it, what your
(13) converation was with Captan Hazelwood?
(14) A Well agan, what I wanted to do and what we did was to
(15) taile with each other, and my intent in the mitual
conversation
(16) was to see how Joe was, how he responded how'd he feei, and
(17) he - I thought he did quite well I asked hum, I remember,
(18) was be ready to go back to work or something to that effect,
(19) and he was I also mentioned to him that - brought hum up to
(20) date a little bit on the activities associated with the Exxon
(21) Yorktown, the ship he was going back to, and some of the things
(22) that had been going on in the fleet, and also my expectations,
(23) one of which was that he needs to understand that he's had hus
(24) opportunty and that he cannot have any further problems with
(20) alcohol or he would have - he would be subject to
discipline

\section*{Vol 21 3594}

I also recall that we had a discussion about what type of support he may have or he may have planned was he plannugg on
(3) goug to any meetings when he got into port in order to continue to support his actuvity
I don't recall all the detaiks of the conversation but in general, that was what we talked about
Q Well you just mentioned something about support Do you recall what his response was when you inquired about what support or meetings he intended?
A Not really I really don't
Q Now at the time that you had this meeting with Captain
Hazelwood did you discuss with him what his diagnosis was?
A No, I didn't
Q Did you - at this time did you know what his diagnosis was?
A Well, my understanding is he was treated for alcohohsm
Q All right But my question is did you know what the diagnosis was? I m not asking your operating assumption A No, no I didn't know what the technical diagnosis was, (20) no
(21) Q Had you discussed with the medical department anything (22) about Captaın Hazelwood?
(23) A No, I did not
(24) Q Had you seen any sort of a plece of paper like an
(25) individual disability report on which there was a diagnosis?

\section*{Vol 213595}

A No, not that I can recall
Q So then your - your assumption was that here was a guy who was an alcoholic right?
A I would normally not see that kand of form, my assumption was he was treated and he was ready to come back to work \(Q\) And with that assumption did you have any sort of a plan to watch Captain Hazelwood?
A Well I had a plan that when he comes into port, I would try to visit the ship as much as I could, recognizing that I was - very short penod of tume, I was transferring out of
that job, but I had planned to do that and my recollection is I got to visit, I beheve, on one occasion before I left my position
Q Now I asked you about your plan or your intention Did you think that was adequate for the job?
AYes, if -
Q Why do you thank that your plen, your intent with respect
to Captain Hazelwood was adequate to deal with the situation that you thought you had?
A Well, if - if Captan Hazelwood, assuming he was an
21) alcoholic, which that was my understanding, then if he started
(22) to drink again, he wouldn't be able to - I don't belneve he
(23) could control that So my visiting the ship, I would clearly
(24) learn that he had a problem and I most likely would have a
high
(25) probability of seeing that and talking with him
(1) Q All right Now would you relv solely upon your own () observations?
(1) A Well I had planned promarily to do that I didn't ask
(4) anyone else to do that kind of thing
(5) Q But whether or not you asked them did you think that you
(6) would be able to detect other than from your own observations
7) of him any sort of problems that might crop up?
(8) A Clearly When I go aboard the vessel I would be chattung
(9) with other folks and I know that I felt that I had the respect
(10) of others in the orgamization, that if there was a problem
that
(11) I would have - that I would be made aware of that
(12) \(Q\) You think it s realistic to expect that people in the
(13) fleet - was it realistic for you to expect that people in the
(14) fleet would let you know if they saw a problem with Captain
(15) Hazelwood?
(16) A I thank so
(17) Q What s your basis for thinking that?
(18) A Because I have been told in the past when there was an
(19) individual that I referred to before that I had a - that had a
(20) problem, I was notıfied
(21) Q I want you to speak up a little bit more I m having
(22) trouble hearing you and maybe some other people are too
(23) A Sorry
(24) Q My question is not your understanding of the disease of
(25) alcoholism My question is what basis did you have for

\section*{Vol 213597}
(1) believing that people that worked under you would let you know
(2) If they saw something amiss?
(3) A Well, I beheve that I had the respect to the organzation
(4) and the rapport with the folks that they would tell me
(5) Q How long had you been working with these people?
(6) A Quite some tume I mean I had been in this job for -
(7) since 1977
(8) Q All right You mentioned that you were transferring to (9) your new job with project EXCEL and you mentioned that that
(10) occurred sometime in September of 1985 Do you recall the
(II) months in which you met with Captain Hazelwood at the

Windham
(12) Hotel?
(13) A Yes, I beheve it was in Augnst, very early Auguat
(14) Q All right Now when you were being replaced by Mr Dwight
(15) Koops was there an opportunity for you and Mr Koops to have
(16) some sort of a tranation?
(17) A Oh, cleariy there was We did that
(18) \(Q\) And in the course of having that transition did you have
(19) an occasion to talk to Mr Koops about the masters that you had
(20) been and were supervising?
(21) A Yes, I did
(22) Q Did you talk about Captain Hazelwood?
(23) A Yes I did
(24) Q Did you tell Mr Koops anything about Captain Hazelwood?
(25) A Well, I told ham what I knew about Captan Hazelwood,
that

Vol 213598
he was in rehabilitation and that he -
Q Let me stop you You said rehabilitation Did you tell him what kind of rehabilitation?
A I think I did, yes, for alcoholism That was my understanding
Q All nght And - and what else did you tell him?
A Well, I told hm that what my plans were, I was going to try to visit the veasel and he may - he may want to consider that type of follow up, and visit the vessel as much as I possibly could when Captan Hazelwood is on
Q Now after you told Mr Koops about your understanding of what the treatment had been and - did you tell him when that treatment had occurred?
A I probably did, but I don't really recall
Q After you told him that Captain Hazelwood was treated for problema relating to alcohol and you had this transition then you went into the project EXCEL job is that correct?
A That's correct In fact, I was actually doing a little bit of that at the tume
Q Now after that did you ever have any occasion to see Caplain Hazelwood?
A Yes, I did
Q Where would you sce him or where did you see him? A I remember seeng hum at least at - at our officers' conferences that we had

Vol 21 3599
(1) Q Did you take the trouble to make any observations about Caplan Hazeiwood and drinking? AI dad Q And what did you observe?
A I did not ever observe him drinking
Q Drinking alcohol?
A Drinking alcohol
MR SANDERS May Ihave just a moment Your Honor? I don thave anything eise Your Honor
THE COURT You may cross examine
MR O NEILL Thank you judge
CROSS EXAMINATION OF JOHN TOMPKINS (Live) BY MR O NEILL
Q My name is Brian O Neill sir we ve nevermet before And it is my custom - let me give you a copy of your deposition transcript if I may approach
You picked up the story with regard to Captain Hazelwood in the spring of 1985 but you Icft out the first step in the story didn \(t\) you?
MR SANDERS 1 object to that
A I don't understand what you mean
Q Well would it be fair to say in February - in February of 1985 you knew that Captain Hazelwood was under some kind of
(24) investigation and you either caused Captain Hazelwood to be (25) notified that he was under investigation or that you notified
(1) himself that he was under investigation and that indeed the
(2) date was about February 11th of 1985?
(3) A Yes, I - I knew that he had some - he was under
(4) invertigation I had noidea what the investigation was
(5) about
(6) Q And you caused ham to be notufied or you notified ham
yourself with regard to the investigation at or about February
(8) 11th of 1985?

A I was advised - requested by Mr Ben Graves to let Captan
(1) Hazelwood know that he, Mr Graves, was conducting an
(11) mvestigation, and I thought that's - and that Captan
(12) Hazelwood be aware that there may be some questions asked of
(13) other folks which he may hear about that associated with an (14) mreatigation
(15) Q And Captain Hazelwood was given that information?
(16) A Best of my knowledge, yes
(17) Q So as of about February 11 th of 1985, Captain Hazelwood
(18) knew that his company was investigating him for something?
(19) A Well, my understanding, it was some actuvity that took
(20) place in the past I don't know, but that's - yeah, he knew
(21) some investigation was taking place
(22) Q And this is the same Mr Ben Graves who appears in what we
(23) refer to as the Graves report?
(24) A That's Ben Graves' signature yes
(25) Q Did you know why he was under investigation?

\section*{Vol 213601}
A No, I did not
Q Did you ever acquaint yourself as to why he was under
investigation?
A Well because it was an issue that took place in the past,
I understand, and nothing to do with my acturitues
Q So would it be fair to say that you his direct supervisor
knew he was under investigation by your company and you did
nothing to acquaint yourself with regard to the facts of the
investigation?
A That's true I might add I - I asked that question and I
recall that Mr Graves suggested that I didn't really need to
know, it had nothing to do with my activitues, so I left it at
that
Q Now I listened to your testimony as you started off today,
and you testified that Captain Hazeiwood told you that he was
in treatment for alcoholism do you recall testufying to that
today?
MR SANDERS I object to that as a
mischaracterization of his testimony
THE COURT The jury will decide whether it is or
isn ta mischaracterization of his testimony but you may
inquire
MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
BY MR O NEILL
Q That was your testimony today wasn tit?

A No, I did not
Q Did you ever acquaint yourself as to why he was under
investigation?
A Well because it was an issue that took place in the past,
I understand, and nothing to do with my activitues
Q So would it be fair to say that you his direct supervisor
knew he wes under investigation by your company and you did
nothing to acquaint yourself with regard to the facts of the
investigation?
A That's true I might add I - I asied that question and I
(il) recall that Mr Graves suggested that I didn't really need to
(12) know, it had nothing to do with my activities, so I left it at
(13) that
(14) Q Now I listened to your testumony as you started off today,
(1S) and you testified that Captain Hazelwood told you that he was
(10) in treatment for alcoholism do you recall tesufying to that
(17) today?
(18) MR SANDERS Lobject to that as a
(19) mischaracterization of his testimony
(20) THE COURT The jury will decide whether it is or
(21) isn ta mischaracterization of his testimony but you may
(22) inquire
(23) MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
(24) BYMR O NEILL
(25) Q That was your testimony today wasn tit?

A I thinit what I said was, what I recall is that I got a phone call from Captan Hazelwood that he told me he was checking into a rehabilitation for alcoholesm as I recail it Q He was checking into a rehabilitation for alcoholism? A That's my understanding
Q And that s what he told you over the telephone?
A That's what I recall
Q So at this point in time you were on notice that he in
February was under some kind of investigation and now you were
(10) on notice that he had checked into a rehabilitation center for alcoholism?
A That's correct
\(Q\) And you were his supervisor?
A That's correct
Q Now prior to 1985 you had not received any traiming in the supervision of rehabilitated alcoholics?

\section*{A No, I ded not}

Q And when you received the call that Hazelwood was ready to come back to duty, you assumed that Hazelwood would be seen by
(20) the Exxon medical people before he came back to work?
(21) A That's the normal procedure, as I knew it
(22) Q But you never spoke with anybody in the medical department (23) to make sure that they indeed interviewed him saw him touched
(24) him?
(25) A No, I was advised by the human resources group, who would

\section*{Vol 213603}
(1) be the direct contact with - with the medical department not
(2) myself Those are confidental ussues and I did not get unvolved in the medical department
(4) Q And you didn t speak with anybody in the medical department
(5) about any spectal accommodations that might be made for Captain
(6) Hazelwood so that he could pursue an AA program or some other
form of aftercare while he was at sea, did you?
A Not that I can recall
Q And indeed you as a supervisor made no provision for
) support or aftercare for Capiain Hazelwood while he was at sea did you?
A No, I dad not I quened as to what his plans were, as I mentioned before, and -
Q This was at the meeting in Auguat?
A That's correct
Q I'm puzzled about the meeting in August Your partner was that Sheehy that met with him that same day?
A Captan Sheehy was the port captann for me, yes
Q And where did Sheehy meet with him do you know?
A To the best of my knowledge, if I recall, it was in the
Windham Hotel
\(Q\) Down in the cocktall lounge?
(23) A I haveno idea
(24) Q You don t know?
(25) A Not that I can recall that lund of comment

Vol 213604
Q Now what I m puzzled about this is Captain Hazelwood s
trial testimony we re going to go through his trial testimony
(3) for a minute and I mitrying to figure out who said what to
(4) who
(5) He \(s\) describing the conversation and he \(s\) - and I m
(6) interested in - I want to ask you a series of questions about
(7) whether these topics were discussed at this meeting with
(8) Mr Tompkins Very well was AA discussed? No Wan aftercare
(9) discussed? No Was the subject of your personal drinking
(10) discussed? No Was the subject of drinking on board vessels
(11) or returning to vessels after having drunk discussed? No
(12) Were you told not to drinh - and then the testimony
(13) continues - with the exception of the parameters of the
(14) alcohol policy? No
(15) Were you told you were going to be monitored?
(16) Well in his inimitable fashion Mr Tompkins kind of
(In) indicated to me that I was going to be watched Did he tell
(18) you you were going to be watched" He didn \(t\) verbalize that
(19) no So he did not tell you that you were going to be watched?
(20) No
(21) Now Captain Hazelwood as he testified here said you
(22) didn task about AA you didn task about aftercare you didn't
(23) talk to him about his personal drinking Is that conaistent
(24) with your story or do we have two different stories about the
(2S) same event?

\section*{Vol 213605}
1) A I don't thank 80 becanse what I - I did not talle to hum
(2) about what he did in the past I felt it was more umportant
(3) for us to look forward, and I also felt that I would ciose ont
(4) that issue by just stating that - that he's had his chance and
(s) that he's had his opportunity and now he needs to take care
of
6) hamself
7) Q So you didn \(t\) discuss AA or aftercare?
(8) A So I didn't - weil, I did not discuss him dranking in the
past I dud not discuss any reference to aftercare I don't
(10) recall that I do recall that I beheve I discussed - asked
(11) him about what kind of monatonng he was - or what land of
(12) support he was going to have or was he going to participate \(m\)
(13) any support efforts, whether I used AA - I thank I dud, but I
4) can't a hundred percent recall
(15) Q So you don t recall?
(16) A I don't recall what I sand at that tume
(17) \(Q\) Would it be farr to say that with regard to the issues of past drinking AA aftercare personal drinking off the job
(19) that those were the subjects that you did not directly discuss
(20) with him?
(21) A I would say that that is farr to say, because I felt that
(22) they were in the past And that by giving hm the comment that
(23) he had - he has hus chance, I felt that was all we needed to
(24) do
(25) Q But there wasn ta detasled discussion about his care his

Vol 213606
progress with regard to rehabilitation you just said Joe this is your last chance?
A Yeah, it was a little more than that, but I just - I did
not get into an aftercare program, no, sir
Q And at the tume you said Joe this is your last chance
would it be fair to say that you as his manager were on notice it was your understanding that he had been treated for
alcoholiem and that the company had conducted some kind of investigation with regard to the man?
A Could you repeat that again' I'm not quite sure exactly what you sand
Q At the tume you said Joe this is your last chance you a management official with Exxon Shipping Company were aware
(14) that he had undergone treatment for alcohoism and that the
(15) company had conducted some kind of an investigation with regard
(16) to the man?
(17) A Well, the purpose of my statement was that he had
(18) undergone, the best of my knowledge, treatment for alcoholesm
(19) and that once be's had that opportumity, which was the policy
(20) we had at the tume then he could come back to work assuming
PI he was classified as fit and he - best of my understanding he
(22) was, and then - but then he had no longer any chance If he
(23) had any further problems, then he would be discipluned
(24) Q Any further problems disciplined?
(2s) A Assocsated with alcohol, yes

\section*{Vol 213607}

Q Any association with alcohol on or off the job?
A I didn't get into differentiating between the two I was prmarnly coacerned about the general term on board the shup
(4) Q You knew that atlending attercart would be difficult for

Captan Hazelwood because of the nature of his job didn \(t\) you?

A Well, agan I didn't get anvolved with dascussions if I recall concerning aftercare
Q My question was did you know that attending aftercare would be difficult becaute of the nature of his job?
A Well certanaly if - if he was to attend an AA meeting, he could only do that when he was in port, so I knew that
Q With regard to Captain Hazelwood you were of the view that Captain Hazelwood could nol drink period isn that right? A Probably so yes
Q You did cogitate come up with the idea of some kind of a montoring plan isn I that correct)
A My intent was to visit the vessel when he's un board as often as I could
Q And you don I recall whether you in fact made a trip or two to his vessel before you turned the mantel over to Mr Koops?
A I think I made one occasion, but I cannot be a hundred percent sure, but I think I did
Q And with regard to implementing any monitoring plan with
Captain Hazelwood you didn \(t\) get the chance to implement the
ol 213608
(1) plan or formalize the plan did you?

A I didn't get to use at very long because -
Q You were moving on to another assignment?
A - I was moving on to another job
(s) Ithink Mr Koops is going to testify next so what happens
there on out I should ask - I should spare you your tume and
ask Mr Koops queations, would that be a fair statement?
A That would probably be more approprate
Q I do though, at the end of my outline want to ask you
about your meeting with Mr Koops. And would at be fair to say
that you didn thave any special meeting about Captan
Hazelwood with Koops but you had one meetung in which you
discussed your ship's officers and the subject of Captain
Hazelwood came up at that meeting?
(15) A My recollection, we had a coupie of opportumites to get (16) together and the tume that we got together concerning the personnel of the gulf coast fleet, we pretty moch reviewed all
(18) of the semor officers, captan and chuef engmeers At that
(19) ume, I included the discussion with Captam Hazelwood or about
(20) Captan Hazelwood
(21) Q And when you discussed that with Mr Koops, you put Mr

Koops on notice that Captain Hazelwood had gone through
treatment for alcoholism?
A I - yes, I did
Q So Mr Koops knew this now too?

\footnotetext{
Vol 213609
A Yes, he did, best of my knowledge
MR O NEILL Thank you sir
THE WITNESS May I leave sir?
THE COURT You re not quite through yet I suspect
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JOHN TOMPKINS (Live) BY MR SANDERS
Q Mr Tompkins other than the telephone call that you had with Captain Hazelwood do you have any sort of knowledge whatsoever as to what sort of treatment Captain Hazelwood
(10) A No, I never really discussed it
(11) Q And I think you ve already testified you had no iden what
(12) the actual medical diagnosis for Capisin Hazelwood was isn t
(13) that right?
(14) A That's correct I dadn't see anything official
(IS) Q Do you know or did you know then - let me ask you did you
(16) know then that there was a medical difference between alcohol
(17) abuse and alcohoism?
(18) A No, sur
(19) Q Do you know now that there is a difference between
alcoholism - between -
A No, sir
\(Q\) - alcohol abuse and alcoholism?
A No, sir
Q And if somebody sand they had an alcohol problem do I take
(25) it then that you simply assume that s alcoholism?
} had?

Vol 213610
```

A If you're sent to rehabilitation yes
Q So when you heard alcohol in the call with Captatn
Hazelwood you assumed aicoholism right?
A Yes
Q Becauge you don t draw any distinction?
A No, sur, I don't
Q Do you remember the exact words that Captam Hazelwood
8) when he described the kind of treatment he was going in for?
A Not that I can recall, no, sir
Q Do you know whether he satd alcohol problem? Do you
(11) whether he sald alcohol abuse? Do you know whether he sam
alcoholism or alcohoinc?
A No, sir
MR SANDERS I have no further questions
THE COURT Thank you sIr
Call your next wutness
MR SANDERS May it please the Court we call
Mr Dwight Koops
THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand please
glr
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record sur state your full name
your address and spell your last name please
THE WITNESS My name is Dwight H Koops I live at
692 Snapdragon Place in Benicia Califorma My lant name is

```
used
know
Vol 21 3611
spelled K O OPS
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DWIGHT KOOPS (Live)
BY MR SANDERS
Q Good morning Mr Koops Mr Koops where are you now
employed?
A I'm employed by Sea River Mantume
Q And what is your job at Sea River Maritime today?
A I'm the ocean fleet manager
Q All nght And where is your office located"
A In Benicia, Cahforma
Q And as the ocean fleet manager what are your duties and
responabilities?
A My promary duties are the safe and efficient operation of
the ocean fleet vessels that Exxon owns U S flagged, and
course supervisory responssbility for the people that man
those
(IO) veasels
(17) Q Does the ocean fleet include oil tankers?
A Yes, it does
Q Does it include anything but oil tankers?
A Prmarily oul tankers
Q Okay Now would you tell the Ladies and Gentlemen of the
Jury a little bit about your educational background?
A I graduated from the U S Merchant Marne Academy in
1962
(24) I have a degree in manne engueening, and I went on for a
(25) masters at night, a masters in engineening from the city

\section*{Vol 213612}

University of New York I have further stadies at NYU for an
MBA masters in business
Q Where did you grow up Mr Koops?
A I grew up in Brooklyn, New York
Q Thought we ought to ciear that up Mr Koops when did you
start working for - or where did you start working when you
got out of school?
A When I graduated from Kings Point I had a license in the
Coast Guard as an engueer and I sauled in the merchant
marme, I sailed for other than Exxon for approximately a year, -
(il) and then I came ashore to contunue my education at might And
(12) I worked for a - the naval shipyard night in New York for
(13) about two to three years and from there, I moved to a small
(14) naval architectural firm in downtown New York I was a
ship
(1s) surveyor for them and a manne designer and supervisor
(16) My late 20s I joined ESSO International which eventually
(in) became Exxon International I was with the tanker
department
(18) of the international group for 13 years I held vanons
(19) positions, construction and design, operations, research and
(20) development, and I transferred in 1980 down to Texas, to

Exxon
(21) Company USA
(22) My last job with the international gronp was for about
(23) three years, I was the administrative head for the fleet which
(9) numbered about 70 vessels And I moved down to Flouston with
(25) Exxon Company then in the marnae departments

\section*{Vol 213613}
(1) Q All right And what job did you have with the manne
(2) department or with what then became Exxon Shipping

\section*{Company in}
(3) the early 80s?
(4) A I was the engneering manager for about five and a half
(s) years
(6) Q All right And as engincering manager did you participate
(7) in the construction of some new vessels that were going to sail
(8) for Exxon Shipping Company?
(9) A Yes My primary duties as the engineerngg manager was
(10) design and contracting and dehvery of a number of vessels that
(II) we currently operate
(12) \(Q\) Would you give the Ladies and Gentiemen of the Jury some of
(13) the names of those vessels that came on line in the 80a that
(14) you worked on?
(is) A Ones we built in the ' 80 s meluded the Charieston, the
(16) Wilmington, the Baytown and the Valdex and the Long

Beach, as
(In) well In addition to a number of towboats and tugs that we
(18) built for the aniand fleet
(19) Q Did there come a time when you took over the job of gulf
(20) coast fleet manager for Exxon Shipping Company?
(21) A Could you say that agan, please?
(22) Q Yes Did there come a time when you took on the job of
(23) gulf coast fleet manager for Exxon Shipping Company?
(24) A Yes, I transferred from the engueering manager's
position
(21) to the gulf coast fleet manager position October 1st, 1985

Vol 213614
Q And who was your replacements - I mean who was your predecessor? Excuse me
A I replaced John Tomplens
Q All right Now, John Tompkins of course just testified you were in the room when he testified?

\section*{AIwas}

Q Let s go straight to the transition period Did you in
fact have a discussion with Mr Tompkins concerning Captain
Hazelwood when you were in this transition period?
A Yes Durng the overlap penod, primarily September, we reviewed of course all the busmeas of the fleet and we talked
(12) about each of the semor personnel, which of course uncluded
(13) the masters and that meluded Captan Hazelwood
(14) Q All night And in discussing Captain Hazelwood did John
(15) Tompkins advise you that Captain Hazeiwood had somewhat
(16) recently undergone treatment that included treatment for
(17) alcohol problems?
(18) A Yes When we discussed Captann Hazelwood, Mr Tompkias
19) told me that Captan Hazelwood had been through alcohol (20) rehahilitation in the spring of ' 85
(21) Q All right Now at that tume did you ash Mr Tompkins
22) what Captain Hazelwood \(s\) diagnosis was?
(23) A I did not
(24) Q Did you ask him what his treatment regimen was?
(25) A I did not

\section*{Vol 213615}

Q Did you have any discussion with anybody in the medical department?
ANo
Q Did you have any access to an actual diagnosis?
A No
Q What - am I correct in assuming that you take on this new job and you find out that one of the masters that you re going to directly supervise has recently been in some sort of
treatment program or rehabilitation program for alcohol is that good news or bad news for you?
A Well it's bad news but I make the ussumptiou that when I
hear alcohol rehabihtation \(I\) assume that I have a captan
that has a dnnking problem and that assumption leads me
to
(14)
(15)
(16)
(17) Q All right At the time 1985 did you thinh you needed to (18) know more then that?
(19) A No, because I was really assuming the worst case scenario
(20) for the situation that Captain Hazelwood was in
(21) Q All right And right or wrong you assumed that he had an
(22) alcoholism problem that would manifest itself in some sort of
(23) loss of control correct?
(24) A That is correct
(25) Q All right Now you don \(t\) know whether that \(s\) in accord
with the diagnosis or treatment but you took the worst case
scenano correct?
AI dad
Q Given the fact that you had this probiem and you had this
assumption as to what the scope of the problem was, what did
you do about it?
A Well, when John mentioned it to me, I - I really looked at
the network of people that I have in my organization, I had
then and I have now, and I knew I had to stay close to Joe -
Q Well now firtt - I ve jumped a little ahead of you Did
you plan to watch Capinin Hazelwood?
A Absolutely
Q And what were you watching for?
A To see of there were any sugns that essentially Joe fell
off the wagon, if he started drnking agan
Q Okay Now having formed that intent or plan did you - I take you back to where you were before I so rudely interrupted you, but what did you plan to do to set that in motion? How were you going to do this?
A As I was saying, I started to look at the network of people
that I have in my organization and as I sand, I had it then and
I have it today, if I start with myself and I go down through
(23) my organization which probably helps if - what my thought
(24) process was at that tume, but I have line functional managers,
(25) which I guess people refer to them as port enguneers and port

\section*{Vol 213617}
captains which in the primary reporting function to me, and then I have in the office personnel, people who handle
personnel issues I have agents who deal with the ships seven
(4) days a week, 24 hours a day, all sorts of questions and
(s) unterface with them I have contractors running around the
shups constantly, partucularly when they're in our ports and
even riding the ships We also have unannounced
searches, we
did them with dogs and did them with people on a farly
frequent basss As part of the admunstrative load for
(10) managing the fleet, you have an awful lot of reports,
(II) performance reports that come in off the ships, and if you look
(12) at them very closely yon can tell an awful lot abont them The
(13) cost reports, requisitions performance of the vessel, and if
(14) you start to see things goung a little bit screwy on them, then
(is) you start to become suspicious So I had really a
mulufaceted
(16) organization that could reach out and stay close with the
(17) situation, I felt
(18) Q All right Well let me ask you the obvious question At
(19) the time that you were following this plan of youre did you
(20) think you had the situation covered?
(21) AYes
(22) Q Now looking back on it now did your plan work?
(23) A I feel very strongly that it did If I look at the year
(2) and a half that I had Joe with me I only had one single
(25) report That report came to me very quickly and in enough

Vol 213618
detal that I was able to follow up on it which we did
Q Okay Let me stop you there What was this report that you got?
A The report that I'm speaking about, it had come from the
port steward, which was Jum Shaw and Bill Sheehy, which was my
(6) port captan at the tume, sand that he had heard from Jum Shaw
(7) that Captan Hazelwood was actung a little weird

Q What did you think when you heard that?
A My immediate thought was that perhaps Joe's started
druming again, and of course Captain Sheehy and I had talled
(i1) abont it previously when I first came into the job and so our
(12) thoughts ran pretty much paraliel
(13) Q So you both had this thought or maybe even a fear that this
(i4) translated into Joe s drinking?
(15) A Absolutely
(16) Q Did you act on that?
(17) AYes
(18) \(Q\) What did you do?
(19) A I asked Captan Sheeby - I had spoken to Jım Sbaw and he
(20) became a little evasive He didn't say alcohol, he became a
ril little more evasive so I said Bill, I said I really want you
(22) to go over and catch the Baton - the Yorktown in Baton

\section*{Rouge}
(23) which, if you know, is farrly close I said, go over there
(24) unannounced, and that was the next port of arnval for the
(2S) vessel, and I want you to spend as much time as possible on
(1) board the ship and see if thugs are oks

Bull, being a captan in the fleet, knows exactly what that meant That meant to tall to a lot of people, to see Joe hmself and spend as much time as possible That's what
(s) did and he came back to me, I recollect a phone call from Bill
(6) that told me that everything was in order based on his evaluation and then he returned to the office And we had some further conversations about the assue
Q All right In these further conversationa did you ask or suggest to him to do anything else?
A I asked Bill to talk to - on a low key basis, tally to
Captan Hazelwood's friends and assocrates and -
Q Let me interrupt you just a second Why would you ask -
why would you ask a guy s friends to find out if the guy was had fallen off the wagon?
A I knew - I knew Joe well enough, that there are enough
(I7) people that care about Joe and people who do know Joe, I thunk
(18) I had a strong enough reading on the situation that people who
(19) do care enough and who do know Joe would certanly say
(20) something to - to Bill
(21) Q Did you know who his friends were?
(22) A Yes, I knew who many of his close associates were
(23) Q Did you know those people?
(24) AYes
(23) \(Q\) In fact were they employees of yours?

\section*{Vol 213620}

A A lot of them were masters in the fleet and engineers
Q Did Captain Sheehy make those kinds of contacts?

\section*{A He did}

Q Do you know specifically who he talked to or did you know at the time?
A He spoke to a number of people When I spoke to Bill,
and
(7) of conrse our offices physically were just a couple of doors
(8) away from each other, and we would speak from tume to tume
9) about Joe Hazelwood and many indicatuons I got from Bll
was
(10) that Captan Hazelwood was fit he was working out he was
!
(II) good shape
(12) He did speak with one individual specifically, that I
(13) found out after the grounding that was Captan Iran
(14) Mihajlovic
(15) Q Let s make sure we don \(t\) get things muddied up here You
(10) asked him to talk to Captain Hazelwood sfrends and he did
(17) and reported back to you?
(18) A Yes
(19) \(Q\) And later on after the grounding occurred some three
(20) four years - well let me back up Strike all that
(21) Do you know when this - when this report came from
(22) Mr Shaw and when this visut Captain Sheehy made to the
(23) Yorktown at Baton Rouge do you know when that was?
(24) A The tume frame, based on my best recollection, is '86, '87
) tume frame
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 213621 \\
\hline (1) & Q Okay And so therefore the conversation you had with \\
\hline (2) & Captan Mihajlovic was some couple or three years later? \\
\hline (3) & A Yes, I - in speakung with Captan Mihajlovic, would you \\
\hline & like me to go into the details? \\
\hline (5) & Q Waita minute I want to back up though But at the time \\
\hline (6) & that you asked Captain Sheehy to make these contacts he had \\
\hline (7) & reported back to you the thoughts and observations of Captain \\
\hline (8) & Hazelwood s friends? \\
\hline (9) & A That's correct \\
\hline (10) & Q But you didn t talk to Captan Mihajlovic at that tıme \\
\hline & correct? \\
\hline & A I did not \\
\hline (13) & Q You did talk to him later? \\
\hline & A Yes \\
\hline & Q What did he tell you later? \\
\hline & A I was visitung Ivan's ship, the San Francisco down in \\
\hline & Baytown, and that was July of '89 Thus is after the \\
\hline & unding \\
\hline & where I'm lookng after the gulf coast fleet, but - and also \\
\hline & watching the west coast fleet Sol was visitung the San \\
\hline & Francisco and Ivan and I go back a number of years, and I \\
\hline kne & \\
\hline & Ivan when he was a chsef mate \\
\hline & It was my recommendation for hum for a captan, so we had \\
\hline a & \\
\hline & close relatuonship and a great deal of respect for Ivan, and I \\
\hline (24) & know that Ivan is a close friend of Captain Hazelwood's, in \\
\hline & fact, they live in the same area, and we talked about it \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\section*{Vol 213622}
before
(?) And we were talking about the grounding and - and there
(3) were allegations, of course, in the newspapers about alcohol
(4) and so forth, and as I was speaking to Ivan I remember like
(5) it was yesterday We were baving lunch on the ship at a table,
(6) and I said to Ivan I says, it is a shame you know And when
(7) he was - when Joe was with me for a year and a half in the
(8) gulf, I says, I had no mdicatuons, in fact, to the contrary
(9) I sard, at was just one mdication that we followed up on, and
(10) Captan Sheehy had come back and sand it was okay, but then I
(ti) asked him to talk to friends
(12) And Ivan sand, yes, he says, I was one of those guys And
(13) he says - and you have to know Ivan to understand thus, but
he
(14) says, you know what I did, and Ivan, I thunk, has a very, very
(IS) close and fond affection for Captan Hazelwood and very
(16) concerned about hm and his family Captan Mihajlovic's shap,
(in the San Francısco went down to Chinqui Grande in Panama, thes
(18) is where we used to pick up crude on the Atlantic side And
he
(19) looked over and saw the Exxon Yorktown in anchor and Ivan
got
(20) in a launch and went over to the Yorktown and went storming
(21) nght up to Joe's quarters is the way Ivan relates st to me,
(22) and literally tore the place apart He was - he was looking
(23) for booze Didn't find any, checked Joe, Joe looked okay,
and
(94) I think Joe probably had his mouth open by now and Ivan
walleed

sitp Q Did Capian Mitactovic tell you at that went that he had
(2) reportid that to Capiain Sheehy at the limu that it owturred)
(3) A I belueve he sand he mentioned it to Bill and that was part
(4) of has overall report to me I would assume when Bull reported
(5) back to me

Q All right Now you ve mentioned this but I want to make it clear and ask you the direct question Other than this one
report which you and Captain Sheehy reacted to was there any
other report during the time that Captain Hazeiwood was on the
0) gulf coast fleet in the gulf coast fleet that you got any sort
(II) of report about Captain Hazelwood drinking alcohol?
(12) A None
(131 Q Did you get any sont of sign or signal or any inkling from
(14) any sort whatsoever that there was any problem with Joe
(IS) Hazelwood returning to drinking?
(16) A No As a matter of fact it would probably be worthwhile
(I7) to the testimony here in speaking with Joe Joe and I
(18) developed a - I got to know Joe probably more than most
(19) skippers in the guif coast fleet at the tume I was the new
(20) Iud on the block, I had come from engineenng management and
(21) takung over gulf coast fleet I was the new kid on the block
(22) And Joe of course, being Joe was going to put me through
my
(23) paces but coming from New York I was up to the challenge, so
(74) I took hum on and we got to know each other pretty well We
(2s) were fairly direct with each other as New Yorkers are and

Vol 21 3624
(1) I - I asked hum about a lot of things procedures and
(2) policies Being a little bit new to the game I asked hum some
(3) thoughts, and of course he always volunteered his thoughts
) about some of the policies that were in place It was a good,
(S) frank relationshap, and I hked Joe Joe was well read I
6) Inked his intellect I liked his frankness He was a good
(7) sounding board and so we -
(8) Q Did you form any - from this relationship did you form
(9) any opinion as to how he was doing with respect to this problem
(19) for which he had been treated?
(11) A Yeah, by talking the way we did, I got to know the man
(12) pretty well and I wouldn't - I wouldn't dumunsh the
(13) relationshup by saying I was there to watch his eye/hand
(14) coordination, but obviously as I talked to hum and got to
know
(15) lum a little bit better, I started to understand the man, I
(16) also understood his behanor So it became pretty eary for
me
(in or a little bit easier with hum to see any aberrations or any
(18) changes in the behavior for the next year and a half
(19) Q Did you see any?
(30) A None In fact, if anything, I counseled Joe on some of his
(21) performance charactenstics that are reported in his
(22) performance report and he was working on those, and in my
(23) estumation, in the year and a half, I saw a great deal of
(24) umprovement, at least an effort to improve in those areas
(25) Q You were kind of tough on him though weren tyou, on the

\section*{Vol 21 3625}

\section*{rankings?}

A I was Joe is a seaman and probably one of the finest that
we had His seamanship skills were very, very good Some of
4) hus duslike for some of the paperwork and such, I needed to see
(s) some more umprovement I didn't have a long enough running
(o) tume on Joe You don't hke to make major movements in (7) seriatim rankings unless you're sure Worst you can do is move
(8) people out on the list, you want them to steer you out so I
9) needed a little bit more ranning tume on Joe I had seen hum
(10) year year and a half and you figure he's only on the vessel
(11) half that tume, so before I made any major moves on Joe on
the
(12) seriatum, I fele comfortable with where ine was, which was
(13) the - the bottom third land of in the upper part of the bottom
(14) thard And I could see if we stayed together probably if he
(IS) contanued hus progress, moving hum a hittle bit more
(16) Q Now you have described for the Ladies and Gentlemen of the
(17) Jury the relationship that you had with Captan Hazelwood when
(18) you would visit the ship Did you try to visit his ship often?
(19) A Yes, 1 did My style of management in running a fleet is
(20) to visit ships as much as possible You need to smell and feel
(21) and touch, and I enjoy that part of the job I especially
(22) enjoyed visitugg Joe and obviously with this knowiedge, I
tried
(23) to spend more tume with Joe than the others
(24) \(Q\) When you say with this knowledge, what are you talking
S) about?

\section*{Vol 213626}

\section*{A The fact that Joe had been through alcohol rehabultation}
and I really wanted him not to start drinking again because of
the consequences and hum as a human being
(4) All nght Now did you ever ask him in these
(s) conversations did you ever ask him about how he was doing with
(6) his aicohol problem?

7 A I asked hum how he was, but he gave me no indications that
(s) had fallen off the wagon, and at that point in tume, I saw
() no reason to take the man's dignity away He was behaving humself, he was mproving, he was fit, so why" There's just
reason to do that
Q I take it you didn't ask him specifically about his alcohol
problem?
A I did not
Q Did you ask him anything about \(A A^{\prime}\) ?
A I ded not
Q Did you ask him anything about marital problems?
A No
Q I think you ve answered this but let me just ask you directly why not?
A These were private matters I was concerned about Joe's
the job performance He gave me no undication that he'd
started drnking again and I saw no reason to break that confidence and take the man's dignuty
Q If you had seen some sort of a problem some change

\section*{Vol 213627}
whether it involved drinking or not would you then have
followed up and asked those direct queations?
A In a New York munte I would have been very direct
with - with Joe Because then you're getting into not only
Joe, but the very safety of that vessel and that's the primary
concern to me
Q By 1987 Captain Hazelwood had been with you some year and
a half Did you have a view on Captain Hazelwood and the past slcohol problem?
A Could you try that on me agann please?
Q By 1987 say the spring of 1987 during which then you had
been with Capian Hazelwood over a year and a half did you
have a view or an opinion about how Captain Hazelwood was doing
(14) in terms of this pant alcohol problem?

A Yes, I did A distunct feeling, a different feeling I had (6) unside when I - when I first got untrodaced to the assue and Joe I felt a year and a half later he had made a great deal
(18) of progress, and suce I only had one report that proved
(19) spurious, that I thought that the situation was very well under
(20) control and hardly a problem at all if at all
(21) Q Mr Koops at that tume did you know anything about
(22) alcohol problems?
(23) A Yes Unfortunately, growing up in Broollyn, New York, and
(24) I grew up in a tenement section, I guess polite people call
(2) them apartment houses we lived on top of each other and I

Vol 213628
don't want to give you the poor bov story, but I guess there
wasn't a week that didn't go by that we didn't see families
destroyed by alcohol People tended to lose themselves in
alcohol and I have a very dear person in my life who had an
alcohol problem I wasn't -
Q Who was that?
A That was my dad
Q So vou thought you had some basis for the opinion that you
had about Captain Hazelwood in the spring of 19879
(10) A I had a great deal of sensitivity to the issue
(II) Q Now in 1987 did you have any occasion to discuss the (12) transfer of Captain Hazelwood?
(13) A Yes Port captan for the west coast Andy Martineau, and
(14) my port captonn, Captain Bill Sheehy discussed moves frequently
(15) and they had a vacancy on the west coast The Exxon Valdez
(16) master - one of the masters resigned from the shipping
(In company to become a San Francisco harbor pilot so they needed a
(18) master to replace him They looked over the slate of masters
(19) that we had in the fleet and Captan Hazelwood was thear
(20) recommendation to me I looked it over and based on what I
(21) viewed as the appropriate background for the job spoke with
(22) Harvey Borgen who was my counterpart on the west coast to
(23) effect that transfer
(24) Q You agreed with the recommendation?
(25) Aldid You know I looked at the - the background of

Vol 213629
(1) Joe He was a skipper on a \(160 \mathbf{- 1 6 5 , 0 0 0}\) ton ships, which
is
(2) our second largest He had traded into Valdez He was a good
(3) seaman I watched hme for a year and a half and he had Prince
(4) Willam Sound pilotage, which - which was an asset And so it
(5) looked hke the right fit and the talent balance for the
(6) fleet
(7) Q All right Now you mentioned that you had
conversations - a conversation or conversations with Harvey
Borgen What job did Harvey Borgen have at the tume of this conversation"
A Harvey was my counterpart on the west coast He was the
(12) west coast fleet manager and obviously, when we're transferring
(13) people throughout the fleet, we talk with each other on a
(14) regular basis, and so I purposely made a phone call on thas (15) transfer
(1) \(Q\) In the course of your conversation - excuse me for
(17) interrupting In the course of your converation with
(1B) Mr Borgen, did the subject of Captain Hazeiwood and alcohol
(19) come up?
(20) A Yes, it did
(21) Q How did it come up?
(22) A Harvey asked me if Captan Hazelvood was having any
(23) problems with - with drinking, and I sand, no, Harvey I
(24) sond, for the past year and a half I've been observing Joe I
(2S) might have even mentroned the one uncident that we investugated

Vol 213630
(1) that proved to be nothing, and I said, as far as I'm concerned
(2) he's clean, he hasn't fallen off the wagon and he's doung fine
(3) Q Did you tell Mr Borgen what you knew as far as Captain
(4) Hazelwood receiving treatment involving alcohol back in the (5) spring of 1985 ?
(6) A No, sunce he mentioned had Captann Hazelwood had any
(7) problems with driniong, I assumed that he knew about the
(8) satuation

Q Is al farr to say that you gave Mr Borgen a ciean bill of health as far as Joe Hazelwood was concerned and the drinking
1ssue?
AYes
Q Did you give him any sort of a run down on how Captain
Hazelwood had been performing as a ship caplain?
AYes
Q What did you tell him?
A Yes, obviously as a professional courtesy to Harvey, I felt
it prudent on me to advise hm of my observatuons of Joe for
that year and a half I pomted out some of the good
(20) operations that Joe had had, some tricky operations with
hus
(21) vessel did an excellent job, and that he - he was good for
(22) the seamanshup siolls and I would recommend the move
(23) Q Did you pass along any of the criticism that you had about
(94) Captain Hazelwood and his paperwork and his love of
shoreside
(25) management?

\section*{Vol 213631}
(I)

A Absolutely Harvey and I know each other pretty well and Harvey and I both know Joe and we deal with Joe on that Q Now in fact Captain Hazelwood was transferred from the gulf coast tleet to the west coast fleet in 1987 correct?
A The last tume I saw Joe was from my fleet was at an officer's conference Apral '87 and then he went on leave and
(7) joined the vessel in July of '87
( 8 ) Q All right From that point to the time of the grounding
(9) did you remain as the fleel manager for the gulf coast fleet?
(10) A Yes I did
(II) Q Located - your office was located in Baytown Texas?
(12) A Baytown Texas
(13) Q Now notwithstanding the fact that he was in another fleet (14) did you have occasion to run into Capiain Hazelwood be able 10
(15) and see and observe him at any functions?
(16) A Yes I saw Joe at officer conferences As a matter of
(17) fact, Joe had called me, it was one of the ancest phone calls
(18) I've ever gotten, he had called me in fall of '87 his vessel
(19) was going north to Alaska and he had called just to teli me
(20) that he enjoyed the relationshap he laked - he laked my style
(21) and we got along well and he'd miss the relationship
( \(\rightarrow\) ) You think that was becausc he was a Ncw Yorhcr don 1 you?
(23) A Direct yes
(4) Q Did you have a chance to observe him though at any of the
(25) conferences after he left your fleet?

AI did
(2) Q Did you notice whether or not Captain Hazelwood was driniting at these conferences?
A Only he had a passion for Perrier and ice tea, as I
remember, and those are the ouly two drinks I ever saw him
drank
Q Did you take particular note of that?
AYes
MR SANDERS You may ask
(10) CROSS EXAMINATION OF DWIGHT KOOPS (Live)
(H) BYMR O NEILL
(12) Q This is your deposition transcript in case you need it
(13) You have - you testified here today some knowledge with
(14) regard to alcoholism isn't that a correct statement?
(15) A Yes
(16) Q And you realize that alcoholics have to admas that they re
(17) alcoholics in order to move forward with their treatment?
(18) AYes
(19) Q And you understand that alcoholics are in fact never cured?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q And you understand that the relapse rate for alcoholics is
(22) better than 50 percent?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q And you testified a little bit about these officer
(25) conferences that you d go to and see Captain Hazelwood

You re

Vol 213633
(1) aware of the fact that individuals who have an alcohol
(2) dependency problem attempt to hide that fact don they?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q It a called masking asn that nght?
(5) A That's correct
(6) Q And at some point in tume you were put on notice that
(7) Captain Hazelwood had gone through alcohol rehabilitation?
(8) A Yes
(9) \(Q\) And you don \(t\) know or you didn \(t\) follow up and ask when
(10) he d been in rehabilitation did you?
(II) A I was told that it was the spring of ' 85
(12) Q Did you know the details of his program?
(13) A I did not
(14) Q Did you know the detalls of his aftercare program?
(15) A I did not
(16) Q Did you know whether he was attending AA or not?
(17) A No
(18) Q Did you know why he went into alcohol rehabilitation?
(19) A No
(30) Q Did you ever speak to anybody in your human relations
(21) department Dan Paul who came in here testufied he was the -
(22) the company officer charged with responsibility for this
(23) particular topic did you ever talk with Dan Paul about the
( A) sub/uct of Captain Hazelwood and alcohol rehabilitation?
(2) \(A\) No, I did not

\section*{Vol 213634}

Q Now you testified here today you started off by asying it mught help the testimony here and then you launched into a
discuasion in which you said we were direct with each other as
New Yorkers are it was a good frank relationship Do you
recall testifying to that today?
A Yes
Q Now did the two New Yorkers talk about, between each other the captain \(s\) alcohol rehabilitation?
A We did not
Q Did you talk about the subject of alcohol?
A No
Q Did you talk about the subject of AA or aftercare?
A No
Q Through the summer of 1987 you never apoke to Frank larossi about Hazelwood and alcohol did you?
A That is incorrect
Q When did you - when is your view now that you spoke to him?
A My recollection is that I spole with Iarossi in the spring
of ' 87 when we gathered together as managers and we were tallong about transfers
Q Okay So let s focus on the spring of 1987 And you talked to Mr larossi in the spring of 1987 about the captain and the subject of alcohol?
AYes

\section*{Vol 213635}
(1) Q Prior to that conversation had you ever spoken to Frank Iarossi about the subject of Joe Hazelwood and alcohol? A No, other than I may have spoken to hum about the - the trip that I asked Captan Sheehy to make to Baton Rouge and I
(s) belseve I've been deposed on that and sad I may have spoken to
him about it That's my only recollection of a conversation Q You were deposed on this subject do you recall that? AYes
Q And the question was farrly asked to you Pnor to that conversation with Frank Iarossi that a the discussion in early
(11) to mid 87, had you had any discussions with Mr la rosei about
(12) Joseph Hazelwood and drinking, and your answer to the question
(13) at that tume was no
(14) A If you look at the November - I had two separate days of (1s) deposition If you look at the November date of deposition
11
(10) November, I beheve my words were that I may have
(17) Q You may have?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q So we have a veraion that started off with no and then we (20) have a second version that started off with I may have?
(21) A Yes We're talling about five years of tume and probably a
(22) few years before that, and I was questioned one month and then,
(23) as haman beings do, they start to thmik about their (24) recollections and certanuly five years later, perhaps I had a (2) different recollection and I may have had a conversation when I

\section*{Vol 213636}
(1) gave my deposition in November of '92 I think

Q Now you testified here today that - I m going to come back to that conversation in a minute but I want to puta couple of conversations together before I move on You testified here today and your words were I remember it like it was yesterday and this is a post grounding conversation that
you had with Ivan - how do you pronounce his last name?
A Mihauionic
Q Mihajlovic in which Mihajlovic told you about going aboard the vessel?
AYes-
(12) Q And that was the first time Mihajlovic told you about going
(13) aboard the vessel?
(14) A Yes
(IS) Q So up to the time of the grounding you and Mihajlovic had
(16) never had a discussion about him going aboard the vessel?
(17) A Rught
(18) Q Never? Ever?
(19) A That is correct
(20) Q Okay Here s what I don I underatand Mr Iarosst has (21) testified here that you did have such a conversation And he
(22) recalls it very spectifically And I put it up on the screen
(23) for you And my question for you is who \(s\) right and who \(s\)
(24) wrong?
(25) A I gueas, after five years both of us think we're nght,

Vol 213637
(1) and I thunk probably both of us are trying our very sincerest
(2) to recollect conversations I feel that I did not have that
(3) conversation with Mr Iarossi based on what I just
previously
(4) testufied, that I had the conversation with Ivan Mihajlone for
(5) the first thme in July of 'g9
(6) Q Now Mister - I don \(t\) want you to comment on what (7) Mr larosst says but when you have two different versions of (8) the story would you agree with that?
(9) A From what you tell me yeah, I'm trying to read it and
(10) decide what you're after but obviously we do and I'm sure
(11) Mr larossi thuks his response is as sincere and honest as I
(12) do
(13) Q Now we had talked for a minute about converationa with
(14) Mr Iarosai and you had - we dgone through your no and then
(15) you d gone through well maybe I had a conversation with him
(16) and maybe I didn t This is Mr Iaroasi a veraion of the
(17) conversation that took place in October or November of 1985
(18) with you in which he told you the need to wateh Joe very
(19) carefully and then you related to him about your father
(20) Now, when we got - did the conversation take place as
(21) Mr Iarossi zand or did it not take place as you firat and or
(22) did it maybe take place as you second satd Or what is the
(23) story?
(24) A My thoughts are very, very clear on this That's a fourly (25) personal assue to me and I remember when I had a conversation

\section*{Vol 213638}

Lhe that with an minvidual my recollection I thank
Mr Iarosst is nght I think the conversation did take
place But the tume frame we disagree on 1 spoke with Mr Iarossi about that sssue and mentioning my dad It was
ether durng the transfer tume which was spring of '87 or it could have even been after the grounding, itself, when we were
7) talking about ussues of monitonng and follow up that I
mentioned my dad But it was clearly not the beginning of
my
) assugnment
Q So Mr Iarossis iestimony as we ve just looked at it
doean't comport with your memory?
A Mr Iarossi's testumony, I'm sure, is as honest and sincere as I thunk mine is
Q If you had had a report to you 1 don twant to talk about
the standards to which you bring to this situation you
testufied here today if there was any indication that Captain
Hazelwood had resumed drinking you would have yanked him
in \(a\)
(18) New York minute do you recall that?
(9) AYes

Q What if it was reported to you that he was ordering beer
overa walkie talkie at for example Portland Shipyard would you have yanked him in a New York minute?
A Assuming that the facts that you cite are true what youi
need to do and what I'd do and what I would always do is
investugate the sttuation I'd talk to the people involved,

\section*{Vol 213639}
if check the context in which that - that radio conversation or
(2) whatever you said it was took place I'd look at the whole
(3) situation

Q Let s discuss that a little bit Talk to the people
involved You dtalk to among other people the suspect
because you re a direct and forthright individual you d say I
have a report that this incident happened what sup is that a
good first step?
A Absolutely You'd confront the individual directly
Q Always confront the individual directly isn that right?
A Srr
Q Always coniront the individual directiv?
A Well as part of the unvestigation I think that's an integral part of any question you have
Q It s both good management and part of being a decent human
(5) being?
7) A That's correct
(8) Q Did you confront Captain Hazélwood about the Shaw cident
directly?
A I did not
Q Okay Now with regard to this hypothetical I ve given you about the Portland Shipyard let sassumu that you got a report not only that beer was ordered over the walkic talhie by tor a) example Captan Hazeiwood but there whre - and the beer was
(25) Henry Weinhards but therı was umply Hunry Weinhard beer cans
(1) in one or two locations on the ship heightened sense of
(?) awareness?
(3) AYes
(4) Q Go talik to the man?
(5) A Part of the investugation
(6) Q Do you know with regard to the Jim Shaw incident whether
(7) other potential witnesses with regard to the atuation as to
(8) Captain Hazelwood acung weird were interviewed? Do you know?
(9) A I asked - I do not lmow spectically
(10) Q Now Mr Shaw s testified here by deposition and he says
(11) that he reported - and I don \(t\) recall to who in management so
(12) I mat going to say it was you or I m not going to say it was
(13) your port captain, but Shaw says that the report consisted of
(14) Joe had fallen off of the wagon Joe was drinking was that
(15) ever reported to you?
(16) A Captain Sheehy reported what I testufied, and I'm afrad
(17) I'm musleading the jury in my eagerness to try and give you a
(18) response in that last question
(19) Captan Sheehy told me - when he came back he talked to a
(20) lot of people Now, Captan Sheehy and I know each other very
(21) well and he knows what I requre, as does everybody else in the
(22) fleet, and he knows exactly what I'm looking for, so the
(23) response well were other people talked to or interviewed, I
(24) feel quite certan that Captain Sheehy talked to a number of
(25)

\section*{Vol 213641}
(1) Q Let me ask you a question about that Captain Sheehy a (2) teatified here If Captain Sheehy did not investigate the
(3) people who were involved in the incident that Mr Shaw related
(4) witnesses participants would Captain Sheehy have been remiss
(5) in his duties?

A I don't know that he did that but the answer to your -
Q Assume he didn \(t\) would he have been remiss in his duties?
A The answer is yes
Q That would have been a reckless act wouldn't at?
A He would have been remiss in his duties
MR O NEILL I mabout to move on to another subject
can we take a break?
THE COURT Take our second break ladies and
gentlemen We Il be in recess now for 15 minutes
THE CLERK This court is in recess for 15 minutes
(Jury outat \(1158 \times \mathrm{m}\) )
(Jury in at 1215 pm )
BYMR O NEILL
Q Would it be a fair statement that no one from above no one 20) from Exxon told you to monitor Hazelwood between 1985 and \(1987{ }^{\circ}\)
(21) A Yes
(22) Q And that was a - to the extent that you performed that
(23) duty that was self generated?
(14) A It was generated based ou information that I got from my
(s) predecessor

\section*{Vol 213642}

Q Okay And if Mr Iarossi came in here and said that he told you to that is at least not consistent with your recollection is it?
A It's not consistent with my recollectuon, yes
Q Now, you talk about visiting Hazelwood s vessel Would it
be fair to say that you visited Hazelwood a vessel
approxımately six tumes a year?
A Yes If you consider Baytown and the other ports where I
also visit ships, which would be Baton Rouge and New York
prmarily
Q Baton Rouge how about is there a place called Texas City?
A There ss
Q Did you visit him at Texas City someumes too?
A I may have
Q And with regard to the other masters vessels you visited
them about five times a year?
A Yes, approximately
Q And when you viatted the other vessels you also checked to
see if those masters had been drinking?
A I check everythung when I'm on the vessels
Q And you did not instruct anyone to make day to day observations of Hazelwood?
AI dud not
Q And you re aware of no piece of paper that exists any place
at Exxon Shipping Company that deals with this monitoring

\section*{Vol 213643}
(1) situation are you?
2) A I'm not aware of a plece of paper for the - relatuve to
3) montonng for the penod that is of mmediate concern to this
(4) discussion, whach was '85 to '87

Q That s right You don t know of any paper?
A I don't know, I'm not aware of one
Q And prior to the transfer you yourself never asked anybody who interfaced if I can use a computer term with
Captain Hazelwood people on the vessel or shoreside, you never
(10) asked anyone directly whether Hazelwood had resumed drinking
(II) did you?
(12) A Could you reframe that for me, please?
(13) \(Q\) Sure At no tume prior to the transfer did you ask anyone
(14) interfacing with Captein Hazelwood people on vessel or
(15) shoreside whether Hazelwood had resumed drinking?
(Io) A I hesitate to answer you because I had a number of
(it) discussions, obviously many discussions with Captan Bill
(18) Sheehy
(19) Q Exclude Sheehy
(20) A I may have heard - I can't answer you absolvtely I may
(21) have had other discussions with peers, other managers,

Harvey
(22) Borgen
(23) Q Okay Would you go to Page 304 of your deposition line 12
(24) to line 17 Are you on Page 3047
(23) A 304
(1) Q And I m going the read the question at line 12 and I m
() going to go through line 17 and you tell me if you were asked
(3) this question and you gave this answer Well at any time
(4) before this converamition with Borgen in 1987 did you ask
(5) anyone who was interfacing with Hazelwood be they people on
(6) the vessei or people on the shoreside whether Hazelwood had
(7) resumed drinking? And your answer was no
(1s that a fair reading?
A My answer is no
(10) Q Now when Captain Hazelwood was transferred to the west
(II) coast you did not tell Borgen that he had to monitor Captain
(12) Hazelwood did you?
(13) A I did not
(14) Q And captain - Mr Borgen did not indicate to you that he
(15) was going to monitor Captain Hazelwood for alcohol use that s
(16) a correct statement isn t it?
(17) A That's a correct statement
(18) Q Now with regard to your observations of Captain Hazelwood
(19) you have testified here today that you got to know the man
(0) pretty well I got to understand him do you recall that?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q You car pooled with a fellow named Ellenwood?
(23) AI did
(24) Q On a daily basis from October of 1985 to April of 1987
(25) isn that a correct statement?

\section*{Vol 213645}
(1) A Yes I missed the days bat I car-pooled with the gentleman
Q On a dasly basis vou? May have missed a day here or there out of town?
AYes
Q You had much more contact with Ellenwood than you had Captan Hazelwood?
A On a day to-day basus yes
Q And you were a frend of Ted Ellenwood?
A As I am a friend of Joe Hazelwood
Q Captain Hazelwood And it turned out that Ellenwood had an alcohol problem isn that night?
A In 1988, it wes reported be turned humelf in for a program
Q You had dally contact with Ted Ellenwood and made no
observations at all with regard to Ted Ellenwood s problems?
(17) A Made no observations of Ted Ellenwood because there was no
(18) knowledge, prior knowiedge that he may have had a problem,
(19) where as there was that knowledge that I had of Hazelwood
(20) Q You were on notice with regard to Captain Hazelwood?
(21) A That is correct
(22) Q With regard - let s go to the Shaw incident and I didn \(t\)
(23) quite catch your testimony with regard to this today but when
(24) Sheehy came back to report to you about the individuals that he
(25) talked to he didn \(t\) tell you who those individuals were did

Vol 213646
he?
A He did not
Q Now you spoke to Shaw?
AI did
Q And was Sheehy in the room when you spoke to Shaw?
A We may have been - all three of us may have been together,
but I remember talking to Jım about the issue
Q And where does Mr Shaw tit on the chain of command with
regard to you and Sheehy?
A The port steward reported darectly to me in the - in the
office And physically, he's - he's located a couple doors
down from where I was, Baytown Texas office
Q With regard to this Mihajlovic incident that we ve talked
to you didn \(t\) know about it until after the grounding we re
clear on that?
A That is correct
Q With regard to the transfer of Captain Hazelwood from the gulf coast fleet to the west const fleet, was Mr Iarossi in
agreement with the decision to transfer Captain Hazelwood?
A When he came up at the meeting that I testified to just a
few muntes ago, he was
Q Did this meeting occur al the time of transfer?
A It occurred in the spnngtime It was after - on or
about but I would say it was after April '87, perhaps May,
June, early July tume frame

\section*{Vol 213647}
, Q Had the decision been made to translur Captain Hazulwood
that period in time or was the discussion with Mr larossia
decision making meeting or did it predate or posidate a decision making meeting' Do you understand what I m taiking about?
A Yes It was a meetung, I think the primary reason for the meeting was to discuss rankings of semor officers but at hat
point in tume Harvey Borgen and myself advised Mr Larossi of
the transfer
Q Did Mr larossi tell you he was shoched?
A He did aut
Q You testified about the captain s iob performante and that was something that you monitored in 1986 do you recall that?
A Yes Youtallang generally"
Q Yes sir
A Yes yes
Q And would it be fair to say and this is Exhibil 155 for
identification that in 1986 at least with regard to the rankings that was his worst year?
A Yes
MR O NEILL 1 mjust about done
MR SANDERS I was trying to look at your chart
MR O NEILL Thank you sir
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF DWIGHT KOOPS (Live) BY MR SANDERS

Vol 213648
(1) QMr Koops let me go to a couple of things that Mr O Neill
(?) asked you about One thing he asked you about was whether you
3) montored other captains or whether you looked at all things on
) all ships do you remember that testumony?
AYes
Q Now when you went to Captain Hazelwood did you look for
things with Captain Hazelwood that you didn tlook for in other
masters?
A I thank the issue is - is one of quality versus quantity
(1*) I'm just one human bemg, and I spread myself as thin as I
'(11) possibly can, but when it comes to, say, visitung Captain
(12) Hazelwood, although the numbers may be fairly close, the
way I
(13) spread myself
(14) \(Q\) You mean number of visits?
(15) A Number of visits, frequency of visits to ships that I can
(16) physically get around to, that I would say my visits to

Captann
(17) Hazelwood had an aspect of quainty I was looling for (18) somethugg perhaps a little bit dufferent with Captan Hazelwood
(19) than I was with the other masters, and that's how I explam the
(20) difference
(21) Q In that sense did you watch Captan Hazelwood differently
(22) than you watched other masters?
(23) A I would say so
(24) \(Q\) And in that sense did you watch him more closely than (25) other masters?

\section*{Vol 213649}

\footnotetext{
A ln a sense, yes
Q Now Mr O Neill has asked you about a couple of
conversations with Mr Iarossi And the first one had to do
with - with Captain Mihajlovic I want to make aure that we reclear on this Did you have a conversation sometime with
Mr Iarosai in which you told him what Captain Mihajovic had
told you?
AYes
Q Differencu is you thinh your rucollection is - your belief
is that it happened after the grounding and Mr Iaroseis
recollection is that it happened before correct?
A That's correct
Q No doubt that the conversation occurred?
AYes
Q All right And the conversation that you had with him in which you mentioned your father is there any doubt in your mind that you had that conversation with Mr larossi at some tume?
A That's correct
Q The only difference is when did it happen? AYes
Q Now you were - you were asked a couple of questions about
(23) whether you were told to monitor The point is did you
(24) monitor Captain Hazelwood in turms of alcohol use?
(25) A Absolutely
}

Vol 213650
(1) Q So regardless of who or whether you were told something (2) you did it?
(3) AYes
(4) Q And did you do it the entire time that Captain Hazelwood
(S) was within your supervision that is from October 11985
untul the end of April 1987'
A The entire penod
MR SANDERS I have no further questions
THE COURT Thank you You may step down sir
Call your next witness
MR NEAL Call Captain Ivan Mhajlovic and Ithink
Your Honor that this is one where I have a few brief
questions but Mr Chalos I think will take us back
THE COURT I understand I got your message about it
(5) yesterday which I appreciate
(16) THE CLERK Rasse your nght hand please
(17) (The Witness Is Swom)
(18) THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name
(19) your address and spell your last name please
(20) THE WITNESS My name is Ivan S Mihajlovic It's
(21) M I H A-J-L O V IC I live at 31 Seaspray Drive in
(22) Centerport New York
(23) DRECT EXAMINATION OF IVAN MIHAJLOVIC (Live)
(34) BYMR CHALOS
(25) Q Captain Mihajlovic are you the brute we ve been hearing

\section*{Vol 21 365!}

\section*{about?}

A I guess so, huh?
Q You don t look so tough in person
By whom are you employed?
A Sea River Mantıme
Q How long have you been employed by Sea River?
A Just under 20 years
Q Sea River being the successor of Exxon?
A Exxon, that's correct
Q You hold a master a license?
A That is correct
Q What is your present ship?
(13) A Present ship is the Sea River Mediterranean, the "ex" Exxon
(14) Valdez
(15) Q That a the former Exxon Valdez?
(16) A That's correct
(in) Q How long have you been the master of that ship?
(18) A About three and a half years, sunce it came out of San
(19) Diego
(20) Q Now prior to that you were a master of other ships for
(21) Exxon?
(22) A That's correct
(23) \(Q\) When did you first obtain your master s license?
(24) A 1983
(25) Q 83?
(1) A 1983 yes
(7) Q And when did you first start sailing as master?
(3) A In 1984
(4) Q Prior to that I take it you were a chief mate?

A That's correct
Q How long were you a chief mate?
A I got my chief mate's hicense in 1978 and from about '78
to '83 beginning of ' 84 I sailed chief mate
Q And I take ll prior to that you were second mate for a
number of years?
A That's correct
(12) Q And before that you were a third mate?
(13) A That is correct
(14) Q Now where did you go to school?
(19) A I went to school at the Umited States Merchant Manne
(16) Academy at Kings Point
(17) Q And you graduated there when?
(18) A 1974 In June
(19) Q How many times have you sailed with Captain Hazelwood in (20) your career?
(21) A In my career two or three
(22) Q What was the last time you sailed with him?
(23) A About 19-1981 1982
(24) Q And you were chief mate at the time?
(25) A That's correct

Vol 213653
Q Now you - do you consider Captain Hazelwood to be a
friend of yours?
A Yes 1 do
Q You live close to him?
A Yes, next town
Q I d like to ask you some questions about your experience in
Prince William Sound
A Okay
Q When did you first start sailing up there
A I believe it was 1977 Back then as third mate
Q Okay And did you continue for a period of ume going up
there on a regular basis?
A Yes, I did
Q Until when?
A I was on the west coast trade until end of 1984 beginning
of 1985
Q So I take it you made trips up there as a third mate?
A That's correct
Q As a second mate?
A That's also correct
Q As a chief mate?
A Yes
Q And up till 1985 as a master?
A Yes, I did
Q Did you hold a pilotage endorsement for Prince Wiliam

Vol 213654

\section*{Sound}

A No, I do not have it
Q Do you have a pilolage endorsement today for Prince William
Sound?
A No, I do not
Q How many tripa - incidentally, where did you go in 1985 ?
A In 1985, I went to the Houston office to work as an
assistont marne advisor for Bill Duncan
Q How long - how long were you there?
A Sux months
Q What does an assistant marine advisor do?
A Basically, it's port approvals for dufferent ports for our charter vessels and anything that may come up, a hitle bit maybe on the bridge organization manual a little bit on other
(15) stuff, plotage, federal regulations used to come by my desk and I'd have to read them
Q Let me ask you about that Duning your tenure in Houston
in 1985 did you have occasion to see a proposed ruie making
the Coast Guard relating to pilotage in Prince William Sound?
A I beheve I did, yes
Q What do you recall about the proposal rule making that you saw?
A I recall that they were talking about abohshing pilotage in Prnce William Sound completely
\(t\)
Q Had you hcard talk to that cifect that pilotage was going

\section*{Vol 21 3655}
to be abolished in Prince William Sound?
A Yes I did And I heard tall about reasons for not
abolushing would be some of the captains there that were
getting extra money going in and out obviously they uldn't
want it abolashed but there was a discussion period ou it Q Did you hear the reasons as to why they wanted to abolish \(H^{7}\)
A I assume that they just felt that it wasn't necessary anymore
Q When you asy you assume what do you mean? You assume 11
(11) wasn inecessary \({ }^{7}\) Why not?

A Well, there were a lot of captans running up there without pllatage
Q You being one?
A Me being one yes sar
Q Let me ask you something Where did you go when you left the office in 1985 or 1986 ?
A I went on the Exxon Benicia
Q And where did that ship tradı?
A That ship traded into Alaska I only made one trip or so on it
(2) Q Did you have occasion to go to the far east at some point (23) before you went to Alaska?
(94) A That's correct about 1986 After that Benicia I was
(25) transferred to the east coast and was on the Exxon San
(1) Francssco We were running between Baytown, Baton

Rouge and
(2) Chinqui Grande and about 1987,1988 , I can't remember exactiy
(3) when, we went around - actually went around the worid, just
about, to Sungapore up to the shipyard period for transfer to
the west coast
Q Okay Did you come back to Alaska after Singapore?
A Yes, I did
Q Before we get to Alaska let me ask you this What was
your understanding of the pilotage regulations in 1985 and 1986
(10) for Prince William Sound?
(11) A In 1985 and in 1986, they were going out the door They
(12) were going to be no more pilotage That's what I
understood it
(13) to be
(14) Q Now, when you came back from Singapore did you have
(15) occasion to ask anyone what the status of the pilotage
(16) regulations was for that time?
(17) A When I left Singapore, I called up - well, let me
(18) clarify 1984, before, it used to be daylight only passages,
(19) referring -
(20) \(Q\) What does that mean?
(21) A That means that you could only, with non pilotage, 80
from
(22) Cape Hinchinbrook all the way to the dock at dayight and same
(23) thing going out, it was very, very ngid In 1986, when I went
(24) up to Singapore, I went to see if did that change or what, and
(25) basically they told me that, yes, you know, that's applicable

\section*{Vol 213657}
anymore
(2) Q Well let s slow down a second

A Okay
Q You were coming back from Singapore?
A Right
Q Going to Alaska?
A That's correct
Q To Prince William Sound this is your first trip back in
what two years?
AYes
Q And you said you made an inquiry to find out what the
pilotage regulations were?
A That's correct
(14) \(Q\) Who did you make that inquiry to?
(15) A Alaska Maritume Agency
(16) Q And who was Alaska Martime?
(17) A Alaska Mantime Agency was our agents in Valdez
(18) Q How did you contact them?
(19) A I belseve I contacted them first by telex and then by
(20) telephone
(21) Q And did Alaska Martume respond?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q How did they respond?
(24) A They responded by sending me a fax or a telex of a letter
(25) Q Okay Let me put up what we previously marked as DX2476

\section*{Vol 213658}
that \(s\) the Alamar letter
MR CHALOS I misidentified the exhibit Your Honor
It s 3483 DX3483 Not only have they taken the machines away
from me now I can \(t\) get the exhibits right
Your Honor I ve been told that this exhibit hasn ibeen offered
THE COURT I m sorry give me that number agan?
MR CHALOS 3483 DX
THE COURT That s a memo FROM Martineau to the masters of Exxon Shipping
MR CHALOS This is the second page of that memo
THE COURT It s not from Alamar
MR CHALOS The cover sheet is from Martineau the
second page is the Alamar letter I thought I offered it into
evidence If I haven \(t\) II do that at this time No
problem
MR O NEILL Offer
THE COURT My notes show that 3483 has been admitted
MR CHALOS I Il offer it at this tume Your Honor
MR O NEILL You don t need to
MR CHALOS Oh it sin ?
THE COURT It \(s\) in you got it
BYMR CHALOS
Q Let me ask you this Is this the letter that you got? Do
(25) you recognize this?

BYMR CHALOS

\section*{Q Captain can you see this?}

A Yes I can
Q When you picked up the pilot and dropped off the pilot where did you pick him up? Can you - can you teil me? I II point to it so you don thave to come down
A Just above Busby in that inttle area between Busby and Rocky Pount
Q That s Rocky Point there?
A So in there
Q Just in there?
A In there that's nght, or just below Busby in that area
Q What would that depend on?
A That would depend on weather
Q Mainly?
A Mainly weather, yes
Q As you understood the situation in 1988 where was the pilot station?
A In 1988 Rocky Point
Q Rocky Point being up here -
AYes

Vol 213661
Q-in this area? Before I put this up I just want to ask
(2) you something I want to put this off to the side for a
3) second Oh Itrapped myself Canwe get the first paragraph
(4) blown up" You can look at it Can we make it a little bigger
(s) first paragraph? That sgood
6) Captain the first paragraph says and I II read it
effective September 11986 the U S Coast Guard requirement
for daylight passage in Prince William Sound for vessela
()) without pilotage has been waived see that?

A Yes I do
Q All non pilotage vessels will be able to transit from Cape
Hinchinbrook to the pilot station and that we said was Rocky
Point right?
AYes
Q At all hours as long as visibilities remain at two miles
or greater The same remains true for the outbound leg from the pilot station to Cape Hinchinbrook You see that?
AYes, I do
Q Then there s some requirements for reporting in the last couple of paragraphs Those requirements for reporting can wo
(21) go back to the - see where it says about notifying the Coast
(2) Guard and it says here number three yeah
(23) It taiks about a bridge navigation team consisting of an
(24) extra watch stander under the direction of the deck officer
) other than the one on watch must report the vesial aposition

\section*{Vol 213662}
every ten minutes while navigating from Cape Hinchinbrook to
Montague Point you see that?
A Yes, I do
Q What did you underatand that third requirement to be?
A I don't understand
Q What did you underatand when they re talking about two
officers on the bridge and reporting every ten minutes?
A Well, just two officers
Q Now is that in a specific area that they re talking about there?
A Just in that area, Just from Cape Hinchinbrook, Cape
Hinchinbrook up to Montague Island, about 13 miles
Q We don thave that but Cape Hinchinbrook is down here
down here nght?
A I gress so, Mike
MR CHALOS Do we have the other one?
MR NEAL Don \(t\) you have it behind you there?
MR CHALOS No that st the small one too
BYMR CHALOS
Q Let me ask you to assume that Cape Hinchinbrook is down
here
A Okay
Q Is that right?
AYes
\(Q\) And Moniague Point is down there 100 ?

Vol 213664
(1) A Move your hands to the left
(-) Q To the left?
(3) A There you go
(4) Q So it s this area right in here?
(5) A That's correct
6) Q That s the only area that that regulation or that letter
said you had to have two officers?
A That is correct
Q Bligh Reef is way up here right?
A That is correct
(L) Q Rocky Point is up here?
(12) A That's right
(13) Q Okay Now prior to the grounding, you operated on the
(14) principle that pilotage had been waived nght?
(15) A That is correct
(16) Q And that just to recap, that you only needed one officer
(17) on the bridge in that area above Moniague Point?
(18) A That's correct
(19) Q Now, Captain, going back to - to the letter from Alanka
(20) Maritume can we go back to the first paragraph that paragraph
(21) says - refers to non pilotage vessels right?
(22) A That's correct
(23) Q It doesn itrefer to pilotage vessels does it?
(24) A No it does not
(25) Q Well did you assume that pilotage was waived also for

\footnotetext{
Vol 213663
A That's correct
Q And that sa short strecth about ten miles or so'
A That's correct
Q So what they re talhing about there is having two watch
standers on the bridge in that ten mile stretch isn it that
correct?
A That is correct
Q Now there s nothing in this that calks about having two
watch standers in all of Prince William Sound does it?
A No
Q Above that point?
A No there's not
MR CHALOS Oh look at this Your Honor Ioffer at
this time DX9172 It s the chart of Prince William Sound
(Exhibit 9172 offered)
MR O NEILL No objection
THE COURT DX9172 is admitled
(Exhsbit 9172 received)
BY MR CHALOS
Q Okay Captain the ares that we re talking about is here s Cape Hinchinbrook right?
A That's correct
Q And Montague Straits is right here?
A Just the top prece here
Q Right here?
}

Vol 21 3665
pilotage vessels or just non pilotage vessels?
A For both vessels
Q Why do you say that?
A Well you can't hold a plotage vessel to a stricter
comphance than a non plotage vessel You know, if a person
(6) has the extra training, you would thulk that he would be let

\section*{off easier}

Q Well let s see if I understand this nght As you were
interpreting this - as this letter is written, it talks about
non pilotage vessels right?
A That's correct
Q And you re saying - you re saying what that pilotage
vessels didn thave to comply etther with the pilotage
requirements?
A That's correct
Q And what s the basis of that?
A I just feel that a palotage vessel can't be held to a
higher standard than a non-pulotage vessel
Q Well it would be true wouldn \(t\) it the way you'd get around if you were a pilotage vessel and the fellow with the pilotage didn \(t\) want to stand the pilotage watch all he had to do under this regulation is declare his vessel a non pilotage vessel right?
A That is correct
\(Q\) is that the basis for what you re talking about?

Vol 213666
```

(1) A That is correct
2) Q Now subsequent to the grounding there was a chief mate
3) assigned to your ship that had the pulotage endorsement?
4) A After the grounding?
s) Q Yeah subsequent?
(5) A Yes
7) Q That means a fter?
*) AYes
M) NEAL Your Honor could we approach the bench a
moment?
MR O NEILL They re objecting to each other This
1s great
(At stde bar off the Record)
THE COURT The laat question has been withdrawn and
the jury will ignore it
BYMR CHALOS
Q Captain when you were operating in Prince William Sound -
AYes
Q - with one officer on the bridge above Cape - above
Montague Point?
AYes
Q Did you believe that you were in compliance with the Exxon
bridge organization manual having one officer on the bridge?
AYes
Q You did?

```
A Yes 213667
Q Have you ever gone below in Prince William Sound?
A Yes, I have
Q And left your mate in charge of the -
A That's correct
Q Have you ever gone below in a place above Bligh Reef?
A Yes, I did once
Q Have you ever gone below in the Narrows?
A That's what I'm taliking abont, yes, sir
Q How long did you stay off the bridge when you were in the
Narrows?
A It was just about the whole transit
Q Of the Narrowa?
A That's correct
Q You had something to do?
A Yes, it was after the grounding
Q This was after the grounding?
A Yes
Q Well my question to you is did you have something to do
on that occasion that caused you to leave the bridge?
A Yes, I did
Q And you felt - you felt at that tume confident enough to
leave your mate and the pilot on the bridge?
A Yes, I did
Q Captain based on your experience is it the master s

Vol 213669
Gibraltar, Englush Channel, I mean, there us no companson to - for those areas than compared to Prince Willam Sound Q In what way?
A Amount of traffic fishing boats just a lot closer traffic
Q Just so I melear are you saving those other arcas that
you re talking about are much more hazardous in terms of navigating than Prince William Sound?
A Oh, yes, yes, the other areas are more hazardous than
Prace Willuam Sound
Q There s been testımony by the commandant of the Coast
Guard Admiral Yost that he beiteves this area to be a very
easy area to navigate Do you agree or dinagree with that?
AI would agree
Q Based on your experience are the navigational hazands in
this area well-known?
AYes
Q And well marked?
A Yes they are
20) Q Well int at mght? Well marked in the daytıme?
(21) A Yes
(22) Q Captain have you ever used the autopilot in Prince William
(23) Sound?
(24) A I may have once
(23) Q Are you aware of any regulations that prohibit its use in

Vol 21 3670
I) Prince Willam Sound?
(2) A At that tume?
(3) Q Yea when you were there?
(4) A No
(9) Q And prior to the grounding is what I m talking about
(6) A Prior to the grounding, no
(7) Q The use of the autopilot is in the discretion of the
(8) master is it not?
(9) A That's correct
(10) Q I d like to ask you now about your relationship to the
(II) Vessel Traffic Center while you were up there
(12) AYes
(13) Q You had occasion to communicate with them?
(14) A Yes, I dad
(15) Q Okay What did you understand the function of the vessel
(16) traffic syatem to have been while you were up there?
(17) A The Vessel Traffic Center or any vessel traffic system is
(18) basically to keep the vessel in a safe condition, to assist the
(19) vessel
(20) Q Assist in what way'
(21) A Assust in the safety, safe transit of the vessel
(22) Q Did you believe while you were up there that you were being
(23) monitored by the Coast Guard?
(24) AYes
(25) Q Let sstick to an area above Bligh Reef starting at Bligh

\section*{Vol 213671}
(1) Reef and above Did you believe you were monitored in that (2) area?
(3) A Yes, I did
(4) Q What did you expect of the Coast Guard in respect to their (s) monitoring you? Did you expett anything from them?
(6) A Well, I expected them to keep me informed if they were 17) tracking me and I was stauding anto danger or something
(8) Q We ve used that term betore can you explain what standing
(9) into danger means?
(10) A Well standing into danger is a term that - let's say I'm
(II) proceeding towards oh \(I\) don't know
(12) \(Q\) Let s say Bligh Reef
(13) A Okay Bligh Reef
(14) Q Why not?
(15) A And I continue to proceed towards that course the traffic
(16) system would turn and explan to me captan you are
standing
(17) into danger In other words captan you better do something
(18) you might want to change course or you're going to cause a
(19) groundiag or whatever
(20) Q Would you expect - or did you expect while you were up
(21) there that they would call you and give you a helm order?
(-) A No
(23) Q You wouldn \(t\) expect that?
(24) A No
(r) Q That s up to you that's your discretion what helm to use
nght?
A That's correct
(3) They re not going to call you up and say captann come ) right ten degrees?
A That's correct
Q Now there's been some testimony that the Coast Guard never
7) gave apeed orders either Did you have occasion up there to
) get a speed order or hear a speed order from them?
A We were coming down once, and we had come unto the
(+0) northbound lane to avoid ice and the Coast Guard called the
(11) overseas Juneau, I beheve, and it was - and told them to slow
(12) down and proceed towards the anchorage to allow me tume to get
(13) back into my southbound lane And then the Valdez was behund
(14) that and told them to slow down
(15) QI see You were on another shap at the tume?
(16) A I was on the Excron San Francusco outbound, yes
(17) Q I see So they ordered the two ships that were coming
(18) inbound to alow down to let you get back in the ianes?
(19) A That's correct, they told them to slow down
(20) Q Now Captain I want to ask you one last area There s
(21) been some testimony here by chief warrant officer -
(22) Mr Montague calls him Lieutenant Delozier but he was really a
(23) chief warrant officer - Delozier had sald that when he
(24) interviewed Captain Hazelwood and Third Mate Cousins that they
(25) both told him that Captain Hazelwood ordered the mate to make

\section*{Vol 21-3673}
(I) his turn at the 38 fathom mark juat below Busby over here
(2) okay I want you to assume that as a hypothetical Are you
(3) with meso far?
(4) A Yeah I can just hardly see that chart, though
(s) Q Right here Lieutenant Commander Falkenstein says no
(s) nobody ever told him that when he asked Captain Hazelwood
he
(7) told him that he instructed the mate to turn at Busby Island
(3) light okay I want you to assume that fact as well
() A Olay
(10) Q In your - how many yeara did we say you re sasing 20
(11) years?
(12) A Close to 20 years, yeah
(13) Q Did you ever receive an order from a captain to make a turn (14) at a fathom mark?
(15) A No
(16) Q Did you as a master or sentor officer ever instruct a
(In mate to turn your vessel at a fathom mark?
A No
Q Have you ever heard of anybody that you ve sailed with give
an order to turn at a fathom mark?
ANo
(2) MR CHALOS Thank you Captain

Mr Neal? Your witness
EXAMINATION OF IVAN MIHAJLOVIC (Live)
BYMR NEAL

Vol 213674
Q Captain Mihallovic I m Jim Neal I represent the Exxon defendants You and I have met?

\section*{AYes}

Q There s been some testimony here about a time down in Chiriqui Grande is that the way you pronounce it?
A That's correct
Q When you had occasion to search Captain Hazelwood s quarters - did you conduct such a search?
A Yes, I did
Q Would you tell us before we get to the search itself tell us how that came about
A I was in Baton Rouge on the Exxon San Francisco
Q You want to speak up just a little bit in what Mr Sanders calls the silver mucrophone?
A Sure
Q Use the allver microphone with your silver voice
A Olay I was on the Exxon San Francisco in Baton Rouge Captan Sheehy had made one of his visits down to the vessel
(19) Captan Sheehy is also a classmate of mine, so we were tallang
(20) about just what was goung on on the ship and everything else,
(21) Just very casual, frendly And he had told me there that he
(22) knew I was friends with Captan Hazelwood and that he had heard
(23) rumors there, predomuantly from a guy by the name of Jum Shaw,
(24) that Captan Hazelvood was drinking again and am I famular
(26) With the company policy, that if you get caught with alcohol on

\section*{Vol 213675}
(1) the shup, you're goung to get canned So I sard, you know,
(2) - I never heard anythng, I was just curnous how these (3) rumors get started And he said, well, you know, if you come
(4) across hum, would you look into it And that's basically how
(5) Captan Sheehy talks
(b) Q Now you were in Baton Rouge and Capiain Sheehy was the 7) port captain?

A That's correct
()) Qis supenior - well let me back that up because it may
(10) depend on the time Do you know approximately when this
(II) conversation with Captain Sheehy occurred?
(12) A I'd have to say summer of '86 It's been a long tume
(13) Q Okay Summer of 86 When you had the converation with
(14) Captain Sheehy he was the port captain of your fleet, the gulf
(15) coast fleet?
(10) A That's correct
(in) Q And you were a captain tn that fleet and Captain Joseph
(18) Hazelwood was a captain in that fleet?
(19) A That is correct
(20) Q And Mr Sheehy s immediate superior was a man by the name
(21) of Dwight Koops?
(22) A That's correct also
(23) Q You have a conversation with port Captain Shechy he tells
(24) you about a numor that Joe is drinking again or something like
(2S) that, and he mentions a man named Shaw a Jim Shaw is that
corsect?

\section*{A That is correct}

Q And he asked you to look into it when you get the chance
or words to that effect?
A Words to that effect yes
Q All right Now then tell us then about from that point on how the search took place that is where did you find Captain Hazelwood and so forth?
A All right I was on the San Francısco, once agaun, and we were at the loading buoy in Chunqui Grande Loading buoys,
(11) Just one buoy, you tre up one line and they have a hose that (12) comes around and they lift it up and put it on a mamfold, very
(13) simple system Captain Sheehy, Captan Hazelwood's shap had
(14) Just took arnval and had anchored at Chinqua Grande it's a (IS) nice like bay I know the pilots we been running down there
(16) quite often, so I saud could I get a launch there and go over
(17) and see Joe Saud no problem, you know, so they took me over
(18) there When I went over there, I talked to Joe I sard, hey
(19) Joe youknow, I heard about this rumor This rumor's not (20) good, you know this company is very adamant about this and
(21) they're goug to can you And Joe, figuring it's just another (22) rumor and here we go agam and all that, sand something, and
(23) people that know me know that I have occasional temper
(24) Q Occastonal temper?
(23) A Occasional yeah
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{25}{*}{\begin{tabular}{l}
Q That s good Occasional? \\
A Occasional I'm not quite the beast you all heard before but I went over there, I talked to hum and I started to get you know, thes is serious, you could lose your job And he sad, hey, if you don't believe me, you're welcome to take a look in my room which 1 did \\
Q A look in your room let stalk about that On the - he was on the Yorktown that a smaller vessel than the Valder is that correct? \\
A That is correct \\
Q On the Yorktown was there a - by the way something that may be not clear here most of us we go to work in the morning, we come home at night we have a workplace and a e to come home and eat and sleep and have a drink or whatever \\
do and when you re on board a vessel your workplace and home place is the ame place is it not? \\
A That is correct \\
Q Now on the Valdez we ve learned there was a living room - or what do you call it stateroom? \\
A They have a stateroom and they have your bedroom Q A bedroom? \\
A Yeah, and then an office \\
Q Okay So you have a little sitting room and a bedroom? \\
A It would be the office, and a sitting room would be on the Yoristown, for example Then the bedroom ss adjouned, but
\end{tabular}}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Q That s good Occasional"
A Occasional I'm not quite the beast you all heard before but I went over there, I talked to hum and I started to get you know, thes is serious, you could lose your job And he sad, hey, if you don't believe me, you're welcome to take a look in my room which I did
Q A look in your room let stalk about that On the - he
was on the Yorktown that a smaller vessel than the Valde7 is that correct?
(10) A That is correct
(II) Q On the Yorktown was there a - by the way something that (12) may be not clear here most of us we go to work in the
(13) morning, we come home at night we have a workplace and a place
(14) to come home and eat and sleep and have a drink or whatever
we
(15) do and when you re on board a vessel your workplace and your
(16) home place is the same place is it not?
(II) A That is correct
(18) Q Now on the Valdez we ve learned there was a living
(19) room - or what do you call it suteroom?
(20) A They have a stateroom and they have your bedroom
(1) Q A bedroom?
(22) A Yeah, and then an office
(23) Q Okay So you have a little siting room and a bedroom?
(24) A It would be the office, and a sitting room would be on the
(23) Yoristown, for example Then the bedroom is adjouned, but Just

Vol 213678
off to the side, that's your bedroom
Q So you have two rooms?
A Rught
Q You have what we II call the office and what we II call a
bedroom"
A Exactly
Q Now did you search the otfice?
A Yes, I did
Q Did you look in drawers)
A Yes, I dad
Q Did you look in refrigerators?
A Yes, I did
Q All right Did you then go into the bedroom?
A Yes, I did
Q Did you search the bedroom?
A Yes, 1 dad
Q Did you find anything of alcoholic beverage at all?
A No, I did not
Q How did Joe look?
A Kund of surprised
Q Pardon me?
(22) A I sand he looked kund of surpnised
(-3) Q Otherwise - 1 mean did he look like he maght have been
(24) drinking?
(2) A No, not at all
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 21 3679 \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{Q Anything like that?} \\
\hline & A No \\
\hline & Q Good shape? \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(4) A Good shape} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(s) Q You think this was about the summer of 1986?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(6) A That is correct} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(7) Q Now following this did you make any report on your what} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(8) Ithcall investigation?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(9) A I wouldn't call it invesugation} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(10) Q Well on your search)} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(II) A On my search all nght I went up - back to Baton Rouge,} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\({ }^{12}\) ) that was our regular run Chinqui Grande up to Baton} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{Rouge} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(131 and Captan Sheehy happened to be up there agann I can't} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) recall whether it was the very aext trip or the trip after but (1s) any way it was in Baton Rouge He came on and I sard, you} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(16) know that's a lot of baloney and, you know I just went on} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(7) ship there, and I don't know whether we're stull friends or} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{(18) not, but there's nothung on here, there's nothing I've seen
(19) mean he didn't know I was un port, we don't - can't keep un}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(20) touch with each other so it was totally by surprise And} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{that} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(21) was it} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(22) Q So you told him that this Shaw report rumor whatever} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(23) you retalking about was a bunch of baloney?} \\
\hline 1-4) & A In those words \\
\hline & MR NEAL You may examin \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
(1) Q Anything like that?
(-) A No
Q Good shape?
A Good shape
Q You think this was about the summer of \(1986^{?}\)
A That is correct
Q Now following this did you make any report on your what Ill call investigation?
A I wouldn't call it unvesugation
Q Well on your search?
A On my search all right I went up-back to Baton Rouge,
(12) that was our regular run Chirqui Grande up to Baton

Rouge
(13) and Captann Sheehy happened to be up there agan I can't
(14) recall whether it was the very aext trip or the trip after but
(1) any way it was in Baton Rouge He came on and I said, you
the
(17) ship there, and I don't know whether we're still friends or
(18) not, but there's nothing on here, there's nothung I've seen I
(19) mean he didn't know I was in port, we don't - can't keep in
(20) touch with each other so it was totally by surprise And
that
(22) Q So you told him that this Shaw report rumor whatever
(23) you retalking about was a bunch of baloney?
( 3 ) MR NEAL You may examin
(1) CROSS EXAMINATION OF IVAN MIHAJLOVIC (Live)
(2) BYMR O'NEILL
(3) Q You are a friend of Captann Hazelwood s?
(4) A That is correct
(s) Q And indeed you both live in the same part of the country
(6) in adjoining towns?
(7) A That's also correct
(8) Q And you ve testified on his behalf before haven tyou?
(9) A That's correct also
(10) Q Now, with regard to the pilotage endoraement of Prace
(H) William Sound you testified about a proposal rule making that
(12) you found out about and you used the expression proposed
rule
(13) making isn that right?
(14) A That's correct
(15) \(Q\) And a proposal rule making is when the government publishes
(16) in the federal register its intent to ether come out with a
an new rule or change a rule but the notice with regard to the
(18) proposed rule making is not the rule is it?
(19) A That's correct also
(20) Q They put it out into the public and they asy here, public,
(21) comment on this?
(22) A That's right
(23) Q And as you sit here today you know that that proposed rule
(24) was never adopted as the final rule don 1 you?
(2S) A I don't know

Vol 213681
(1) Q You don t know?
(2) A No, I been out of Alaska sunce 1990, after the accident I
(3) haven't been back there, sir
(4) Q Well you know through 1990 that that proposed rule was
(5) never adopted don tyou?
(6) A That's correct
(7) Q So did - when you found out about the proposed rule
(8) through 1990 the proposed rule was never adopted?
(9) A That's correct
(10) Q And with regard to the notice that you got from Alamar can
(11) we bring that up, second page?
(12) MR CHALOS You need some help Mr O Neill?
(13) MR O NEILL Got it
(14) BY MR O NEILL
(19) Q The Alamar document in point of fact only deals with
(16) non pilotage vessels isn that correct?
(17) A That's correct
(18) Q And with regard to pilotage vessels it doesn taddreas the
(19) subject is that not correct?
(20) A That's also correct sir
(21) Q And with regard to your testimony about pilotage vessels
(22) those are assumptions that you made you didn tget that from
(23) this notice did you?
(24) A That's correct
(25) Q And you re aware of course that as - as - as the master
(2) A No, I been out of Alaska sunce 1990, after the accadent I
(3) haven't been back there, sir
(4) Q Well you know through 1990 that that proposed rule was
(6) A That's correct
(7) Q So did - when you found out about the proposed rule
(8) through 1990 the proposed rule was never adopted?

A That's correct
(II) we bring that up, second page?
(12) MR CHALOS You need some help Mr O Nesll?
(13) MR O NEILL Got it
(1s) Q The Alamar document in point of fact only deals with
(16) non palotage vessels isn that correct?
(in A That's correct
(18) \(Q\) And with regard to pilotage vessels it doesn \(t\) address the
(19) subject is that not correct?
(20) A That's also correct sir
(21) Q And with regard to your testimony about pilotage vessela
(22) those are assumptions that you made you didn \(t\) get that from
(23) this notice did you
(25) Q And you re aware of course that as - as - as the master

\section*{Vol 213684}
of a vessel if in fact pilotage is required chapter 46 of the
United States Code requires that the pilot be in direction and control of the vessel you re aware of that aren \(t\) you? A I guess il am now, yes, sir
Q With regard to the Exxon bridge manual your employer you
know takes the position - do you know that your employer
takes the position that at or about the time of the accident
(8) the grounding of the Exxon Valdez that there was a
requirement
that there be two officers on the bridge you know that \(s\) what your employer a position is don't you?
A Yon were asking me what I did?
Q My question is do you know what your employer s position 18?
A I don't remember, sir
Q Your employer has stipulated binding stipulation on this jury, in this court that Captain Hazelwood was negligent in leaving the bndge of the Exxon Valdez at or about 1153 and that such negisgence was a proximate cause of the apill are you aware of that?
A That's the first tume l've seen it, sur
Q Who's Mr Duncan?
A Captan Duncan is - was the manne adnisor and he was the

\section*{gentleman that I worked for}

Q You worked for Captain Duncan and Captain Duncan was
author of the bridge manual wasn the?

\section*{Vol 213683}
```

A Yes, he was
Q Captain Duncan has testnfied here about the question of
discretion And this is Captain Duncan
(Portion of Video of Captain Duncan played as follows)
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q The watch conditions as they are set forth in the manual
are they absolute mandates in which the master is obligated to
comply with?
A They're Exxon gundelnnes
Q So given the conditions as a master underatanding them to
be and the situation the vessel is in is it fair to say the
matter has the discretion as to what watch condition he would
invoke for any given time period?
A Yes, he can certanly merease as approprate
Q Caplain did I just underatand you to asy that the watch
types are only guidelines and that the master can merease
them as appropriate?
A Yes
Q Can : decrease them?
A No, sır
Q Okay so Captamn Hazelwood didn t have the discretion to
decrense the watch (indiscernible) on the nught of the
grounding?
AYes
BYMR O NEILL

```
(20) says nothing in this manual is intended to relieve any person
(21) from complying with any other laws and regulations? The
(22) manual s purpose is not to let you off of the hook with regard
(23) to other laws and regulations you re aware of that aren \(t\)
you?
A Yes

\section*{Vol 213685}

Q But more specifically with regard to the subject that we re talking about here today the manual addresses that doesn tit \(^{7}\) In paragraph 6 of the manual the manual atates responsibility of the master or pulot for safe navigation and prudent maneuvering of his vesiel is in no way lessened or reheved by this regulation The master is responsible isn \(t\) he?
A Responsibility of the master or pilot for safe - or pulot
for safe aavigation and prudent maneuvenig of his vessel
is 4
(10) no way lessened or reheved by thas regulation, yes

Q And that in the manual Its purpose in the manual is to
make sure that people don tuse the manual with regard to
getuing them off the hook with regard to responsibilities
isn t that nght?

\section*{A I don't know The person who wrote the manual will have}
answer that
Q Now with regerd to your conversation with Captain
Hazelwood when you boarded the vesiel his reaction was here
(19) we go again? When you boarded the vessel when you raised
subject of these rumors it was here we go again?
AYes
Q It was cavaher wasn \(t t^{\text {? }}\)
A No, I beheve that rumors, both Captan Hazelwood and myself agree with that that rumors are started by - by just people, and they can get out of hand It's happened before

\section*{Vol 213686}
a lot of good people and 1 think that was what he meant by that
Q And he invited you in to search didn the? You testified he sald go ahead and search?
A That's nght
Q So with regard to the search he knew the answer to the question didn the when he invited you in and said go ahead and eearch he knew whether or not he had alcohol there?
A I don't know what he thought or - he didn't know my ship was going to be in He didn't know I would be on that day,

I don't understand what you mean by that sur
Q Now with regard to your knowledge of Captain Hazelwood
dranking, from 85 to 89 then we have this one search that
you conducted for one brief point in tume and that \(s\) it isn \(t\) \({ }^{1 t}\) ?
A That's correct
Q And whether there was two years after that or two years
before that and what went on during those periods of time you
(9) Just don \(t\) know do you?
(20) A I don't understand Could you kind of rephrase that?
(21) \(Q\) Were there other searches that you conducted?
(22) A No that was Just the only one for me
(23) MR O NEILL Okay thank you I have nothing
24) further

REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF IVAN MIHAJLOVIC

\footnotetext{
BYMR CHALOS
Q Captain you are familar are you not that the captain of the port in a port like Valdez or any other port in the United States has the authority to vary regulations by a local captain of the port order?
A That is correct
Q And did you believe, when you saw that Alamar letter that that was a local variance of the pilotage regulations? A That's correct
Q I want to give you an example that I ve used before ! want you to assume two ships coming into Hinchinbrook at the same tume Let me put up the chan I wanl you to assume two ships coming into Hinchinbrook at the same time One has pilotage meaning someone with a pilotage endorsement and
(15) other one does not have someone with a pilotage okay
(16) The first vessel with the pilotage endorsement if pilotage
(17) is not waived would have to have the person holding the
(18) pilotage endorsement on the bridge all the way up to Rocky
(19) Point right as you understood the pilotage requirements?
(20) A That is correct
(21) Q The second vessel doesn thave anybody with pilotage I
(22) want you to assume further has never been in Prince William
(23) Sound before that vessel would only need two people on the
(24) bridge through this stratt right here and then from then on
(25) one person who may or may not know Prince William Sound al
} the all
(1) right?
(?) A That's exactly correct
(3) Q The hazards to navigation in Prince William Sound are the
(4) same are they not whether you re a pilotage vessel or
(5) non pilotage vessel?
(6) A That's correct
(7) Q Does it make any sense to you after reading that Alamar
(8) letter that the person who has the most knowledge of the area
has to be on the bridge but someone who s never been there
(10) before doesn thave to be there?
(th) A Exactly That's what I tried to state before
(12) Q And that a why you believe that regulation waived pilotage
(13) for all vessels?
(14) A That's correct
(15) Q Captain you were asked about the - the bridge
(16) organizational manual?
(17) AYes
(18) Q The Exxon bridge orgamzational manual I want you to know
(9) Captain Hazelwood did not stipulate that Watch Condition

C
(20) applied on the night of the accident okay I want you to
(21) assume that
(22) A All right
(23) Q The bridge organization manual is a guide is it not to
(24) the masters?
(25) A That is correct
Vol 21 3689
(1) Q And it \(s\) the captain who sets the watch conditions is it
(2) not?
(3) A Right
(4) Q That \(s\) in his discretion?
(5) A That is correct
(6) Q I want to put up for you - I want to put up an excerpt -
(7) can I have this thing whatever you call it? It a from DX
(8) Exhibit 3450 Okay let s go to the first paragraph This is
(9) section 8 I 3 okay? See what it says? Watch conditions are
(10) to be set by the master according to the actual or anticipated
(I1) steaming situation You see that?
(12) A Yes, I do
(13) Q Okay Here s the definition of Watch Condition A and the
(14) one that applies is the second one in restrictive watera with
(15) clear visibility and little or no traffic you see that?
(16) A Yes, I do
(17) Q Now when you were in Prince William Sound Captain prior
(18) to the grounding you set Watch Condition A did you not?
(19) A That is correct
(20) Q Now Watch Condition C is this one here and it says - and
(21) this is what Exxon is relying on it sin restricted waters
(22) with clear visibility and high density traffic I want you to
(23) assume Captain -
(24) A Yes
(2S) Q - for the moment that there were no other ships in the

\section*{Vol 213690}
(1) VTS system above Bligh Reef or even in Prince William Sound at
(2) the time that the Exxon Valdez was there Does the
(3) high density traffic portion spply in Watch Condition C?
(4) A No, it does not
(s) Q How about the next ttem here when entering or leaving
(6) port with clear visibility regardless of traffic Now let me put up this chart for you okay?
A Sure
Q Captain where is this Port of Valdez is it right up here?
A That's it up there, httle circle
Q Once you get through the Narrows aren \(t\) you out of that port?
A That's it, you're out
(14) Q Mr O Neill read to you from the bridge organization
(1S) manual - sorry from the Prince William Sound user a manual
(16) second edition Let me read you the part that he didn \(t\) read
(1) to you okay? The purpose and applicability says this manual
(I8) describes procedures to be followed by vessels operating in the
(19) Prince William Sound Vessel Traffic Service area parenthesis
(20) VTS area The purpose of the Prince William Sound traffic
(21) service - who s that? Who sthe traffic service? Isn that
(22) the VTS?
(23) A VTS, that is correct
(24) \(Q\) Is to enhance the safety of navigation in the VTS area -
(25) that sthis whole area right? By reducing the potential for

\section*{Vol 21 3691}
collisions and groundings see that?
A Yes,l do
Q And to protect the waters of the VTS area from
environmental harm resulting from those mishaps see that?
AYes Ido
Q How does the VTS - let me use their words - reduce the potential for collisions and groundings? They do that by
montoring don they?
A That's correct
Q And you toid us that you expected if your ship is standing
into danger of a collision or a grounding that they should warn you?
A That's nght
\(Q\) Isn that right?
A That's nght
Q Is there any other purpose for them to be up there?
ANo
MR CHALOS No further questions
THE COURT I think that sit sir Youcan atep down
MR NEAL Judge while the next witness is coming up
could Mr O Neill and I have a bref moment at the aide bar?
(Sidebar conference off the record)
MR CHALOS I got so excited I forgot I had the next
witnesa I mback

Vol 213692
1) Your Honor the defendants call Mr Guy Kleess I should
) say Captain Guy Kleess
(3) THE CLERK Would vou rasse your right hand please?
(4) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(5) THE CLERK For the record sir state your full name
(i) vour address and spell vour last name please
() THE WITNESS My name is GuyG H Kleess That s
8) K L E E S S I reside at 4100 Teton View Lane Jacicson
() Wyoming
(10) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GUY KLEESS (Live)
(11) BYMR CHALOS
(12) Q Guy Kleess sounds like a movie star name
(13) A That's my real name, but nobody spells it nght
(14) Q That s a good one Better than Julus Herman
(15) MR O NEILL I object to that on behalf of Julus
(16) Herman
(17) MR CHALOS He s been tied up all weekend but that \(s\)
(18) another story
(19) THE COURT I m not going to tell you what my H
(20) stands for You guys will make fun of me too
(21) MR CHALOS You re right you re right Your Honor
(22) I don I hnow
(23) BYMR CHALOS
(24) Q Captain Kleess who are you employed by?
(25) A Currently on contract Loussiana Offshore Oil Port I'm a


Q You re a mooring master?
AYes
Q You dock ships?
A It's another term for pilot
Q How big are the ships?
A VLCC, ULCC, up to the largest in the world, 560000 dead weight
Q How long you been doing that?
A I been doing that since - part-time since 1990 full tume
since 1991
Q Prior to that were you employed by Exxon?
A Yes, I was
Q For how long?
A Approximately 13 and a half years from 1976 to 1990
Q Now you hold a masters license do you not?
A Yes, I do
Q You also hold an engineer s license?
A Yes, I do, second enguneer's hcense
Q How long have you held - have you had the mastera license?
A I can't recall an exact date It would be the mad '80s,
1985 or so
Q And prior to that I take it you sailed as a chief mate?
AYes, I dad
Q Second mate?


Vol 213695
Bay
Q And you were on for about three weeks with Captain
Hazelwood before that?
A Correct
Q And prior to that you wure on with Captain Stalicur for a
period of lume)
A Correct I joined the vessel I believe it was in
January
Q In the three week period that you were on there with
Captain Hazelwood did you ever see any alcohol aboard the vessel?
A No I dıdn't
Q Did you ever see Captain Hazelwood drinking aboard the vessel?
A No I didn't
Q Did you ever drink with Caplain Hazelwood whether it was aboard or ashore?
A No I dıdn't
Q Did you ever yue Captain Hacelwood intoxicated"
A No 1 did not
(1) Q Did you ever see him impairud during that period?
(29) A No I did not
(23) Q Did you ever see any officers or crew drinking on the Exxon
(24) Valdez at all while you were there?
(25) A No I did not

\section*{Vol 213696}
(1) Q I d like to direct your attention to what we ve called here
(2) as the launch incident the Mary Wiliamson launch incidents?
(3) AYes
(4) Q This would have been around a couple days before you got off?
(6) A The incident in question I think, took place on the
( 7 ) evening of March 12th, approximately 11.30 p m
(8) Q Okay So we'll set the date of March 12th Let me ask you
some questions You have a recollection of that of that
(10) evening?
(H) AYes, I do
(12) Q You have a recollection of seeing Captain Hazelwood that (13) evening?
(14) A I - I arnved at the launch terminal about 15 minntes
(15) prior to the lannch leaving That would have been about
(16) 1115 I can't recall whether Captan Hazelwood was at the
(17) terminal at the tume or came in shortly afterwards, bnt -
(18) Q Okay The terminal is that a warehouse or house?
(19) A It's a warehouse, housing office of the Westar lannch
(20) \(Q\) And it had benches that you could sit there or you had to
(21) stand?
(22) A I don't even thunk it had benches Think you just stood
(23) there
(24) Q You have a recollection of talking with Captain Hazelwood
(25) on that occasion?

\section*{Vol 213697}
(1) A Yes Captan Hazelwood was there I belneve this third (2) engneer, Katie - Katie - Katie Havens was there The second
(3) mate I believe was Nathan Carr was there and I belseve A-B
(4) Maureen Jones may have been - may have been there
(5) \(Q\) Were they there when you arnved or did they come in -
(6) A I can't recall if we were - but I do know we were all
(7) tallugg together for approximately 10 to 15 minntes pror to
(8) boarding the launch
(9) Q How close were you to Captain Hazelwood during this
(10) period?
(11) A Abont two to three feet
(12) Q You were standing close to him?
(13) AYes
(14) Q Were you talking with him?
(15) A Yes, I was
(16) Q And he talked to you?
(17) A Yes he did
(18) Q What were you calking about?
(19) A Music I had just bought a bunch of tapes at the store in
(20) San Francisco and we were just talking about the tapes I
(21) bought
(22) Q When Captain Hazelwood spoke to you did he slur his words?
(23) A No, he did not
(24) Q Did he appear to you to be impaired?
(2) A No, be seemed fine

\section*{Vol 213698}

Q Seemed normal to you?
A Seemed in good shape yes normal
Q You had occasion to watch him walk from the office to the launch?
A Yes it -1 guess about 20 feet from the door to the
termonal to the ladder leading down to the launch I walked with hum, about 20 feet
Q You notuce him stumbling?
A No, I dad not see hum stambling
Q Unsteady in any way \({ }^{2}\)
A No seemed normal
Q Climbed down the ladder onto the launch?
A Yes
Q Got onto the launch?
A Yes sur
Q Did that okay?
A Yes, sir
Q As fur as you remember?
A Yes, sir
Q Now when you got onto the launch did you have occasion to
(21) see Captann Hazelwood?
(22) A I don't recall seeng Captan Hazelwood after the launch
(23) departed the dock I stayed on deck I don't know where (24) Captan Hazelwood went I assume he went down below but I'm
(22) not sure

Vol 213699
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{) Q Did you see Mary Williaman there that evening?} \\
\hline (2) & A I remember some people from the Galveston there and I \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{don't} \\
\hline & specifically recall her but I remember there was people \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{from} \\
\hline & the Gaiveston there \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(6) Q Did you see do you have any recollection of seeing Captain} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(7) Hazelwood speaking with Mary Willamson?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(8) A No, I don't I don't recall} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(9) Q Did you hear any raised voices on the launct} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(10) A On the launch, no, or in the termmal, no The} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(11) nothing untoward in the whole evenung} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(12) Q Now the launch took off from the pier went out to the (13) ships did it not?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) A Yes} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(15) Q Mary Williamson s ship was the Galvest} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(10) A I belueve so} \\
\hline (1) & Q And your ship and Captan Hazelwood a ship was - \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(18) A Exxon Valdez} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(19) Q - was the Valdez Did the launch go to the Galveston} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(20) firat?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(21) A Yes} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(22) Q Did dropped off people there?} \\
\hline (2) & A Yes \\
\hline (24) & Q Did you sec anything untoward going on there at that ume? \\
\hline & A No, I drd not \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
(1) Q After the launch dropped people at the Gaivestion you went
() over to the Valdez?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q Was the Valdez light at this point in tume? In other
(5) words had it discharged most of its oil?
(6) A It had discharged most of the oll yes and it was the end
(7) of the port call and -

Q Was he riding high in the water)
A Yes
(10) \(Q\) Do you remember the companionwav?
(ii) A Theaccommodation ladder yes
(12) Q The accommodation ladder?
(13) A It was steep It was a long clamb It was a long clumb
(14) I remember it was a steep -
(IS) Q You have a recollection of the steepness?
(16) A Yes I can't recall the number of feet that the - you
(17) know, that her free board, the heaght of the deck above the
(18) water, I can't recall how high that was but it was very - the
(19) shup was very light
(20) Q Just so the Ladies and Gentlemen of the Jury understand
(21) when you re standing on this launch the launch is sort of
(12) going like this?
(23) A Ub huh
(24) Q And this -
(23) A There's a little platform at the base of the accommodation

\section*{Vol 213701}
(I) ladder approximately three feet by three feet and you jump up
(2) onto that and you chmb up the ladder
(3) Q You kind of have to stand on the ratl of the launch and
(4) then Jump?
(s) A Tume your jump and everything
(6) Q You got to tume 1t?
(7) A Yeah
(8) Q Captan Hazelwood do that?
(9) A Yes, sir, he dad
(10) Q You did it?
(II) AIdid it
(12) Q Everybody else did it that was on the ship?
(13) A There were no meidents yeah
(14) Q And Captain Hazelwood I assume went up the accommodation
(IS) ladder or the gangway'
(16) A Yes I didn't see him go up the ladder, but everybody got
(i7) on the maun deck in good order and there were no meidents
(18) Q Nobody slipping?
(19) ANo
(20) Q Nobody stumbling?
(21) A Nothing like that
(22) Q Now I know three weeks isn \(t\) a long time but you had a
(23) chance to observe Captain Hazelwood?
(24) AYes, Sir
(25) Q You watched him operate at sea?

Vol 213702
A Yes, sur
Q You beheve he was a good captan?
A Yes, I thonk Joe was - Captain Hazelwood is a very good captans
Q You find him to be an even tempered fellow?
A I - yes, I don't recall any - any uncidents where he lost
hus temper or raused his voice or anything like that, very
calm, cool and collected
MR CHALOS Thank you Mr Kleess Your witness
MR NEAL Could we just hold one second Your Honor?
(II) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GUY KLEESS
(12) BY MR O NEILL
(13) Q With regard to Captain Hazelwood and drinking which you ve
(14) testified about here today when you came on to the Valdez
(15) your first assignment on the Valdez you knew that Captann
(16) Hazelwood had a reputation as a drinker didn tyou?
(17) A I had heard - you know when I joined the fleet in the
(18) early ' 80 s that Captoun Hazelwood had a - was a drinker,
yes
(19) I had also heard that - that he had gone through
(20) rehabulatation
(21) Q So you knew also that he had gone through rehabilitation?
(22) A Yes, I had heard that
(23) \(Q\) That was widely known throughout the fleet wasn \(t\) it?
(24)
(25) Q Thank you The Westar launch incident let me see if we

\section*{Vol 213703}
(1) can do this real quick and you can get out of here and I can
(2) get out of here You were on the top of the vessel the
(3) launch Hazelwood and Mary Williamson were not up there with
(4) you that 5 a correct statement?
(5) A I don't recall them on the deck
(6) Q So whatever transpired between Captain Hazelwood and Mary
(7) Williamson is something that you didn isee?
(8) A Correct
(v) Q So you can I castify onc way ur the other about what went
(10) on between the caplain and Mary Williamsun because you just
(II) don 1 know?
(12) A Well I know that nothing happened in the terminal
(13) \(Q\) But with regard to the ride over on the launch you don \(t\)
(14) know? It s sort of like trying to prove a negative isn \(t\) it?
(15) A On the launch, you're correct I do not recall seeng
(16) Captan Hazelwood
(17) MR O NEILL Thank you that sall there is
(18) MR CHALOS Nofurther questions Your Honor
(19) THE COURT Thank you sir
(20) I have the impression at this point that cverybody wanted
(21) to get out of here today
(22) MR NEAL Judge I m not-1 m not-matter of
( 31 fact I may bc onc of the authors ol that
(4) MR O NEILL And I think I \(m\) the \(w\) author of that
(s) THE COURT Well adjourn now for the day ladies and

\section*{Vol 213704}
(1) gentlemen Please enjoy the sunghine outside it a a
(2) beautiful day, although we wouldn t know it in here Please
(3) don \(t\) read or look at anything about the trial of this case and
(4) we Il see you at 800 in the morning
(s) Counsel stay for just a moment please
(6) (Jury out at 140 pm )
(7) THE COURT Do we happen to have the jury instruction
(8) people with us today or -
(9) MR NEAL Judge' I couldn \(t\) - I didn \(t\) hear you
(10) MR LYNCH Not here at the moment Your Honor
(H) THE COURT Maybe the best thing to do is to simply
(12) say I want to see the people on each side who are working on
(13) your jury instructions at 200 or whenever we suspend tomorrow
(14) okay?
(1s) MR O NELLL Yes sir
(16) THE COURT Enjoy the afternoon
(17) THE CLERK Thrs court 18 now adjourned until eight
(18) a m tomorrow morning
(19) (Recess at 143 pm )
(i) INDEX

Vol 213706
(1) CONT D DIRECT EXAMINATION OF THOMAS FALKENSTEIN (Video) 3502
(2) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 3502
(4) CROSS EXAMINATION OF THOMAS FALKENSTEIN
(Video) 3509
(5) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 3509
(7) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF CHARLES CUSHING (Live) 3515
8) BY MR NEAL

3515
(10) CROSS EXAMINATION OF CHARLES CUSHING 3545
(II) BYMR MONTAGUE
(13) DLRECT EXAMINATION OF GARY RICHARDSON (Live) 3551
(14) BYMR LYNCH 3551
(16) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GARY RICHARDSON
(Live) 3572
(17) BY MR GERRY 3572
(19) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF GARY RICHARDSON
(Live) 3581
(20) BYMR LYNCH 3581
(2) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JOHN TOMPKINS (Live) 3583
(23) BY MR SANDERS 3583

Vol 213709
(1) EXHIBITS
(3) 1733 A 1736 A and 1734 A offered
(4) 2495 offered

3561
(5) 1744 offered 3961
(6) 2495 offered 3561
(7) 9172 offered 3663
(9) 1733 A 1736 A and 1734 A received

3515
(10) 1744 received 3561
(II) 2495 received

3562
(12) 9172 received 3663
(1) STATE OF ALASKA )
(2) Reporter s Certificate
(3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA )
(6) I Joy S Brauer a Registered Professional
(7) Reporter and Nolary Publie
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
(9) That the foregoing transcript contains a true and
(10) accurate transeription of my shorthand notes of all requested
(11) matters held in the foregoing captioned case
(12) Further that the transcript was prepared by me
(13) or under my direction
(14) DATED this day
(15) of 1994
(21) JOY S BRAUER RPR Notary Public for Alaska
(22) My Commisason Expires 51097

Look-See Concordance Report

UNIQUE WORDS 2,858 TOTAL OCCURRENCES 13,628
NOISE WORDS 385 Total Words in File 43,060

Single File Concordance

\section*{Case sensittve}

NOISE WORD LIST(S) NOISE NOI

INCLUDES ALL TEXT OCCURRENCES

IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD RANGES © BOTTOM of Page

MaXIMUM TRACKED OCCURRENCE THRESHOLD 50

NUMBER OF WORDS SURPASSING OCCURRENCE THRESHOLD 20

LIST OF THRESHOLD WORDS
alcohol [53]
beheve [53]
Captan (267)
course [54]
COURT [5]|
Exxon [96]
fleet [59]
Hazelwood [202]
Joe [63]
manutes [58]
Okay [60]
people (6)]
point [59|
recall [76]
rught [176]
ship [65]
sir (1772]
sleep (58)
Valdez \({ }^{61]}\)
vessel |ll 16
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline -1- \\
\hline 1013 [1] 357221 \\
\hline 1047 [2] 35392135402 \\
\hline 1115 [1] 369616 \\
\hline 1126 [2] 35392435403 \\
\hline 1130 [1] 36967 \\
\hline 1139 [2] 3523 11 35317 \\
\hline 1147 [1] 35401 \\
\hline 1152 [2] 352321352522 \\
\hline 1153 [1] 368217 \\
\hline 1155 [3] 35361618 \\
\hline 1156111353619 \\
\hline 1158 [5] 353751015 \\
\hline 364116 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

115830 [1] 353711
11th [3] 36002817
1200 [1] 356920
1215 [1] 364117
1253 [1] 354811
12th [2] 369678
13th [1] 369425
1733-A [3] 351422351579
1733-Able [3] 351419
35221216
1734-A [7] 35142235158
9354291012354411
1734-Able [1] 351420
1735-Able [2] 351421
353813
1736-A [3] 351422351579
1736-Able [1] 351419
1736-Alpha [2] \(353312 \quad 14\)
100 [1] 35654
140 [1] 37046
143 [1] 370419
1st [1] 361325
- 2 -

20s [1] 361216
21st [1] 350420
22nd [2] 350419356416
23rd [5] 35044350719
354017356418,35652
2495-A [1] 356125
2495-Alpha [1] 356120
24th [3] 3504435318 ,
356223
26-year [1] 35168
200 [1] 370413
- 3 -

35-A 11\(] 35153\)
-

400111354017
4th [1] 350720
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline -5- \\
\hline 5-10-97 [1] 371022 \\
\hline -6- \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 630|1| 359215 \\
& 653|1| 354019
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline -7- \\
\hline \[
\begin{aligned}
& 720|1| 356424 \\
& 722|1| 354021
\end{aligned}
\] \\
\hline -8- \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

80s \(\{51361331315\)
369321370218
800 [4] 35022353920 ,
35641637044
\(\frac{-9-}{\frac{956[1] 357220}{-A-}}\)

A-B |11 36973
a m [6] 3502235585

35722021364116370418 A89-0095 [1] 35026
AA [10] 3603 6 3604822
3605713 18, 360710
362615363316363412
abeam [16] 35263353322
353471335355101621
3536510151735392
35421719354518
aberrations [1] 362417
abiltty [2] \(356610 \quad 358219\)
Able [1] 353814
able (21] 3515 3, 351714
35291173539415
35411735424,354312
3544233550735661
3567123569335913,
359213595 22, 3596 6,
36181363114366111
abnormailtues [1] 357325
aboard [8] 3513635968
363691316,36951013
17
abolsh [1] 36556
abolished [2] 365515
abolishing [2] 365423
36553
abrupt [3] 353034
absolute [1] 36837
Absolutely [5] 361612
36181536311,36399
364925
absolutely [1] 364320
abstracts [1] 35551
abuse [4] 35893360917
22361011
Academy [8] 35161021
35171351925358312
36112336521636944
academy [1] 351625
accept [1] 35225
accepted [1] 355511
access [1] 36154
accident [4] 35492536812 3682 7, 368820
accommodation [4] 370011
1225370114
accommodations [1] 36035
accomplish [2] 350448
accomplshed [1] 35795
accord [1] 361525
According [1] 35806
according [7] 351420 352912353719354410 356012357723368910
account [1] 357410
accounts [1] 35716
accurate [5] \(35578 \quad 357820\)
35821618371010 achievement [1] 3520 1
acquaint [2] 360128
act [4] \(3581 \quad 15 \quad 35917\)
36181636419
acting [2] 3618736408
action [4] 35084610
actrons [3] \(3555 \quad 16 \quad 35693\)
358114
active [3] \(3569414 \quad 357111\)
actuvities [3] \(359320 \quad 36015\)
12
activity [5] 357524358924

35912035944360019
actual [4] 353713360912
36154368910
adamant [1] 367620
add [2] \(357415 \quad 3601 \quad 10\)
addution [2] 35173361317
additional [1] 35307
address [7] \(355112 \quad 357614\)
35832361023,365019
3681 18, 36926
addresses [1] 36852
Adelphi [3] 3583141617
adequate [3] 356722
359515,18
adequately [1] 35811
adjomed [1] 367725
adjoming [1] 36806
adjourn [1] 370325
adjourned [1] 370417
adjust [3] \(354313 \quad 356312\)
35641
adjusted [3] 3525 14,
\(356313 \quad 357425\)
adjustment [1] 35639
administered [1] 351819
administration (1] 358314
admunistrative [2] 361223
36179
Admural [2] 351923366912
admit [1] 363216
admitted [7] 3514 21, 35155
8, 35611735621,365818
366317
adopted [3] 3680 24, 36815
8
adult [1] 35584
adults [1] 35589
advantage [1] 357020
adverse [1] 357123
advise (3) \(355520 \quad 361415\)
363018
advised [3] 360093602 25,
36478
advisor [3] 3654811
368222
affected [1] 355516
affection [1] 362215
affiluate [1] 358321
affilhates [1] 358325
afford [1] 358916
afrand [1] 364016
aftercare [13] 3603710
\(360482236057,9,18\),
360643607478 , 363314 363412
afternoon [10] 35401617
356023565535661922
2535681035925370416
afterwards [1] 369617
age [2] 356412
Agency [2] 36571517
agents [2] 3617 3, 365717
ages [1] 35776
agree [7] 350616354524
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3575 & 19 & 36378 & 3669 & 1314\end{array}\)
368524
agreed [2] 350522362824
agreement [1] 364619
aground [8] 35071719
3509 23, 24351013
351217358010

Aha [1] 351813
air [4] \(3569735701922 \quad 24\) Aurport [1] 359018
arport [2] \(359017 \quad 359311\)
Alamar [7] 365811214
368110153687736887
Alaska [18] 3517835194
3577436311936552023
36566836576151617
2136593 12, 366419
36812371021
Alaskan [1] 351720
akcoholc [6] 3511220
3595321361012367817 alcoholics [5] 360216
363216171921
alcoholsm [20] 358722
35941635962535984
36011636023411
360681418360823
\(36091720 \quad 22 \quad 2536103\)
12361522363214
alert [8] \(3548 \quad 22 \quad 355821 \quad 24\)
355931435606356219
356510
alerting \{5] 35692235707
1435724357824
alertness [22] 355918
3560252225356167
3562935632021356515
35689111621356910
123572635787357911
1335806
alerts [1] 357022
align [1] 354421
alugned [1] 354310
allegations [1] 36223
allow [2] \(356421 \quad 367212\)
allowing [1] 356923
allows (1] 355619
alone [1] 356021
alumnus [1] 351925
amıable [1] 35079
amid (1) 351014
amidships [2] 351015
35476
amiss [1] 35972
Amount [1] 36694
amount [3] 354222356713
357920
analyss [1] 356818
analyze [1] 35564
analyzing [1] 352018
anchor [1] 362219
Anchorage [3] \(35178 \quad 13 \quad 17\)
anchorage [1] 367212
anchored [1] 367614
Andre [1] 350424
Andy [1] 362813
angle [3] \(35298 \quad 13 \quad 35301\)
angles [1] 35504
answer [18] 35072224
3541710354614358017
358111358217363512
36416,836431620
364437936851636866
answered [2] 351020
362619
anticipated [1] 368910
anybody (9] 350721
35462036022236034

3615136332036438
367319368721
anymore [3] 35102436559 36571
apart [1] 362222
apartment [1] 362725
apnea [2] \(35575 \quad 35668\)
apologize [1] 35553
apparently [1] 350413
appear [2] 352617369724
appears [1] 360022
applicabulty (1] 369017
appicable [1] 365625
application [1] 35307
applied [4] \(3530 \quad 10 \quad 353111\)
356614368820
applies [2] \(357318 \quad 368914\)
apply [5] 358019358223
536903
apprecrate [1] 365015
approach [7] 352618
3539735511735573
35611035991636669
approprıate [6] 354412
35672136088362821
36831417
approvals (1] 365412
approximate [2] 35446
358521
Approxamately [4] 354628 369315
approximately [10] 353424
3564233612103642717
36751036941836967
3697737011
approximating [1] 3563 11
April [5] 35042036316
36442436462436506
arcane [1] 35553
Architects [2] 35172325
architects [1] 351520
architectural [1] 361214
architecture [7] 351615
351711351924352067 1735214
Arco [14] 353881035404

1835436354916
arcts [1] 35697
area [30] 3508 13, 19

35792359111362125
366011163661136629
1136632036644617
3669121316367025
3671236722036888
\(369019 \quad 20 \quad 24 \quad 25 \quad 36913\)
areas [8] 351324362424
\(\begin{array}{llll}3668 & 19 & 23 & 25 \\ 3669 & 2 & 6\end{array}\)
aren't [3] 36823368423
369011
arena [1] 35594
arrse [1] 359020
ansing [1] 359023
Arm [2] \(350823 \quad 352220\)
arranged [1] 35889
arrangements [3] 358925 359046
arrival [3] 350625361824
367614
arrived [3] \(353923 \quad 369614\)

36975
arrives [1] 354019
arriving [1] 354020
artucies [5] 352034
3554142535753
ascertan [2| 3563735694
ashore [2] \(3612 \quad 11 \quad 3695 \quad 17\)
asking [4] 35194357516
359418368211
\(\begin{array}{lllll}\text { asleep }[11] & 3556 & 13 & 15 & 17\end{array}\)
18355838182435604
35621114
aspect [3] \(3566 \quad 23 \quad 357413\) 364817
aspects [3] \(356921 \quad 357718\)
358422
Aspland [1] 35415
asset [1] 36294
assugned [1] 36663
assugment [71 3586567
359023608336389
370215
assignments [1] 351712
Assist [2] 36702021
assıst [2] \(358425 \quad 367018\)
assistant [3] 35841136548 11
Associated [1] 360625
assocuated [3] 358423
359320360013
Associates |11 351524
associates \(\{2 \mid 361912 \quad 22\)
assoctation [1] 36071
assoctations [11 351721
Assume [2] 3532736417
assume \(\left[\begin{array}{llllll}37] & 3531 & 10 & 15 & 17\end{array}\right.\)
23253532279353519
353614353721721
3542183543222335615
36092536151236234
3639223655810366220
366425367328368711
1222368821368923
369824370114
assumed [5] 353325
36021936103361521
36307
assumes 12135342035379
Assuming [1] 363823
assuming [8] 3532522
353420356613359520
\(360620 \quad 3615619\)
assumptron [10] 355614
35613357710359418
359524636151113
36165
assumptrons [2] 356224
368122
Atlantic [2] \(35173 \quad 362218\)
attained [1] 355319
attempt [4] 35632135682
35741336332
attempted [4] 3562835637
35741522
attemptang [1] 358113
attend (1] 360710
attending [3] 360748
363316
attention [3] 35051735127
3696 I
attributable [1] 357213

August [4| \(359713 \quad 360314\) 16
author 111368225
authored [1] 355421
authority 12135851036874 authors |1| 370323
automate [1] 354923
automation [1] 352323
automobile [1] 35249
autopilot [6] \(3518 \quad 12 \quad 14\)
35493636692236707
available [4] 350622
355013355524358213
average [2] \(356316 \quad 19\)
avold [2] \(3538 \quad 19 \quad 3672 \quad 10\)
avoided [1] 354816
awake [11 357723
award \(121351923 \quad 35201\)
awards [4] \(3519 \quad 22 \quad 23 \quad 25\) 35202
aware \{251 3504267
35112235123353514
35386355025357419
3587912359611360012
36061336331364224
36432636686366925
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3681 & 25 & 3682 & 3 & 19 & 3684 \\ 19\end{array}\)
23
awareness [1] 36402
awful [2] \(361710 \quad 12\)
axes [1] 35626
axts [5] 35572435582
356271020

\section*{- B -}
bachelor [5] 351611
355320358313369489
background [5] 35169
35831036112236282125
balance [1] 36295
ball [1] 355720
baloney [2] 36791623
bar [4] \(35649 \quad 359217\)
366613369122
bars [2| 356445
basell| 370025
Based 12 ) 3668 /4 366915
based |12| 350812356321
356583566435684
3589636196362024
36282036373364124,
366725
Bastcally [2] 365412
365918
basically [5] 355219
36562536598367018
36754
basis (18) 355515356716
35712135721114
3582153596172536179
36191136288362914
364424364538365312
36651625
Baton [14] 350710361822
362023363543642911
365613674121736756
3679111215
Bay [3] \(3508 \quad 23 \quad 351719\)
36951
bay [1] 367615

Baytown (10] 350711
359013359115361316
3621173631111236428
36461236561
Beach (1) 361316
bearing [1] 35698
beast [1] 36772
beautiful [1] 37042
becomes [2] 35652122
bed [3] 355616356423 357123
bedroom [8] 3677202123
253678151315
beep [1] 35578
beer [5] 35118363820
3639232425
begins [6] 352310352725
35281035371935401
35809
begun (1] 35285
behalf [3] 3590736808
369215
behaving [1] 36269
behavior [3] 3565 11
36241618
behind [2] 366217367213
beings [1] 363523

belreves (I) 366912
believing (1) 35971
bell (1] 354922
belonged (1) 35195
Ben (4) \(358813 \quad 3600922\) 24
bench [1] 36669
benches \([2] 36962022\)
benefit [1] 353621
Bencta (4) 361025361110 36551824
besides [2] \(350623 \quad 357718\)
beverage [3] 3511221
367817
bigger |l| 36614
Blll (15) \(355623 \quad 3618521\)
36192451120362069
362334362814364317 36548
bill [1] 36309
binding [1] 368215
brological 16\(] 3560 \quad 13 \quad 19\)
3563235661835701920
bxology [1] 356624
burds [1] 36946
bit [21] 35212354212
3547233552335838
359320359621359818
3611223617143624215
173625915363224
\(363943648 \quad 1836541314\) 367413
Blandford 1!1 35042
blank [1] 351811
Bligh [18] 352921353923
73540222535411
35437123664936676
\(367025 \quad 3671 \quad 1213 \quad 36901\)
block [2] 36232021
blown [2] 3509136614
blue [10] 35222035346
3537911354618356315 16356721
board [9] 350211357320 360410360731736191 \(36247367715 \quad 370017\)
boarded [2] 36851819
boarding [2] 3510336978
boats [1] 36694
bodies [3] 35752135765 21
body [4] 356015356314 357318
books [2] 35542122
booze [1] 362223
Borgen [11] 36282236299
18363039364322 ,
36444111436478
boring [1] 35702
boss [1] 36842
Boston [2] 355216
bought [2] 36971921
bouncing [1] 355720
bow 1131352891035296
3531182025353249
\(3534910 \quad 25 \quad 35371118\)
box (1) 356413
boxes [1] 356410
boy (1] 36281
bracing [1] 35697 :
brackets [1] 356515
BRAUER [1] 371021
break [4] 3572 17, 362623
36411213
breath (4) \(351021 \quad 3511911\)
Bran (1) 359914
bridge \(\{471351056718\)
35111835327354325
354413545213546710

3569711357915365414
3661233662736635
36641736661923
36671020233668127
17368259
\(\begin{array}{llllll}17 & 25 & 3684 & 1 & 3687 & 18 \\ 24\end{array}\)
36889151823369014
brief (4) 35549365012
368614369122
briefly [4] 35361920
35651235842
Brigham [5] \(3552 / 13511\) 355323
Bristol (1) 351719
broad 151353125353249 \(355220 \quad 357612\)
Brooklyn [16] 353881017 213539317181935401 35421535436354916 35501436124362723 brute [1] 365025
built [2] \(361315 \quad 18\)
bunch [2] \(367923 \quad 369719\)
buoy (3) \(3570 \quad 12 \quad 3676 \quad 10 \quad 11\)
buoys [1] 367610
\(\begin{array}{llllll}\text { Busby }|31| & 3526 & 13 & 14 & 22\end{array}\) 352713533223534714 353551016213536610 \(\begin{array}{llllll}15 & 17 & 3542171935444\end{array}\) \(18 \quad 3545183546435698\) 3659242536601116 367317
busmess [5] 35152135164
35831436122361411


C-U-S-H-I-N-G [1] 351823 cadet [2] 351623
caffeme [3] \(3571 \quad 18 \quad 20 \quad 25\)
calculation [1] 355018
calibrated [1] 358123
Calıforna [3] 355311
361025361110
Call [5] 3502435517
3610 16, 3650 10, 11
call [30] 35042425,35054
7350716351410358222
3587151617,358811
3602 2, 183609736102
1736195362724,362914
3671 21, 3672 3, 367719
3678 4, 3679 8, 9, 36897
3692137007
calls [4] 357012363117
367222367414
calm [1] 37028
Cambridge [1] 355115
canned [1] 36751
cans [1] 363925
capability [1] 358615
Cape [10] 365622366111
1736621111320
3663 21, 366619
captan [47] 35031,1619
243506535105,8921
3511101120,35512 ,
3570123585722,35876
35915360318360818
3615123618636192 ,
36212236281314
\(36301436348 \quad 23,364013\)
3644143647 12, 366817
3671 16, 173672 3, 3673 13,
\(\begin{array}{llll}3675 & 7141718 & 368724\end{array}\)
36891370224370310
captans [11] 350512
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3508 & 6 & 10 & 3585101215\end{array}\)
358823617136483
3655312
captroned [1] 371011
car (1] 356610
car-pooled [2] 364422
36451
care [6] \(35521415 \quad 36055\)
2536191719
career [4] \(35168 \quad 365220\) 21369412
 16
carefully [2] 35531363719
cargo [1] 35166
Carr [1] 36973
carried [5] 35322435359
10353912354222
carriers [2] 351667
Carskadon [1] 355624
case [16] 35026353116
3535153538335416
354324355121355422
356863573235915
36151936161363212
37043371011
cases [1] 35511
casual [1] 367421
catch [2] \(3618 \quad 22 \quad 364523\)
categonzed [1] 358022
category [1] 35616
caught [2] 354822367425
caused [6] 353045
35741135992436006 ,
366720
caution [1] 352615
cauthonary [2] 35274
356623
cavaher [1] 368522
Center [7] 3509 13, 15,
35112435124 12, 367011 17
center [2] 35306360210
Centerport [1] 365022
CERTIFY [1] 37108
cham [1] 36468
charman [1] 350210
challenge [1] 362323
CHALOS [27] 3650 24,
36582811 13, 19, 21, 23
366015366216 18, 19,
36631319366616
36732236811236871 1,
369118243692111721
\(23 \quad 37029370318\)
Chalos [2] 351411365013
chance [12] 358816
35911036054,2336062
51222360725363124
36763370123
change [10] 35081,13
351212,352617353034
362625365624367118
368017
changed [1] 35128
changeover [2] 3504 4, 9
changes [1] 362418
changing [2] 35124352313
Channel (1] 3669 I
chapter [1] 36821
characteristic [2] 358023
35812
characteristucs [1] 362421
characterized [1] 35777
charge [1] 36674
charged [1] 363322
CHARLES [2] 351511
35458
Charles [6] 351410351513
\(15 \quad 16 \quad 17 \quad 351822\)
Charieston [1] 361315
chart [35] 35131935142
35229192125352312
352923353320353620
2535392535401535427
3543163545151635498
14153557915355916
356021243562435804
736472236602366314
36734
36871236907
charter [1] 365413
charts [4] 353921354510
35491113
chatted [1] 358912
chattung [1] 35968
check [3] 3507236391
364220
checked [4] 351418
360210362223364218
checking [3] 35871836023 4
chemical [2] 35892
chief [12] \(360818 \quad 362121\)
3652467824365321
3666236722123369323
Chırıqu [6] 36221736562
3674 5, 36761014367912
chronically [2] 3567517
Chunks [1] 350825
curcadıan [5] 356018
3576223577715358122
circle [2] 350317369010
curcled [2] 350319354623
crreumstances [3] 351117
355520,35706
crte [1] 363823
Cty [3] \(351522 \quad 36421113\)
city [1] 361125
civi [1] 35026
clarnfied [1] 35188
clarnfy [1] 365618
classified [1] 360621
classmate [1] 367419
clean [2] 363029
clear [12] 357012336125
36237363724364615
36495,36696367712
3689 15, 2236906
CLERK [19] 35023351414
163518719355181116
3572 19, 35822435831
36101922364115
36501618369235
370417
clumb [3] 37001337012
Clmbed [1] 369812
Clinic (1] 3552 I1
clunce [2] 355125355217
clenceal (3) 3552141521
clock [14] 35282356015
18193563243577237
16202325358122
clocks [3] \(357622 \quad 2325\)
closer [2] 3543836694
closest [2] 35397354418
closure [4] \(350510 \quad 15 \quad 19\) 350616
co-author [1] 370324
Coast [14] 35131013
35145351612351914
361293654193661721
36691136702336714
3672610
cosst [36] 3584121520
3585 3, 151622358614
3587 4, 359012360817
361320,232536211819
362310192136281315
2236291112363149
364411364618365315
36552536565367515
cocktal [1] 360322
Code [1] 36822
coffee [16] \(357125 \quad 6 \quad 12\)
\(\begin{array}{llll}14 \quad 18 \quad 22 & 24 & 35723 & 7\end{array}\)
35791418202325
cogitate [1] 360715
cold [5] 35697,35702022 23, 357913
coldness [1] 357020
collected [41 3556835613
3568737028
College (1] 351616
colliston [1] 369111
collssons [2] 369117
colloqual (7] 35595
\(357517 \quad 203576461419\)
color [3] 353723354056
Columbra [1] 350823
combmation [1] 35308
comfortable [2] 358911
362512
coming [11] 350512
3570101136232336574
367291736844368711
13369121
command [2] 3547436468
commandant [1] 3669 11
Commander [11] 350215
350422350524350638
11 35072350921351018
2336735
commander [1] 350411
commanding [1] 35065
commence [3] 35028 ,
354218354420
commenced [1] 352322
comment [5] 35672
36032536052236376
368021
Commssion [1] 371022
commission [1] 351613
committed [2] \(3581 \quad 12\)
358216
committees [3] 35191315
18
common [2] 35596357821
communicate [1] 367013
communication [2] 351216
354611
communicatrons [2] 35058 350914
Compantes [1] 35173
companronway [1] 3700 10
Company (13) 351519
358410163586835872
3606133612212536132
82023364225
company [10] 351624
360018360173606815
362817363322367425
367620
compare [1] 366822
compared [2] 3543536692
comparison [1] 3669 I
complain [1] 35575
complete [4] 350510
3518101135474
completely [1] 365424
complex [2] 358024358116
complance [2] 36655
366622
comply [3] 35132366513
36838
complying [1] 368421
components [1] 35569
comport \{1] 363811
computer [1] 36438
con (1] 351815
concervably [1] 356924
concept [1] 357613
concern [2] 3627636433 concerned [7] 357324
3591336073362216 3626213630110
concerning [3] 36077
36081636148
conclude [7] 355515
\(35671215 \quad 20357211\)
35811636597
concluded [1] 36598 concludes [1] 35097
conclusion-[2] 35813
358214
conclusions [3] 356568
35814
Condition [5] 368819
\(\begin{array}{llll}3689 & 13 & 18 & 20 \\ 3690 & 3\end{array}\)
condition [2] 367018
368312
conditions ( 10 이 35508
35531435561521
3562123683610368919 conduct [1] 36748
conducted [6] 35227
3549243606815368614 21
conductung [1] 360010
conference [4] 359220
35931036316369123
conferences \(\{5] 359825\)
363116253632325
confidence |II 362624
confident |11 366722
confidentral [1] 36032
conflict [1] 359223
confront [4] \(3639910 \quad 12\)
18
connection [2] 355519
356818
conning [1] 354714
consequence [1] 357414
consequences [1] 36263
conservative [1] 356813
conservatively [1] 356816
consider [1113525 20
35447103567435701
35757121635988
3642836531
considered [4] 35418
3557335692235718
considering [2] 354220
354412
consist [1] 355219
consisted [1] 364013
consustent [6] 350714
356016358218360423
364224
consistang [1] 366123
constantly [1] 36176
constructed [2] 35374 35745
construction [4] 35165
3517 5, 3612 19, 36137
consulted [1] 350620
consume [1] 357923
consumed [3] 35112
357119358621
consuming [1] 351120
consumption [4] 3571 7, 20,
35721357921
CONT'D [1] 350217
contact \(14 \mid 3603136456\)
15365718
contacted [1] 365719
contacts [2] 3620236216
contans 11137109
context [3] 3581 4836391
continuation [1] 35026
Contanue [1] 352711
contunue [6] 350215
35291835944361211
365311367115
continued [5] 3526311
\(352919353025 \quad 362515\)
continues [4] 351319
352312353824360413
continuously [2] 355315
358324
contract |1] 369225
contracting [1] 361310
contractors [1] 36175
contradict [2] 3578335798
contrary [2] \(357413 \quad 36228\)
contributed [1] 356820
contributes [1] 3569 11
contributōr (1] 355424
control [6] 35241358423
359523361523362720
36823
controlled [2] 3553 / 4
conventions [1] 351916
conversation \(\{421350219\)
2335031535092022
3532 /1 3590243591213
359313153594536045
3621136298101617
3635161025,363636 ,
2136373415172025
363823639136444 ,
364951315
173675111323368517
conversations [9] 361989
362653629836364
\(3637213 \quad 36493\)
Cook III 3517 IS
cool [1] 37028
coordination [11 3624 14
Copenhagen [1] 3521 22
copies [2] 3549 II 15
copy [2] 356111359915
Corporation (1] 3502 11
corrected [1] 351824
correctly [5] 350419
350610351214356525
358025
correlation [1] 35592
corresponds [1] 356514
cost [2] \(358423 \quad 361713\)
Counsel [1] 37045
counsel [1] 355514
counseled [1] 362420
counter [2] 354735
countermeasure [1] 35725
counterpart [2] 362822
362911
country [1] 36805
couple [13] 35175354515
355925360815,36207
36212363643646 11,
3648136492,22366120
36964
courses [2] 351314354221

Bene Syntome Apphandic:
Court [13] 3502489
351491735209352217
3523235344353523
353814358222361017
court [6] 35189352124
357219364115368216
370417
courtesy [1] 363017
Cousins 1400 353124
353210353515353614
35421835461221
355516213556635635
17356421335659
356753568161921
356933570335711
357271235732122
35746243577212
3578716357914
358021435811420
358216367224
cover [3] \(3508 \quad 23 \quad 35091\)
365813
covered [1] 361720
covers [1] 355222
Crag [1] 3579 /1
crew [1] 369523
critsism [1] 363023
crop [1] 35967
CROSS 17135091035458
357224359912363210
36801370211
cross [4] 35082535099
35122435131
cross-examine [3] 357216 23359910
crossed [2] \(3526 \quad 12 \quad 13\)
crossing (1) 35146
crude [1] 362218
cultural [1] 3566 /8
cultures \(121356621 \quad 23\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}\text { cup } & \text { (4) } 3571 & 13 & 14 & 22\end{array}\)
357925
cups [3] 35711217357924
cured (1) 363219
curnosity 111354125
currous (11) 36752
Currently [1] 369225
currentiy [1] 3613 11
curnculum [1] 35554
 curves (3) 3535735502 356319
curving [2] 35367354012
CUSHING 1213515 II
35458
Cushing [24] 351410
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3515 & 13 & 15 & 16 & 19 & 24\end{array}\) 35182235203352110 352271535236352711 35311035331035378 35383354153542717 354318354521112 custom |1] 359915 cycled [1] 350417
- D -
dad \(|3| 36287363848\) dauly \([3] \begin{array}{lllllll}3644 & 24 & 3645 & 3 & 15\end{array}\) damage [1] 35077
Dan [2] 36332123
danger [5] 3671791017 3691 11
Danish [1] 351622
dark [3] 35379 11
data [19] \(35508 \quad 35568\)
35612356316356579
35663356793568236
13357451935752
35781035801358213
date 17135852135863
35932036002363515
36932136968
DATED [1] 371014
dates [2] 35031035644
David [3] 35687131358113
day [31] \(350720 \quad 353811\)
35391617355762325
3558116355925356311
3567113568635711220
2135741214357817
3579152235806359211
133603173617436453
36861037032537042
371014
day-to-day [2] 364221
36458
daybreak [1] \(3567 \quad 17\) 7)
dayglow [2] 3536335406
daylught (3) 365618 22,
36618
days [11] 3504171822
356222356781336174
3635143645136964
daytume [1] 366920
dead [1] 36937
deal (10) 357093573913
35951836173362123
\(362423362717 \quad 362810\)
36312
deals [2] 364225368115
dear [1] 36284
decent [1] 363915
decide [2] \(360120 \quad 363710\)
deciswn [6] 35084351716
35861636461936471
36684
decision-making [2| 36473
4
deck [111 35162335172
352110355613567711
\(366124369823 \quad 370017\)
37011737035
declare (11-3665 22
decrease (3) 35602368319 22
decreases [1] 35605
deemed [1] 350813
deep (1) 35433
Defendants [10] 35141920
21352216353311
\(3538131354318 \quad 354411\)
356125
defendants [5] 35097
35512035551436742
36921
Defense [1] 35429
defense [1] 35428
define (1) 35669
defintion [1] 368913
definitions [1] 355910


351711352819352914 18353089353217
353345353420353549
1935361589353714
2122353913354217
3544203553202123
35669357013358313
361124369489
degrees [31] 35125912
13352313163526111
3527103528121335299
10133531111353211
15353323534235375
233547910354834
3553 18, 36724
delegate [1] 351916
delegation [1] 351915
delivery [1] 361310
Delozier [7] 35022225
35035351019354620
36722223
Dement [1] 355624
demonstrate [1] 35229
demonstrating [1] 353524
denote [1] 35597
departed [2] 369425
369823
Department [1] 358410
department (11] 35841316
359421360222360313
4,3612173613236152
363321
departments [1] 361225
departure [1] 3507 l
depend [3] 36601718
367510
dependency [2] 35893
36332
depicted (2] 35581035639 depicts [1] 355715
deposed [2] 363557
deposition [13] 35021015
356916357936358017
359915363212363515
36361364010364323
depositional [5] 355523
3564113567735702
35742
deprived [3] 35674617
describe [5] 35592435696
3575173579235842
described [10] 35325
35331735347353712,
35541335652435762
35811336108362516
describes \((5) 356815\)
3569535742357510
369018
describing [1] 36045
description [3] 3565 11
3571817
design (3) 358614361219
361310
designated [3] 35141
368447
designed [2] 3517435822
designer [1] 361215
designs [1] 35165
desires [1] 35144
desk [1] 365415
destroyed (1] 36283
detall [2] 35682436181
detaled [1] 360525
details [5] 3593135945
3621436331214
detect [1] 35966
determination [3] 354625
35472135495
determune [22] 3517 13,
3521203522835291
3530935391535411725
35424354712 15, 16, 17
18354918355010,1719
213558213574 22, 358012
determmed [2] 35298
35317
determining [1] 35633
develop [1] 356624
developed [3] 3556 22,
\(358018 \quad 362318\)
development [3] 3556 23,
35684361220
deviate [1] 35144
deviated [2] 3509 3, 6
deviations [2] 35146
357719
dıagnose [1] 355218
dragnosis [10] 35574
359412 14, 18 19,-25,
3609 12, 36142236154
36161
Dick [1] 35731
Drego [1] 365119
differ [1] 35588
Difference [1] 36499
dnfference [4] 36091619
364820364920
dufferentating [1] 36072
differently [1] 364821
dificult [2] 360749
dafficulty [1] 350517
dugnity [2] 3626924
dimmish [1] 362412
Dinges [6] 35687357545
21357810358113
DIRECT [7] 350217351511
3551183583536112,
365023369210
Direct [1] 363123
direct [14] 35098354022
356793585 14, 35876
36016360313623725
3627233634336396
36961
drrected [1] 35104
drection [7] 35231335283
35303354311366124,
36822371013
directions [1] 35502
durector [3] \(355125 \quad 355210\)
disabulty [1] 359425
disagree [2] 36383366913
dscharged [2] 370056
dscipline [1] 359325
disciplined [3] 358917
36062324
dscretion [7] 3668136707
36712536833 12, 21
36894
discuss [10] 35063,35491
359412360578919
3628113639436477
dscussed (19] 35047
35065935071354111 1535791235942136047 891011360510360813 21360910361418362814 discussing [I] 361414 discussion [12] 356711
35941,360525360819
361483615136343
36351036361636434
3647236555
discusswons [5] 36076
36351136431721
disease [2] 357721359624
dislike [1] 36254
Disorder [1] 355125
disorder [1] 35535
Disorders [1] 355210 disorders [8] 3552141823
3554 6, 113555935574 35615
display [1] 355417
dsruptave [2] 3571 23,
35724
dassect [1] 35811
distance [3] 35268353625
35396
distunct [1] 362715
dstunction [1] 36105
dinders [1] 353624
dock [3] 3656223693 4,
369823
Doctor [1] 355511
doctor [1] 35528
document [1] 368115
documents [3] 35279
35552535561
Doesn't [1] 355718
doesn't [12] 35472335618
35661357411357716
358010363811366423
36811836853368721
368810
dogs [1] 36178
door [3] 35823365611
36985
doors [2] 36207364611
dots [1] 35488
doubt [2] \(\begin{array}{llll}3649 & 13 & 16\end{array}\)
downtown [1] 361214
doze [1] 357722
Dr [19] 355172035535
35558355623355714
35624356723568718
35721035731357417
35754521357810
357911358113
dramatically [1] 357124
drank [1] 357914
draw [1] 36105
drawers [1] 36789
drawing (1) 35441
drew [2] 356578
drift [1] 35504
drifted [1] 350825
drunk [6] 359522360412
36071336326367714
369516
drinker [2] 37021618
Drinking [2] 359967
drunking [39] 3571 \(10 \quad 12\)

357273599253604910
23360581836151314
36161536181014
362311153626223
362713629233630710
36323363512363817
364014364219364310
1536447367424367524
367824368613369513 23370213
drinks [2] 35712236325
Drive [1] 365021
drive [1] 356610
drop [1] 365922
dropped [4] 36592436608
36992237001
drunk [1] 360411
due [3] 35252535268 35279
Duncan [8] 36548368221 22243683234
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}\text { duration } & 14 & 3578 & 12 & 13 & 15\end{array}\) 18
Dutch [1] 351719
dutes [9] 35043355213
3584193611111336139 36415710
duty [3] \(\begin{array}{lllll}3564 & 24 & 3602 & 19\end{array}\) 364123
DWIGHT [3] 36112363210
364724
Dwight [4] 359714361018 24367521
DX [2] 3658836897
DX1744 [3] 355712356115 17
DX2476 [1] 365725
DX3483 [1] 36583
DX3495-Alpha [1] 3561 11
DX9172 [2] 36631417
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
eagerness [1] 364017
earlest [1] 350311
early \(\{14\} \begin{array}{llll}3507 & 18 & 3517 & 13\end{array}\)
353919356625356810
12358523359212
\(\begin{array}{lll}359713 & 36133 & 363510\end{array}\)
364625370218
easier [2] \(362417 \quad 36657\)
easily [1] 358022
east [2] 36552225
easy [2] 362416366913
eat [1] 367714
edge [2] \(3543 \quad 25354422\)
edited (1] 355421
edition [1] 369016
editor [1] 355423
education (1] 3612 11
educational [4] 35169
355318358310,361122
effect [6] \(352918 \quad 359318\)
362823365425367645
effective [1] 36617
efficient [1] 361113
effort [1] 362424
efforts [1] 360513
exght [9] 352719353020
35466113560735653
35741235805370417

Eught-tenths [1] 35399
elght-tenths [2] 353612
35398
elaborate [1] 35101
elected (1] 35671
electronic (1) 351412
Ellenwood [7] 364422
36456911151617
elsewhere [2] 351316 35549
employed [7] 355120
36115 6-36514 6369224
369312
employees [2] 35871
361925
employer [5] \(36825 \quad 6 \quad 10\)
1215
employment [1] 355124
empty [1] 363925
enable [1] 35822
encompass [1] 35645
encounter [1] 366824
end \([8] 35148 \quad 356310\)
3564835852336089
3650636531537006
endocrmology [4] 355223
3554535731014
endorsement [8] 365325
3654336592036663
3680103687141618
ends [2] 354012
engune [6] 351014,352412 3354922
enguneer [7] 3585836129
369318193694210 36972
engmeering [101 351615
3583133611242536134
692436232036949
Engmeers [2] 351724
35181
engineers [4] 351520
36081836162536201
Enghsh [1] 36691
enhance [3] 35861420
369024
Enjoy [1] 370416
enjoy [2] \(362521 \quad 3704\) /
enjoged (2) 362522 3631 20
entering [1] 36905
entries [1] 353318
entry [2] 356512
environmental [1] 36914
epsode [3] \(356419 \quad 3565 \quad 13\)
equipment [1] 35435
equipped [2] 35122435281
erased [2] 35041718
error [4] 3578 22, 358022
24, 358117
errors [8] \(3565 \quad 23 \quad 358014\)
21,35811111214
358215
essentally [1] 361614
ESSO [2] 35846361216
establish [2] 3550835822
eatablished [1] 35488
estumate [9] 355722
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3563 & 19 & 35684 & 14 & 16\end{array}\)
3571183577535781022
estumated [2] 356210
356412
estumates [2] 3556220
estumation [1] 362423
evaluate [3] 355121
\(355217 \quad 355514\)
evaluation [3] 355312
35891036197
evasive \(\{2] 3618 \quad 20 \quad 21\)
evening [14] 35232135317
35401921356057
35648356812359212
3696710133699111
event [3] 35872335921
360425
events [1] 356824
eventually [1] 361216
Everybody (1) 370112
everybody [3] 364021
370116370320
evidence [9] 351418
352215353310354318
24356751535711
365815
ex|l| 365113
exact [3] 3586336107
369321
Exactly [7] 35581922
\(355913 \quad 2035621736786\)
3688 I1
exactly [13] 35057350646
350725351115355822
3564235931360610
3619236402236562
36882
EXAMINATION 1191350217
35091035151135458
35511835722435816
3583535991236095
36112363210364724
3650233673 24, 36801
\(368625 \quad 3692103702\) 11
exammatron [1] 357321
examine \(\{3135453356823\)
367925
exammed [2] 357322
358120
EXAMINER [3] 350218
35091136835
example [11135574 35614
35666103569435719
35768363821363924
\(367725 \quad 368710\)
EXCEL [5] \(\begin{array}{llllll}3586 & 10 & 13 & 17\end{array}\)
3597 9, 359817
excellence [1] 351924
excellent [1] 363021
exceptron [1] 360413
excerpt [1] 36896
excessively [1] 35576
excited [1] 369124
Exclude [1] 364319
exclusively [1] 358624
Excuse [5] 35451355710
113614236601
excuse [1] 362916
executed [4] 35342135356
35365353710
executing [1] 35433
exercises [1] 358612
Exhybt [20] 35141921
35221216353311
353813,35429354319

354411355712356113 \(16 \quad 18212535622\) 3647173663151836898 exhibit [9] \(3522 \quad 19 \quad 35428\) 35581035611235657 357456365825
Exhibits (3) 35141922 35159
exhibits [5] 35141124
3515735732036584
exist [1] 358213
exists [1] 364224
exat [1] 354222
extted [1] 353810
exts [1] 354010
expanded [1] 356221
expect \(\{11\} 35659356712\)
357063572835961213
3671452023
expectations [1] 359322
expected [2] 36716369110
experience [11] 350821
351619 20, 35194357819
3588242536536366725
366814366915
experienced [1] 35077
experument (1] 35738
experimental [2] 355625
35744
experuments [5] 355224
355333573912
expert 114135201012
352223555835755810
111235782435792410 expertise [1] 352012
Expres (1) 371022
Explain [1] 352324
explan \(\{13\) ) 35221635344 35352335377353814 355714356410356725 35772235818364819 3671816
explanations (1] 357724 expression [1] 368012 extend [1] 350822 extending 11 ) 35094 extensive (1) 35568 extent [4] 3505935726 357425364122
external [11 356020
extra (3) 36554366124
36656
extrapolate [1] 35752
extrapolating [1] 357117 extremely [1] 358019 eye \([2] \begin{array}{llll}3588 & 18 & 3624 & 13\end{array}\) eyebrow (4) 35672535682 1535788
\[
-F-
\]
facilty [1] 3553 /1
fact \(132 \mid 35326 \quad 353510\)
35492735661935714 35741135771357816 357917358925359818
3607193614836164 36192536212536228 36231636242036261 363131317363219 36331236738368115

36821
370323
factor [4] 35565356924
\(357020 \quad 357824\)
factors [1] 356819
facts [10] 35311516
35325635552035664
3574223575336018
363823
fauled [2] 355711,358115
faur [15] \(357013 \quad 35824\)
3599223601636051721
36066360871036309
3641193642636448
364717368311
faurly [10] \(351920 \quad 35617\),
356363593736178
36182336232536359
\(3637243648 \quad 12\)
FALKENSTEIN [2] 350217 350910
Falkensten [2] 350216
36735
fall [15] \(35561315 \quad 1718\), 355838182435604
3562111335771316
35809363118 . 7
fallen [4] 36191536268
36302364014
familar [6] 35093354615
357912367424368416
36872
families (I) 36282
family [1] 362216
fashon [2] 356516360416
fast (1] 361515
faster [2] 35557355615
father [2] 363719364916
fathom [8] 3503 2, 1925
\(354623 \quad 36731141720\)
fatigue (5) \(35758 \quad 1011 \quad 21\) 357621
fatugued [4] 35595357514
\(18 \quad 357610\)
fax III 365724
fear [1] 361813
features [1] 355925
February [7] 35992236002 71736029369418
federal [2] 365415368016
feeder (11) 351719
feel [14] 35141235593
3567243576910358020
35918359316361723
36252036372364024
366517
feeling [3] 35087362715
feels [1] 35743
feet \(16 \mid 369711369857\)
37001637011
fell [1] 3616 /4
fellow [5| 3517243518 1
36442236652037025
felt [13) 35891135969
3605232123361717
362512362717363017
36558366722
field [10] 35534715
355410357558101112 35791
figure [5] 35394354724

3578936043362510
figuring [1] 367621
final [1] 368024
find [9] \(356715 \quad 357717\)
36157361914362223
36571136767,367817
37025
Fine [1] 357217
fine [3] 3630236604

\section*{369725}
finest [1] 36252
firm [6] 35151925,35165
8, 19361214
First [3] 35432354717 35626
first [47] 35091235157
35181135238,35249 ,
3528 22, 3532 15, 17 23,
35341235381835539
1335572435592435601
3564 13, 3572 17, 35745 ,
358213583113592 8, 10
359918361610,361811 ,
36271636361236375 ,
21, 3639 8, 36493365123,
365223653 9, 36578 19,
36613 5, 6366420
3682 20, 3687 16, 36898 ,
3699 20, 370215
fishing [I] 36694
fit [8] 35616,356313
357425360621362010
36261036295,36468
fits [1] 35772
Five [1] 35266
five [26] 3525 12, 1617
352653527 6, 352920
353124353411353519,
3536159,3541 12, 35479
3560103565243566511
153567335711236134,
36352124363625364216
fix [6] 3523 11, \(353615 \quad 20\)
2223
fixed (1] 356018
fixes [3] 35424354915
356019
fixing [2] \(356015 \quad 35632\)
flagged [2] 351622,361114
flashung [3] 35312435324
8
floor [2] 359222359310
focus [1] 363422
focused [2] 355422356014
folks [3] 3596935974
360013
follow [9] \(352620 \quad 353711\)
2535504355520355720
361813633936387
follow-up [1] 35989
followed [12] 352222
35272335301435332
3534101735361,6
35792136229,36272
369018
following [4] 35681735805
36171936797
follows [1] 36834
fond [1] 362215
forced [1] 35767
forces [1] 357614
foregoing [2] 3710 9, 11
forever [1] 354710
forgot [1] 369124
form [5] 3589 19, 35954
3603736248
formal [1] 35545
formaluze [1] 36081
formed [2] 351618361616
former [1] 365115
Fort [1] 351617
forth [4] 3572 2, 3622 4,
3676836836
forthright [1] 36396
forward [4] 3519335314
3605 3, 363217
forwards [1] 35838
found [6] 357193581 12,
3587 13, 362013368012 ,
36817
four [7] 35121935324,8
3534113548135525
362020
Fox [1] 35118
frame [7] 356613358420
3585183620242536383
364625
France [1] 352121
Francisco [12] 3507 10,
3621 16, 20, 362217
3628173656 1, 3672 16,
3674121736769,369425 369720
Frank [3] 3634143635 1, 10
frank [2] 3624 5, 36344
frankness [1] 36246
free [1] 370017
frequency [1] 364815
frequent [1] 36179
frequently [1] 362814
fresh [2] 35114357018
freshly [1] 351116
friend [5] 3621243645910
3653236803
friendly [1] 367421
friends [8] 3619121421
36201636218362211
367422367917
full [13] \(35245,6,2535253\)
35511135581357115
35792435831361022
36501836925
full-tume [1] 369310
fun [1] 369220
function [2] 36171367015
functional [2] 35606
361624
functions [1] 363115
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline - G - \\
\hline G H [1] 36927 \\
\hline Galveston [5] 3699 2, 5, 15 \\
\hline 1937001 \\
\hline game [1] 36242 \\
\hline gangway [1] 370115 \\
\hline GARY [3] 355118357224 \\
\hline 35816 \\
\hline Gary [2] 3551 713 \\
\hline gas [1] 35166 \\
\hline gather [1] 352115 \\
\hline gathered [1] 363420 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
gave [8] 353211356424
36267223630936361
3644336727
gear [1] 351412
generalized [1] 356322
generated [I] 364124
gentleman [2] 36452
368223
Gentlemen [9] 352217
3534335362135911
359312361121361312
362516370020
gentlemen [3] 35025
36411437041
geographical [1] 356225
GERRY [8] 355510356114
2235722225357835 35815
Gerry [4] 356119357223
35731358119
gets [1] 357115
Gibraltar [1] 36691
gist [1] 35912
give \([13] 350513350721\)
35169351821359915
36131236281363013
36401736587367121
367319368710
Given [1] 36164
given [19] 35101535197
\(353251518 \quad 2335334\)
353418213535535365
353751035452535576
36001536392136831013
giving [1] 360522
goes [3] 353016353620 35805
gotten [2] 35077363118
government [6] 351912
352219357524357616 17368015
governmental [2] 357520
35765
Grace [1] 351624
gradually [4] 35242322 35476
graduate [4] 35161014
35831236943
graduated [5] 361123
36128365217369448
graduation [2] 35162425
Grande [6] 36221736562
3674536761014367912
granted [1] 355323
Graves [9] 35881320
358973600910222324 3601 11
gray [2] 3564935661
great [6] 35709362123
362423362717362810 366612
greater [2] 352414366116
green [1] 35406
Gregory [2] 35551635566
grew [2] 36124362724
ground [1] 352412
grounding [30] 350423
35128353511353611
353715354812355517
2236201319362117
36222363183636615

36386364614364910
366413366624366716
17367056367119
\(\begin{array}{llll}36828 & 3683 & 23 & 3689 \\ 18\end{array}\)
369111
groundings [2] 369117
group (3) \(3602 \quad 25 \quad 361218\)
22
grow [1] 36123
growing [1] 362723
Guard [14] \(3513 \quad 10 \quad 13\)
35145351612351915
361293654193661722
36691236702336714
3672610
guess [10] 35585361625
36272436281363625
3651236603366215
3682436985
guide (1] 368823
gudelines [2] 3683916
Gulf [1] 352121
\(\begin{array}{lllll}\text { gulf }[25] & 3584 & 12 & 15 & 20\end{array}\)

35874359012360817
\(36131923 \quad 25 \quad 362118\)
\(36228 \quad 3623101921\)
363149364618367514
GUY [2] \(369210 \quad 370211\)
Guy (4) 369212712
guy [4] 35952361914
367423
guys [2] 362212369220
gyro [1] 35284
\(-\mathrm{H}-\)
half [32] 352515352819
3529514353112353219
2135452535463611
\(357115 \quad 35791517 \quad 24\)
3593836134361724
\(3622736241823 \quad 362510\)
113627812173629324
363019365118366813
369315
halfhearted (1) 366812
halfway (2) \(354419 \quad 23\)
hand [11] 3511816
35141435518356110
358224361019362413
36501636852536923
handle [2] 35471236172
hands [1] 36641
happens [4] 353024
3569193578736085
happy [1] 351715
harbor [2] \(3517 \quad 19 \quad 3628 \quad 17\)
hard [5] 35092324351013 355418358019
hardly [2] 36272036734
harm [1] 36914
Harvard [5] 3554278 3555435738
Harvey [11] 36282236298
\(91122 \quad 2336301736311\) 236432136478
hasn't [2] 3630236585
haven't [6] 354514354722 36581536681336808 36813

Havens [1] 36972
hazard [1] 350511
hazardous [2] 366979
hazards [3] \(366823 \quad 366915\) 36883
he'd [3] \(3626 \quad 22 \quad 363121\)
363310
head [5] 35104352722
\(357623358618 \quad 361223\)
heading [4] \(351016 \quad 35125\)
812
heads [1] 356018
health [1] 363010
hear \([9] 35215 \quad 35838\)
358720360013361512
365563672836999 37049
heard [19] 351824354624
355133557835716
36102361868364320
36542536552367319
36742236752367619
367723702171922
hearing [2] 359622365025
heavy [6] 35051422
35061735087835711
height [1] 370017
heightened [1] 36401
held [5] 3507 7, 361218
366517369320371011
Heller (1] 3579 11
helm (4) \(351923528 \quad 13\)
36712125
helmsman (3) 353224
35334357013
help [5] 3521635428
3562536342368112
helping [1] 3569 I
helps [1] 361623
Heary [2] 363925
HERBY [1] 37108
Herman [2] 36921416
hesrtate [1] 364316
hey [2] \(367618 \quad 36775\)
hide [1] 36332
high [5] 35101735617
3595243700818
high-density [2] 368922 36903
higher (3) 355916366518
highest [1] 35806
Hinchmbrook [11] 365622
36611217366211112

history [2] 355521356723
hitter [2] 368448
hold [6] 365110365325
3665436931618370210
holding [1] 368717
home [3] 3677131416
honest [2] 363711363812
Honor [47] 35021435097
3514811253515610
\(3518315 \quad 20 \quad 35201121\)
35212335222435339
354513551571735559
10,123557113561910
1214 22, 24, 3572 15, 22
358220359989365012
365825
19,3660 136631336669

368473692121370210
370318370410
honors [1] 35799
hoods [1] 358613
hook [2] \(368422 \quad 3685 \quad 13\)
hope 111358212
horizontal [2] 355724
356220
hose [1] 3676 11
Hospital [5] 355214511 355324
hospital [1] 35527
hospitals [1] 35526
Hotel [7] \(3590 \quad 17 \quad 19\)
3592223593610359712 360321
hour [19] \(35248 \quad 10 \quad 15 \quad 18\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}19 & 20 & 21 & 3525 & 8 & 9 & 11 & 13\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}15 & 1618 & 35581 & 357412\end{array}\)
35791535938
hours \(\begin{array}{llllll}81 & 3561 & 8 & 3564 & 14 & 25\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3565 & 5 & 3566 & 25 & 3568 & 17\end{array}\)
36174366115
house [1] 369618
housekeeping [1] 35047
houses [1] 362725
housing [1] 369619
Houston [8] 35841035901
917359311361224
3654717
how'd [1] 359316
huh |l| 36512
human 기 355221360225
\(36263363320 \quad 363523\)
\(363915 \quad 364810\)
hundred [3] \(35175 \quad 3605 / 4\)
360722
hurt [1] 351817
hydrodynamic \(\{1\} 353017\)
hypothetical [6] 35472
35611357468363921
36732
hypotheticals [1] 354617
- - I-

Id \(116 \mid 35029350315\)
\(\begin{array}{llll}1812 & 18 & 3522 & 12 \\ 3545 & 15\end{array}\)
358016358310359215
363824253639236536
365416367010367512
36961
I've [22] 35162351746
351815351914352117
35513355372435548
2235732235759361610
36292436311836355
36392136585367918
368220368710
I S O [1] 351916
\(\begin{array}{llllll}\text { Iaross1 } & {[26]} & 3634 & 15 & 19 & 23\end{array}\)
363521011363620
36373711141621
363824101236421
36461836472810
3649361017
rce [25] \(350591111416 \quad 22\)
\(350871922 \quad 25350914\)
3517153538193541911

131722,36324367210

Idea [6] 35701035919
36004360323360715
3609 11
ideal [1] 356516
identrical [1] 35507
identification [1] 364718
identufy [2] 3569135811
gnore [3] 3567135767
366615
ummedrate [3] 36189
36433367520
ummedıately [2] 350625
35106
umpact [2] 35707357123
mparr (1] 35669
umpared [3] 357017
369521369724
mpedıment [1] 35088
implement [1] 360725
mplementing [1] 360724
umportant [7] 35569
3559233560135632
35712035792136052
umpossible [1] 358025
Imprecise [1] 357620
umprecise [4] 35751725
35761721
impression (1] 370320
mpressive [1] 35716
umprove [3] 35725358615
362424
umprovement [3] 356910
36242436255
umproving [1] 362610
madequate [1] 35598
unbound [2] 350824367218 incident [11] 356415
362925363971836406
36413364522364613
36966370225
Incidentally [1] 365919 uncidentally [1] 36546
medents [4] 36962370113 1737026
melude (5) 35542135696
35741336111719
meluded 161358422
\(360819 \quad 361315 \quad 361412\) 1316
incorrect |1| 3634 16
merease (7) 352423
3566212535688368314 16
mcreased (5] 352422
352693527121535786
increases [3] 352517
356038
uncrement [2] 356814
357811
indicate [2] \(350515 \quad 364414\) indicated [6] 3510613
351231435473360417
indicates |4| 3524735282
3355820
indication [7] 35277
352813223530236229
362622363816
indxcatrons [3] 36209
3622836267
indscator [1] 353617
indscernible (1) 368322
ndividual (32] 35598
\(356017 \quad 23253562919\)
2535652135684357022
35719212535732425
357473576335771113
1535782223359425
35961936201236381
3639691012
Individuals [1] 357624
individuals \{22] 355524
35582583560211
35613356317356524
35665357015357317.
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}3576 & 11 & 3577 & 6 & 8 & 11 & 20 \\ 3 & 21\end{array}\)
3578213633136452425
mfer [2] \(358021 \quad 358215\)
Inferring [1] 356710
mfluence [2] 35692235724
mform (2] 35121117
information [9] 35061
35189353922354615
355013355811358122
360015364124
mformed [2] 3512436716
mherent (1) 35692
mherently [1] 355610
mhibits [1] 357024 :
inimitable [1] 360416
mitual (2] 35346359315
mkling [1] 362313
inland [1] 361318
Inlet [1] 351715
mput [2] 350724350812
inquire [1] 360122
inquired |l| 35948
inquiry [2] \(3657 \quad 1114\)
inside [2] \(356018 \quad 362716\)
insights [1] 35825
insomma [1] 35575
installed (1) 352117
Instutute [3] 351614351724 25
instututrons [1] 355312
instruct [2] 364221367316
instructed (1) 36737
instruction [1] 37047
instructions [1] 370413
instructor \([2] 3554235735\)
instruments [1] 353622
integral |1| 363914
intellect [1] 36246
intended 15135112435899
1835949368420
intent [5] 359315359517
360717361616368016
untention [3] 35789358919 359514
interactung [1] 357015
interaction [3] 35701012 13
Intercontinental (1) 359018
interested |1| 36046
interesting [3] 356622
3578635804
interests [1] 355220
unterface [1] 36175
interfaced [1] 36438
interfacing [2] 364314
36445
internal [1] 356015
International [4] 351917
\(35847361216 \quad 17\)
international [2] 36121822
interpreting [1] 36659
interrupt [2] \(356517 \quad 3619 \quad 13\)
interrupted [1] 361617
interruptung [1] 362917
intervals [1] 355815
interviewed [5] 354621
3602233640823367224
untoxicated [1] 369519
introduce (1] 35029
untroduced [2] 351011
362716
investugate [2] 363825
36412
mvestugated [1] 362925
investugatung [1] 360018
investugation [20] 359924
253600147111421 ,
25360137936029
360691536391336405
367989
mvited [2] 368637
mvoke [1] 368313
unvolve [5] 35521324
35541335872435883
mvolved [15] 350817
35537913355423
355524355623,358612
359333603336076
36271363825,36395
36413
unvolving [3] 3552 22, 35892
36304
Island [26] 35264131422
35271353322353414
35356101621353610
\(\begin{array}{llllll}15 & 18 & 3539 & 2 & 35421719\end{array}\)
354441835451935464
3569835831718366212 36737
sssue [17] 356521356912
35752535792135932
360143605436198
362716362810363011
3637253638436467
364893659910
issues \([7] 35512135565\)
3603236051736173
36387
Item [1] 36905
IVAN [4] 365023367324
36801368625
Ivan [18] 362013362116
2021232436224612
\(\begin{array}{llll}13141921 & 24 & 36367\end{array}\)
3637436501120
- J -

Jackson [1] 36928
January [1] 36958
Jerry [1] 3541 5
Jum [8] 3618561936406
364673674123367525
job [30] 354712357111
358413242535861
35951115359769
359817360518360715
93608436117361222
36131192236157

361811362521362622
36282136299363021
36471236774
jobs [1] 35842
JOHN [3] 35835359912
36095
John [8] 35602335615
35822335833361434 1436167
jom [2] 35122435131
jomed [7] 35161835171
103612163631736957 370217
Jones [1] 36974
Joseph [2] 363512367517
Journals [1] 35204
JOY [1] 371021
Judge [5] 3601233684 11, 3691213703 22, 37049 judge [2] \(356518 \quad 359911\)
judgment [1] 356820
Julus [2] 36921415
July [4] 36211736317 ,
36375364625
jump [3] 3701145
jumped [1] 361610
June [2] \(364625 \quad 365218\)
Juneau [15] 3538910
3540459 15, 16 22,
35411131835436
\(354916355013 \quad 367211\)
Jury [21] 350229351410
352217352324353434
353524353621353814
3572202135911359312
361122,361312362517
3641161737002037046
jury [11] 3557142335656
356915358310360120 364017366615368216 3704713

\section*{- K -}

K-L-E-E-S-S [1] 36928
K-O-O-P-S [1] 36111
Katue [3] 36972
keep [4] \(3588 \quad 18 \quad 367018\)
36716367919
keeping [2] 3514203561 11
key [1] 3619 11
kid [2] 36232021
kunds [2] 3521536202
Kugg [5] 35161136128
365216369434
Kingwood [1] 35834
KLEESS [2] 369210370211
Kleess [6] 369212712
2437029
knot [5] \(35248910 \quad 14\)
352715
knots [16] 352461621
35251573526110
3527143530212235313
354112222335425
knowing [1] 355016
knowledge [17] 350410
35121135132357323
360016360320360618
36091836252224
36321316451819

36861236888
KOOPS [3] 36112363210 364724
Koops [22] 3597151924 359811360721360857 \(\begin{array}{llllll}1012 & 21 & 22 & 25 & 361018\end{array}\) 2436114361235 36272136481367521
-
lab [1] 35738
laboratory [6] 3552135533 1435731335775358018 lack [3] 35551535564
357213
lacking [1] 355912
ladder (9] 351043698612 370011123701121516
Laddre [1] 354514
Ladies [9] 35221735343
35362135911359311
361121361312362516
370020
ladies [3] 35025364113
370325
Land [1] 351923
land [3] \(3524141717 \begin{array}{llllll} & 3525 & 6\end{array}\)
Lane [1] 36928
lane [22] 350824351125
35121525351312122
351423467352319
353818203540101112
36721013
lanes [13] 3509245
3513335141352315
353322353516353822
35401324354424367218 large [2] 3571522
largest [2] 3629236937
last [23] \(3512 \quad 16 \quad 354315\)
\(35502535511213 \quad 35832\)
1635861736062512
3610232536122236315
36367364018365019
365222366119366614
36722036926
lastung [1] 35655
lastly [1] 354825
late [8] 35036935604
3588135892223359224 361216
Latency [7] 35561222
355722355814356213
356611357811
latency [8] \(3557163558 \quad 15\) 173562103566514 3567322
lattude [3] 35636811 latter [2] 358619358714
launch [27] 36222025
36761636962141519
36978369846121420
22, 3699910121937001
213701337022537033
1315
launched [1] 36342
laws [2] 36842123
leadershup [2] 35861520
leading [6] 354325355312
356781335791036986
leads [1] 361513
lean [1] 35838
learn [1] 359524
learned [6] 3528635551
3563135826367718
36993
leave [12] 351124351224
3513135431735441
3545335871036093
3631636672023369424
leaving [5] 351124353818
36821736905369615
LeLam [1] 358612
lecturing [1] 35548
Lee [1] 35029
leg [1] 366116
length [1] 369420
lessened [2] \(36855 \quad 10\)
lesson [1] 356623
letter [15] 35445365724
36581142436591257 936646193665936877 36888
level [4] \(356022 \quad 2435806\)
levels [2] \(355620 \quad 3568\) 11
liasons [1] 35853
license [11] 35161336128
3651102336527369316
\(18 \quad 19 \quad 2036941011\)
Icensed [1] 355323
Licenses [1] 36947
Leutenant [5] 350215
350612354620367222 36735
life [4] 35582358019
35862136284
lift [1] 367612
\begin{tabular}{llllll} 
lught & {\([28]\)} & 3526 & 4 & 13 & 14 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
233527135312435323
83533233534814
353561116213536610
163539235421719
3545193546435698
367383700419
lights [1] 355616
luked [5] 362456363120
lumited [4] 35201235678
35718357419
lne [32] \(352023 \quad 3522821\)
352373526192235316
193533173535235389
\(353918 \quad 35401522\)
354213354516354724
354913563151635661
35672135801735859
361313361624364323
24364412367611
lenearly [1] 35608
lined [1] 354313
Lines [4] 35162435172
lines [7] 351320352120
3542192035581012
355911
lust [4] \(355419 \quad 2035556\)
36258
listened [1] 360114
lusts [1] 355425
Lt [1] 366920
Lterally [1] 362222
Live [14] 351511355118
3572243581635835

3599123609536112
363210364724365023
36732436801369210
live [7] \(3551 \quad 1435834\)
361024362125365021
3653436805
lived [1] 362725
living [1] 367718
Lloyd (1) 358612
load [101 35232324
3524213525112235262
\(9352713-3550736179\)
Loading [1] 367610
loading [1] 367610
loads [1] 35135
local [2] 368748
Located [1] 3631 I1
located [4] 35152136119
363111364611
location [2] 35446356225
locations [1] 36401
logger [1] 354922
logs [3] 355613567711
lone [1] 35703
lookout [4] 3531 \(17 \quad 23\)
353227
looks [2] \(3536 \quad 16 \quad 357316\)
lose [2] 3628336774
loss [1] 361523
lost [1] 37026
lot [12] \(355416 \quad 3568 \quad 24\)
361710123619336201
36241364020365512
3669436791636861
Loustana [1] 369225
lounge [1] 360322
love [1] 363024
low (2) \(356615 \quad 361911\)
lower [1] 355919
lucky [1] 358210
lunch [1] 36225
LYNCH [17] 355171719
35556121335571113
3561915192435623
35721535817358220 370410
\(\frac{-\mathbf{M}-}{\text { M-I-H-A-J-L-O-V-I-C [I] }}\)

M-I-H-A-J-L-O-V-I-C [1]
365021
M D [1] 355321
machine [1] 350420
machines [1] 36583
man [1] 370117
Mamly [2] 36601920
major [2] 3625611
man [17] \(351920 \quad 25 \quad 35611\)
3579103606916361115
362411153626924
3640436441936752025
368412
manage [1] 35867
management [7] 35859
360613362320362519
\(3630 \quad 25 \quad 363915364011\)
manager [22] 3584 ll 12 IS
203585216358614
3587435901236066
3611811361346920
\(\begin{array}{lllll}23 & 24 & 25 & 362912 & 36319\end{array}\)
managers [3] 361624
363420364321
managing [1] 361710
mandates [1] 36837
maneuver [4] 35434714 35474
maneuvering [5] 352446
25368559
manifest ||| 361522
manifold [1] 367612
mantel [1] 360720
manual [28] 35121935136
936541436662336825
253683636841141618
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}19 & 20 & 22 & 3685 & 2 & 3 & 11 & 12\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}15 & 3688 & 16 & 18 & 23 & 3690 & 15\end{array}\)
17
March (22] 3504121419
35071935229352389
3538511354214356222
3564163567619356822
357212358714369419
25369678
Marine 111135161021
351712435192435415
358312358410361123
36521536944
marme \([16] 3515 \quad 20 \quad 3516 \quad 11\)
15351925352113
358415361124361210
1525361313654811
368222369489
marital [1] 362617
Martume [11] 351616
35832336116736515
36571516172136593
366420
martume |l| 351625
mark [1113503 \(218 \quad 20 \quad 25\)
 141720
marked [6] \(351320 \quad 3523\) 11
12356223365725366920
marker [1] 35666
Martineau [18] 350424
35052346193506223
35074816182135082
53628133658913
Mary [9] 35562436962
36991371537033610
masking (1) 36334
Mass [1] 35526
Massachusetts \{3] 351614 35511535522
master [27] 35053351617

36511017202336522
36532336672536687
36708367316368125
36837101216368546 8368910369312

192135081235171
358314359719361125
3612236141336157
\(3620136281618 \quad 364215\)
1936488192225
36581036882436931620
matched [1] 35642
Mate [6] 35675357212
358120358216358611

367224
mate [27] 350321635101 355516362121365246 789122436531017 1921366623667423 36722536737,17369323 253694136973 maternis [1] 35551 mates [2] 35171,369410 matter [5] 35063354125 , 3623163631 16, 370322 matters [2] \(362621 \quad 371011\)
Maureen [1] 36974
maximal [1] 356010
MBA (1) 36122
Mchall [5] 350524350638 11350921
mean [19] 352022353623
3540 1, 3549 13, 355817
3575 22, 3576 6, 13, 35938
3597 6, 35992136141
364814365510365620,
36691,367823367919 368611
meaning [4] 35522135596
35646368714
meanngs [2] 35752325
means [6] 353624355215
3557736562136667 36719
meant |3| 361933686 |
measure 111 355617
measured [1] 355815
measures [1] 355613
measuring [2] 355820
356722
Mechanical [1] 3518 I
mechansm [1] 357022
Medical (3) 35531135543 8
medical [16] 35526810 3553102135735358710 3594213602202236031 343609121636151 medicine 13135532235542 6
Medterranean (1] 365113 meet [8] 35899359145 3592171719360319 meeting [24] 358891214 359092135911722 35922435934359411 3603141636047360710 360810111214364620 2236473467 meetings [2] 359439 member \(16 \mid 351721 \quad 23 \quad 25\) 351813519914 Members 14135149 35232435344353523 memo [3] 3541103658911 memory [2] 350220363811 mentally [1] 35694 mention [1] 350324 mentroned [23] 35572 3561735631357018 35741435759357719 358018359137359319 35947359789360313 361673623363629725 3630636388364916
mentroning [1] 36384
mentions [1] 367525
Merchant (8) 35161021
35171351924358312
3611233652 15, 36944
merchant [2] \(3521 \quad 13 \quad 36129\)
message [1] 365014
metal [1] 352520
methods [1] 355023
Mexico [1] 352121
microphone [3] 35838
36741416
mid [2] 363511369321
mud-watch [1] 35043
Mudnight [1] 356417
midnight [34] 352656611
122535276212225
\(352871015 \quad 19,352957\)
14152235301035318 ,
1213353221353412
3537182435461356024
3561635622335641416
356822
midshipman [1] 351623
MIHAJLOVIC [4] 365023
36732436801368625
Mihajlovic [19] 362014
36212310362216
\(3623 / 3636891215\)
36374364613364946
365011202536741
Mike [1] 3662 15
mule [14] \(35241013,14,15\),
35268353513353612,
353823539891235412 336635
mules [18) 35248111718
192021352568911
131617353716366115
36621236632
mind [1] 364917
mine [2] \(3638 \quad 13 \quad 367419\) minımize ||| 35692
minımum (3) 35617356515 16
minute [18] 3521 2352819
352951335302035313
1135321935431535673
360433621536273
3636336371336381822 368413
mischaracterization [2]
36011921
mishaps [1] 36914
misidentified [1] 36582
misleading [1] 3640 17
miss (2) 359225363121
missed |6| 3535 /I 353610
\(3537153538 / 364513\)
misspoke [1] 356124
mistakes [1] 357212
Mister (4) 35641235819 35871736376
mxture [1] 35615
model [5] 35683357414
162225
modest [2] 351920
moment (12] 352473545 I
35584356129356923
35998366610368925
3691223704510
money [1] 36554
monitor [6] 358818364120
3644111536492324 monitored [5] 360415
3647 13, 3648 3, 367023 36711
montoring [8] 360511
3607162436387364225
3643 3, 3671 S, 36918
MONTAGUE [10] 3514 25,
\(3520111518 \quad 2335455,7\)
9, 35514355710
Montague [11] 351418
35151354531436622
1225366323366417.

366620367222
month [1] 363522
months [2] 3597111365410
mooring [2] 3693 1, 2
morning [19] 3502512,13 ,
3518 12, 353919 20, 21
3558 6, 3560 10, 11, 3564 17,
2435652,3356615,
361143677133704418
motion [2] 35314361618
Moussy [1] 35118
mouth [1] 362224
Move [1] 3664 I
move [7] 35193354212
36257363022363217
36364364111
moved [6] 35261625 ,
3528 18, 3531 18, 3612 13, 24
movement [1] 356910
movements [1] 36256
moves [3] 352314362511
362814
movie [1] 369212
moving [12] 35231319
3526113527935302225
355023571111736083
4362515
MS [6] 350214350979
3514835331214
MSO [1] 350721
muddled (1] 362015
muddy [1] 36844
multufaceted (1] 361715
Multuple [7] 35561122
355721355814356213
356611357811
multuple [1] 355715
Music [1] 369719
myself [13] 350220351011 35751235792358513
3590636032361622
364783648101336613 368524
\[
-\mathrm{N}-
\]
name [29] 3518 8, 202122 25355111121335731 3576213583123
359914361022232425 363673650181920 367423367520369256 71213
named [2] 364422367525 names [2] \(358825 \quad 361313\) namug [1] 35765
nap 111] 3560335654
356622356889 17,

napping [3] 35685935755
narcolepsy [2] 35575 ,
35668
Narrows [5] 35131736678
1113369011
Nathan [1] 36973
naturally [1] 353016
nature [3] 350922,360759
nautical [6] 3524 10, 13,
35631035647,8
Naval [3] 35172324
351910
naval [11] 3515 19, 3516 13,
\(15351711,351924,35206\),
7, 163521 4, 3612 12, 14
navigate [2] 350813,366913
navigating [2] 3662 1, 36698
Navigation [1] 351725
navigation [8] 35089 .
35491415366123,36854
93688 3, 369024
navigational [2] 3668 23,
366915
navigator [1] 354712
NEAL [43] 350283514917
3515361012351836
14172135191,3520920
2535218 9, 23, 3522612
\(1424352325,35338,13\)
153542 11, 3545 1, 2, 6 ,
35515365011366217
36669367325367925
36847
3691213702 10, 370322 , 37049
Neal [2] 36732336741
needs [3] 35189359323
36055
negative [1] 370314
negligence [1] 368218
negligent [1] 368216
neighborhood [1] 35048
network [2] 3616820
neurologic [2] 35771021
news [3] 36151011
newspapers [1] 36223
nice [1] 367615
nicest [1] 363117
nught [19] 35031135228
352381135381135608
356415193568535691
35721235925361125
361211366920367713
368322368820
nghttume [2] 356418 , 356513
nune [2] 3531235607
NOAA [1] 352219
Nobody [2] 3701 18, 20
nobody [3] 3544436736
369213
nocturnal [2] 356418
356512
nomunal [1] 356023
non-pilotage (10] 365621
366111366421366515
\(101822,368116,36885\)
noon [2] \(3562 \quad 23 \quad 35653\)
norm [2] 357723
Normal [1] 35584
normal [18] 35243355924
3562935632024356713
357317 24, 2535747
3577131518358924
36022136981211
normally [2] 35681135954
North [3] 3506243507610
north [4] 35321935357
353713363119
northbound [5] 351321
352319354010367210
northern [3] 35143356368
northwestern [1] 35143
Notary [1] 371021
notations [1] 354213
note [5] 3523 20, 356513
357863580436327
noted [1] 35581
notes [3] 35154365818 371010
notace [11] 3602810
3606736082236322
36336364520368017
3681 10, 2336988
noticed [1] 351919
notufied [7] 3511233512 25,
35962035992536006
notifyng [1] 366121
notwithstanding [1] 363113
novel [1] 35705
November [5] 36351415
1636361363717
Number [1] 364815
number [22] 35031835043
351914172335201
3521102235591635715
35776361310,1736206
362120364024364316
36481436521036587
366122370016
numbered [1] 361224
numbers [1] 364812
numeral (1] 351219
NYU [1] 36121
- - O-

O'NEILL [27] 351813
3599111336012324
3609 2, 3632 11, 3641 11, 18
36472123,36581720
36631636661136802
36811314368325
36841112368623
369215370212370317 24370415
O'Nell [7] 351424359914
3648136492368112
369014369122
oath [1] 351819
object [4] 357618359920
360118369215
objectufy [1] 355610
objecting [1] 3666 11
Objectron [1] 36847
objection [8] 351425
3520113561142022
3663163684910
objections [2] 351423

355510
objectuve \(\{3135568 \quad 10 \quad 12\) objectuvely [1] 35577
obligated [1] 36837
observations [9] 359626
3599136217363018
36422236441836451617
observe [5] 359945
36311524370123
observing [1] 362924
obtan [1] 3651 23
obtamed [4] 351612
351711356412357416
obvious [1] 361718
obviously [8] 3540 1]
362414362522362912
363017363710364317 36554
occas.on [19] 35094
35211519359512
359719359820360722
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3628 & 11 & 3631 & 14 & 365418\end{array}\)
365522365615366720
3670133672736747
3696253698320
Occasional [4] 36762425
367712
occasınal [1] 367623
occasions [1] 350822
occupation [1] 351518
occur [5] 35618356334
3577 20, 364622
occurred [11] 35637
356515356923,359011
359710359813362019
36232364623364913
3675 II
occurring [1] 35688
occurs [3] 35661124
35726
ocean [4] 36118111417
October (4) 361325
36371736442436505
Offer [2] \(356115 \quad 365817\)
offer [7] \(351418 \quad 3522 \quad 3\)
\(\begin{array}{llll}3555 & 8561 & 12 & 19 \\ 3658 & 19\end{array}\) 366313
offered (7) \(351422 \quad 3561 \quad 13\)
16213658614366315
office \([20] 350313350425\)
35059359012359115
361193617236197.

3631113646111236547
3655173677222436784
736961936983
officer [15] 35065351613
35172,3521113631616
3632243633 22, 366124
36641636661923
36722123367316
officers [9] 3598 24, 360813 ,
18, 36477366278,36647
36829369523
offices [2] 35152236207
official [2] 3606 13, 360914
Offshore [1] 369225
Oh [7] 351821352420
35971736582136613
36631336699
oh [3] 3532 6, 36603
367111

Oll [1] 369225
oll [6] 3516636111719 20370056
okay [19] 352343528 1]
35311719354319
3576223619136221023
367328368414368715
368820368993690717
369816370414
old [3] \(351525 \quad 3563 \quad 16\)
357720
Older [1] 35588
older [2] \(356317 \quad 18\)
omession [4] 3581111114
18
Ones [1] 361315
onset [2] 35647
open [1] 362224
operate [4] 35171416
361311370125
operated (1] 366413
operating [4] 351720
\(359418 \quad 366617369018\)
operation [4] 352322
35842122361113
operations [4] 358411
361219363020
opinion [11] 35291235326
1422 23, 35331354221
35672136249362713
36288
opmions [1] 35223
opportunties [1] 360815
opportunity [6] 358915
359110359324359715
36055360619
optamal [1] 356514
Orange (1] 353723
orange 14] 35372325
353816354618
Order [1] 35024
order [28] \(3518 \quad 25353211\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllll}15 & 17 & 22 & 24 & 353418 & 20\end{array}\)
35355353653537910
35391135452535474
3550103558635943
361963632 17, 367121
367283673132036875
370117
ordered [4] \(354218 \quad 363923\)
36721725
ordering [1] 363820
orders [1] 36727
ordinarily [1] 35064
ordinary [1] 351622
organization [12] 35553
35861535961035973
3616 8, 2123361716
3654 14, 366623368823
369014
organizational [2] 368816 18
Organizations [1] 351917
organizations [3] 351722
3518235195
organzed 11135555
orient [1] 355723
orented [1] 35635
orients [1] 356019
orgin [1] 356620
ought [1] 36125
outbound [6] 350823
35112535131925
366116367216
outhne [2] 3513936089 outside [7] 35094353615
3538213570192135773 37041
overall [2] 35842136234
overlap [1] 361410
overlay [3] 3534 / 2354216
overlays [1] 353321
overseas [1] 3672 I1
owns [1] 361114

\section*{- P-}
pm \(17135641416 \quad 35805\)
364117369673704619
paces [1] 362323
Page [2] 36432324
page (6] \(351218 \quad 358016\)
1736581114368111
pages 111355425
Pan (11) 35173
Panama [1] 362217
paper [5] 356111359424
364224364325
paperwork [2] 36254
363024
paragraph [9] 36613 5, 6
36642036841936853
36898
paragraphs [2] 366120
368418
parallel [4] 354310354422
361812
parameters [5] 357624
357791416360413
Pardon (1) 367821
parenthesis 11369019
Part [1] 36405
part [26] 35071819
351620351824351915
3524135346354114
354213557335589
\(356821 \quad 35711135751\)
3586131935871436179
3623336251321363913
141536805369016
part-tume [1] 369310
partal [1] 355420
participants [1] 36414
participate [2] 360512
36136
participated [1] 35176
partner [1] 360316
Pass [1] 35834
pass [1] 363023
passage [2] 3581836618
passages [1] 365618
passed [3] 35306,1735464
passing [1] 35305
passingly [1] 357912
passron [1] 36324
patuent (1) 35667
patrents [6] 3552141617
355743561435769
pattern [11] 35589355921
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3560 & 12 & 16 & 17 & 19 & 3563 & 2 & 8\end{array}\)
914
Paul [2] 36332123
pay [1] 350517
peak [1] 35618
peaks [2] 3560535633
pedal [1] 352520
peer [1] 355414
peers [1] 364321
People [2] 3560636283 perceaved [1] 350511 percent [5] 35241314
360514360723363222 perform (1] 35662
Performance [1] 356523 performance ( 10 ) 355313 35565356523357017
3617111336242122
362622364712
performed (3] 355814
358025364122
performing (4) 35609
35696358425363014
perrod [31] 350449
35081635163351911 352716352919354014 356456356851021
35695359510360713
361479103643336472
3650736531136555
36564368313369569 21 369710
periodic [1] 350712
perrods [1] 368618
Perrier (1) 36324
person 1171354714354815
1935632435661356722
3575141735771536284
3651336655368420
3685153687172536888
personal [5] 35732336049
\(23360518 \quad 363725\)
personnel [6] 358423
358624360817361412
361723
Pharaoh |1| 351623
phase 11135603
phone 18135059350716
35871535881136022
36195362914363117
physical [1] 356910
physically \({ }^{6} 613569414\)
35711136207364611 364816
physology [1] 355223
pick [3] 362218365922
36609
picked [4] \(354416 \quad 17\)
35991736608
plece |4] 359424364224
36432366324
pier |l| 369912
pilot |14| 362817365922
24366082236611217
36672336822368548 36935
pilotage [43] 36294365325
\(365431519 \quad 2325\)
365513365691215
\(36571236598 \quad 1619\)
366193664142325
3665141213172021
3666336801016811821
368213687814151618

\section*{192136884}

12
pilotung [1] 358116
phots \(12 \mid 35172367615\)
pinnacle [7] 35292035306
717182022
Place [1] 361025
place [19] 3600 20, 21
3601436222236244 36371720212236383
3639 2, 3642112436676
367673677131636966
places [1] 352122
Planntuffs [1] 35099
plantuffs [1] 35732
plan [14] 354222359568 \(14 \quad 17 \quad 3607 \quad 16 \quad 2436081\)
361611161836171922
planned [4] 35441035942
35951135963
planning [3] 35441358924 35942
plans [2] 35987360312
platform [1] 370025
played [1] 36834
Please [3] 3514 16, 370412
please (21) 3502835149
1417352093551812
\(358222 \quad 2435832361017\)
\(1923 \quad 361321362710\)
3643123650161936923 637045
plot [2] \(353623 \quad 354914\)
plots (11) 353620
plotted [1] 354917
plottung [2] \(3536 \quad 23355811\)
Pount [17] 351611351816
3612836521636601213
23243661133662225
36641117366620
368719369435
pouted [4] 35283354024
35436363019
pointer \(14 \mid 352225354321\) 35571735587
pounts [1] 353923
policres [2] 362424 polsey [3] 360414360619 367425
polite [1] 362724
poor [1] 36281
Port [10\} 350816351357
35385353919354016
35421436281336909
369225
port \(141 \mid 350511202123\)
35068162235071213
350812351311351718
353615193585735915
3594335958360318
360711361625361856 24362814364013
3646103654123675714 2336791936873
536906,1237007
Portion [1] 36834
portion [9] 35221922
35237352615354010
35411835681535789
36903
Portland 121363821363922
portray [1] 356321
portrayed [1] 35626
ports [3] 3617636428
365412
position [17] 351523
352310352525353625
35501517355213
356313157011359513
3613242536612536826
71012
positions [5] 3542335498
1735848361219
possibility [2] \(353011 \quad 12\)
post [1] 36366
postdate [1] 36473
potental [4] 35922336407
36902536917
poured [2] \(351116 \quad 357918\)
practical [1] 35571
practucing (2] 35532225
preceding [1] 35385
precise [6] 355946
3575 23, 357612435797 precisely [6] 35261235374 35561735651435776 357821
predate [1] 36473
predecessor [2] 36142
364125
predict [1] 356022
predommantly [1] 367423
preface [1] 35056
preparation [1] 355423
prepare [2] 35332035389
prepared [2] 35229371012
Present (1] 365113
present [10] 35021922
35091214,35151723
355124357016358324
365112
presented [1] 356220
preserved [2] \(350414 \quad 18\)
President [1] 351519
president [2] 35152435162
presuming (1) 357713
pretty [10] 358911360817
361515361812362324
3624121636311364420
prevented [1] 35373
prevously [4] 3521 24,
36181136373365725
Primarily [1] 361120
primarily [4] 3596336073
361410364210
prumary [5] \(361113 \quad 36139\)
361713627536476
Prince [46] 3505 10350821
3513202135141352220
35381017354191418
35422362933653725
36543 19, 2436551
3656 10, 3657 8, 36591723
36603,366183663914
3666173667236686 19, 22, 36692
810223670 : 368010 ,
3687 22, 2536883368917
36901 15, 1920
principal [3] 35791 12,
35853
pruncipally [2] 355523
prmciple [1] 366414
printout [1] 354923
Proor [7] 35888363519
3652436706369312
369421
prior [18] 3504235128
35168355517359019
3602153643713,364518
36512036529366413
367053689173693 23,
3695536961536977
private [1] 362621
probability [2] 356716
359525
probable [3] 3560 24,
356321357211
problem [30] 3581 12,
358921635901923 ,
\(359524359610,14,20\),
360924361010,361513
22361645362314
362493626613,25 ,
36279 14, 20, 36285 ,
36332364512 18, 365816
367617
problems [15] 350925
35609357710359111
35932435967,359816
3606 23, 24, 361417
3626173627 22, 362923
36307,364516
procedure [2] 3555 19,
360221
procedures [3] 35081 ,
36241369018
proceed [3] 357222
3671 15, 367212
proceeded [1] 35106
proceeding [2] 352125
367111
process [4] 3582 / 358616
361514361624
processes [1] 356013
produce [1] 356319
professonal [6] 351721
352014355318356820
363017
program [22] 3523 23, 24
3524223525 12, 2235262
1035271335507358613
14172023,3588336036
3606436159363312,14
364514
progress [3] 36061362515
362718
prohibit [1] 366925
project [4] 35867 10,
35979359817
promote [1] 358620
prompteng [2] 358967
prone [1] 356519
pronounce [2] 3636 7, 36745
proper [1] 351323
properly [1] 353224
proposal [3] 3654 21,
36801115
proposed [7] 365418
36801218 23, 3681478
protect [1] 36913
prove [2] 3581 \(13 \quad 370314\)
proved [2] 3627 18, 36301
provided [5] 354915
3555253556135753
357810
provides [1] 351223
provision [1] 36039
proximate [1] 368218
prudent [4] 35418363018
368559
Public [3] 35602335616 371021
publec [2] 368020
publication [1] 355413
publications [2] 35205
355419
published [3] 35203
35541035551
pubishes [1] 368015
pump [1] 356725
purpose [6] 360617
368422368511369017 20369116 purposely [1] 362914 purposes [3] 355625
35571356112
pursue [1] 36036
puts [1] 352421
putting [2] 352520353625
puzzied [2] 36031636041
\(-\)
qualifications [3] 35215
35225355511
qualufied [3] 35222354614 354810
qualty [2] 3648917 quantratave [2] 3556220 quantrty \([2] 35561136489\) quarters [2] 36222136748
queried [1] 360312
Question (1] 35417
question [40] 350621
35081135416354818
355025356222356312
356415356714357113
35727357311357626
1535811020358720
35941735962425
36011036078361718
362373635912363623 363914
3640 18, 36411,364413
366614366719368212
3683236841036867
36966
questroned [1] 363522
questrons [18] 35515
35721535811924
35822036001236046
3608736101436174
362723649223650813 3653636911836969 370318
quick [1] 37031
quackly [2] 355613361725
quotes [1] 357925
\begin{tabular}{l}
\hline\(\frac{-\mathbf{R}-}{\text { R-I-C-H-A-R-D-S-O-N [1] }}\) \\
3551 14 \\
radar [1] 353619
\end{tabular}

Radю [1] 351224
radm [2] 35091436391
ral [1] 37013
Ralse [2] 358224365016
rase [5] 35141435518
35681036101936923
rassed [3] 36851936999
37027
ran [1] 361812
range [1] 35673
Rangung [1] 356216
rankmgs [4] 362517
3647719
rapport [1] 35974
rare [1] 36946
rarely [1] 357122
rate (1] 363221
rates [1] 35504
RAYMOND [1] 350213
Raymond [2] 3502912
re [1] 35026
reach [2] 352512361716
reacted (1] 36238
reaction [1] 368518
read [15] \(351223 \quad 352015\)
3541635801636245
3637936441365416
36595636616369014 1637043
reading [4] \(361918 \quad 36448\) 3659736887
real (5) \(356522 \quad 23358019\)
36921317031
realstic [2] \(359612 \quad 13\)
realize [2] \(355418 \quad 363216\)
reason [7] 35659356720
3572836269112336476
reasonable (4) 356712
3570635748357710
reasonably [1] 35614
reasons [6] 35301735432
3565 12358020365526
rebound [1] 35604
recalls [1] 363622
recap [1] 366416
recenve [2] 358716367313
received (10] 35159
3561183562235871517
360215183659 2, 5
366318
recering [1] 36304
recently [2] 36141636158
Recess [11 370419
recess [5] 3572171819
36411415
reckless [1] 36419
recognize [3] 365825
365912
recognizing [2] 35635
35959
recollect [2] 3619536372
recollection [18] 351112
3592 21, 359511360815 ,
3620243634193635625
363813642343649911 ,
36969122436996
370015
recollectrons [1] 363524
recommend \([3] 3569\) 15
357018363022
recommendation [3]
\(362122362820 \quad 24\)
reconstructung [2] 352024 355524
Record [1] 366613
record [13] 35142035188
203524735311635383
35511135611135831
361022365018369123
36925
recorder [8] 3527835281
29143529635302 353424 -
recorders [2] 35211619
recording (1) 3553 I
records [2] \(354920 \quad 3582 \quad 13\)
Red [1] 366825
\(\begin{array}{llllll}\text { red }(13) & 3526 & 12 & 13 & 15 & 17\end{array}\)
35273353124353238
35341835352354618
356445
REDIRECT [4] 35816
36095364724368625
reduce [1] 36916
reduced [1] 357125
reducing [1] 369025
Reef [17] 352921353923
73540222535411
35437123664936676
367025367111213 36901
reef [6] 35102353124 35381354315354422 reentering [1] 354012 refer [4] 351218360023 361625366423
reference [1] 36059
referred [1] 359619
referring \(\{1] 365619\)
refers [1] 366421
reflect [1] 357320
reflecting [1] 354216
reflects [3] 3528 IO 35383 354213
reframe (1) 364312
refrigerators [1] 367811 regard [411 3560635705 3599173600736018 36051736061915
36071224363214
363921364067364215
364418364516202223
364691317364718
368010173681101821
36825368452236851
\(\begin{array}{llll}12 & 13 \quad 173686 & 12\end{array}\)
370213370313
regardless [2] 3650136906
regards [1] 357624
regumen [1] 361424
region [2] 35426354312
register [1] 368016
regular [5] 355815357120
3629 14, 365312367912
regulation [7] 36646
360522,366861536856
10368812
regulations [9] 365415
3656916365712366925
36842123368748
rehabiltated [1] 360216
rehabilatation [22] 358718

213589153598123
360234103606136101
36142036159123626 I
3633710182436348
37022021
relapse |l| 363221
relate \([3135248\) Il 35565
related [8] \(35208 \quad 356012\)
3570203581122335932
36371936413
relates [3] 35216355715 362221
relating [5] 351718355121
355521359816365419
relations [1] 363320
relatronshıp [17] 35057
35079351393573913
1635791336212336245
81336251736312021
36344367010368413
relatuve [1] 36432
relaged [1] 350923
relevant [5] 35645356510
3569181935751
relieve [1] 368420
relieved [2] 3685610
rely [1] 3596 I
relying |l| 3689 21
remam [4] 351323358525
36319366115
remans [1] 366116
remarkably \(\{2\} 356016\) 35779
remember [301 3503268
133504192535064614
3507153512 14, 358120
24358521359317
3598243610736224
3632536365363725
364673648436562
368214369818369924 37001014
remiss [3] 36414710
reparr [2] 35078354925
repeat \(\{11360610\)
repeatedly [1] 358018
rephrase [1] 368620
replace [1] 362818
replaced [2] 35971436143
replacements [1] 36141
report [32] 35051314
350718350814351715
35201335216357011
3579232425359425
360023361725361824
362021362348911
362422362718363814
3639722364013364524
3661253679722
reported [18] 35147
3564182335654357815
1835851236201736217
36232,4362421363820 ,
364011 15, 16364513
364610
reportedly [2] 353819
354311
reporter [1] 35189
reporting [6] 3514535743
361713661192036627
reports [8] 356419357110

12357420357819
3617101113
represent [5] 350411
35631535641035731
36741
represented [7] 351912
352922353917354014 \(1518 \quad 35657\)
representing [2] 353925
356221
represents [4] 35221821
3540535445
reputation [1] 370216 request [8] 35042135069
3507222335227353320
35351835389
requested [3] 350419
3600 9, 371010
require [2] 35638364021
required (3) 35136366817 ,
36821
requrement [5] 35133
351453661736624
36828
requrements [4] 36611920 \(366514 \quad 368719\)
requires |3| 3555436687
36822
requisitions [1] 3617 /3
research [15] 3552131920
213553635559355820
35601235752335791
358216361219
reserve [1] 351613
Reserves (1] 351910
reside [1] 36928
restgned [1] 362816
resources |1] 360225
respect 18135491359020
3595173596935973
3621233624936714
respond 12136572123
responded [2] 359316
365724
response [4] 35948
36371136401823
responsiblities [2] 361112 368513
Responsibulty [I] 36858
responsibulity [6] 35703
358421361115363322 36854
responsible ||| 36856
rest (2) 356324357524
rested (1) 35743
restricted [2] 366824
3689 21
restrictive 111368914
result [3] 3533535699
359023
resulted [1] 3508 I
resultung [I] 36914
results |11 35532
resume (1) 355418
resumed |4| 363817
\(364310 \quad 1536447\)
return [1] 35885
returned [1] 36197
returning [3] \(35888 \quad 3604\) 11 362315
returns ||| 3588 IS
reused [2] 350418
review [1] 352115
reviewed [8] 352117
3554 14, 35552325 ,
35641135677360817
361411
revolutions [3] 35242
35492335505
Rice [1] 350612
RICHARDSON [3] 355118
35722435816
Rxchardson [13] 3551713
14203553535558
3557143562435672
35681835721035731 357417
ride [1] 370313
riding [2] 3617737008
Right [10] 35122235414
3559 15, 36361736575
36592236632536735
3678336893
rugh [1] 365623
rise |1] 35023
risk [1] 354222
River [8] 3583222336116
\begin{tabular}{llll}
7 & 3651 & 5 & 6 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
Roared [1] 358414
Robert [4] 3515151617 ,
351822
rock [1] 351017
Rocky [7] 366012 13, 23, 24,
3661 I2 366411368718
role [1] 356015
Roman [1] 351219
room (10) 35362035434
3593103614536465
367767192324
rooms [2] 35922036782
Rouge |l3| 350710361822
362023363543642911
365613674121736756
3679111215
roughly [4] 35241235585 ,
3565435777
round [1] 351714
routunely [4] 3566522 ,
3570435768
Royal [2] 35172425
rpm [2] 35262
rpms (1) 35246
RPR [1] 371021
rudder \(\begin{array}{llllllll}381 & 3528 & 11 & 13 & 18\end{array}\) 2335291481318 3530178910353111
353211151824353334
525353423535510
3537142124353913
354420354745713, 35502
rudely [1] 361617
rule [14] 3654 I8 21
 243681478
rules [2] 3541835822
rumor \(1513675 \quad 24367619\) 22367922
rumors [5] 36742336753 3685202324
run [7] 3507611351316
35431135556363114

367912
run-down [1] 363013
runnung [8] 3565336175
36255 9, 19365512
36561367615
runs [1] 35809
rush [1] 359122

\section*{- S -}
safe [7] \(358422 \quad 361113\)
367018213685489
sāfety [6] \(351915 \quad 35208\)
3584 22, 3627 5, 367021
369024
sall [1] 36137
sauled [16] 35162123
3517 2, 3521 10, 358456
36129 10, 365281922
3668 19, 23, 3673 19.
3693 23, 369412
saving [3] 3652 2, 36539
367310
San [13] 350710362116
19362217362817
365118365525367216
3674121736769369425
369720
SANDERS [13] 358222
358363599820,360118
36096361014,1736113
363293647222536508
Sanders [1] 367413
satelitite [1] 35058
satisfied [1] 358212
Saturday [1] 3503 11
saying [11] 3503 1 35056
35481821358722
36162036241336341
36651236696
scale [2] \(35445 \quad 356221\)
scenario [2] 36151936162
schedule [7] 35076 12, 14
35552535562357512
 35408
School [3] 3553113554 3, 8 school [4] 3573636127
3652 14, 15
schools [1] 35547
Schuyler (1] 351617
science [7) 35161117
35532035821358313
369489
scientufic (4] 35551535594 356716357211
scientifically [1] 358216
scientist [l] 358212
scope [1] 36165
screen [5] \(355422 \quad 355717\)
3561123562 4, 363622
screwy [1] 361714
Sea 19\(] \begin{array}{llllll}3583 & 22 & 23 & 36116\end{array}\)
7365156813366825 sea \([13] 3516203517610\)
352442335253354924
355013603710370125
Sea-Land [2] 35171114
seagoing (1) 35872
seaman [4] 35104351622
3625236293
seamanship [2] 36253
363022
search [13] 36747810
367673678715367910
11368634613
searches [2] 36177368621
Seaspray [1] 365021
seated [1] 351416
Second [3] 358611369325 36941
second [29] 35091335328
35361635439354510
355418356517,356725
359222359310361913
36292363520363722.

3641133652 9, 3653 19,
3657 2, 3658 11, 143660 1,
36613368111368721
3689 14, 3690163693 19,
36972370210
seconds [6] 3528 16,
3531 24, 35324 9, 353411 24
section [3] 3512 19, 362724
36899
sector [5] 352612131415
self-generated [1] 364123
sending [1] 365724
senior [4] 3608 18, 361412
36477367316
sense [7] 356253565 21,
364013648212436491
36887
sensituvity [1] 362810
separate [1] 363514
separation [5] 3508 24,
351125351322352314
35407
September [6] 35865
359710361410365913 1636617
sequence [1] 35629
SERDAHELY [1] 354210
Serdahely [1] 35428
sernatum [2] 3625712
sentes [2] 3574436046
sermous \([2] 356523 \quad 36774\)
Service [4] 35147351712
355125369019
service [4] 35171416
369021
sets [1] 36891
setting [2] 35729358019
Seven [2] 3527 17, 18
seven [6] 350422352717
35292235301018,36173
severe [3] 356693577919
severely [2] 356647
shame [1] 36226
shape [5] 358912362011
36793436982
shaped [1] 355921
Shaw [17] 36185619
3620223639183640610
133641336452236463
5, 8367423367525
367922
Sheehy 411135902435914
143592493603171819
3618510193620222
36216362210362328

3628143635436401619 20243641124364318 19364524364659 \(\begin{array}{llllllll}3674 & 18 & 19 & 3675 & 5 & 6 & 11 & 14\end{array}\) 2023
367613367913
sheet (1] 365813
shift [17] 35682435699
357014357151015
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3572 & 3 & 3574 & 12 & 15 & 18 & 19\end{array}\)
20233575235769
35792021
shmes [I] 352614
Ship (1] 358512
Shupping [10] 358416
3586835871360613
3613282023364225 365810
shipping [2] 35133,362816 ships [33] \(350520 \quad 350614\)
1825,35079111635166
233517719352118
35491235802358624
361736711362520
36291364293648415
365120367217368711
13368925369346
369913
Shipyard [2] 363821
363922
shipyard [2] 36121236564
shocked [1] 364710
shoreside [6] 358625
358723630243643915 36446
shorthand [1] 371010
Show [1] 35782
show [14] 35154352215
352914353112353310
3534335353353922
3542735431835557
35571835665365818
showing [6] 352220
3533213534233557724
35688
shows [3] 35302353525 354923
shut \([2] 350818 \quad 351015\)
sic [1] 356111
Sidebar [1] 369123
Siesta [1] 356620
stesta [1] 356620
sight (1] 353622
sughting [1] 35698
stgn [1] 362313
signal (1] 362313
signature [1] 360024
sgnuficance [3] 355922
35661835714
stgnuficant [3] 3505 11
356823356910
sganficantly [1] 357124 signs [1] 361614
siver [4] 3583736741416
sumple [1] 367613
smulated [2] 35492535501
sumulations [1] 356313
slacere [2] 363711363812
smeerest [1] 36371
Sugapore [6] 36564614 172436574
sungle [1] 361724
sips [1] 35174
Sur [2] 36391136846
stt [2] 368023369620
site [1] 353715
sttting [3] 356913367723 24
situation [26] 350615
351011355521356819
357025835711535748
2335762359518361520
36171720361918
3627193630836381525
363933640736431
366021368311368911
Sxx [1] 365410
swx 9 (9] \(351218 \quad 35251217\)
35463356010356425
3571 12, 35921536427
Sxx-tenths [I] 35413
sx-tenths [1] 35412
skew [1] 35306
skills [2] 36253363022
skıpper [1] 3629 1
skıppers [1] 362319
slate [1] 3628 I8
Sleep [10] 355125355210
35561222355722
355814356213356521
356611357811
sleepier (1) 355614
Sleepiness [2] 35607
356510
sleepiness (38] 355313
355679123559724
3560359222535618
356393565223566910
2125356921223
35701624357269
\(3573810 \quad 1316357513\)
35801221233581211
358215
sleepıng [3] 35613356713
35685
sleepy [16] 35576722
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}3558 & 21 & 3559 & 1 & 11 & 14 & 19\end{array}\)
356519356647357514
18357639
slept [2] \(356413 \quad 356710\)
slice [1] 353019
sliced [1] 353019
slight [1] 35304
slightly [2] 35367
slipping [1] 370118
Slope [3] \(35062435076 \quad 10\)
slow [6] 35301636572
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3672 & 11 & 14 & 18 & 19\end{array}\)
slowed [3] 3530141821
slur [1] 369722
smaller [1] 36778
smell \(77 \begin{array}{lllllll}3511 & 6 & 10 & 11 & 15\end{array}\)
18362520
Smelled [1] 351120
smelled [7] 3510192123
351112910
Snapdragon [1] 361025
socual [2] \(35709 \quad 13\)
Society 12\(] 351723 \quad 3518\) I
society [1] 35671
solace [1] 351916
solely [1] 35961
somebody [2] 35904
360924
someone [14] 350612
3548213556131435583
24356520357110
3588213589135907
3687141536889
somewhat [3] 35588
356221361415
somewhere [3] 353618
356522359116
Sorry [1] 359623
sorry [10] \(352420 \quad 353313\)
35412235499357311
\(358720 \quad 2136587369015\)
sort [20] 351812357118
3588235892359122
3594243595635967
35971636098936158
223623101314362625
363013370021370314
sorts [1] 36174
Sound [45] 350510350821
3513202135142352220
3538 II 17354191419
354223629436537
365414192436551
3656103657836591723
366183663914366617
36672366872022
3669281023
36701,36801136872325
368833689173690115
1920
sounding [1] 36247
sounds [1] 369212
south (9] 35245352525
35263113527935347
35367353712
southbound \([5] 351215\)
3513203514135409
367213
southerly [1] 352313
southward [3] 352314
35381735433
spare [1] 36086
speak [7] 35837359621
360343620812363320
367413
speaiking [7] 350611
3580243618436213
3622436231736997
special [31 3586736035
360811
specialty \([5] \quad 3520 \quad 16 \quad 18\)
3554535731014
specuic [4] 351024356224
3581436629
specifically [9] 350317
\(\begin{array}{llllll}356511 & 3620412362612\end{array}\)
3636223640936851
36994
spectrum [1] 356518
speed [25] 352434617 ,
2223253525335269
35271335313354189
172135421355031719
21367278
speeds [6] 351316354919
2135506811
spell [5] 35511235832

36102336501936926
spelled [2] 35511436111
spells 111369213
spend [4] \(3568 \quad 24361825\)
36194362523
spill [1] 368218
splat \([5] \begin{array}{lllll}3574 & 12 & 15 & 17 & 19\end{array}\) 23
spoke [13] 35052435109
36022236206362821
363414171936383
364635369722
spoken [4] \(3618 \quad 19 \quad 36351\)
35
spot [1] 353611
spots [2] 354812
sprays [1] 351321
spread \(1213648 \quad 10 \quad 13\)
spring [17] 35873479
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3588 & 1 & 3589 & 22 & 23 & 3599 & 18\end{array}\)
36142036271136289
3630536331136341922
2336385
springtime [1] 364623
spurmus 11362719
staff [1] 358424
stale [1] 35116
Staizer [1] 36955
stand [5] 35233356915
3665213692137013
standard [3] 35573356614
366518
standardized [2] 355615
356212
Standards [1] 351917
standards [1] 363815
stander [1] 366124
standers [2] 366359
standing 191351118
\(356913 \quad 3671781016\)
369110369712370021
stands [1] 369220
Stanford [3] 3553 11 20 21
star [1] 369212
Starboard [1] 353123
starboard [8] 35286
353118202125353234 9
start [13] 351417353419
35391635831836126
3616223617141536262
3635233652236539
started [20] \(352722 \quad 353015\)
353220353322353410
354421359521360114
3616152036189362415
3626233634136351920
3675336773368524
36941
starting [2] 351712367025
starts [2] 353711361514
State [1] 351616
state [7] 35511135598
35831361022365018
36881136925
stated [1] 353110
statement [11] 35748
35751935824360617
36087363214364119
364416172537034
statements [1] 35043
stateroom [2] 36771920
States [6] 3519912
35831236521536822
36874
states [1] 36853
statung [1] 36054
station [3] \(3660 \quad 22 \quad 3661 \quad 12\) 17
status [1] 365615
statute [1] 352414
stay (8] 35036 9, 351325
3547936169361716
36671037045
stayed (2] 362514369823
steady [1] 354720
steaming [2] 352525
368911
Steamship [2] 351723
steep [2] 37001314
steepness [1] 370015
steer [2] 35131436258
step [9] 3525 15, 16, 35516
35612358221359918
3639836509369119
stepping [2] 353624
357019
steps [1] 355519
steward [2] 36185364610
STEWART [4] 350214
3509735331214
stuck [1] 367025
stumulating [1] 357023
stupulate [1] 368819
stupulated [1] 3682 IS
stpulation [1] 3682 15
stop [5] \(3523 \quad 20 \quad 3584314\)
3598236182
stopped [2] 3531435774
stopper [1] 35782
stops [1] 353619
store [1] 369719
stories (1) 360424
storm [1] 35077
storming [1] 362220
story 17135991719
360424362813637823 369218
straight |4| 354313354424
3550236147
stratt [1] 368724
Strats (1) 366323
Street (1) 355115
stretch [2] 366325
stricter [1] 36654
Strictly [1] 358024
Strike |1| 362020
strong [1] 361918
strongly (3) 35593358020 361723
struck 13135292035312
student [1] 355314
studied 3135211735715 35777
studies 16\(] 357025357417\) 233579192036121 study [13] 35211635227 10, 35536355721355813 355923356015356322 357521357621357917 35801
stuff [2] 36541536599
stumbling [3] 369889 370120
style [2] \(3625 \quad 19 \quad 363120\)
sub (1] 351219
subject [18] 3521625
3593253604910360813
362918363324363410
1224363527364111
368119368453685120
subjective [1] 3556 11
subjects [10] 35208
3552223554435558
35631835642360519
subsequent [3] 35689
366625
Subsequently [1] 35653
subsequently [1] 36993
successfully [1] 35474
successor (1) 36518
sufficiently [1] 35669
suggest [4] 3505 15350616
358822361910
suggested [5] 350519
3588141517360111
suggestung [2] 350510 35768
suggestron [3] 350723
350825
suggestions [1] 358821
summarize [1] 35629
Summer |1| 367513
summer 1513589119
36341436751236795
Sunday [3] 35031112
351210
\begin{tabular}{lllll} 
sunilght & {\([4]\)} & 3563 & 5 & 8 \\
\hline
\end{tabular} 35646
sunrise [2] 35631035647 sunset [1] 35647
sunshine [1] 37041
superior [2] 3675920
supervise [1] 36158
supervised [2] 35174 35882
supervises |1| 35165
supervising [1] 359720
supervision [4] 358525
3587736021636505 supervisor [7] 3585 14 19, 3588636016360213 36039361215
supervisory [1] 361115 support [71 35942479 36031036051213 supposed [3] 35132325 357723
surprise 12135213367920
surprised [2] 36782022 surprising (11) 357717 surveyor |11 \(3612 / 5\) suspect [2] 3609436395 suspend [1] 370413 susprious 111361715 sustain (1) 368410 swear (1) 351817 swing [10] \(352722 \quad 25\), 352856 10, 14, 3532 20, \(35341025 \quad 353711\) swinging [1] 353419
Sworn (6) 3514153551 10, 358225361021365017

36924
sworn [3] 3518467
syndrome [1] 35668
system [14] 3508171819
35136351421352323
3524135251435284 36701617367116
3676 13, 36901
\[
-\mathrm{T}-
\]

T-O-M-P-K-I-N-S [1] 35834
table [1] 36225
takes [7] 354723355618
355831824368267
talent [1] 36295
Talk [1] 36394
talk [29] 350613355817 ,
\(358913 \quad 359315359719\)
223604233605136193
11362016,36211013
3622 11, 362913363323 ,
3634710 12, 36381425
363953640436425 ,
3654253655236777
368413
talked [18] 35061359112
35946361411361810 ,
36204362125362414
363423363713364019
2324364525364613
36761836773369716
talking [33] 3503 10, 35059 ,
351116351919357623
3585183595 25, 36222
362411362524363421
3635213638736467 ,
364741436542336626
93663420366525
3667936697,36705 ,
3674 19, 36792336852
369624
36977 14, 1820
talks [4] 36612336638
3665936755
tank [3] 35052035135 35208
tanker [5] 3505312
\(350613 \quad 353816 \quad 361217\)
tankers [9] 350681922
351663538435846
361117,1920
tape [2] 3504 14, 19
tapes [4] \(350411 \quad 17\)
36971920
task [3] 35707358025
35811
tasks [2] 3504735695
tea (1) 36324
teach [6] 35541458
35699357014
teaching [2] 3552635549
team (1) 366123
teamwork [2] 35861621
technical [2] 3519 13,
359419
technique [1] 35563
Technology [1] 351614
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}\text { Ted [4] } 3645 & 9 & 15 & 16 & 17\end{array}\)
telephone [4] 3505836026
36097365720
telex [2] 36571924
telling [2] \(354613 \quad 358718\) tells [2] 35667367523
temper \([3] 36762324\) 37027
temperature [1] 357021 tempered [1] 37025
Ten [1] 352910
ten [39] 3504 22, 352716
3528 12, 13, 352981317

35332453534220
353549353673537514
22, 3539 12, 354217
3544203547935483
3565223568 21, 22
3571123662 1, 7, 36632
536724
tend [1] 357722
tended [1] 36283
tendency [2] 35603356619
tender [1] 35209
tenement [1] 362724
tenth (1] 35382
tenths [1] 352715
tenure [1] 365417
term [19] 35591347
35759172022 24, 35761 \(714,36073,36438,36718\) 10, 36935
terminal [6] 3696141718
36986369910370312
terms [10] 352925355959
3575 22, 357611358018
3627143649 24, 366822 36697
Test [7] 35561222355722 3558143562 13, 356611
357811
test [10] \(\begin{array}{llllll}3556 & 8 & 11 & 12 & 18\end{array}\)
253557261116355911
testufied [37] 35021025
35112235212435236
35321035391135416
35462135481354919
358214360115360421
360911361445363213 24, 3633213634136362 52136374363816
3640101636412364419 3646 20, 3647 12, 3680 8, 11
368323686 3, 370214
testufy [3] 3520 20, 36085 37039
testafying [2] 36011636345
testumonies [1] 35511
testumony [30] 35042
350610353514353719
3555243564113567810 357023571335742
358611360114192125
360421236231736342
3638101236452336484 366911367262136744 368121
tests [1] 35165
Teton [1] 36928
Texas [10] 358343590913
359311361220363111
12364211 13, 364612
Thank [23] 35151610

3545235514616
3555123580435815
358221359911360123
36092361015364723
36509367322368411
370292537031719
thank [1] 368623
thanks [1] 350724
there'd [1] 350714
thereafter [2] 350521
358723
thermoregulation [4]
35782535791511
They're [3] 3666 I1 36723 36839
they're [10] 35345353814
3566735802236176
36321636626936634 367621
thm [1] 364810
thunking [2] \(354723 \quad 359617\)
Third [5] 35675357212
358120358215367224
third [17] 35032350718
35101351612355516
\(356425 \quad 36251314\)
3652123653101736624
369411036971
THOMAS [2] 350217
350910
thoughts [5] 36181236217
36243363724
three [28] 350411350918
3515735271535421420 21354827835525
3612132336201936212
36466365118365221
366122366813369422
23369529369711
3701122
three-quarters [1] 352514 throwing [I] 357924
thrown [2] 357115357918
tude [1] 351017
tue [1] 367611
tued [2] 35284369217
tull [2] 35265365323
tumes [20] 35212035284
353916172235424
35484735491719
3551235572335581
3564123642716365219
369415
tred [3] 355915357610
tomorrow [2] 37041318
TOMPKINS [3] 35835 35991236095
Tompkins [15] 358223
35833 7, 358925359113
359216360481636097
361434815,1821
ton [1] 36291
topic [1] 363323
topics [1] 36047
tore [1] 362222
total [1] 35775
totally [4] 353821357820
359124367920
touch [3] 351412362521
367920
touched [1] 360223
tough [2] \(362425 \quad 36513\)
towards (3) 36711115
3672 I2
towboats [1] 361317
town [2] 3645436535
towns [1] 36806
trace [9] \(35223 \quad 20 \quad 35302\)
35352535379121325 353816
traces [1] 353712
track [31] 351323352019
22232435212035228
213523735301435316
183533173534689
353547253536635389
\(\begin{array}{llllll}16 & 353918 & 23 & 35401015\end{array}\)
3542132035491
trackmg [1] 36717
tracks [4] 35223353916
355038
trade [3] 35205365315 365519
traded [2] 36292365520
Traffic [9] 35091315
351124351241235147
36701117369019
traffic [39] 35081718
3509435112535121524
35131212235141234
 \(\begin{array}{llll}22 & 354071213 & 13\end{array}\)
354219354424366945
36701617367115
368915223690362021
trainug [4] 355310360215
36656
transcript [4] 359916
3632123710912
transcription [1] 371010
transfer [12] \(362812 \quad 23\)
362915363853643713
3646171922364719
36564
transferred [6] 35849
36122036132436313
364410365525
transferring [3] 359510
35978362912
transfers (1] 363421
transit [5] 350819351310
366111366712367021
transited (1] 3541 18
transitung [4] 3541914
35421
transition [5] 35971618
359816361479
translate [1] 3524 11
translated [1] 361814
transpired [1] 37036
transportation [2] 351612
369410
trapped [1] 36613
traveling [9] 3524535261
193527143531335409
3542535433
travels [3] 353817354011 20
treat [2] \(355218 \quad 35825\) treated [5] 35941635955 35981536067362410 treatung [1] 355215
treatment [19] 35827
3587243588335893
359812131360116
3606141836082336099
\(36108361416 \quad 2436159\)
3616136304363217
trial [7] 35026354924
3550135512236042 37043
trials [2] 351767
tricky [1] 363020
trip [6] 36071936354
36552036578367914
trips [2] 36531736546
Trooper (11 35118
trouble [31 35759359622 35991
troughs [1] 35634
true [8] \(356617 \quad 35802\)
360110363823366116
36651936681237109
truth [2] \(3518 \quad 10 \quad 18\)
tugs [1] 361317
turning [1] 35504
turns [4] \(3546 \quad 2535472\)
35481522
twilight \([6] 35631035646\) 78
type [4] 358022359111
3594135989
types [2] \(35166 \quad 368316\)
typical \([2] \begin{array}{llllllll}3567 & 11 & 3571 & 14\end{array}\)
typically [3] 35601135673
357922
\(\overline{-\mathrm{U}-}\)

UN [1] 351916
U S [12] 3516101224
351723519141516,
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3521 & 21 & 3611 & 14 & 23 & 36617\end{array}\)
36944
USA [3] 35841016
361221
Uh-huh (1) 370023
ULCC [1] 36937
unannounced [2] 36177
361824
undergo [2] \(35078 \quad 35602\)
undergone [3] 36061418 361416
undergrad [1] 35799
undergraduate [1] 355310
underlying [1] 355614
understand [30] 35069
352618353819354818
355022356422356525
3573511358723359323
35992136015362213
36241536321921
36362036442036474
365014366245636658
367015368315368611
20370020
understanding [13] 354116
357720359416359521 ,
3596243598511360019
36025360672136569
368310
understands [1] 358816
understood 161358715

358914362416365612
366021368719
Unfortunately 11 | 362723
uninterrupted [1] 355325
unmon [1] 35932
United [6] 3519912
35831236521536822
36873
University [5] 351616
355543583151736121
unversity [1] 358316
Unsteady [1] 369810
unsuccessful \(\{2] 35101416\)
untoward [2] 36991124
unusual [2] 3563735708
upper (1) 362513
user \(\{313512 \quad 18 \quad 35712\)
369015
uses [1] 357524
- - V -
vacancy [1] 362815
Vaguely [1] 35045
vaguely [1] 35045
vartance (3) \(35778 \quad 12\)
36878
variation [1] 357410
variety [1] 355222
vary [5] \(357622 \quad 24357711\)
35782236874
verbalize \(\{11360418\)
version [3] 36351920
363716
versıons [1] 36377
versus [1] 36489
vertical [3] 355823562710
Vessel [91 \(350913 \quad 15\)
351123351241135147
36701117369019
Vessels [1] 351325
vessels [49] 350735
3508193509335131014
223516635172035208
193521162035223
353848354241421
3549593584535854
3604101136111416
361224361371013
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3642 & 15 & 18 & 20 & 3654 & 13\end{array}\)
366181136642123
366512101336811618
21368813369018
VIDEO [3] \(350218 \quad 350911\)
36835
Vıdeo [3] 350217350910
36834
video [2] 35021535099
View [1] 36928
view [9] 35061335563
35762358025358115

vewed [1] 362821
visibiltues [1] 366115
vsibility [3] 36891522
36906
vist [11] 359591235988
9360717362022362518
203642913
vsited [3] 364261518
visitung \(161359523 \quad 362116\)

Beax Sybara Applicaticos
1936252236425364811 visits [6] \(3509 \quad 13 \quad 3648 \quad 14\)
\(15 \quad 16 \quad 367418\)
vitae [1] 35554
VLCC [1] 36937
voice [2] 36741637027
vorces [1] 36999
volunteered [1] 36243
voyage [4] 352024352223 35238
VTC [6] \(3512 \quad 25 \quad 3684 \quad 13 \quad 14\) \(16 \quad 18 \quad 19\)
VTS [7] \(369012022 \quad 23 \quad 24\) 369136
-W -
W-E-N-D-E-L-L [1] 355115 WAGNER [2] 3509935148 wagon [5] \(361615 \quad 361915\) 3626836302364014
Watt [1] 36215
watt [1] 354510
wasted [1] 35049
waved [6] 36591736619
36641425368717368812
wake [1] 35751
walk (1) 36983
walked [2| 36222436986
walkne-talkie \{2| 363821
363923
walking [1] 3569 13
wanted [7] \(3589 \quad 10 \quad 13 \quad 14\)
3593143626236556
370320
warehouse [2] \(3696 \quad 18 \quad 19\)
warn (11 3691 11
warrant [2] 36722123
Watch [6] 36881936899
\(1318 \quad 2036903\)
watch \(\{23 \mid 3536 \quad 16 \quad 18\)
3564143565235805
35957361611362413
36371836482124
36612425366349
36652136836121522
3689136983
watched \(161360417 \quad 18 \quad 19\) 36293364822370125 watching [3] 356915
361613362119
water [4] 3543336845 3700818
waters |5| 351720366824 3689142136913
ways [2] 3550213593 s we'd [3] \(35071213 \quad 13363714\)
We'll (3) \(357218 \quad 3641 \quad 14\) 370325
we'll 1513557836784 3696837044
We're [2] \(354510 \quad 363521\) we're [151 \(350214 \quad 351116\) 35378355724357613 35821035851836042 362912363625364614 36495366320367917 36852
We've [3] 35348356014 36718
we've [24| 3504635174

352863534635488
35568356282135631
121335641135715
35722357321535777
19359914363810
\(364613365025 \quad 367718\)
36961
weather [2] 36601820
week [5] 350371236174
3628236959
weekend [1] 369217
weekly [1] 351716
weeks [4] 36942223
36952370122
weight [1] 36938
werghted [1] 356319
Weinhard [1] 363925
Weinhards (1) 363925
weard [2] 3618736408
welcome [1] 36775
well-known [1] 366916
well-marked [1] 366918
Wendell (1] 355115
weren't [2] \(354820 \quad 362425\)
west [12] 35268362119
\(36281315 \quad 2236291112\)
36314364410364618
36531536565
Westar [2] 369619370225
western [1] 356623
whatsoever [2] 36099
\(3623 / 4\)
whenever (2) 35925370413
whereby [1] 357022
whichever [1] 350720
white (3) \(35261417 \quad 23\)
widely [1] 370223
widespread [2] 355619
35572
widest [1] 357723
Willaam (45) 350510
3508213513202135142
3522203538101735419
14183542236294
3653725365431924
3655 / 36561036578
365917233661836639
143666173667236687
192236692810
\(\begin{array}{llllll}22 & 36701368011 & 368722\end{array}\)
253688336891736901
151920
Willamson [8| 36962
36991371537033710
Willow 111 35834
Wilmington 11 ) 361316
Windham [7] 35901719
3592223593610359711 360321
wing [7] \(351018 \quad 353121\)
2335323735361535697 wish [1] 35662
withdrawn [1] 366614
WITNESS (10) 351822
352214355113356921
3583336093361024
36502036927
Witness [6] 351415355110
358225361021365017
36924
witness |16| 35141335183

673520103521435225 24355117356110 361016365010367323 3691212537029
witnesses [2] 3640736414
woman [1] 357011
Women [5] 355214511 355324
won [1] 351922
wonder [1] 355714
wonderful [1] 35215
Woodlands [1] 35935
word [2] 35091355215
Words [1] 36765
words [15] 350924353221
3534835441835479
35851436107363516
3636536711736764
36792436916369722
37005
work [28] 350516,351619
2035178 18, 3529 12,
3547735521235562
357115357315357411
3575 2, 2135775357910
35832021358858
3589435931835955
360220360620361722
36547367712
worked [10] 35171135534
356413358324358410
35971361212361314
36822324
worker [2] \(3571 \quad 10 \quad 357423\)
workers [10] 35682535699
3570143571635723
3574181935769357920 22
working [10] 355315
3568242535831835975
36126362010362422
370412
workplace [2] 36771315
works [1] 357412
world [4] 352122356020
3656336937
worry [2] \(351412 \quad 35728\)
Worst [1] 36257
worst [3] 36151936161
364719
worthwhile [1] 362316
wouldn't [12] 350825
35731535792359522
3624123641936554
36651936712336799
37042
wreck [2] 3548516
write [1] 350814
written [3] 35411035753 36659
wrong [3] 35435361521
363624
wrote [2] 36841368515
Wyoming [1] 36929
\(-\quad-\mathbf{Y}-\)
ganked [2] 36381722
Yeah [11] 35154355021
3593836063362411
36594153666536734

36772237017
yeah [6] 36002036379
366122367312367625
370113
year [23] 350513351714
35192535201355324
358521358621361210
3617233622736241823
362510362771217
362932436301936427 16364719
years [30] \(3515 \quad 25 \quad 351618\)
3519113521 10, 3557 21,
35581335601435852 2,
361213182336135
3620203621220363521
22243636253651718 ,
36521036579366813
\(36731011 \quad 12368617\)
369315
yellow [7] 35352535362,6
\(354618 \quad 35681535789\)
yellowsh [1] 35406
yesterday [4] 355414
3622536366365015
York \([14\} 351522351616\)
358473612141214
3623233627323363818
2236429365022
Yorker (1) 363122
Yorkers [3] 36232536344
7
Yorktown [8] 359321
\(361822362023 \quad 362219\) 20367781125
Yost [1] 366912
You'd [2] 363959
you'd [6] 353425353912
36322536371536396
366519
you'll [1] 356513
you've [20] 35197352425
35331735411435473
35512035542135551
356743578635826
3584236091136236
\(\begin{array}{llll}3626 & 19 & 3668 & 19 \\ 3673 & 19\end{array}\)
36808369412370213
young [3] 35589356316 35783
younger [2] 35631718
yours [3] 361719361925
36532
yourself [5] 35552036007
36012836437
```

- Z -

```
zero [2] \(356216 \quad 356518\) zone [5] 350824351321
35231435261516
zones [1] 351320


\section*{Vol 223713}
(1) So shall I start?
(2) THE COURT You shall start
(3) MR NEAL We call Mr Harvey Borgen
(4) THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand please
(5) sir
(6) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(7) THE CLERK For the record state your full name your
(8) address and spell your last name please
(9) THE WITNESS My full name is Harvey Jensen Borgen B
(i0) Iike in boy O R G E N 309 Sugar Berry Circle Houston
(II) Texas
(12) THE CLERK Thank you sir
(13) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF HARVEY BORGEN (Live)
(14) BY MR NEAL
(IS) QMr Borgen how are you employed sir?
(16) A I'm employed by Sea River Mantume, Inc
(17) Q How long have you been employed by Sea River or Exxon
(18) Shipping Company or one of the Exxon entulies?
(19) A It'll be 31 years this month
(20) Q So you first became employed by Exxon in 19637
(21) A That's correct
(22) Q Prior to becoming employed by Exxon in 1963 give us your
(23) formal educational background
(24) A I went to New York State Mantıme Academy, college, and
(25) graduated un 1963 with a bachelor of science degree in marine

Vol 223714
transportation an ensign commission United States Naval
Reserve and a U S Coast Guard issued third mate's hcense
Q All nght sir Any other formal education?
A Yes Between 1964 and 1969 I went to University of Houston might school to get my master's degree in business with
6) a major in management and finance

Q And that was while you were employed by Exxon or one of

Exxon companies?
AYes
Q Who paid for that education for you Mr Borgen?
A At that tume the company pard 75 percent of my tuntion and
(12) books and costs

Q Now then would you just very brefly deseribe your positions with Exxon or Exxon companies from 1963 and let s stop at 1982?
A I was employed mitholly as an economic analyst in our planning group I was in the position for about five years I then moved unto your labor relations group where I worked as 2
(19) labor relations analyst for two years I then moved to New (\%) Jersey and became our operations manager for our tug and barge
(2) fleet that operated along the east coast of the United States Did that for a couple of years, and then transferred to the parent corporation in their long range manne woridwide planning group for two years
I then moved back to Houston, and I worked in the group

\section*{Vol 223715}
(1) Exxon
(2) U S A and did that for about a year and a half, and then after
3) that went back into the manne group as the repair manager
for
4) the tanker fleet of Exxon at the tume Did that for two years,
s) and then I became mantenance and services manager for the next
6) five years and had responsibulity for repars, fleet manning,
\(n\) manne benefits And in August of 1982, I moved to the west coast to become the fleet manager
Q In August of 1982 you moved to the west const to become fleet manager of the Exxon Shipping Company west coast fleet?
A Yes, sir
Q All nght Now I m going to ank you specifically about
some converation I m going to ask you what you said to somebody and what somebody aatd to you in aubatance okay?
A Yes, sir
Q In 1987 did there come a tume when you were asked to
consider Captain Hazelwood, who was on the gulf coast fleet at
the time for a transfer to the west coast fleet and become
what you call alternate captain of the Exxon Vaidez?
A Yes.
Q With whom did you have the first conversation?
A First conversation with Captan Andy Martineau, who was
port captonn
Q You might lean forward a little bit so everybody can hear you
(1) A First conversation I had was with Captan Andy Martineau
(2) Q Describe that conversation in substance I know it sa
(3) long time but in substance
(4) A We had a vacancy on the Exxon Valdez and I asked Andy to
get with the respectuve port staff from the gulf coast fleet to
make a recommendation to me as to who the individual
ought to
be to fill that position
Q All night And did he later on come back to you and you
have another conversation with him?
(10) A Yes He came back to me at a later tome and sand that the
(II) two port captans had gotten together
(12) \(Q\) Did he mention who the other port captain was?
(13) A Captam Sheehy
(14) Q All nght He told you he and Captain Sheehy had gotten
together and he was back to you to make a recommendation?
A Yes, sar
Q Go ahead
A And he said between the two of them they felt the best qualified individual for this position ought to be Captan Hazelwood
Q Did they tell you - go ahead just with the conversation
but was there more to the conversation? Did he tell you why?
A They sand - I asked them why, and they sand that they felt that because of his proor bug shup expenence his proor experience at Prnce Willom Sound and being - having an

\section*{Vol \(22 \quad 3717\)}
endorsement on hus license for Prince Wilham Sound pilotage,
(2) he was known as a fine seaman hus navigational skills were
(3) well known, beyond reproach he had a good rapport with
the
crew, and they felt that because of those qualafications be
was the best one to fill that slot at the tume
Q Now you were speaking to Captain Martineau presumably
he
was talking for both himself and Captain Sheehy but you re
apeaking to Captain Martineau is that correct?
A Yes, sir
Q What did you say to Capiain Martineau in response?
A I sand that I would get back to him on that
recommendation
Q All right Did you then have a converation with someone regarding Captaın Hazelwood?
AYes
Q Who was that?
A I had a conversation with my counterpart, the gulf coast fleet manager, Dwight Koops
(19) Q And would you tell us in substance what Mr Koops said to
(20) you and what you said to Mr Koops and in substance what he
(21) said to you in this conversation?
(22) A I had known that Captain Hazelwood had gone through some
(2) type of alcohol rehabilitation program, so I asked Dught Koops
(24) about Captan Hazelwood's performance, and he sand he พาร
(20) performing extremely well in the guif coast fleet, he was

\section*{Vol 223718}
(1) not - they had been montoring hum they hadn't any undication
(2) that he was drunking and he was clean And on that basis I
(3) said, thank you
(4) Q And then did you - was it your decision then to transfer
(s) or to agree to the transfer of Captain Hazelwood to the west
(6) coast?
(7) A It was a joint decision between myself and Dwight and we (8) agreed to it
(9) \(Q\) Now do you know a - do you know an individual by the name
(10) of Doug Larsen?
(11) A Yes sir
(t2) \(Q\) Who was at that tume - now we retalking about 1987
(13) July August 87 who was Doug Larsen? What position did he
(14) have at that time?
(IS) A Doug Larsen was our operatuons supervisor for an office
(10) that we had in Long Beach, Calufornia This office was the (17) office responsible for doing agency worik for any of our veasels
(18) that came into the Los Angeles, Long Beach area
(19) \(Q\) While we re on that it \(s\) been stated in the record that at
(20) this tume the trade of the Valde \(\angle\) was to pick up North Slope
I) crude tahe it io Panama slup bach al Lont Beach and thungo
(22) back to Valdez Port of Valdez that is correct?
( 31 ) A That is correct
(4) \(Q\) All right So the vessel would stop at Long Beach on the
(25) way back from Panama?

Vol 223719
(1) AYes
1) Q All right Did you havea - dıd vou happon to havea
(3) conversation with Mr Doug Larsen about the tume of the
(4) transfer of Captain Hazeiwood to the west coast?
(s) AYes
(6) \(Q\) Would you tell us again now in substance what you said to
7) Mr Larsen and what he said to you?
(8) A I told Mr Larsen that Captain Hazelwood was joining the
) Exxon Valdez as an alternate master that he had had presumed
(10) a dranking problem at one tume I wanted Doug, each tıme the
(II) ship came unto port when he boarded the ship, to make an
(12) abservation as to how Captain Hazelwood's job
performance was
(13) how his paperwork was, Just generally observe his behavior and
114) report back to me if he suw anythang that warranted reporting
(19) back
(16) Q And did he make reports back to you?
(17) A Yes
(i8) Q What were those reports?
(19) A Reports were all very very good He sand that Captann
(20) Hazelwood's paperwork was impeccable he was a real team
( I) player During a turn around time of that nature there's 1 (2) lot of activity goes on When the ship comes in the agent
('3) Doug Larsen would board the vessel along with \(U S\) Customs
i si personael LS lmmagratan personnel would conte aboard We're
1 st storing provisions food items un the ship we have repair work

\section*{Vol 223720}
that may be going on We have bunkers of fuel oil being delivered so it's a very actuve tume a lot of involvement, and it takes a real team effort to make that all come together smoothly
Q Now what were the reports back from Mr Larsen other than
that that he was doing well no problem et cetera?
A That's correct
Q Now then I want to direct your attention to a third
thing There \(s\) been something in the testimony here about
so called Henry s or somebody satd to be Captain Hazelwood
ordering Henry s aboard a walkie talkie - or through a
walkie talkie You understand what I m talking about?
A Yes sur
Q Did you happen to have a conversation with a Mr Herb Leyendecker regarding this matter?
A Yes, I did
Q Was that in person or by phone?
A By phone
Q All right Again tell the Ladies and Gentlemen of the
201 Jury and the Court in substance what Mr Leyendecker said to
(21) you and what you said to ham?
(12) A Mr Leyendecker said that whale he was aboard the Exxon
(23) Valdez at the Portland Shupyard -
(24) Q And by the way the Valdez was in dry dock at that time
(25) correct?
(1) was concerned, Herb's unvestugation of thes particular mcident
(2) was satusfied - satusfactory
(3) MR NEAL You may examine
(4) Excuse me just a moment Your Honor Hold on just a
(s) moment Your Honor
(6) CROSS EXAMINATION OF HARVEY BORGEN
(7) BYMR O NEILL
(8) Q I am going to cover with you because of the rules of the
(9) game that we play with exactly the subjects that Exxon just
(10) covered with you okay?
(1i) Now the first conversation that you just talked about was (12) the 1987 conversation between Martineau and Sheehy regarding
(13) Captain Hazeiwood s proposed transfer to the west coast that s
(14) the first thing you talked about right?
(15) A Yes, sur
(16) Q Let s talk about that for a minute You stated that you
(17) had known that Captain Hazeiwood had been through alcohol
(18) rehabilitation?
(19) A Correct
(20) \(Q\) And you learned that at a fleet conference sometime in 85
(21) or 86?
(22) A I want to say ' 86
(23) \(Q 86^{7}\) And you don \(t\) specifically recall how you found out
(24) about it but it was in any event a subject of conversation
(2) between you and somebody elee at a fleet conference in 1986?
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 223723 \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{\begin{tabular}{l}
(1) A Well, it would have been - I would bave heard it from \\
(2) someone, yes
\end{tabular}}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline (3) & Q Okay And then you had this conversation with your \\
\hline (4) & counterpart on the gulf coast and he said he was not drinking \\
\hline (5) & and clean Is that a correct statement? \\
\hline (6) & A That's correct \\
\hline (7) & Q So it was important to both of you I assume that he was \\
\hline (8) & not drinking and that he was clean? \\
\hline (9) & AYes \\
\hline (10) & Q And then there was a joint decision made between you and \\
\hline (II) & Mr Koops to reassign Captain Hazeiwood? \\
\hline 12) & A Yes, sir \\
\hline (13) & Q I want to talk briefly aboul that decision and what you \\
\hline (4) & did or didn \(t\) do with regard to that particular decision \\
\hline (1) & okay? \\
\hline (16) & You didn \(t\) talk to the human resources department about the \\
\hline (17) & rehabilitation did you? \\
\hline (18) & A I did not \\
\hline (19) & Q You didn t talk to the medical department about the- \\
\hline (20) & rehabilitation did you? \\
\hline (21) & A I did not \\
\hline (22) & Q You didn t talk to the human resources department or the \\
\hline (23) & medical department with regard to what a proper montoring \\
\hline (24) & program might be forthis captain in this situation did you? \\
\hline (2) & A I did not \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Vol 223723
A Yes
Q All right Go ahead with the conversation
A That he overheard on the walkie-talkie Captan

\section*{Hazelwood}
(4) ordenng beer IIerb then the next day, confronted Captan
(s) Hazelwood and sard he had overheard ordering beer and we do not
(6) allow beer on our shaps and Captan Hazelwood sand, no it
(7) wasn't for the ship, I was ordening the beer for a crew party
( 8 ) ashore and reassured Herb at that time that that's what he was
(9) doing
(10) Q Did Mr Leyendecker say anything to you about whether he
(11) asked Captain Hazeiwood if he were drinking or not?
(12) A Well I asked Herb if in his observations of Captan
(13) Hazelwood - because he had been there, this was a second
trp
(14) to the shipyard to visit, see how thngs were going, any
(15) indication is his eyes that Captoun Hazelwood was drunang or
(10) appeared to be impaired in any way, shape or form, and Herb
(t7) assured me that in his judgment, he was not
(18) Q Okay Following this conversation did you have occasion
(19) to meet or to talk to Mr Paul Myers your ahip group
(20) coordinator regarding this?
(21) A We did have a discussion after about this specific
(22) uncident
(23) Q Do you remember the - that conversation?
(24) A Well, I'm - I don't recall all the specifics of the
(25) conversation, but what I do recall telling Paul was as far as I
(1) A Well, it would have been - I would have heard it from (2) someone, yes
(3) Q Okay And then you had this conversation with your
(4) counterpart on the gulf coast and he satd he was not drinking
(s) and clean Is that a correct statement?
(6) A That's correct
(7) Q So it was important to both of you I assume that he was
(3) not drinking and that he was clean?
(9) A Yes
(10) \(Q\) And then there was a joint decision made between you and
(It) Mr Koops to reassign Captain Hazeiwood?
(12) A Yes, sir
(13) Q I want to lalk briefly aboul that decision and what you
(14) did or didn \(t\) do with regard to that particular decision
(IS) okay?
(16) You didn t talk to the human resources department about the
(I) rehabilitation did you?
(18) AI did not
(19) \(Q\) You didn \(t\) talk to the medical department about the \({ }^{-}\)
(20) rehabilitation did you?
(21) A I ded not
(22) Q You didn t talk to the human resources department or the
(23) medical department with regard to what a proper montonng
(25) A I dad not

\section*{Vol \(22 \quad 3722\)} 
\(\square\)

\section*{Vol 223724}
(1) Q You didn t go back and find out the details of his
(2) rehabilitation or the details if any of any aftercare
(3) program did you?
(4) A I did not Other than the monitoring that Dwight Koops
(5) sand that they had done
(6) Q And you didn t talk to the man in person about how he was
doing how he was doing with regard to his recovery or that
subject the man in person I mean Captain Hazelwood?
A No
Q In any event you were on notice that he had gone through
an alcohol rehabiltation program?
A Yes
(13) Q Second conversation the Doug Larsen conversation your
(14) instructions to Mr Larsen were to take a look at job
(1S) performance and paperwork when the ship came in?
(16) A Correct
(17) \(Q\) And that was the sum and substanta ol your direction to (18) him?
(19) A I also told him to observe hm to see whether or not
(20) Captan Hazelwood appeared to have been drunking at all
(21) Q While - but - okay Thank you Thank you Thiswas
(22) while the ship though came into the harbor?
(23) A And - yes, while at came anto the harbor
(24) Q Okay And I listened to your testimony you didn thave
(25) him check the captain or you didn t tell him to check the

\section*{Vol 223725}
ii) captain when the capiain came bach from leave or came back from
(2) shore to get on the ship you were talking about when the ship
(3) came in?
(4) A And while it was in port
(5) Q Do you know is this in Long Beach?
(6) A Yes sir
(7) Q Do you know ol a place in Long Buach valled the Yankee
(8) Clipper or the Yankee Saslor somewhere near where the terminal
(H) 18 ?
(10) AI don't recall
(11) Q Do you know if in fact -
(12) A But it's not - the ship is nut at a terminal, it's
(13) actually at anchor
(14) Q Then they bring a launch in?
(15) A The launch comes in
(16) Q And where the launch gets off are you aware of a bar
(17) called the Yankee Clipper or Yankee Sallor are you aware at
(18) all that your crew members get together there and have a
couple
(19) of beers?
(20) ANo
(-1) Q You re not aware of that)
\(1-1 \quad A \mathrm{Nu}\)
1 31 Q And he reporitd to vou that the paperwork was impeccable
(-4) and that the captain was a luam player and doing well?
(-S) A Yes sir

Vol 223726
(1) Q But he never reported to you that he talked to the captain
(2) about his emotional health emotional well being recovery
(3) whether he was drinking or not drinking did he?
(4) A That's correct
(5) Q Now I want to talk about the Henry s incident briefly and
(6) then we Il get you out of here okay?
(7) A Fine
(8) Q At the tume of the Henry s incident Steve Day worked for
(9) you or worked in the same area?
(10) AHe - yes, he did
(H) Q And -
(12) A Not directly for me, though
(13) \(Q\) Sort of a different chain of command but co located?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q And Mr Leyendecker was from what you guys call Mecea or
(16) Houston?
(17) AYes
(18) Q That is right?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q He was there \(\mathbf{2 0 0}\) in the Portiand Shipyard?
(21) A Correct He's the repaur manager
(22) Q And with regard to the report by Mr Leyendecker to you
(23) you testified today that Mr Leyendecker reported to you that
(24) Mr Leyendecker overheard Captain Hazelwood ordering beer?
(25) A Correct

\section*{Vol 223728}
```

the conclusion that this is enough I m going to move on to
something else?
A Correct
Q Now was Mr Steve Day - then there was a conversation
with Myers Myers came in and reported this to you and then
you told Mr Myers that it had been taken care of?
A What I told Mr Myers was that I knew about the mcident
and Herb had mvestugated that mcadent and I was satusfied
with the investigation that he had undertaken
Q And then that was - and then that sit all of the
conversations on the topic?
A Yes sir
Q Did Mr Steve Day s name come up -
A No sir
Q - at all in the reports to you?
A No
Q Now does Mr Leyendecker still work for Exxon?
A Yes, he does
Q Does Mr Day still work for Exxon?
A Yes
MR O NEILL Thank you sar
MR NEAL Just one question I didn t quite
understand
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF HARVEY BORGEN
BY MR NEAL

```

Vol 223729
Q Did you ask Mr Leyendecker if he had taiked to Captain Hazelwood?

\section*{A Yes he had talked to Captann Hazelwood}

Q Did you ask Mr Leyendecker if he dasked Captain Hazelwood
whether he was drinking? I don \(t\) remember what you aaid about
(6) that

A I don't recall whether I asked that specific questron at
this tame I can remember that, but -
Q Did you come away - excuse me
A But I do remember asking Herb, was there any indication
11
(II) at
(2) the tumes that you were aboard and observed and talked to ham,
13) and he said no

Q Did you get the impression from that conversation that as
faras you re concerned Captam Hazelwood wasn \(t\) - had not
been drinking?
A That's correct
MR NEAL Thank you
THE COURT Thank you str
MR NEAL You want to stop now or -
THE COURT I m going to get a agnal when -
MR NEAL We II call the next witness then
THE COURT We can juat go ahead
MR NEAL We call Mr Doug Larsen
THE CLERK Please rasse your nght hand
(The Witness Is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record str state your full name
your address and spell your last name
THE WITNESS Douglas Paul Larsen Last name is
Larsen L A R S N Address is 1712 Coral Place C ORAL
in Seal Beach Califorma
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DOUG LARSEN (Live)
BY MR NEAL
Q Mr Larsen did anybody ever tell you - I remembera
quarterback named \(\mathrm{I}_{1 \mathrm{~m}}\) Plunkett Anybody ever tell you you
look
(II) a lot Jike Jım Plunkett?
(12) A No sir
(13) MR SANDERS No further questions
(14) MR NEAL You may examine
(15) MR O NEILL How well did you know Jım Plunkett?
(16) MR NEAL Somebody told me one time that with my
(I7) cigar in my mouth I looked like - what shis name?
(18) MR CHALOS George Burns
(19) MR NEAL George Burns I m not that old and I
(20) resented it too But Jtm Plunkett was a great footbail
(21) player Moving on
(22) BY MR NEAL
(23) Q Mr Larsen where are you employed sir at the present (24) tume?

San
A I'm employed by Wilmington Transportation Company,

\section*{Vol 22 3731}

\section*{Pedro Californta}

Q Pardon me?
(3) A Wilmangton Transportation Company, San Pedro

California
(4) \(Q\) What is your position with Wilmington Transportation

Company?
A I'm president, chuef executave officer
Q Mr Larsen were you ever employed by Exxon Corporation
Exxon Shipping Company?
A I sure was
Q From what date to what date?
A From June of 1976 untal February, March of 1991
Q All nght Now in order to move on here let me alay that
you graduated from the Califormia Maritime Academy in 1976 ?
A That is correct
Q With third mate license?
A That's correct
Q And then you sauled with Exxon as a third mate from 76 to 78 ?
(19) A That is correct
(20) Q And from - sailed as a second mate then, with Exxon from
(21) 78 to 79?
(22) A That is correct
(23) \(Q\) And then from 79 to 80 you were a temporary port
captain?
A That's correct assistant port captan staff officer in

Vol 223732
, Houstor
(2) And what position did you assume in or around 19829
3) A Followng approximately a one to one and a half year pernod
(4) of working in Ventura County area with production department, I
s) was transferred down promoted to position of operations
(6) supervisor managing southern Californa operation for shupping
7) Q Where was that located?

A Located m Long Beach
Q Long Beach Californıa?
A That's correct
\(Q\) What was the function of that office?
A When I was transferred, it was twofold, was to handle the scheduling of the shups calling in Santa Barbara area which were running on a shuttle to Baytown, Texas, but prmanly, which was the reason the office was ongrally opened, was
attend to vessels calling in ports of Los Angeles and Long Beach
Q Los Angeles and Long Beach?
A That is correct
Q All right sir Now let me direcl your aticntion to the
year 1987 late summer early tall Wcre you still the
operations managur there located in Lonng Beach? '
A Operations supervisor yes
Q Operations supervisor? All right sir And did you
have - how long did you stay in that position?

\section*{Vol 223733}

A From July '82 untul July August of '89 approximately seven years
Q So you were there then during the cnilire pariod of time
that Captain Hacciwood was the mastur of the Long Beach from
July Auguat 87 up to the date of the grounding the master of the Exxon Valdel'
A That's correct
Q From July August of 87 up to the day of the grounding?
A That's correct
Q In that regard did you happen around July or August 1987, happen to have a conversation with a Mr Harvey Borgen? AI did
Q Did you recognize Mr Borgen as the west coast fleet
managur who just left the stand?
AIdo
Q Would you tell us in substance the conversalion you had with Mr Borgen' A Mr Borgen advised me that the - ouse of the alteruate positions of master of the Exain \(V\) ildez was upen was being
(20) replaced by Master - Captan Hazelwood He would be coming
(i) out working on the west cuast coming out from the gulf coast
i-) Further to that he udvised me that Captann Hazelwood had
a -
(3) effectively, a substance abuse problem in the past and it
was
(24) indicated it was alcohol related and that he requested me to
(S) monitor him while he was - while has vessel came into port
(1) notufy hum if there was any problems, behavioral cues, his
2) paperwork was out of sync, if his arrivals were off his
(3) performance was other than the normal expected of the position,
(4) If I noted if he had been dronking on any occasion, along those
s) lunes, agan, Just generically any problems
(6) Q You understood what you were supposed to do?
7) A Yes, sur
8) Q All right Following that conversation did you undertake
to perform the task of monitoning Captain Hazeiwood as
(10) requested by Mr Borgen?
(il) AI did
(12) Q How would - what did you do to fulfill that role?
(13) A Follow through with all aspects of his request Ifirst
(14) met Captan Hazelwood when he was - met with hm when
he
(15) jomed the west coast I don't know if he was already on the
(10) ship or he was about to join the shup I had a lunch -a
(17) lunch with hum at a shoreside facility in Long Beach I met
(18) whth hum and another captain from another ship, who was going
(19) on a paid leave or leaving, and we had lunch That was a

Saturday I believe, Saturday afternoon
(21) I had lunch with him I had a beer I think one of the
(n) other captans had a beer possibly Captan Hazelwood had
(23) Perrier As follow up, as an example, I notufied Mr Borgen
of
(24) the lunch welcome to the west coast, and just told hum that
we
(2S) had lunch and he wasn't drinking, he was having Perner

\section*{Vol 223735}

Durng subsequent meetings dunng that roughly one and a
half year penod the Valdez called anto port roughly a dozen times
Q Roughly how many tumes?
A A duzen Roughly on a one mouth cycle, the Valdez went
Panama and stopped in Long Beach on the northbound trip
for
(7) ballast and coming from a foreign port customs clearance
needed to be taken care of, ammigration work for the crew
leaving, being repatnated, crew that were joining and what
have you, had a close interface with Captan Hazelwood
preceding the actual arnval of the vessel, both in exchange of
(12) telexes communications, discussions on the MARSET radio about
(13) the upcoming port call, attending to the - advising us of what
(i4) port requirements he was going to need repars stores, fuel,
(IS) et cetera Doarded the vessel ether myself or the agent who
(16) reported to me his name was Roa Kelly the two of us went
-
(17) one or the other of us would attend to the entry of the vessel
(18) seven days a week, 24 hours a day didn't matter what tume It
(19) was, one in the morning or whatever
(20) Q Speak up just a little bit
(21) A I'm sorry It could have been any time of the day We (22) boarded the ship with the customs and immigration personnel
(23) Proceeded to the bridge and spent roughly one to two hours
(4) board the ship in the master's office and stateroom area
s) During that tume I had - I was in close proximity the Vol \(22 \quad 3736\)
(1) occasions that I boarded personally boarded the vessel for (2) customs entry I had - I was wnthun inches or a foot of
(3) Captan Hazelwood Never had any odor of alcoholic beverage on
(4) hum at all completely control of his vessel always on tume paperwork was absolutely impeccable the best l've ever seen
(6) very well organized very well land out quick turn around quack entries although I think Harvey Borgen mentioned it's a
(8) real team - teamwork between all the - the agent the repar
gangs, and everybody else that was attending the ship and
the
((0) ship's personnel trying to get the ship in attend to the
(i1) various aspects that were going on, he managed his ship
very
(12) well in port
(13) Q Did you - so there are a number of occasions then when
(14) you spent a good bit of time with Captain Hazelwood in close
(15) contact?
6) A That's correct

Q And this is when the vessel was coming into port?
A That is correct
Q Would the vessel be in port at tumes several - several days at a ume?
A Typically the ship would come and spend between 12,12
hours unless there was extended repars On occasion I
belseve the shup was in port up to maybe a week
Q A week?
A Correct

\section*{Vol 223737}
11) Q On any of those occasions you were with Captain

\section*{Hazelwood}
(1) did you see any sign of any untoward conduct any stgn of
(3) drinking any sign of anything like that?
(4) A Absolutely not
(s) Q Did you report your observations to Mr Borgen?

AI did
Q And did you report that you had seen no sign that Captain Hazelwood was what you ve juat testified?
A I reported thoroughiy, yes
Q Now I gather that you had an assiatant by the name of Ron Kelly?
A That's correct
Q Did you talk to - did you inform Mr Ron Kelly about the
fact that Hazelwood Captain Hazelwood had had some sort of rehabilitation in the past?
A I was unaware that Captan Hazelwood had any
rehabuitation
(In at all They just told me that he had a problem io the past
(18) and that he was out on the west coast at this tume and keep
an
(19) eye on hum As regards my discussion with Ron Kelly, no I did
(0) not tell him specifically that Captam Hazelwood had - or I
(21) was informed or aware that he had a problem with alcohol, what
(22) have you, but I did review with Ron Kelly, the agent, each
and
(23) every port call I made a point of looking at the paperwork
(24) and the voyage file It always came by me any ways as a matter
(5) of recourse standard operating procedure I would review the
files before they would be put among the central files I
would dıscuss with Ron each port call albett 12 hours or 7
days, any problems not just with Captan Hazelwood but any
other ship that came into port as a matter of fact but for
the Valdez probablv a little bit closer than other shaps yes Q Did Mr Keily ever report to vou that he saw anything untoward for lack of a hetter word unprofessional untoward any conduct that would - out of the way about Captain Hazelwood?
A Absolutely not Just to the opposite of that We had discussions that the Valdez with both Captan Hazelwood and
(12) Captan Stalzer were enjoyable to have come into port
because
(13) everything worked on clockwork it was well organized

Q Did you ever inquire of anybody about Captain Hazeiwood a
conduct or performance?
A Yes, I did
Q With whom did you inquire?
A Vanous pilots Long Beach pilots
Q Did you inform them hey I understand that Captain
Hazelwood may have had a problem with alcohol in the past
and
(21) theretore I want you to do anything or tell me anything?
(29) A No I did no
(23) Q Pardon me?
(24) A No, I did not
(2J) Q Why not?

\section*{Vol 223739}

A Well the discussion I had with Mr Borgen, it was treated
in a very sensitive manner it was confidentagl mformation I
felt that Mr Borgen passed on to me and the questions that
(4) directed or just talking casually with the varnous pilots the people in the port that I had acquaintances with that might have had dealings with Captan Hazelwood were very generic, and
discussion in text the reaction I got from the plots along
the lnes was that they thought he was an excellent ship
handler, great command of the vessel, very comfortable, knew
(10) how the vessel handled very comfortable working with hum
(11) \(Q\) Is it far to say then you talked to these pilota and
(12) people about Captain Ha7elwood s performance and asked them
(13) about il withoul being so indelicate as to mention that your
(14) understanding he might have had some alcohol problem in the
(15) past?
(16) A That us correct
(17) Q Did you ever get any bad report from anybody about Captain
(18) Hazelwood in any of these pilots that you talked to?
(19) A No, I did not
(20) Q By the way on occasion was Mr Borgen down at the vessel
(21) aiso?
(22) A He boarded occasionally I know of -
(23) \(Q\) In Long Beach?
(24) A That's correct
(23) Q Thank you

Vol 223740
```

A Or outside Long Beach yes
THE COURT Mr Neal this is the time
MR O NEILL Oh tume out
THE COURT This is tume out
MR O NEILL Darn it
THE COURT You II get your chance I don t know
whether you heard or not we have to take just a few moments
Would everyone just please stand by bc at ease fora few
minutes and we ll be back just as quickly as we can
(Recess laken at 844am tu 8 55am
THE CLERK Court is back on the record
THE COURT Youmav cross examine Mr Neal-oh I
did itagan I m sorry O Neill
CROSS EXAMINATION OF DOUG LARSEN
BY MR O NEILL
Q Did you have anything to do at all with San Francisco? Did
you ever go up to San Francisco and help the ships in San
Francisco?
A In what tume frame, sur?
Q 87 to 89?
A No Late un '89, I was - I was promoted and transferred
up to the San Francisco to operations supervisor for the
enture
(23) west coast so at the tal end of 1989 yes, I dad
(24) Q I m concerned about March of }198
A No1

```

A No, I did not
2) Q How about Nate Carr?
3) A No, I did not
(4) Q How about Pat Enright?
(5) A No, I did not
6) Q How about Katherine Haven?
7) A No, not Kathenne Haven
8) Q How about Carlos Hogan?
(9) A No
(10) \(Q\) So as the montor you were unaware that these crew members
(II) and the captain would go over to the Yankee Whaler and have a
(12) couple of beers?

A I was unaware of that
(14) \(Q\) He wasn \(t\) hiding the fact that he had a couple of beers
5) with anybody and indeed he stestified he openly did it you
weren \(t\) aware of that?
(17) A I didn't follow Captonn Hazelwood around if he came ashore,
(18) no, I dad not
(19) Q Now was Kevin Dick or Bob Sturgis were they assigned to
(20) the Valdez when you had this 87 to 89 duty?
(21) A I don't recollect It's possible they did
(22) Q Did you ever ask them whether they drank with Captain
3) Hazelwood?
(24) A No I did nut
(25) Q How about Mr Kunkel did you ever ash Mr Kunkel if he

\section*{Vol 223743}

\section*{drank with Capian Haselwood)}
(2) ANo sir
(3) Q Did you ever receive any training in montoring people
(4) who d been through alcohol rehabilitation?
(5) A I have had certan background tramug at the Merchant
(6) Marine Academy as tar ds general awareness of substance abuse
7) problems Further to that when I first became employed with
(8) Exxon, was in the marine with Exxon Company USA, at the tume
(9) we had a one week orientation when I first came on board
for
(10) anyone that was coming aboard in a sanling capacity

During
(11) that onentation they had an overview of company policy and
(12) what was allowed what was not allowed and beyond that there
(13) was a - one - had a one week management course that we had
(14) with officers, engineers and deck officers to discuss in part,
(1S) not specifically for that but part of that was to deal with
(16) identufying and how to handle problematic situations
(17) Q So you have had training?
(18) A Some Videos on board the vessels general awareness more
(19) than anything else
(20) Q So you re aware that with regard to alcoholics who have
(2i) been through rehabilitation there \(s\) a high rate of relapse?
(2) A I was unaware that Captain Hazelwood had been through
(23) rehabulitation
(24) Q My question for you is are you aware of the fact that
(25) aicoholics who have been through rehabilitation have high rates
(1) of relapse?
(2) A Yes
(3) Q And you re aware that aicoholics learn to mask and that s
(4) the technical term used mask both their drinking and the
(5) effects of their drinking'
(6) A I assume so yes
(7) Q And now I want to come back to what you said in response to
(8) my question two or three questions back You said I was
(9) unaware of the fact that Captain Ha7elwood had been through
(10) rehabilitation So you were the monitor and nobody told you
(11) that Captain Hazelwood had been through alcohol
rehabilitation?
(12) A I maght -
(13) Q Is that a correct statement?
(14) A - take exception in stating that I was the quote
(15) unquote monitor
(16) Q You weren the monitor -
(1) MR NEAL Let him finish
(18) MR O NEILL Go ahead Are you finished?
(19) THE WITNESS What was the question again if you want
(20) to rephrase it
(21) MR O NEILL I m happy to rephrase the question
(22) Could you go back and read what he was saying nght before
(23) counsel s objection?
(24) (The last question and answer were read back)
(5) BY MR O NEILL

\section*{Vol 223745}
I) Q Your statement was Itake exception to stating that I was
(2) the quote unquote monitor She just read that back did you (3) hear that?
(4) A Okay

Q You were not the monitor were you'
A Words in my mouth I was asked by Mr Borgen given the backdrop that Captan Hazelwood had a problem didn't go into
8) detail to it other than just to tell me there was a problem
associated with alcohol and to keep a close surverliance,
report anything concerning his performance if there was any
(11) relapse or if there was a problem, whether it was dnuking or
(12) the performance of bruging the ship in and ont of port

Q So you didn \(t\) consider yourself to be the monitor did you
(14) or a monitor and you weren \(t\) trained to be a monitor for
(1s) somebody who had been through alcohol rehabilitation were you?
(16) A That's kand of a vague question I don't know if Ican (17) answer that question
(18) Q Then don :
(19) A I was asked to monitor oversee to report and 1 did (20) that
(21) Q You were - one of the things you looked at was his
(22) paperwork okay? Do you recall that?
(23) A Uh-huh
(24) Q And you said his paperwork was exceptional?
(2) A Uh huh

\section*{Vol 223746}

Q Were you aware of the fact that Captain Hazelwood had been regularly rated at the bottom of the scale or level of masters in major part because he wasn igood at things like paperwork?
A I was not privy to his performance evaluations, no, sar Q Okay
A But as I indicated earher, his paperwork relatuve to
completing the required Coast Guard and ummigration
forms, the
(B) vanous paperwork associated with his port call, telexes,
(9) exchange of communcations was without - was flawless
(10) Q Now with regard to boarding these vessels that you did in
) Long Beach and checking the paperwork and coming on with
the
(12) customs and immigration agents that s something that you did
(13) for all of the vessels isn \(t\) it?
(14) A That is correct, the requred paperwork
(15) \(Q\) So the number of tumes that you visited Captain Hazelwoods
(16) vessel when it was in port was something that you did for all
(I7) of the vessels, that a a correct statement isn \(t\) at?
(18) A That's correct I probably boarded - I boarded his ressed
(19) more than was requred, though
(20) Q How many more umes? One? Two?
(21) A A few
(22) Q One or two umes more?
(23) A Possibly one or two tumes
(24) MR O NEILL Okay thank you ,
(25) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF DOUG LARSEN

\section*{Vol 223747}

\section*{BY MR NEAL}

QMr Larsen in your activities and observations - did your activities and observations of Captain Hazelwood and your interaction with him differ from that with other masters?
A I don't understand the question Im surry
Q Maybe I don thther You had curtain duties with respect to all masters?
A That's correct
Q Were you given an additional duty with respect to Captain
Hazelwood that you were not given with respect to other
masters?
A Yes, sar
Q That s the point
A Yes sir I was
Q And what was that duty?
A To oversee to evaluate the effectiveness of has tura around in the port and report any abnormalities actually proceed to the west coast fleet
Q Were you asked to do that with ruspect to any other master other than Captain Hasclwood'
A No I was aot
THE COURT Thank you sir You may step down
3) MR SANDERS May il please the Court defundants call
(24) Mr Tom Shearer
(25) THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand please
(1) sir
(2) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(3) THE CLERK For the record state your full name your
(4) address and spell your last name please
(5) THE WITNESS Grady T Shearer, S H-E A R ER 3768
(6) Grove Street Sonoma California
(7) THE CLERK Thank you sir
(8) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GRADY T SHEARER (Live)
(9) BY MR SANDERS
(10) Q Good morming, Mr Shearer?
(LL) A Good morming
(12) Q Let me guess you work for Sea River Marnume?
(13) A You got it
(14) Q How long have you worked for Sea River Maritime or Exxon
(15) Exxon Shipping Company?
(16) A Approxmately 27 years
(17) Q All right And before coming to Exxon did you receive any
(18) formal education?
(19) A I have a business degree from Lamar Tech in Beaumont,
(20) Texas
(21) Q Did you grow up in Texas?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q And when you were employed with - by Exxon 27 yeara ago,
(24) where did you go to work?
(2s) A I started in Baytown Texas, and worked there about seven

\section*{Vol 223749}
(1) months
(2) Q And then where did you go?
(3) A Norfolle, Virgenia
(4) Q And how long were you in Norfolk?
(5) A About seven, elght years, then I transferred to the west coast in about 1978
Q All right Now when you transferred to the west coast neet office where was it located?
A At the time, it was located in Concord, Califorma
(10) Q All night And at some time subsequent it moved to
(II) Benicia?
(12) A Yes, Benucia refinery
(13) Q And there was a break when it was in Emeryville?
(14) A Yes, it went to Emeryville in '90 or something hke that
(15) Q Now it s back in Benicia?
(16) A Rught
(17) Q Have you served continuously in that office ance 1978
(18) wherever it happened to be located?
(19) A Yes sir I did
(20) Q What was your job?
(21) A I'm a personnel specialist and primarily handle employee
(22) relations labor relations issues for the ocean fleet
(23) Q And in the 1987 time frame did you have an office in the
(24) same location that the port captain \(s\) office was?
(25) A Yes, sir, I did
```

Q And was it in the same location with the west coast fleet
manager?
A Yes
Q And Mr Borgen was the west coast fleet manager correct?
A Correct
Q And then for a part of the year in 1987 Captain Andre
Martineau was port captain correct?
A That's correct
Q All right Now you kind of were with the west coast fleet
office ever since there was a west coast fleet office almost
nght?
A That's - that's fair to say
Q West coast fleet office was started up in around what
77 787
A Yes sir
Q And you ve been out there all that tume?
AI have
Q Now I want to change sports here for a second I want to
go way out in left field and ask you a question Are you
familiar with the Exxon North Slope?
A Yes
Q Is the Exxon North Slope a west coast fleet ship?
A Yes sur she ss
Q Do you have any recollection of there ever being a tame
when the North Slope was not in the west coast fleet?

```
```

Vol 22 3751
A No
Q Do you have any recollection of the North Slope ever
saling around and going to the port of Baytown?
A Not that I'm aware of
Q All right Mr Shearer let me take you to - or return
you to 1987 and ask you if you remember a tume when there was
discussion tn the west coast fleet office concerning the
replacement of a master for the Exxon Valdez?
AYes I do
Q And let me ask you a step further Was there a
conversation that you had concerning Caplain Hazelwood in

```
that
(12) regard?
A Yes
Q Who was that conversation with?
A Captan Martineau
Q And Captain Martineau was the port captain?
A He was
Q And would you tell the Ladies and Gentiemen of the Jury as
beat you can recall what that converation was?
A Captan Martuneau called me unto has office and uformed
that he and Captan Sheehy, who was the port captann of the
east coast, were contemplating a move of Captan
Hazelwood to
(23) the - to the Exxon Valdez and he said that Harvey Borgen,
who
(24) was the fleet manager wanted him to check out make sure
Joe
(25) was - was clean was doing a good job and wasn't druining
r
anything
Q Excuse me vou droppud vour voice What was the last part
A That he wasn't dnnking
Q That he was not drinking?
A That he wasn't driaking
Q And he told you that Mr Borgen asked him to check that out?
A Yes
Q Did he tell you anything further about how he was asked to check il out or how he was going to check it out?
A Yes He was going to talk to Captan Sheehy and get a good
(12) background from the east coast fleet and -

Q Did he ask you any questions?
A Yes
Q What did he ask vou?
A He wanted to know if I'd heard anything because I dealt whth a lot of different people and what I'd heard about Joe
was, was he doug a good job was there any indication that ['d
(19) picked up that he was having a problem And I told hm no, that everything I'd heard about hum was good
(21) QOkay Now this was in - this was in 877
(22) A Rught
(23) Q Do you know the tume of the year? Can you remember now?
(24) A It was a few months before Joe came over I'm not sure I
(25) think it was spring or a few months before then

\section*{Vol 223753}

Q Now did you in that conversation or in a later conversation with Captain Martineau did he mention to you that he had in fact checked with Captain Sheehy?
A Yes, just shortly after that conversation, the same day, he came down and said don't worry about making any calls I've
(6) checked with Captain Sheehy and loe's doing a real good job and
he doesn't drink anymore
Q Now I want to ask you about one other conversation Do
you happen to recall the time that - well strike that
(10) Did you have a conversation with Mr Borgen concerning
(11) Captain Hazelwood somewhere around the time that Coptain
(12) Hazelwood came back out to the west coast?
(13) A 1 had many conversations with Mr Borgen ike that
(14) \(Q\) Yeah but you know which one I m going to ask you about
(15) Did you have a converaation about Captain Hazelwood as

Captain
(16) Hazelwood was coming out to the west coast or just bēfore?
(17) A Yes
(18) Q Okay Do you happen to recall the date that would have
(19) been?
(20) A No Idon't recall
(21) MR SANDERS Your Honor might Iapproach the (22) Witness?
(23) BYMR SANDERS
(24) Q I mgoing to hand you a page Captain Hazelwood a
(25) assignment history that comes out of Plaintiffs Exhibit

\section*{Vol 223754}

Number II I believe it salready admitted in evidence and
I m going to ank you to look down here at the first entry for
the Exxon Valdez Captan Hazelwood s assignment history,
and
(t) does that indicate the first date that he joined the Exxon
(5) Valdez?

A Yeah, July 30th, '87
Q Is that roughly the time frame in which you had this
conversation that I m getting ready to ask you about?
AYes
Q All right Now Mr Shearer this conversation was about
Captain Hazelwood?
A Correct.
Q With Mr Borgen?
A Right
Q And can you recall today the exact words of the
converation?
A No
Q Did you have an underatanding of what Mr Borgen wanted, based on that conversation?
AYes
Q What did he wanl?
A He wanted me to pay partucular attention to Joe and make
sure that he was not drinking and that he - he stayed
straight
Q Now as the personnel specialist in the west coast fieet

Vol 223755
1) office did you have an opportunty to talk to a lot of people
(2) that were involved with the ships and with the masters of the
3) ships?

AYes
Q And did you have a lot of - in the 90s we called it
interface with people who boarded the ships who serviced the
ships who came from the shoreside office to the ahips, as
well?
A Yes
Q Did you in fact pay particular attention to
Mr Hazelwood Capiain Hazelwood in response to Mr rgen s
request \({ }^{\text {? }}\)
A Yes
Q All right Did you ever notice anything that was - that would indicate to you that Captain Hazelwood was drinking alcohol?
A None whatsoever
Q Did you go around asking people that question?
A No, I don't recall what I asked them, but I dadn't probably wasn't that blunt, but I looked for signs, I didn't see anything but good
Q Did you get any signs?
A Posituve that he was doing a good job signs and people were -
Q Did you get any signs that he was drınking?

A None
Q All night Now from time to time would Mr Borgen ask you
about your observations of Captain Hazelwood?
AYes
() Q And would you give him the report that you juat gave the

Ladies and Gentlemen of the Jury?
A Yes, I did, I did
MR SANDERS No further questions You may ask
CROSS EXAMINATION OF GRADY T SHEARER
BYMR O'NEILL
Q How are you sir?
A All nght
Q Were you here for Mr Borgen a teatimony?
AIwas
Q You were siting in the back, and in the conversauons that
(16) Mr Borgen related to us today I didn thear your name come
(17) up, did you?
(18) A No, I didn't
(19) Q So Mr Borgen didn't come in and tell us today about thene
(20) converations that you and he - that you ve just testified to?
(21) A That's correct
(22) Q Let's talk about Captain Sheehy contemplating the move to (23) the Exxon Valdez that core set of converations And you
(2a) testified that you were asked what you had heard, was there any
(25) indication - now at the time that this conversation takes

Vol 223757
) place you re on the weat coast aren tyou?
(2) AYes
(3) Q And you re the pertonnel director on the west coast and
(4) Captan Hazelwood is over on the gulf coast isn that right?
(s) A That's correct
(6) Q So he asking somebody on the west coast about comebody on
(n) the gulf coast?
(8) A That's correct
(9) Q Okay Juat so we're clear And with regard to any calls (10) that you were going to make you were going to make some calis
(11) and then that was cut off because Shechy came in and and (12) don \(I\) worry about making any calls Joe doesn \(t\) drink anymore
(13) so you didn t make any calls did you?
(14) A I'm really not sure what - it's been so long ago, whether
(1s) I didn't make calls or he stopped me from making more, I'm not
(16) sure about that, but I was convinced that everything was olcay
(17) Q But in any event you were on one coast he was on the
(18) other coast and you don \(t\) recall making any calls?
(19) A That's correct
(20) Q And at this point in tume would it also be fair to say
(21) that Sheohy, Borgen and you all knew that there was a potential
(22) problem with regard to this captain and the aubject of aicohol?
(23) A That's correct
(24) Q So you were on notice?
(2) A That's correct

\section*{Vol 223758}

Q And would it be farr to say that you and Sheehy and Borgen
are all management level officiala that were at that tume management level officials with Exxon Shipping Company?
A I think it's meorrect to say I'm management level I'm a staff person with the ocean fleet office
Q How about Sheehy and Borgen?
AYes
Q Are you aware of one piece of paper anywhere in the world
that deals with the subject of monitoring Captain Hazeiwood?
I m sure they told you I d ask you that question
A No, I'm not aware of any
Q Now with regard to the - is it a July 87 conversation
with Harvey Borgen is that about when it was?
A Right
Q You don \(t\) recail the detats of the conversation'
A No, I don't
Q Then you testified that you had a lot of opportunity to
talk to people and you don \(t\) recall any signs do you recall that testumony here today?

\section*{AYes}

Q Have you ever been trained in the monitoring of people who have been through alcohol rehabilitation or the monitong of people who have alcohol problems?
A At that time I - I have recently had some traning in that, yes

\section*{Vol 223759}

Q How about at that point in time?
A Not specifically
Q So it would be fair to alay that at that point in time you
were untrained with regard to the techniquea used methods used
(s) in order to heip somebody who had gone through alcohol rehabilitation stay clean that safatr atatement isn it? A That's correct
Q Now you re responsible for the whole west coast so
you re-unlike your colleague who was a here a minute ago whose responsibilities were limited to Long Beach your responsibilities included Long Beach San Franciaco Valdez? A Correct
Q Now did your responsibilities span from the summer of 87
through the grounding?

\section*{AYes}

Q In your talking to people and investigatung, did an incident with regard to Henry in Portland ever come up? A I - I heard about that todiay I didn't get involved in that
Q Okay And did an incident with regard to a launch and a Mary Williamson and a Captain Reeder in San Franciaco ever come
(22) to your attention?
(23) A After - after the grounding that came to my attention
(24) Q I mtalking - let just atick with the period 87 to 89
(2s) at about the time it happened did at come to your attention?

\section*{Vol 223760}

A Shortly after the grounding
Q Let me try it again so the record - I m not trying to give
you a hard time We re two ships passing in the night to use
the right analogy
At or about the time of the San Francisco launch incident
Mary Williamson Steve Day Captain Reeder Captain
Hazelwood
did your activities turn up the fact that that incident
occurred?
A No
Q Okay And I maging to mention a list of names of people
and I m going to ask you with regard to each of those names
were they on the west coast when you were on the west const
and then I 11 ask you some questions about them Just like I
did with your colleague Chuck Kımis?
AYes
Q Did you ever ask Kimlis about Captain Hazelwood and
(17) alcohol?
(18) A No
(19) Q Nate Carr?
(20) A I don't recall
(21) Q Were you aware that crew members on occasion would gather
(22) at a place called the Yankee Clipper or the Yankee Whaler have
(23) a couple of beers?
(24) A No
(2) Q Captain Hazelwood would go over there and have a couple

Vol 223761
beera with them?
A No
Q Did so openly?
A No
Q Katherine Haven?
A No
Q Butch Ogren Butch Ogran or Ogren is that a new name to you?
A I thank you're pronouncing it wrong I know - but, no
Q How should I pronounce it?
A I think it's Ogen (ph), isn't it"
Q It says here Ogen on my notes and -
A I don't know
Q You ever talk to him about the captain and drinking?
A Not that I recall
Q How about Jım Kunkel?
A Not that I recall
Q How about William Masciarelh? You ever talk to hım? A No
Q How about Joel Roberson?
A No, I don't recall him
Q You don \(t\) recall talking to him or you don \(t\) recall him?
A I don't - no, I didn't talk to hum about that
Q But he was assigned to the Valdez during your watch?
(2) A Rught, I don't recall tallung to hum

Vol 223762
(1) Q How about Katue Haven you ever talk to her about the
(2) captain and alcohol?
3) A No
(4) Q You mentioned that you d recently gotten some training on
(5) alcohol and alcoholism do you recall that a couple of minutes
ago?
AYes
MR SANDERS Your Honor if we re going to pursue
this I think we ought to object This is after the grounding
MR O NEILL I was - I give up
THE COURT Sustanned
MR O NEILL You re a lucky man
MR SANDERS It was going to be devastaung wasn : It?
(IS) MR O NEILL Thank you sir
(16) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF GRADY T SHEARER
(1) BY MR SANDERS
(18) Q Are you famuliar with a bar or reataurant called the Yankee
(19) Clipper or the Yankee Whaler?
(20) A No
(21) Q I was hoping we were going to get that straightened out
(22) whether it s clipper or whaler
(23) Now Mr O Neill asked you some questions about training
(24) Mr Shearer have you ever drunk any alcohol?
(25) A I have on occasion

\section*{Vol 223763}

Q You ever been around anybody that drank alcohol while you
were present?
AYes
Q Would that be a usual or an unusual occurrence in your life?
A Usual
Q And in 198788 and 89 would that have been a uaual occurrence in your life?
A It would have been usual
Q Have you ever ever had the occasion to see anybody that
had too much to drink?
AYes
Q Would that be unusual?
A It would be-no, it would not be unusual I've seen
people who've had too much to drink
Q You know how to recognize -
A Certanaly
Q - people who ve had too much to drink can tyou?
A Certanly
Q You can recognize a bottie of wine you know what that looks like?
A Certanly do
Q You know what a can of beer looks like?
AYes
Q You know what a bottle of liquor looks like?
(1) AIdo

Q Do you know what alcohol smells like?
3) A I know what alcohol products smell like

Q Did you ever see Captain Hazelwood on your visits with him
) any meetings, any other place, look like what some of these
people you ve seen in your life who ve had too much to drink
looked lake?
A No
Q Have you ever been close enough to Captain Hazelwood to
smell his breath?
A Certanily
Q Have you ever smelled alcohol on his breath?
A No
Q Have you ever been on a ship -
AXes
Q Have you ever been in his cabin?
AYes
Q Have you been in his stateroom?
AYes
Q Have you been in his office?
AYes
Q Did you ever see anything that looked like to you a
contaner that contaned alcohol?
A No
Q Did you ever see Captain Hazelwood take a drink of what you

\section*{Vol 223765}
I) believed to be alcohol?
(2) A Never
(3) MR SANDERS No further questions
(4) THE COURT You may step down sir Thank you
(5) MR LYNCH Your Honor call James Rouse to teatufy
(6) Tempted to say he a an adverse witness but -
(7) THE CLERK Would you raise your right hand please
(8) 81 r
(9) (The Witnees Is Sworn)
(10) THE CLERK For the record air state your full name,
(II) your addreas and apell your last name please
(12) THE WITNESS My name is James J Rouse that :
(13) spelled R-O U S E My address is 14927 Cindy Wood

Houston,
(14) Texas
(15) THE CLERK Thank you sir
(16) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAMES ROUSE (Live)
(17) BY MR LYNCH
(18) QMr Rouse you re employed by Exxon? \({ }^{-}\)
(19) A Yes, sar, I am
(20) \(Q\) How long have you been with Exxon?
(21) A Jomed Exxon 32 years ago this weel
(22) \(Q\) And what is your current job, sir?
(23) A I am the manager of Exxon's pubhc affars department
(24) Q As of March 23, 1989 what was your job title?
(25) A I was the manager of the human resources department

\section*{Vol 223766}
(1) Q How long had you held that job prior to March 2319897
(2) A I moved back into human resonrces and I had a human
(3) resources background in the company as the assistant manager of
(4) the department in May of 1980, and took over general management
(5) responsibilities for the department in May of 1981
(6) Q So you were manager from May of 1981 up to and including
(7) the tume of this accident?
(8) A Yes, sir
(9) Q And I think you said you had a human relations resources (10) background in the company what did you mean by that?
(II) A Well, my degree is a bachelor of science in industrial
(12) management and industrial engineering, and I joined the company
(13) in 1962 in a human resources capacity I worked un that (14) capacity for a year I had an Army commssion went on active
(1s) duty as a Leutenant un the Army for two years on mulitary
(16) leave from the company, returning in 1965 in human resources
(17) I worked in human resources then for another three or four
(18) years at which tume I joined the marketing department and had
(19) a senes of management assignments in the marketing
department
(20) over the next, oh, I'd say enght or nine years
(21) I was then in what we call our supply or logistucs function
(22) for a couple of years, and then obviously returned to human
(23) resources in 1980
(24) \(Q\) Could you give the jury a very brief description of what
(23) human resources included?

\section*{Vol 223767}
(1) A Yes sir
(2) Q I might say that someone else from human resources has been
(3) here before you so you don thave to give the full nine yards

A My responsibilities included collectave bargannig, which
(5) is involvement with our unions, we have about 35 or 40 unions
(6) at Exxon U S A They included professional recruitung
(7) program We had a management training group we had a
(8) compensation group that deals with pay and wages and
(9) compensation We had a benefits group that had responsubility
(10) for admunsterigg our hospitalization plan, our retirement
(1i) plan, those kinds of benefit plans We had a group that was
(12) responsible for what we call equal employment opportunity
and
(13) diversity to ensure that we were bringing all types of people
(14) from all types of backgrounds unto the organastion We had a
(15) group opportunity, part of the tume I held this position that
(16) had to do with safety, it was a staff group having to do with
(17) safety, and we developed personnel policies in that group
(18) Q Now you kept saying we had a group These were groups of
(19) people who specislized in these various areas?
(20) A Yes, sir, that's correct And then they ultumately
(21) reported into the hamon resources department
(22) \(Q\) And I think among the groups that you mentioned was a group
(23) or groups responsible for developing personnel policies?
(24) A Yes, sir, that's correct
(25) Q And did that include the alcohol policy of Exxon?

A Yes sur indeed it did
Q Now Mr Paul was here eariter and testified that Exxon
Shipping Company relied on the expertise of the Exxon USA
human relations department for policy development Could you
(5) explain how the work that your group did would find its way to

Exxon Shipping Company?
A Yes Exxon U S A at the point in time we're tallong
about, had overall responsibility for developing personnel
policses on behalf of the corporation, and then if the
corporation adapted those policies they would be spread or
(11) sent down to all the various regions and affilates across
the
(12) United States, and Exxon Shipping beang one of those
organizations
Q Being an affiliated organization?
A Yes sir that's correct
Q You would develop the policy and that would be provided to
Exxon Shipping?
A Yes, sir, that's correct
Q And if they needed to make some changes or adjustments
their corporation they would do that?
A Certanoly they could
Q On the assumption that the policies we re talking about
(2) were substantually the same and I think the record reflects
that they were, my questions will relate for the period from
(25) January 1 - could I have just a blank screen - January 1

\section*{Vol 223769}
(1) 1965-1985 excuse me untal the date of the - the day
(2) before the accident March 23 1989?
(3 Yes, sir
Q And I d like to start with that January \(1 \quad 1965\) date juat for - I satd it again
A 1985
MR LYNCH Thank you Your Honor I didn teven get it out of the newspaper
BYMR LYNCH
Q January I 1985 date and could you just brefly deacribe (II) the overall alcohol policy of Exxon Corporation Exxon Company
(i2) U S A as it existed on that date?
(13) A Well, if you - I guess you'd have to go all the way back
(14) If we want to work it that way, we have had the issue of
(15) drug - or rather alcohol - certanly alcohol and subsequently
(16) drags and alcohol in our management systems, in our management
(17) phulosophes for decades If you go back to the early '60s,

11
(18) our union contracts we had provisions in there that had to
do
(19) with possession use dastribution of alcohol on company
(20) premuses
(21) We have a comprehensive management tranung program at
(22) Exxon U S A and in Exxon Corporation, and that unvolved
(23) monitorng employee's job performance In our organszation and
(24) our philosophy, the way people get pasd the pay rasses they
(25) get, their promotions, ther transfers are all thed to their

\section*{Vol 223770}
(1) job performance, so supervisors are traned extensively in how
(2) to reevaluate job performance how to work whth employees on 1
(3) day to-day basus in their development and un thear
performance So in that regard, supervisors would be tramed
in monitoring or observing or working with day-to-day behavior
Now, in about 1977, to supplement those actunties, we had
what we call the employee policy on alcoholssm, and that was

Just a sheet of paper that supplemented the thungs I've already
(10) described
(11) Q So those things were in place as of January 1, \(1985 ?\)
(12) A Yes, sur, they were
(13) Q And as we underatand it, that same set of pnaciples, were
(14) they appitcable to Exxon Shipping Company?
(15) A Yes, str, they were
(16) Q If I may approach Your Honor I d like to hand - let me
(in) show you Defendents Exhibit 9182 and ask you if you could
(18) Identufy that for the record, sur?
(19) A Yes, sir This as a letter that was dated March 20th,
(20) 1984, to headquarters, department managers and presidents of
3.4
(21) affiluted companies, Excron Shipping would be an affiliated
22) company and it's sugned by me
(23) \(Q\) And the purpose of this letter?
(24) A Purpose of this letter is to outhne for them a policy of
(23) progressive dusciphae that we would have for employees that

\section*{Vol 22 3771}
were - they were called the progressive disciphinary gudelmes Agan, these are gudelınes that were in many of our union contracts for many years but this was just kind of a
(4) codification, if you will, of some practuces that were already un place
Q So taking the January 11985 start date that we ve been talking about this is the-does this document express the list of rules and regulations that you had relating to alcohol in part?
A Yes, sir, it does
Q And the procedures that management was given for enforcement of those rules?
AYes sir it does
Q Now let me direct your attention specifically to this language Can you read that on your screen Mr Rouse?
A Yes, I can
QOna screen?
A Right
Q Seems to be a little out of focus to me I can never tell whether it s my glasses or if - are you able to read it Your Honor)
THE COURT Don i worry about me
BYMR LYNCH
Q Mr Rouse you see the highighted language there
A Yes
(1) Q Could you just expand on how it was that managera were
(2) expected to watch for alcohol or watch for substances in the
(3) workplace to the extent that they might pose a nisk or danger
(4) to employees of Exxon or employees of the public?
(s) A Obvionsly what the words say - to begun with, it's
(6) umpractical to try to spell out every single thing you try to
(7) do in this regard in some kind of printed rules If you did
(8) that, you'd have a rule book that none of us would be able to
(9) carry in this courtroom What it goes on to say is that even
(10) though we can't cover all situations, the list attached is an
(H) illastration of the kinds of violations that may result with
(12) duscipluee without warming
(13) Q Even though you had a process that called for gradual
(14) warning to the employee the chances to clean up his act, if it
(1S) were, there were certain offenees that were automatically
(16) subject to permanent discipline, is that -
(17) A Yes, sur, that's correct
(18) Q And referning to Exhibit \(A\), among those were possession and (19) use of alcohol?
(20) A Yes, sir Possession and use of alcohol or reporting for
(21) work in an unfit condrtion, unciuding under the influence of
(22) intoxicants, narcotics or drugs
(23) \(Q\) Let me juat ask you if you can comment further This is in
(24) the page preceding Exhibit A under the title important notes
(2) Was the - was the policy of the Exxon human resources

\section*{Vol 223773}
(1) department personnel department that managera had no
(2) discretion that if an employee stumbled or took a drink or had
(3) an alcohol problem that he must be terminated in every case?
(4) A No, sir And in fact as these gundehnes state,
(5) management has discretion, either to termmate the
employee or
employ lesser discipline based on the seventy of the
deference, tuming and other mitugating factors
Q And conisnuing on that I see that one of the
recommendations is that where - where it imanager's
(10) Conclusion that it \(s\) not necessary on the spot to terminate the
(11) employee that it a recommended that the employce be sent to
(12) medical for evaluation?
(13) A That's correct
(14) Q Could you explain how that process was supposed to work?
(1s) A Well, what would happen there is if the supervisor had an
(10) employe who he or she suspected that alcohol may have job
(i7) performance detenorated and perhaps aicohol was an sssue, then
(i8) what they should do 25 send that employee to medical for an (19) evaluation
(20) Q What was the purpose of sending them to medical?
(21) A Medical could help determine whether it really was an
(22) alcohol problem or some other type of situation
(23) Q Now you mentioned that in 1977 - well first of all are
(24) these - these the rules that you were referring to that went
(2) back prior to the existence of an alcoholism poiscy?

\section*{Vol 223774}
```

    A Yes sur, that's correct
    Q And in 1977 the company adopted an alcoholism policy
    ```
And
    (3) I ll put up Plaintiffs Exhibit 158 in evidence ask you if
    that sin substance the policy you were talking about?
    A Yes, sir, that's correct That was our 1977 policy
    Q And this problem relates to employees who have a problem
    With alcoholism is that correct?
    A That's correct, sur
    Q Now suppose an employee thought that he had a problem
and
10) went to a doctor for advice and it turned out the doctor didn \(t\)
diagnose him as having alcohol - in other words as being an
alcoholic was this policy available to that employee?
A Well, it would have been avalable, but I suppose if he was
    not diagnosed as being an alcohohe you wouldn't be
working
with hum on a policy of alcoholism
Q Well if the employee went for alcohol treatment -
AYes, sur
    Q - but the doctor concluded you have an alcohol abuse
    problem how would you deal with that?
    A Well, then it would come under thes policy as I would see
    t
(22) Q Even if it 3 not diagnosed as atnct alcoholism is that
(23) correct?
(24) A That could be the case
(23) Q Now in formulating this policy, that \(s\) when you were in

\footnotetext{
Vol 223775
marketing is that correct?
A The polacy was actually formulated and released when I was
(3) stull in mariketing that's correct
(4) MR LYNCH Your Honor I don tbelseve I offered
(s) 9182 and I do so at this time
(6) (Exhibit 9182 offered)
(7) THE COURT Is there objection?
(8) MR O NEILL No objection
(9) THE COURT Defendiants 9182 is admitted
(10) (Exhibil 9182 received)
(11) BYMR LYNCH
(12) \(Q\) When you became manager of the human resources department
(13) you had a group that was involved with formulation of this
(14) policy, among others?
(15) A That's correct
(10) Q And did you - as manager did your duties include
(in) informing yourself on the atate of the policy and whether it
(18) was up to date and satisfactory?
(19) A Yes, sir, it did
(20) \(Q\) And was the - was this aspect of the overall aicohol
(2i) policybased on safety considerations?
(22) A Yes, it was What we were really trying to do here in this (23) sssue of alcoholism, is you're trying to balance the rights of (24) the employee and the public safety It's a very semous thing
(2S) to accuse somebody of - of haning an alcohol problem if, in
}
(1) fact they do not At the same tume you're trying to balance (2) that with the safety for the public We're not trying to be (3) big brother here Exxon has no responsibility and wouldn't want
(4) to take on responsibulaty of montoring an employee's personal
(5) Ufe When it affects job performance, when that job
(6) performance could indeed affect the public safety, then
(7) obviously it is an ussue
(8) Q Now I've highlighted the language which has been
(9) discussed at length in this case which reads employees who
(10) suspect that they may have an alcoholism problem are encouraged
(II) to seek diagnosis and follow through with prescribed
(12) treatment No employees with alcoholism will have their job
(13) security or future opportunities jeopardized due to a request
(14) for help or involvement in a rehabilitation effort
(15) First of all what as the manager of the program the
(16) policy what did that mean to the employee who went to an
(in) alcohol treatment facility and admitted himseif for
(18) rehabilitation or treatment?
(19) A Well, what it meant to that employee was if they self
(20) referred themselves for alcohol treatment and we found out
(21) about it, we weren't going to fire them, we were goung to more
(22) than hkely return them to thear job That was the norm at
(23) that tume, and certainly we were not going to hold that aganst
(24) them, in terms of future promotion opportunities
(25) We were tryng to encourage people to come forward

\footnotetext{
Vol 223777
(1) Q Now what about something like - you probably were sitting
(2) in court when Mr O Neill anked the preceding witnesses well
(3) did you ask him about how he was doing on his rehab was that
(4) something that Exxon wanted ts managers to do if someone
(s) returned to the job after having treatment?
(6) A No, sir, I don't think that we asked them to have a
(7) specific responsibility to monstor just the actavitues that
(8) related to rehabilitation Certainly on a day to-day basis
(9) they interact with those people and they should be looking

\section*{at}
(10) job performance The key to what that supervisor should be
(11) looking at ns how the andividal is performang on the job
(12) Q Now how in your opinion did telling the employee that if
(13) he went out to rehab he would get his job back or be assured of
(14) employment and I guess future status on the job wouldn't be
(15) jeopardized how did that coninbute to the anfety of coworkers
(10) and the public?
(17) A Well, the view was that if you did not offer them the
(I8) opportunty to come back to thear job, if un fact you penaluzed
(19) them for coming forward and saying they had a problem
then
(20) they wouldn't come forward, then you got a situation where you
(21) have somebody with a senons problem that you don't know about,
(22) and that has a very, very deep concerning for us from a safety
(23) standpoint
(24) Q Did you and the people in your department - Mr Rouse did
(25) you resch that conclusion on your own or did you seek advice
}

Vol 223778
(1) about this subject?

A All the way through as we worked drug and aicohol issues,
(3) we have had a number of advisors, resources that we depended on
(4) to provide us information
s) Q Okay And with reference to the status of the policy as of
6) January 11985 could you just give us a general description
7) of how you went about determining where this policy fil in the
B) industry generally?
9) A Well obviously we had input from our medical department,
(10) and I'm aware of the fact that they reached out to other
(II) medical departments and other companies to see how they were
(12) dougg I'm personally involved in several groups, a group
(13) called the Business Round Table Employer Relations Committee, a
(14) busuness round table made up of perhaps a hundred CEOs of major
(IS) companies in the country I was on a committee called Employee
(16) Relations and we frequently talked about substance abuse
(17) policies, problems and that surt of thing I was charman of
(18) that committee in 1986 I'm in an organization of - Labor
(19) Policy Association, and it does research on labor and personnel
(20) policy ssues had many discussions about drug and alcohol
(21) policies so I was I think, generally familiar - my view would
(22) be I was generally familiar with drug and alcohol policies of
(23) other companies, as well as advice from medical experts
and
(24) others in the field

teatified that in the mid 80s there was a rucognized standard
that employees who went out to ruhab if they held a job in a
safety senative position that the employer should get
directly involved in supervising aftercare
In your research as of 1985 was it a standard in industry
that employers get involved in aftercare of employees who held
jobs in safety-sensitive positions?
A I would say not I would say that this is - you're almost
saying shouldn't we be montoring what they do on their
personal tume which - should we be monitoring their personal
(II) Lives and I don't view that as a responsibility of the
(12) company The responsibility of the company is to ensure that
(13) their job performance is not detenorating because they
have
(14) those kind of problems and if at becomes a job performance
(1s) issue then yes I think it would involve the company I
(16) respectfully disagree with the doctor's view on what was state
(17) of the art at that tume
(18) Q Well could you address whal you did to learn what others
(19) thought about this? In other words were these practices being
(20) followed in other companies?
(21) A My - my view would be that they were not in the
companies
(22) that I'm familiar with
(23) Q And that includud the 150 plus companmes that participated (94) in the business round table?
(25) A Yes sur that's currect

Q And were you making an effort to determine what the state of the ant was?
A Yes, sir We did from tame to tume run surveys to see what the state of the art was
Q I'd like to address your attention if I can find my
highlighter to the language in this part of the policy Now,
did you have medical or professional advice at the Exxon human
) resources department concerning this provision of the
alcoholism policy as it existed in 1985?
A Yes, sir And I thmik our human resources advice was smular, which was the policy didn't require or should not result in any special privileges, if you will for people that have problems with - with substances
Q Nor special requirements?
A Nor special requrements, that's exactly right
Q Now if you followed what apparently is Mr O Neill or
Dr Masters advice you would say when an employee came
back
(18) from rehab well you have to come in and check in with us that
you ve been going to see your doctor that you've been going to
AA meetings Did you ever consider doing that?
A At that point in tame, no, sir
Q Did you know of companies in your industry who were doing 47
A No, sur I don't think any of them were
Q Do you know of any professional advice you received to do

Vol 22 3781
(I) that?
(2) A No, sir In fact, I thank we probably received 3) professional advice that was the opposite, from our law
(4) department, for example, who would have probably counseled us
(5) and did counsel us that that could result in charges of (6) discrimunation
(7) Q Did you consider - did you make studies to determine what
(8) the proper way to handle the employee who had returned from
(9) rehabilitation was as of the time in 1985 about mudway
(10) through the period of time that we re talking about?
(i1) A Our view was when they retaried from rehabihtation, we (12) shouid put them back on the job that they came from, uning good
- \(\boldsymbol{H}^{3}\)
(13) solid management judgment and then use our normal supervisory

4
(14) oversight of their job performance
(15) Q Did you have experience in Exxon that is to say did the
(16) corporate experience give you assurance that that method and
(In) procedure was adequate to identify problems with an employee
(18) who resumed or possibly resumed the use of alcohol or any
other
(19) substance after returning to work?
(20) A At that point in thme, as the senior human resources
(21) offical in Exxon U S A , I was very comfortable that we had a
(22) policy that dad what it needed to do to balance the nghts of
(23) those individuals, as well as do the most we could to protect (24) the safety of the publec
(25) Q And you ve heard some questions this morning about whether

Vol 223782
people were trained and Ithink the question was put to
Mr Larsen a few minutes ago were you trained to monitor a person who had returned from rehab?
(4) Did you have procedures to train managers at Exxon to deal
5) With substance abuse problems whether they be aicohol or other
(6) substances of employees who were working in Exxon premises?
(7) A Yes, sar, I thank we dad We pat all of our young
\({ }^{\text {8) }}\) supervisors as they'd become supervisors through a program I
(9) think Mr Larsen called it management one indeed today we call
(10) it leadership one It's an 11 day course on supervision how
(II) you coach employees how you momior their performance, how you
(12) connsel employees, how you help those employees develop and
(13) umprove on the job and to that extent I would have to say that
(14) our supervisors were well versed in examining employee (Is) behavior
(16) Q Now that supervision does it include that II day course
(1) does it include the issue of montoring for substance abuse
knowing - knowing what to watch for?
(19) A There is a segment in that course that speais to substance
abuse in the workplace
(21) Q And what has Exxon s experience been in actual practice
(22) with the success of its managers in identifying problems - in
(23) identifying people who have problems and either moving them out
(24) of the job or getting them to help or whatever is necessary to resolve the problem?

\section*{Vol 223783}
1) A My view is that we have been successful in that regard
2) Q Now as of 1985 you overall - and referring to all the
(3) sources that you consulted were you satusfied that the Exxon
(4) drug - excuse me Exxon alcohol policies that then existed was
si consistent with the standard of the industry in other companies
si like Exxon that had - that included safety-sensitive jobs?
A I would say yes and I suppose I should say that we just
were not relying on that - on that policy at that pount in
tume in 1985 For example, in - m 1984, we initagted an
(10) employee health advisory program which was a free service that
(11) employees could come to to recenve counseling if they had (12) marital problems or family problems or problems with substance
(13) abuse
(14) We had very broad awareness training on - on drugs and s) alcohol in the work place In fact, in 1984, we intanted that and I personally took a fellow to our management committee.
(In which is our very senior managers call them the three or four
(18) star generals, using a military term and we started with a (19) drug àwareness program with them and then we began to cascade
(20) that out throughout the organization So the point I'm trying
(21) to make is as we did these studies and understood what
(22) companses were doing, then of course we brought our policres
(23) along, as well
(24) Q As of approximately April 1985 the record indicates that (2) Captain Hazelwood admitted himself for treatment at South Oaks

\section*{Vol \(22 \quad 3784\)}
1) Hospital for a treatment that involved at least some aspect of
(2) an alcohol diagnosis I d like to ask you a few questions
3) about as the person responsible for the policy about how that
(4) poincy was meant to apply to the facts that exist in this
record
First of all do you understand the term selfidentifying?
A Yes sir I thank I do
Q Was the term selfidentifier relevant to the Exxon aicohol policy as at existed at that time?
A Yes sir I think it was
Q What was ts relevance?
A Well, the relevance was that a person could self identify, that is they could go to rehab on thear own, through the suggestion or urging of a family member or perhaps a peer or
(15) someone Like that or the supervisor because there were severe
(16) job performances could in effect order them to go to the
(17) medical department and find out what the problem was
(18) Q You ve confused me there Are both of those self
(19) identıfiers?
(20) A Oh, absolutely not The first one is self identıfier the
(21) second one would be a supervisory referral
(22) \(Q\) What s the difference under the policy versus a supervisory
(23) referral?
(24) A Well, a self identifier would be someone who identufied
(2) someone said you had a problem, you ought to do
something about

\section*{Vol 223785}
(1) your problem you'd go to work on that problem versus a (2) supervisor referral that I would best describe thas way from
(3) personal expenence I have where we call an individual in
(4) sad your job performance is deteriorated, your attendance
has
(S) detenorated and I think you have a problem and I'm going to
send you to medical to find out what that problem mught be and
(7) let them make a diagnosis and if you don't do that, your
(8) option is to clean out your desk and leave the company
(9) Q And you described the distinction but what effect does it
(10) have under the policy? Does the employee have a different
(II) right if he \(\mathbf{s}\) a self identifier versus if he \(\mathbf{a}\) referred by
(i2) supervisor?
(13) A If he's a self identufier, he's not going to be subject to (14) disciplene, and obviousiy in the case of supervisory referral
(IS) there's goung to be heavy dusciplune if he doesn't talce the (10) actuon
(I7) Q We apoke about the provision of the poiscy that told the
(18) employee if you seek help and get rehabiltation your job
(19) poastion will be returned to you and your future opportunities
(20) will not be jeopardized?
(21) A Yes, sir
(22) \(Q\) Is there a difference under that provision of the policy
(23) between a self identifier and a aupervisory referral?
(24) A I absolutely think so because if you were supervisory
(25) referral then I don't think there would be any obingation

\section*{Vol 223786}
necessarily, to put you back in the position you were in
You're in a - when you have a supervisor referral, you're in
a
(3) disciplunary mode at that point

Q Now with reference to Captain Hazelwood - well let s-
as you understood the policy if an employee admitted himself
for rehabilitation and shortly prior to that, someone in his
management chain had advised him that there was an
invertugation underway relating to him that much no more would that make the individual a supervisory referral?
A No, ser, it would be -
Q How would you classify st?
A That would be a self referral
Q Even though the employee possibly made the decision to
seck
(14) help because he heard about an inveatigation?
(1S) A Absolutely, because you didn't have the supervisor
saying,
(16) in effect, go to medical and get some help or you're going to
(17) have to clean out your desk and go home
(18) \(Q\) Did being a selfidentifier require that the empioyee go to
(19) his manager and tell the manager I m going into rehab?
(20) A No, 815
(21) Q Did the - was self identification necessarily a formal
(22) identification to management of the company that the individual
(23) had chosen to go to rehab?

Q
A No, sur
(25) Q Under this policy was it permissible and applicable for an

\section*{Vol 223787}
employee to go to a rehab facility and tell the company nothing at all about it?
A Quite possible An employee could take vacation, say I'm
goung to Palm Springs to play golf, put themselves in
rehabilitation program \(g 0\) through that rehabilitation
program,
(6) come out and go back to work and no one would have been the
(7) wiser
(8) Q Let me ask you if you could slow down a little bil

A Yes, sir
(10) Q Maybe they can write it down that tast but I can thaten
(II) to it that fast
(12) A Okay
(13) \(Q\) in the case of an employee who did that would the
(14) provision of the policy that we talked about that assured the
(1s) empioyee that he would return to his job would that provision
(16) apply to the employee even though he never told the company
(17) anything about the rehab?
(18) A Well in the hypothetical you're giving me if he never
(19) told anyone anything about rehab certanly he would go
back to
(20) the job that he had when he went off on vacation or on leave
(21) Q Because the company wouldn thnow anything about a?
(22) A Absolutely
(23) Q But if it subsequenily learnud aboul it that would be (24) rehab covered by the policy?
(2s) A Yes sar 1 think so
(1) \(Q\) And what about the provision of the policy that asid no
(2) special requirements and no special restrictions will apply
(3) when the employee returns to work?
(4) A To me that's not applicable 1 thunk the employee could
(s) come back to that job and contanue in that position
(6) Q It is applicable?
(7) A Excuse me, yes, the reverse, it as applicable
(8) Q And agan under the policy as you understood it would it
(9) have been permissible for an Exxon manager to say to the
(10) employee when he comes to work, you can have your job back but
(11) only if you bring me in slips from your AA sponsor to ahow that
(12) you've been going to three meetungs a week would that have
(13) been a permusable requirement?
(14) A If the person was on medical leave, that could have been a
(15) permussible requirement
(I6) Q I'm talking about under the provision of the poicy that
(17) saya, when you come back you won't be aubject to any apecial
(18) requirements or any tpecial privileges
(19) A Then that would not have been permussible nider our policy
(20) as it was
(21) Q So if the employee went to rehab and came back the policy
(22) assured him that he was not going to be subjected to apecial
(23) medical requirements is that -
(24) A That's correct, sur
(25) Q Now you and that the ordinary - the general rule was

\section*{Vol 223789}
(1) that an employee who had been out to rehab when he returned (2) he'd be given the same job back?
(3) A Yes, sir
(4) Q By that do you mean the amme job assignment?
(5) A That's correct I described that as the norm It would
(6) not have to happen in every case, certanly, but I would say (7) that was the norm
(8) Q Suppose in a situation that an employee -
(9) MR LYNCH Maybe this is a good time to break, Your
(10) Honor
(1I) THE COURT Take our iniund recess Ladies and
(12) gentlemen we 11 be in recess for 15 minutes
(13) THE CLERK Court is in recess for 15 minutes
(14) (Jury out at 1000 am )
(1s) (Jury in at 1016 am )
(10) BYMR LYNCH
(I7) Q Mr Rouse we were talking about the employee who goes
out
(18) and commits himself or herself for a rehabilitation program
(19) involving alcohol and the application of this policy insofar as
(20) It includes a provision that the employee may return to his or
(21) her job You said I believe that your department at Exxon
(22) U S A was also responsible for the benefits program?
(23) A Yes, sir, that's correct
(24) Q Now in addition to - well I think the policy says it I
(25) won t put it back up but under the Exxon policy as it existed

Vol 223790
in 1985 was an employee entitled to benefits if the employee
self identified or self admitted into an alcohol rehabilitation program?
A Yes sir, that would have been covered under our medical
our hospital medical plan
Q What about disability benefits salary - substantiation of salery?
A If he went to a rehabulitation facility and that was lenown
to the company, in other words he took medical leave to do
that then he would be subject based on the years of rvice
he had, or she had, to recenve pay whule on disability
Q And in this case there s some evidence that - that the
employee admitted had himself admitted into a hospital - in
hospital in house hospitalization program and then there was
some time off afterwards for the opportunity to attend
meetings If that kind of treatment post hospitalization
Ireatment were prescribed were preseribed by the doctor did the Exxon disability benefits cover that?
A Would have depended on the type of leave the individual was
(20) on whether they were then on at that point a medical leave or
) just on personal leave
Q Well my question is could they go on medical leave if the
doctor prescribed that kind of treatment?
A I thonk that would depend on the curcumstances
Q What would the - what would make the difference?

\section*{Vol 223791}
(1) A If that was part of the formal rehabuitation program then
2) it would be possible I suppose, for our doctors, our - HR
doesn't decide this our doctors decide whether they're on medical leave or not The doctor could say they were on medical leave However I think in many cases if they were just attending meetungs that would not be a medical leave
Q If their own doctor prescribed time off for them?
A Yes
Q And did not dec lare them fit for duty would they be entitled to continuing disability benefits?
A I don't thank so, if their doctor said they were fit for duty
Q Not?
A They were not fit for duty
Q That s what I said sir
6) A They were not fit for duty Agan, I'm not beang vague
(17) here I thank it would depend on the circumstances, perhaps,
(18) that would be a judgment call by the medical department
(19) \(Q\) In the case of the employee who had taken disability (20) benefits your medical department would determine whether and
(21) when the employee returned fit for duty status?
(22) A When you come off medical leave you need to supply the
(23) medical department some evidence that your doctor says you're
(24) fit to come back whether that would be problem with alcohol
(2S) heart attack broken leg whatever it might be
(1) \(Q\) Now when an employee comes back to work after having gone
(2) through such a program the medical department is the one that
(3) verifies the emplovee s qualification to return for dutv is
(4) that correct?
(s) A I wouldn't state it quite like that I think the wav it
(6) would really happen is our medical department would contact or
(n) the minividual's doctor would contact the medical department,
(8) they would have an interaction our medical department and the
employee's physician and if the employee's physician said this
(10) person is ready to return to work then our doctor would so
(11) note that and they'd return to work
(12) Q And is that insofar as disability benefits are concerned
(13) under the - under the Exxon program as it existed in 1985 is
(14) that what determines whether or not the employee receives
(1s) disabilty benefits?
(16) A Yes sur
(17) Q Now when - you testified that as of 1985 you belseved
(18) that the policy that was then in effect which had these three
(19) basic elements that you describe the rules against use of
(20) alcohol the procedure for encouraging selfidentification and
(21) the - and the procedures that the employee had avalable to
(22) him when he returned to work was that policy changed between
(23) January 11985 and March 2319897
(2) A Yes sir it was
(25) Q Okay Could you just take us through as you recall the

\section*{Vol 223793}
(1) major changes that occurred over that period of time?
(2) A Well, the first change that occurred was in - in 1985, we
(3) decided to minate a program of pre-employment drag
(4) screening We were concerned enough about managing the people
(s) who belonged to the company who were company
employees, and
(6) managug their activities as safely as we could for the
(7) public We didn't find ourselves wantung to add additional
(8) people to the roles who came to us with basically the problem
(9) And so we inituated pre-employment drug screening for all of
(10) our people who were hired whether that would be a blue collar
(II) wage earner or if it was a matter of a young engineer coming
(12) off the college campus
(13) Q That occurred in 19857
(14) A That occurred in 1985
(15) Q Any other changes in 1985?
(16) A Well, we also had, in 1985, we had expanded - our EHAP
(17) program started out as a test in 1984, and we expanded that
(18) broadly across the company in 1985 and our drug
awareness
(19) tramug that I mentioned for supervisors took place in '84
and
(20) '85, the year of '85
(21) \(Q\) And this drug awareness did that include training
(22) supervisors on identification of alcohol abuse on the job?
(23) A Yes, sir Drug and alcohol abuse
(24) Q How extenaive was that? Was that provided to people at
(25) Exxon Shipping Company?

Vol 223794
(1) A Yes sir We intended for all of our supervisors to (2) recenve that, what we call drug awareness training program
(3) I'm sure that probably if you took the role of every supervisor
(4) We had at that tume in the company, perhaps a thousand or more,
(S) there might have been someone who massed that tranning becanse
(6) they were off on duty someplace or had - had - on vacation or
(7) something, but the norm or the expectation was all supervisors
(8) would receive that training
(9) Q Inciuding supervisors at Exxon Shipping Company?
(10) A That's correct, sur
(II) Q Now have you identified the changes that occurred in 1985
(12) to the alcohol policy?
(13) A Yes, that would be basucally it an 1985 Now, in 1986 -
(14) Q Well, let me ask the question Did you make any changes in
(IS) 1986 ?
(16) A Yes, sur, we did We -
(17) \(Q\) What were those changes?
(18) A Okay We were to the process, throughout the year of 1986,
(19) doung a complete reevaluation of our alcohol and - our alcohol
(20) poicy, and that resulted in early 1987 in the introduction of
(21) a new drug and alcohol policy
(22) Q Okay Now before I ask you about the reevaluation could
(23) you just give the jury a quick summary of what the differences
(24) were between the 87 policy and the one that had exiated at the
(25) start of 1985?
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{\begin{tabular}{l}
1) A Yes sir The 1987 - the new ' 87 policy added drugs to \\
2) the equation for the first tume because previously we had
\end{tabular}} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{just} \\
\hline & an alcohol policy It provided for search for cause, it provided for tests for cause, and then it contunued to ha \\
\hline the & \\
\hline & thugs we already bad, pre-employment drug screeming, supervisory awareness tranang, substance abuse is \(\boldsymbol{a}\) \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{treatable} \\
\hline & condition, encourage people t \\
\hline & chabilitation \\
\hline & Q Now you indicated that through 1986 you were engaged in a \\
\hline & reevaluation of the policy that we have deguribed through 1985? \\
\hline & A Yes, str \\
\hline & Q And did you come across Dr Masters standards for how you \\
\hline & deal with employees after they return from.rehab of they re in \\
\hline & a safety senative position? \\
\hline & A No, sir, I did not personally come across those standards \\
\hline (16) & Q Did anybody report to you in your depariment that they had \\
\hline & learned that there was this well established standard out there \\
\hline & that applied to safety sensitive positions? \\
\hline & A No, sir they did not \\
\hline (20) & Q What did you do to try to find out what was going on in \\
\hline & industry and what academics and government were \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{recommending to} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(22) companies in Exxon sposition?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{\begin{tabular}{l}
(23) A Well when we wrote our 1987 policy we had a number of \\
(24) outside resources we used uutside and inside resources
\end{tabular}}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{We} \\
\hline & used to help us design that policy \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

A Yes sar The 1987 - the new ' 87 policy added drugs'to
(2) the equation for the first time because previously we had Jus
(3) an alcohol policy It provided for search for cause, it provided for tests for cause, and then it contanued to have
(5) things we already bad, pre-employment drug screening,
(6) supervisory awareness traming, substance abuse is a treatable
condition, encourage peopie to come forward for rehabilitation
Q Now you indicated that through 1986 you were engaged in a reevaluation of the policy that we have deacribed through 1985? A Yes, str
(12) Q And did you come across Dr Masters standards for how you
(13) deal with employees after they return from-rehab of they re in
(14) a safety gensitive position?
(IS) A No, sir, I did not personally come across those standards
(16) Q Did anybody report to you in your deparment that they had
learned that there was this well esiablished standard out there
(18) that applied to safety sensitive positions?
(9) A No, sir they did no
(20) \(Q\) What did you do to try to find out what was going on in
(21) industry and what academics and government were
ending to
(22) companies in Exxon s position \({ }^{2}\)

A Well whea we wrote our 1987 policr we had a number of We
(2s) used to help us design that policy
(1) For example, we used human affairs international these
(2) were the tramed counselors that our employees could go to If
3) they had personal problems, including problems with drugs and
(4) alcohol, so we used ther mput
(5) Q I think you assumed a lot of us I ve spent a lot of ume
(6) On this you ve spent a lot of time on this and we jump over
() things These were the EAP providers?
(8) A Yes, gir, that's correct
(Q) Q And Human Affairs International was a different
(10) corporation not a division or affiliate or department of
(11) Exxon?
(12) A That's correct, they're Just a contractor of Exxon They
(13) don't work - they're not a department of Exxon, thear ) employees are not Exxon employees
(15) Q Why was the EAP or EHAP program kept separate from Exxon
(16) itaelf?
(17) A Because we wanted to maintan confidentuality, for one
(18) thing, and, secondly, we didn't want to have that an un house
(19) program We thought we could get better counseling across the
(20) aation for our employees by using a contractor
(21) Q You consult that company?
(22) A Yes, sir, we did
(23) Q And the peopie in that company work full-time in the
(24) employee assistance field?
(2S) A Yes, sir, they do

\section*{Vol 223797}
(1) Q What elee did you do?
(2) A Well, we obviousiy worked with our own medical department,
(3) and it's my understanding that they reached out to other
(4) medical departments to find out what - un other companes to
(5) find out what they were about in the area of drug and alcohol
(6) \(Q\) And what else if anything did you take into account?
(7) A Well, we had - we had a survey that was done by business
(8) round table group that I mentuoned of about a hnndred and fifty
9) companes, unteresting to note that about half of those
(10) companies had no drug and alcohol policy and were not planning
(11) one at that point in tume The \(\mathbf{7 0}\) or so that did have policies
(12) basically had policies that included education of
supervisors,
) pre-employment drug screening, a rehabihtation EHAP type
) program and tests and searches for cause
(15) \(Q\) Is it fair to say that what you saw from other companies
(16) were policies very similar to your own?
(IT) A Yes, sir that's correct
(18) Q Did you look beyond what people were already doing and
see
(19) what there might be out there that you could do to improve your
(20) policy?
) A Yes, sir we did
(2) What are some of the things you considered?
(23) A Well for example, we considered random screening Should
(2a) we move forward in random drug screening where you just call
( s) somebody in and say it's tume to have a drug and alcohol test
\[
\text { Vol } 223798
\]
(i) Just totally random After a lot of consideration gathering a
(2) lot of data we rejected that concept
(3) Q What led you to reject it?
(4) A We rejected it for a number of reasons We rejected it s) because our unons that we want to work with we have a good
(6) relationship with Our unions were very opposed to random
7) screening at that point They heard all the horror stones
(8) about chan of custody where employeen were falsely accused of
(9) having problems they didn't have confidence in the tests and
(10) so they were very concerned
(II) We were concerned about the - what had happened to several
(12) companues in our industry who were trying - decided they might
(13) try random screening in a place or two, and what basically
(14) happened was either the courts or their own unons
enjomed
(15) them from going forward with random screening and stopped them
(16) cold
(17) In the states I don't have all of them commatted to
(18) memory, but states like Tennessee New York, Ohio,
(19) Massachusetts these were states where the state officials
(n) stated they would random screen police officers and the local
(21) courts stopped them from doing that The federal government
(22) our own federal government put forth some regulations to random


(2f) tifie and Went out with that, we might get an injurction that
(3) would leave us with no policy at all and that was not in the
(4) best interest of protecting the public And so we took the
(s) decision that we would go with - with tests for cause which
(6) our own union official we went and talked to him and we -
(7) they said we can support tests for cause because
something's
(8) happened and you have a reason to do the screening
(9) Q Now did you focus at any ume during the reevaluation of
(10) the drug policy drug and alcohol policy in \(1986 \quad 1987\) on
(II) safety sensitive or critical skills positions?
(12) A Yes, sur That was another aspect of testung that we
(13) looked at and we rejected that one at that pout in tome, as
(14) well
(Is) Q Why was that sir?
(16) A Well, we rejected it really for three reasons The first
(it) reason being that it's very difficult to define what a
(18) safety-sensitive position is It anay sound easy, but if you're
(19) going to say, for example a truck driver is a safety sensitive
(") position how about the guy that fixes the brakes on the truck.
(יi) is that-a safety sensituve position as well, so we were
(22) concerned about that definition
(23) We were concerned that safety sensitive jobs would appear (24) to be discrmmatory from a racial standpont We worked very,
(23) very hard to have diversity in our work force and many of our
(2) safety sensitive were populated by manonties and we were
afrand people would say I see what you've done you've just
got a drug testung program here for your minonties and we didn't think that was fair
And the other reason was we were advised by our legal department that perhaps there would be some challenges to this
(8) kind of activity So when you rolled all that together combired with the fact that other companies - many other companies in our industry were not trying that kind of an approach we felt that the prudent thing to do was to go with testing for cause
MR LYNCH Your Honor may I approach the witness?
THE COURT Uh huh
BY MR LYNCH
Q This is my only copy at the moment at least
Mr Rouse I mputting in front of you Defendants Exhibut 9181 Could you describe that for the record please?
A Yes sir Thas is really - thas anch or 30 document of papers represented the tranning program the supervisory tranung program that we used when we introduced the 1987 policy That was prepared by the training and safety group
(23) my department
(24) \(Q\) And to whom was that program given?
(25) we

A Well in Exxon we have kind of a unique concept perhaps

\section*{Vol 223801}
call it the tran - the tranner program and what we do is we bring peopte in from all over the company and we tran them
the policy and then it is then their responsibility to take
these materials and go back and tran all the supervisors in therr work area
Q So the bottom line is all supervisors received this training?
A Yes, sur that's correct
Q And did just the traners get these materials that I ve handed you 9181 I believe?
A No, sir, the - everybody that attended the traming was given a copy of these maternals
MR LYNCH Offer Exhibit DX9181 Your Honor
(Exhibit 9181 offered)
MR O NEILL Noobjection
THE COURT Defendants Exhibil 9181 is admited
(Exhibit 9181 received)
BY MR LYNCH
Q Now I d like to call your attention to some material on
pages six and seven of these training matenals which I ve
highlighted together - in the interest of legibility III
22) take the - only part of it
(23) The phrase Exxon is committed to providing a safe healthy
(24) and productive workplace to all employees for all employees
(3) our new alcohol and drug policy is aimed at ensuring this

Vol 223802
environment With reterence to the specific issue that \(s\) been
focused on in this case did you re examine the question of
whether providing an assurance to employees that if they sought
(4) rehabilitation they could have their job back did you
(s) re examine whether that was something that tended to promote
afe healthy and productive workplace for all employees?
A Yes, sir, we did
Q Did you ask for professional advice on that subject?
A Yes, sir, we did
Q Did you explore what other companies in the industry were doing?
A Yes, sur, we dad
Q Including companies that had safety senaitive jobs?
A Yes, sur
Q Okay And did you reach the conclusion that continuing
that part of the Exxon alcohol policy into the now Exxon drug
and alcohol policy was in the interest of safety?
A Yes, sur
Q What was the basis for that conclusion?
A Well, we just felt hke returning those people to the job was the correct thing to do We felt that if we did not return
) them to the job, if it appeared that they were goung to lose
(23) therr jobs, they would go underground and, therefore we would
(24) have a problem that we didn't even know about and that we felt
(25) was a greater nisk, greater safety risk than having the

\section*{Vol 223803}
employee in the job with appropnate supervisory montorng
(2) Q I d like to go on to the next paragraph of these materials
(3) which says now that we ve told you what we are about here's
(4) what we are not about in implementing the policy We are not
(5) trying to police the moral behavior of our employees nor are
(6) we trying to tell you what to do or not do away from work We
(7) espectaily do not want to infringt on your rights
(8) With reference to that provision of the policy did you
(9) seck professional advice?
(10) A Yes, we dad
(11) Q I should say these are the training materials?
(12) A Yes, sir that's correct
(13) Q This was what the policy was intended to accomplish is (14) that correct?
(IS) A That's correct
(16) Q Now again focusing you on the specific sasue that s been (17) raised in this case how a corporation should deal with an
(18) employee who had voluntarily sought treatment for a problem
(19) when he came back to work did you seck professional advice on
(20) how you ought to deal with that employee when he returned to
in work?
(1) A Yes wedad
(3) \(Q\) Did you receive advice that you should - thal the
(24) supervisor should get involved in making sure that the
(25) employee sattending AA mectings?
(1) A No, sir we did not receave advice that it is our
(2) responsibility or it would be approprate I don't like to use
(3) that word responsibility, would be appropriate for Exxon to be
(4) unvolved in whether that minividual attended AA on their own
(5) tume
(6) Q Did you receive advice that Exxon ought to set up some
(7) procedure to make sure that the supervisors are inquiring about
(8) employee a emotional well being?
(9) A No, sur, we ded not
(ம) Q Or how the family life was going?
(11) A That's night We felt that the best advice we could get,
(12) that that was inapproprate for the company at this point in
(13) tume
(14) \(Q\) In the cate of an employee who, prior to or pursuant to
(15) this policy went out and received treatment what were you -
(16) what was your conclusion as to the appropriate role for a
(17) supervisor?
(18) A Well, our view was that supervisors, because of their
(19) extennve background and traming in day-to-day supervision of
(20) employees, worlang with those employees on job
performance,
(21) that what we should focus on \(s\) how the employee's performing
(22) the job, and so the supervisory monitoring would take place 02
(23) doms
(24) that job
(25) Q Now under the procedures and training that you had if a

\section*{Vol 223805}
supervisor was aware that an employee had received treatment
in
the past for an alcohol problem was the supervisor supposed
to
sgnore that information?
A No I don't thank they were supposed to ignore it
Q What place did that kind of information have in the definuion of the supervisor a responsibility?
(7) A It would just be another prece of information that he knew
about that employee and he would factor in or she would

\section*{factor}
(9) mto the day to-day montoning of that employee
(10) Q Okay There have been a lot of questions here this morming
(11) about a bar that was - or restaurant that was etther called
(12) the Yankee Whaler or the Yankee Clipper Firat of all have
you been to Long Beach?
A I've been to Long Beach
Q Do you know what the name of the place is?
A No, I do not Unfortunately, I've never been there Q Was it required by this policy or intended by this policy that supervisors should determine whether employees in their off duty tume were consuming alcohol?
A No sur, they were - the policy did not intend that supervisors would do that
(22) \(Q\) Let \(s\) assume that the supervisor believes that the employee
(23) has been through a rehabilitation program for alcoholism
(24) A Yes
(23) Q Was it - did this policy contemplate that the supervisor

\section*{Vol 223806}
should determine whether the employee is going to a bar or a restaurant in his off duty time and having a glass of wine or a giass of beer?

\section*{A No, sir it did not}

Q Okay Why not?
A Because we felt that the supervisor should monitor the individual's job performance and if there was a problem with
(8) substance abuse that would be reflected in that job performance
Q Now you have heard have you not the - the common saying
that once a person \(s\) an alcoholic always an alcoholic?
A Yes sir
Q And have you heard it said by people who ve been to AA or otherwise that even one drink for a person who \(s\) an alcoholic is a relapse?
A Yes sir, I've heard that
Q Now if a supervisor under the 1987 policy were to have learned that someone who went to aicohol rehabilitation treatment had at their home or at a private restaurant had a drink under that policy and the supervisory guidelines and the training that you gave your supervisors what should they have done?
(3) A Well I can onlv speculate about what I would have done, and first I would have had some concern if the employee had
( s) been through a rehabulitation and in fact was rumored to have

Vol 223807
(1) started drinking agann I think what I would do is perbaps try
(2) to check that rumor out and find out if it's valid

Q Would the - did this policy provide that if an employee
who had been to alcohol rehabilitation had had a drink on
private time that the supervisor could take job action?
A No sir it did not
Q Could you reassign that employee?
A It's always management's discretion to reassign an employee
Q If you learned that an employee had been drinking off the
job would you consider that an appropriate basis under this policy?
A To reassign someone?
Q To reasaign someone
A Not that in and of atself no, sur
(16) Q I m trying to get it clear You said you d go check if (I7) somebody went to the Yankee Clipper and had a glass of wine or
(18) beer with co workers you said you d check into that?
(19) A I sand I might checi into that as personal management (20) style
(21) \(Q\) What use would you make of that information?
(22) A If I found the employee was drinking, that the rumorin
(23) fact was true, then I might be monitonng that job
performance
(24) Just a little bit closer
(25) Q But the job you would have the policy and the rules that

\section*{Vol 223809}
(1) MR O NEILL No objection
(2) THE COURT I don think you did 9181 is admitted
(3) without objection
(4) (Exhibit 9181 received)
(s) MR LYNCH Thank you Your Honor
(6) BY MR LYNCH
(7) Q Were there additional or subsequent changes made to the (8) Exxon alcohol polscy between 1987 and the time of the accident?
(9) A No actual changes In the late summer, August kand of tume
(10) frame in 1988 our senior management asked us to talte a look at
(II) our drug and alcohol policy along these lines They sand (12) you've had it in place for about 18 months Let's take a look
(13) and see if it's stull state of the art let's see if it's stull
(14) up to speed with regulations, requrements, social changes, and
(1s) come back to us and give us some recommendations-about
any
(10) changes you'd recommend
(17) Q And what - what did you do pursuant to that directive?
(18) A We looked at varions studies that we had It was about
(19) this time frame or certanly that fall when the government
(20) passed the Drug Free Workplace Act Our 1987 policy fully (21) complied with every aspect of that act We looked to see what
(22) other companies were doing and their vanous policies came up
(23) with several things, issues if you will, that we brought to (24) the attention of our management and they agreed that some of
(24) the thugs we ought to go forward with and some we should not

\section*{Vol 223810}

Q Now, let me ask you one atem you didn \(t\) refer to Under
these policies that you as manager of human resources were
responsible for was - were the local managements of Exxon
facilities or Exxon operations free to augment these policies?
A Yes We had situations where local managers, during thes
tume, would have supplemented, if you will, the policy with
vanous ideas
Q Aad in connection with this case are you acquainted with a
letter that Mr Iarossi wrote to the people of the Exxon
Shipping Company in 1985?
A Yes, sur, 1 am
Q And the effect of that - what was the effects of that letter?
A Well, hus 1985 letter, as I recall it, really took them
(IS) from a policy on just alcohol to one that meladed searches and
(16) some of the things that we had in the 1980 , ultumately put in
(17) the 1987 policy for the company
(IB) Q So in that case the Exxon Shipping Company adopted come
(19) procedures in 1985 that the corporation ended up adopting
(20) corporation wide in 1987 ?
(21) A Yes, sir, that's correct
(22) Q Now in connection with your update or whatever it was in
(23) 1988 did you look at what focal elements of Exxon were doing
(24) and see if they d had any good ideas?
(23)

A Yes, sir, we did
Vol 22 3811
Q And what if anything did you find about that?
A One that came up as a result of that examiantion was the
concept of post rehabilitation testing, has to do with when
employee comes back from rehabilitation should you do periodic
s) testing of that individual, unannounced testing

Q That would be testing for such things as alcohol in the
ayatem?
A Yes, sir, it would Although, I got to tell you, those
knods of tests are not really too effective with alcohol,
) beeause alcohol metabolizes through a system farly quickly, so
(ii) post rehab testing is most effectave with drugs like cocane
(12) and manjuana that may stay in the bloodstream as long as 24
(13) days or so depending on the individual
(14) Q Now we talked earlier about whether you had conadered
(Is) teating of rehabbed people people who had returned and
(16) indicated that that was thought to be inconsistent with the
(17) provision that people who look advantage of the policy would
(18) not be subjected to special requirements?
(19) A That's correct
(20) Q What changed - or how did that develop in Exxon
(21) organizations given that provision of the policy?
(22) A Well, thas whole thing is an evolutionary process You're (23) moving along with how society's changing, you're moving along
(24) with how laws are changing, and so what we were looking at

10
(25) 1987 in terms of post rehabilitation testing, we found more
i) activity in that area more acceptance of that bv unions more
2) acceptance of that by the courts in this penod of the fall of (3) 1988
(4) Now did you take any action as a result of the study that
(s) you did in late 1988 ?
(6) Well we went to the management committee with several
7) recommendations that had to do with whether we should relax our
) drug testing standards because we have about the toughest drug
9) testing standards of anyone in the industry and assue was
whether we ought to move marijuana from 20 nanograms up to 9
(II) hundred and we concluded we should leave it
(12) Q Move it up means to a leas atrict test?

A Yes, sur, that you would not be considered positave of 4) manjuana, construed positive if you were 99 or below, and nght now it's 19 or below you're construed as having martuuang
(16) un your bloodstream We concluded our testang, as we
(17) discussed We told the management committee we felt we needed
(18) to continue our education programs we had We suggested to the
199 management committee that - a couple of other areas that don't
(30) come immediately to mind
(21) What our management committee said to us these are just
(22) concepts There are some - we think you ought to do the final
(23) analysis terms of implementation what's that involve, well, (24) you got to check and work out the details as to how it relates
 you
don't slam dunk these with the unions We want to bargoin these and do it correctly, what changes that would make to our
(3) supervisory training what materials we would have to develop
(4) for employees and supervisors to do these things so we were
(s) in that staff process up to March 23rd, 1989

Q So as of March 23 rd these proposed changes or proposed updates of the policy had not been put into effect?
A They had not been The mechanics and the detanls were being finalsed to go back to the management committee for one
(10) Last here's-how it-will all play-out kind of review before we (i1) umplemented them and the accident occurred before we got back
(12) to it
(13) Q Now Mr Rouse as of March 23, 1989 based on the
(14) information available to you was the Exxon overall alcohol
(15) policy as you ve discussed it today deficient in - in faling
(16) to have that post rehab testing proviston?
(I7) A No, sir I would not think so, because the federal law that (18) was passed a few months before in 1988 did not have any comment
(19) requirements about post rehabilitation testing As we looked
(20) at other companes, there were some dong that, but it was not
(21) yet a widely adopted concept, so I would have to say my (22) testumony would be at that tume our 1987 policy was still state
(23) of the art versus what other companies had Understand there
(24) are many companses at this pont that didn't have a drug

Vol 223816
Vol 223814
(1) Q Was in your view based on the intormation that you had
2) available was the Exxon overall alcohol pohicy that existed
(3) in - on March 231989 deficient insofar as it dealt with the (4) monitoring of employees who had been through rehabilitation?
(5) A Agan I would say it was not, and I would base that on the
(6) fact that the federal drug and alcohol - work free drug -
(7) Drug Free Workplace Act that was put into place at that point
(8) in tume made no comments at all about post rehabilitation
(9) montonng
(10) Q Well putting that statute aside
(11) A Rught
(12) Q Was it common in industry based on your research for
(13) companies to have procedures for mandatory post rehabilitation
(14) monitoring of employees who had been through rehab for alcohol
(15) abuse?
(16) A I would testify that it was not common We were seemg (17) some movement in that area, and that's why we were recommending
(18) to our management committee the concept of post rehabihtation
(9) testing, but it was still not common in iudustry at that tume Q Okay Now are you familiar with the procedures that were
used in the airline industry through that puriod for pilots who
were flying under an extmption bulausc ol the diagnosis of alcoholism?
A I'm not really familiar with that but my limited understanding of the -
(1) A My understanding of the airhne industry program was they
2) had special legal considerations from the government that would
3) permit them to have that kind of program considerations that
(4) my industry does not have

Q In your - your evaluation through thi business round table
committee and through other professional organizations that
you
( \(\rightarrow\) ) belong to had you determined whether procedures such as
mandatory counseling mandatory participation in Alcoholics
Anonymous were common in companies situated in the alame position as Exxon?
A I would testufy they were uncommon at that point
Q Had you determined whether such provisions were common among oil companies?
A They were not common among oul companies In fact, in my
recollection, I don't believe there was a single one of the
majors, the majors being the top 12 , that was doing that at that point in time
Q Were such procedures common for holders of
fety sensulive
jobs?
A Again that would - I would not think that was common at
that point in ume
MR LYNCH Your Honor I have no further questions
THE COURT You may cross examine
MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
(25) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JAMES ROUSE

\section*{Vol 223817}

BY MR O NEILL
Q Sir you came in here and testified about the airline industry today and you don t know about the airline industry?
A I testufied what my understanding was that's correct
Q Do you know about the regulatory structure for the airine indusiry yes or no?
A No I do not
Q You don t know do you?
A I do aot that's correct
Q Now I also was interested and I read during your testimony
the big supervisor s volume and I want to go over some of the
pages with you
A Fine
Q Could we have the Elmo please
On page five of the supervisor a volume it states that of
(16) a hundred million people in the nation \(s\) work force the ten
(17) million or so who are the drug and aicohol abusers cost
(18) compantes between 40 to 60 billion doliars a year in lost
(19) productivity medical expenses lost or damaged equipment
and
(20) rehabilitation do you see that?
(21) A Yes I do
(22) Q It s a serious problem isn 1 Il?
(23) A There's no question ibout th it
(24) Q And your company if an employee - back in \(85 \quad 86\)
(25) If an employee is found with or is under the influence of drugs
```

or alcohol on company property disciplinary action will be
taken and is grounds for termination isn t that a correct
statement?
A That is a correct statement
Q So if somebody is under the influence of alcohol on company
property there is a requirement for disciplinary action?
A Could I check your dates agann' I belseve you sand }198
You're reading from a supervisory manual from 1987
Q 1987'
A 1987 that was the case
Q And it was the case in 1985 wasn t it?
A Not in Exxon U S A
Q At Exxon Shipping Company if an employee was found
under
(14) the influence of alcohol on company policy disciplinary action
(5) had to be taken isn t that right?
A I would have to go back and look at the shipping's policy,
I'm not certann of that
Q You don t know one way or the other?
A I know that that language was not used because that
language wasn't written then
) Q Doesn t make any since to have drunken employees on
company
property is that right?
A That's nght
(4) Q It sa bad practice?
(25) A Yes

```
Vol 223819
(1) Q Something should be done about it?
(2) A I would say it was a bad practice
(3) Q In 1985 ut was a bad practice?
(4) A I would say it was a bad practice
(5) Q Are you aware that there were reports and Captatn
Hazelwood
(6) admitted he occasionally drank aboard the ship?
(7) A I was aware of that
(8) Q And he came back from the ship - came bach to the ship
(9) from port drunk?
(10) A Let me say it this way I was not personally aware of that,
(11) I have seen that document
(12) Q You see it now?
(13) A Yes sir
(i4) Q Bad practice don \(t\) you think?
(15) A Yes sir Ternble is your word I said bad practuce
(16) Q Disciplinary action should be taken?
(17) A It would depend on the circumstances
(18) Q Do you know if any disciplinary action was laken?
(19) A I do not
(20) Q The effects of alcohol are well documented includes slowed
(21) reaction reduced level of interest abrupt increase in
(22) frustration frequent drop in moods that sa correct
(23) statement?
(24) A Yes, sir I'd say that's correct
(25) Q You showed your employeesa movie Everything Looks So

\section*{Vol 223821}
(1) is concerned is a performance problem isn that right?
(2) A Any substance abuse problem is a performance problem
(3) Q So alcohol problems are not performance problems but drug
(4) problems are?
(s) A No sir I didn't say that I said any substance abuse
(6) problem is a - is a performance problem We've said that in
(7) this testumony going way back decades and decades
(8) Q That s right Somibudy with an alcohol problem has a
(9) performance problem don 1 they?
(10) A That does not necessanly follow I suppose people could
(11) have an alcohol problem on their owa tume and not have it
(12) affect their job performance and, as we've testafied, what we
(13) were concerned about is thear job performance
(14) Q We'll get to that in a minute
(1s) A Good
(16) \(Q\) And indeed you show your employess a chart as part of the
(in training that talks about confronting the employee if you think
(18) a problem exists?
(19) A That's correct, 1987, that's what we told our emplayees
(20) Q And if somebody thought a probiem exists they should have (21) gone to the medical department?
(22) A We said - told our emplovees our supervisors that if they (23) thought a problem exasted they should send the employee to the
(2A) medical department, in 1987
(23) \(Q\) And serious misconduct should normally lead to
termination?

\section*{A That's correct}

Q Is coming back to ship drunk serious misconduct?
A It depend on the curcumstances
Q How drunk you were?
A Or if you were indeed drunk what basis you say they're
druak Did you run a test did you not runa test was it
based on the smeil of alcohol on somebody's breath or hatever
Q I was very interested in your manual on these the three highlighted comments abuse in the workpiace is not committed to your stereotypical imbalanced staggering person do you see
(12) that comment?

A Yes sar Ido
Q And alcoholics seldom ever dank on the job do you see
that concept that comment right there?
A Well, it was not because I think - put the whole comment -
Q Putit up?
A Or says, takes barbiturates for the same effect
Q Monitoring alcoholic on the job is sort of a non event
because as you say there alcoholits seldom drinh on the job?
A Oh I would disagree with that completely 1 think
monstonag is a very major event I don't know where you come
(24) up with the non event concept
(25) Q My question is do alcoholics seldom ever drink on the job?

\footnotetext{
Vol 223823
AI ve had expertencer where alcoholics drank on the job and
expernences where they did not
Q Is this your manual?
A Yes it is
Q Thank you Now you came in here and you talk in your direct testimony at the beginning part of your direct testimony very very caretully and vour words were very very careful You said that when somebody womes out of rehabilitation "was the norm to return them to the same job? A Yes sir that is what I said
Q And I mintercsted in the sccond half of that statement A Okay
Q The half you didn 1 say
A All right
Q Lal stakua look al wh could al the hall vou didn i
say Pagı 212 lincs 4 through linu 23
MR LYNCH His deposition?
MR O NEILL Yes
(Portion of Video of James Rouse played as follows)
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
QMr Rouse previously we discussed the issue of an individual coming back from drug or alcohol rehabititation and what would happen to that person
In or around 1985 when a person came bach from alcohol
rehabilitation did that purson enjoy joh scturity but not
}
necessarily the job that that person once had? We II start out with an Exxon U S A employee
A Regarding Eaxon U S A, 1985 we would have been under
1977 policy on alcohohsm And as I've previously testufied
I think our norm would have been to put them back into their
previous assignment We would have put them back in their previous assignment
Q Okay
A Since the policy were sulent on that, if a manager for some
reason had certain concerns I'm sure he was not obligated
put hum back in that assignment necessanly
(Portion of Video of James Rouse concluded)
MR O NEILL Let s iake a look at it again in another
part of the deposition on page 213 lines 11 through 21
(Portion of Video of James Rouse played as follows)
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Does that mean that in 1985 people returning from an alcohol rehab program were subject to extra scrutiny with respect to the job they - they went back to?
A No As I've testified all along, the norm would be to put them back on the - on the existing position But if the person looked like they were not having a very good recovery or
(23) there were safety concerns there's nothing that obligated that
(24) manager to put him straight back in that job There's to be
(2s) some management judgment in that (End of video

\section*{Voi 223825}

MR O NEILL And on page 214 of your daposition
transuript lines mine through 14
(Portion of Video of James Rouse played as follows)
BY VIDEO EXAMINER
Q Meaning that the manager based solely on afety concerns could determine in 1985 not to put that individual back into the position he or she once held?
A I think I'll just repeat the same answer I've been giving
I'll give it one more tume which is the norm was to put them
(10) back in the job That would not prevent management
judgment
(II) which would do something different than that
(Portion of Video of Jamus Rouse concluded)
BY MR O NEILL
Q So there was no requirement they go back to the same job?
A I have testified here this morning that was the norm and
(16) as I said in my deposition very clearly management has the
(17) nght to manage We train our supervisors and our
managers
(18) very carefully and we do not take their ability to make
(19) individual decisions away from them with our drug and
alcohol
(20) policy
(21) Q Now I m going to use Defendants Exhibit 3683
(22) MR O NEILL Offer 3683
(23) (Exhibit 3683 offered)
(24) BY MR O NEILL
(2s) Q Dutendants Exhibit 3683 appcars to be some charts Have

(1) works for Exxon USA that Exxon is in the minority of companies which do not specify abatement rehabilitation following first positive test is that a correct statement?
A Yes, that's correct that's what that draft says
Q You didn twant Exxon to be out on the leading edge with regard to any alcohol policies did vou?
A I wanted Exxon to have a policy we could mplement and I
didn't want to be enjoined by the Court so I wound up with
empty bag and had no policy to protect the safety of the public
Q Now lam puzzled by what this page is in the document
A This was sumply a rundown of our pre-employment drug testing results for the year
Q By race?
A 1987, by race, that's correct
Q Now this document has at the end of it some assessment of the compelitive atuation with regard to post rehab testing and you compare youraelf to two otl companies Shell and Amoco
you see that?
A Yes, sar, I do
Q Post rehab testing Exxon no Shull pusi rehab Amoco post rehab Do you sut that'
AYes str Ido
Q 3 M post rehab DuPont post ruhab Allied Signal posta
rehab IBM posi rehab So you and thu soap manutacturer are

Vol 22 383I
the two that don 1 Proctor and Gambel is that nght?
A No sir What that is that's the companies doing post rehab out of the \(\mathbf{1 5 0}\) dong the survev I believe the number
was about six or seven at that peint so that meant a hundred
and 43 were not doing it
Q Now I ma hitle interested in - see il we can clean this
up Union Oll in the carly 1980s had a very specific follow up
program with regard to its employees that went through
rehabilitation didn they"
Al have no data on that
Q You don (know?
A No sir I don't know
Q Have you ever been informed of that'
A No sir
Q Ever been shown any Union Oll documents on that?
A 1 saw a Union Oil document yesterday that sand you were going to use thas morning
Q Union Oll you know as you sit heru loday that Union Oil
had a very careful follow up program with regard to post rehab employees?
, A No, sir, I did not know that And mfact the document (2) you provided was a dear to nobody letter sigaed by nobody
(23) Appeared to me to be d draft by the w iy
(24) Q Or a form letter?
(2s) A Looked to me like a draft

Vol \(22 \quad 3832\)
(1) Q You ve been deposed in various cases on behalf of Exxon
(2) ten to 15 times that sa correct statement?
(3) A In my 32 year career, that would be correct, SIr
(4) \(Q\) And you know that the nature of alcoholism is such that it
(s) goes abstinence relapse abstinence reiapse that \(s\) a correct
(6) statement isn \(t\) it? You know that don \(t\) you?
7) A Well, I really - I do and I don't and let me testufy to (8) what I do know
(9) Q Let stake a look at your deposition transcript
(10) A Well let me testify what I do know because I know exactly
(11) what I said in my deposituon I said early on I was of the
(12) mpression that employees who went to rehabilitation

\section*{tended to}
(13) be cured when they came out of there and if they stuck with (14) their aftercare, then there was not a problem
(15) I have subsequently learned that the relapse rate was a
(16) great deal higher than I probably realized that it was and, in
(17) fact, I was shocked, as some people in this courtroom might
be
(18) shocked, in a substance like cocane it's as high as 90
percent
(19) and frankly, I did not know that
(20) Q Couldn itell whether you agreed with me or not?
(21) A I told you what I testified to in my deposition Or what I
(22) recall testafying in my deposition
(23) Q Let s go to page 48 of your depostion
(24) A Okay
(23) Q The questions on page 47 Would this be the case for

\section*{Vol 223833}
(I) exampte the alcohol and breath everyone - well if an
(2) individual reported for work with alcohol on his or her breath
(3) and il was the firat time would that person - was the policy
(4) that that person regardless ot the number of times it happened
(s) be sent for Ireatment?
(6) That sa crazy question but your answer was again that
(7) would depend on the earcumstances If you look into the
(8) subject of alcoholism you find the nature of alcoholism is 9) abstinence relapse abstinence relapse abstinence relapae and
(10) somebody can be having a very successful recovery and atill
(II) have a stuation where they have a relapse And that a the
(12) answer that you gave
(13) A Absolutely in that context that's right We were talking
(14) about a penod much more recent than the one that you seemed to
(Is) betalking about
(16) Q Now do you have an understanding thal over 50 percent of (17) alcoholics have relapses?
(18) A I - that's not a number that I'm familiar with I would (19) have said it would have been something less than that, but you
(20) may be correct I Just don thave the data committed to
(21) memory
(22) \(Q\) Go to page 67 of your deposition testimony
(23) A Okay
(24) Q Take a look and read along with me
(25) A Sure

\section*{Vol 223834}

Q The question on line 18 is your testimony is that your
understanding is it \(s\) well over half answer that a correct
A Excuse me sir you said what page we're on'
Q 67
A Mine only goes to 58
Q I m sorry Here s 67
A Okay Thank you
Q And if you would why don 1 you read to the jury line 18 to line 20
A Line 18 says, question your testimony is that your
understanding is it's well over half?
That's correct
What I was understanding between - was that your understanding between 1977 and 1987 And I'm sayug are you
(1s) asking me to give you the date at which I really became
(16) familer with the ilness and I can't do that because I don't
(In know when that was It's been an evolutionary process mueb
(18) like I just sand and I've learned a lot about that process as
(19) we worked through it

Q Are you ignorant now? You re more knowledgeable now than
(1) you were in 1985?
( 9 A No question about that sir
(3) Q Did you know what relapse rates were in 1985?
(14) A No I did not
(.S) Q Should you because of your position at Exxon US A have

\section*{Vol 223835}
known that information? You were writing an alcohol policy weren tyou?
A No sır I don't necessanly think I needed to be famular with relapse rates at that point in tume
Q You were writing alcohol policies for the company in 1983
84 and 85 and you don \(t\) think you should have been familaar
with relapse rates?
A I didn't write a policy in '83 I didn't wnte one in '84
and I didn't write one in '85
Q Did you approve them?
A And I did not approve them I was involved in writugg one as I testufied in 1986 which was put out to our employees in the year 1987
Q And it wasn i necessary to know about relapse rates?
A We were deahng with our medical department and certanaly
(16) the medical department was famulur with that and I would have
(17) depended on them to provide me that advice if they thought tt
18) was a sugnificant issue
(19) Q Apparently it wasn \(t\) was it because they didn t provide you with that advice?
A They did not provide me with that dita
Q So it s their fault?
A I'm not sayiag at's anybody's fault I'm Just saying they didn't provide me with that data
Q Would you agree with the proposition that at least the

\section*{Vol 223836}
(1) society outside of Exxon Corporation and Exxon Shipping
(2) Corporation that a supertanker captain presents more of a risk
(3) to the public than for example a secretary or a clerk?
(4) A Yes sir I'd agree with that
(5) Q With regard to Exxon Shipping Company you don \(t\) know what
(6) kind of training was provided to Exxon Shipping Company
(7) supervisors with regard to monitoring employees who had been
(8) through alcohol rehabilitation?
(9) A Sir, you're going to bave to put that in a tume context
(10) You tatking about '77 '87
(11) Q 8586
(12) A '85 '86 We did drug awareness traming in 1984 and '85,
(13) and Exxon supervisors were allowed to participate in that
(14) training
(1s) Q Did Exxon Shipping Company ever seek your advice on how to
(16) go about monitoring an alcohol or drug abuser who had been
(17) through rehab and come hach to work?
(18) A I don't recall of they ever sought my advice on that
(19) \(Q\) Proper investigation of a report of alcohol use would
(20) include interviewing the suspect interviewing the accuser and
(21) interviewing people that were aboard the vessel and
(22) documentalion?
(23) A I testified in my deposition that I personally would have
(24) documented and investigated an occurrence in that monner
(23) Certanly it's up to the individual manager on how they do

\section*{Vol 223837}
that That was just my personal view of what I would have
done
Q Makes good common sense and it is an honest way to deal with people?
A I would say that I would have done that. yes sir
Q You testified that with regard to these discustions over
alcohol policies you were trying to balance the rights of the employee against the pubicic safety?
A Yes, sir
Q And putting somebody who had gone through alcohol
rehabilitation in charge of a supertanker presents a nak to the public doesn \(t\) it?
A It would depend on why they went through alcohol rehabilitation I have a fellow, people I'm aware of that went through alcohol rehabilitation because their son was going
through and they wanted to go through it so they could experience it with them So first question I'd ask in that case is what were the circumstances of the individual going Q Let me reagk the question
A All right, sar
Q And I want to get your position Putting somebody who has gone through alcohol rehabilitation because of problems with alcohol in charge of a supertanker presents a potential risk to the public yes or no?
A I would say there would be some nisk to the public
\(\qquad\) xmaxiss,

\section*{Vol 223838}

Q And if you had a supertanker acudent a supertanker grounding a supertanker mishap the rishs can be catastrophic cantit?
A No question about that
Q I m going to try to summarize your direct testimony and you can come along with me if you would but you re aware that

Captain Hazelwood it was reported to him that he was under inveatugation in February of 1985 by Mr Tompkins? A That is my understanding
Q And that Mr Pierce had a conversation with him as a result of an anonymous phone call aftur the capiain already \(\mathrm{hncw}_{\mathrm{n}} \mathrm{h}_{\mathrm{L}}\) was under investugation you re aware ol that aren 1 you' A That is my understanding
Q And the capiain went through an alcohol rehabilitation program you re aware of that?
AI am
Q And the capiain held a safety senstive position?
A That's your description, but yes I'll accept that
Q And the company a policy with regard to taking care of this
captan was such that the only thing you were going to look at
was job related performance you weren igoing to look at off
duty drinking whether he was drinking again that \(s\) the
company spolicy isn t that right'
A Our policy was to moaitor the individual based on thear 5
performance as I testufied that scorrect sir

\section*{Vol 223839}

Q So af you had Captain Hazciwood who had gone through alcohol rehabilitation and he was drinking again so long as he didn i drink on tompany proptrit or umb bach to ship drunk his drinking again was hunhy dory with rugard to company policy?
A Well I'm surry I don't undervtand what vou mena by hunky
dory
Q Wasn itt a violation of company policy for the captain to be drinking again even though he went through alcohol rehabilitation?
A It was not a violation of company policy for him to consume
(12) alcohol on his own time aud as long us it didn't interfere with
(13) his job performance that's right
(14) \(Q\) And the policies did not require anything with regard to
(Is) making sure that he was not rulapsing there was nothing in the
(16) policy that said we gol to follow up with rugard to the

117 gencral subjut ol rulapsu oll duly pursunal life problums
(18) drinking that kind of thing Lxccpt with a strici arca of job 91 performance?
(io) A Well I would not accept your - your definstion as you've (21) laid that out I would say that in a normal supervisory (22) employee relationship, that that supervisor be working with (23) that employee frequently, would have a good understanding of
(24) how they were getting along, how they felt how they were (25) performing their job and they would set \(a\) detenoration if that
(I) was a problem
(2) Q We II get to that in just a minute
(3) A All right

Q A relapse - so the company policies would allow - the
company policses would allow a relapsed alcoholic to be in
charge of a superianieer so long as nobody knew so long as his
relapsed nature didn taffect his job performance?
A Are you speaking of Captain Hazelwood?
Q No I m taiking generally a relapsed alcoholic can work
(w) who has gone through treatment can work for Exxon

Corporation
(II) and drive a supertanker according to Exxon Corporation a (12) policies?
(13) A That's correct, sir, with approprate monitoring
(14) Q So your policies knowing the risk to the public of the
(IS) catastrophic results of a supertanker accident allow a
(16) relapsed alcoholic to command a supertanker?
(17) A Yes, sur, that's possible under our policy
(18) Q And you write your policies you can change your policies
(19) the management committee can change your policies that a all
a
(20) correct statement isn I it?
(21) A Yes, sir, it is
(22) MR O NEILL Nothing turther
(23) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAMES ROUSE
(24) BYMR LYNCH
(25) Q Mr Rouse you were shown this document by Mr O Nell?

\section*{Vol 22 384!}
(1) AYes
(2) Q There seemed to be some confusion at the conclusion of your
(3) dislogue What did the 1987 policy ultimately provide with
(4) reference to for cause testing ol safely sensitive positions?
(s) A What the 1987 pulicy suid was that if a manager bad reason
(6) to believe or had safety concerns he bad the nght to test in
(7) those sttuations if he had reason to beheve there was a
(8) problem or had safety concerns under our test for cause policy,
(9) he or she had the right to conduct for cause testing
(10) Q And I believe you testified that you considered giving or
(II) providing for testing even withoul concern jusi because the
(12) person held a job and concluded that would not be a good idea?
(13) A Yes sir that is my testimony
(14) Q Now in connection with this document Mr O Neill saw fil
(1S) to show you for some reason a page thal had to do with
(16) breakdown of pre tmployment test results by race?
(17) A Yes sur
(18) Q I don (know what that has to do with this tase but why (19) did you prepare that breakdown?
(20) A Because as I've already testafied we're very very
(21) uterested and concerned about the issue of embracing diversity
(22) un our company and we wanted to make sure that in no way our
(23) testing policy was adversely affecting our fine minority
(24) employees and the ouly way we knew to do that was to go
get
(25) some data

\section*{Vol 223842}

Q Now Mr O Neill asked you about this page of the 1987
training materiais and particularly the underlined phrase
that disciplinary action will be taken Would you read the next sentence?
A Yes, sir As you will see later in the program we must try to keep - we must try to get all the facts in a situation
carefully evaluate those issues and use good judgment in making
(8) our decision
(4) Q Now I d like to refer you then to page 24 and ask you
0) If this is the later pari of the program which is referred to
(II) there as the - as an indication of how good judgment is to be
(12) used in a situation where information of a possible employee in
(13) violation comes to light?
(14) A Yes, sir, that's correct What thas says is, you'll find that there are not always cut and dried solutions to these cases Our intent in this section will not be to give you a 7) school book solution but rather to learn a process for makung
(18) -
(19) in this decision making process are clarify the situation 0) investugate by gathenng relative or relevant information,
( I) analyze your information decide on a course of action and
( ) follow up
(3) Q Then I d like to take you to page 32 and direct your a) attention to the second sentence reading for cases involving ) an employee in an unfit condition at work under the influence
telling the manager?
A Absolutely not As far as -
Q That atter having undergone rahabilitation and admiting
some prior problem he now has to be punshed?
A Absolutely not He does not need to be punmbed We
encourage our people to seek help He sought help and I
thank
it would have been a termble thing to go back and disciplune
hum retroacturely after he'd gone and sought help and gone through rehabilitation
Q Now one last item You were shown a list of companies
which as of 1988 were doing some rehab testing post rehab testing?
A Yes sir
Q And you were asked about whether Exxon was the odd man
in that list This is that drafi document that you were asked about
A Yer sir
Q Now what did you say about how those companies were selected?
A Well, that was a broad potpourri of companes As I testufied, we looked at as many as 150 different companies 12
(7) our policy and what that draft document did was just speak
(23) those that were doing that type of testing, it didn't speak to
(20) those who were not doang that type of test
(23) Q In other words it picked just the pace setters?
Vol 223845
A That's what we dad
Q And of how many companies were on that list that were doing
that?
A My recollection was the BRT survey had 150 companies
perhaps and so these were the pace setter companes out
that group
Q Seven?
A There were seven
MR LYNCH No further questions Your Honor
THE COURT Sir you may step down
MR CHALOS Your Honor I mhappy to report to you
and to the Jury that this is our last witness We re simost
there
The defense calls Captain Jay Bolton
THE CLERK Rase your nght hand please, sar
The Witacas Is Sworn)
THE CLERK For the record state your full name, your
address and apell your last name, please
THE WITNESS Yes sir My name is Captain Jay D
Bolton that s B \(O\) L O N I live at Browns Lane Old Lyme
Connecticut
THE CLERK Thank you sir
DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAY BOLTON (Live)
BY MR CHALOS
Q Captain Bolion how old are you?

\section*{A That's what we dad}

Q And of how many companies were on that list that were doing that?
(4) A My recollection was the BRT survey had 150 companes un it,
(s) perhaps and so these were the pace setter companies out
of
(6) that group

Q Seven?
A There were seven
MR LYNCH No further questions Your Honor
THE COURT Sir you may step down
(I) MR CHALOS Your Honor I m happy to report to you
and to the Jury that this is our last witness We resimos
(3) there
(14) The defense calla Captain Jay Bolton
(1s) THE CLERK Rase your night band please, sir
(10) (The Witness Is Sworn)
(17) THE CLERK For the record atate your full name, your
(18) address and apell your last name, please
(19) THE WITNESS Yes sir My name is Captain Jay D
(20) Bolton that s B O L T O N I live at Browns Lane Old Lyme
(21) Connecticut
(2) THE CLERK Thank you sit
(23)
(25) Q Capiain Boiton how old are you?

\section*{Vol 223846}

A 51, sir
Q51 You look good 517 By whom are you employed?
A 1 am presently self employed serving as a consultant
(4) Q Consulting on what?
(s) A At the present tume I m cousultung with a coumpany that
(6) monufactures ship handing simulation and traning equipment
(7)
(8) A My job in the last few months has been to survey merchant
(9) manne academies from around the world to determine their
(10) traning requrements, learn of the training methods and to
(II) advuse them as to what kind of equipment they can most
(12) effectively use to mplement their training objectives
(13) Q Now when you talk about training are you talking about
(14) training officera to go on board vessels?
(15) A Yes, sir
(16) Q Now tell us a little bit about your educational
(17) background
(18) Alattended the State University of New York Maritume
(19) College and graduated un 1967
(.0) Q Prior to that you were at the naval academy for a couple
(1) of years?
( ) AYes sur
(3) Q Since your graduation from the - Irom Fort Schuvler can
( 4) youtell us a little bit about your employment history?
(25) A Immediately upon graduation in 1967 I was deployed to a

Vol 223847
(1) tanker that was serving in the Vietnam Persian Gulf waters and
() I served on that ship for approximately ten months Sunce
(3) then I've been serving continuous duty as a junior officer,
(4) nsing through the ranks from third mate to second mate to
(S) chief mate
(6) Q Let s slow down a little bit How long wer you - you got
(7) a third mate s license when you graduatid right?
(8) A Yes sir
(9) Q How long did you sail as a third matc?
(10) A 1 sauled for six months as a third mate and then started
(II) saliag as a second mate on a waver because of the

Vietnam
(1) war
"17 Q Which war)
(1s) A And I obtamed wy true recond mate as lacense in early
(15) 1969
(16) Q You were sailing through Vietnam you say?
(17) AYes sir
(IB) Q What type of ships were you on as a third mate and then a
(19) second mate?
(20) A Essentually tankers although as I rose to second mate I
in served aboard general cargo ships ds well
(.2) \(Q\) And eventually you became a thee matc)
(1.3) A Yes sir
(4) Q When did you obtain thal lacans)
(s) A I obtaned my cbief mate , liceince in 1972
Q And how long did you sail on that license?
A I served in a capacity as chief mate from 1972 through the
middle of 1977
Q What type of ships?
A Tankers
Q Then I take it you - you received your master s license?
A I received - I took the examination for my master's
license and received it in 1974
Q Okay When was your first job as a master?
A My first command was in the fall of 1977
Q What type of ship?
A That was a 40 000 ton tanker
Q When did you retire? You said you retured - or you left
the seagoing career Sorry you re only 5 I m sorry Go
ahead
A Too young to retire I left the company that I was working
for as a master of tankers in 1980 - late 1987
Q Did you work for the same company from 1977 to \(1987 ?\)
A Yes, sir
Q As a master?
A Yes sir
Q And this company was who?
A This was a company, Maritume Overseas Corporation
Q And did they operate tankers in the Valdez trade?
A Yes sir

\section*{Vol 223849}
1) Q Was that vour primary trade between 1977 and 19879
\({ }^{7}\) A It was part of our trade It wasn't primary I was
3) involved in the Alaskan oil transportation scheme, but I spent
(4) a great deal of my tume down in the Gulf of Mexico in the U S
5) Gulf and east coast
6) Q Have you been up to Valdcy?
(7) A Yes sir
() Q On tankers?
(9) AYes sir
(1) Q As a master?

A Yes, sur
Q How many trips did you make up there as a master?
A It's an estrmate but I would guess about 20 trips
Q In your deposition you said 2022 Irips is that a fair estumate?
A That's an estumate yes sir
Q Trips are what we call round trips right?

\section*{A Correct}

Q Okay So you would have been in and out of Valdez 40 to 44 times?
A If you included each pishage that's correct
(22) Q As a nastur?
(23) A Yes alr
(24) Q What stce tankers did you work on'
(25) A I was pramarily engaged aboard a 90000 ton tanker That
Vol 223850
(1) shap had almost the same length as the Exxon Valdez She
was
(-) about 900 feet in length but she was much narrower and
was not
(3) as deep, so she was much smaller in size by tonnage
(4) Q You ve been on ships bigger than 90000 tons?
(s) A Yes, sir
(6) Q As a master?
(7) A Yes sir
(8) Q Also tankers?
(9) A Yes sir
(10) Q Let me ask you this In respect to your coming up to the
(11) Valdez trade did you hold the pilotage endorsement for Prince
(12) Willam Sound?
(13) A No, I did not
(14) Q So all those trips that you made 40 to 44 trips you had
(15) no pilotage endorsement?
(16) A That is correct
(i7) Q Okay Do you presentiy hold a master s license?
(18) A Yes, sir
(19) Q Is that an unlimited license?
(0) A Yes it is
(21) Q You can go on any - any ship any size any ocean?
(2) A Correct
(3) Q Did you do any postgraduate studies after you left Fort
(a) Schuyier?
(5) A Yes I did

\section*{Vol 223851}

Q What type of studies?
A I attended vanous professional courses of study at an organization called the Maritume Instutute of Technology and

Graduate Studies
Q What was that in?
A Various topics from admiralty law ships medicine cargo
operations and various courses like that I also attended a sımulator ship handing simulator course
Q For tankers?
A For VLCC
Q What is a VLCC?
A VLCC is what they call a very large crude carner and
those are shups that are generally judged by size of being
\(\mathbf{2 6 5 , 0 0 0}\) tons up to about \(\mathbf{3 0 0 , 0 0 0}\) tons
Q Did you participate in a simulator project as a subject?
A Yes I did
Q That was over at Kings Point?
A Yes, sar
Q And you had an opportunity to work the simulator and they gauged your performance is that the subject of the test?
A I was a test subject doing runs going up into the Valdez
Narrows *
Q They could simulate that?
A Yes, sir
Q What have you done since you left going to sea as a tanker
(1) master)
(1) A Well in 1987 I formed a nonprofit organzation I formed (3) it for the purpose of advancing the cause of marine safety and
4) promotug the U S flagged merchant manne and promoting U S
(5) commerce and trade The name of that organization is the
(6) Unuted States Mantime \(F\) oundation
(7) \(Q\) Is that the one that you re working for now?
(B) A I am That is still presently an active organization,
(9) yes -
(10) Q Now have vou ever qualified as an expert witness in a case
(II) involving collisions or grounding?
(12) A Once
(13) \(Q\) When was that?
(14) A It was about a few months ago three or four months ago
(1s) Q Was that in federal court?
(16) A Yes sir
(17) Q In Newark New Jersev?
(18) A Yes sir
(19) Q And were you accepted by the court as an expert in marine (20) operations navigation and duties of a captain overall?
(21) A Yes sir
(22) \(Q\) Those were the subjects that you were accepted as an expert
on?
(24) A In substance ves
(25) Q Have you been to sea lately?


Vol 223854
(1) areas of expertise He's expected to have working knowledge
(2) and discharge his responsibilities in areas and in such topics
(3) as nautical astronomy navigation ndval architecture manne
(4) engineering He must also be a paramedic level skilled
(s) individual so he can discharge his medical responsibilities

61 and the list goes on and on and on
(7) The thing that makes this job perhaps really different is
(8) the fact that first he bas this responsibility \(\mathbf{2 4}\) hours a day
(9) It never goes away while he's on board the stup or while the
(10) shup is at sea, and the other thing that makes his job somewhat
(11) unuque is the fact that up until most recently and even now,
(12) once a ship is at sea he has no umbilical cord of support

He
(13) is the sole decision maker and he lives with the responsibility
(14) that he's got to discharge under vanuus adverse and vaned
(15) conditions calling upon these levels of expertise at moments
1161 and when be's least expecting it
(17) \(Q\) What s the captain s role let \(s\) say in relation to his
(18) junior officers as far as teaching them as faras guiding
(19) them?
(20) A I view that one of the most amportant jobs a master has is
(21) the education of all of his crew members Bear in mind if
(22) you're in the middle of the ocean on a small ship, and even
(23) shups like the Exxon Valdez, as big as she may appear here
(24) when you're at sea it becomes a very small island and we have
rs, 25 people on board We reall dependent upon one another
for
\[
\text { Vol } 223855
\]
, our own survival and uur well beang dad our happiness So the
2) most important job a captann has therefore as to develop
3) those people professionally and assure that they have the
4) professional skills and competency level such that they can
s) discharge their responsibilities in an effective mauner Q How does hu do that'
7) A Well, every captain has different ways of discharging that educational responsibility they're responsible to be a teacher Sol couldn't speak to how ther do it but typically
(10) at's done by encouraging them to assume responsibility to guade
(1) them as they grow in their ability to accept and discharge
i) consequential responsibility and I thank that that's the key
(13) Every crew member be it urdiaary veaman or conk has got to be
(14) able to accept and discharge his own consequentual
(15) responsibility so that's the guide of a captain to a coach a (16) teacher, and a cheerleader at the same tume
(17) Q Does the captain discharge that responsibility by giving
(18) his officers on the job training giving them responsibility to let them do \(t\) by themselves?
(io) A Well it varies In my situation I did not have the (i) luxury of having permanent officers or crew members so I would
(-2) be having to work ammedately with people whum I did not know
(-3) dad not know what their bichground was ouly the fact that they
(-4) had a Coast Guard license and were qualified So the first
(2s) chore that I had was to assess the individual assess their own
abilitues at that point in tume and then to grow that
capability withm each person
Q Let me get a little bit more specific now You ve read the
testimony of Captain Hazelwood in this case?
A Yes, sir
Q You read the testimony of Chic § Mate Kunkel?
A Yes, sir
Q You ve read the testimony of Third Mate Cousina?
A Yes, sir
Q Did you read the testimony of Mr LeCain?
A I don't remember the name LeCan
Q He was the second mate?
A No, I did not
Q Now, with respect to the testimony that you read you read
about Captain Hazelwood s management style and the way he
dealt
(16) with his junior officers?

A Yes
Q You remember that?
A Yes, sir
Q How do you describe his managument style vis a vis that
you re talking about here what a captain needs to do to train his officers?
A Well I think that in the trial you may have heard or mitnessed different management styles everybody has a different style I thank one captan testufied be does
everything Doesn't trust anybody to do everything, he does

2 everything humself that way he doesn't -
Q Imsorry to interrupt That particular captain that
you re talking about was the plaınuffs expurt Captain Clark?
A I think the name was Clark
Q You read his iestimony as well?
AYes
Q Go ahead
A That's an mdividual who doesn't trust hamself enough to
trust other people in my view Captan Hazelwood, in Instening to or reading the deposition I think specifically of Mr Cuusins and Mr Kunkel Mr Kunkel being close to being a
master having had a broad base of experience they indicated
(14) to me that they had a very active or proactive master with
(15) respect to training and developing his management team if you
(16) will between the levels of officers

So I would interpret Captann Hazelwood's modus operandı
being one of - being very didactic and being very interested
in the development of his junior officers
Q What was that word?
A Sorry very much of a teacher he's very educationally
onented Fxcuse me
Q When a captain dous that when you have the style of
Captain Hacclwood whurt he steaching his junior officers
what sthe reward for him' I mean what can he expect in
\(\qquad\)
\(\qquad\)
i return for doing that?
) A I think the reward of any teacher is to see their students 3) \(\mathbf{g o}\) on to be successful and I think the biggest reward I've had
4) is to see people I've had opportunity working with as third (s) mate to learn that they are someday a captan That's the most
(6) rewarding The instant gratification or benefit is the fact
) that the ship manning ufrastructure was not designed to be a
(8) one man dog and pony show it was designed that lots of
9) professionals would work different departments engıeenng,
(10) steward and deck performing their tasks so by emphasizing the
(i1) educational level by developing the professional competency
(I') it assured that the ship had a better overall sense of - or (13) capability of being operated safely
(14) Q A captain can 1 be on the bridge 24 hours a day can he?
115) A That's a good question There aremany many
documented
(16) cases whereby a captann has tried to live on the bndge day in
(17) and day out Most recently there was a captan who - no
(18) offense it was a Greek ship was coming into -
(19) Q They love these Greeks I m telling you take il easy (20) will you?
(21) Go ahead
(2) A The captann was making landfall coming into I thunk Rhode
(23) Island a couple of years ago, and he had been on the bndge for
(4) 2448 hours or something and he massed the buoy and ran

that's - that's the disaster of trying to do everything by
yourself and exhausting yourself beyond any realm of reasonability
Q Do you have an opinion as to Captain Hazelwood s anagement
siyle? Was il good bad based on your experience and based
your experience in training officers?
A Well the testimony has been that he's the best -
Kunkel - I thank Mr Kunkel saıd he's the best captan I've
ever sailed with Bearin mind that the junior officers
Mr Kunkels of the worid who are looking at becoming a master
(II) they're looking for a role model what kind of captain are they
(12) goug to be when they get to sat in that chair So that (13) meaning he's the best captonn I ever saled with doenn't mean
(14) He's the nicest guy in the world, but it does mean he's
(IS) probably the most effectuve mdividual that that undividual has
(16) sailed with so I'd rather say that based on that snput that
(I7) Captan Hazeiwood must have been a very effective ship's
(18) master
(19) Q You mentioned Capiain Clark Let meask you a few
(20) queations about him He testified - Captain Clark again was
(21) the plaintiffs expert he testified that in Ithink 20 years
(22) or so at sea he never came close to making a mistake or having
(23) an accident What do you think about that?
(24) A Boy, was he lucky
(25) Q You think he was just lucky?
(1) A I - going to sea 15 a hazardous occupation It's a
(a) hazardous busmess by its very nature In my \(\mathbf{2 0}\) some odd years
of going to sea I don think there \(s\) been a tour that I have
not witnessed some form of mashap or an accident That's
the
nature of the busmess And the nature of our traming is to
try to cope with that - that mishap or accident as bert we can
to minumize the danger
Q I take il in your career you ve had some close calls yourself"
(10) A Yes sir
(II) Q Now you read did you not that the Exxon Valdez in 1987
(12) and 1988 under Captain Stalzer and Hazelwood won the fleet
(13) manager s safety award?
(14) A Yes sir I did
(15) \(Q\) What does that indicate to you?
(16) A It indicates two thangs to me The company that I worked
(17) for was not an oil company fleet at was a company that
(18) operates many tankers and that's their promary busmess

The
(19) company that I work for and many other companes that I worked
(20) for did not have a safety awards program so that tells me one
(21) thing, that from the administration perspective the company
(22) was unterested in higher level or consustent level of safety
(23) Frow the instant performance perspectave it indicates that
(24) dunng those two years, the people who - and the crew who were
(2s) on board that ship were achieving a hugh level of safety in all
\[
\text { Vol } 223861
\]
(1) areas, perhaps from the galley to down in the engme room and
(2) up to the bridge
(3) Q You started to say something before and I jumped in
(4) Accidents and mishaps in the marine transportation field and
(5) the seagoing field are common occurrences aren they?
(6) A Yes sir
(n) Q I mean that s part and pareel of the business isn \(t\) it?
(8) A Right \(I\) believe that in the Lloyd's lust which is a
(9) publication out of London I thank they record something at
(10) least one mantume casualty a dav
(It) \(Q\) Serious maritime casualiy)
(12) AYes
(13) Q As opposed to somebody cutung their finger?
(14) A Correct, groundings, drowang, collssions, fire
(15) Q Captain Bolton did you ever have the occasion to visit the
(16) Exxon Valdez?
(17) A Once
(i8) \(Q\) When was that?
(19) A I was on my tanker, I say loosely I was aboard a ship un
(20) Valdez and I saw this new ship, I knew it was an Exxon shop,
(21) never been on board an Exxon ship and I wanted to - I was very
(22) interested to see what it was lake to - to be on a brand new
(23) ship like that operated by an oul company so I went over to
(24) have a tour
(24) Q Who was the caplain at the tume?

A It was Captan Hazelwood
Q Did you meet Capiain Hazelwood in town or did you go over to his ship?
A I don't remember I thunk I may have met him at the agent
office, Alamar or someplace I don't remember But enther
mnited me over or I marched over myself, and I don't
remember
Q Okay When you went on board did Captain Hazelwood give
you a tour?
A Yes, he did
Q What did you find?
A Well obviously 1 was very impressed with regard to the
shp It was new The equipment that they had on the shup far
(14) and away exceeded industry standard which a manne undustry
(15) standard from all the ships I have ever been on, especially
(16) impressive was the firefighting capability The extra gear
(in) that as put on that was not required by Coast Guard, and I went
(18) away thinking that I checked off the wrong box
(19) Q What box is that?
(20) A Well, I wish I'd worked for Exxon
(21) \(Q\) Well let me ask you this Did you al my request review!
(22) some of the Exxon salety manuals -
(23) AI -

Q-and procedures?
A - reviewed the brigge orgmaizatiou guide and I think that

\footnotetext{
Vol 223863
that's the only Exxon publication that I reviewed
Q How did that - what you read how did that compare to the industry standard?
A Bear in mind my frame of reference in my going to sea,
worked for maybe 15 different companies there are always duty
instructions sometimes outdated old bometimes ao
instructuons The last ship that I was in coumazd of not the
Bounty but the last bag ship had literally no mstructions to the master
I found in reading those instructions or guides, gundelines
I guess they call them they were comprehensive un my sense
(12) they were a good and excellent guide especially for what I
(13) percerved to be like a first tume master or a first tume
(14) employee because it lays out very specifically what's expected
(15) of him and what's expected of him without taking away his
(16) authonty and I thought it was from that respect extremely
(17) well wntten and authored from my experience
(18) MR CHALOS Okay Id likulo-Your Honor I can
(is) start a new subjut now or we ban take our breah whatever you
(20) like
(al) THE COURT Lul staku our brad We il be in recess
1-1 tor 15 minutes
(23) THE CLERK Court is in recess for 15 minutes
(24) (Jury out at 1157 am )
(25) (Jury in at 1216 pm )
}
(1) BYMR CHALOS
(2) Q Mr Bolton I want to cover a subject very quickly
(3) There s been tesumony in this trial that the sailing board -
(4) you re familar with the saling board on the ship?
(5) A Yes, sir
(6) Q That sto advise crew members going ashore what time the vessel would sa!l?
A Correct
Q There s been testumony here that the sating board was set
(10) for 900 originally it was later changed And Captan
(H) Hazelwood and his two shipmates found out it was changed to
(12) 1000 and then unbeknownst to them was moved back up to
(13) 900 What I want to ask you is based on your expenence
(14) sailing up to Valdez have you ever seen that situation where a
(15) sailing board was put back to 1000 - or back to any tume and
(16) then moved back up?
(17) A It cannot
(18) Q It cannot?
(19) A It cannot be changed the other direction
(20) Q Why not?
(21) A The salung board - the purpose of the salung board was
(22) set up such that if the ship is in port and sailors go ashore,
(23) and the shup decides to sall that they would leave seamen
(24) destatute, that's the basic idea You can't leave a guy on the
(25) beach looking for a ship So there are rules or reguiations

\section*{Vol 223865}
(1) that many mantume unions have set up, and I don't know if it
(2) applies to Exxon but in principle, it says that there are very
(3) dustinct rules that you must tell the crew members what tume
(4) you're going to sail and you cannot leave eariter because of
(s) the fact you would leave somebody destitute so you never
(6) advance the sailang board to an eariner tume You can

\section*{postpone}
(7) it but never advance at
(8) Q Was it unreasonable for Caplain Hazelwood and his iwo
(9) shipmates to believe that once they found out the sailing board
(10) was set at 1000 was it unreasonable for them to believe that
(11) the ship would sail at 1000 or later?
(12) A No, that's a reasonable assumption
(13) Q All right I want to speak to you now about the transit
(14) the vessel \(s\) transut through the Narrows There s been
(15) evidence presented in the trial that the captain Captain
(16) Hazelwood was off the bridge during the ternsit of the
(17) Narrows
(18) A Yes
(19) Q And appears that he was off for about 30 minutes 35
(20) minutes Thure \(s\) also evidence that during that period of
(21) tume he came up once stood in the bach took a look around
(22) okay and there s further evidence that the mate called him
(23) while he was in his office and advised him what was going on
(24) Okay 1 want you to assume all that Are there any
(2) regulations that you re aware of prior to the grounding that

\section*{required the master to be on the bridge at any time in Prince} William Sound?
A No
Q That includes the narrows is that correct?
A Correct
Q It strue is it not that it \(s\) in the master \(s\) discretion as to when he should be on the bridge and when he should be off
the bridge?
A Right
Q He decides that doesn the?
A Yes sir
Q Now Captain Clark testified here on behalf of the plaintiffs that in his opinion Captain Hazelwood exercised poor judgment by being off the bridge during the transit of the Narrows okay?
A I remember reading that
Q Do you agree or disagree with that opinion? Aldssagree
Q Why?
A As I said earier the captan is a CEO and be has many
11 responsibilities sacluding the safe navigation of the vessel and that's not a minmal responsthility He has many responsibulitues The captan has got to use his discretion and look at the risk analysis or perform a nisk analysis if you will of the - of the potential dangers or non dangers

\footnotetext{
Vol 223867
in that a ship would be encountering to determine where be should
(י) or should not be so he's got to make that decision himself
(3) Q Let me ask you this With respect to the transt through
(4) the Narrows of any tanker going through
(5) A Yes

161 Q What are the things that a captain sees knows is
(7) confronted with? I mean what are the factors?
(8) A The factors that he would use in performing his risk (9) analysss?
(10) Q Right
(11) A Sure In the Narrows, there are perhaps two kinds of (12) factors, one are ship factors and the other are envirommental
(13) factors Let's look at the ship factors first Any shup (14) that's navigate in a reatricted waterway, narrows or any niver
(15) or any port the two most common shup factors are loss of your
(16) rudder your steering capability, and the second is a loss of (17) your engine Would you hke me to go through what that means?
(18) Q Yeah yeah yeah I m not ignoring you I was looking for (19) an exhibil Goahead
(20) A As far as thus ship is concerned, in modern day tankers (21) safety systems and backup systems are installed to munmize
(22) that nsk For example there are two steening independent
(23) steenng systems on the ship so if one fails, it's a matter of
(24) pushing a button or a lever and you instantaneously within two
( s) seconds can be working on your backup system Very sımular
}

\section*{Vol 223868}
(1) Like an arplane they have backup systems
(2) If for any reason that system were to fat there is \(d\)
(3) thard system which bypasses all the electronics on the bridge
(4) and gives a direct stimulus or signal to the steering gear which is back in the back part of the ship so there's three systems for backup on the steering
So 1 a the Narrows where there is no current or minimal current, where the ship is steadied on course, if the rudder were to foul once, twice, or maybe altogether, then the next
(10) back up that is available is the assistant tug, and they have a
(11) tughoat that goes out with the shipper per chance that
(12) emergency, so at the speed that the ship is traveling, which 15
(13) about seven mules per hour six knots that tug is close enough
(14) to come alongade the shp and steer it untul such tume that (IS) ether the steerng system can be restored
(16) With regard to the engue, the problem with when you lose
(17) the engine or you lose the plant as they sometumes say, is
(18) that you would lose electricity and you would lose your
(19) steening and everything else So they have a backup system for
(30) that and they have what they call an emergency generator, and
(21) the emergency generator on the ship is designed to trip on (22) almost instantaneously within a few seconds When you lose the
(23) engune's generation system and that generator supplies
(24) electricity for the steering so at the very least you would
(25) steer yourself through the Narrows at a slower speed So those

\section*{Vol 223869}
are the two shap rasks
The environmental nisks that need to be considered are in any port any - any channel what kind of current do you have Well in some places like in the Mississippi River the current can be runnang at maybe five or sum miles per hour and
(6) so that is very much of a factor that could pust the ship into another ship or push the ship under the - onto the shore The other factor is wind On a loaded tanker wind is really not a factor On an empty tanker at is because most
(10) it's out of the water A loaded tanker that is not a factor
(11) So those are the two key envirunmeutal factors
(1) The thurd would be how much water is under the ship In
(13) some places it's not uncommon to ugvigate a ship where there is
(14) minmal clearance between the bottom of the ship and the bottom
(1s) of the channel maybe three or four feet sometumes less and
(16) that becomes very much a factor In the case of the Valdez,
! 17 the Narrows that was not the factor
(18) Q Let me ask about that The watur in the Narrows is very
deep 18 II not?
(20) A Yes sir
(21) Q Over 600 feet?
(29) A Something lake that
(23) Q There s no current running through thure or negligible (24) current?
(25) A Correct

Q And the wind is not a factor?
(2) A Correct
(3) Q He didn thave any of the environmental factors to (4) consider?
(S)
\(\qquad\) the
(7) potential for human error And on board a tanker or a ship, (8) when you have a plot, you have a licensed deck officer and you
(9) have an experienced qualified helmsman there are bancally
(10) three people on the bridge that are checking and cross checking
(iI) one another for the human error factor So it's hke a triple (12) redundant type of a situation on board the bridge of any
(13) merchant shup
(14) Q You read the teatimony in this case that Captain Murphy was
(15) the pilot on board?
(16) AYes
(17) Q You know Captain Murphy?
(18) A I don't know hum personally I beheve I've - may have
(19) had him - I'm sure I've had him during one of my transits but (20) I do not know hm personally
(21) Q You have any doubt - he sbeen described as a very (22) competent pilot, you have any doubt about that?
(23) A In my expenence coming into Valdex, the - all of the
(24) pulots had a unform standard of excellence that I wish many
(25) other ports in the world had the same standard Good palots

Vol 223871
(1) and - and by virtue of the fact that myself I was up here
(2) about \(\mathbf{2 0}\) tumes, the captain gets to know the plot, know has -
(3) his technique, and generally, there's a bond of trust that
(4) develops once you know how they - how they operate
(5) Q Captain Bolton let me get to the bottom line on this
(6) inquiry The testimony here was that the trip through the
(7) Narrows was uneventful?
(8) AYes
(9) Q No problems?
(10) A Correct
(II) Q Okay and Captain Clark testified that in his opinion the (12) fact that Captain Hazelwood may have been off the bridge during
(13) that period of time played no role in the grounding do you
(14) have any reason to dispute that?
(IS) ANo, I don't
(16) Q You agree with that?
(17) A I agree
(18) Q Now let me ask you this you ve saited in Prince William
(19) Sound made 20 trips 40 passages How do you compare
(20) navigating in Prince William Sound to other areas of the world
(21) that you ve operated in lut say the Mississippi or down in
(22) Galveston Houston)
(23) A I think by way of comparison is pertiaps one of the easiest
(24) ports in the world My last VLCC, which was a ship that was (2) \(\mathbf{1 1 0 0}\) feet long, I was transiting something called the Malacea

Vol 223872

Straits going by the Straits of Singapore and through that straits which is a much narrower body of water going in and out of the port they average 270 ships each day \(\mathbf{2 7 0}\) shups each day plus the other traffic so probably somewhere in

\section*{neighborhood of three to four hundred ships are transiting}
area that is much more confined with heavy current than Prance

Wilnem Sound
Q Did you find it to be an easy place in navigate?
A Yes
Q The hazards whatever hazards there are are they well known?
A They're very well defined
Q And well marked?
A Yes
Q Im showing to the jury now Defendants Exhibit 9172 which
is in evidence This is the Prince William Sound that we re
talking about right? Fairly wide open roadstead?
A Yes, sir
Q Little or no traffic most of the time?
A I don't know what the statistics are but in - very rarely do we pass another ship in the safety lanes very rarely Q Okay Now Admiral Yost sasd - Just one more question on this and we Il leave ti alone Admiral Yost said that this was in his opinion a very very casy area and the third mate ) could navigate in this area with no problem at all Do you

\section*{Vol 223873}

\section*{agree or disagree?}

\section*{A Admiral Yost as you remember was the commandant of} the
(1) U S Coast Guard and as such I would consider ham to be one
(4) of the leading authonties on vessel safety qualifications and
(a) probably one of the most knowledgeable people in the United
(6) States He made a comment that even a chald could navigate
7) Well, I wouldn't go so far as saying a child could navigate,
but certanily with a professionally licensed and qualified
) individual, this was pertaps a textbook area of - of a place
(0) where any officer could and should be able to navigate II) successfully

Q Captain Bolton while we have the chart out when you came
up to Valdez without your pilotage endorsement -
A Yes
Q - where did you pick up and drop off the pilot?
A A Little south of Rocky Point
Q Up here?
A Yeis sir
Q In this area?
A Correct
Q Okay I d like to ask you about the commumeations that
you had with the Vessel Traffic Center when you were up there?
AYes
Q Okay did you report to them from time to tume?
A Yes, that was a requirement
(1) Q Okay there s been - when you were up there you deviated (?) out of the lanes for ice?
(3) A Yes
(4) Q And you gave them certain reports when you did that?
(s) A We deviated for ice on one occasion for vessel traffic
(6) Q There s been testımony here by Captain Clark and Captain
(7) Clark criticized the communications that Captain Hazefwood had
(8) with the VTS where he told them that he was leaving the lanea
(9) so on so forth okav? Are vou with me so far?
(10) A Yer
(II) Q What Caplain Clarh said - well let me back up What
(12) Capiain Hazelwood said he made a transmission to them after -
(13) after the pilot came off - let me put up a chart This way I
(14) can read from it
(1S) At 1124 this is after the pilot got off within a minute
(16) after the pilot got off Captatn Ha7etwood told them that he
(17) departed the pilot and is hooking up to sea speed and he gave
(18) them an ETA at Naked Island Now was that the standard phrase
(19) that was used up there when you were up there?
(20) A Yes sir
(21) Q Okav Then he stelling them I will probably divert in
(?) from the TSS and end up in the inbound lane and if there s no
(1) conflicing traffic What dous the TSS mean to you?
(A) A That means traffic separation scheme
(2) Q I m looking at Defendants Exhibil 9172 - finally igot

\footnotetext{
Vol 223875
(1) him to do something for me Thank you The TSS is the
(2) southbound lane the separation zone and the northbound lane
(3) right?
(4) A Yes sur
(s) MR CHALOS Thank you Mr Neal
(6) MR NEAL You re welcome
(7) MR CHALOS You re very gond I may use you again
(8) BYMR CHALOS
(9) \(Q\) When he stelling them he a divering from the TSS he s
(10) telling them he s going right out of the lanes correct?
(II) A Yes
(12) Q Now at 1 1 30 - you read Captain Hazelwood a teatimony,
(13) did you not?
(14) A Yes I did
(1s) Q He said that when he made this transmission at ll 24 he
(16) was still asseasing the situation you remember?
(17) AYes
(18) \(Q\) And he was over at the radar looking at the ice situation
(19) and that he changed his mind and he decided not to go to sea
(20) apeed at that point all right you remember that?
(21) A Yes
(22) \(\mathbf{Q}\) So then he calls back at II 30 and asys at the present
(23) tume 1 am going to alter my course to 200 and reduce speed to
(24) about 12 knots and to wend - wend means to maneuver
doesn \(t\)
(2S) it in nautical talk?
}

\section*{Vol 223876}

\section*{A Yes}

Q And wend my way through the ice and then be tells them about what he a going to do with his ETA Is that a lot of information to give to the VTS?
A In my opinon, it is perfectly more than ample
Q And when he told them he was going about 12 knots that \(s\) his full ahead maneuvering speed isn it or thereabouts?
A I belueve that 15 , yes
Q So when you read this do you take it as Captain Hazelwood
revising his previous - his previous advice to them that he
was hooking up to sea speed to tell them that he was
maintaining his speed at around 12 knols ?
A I beheve the sea speed on that ship is something around 15
(14) or 16 knots
(15) QRight
(16) A So his second transmission where it says, reduce speed to
(17) about 12, that means he's not going to go up to the sea speed
(18) That's how I would interpret that
(19) Q Okay There s been some critucism by Captain Clark that
(20) eventually Captain Hazelwood put the vessel on a course of

180
(21) on a course of \(180^{7}\)
(22) AYes +'श
(.3) Q And that he didn 1 ruport that'
(24) A Correct
(25) \(\mathbf{Q}\) You remember he said that?

\section*{Vol 223877}

A (Nods head up and down)
Q And that was against what he said the rules you agree or disagree with that?
Al dasagree
QTell us why?
A At that point in time the captain in concersed with determining how he s going to direct hin vesset how he's going
(8) to get through the ace That's the key thing He's made hus initial report to VTC, in my view That tells VTC he's doing
(10) something that's totally different than the normal and at that
(11) point the captan's got other things on his mind in my view
2) than to be providing excess communications to VTC
(13) And with regard to VTC haviag received a transmission from
(14) a ship saying, I'm doung something that's different that to
me
(1s) is a tip-off to VTC they should start to monitor that
(16) situation and so the transuissions - uny other
transmissions
(17) would not be necessary
(i8) QI mgoing to ask you about the monitoring in a second Id
(19) like to just stick to this In your experience up there
(20) you ve had a chance to use the users manual up there?
(21) AYes
(2) Q Is there any requirement in the users manual that says you
(23) have to tell them every time you change tourse?
(24) A No
(25) Q Okay Lul stake a look at the communications by the
(1) Brooklyn and the Arco Juncau You re aware that they also went
(2) outside the TSS?
(3) A Correct
(4) Q Have you had a chance to compare the communications that
(5) Captain Hazelwood made to the ones that were made by the
(0) Brooklyn and the Arco Juneau in terms of the amount of
(7) information that was given?
(8) A Yes
(9) Q Who gave the most information?
(ю) A Well, it's clear by the chart that Captain Hazelwood was
(II) giving them far more information than the other two vessels
(12) were
(13) Q Did either one of the other vessels give a speed or a
(14) course that they were steering?
(15) A I don't beheve so
(16) Q I want to show you something Imgoing to put this up
(i7) This is Defendants Exhibit 1735 Alpha Your Honor in
(18) evidence
(19) The yellow dayglow yellow is the Arco Juncau you sce
(20) this? And the orange is the Brooklyn okay you with me? Can
(21) you see?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q The Arwo Juneau made one course change two course
changes
(24) three course changes you see this?
(25) A Yes

\section*{Vol 223879}
(I) Q And the Brooklyn made one course change two course also
2) three course changes nght?
3) A Correct
4) \(Q\) Is there any indication any indication on the
(s) communitations that they had with VTC where they advised of
any
(6) course change?
(7) A No
(8) Q But Captain Hazelwood told them that he was cbanging
9) course he gave them a course?
(10) A Yes, sur
(II) Q Okay I want to go to another subject now so we can move it
(12) along There \(s\) been some testumony here about the use of the
(13) autopilol?
(14) AYes
(IS) Q Captain Hazelwood has testified that he put it on for
(16) anywhere from five to eight minules?
(17) AYes
(18) Q You remember that?
(19) A Yes
(20) \(Q\) And he also testified that the reason he did that was so he
(21) could get a clear picture of the ice he wanted a steady course
(22) and it was at a tume when the helmsmen wert changing?
(23) A Yes
(24) Q So he didn I want to have to look at the helmsman heep an
(25) eye on the helmsman white ho concentrated on the 16 with

\section*{Vol 223880}
(1) Cousins?
(1) A Yes
" Q You remember all that?
(4) AYes Ido
5) Q With respect to the use of the autopilot are there any
6) regulations that you re aware of that prohibit the use of the
7) sutopilot in Pnnce William Sound?

81 A There are no regulations that I'm aware of
9) Q It sup to the captain to decide that isn ta?

A Yes
Q And depending on what he wants to do he can use it
anywhere?
A Correct
, Q And you yourself have used autopilot in Prince William
Sound have you not?
A I've used it in Prince Wilham Sound and in congested
maneuvening areas
Q More congested than this area?
AYes
Q Now I told you what Captain Hazelwood testified and that
comports with your recollection?
A Yes
) Q Do you find anything unreasonable in what Captain
Hazelwood
(94) did or was thinking about when he used the autopilot?
(s) ANo

\section*{Vol 223881}
, Q Do you agree that that was a good maneuver that he made under the circumstances?
3) A Well I don't know what was in Captan Hazelwood's mind
(1) It was good for his management decision based upon the
(s) information that he provided an the deposition or trial
testımony It was a good - a good decision sure
Q Assume the facts I just gave you -
A Yes
Q - that he said I was looking at the ice I wanted a
steady course I wanted a clear picture on my radar -
A Sure
Q - and I don I want to have to watch a helmsman Are those
two good reasons for what he did?
A Very gqod reasons
Q Do you agree or disagree with Captain Clark s opinion that the autopilot played no role in the grounding the use of the autopilot?
A Yes I do It played no role in the grounding
Q Okay I want to talk a little bit about the communications that Captain Hazelwood had with Third Mate Cousine?
AYes
Q Do you remember the testimony on that?
A Yes'
Q Just so we put it into perspective both Captain Hazelwood and Third Mate Cousins testified that they stood at the radar
together and they assessed the situation and stood there for
about ten minutes talking the situation over You remember
that?
AYes Ido
) \(Q\) And that Captain Hazelwood was asking for input from
( Mr Cousins?
A Correct
Q And giving input io Mr Cousins?
A Yes
(10) \(Q\) How does that - that exchange that ten minute exchange
(11) where they were both gathering information and talking it over
(12) and so on and so forth how does that fit into this training
(13) thing that you re talking aboui the training of officers?
(14) A I thunk that that maybe is a perfect example whereby the
(15) captasn is giving certain bits of unformation what do you
(16) think about it gettung the officer to become an actave
(17) participant in the job at hand So that's a very excellent way
(18) of developing the traning
(19) More umportantly it develops a bond of trust between the
(20) Junior officer and the captan which in many cases is totally
(21) absent So it bolsters the confidence of the junsor officer
(22) that he can have this dalogue with the semor captain and not
(23) be criticized for it So in my view this is a very excellent
(24) kind of opportunity to - to conduct call at training
(25) exercise but to contunue this philosophy

Vol 223883
(1) Q You ruad that Mr Cousins said that the captain elicited
(?) from him his advice?
(3) AYes
(4) Q Is that good or had?
(s) A Excellent
(6) Q Now in terms of - of the maneuver that they were
(7) coniemplating -
(8) A Yes
(9) Q - was this discussion the overall diacussion agood or a
(10) bad thing?
(1i) A The dascussion?
(12) Q Yeah In other words Captain Hazelwood didn t juat say to
(13) the mate okay 1 m leaving, it a yours?
(14) A No it was an - an excellent or outstanding interchange
(1s) between jumor officer and senior officer
(16) Q And whal was the purpose in your mind? I mean what was
(17) the purpose of this discussion?
(18) A Well the purpose I beheve number one, was from the
(19) educational perspective it appears that at some point to
(20) continue that educational process or for some reason, the
(21) captan, as I've learned subsequent to my earher
deposition,
(22) had a reason for leaving the bridge He was well prepaning
(23) that officer to continue in the performance of his duties, so
(24) he was preparing that gentleman to be able to successfolly
(23) conduct the navigation and pulotage of the ressel

Vol 223884
Q Based on what you read in terms of Captain Hazelwoods testimony and Mr Cousins lestimony did the caplaingive on the basis of this discussion that they had did the captain give that mate enough information for the mate to carry out the contemplated maneuver?
A Yes
Q Now did you conclude whether or not they came to a mutual
agreement about the contemplated maneuver?
A They did come to a mutual agreement
Q What do you base that on?
A I basen promanly on the tnal testumony of Mr Cousins and also the testumony of Captann Hazelwood And in both
cases, Mr Cousus basically sent a loud and clear signal to Captan Hazelwood, I understand what's at hand I'm comfortable
(15) with it, and I can do it
(16) Q Was it unreasonable for Capiain Hazelwood given this
(t7) discussion that they had given the situation that they were
(i8) looking at and given Cousins assurance to him that he was
(19) confident comfortable with the situation was it unremsonable
(20) for him to rely on what Mr Cousins told him?
(21) A No
(22) Q One factor we didn 1 throw in Captain Hazelwood has
(23) testified that he knew Mr Cousins and he knew ham as a good
(24) mate remember that?
(25) AYes
,

\section*{Vol 223885}

Q Does that go into the planning and thinking procesa?
A All of the factors go - yes That's one of many factors that goes me play as far as determining when and under what
(4) circumstances you turn the cou over to a deck officer

Q In your opinion based upon the icstimony that you read could Mr Cousina have said no to Caplain Hazelwood if he wagn 1 confident?
A Most defintely That's a duty responsibility of any junnor mate or any deck officer
Q Was there anything in whal you read that indicated to you that Mr Cousins was afraid to say no to Captain Hazeiwood? A No, to the contrary
Q Why do you say that?
A Because of the dralogue there's one statement that he was
(15) one of the eastest going captuins I've ever sauled with and
(16)
(18) could have thes bond of trust that I spoke about was so
(1) bridge the captann certannly would have done so
(2) Q So he had that option available to him at any ume didn \(t\) 3) he?
(4) AYes
(5) \(Q\) Including saying, Captain don leave the bridge, I mnot comfortable?
A Most definitely, and that's a very common request of a jumor officer I deal with it perhaps more because I have officers I don't sall with all the tume But at any ume that
they're aot comfortable, the first one to say, Captan, you
better stay here because I'm not comfortable with this, I
haven't done this before, that's a tradition of -I won't say
tradition of the sea, but certanly is well within the workng relationship between jumior and semor officer
Q And based on your experience there s no repercussion, it
there if the mate says no Captain I want you to stay with me?
A No, never At least not to my - my expenence level
Q I mean, in dealing with your mates, if a mate asked you to
stay up there you would have stayed wouldn \(t\) you?
A Correct
Q And that s what Cousins said about Captann Hazelwood right?
A Rught and what that's saying to the captan is I need
(s) some more anstruction I need some more guidance or I need your

\section*{Yol 223887}
expenence and that's the reason why the captain would reman
Q Okay I want to put up the - what I referred to as the
ice chart and I want to talk about the maneuver, the
contemplated maneuver This is Defendants Exhibil 1729
This
6) is a chart thal was prepared during Capiain Hazelwood s
(7) deposition Captain Harclwood has testified that the apex of
8) the ice - let me get a pointer
9) MR SANDERS Here Mike
(10) MR CHALOS I mgoing to use the plaintiffs
pointer It a better pointer
BYMR CHALOS
Q Caplain Hazelwood testified that the apex of the ice was up
here see this?
A Yes 11
Q And that was almost directly opposite of Busby laland light?
A Correct
Q And what he was doing by coming to 180 he was trying to
get the vassel an equidistant betwurn the apex of the ice and
Busby lisiend?
A Correct
Q In your opinion is that a good or a bad mancuver?
A Excellent maneuver
Q He s also teatified that - and now just to put the whole

Vol 223888
thing in perspective Mr Cousins says - bv the way this
thing here that ! m drawing with the pointer is what Captain
Hazelwood saw as the leading edge of the ice Mr Cousins
testufied that when he and Captain Hazelwood were at the radar
together he saw the ice in approximately the same area except
he thought the leading edge was slightly further to the east as
represented by these red circles okay?
A Okay
Q All nght So the instructions that Captain Hazelwood gave to the mate was when you come abeam of Busby Island I want vou
(1)] to start turning back towards the lanes okav? Now there was ) some criticism from Captain Clark that Captain Hapelwood hould
have given him given the mate a course to steer Do you agree or disagree with that?
A In that situation I would disagree
Q Why?
A Because they - they were skirting ice of an unknown definition not knowing exactly where it is and they were coming through like a channel or a - between two barriers one
(20) land barner and the ice barner which is not defined The i) objectuve would be to pass midway between those two barriers
) If you will to be somewhat in the middle So to set a course
a specific course right at Busby Island would not necessarily
(4) put the ship madway between the two areas of danger that they
( 5 ) would discover as they get closer and the radar picks up more

\section*{Vol 223889}
of the ice
, Q So was the captain giving discretion to the mate to look at the sttuation and decide what course he wanted to steer? A Discretion to the mate as far as the numencal course but
(s) they both came to an agreement I believe and the testumony
(N) states that they both agreed that they would go night down the

7, maddle That smy recollection So they - that was very precise or very definite they're going to go down the nuddle

91 Q So we all understand when you say down the middle you mean -
A Between the two barriers, the ice and the land going down,
(12) the reef

Q That would be Bligh Reef buoy?
AYes
Q He wanted to stay equidistant betwean the ice and Bligh Reef buoy?
A Yes
Q Let me ask you this we ve been talking about the leading edge of the ice -
A Yes
\(Q\) - and the smage that I conjure up in my mind is this big sheet of ice with an edge you know almon like a giacier is that what you see out there?
A No As a matter of fact I looked at a vadeotape that was taken the morning of the grounding and there were small
(1) of ice toward the eastern end and appeared to be larger bits of
(2) ice chunks of ice sporadically towards the northwestern side
(3) Q That suphere?

A So there's no definite wall as such but the bigger ice appeared to be further to the northwest or up to that corner Q What you re talking about is the video that Mr Lawn took where we saw bits of ice?
A Yes
Q Hasthat been your experience that is when you have ice going across the lanes that the bigger pieces tend to be over here to the west closer to Columbia Glacier and the smaller preces to the east?
A I don't remember how many tumes I've actually

\section*{encountered}
(14) ice daring my transits I know I've encountered it two or
(IS) three tumes SoI think that logic would dictate that the
(16) larger preces would be up there up to the - closer to the
glacier atself and that the wind would drive the smaller pleces across, potentally
Q Okay Now at my request did you measure the distance
between Bligh Reef buoy and the leading edge of the ice at the
(2) closest point of approach as Captain Hazelwood saw?
(22) A Yes I did
(23) Q And what did you find?
(2) A It was about two miles
(25) \(Q\) How ahout from where Cousins drew it?

\section*{Vol 223891}

A Can you pomt to Cousins' -
Q This would be the leading edge
A Somethang like maybe one and a half or one and
three-quarter miles pertaps
Q Based on what Captain Hazelwood saw the moment he left
the
(6) bridge and what Cousins saw in your npinion was there plenty
of room if the turn had buen started at Busby for them to
navigate safely through where the ste was and where the buoy
was?
AYes
Q Now you ve heard lestumony yesterday that if Captan
(12) Hazelwood s orders were followed the veasel would have mussed
(13) Bligh Reef by a comfortable margin do you agree or disagree
(14) with that?
(IS) Alagree
(16) Q Incidentally what was the dialance - did you measure the
(in) distance between Bligh Reef buoy and the apex as Captain
(18) Hazelwond saw II?
(19) A Yes I think it was in the magnitude of three and a half
(20) to three and three-quarter miles
(21) Q Was it unreasonable when Captain Hazelwood when he left
(22) the bridge to believe that he had given instructions for a
(23) simple maneuver and there was plenty of room to make that
turn
(24) \(1 \mathrm{In}^{7}\)
(20) A Yes
\(\qquad\)
1) Q It was unreasonable?
-) A No, it was reasonable
3) Q The maneuver that he asked the third mate to make that is (4) when you come abeam of Busby lurn the vessel bach towards the
5) lanes go right up the middle is that a maneuver within the capabilities of the licensed third mate?
A Definutely
Q Tell me about that That particular - that particular
task that was asked of the mate how do you compare that in terme of difficulty?
(II) A One aeeds to look at all of the tasks of a deck officer and
(12) if you get in all the technical things, even non navigation
(13) whereby the officer is in a control room all by humself,
(14) loading cargo, it may be 80000 barrels per hour
manupulating
(15) maybe \(\mathbf{2 0}\) valves that's a fairly complex skill required of an
(16) officer to do by humself
(17) With regard to navigation there are many instances where
(18) one would be at sea with ten or 15 ships converging in
(19) different angles with nobody able to communicate with one
(20) another where two shups might be passing within a mule of
(21) another with a crusing speed of maybe 35 or \(\mathbf{4 0}\) miles an hour,
(-.) not knowing exactly what the other ship is going to do there
(23) are many areas of navigation around the world where one
has got
(24) to encounter traffic and current putting all that into
(20) context, as far as a skill required to make a simple course
```

                    Vol }22389
    change with no traffic nocurrent good visibility st's got
to be on a scale of difficulty, minumal, minumal requirement
for a thurd officer
And I believe that that was attested to by Admiral Yost
commandant of the Coast Guard
Q I forgol about visibulity Captain Hazulwood said the
visibility and Mr Cousins conferrod that the visibility was
ten miles Is that prelly good visibilily?
A Yes
Q Caplain Hacelwood has lastlicd that the reason he went
below at that particular momunt - which incidentally I want
you to commant on something ho was coming up to a courye
chang= at 2355 1! 55
A Yes
Q He lett the bridge at I| 53 and he said the reason he did
that was to go down and check do some weather calculations
Do you have an opinion as to whether or not he should have
stayed up and wated for that turn to commence given the
totality of the situation?
A Remember before I said nisk analysis needs to take place
before a captann leaves the bridge or whatever he does
regardless of what be does risk analysis in very key Based
on the training that he apparently had beeu conducting with
(9) has officers based on the skalls of the third officer any
(2S) requirement that would take the captain off the bridge he

```
all
(1) should have had a hundred percent expectation that that
(2) command that was a very explecit command would have been
(3) carned out and carmed out successfully
(4) Q Do you have any criticism of the fact that he ieft two
(S) minutes before the turn started?
(6) A No
(7) Q What do you base that on?
(8) A Before I said the captann has many responsibilities My
9) reading of the - of the depositions and trial transcript, the
(1) Captan had something on his mind, apparently, with regard to
(II) vessel safety, and that is he had to make a decision as to
(12) whether or not to proceed to sea out through Hinchumbrook or to
(13) take the shap to Knowles Head and anchor and the factor that I
(14) understand was on his mind had to do with - with high wind, 70
(15) knot wuds or a low, and he was apparently concerned about
(16) having to make the decision, what course of action he was goung
(in) to do after he was through the ice
(18) Q When you gave that opimion did you put yourself on the
(19) bridge of the ship that aight as opposed to the courtroom tive
(20) years later?
(21) A Well that - excuse me'
(22) \(Q\) Let me rephrase that
(23) A You lost me
(24) Q When you were making that analysis in your own mind
(25) A Just now'

Vol 223895
(1) Q Yeah When you say I don \(t\) criticize Captain Hazelwood (2) for leaving two minutes before the turn
(3) A Rught
(4) Q Did you try and put yourself in the ship that night and put (5) yourself in Captain Hazelwood s position?
(6) A Of course One has to - to try to understand what was in
(7) hus mind what's were the pressures what were the concerns
8) what was his overall thinking process at that pount in tume
(9) Q And how much confidence he had in the mate and the
(10) navigation factors that he looked at?
(11) A All facturs have got to go together All factors
(12) Q It s farrly easy to say five yeara after the fact isn \(t\)
(13) It that hey maybe he should have stayed up there two more
(14) minutes after you know that you ve had an accident?
(15) A In retrospect, that would be the obvious conclusion
(16) Q And Captain Hazelwood - you read did you not he said
(17) knowing what I know now knowing that that turn wasn i done
as
(18) I wanted I would have stayed up there Do you remember that?
(19) A Yes I do
(20) \(Q\) Is that a normal raction under the circumstances?
(21) A Most definately
(2-) Q Okay Let me talk a litile bil about this weather that you (23) mentioned You heard iestimony from Mr Leitz did you not
(24) that on Sunday the 26th iwo days after this there was a big
(25) storm that came through?

Q In Prince William Sound 70 mile an hour winds that moved
the ship a hitle bit do you remember that?

\section*{A Correct}

Q Based on your experience up there in March you get these big lows coming through do you not?
A Yes, sir
Q Those lows sweep across and go in the Gulf of Alaska?
A They go various places
\(Q\) And they can be very dangerous can they to a ship
especially a ship with slack tanks?
A Yes
Q So was It unreasonable at that tume for Captain Hazulwood to be concerned about an approsching low?
A No That's a major factor because the preservation of the safety of the vessel in a different element now not from a navigation but from a structural perspective is an important thing be was looking at or obviously considenig at that point
in time
Q Okay I want to talk about the things that Third Mate
Cousins did Third Mate Cousins testified as to all the things
he did do you remember he - lurn this towards the jury
Third Mate Cousins testified that when Captain Hazelwood left and he wanted to plot his position at 2355 he came out of the
wheelhouse walked all the way down to the end of the wing

\section*{Vol 223897}
here right and using an azimuth bearing sighted Busby Island
light then he walked all the way back into the wheelhouse
went over to the radar swung an arc on the radar gota range
then waiked all the way back to the chart room and plotted II
Remember that?
AYes
Q Okay And he said that look him about two minutes or so?
A Okay
Q Remember that?
AYes Ido
Q Based on your uxperience did Mr Cousins have to do all that?
A It was totally unnecessary
Q Why do you say that?
A There are two other very smple ways of findung out or determining your position and determining what course you are
(I7) goug to steer that he could have used and vhould have used
(18) that he chose - for whatever reason chose not to use
\(119)\) Q What could he have done that would have assessed his (20) position or given hima fix without having to walk all the way (21) to the end of the bridge wing come back in go to the chart (22) room go to the radar then the chart room?
(23) A The best thing and the thing we're all faminar with, and (24) that is simply using your own two eyes and looking out the window the light was visible to him okay, Bugh Reef light

6-2-94
was visible
Also the light of Busby Island was visible to him so all he reaily had to do was stand in the middle of the - can you point to the middle of the bndge wing the bndge wheelhouse
maddle stand and look out one of those windows and all be had
(6) to do is look to the left see that the light is almost abeam
and actually in fact he should have started hus tura when the
light was a bittle forward of the shap hecause it takes a while
for the ship to start to turn and he sumply had to turn the
(10) ship watching that light until the light was on the left band
(11) sade of the ship That's all he had to do
(12) Q The maneuver that Captain Hazelwood wanted him to do was
(13) that simple?
(14) A Yes
(15) Q Now you recall Third Mate Cousins called Captain

Hazelwood
(16) after he laid down the fix on the chart you remember him
(17) saying I went over to the phone and I called Captain

Hazelwood?
(18) A Yes
(19) Q And he - Captain Ha/elwood askıd him what s going on what
( 01 rudder are you using and hu iold him ten degrees night rudder
(-1) do you rumımbur that?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q Was captain - was that a good rudder to use ten degrees?
(74) A Not having been on the ship it would be wrong for me to (2s) second guess I think I probably would have started off with
8

Vol 223899
nght 15 degree rudder to start the swang and then eased, eased
(9) the swing a little bit to ten degrees but it would be inaccurate for me to judge hut that's a minmum amount of rudder that I would have used
Q Okay You heard Mr Cushing yesterday say that ten degrees
(6) right rudder would have brought her comfortably past?

AYes
Q So they have this cxchange the capiain asked him is everything okay He said everything s fine so on so forth
Was it unreasonable for Captain Hazeiwood to rely on that call
from the mate to put his mind at ease that the orders were
being carried out?
A It was a very reasoanble expectation
Q At that point if Third Mate Cousins felt uncomfortable what should he have done?
A As I indicated before it's an every day occurrence for a mate to call the captain and advise hum of information and
\(t 0\)
(18) send the signal etther I need you on the bridge or I'm dong
(9) something I don't need you on the bndge, that happens all the
(20) tume, all the tume So the signals that Cousins sent to
(21) Captan Hazelwood was very clear I don't need you on the
(22) bndge, I've done what you told me to do
(23) Q And Captain Hazelwood could rely on that?
(24) A If you can't rely on that, then there's a major problem on
(25) board a vessel where you have qualified officers
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{25}{*}{}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline & \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

1
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 223901 \\
\hline & \multirow[t]{2}{*}{(II) coilisions and groundings?} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{worldwide} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{141 specific anstance they deploved or used a radar to track the}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(s)} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(6) they had a communicut} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(7) vessels to - to obtan information from the vessels and to} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(8) disseminate information to the ships} \\
\hline & Q Let me ask you directly When you were up there did you \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(10) believe you were being montored above Bligh Reef?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(11) A Most defintely} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(12) Q Did you ever have occasion to get a rudder or a speed} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{command - let me strike tha} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) Did you have occasion} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(1s) command from them?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(16) A l've received bath from them ut different ume} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(17) \(Q\) Where they told you to slow down spud up move here} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{move} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(18) thera?} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(191) A They told us to slow down} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(20) Q Lel me ask you this If your ship} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{Rear} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{that} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(1-2) they would call you and lull you captain do something} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(23) anything avoid the danger?} \\
\hline & A Not expressly wniten in the purpose but it does say that \\
\hline & their goal or their mission is to prevent groundings \\
\hline & \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

Vol 223903
(1) A Well, here is a gentleman coming on watch with a - with a
(2) responsible task to monitor a ship that was within radar
range
(3) and for this guy to go down and have a ham sandwich and not
(s) montor it If find unbelievable

Q Was il unreasonable for Captain Hazelwood when he ieft the
bridge at 2353 to bulieve that his vessel as an added measure
of safety if his vessel was standing into danger that there
would be a call from the VTS?
(9) A That's not an unreasonable assumption I would doubt
that
(10) that was - that that was foremost in the captan's mand
(II) because I don't thank that he had any indication or any
thought
(12) that he was going to be standing into danger so I don't thunk
(13) that came into his thought prucess, but if you would ask him as
(14) to what he expected I would thank yes certanily
(IS) Q Ohay Let stald now about the post grounding and then
(16) we re done Have you been involved in any major casualites in
(17) your career?
(18) AYes
(19) Q Tell us about the major casuaily
(20) A Well, I've been - throughout my career I've been uvolved
(21) in vanous kinds of casualties I've come under rocket attack
(22) twice in Vietnam I've sten ship fires experienced ship
fires,
(23) suicides massive human injuries that resulted in
mechanical
(24) faulures on board a ship so I've seen a lot of -
(25) Q Give us a big one
(1) A The biggest one or the most devastating to me was happening
(2) in 1972 when I was second mate of a ship and - can I use that
model"
Q This one here?
A Please The ship that I was second officer on was a cargo
ship so at didn't look lake this but I need to use thas for
point of illustration A cargo ship carmes general cargo
does not carry oul and unstead of having a flat deck has
cargn tooms usually higher than the house big steam shovel
(10) cranes for lufting out heavy steel and all kinds of
(II) superstructure up here
(12) The accident happened in January of 1972 We were (13) southbound in something called the Chesapeake Deloware canal
(14) It's a canal that divides the Delaware peninsula if any of you
(ts) are from that area It's about \(\mathbf{8 0 0}\) foot wide the canal
(16) itself We were going through with about four knot current (17) pushing us along and after we entered the canal in the early
(18) morning hours fog set in and our visibility was no more thon
(19) maybe half a mile ahead of us The ship was empty and because
(20) the ship was empty the ship had an attutude of something like
(21) this
(22) Now, the ship I was on was about half the size, much
(23) smaller, only 500 feet Let's assume thus is a small ship
(24) Almost the same land of thing happened here with regard to VTS

And
(1) there was a watch change and at the watch change the guy
(r) forgot to tell the other guy that we were in the canal So 20
(1) manutes Inter the canal operator Army Corps of Engneers got
(4) a phone call from a railroad bridge operator There's a
(s) railroad bridge that spans this \(\mathbf{8 0 0}\) foot canal it's a lift
6) roilroad bridge, said l'm going to lower, I have a freight
(7) tran coming through
(8) Well they lowered the bndge and we saw it, it came out of
(9) the fog with maybe less than half a mule The bridge, corner (10) of the bridge hit nght here and it proceeded to knock away
the
(It) anchor wandlass All the cargo came down, like a lawn mower,
(12) and everything's crashing And finally, the bindge mpacted
(13) the bouse neariy kalled us all neariy decapitated the house
(14) We're lucky or fortunate oniy one person was lalled, was a
(19) lookout forward And as a result of that secident of that
(16) accident the ship was a total loss
(17) Q Were you - were you on watch at the time?
(18) A I was a second officer I had come off watch, but I
(19) retarned to the - to the bridge to help the captan and the
(20) third mate, so I was standing by the radar at the tume of
(21) the - of the collision or the impact
(22) Q So you witnessed this thing?
(23) A Yes sir
(24) Q And the captann was there?
(25) A Yes


Vol 223907

\section*{AYes}

Q The grounding you remember the testimony of what he did
when he came up on the bridge the orders he gave?
AYes
Q The discussions that he had with his mate?
AYes
Q How do you compare that to what you explrientud) With your
caplain"
A Well I beluve the stress probably was every bit as great or perhaps - it's every bit as great as what the captan was that 1 expenenced But whatever that level was not measurable, but Captan Hazelwood at that point in tume had
(3) some very instant responsibiluties that be carried out with , exceptuanal amount of calm and judgment especinlly in view of
(1s) the - lake this as something that we never prepare for We 16) never expect to bave a casualty of such magaitude so l've got
17) to say that he - because of his own pernonal fortatude was able to function miraculausly in spite of thas tragedy
Q Well I want to shortult this You vercad about
evcrything that he did in the course of about an hour?
AYes
Q All the orders he gave what he was thinking about how he
was trying to get the ship to seltle down you remember all that?
A Yes
(1) Q Do you have any criticism at all of what he did?
() A No I don't
(3) Q Did you find it to be the decisions that he made to be
(4) good decisions under the circumstances?
(5) A Excellent decisions
(6) Q Do you think based on your experience someone that s
(7) imparred by alcohol could make the decisions that Captain

Hazelwood made under the circumstances?
MR MONTAGUE Objection no foundation
(10) THE WITNESS I don \(t\) know sir
(H) THE COURT Just a moment
(12) MR CHALOS Okay Let me approach it froma
(13) different standpoint
(14) BYMR CHALOS
(1s) \(Q\) You ve read the testimony of the trew membera?
(16) A Yes
(17) Q That Captain Hazelwood was not impaired at any time after
(18) the grounding?
(19) A That's what I read
(20) \(Q\) You have any reason to quarrel with that?
(21) A No
(22) Q Were his actions consistent with someone being alert and
(23) dealing with a horrible situation at that moment?
(24) A Most definitely You heard the tape
(25) Q You heard the lape where Captain Hazelwood called the VTS

\section*{Vol 223909}
(1) at \(12 \mathbf{2 8}\) to report the grounding?
(2) A Yes
(3) Q Let me ask you this You ve had experience with
(4) transmissions bach and lorth to the VTS?
(s) A Yes
(6) Q Did you find in your experience any - any distortion of
(7) your voice when you wer away from the VTS as opposed to
(8) someone being right there with a monitor?
(9) A Well if there's a recording device in the room where
(10) somebody is transmitting as opposed to when they're receiving,
(il) there's a very different sound in the voice in all cases
(12) \(Q\) And that depends on the distance that you re away from that
(13) device doesn \(11^{?}\)
(14) A it depends on factors of which I know aot but it depends
(15) There is a difference in sounds \(I\) know that
(16) MR MONTAGUE Your Honor
(17) MR CHALOS I mdon
(18) BYMR CHALOS
(19) Q You heard Captain Hacelwood s voice?
(20) A Yes
(21) Q At that moment giving that information?
(22) A Yes
(23) Q What is your opinion of the voice? Does that sound to you
(24) as someone impaired?
(25) THE COURT Wall a minute

\section*{Vol 223910}

MR MONTAGUE Your Honor
MR CHALOS I II hach olf
THE COURT Thure san ohpuction and I ustain the objection
BY MR CHALOS
Q Now there s been a suggestion that Captan Hazelwood was
trying to free this vessel from the reef and you read
Mr Leitr s lestimonvthat -
A Yes
Q - that he didn t belteve he was doing that and all the
actions were consistint with keeping ti on the reef
A Yes
Q And you read Commander McCall stestımony \({ }^{2}\)
MR MONTAGUE Your Honor Ithought we ware not
having cumulative testimony here
MR CHALOS I just want to ask him opinion
MR MONTAGUE Mr Luity lestified about this at
length and was examined and now you re going to go into it
again
MR CHALOS All right I matisfied with what
Mr Leitz said
BYMR CHALOS
Q Okay Captain Bolton given everything that you ve read and heard and testified to do you have an opinion as to what
caused the grounding in this case?
i) Bligh Rcel
(') Do vou agree or disagree with that opinion'
(3) A I agree with - with that upinion
(4) MR CHALOS I have no further questions Your Honor
(s) THECOURT Youmay cross examine
(6) We re going to take five minutes or two or three or
(7) whatever We II be off the record for a moment
18) (Recess trom l 20 pm To 123 pm )
(9) THE COURT Back on the record
(10) You may cross examine

III CROSS EXAMINATION OF JAY BOLTON
(1) BY MR MONTAGUE
(13) Q Captain Bolton good afternoon
(14) A (roond afternoon sir
(15) Q 1 m Laddie Montague
(16) A Yes sir
(17) Q We met once before
(18) A Yes
(19) Q I just want to start oul - I was going to start out by
(20) asking you if on the morning of the 24th of March 1989 the
(21) Exxon Valder ended up on Bligh Reef but you finally got around
(22) to that
(-3) I Just want to talk about this chart for a second okay?
(9) You talked about the communications between Mr Cousins and
(9s) Captain Hazelwood?

\section*{A Yes}

Q What is vour opinion?
A There are dynamics that have come together apparently that
(4) have led to this accident Vot technical unt environmental It's people In my view there are perhaps three causer of thes accident The first is that Captan Hazeiwond relied on the professional competency of his third officer He trusted that third officer That in retrospect was his mistake The second mistake in my view was the third officer who acted for that period of time most unprofessionally for whatever reason
And I think the third mistake and perhaps this is the nail in the coffin is the fact that the third mate gave the captain misinformation and that misinformation gave the captan the
(15) wrong sense as to where he needed to be to discharge his (16) responsibilities
(17) Q Do you agrec or disagrac with this statement made by 1181 Admiral Yost in issumony hure The primary cause of the (19) grounding was a perfectly qualificd third mate on the bridge of (0) a ship that through a period of a few minutes of inatuention ( 1 ) to duty or lach of hnowledge of exactly where he was ran the (2) ship aground on a clear might with all the navigational aids (3) watching him a person who had received a license properly (4) issued by the Coast Guard on a vessel like the Exxon Valdez ( s) should have no difficully navigate a vessel in the area around

Vol 223914

\section*{A I thought I did}

Q It will go faster
A I'll do my best
Q That is did you give any significance to the fact that
Mr Cousins and Captain Hazelwood drew these divergent leading
(6) edges of the ice yes or no?

A Significance with regard to that point in time?
Q Yeah As to how they - does the fact that they had
different perceptions -
A Mr Cousins -
Q - perceptions of where the ILe is?
A Mr Cousus perception of this is not consistent with has testamony
Q He drew that you know?
(1s) A Was not consistent with what he said to Captan

\section*{Hazelwood}
(16) at the tume
(17) Q Are you aware that he drew that line?
(18) A In the trial, yes
(19) Q Now as the vessel was coming down this area ithink you
(20) deacribed it in your testimony that il was shirting ice of an
( 1 ) unknown delinition is that corral)
('2) A Correct
(23) Q And it aiso had - il was a lookout tor ice right)
(4) A They had a lookout
\(n\)
(23) \(Q\) And for ice ice was one of the hazards that was involved

\section*{in that -}

A The only way of accurately detecting ice at aightime is by
use of radar unless you have full moou night or daytume or visible My assumption as their detection of ice based on Hazelwood's testumony was by use of radar
Q How long is it once you get to Bligh Reet or you pass
Bligh Reef how long is it untal you get to Lape Hinchinbrook?
A Mileagewise?
Q No timewise
A Depends on the speed of the vessel Maybe five hours 60
(II) some odd mules I beheve
(12) Q So after they passed Bligh Reef utook five hours to get
(13) to Cape Hinchinbrook which is somuthing lihe that?
(14) A Something in that magnitude
(15) Q You re saying that il was proper for Captain Hazelwood to
(16) leave the bridge and not wall two more minuls before he
looked
(17) at a weather report?
(18) A I dad not say that
(19) Q Have you seen the weather report?
(20) A No I haven't
(21) Q For that?
(22) A No, I haven't
(23) \(Q\) So you don \(t\) know what - what was brewing in the
(24) Aleutians right?
(2) A Correct
(1) Q And you don \(t\) know whether or not that was something that (2) was suffictent to take the captain off the bridge when he had
(3) five more hours before he got out of Prince William Sound?
(4) A As I stated earluer, sir, it was not that he had five
(s) hours, but that he had to make a decision as to whether or not
(6) he was going to go to Knowles Head which was just hterally (7) around the corner
(8) Q Didn the have to make a decision as to whether or not he
(9) was going to make it through this transtt first and get past
(t) Bligh Reef wasn that the first order of business?
(II) AYes
(12) Q Okay Now the last command was - other than a tall ahip
(13) was in 1987'
(14) A No, my last command was 1991 '2 I was captan of a

VLCC
(15) Q Your last command in Prince William Sound was \(1987 ?\)
(16) A About 1987, I beheve
(17) Q Did you hear any of the teatimony from the captains of
(18) Exxon that appeared here?
(19) A Yes
(20) Q Did you hear Captan Martineau testify"
(21) A I don't - 1 don't remember Captain Martineau
(29) Q Did you hear Captain Stalzer testify?
(23) A No, I mussed his testumony
(24) Q Did you hear Caplain Duncan lestify?
(23) A No

\section*{Vol 223917}

Q Did you hear Caplain Shechy lestify?
A No
(3) Q How about Capiain Deppe?
(4) ANo
(s) Q You must have heard Caplain Mihajlovic?
(6) A I'm glad you pronounced the name for me
(7) Q I may have mispronounced the name for you but I heard him
(8) yesterday
(9) A Yes
(10) Q And did you hear Capisin Pierce?
(II) A I don't belneve so
(12) Q Now I don t mean to be - sound disrespectful but with
(13) all those captains in the Exxon fleet coming bere and
(14) testifying do you feel you re better qualified to comment on
(IS) captaining a tanker vesuel through Prince William Sound than
(16) they are?
(17) A I don't think that's a reasonable question to ask me, sur (ib) because we're looking at people whom I don't even know, I don't
(19) know what their background is and captanning of a ship is
(20) command, it's a responsibility, it's not - it's not a motor
(21) function as you're describing, so I cannot answer that
(23) question sir
(23) \(Q\) We don I know who you are either?
(24) A That's correct
(25) Q Are you aware that those other than Captain Mihajlovis
I) but of those captains that were asked they said that thev
would stay on the bridge thev would not have left the
bridge -
A What's the question '
Q-during this transit?
A But what is the question sir' Am I aware -
Q Yeah Are you aware of that?
A I just told you I did not hear those captanns testify
Q Oh okay Now you ve used often in vour - in your
testimony on direct you used the word discretion or
Mr Chalos used it weth vou do vou recall that if ain the
captain \(s\) discretion?
AYes
Q And would you agrec that that sthe samı a judgmant it s
in the captain s judgment?
A Yes
Q And just because it sin the captain s discretion or
judgment that doesn I mean that the captain might not have
exercised poor judgment or poor discretion isn that
correct?
A Sometımes captains exercise poor judgment sometımes
good
( ) Judgment and sometmes not so good judgment
(1) Q Now let s go to the vovage Can everybody see that? We a) went through this yesterday with Mr Cushing so 1 m going to

I not repeat il but you will recall that the captain left the

bridge al 2353 \({ }^{7}\)
A Yes
QRigh
Q And that the iurn that he asked Cousinn lo makt was at
2355 right?
A He said make the turn when you're abeam He did not
specify the tume
vessel was abeam Busby Island light?
Q And of course they re headed lowards a known hazard
right'
AYes
Q And il s nightims?
A Yes
Q Okav Now do you - do you have any criticism of Captain
Hazelwood leaving the bridge two minutes approximately two
minutes before the vossel was abeam Busby Island light as
described in the facts as I ve set them out in that charn?
A I believe I just testified a few moments ago that I did
not
Q Ohat Do vou rusall hitig a ahcd that question at vour
duposilion'
AIdo
Q And if vou would 11 vou dturn lo page 132 of your
deposition that sthat big fat -
A I have page 132
(17) Q And do you see the question do you have any criticism of
(18) Captain Hazelwood?
(19) A Yes
(30) \(Q\) And did you give this answer If I had been on the bridge
(21) myself I would not have left the bridge?
22) A I see that
(23) Q Did vou give that answer?
(4) A For that specific question yev
(s) Q W Cll that sthe question I fust asked

Vol 22 3922
Q Do you suc your nuxt answur you say you don I hnow all the facts why Captan Hazelwood dicided to luave the bridge it could have been a very compelling reason I don \(t\) know And
then you say but I myself would have stayed on the bridge
until I was clear of the ace Did you give that answer?
A To that question yes
Q Now I m confused aboul something maybe you can clarify
It but you stated if I can find it when you were asked about
whether the eaptain should have reported this course change
from 200 to 180 degrees remember you were asked that
8tuon"
A Yes
Q And the answer that I got was at that point in tume the captain was concerned how he s going to get through the tee
At that point the caplain has othur things on his mind other than call the VTC Do you remember that answer?
    AYes
    Q All right Well wouldn the have the same concern down
    here?
    A I don't think so
    Q Now let s do this again Captain luaves the bridge at
    2153
    A 2353
    Q1m sorry 2353 And he illls Mr Cuusins whan he luaves
    make the turn whun you ru abcam Busby light righi'
    A They came to a consensus ds to wh it ther were going to
do
(1) that if a captain were expecting a course change in two minutes
( \()\) and he dad not receive a phone call for eight manutes if
(3) that's an assumption then I would say that that would probably
(4) be a tup-off to the captain that maybe something needs to
(s) happen sooner
(6) \(Q\) And when you were asked that question in your depoation
7) and you said if you were in - read the question it \(s\) on page
8) 176 The last question on the page Have it page 176?
(4) A Okay
(10) \(Q\) You were asked the question and if you were in the cabin
(II) in Hazelwood \(s\) shoes wouldn 1 you aftur two or three minutes
(12) have either called the bridge on the telephone and checked
with
(13) Cousins to see that the turn started or go up to the bridge
(14) wouldn tyou have done one or the other? And your answer is I
(15) think I would have Is that correct?
(16) A Yes, but I - I need to add that this was in response to a
(I7) hypothetical question as you are asking me today and as a
(18) hypothetral
(19) QYes exactly Same hypothetical
(20) A Right
(21) Q Ohay Now let sturn to the VTC for a minule okay Do
(22) you have Exhibil 101 in Iront of you Plaintiffs Exhibit 101 ?
(73) A Yes wr
1.4) Q That , the - the usur , manual of 1988,
(2s) A Yes sur
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{Vol 223923} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(1) yes} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{Q But that a what he told Cousins)} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{A Currect} \\
\hline (4) & Q Then he told Cousins to call him when he made the turn? \\
\hline (5) & A Correct \\
\hline 161 & Q And he kncwat that link where hin location was with \\
\hline 171 & respect to Busby Island light right' \\
\hline (8) & A Correct \\
\hline (9) & Q And he knew that the turn was going to bl aboul two \\
\hline (10) & minutes? \\
\hline (11) & A Yes \\
\hline (1) & Q And he didn 1 rucive a call at 235S did he? \\
\hline (13) & A I don't know when he received a call \\
\hline (14) & Q Okay Well 1 m going to ask you to assume that he \\
\hline & received a call uighi and a half to nine minutus latur between \\
\hline & 0150 and 02 okay one and a hall minulus after midnight and \\
\hline & two minutes after midnight somelime in that range I want you \\
\hline & to assume that and given thosc lacty shouldn t Captain \\
\hline & Hazelwood have known ther was a scrious problum whin he \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{failed} \\
\hline & \multirow[t]{2}{*}{to recuive the inluphone sall trom Counins around two or thres minutis afler he holl the hridge'} \\
\hline & \\
\hline (-) & \multirow[t]{2}{*}{A I - 1 want to retterate I have int inforiuation is to when that call was made so if this is a hypothetical} \\
\hline & \\
\hline (24) & Q It sa hypothetical \\
\hline & A And this is taken in isolation and if you're asking me \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
```

    A Yes sar
    Q Than it would have il it staycd on 200'
    A Yes
    Q So he didn I do that and he didn ilull the VTC where he
    left the lanes is that correct?
    A That's correct
    Q And he didn Itell them where he planned to turn back?
    A That's correct
    Q Okay And he didn ticll them that he was on auto gyro?
    A Correct
    Q And he didn Itell thum that he was pulting the load
    programup on as he got out of the traffic lanes is that
    correct?
    A Correct
    Q And he never asked the VTC If they had the radar on and
    they were tracking him is that correct?
    A Correct
    Q Now I think you ve correctly stated in your direct
    testimony that the VTC operations is advisory
    A Correct
    Q And that onc of the things that thcy rcly on is - is the
    materials the communtations they have with the vessels?
    That sone of the components that they rely on?
    A Yes communcations is a part of that system
    Q And - and another component is radar?
    ```
(1) A Correct
Q And they all work togethur?
A Correct
Q And do you recall that there a a provision boldiv stated in
the user s guide the VTC user s guide expressing the
importance of having accurate information from the vesseis?
A You'll have to show it to me sar
Q If you want to turn to the manual you can hut this is the
first intro - introductory page and it states the mariner is
cautioned that information providud by the Vassel Tralfic
Center is to a larbc wximit based upon ruports of parlicipating
vessels and can bu no more accurate than the information
received
Were you aware of that?
A I can't say if I was aware of it but I can certanaly read
it as you are I understand what it's saying
Q Okay And then it goes on if you look at the next
highlighted section the efficient operation of the Princu
William Sound Vessel Traffic Service and safe navigation in the
service area depend upon manners observing these operating
procedures day and might in all weather Were you aware of
that?
A l'm'aware of that
Q Were you awarl of 11 whun you testified carlier)
A I can't say - I was not acutely aware of at no I did

\section*{A Correct}

Q And they all work togethur?
A Correct
Q And do you recall that there sa provision boldiv stated in the user s guide the VTC user s guide expressing the importance of having accurate information from the vesseis? A You'll have to show it to me sar Q If you want to turn to the manual you can but this is the firstintro - introductory page and it states the marineris

\section*{Vol 223930}
this wreck is that correct?
A It was one of the causes of the wreck
Q You gave the three?
A Yes
Q Now would you agree that il Caplain Hacelwood had been
on
6) the bridge like you said you would have been on the bridge
7) that that unprofessional conduct on the part of Third Mate
(8) Cousins would have been avoided?
(9) A It - it's a strong likellhood that it would have been,
(i0) yes
(11) MR MONTAGUE Thank you very much Captain
(i2) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAY BOLTON
(13) BYMR CHALOS
(14) Q Mr Bolton did you read anything with respect to Captain
(IS) Hazelwood a actions that suggested that he was trying to get
(16) this vessel off the reef?
(In A To the contrary
(18) \(Q\) He was trying to keep it on?
(19) A Correct
(20) Q Now Mr Montague read to you from the VTS user s manual
(1) about reporting course changw whan you re crossing the VTS?

1, AYes
13) Q That stalking about a situation where vou re hbre and you
(24) want to - let a aay you re in Curduva and you want to go over
( -5 ) to Whitter right you gol to tross the TSS?

\section*{Vol 22 3931}

1 Q That , what they tall aboul there don ithby" Inn ithat
3) correct?
(4) A Correct
5) Q And you read Captain Clark stustimony that he said he (6) didn i report every course change that he made do you remember
(7) that)
(8) A belheve I do
9) Q Now Mr Montague gave you a list of things that Captain
(10) Hazelwood didn \(t\) do he didn Itcll them hi was going lo his
(II) cabin he didn \(t\) tell them he was taking his coal off he
(I) didn itell them - you remumbur all that)

13, A Yes
(s) Q is there any raquirumant in the VTS manual that requirad
(15) him to make any of those reports that Mr Monagut suggested 10
(16) you?
(17) ANo sir
(18) Q You remember he told you he didn I lell them this that
(19) there \(s\) no requirement for any of that?

1301 A No sir
(i) Q Now Mr Montagut asked you somt quistion about when
(.2) Capiain Hazelwood got the call from Mr Cousins

13 A Yes
(24) Q Do you remember Captain Haselwood stustimonv that he
(2s) received a call within two minutes allur hi sxpecind it)
(1) A Correct
(r) Q And you remember Mr Cousins testimony that he made the
(3) call within a minute or so after he laid the fix down?
(4) AYes
(5) Q And he laid the fix down at 2356 or 579
(6) A Correct
(7) Q lsn that within the realm of tume that the captain should
(8) have expected the call?
(9) AYes
(10) Q Now you said that in response to the question that you
(L) wouldn thave left the bridge on that night that was before
(12) you heard what Captain Hazelwood had to say the reasons that
(13) he left?
(14) A Correct
(15) \(Q\) And you yourself have left the bridge of your ships above
(16) Bligh Reef on a number of occasions have you not?
(17) AYes
(18) Q Okay When you leave the bridge of the ship, you don 1
(19) leave the ship do you?
(30) A No
(?) Q You re only ten seconds away at most correct?
(בי) A Correct
(23) Q And you got a itlephone?
(24) A Right
(25) Q You can be called any time)
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline & Vol 223933 \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|r|}{(1) A Correct} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{(2) Q Now Mr Montagul gave you a list ol Exxon caplains who (3) said they wouldn thave left the bridge undur the}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(4) circumstancus right? Arc you surprised that Exxon caplains} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{(5) would come in hure after the lact and say golly gee i would (6) have never left the bridge?}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(7) A If I was an Exxon captain or a cumpanvemployet the} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{safest} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(8) answer is to say I'd never leave the bridge} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(9) MR NEAL Ob|ccton Your Honor} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(10) THE WITNESS With all the bussus in the room} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(11) MR NEAL Objection Your Honor Move that il be} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(19) stricken} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(13) MR CHALOS You junt got mi in trouble} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(14) THECOURT Justa butund} \\
\hline (15) & MR CHALOS Last question Your Honor last \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(16) question} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(17) MR NEAL There san objection} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(18) MR CHALOS I Il withdraw it smy ow} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(19) I II withdraw the question} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(20) THE COURT Okay The question is withdrawn The} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{\multirow[t]{2}{*}{\begin{tabular}{l}
(21) Ladies and Gunilemin ol the Jury will ignore the question and \\
( \({ }^{(2)}\) ) the answer and give il no consideration in duciding this case
\end{tabular}}} \\
\hline & \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(23) THE WITNESS Exiusw inc for huing facetious it sa} \\
\hline \multicolumn{2}{|l|}{(24) lont wich} \\
\hline & THE COURT Glad I didn I do \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
saıd
```

BYMR CHALOS
Q Okay Last question here Mr Montague showed you the ice
chart and he asked you about this line here that he satd
Mr Cousins drew?
A Yes
Q I want to clear this up You remember the testımony of
Mr Cousins and Captain Hazelwood gave Captain Hazelwood
8) this is the way he saw the ce when thev were at the radar?
A Yes
Q Right here where I mpointing?
A Yes
Q And Mr Cousins said he saw the me as depicied in this red
when they were standing at the radar you rumember that?
A Yes
Q That s roughly about the same isn 1 IT I mean they re
looking about the same tee in the same area)
A Correct I think the important thing is they both came to
a mutual agreement
Q Right Now this linc downherc thal Mr Montague referred
to was what Mr Cousins said was the leading edge that he saw
as he was - as he got down beyond - bevond Busby Island
light you remember that?
A Yes
(4) Q That s not the ice that he and Captain Hazelwood saw?
( s) A Correct
BYMR CHALOS
Q Okay Last question here Mr Montague showed you the ice
chart and he ashed you about this line here that he said
Mr Cousins drew?
AYes
Q I want to clear this up You remember the testımony of
Mr Cousins and Captain Hazelwood gave Captain Hazelwood
this is the way he saw the ice when ther were al the radar?
AYes
Q Right here where I mpointing?
A Yes
Q And Mr Cousins said he saw the te as depicted in this red when they were standing at the radar you rimember that? Q
Q That s roughly about the same isn $1 \|^{\circ}$ Imean they re looking about the same ile in the same area a mutual agreement
Q Right Now this Jinc downherc thal Mr Montague referred
to was what Mr Cousins said was the leading edge that he saw
light you remember that?
A Yes
A Correct

```

Vol 223934

\section*{111}
() Q Do vou recall anv conversations with Frank larossi where
(?) vou told him that il was vour understanding that alcoholism was
considered a disability under fideral law and as a result
Captain Hazelwood had to be assigned back to sea aboard a vessel?
A That conversation did not take place
Q If Frank Iarossi said it did take place he swrong?
A One of us is wrong I don't recall it I remember Frank specifically askung me to check on the company policy and
I do
(I) not recall anv conversation or me doing anything about any federal investigation of federal statutes
Q And in your mind a shoresid assignment for Captain
Hazelwood would not have violated company policy nor federal
regulation?
A No I don't think so Nether would his seagorng
assignmeat
(Portion of Video of Ben Graves concluded)
MR JAMIN I bulieve there s no zross Your Honor
MR SANDERS That is correct
THE COURT Thank you
(22) MR JAMIN Your Honor at this ume plaintiffs would
(23) move Exhibit 3809 as redacted into evidence
(24) (Exhibil 3809 offered)
(5) THE COURT That s Exhibul 3809?

THE COURT Sir you may step down
MR CHALOS I have one more thing and then we re
done
(s) THE COURT Good We re through with -
(6) MR CHALOS Yes This witness is finished Thank
(7) you
THE COURT Thank you sir You may step down
MR CHALOS I would like to offer into evidence now
Defendants Exhibil 2478
(Exhibit 2478 offercd)
MR O NEILL W have no objection
(13) THE COURT Defendants Exhibit 2478 is admitted
(14) (Exhibit 2478 received)
(1s) MR CHALOS Thank you
(16) MR LYNCH Looks like defendants rest Your Honor
(i7) THE COURT Thank you
(18) Ladies and gentlemen this concludes the defense aide of
(19) the care
(20) Mr Jamin I guess
(1) MR JAMIN Very brsef rebuttal Your Honor Ithink
(2) we ll make 200
(1) First Your Honor we have very brief videotape of
(4) Mr Graves again
(2s) (Portion of Video of Ben Graves played as follows)

Vol 223938
remember my instructions that you not read any newspaper articles about the case or listen to any reports about the case Don t let anyone discuss the case with you Don 1 listen to anybody discussing the case and furthermore even though you ve heard all of the cvidence al this point don t start making even tentative decisions about where you think you re going to go with the case
I know it s hard not to make those kind of judgments but you really will be betler offif you stay in ncultal over the weekend Watt until you ve heard the arguments wall until you ve heard my instructions and then il will be plenty of ume for you to be making ducisions Have a good weehend
will see you on Monday morning
Counsel will please stay a moment
(Jury out at 202 pm )
THE COURT They didn I seem the least bit offended
Mr Lynch?
MR LYNCH Your Honor on behalf of the Exxon defendants and I believe that Mr Chalos will join me in part of this motion I move pursuant to Rulc \(\uparrow 8\) for judymunt as a matter of law on the ground that the record taken as a whole and by the proper lagal standards is insulticicnt to cstablish a claim of recklessnces as against the Exxon dufundants and I ask for entry of judgment abainst the planinffs clams for puntive damages

Vol 223939
Separately would ask the Courl to rule that there is not sufficiont evidente in this robord and iudgid by the approprialu legal standard lor a jury to tind that a clarm ot recklessness sould be habud on the allezation that the assignment of Roburi Kagen as a hulmsman aboard the Exxon Valde \(\angle\) way a reckicss aul or could bu a predicat lor an award of punslive damages
Similarly and separaicly we ask for a judgment that there is insulficient evidunce on this rutord judged by the appropriate legal standard for a jury to conclude that the grounding of the Exxon Valder resulted from the fatigued state of Gregory Cousins or inallunlion or dumanding pratlicis of Exxon relating to duck officers On the same standard we do - we submit that it is appropriate for the Court to dirul unry of judgmint as a matter of law on the ground that the cvidencl lakin as a whole and by the appropriate legal standard is not sulfisient to establish that Captain Hacclwoud was ampairud by alcohol al the
|ly) time of the grounding or that the impairmunt - that the (20) consumption of alcohol rather was a proximate cause of the (21) grounding and accordingly that judgment is permissible and (i) proper as a matier of law and it would bu impropur for the jury ( 31 to return a verdict based on claims rulating to Exxon salcohol (24) policy or Captain Hazclwoodsations because there is no
(25) adequate proof of impairment or proximate causation

Vol 22 3940
(1) We make the same motion separatelv as to the claims
(-) relating to - claims of recklessness and claims for punitive
(3) damages relating to actions of Captain Hazelwood on the ground
(4) that on the evidence prusunted and that by the appropriate
(5) legal standard any actions of Captain Hazelwood with reference
(6) to leaving the bridge cannot be attributed to Exxon Corporation
(7) for purposes of punitive damage lidbility busause those actions
(8) were not in a requisite degree of direct complicity and as the
(9) record indicates were contrary to the direct practices of Exxon
(10) Shipping Company
(11) Lastly and separately we move for judgment as a matter of (12) law on the ground that the evidence taken as a whole and by
the
(13) appropriate legal standard would not permit a jury verdict of
(14) recklesmess with regard to the Exxon Shipping Company alcohol
(IS) policy, either in general or as applied to the case of Captain (16) Hazelwood
(17) I believe Your Honor that wh can bulter support this
(18) motion with a brief which we would like to submil to the Court
(19) tomorrow As the Court Anows you have the discretion and we
(30) art invilud in suggest to you that some or all pars of this
(21) motion mighi be rustrved for consideration al a latur tume It
(22) is our view that particularly the lirst two grounds of the
(23) motion that I muntioned that is the tham ol impairment -1 m
(24) sorry the claim of Kagan was unqualificd to serve as helmsman
(25) and that that had somi involvement in this action and the claim

\section*{Vol 223941}
(I) that fatigue or deck officer manning practices were a proximate
(2) cause of this aucident are matters which - which it would be
(3) constructive to resolve before submission of the case to the
(4) Jury
(5) We believe that those two points in particular are charly
(6) unsupported and that it would simplify the jury deliberation
(7) process to resolve those matters and instruct the jury
(8) accordingly 1 don 1 say that in derogation of the other
(9) points that I ve made but those two points in particular would
(10) tend to simplify the consideration of the case by the jury
(II) MR CHALOS Your Honor on behalf of Captain
(12) Hazelwood we also move for a directid vurdicion the issue of
(13) negligence \(W_{L}\) do not helicve that the evidence that \(s\) been
(14) presented supports a finding that Captain Hacelwood was
(is) negligent on the night of the grounding particularly in his
(16) luaving the bridgt undur the circumstancts that have been
(17) presented
(18) We also move lor a directed verdict on the issue of
(19) recklessnuss in that Captain Hacclwood sactions on the evening
(20) of the grounding do not rise to the levil of the lugal standard (21) of recklessness
(22) We juin in Exxon s motion with ruspect to the impairment
(23) issue as outlined by Mr Lynch We would also like to reserve
(24) for Captain Hazelwood the opportunity to submit a brief on the
(25) two - on the motions that we have made on the issues of

\section*{Vol 223942}
recklessness and negligence
(1) THE COURT You all sure like to write briefs

MR O NEILL I don t think we need bricfs We were all here and saw the same evidenct The Rule 50 vandard is that there is no lugally sufficient evidentiary basis for a reasonable fury to find for the non moving party on the issue And a jury siting here in this couriroom tor the last three or four weeks can believe or disbelieve the testimony of almost anybodv it chooses io hecsuse most of the witnesses have deviated from past deposition testimony
I want to cllar up one matler with regard to Mr Kagan and their molion boncerning Mr Kazan The plaintiffs don I (13) contend that the assignment of Mr Kagan per se onto the
(1s) vessel provides in and of itself a ground for the award of
(19) punitive damagus Just so we re cluarabout that
(16) Mr Kagan s role as far as we re concerned is a piece of
(17) evidence that at the time the captain made the decision to
(18) leave the bridge hu left it in charge of Cousins and Kagan

191 and Kagan shistory was rulevant to that dutision So Kagan
10. perse is a piece of evidence and to shorteut the legal jargon
' II is not a cause of action 1 guess he saperson but he isn 18
' I cause of action
(1) Our theory with regard to Exxon is that it is liable for
( a) punitive damages bccause Exxon was reckless with regard to
si Hazelwood and secondly because Exxon was reckless because

\section*{Vol 223943}

Hazelwood was its managing agent and his acts his reckless acts were altributable to Exxon
So those are the twn theoriss on the hasis ol the stipulated facts on the basis of statutory violations including the four hour rule the six hour rule the pilotage requirement in 46 USC 8502(a) on the basis of Exxon s general admissions including those of its president and chairman of the board Mr Rawl Mr Raymond Mr Stevens Mr LeGrange In light of the admissions that we presented to the Court and in light of the proot prosented to the Court thert is more than sufficient evidence to consider that Exxon with regard to ether of those thcories was reckless
(19) With regard to Mr Hazelwood a jury could conclude based (14) upon the evidence presented to it in this courtroom that he (15) drank that his drinking caused impaired judgment at or about (16) the time he left the bridge that his leaving the bridge was
(17) cause of the accident and indeed Exxon has stipulated that it

1181 was a proximate cause of the accident He had a 06 (1) a fterwards Thure is evidence that can put him up to 14 drinks
( 0 ) that afternoon af you listen to the bartenders
(1) With regard to manning there is evidence with regard to ( 21 the fact that there was violations to the six on six off
(73) statute - We went through that in great detall with that big
( 4) board There sividence that such violations oceurred
( s) regularly There s cvidence that Exxon did not have a system
(1) in place to ensure compliance with the six on six off
i) requirements
i) With regard to alcohol prool thare salcohol pronf for three and a hall wheh Soall of the motorns with the exccplion of the Kagan motion are in our view after what we ve heard for the last threc and a half walks ill founded and we oppose the motion on the basis of the record and the law
With regard to our rucord and Immoving on to a new
subject we move on both of our theories for judgment as a
matter of law under Rulc 50 and criteria the rucord
ill move on
THE COURT Thank you
MR O NEILL I want to address one question on the
verdist form in some detal!
THE COURT On the what?
MR O NEILL One question that may be on the verdicl form in somb ditall lamgoing to move for iudgment as a matlur ol law undur Rulu 50 that Caplain Ha/elwood was a managing agent of Exxon Corporation And I cite the Protectus Alpha case which we ve all looked at more times than we care to have looked at and the testimony of Paul Myers Lloyd LeCain Frank larossi Mr larossis piece of work surrendering the memories Dantel Paul stestimony Mutch Stalzer s testımony Captain Andre Martineau stestimony and the

\footnotetext{
Vol 223945
testimony of expert Bolton who today described the master of a
chief - as a chief cxecutive officer and chairman of his own
company and deacribed him as a CEO So we move under Rule
for judgment as a matter of law that Captain Hazelwood was the
managing agent of Exxon and we don t believe there sany
evidence to the contrary in the record
So I ve moved for judgment as a matter of law under Rule 50
based upon the record and the applicable law againat Exxon
Corporation Exxon Shipping Company under both theories on
claims of rubhlussnuss I move against Captain Hazelwood with
regard to nugliginte and Caplain Hazilworod with regard to
recklessneas and I thinh my record 8 complete
Thank you Judge
THE COURT Mr Lynch?
MR LYNCH Your Honor we oppose that motion
MR CHALOS 1 join in the opposition
MR LYNCH I really hadn iprepared to meet it but I would like to say one thing with regard to the fatigue aspect of Mr O Neill s comments and that is that his claim in this case is necessarily a clam based on recklessness conscious disregard of the known risks
The six hour rule a Coast Guard regulation put in at the turn of the contury as Mr O Neill has said as part of a labor issue rulating to the loading activilics of mates in port I
think the eviduncl on that issul does not by any atretch of
}

Vol 223946
(1) the imagination rise to the level of recklessness but (2) moreover \(t\) doesn \(t\) seem to me to have anything to do with the
(3) question of whether the - the activities and actions of Third
(4) Mate Gregory Cousins on the night of the grounding were or were
(5) not caused by a state of fatigue That statute doesn \(t\) -
6) doesn t guarantee rest The plainiffs own expert indicated
7) that you could be in full compliance with that rule and in a
(8) very advanced state of fatigue
(9) The absolutely uncontradicted testimony of everybody who
(10) saw Mr Cousins and Mr Cousins himself was that he was well
(II) rested The record is that he had ten hours of sleep in the (12) preceding 23 more than the amount that the plaintiffs expert
(13) says is necessary to meet the adequate sleep needs of the
(14) average person So there s no testimony other than pure
(1S) speculation that fatugue played any role in this grounding
(16) Now whether the plaintiffs agree with the procedures that
(17) were used for the six hour rule or not the six hour rule is
(18) basically a red herring I go into that because as I said
(19) that is one issue which we do strongly feel would well be out
(20) of the case before the matter is submitied to the jury
(21) As to the other matters we do wish to submit a brief
(22) aithough I gather that Your Honor is not particularly anxious
(23) to have one and I d like to defer a more detailed discussion
(24) on the record on the other points to something we could submat
( g\()\) in writing

Vol 223948
1) instructions but - but basically what I mean to do is to
(2) leave ali of these issues for the jury to deal with hopefully
(3) with proper instructions
) MR LYNCH Thanh you Your Honor Ithink one minor 5) point that doesn thave to be dealt with now but \(I\) think it is
6) important that we confirm that that \(s\) on the underatanding that
7) Mr O Neill \(s\) concession that there is no claim made with
relation to the assignment of Mr Kagan is - is included in
your comment
THE COURT Oh well I-
MR O NEILL I meant what I said
THE COURT I heard that but - but -
MR LYNCH I had made a motion on that ground and you
were technically denying it and Mr O Neill Ithink had
conceded that there s no claim for punitive damages made as to the assignment of Robert Kagan
THE COURT Well 1 guess I m denying at because I
expect you all to talk about the role that Mr Kagan played in this thing and I don tmean - I don \(t\) wish to by ruhing on
) the motion to preempt anyone from talking about Mr Kagan s
role in the case So I don think I should grant a motion on
(22) \(1 t\)
(23) MR O NEILL Thank you Judge
(24) THE COURT But I understand what you re saying that
(25) there is no claim cause of action based upon the assignment

\section*{Vol 223949}
(1) of Kagan to the vessel per se
(2) MR O NEILL Per se that s correct but we are going (3) to talk about Mr Kagan
(4) MR LYNCH Similar to the Coast Guard - thank you
(5) Your Honor
(6) THE COURT Anything else we need to talk about now?
(7) MR O NEILL No sir
(8) THE COURT Okay You all are going to take a close
(9) look at your - your exhibit lists so that you know that when
(10) you are arguing you re talking about exhibits that have been
(11) admutted and not multiple many many things that you ve got
(12) that were identified but not admitted
(13) MR O NEILL Yes sir
(14) MR LYNCH Even more importantly the ones that we
(15) have are the same ones that were admitted by those numbers
(16) THE COURT That would be nice too
(17) We 11 be in recess now for this case until 800 Monday
(18) morning but I will be seeing counsel on instructiona
(19) (Recess at 220 pm )

Vol 223950
Vol 223952
(1) INDEX
; DIRECT EXAMINATION OF HARVEY BORGEN (Live) 3713
, BY MR NEAL 3713
CROSS EXAMINATION OF HARVEY BORGEN 3722

BY MR O NEILL 3722
REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF HARVEY BORGEN
3728
BY MR NEAL
3728
(11) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DOUG LARSEN (Live)

3730
(12) BY MR NEAL 3730

141 CROSS EXAMINATION OF DOUG LARSEN 3740
(15) BY MR O NEILL 3740
(17) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF DOUG LARSEN 3746
18: BYMR NEAL 3747
(ㅇ) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GRADY T SHEARER (Live) 3748
, BY MR SANDERS 3748
(n) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GRADY T SHEARER 3756
A BYMR O NEILL

\section*{Vol 223951}

\section*{(") REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF GRADY T SHEARER} 3762
1) BY MR SANDERS 3762
(4) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAMES ROUSE (Live) 3765
(9) BYMR LYNCH

CROSS EXAMINATION OF JAMES ROUSE
3816
18) BYMR O NEILL

101 REDIRECT EYAMINATION OF JAMES ROUSE 3840
(1) BY MR LYNCH
(13) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAY BOLTON (Live) 3845
(14) BY MR CHALOS
(16) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JAY BOLTON
(19) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF JAY BOLTON 3930
(20) BY MR CHALOS
\begin{tabular}{|c|c|}
\hline (1) EXHIBITS & \\
\hline 1) 9182 offered & 3779 \\
\hline (3) 9181 olfured & 3801 \\
\hline (4) 9181 offered & 3808 \\
\hline (5) 3683 offered & 3825 \\
\hline (6) 3918 offered & 3827 \\
\hline (7) 3683 oftered & 3827 \\
\hline (8) 3617 offered & 3829 \\
\hline (9) 2478 offered & 3935 \\
\hline (10) 3809 offered & 3936 \\
\hline (12) 9182 received & 3775 \\
\hline (13) 9181 received & 3801 \\
\hline (14) 9181 received & 3809 \\
\hline (15) 3918 received & 3827 \\
\hline (16) 3683 recelved & 3828 \\
\hline (17) 3617 recelved & 3829 \\
\hline 1812478 raleived & 3935 \\
\hline (191 3809 recelved & 3937 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

\section*{Vol 22 3943}
(1) STATE OF ALASKA )
(2) Reporter s Certificate
(3) DISTRICT OF ALASKA)
(6) I Joy S Brauer a Registered Professional
(7) Reporter and Notary Public
(8) DO HERBY CERTIFY
9) That the foregoing transcripl contains a true and
(10) accurate transcriplion of my shorthand notes of all requested
(lil matters held in the foregoing eaplioned case
(1) Furthur that the transuript was preparad by me
(13) or under my direction
(14) DATED this day
(1s) of 1994
(21) JOY S BRAUER RPR

Notary Public for Alaska
3912(22) My Commission Expires 51097

\section*{Look-See Concordance} Report

UNIQUE WORDS \(\mathbf{3 , 2 3 9}\)
TOTAL OCCURRENCES 16,139
NOISE WORDS 385
TOTAL WORDS In FILE 50,003

SINGLE FILE CONCORDANCE

\section*{Case sensitive}

NOISE WORD LIST(S)
NOISE NOI
INCLUDES ALL TEXT OCCURRENCES

IGNORES PURE NUMBERS
WORD Ranges © Bottom of Page
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline -1- \\
\hline 1000 [5] 378914386412 \\
\hline 1538651011 \\
\hline 1016 [1] 378915 \\
\hline 1124 [2] \(387415 \quad 387515\) \\
\hline 1130 [2] 38751222 \\
\hline 1153 [1] 389315 \\
\hline \(1155[1] 389313\) \\
\hline 1157 [1] 386324 \\
\hline 1216111386325 \\
\hline 1228 |11 3909 / \\
\hline 15th |11 38288 \\
\hline 1735-Alpha [1] 387817 \\
\hline 1980s |1| 383] 7 \\
\hline 120 (1) 39128 \\
\hline 123 [1] 39128 \\
\hline -2- \\
\hline 20th (1] 377019 \\
\hline 21st (1] 38264 \\
\hline 23rd [2] 381356 \\
\hline 24th [1] 391220 \\
\hline 26th [1] 389524 \\
\hline 200111393522 \\
\hline 202111393815 \\
\hline \(22011 \mid 394919\) \\
\hline - 3- \\
\hline 30th (1) 37546 \\
\hline 3M [1] 383024 \\
\hline -5- \\
\hline 5-10-97 [1] 395322 \\
\hline 5th [3] \(392117 \quad 2021\) \\
\hline -6- \\
\hline 60s 111376917 \\
\hline -8- \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

80s [1] 3779 )
800 [3] 37122393722
394917
\(830[1] 371210\)
844 [1] 374010
855 [1] 374010
-9-
9/11/85 [1] 3828 I5
90s 11137555
\(900|2| 386410 \quad 13\)
\(-\mathbf{A}\)
A-B 1139062
am m [6] 37122374010
37891415386324
A89-0095 [1] 37126
AA [5] \(378020 \quad 378811\)
38032538044380613
abatement [1] 38302
abeam [10] 38881038924
389863913172339197
103920739216392224
abilities [1] 38561
ability 12 ] \(3825 \quad 18 \quad 3855 \quad 11\)
able 177 \(377120 \quad 37728\)
385514387310388324
\(389219 \quad 390718\)
abnormal [1] 39026
abnormalitues [1] 374717
aboard [12] 371924372011
2237291237431038196
383621384721384925
3861193936539395
abrupt (1) 381921
absent [1] 3882 21
Absolutely [8] 37374
373810378615378722
\(380818 \quad 383313384425\)
absolutely 14137365
37842037852439469
abstunence |ऽ| 3832538339
abuse (16) 37332337436
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3774 & 18 & 3778 & 16 & 3782517\end{array}\)
2037831337932223
3795638068381415
382125382210
abuser [1] 383616
abusers [1] 381717
academics 11 | 379521
academies [1] 38469
Academy [3] 371324
373113 37436
academy 111384620
accept |4| \(3838 \quad 18 \quad 383920\) \(385511 / 4\)
acceptance (2) 381212
accepted [3] 38521922
385316
accident [19] 3766737692
3809838131138381
384015385923386046
389514390412390515
163906339114639412
39431718
Accidents |11 38614
decomplish 111380313
according |1| 3840 II
account ||| 37976
accurate [3] \(39276 \quad 12\)
395310
accurately [1] 39152
accuse [1] 377525
accused [1] 37988 accuser [1] 383620 achueving [1] 386025 acquaintances [1] 37395 acquainted [1] 38108
Act [2] 38092038147
act [3] 377214380921 39396
acted [1] 391110
actung [1] 390616
action [18] 37851638075
38081638124381816
1438191618,382018
3826 18, 3842 3, 21389416
39402539422122394825
actrons [9] 390822391011
393015393924394035
739411939463
actuve [5] 37202376614
38528385714388216
actuvitues [9] 374723
376073770737777
37936392920394524
39463
actavity (4) 37192238008
38121384324
acts [2] 3943 I 2
actual (3) 373511378221
38099
acutely (1] 392725
adapted [1] 376810
add [2] 37937392416
added [2] 3795139036
addition (1] 378924
additional [4] 3747937937
3809739479
Address 11137305
address [9] 3713837303
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3748 & 4 & 3765 & 11 & 13 & 377918\end{array}\) 37805384518394414
addressed [1] 382914
adequate [3] 378117
393925394613
adjustments [1] 376819 adminstering [1] 376710
administration [1] 3860 21
Admiral (5) 38722223
3873238934391118
admuralty (1] 38516
admıssions [2] 394379
admitted [21] 3754 / 37759
37761737832537865

3819638272138283
38297384323390010
3935133937339491112 15
admitting [1] 38443
adopted [3] 37742381018 381321
adoptung [1] 381019
advance \([3] 38081238656\) 7
advanced [1] 39468
advancing [1] 38523
advantage (1) 381117
adverse [2] 376561385414 adversely [1] 384123 advice [23] 377410377725 37782337807101725 37813380283803919

2338041611380814 \(383517 \quad 2038361518\) 3843838761038832 advise [7] 38461138646 3899173902239251517 392813
advised [7] \(373318 \quad 22\)
3786738006386523
38795392816
advising [1] 373513
advisors [1] 37783
advisory [3] 37831039013
392619
Affars [1] 37969
affairs [2] \(3765 \quad 23 \quad 37961\)
affect [3] 37766382112
38407
affecting [1] 384123
affects [1] 37765
affiliate [1] 379610
affilsated [3] 376814377021
affiliates [1] 376811
afrand [2] 38003388511
aftercare [5] 3724237794
6382822383214
afternoon [4] 373420
39121314394320
afterwards [2] 379015 ,
394319
agency [1] 371817
agent [8] 371922373515
3736837372238624
39431394420,39455
agents [1] 374612
agree [23] 3718 5, 382921
38352538364386617
387116173873138772
3881115388813389113
15391117391223
3918143925143929710
39305394616
agreed [6] 37188380924
38322038896391313
392518
agreement [4] 388489
38895393418
aground [2] \(385825 \quad 391122\)
alds [1] 391122
almed [1] 380125
arrine [6] \(381421 \quad 381525\)
381613817235
arplane (1) 38681
Alamar [1] 38625
Alaska [2] 38968395321
Alaskarr [1] 38493
albett [1] 37382
alcohoinc [10] 37363

38222038405916
Alcoholes [1] 38168
alcoholics [8] 37432025
374433822142125
38231383317
alcoholism [19] 37625
37708377325377427
\(1522377523377610 \quad 12\)
3780938052338084
3814233824438324
3833839363
alert [2] 39027390822
Aleutuans [1] 391524
allegation [1] 39394
allegations [1] 382014
Alleed (I] 383024
allow (5) 37216384045 1539068
allowed [3] \(374312 \quad 383613\)
ałone [1] 387223
dlongside [1] 386814
Alpha (1) 394421
alter [1] 387523
alternate [3] 37151937199
373318
altogether [1] 38689
America (1] 380819
Amoco [2] \(383018 \quad 21\)
amount [4] 3878638993
390714394612
ample [I] 38765
analogy [1] 37604
analysis (8) 380423
38122338662438679
38932022389424
analyst [2] 37141619
analyze [1] 384221
anchor [4] 37251337414
389413390511
anchors [1] 37415
Andre [2] 37506394425
Andy [3] 371522371614
Angeles [3] \(3718 \quad 18 \quad 3732 \quad 16\) 18
angles [1] 389219
announcement [1] 380822
Anonymous [1] 38169
anonymous (1) 383811
answer [21] 372718
37442437451738258
383361238342390610
391325391721392020
233921151939221512
153924143933822
answers 111372715
anxюus [1] 394622
Anybody [1] 373010
anybody (12) 37309
373814373917374215
3763110379516383523
385713902239384
39429
anymore \(\{2\) | 37537375712
anywhere [3) 37588
387916388012
apex [4] \(3887713 \quad 20\)
389117
Apparently [1] 383519
apparently [5] 378016
3893233894101539113
appear [2] 379923385423
Appeared [1] 383123
appeared (7) 372116
372420380222389015
391321391618
appears [3] 382525
386519388319
applicable [6] 377014
378625378846739458 application [1] 378919
appled [2] \(379518 \quad 394015\)
applies [1] 38652
apply [3] 37844378716 37882
approach [6] 375321
37701638001113
389021390812
approaching [1] 389614
appropriate [18] 38031
38042316380711
38083615382014
3826213840133939310

approval [1] 38265
approve [2] \(3835 \quad 10 \quad 11\)
Approximately [1] 374816
approxmately [7] 37323
3733137832438472
388853920639215
April [1] 378324
arc [1] 38973
archrtecture [1] 38543
Arco [4] 3878161923
area \([26] 3718 \quad 18 \quad 37269\)
3732413373524374117
379753801538121
38141738268383918 3872624253873919
38801838885390415
391125391315391419
392720392824393416
areas [10] 376719381219
38532438541238611
387120388017388824
389223
aren't (4) 37122137571
38381238615
arguing [2] \(394718 \quad 394910\)
argument [1] 394720
arguments [3] \(393716 \quad 23\)
3938 IO
arise [1] 3913 11
Army (4) \(376614 \quad 15\)
39042539053
arrival [1] 3735 /1
arrivals [1] 37342
art [5] 377917378024
380913381323
artacles (I) 39382
ashore [5] \(37218 \quad 372711\)
3742173864622
aside [1] 381410
asking (10) \(3729 \quad 10 \quad 3755 \quad 18\)
37576382624383415
38825391220392325
392417393610
aspect [5] \(377520 \quad 37841\)
379912380921394518
aspects [2] \(373413 \quad 3736 \quad 11\) assess (3) \(385525 \quad 393717\)
assessed [3] 3870638821
389719
assessing [1] 387516
assessment [1] 383016
assigned [3] 374219
37612439365
assignment [13] 375325
375433789438246711
3936131739395394213
\(39488 \quad 16 \quad 25\)
assignments [1] 376619
assistance [1] 379624
assistant [4] 373125
37371037663386810
associated [2] 3745937468

Assocration (1) 377819
Assume [1] 38817
assume [11] 37237372718
3732237446380522
385510386524390423
3921739231418
assumed III 37965
assumption [5] 376822
3865123903939154
39243
assurance [3] 3781/16
38023388418
assure [11 38553
assured (5) \(372117 \quad 377713\)
378714378822385812
astronomy [1] 38543
attached [1] 377210
attack [2] \(379125 \quad 390321\)
attempted (1) 39298
attend (4) \(3732 \quad 16373517\)
373610379015
attendance |11 37854
attended \(|5| 38011 / 38044\)
384618 38512 7
attending (4) 373513
3736937916380325
attention [14] 37208
\(373220 \quad 375422375510\)
3759222325377114
37805380119380924
382011384224384319
attested [1] 38934
attutude [1] 390420
attributable [1] 39432
attributed [1] 39406
augment [1] 38104
August [8] 371579
\(3718 / 33733 / 5810\) 38099
authored [1] 386317
authorities [1] 38734
authority (1) 386316
auto (1) 39269
automatically [1] 377215
autopilot (7) \(387913 \quad 38805\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllll}7 & 14 & 24 & 3881 & 1617\end{array}\)
avalable \([81377412 \quad 13\)
37922138131438142
38681038862390025
average [2] \(387233946 / 4\)
avoid [3] \(382018 \quad 382624\)
390123
avorded [2] \(3826 \quad 19 \quad 39308\)
award [3] 38601339396
394214
awards [1] 386020
aware \(\begin{array}{lllllll}421 & 3725 & 16 & 17 & 21\end{array}\)
37372137418913
3742163743202437443
37461375143758811
37602137781038051
38195710383714
\(3838612 \quad 15 \quad 386525\)
38781388068391417
391725391867392714
1521232425392868 19
awareness [9] 3743618
3783141937931821
3794237956383612
azmuth [1] 3897 1


Conoordaras by Loot-Sec(66)
\(-\cdots\) - B -

B-O-L T O-N [1] 384520
bachelor [2] 371325
3766 II
backdrop (1) 37457
background [9] 371323
374353752123766310
380419384617385523
391719
backgrounds [11 376714
backup 15138672125
\(3868 / 619\)
bag (II 38309
balance 14| 37752337761
37812238377
ballast [1] 37357
bar 16137251637416
3762 /8 3805 11 3806 I
393712
Barbara |l| 3732 /3
barbiturates |11 382219
bargain |2| 38122538131
bargaining [1] 37674
barge [1] 371420
barrels [1] 389214
barrier [2] 388820
barriers [3] 38881921
3889 II
bartenders [1] 394320
base [5] 38145385713
3884101138947
Based [5] 3884138915
38932238965389711
based [31] 37541937736
377521379010381313
38141123822838255
383824384343859516
3864133881438855
3886 IS 389324390121
390863915439211415
\(3927113939423 \quad 394313\)
3945820394825
bastc (2) 379219386424
Bascally [1] 390619
bascally \([8] 37938 \quad 379413\)
37971237981338709
38841339461839481
basis |14| 3718237703
37778380219380711
38081638151138226
38843394253943346
39447
Baytown [3] 373214
37482537513 _
\(\begin{array}{lllll}\text { Beach [24] } 3718 & 16 & 18 & 21\end{array}\)
243725573730637328
917182237334373417
37356373818373923
3740137411374611
3759101138051314
beach [1] 386425
Bear [3] 38542138599
38634
bearing [I] 3897 I
Beaumont [1] 374819
becomes [3] 377914
385424386916
becoming [3] 371322
38591039012
beer [12] 37214567

372624372710373421
2237411837632338063 380718
beers \(161372519 \quad 3741\) II 37421214376023 3761/ beg [1] 391919
behalf [S] 376893832 I 386612393818394111 behavior [4] 37191337706 37821538035
behavioral [1] 3734 I
behind [1] 393710
belleve [45] 37278373420
3736233754137754
378921380110381615
381873826438313
384167103861838659
103870183876813
38781538831838895
38912238934390024
3901103903639079
391010391321391511
39161639171139209
39318393619393819
394017394151339428
39455394719 22
believed (2] 3765 / 379217
beheves (1) 380522
belong (11) 38167
belonged 11137935
Ben \([2] 393525393618\) benefit [2] 3767 I/ 38586
benefits 11013715737679
37892237901618
\(379110 \quad 20 \quad 37921215\)
Benicta [3] \(3749 \quad 11 \quad 12 \quad 15\)
Berry [1] 371310
beverage [1] 37363
bigger [3] 385043890410
buggest [2] 3858339041
billion |11 381718
bit [19] 37129371524
37352037361437385
378783807243846716
243847638563388119
3895223896338992
3907910393816
bits \(\{5 \mid 388215388925\)
3890 I 7391321
Blandford 111390219
blank [1] 376825
blatantly [1] 3929 /5
Bligh [17] \(388913 \quad 15\)
38902038911317
3897253901102139121
213913539156712
391610391917393216
Blighton 1113853 II
broodstream |2| 381112
381216
blue [2| 3793103800 I
blunt \(|1| 375520\)
blush 11] 385322
board (25) 371923373524 374391838461438549 2538602538612138628 38643491521386569 387071215389925 3903243943824
Boarded [1] 373515
boarded [8| 3719 /]

37352237361373922
37461837556
boarding [11 374610
boat |l| 385310
Bob |l| 374219
body [1] 38722
boldly [1] 39274
bolsters [1] 388221
BOLTON [3] 384523
391211393012
Bolton [12] 3845142025
38531238611538642
38715387312391023
39121339301439451
bond (3) 38713388219
388518
book (2) 37728384217
books [1] 371412
booms (1) 39049
BORGEN [3] 3713 /3
37226372824
Borgen \([32] 37133\) 9, 15,

373410233736737375
373913203745637504
3751233752637531013
\(37541318 \quad 37551137562\)
\(13 \quad 16 \quad 19 \quad 375721 \quad 375816\)
13
bosses |1| 393310
bottle |2| 37632025
Bounty \(|3| 38533638638\)
bounty \(\{2 \mid 38538\)
boutaques 11 13741 15
box [2] \(386218 \quad 19\)
Boy (1) 385924
boy (1] 371310
brakes [1] 379920
brand [1] 386122
BRAUER [1] 3953 21
break (4) \(374913 \quad 37899\)
38631921
breakdown [2] 3841 1619
breath |5| 37641012
38228383312
brewing II 391523
Bran |11 3826 /5
brief 110137662439027
39352123394018
3941243946213947128
briefly [4] \(371413 \quad 372313\)
37265376910
briefs [4] 39422339476
10
bringing \(121374512 \quad 376713\) broad |4| 378314384420 385713392910
broadly |1] 3793 /8
broken 111379125
Brooklyn |4| 3878 / 620 3879 I
brother 11137763
Browns [1] 384520
BRT [1] 38454
bunkers [1] 37201 buoy [6] 385824388913
163890203891817
Burns [2] 37301819
Busby |16| 388716 2]
388810233891738924
389713898239131723

3919103920739216
39222439237393421
Busmess [1] 377813
busmess [11] 37145
374819377814377924
379773816538602518
38617391610
Butch [2] 37617
button [1] 386724
bypasses [1] 38683
\begin{tabular}{ll}
\hline\(-\quad-C-\) \\
\hline C-O-R-A-L [1] 3730
\end{tabular}
cabin [4] 376416392410
392515393111
calculations [1] 389316
Calufornua [9] 371816
373063731131337326
93748637499
Call [2] 37124374115
calling [3] \(3732 \quad 13 \quad 16\)
385415
calls [10] 375353757910
\(\begin{array}{lllll}12 & 13 & 15 & 18 & 3845 \\ 14\end{array}\)
38608387522
calm [1] 390714
campus [1] 3793 12

25,3905235
capabilitues [1] 38926
capability [5] 38562
385813386216386716
390621
capactty [4] 374310
3766131438482
Cape [1] 391513
cape [1] 39157
captanug [2] \(391715 \quad 19\)
captans \([10] 3716\) II
\(373422388515 \quad 391617\)
3917133918 / 821
393324
captioned [1] 3953 /1
care [5] 37121337286
37358383819394421
career [5] 38323384814
3860839031720
careful [2] \(38238 \quad 383119\)
carefully [3] 38237382518
38427
cargo [8] 38472138516
3892143904579390511
Carlos [1] 37428
Carr [2] 37422376019
carried [5] 38943389912
390015390713
carrier [1] 385112
carries (1) 39047
carry [3] 3772938844
39048
cascade (1) 378319
case [491 3712 6, 1437733
37742437769378514
37871337896379012
37911938022380317
3804143810818381810
11383225383718

38521038564386916
387014390219391025

393322
39351939376,91418
39382347394015
3941310394421394520
3946203947 22, 394821
394917395311
cases [9] 379153832 I
\(38421618 \quad 24385816\) 388220388413390911 casually [1] 37394
casualtues [2] 39031621
casualty [6] 38611011
3903193906725390716 catastrophic [2] 38382 384015
caught [2] 382023
causation [1] 393925
caused [4] 3820 10, 391025
39431539465
cautioned [1] 392710
Center [3] 38732239002
3927 11
central [1] 37381
century (11 394523
CEO [2] 38662039453
CEOs [1] 377814
CERTIFY [1] 39538
cetera [2] 37206373515
chain [3] 37261337867
37988
chair [1] 385912
chairman [4] 377817
3853243943739452
challenges [1] 38007
CHALOS [41] 373018
3845112438531218
386318386413875578
38871012390081115
1739066939081214

2239124393013393313
15183934139351369
1539372
394111394516
Chalos 16 ] 37121623
39135391811392921
393819
chance [4] 37406386811
38772038784
chances [1] 377214
change [19] 37501837932
38401819387723
38782338791638931
13390013905139229
39241159251922392814 39316
changed [7] 379222
381120385311386410 1119387519
changes \([18] 376819\)
37931153794111417
3809791416381326 382053878232438792 39258393021
changing [4] 38112324
3879822
channel [3] \(38693 \quad 15\)
388819
charge [4] \(3837 / 1 / 23\)
38406394218
charges [1] 37815
chart [15] \(3821 \quad 1638261\) 382913387312387413
38781038874638974
2122389816391223 3920839343
charts [1] 382525
check [15] 372425375124
375261037801838072 16181938122438187 389316393610
checked [5] 375336
38621839241239258
checking [3] 3746 11
387010
cheerleader [1] 385516
Chesapeake [1] 390413
Chef [I] 38566
chief [9] 37316,374123
384752225,38482
38532339452
chuld [3] 387367390617
chooses [1] 39429
chore [1] 385525
chose [2] 389718
chosen [1] 378623
Chuck [2] 374123376014
chunks [1] 38902
cugar [1] 373017
Cindy [1] 376513
Curcle 11371310
carcles [1] 38887
cracumstances [15] 379024
379117381917382013
3822438337383718
3881238854389520
39084839211539334
394116
crite [1] 394420
Civil [I] 37126
claım [10] \(393823 \quad 39393\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3940 & 23 & 24 & 25 & 3945 & 19 & 20\end{array}\)
394871525
clams [6] 393824393923
394012394510
clarify [2] 38421939227
Clark [13] \(38574 \quad 5 \quad 385919\) \(203866123871 / 1138746\) 711387619388115 38881239315
classufy [2] 37861138001 clean [9] 3718.2372358 37512537596377214 3785837861738316 clear [12] 37579380716 387810387921388110 388413389921391122 392253934639421115 clearance [2] 37357386914 clears [1] 39292 CLERK [i8] 3712337134 71237292537302 374011374725374837 376571015378913 3845151722386323 clerk [1] 38363
Clupper [9] 3725817 374171425376022 376219380512380717 clipper [1] 376222 clockwork [1] 373813 closer [6] 37385380724
\(388825 \quad 3890111639134\) closest [1] 389021
closung [2] \(393715 \quad 23\)
co-located [1] 372613
co-workers [1] 380718
coach [2] \(3782 \quad 11 \quad 3855 \quad 15\)
Coast [9] 3714237467
38552438621738733
38935391124394522
39494
coast [49] \(371421 \quad 371589\) \(\begin{array}{llllllll}10 & 17 & 18 & 3716 & 5 & 371717\end{array}\) \(\begin{array}{lllllllll}25 & 3718 & 6 & 37194 & 372213\end{array}\)
37234372723137313121
\(373415 \quad 24 \quad 373718\)
\(374023 \quad 374718 \quad 374967\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}37501 & 4 & 9 & 10 & 13 & 22 & 25\end{array}\)
\(3751722 \quad 375212 \quad 375312\) 16375425
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}37571 & 3 & 4 & 71718\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{llll}37598 & 3760 & 12 \quad 38209\end{array}\)
38495
coat [1] 3931 II
cocaine [2] 3811111383218
codification [1] 37714
coffin (1] 391113
cold [1] 379816
collar [2] \(379310 \quad 38001\)
colleague [2] 37599376014
collectave [1] 37674
College [1] 384619
college [2] \(371324 \quad 379312\)
collasion [1] 390521
collswns [5] 3852 11
386114390052139011
color [1] 392823
Columbsa (1) 389011
combined [I] 38009
comfortable [9] 3739910
\(378121 \quad 3884141938866\)
1011389113
comfortably [1] 38996
coming [26] 372725
3733202137357373617
\(374310 \quad 374611374817\)
\(375316 \quad 377719379311\)
38223382322385010
\(3858 \quad 18 \quad 22 \quad 387023\)
\(388719 \quad 388819389312\)
389663903139057
3914193917131392820
command [15] 372613
\(373993840163848 \quad 10\)
385313863738942
\(3901 \quad 13 \quad 15 \quad 39029391612\)
\(\begin{array}{llll}14 & 15 & 3917 & 20\end{array}\)
commandant [2] 38732 38935
Commander [1] 391013
commence [1] 389318
comment [9] 377223

38736389312391714
39489
comments [3] 38148
\(382210 \quad 394519\)
commerce [1] 38525
Commission [1] 395322
commession [2] 37141
376614
commitment [1] 371225
commits [1] 378918
committed [4] 379817
380123382210383320
Committee [1| 3778 13
committee [14] 37151
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3778 & 15 & 18 & 3783 & 16 & 38126\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}17 & 19 & 21 & 3813 & 9814 & 18\end{array}\)
3816638262382815
384019
common [15] 380610
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}3814 & 12 & 16 & 19 & 3816 & 9 & 12\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllll}14 & 18 & 20 & -3837 & 38615\end{array}\)
3867153886739012
commonly [1] 382915
communicate [2] 389219
39016
communicated [1] 39132
communicating [1] 391310
communication [2] 39028
\(3913 / 3\)
communcations |13|
\(373512 \quad 37469387321\)
\(38747387712 \quad 2538784\)
3879538811939016
39122439262224
companies [46] \(37148 \quad 14\)

\(377920 \quad 21 \quad 23 \quad 378022\)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3783 & 5 & 22 & 3795 & 22 & 37974\end{array}\)
\(9 \quad 10 \quad 15 \quad 379812 \quad 3800910\)
\(380210 \quad 13 \quad 380922\)
\(381320 \quad 23 \quad 24381413\)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3816 & 9 & 13 & 14 & 3817 & 18\end{array}\)
38267113827238302
\(183831238441018 \quad 20\)
\(\begin{array}{lllll}21 & 3845 & 2 & 4 & 586019\end{array}\)
38635
Company [24] 371318
\(371510 \quad 373025 \quad 373135\)

376836376911377014
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3793 & 25 & 3794 & 9810 & 10 & 18\end{array}\)
\(381813 \quad 38365615\)
3940101439459
compare [6] \(383018 \quad 38632\)
3871193878438929
39077
comparison [1] 387123
compelling [1] 39223
compensation [2] 376789
competency [3] 38554
38581139117
competent [1] 387022 competituve [1] 383017
complete [2] 379419
394512
completely [2] 37364
382222
completes [1] 39378
completing [1] 37467
complex [1] 389215
complance [2] 39441
39467
complicity ||| 39408
comphed [1] 380921
component [1] 392625
components [1] 392623
comports [1] 388021
comprehensive [2] 376921 386311
con [1] 38854
conceded [1] 394815
concentrated [1] 387925
concept [7] 37982380025
381131381321381418
38221524
concepts |1| 381222
concern [4] 37991380624
3841 /1 392217
concerned [18] 37221
\(372915 \quad 3740 \quad 24 \quad 379212\)
37934379810 II 379922

\(386720 \quad 38776 \quad 389415\)
\(3896143922 \quad 13 \quad 394216\)
concerning [7] 374510
\(3751711 \quad 375310 \quad 377722\)
37808394212
concerns [6] 38241023
3825538416838957
concesswn [1] 39487
conclude 13138847
393910394313
concluded [7] 377418
38121116382412

concludes [1] 393518
conclusion [81 37281
\(377310 \quad 377725 \quad 380215\)
1938041638412389515
Concord [1] 37499
condition [3] 377221
37957384225
condituons [1] 385415
conduct [8] 3737237388
1538419388224388325
39292539307
conductung [1] 389323
conference [2] \(372220 \quad 25\)
conferred [1] 38937
confidence [3] 37989
38822138959
confident 12138841938857
confidentual [1] 37392
confidentashty (1) 379617
confined [1] 38726
confirm [|| 39486
conficting |1| 387423
confront \([3] \begin{array}{llllll}3820 & 5 & 15 & 16\end{array}\)
confronted [4] 37214
3820111438677
confronting [1] \(3821 \quad 17\)
confused [2] \(378418 \quad 39227\)
confusron [1] 38412
congested [2] 38801618
conjure [t] 388921
Connectrut [l] 384521
connectron [4] 380822
3810822384114
conscious [1] 394520
consensus [1] 392225
consequentıal [2] \(3855 \quad 12\) 14
consider [8] 371517
\(3745 \quad 13 \quad 378020 \quad 37817\)
3807 II 3870438733
3943 II
consideration [4] 37981
\(393322 \quad 394021 \quad 394110\)
consideratrons [3] 377521
381623
considered [7] 37972223

Bene Sytume Appication
381114381213384110
3869239364
considerng [1] \(3896 / 8\) consistent [6] 37835
3860223908223910 11 391412 IS
console [1] 393710 constructuve [1] 39413 construed 12138121415
consult [1] 379621 consultant [1] 38463
consulted [1] 37833
Consultung [1] 38464
consultung [1] 38465
consume [1] 3839 11
consuming (1) 380519
consumption [1] 393920 contact (3) 373615379267
contamed [1] 376423
contamer [1] 376423
contains [1] 39539
contemplate [1] 380525
contemplated (3) 388458
38875
contemplatung [3| 375122
37562238837
contend [1] 394213
context [6] 38262021
38331338369389225
39295
contunuation 11\(] 37126\) contunue [5] \(378853812 / 8\)
38822538832023
continued [1] 37954
continumg [3] 37738
379110380215
contunuous [1] 38473
contunuously (1) 374917
contractor [2] \(379612 \quad 20\)
contracts [2] \(376918 \quad 37713\)
contrary 14] 388512
3930173940939456
contrast [1] 390623
contribute [1] 3777 IS
control (2) \(373643892 / 3\)
controlled III 390425
converging 1113892 /8
conversation 1471371513
\(21223716 / 292122\)
371713172137193
37201437212182325
372211122437233
37241337284372914
3733111637348375111
1419375312481015 375481016
1937562537581215
3838103936711
conversations \(|6| 3728\) /]
\(3753 / 33756 / 52023\)
39362
convinced II 375716
cook [1] 3855 /3
coordinator \(111372 / 20\)
cope [I] 38606
copied [1] 3829 /I
copy [4] 3800 16 \(3801 / 2\)
38263382910
Coral [1] 37305
cord [1] 385412
Cordova [1] 393024
core [1] 375623
corner (3] 3890539059
39167
corporate [1] 378116
Corporation [14] 37317

\(3836 / 238401011\)
38482339406394420
39459
corporation 191371423
\(3768910 \quad 20 \quad 379610\)
38031738101920382816
Corps [2] 39042539053
correctly [3] 38132391313
392618
cost [1] 381717
costs (1) 371412
Counsel [1] 3938 /4
counsel [7] \(372713 \quad 374423\)
378153782123937914
394918
counseled [1] 37814
counseling [3] 3783 /1
\(379619 \quad 38168\)
counselors [1] 37962
counterpart [2] 371717
37234
country [1] 377815
County (1] 37324
couple [13] 371422372518
37411137421214
37602325376253766 22,
\(3812193846 \quad 20385823\)
\(3906 /\)
course 144 | \(374313 \quad 378210\)
1619378322384221
3851838688387523
38762021387723
38781423243879126
921388110388813,22
23388934389225
38931238941638956
389716390720391925
\(392293924: 39251922\)
\(243928 \quad 1439302139316\)
courses [2] 385127 7
Court 113137124372020
3740 I/ 374723378913
383083863233939115
\(394018 \quad 193943910\)
court [4] 37772377825
38521519
courtroom [6] 371212
37729383217389419
39427394314
courts [3] \(37981421 \quad 38122\)
cover [4] \(37228 \quad 377210\)
37901838642
covered 131372210
37872437904
coworkers 111377715
cranes [1] 390410
crashing (1) 3905 12
crazy |11 38336
crew |18| 3717437217
\(3725 / 8 \quad 3727 / 1373589\)
\(37419 \quad 15 \quad 19 \quad 374210\)
3760213854 21, 385513
21 3860243864638653
390815
criteria [1] 3944 1]
critucal [1] 3799 11
critucism [7] 387619
3888123894439081
392051739214
critucuze [1] 38951
crituczzed [2] 38747388223
CROSS [5] 37226374014
37569381625391211
cross [3] \(387010 \quad 393025\)
393619
cross-examine [4] 374012
\(381623 \quad 3912510\)
crossing [2] 39293393021
crude [2] \(371821 \quad 385112\)
crusing [1] 389221
cues [1] 37341
cumulatuve [1] 391015
cured [1] 3832 13
current [12] 376522
382915386878386935 , 232438726389224
38931390416
Cushing [3] 3899539134 391824
custody [1] 37988
Customs [1] 371923
customs [4] 3735722
37362374612
cut [2] 375711384215
cutting [1] 386113
cycle [1] 37355
- D -
damage [1] 39407
damaged [1] 381719
damages [6] \(3938 \quad 2539397\)
\(39403394215 \quad 24394815\)
danger [9] 3772338607
3888243901202339023
3903712391918
dangerous [1] 389610
dangers [1] 386625
Daniel [1] 394424
Darn [1] 37405
data \(|6| 37982383110\)
38332038352124384125
date [II] 37311037335
37531837544376914
101237716383415
DATED (1) 395314
dated (5) 377019382717
3828838294390012
dates [1] 38187
daughter (1) 38085
Day [5] 372683728413 1937606
day (21) 3721437338
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3735 & 18 & 21 & 37534 & 37691\end{array}\)
\(378210 \quad 1638548385814\)
1617386110386720
387234389916392721
\(393720 \quad 22395314\)
day-to-day \([6] 377035\)
377783804192338059
dayglow (11] 387819
days [5] \(373518 \quad 373620\)
37383 381113, 389524
daytume [1] 39153
deal [12] \(374315 \quad 377419\)
3782437951338031720

3832163837338494 3886839371639482 dealing (3) \(383515 \quad 388619\) 390823
dealungs [2] 3739639002
deals [2] 3758937678
dealt [4] 37521638143 38561539485
dear-to-nobody [1] 383122
decades [3] 3769 17, 38217
decapitated (1) 390513
December (11) 38288
decide (5) 37913384221 3880938893
decided [4] 3793 3, 3798 12, 38751939222
decides [2] 386423386610
deciding [1] 393322
decision (19) 371847 ,
3723101314378613
379953842819385413 38672388146,389411 ,
163916583942 17, 19
decision-making [1] 390620
decisions (9) 382519
384218390621390834 573938612
deck [11] 374314385810
387083885493892 11
39048390612393913
39411
declare [1] 37919
deep [3] 37772238503 386919
Defendants [16] 377017
37759380017380116
38252125382717,38283
382937387215387425
38781738875 5, 39351013
defendants [4] 374723
39351639381923
defense [2] 384514393518
defer [2] 39462339478
deference [2] 3773738435
deficient [2] \(381315 \quad 38143\)
define [1] 379917
defined (1) 388820
definite [2] 3889838904
Definitely [1] 38927
defintely [5] 3885838867
389521390111390824
definition [5] 3799 22,
38056383920388818
391421
degree [0] 37132537145
37481937661138991
39408
degrees \([8] 38982023\)
38992539021011
392210392519
Delaware [2] 3904 13, 14
deliberation [1] 39416
delivered [1] 37202
demanding [1] 393912
deny [1] 394716
denying [2] 39481417
departed [1] 387417
departing (1] 374110
Department [1] 379823
department [42] 37231619
22233732437652325

3766451819376721
3768437702037731
37751237772437789
3780837814378417
3789213791182023
37922678379516
\(37961013 \quad 3797238007\)
233821212438281821
38351516
departments [3] 3778 II
3797438589
depend 171379024379117
3819173822438337
383713392720
depended [3] 37783
379019383517
dependent [1] 385425
depending [2] \(3811 \quad 13\) 388011
Depends [1] 391510
depends [3] 39091214
depicted [1] 393412
deployed [2] 38462539014
deposed [1] 38321
deposition [23] 382317
382414382511638329
11212223383322
383623384914385711
3881538832138877
3920121539211017
3924639289394210
depositions [2] 38949
392112
Deppe [1] 39173
derogation (1) 39418
Describe [1] 37162
describe [6] 371413
37691037852379219
380018385620
described (10) 377010
3785937895379510
38702139142039208
39217394513
describing [1] 391721
description [3] 376624
37786383818
design [1] 379525
designed [4] 385878
38682139013
deak [2] \(37858 \quad 378617\)
destrtute [2] 38642438655
detal [4] 37458394323
39441518
detaled [1] 394623
details [5] 372412375815
38122438138
detecting [1] 39152
detection (1) 39154
deteriorated [3] 377317
\(378545^{\circ}\)
deteriorating [1] 377913
deterioration [1] 383925
determine 191377321
3780137817379120 3805183806138256 3846938671
determined [2] 3816712
determines [1] 379214
determinng [5] 37787
3877738853389716
devastating [2] \(3762 / 3\)

39041
develop [5] \(376816 \quad 378212\) 3811203813338552
developed [1] 376717
developing [5] 376723
37688385715385811
388218
development [3] 37684
37703385719
develops \([2] 38714388219\)
deviated 1313874 I 5
394210
device \(\{2 \mid 39099 \quad 13\)
duagnose [1] 3774 11
dragnosed [2] 37741422
dragnosis [4] 377611
3784237857381422
dialogue \(|3| 38413388222\)
388514
Dick [1] 374219
dictate [I] 389015
didactic [1] 385718
differ [1| 37474
difference [4] 378422
\(378522379025 \quad 390915\)
differences [1] 379423
difficult (1) 379917
dufficulty (3) \(389210 \quad 38932\)
391125
dinner [1] 374117
DIRECT (S) 37131337307
37488376516384523
direct [14] 37208373220
3771143823638385
3842233868438777
\(391810392618 \quad 393915\)
394089
directed \(|3| 373943941 / 2\) 18
direction \(\{4 \mid 372417\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3864 & 19 & 3902 & 16 & 3953 & 13\end{array}\)
directuve [1] 380917
director (I) 37573
disability 181379061118
3791101937921215
39364
disagree (13) 377916

387734388115388814
1538911339111739122
disaster [1] 38591
disbelieve [1] 39428
discern [1] 388520
discharge \([8138542514\)
38555111417391115
discharging (1) 38557
Disciplinary [1] 381916
disciplenary [9] 37711
3786338181614
\(381918 \quad 382018 \quad 382618\)
38423
discipline [11] 377025
3772121637736378514
1538262438434913
38447
discover [1] 388825
discrepancy (2) 3913811
Discretion (1] 38894
discretion (14) 377325
\(38078 \quad 384331215\)
386662338892391810
\(\begin{array}{ll}12 \quad 17 \quad 19 & 394019\end{array}\) discrimmation [1] 37816 discriminatory [1] 379924 dscuss [3] 37382374314 39383
discussed [5] 37769
381217381315382321 38269
discussing |1| 39384
discussion |12| 372121
37371937391737517
38839 1ト 173884317
394623
discussons \(|5| 3735 \quad 12\)
3738 1/ 37782038376
39075
dspute |1| 387114
disqualufied [1] 38152
dsregard [1] 394521
dsrespectful (1] 391712
disseminate [1] 39018
distance |4| 389019
\(3891 \quad 1617390912\)
distunct [1] 38653
distunction |l| 37859
distortion [1] 39096
distribution [1] 3769 /9
divergence [1] 3913 l8
divergent [1] 39145
diversity [3] 376713
379925384121
divert [1] 387421
divertung [1] 38759
divides [1] 390414
division (1) 379610
doctor [13] 37741018
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3779 & 16 & 3780 & 19 & 379017\end{array}\)
23379147112337927
10
doctors [2] 379123
document |18| 37717
3800193819 I/ 3827 II
163828811382913
3830111638311621
384025384114384415
2239001218
documentatron [1] 383622
documented 131381920
383624385815
documents \(\{2\} 382820\)
383115
Doesn't [2] 38182138571
doesn't [18] 37537375712
37851537913382021
382922383712385729
385913386610387524
390913391818394625
639485
dog [1] 38588
dollars [1] 381718
dory [2] 383947
doubt [4] 38702122
38852139039
DOUG [3] 37307374014 374625
Doug \(\{8] \begin{array}{llll}3718 & 10 & 13 & 15\end{array}\)
371931023372413
372924
Douglas |11 37304
dozen [2] 373525
Dr [3] 377825378017

379512
draft |9| 3826238292324
\(3830438312325 \quad 384415\)
22
drank [7] 374124374222
3743 / 3763 / 38196
3823 / 394315
drawing [1] 38882
drew \(|5| 3890253914514\)
1739344
dried 111384215
drınk |16| 37537375712
3763 // 15183764625
377323806142038074
3808203822142125
38393
drinking (40) 37182
3719103721111537234
837242037263372715
203729511163734425
373733744453745 11
3751253752345
37542337551525
376114380711022
38081738208383822
38392
4918394315
drınks ||| 3943 19
drive [2] 3840 |l 389017
driver (1) 379919
drop [2] 3819223873 IS
dropped [I] 37522
drove [1] 382621
drowning [1] 3861/4
Drug [3] 379323380920 38147
drug 141| 3769153778220
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}22 & 3783 & 4 & 19 & 3793 & 3 & 9 & 18\end{array}\)
21379422137955
3797510132425
\(379910 \quad 38004380125\)
380216380813380911
3812838132438146
38171738202425
38213382322382519
383012
38361216384218
drugs [81 376916377222
3783143795137963
38111138172538431 (
drunk [7] 37622438199
382235638393
drunken [1] 381821
dry-dock [1] 372024
due [1] 377613 .
Duncan [1] 391624
dunk [1] 38131
DuPont [1] 383024
duties [6] 37476377516
385220385313388323
duty [22| \(374110 \quad 374220\)
374791537661537919

38051938062383822
38391738473385320
386353885839022
391121
Dwight \(14 \mid 37171823\)
3718737244
DX9181 111380113
dynamies 11139113
\(-\mathbf{E}_{-}\)
EAP [2] 3796715
early \(171373221 \quad 376917\)
379420383173832 II
384714390417
earner [1] 379311
ease [2] \(37408 \quad 389911\)
eased [2] 38991
easiest [2] \(387123 \quad 388515\)
east [6] 371421375122
3752123849538886
389012
eastern [1] 3890 /
easy [5] \(3799 \quad 18 \quad 3858 \quad 19\)
3872824389512
economic [1] 371416
edge [9] 38305388836
3889192238902038912
39133393420
edges [1] 39146
education [6] 3714310
374818379712381218 385421
educational [6] 371323
384616385583858 //
38831920
educationally [11] 385721
effect 19137841637859
378616379218380819
38101238137382219
390217
effectuve \(15 \mid 38119\) Il
\(38555385915 \quad 17\)
effectuvely [2] 373323
384612
effectiveness [1] 374716
effects [3| 37445381012 381920
efficient |1| 3927 /8
effort [3] 37203377614 37801
EHAP 131379316379615 3797 /3
eight [5] 37495376620
38791639231539242
electricity [2] \(386818 \quad 24\)
electronics [1] 38683
element [1] 389616
elements [2] 379219
381023
elicited (1) 3883 /
Elmo [1] 3817 14 embracung [1] 3841 21 emergency 13 | 3868 /2 20 21
Emeryville [2! 3749 /3 14 emotional |3| 3726238048 emphastue \|l| 382924 emphasLing 111385810 employ 11137736 employe 111377316 employed 114 | \(371315 \quad 16\) \(1720 \quad 22 \quad 3714716\) \(373023 \quad 253731737437\) \(374823 \quad 37651838462\) Employee [1] 377815 employees [45] 3770225 37724377463776912 377926378261112 \(37831 / 37935379513\)

37962142037988 38012438023638035 38042038051838134 3814414381821381925 \(38211619 \quad 22 \quad 382612\) 382743831820383212 38351238367384124 Employer [1] 377813 employer [1] 37793 employers [1] 37796 employment [3] 376712 377714384624 empty [4] 3830938699 39041920
encounter (1) 389224 encountered [2] \(389013 \quad 14\) encountering (1) 38671 encourage [3] 377625 3795738446 encouraged [1] 377610 encouraging [2] 379220 , 385510
End (1] 382425
end \(|6| 3740233830\) 16,
38742238901389625
389721
endangered [1] 39299
ended \(121381019 \quad 3912 \quad 21\)
endorsement \(14 \mid 37171\)
3850 /I \(15 \quad 387313\)
enforcement |1| 377112
engaged \([2] 37959384925\)
engune [5] 3861 \(/ 386717\),
3868161723
enguneer [2] 374123
379311
enguneering \([3] 376612\)
3854438589
Engineers [2] 390425
39053
engineers (1) 3743 /4
enjorned \(|3| 3798 / 424\)
38308
enjoy |11 382325
enjoyable [1] 373812
Enrught |11 37424
ensign [1] 3714 1
ensure 13 ) 376713377912
3944 I
ensuring (1) 380125
enter [1] 3928 I
entered (11 390417
entitues 111371318
entutled [2] 37901379110
entries [1] 37367
entry (5) \(3735 \quad 17 \quad 37362\)
37542393824393915
environment |l| 3802 I environmental |5| 386712
38692 /1 \(38703391 / 4\) equal |11 376712
equation |1| 37952
equidestant [2] 388720
3889 IS
equipment [4] 381719
\(38466 / 13862 / 3\)
error 14] 38707 1/ 3929 |1 18
Essentually [1] 384720
establish \(12 \mid 393822\)
\(3939 / 8\)
established [2] 379517 39199
estamate \(\left[\begin{array}{llllllll}38 & 3849 & 13 & 15 & 16\end{array}\right.\) et \([2] \begin{array}{llllllllllll}3720 & 6 & 3735 & 15\end{array}\) ETA [2] 3874 18, 38763 evaluate [2] 37471638427 evaluation [3] 37731219 38165
evaluations [1] 37464
evenung [1] 394119
event [4] 372224372410
375717382223
eventually [2] 384722
387620
everybody [6] 371524
37369380111385624 39182339469
evidence [32] 3754137743
3790 12, 3791 23, 386515
20223872 16, 387818
3900 8, 393593936 23,
393793938539392916
39404 12, 39411339424
1720394311 14, 19 21,
\(\begin{array}{lllll}24 & 25 & 3945 & 65 & 394718\end{array}\)
evidentury [1] 39425
evolutionary [2] 3811 22,
383417
exact [1] 375415
exactly [8] 37229378015
383210388818389222
390217391121392419
EXAMINATION [15) 371313
372263728 24, 37307
37401437462537488
37569376216376516,
381625384023384523
391211393012
examination \(\{2 \mid 38112\) 38487
examine \([2] \begin{array}{llll}3722 & 373014\end{array}\)
examined [I] 391018
EXAMINER 14 ! 382320
382416382543936 /
examming [1] 378214
example [10] 373423
378143783937961
37972337991938331
38363386722388214
exceeded [1] 386214
excellence [1] 387024
Excellent [3] 38835388724 39085
excellent [5] \(37398 \quad 386312\)
\(388217 \quad 23 \quad 388314\)
except [2] 38391838885
exception [3] 374414
3745 I 39445
exceptronal \(\{2\) ) 374524
390714
excess [1] 387712
exchange [5] 373511
3746938821038998
Excuse [7] 3722437522
3788738343385722
392120393323
excuse [S] 371211137299
3769137834389421
executuve [31 37316
38532339452
exemption [11 381422
exercise [2] \(3882 \quad 25 \quad 391821\) exercsed (2) 386613 391819
exhausting [1] 38592
Exhibut \([401375325 \quad 377017\)
377218243774337756
103800173801131416
1738082538094382521
\(\begin{array}{llllll}23 & 25 & 3827 & 17 & 19 & 22\end{array} 25\)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}38284 & 3829 & 5 & 8 & 387215\end{array}\) \(387425 \quad 38781738875\)
39004392422,39351011 13

143936232425,39374
exhibit (5] 38286724
38671939499
exhibits [1] 394910
exust [1] 37844
existed [10] 37691237809
3783437849,378925
37921337942438142,
381525382123
existence [1] 377325
existing [1] 382421
exsts [2] \(382118 \quad 20\)
expand [1] 37721
expanded [2] 37931617
expect [7] \(385725 \quad 390121\)
3902910390716391311
394818
expectation [4] 37947 ,
3894 l 38991339024
expected [9] 3734337722
3854138631415390213
39031439312539328
expecting [2] 3854163924 I
expenses [1] 381719
experience [25] 37162425
\(37811516 \quad 378221 \quad 37853\)
\(383717 \quad 385713385956\)
386317386413387023

3890938965389711
39012139061439086
390936
expernenced [4] 38709
3903223907711
experiences \([2] 382312\)
expert \(\{913852101922\)
\(385313 \quad 38574385921\)
394513946612
expertise \([3] 3768338541\) 15
experts 14\(] 3778 \quad 23 \quad 381512\)
1324 -
Expres [1] 395322
explan [2] 37685377314
explicit [1] 38942
explore [1] 380210
express [1] 37717
expressing [1] 39275
expressly [1] 390124
extended [1] 373622
extensive [2] 379324
380419
extensively (1) 37701
extent [3] 37723378213 392711
extra [2] \(382418 \quad 3862 \quad 16\)
extremely [2] 371725
386316

From EAP to extremely
exe [2] \(373719 \quad 3879 \quad 25\) eyes [3] 372115372911 389724
\(-\mathrm{F}-\)
facetrous [1] 393323
facilities [1] 38104
facinty [4] \(373417 \quad 377617\)
3787137908
fact (43) 372511372719
37371437384374214
3743243744937461
3753337551037607
3773437761377718
37781037812378315
38009380625380723
38146381614383121
3832173854811385523 38586
38655,3871112388524
38892438944389512
3898739027391113 39131639144839335 394322
factor [15] 38058386968
9101617387015611
388422389413389615
factors [18] 3773738435
386778121315386911
38703538852389510
11390914
facts [8] 3784438426
388173920839217
3922239231839434
fay [2] 386829
farled [1] 392319
failing [1] 381315
fais (1) 386723
failures [1] 390324
fair (11) 3739 11 375012
37572037581375936
37971538005382918
384914394720
Fairly [1] 387217
farly [4] \(381110 \quad 389215\)
38951239138
fall [4] \(373221 \quad 380919\)
38122384810
faisely [1] 37988
famular [17] 3741 \(6 \quad 375020\)
37621837782122
37792238142024
382812383318383416
3835361638644
38972339256
familarity [2] 3815911
family [3] \(378312 \quad 378414\)
380410
fast [2] \(378710 \quad 11\)
faster [1] 39142
fat [1] 392015
fatigue [5] 39411394518
39465815
fatugued [1] 3939 11
fault [2] \(383522 \quad 23\)
February [2] 37311138388
federal [9] 37982122
38131738146385215
393641214
fee [3] 38083391714

394619
feeling [1] 39009
feet [5] 3850238691521
387125390423
fell [1] 390613
fellow [3] 37831638084
383714
felt \(\begin{array}{llllll}131 & 3716 & 18 & 23 & 37174\end{array}\)
3739338001138022021
2438041138066381217
383924389914
field 16\(] 375019377824\)
379624380813386145
fieldıng [1] 372724
fifty (1) 37978
file [1] 373724
files (2) 37381
fill [2] 3716737175
film [2] 391320
final (1) 381222
finalize [1] 393719
finalized (1) 38139
finaluzing [1] 382821
finance [1] 37146
find [23] 3724137685
3780537841737856
37937379520379745
380723811138338
38421438621138728
38802338902339034
390833909639228
3939339426
finding \([2] 389715 \quad 394114\)
Fine [2] 37267381713
fine [3] 37172384123 38999
finger [1] 386113
finish [1] 374417
finished [2] \(374418 \quad 39356\)
fire [2] 377621386114
firefightung [1] 386216
fires [2] 390322
First [6] \(371522 \quad 37161\)
37761537846380512
393523
first [33] \(3713 \quad 20371521\)
3722111437341337437
9375424377323
3784203793237952
37991638062438276
3830338333383717
384891038532238548
385524386313386713
3886103911639169
1039279394022
fit 19\(] 37787379191114\)
\(16 \quad 2124384114388212\)
five [12] 37141737156
38171538695,387916
38941938951239126
39151012391634
fix [4] \(389720 \quad 389816\)
393235
fixes [1] 379920
flagged [1] 38524
flat [1] 39048
flawless [1] 37469
fleet [33] 371421371546
\(8 \quad 10 \quad 1718 \quad 37165 \quad 371718\) 2537222025372723
\(373313374718 \quad 3749822\)

375014910132225
\(\begin{array}{llll}37517 & 24 & 375212375425\end{array}\)
\(37585386012 \quad 17391713\)
flying [1] 381422
focus [3] \(3771 \quad 1937999\)
380421
focused [1] 38022
focusing [1] 380316
fog 12139041839059
Follow [1] 373413
follow (7) \(3734 \quad 23 \quad 3742 \quad 17\)
37761138083382110
383916384222
follow-up (2) 3831719
followed [5] 372710
377920378016389112
393723
Followng (3) 372118
3732337348
following [3] 38303391321
392825
follows [4| 3823 19 382415
38253393525
food (1) 371925
foot [3] 37362390415 39055
football [1] 373020
force [2] \(379925 \quad 381716\)
foregoing [2] 39539 1]
forehead (1) 394713
foreign [1] 37357
foremost [1] 390310
forgot (2) 3893639052
form (5) 3721 16 3831 24
3860439441518
formal (5) \(371323 \quad 37143\)
37481837862137911
formed [2] 38522
forms [1] 37467
formulated [1] 37752
formulating (1) 377425
formulation [1] 3775 13
Fort [2] \(384623 \quad 385023\)
forth [5] 37982238749
3882123899939094
fortrtude [1] 390717
fortunate [1] 390514
forward [10] 371524
3776253777192037957
379724379815380925
38988390515
found ( 101372223377620
380722381125381725
381813382017386310
38641138659
Foundation [1] 38526
foundation [3] 3815114
39089
founded [1] 39446
four (10] 371217376617
37831738273385214
38691538725390416
3942839435
fourth [1] 38277
frame [6] 374019374923
375473809101938634
Francisco [8] \(374016 \quad 1718\)
223759112137605
38209
Frank [4] 3936289
394423
frankly [1] 383219
Free [2] 38092038147
free [4] \(378310 \quad 38104\)
3814639107
freight [1] 39056
frequent 111381922
frequently \(1213778 \quad 16\)
383923
Friday (1) 393722
front |4| 380017382710
382910392422
frustration (1) 381922
fuel 12 1 37201373514
fulfill (1) 373412
full [10] 37137937302
3748337651037673
3845173876739153
39467
full-tume [1] 379623
fuily [1] 380920
function \(\{5\} 3732 \mathrm{II}\)
37662139005390718 391721
future 14| 37761324
377714378519
- - G -
galley [1] 38611
Galveston [1] 387122
Gambel [1] 3831 I
game [1] 37229
gangs |II 37369
gather \(131373710 \quad 376021\)
394622
gathering [3| 3798 I
3842203882 1/
gauged |II 385120
gave 1201 \(37565 \quad 380621\)
383312384383874417
387893879938817
388893894183907322
3911131439211039303
393193933239347
gear \{2] 38621638684
gee [1] 39335
generals [1] 378318
generation (1) 386823
generator (3) 3868202123
generic [1] 37396
generically [1] 37345
gentleman [2] 388324
39031
Gentlemen [4] 372019
37511837566393321
gentlemen [6] 371258
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3789 & 12 & 3935 & 18 & 39378 & 13\end{array}\)
George [2] \(373018 \quad 19\)
gets [3] 37251638712
394718
Give [1] 390325
give [24] 37132237565
37602376210376624
3767337786378116
37942338091538156
38259383415384216
3862838764387813
38842439144392020
3339225393322
given [21] 3745637479 9, 10
37711137892380024

Beac Syuema Applowiner
38011238112138787 \(3884161718 \quad 388813\)
389122389318389720
391023392127392318
gives [1] 38684
giving [10] 37871838258
38411038551718
387811388281538892
390921
Glacier [1] 3890 11
glacier [2] \(388922 \quad 389017\)
Glad (1] 393325
glad (1) 39176
glass [4] 380623380717 38085
glasses [1] 377120
goal (1] 390125
goes [11] 37192237729
3789173832538345
38546938681138853
39024392717
golf \{1] 37874
golly [1] 39335
gotten [5] 37161114
37624380821390612
government \(|5| 3795\) 2]
3798212238091938162
gradual [1] 3772 /3
Graduate 111 38514
graduated \(\{41371325\)
37311338461938477
graduation [2] 38462325
GRADY [3] 3748837569
376216
Grady [1] 37485
grant [1] 394821
gratulication [1] 38586
Graves [31 39352425 393618
great \(|8| 37302037399\)
383216384943907910
393716394323
greater [2] 380225
Greek (1) \(3858 / 8\)
Greeks |11 3858 /9
Gregory |2| 39391239464 ground \(|6| 393821393916\) 39403 12 3942 14 \(3948 / 3\) grounding [27] 373358 375914233760137629 38382385211386525 387113138811618 38892539031539072
39081839091391025 3911193929739391119 \(213941 / 5203946415\) groundings ( 5 ) \(3861 / 4\) \(39006213901 / 25\) grounds \(\{2] 38182394022\) group 122 ) 3714171824 25371513372119 376778911151617 182237685377513 37781237978380022 38456
groups [4] \(376718 \quad 22 \quad 23\) 377812
Grove [1] 37486
grow (3) 3748 21 3855 // 38561
guarantee [1] 39466

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 6-2-94 VOLUME 22
Guard |9| 3714237467
38552438621738733
\(38935391 / 24394522\)
39494
guess [12] \(3748 / 2 \quad 3769 / 3\)
3777143849131386311
389825390224390615
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}16 & 3935 & 20 & 3942 & 21 & 3948 & 17\end{array}\)
guidance [1] 388625
gurde [6] \(3855 \quad 10 \quad 15\)
\(386225 \quad 38631239275\)
guidelune [1] 38436
guidelanes [6] 3771237734
380620384324386310
guides [1] 386310
guiding (1] 385418
Gulf |4| 3847 / 384945
38968
gulf \(181371517 \quad 37165\)
\(371717 \quad 2537234373321\)
375747
guy [6] \(379920 \quad 385914\)
38642439033190512
guys [1] 372615
gyro |l| 39269
- H-
hadn't 12 | 3718 / 394517
half \(119 \mid 3715237323\)
373523797938231113
1538342 Il 3891319
3902153904192239059
39231516394446
ham [1] 39033
hand 19137134372925
37472537532437657
377016384515388217
388414
handed 111380110
handle |S| 373212374316
37492137818388523
handled (1) 373910
handler ||| 37399
handing |2| 38466 3851 8
happening III 3904 /
happens (2) 389919394711
happiness |11 3855 I
happy [2] 3744 21 3845 11
harbor \(13 \mid 37242223\)
37411
hard (3) 37603379925
39388
HARVEY f3) \(371313 \quad 37226\) 372824
Harvey 161371339
37331137367375123 \(3758 / 3\)
hash |1| 394725
Haven 14137426737615 37621
haven't |3| 388612391520 22
hazard III 391925
hazardous (2) 3860 I 2
hazards [3] 3872 10, 391425
he'd [5] 37271437294
37892,38448388524
Head (2] 38941339166
head [31 374) 123877 I
390622
headed [2] 390215391925
headquarters [1] 377020
health [2] 37262378310
healthy [2] 38012338026
hear [10] 37152437453
\(3756163916172022 \quad 24\)
39171 10, 39188
heard [32] 3723137279
374073752161720
375624375918378125
3786143798738061013
1638151213385623
38911138952338995
39082425390919
391024391757393212
39385101139446
394812
heart (I) 379125
heavy (3) 37851538726
390410
held [8] 37661376715
377926,38257383817
384112395311
helmsman [6] 38709
3879242538811239395
394024
helmsmen [1] 387922
help [14] 37401737595
3773 21 377614378212
24378518,37861416
\(379525 \quad 384468390519\)
Henry 16\(] 372010\) II
372658372722375917
Herb [8] 372014372148
12163722137288
372910
HERBY [1] 39538
herring [1] 394618
hey \([2] \begin{array}{lllllll}3738 & 19 & 3895 & 13\end{array}\)
hadung [1] 374214
hugh [7] \(374321 \quad 25 \quad 3826 \quad 12\)
38274383218386025
389414
hugher [3] 383216386022
39049
highighted \(|5| 377124\)
37768 3801 21382210
392718
highlighter (11 37806
Hunchanbrook [3] 389412
3915713
hired [1] 379310
history (4) 37532537543
384624394219
hit [1] 390510
HMS [1] 38533
Hogan [1] 37428
Hold (1) 37224
hold \(1313776 \quad 23 \quad 3850 \quad 1117\)
holders [1] 381618
home [2] 378617380619
honest [1] 38373
honestly [1] 38289
Honor (S0] 37122437224
53753213762837655
37697377016377121
37754378910380013
38011338082438095 ,
381515381622382720
3845911385312386318
\(387817 \quad 39008390656\)

3909163910114
391243921213933911
1539351162123
3936192239376393818
\(394017394111 \quad 394515\)
394622394741439484
39495
hooking [2] 387417387611
hope [1] 392915
hopefully [1] 39482
hoping [1] 376221
hormble [1] 390823
horror [1] 37987
Hospital [1] 37841
hospital [3] 379051314
hospitaization [3] 376710
37901416
hour [11] 38681338695
3892142138962390720
39435394522394617
hours \(115 \mid 37351823\),
3736223738238548 ,
38581424390418,39064
39151012391635
3921 II 3946 I1
house [4] 39049390513
3906 11
Houston [7] 37131037145
25, 3726 16, 37321376513
387122
how-it-will-all-play-out [1]
381310
HR [1] 37912
Human [1] 37969
human [25] 37231622
376525376629131617
22, 2537672 21 37684
\(377225 \quad 3775123780710\)
37812037961,38102
38706711390323
hundred [7] 37781437978
38121138171638314
3872538941
huaky [2] 383946
hurry (1) 392124
hurt [1] 371220
hypothetical [6] 378718
\(392323 \quad 243924171819\)
-I-
I'd [25] \(37521617 \quad 18 \quad 20\)
37581037662037694
3770163780537842
38011938032381924
383643837173842923
3859163862203863418
38732138771839338
394623
I've 14313736537535
37631437709,37768
379653801920380514
163806163823138244
20,382583826623
3834183841203847 3,
38583438598387018
19388016388321
\(388515 \quad 38901314\)
389922
390116390320212224
390716392083921716

3941939457
larossi [5] 38109393628 394423
[BM [1] 383025
Idea [2] 3841 12386424
ideas \(\{2 \mid 3810724\)
identification \(|4| 37862122\)
379220379322
identified (5] 378424
3790237941139137
394912
identafier [7] 378482024
3785111323378618
identufiers [1] 378419
1dentrfy \(\{3] 377018 \quad 3781 \quad 17\) 378412
Identifying [4] 374316
3782222337846
ignorant [1] 383420
ignore [31 380534393321
lgnoring [1] 386718
Ill [I] 39446
illegal [1] 380819
allness [1] 383416
illustration \{2] 3772 11
39047
ımage [1] 388921
imagination [1] 3946 1
umbalanced [1] 3822 11
Immedsately [1] 384625
immedrately [4] 379824
38122038552239064
Immigration [1] 371924
immigratron [4] 3735822 3746712
impact (2] 390521390611 impacted [1] 390512
impared [6] 37211639087
17390924393918394315
imparment [4] 39391925
394023394122
impeccable [3] 371920
37252337365
umplement [2] 38307
\(3846 / 2\)
implementation ||| 381223
implemented [1] 3813 /I
implementung [1] 38034
umportance [1] 39276
important [8] 37237
3772243854,2038552
388519389617393417
39486
umportantly [3] 385324
388219394914
impose [3] 38434913
impractical [1] 37726
umpressed [1] 386212
impression [2] 372914
383212
impressive [1] 386216
improper [1] 393922
umprove [2] 3782 l3 379719
in-house [2] 379014379618
inaccurate [1] 38993
inappropriate [1] 380412
inattentron [2] 391120
393912
inbound [1] 387422
Inc [1] 371316
unch [1] 380019
inches [!] 37362
incident |1213721 2237221
372658372722372878
3759172037605738208
Incidentally (1) 3891 16
incidentally (1) 389311
include [6] 376725377516
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3782 & 16 & 17 & 379321 & 3836 & 20\end{array}\)
included [11] 3759 II
376625376746377923
3783637971238088
38101538492139488
includes (3) 378920
38192038664
inconsistent [1] 3811 16
incorrect || 37584
increase [1] 381921
indelicate (1) 373913
independent [1] 386722
indicate [3] 37544375515
386015
indicated [9] 373324
3746637959381116
384319385713388510
38991639466
indscates \(|5| 378324\)
3829133860162339409
indication [9] 3718 I
372115372910375218
37562538421138794
390311
individual |28| 3716619
3718937771137853
378692237901937927
38044380673811513
3820111438232238256
1938332383625383718
38382438545385525
3857938591538739
individuals [1] 378123
industrial [2] 3766 11 12
industry (22) 3778837795
37802237835379521
379812380010380210
\(\begin{array}{ll}38129 & 3814121921\end{array}\)
381525381614381736
38291538621438633
mfluence \(|5| 377221\)
3817253818514384225
mform [2] \(\begin{array}{llllll}3737 & 13 & 3738 & 19\end{array}\)
unformatron [31] 37392
377843805357380721
3813143814138351
3842122021384318
38764387879 11 38815
3882111538844389917
390178390921392322
392761012392825
39479
informed [3] 373721
375120383113
informing [1] 377517
unfrastructure [1] 38587
mfringe [1] 38037
inttal [3] 3789 Il 38779
390611
intually [1] 371416
mituate [11 37933
inituated [3] 3783915
37939
injunction [1] 37992
injuries 111390323
input [5] 3778937964 385916388258
inquire [3| \(3738 \quad 14 \quad 17\)
385317
inquiring [1] 38047
inquiry [1] 38716
inside [1] 379524
insofar [4] 3789 19 379212
38081138143
installed |l| 386721
instance IH 39014
instances |1| 389217
instant (3) 38586386023 \(3907 / 3\)
instantaneousiy [?] 386724 386822
unstunct [1] 390616
Instatute [1] 38513
instruct [2] \(380815 \quad 39417\) instruction [1] 388625
instructrons [14] 372414
38636781038889
389122393719243938 I
113948 / 33949 I8
insufficient |2| 393822
39399
intend [1] 380520
intended [3] 3794 / 380313 380517
intent |1| 384216
interact |1| 37779
interaction [2] 3747437928
interchange [1] 388314 interest [4] 37994380121
380217381921
interested [11] 381710
382293823 /1 382716 3828624 3831 6 3841 21 \(385718 \quad 386022386122\) interesting [1] 37979
interface \([2] 37351037556\)
interfere [1] 3839 /2
International [!] 37969
internatronal [1] 3796 /
interpret [2] 385717387618 interrupt [1] 38573
interviewing \{3] 38362021
intoxcants [1] 377222
intro [1] 39279
introduced [1] 380021
introduction (1) 379420
introductory ||| 39279
invariably |11 38439
investigate |11 384220
investigated \((3) 37288\)
382013383624
investrgating 11 | 3759 /6 investugation [9] 3722 I
372723372893786814 3836193838812393612 invited [2] \(38626 \quad 3940 \quad 20\) nvolve [3] 371214377915 381223
unvolved [15] 37552
\(\begin{array}{lllll}3759 & 18 & 3769 & 22 & 3775 \\ 13\end{array}\)
37781237794637841
380324380443835 II
3849339031620391425 involvement 14| 37202
37675377614394025
involving 31378919
384224385211
Island |IS| \(3858 \quad 23 \quad 387418\)
3887162138881023
389713898239131723
3919103920739216
39237393421
sland [11 385424
solated III 392I IS
solation 111392325
sssue |191 376914377317
37752337767377915
\(3782173802 / 380316\)
38129382321383518
3841213941121823
3942639452425394619
ssued [2] 37142391124
issues [7] 37492237782
2038092338427394125 39482
It'll fll \(^{3} 371319\)
Item [2] 38101384410
items [2] 37192538273
- J -

JAMFS 131376516381625 384023
James 1713765512
3823193824121538253 12
JAMIN [5| 393521393619
\(223937 / 5\)
Jamin |II 393520
January [9] 37682537694
103770113771637786
379223390412
jargon [1] 394220
|AY |3| \(384523 \quad 391211\) 393012
Jay l21 38451419
lensen 1137139
jeopardized \([3\) ) 377613
377715378520
Jersey \([2] 3714 \quad 20 \quad 3852 \quad 17\)
Jm [5] 373010111520
376116
jobs l9| 3779737836
3799233800138021323
381619385322385420
Joe l6] 37512437521724
37536375422375712
Joel 111376120
join (4) \(373416 \quad 393819\)
3941 22, 394516
Joined (II) \(37652 T\)
jomed (4) 37341537544
37661218
joming [2] 3719837359
joint [2| 37187372310
JOY [1] 395321
Judge [4] 381624394513
394712394823
judge [1] 38993

judging [1] 391320
judgment [301 \(3721 \quad 17\)
378113379118382425
3825103842711384316
386614390714391814
\(\begin{array}{lllll}15 & 18 & 19 & 21 & 22 \\ 3929 & 11\end{array}\)

183938202439398 1S
21394011394315
39441018394547
judgments [1] 39388
July \([8] 371813,3733 / 58\) 1037546375812
jump [1] 37966
jumped [1] 38613
June [1] 3731 11
Juneau (4) 3878 I 61923
Junior (12] 38473385418
3856163857192438599
3882202138831538859
3886814
Jury [11] 37122372020
3751183756637891415
38451238632425
393321393815
jury [22] 376624379423
383483872 15, 389622 39371924393931022 394013394146710 394267394313394620 3947232539482
- K -

Kagan 116139395394024


3949 l 3
Katherine [3] 374267 37615
Katue [1] 3762 1
keep [6] 371225373718
3745938426387924
393018
keeping [1] 3910 II
Kelly \(16 \mid 3735 \quad 16 \quad 3737\) 11
13192237386
kept [3] \(376718 \quad 379615\)
3902 21
Kevin 111 374219
key \(161377710 \quad 384218\)
\(3855 / 23869\) // 38778
389322
killed [3] 39051314
390615
Kimts 131374123376014 16
kmds |71 3767 || 3772 /1
38119386711390321
39041039476
Kings [1] 385117
knock [1] 390510
knot \([2] 389415 \quad 390416\)
knots |5| 3868 /3 387524
387661214
Knowing |1| 390125
knowing 171378218
384014388818389222
389517
knowledge [2] 3854 /
391121
knowledgeable [2| 383420 38735
Knowles 12138941339166
Koops [6] 3717181920
233723 // 37244
Kunkel \(|8| 374225376116\)
3856638571238598

Kunkels [1] 385910

\section*{- L -}

L-A-R-S-E N [1] 37305
Labor [1] 377818
labor (5) \(371418 \quad 19\)
374922377819394523
Lack [2] 37387391121
Laddıe [1] 391215
Ladies [8] \(372019 \quad 375118\)
375663789 II 393321
\(3935 \quad 18 \quad 39378 / 3\)
ladies \{21 371258
laid 15: 37366383921
389816393235
Lamar (1] 374819
land [2] \(388820 \quad 3889\) 11
Landfall [1] 385822
Lane [1] 384520
lane [3] 38742238752
lanes [11] 387221387428
387510388811389010
389253925212339265
12
language (6) 37711524
377683780638181920
large 12| 3851 123927 II
larger 12 | 3890 / 16
LARSEN [3] 37307374014 374625
Larsen [19] \(371810 \quad 13,15\) 37193782337205 ,
3724131437292437304
59233731737472
378229
Last |3! 37304393315
39342
last [29| 3713837303
3744243748437522
37651138131038273
382867384410384512
\(18384683853 / 386378\)
\(387124 \quad 39061819\)
\(3916 / 2141539248\)
39291939331539427
39446
Lastly [1| 3940 |1
Late |I| 374021
late |4| 37322138099
38125384817
Launch 1713725141516
37412737592037605
law 114] 3781 \(3 \quad 381317\)
3851639364393821
3939162239401239448
11193945478
lawful |1| 380817
Lawn |2| 38906391320
Lawn [1] 3905 /1
Laws (1) 381124
lays [11 386314
lead |1| 382125
leadership (1) 378210 leading |10| 3830538734
388836388918389020
3891239145393420
393720
lean |1| 371524
learn \(|5| 37443377918\)
38421738461038585
learned [9] 372220378723 379517380618380710 383215383418388321 392116
leave [33] 37251,3734 19, 37661637858378720
37881437909192021
2237914562237993
381211385310386423
24386545387223
3886539151639222
\(39252123 \quad 39321819\)
3933839421839482
leaves (3) \(389321 \quad 3922 \quad 20\)
23
leaving [12] 3734 19, 37359
387483883132238952
392063921 S, 3925 15,
39406394116394316
LeCan [3] 38561011
394423
left-hand [1] 389810
leg [1] 379125
legal [111 38006380817
381623938223939310
173940513394120
394220
legally [1] 39425
legibility [1] 380121
LeGrange [1] 39438
Letz [4] \(389523 \quad 3910817\)
\(2 I\)
length [4] \(377693850 / 2\)
391018
lessened [1] 39285
lesser [2] 3773638434
letter (8) 3770192324
38109131438312224
level |ts| 374623758234
3819213854438554
3858 // 38602225
\(3886 / 8 \quad 39071 / 394120\)
39461
levels [2] \(385415 \quad 385716\)
lever [1] 386724
Leyendecker [19] 372015
202237211037261522
\(\begin{array}{llllllll}23 & 24 & 3727 & 3 & 6 & 7 & 9 & 13 \\ 19\end{array}\)
24253728 17, 372914
Luability [1] 39407
Lable [1] 394223
license [14] 3714237171
37311538477142425
384816838501719
385524391123
Lscensed [3] 3870838738 38926
heutenant [1] 3766 15
life [7] 37635837646
37765380410383917
385310
left [1] 39055
lfting [1] 390410
light [18] \(3842 \quad 13 \quad 388717\)
3897225389826810
3919103920739216
39222439237393422
3943910
lughts |11 \(3906 / 4\)
likelihood (1) 39309
lumited (2] 375910381424

Line [1] 383410
lane [12] 37411438016
382316383418938715
391333914173934319
lunes [6] 3734537398
380911382316382414
38252
Iquar (1) 376325
list [101 37601037718
3772103844101538452
385463861839319
39332
listen [4] 378710393824 394320
histened [2] 372424392113
listening [1] 385711
hsts [1] 39499
Lterally [2] 3863 8, 39166
Live [5] 3713 13, 37307 ,
\(\begin{array}{llll}37488 & 376516 & 3845 & 23\end{array}\)
luve [2] 3845 20, 385816
Lives [2] 377911385413
Lloyd [2] 38618394422
load [1] 3926 11
loaded [2] \(38698 \quad 10\)
loading [2] 389214394524
local [4] 379820381035
23
Located [1] 37328
located [5] 3732722
37498918
location (3) 37492437501
39236
logre [1] 389015
logistics [1] 376621
London [1] 38619
lookout [3] 390515391423 24
Looks [2] 381925393516
looks [3] \(376321 \quad 23 \quad 25\)
loosely [1] 386119
Los [3] \(371818 \quad 37321618\) lose [6] \(3802 \quad 22 \quad 3868 \quad 16 \quad 17\)
1822
loss \(\{3] 386715 \quad 16 \quad 390516\)
lost (4) \(381718 \quad 19 \quad 389413\)
390620
lot (18) 37192237202 ,
373011375217375515
375817379656379812
\(380510383418,38763\).
39032439134392521
lots [1] 38588
loud [1] 388413
Lousvilte [1] 394713
love (1) 385819
low [2] \(\begin{array}{llllllll}3894 & 15 & 3896 & 14\end{array}\)
lower [1] 39056
lowered [1] 39058
lows [2] 389668
lucky \(14 \left\lvert\, \begin{array}{lll}376212 & 3859 & 24\end{array}\right.\)
25390514
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}\text { lunch } 17 & 3734 & 16 & 17 & 19 & 21\end{array}\)
2425374117
luxury |l| 385521
Lyme [1] 384520
LYNCH (40) 3765517
37697937712337754
11378991638001315
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}3801 & 13 & 18 & 3808 & 24 & 38095\end{array}\)
638153681523

Besk Systane Apphcatione

381622382317382615 38272038282382916 38402438459393516 \(393818 \quad 394515 \quad 1739474\)
1339484133949414 Lyach [5] 37121623 \(3938173941233945 / 4\)

\section*{- M -}
magnitude [3] 389119
390716391514
maintann [1] 379617
mantaming [1] 387612 maintenance [1] 37155 major [10] 3714637463 37781437931382223
389615389924390316 1939067
majors [2] 381616
maker [1] 385413
Malacca [1] 387125
man 151372468376212
38441438588
manage [1] 382517
managed [1] 3736 11
Management [1] 38433
management [46] 37146
371513743133758234 37664121937677
3769162137711137735
37811337829378316 37867223807819 38091024381261719 2138139381418382425 3825101638262
3828153840193843812 19233856152024 3857153859438814 managements [1] 38103 manager [34] 371420
371535810371718
372621372723373222
373314375024375124
37652325376636
3773937751216377615
3786193788938102
382492438255382713
38362538415384315
38441386013
managers [10] 377020
377213773137774
378242237831738105
\(382517 \quad 382610\)
managing [6] 3732637934 63943139442039455 mandatory \(\{3\} 381413\) 38168
maneuver [13] 387524
3881138836388458
3887452324389123
389235389812
maneuvering [3] 38767
38801739285
manıpulatung [1] 389214 manner [3] 37392383624 38555
manning [4] 3715638587
39411394321
manual (14) 3818838204
6173822938233

38772022390023
39242439278392818
393020393114
manuals [11 386222
manufacturer (1) 383025
manufactures [1] 38466
March [13| 373111374024
3765243766137692
377019379223381356
133814338965391220
marched (1) 38626
margin [1] 3891 13
marijuana (4) 381112
3812101415
Marme 111 37436
marme [12] 371325371423
3715373743838469
385234193854338614
386214
marıner (1) 39279
marıners [1] 392720
marital [1] 378312
Maritme [9] 37131624
373113137481214
\(384618 \quad 384823 \quad 38513\)
38526
maritime 3 | 38611011 38651
marketang (4) \(376618 \quad 19\)
377513
MARSET [1] 373512
marshal [1] 393717
Martineau (14) 371522
3716137176810
3722123750737511516
203753239162021
394425
Mary \(\{2137592137606\)
Mascuareliı |1] \(3761 / 8\)
mask [2] 374434
Massachusetts [1] 379819
massive [1] 390323
master [33| 3714537199
37334519373524
374719375183848679 \(1720 \quad 384910 \quad 12 \quad 22\) 385061738521385320 2138542038571314 385910183863913 386616392842439451
Masters (3) \(377825 \quad 3780 \quad 17\) 379512
masters [5] 37462374747 1137552
Mate [12] 385668388120 253896202123389815 38991439251639307 39464
mate [45] 37142373115
1720384745791011 \(\begin{array}{lllllll}14 & 18 & 19 & 20 & 22 & 25 & 3848 \\ 2\end{array}\) 38561238585386522
3872243883133884424 3885938861619388810 133889243892369 389593899 /1 1739042 390520
390623907539111319 material [3] \(3801 \quad 19 \quad 3921 \quad 13\) 393716
materials [10] 38014912

20380321138088
3813338422392622
mates [3] 3886193906 / 394524
matter [17] \(372015 \quad 373518\)
37372437384379311
386723388924393821
393916223940 II
3942 I/ 3944 |/ 1939454 7394620
matters |4| 3941 27
3946213953 II
McCall Ill 391013
mean [23| \(37248 \quad 37273\)
37661037761637894
38241738396384322
3857253859131438617
38677387423388316
388619388910390025
391712391818393415
3948119
Meaning [1| 38255
meaning ||| 3859 /3
means |6| \(381212 \quad 386717\)
\(3874243875 \quad 243876 \quad 17\)
390025
meant [4] 37761937844
383143948 /I
measurable [1] 390712
measure [3] 389019
38911639036
measurements [1] 39137
Meced (1) 372615
mechanical [1] 390323
mechanies [1] 38138
Medical [1] 377321
medical 140137231923
37731218203778911
233780737841737856

\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}5 & 9 & 20 & 22 & 3791 & 5 & 618\end{array}\)
20222337922678
379724381719382121
 38545
medicine [1] 38516
meet [4] 37211938622
394517394613
meeting [1] 374119
meetungs [7] 3735 l 37645
\(378020 \quad 378812379016\) 37916380325
member \(1213784143855 / 3\)
members \(110 \mid 372518\)
3741915374210376021
38542138552138646
38653390815
memo [2] 3829 10 11
memorandum [1] 38294 memories [1] 394424
memory [2] 379818383321 mentron [4] 371612
37391337532376010 mentroned [11] 37367
37624376722377323
3793193797838266
\(3859193895 \quad 23 \quad 3929 \quad 19\) 394023
Merchant [1] 37435 merchant [3] 3846838524 387013
merry |1] 392916
metabolizes [1] 381110
method 111378116
methods \{2 37594384610
Mexico (11) 38494
mid || 3779 I
maddle |101 38483385422
388822388978938925
3898345
midnight 12 ! \(392316 \quad 17\)
midway |31 37819388821
24
Mihajlovx (2) 3917525
Mike |II 38879
male [8] 38922038962
3902152021390419
39059391314
Muleagewise [1] 39158
mules \(181386813 \quad 38695\)
3890243891420389221
38938391511
mhlary \(|2| 376615 \quad 378318\)
million |2| \(3817 \quad 16 \quad 17\)
mind 1191381220385421
3859938634387519
3877 |/ 38813388316
3889213894101424
38957389911390310
390636392214393613
Mine |1] 38345
minimal 15138662238687
38691438932
minımıze [2] 38607386721
minumum (I) 38993
minor [11 39484
minorites [2] 380024
minority \([2\) l \(3830 / 384123\)
minute 110137221637599
3821 14 38402387415
388210390925392421
39323393710
\(\begin{array}{lllll}\text { minutes } & 34 \mid & 37121317\end{array}\)
374093762537822
3789121338632223
3865192038791638822
38945389521438977
3905339112039126
391516392067392156
39231015161721
3924 | 2 11 393125
miraculously [1] 390718
misconduct [2] 382125
38223
mıshap [3] 38382386046
mishaps ( 113861.4
misinformatron [2] 391114
mispronounced [1] 39177
missed (4) 37945385824
389112391623
mussion [3] 390019390125
Mississippl [2] 38694
3871 21
mistake [4] 38592239118
912
Mister [1] 373320
Mitch [1] 394424
mitugatung [2] 3773738435
mode [1] 37863
model [2] 38591139043
modern (1] 386720
modus [1] 385717

Base Symore_Applecuncia
moment |12| 372245
3800 /6 389153893 //
390013908 II 23390921
39127391322393814
moments [3] 37407
38541539209
Monday [3] 393722393813 394917
montor (21] 373325
374121374210374410
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}15 & 16 & 3745 & 2 & 5 & 13 & 14 & 19\end{array}\)
37777378221138066
383824387715390324
39098
monttored [1] 390110
Monitoring [1] 382220
montoring [26] 3718 I
3723233724437349
37433375892122
3769233770537764
377991037821738031
38042238059380723
38144914382223
3836716384013387718
monitors 11138082
MONTAGUE \(113 \mid 385315\)
3900123906539089
390916391011417
3912123921212425
393011
Montague \(1813912 / 5\)
393020393191521
393323934219
month [2] 37131937355
months [10] 3749 / 375224
2538091238131838468
3847210385214
moods |1] 381922
moon III 39153
moral [11 38035
morning [18] 37125810
37351937481011
378125380510382515
383117388925390418
391220391321393723
\(393813 \quad 3949 / 8\)
mostly |1| 390616
motion |I3| 3938203940 I
182123394122394212
394457394515394813
2027
motwons |3| 3941 2539444 394716
motor 111391720
mouth [21 37301737456
Move [2| 3812 I2 3933 /I
move [19] 3728 / 373/ /2
375122375622379724
381210387911390117
3936233938203940 II
394112183944101218 3945310
moved (11) \(371418 \quad 1925\) 37157937491037662
386412163896239457
movement [2] 381417
392823
movie [1] 381925
Moving (11 373021
moving [4| 378223 381/ 23 39449

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
mower |l| 3905 /I
multuple |l| 3949 /]
Murphy [2] \(3870 / 417\)
mutiny [1] 38538
mutual [3] 388479393418
Myers [6] 3721 19372856 7394422
myself [9] 37121137187
3735153862638711
3906239202139218
39224

\section*{-N -}
nal (1) 391112
Naked [1] 387418
name [28] 3713789
371893728133730234 1737351637371037483 437561637617376510

19385253853 11 3856 11
38575391767
named (1] 373010
names [2] 37601011
nanograms |11 381210
narcotics |11 377222
narrower \(12 \mid 3850238722\)
Narrows |II| 3851 22
3865 14 \(173866 / 538674\)
11386872538691718 38717
narrows \(\{2\) ) 3866 4, 386714
Nate [2] 37422376019
nation [2] \(379620 \quad 381716\)
nature 881371921381524
383243833838407
386025
nautical [2| 38543387525
Naval ||1 3714 I
naval 12| 38462038543
navıgable [1] 3853 /3
navigate 1101386714
386913387282538736
71038918391125
392824
navyating [1] 387120
navıgation (II) 385220
38543386621388325
\(389217 \quad 23 \quad 389510\)
389617390114392719
39284
navigational [2| 37172
391122
NEAL [21| 37122437133
143722337282225
\(372918 \quad 20 \quad 22 \quad 2437308\)
\(\begin{array}{lllll}14 & 16 & 19 & 22 & 374417\end{array}\)
374713875639339 /1 17
Neal 1613712151924
374021238755
needs 16| 38562138706 ,
38921138932039244
\(3946 / 3\)
negligence \(|3| 3941 / 3\)
3942 I 3945 11
negligent (I) \(3941 / 5\)
negligible [1] 386923
nexghborhood [1] 38725
nerve (1) 3906 /6
neutral [1] 39389

Newark 111385217
newspaper 14| 37121922
376983938 」
nuce [1] 3949 I6
nicest (1] 385914
nught [10] 3714537603
38941938954391122
39153392721393211
39411539464
nighttume [2] 3915239203
mae [4] 37662037673
38252392315
nobody [4] 374410383122 38406389219
Nods [1] 38771
non-dangers [1] 386625
non-event [2] 38222024
non-moving [1] 39426 non-navigation [1] 389212
nonprofit [1] 38522
Norfolk [2] 374934
norm [9] 377622378957
37947382393824520 3825915
Normal [1] 3820 I
normal [5] 37343378113
3839 2! 387710389520
normally [I] 3821 25
North [5] 371820375020
\(22 \quad 2537512\)
northbound \(\{2137356\)
38752
northwest [1] 38905
northwestern [1] 38902
Notary [1] 395321
note [2] 37921137979
noted [1] 37344
notes [3] \(3761 / 2377224\) 395310
notice [3] \(372410 \quad 3755 \quad 14\) 375724
notufied (1] 373423
notufy (1] 3734 1
November [2] 382634
Number 1113754 |
number [ 10 ) 373613
37461537783379523
37984383133833418
\(388318 \quad 393216\)
numbers [1] 3949 15
numerical (I) 38894
\(\frac{-\mathrm{O}-}{\square}\)
37622337772378016
\(3840253841 / 43842\) I
3843173945192339487 14
O-R-G E-N [1] 371310
Oaks |11 378325
object [2] 3762939065
Objection [5] 3815114
3908939339 II
objection [18] 374423
377578380115380913
381551838272038281
238296385315391034
39331739351239372
objectuve [I] 388821
objectives [1] 3846 /2
obllgated \([2] 38241023\) obligatwo [2| 378525 392813
observation [2] 371912
372715
observations [7] 372112
3737537472337563
3820610
observe [3] 371913372419
38205
observed (1] 372912
observing [2] 37705
392720
obtain [2] 38472439017
obtamed [2] 3847 14, 25
obvious [1] 389515
Obviously [1] 37725
obviousiy [7] 376622 ,
377673778 9, 3785 14,
37972386212389618
occasion [12] 372118
37344373622373920
37419376021376225
37631038611538745
39011214
occasionally [2] 373922 38196
occasions [4] 3736113
37371393216
occupation [1] 38601
occupy [2] 38261238274
occurred [9] 376083793 1
21314379411380822
381311394324
occurrence [4] 376348
383624389916
occurrences [1] 38615
ocean [4] 37492237585
385021385422
October (1) 38294
odd [3] 3844 [4 38602
3915 11
odor [1] 37363
offended [1] 393816
offense [1] 385818
offenses [1] 377215
Offer [3] \(380113 \quad 382522\)
382718
offer [7] 377717382723
38282538293385312
3900939359
offered |13] 377546
38011438082425
381516382523382719
25 3829-2 5393511
393624
office [21) \(371815 \quad 1617\)
3732 // 1537352437498
17232437501013
375172037551737585
37642038625386523
officer [28] 3731625
3847338532338708
3873103882162021
38831523388549
\(38868 / 43892111316\)
389332439045390518 39117893941139452
officers [19] 374314
\(379820 \quad 384614385418\)
3855182138561622

Bsace Sywarn Applecticas:
3857161924385969 38821338869389324 389925393913 official [2] 3781 2137996
offictals \{3| 375823
379819
Ogen [2] \(376111 \quad 12\)
Ogran [1| 37617
Ogren [2] 37617
Oh [6] 37403378420
38222239189392822 394810
oh \(\{2 \mid 374012 \quad 376620\)
Ohr (1] 379818
\begin{tabular}{llllll}
OL & {\([5]\)} & 3831 & 7 & 15 & 16 \\
\hline
\end{tabular} onl (8) 3720138161314 38301838493386017 38612339048
okay (22] 371514372210
37231537242137266
374522375716386522
\(3866 / 538749387820\) 3883133888711389725
38999390216390622
39122339189392316 392421
Old (1] 384520
old [4] \(373019 \quad 3845 \quad 25\)
38636390618
on-the-job (1] 385518 ones (3) 3878 S 3949 14 15
ongomg [1] 388516
open [2] \(373319 \quad 3872 \quad 17\)
opened (1) 373215
openly [2] 37421537613 operandi [1] 385717 operate [2] 38482438714 operated [4] 371421
385813386123387121 operates [1] \(3860 / 8\)
operatung [3] 373725
38001392720
operation [2] 37326392718
Operations [2] 37322324 operations [9] 371420
3718153732522374022
3810438517385220
392619
operator [2] 390534 opmion [201 37771238594 38661317387111 38722438765388115 3885538872338916 389317389418390923 391016243911239122 3392925
opportunitues [3] 377613 24378519 opportunity [11] 37551 37581737671215 377718379015385119 38584388224392112 394124
oppose [2] 39447394515 opposed (5) 379863861 13 3894193909710
oppostte [3] \(373810 \quad 37813\) 388716
opposition [1] 394516 optwon [2] 3785838862
orange [1] 387820

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
Order |1| 37124
order [5] \(3731 / 237595\)
378416391610393717
ordered ||| 3727 ||
ordering 1713720 1/ 37214
573726243727310
orders [4| 3891123899 I1
3907322
ordnary [3] 37129378825 385513
organzation (11) 376714
376814376923377818
37832038081138513
3852258386225
organizations \(\{3 \mid 3768 \quad 13\)
38112138166
organized [3] 37366
373813393718
orientation \(\{2] 37439 \mathrm{II}\)
oriented [1] 385722
originally [2] 373215
386410
ought f101 371661937629
37842538032038046
38092538121022382711
ourselves [1] 37937
outdated [1| 38636
outhene [1] 377024
outhned [1] 394123
outs |II 382922
outside 1613740 / 379524 \(38361387823919 / 3\) outstanding [1] 388314 overall [11137688 3769 11 37752037832381314 38142385220385313 3858123883938958 overheard (3) 372135 372624
Overseas [1] 384823
oversee [2] 374519374716 oversight [1] 3781/4 overview III 3743 /]
\(-\mathbf{P}_{-}\)
pm [5] 38632539128 3938 I5 394919
pace [2| \(384425 \quad 38455\)
Page [2] 38231639283
page [26| 375324377224
38171538241438251
382615382712382867
382925383011383223
2538332238343384115
3842192339201416 39247839279
pages \(\{2\} 3801 \quad 20 \quad 381712\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllll}\text { pard [4| } & 3714 & 10 & 11 & 373419\end{array}\)
376924
Palm [1] 37874
Panama [3] 37182125
37356
paper [6] 3758837709
3827103829192021
papers [1] 380020
paperwork [14] 37191320
37241537252337342
3736537372337452224
37463681114
paragraph (1) 38032
paramedıc 11138544
parcel 11138617
Pardon |2| 37312 373823
pardon III 391919
parent III 371423
part [25] \(37431415 \quad 37463\)
3750637522376715
377193780637911
380122380216382116
3823638241438264
3842103849238617
38685392624392813
39307393819394523
394722
participant 111388217
participdte [2] \(3836 / 3\)
\(3851 / 15\)
participated |1] 377923
partucipating (11) 3927 /1
participation |1] 38168
parts [1] 394020
party (3) 372173727 /I
39426
pass [3] 387221388821
39156
passage [1] 384921
passages |11 \(3871 / 9\)
passed 14137393380920
\(381318 \quad 3915 / 2\)
passing [3| 37272437603
389220
Pat [1] 37424
Paul [6] 3721 192537304
3768239442224
pay [5] \(375422 \quad 375510\)
37678376924379011
Pedro [3] 3731113374115 peer (1) 378414
penalized 111377718
peninsula [1] 390414
perceived [1] 3863 /3
percent |4| 3714 /1/ 3832 /8 38331638941
perception |l| \(39 / 4\) 12
perceptions \(|2| 39149 \mathrm{II}\)
perfect 1113882 /4
perfectly [2] 38765 3911/9
perform [2| 37349386624
performance [42| 371724
37191237241537343
373815373912374510
123746437692337701
24377317377656 37771037791314
37811437821137854
380420380679380723
\(380823821 / 2369\)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}12 & 13 & 3838 & 21 & 25 & 383913\end{array}\) 1938407385120386013 388323
performances [1] 378416
performung [6] 371725
377711380421383925
38581038678
period [14] 3732337333
37352375924376824
3781103793138122
381421383314386520
38711339111020
perrodic (II 38114
permanent [21 377216

385521
permıssible |6| 378625

permit [2| 38163394013
Perrier \{2| 37342325
Persian |1| 3847 I
person 125137201737246
837585378233784312
378814379210380611
143822113823232425
3824122383334
38411238562390514

personal [10] 37764
37791037853379021
3796338071938371
3839 /7 \(3907 / 7\)
personally \([813736\) /
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllll}3778 & 12 & 3783 & 16 & 3795 & 15\end{array}\)
38191038362338701820
personnel [121 371924
373522373610374921
3754253757337671723
3768837731377819
perspective 16\(\} 386021 \quad 23\)
38812438831938881
389617
ph |11 3761 II
phulosophies [1] 376917
philosophy [2] 376924
388225
phone \(1613720 \quad 17 \quad 18\)
3838 1/ 38981739054
39242
phrase \(\{3138012338422\)
387418
physcian \{2] 37929
prek [2] \(371820 \quad 387315\)
picked [2] 375219384425
picks [11 388825
prekup [11 382622
picture 121387921388110
prece \(|8| 37588 \quad 38057\)
382710382919391921
39421620394423

Pierce \(12!383810 \quad 391710\)
pilot |ll| \(38708 \quad 15 \quad 22\)

16173906239284
pilotage [6] 37171385011
1538731338832539435
pilots [9] \(373818 \quad 373947\)
11 1838142138702425
Place [H1 37305 -
place [211 3725737571
37602237645377011
37715378315379319
3798133804223805515
3809123814738728
38739389320391318
39367839441
places [3] \(3869413 \quad 38969\)
Plantuffs [5] 37532537743
3900439242239373
plantuffs [11] 381516
38574385921386613
388710393622393824
\(3942 \quad 12394661216\)
plan |3| 376710 /| 37905
planned |l| 39267
plannung [5] 37141724 379710382633885 ।
plans [1] 3767 11
plant [1] 386817
play [3] 3722937874 38853
played [9] 382319382415
38253387113138811618
\(393525 \quad 394615 \quad 394818\)
player [3] 371921372524
373021
Please (2] 37292539045
please [15] 37134837408
374723253748437657
11380018381714
38451518392822
393725393814
plenty [3] \(38916 \quad 23 \quad 3938\) I/
plot [1] 389624
plotted [2] 38974390215
Plunkett [4] 3730101115 20
plus [2] 37792338724 Pount (3| \(3851 / 73873 / 6\) 39474
pont |50| \(373723 \quad 374713\)
37572037591337687
3780213781203783820
37863379020379711
37987379913380412
3813243814738161117
213826253831438354
385613875203877611
388319389021
3891138958389618
38984389914390215
39047390615390712
3913173914739221214 3937143938539471416
192339485
pointed III \(3808 / 9\)
ponter (4) 38878 // 38882
pounting [1] 393410
pounts [6] \(384218 \quad 394159\)
394624394717
police [2] \(379820 \quad 38035\)
policies [27] 37671723
37689102237781721
\(2237834223797 / 1 / 2\)
16380922381024
383063835538377
383914384045121418 19
Polscy (1) 3778 19
pony |11 3858 \&
poor 14) 3866 /3 3918 19 21 populated |11 38002
Port [1] 371822
port (37) 3715233716511
123719 /1 37254373123
253733253735271314
373612171923373723
3738241237395
\(\begin{array}{llllll}374512 & 37468 & 16 & 374717\end{array}\)
37492437507 3751 316
21 38199386422386715 38693
38723394524
Portion 1713823 19 382412 153825312393525 \(3936 / 8\)

Portiand [4] 372023
37262037591738209
Ports [1] 374115
ports \{3] \(373216 \quad 387025\)
387124
pose [1] 37723
position 130137141737167 ,
193718133731437322
52537343376715
\(\begin{array}{llll}3779 & 3785 & 19 & 37861\end{array}\)

2021381610382421
38257383425383721
38381738955389624
\(389716 \quad 20 \quad 39015\)
positions [8] 371414
37331937797379518
37991138261238274
38414
Positive (1] 375523
posituve (4) \(3812 \quad 13 \quad 14\)
38303390218
Possession 111377220
possemsion [2] 3769 19
377218
possibility |II 391920
Post II 383021
post 12113790163811311
25381316193814813

24253831219384411
390315
postgraduate [1] 385023
postpone [II 38656
potentral [4] 375721
38372338662538707
potentrally [2] 389018
\(3906 / 5\)
potpourri |l| 384420
practice [7] 378221
\(\begin{array}{lllllllll}3818 & 24 & 3819 & 3 & 3 & 14 & 15\end{array}\)
practices [5] 37714
\(377919 \quad 39391239409\)
39411
pre-employment (6) 37933
937955379713383012
3841 16
preceding [4] 373511
37722437772394612
precise 11138898
predscate |11 39396
predicated |1| 39254
preempt 11394820
premses | 2137692037826
prepare |3| 384119390715
prepared |4| 38002238876
\(3945 \quad 17 \quad 395312\)
preparing [2] 38832224
prescribed [5] 3776 11
3790172337917
present [5] \(373023 \quad 37632\)
\(384653875 \quad 22 \quad 393718\)
presentation \([2] 38265\)
382712
presented 181382814
3865 15 \(394043941 / 417\)
394391014
presentung III 39295
presently [3] 38463
38501738528
presents \(\{3 \mid 38362383711\)

23
preservation [1] 389615
president [2] 3731639437
presidents [1] 377020
pressures [1] 38957
presumably [1] 37176
presumed [1] 37199
pretty [1] 38938
prevent [5] 38251039005
2125390125
previous |6| 382467
384315387610390016
previously [3] 37952
38232138244
primarily [5] 373214
374921384925388411
39013
prumary [4] 384912
386018391118
Prance [20] 3716253717 /
3850113853 14, 38661
3871 18, 20, 3872616
38807141638962
390013223916315
3917153925 / 392718
princıple [2] 38652390015
principles |1| 377013
printed [1] 37727
Prior (3) 3713 22, 384312
384620
pror \(\{9] 3716243766\) !
3773 25, 3786 6, 380414
38432438444386525
private [3] 38061938075
380817
privileges [2] 378012
378818
privy |l| 37464
proactive 111385714
problematic |11 3743 /6
problems [24] 3734 / 5
3738337437375823

378117378252223
378312379637989
382134383722383917
38719
procedure [5] 373725
37811737922038047
38159
procedures |13| 3771 11
37824379221380425
3810193814132038167
18382822386224
392721394616
proceed [2] \(374718 \quad 389412\)
Proceeded [1] 373523
proceeded [1] 390510
process [14] 377213
377314379418381122
\(3813538341718 \quad 384217\)
193883203885138958
390313139417
processes [1] 3928 /
Proctor [I] 3831 I
production [1] 37324
productuve 121380124
38026
productivity |1| 381719
products [1] 37643
professional [14] 37676

37807253781338028
380391938081338166
3851238554385811
38851739117
professionally [2] 38553
38738
professionals [1] 38589
profitable [1] 39477
program [42] 371723
372324372431137677
37692137761537828
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3783 & 10 & 19 & 37875 & 3789 & 18\end{array}\)
22379031437911
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3792 & 2 & 13 & 3793 & 17\end{array}\)
3794237961519379714
3800420212438011
38052338152538161 ,
33824183831819
3838153842510386020
392612
programs [2] 381218
382822
progress [1] 39025
progressive \([2] 377025\)
37711
prohibit [1] 38806
project [1] 3851 15
promised [1] 39375
promote [1] 38025
promoted [2] 373253740 2]
promotung (2) 38524
promotion [1] 377624
promotions [1] 376925
pronounce [1] 376110
pronounced (1] 39176
pronouncing (1) 37619
proof [4] \(393925 \quad 394310\)
39443
Proper [1] 383619
proper [6] \(3723 \quad 2337818\)
391515393822393922
39483
properly [2] \(391123 \quad 393718\)
property |4| 3818 I 622
38393
proposed [3] 37221338136
proposition |l| 383525
protect [21 37812338309
protecting (1) 37994
Protectus [1] 394420
provide [8] 3778438073
38351719212438413
394710
provided [8] 376816
\(379324-379534383122\)
3836638815392710
providers [1] 37967
provides [1] 394214
providing [4] 380123
38023384111387712
provision [14] 37808
3785172237871415
378811637892038038
3808938111721381316
39274
provishons \(\{3\) ) 371925
\(376918 \quad 381612\)
proximate [4] 39392025
3941 \(13943 / 8\)
proximity [1] 373525
prudent [2] 3800 /1 39284

Bras Syuterm Applraucre
Puble [1] 3953 21 public [16] 37652337724 377524377626377716 3781243793737994 383010383633837812 2425384014 publication [2] 38619 38631
pull [1] 392915
punsh [1] 384325
punished (2] 384445 punstive 77139382539397
39402739421524 394815
pure [1] \(3946 / 4\)
Purpose [1] 377024
purpose [9] 377023
37732038523386421
\(3883161718 \quad 390022\) 390124
purposes [11 39407 pursuant 131380414
380917393820
pursue [1] 37628
push [2] 386967
pushing [2] 386724390417
Putting [1] 383721 putting (5) \(380017 \quad 381410\) 3837103892243926 11 puzzled (I) 383011 PX101 [1] 39008
- - -
qualification [1] 37923 qualifications [3] 37174 38531638734 qualified 881371619
38521038552438709 38738389925391119 \(3917 / 4\)
quarrel [1] 390820
quarterback [1] 373010 questions [18] 373013
3739337448375213
37568376013376223
37653376824378125
37842380510381622
38322538459385920 3912439351
quick [3] 373667379423 quickly [3] 37409381110 38642
quote [2] 37441437452


FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
6-2-94
3783 // \(37901 / 379428\)
380323380416392312
2039242
received [24| 377510
378025378123801617
38041538051380814
3809438272238284
382983848678387713
390116391123392313
15392713393125
39351439374
receives \(11+379214\)
receiving |I| 390910
recent 111383314
Recently |11 3921 23
recently [4] 37582437624 3854 /1 \(3858 / 7\)
Recess [3] 37401039128 394919
recess [6] 3789 II \(12 \quad 13\) 38632123194917
reckless \(|5| 39396394224\) 253943112
recklessness |11| 393823
3939439402 /4 3941/9 213942 | 3945101220 39461
recognize |4| 3733 /3
\(376316 \quad 2038287\)
recognized |11 3779 I
recollect |11 3742 21
recollectron 171375024
3751238161538454
38802138897391315
recommend [2] 380916 38277
recommendatron [4] 37166
1537171238276
recommendatrons [3]
377393809 /5 38127 recommended \(|2| 3773 \mathrm{II}\) 38276
recommending [2] 379521
381417
reconvene |1] 393722
Record [11 3937 12
record \([29137137371819\)
3730237401137483
37602376510376823
37701837832437845
38001838451738619
39004391279393821
39392939409394479
113945681239461124
recording [1] 39099
recourse |11 373725
recovery [4] 3724737262
382422383310
recruitung (1) 37676
red 13138887393412
394618
redacted [1] 393623
REDIRECT [5] 372824
374625376216384023
393012
reduce \([2] 387523 \quad 387616\)
reduced [1] 381921
redundant [1] 387012
Reeder [2] 3759 21 37606
Reef 117138891316
\(3890203891 / 317\)

3897253901102139121
213913539156712
391610391917393216
reef [7] \(3889 \quad 12 \quad 3910711\)
392991517393016
reevaluate [1] 37702
reevaluation \(\{4 \mid 37941922\)
37951037999
refer [2] 3810138429
reference 1713778537864
380213803838414
3863439405
referral 19137842123
37852142325378629 12
referred [ऽ] \(377620 \quad 378511\)
38421038873393419
referring [31 377218
37732437832
refinery 111374912
reflected (1) 38068
reflects (1) 376823
Regarding [!] 38243
regarding 141371714
\(372015 \quad 3721 \quad 20 \quad 372212\)
regardless |2| 38334
389322
regards 111373719
regrons |11 3768 II
regularly [2] 37462394325
regulation \(|3| 39286\)
3936 IS 394522
regulations [7] 37718
379822380914386425
386525388068
regulatory [1] 38175
rehab [32] \(\begin{array}{llllllll}3777 & 3 & 13 & 3779 & 2\end{array}\)
37801837823378413

243788213789 / 379513
381111381316381414
382418383017212224
253831319383617
3844 //
rehabbed III \(381 /\) /S
reiterate (11) 392322
reject (11 37983
rejected [5] 379824
37991316
relapse [17] 37432137441
3745113806153832515
383391138342338354
71438391738404
relapsed 141384057916
relapses [1] 3833 17
relapsung [1] 383915
relate [1] 376824
related [5] 373324375616
\(37778 \quad 382025383821\)
relates [2] 37746381224
relatung [7] 3771837868
39391323394023
394524
relation [2] 38541739488
Relations [2] 37781316 relatrons [6] 37141819 3749223766937684 relatronship [4] 37986 383922388517388614 relatuve 12137466384220 relatively (1) 388516

Basic Syuleme Applealions
relax [1] 38127
released |11 37752
relevance \([313784\) /l 12
39065
relevant [3] 37848384220
394219
rehed [2] 3768339116
reheved (1) 39285
rely [6] 38842038991023
2439262123
relying [1] 37838
reman [2] 38852538872
Remember [3] 389320
389759
remember 145 1 372123
372958103730937516
3752233856111838624
5738661638732
38751620387625
38791838803388122
38822388424389013
3895183896322389816
21390722339134 13,
3916213922101539316
121824393223934613
223936939381
remove (II) 39298
repair 14137153371925
37262137368
reparrs \(31371563735 / 4\) 373622
repatriated (1) 37359
repeat [2] 38258391825
repercussion [1] 3886 15
rephrase \(\{3 \mid 374420\) 21
389422
replaced [1] 373320
replacement 11137518
report [24| 371914372622
\(\begin{array}{llllll}37273 & 1419 & 373757\end{array}\)

37471737565379516
3836 /9 384511387324
3876233877939091
3915171939282539316
reported \(110 \mid 372523\)
3726 / 2337285373516
3737937672138332
3838739229
reporting [3] 371914
377220393021
Reports [1] 371919
reports 110137191618
3720537281538195
\(387443927 / 1392824\)
39311539382
represented 141380020
388873913510
reproach 11137173
request [7] \(373413 \quad 3755 \quad 12\)
377613382619386221 38867389019
requested [3] 373324
373410395310
requestung [1] 382019
requare \(14137801 / 3786 / 8\)
383914384325
required 191374671419 3805173862173866 I 3892 IS 25 3931/4
requirement ||3| \(3788 / 3\) /5

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 6-2-94
\(381863825 / 4387325\) 3877223893225392818 19 3931/4 1939436 requirements [11] 373514
\(378014153788218 \quad 23\) 380914381118381319 38461039442
requisite [1] 39408
research 13137781937795
381412
resented |I| 373020
Reserve [1] 37142
reservell| 394123
reserved (II) 394021
resolve [3] \(378225 \quad 394137\)
resources \(\{22 \mid 37231622\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3765 & 25 & 3766 & 2 & 3 & 13 & 16\end{array}\)
1723253767221
37722537751237783
3780810378120379524 38102
respect [15] 3747691019
382419385010385314
\(3856 / 4385715386316\)
386733880539237
393014394122
respectully |l| 3779 /6 respective 11137165
respects 111394717
response |5| 371710
374473755 /I 392416
393210
responsibilitues [13] 375910
11133766537674
38542538555386621
2338948390713391116
responsibility \([25 \mid 37156\)
3767937688377634
377773779 /1 1238013
38042338056385325

\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}17 & 18 & 3866 & 22 & 38858\end{array}\)
39172039283
responsible 191371817
375983767122337843
3789223810338558 39032
rest [3] 39351639375 39466
restatement (1) 3829 /8
restaurant (4) 3762 /8
3805113806219
restaurants |1] 3741/4
rested ||1 3946 /]
restored 111386815
restricted |II 3867 /4
restrictions 11137882
result 18 ! 3772 /1 378012
378153811238124
38381039051539364
resulted (3) 379420
3903233939 I/
results \(1313830 \quad 13 \quad 384015\) 384116
resumed [2] 378118
reture [2| 3848 /3 16
retured |I| 3848 /3
returement |1| 376710
retroactuvely |11 38448
retrospect \(\{2 \mid 3895\) IS 391/ 8
return \(112 \mid 37515377622\)
\(378715378920 \quad 3792310\) 1137951338022138239 38581393923
returned [13] 376622
37775378181137823
37851937891379121
379222380320381115
390519392110
returning [4] 376616
3781 19380220382417
returns [1] 37883
reverse [1] 37887
review [8] 37372225
380423381310382634
386221392112
reviewed [3] 3862253863 I
392511
revsing [1] 387610
reward [3] 385725385823
rewarding (1] 38586
Rhode [1] 385822
Rught [18] 374916375222

377118381411138618
38669386710387615
3886243895339193
39242039322439341019
rights [4] 377523378122
3803738377
rise \(\{3137123394120\)
39461
rsing [1] 38474
risk [16] 37723380225
3826123827438362
3837112325384014
3866243867822389320
22
risks [4| 38382386912
394521
River \(151371316 \quad 17\)
3748 12 1438694
river (11) 386714
roadstead (I] 387217
Roberson (1) 376120
Robert [2] 39395394816
rocket |1| 3903 21
Rocky ||| 387316
role [12| 37341237943
380416385417385911
\(38711313881 \quad 1618\)
\(394216394615 \quad 3948\) 18 21
roles 11137938
rolled [2] 38008382622
Ron \(16 \mid 3735 \quad 16 \quad 373710 \quad 13\) 192237382
room (10) 386113891723
389213389742239099
393310394720
rose [1] 384720
Roughly [3] 37354537414
roughly |6| 3735 / 223
37547391314393415
Round 111377813
round [5] 377814377924
3797838165384917
ROUSE [3] \(376516 \quad 381625\) 384023

37711524377724
378917380017381313
\(3823 \quad 19 \quad 21 \quad 38241215\)
3825312384025
RPR [1] 395321
rudder \{12] 38671638688
389820233899146
390112390291011
Rule [7] 39382039424
39441119394537 394716
rule 19137728378825
3939139435394522
3946717
rules |lo| 372283771812
37727377324379219
380725386425,38653
38772
ruling [1] 394819
rumor [2] 3807222
rumored [1] 380625
run 1313780338227
rundown [1] 383012
running [4] 37321438695
233929 2I
runs |11 3851 21
- S -

S-H-E-A-R-E-R [1] 37485 safe [5| 3801 2338026
38662139271939284
safely [3] \(379363858 \quad 13\)
38918
safest [I] 39337
safety [35] 37671617
37752124377626
37771522378124
379911233800222
380217253808 Il
38242338255,38309
3837838416838523
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3860 & 13 & 20 & 25 & 386222\end{array}\)
38672138722138734
389411389616
3903739299
safety-sensituve [13] 37793
73783637951418

\(38 / 6 / 8 \quad 3827 / 4 \quad 383817\)
38414
sall [7] 3847938481
3864723386541138864
salled [8| 37311720
384710385991316
387118388515
Sailing [! 38534
sailing [14] 37431037513
38471116386434914
1521386569390013
Salor [2] \(37258 \quad 17\)
sators [2] 38642239067
salary [2] 379067
San 1111373025 3731 3
\(37401617 \quad 22 \quad 374115\)
3759 1/ 21 3760538209
SANDERS 1121373013
3747233748937532123
37568376281317
3765338879393620
sandwich [1] 39033
Santa [1] 373213
satusfactory [2] 37222

377518
satisfied [4] 3722237288
37833391020
Saturday [2] 373420
saying [18] \(374422 \quad 3767\) 18
37771937799378615
380610383414383523
387373877143886524
38981739024391515
392716394824
scale [2| 3746238932 scheduling [1] 3732 13 scheme [2] 38493387424 school (2) 37145384217
Schuyler [2] 384623
385024
scrence [2] \(3713 \quad 25 \quad 3766\) I]
scope [1] 3929 IO
screen ( 5 ) 376825 377) IS
1737982023
screening [11] 379349
379553797132324
37987 13 153799 / 8
scrutuny 111382418
se 14| \(3942 / 3 \quad 20 \quad 3949\) / 2
 14
sea (191 3851 25385225
3854101224385922
38601338634387417
\(\begin{array}{llllll}387519 & 3876 & 11 & 1317\end{array}\)
\(3886 / 33892 / 8 \quad 3894 / 2\)
39061739365
seagoing [3] 3848 /4
38615393616
Seal [1] 37306
seaman [2] \(371723855 / 3\)
seamen (1) 386423
search [2] 37953382715
searches [2] 3797 /4
381015
hecond 1113724 /3
second [24| 372/ 1337276
373120375018378421
3823 11 38422438474 II
141920385612386716
387616387718389825
39042539051839119
\(3912233933 / 4393725\)
secondly \([2] 3796 / 8\)
394225
seconds [3] 386725
386822393221
secretary |l| 38363
section [2] \(3842 \quad 16 \quad 392718\)
secured [1] 37414
security (2) \(377613 \quad 382325\) seek 1813776 /1 377725 3785183786133803919 38361538446
sees [1] 38676
segment [1] 378219
seldom [3] \(38221421 \quad 25\)
selected [1] 384419
self \(\{161377619 \quad 378468\)
 23378612182137902 379220
seff employed |II 38463 send [4] 37731837856 382123389918
sending 111377320
sentor 161378120378317
380910388222388315
\(3886 / 4\)
sense \(15|38202| 38373\)
3858 12 3863 |1 391115
sensitive 141373923799 /I
2338002
sentence [2] 3842424
separate [1] 379615
Separately |1| 3939 I
separately [3] 3939839401 11
separation \([2] 387424\)
38752
September [2] 382717
382820
series 11 | \(3766 / 9\)
Serwus |l| 3861 /I
sermous [7] 3775243777 21
38172238212538223
3923193929 II
serve |11 394024
served (4) 37491738472
2138482
Service (11 392719
service \(131378310 \quad 379010\)
392720
serviced (1) 37556
services [1] 37155
serving [3| 38463384713
setter 11138455
setters |1| 384425
settle [1] 390723
Seven 11138457
seven 19137332373518
37482537495380120
3829133831438458
3868 /3
severe 111378415
severity [2] 3773638434
shake [1] 390622
Shakes 111 374112
shape 11| \(3721 / 6\)
SHEARER [3| 3748837569 376216
Shearer \(16 \mid 37472437485\)
1037515375410376224
Sheehy (14) 37161314
37177372212375121
3752 /I 375336375622
3757112137581639171
sheet \([2] 37709388922\)
Shell [2] 38301821
shipmates [2] 3864 1]
38659
shipper |11 3868 II
Shipping [23] 371318
\(37151037318 \quad 374815\)
375833768361217
\(\begin{array}{llllll}377014 & 21 & 3793 & 25 & 37949\end{array}\)
 56153940101439459
shipping [2] 37326381816
ships [25] 37216373213
373853740173755236
737603,38471821
38484385043851613
385423386215387235
\(3892 / 8 \quad 20 \quad 390183932 / 5\)
Shipyard [3| 372023

37262038209
shipyard |11 3721 14
shock [1] 3906 /3
shocked (3) 3832 I7 /8
390224
shoes [1] 3924 II
shopping \(1113741 / 7\)
shore \(14 \mid 37252374123\)
38697
shoreside [3] 3734 /7
37557393613
shortcut [z 390719394220
shorthand [1] 395310
shovel (1) 39049
show [10 3770 I7 3788 /]
3821 16382711384115
385883878 16 390018
3927739282
showing 11| 3872 I5
shuttle [1] \(3732 / 4\)
shuttles |1| 3741 2
sighted 1113897 )
sugn [4] 3737237
Sugnal I! 383024
signal 14] 37292138684
388413389918
stgnals [1] 389920
stgned [2] 377022383122
Squnficance [1] 39147
significance [2] \(3913 / 8\)
39144
signuficant 111383518
stgns|5| 375520222325
\(3758 / 8\)
silent [1] 38249
sumple |4| 389123389225
389715389813
simplify [2] 394] 610
sumulate [1] 3851 23
sumulation |1| 38466
simulator \(1413851815 \quad 19\)
Singapore [2| 3872 I
3921 II
single |2| \(377263816 / 5\)
Sir \(\{4 \mid 3817238369\)
38451039352
stit \(\{21383118 \quad 385912\)
sitting [3] 3756 /5 3777 1
39427
situated [1] 38169
situation [26] 372324
37732237772037898
3827143830173833 II
384261219384318
385520386414387012
387516183877163882 I
238841719388815
38893389319390823
393023
stituations \(15 \mid 374316\)
377210381053826 /1
38417
swx [14] \(380120 \quad 38314\)
38471038681338695
390221394352239441
394522394617
slze [5] 3849243850321
385113390422
skill [2] 3892 15 25
skilled [1] 38544
skilk 14|371723799 //

38554389324
skirtıng [3] 388817391420
391915
slack |I| 3896 /]
slam |11 3813 |
sleep |2| 3946 I/ 13
shightly [1] 38886
slips ||| 3788 /|
Stope \(15 \mid 3718 \quad 20 \quad 375020\)
\(22 \quad 2537512\)
shot \(12137175 \quad 391314\)
slow 1413787838476
39011719
slowed |1] 381920
slower |11 386825
slugger III 3947 /3
smaller |4| \(3850338901 /\)
17390423
smell [3| 376431038228
smelled |I| 376412
smells |1] 37642
smoking |l| 382622
smoothly II 37204
so-called |l| 372010
soap III 383025
socral [1] 380914
society [2] 3811 2338361
sole [1| 385413
solely [I] 38255
solnd 111378113
solution |II 3842 /7
solutions |11 \(3842 / 5\)
Somebody [2] 373016 3821 8
somebody 1241371514
\(372010372225 \quad 374515\)
3757637595377525
377721379725380717
3818538212038228
38238382925383310
\(38371021386113 \quad 38655\)
39023390910
someday [1] 38585
someone \(\mid 1613717 / 3\)
372323767237774
378415242537866

3978 6223909824
someplace [2] 3794638625
somewhat [2] 385410
388822
somewhere [4] 371210
3725837531138724
son (1) 383715
Sonoma [1] 37486
sooner [1] 39245
Sorry [3] \(384814 \quad 385721\)
392121
sorry 191373521374013
374753834638396
38481438573392223
394024
Sort [1] 372613
sort [1] \(373714 \quad 377817\)
382220
sought [5] 38023380318
383618384468
Sound [20| \(371625 \quad 3717\) I
\(3850 / 238531438662\)
387119203872716
38807151638962

Besic Syaterna Applantione
390014233916315
\(3917153925 / 392719\)
sound (4) 3799183909 11
23391712
sounded [1] 38154
sounds [1] 390915
sources [1] 37833
South [1] 378325
south [21 387316391316
southbound (2] 38752
390413
southern [1] 37326
span [1] 375913
spans [1] 39055
Speak [1] 373520
speak [5] 38442223
\(38559386513 \quad 390620\)
speaking \{3] 3717 6, 8, 38408
speaks [1] 378219
special [10] 3780121415
\(37882171822,3811 / 8\),
38162
specualst |2| 3749 21
375425
specialuzed 111376719
specific |10| 372! 2! 37297
3777738021380316
3831738563388823
39014392024
specifically 191371512
372223373720374315
375923771143857 /1
386314393610
specifics [1] 372124
specify [2] 3830239198
speculate [1] 380623
speculation [2] 3815 /4 3946 IS
speed |18| \(3809143868 / 2\)
2538741738752023
387671112131617
387813389221390112
1417391510
spell [6] 3713837303
3748437651137726
384518
spelled [1] 3765 13
spend (1) 373621
spent |5| 373523373614
37965638493
spite ||| 3907 /8
spoke [2] \(3785 / 73885 / 8\)
sponsor [1] 3788 /1
sporadically 11138902
sports [1] \(3750 / 8\)
spot [2] 374119377310
spread (1) 376810
spring [1] 375225
Springs ||| 37874
staff [5] 37165 3731 25
3758537671638135
staggering [1] 3822 1]
Staizer [4] \(3738 \quad 12 \quad 3860 \quad 12\)
391622394424
stand [4] 37331437408 38983 S
standard 1191373725 37791537835379517 3862141538633387024 25387418393931014

FEDERAL TRIAL'TRANSCRIPT : 6-2-94 VOLUME 22 Cococortanas by Look-Socil3

173940513394120 39424
standards \(1513795 \quad 12 \quad 15\)
381289393822
standing [6] 39012039023
3903712390520393413
standpomt [3] 377723
379924390813
star [1] \(3783 / 8\)
start|16137128 371312
3769437716379425
38241385319386319
\(3877153888 / 1138989\)
3899 / 39121939386
started |12] \(374825 \quad 3750 \quad 13\)
\(3783 / 8 \quad 37931738071\)
\(384710 \quad 38613138917\)
389453898725392413
State [2] 371324384618
state [19] 3713737302
3748337651037734
3775173779163780141
37925379819380913
381322384517390636
3939 // 394658
stated \(1813718 \quad 19 \quad 372216\)
37982039002239164
\(392283926 / 839274\)
statement [19| 37235
37441337451374617
37596381834381923 ,
3823 11 38292538303
383226384020388514
390022391117392114 ,
39283
stateroom [2] 373524
\(3764 / 8\)
States |6| 3714 / 21
37681238526385322 38736
states \(171 \begin{array}{lllll}3798 & 17 & 18 & 19\end{array}\)
38171538282038896
39279
statung |2| \(3744 / 43745\) /
statistucs [1] 387220
status |3| 37771437785
379121
statute [3] 3814 10394323
39465
statutes [1] \(3936 / 2\)
statutory |1| 39434
stay |l|| 37322537596
3811123885223886 II
\(16 \quad 20 \quad 3889 / 5 \quad 39182\)
3938914
stayed 171375423388620
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllllll}3893 & 18 & 3895 & 13 & 18 & 39224\end{array}\)
39262
steadıed |1] 38688
steady |2| 387921 3881 10
steam |I| 39049
steel [1] 390410
steer [5] \(3868 / 425\)
3888 /3 38893389717 steering 191 3867162223
\(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3868 & 4 & 6 & 15 & 19 & 24 & 3878 & 14\end{array}\)
step 171374722375110
37654384510390621
393528
steps 11138287
stereotypical |+| 3822 //

Steve [4] \(37268 \quad 3728413\) 37606
Stevens [1] 39438
steward [1] 385810
strek [2] 375924387719
stumulus [1] 38684
stupulated [2] 3943417
stop [7] \(371212 \quad 371415\)
37182124372920
37411718
stopped [7] 37356375715
\(379815 \quad 21 \quad 24390013\)
39251
stops [1] \(3900 / 3\)
stores [1] 373514
stories [1] 37987
storing [1] 371925
storm [1] 389525
straight [2] 375424382424
straightened [1] 376221
Stratts [2] 38721
strats [I] 38722
Street [1] 37486
stress [1] 39079
stretch [1] 394525
strucken \(1113933 / 2\)
strict [3] \(3774 \quad 22 \quad 3812 \quad 12\)
383918
strike [2] 37539390113
strong [1] 39309
strongly [1] 394619
structural (I] \(3896 / 7\)
structure [I] 38175
stuck [1] 383213
students [1] 38582
studied (11) 3808 /1
Studies [1] 38514
studies [5] 37817378321
380918385023 3851 1
study [2] 3812438512
stumbled [1] 37732
Sturgis |1| 374219
style |6| \(380720 \quad 385615 \quad 20\)
2538572338595
styles [1] 385624
subject [21] 37222437248
37572237589377216
37781378513378817
3790103802838152
38241838338383917
\(385115 \quad 2021386319\)
386423879 11 394410
subjected [2] 378822
381118
subjects \(\{3\) | 37229385222
39001
submissюn [1] 39413
submit [5] 3939 /4 \(3940 / 8\)
39412439462124
submitted [1] 394620
subordinates [1] 382923
subsequent [5] 3735 ।
37491038097388321
392113
subsequently [3] 3769 15
3787233832 /S
substance 1261371514
37162337171920
37196372020372417
\(37272325 \quad 37331623\)
3743637744377816
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}3781 & 19 & 378251719\end{array}\) \(\begin{array}{llllllllllll}3783 & 12 & 3795 & 68068\end{array}\) \(382125383218 \quad 385224\)
substances [3] 37722
37801337826
substantually [1] 376823
substantuation [1] 37906
success [1] 378222
successful [3] 37831
38331038583
successfully [3] 3873 11
38832438943
sufficient [5] 3916239392
1739425394311
Sugar [1] 371310
suggest [2] 394020394710
suggested \(\{4\} 380814\)
\(381218 \quad 393015,393115\)
suggestion [3] 378414
39106392916
suggests [1] 3947 15
surcides [1] 390323
sum [2] 372417372722
summarke [1] 38385
summary [1] 379423
summer [4] 373221
3759 /3 3809938531
Sunday [1] 389524
superstructure [1] 3904 I/
supertanker [10] 38362
3837 II 23383812
\(3840611 \quad 1516\)
supervaing [1] 37794
superviswon [3] \(378210 \quad 16\)
380419
supervisor [27] \(3718 / 5\)
373262324,374022

37852123786215 ,
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3794 & 3803 & 24 & 3804 & 17\end{array}\)
3805126222538066
173807538082381711
15383922
supervisors [26] \(3770 / 4\)
\(37828 / 437931922\)
379417937971238014
6380471838051821
38062138081315
38134382122382517
3836713
supervisory [15] 3781/3

3786937956380020
38031380422380620
3813338188383921
supplement [1] 37707
supplemented [2] 37709 38106
supplies \{1] 386823
supply [2] \(376621 \quad 379122\)
support [4] 3715137997
385412394017
supports [1] 3941/4
Suppose [1] 37898
suppose [5] 3774913
3783737912382110
supposed [7] 371221
37346377314380524
3828 21 390618
surprised [2] 39022339334
surrendering [1] 394423

Hz re Systerne Applicationa
survellance [1] 37459
survey [4] 37977 383/ 3
3845438468
surveys [1] 37803
survival [1] 3855 / suspect [2] 377610383620 suspected [2] 377316 38203
sustain [1] 39103
Sustained [1] 3762 II
sweep [1] 38968
swing [2| 389912
Sworn [5] 3713637301
3748237659384516
swung |l| 38973
sync |l| 37342
system [12] 3811710
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}3867 & 25 & 3868 & 2 & 3 & 15 & 19 \\ 3\end{array}\) 390136392624394325 systems 171376916
\(386721233868 / 639012\)
- T-

Table [1] 3778 /3
table |4| 377814377924
3797838165
tanl 111374023
takes (4] 37203375625
38221938988
talk [31] 372119372216 37231316192237246
37265373713375211
37551375622375818
376114182337621
38235384613387525
38811938874389522
389620390315391223
39312393710394818
394936
talked [17) 3722 // 14
3726 / 372714193729 I
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3 & 12 & 373911 & 18 & 377816\end{array}\)
37871437996381114
39122439472124
talking [35] 37122237177
37181237201237252
3739437591624376122 25376872237717
37744378110378816
37891738331315
38361038409384323
38461338562138574
387217388221113 388918
3890639302339477
394820394910
talks [1] 3821/7
tall [2] \(38533 \quad 391612\)
tanker (124 371543847 ]
384812384925385125
38611938674386989
1038707391715
Tankers [1] 38485
tankers [10] 384720
384817243849824
3850838519385320
386018386720
tanks [1] 3896 I/
tape [2] 39082425
task (3) 3734938929

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT 6-2-94 VOLUME 22 (meordence by lomk Seer(84)

39032
tasks |21 3858 10 3892 //
teacher [4] 3855916
38572138582
teaching \(\{2\} 3854 / 8 \quad 385724\)
team \(151371920 \quad 37203\)
37252437368385715
teammate \(11 \mid 393318\)
teamwork [1] 37368
Tech |1| 374819
technical \([413744438705\)
38921239114
technicallv ||| 3948 /4
technique |1| 38713
technıques |1| 37594
「echnology |l| 38513
telephone 161 \(3727 / 4\)
39232039241239291 393223
telexes \(1213735 \quad 1237468\)
telling [7] \(3721 \quad 25 \quad 3777 \quad 12\)
3844 / \(3858 / 9387421\)
3875910
tells 14138602038762
38779392223
temporary [1] 373123
Tempted [1] 37656
ten 114 | \(381716 \quad 38322\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}38472 & 3882 & 2 & 10 & 389218\end{array}\)
389383898202338992
53902103932213946 /I
tend 121389010394110
tended (21 \(38025 \quad 383212\)
Tennessee [1] 379818
tentative [1] 39386
term [7] 37444378318
\(\begin{array}{llllll}37846 & 8 & 3885 & 16 & 391916\end{array}\)
terminal [2] \(37258 \quad 12\)
terminate [3] 3773510
38433
terminated [1| 37733
termination \(12138 / 82\)
38221
terms \(191377624381 / 25\)
\(38 / 2233827 / 338786\)
388363884 / 389210
394725
Terrible [1] 3819 15
terrible [1] 38447
test [16] 379317379725
3812 12 382273826 11
\(\begin{array}{lllll}3827 & 2 & 13 & 14 & 38303\end{array}\)
\(\begin{array}{llllll}3841 & 6 & 8 & 16 & 3844 & 24\end{array}\)
38512021
testufied [49] \(372623 \quad 37378\)
\(374215 \quad 375620 \quad 24\)
3758173768237791

3824420382515383221
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3835 & 12 & 3836 & 23 & 38376\end{array}\)

\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3844 & 21 & 3856 & 25 & 3859 & 20\end{array}\)
213866123871 II
387915
20388020388125
3884233885243887713
2538884389310389621
233910172439134
\(3920939272439288 \quad 12\)
testify [11] 37655381416
3816113829203832710

391620222439171 39188
testufying \(|3| 38152383222\) \(3917 / 4\)
testung (27) \(379912 \quad 38004\)
\(1238113561 / 1525\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}38128 & 9 & 16 & 3813 & 16 \quad 19\end{array}\)
\(3814 \quad 19 \quad 382914 \quad 383013\)
17213841491123
3844 /1 1223
tests 16137954379714
3798937995738119
Texas 161371311373214

text |11 37397
textbook |11 38739
Thank [351 3713 12 3724 21
\(\begin{array}{llll}3728 & 21 & 37291819\end{array}\)
\(373925 \quad 374722 \quad 37487\)

3809538162438235
38347384522387515
39001139069392122
3930113935681517
39362139377394413
3945133947123948423
thank [3] 37183374624
39494
theories \(14 \mid 3943312\)
39441039459
theory [2] 3937 /8 394223
thereabouts |I| 38767
thereafter |1| 39064
they'd [3] 378283792 //
381024
They're [3| 374143872 /2 39013
they're [16] 3741410
\(379133795 \quad 13 \quad 37961213\)
38226385583859 /1
3886103889839021
\(390910 \quad 391317 \quad 39 / 925\)
\(3934 / 5\)
they've |l| 393716
thinking \(161386218 \quad 3880 \quad 24\)
\(3885 / 3895839021\)
390722
Third [11| \(38568 \quad 388120\)
 \(389914 \quad 3925 \quad 15 \quad 39307\) 39463
third \(\{24\) ) 3714237208
\(3731 \quad 15 \quad 17 \quad 384747910\)
183858438683386912
38722438923638933
24390520391178912 1319
theroughly |1| 37379
thousand 11137944
thrash [1] 394725
three [30] \(371215 \quad 17\)
\(37448 \quad 376617 \quad 378317\)
\(\begin{array}{llllllllll}3788 & 12 & 3792 & 18 & 379916\end{array}\)
3822938277385214
\(38685386915 \quad 387010\)
3872538782438792
\(389015 \quad 3891 \quad 19,20\)
3902213911539126
3923203924 /1 39292
3930339427
394446
threequarter [2] 3891420
throw |l| 388422
tied [2| 374111376925
tume-out |l| 37404
tumes |l|6| 372912373534

3832238334384920
\(3871238901315 \quad 390116\) 394421
timewise 11139159
timing [2| 3773738435
tıp-off \(12 \mid 3877 / 5 \quad 39244\)
title |2| 376524377224
Tom |1| 374724
tomorrow [2] 3937 21
394019
Tompkins [1] 38388 ton (2) \(3848 / 2 \quad 384925\)
tonnage [1] 38503
tons [3| 38504385114
topre [1] 3728 11
topics [2| 3851 638542
total \(|2| \begin{array}{llllll}3843 & 15 & 3905 & 16\end{array}\)
totality |l| 389319
Totally [1] 3929 /8
totally [5] \(3798 / 1887710\)
\(3882 \quad 20 \quad 389713 \quad 392921\)
toughest |11 38128
tour \(141374110 \quad 38603\)
38612438629
tourssts [1| 374 ] 16
towards [5| 3888 /| 38902
38924389622391925
town [1] 38622
track 121390145
tracking 13139021392616
trade \(16 \mid 371820384824\)
38491238501138525
tradition [2] \(3886 \quad 12 \quad 13\)
Traffic [4] 38732239002
39271019
traffic |9| 387241938745
23243892243893 /
\(392523 \quad 3926 / 2\)
tragedy |11 390718
train 171378243801124
38251738562139057
tramed [7] 374514375821
37701437821237962
tramer (1] 3801 1
tramers [1] 38019
training [49] 374331517
\(3758243762423 \quad 37677\)
376921378314379319
21379425837956
\(38002021 \quad 223801711\)
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}20 & 3803 & 11 & 3804 & 19 & 25\end{array}\)
380621380882238133
\(382023821 \quad 173836612\)
143842238466
10121314385518
3857153859638605
\(\begin{array}{lllllll}3882 & 12 & 13 & 18 & 24 & 3893 & 23\end{array}\)
transcends [1] 385325
transcript \(\{5] 3825238329\)
389493953912
transcriptron [1] 395310
transfer [5] \(3715 \quad 18 \quad 37184\)
537194372213
transferred [6] 371422
\(\begin{array}{lllllllllllll}3732 & 5 & 12 & 3740 & 21 & 37495 & 7\end{array}\)
transfers (1) 376925
transit [7) 3865131416
3866143867339169
39185
transtung [2] 38712538725
transits [2] 387019389014
transmission [4] 387412
387515387616387713
transmissions [4] 387716
390943925 /I
transmittung (1) 390910
Transportation (4) 373025
373134379823
transportation [3] 3714 I
3849338614
traveling [1] 386812
treatable || | 37956
treated [1] 3739 I
treatment [18] 377416
\(3776121718 \quad 2037775\)
3783253784137901617
2338031838041538051
38061938201938335
384010
tree [1] 382622
trial 19137126385623
3864338651538815
3884 /1 \(389493914 / 8\) 392116
trip [4] 37211337356
38682138716
triple |1] 3870 /1
Trips (1) 384917

385014387119
trouble ||| 3933 /3
truck |3| \(379919 \quad 20 \quad 382622\)
true 14| \(3807233847 / 4\)
3866639539
trust 1613857191038713
388219388518
trusted (11) 39117
TSS 18 | 387422233875 ।
93878239191339293
393025
tug (3) \(371420 \quad 386810 \quad 13\) tugboat [1] 3868 1]
tuition [1] 3714 /1
turning [1] 3888 //
twice \(\{2\) 2 38689390322
twofold [1] 373212
type 1121 371723377322
\(379019379713 \quad 384423\)
2438471838484 /1
3851/3870 \(1239 / 3\) /I
types \(|2| 37671314\)
Typically [1] 373621
typically [2] 3827238559
\begin{tabular}{|c|}
\hline - U - \\
\hline U S 171371423719 2324 \\
\hline 384943852438733 \\
\hline USA [15|3715 237438 \\
\hline 37676376837376912 \\
\hline 22378121378922 \\
\hline 381812382423382812 \\
\hline 38301383425 \\
\hline Uh-huh [4] 37452325 \\
\hline 380014392525 \\
\hline ultumately [3] 376720 \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

38101638413
umbuical (1) 385412
unannounced [1] 38115
unaware [5] 373716
3742101337432237449
unbeknownst [1] 386412
Unbelievable [1] 390614
unbelievable |II 39034
uncomfortable |1| 3899 /4
uncommon [2] 3816 /]
3869 /3
uncontradscted (1) 39469
undergone [1] 38443
underground (1) 380223
underlined [1] 38422
Understand [1] 381323
understand [14] 372012
37282337381937475
3770133784638396
38432538841438899
38941438956392716
394824
understanding (177) 373914
\(375418 \quad 37973 \quad 381425\)
3816138174383316

3839233925539363
39486
understood (5) 37346
378321378653788 8,
390019
undertake [1] 37348
undertaken (1) 37289
underway (II) 37868
uneventful 11138717
unfit |2| 3772 2l 384225
Unfortunately 111380516
uniform 111387024
Unxon |ك| 38317151618
unwon 3 ! \(3769 / 8 \quad 37713\)
37996
unions [9] 37675379856
1438121253813138651
umque \([2] 380025 \quad 385411\)
Unted [6] 3714 | 21
37681238526385322
38735
University [2] 37144
384618
unknown \(|2| 388817\)
391421
unlake |l| 37599
unhmited [I] 385019
unnecessary (3) 3897 /3
39292123
unprofessonal [5] 37387
392923242539307
unprofessionally (1) 3911 10
unqualified [1] 394024
unquote (2) 37441537452
unreasonable [11] 38658
\(10388023 \quad 38841619\)
3891 2/ 3892 / 3896 /3
389910390359
unspoken |l| \(3843 / 4\)
unsupported |1| 394/ 6
untoward |3| 3737237387
untramed (11 37594
untrue [1] 382015
unusual 14 ) 376341314, 385322
unwritten [1] 384314
up-to-date [1] 377518
upcoming [1] 373513
update [1] 381022
updates (1) 38137
urging [1] 378414
USC [1] 39436
user \(16 \mid 390023 \quad 392424\)
39275392818393020
users [2] \(387720 \quad 22\)
Usual [1] 37636
usual [3] 3763479
- - V -
vacancy [1] 37164
vacation [3] 3787320
37946
vague [2] 374516379116
Valdez [42] 37127371519
371643718202237199
372023243733619
3735253738511
374) \(24374220 \quad 3751823\)

375435375623375911
3761243848243849619
3850111385121385423
386011386116
20386414386916
3870233873131391124
3912213939611
valud [1] 38072
valves (1] 3892 IS
varied [1] 385414
varies III 385520
ven \(1113902 / 8\)
Ventura |l| 37324
verdict 6 (6) \(393923 \quad 3940 \quad 13\)
3941 121839441517
versfies 11137923
versed [I] 378214
version [3] 3925246
versus [4] 3784223785 1
11381323
Vessel [4] 38732239002
39271019
vessels [16] 371817
\(3732163741 / 374318\)


3926223927612
VIDHO \(14 \mid 382320382416\)
382543936 I
Video 171 382319382412
153825312393525
393618
video [2] 38242538906
Videos [1] \(3743 / 8\)
videotape [2] 388924
393523
Vietnam [4] 38471 |/ 16
390322
view 1211377717377821
3779 11 \(16213781 / 1\)
3783138041838141
38371385420385710
3877911388223390714
391159391319394022
39445
viewed [1] 391312
volated [1] 393614
volating [1] 382017
volation (5) 38398 II
3842133843920
violations (5) 377211
382618394342224
Virginia [l] 37493
virtue (1) 38711
vis-a-vis |l| 385620
visibility \({ }^{[6]} 38931678\)
390418
visible [4] 389725389812
39154
vistt [2] 372114386115
visited [1] 374615
vistors [1] 374116
visits [1] 37644
VLCC [5] 3851101112
387124391614
voce [5] 375223909711
1923
volume (2) 38171115
voluntarily [2] 380318
385310
voyage |3| 373724390619 391823
VTC (18) 38779121315
38795392215392421


VTS |14| 3874838764
39005192339012
39038390424390825
39094739302021
3931 14

walked [3] 3896253897
Walkie-talkte [1] 37272
walkie-talkue [3] 3720 /1 12
37213
wall [1] 38904
wanted 1191371910
375124 375216375418
223777437961738307
383716384122386121
387921388191038893
15 3895 -18 389624389812
wantung [1] 37937
wants (1) 388011
war [2] \(384712 \quad 13\)
warning |3| \(3772 \quad 12 \quad 14\)
\(3902 / 3\)
warranted 111 371914
watch [111 37612437722
\(3782 / 83881 / 2390220\)
39031390511718
watchıng [3| 38981039025
391123
water 14] \(386910 \quad 12 \quad 18\)
38722
waters [1] 3847 ]
waterway (1] 386714

Ranc Sviletre Application
wave [1] 3906 /4
wavs [31 37372438557
389715
We'll [7] 372922382114 3824138402386321 39127394917
we'll [6| 37121737266
37409378912387223 393522
We're 181 37192437603 37762384512385425 3905143912639355 we're \([2013712814\) 371812193757937628 3768722378110382712 38343384120387216 389723390316391718 3935339421516394724
We've lli 38216
we've \(181371225 \quad 37716\)
38033380821382112 3889183944621 weather [5] 3893 I6 389522 39151719392721
wedding |1| 38085
week 181373518373623
243743913376521
378812393324
weekend (3) 393725
39381012
weeks [3] 39428394446
welcome 13| 37342438756
39475
well-being [3] 3726238048 38551
well-defined ||| 3872 /2
well-known [2] 37173
3872 11
well-marked [1] 3872 13
wend (3) 38752438762
weren't [6] 3742 I6 3744 I6
37451437762138352
383821
West [11 375013
west [35] 3715791018
3718537194372213
37272337331321
37341524373718
374023374718374957
3750149102225
\(37517375312 \quad 16375425\)
375713637598376012
38208389011
Whaler [7] 374161425
374211376022376219
380512
whaler [1] 376222
whatsoever [1] 375517
wheelhouse [3] 389625
3897238984
whereby \([3] 385816\)
388214389213
wherever (1) 3749 /8
Whittier [1] 393025
who'd [1] 37434
who've 44\(] \begin{array}{lll}3763 & 15 & 18\end{array}\)
37646380613
wide [4] \(3810 \quad 20 \quad 3872 \quad 17\)
39041539138
widely [1] 381321
Willam [21] 37162537171

FEDERAL TRIAL TRANSCRIPT
6-2-94
VOLUME 22
( mentiance by laot Seer861

376118385012385314
\(38662387118 \quad 2038727\)
1638807141638962
3900132313916315
\(3917153925 / 392719\)
Willamson [2] 375921
37606
Wilmington \(\{3 \mid 373025\) 3731 34
wind \(16138698 \quad 38701\)
389017389414390218
windlass [1] 3905 I1
wndow 111389725
windows |l| 38985
winds \(\{2 \mid 38941538962\)
wine |4| 37632038062
38071738085
wing (4] 389625389721
38984392922
winner [1] 381519
whser (1) 37877
wish [6] 371225382723
386220387024394621
394819
withdraw \(14 \mid 381517\)
\(3933 / 8 \quad 19\)
withdrawn [1] 393320
withdrew 11 | 381519
WITNESS [12| 37139
3730437441937485
376512381522384519
3906 I/ 390810392123
\(393310 \quad 23\)
Witness [5] 3713637301
3748237659384516
witness [7] 372922375322
37656380013384512
38521039356
witnessed [3] 385624
38604390522
witnesses 1213777239429
won |1] 386012
won't \(|3| 3788 \quad 17 \quad 378925\)
\(3886 / 2\)
Wood \(11 \mid 3765 / 3\)
word \(|5| 3738738043\)
381915385720391810
Words [1] 37456
words [10] 37541537725
37741137791937909
38237384425388312
3929421
worked [17] 37141825
372689373813374814
253766131737782
37972379924383419
3860161938622038635
workers [1] 379823
working [16] 37324373321
\(373910 \quad 37705377414\)
3782638042038281618
38392238481638527
3854138584386725
388613
Workplace [2] 380920
38147
workplace [5] 37723
37822038012438026
382210
works [1] 3830 I

\(38392038608 \quad 38711821\)
\(38772038911 / 3895 / 4\)
3910233918939251118
392618393851011
3947243949 11
young |3| 378273793 I1
384816
yours [1] 3883 /3
yourself [12] 374513
\(377517 \quad 383018 \quad 38592\)
38609386825388014
\(389418 \quad 389545393215\)

zone |11 38752```


[^0]:    Q Does that indicate to you that that box was opened at some
    2) itme before your lab received it - I m going to give you the (3) benefit of the doubt that your lab didn t do that?
    4) A l would believe my lab did not do that and that was done
    at
    (5) some prior time
    (6) Q Now I want to put on here Exhibit 3808 okay? You
    7) Identifted that as a gray stoppered tube has a red - you see
    8) here where it s been nicked?
    (9) AYes
    (10) Q Right And that s how you see the gray stopper?
    (i) A l cannot see that on that projection, but -
    (12) Q Okay Well you want me to hand it to you?
    (13) A I would appreciate that
    (14) MR CHALOS Your Honor with your permission I d like
    (15) to give this back to the jury
    (16) BYMR CHALOS
    (17) Q I m going to hand it to you and then III go back Go (19) ahead and study -
    (19) Thanks Okay To the best of your recollection does this
    (20) wrapping that you see on here comport with what you saw
    around
    (21) May ist 19897
    (22) AYes
    (23) Q It does Were you here for Mr Conner s testımony?
    (24) A Some at t , yes
    (25) Q Do you remember Mr Conners saying that when he sealed

[^1]:    Voㅓ 131789
    (1) privacy but yet you voluntarily turn it over to the
    (2) plaintifts is that a fair statement?
    (3) A That s the statement if you wiah to make it in that manner
    (a) that there was certainly various players involved beyond
    me in
    (5) fact way beyond me in those decisiona
    (6) Q it couldn t be could it Doctor that you did that because
    (7) you re getting paid to come up here and testify?
    (8) A That is not by any means the reason
    (9) Q You are getting paid?
    (10) A Yea 1 am 1 m getting reimburaed for my time
    (1i) Q And your expenses?
    (12) A Correct
    (13) Q And your time is worth I think you told us
    (14) 1000 -something or something?
    (15) A 1,250 per day
    (16) Q Okay Doctor thanks alot
    (17) I have no further questions
    (18) THE WITNESS Thank you
    (19) MR JAMIN I have some very brief redirect Your
    (20) Honor
    (21) REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF MICHAEL PEAT
    (22) BYMR JAMIN
    (23) Q Dr Peat with respect to the subpoena that came from
    (24) Mr Chalos s firm was that in connection with a Coast Guard
    (25) proceeding?

[^2]:    Vol 131797

    1) company say this is a reliable specimen that the company can
    (2) act upon and then I implement whatever procedures are indicated
    (3) Under company regulations And the campany that I work with
    2) one of the functions of the medical review offlicer is to
    3) participate in what we call the first time offender policy which means that if they come up positive in the workplace the
    (7) first time they have the option of treatment I evaluate the
    (8) employee along with the employee assiatance program and the
    (9) treatment program that we select
    (io) The individual is entered into treatment Consistent with
    (11) the company guidelines, $I$ evaluate the treatment and then
    (12) montor the employee for five years In association with the
    (13) empioyee assistance program counselor, the treatment program
    (14) and what montoring guidelines exist by the company
    (15) Q Now you mentioned amongst all those things you do as a
    (16) medical review officer that one of the things you are concerned
    (17) with is determining the reliability of the chain of custody of
    (18) the blood sampling?
    (19) A Yes, that is a responsibllity the medical review officer we
    (20) recelve training in our medical review officer training as to
    (21) chaln of custody and we are required to check chaln of custody
    (22) because like any medical test we must judge it reliable and we
    (23) must certify it adds a medical review officer In certain
    (24) sense we put our medical certification and license behind that,
    (25) saying this is a reliable specimen upon which the company
[^3]:    ## Vol 131861

    THE COURT Thank you
    (Exhibit 9093 recelved)
    BYMR SANDERS
    Q With respect to this I wanted to ask you one more question about this With respect to this disparity between the original log in of the Hazelwood blood tubes and the correction that was made as Doctor Peat called it a correction that was made on May the 1st 1989 Don tyou agree that it would have been good clinical practice to have reported that?
    (10) A There is no regulatory requirement covering alcohol
    (11) testing, to report it, but in general if there ls an leaue ilke
    (12) this, as an MRO id like to hear about it for me to make a
    (13) judgment on it And therefore it'e not required, it sat no
    (14) fatel flaw, but ithink It is good clinical practice 80 report (15) alterations in the paperwork so there can be a decislon made
    (16) Had I received word of this, my decision would have still been
    (17) the same This was just a correction
    (18) Q At least you say as an MRO you would like to have heard
    (19) about it?
    (20) A ilike to hear about issues on the paperwork, yes
    (21) Q What is neogenesis of alcohol?
    (22) A Neogenesis of alcohol is a phenomenon in which there is
    (23) spontaneous generation of elcohol it uaually occurs in
    (24) cortain blological specimens in which, for example, a diabetic
    (25) might secrete giucose into urine and then there is organisme

[^4]:    Vol 131919
    similar meatungs before being returned to his job? ANo
    Q Do you have an opinion about whether or not an alconolic
    can suffer a loss of cognitive efficiency but at the same tume
    not exhibit any overt signs of gross motor impairment?
    A Yes I have an opinion
    a Would you please explain it?
    A I belleve it can happen I also believe that the other
    half of that is true that you can autter motor inabilities and not be able to show any cognitive diffleulties And I don t
    (II) know which one is dominant in an individual - given
    (12) Individual, because of the variation within individuals
    (13) Q Doctor do you have an opinion about whether or not the
    (14) greater number of drinks that a rehabilitated alconolic
    (15) consumes following rehabilitation the greater likelihood of (16) relapse?
    (in) A l know about the arguments that have gone on in some of
    (18) Ilterature with regard to this kind of thinking There are
    (19) some folks some experts who believe that any amount of
    (20) alcohol in fact indicates a relapse and others who feel that
    (21) after rehabilltation is complete that some small amount of
    (22) alcohol can be periodically drunk by someone who
    (23) been designated as an alcoholic I don $t$ know what the
    (24) long term outcome of these academic deliberations will be
    (25) it seems to me that from the standpoint of operational

[^5]:    
    $\qquad$

[^6]:    

[^7]:    

[^8]:    

[^9]:    Vol 141942
    (1) that contunually changed and when it was - at some point it
    (2) became so different that it was, you know some major change
    (3) was made to call it a dafferent policy but it was a state of (4) gradual evolution from the eariy '80s
    (s) Q Just as a definition do you have a definition of what an
    (n) alcoholic what does it mean to be an alcoholic?

    A Yes my own opinion based on - and you asked me where
    read it and where I got it that would be hard to say Over
    ume it's - it's a disease a primary kind of disease, not as
    (10) a result of other thugs I mean by primary, comma, it has sts
    (11) own symptomatology It is usually chronic and accelerating ff
    (12) (reatment is not sought, and one of the - one of the many
    (13) addicture processes that follows the same lune, the
    addictuve
    (4) substance being alcohol instead of some other addictive
    (Is) substance but in every other way pretty much the same as having
    (16) chronic and physical mental and societal effects And
    (17) ultumately unchecked, leading to death
    (18) $Q$ How do you determine that an individual is in fact an (19) alcoholic?
    (20) A That's very difficult Let me say that the surent way to (21) determine, the only real sure way probably, to determine that
    (22) an alcoholic is an alcoholic in the stages other than the end (23) skod-row stages, are based on an intervention, and the employee
    (24) admits that he is an alcoholic Brealong through the denial of
    (2d) alcoholusm or addiction to the point where the patuent

[^10]:     with you, you're an a pretty controlled environment for a bunch
    (i) of days
    (1) Q Did you have any rolu in ruviewing the lefilimacy of the
    (13) rehabilatation program the legilimacy ofthe lave ilsult?
    (14) A In some - in some cases when employees were referred by (IS) supervision particularly, supervision wanted me to manage (16) interface with the treatment facinty and one of the stated (17) purposes were to make sure that the person was in and getting
    (18) the required treatment and that I would take broadly to mean
    (19) they wouldn't get the disability of they weren't complying with
    ( 01 medical treatment
    (1) Q What procedures did you tahe with ruspulto the rumaining
    (2) employees newly emerged from slwohol rahab?
    (3) A Welcome them back encouraged them to come to see me If
    (24) they had any contunuing problems On occasion I recall tellugg

    Is it the - isn this then a concern of yours tor an ongoing or seagoing employer?
    with boredom of the employee on the vessel it' mol a very
    with boredom of the employee on the vessel it's not a very aboard a
    (6) vessel and time is pretty well taken up Thev have the the
    (8) remoteness can be taken as an advantage because you can't go
    (9) down to the local bar and af you can tinke alcohol on buard

[^11]:    Vol 141994
    because Captain Hazelwood was not on the bridge?
    Do you remember the question now or do you want it read back again?
    A Well I think you're asking was the reason that I think the third mate was overworked the fact that the captann was not
    the bridge I can oniv say that if I had been on the bridge in those circumstances and I was five or sux tames in the two months pnor with that much ice if my captan had left the bndge because he - in both cases with two captans they
    : 10 , been looking at the radar while I did everything else If the
    (1I) captan had not been on the bridge I would have felt ) overwhelmed
    Q Under those circumstances as you understand them?
    A Yes
    Q Based on your experience as a third mate and based on the
    knowledge that you have of the facts and circumatances that
    took place that night could fatigue have been a factor in Cousin sperformance?
    A I can imagine that it would have been yes Might have been
    MS WAGNER Nothing further Your Honor
    THE COURT Cross?
    MR SANDERS Just briefly Your Honor
    CROSS EXAMINATION OF WILLIAM MASCIARELLI (rlad)
    BY MR SANDERS

[^12]:    Vol 142018
    the following answers What would you have done if you wanted
    i to get her off the rect And the answer iff wanted to
    attempt to get off I sould have pushud iwn hutions and gonc
    sea speed full astern in about two minutes Youdidnidn
    that No
    Do you have anv opinion about that statiment br Captain Hazelwood?
    AYes sir
    Q Could you icll us what your opinion is?
    (10) A Well the two things that are not entarely realistic first
    "It of all the vessel at this stage the stage that you were
    (l) stopped was pointing towards a channel she was not pointing
    (13) towards a reef she was pointing to its channet And also at
    (14) that stage Captan Hazelwood must have thought that he was hung
    (1s) up somewhere further out because he bad damage so far out all
    (16) the way to the last cargo tank To back her up he would go
    (17) backwards and be would have worked his way backwards
    through
    (18) the entire reef before he could get to the water go to the
    (19) reef tura around get back to deep water so it was quite a
    ( 0 ) lengthy course to take
    ( I) The other thing that I find is not entirely realistic is
    (-ㄱ) that Captan Hazelwood states that he could have gone sea
    speed
    (3) full astern in about two manutes When the ship is aground
    (4) when a commercial ship or tanker like that is aground it is
    (_s) impossible for the propeller to come up to full revolutions

[^13]:    Vol 142030
    (1) Q And as betwecn you somcone who dousn thave a murchant
    (2) marine license who $s$ nuvcr becn to sca as a cruw mumbur who s
    (3) never really becnaground on a ship that $s$ run abround and
    (4) Captain Hazelwood who sthe master ol that ship who was ina
    (s) better position to judgu the best coursc of action vou or him'
    (6) A Once you re talking aground I think I have a lot more (7) expenence
    (8) Q That one time that you wire on the ship in Rhode Island)
    (9) A Many shups that were aground
    (10) Q Mr Van Hemmen at the moment that that ship ran aground
    (11) and decisions had to be made and information had been gathered
    (12) who was in the better position to evaluate that position' I
    (13) don I mean in a courtroom five years later as a paid
    (14) consultant At that moment?
    (1s) A Captan Hazelwood as the only pervian on board the ship to
    6) evaluate information on board the hap
    (17) Q Now you talked about the use of the rudder and the cingine
    (1s) by the capiain?
    (19) A Yes sir
    (20) Q Okay Did you doany analysis of the pown curves of this
    (1) vessel?
    (22) A No
    (2) Q You did not?
    (24) A No
    t.s) Q Well how much horsupown was avallable to Captann

[^14]:    Vol 142038
    Mate Kunkel who said that the captain had to use in his testumony he a a chief mate a licensed captain sailing as a
    chief mate the captain had to use the engine and the rudder to
    try and evaluate and assuss the siluation do vou rumumbur
    that?
    A I don't remember that nul
    Q You don i remumburhim saving " Ohav Lulmasah vou
    thas You had an opportunny to read the hall loggtr on this
    vessul?
    A Yes sur
    Q Lul me gel It
    A Well I read
    Q I want to show it to you Im not trying to trich you
    A Okay
    Q I don 1 want your father gelting mad at me
    A Okay
    QIm going to show you the bell logger which has beln
    previously marked as plantuffs $\llcorner$ xhibulini in cvidence This
    is actually a blowup of the bull logker
    A Uh huh
    Q You see that? Do you rumumber in vour deposition and in
    your ruport to the plainults making a statumuni a collows
    First in rufloating unless there is a compulling ththmial
    reason a vessel should bc rufloatud along the samu path that
    the vessel grounded do you rumamber saving that?

[^15]:    Vol 142054
    (1) A Yes I see it
    (?) Q And this is a document which we got from the National
    (3) Transportation Safulv Board and the pagt the first page after
    (A) the curificate trom the transportation saluiv hoard is a
    (5) letter that you wrolu 10 a Dr Birky in Ausust of 1989
    (6) enclosing a benelil rucord sichnuss report ol losuph

    Hazelwood
    (7) do you see that?
    (8) A Yes I do
    (9) $Q$ And the next page is the benefil record sichness report
    (10) Do you see that?
    (111) A Yes
    (12) Q Lut me see ifl can aclually - lul s swith bach dndsu
    (13) if I can pull this up
    (141 I mgoing to put it up on the TV screen and sec if we can
    (15) get a good look at you Now whare did this hanefil rucord
    (16) sickncss raport comb (rom'
    (17) A I belneve it came from our benefits ddmustrator file
    tisi $Q$ And in the upper lith hand corncr thure in an calrv that
    119) says has Jusuph Ha/clwood and il hangola didz novis ALC
    (20) tratment do vou sce thal'

    1: AYes
    (29) $Q$ And then right over herv il has got an enirv 4/16/85 hos
    ( 3 ) through $4 / 29$ then LOA lorgroup something clsc marilax
    (24) therapy AA lectures et cetcra do you see that?
    rs, A I see something lake that yeah it's hard to read it

[^16]:    Vol 142064
    the question?
    , A I'm not sure that I do
    (a) Q Are thare too many words in that question?
    (1) A'm not sure of the time frame you'retalking about

    Q You and Borgen are going to monitor Ha/lwood pursuant to
    larossi s request at this conterenct in 1988?
    A Yes
    Q Did you tell Harvey I tried to monitor this guy before I
    had probiems It didn $t$ work out or words to that effect?
    A No I don't believe I dad huh uh
    Q Now how long was this fleel conference?
    A About a week
    Q And othur than this ruquest from larossi and this one weed
    lleet conterence that s the sum and substance of your
    knowludgl with rugard to monitoring Captain Hazelwood?
    A I did on iny own without uentioning it to anybody monitor
    , bun th the 1987 officer conference as well which I attended,
    also held in Houston about a week long conference and
    because
    of the knowledge I had I did observe him more carefully and was aware of his past problem
    Q And you weren 1 monitoring him for mild depression were you you wert monitoring for alcohol use?
    A That's correct uh huh
    ) Q And that was sort of done on vour own?
    AYes

[^17]:    Vol 142074
    II) Q And is that - that v the lype ol award that the companv
    2) offers and bestows on ships or crews or people?
    (3) A That's an example of them There are other awards bevond
    that too
    Q Okay And art those awards takın seriouslv'
    A I thank they are yes
    Q Are thev important to the pcople who are working on the
    ships do they have carcer and pay and rating significance io people?
    A Well the awards themselves I think just represent
    (II) recognition There are other ways to recognize thetn as well
    (1) through pay
    (13) MR LYNCH May I offer Exhibit 9118 Your Honor
    (14) (Exhibit 9118 offered)
    (15) MR O NEILL Oh objection
    (16) THECOURT Admitted
    (17) (Exhibit 9118 ruceived)

    BYMR LYNCH
    (19) Q Has Exxon Shipping been recognized by any outside agency?
    (r) A Yes we bave a reputation of probably being the premiere
    ( 1) operator in the industry
    (2) Q Let me ask you to look at Exhibit 9117 for identification
    (23) at the moment Could you describe that for the record
    (9) Mr Paul?
    (.5) A Yes That's 7 three different kınds of awards that

[^18]:    Vol 142090
    (1) days How would that allect thur vacation days or olf daya'
    () A They earned approximately one day of pard leave for every
    (2) day that they worked un thap So if they wurked five dava

    4, they'd earn an extra fived ivs of pand leive
    s) Q 65 days on supposed to be entilicd to 65 davs off'
    A) A Approximately ves

    71 Q Just approximatelv what hind ol salary rangt would people masters for example mahe?
    A Well in the 100000 range
    Q Now how did the work schedule you have oclasion to know from the union and contract nugotiation work you did the
    (12) salary administration work you did how Exxon 3 work hours
    (13) compared with work hours in other tanker operators in the U S
    (14) fleet?
    (1s) A Best I can tell they were comparable
    (16) Q Now we vealso heard indeed heard a lot this mention
    (I7) about with a Ithink is call the forced ranking system Can!
    (18) just put this back up 1 II promise not to write on the back
    (19) of it so you know where 11 goes on the easel In 1985 you
    (20) didn thave a torced ranking system?
    ( ) A That's correct
    1 ) Q I guess I should go back for a munute?
    ' is A We had a system we didn't have the ranking
    (4) Q At one point in time Exxon Shipping did not have a straight
    (2s) salary system for its deck officers is that correct?

[^19]:    THE WITNESS 1 thought the angels were coming
    BYMR LYNCH
    Q I may bu repeating myself but in the - under the previous
    system you paid the masters and mates by the hour?
    A We paid them a flat rate or daily rate for thear eight
    hours and we pand them a rate for each overtume hour they worked
    Q And within say the group of masters did everybody get the same no matter they were both the best or the poorest?
    A The masters did not get overtime They were on a flat
    salary but their individual contnbution was not differentuated at that tume
    Q That was at that tume before you went to the salary system? A Right
    Q The mates got overtime?
    A The mates got overtime $\quad-=$
    Q How was that overtime kept?
    A Well we agann we did a competutive survey to see what
    rates would be
    Q I guess what I masking among rates did they all get the same rates?
    A They all got the same rates
    Q When you went to the merit salary system did everybody get the same?
    A No

[^20]:    Vol 142094
    Q1 mreferring now to Planntiffs Exhibit 155 is il' These
    indicall that Captain Ha/clwoud was bulow hall in the sucond
    half of Exxon captains in csscntially all the ycars wh rL talkıng about corrabl'
    AYes it does
    Q Have you had octasion - plainilils und over as a possible exhibit Captan $\mathrm{Ha} /$ lwood,$~ p u r$ onnal lilu'
    AYes
    Q Did you have oscaston to ravicw that'
    A Yes I did
    (111) Q Now if you were ranking Captain Hacelwood if these yellow
    (1.) tapes were going to be based on the basis of the appraisal of
    (13) Captain Hazeiwood for a ship operating that is his scamanship
    (14) and his ship handing and his knowledge of ships how would
    (15) expect ham to be ranked in terms of a forced rank list?
    (16) A He would be very close to the top of that list
    (17) $Q$ What was it that pulled him down into the low er half of 118) that list?
    (19) A His attitude towards assuming a broader manajement
    (30) responsibilaties on the shap
    (") Q Broadur managumcnil rusponsibililics incaning the paperwork
    ( -) and things like thal)
    13) A Yeah paperwork controlling the covts and managing the (-4) overall operation of the shop
    (25) Q Now are you acquainted with suggestions that whre made

[^21]:    Vol 152209
    that 18 to 20 day period of time?
    A No not in the penod I was there no
    Q Did Paul Myers?
    ANo
    Q My question is you had - in March of 88 it was your belief that Hazelwood had stopped drinking is that right? AYes Q And after either the incident in May of 88 or Mary Williamson 3 report a week before the grounding did you consider the fact that Hazelwood had relapsed and he $d$ started drinking again?
    A I thought that maght be a possibulity, yes
    Q That a why you reported it to Exxon Shipping Company management true?
    A The way I put it eariter was that I reported the information to Pari Myers because I felt as - as his (In supervisor, he shoald be aware of - of thes anformation I (18) believe that's the way I put it Certanly as his supervisor (19) hopefully he had a lot more information about thes undividual
    (20) than I did I didn't know Joe Hacelwood very well and he could
    (21) draw those conclusions as to what that information - what you
    (22) know, what that meant to hum or to hus - in his job as hus (23) supervisor more than myself As I sand, I felt that could have
    (24) been a possibility
    (25) Q Okay And it was on each occasion when you wem to Paul

[^22]:    foreign country bas to - in order to practice in America has to do a special exam, so i did that exam when I came here to do a special exam, so idsd that exam when I came here I got in 1965 I am a speciolest in psychiatry, it's called board certufied un psychuatry by the Amencan Board of Psychatry and Neurology which I received in 1970 I also have a Califorma license to practice mediciate which I recesved when I - ufter I went to Califorms in 1980 which I recenved when I-ufter I went to Califorma in 1980
    and in addition I have been certified in addiction medicine by the American socsety of Addiction Medicine in 1986 by examination
    I think that covers the incenses as far as I remember Q Okay Have you authored any publicalions? AYes I have Q Any to do with the - your spetsalty? A Yes several One was called A Drug Abuse Industrv whuch
    which
    (17) was published in the early '70s which showed that the berom
    (18) addiction and partucularly other forms of drug addiction were y
    (19) pullar of the aation's economy and there was a whole economic
    (º) substrate connected to addiction and that was pubhished in
    a
    (21) vanety of differeat places
    (.) Then there was another one in the early '80s that I
    (23) published, was published of mine It was in a book about
    (2a) training in aicoholism and drug dependence university
    (23) published, was published of mine It was in a book about
    (2a) traming in aicoholism and drug dependence university (23) tranning, and I wrote the chapter on trannong psychiatrists and d

[^23]:    Vol 152289
    31gns?
    A I beheve they could
    1 Q By the way is il accupled professional conduct in your
    field to require an evaluation of someont who has gone through
    alcohol treatment on the basis of rumor?
    A Yes
    Q Particularly with when that person is in a yafety sensitive powtion?
    A That's correct
    Q la that normal in your experience?
    A Yes it is normal Aggressive investigation of rumors about dranking ought to, under circumstances of a person after
    (1) evaluation trigger a medical evalumtinu of thetr recovery status at the tume
    Q Okay Now une laxi qucsition Bastd upunall ol your lestimony today and whal you ve heard in this bourtroom and based on the signs that were available to Exxon do you have an opinion as to whether Exxon should have allowed Captain
    Hazelwood to be the master on the Exxon Valdez as it lefi San
    Francisco in March of 1989?
    Aldo
    221 Q And what is your opinion?
    (3) A I believe that Exxon should not have permitted him to
    leave
    (24) San Francisco as master of the Exxon Valdez on that date (2s) MR MONTAGUE Thank you very much Doctor

[^24]:    (I) right?
    (2) A That's where it is, yes
    (3) $Q$ And 300 40, as you ve said in your earlier testimony is
    (4) dyathymic disorder?
    (s) A Dysthymic disorder and mild depression yes
    (6) Q And 30502 is alcohol abuse episodic?
    (7) A That's correct
    (8) Q Which is different under DSM III than alcohol dependence or
    (9) alcoholism is it not?
    (10) A Under DSM III, yes, it is
    (II) Q That swhat Dr Vallury was using isn it?
    (1) A That's true
    (11) Q Quile obviously?
    (1) A That's true
    (IS) Q Couldn thave used DSM III yet because it wasn there yet?
    (16) A That's correct
    (17) Q Couldn tuse your societies definition because it wasn t
    (18) there yet?
    (19) A That's correct
    (20) $Q$ So what you re doing is you re coming in here now nine
    (21) years later and saying you diagree with that diagnosis
    ( ? $_{2}$ ) correct?
    (23) A That is a $\mathbf{- i n}$ my opinion because it is a diagnosis that (_4) exists only 16 days after Captan Hazeiwood's admission to the
    (9) hospital is at this point and two weeks before his discharge

[^25]:    Vol 15 2321
    （I）manager with Exxon Shipping Company？
    2）A Yes，I suppose so
    3）Q is it your understanding that this drug and alcohol policy
    （s）prohibitud the posscession and use of alcohol on hoard vessuls？
    （s）A Yes
    （6）Q And has it always bein the intent al Exxon Shipping Company
    （7）drug and alcohol poliuics to prohibit cmployuss Irum rupuring
    （8）to work in an intoxicated condition？
    （V）A I would assume that to betbecase its
    （10）Q What I mirying－what I mirying to ayh you is whuther
    ＂II）this paricular policy uncouraged Exxon Shipping Cumpany
    （12）employees to report violations of the drug and alcohol policy
    （13）that those employees were aware of？
    （14）A I don＇t know that it specifically said that it encourages （15）employees who suspect they have a problem to take some action
    （16）Q Do you know if that－if that fact reporting of a
    （17）violation of a drug and alcohol policy to a supervisor if
    （18）that sa normal situation if that fact was made awart io－ 10
    （191 Exxon Shipping Company umployecs？
    1201 A I m not sure whether it wav or aut
    （rl）Q Well I mespecificallv rifircneing whethur or not there was
    1 1 a formal mechamism ancstablishod muchanism loran uniにしロゃいd
    131 person to report what he or she percaived to be mistonduct on （24）the part of a licensed officer？
    1251 A I don＇t recall anything written in terms of formality but

[^26]:    Vol 162404
    there was concern it was burned quite deeply under everythang,
    (2) other thought processes that were necessary to do the job
    (3) Q All right Now the fatl is one of the reasons you were so
    (a) busy was bucause you were the only otficer on the bridge is
    (s) that right?
    (6) A The workload ancreases somewhat when you find

    ## yourself in

    (7) this type of satuation I m not used to being a pilot 1 have
    (*) never seen a palot for example in the Mississippi River
    have
    (9) to walk hack into the chart ronm to Jook at a chart So
    (10) perhaps I was not accustomed although I knew or I should have
    (II) known better than to take my attention away from the progress
    (12) of the vessel, anstead of plotung the progress of the ressel
    (13) Q Now had Hazelwood been on the bridge I take it that some
    (14) of these responsibilities would have been spread out?
    (IS) A He would not have walked back into the chart room He
    (18) would not have left what I'll call the conning station He
    (17) would not have left the - I would not say that he would have
    (18) left the wheelhouse I observed Captan Hazelwood
    maneuver a
    (19) vessel before and I don't recall him ever talung his attention
    (20) away from piloting a piloting profile is how you might
    (21) describe it
    (22) Q If he had wanted those things done he would have had you
    (23) do them?
    (24) A Correct
    (25) $Q$ But since you were the only person there you had to do

[^27]:    Vol $16 \quad 2+70$
    Do you recall thone qucstions and answers'
    A Vaguely yes
    Q And then latar on the next page on page 67 at linc 9 the quistion was ashed now aboul how long was the veskel on
    (1) 20 dugracs bcfor you did something clac?

    And the answer way $l$ extimate two minules
    Do you rucall that'
    AYes
    Q At the time that you talked in Capiain Hazelwood about the maneuver you were going to make vou lully uxpeciled that you would be traveling through watcr that mighi he 90 fathoms or luss isn (that trul?
    A Yes
    (14) Q And isn it ituc that if you loosk at the 2355 plot that

    If evenallurgiving a Itn dugric righi ruddur command vou
    (16) tertainly would have passud over arcas that whre iess than 50
    (17) fathoms?
    (18) A Yes
    (19) $Q$ And you would have had a fathometer alarm going off on -
    (20) A Yes
    (1) Q And would that - would the addition of that alarm with the
    ( ) other things that you wurb dong, have bucnol ansistancu in
    131 you?
    (-4) A In that perspective no Not really I mean I knew the
    ( 5) depths of water that we were going to traverve anvway

[^28]:    (I)
    (') something along the lines that Captan Hazelwood went
    (3) voluntanly to a rehabihtation program before it interfered with his job performance
    Q Did he at some subsuquinl lime tell you that Josuph
    Hacliwood s drinking problums inicricrod with the purlormancu
    of Captasn Hazilwood s joh'
    A I beleve that Mark did not tell ine that that he and there may have been a proteatial forit but I dou $t$ believe he ever sand that there were any performance problens
    Q Okay sir would you go to page 116 of your deposition transcript? And on page 116 of your deposition translripl at line 21 through page 117 line 5 would you read that? A Starting on which lane line Q Line 21 there a a question on line 21 MR SANDERS Your Honor I dash that qucsloon fo back to 116 lins 5 Makc 11 complute MR ONEILL Thisis my sxaminaisin Judge It he wants to rudirul him -
    THE COURT Well 1 think the rulc xays that you nutd to pick the rulevant pari Take a lool at il and utc sue il you rugtlling all that , rulcvant
    MR ONEILL The lup al page 116 dealvwith the lirv
    
    allur 1985 Did Marh Pictudanv lime allur $19 x 5$ にll vou

[^29]:    (1) and I don't know if it was the beginning or the end - I have a
    (2) feeling it was the middle of this dascussion went on for about
    (3) five or six hours about all the concerns in the yard and be
    (4) says I got a report from Herb I eyendecker about some beer
    (3) being ordered or referred to on the walkie-talkie and in sum

    161 and substance It told hom the same thing I ve testified to
    (7) today what happened sand ukay
    (8) $Q$ Did he say anything elsc besides ohay when you gave ham
    (v) the -
    (10) A No He just sand I Just wanted to be sure there was no

    III violation of the alcohol policy and I said uv to ur wav of
    i2) thanking, there was none
    (1) $Q$ Did he - al this poinl did you till him thal you had
    (/A) tonsumed some of that beer later)
    (1s) A I belueve I did I said Chuck Kimits and I went and
    (10) watched the Bruns play whoever they were playing in the
    (17) Stanley Cup finals I thank it was I explaned the whole

    Hy) scenano to hm
    (19) $Q$ You expiained the scenario sncluding the fact that vou
    (30) subsequently drank some of the bwer while watching the
    football
    (1) game?
    ( 1 ) A Hockey game
    (-3) Q Hockuy game?
    ( 4) A I belneve I dad yeah
    (-) Q You refer to Mr Timmons 1 forgul he was on the othur end

[^30]:    (I) A Yen sar
    (-) Q And you said he did - you did and he sand and Capian
    (3) Deppe wouldn t take him isn that correct?
    (4) A That's correct
    (5) Q And he dropped it there?
    (6) A Yes, sir
    (7) Q Let me ask you this if you didn tissufy Captain Deppe
    (8) did not want Captain Hazelwood on that run primarily because
    (9) Captain Hazelwood is quite outspoken and I think he was
    (10) looking for someone that was a bil more diplomatic because
    you
    (1) had - It was - you had to deal with the third party
    (i) oceasionally?
    (17) A That's correct
    (14) QMr O Nuill didn ibring that out did he?
    (15) A No sir
    (16) Q He tried to make it appear that Captain Deppe rejected
    (17) Captan Hazelwood because there was something
    extraordinarily
    (18) wrong about Captain Hazelwood or he was drinking or something
    (19) like that correct?
    (20) A That's correct
    (?) Q Isn t that right helow where Mr O Neill could not have (72) mussed it when he asked you that question?
    (23) A I belueve so sar
    (2a) Q Now and isn iti a fact - well let me ask you have you
    (-5) seen- Mr O Neill ploycd for you what Captain Hazelwood said

[^31]:    (1) A Yes sir
    (-) Q Now were you still - did you still have in your memory
    (3) this recollection of orduring bucr?
    (4) $A Y_{\text {es }}$ sar
    (s) MR NEAL Just iwo questions Your Honor

    BYMR NEAL
    Q You went aboard the vassu!'
    A Yes sir
    Q What was the first thing you did?
    (0) A I went to see the captan and said hello,
    (II) Q And what was the stcond thing you did?
    (12) A After a few salutations and whatnot I went to see the (13) chief engineer And -
    (14) Q What did you say to him and what did he say to you?
    (1S) A Well, apart from bello bow are you type of thing I asked
    (16) hum pointblank with the Heary's thang on my miad and if
    (17) Hazelwood was dranking and he saud nu
    (18) THE COURT We 11 rectss now lor the day ladics and
    (19) guntlomen Pleast rumembur my instrublions that vou not Insten
    (20) to or ruad anything ahout this ave and $w_{6} \|$ rasumb lonorrow
    ( 11 morning at 800
    1 ) Would counsul stav lor just a momisal
    (_3) (Jury out at 202 pm )
    ( 54 ) THE COURT We ru olf the rucurd now
    (2S) (Recess at 202 pm )

[^32]:    $\qquad$

[^33]:    - 

[^34]:    $\qquad$

[^35]:    f

[^36]:    (1) breath He could have had a beer five minutes before he showed
    (2) up for the launch He didn islur his words he didn t
    (3) stumble He wasn tas nice to me as he dalways been on the
    (4) phone with me but I didn itake that directed at me That $s$
    (5) what I perceived I didn t perceive a fumbling person going
    (6) back to the ship
    (7) Now did you hear anywhere in there about any inebriated
    (8) state or possibly inebriated state?
    (9) A No, sir
    (10) Q Now you were also played a portion of Mr Day s testımony
    (11) yesterday in which he recollects at that point telling you
    (12) about the - whatever Mary Williamson told him Do you
    (iJ) remember that?
    (14) AYes sir
    (15) MR NEAL Let me play a portion that was not played
    (16) yesterday
    (17) (Portion of Video Testımony of Steve Day played as follows) (18) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
    (19) Q You said a few moments ago in response to one of Mr
    (20) Klinckhardt s questions that you didn t know whether Mr Myers
    (21) had heard or understood what you were telling him about Captain
    (22) Hazelwood is that accurate summary of what you said (23) paraphrasing?
    (24) A Yeah I hope it agrees I hope it agrees with the record (25) but yeah

[^37]:    Vol 172703

[^38]:    (I) security bullding where there $s$ a metal detector and whatever
    (2) packages people have are also looked at
    (3) Q Are you - are you being observed by the outside security
    (4) guard as you re walking from the car around and into the
    (5) secunty bulding?
    (6) A I have to assume they re watching, yes
    (7) Q And there are wo security guards inside the security
    (8) building?
    (9) A That evening there were yes
    (10) OWhat s their job as you understand it?
    (i1) A Well, as I said they look through packages that people
    are
    (12) bringing in, and that s part of the security detail What
    (13) their specific functions orders are I really wouldn t know
    (14) Q Do you know whether they re looking for alcohol?
    (is) A it is - well, it $s$ very posslble because it is a policy
    (16) that no alcohol can be brought Into the terminal
    (i7) Q Did you have a conversation with these guards? Did they
    (18) engage you in conversation?
    (19) A I don $t$ know who engaged whom but there were pleasantrles
    (20) exchanged that s all
    (21) Q Are you fairly close to them as you re talking to them?
    (22) A Yeah I dsay so
    (23) Q Now did - were you able to go - incidentally what
    (24) packages did you have?
    (25) A I had the magazines that I bought in the bag plus the two

[^39]:    BY MR SANDERS
    ) Q Miss Pennington the question is Did you have a
    () conversation in which Mr Shaw inld you that Jesse Watis was
    (a) bringing booze back to Caplain Hazelwood and that theretor
    vou
    (S) shouldn 1 asaign Mr Watts to Mr Hazulwood s ship again" Did
    you have that conversation?
    A No sar I did not
    MR SANDERS Nofurther questions
    THE COURT You may step down
    MR SANDERS Your Honor wh lall Ms Ellun Share
    THE CLERK Raise your right hand
    ) (The Witness Is Sworn)
    (13) THE CLERK For the record state vour full name your (4) address and spell your last name please
    s) THE WITNESS My name is Ellen Share I live al 14914
    6) Barboula (ph) Housion Tuxas Spell my last name is
    un Share
    (18) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF ELLEN SHARE
    (19) BYMR SANDERS
    (20) Q Ms Share I m going to ask you to speak right out okay
    (?) you have kind of a little voice quite unlike mine
    (22) Ms Share by whom are you employed now?
    (?3) A Exxon Company USA
    (1) Q And how long have you been with Exxon USA?
    (2) A 21 years all told

[^40]:    Vol 203464
    (1) office to serve as a clnser contact with Fxxon employees ease
    i coming on the vessels to do benefit related work
    (3) $Q$ Did you also have any function in terms of safuly?
    (4) A Attended safety meetings when they had them
    (5) Q All right Where was your office?
    (6) A In the Baytown office in the Baytown refinery
    17. Q Do ships comi in to Baytown and dock there?
    (8) A Yes air
    (9) Q Did you visil the ships?
    non A Yes ur that was part of mivesponsibility to be there
    "II when - when possible tu answer quevtions and help
    employees
    (1) when the ships came'
    13) Q So dol understand you to say that you visited the shipa
    (14) every lime the ships tamu in?
    (is) A Yes sir
    (16) Q And in visiting the ships did you happen to know a man by
    (17) the name of Jim Shaw?

    1181 A Yes sir
    (19) $Q$ What was Jim Shaw s job at that lime?
    (ヵ) A He was at port steward He worked with stowiag the
    (い vessels
    1 Q Q Did you have a lot of dealings with Mr Shaw?
    i " A lndirectly His office was located across from mine
    ( 4) We - we visited when the shops weren't in And but
    basically
    is) has responsibility was totally differens from mine

[^41]:    Vol 203476
    What is the shortcit inicrval of time between visits that
    was tound by your rosearh'
    A26daw
    Q And this was the last one right before Captain Hazelwood
    left the ship in 1987 correct)
    A That's correct
    Q All right And then of tourse the nuxt shortest is 51
    days and then the rest of them are a whole lol ot days'
    A That's correct
    MR SANDERS Move the admission of defendant exhibit 7420
    (Exhibil 7420 olterad)
    MR O NEILL No sbluction
    THECOURT Dulcndani 7420 is admiltud
    (Exhibit 7420 received)
    BYMS SANDERS
    Q I also have here - and if I may approach the wilness Your
    Honor I have Defendant Exhibil 3476 A?
    THECOURT 3476)
    MR SANDERS 76 A alpha That sin uviduncl
    BYMS SANDERS
    Q And that is the assignment history tor Jesse Walls is
    that right?
    A That's correct
    Q Now you have in tront of you the assignment history for

[^42]:    Vol 203492
    smelled to lead you to belitve that the - that Caplain
    Hazelwood had been drınkıng'
    A No sir I smelled what I smelled and I did smell the odor of alcohol in and around the area of Captan Hazelwood and
    (s) only Captann Hazelwood But other than that, no, sar, there
    was no other indication that would lead me to believe he had
    consumed alcohol or was under the anfluence of alcohol
    Q You had not sewn anything in Captain Hazeiwood a behavior
    or dumeanor to suggest that he was intoxicated had you?
    A From my observations no
    Q Let me ask you specifically at the time that you spoke to
    Captain Hazelwood aboard the vessel did he appear to you in
    any way to be either in shock or incapacitated?
    A When I initally spoke with hum on the bridge right after I
    got aboard he looked a little shocked or stunned or -
    understandably upset about the condition that he - his shap had come into
    Q Now did he appear to be incapacitated?
    A No sir
    Q You as thc Coasi Guard on scene investigator had the authority to rulicve the captain that you - if you felt that he was intoxicatiod or in any other way unable to command the voncl la that turrobl'
    AYes sur
    Q And it is also a tact that you did not relteve Captain

[^43]:    Vol 203496
    REDIRECT EXAMINATION OF MARK PIERCE
    3392
    () BY MR SANDERS 3392

    DIRECT EXAMINATION OF DAN LAWN (Video)
    3395
    (s) BY VIDEO EXAMINER

    3395
    CROSS EXAMINATION OF DAN LAWN (Video) 3402
    (8) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 3402

    1101 DIRECT EXAMINATION OF GABRIELLA GUERRA
    3404
    (\|।) BY MR SANDERS 3404
    (13) CROSS EXAMINATION OF GABRIELLA GUERRA 3424
    (14) BY MR O NEILL 3424
    (16) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF BEN GRAVES (Video)

    3427
    (17) BY VIDEO EXAMINER
    (19) CROSS EXAMINATION OF BEN GRAVES (Video)

    3433
    (20) BY VIDEO EXAMINER3433
    (22) DIRECT EXAMINATION OF JOE DeOLIVEIRA (Video)

    3434
    (23) BY VIDEO EXAMINER 3435
    (יS) CROSS EXAMINATION OF JOSE DLOLIVEIRA (Video) 3442

[^44]:    --

[^45]:    $\qquad$<br>$\qquad$

[^46]:[^47]:    品

[^48]:    (1) with native corporations
    (1 Congriss purpose was broad and swleping it salmost
    (3) inconcuivable that congress intended that a tribe or a native
    (4) corporation whose sites were dusecrated by someone acting
    (s) without the requirements created by ARPA would be left without
    (6) the remedies if any are providud by state law We eited Cort
    (7) versus Ash Your Honor works through that I think you II
    (8) find that the lust tor implication of a private right of action
    aru cluarly mut
    (10) But Ido want to say in passing on this point that this is III) an uxtremely imporiant point of issuc for this state and all (1) states that have substantial archacological resources Im not
    (1) boing to say to Your Honor and it would not be proper for me (Id) to say that Exxon reprusents the inturests of Native
    (15) corporations or all the Indian tribes who aren t here today we
    (16) don I But the odd rules of removal law put us in the position
    (17) of defunding that side of the argument and the zeal of
    (18) plaintiffs counsel to avoid this courl at all costs puts them
    (19) in a position of acting abainst what I think any objective
    ( 01 observer would see as the long iurm inticests of their clients
    ol cvery Native corporation in Alasha and of Indian tribes So I simplv rumind Your Honor that on the issue of whether thure sa private rumudy under ARPA you ru making law for all Alasha on a matlur ot gral polunitial importance and you necd to considur the inturuls of all partics not just those who

